

1 NEW YORK STATE SENATE

2  
3  
4 THE STENOGRAPHIC RECORD

5  
6  
7  
8  
9 ALBANY, NEW YORK

10 May 28, 2026

11 1:01 p.m.

12  
13  
14 REGULAR SESSION

15  
16  
17  
18 SENATOR ROXANNE J. PERSAUD, Acting President

19 ALEJANDRA N. PAULINO, ESQ., Secretary

## P R O C E E D I N G S

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The  
Senate will come to order.

I ask everyone to please rise and  
recite the Pledge of Allegiance.

(Whereupon, the assemblage recited  
the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: In the  
absence of clergy, let us bow our heads in a  
moment of silent reflection or prayer.

(Whereupon, the assemblage respected  
a moment of silence.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Reading  
of the Journal.

THE SECRETARY: In Senate,  
Wednesday, May 27, 2026, the Senate met pursuant  
to adjournment. The Journal of Tuesday, May 26,  
2025, was read and approved.

On motion, the Senate adjourned.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Without  
objection, the Journal stands approved as read.

Presentation of petitions.

Messages from the Assembly.

The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Senator Cleare

1 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Aging,  
2 Assembly Bill Number 8447A and substitute it for  
3 the identical Senate Bill 8072B, Third Reading  
4 Calendar 229.

5 Senator Harckham moves to discharge,  
6 from the Committee on Crime Victims, Crime and  
7 Corrections, Assembly Bill Number 6666A and  
8 substitute it for the identical Senate Bill  
9 6390A, Third Reading Calendar 425.

10 Senator Sanders moves to discharge,  
11 from the Committee on Aging, Assembly Bill  
12 Number 582A and substitute it for the identical  
13 Senate Bill 3180A, Third Reading Calendar 490.

14 Senator Kavanagh moves to discharge,  
15 from the Committee on Housing, Assembly Bill  
16 Number 3029A and substitute it for the identical  
17 Senate Bill 2091A, Third Reading Calendar 573.

18 Senator Parker moves to discharge,  
19 from the Committee on Energy, Assembly Bill  
20 Number 5592A and substitute it for the identical  
21 Senate Bill 2011A, Third Reading Calendar 687.

22 Senator Hinchey moves to discharge,  
23 from the Committee on Investigations and  
24 Government Operations, Assembly Bill Number 10405  
25 and substitute it for the identical Senate Bill

1 9387, Third Reading Calendar 720.

2 Senator Krueger moves to discharge,  
3 from the Committee on Housing, Assembly Bill  
4 Number 659 and substitute it for the identical  
5 Senate Bill 9650, Third Reading Calendar 723.

6 Senator Sepúlveda moves to  
7 discharge, from the Committee on Judiciary,  
8 Assembly Bill Number 8047B and substitute it for  
9 the identical Senate Bill 9792, Third Reading  
10 Calendar 754.

11 Senator Scarcella-Spanton moves to  
12 discharge, from the Committee on  
13 Higher Education, Assembly Bill Number 6001A and  
14 substitute it for the identical Senate Bill  
15 Number 7784A, Third Reading Calendar 769.

16 Senator Ramos moves to discharge,  
17 from the Committee on Labor, Assembly Bill  
18 Number 8480 and substitute it for the identical  
19 Senate Bill 8131, Third Reading Calendar 870.

20 Senator Hinchey moves to discharge,  
21 from the Committee on Health, Assembly Bill  
22 Number 7840A and substitute it for the identical  
23 Senate Bill 6578A, Third Reading Calendar 977.

24 Senator Skoufis moves to discharge,  
25 from the Committee on Investigations and

1 Government Operations, Assembly Bill Number 10032  
2 and substitute it for the identical Senate Bill  
3 Number 9107, Third Reading Calendar 1069.

4 Senator Hinchey moves to discharge,  
5 from the Committee on Investigations and  
6 Government Operations, Assembly Bill Number 10522  
7 and substitute it for the identical Senate Bill  
8 Number 9374, Third Reading Calendar 1075.

9 Senator Hinchey moves to discharge,  
10 from the Committee on Investigations and  
11 Government Operations, Assembly Bill  
12 Number 10737A and substitute it for the identical  
13 Senate Bill Number 9551A, Third Reading Calendar  
14 1080.

15 Senator Zellner moves to discharge,  
16 from the Committee on Investigations and  
17 Government Operations, Assembly Bill  
18 Number 10932A and substitute it for the identical  
19 Senate Bill 9850A, Third Reading Calendar 1083.

20 Senator Stewart-Cousins moves to  
21 discharge, from the Committee on Cities 2,  
22 Assembly Bill Number 9520 and substitute it for  
23 the identical Senate Bill 8859, Third Reading  
24 Calendar 1131.

25 Senator Addabbo moves to discharge,

1 from the Committee on Veterans, Homeland Security  
2 and Military Affairs, Assembly Bill Number 7627B  
3 and substitute it for the identical Senate Bill  
4 Number 7786B, Third Reading Calendar 1162.

5 Senator Palumbo moves to discharge,  
6 from the Committee on Local Government,  
7 Assembly Bill Number 10325 and substitute it for  
8 the identical Senate Bill 10012, Third Reading  
9 Calendar 1252.

10 Senator Ryan moves to discharge,  
11 from the Committee on Transportation,  
12 Assembly Bill Number 9351A and substitute it for  
13 the identical Senate Bill 8571A, Third Reading  
14 Calendar 1271.

15 Senator Fernandez moves to  
16 discharge, from the Committee on Transportation,  
17 Assembly Bill Number 10722 and substitute it for  
18 the identical Senate Bill 9639, Third Reading  
19 Calendar 1277.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: So  
21 ordered.

22 Messages from the Governor.

23 Reports of standing committees.

24 Reports of select committees.

25 Communications and reports from

1 state officers.

2 Motions and resolutions.

3 Senator Gianaris.

4 SENATOR GIANARIS: Good afternoon,  
5 Madam President.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Good  
7 afternoon.

8 SENATOR GIANARIS: There will be an  
9 immediate meeting of the Rules Committee in  
10 Room 332.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: There  
12 will be an immediate meeting of the  
13 Rules Committee in Room 332.

14 SENATOR GIANARIS: We may reconvene  
15 to simultaneously take up some resolutions, but  
16 for now we will stand at ease.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The  
18 Senate will stand at ease.

19 (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease  
20 at 1:06 p.m.)

21 (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at  
22 1:08 p.m.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The  
24 Senate will return to order.

25 Personal point of privilege: Happy

1        Birthday, Dorothy!

2                    (Applause.)

3                    ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Senator  
4        Serrano.

5                    SENATOR SERRANO:    Thank you,  
6        Mr. President.

7                    Let's now take up previously adopted  
8        Resolution 2113, by Senator Hinchey.    Let's read  
9        that resolution title only, and call on  
10       Senator Hinchey.

11                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    The  
12       Secretary will read.

13                   THE SECRETARY:    Resolution 2113, by  
14       Senator Hinchey, mourning the death of Ronald F.  
15       Lipton, distinguished citizen, devoted public  
16       servant, and cherished member of his community.

17                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Senator  
18       Hinchey on the resolution.

19                   SENATOR HINCHEY:    Thank you,  
20       Mr. President.

21                   I rise today to honor the  
22       extraordinary legacy of a beloved Greene County  
23       community member and friend, Ron Lipton, who  
24       passed away on January 22nd this year at the age  
25       of 85.

1 Ron believed that each of us must  
2 actively work to change the world for the better,  
3 starting right in our own communities, and he  
4 lived that belief to its fullest. He lived  
5 through and witnessed some of the most tumultuous  
6 times of social and political upheaval of the  
7 past century. Instead of turning to apathy and  
8 cynicism, he looked to the strongest force for  
9 good that he knew, people.

10 In each community that was lucky  
11 enough to count Ron as a resident, he learned the  
12 local issues, brought people together, and  
13 advocated for real commonsense solutions that  
14 would actually make a difference in people's  
15 lives.

16 As a young man, he committed himself  
17 to global humanitarian service, through the  
18 international aid organization Care, in the early  
19 1970s. When he returned to the U.S., Ron  
20 ventured to California, serving as an advisor to  
21 then Governor Jerry Brown, during a pivotal  
22 moment in environmental and economic reform.

23 In 2006, Ron relocated to Lexington,  
24 in Greene County, for his retirement. And it  
25 should be said that it says a lot about a person

1 who chooses to move to a beautiful-but-can-be-  
2 fairly-challenging area like the Mountain Top  
3 upon retirement.

4 But oh, how lucky we were. What  
5 might have been a period of rest and tranquility  
6 instead became a vibrant new chapter of active  
7 community involvement on the mountain. He served  
8 with distinction as the cochair of the Lexington  
9 Town Democratic Committee and was an active  
10 member of the Mountain Top Progressives, an  
11 organization he helped found and lead as a forum  
12 for connection and activism across the rural  
13 community that shared Mountain Top towns.

14 Ron had an insatiable drive to right  
15 wrongs and better the lives of those around him.  
16 Over the years, my team and I worked with Ron on  
17 a number of occasions. Always fighting for the  
18 well-being of his neighbors, Ron never just  
19 brought us grievances, he worked with us on  
20 solutions. In fact, one of my favorite topics to  
21 discuss with Ron was energy policy, an area he  
22 focused on during his tenure with Governor Jerry  
23 Brown.

24 He was advocating to me for  
25 PSC reform and utility oversight well before it

1 was in our everyday lexicon. And our bill to  
2 change the makeup of the PSC and require  
3 affordability in all proceedings -- which has  
4 already passed this chamber -- was written in  
5 partnership with Ron and his wisdom.

6 We all know that in this job one of  
7 the best parts is meeting the people that would  
8 otherwise probably never cross our path. For me,  
9 one of those incredibly special people was  
10 Ron Lipton.

11 I'll spare the whole story, but my  
12 first meeting with Ron almost never happened.  
13 You see, we were scheduled to meet at Maggie's  
14 Crooked Cafe in Tannersville. However, that part  
15 of town had exactly zero cell service. Both Ron  
16 and I waited for over an hour for the other to  
17 show up, not knowing that the other was just  
18 sitting just a few feet away, one inside and one  
19 outside.

20 It was a quick lesson for me on the  
21 lack of critical infrastructure across our rural  
22 communities.

23 At the last moment, Ron and I did  
24 find each other, and thank God we did. That  
25 meeting started a wonderful friendship filled

1 with life lessons to me from Ron. I was in awe  
2 of his travels, his stories, his energy and his  
3 moral clarity that never wavered.

4 Those of us lucky enough to have  
5 known Ron Lipton will forever miss the example he  
6 set in his community-minded leadership. And of  
7 course, his persistence. My one regret is that I  
8 never made it with him to the Bronx Zoo, but I  
9 promise that I will get there in his honor.

10 Joining us in the gallery today are  
11 friends of Ron who have become family. We  
12 remember Ron today in this chamber but will carry  
13 his lessons, his humor, his passion and his  
14 memory with us forever.

15 I proudly vote aye on this  
16 resolution and look forward to honoring Ron and  
17 his memory in the years to come.

18 Thank you.

19 (Applause from the gallery.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank  
21 you, Senator Hinchey.

22 To the friends who have become  
23 family of Mr. Lipton, we will assure you that  
24 Senator Hinchey will make her way to the  
25 Bronx Zoo.

1                   We thank you for carrying his legacy  
2                   on. And I welcome you on behalf of the Senate  
3                   and extend to you all the privileges and  
4                   courtesies of this house.

5                   Please rise and be recognized.

6                   (Standing ovation.)

7                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The  
8                   resolution was adopted on May 19th.

9                   Senator Serrano.

10                  SENATOR SERRANO: Thank you,  
11                  Mr. President.

12                  Let's now take up previously adopted  
13                  Resolution 2060, by Senator Fahy. Let's read  
14                  that title only and call on Senator Fahy.

15                  ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The  
16                  Secretary will read.

17                  THE SECRETARY: Resolution 2060, by  
18                  Senator Fahy, memorializing Governor Kathy Hochul  
19                  to proclaim May 2026 as Cystic Fibrosis Awareness  
20                  Month in the State of New York.

21                  ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator  
22                  Fahy on the resolution.

23                  SENATOR FAHY: Thank you,  
24                  Mr. President.

25                  Today this resolution recognizes

1     that May of this year is Cystic Fibrosis  
2     Awareness Month.

3             Cystic fibrosis is a rather  
4     devastating genetic disease that affects the  
5     lungs, digestive system and other vital organs.  
6     It affects 1600 New Yorkers and of course tens of  
7     thousands of families across the country.

8             Today we are joined by one of those  
9     individuals, Kellen McHale, who is here in --  
10    stand up, please, Kellen, if you would. He  
11    attends Lynnwood Academy in Guilderland, and he  
12    is one of those who knows what it's like to daily  
13    live and go through hours of treatment,  
14    medications and therapies simply to breathe, eat  
15    and stay healthy.

16            However, he has shown, as well as so  
17    many others with this disease, extraordinary  
18    resilience, courage, and hope.

19            And because of decades of research  
20    and advocacy, as well as innovation, today those  
21    with CF, or cystic fibrosis, live longer, fuller  
22    lives than ever before. And treatments that were  
23    unimaginable just a generation ago are really  
24    allowing patients to attend school, play  
25    baseball, as Kellen does, build careers, raise

1 families, and pursue multiple dreams.

2 That's why awareness is so essential  
3 for this disease, as is early diagnosis with  
4 newborn screening, continued investments in  
5 research. And all, combined, can make a  
6 life-changing difference here for these families  
7 and individuals.

8 It is important that here in  
9 New York we continue to support world-class  
10 treatment centers and support our dedicated  
11 health professionals as well as the parents, the  
12 caregivers and all the loved ones who shoulder  
13 the burden behind the scenes and help young  
14 people like Kellen navigate the healthcare system  
15 through their unwavering support, as his mom and  
16 granddad and more are here to support him.

17 As lawmakers we do have that  
18 responsibility to make sure that we continue to  
19 provide quality access to affordable care, to  
20 strengthen biomedical research, and ensure that  
21 New Yorkers living with CF have the opportunity  
22 to live these longer, healthier lives through  
23 this advancement of medical progress.

24 So today, on behalf of myself as  
25 well as Senator Ashby, who is a friend of the

1 family, I would appreciate, Mr. President, if you  
2 would join me in welcoming Kellen and his entire  
3 family. Thank you.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank  
5 you, Senator Fahy.

6 Senator Ashby on the resolution.

7 SENATOR ASHBY: Thank you,  
8 Mr. President.

9 And thank you, Senator Fahy, for  
10 bringing this important resolution to the Senate  
11 floor and for your continued advocacy for cystic  
12 fibrosis.

13 I know many of today's guests will  
14 also be at this Saturday's Great Strides event in  
15 Albany, at UAlbany's purple path 5K, which is a  
16 fun day and fundraising event.

17 Our guests today are unique and  
18 special in their advocacy. Emilie McHale is the  
19 2025 Outstanding Advocate award winner, and she  
20 is joined by her 9-year-old son and mighty  
21 warrior who we just met, Kellen McHale; as well  
22 as Kellen's number-one fan and Grampion,  
23 Tim McHale of Brunswick, in my district;  
24 Francie Gransbury, a cystic fibrosis coordinator  
25 and RN at Albany Medical Center; as well as

1 Grampion Janet Schuster.

2 Mr. President, I'd ask that you  
3 recognize them and offer them all the privileges  
4 of the house.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank  
6 you, Senator Ashby.

7 To the McHale family, and especially  
8 Kellen, Lynnwood's finest, we thank you for your  
9 strength, your resilience, your resolve, and  
10 being here today. It's really important that  
11 you're here.

12 I welcome you on behalf of the  
13 Senate and extend to you all of the privileges  
14 and courtesies of this house.

15 Please rise and be recognized.

16 (Standing ovation.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The  
18 resolution was adopted on May 12th.

19 Senator Serrano.

20 SENATOR SERRANO: Mr. President, at  
21 this time we'll stand at ease.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The  
23 Senate will stand at ease.

24 (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease  
25 at 1:19 p.m.)

1 (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at  
2 1:24 p.m.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The  
4 Senate will return to order.

5 Senator Gianaris.

6 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President, I  
7 have a motion here.

8 On behalf of Senator May, I wish to  
9 call up Senate Print 2708A, recalled from the  
10 Assembly, which is now at the desk.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The  
12 Secretary will read.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
14 454, Senate Print 2708A, by Senator May, an act  
15 to amend the Public Service Law.

16 SENATOR GIANARIS: Move to  
17 reconsider the vote by which the bill was passed.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
19 roll on reconsideration.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
23 is restored to its place on the Third Reading  
24 Calendar.

25 SENATOR GIANARIS: I offer the

1 following amendments.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The  
3 amendments are received.

4 SENATOR GIANARIS: Please call on  
5 Senator Lanza for a motion.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator  
7 Lanza.

8 SENATOR LANZA: Mr. President, I  
9 wish to call up Senator Stec's bill, 8454,  
10 recalled from the Assembly, which is now at the  
11 desk.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The  
13 Secretary will read.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
15 1066, Senate Print 8454, by Senator Stec, an act  
16 to amend the Public Officers Law.

17 SENATOR LANZA: Move to reconsider  
18 the vote by which the bill was passed.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
20 roll on reconsideration.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
24 is restored to its place on the Third Reading  
25 Calendar.

1                   SENATOR LANZA:    I now offer the  
2 following amendments.

3                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    The  
4 amendments are received.

5                   Senator Gianaris.

6                   SENATOR GIANARIS:    There's a report  
7 of the Rules Committee at the desk.

8                   Let's take that up.

9                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    The  
10 Secretary will read.

11                  THE SECRETARY:    Senator  
12 Stewart-Cousins, from the Committee on Rules,  
13 reports the following bills:

14                   Senate Print 247, by  
15 Senator Persaud, an act to amend the  
16 Education Law;

17                   Senate Print 519, by  
18 Senator Persaud, an act to amend the  
19 Education Law;

20                   Senate Print 687, by  
21 Senator Martinez, an act to amend the  
22 Education Law;

23                   Senate Print 704A, by  
24 Senator Krueger, an act to amend the  
25 General Business Law;

1                   Senate Print 1063, by  
2   Senator Serrano, an act to amend the  
3   Education Law;

4                   Senate Print 1072A, by  
5   Senator Serrano, an act to amend the  
6   Education Law;

7                   Senate Print 1157, by  
8   Senator Cooney, an act to amend the  
9   Private Housing Finance Law;

10                  Senate Print 1162A, by  
11   Senator Krueger, an act to amend the  
12   General Business Law;

13                  Senate Print 1242A, by  
14   Senator Addabbo, an act to amend the  
15   Veterans' Services Law;

16                  Senate Print 1366, by  
17   Senator Serrano, an act to amend the  
18   Mental Hygiene Law;

19                  Senate Print 1378A, by  
20   Senator Serrano, an act to amend the  
21   Arts and Cultural Affairs Law;

22                  Senate Print 1476B, by  
23   Senator Krueger, an act to amend the  
24   Public Health Law;

25                  Senate Print 1578B, by

1 Senator Sanders, an act to amend the  
2 Public Health Law;  
3 Senate Print 1809, by  
4 Senator Fernandez, an act to amend the  
5 Election Law;  
6 Senate Print 2046, by Senator Webb,  
7 an act to amend the Education Law;  
8 Senate Print 3051B, by  
9 Senator Harckham, an act to amend the  
10 Mental Hygiene Law;  
11 Senate Print 3334, by Senator Liu,  
12 an act to amend the Education Law;  
13 Senate Print 3340, by  
14 Senator Gianaris, an act to amend the Tax Law;  
15 Senate Print 4430, by  
16 Senator Comrie, an act to amend the  
17 Public Service Law;  
18 Senate Print 4462B, by  
19 Senator Mayer, an act to amend the  
20 Social Services Law;  
21 Senate Print 4707B, by  
22 Senator Stavisky, an act to amend the  
23 Education Law;  
24 Senate Print 4917B, by  
25 Senator Scarcella-Spanton, an act to amend the

1 Insurance Law;  
2 Senate Print 5189, by  
3 Senator Comrie, an act to amend the  
4 Public Authorities Law;  
5 Senate Print 5228A, by  
6 Senator Bailey, an act to amend the  
7 Executive Law;  
8 Senate Print 5494A, by  
9 Senator Bynoe, an act to amend the Education Law;  
10 Senate Print 6017, by  
11 Senator Baskin, an act to amend the New York  
12 State Urban Development Corporation Act;  
13 Senate Print 6019, by  
14 Senator Baskin, an act to repeal paragraph 2 of  
15 subsection (e-1) of Section 606 of the Tax Law;  
16 Senate Print 6551A, by  
17 Senator Bailey, an act to amend the  
18 Insurance Law;  
19 Senate Print 6832, by Senator Webb,  
20 an act to amend the Military Law;  
21 Senate Print 6976B, by  
22 Senator Harckham, an act to amend the  
23 Transportation Law;  
24 Senate Print 7032, by  
25 Senator Sepúlveda, an act to amend the

1 Vehicle and Traffic Law;

2 Senate Print 7280, by  
3 Senator Martinez, an act to amend the  
4 Insurance Law;

5 Senate Print 7494A, by  
6 Senator Gianaris, an act to amend the  
7 General Business Law;

8 Senate Print 7605A, by  
9 Senator Mattera, an act to amend Chapter 19 of  
10 the Laws of 1964;

11 Senate Print 7701, by  
12 Senator Stavisky, an act to amend the Tax Law;

13 Senate Print 7717A, by  
14 Senator Cooney, an act to amend the  
15 General Business Law;

16 Senate Print 7720, by  
17 Senator Gallivan, an act to amend the Vehicle and  
18 Traffic Law;

19 Senate Print 7951B, by  
20 Senator Mayer, an act to amend the  
21 State Finance Law;

22 Senate Print 7984A, by  
23 Senator Fernandez, an act to amend the  
24 Social Services Law;

25 Senate Print 8201A, by

1 Senator Martins, an act to amend Chapter 280 of  
2 the Laws of 2016;

3 Senate Print 8252C, by  
4 Senator Gianaris, an act to amend the  
5 General Business Law;

6 Senate Print 8353, by  
7 Senator Salazar, an act to amend the  
8 Correction Law;

9 Senate Print 8363A, by  
10 Senator Fernandez, an act to amend the  
11 Mental Hygiene Law;

12 Senate Print 8457, by  
13 Senator Cooney, an act to amend the  
14 Insurance Law;

15 Senate Print 8541, by Senator Webb,  
16 an act to amend the Social Services Law;

17 Senate Print 8580A, by  
18 Senator Skoufis, an act to amend the  
19 General Business Law;

20 Senate Print 8587A, by  
21 Senator Gounardes, an act to amend the  
22 Public Health Law;

23 Senate Print 8592A, by  
24 Senator Sutton, an act to amend the  
25 Insurance Law;

1                   Senate Print 8598A, by  
2   Senator Ramos, an act to amend the  
3   General Business Law;

4                   Senate Print 8637, by  
5   Senator Fernandez, an act to amend the  
6   State Finance Law;

7                   Senate Print 8701A, by  
8   Senator Hinchey, an act to amend the  
9   Agriculture and Markets Law;

10                  Senate Print 8706B, by  
11   Senator Hinchey, an act to amend the Labor Law;

12                  Senate Print 8837, by  
13   Senator Hinchey, an act to amend the  
14   General Municipal Law;

15                  Senate Print 8850A, by  
16   Senator Gounardes, an act to amend the  
17   General Business Law;

18                  Senate Print 8969B, by  
19   Senator Bailey, an act to amend the  
20   Insurance Law;

21                  Senate Print 9021, by  
22   Senator Harckham, an act to amend the  
23   Civil Rights Law;

24                  Senate Print 9024, by  
25   Senator Gianaris, an act to amend the

1 Election Law;

2 Senate Print 9041, by  
3 Senator Hinchey, an act to amend Chapter 443  
4 of the Laws of 2006;

5 Senate Print 9058, by Senator Weber,  
6 an act to amend the Real Property Tax Law;

7 Senate Print 9059, by Senator Weber,  
8 an act to amend the Real Property Tax Law;

9 Senate Print 9060, by Senator Weber,  
10 an act to amend the Real Property Tax Law;

11 Senate Print 9063A, by  
12 Senator Addabbo, an act to amend the  
13 Mental Hygiene Law;

14 Senate Print 9115A, by  
15 Senator Harckham, an act to amend the  
16 Environmental Conservation Law;

17 Senate Print 9199, by Senator  
18 Scarcella-Spanton, an act to amend the  
19 Public Service Law;

20 Senate Print 9276, by  
21 Senator Sepúlveda, an act to amend the  
22 Retirement and Social Security Law;

23 Senate Print 9278A, by  
24 Senator Fernandez, an act to amend the  
25 State Finance Law;

1 Senate Print 9305, by Senator May,  
2 an act to amend Chapter 62 of the Laws of 2003;

3 Senate Print 9310, by  
4 Senator Brisport, an act to amend the  
5 Limited Liability Company Law;

6 Senate Print 9330, by Senator Ramos,  
7 an act to amend the Labor Law;

8 Senate Print 9349, by  
9 Senator Zellner, an act to amend the  
10 Insurance Law;

11 Senate Print 9370, by  
12 Senator Comrie, an act to amend the  
13 State Finance Law;

14 Senate Print 9419, by  
15 Senator Addabbo, an act to amend the  
16 Vehicle and Traffic Law;

17 Senate Print 9498, by Senator Mayer,  
18 an act to amend the Social Services Law;

19 Senate Print 9541, by  
20 Senator Skoufis, an act to amend the  
21 Real Property Tax Law;

22 Senate Print 9555A, by  
23 Senator Skoufis, an act to amend the  
24 Public Health Law;

25 Senate Print 9604, by

1 Senator Hinchey, an act to amend the  
2 Public Health Law;  
3 Senate Print 9629, by  
4 Senator Bottcher, an act to amend the Penal Law;  
5 Senate Print 9643, by Senator Liu,  
6 an act to amend the State Technology Law;  
7 Senate Print 9657, by Senator Bynoe,  
8 an act to amend the Criminal Procedure Law;  
9 Senate Print 9679, by  
10 Senator Baskin, an act to amend the  
11 Private Housing Finance Law;  
12 Senate Print 9728, by Senator Brouk,  
13 an act to amend the Social Services Law;  
14 Senate Print 9815, by  
15 Senator Krueger, an act to amend the  
16 Insurance Law;  
17 Senate Print 9820A, by  
18 Senator Borrello, an act in relation to  
19 authorizing the City of Olean assessor to accept  
20 an application for a real property tax exemption;  
21 Senate Print 9858A, by  
22 Senator Hinchey, an act to amend the Penal Law;  
23 Senate Print 9880, by  
24 Senator Cleare, an act to amend the  
25 Social Services Law;

1                   Senate Print 9887, by Senator Webb,  
2     an act to amend the Executive Law;

3                   Senate Print 9889, by  
4     Senator Zellner, an act to amend the  
5     Private Housing Finance Law;

6                   Senate Print 9897, by  
7     Senator Zellner, an act to amend the  
8     Public Health Law;

9                   Senate Print 9900, by  
10    Senator Martinez, an act to amend Chapter 581 of  
11    the Laws of 2005;

12                  Senate Print 9901, by Senator Ryan,  
13    an act to amend Chapter 492 of the Laws of 1993;

14                  Senate Print 9902, by Senator Ryan,  
15    an act to amend Chapter 629 of the Laws of 2005;

16                  Senate Print 9903, by  
17    Senator Martinez, an act to amend Chapter 307 of  
18    the Laws of 2005;

19                  Senate Print 9919, by  
20    Senator Borrello, an act to amend the Town Law;

21                  Senate Print 9989, by  
22    Senator Weber, an act authorizing Toivas Dovid  
23    Community Kollel, Inc., to receive retroactive  
24    real property tax-exempt status;

25                  Senate Print 10066, by

1 Senator Stavisky, an act to amend Chapter 534 of  
2 the Laws of 1993;

3 Senate Print 10118, by  
4 Senator Murray, an act to amend the Town Law;

5 Senate Print 10134, by  
6 Senator Weber, an act authorizing the  
7 Congregation Divrei Chaim to receive retroactive  
8 real property tax-exempt status;

9 Senate Print 10227, by  
10 Senator Cooney, an act to amend the  
11 Executive Law;

12 Senate Print 10273, by  
13 Senator Gounardes, an act to amend the  
14 Real Property Tax Law;

15 Senate Print 10411, by  
16 Senator Harckham, an act to amend Chapter 550 of  
17 the Laws of 2013;

18 Senate Print 10431, by  
19 Senator Bottcher, an act to amend the  
20 Local Finance Law;

21 Senate Print 10432, by  
22 Senator Martinez, an act to amend Chapter 130 of  
23 the Laws of 1998;

24 Senate Print 10438, by Senator Ryan,  
25 an act to amend the Penal Law;

1                   Senate Print 10445, by  
2     Senator Gianaris, an act to amend the  
3     Education Law;

4                   Senate Print 10467, by  
5     Senator Bottcher, an act to amend the  
6     Education Law;

7                   Senate Print 10525, by  
8     Senator Serrano, an act to amend Chapter 138 of  
9     the Laws of 1998;

10                  Senate Print 10531, by  
11     Senator Skoufis, an act to amend Chapter 435 of  
12     the Laws of 2014;

13                  Senate Print 10542, by Senator Fahy,  
14     an act to amend Chapter 141 of the Laws of 2014;

15                  Senate Print 10566, by  
16     Senator Martinez, an act to amend the  
17     Environmental Conservation Law.

18                  All bills reported direct to third  
19     reading.

20                  SENATOR GIANARIS:   Move to accept  
21     the report of the Rules Committee.

22                  ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:   All  
23     those in favor of accepting the report of the  
24     Rules Committee please signify by saying aye.

25                  (Response of "Aye.")

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:   Opposed,  
2   nay.

3                   (No response.)

4                   ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:   The  
5   report of the Rules Committee is accepted.

6                   Senator Gianaris.

7                   SENATOR GIANARIS:   Let's take up  
8   the calendar, Madam President.

9                   ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:   The  
10   Secretary will read.

11                  THE SECRETARY:   Calendar Number  
12   214, Senate Print 1783C, by Senator Hinchey, an  
13   act to amend the Agriculture and Markets Law.

14                  ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:   Read the  
15   last section.

16                  THE SECRETARY:   Section 2. This  
17   act shall take effect on the 30th day after it  
18   shall have become a law.

19                  ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:   Call the  
20   roll.

21                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

22                  ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:   Announce  
23   the results.

24                  THE SECRETARY:   In relation to  
25   Calendar 214, voting in the negative are

1 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,  
2 Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Martins, Ortt,  
3 Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk,  
4 Weber and Weik.

5 Ayes, 41. Nays, 17.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill  
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
9 225, Senate Print Number 8968A, by  
10 Senator Scarcella-Spanton, an act to amend  
11 the Mental Hygiene Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the  
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
15 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it  
16 shall have become a law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the  
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator  
21 Scarcella-Spanton to explain her vote.

22 SENATOR SCARCELLA-SPANTON: Thank  
23 you, Madam President.

24 My legislation establishes a  
25 veterans' suicide mortality review board.

1 New York should treat veteran suicide as a public  
2 health emergency and create permanent,  
3 data-driven review boards to identify preventable  
4 failures, improve coordination and save lives.

5 We've all heard the rallying cry  
6 that 22 veterans a day are dying of suicide. We  
7 see that these rates are extremely younger  
8 veterans, whether it be PTSD, CTE. This is not  
9 about assigning blame, but this bill will allow  
10 us to address this through policy that actually  
11 helps our veterans.

12 With that, I proudly vote aye.

13 Thank you.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator  
15 Scarcella-Spanton to be recorded in the  
16 affirmative.

17 Announce the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill  
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
22 229, Assembly Bill Number 8447A, by  
23 Assemblymember Seawright, an act to amend the  
24 Elder Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the  
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce  
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill  
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
13 238, Senate Print 7131B, by Senator May, an act  
14 to amend the Executive Law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the  
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This  
18 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it  
19 shall have become a law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the  
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce  
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: In relation to

1 Calendar 238, voting in the negative are  
2 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,  
3 Chan, Helming, Martins, Mattera, Murray, Ortt,  
4 Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk and Weber.

5 Ayes, 44. Nays, 14.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill  
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
9 249, Senate Print 5003B, by Senator Hinchey, an  
10 act to amend the Public Authorities Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the  
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This  
14 act shall take effect immediately.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the  
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce  
19 the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill  
22 is passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
24 259, Senate Print 1723, by Senator Harckham, an  
25 act to amend the Executive Law.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:   Read the  
2   last section.

3                   THE SECRETARY:   Section 2.  This  
4   act shall take effect immediately.

5                   ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:   Call the  
6   roll.

7                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:   Announce  
9   the results.

10                  THE SECRETARY:   Ayes, 58.

11                  ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:   The bill  
12   is passed.

13                  THE SECRETARY:   Calendar Number  
14   299, Senate Print 5049A, by Senator Bailey, an  
15   act to amend the Insurance Law.

16                  ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:   Read the  
17   last section.

18                  THE SECRETARY:   Section 2.  This  
19   act shall take effect immediately.

20                  ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:   Call the  
21   roll.

22                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

23                  ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:   Announce  
24   the results.

25                  THE SECRETARY:   Ayes, 58.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:    The bill  
2   is passed.

3                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
4   305, Senate Print 5939C, by Senator Skoufis, an  
5   act to amend the Public Health Law.

6                   SENATOR LANZA:    Lay it aside.

7                   ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:   Lay it  
8   aside.

9                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
10   349, Senate Print 8555, by Senator Palumbo, an  
11   act to amend Chapter 282 of the Laws of 2003.

12                   ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:   Read the  
13   last section.

14                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.   This  
15   act shall take effect immediately.

16                   ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:   Call the  
17   roll.

18                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

19                   ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:   Announce  
20   the results.

21                   THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
22   Calendar 349, voting in the negative are  
23   Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Harckham, Lanza,  
24   Martinez, Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton and Skoufis.

25                   Ayes, 51.   Nays, 7.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:    The bill  
2    is passed.

3                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
4    392, Senate Print 3207B, by Senator Kavanagh, an  
5    act to amend the Public Health Law.

6                   ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:    Read the  
7    last section.

8                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.  This  
9    act shall take effect one year after it shall  
10   have become a law.

11                  ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:    Call the  
12   roll.

13                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

14                  ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:    Announce  
15   the results.

16                  THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 58.

17                  ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:    The bill  
18   is passed.

19                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
20   404, Senate Print 4099, by Senator Parker, an act  
21   to amend the Administrative Code of the City of  
22   New York.

23                  ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:    Read the  
24   last section.

25                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 5.  This

1 act shall take effect on the 120th day after it  
2 shall have become a law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the  
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce  
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
9 Calendar 404, voting in the negative are  
10 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,  
11 Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins,  
12 Mattera, Murray, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison,  
13 Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

14 Ayes, 39. Nays, 19.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill  
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
18 414, Senate Print 5257C, by Senator Hinchey, an  
19 act to amend the General Business Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This  
23 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it  
24 shall have become a law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
9 425, Assembly Bill Number 6666A, by  
10 Assemblymember Kelles, an act to amend the  
11 Correction Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
15 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it  
16 shall have become a law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator  
21 Stec to explain his vote.

22 SENATOR STEC: Thank you,  
23 Mr. President.

24 This bill would require DOCCS to  
25 make facility water-testing results accessible to

1 the public, to our staff, and to the  
2 incarcerated. It's transparency, and that's a  
3 good thing, and I'll be voting in favor.

4           However, it strikes me that what  
5 we're doing here, we're doing nothing to prevent  
6 fentanyl and other drugs and contraband from  
7 coming into our facilities. It seems that we're  
8 more concerned about water quality for rapists  
9 and child molesters and murderers than we are  
10 about preventing deadly drugs and contraband from  
11 coming into our facilities.

12           I just thought I'd highlight that as  
13 we continue to do nothing in our correctional  
14 facilities for our employees that worked there  
15 and are risking their lives for us.

16           ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator  
17 Stec to be recorded in the affirmative.

18           Announce the results.

19           THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

20           ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
21 is passed.

22           THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
23 465, Senate Print 4152A, by Senator Sanders, an  
24 act to amend the Executive Law.

25           ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
13 490, Assembly Bill Number 582A, by  
14 Assemblymember Steck, an act to amend the  
15 Elder Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
19 act shall take effect one year after it shall  
20 have become a law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
25 the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
5 514, Senate Print 1784A, by Senator Hinchey, an  
6 act to amend the Real Property Actions and  
7 Proceedings Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This  
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
21 538, Senate Print 5067B, by Senator Sepúlveda, an  
22 act to amend the Education Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 33. This

1 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it  
2 shall have become a law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
9 Calendar 538, voting in the negative:  
10 Senators Skoufis and Walczyk.

11 Ayes, 56. Nays, 2.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
13 is passed.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
15 553, Senate Print 1009, by Senator Brouk, an act  
16 to amend the Veterans' Services Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This  
20 act shall take effect immediately.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
25 the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
5 573, Assembly Bill Number 3029A, by  
6 Assemblymember Kelles, an act to amend the  
7 Executive Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
21 584, Senate Print 4945, by Senator Comrie, an act  
22 to amend the Public Authorities Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This

1 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it  
2 shall have become a law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
12 590, Senate Print 614B, by Senator Rivera, an act  
13 to amend the Correction Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This  
17 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it  
18 shall have become a law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
25 Calendar 590, voting in the negative are

1 Senators Borrello, Chan, Gallivan, Griffo,  
2 Helming, Lanza, Mattera, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,  
3 Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

4 Ayes, 43. Nays, 15.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
6 is passed.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
8 597, Senate Print 2666B, by Senator Salazar, an  
9 act to amend the Correction Law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
11 last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
13 act shall take effect immediately.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
18 the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
20 Calendar 597, voting in the negative are  
21 Senators Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Ortt, Stec,  
22 Tedisco, Walczyk and Weik.

23 Ayes, 50. Nays, 8.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
25 is passed.

1                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
2   670, Senate Print 9409A, by Senator Martinez, an  
3   act authorizing the Commissioner of  
4   Transportation to extend the lease of certain  
5   state lands located in the hamlet of Farmingdale.

6                   SENATOR LANZA:   Lay it aside.

7                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:   Lay it  
8   aside.

9                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
10  687, Assembly Bill Number 5592A, by  
11  Assemblymember Lucas, an act to direct the  
12  Department of State and Public Service Commission  
13  to jointly study and report upon the provision to  
14  consumer reporting agencies.

15                  ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:   Read the  
16  last section.

17                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 2. This  
18  act shall take effect immediately.

19                  ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:   Call the  
20  roll.

21                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

22                  ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:   Announce  
23  the results.

24                  THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
25  Calendar Number 687, voting in the negative are

1 Senators Gallivan, Martins and Ortt.

2 Ayes, 55. Nays, 3.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
6 698, Senate Print 8512C, by Senator Krueger, an  
7 act to amend the Public Service Law.

8 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Lay it  
10 aside.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
12 716, Senate Print 8732, by Senator Fahy, an act  
13 to amend the Public Officers Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
24 Calendar 716, voting in the negative:  
25 Senator Brisport.

1                   Ayes, 57. Nays, 1.

2                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
3 is passed.

4                   THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
5 720, Assembly Bill Number 10405, by  
6 Assemblymember Jacobson, an act to amend the  
7 Public Officers Law.

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
9 last section.

10                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12                  ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
13 roll.

14                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

15                  ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
16 the results.

17                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
18 Calendar 720, voting in the negative:  
19 Senator Brisport.

20                  Ayes, 57. Nays, 1.

21                  ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
22 is passed.

23                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
24 723, Assembly Bill Number 659, by  
25 Assemblymember Rosenthal, an act to amend the

1 Real Property Tax Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This  
5 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it  
6 shall have become a law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
13 Calendar 723, voting in the negative are  
14 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,  
15 Chan, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming, Lanza, Martins,  
16 Mattera, Murray, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison,  
17 Skoufis, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

18 Ayes, 37. Nays, 21.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
22 754, Assembly Bill Number 8047B, by  
23 Assemblymember Rajkumar, an act to amend the  
24 Court of Claims Act.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This  
3 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it  
4 shall have become a law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
9 the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
14 764, Senate Print 8962, by Senator Rhoads, an act  
15 in relation to authorizing the Telugu Literary  
16 and Cultural Association to receive retroactive  
17 real property tax-exempt status.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
3 Calendar 764, voting in the negative:  
4 Senator Skoufis.

5 Ayes, 57. Nays, 1.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
9 769, Assembly Bill Number 6001A, by  
10 Assemblymember Schiavoni, an act in relation to  
11 the issuance of pool and health memberships to  
12 disabled veterans.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This  
16 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it  
17 shall have become a law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator  
22 Palumbo to explain his vote.

23 SENATOR PALUMBO: Thank you,  
24 Mr. President.

25 I just wanted to commend the chair

1 of the Veterans Committee for bringing this bill  
2 to the floor and making it statewide. We  
3 discussed this bill. They do it in  
4 Suffolk County for our disabled veterans.

5 Commander Bill Hughes in the  
6 Westhampton Beach VFW Post brought this to our  
7 attention, that this should be something we  
8 should definitely do statewide to assist our  
9 disabled veterans to use the facilities, use the  
10 pools, use the gym, to assist in their recovery  
11 and overall health.

12 So thank you to the chairwoman for  
13 bringing me on as a coprime sponsor as well, and  
14 I proudly vote aye.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator  
16 Palumbo to be recorded in the affirmative.

17 Announce the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
22 781, Senate Print 7779, by Senator Fernandez, an  
23 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
25 last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This  
2 act shall take effect immediately.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator  
7 Fernandez to explain her vote.

8 SENATOR FERNANDEZ: Thank you,  
9 Mr. President.

10 New York State has a proud tradition  
11 of using distinct license plates to commemorate  
12 the service of our veterans. We have license  
13 plates for recognizing military branches,  
14 Catholic war veterans, the Gold Star Mothers, and  
15 many others who have served our nation with  
16 honor.

17 This bill carries that tradition  
18 forward by honoring the 65th Infantry Regiment,  
19 the Borinqueneers, whose legacy was forged by  
20 fire during the Korean War. Many of the brave  
21 soldiers of this storied military unit settled  
22 here in New York, building lives, raising  
23 families, and continuing their service to our  
24 communities.

25 As we continue the evergreen mission

1 of honoring our veterans, this legislation  
2 provides a meaningful token of appreciation to  
3 the Borinqueneers and their families. We have  
4 seen similar legislation passed in other states,  
5 and it is time for New York to do so as well, to  
6 give the Borinqueneers license plate a home.

7 Thank you, and I proudly vote aye.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator  
9 Fernandez to be recorded in the affirmative.

10 Announce the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
13 is passed.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
15 792, Senate Print 5452, by Senator Comrie, an act  
16 to amend the Election Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
20 act shall take effect immediately.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
25 the results.

1                   THE SECRETARY:   In relation to  
2   Calendar 792, voting in the negative are  
3   Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,  
4   Gallivan, Griffio, Helming, Lanza, Martins,  
5   Mattera, Murray, Ortt, Rhoads, Rolison,  
6   Scarcella-Spanton, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber  
7   and Weik.

8                   Ayes, 39.   Nays, 19.

9                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:   The bill  
10   is passed.

11                  THE SECRETARY:   Calendar Number  
12   858, Senate Print 680, by Senator Martinez, an  
13   act to amend the Executive Law.

14                  ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:   Read the  
15   last section.

16                  THE SECRETARY:   Section 2.   This  
17   act shall take effect immediately.

18                  ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:   Call the  
19   roll.

20                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

21                  ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:   Announce  
22   the results.

23                  THE SECRETARY:   Ayes, 58.

24                  ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:   The bill  
25   is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
2 866, Senate Print 6882, by Senator Harckham, an  
3 act to amend the General Municipal Law.

4 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Lay it  
6 aside.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
8 870, Assembly Bill Number 8480, by  
9 Assemblymember Bronson, an act to amend the  
10 Workers' Compensation Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
14 act shall take effect immediately.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
19 the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
21 Calendar 870, voting in the negative:  
22 Senator Borrello.

23 Ayes, 57. Nays, 1.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
25 is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
2 874, Senate Print 1280B, by Senator Krueger, an  
3 act to amend the General Business Law.

4 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Lay it  
6 aside.

7 There is a home-rule message at the  
8 desk.

9 The Secretary will read.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
11 891, Senate Print 8956, by Senator Stec, an act  
12 to amend the Public Housing Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
19 Calendar 891, voting in the negative:  
20 Senator Ryan.

21 Ayes, 57. Nays, 1.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
25 902, Senate Print 9961, by Senator Martinez, an

1 act to amend the Real Property Tax Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
5 act shall take effect on the first of January.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
10 the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
12 Calendar 902, voting in the negative:  
13 Senator Brisport.

14 Ayes, 57. Nays, 1.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
18 904, Senate Print 10023, by Senator Martinez, an  
19 act to amend the Real Property Tax Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This  
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
3 the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
5 Calendar 904, voting in the negative:  
6 Senator Skoufis.

7 Ayes, 57. Nays, 1.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
11 906, Senate Print 8288A, by Senator Persaud, an  
12 act to amend the Education Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
16 act shall take effect immediately.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
21 the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1       911, Senate Print 10049, by Senator Jackson, an  
2       act to amend the Education Law.

3                ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Read the  
4       last section.

5                THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.  This  
6       act shall take effect immediately.

7                ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Call the  
8       roll.

9                (The Secretary called the roll.)

10               ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Announce  
11       the results.

12               THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 58.

13               ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    The bill  
14       is passed.

15               THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
16       916, Senate Print 9789, by Senator Sepúlveda, an  
17       act to amend the Uniform City Court Act.

18               ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Read the  
19       last section.

20               THE SECRETARY:    Section 4.  This  
21       act shall take effect on the 90th day after it  
22       shall have become a law.

23               ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Call the  
24       roll.

25               (The Secretary called the roll.)

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:   Announce  
2   the results.

3                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:   In  
4   relation to Calendar 916, voting in the negative  
5   are Senators Ashby, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,  
6   Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins,  
7   Mattera, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco,  
8   Walczyk, Weber and Weik. Also Senator Borrello.

9                   Ayes, 40. Nays, 18.

10                  ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:   The bill  
11   is passed.

12                  THE SECRETARY:   Calendar Number  
13   927, Senate Print 5134, by Senator Harckham, an  
14   act to amend the Correction Law.

15                  SENATOR LANZA:   Lay it aside.

16                  ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:   Lay it  
17   aside.

18                  THE SECRETARY:   Calendar Number  
19   951, Senate Print 10039, by Senator Martinez, an  
20   act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

21                  ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:   Read the  
22   last section.

23                  THE SECRETARY:   Section 2. This  
24   act shall take effect immediately.

25                  ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:   Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
9 966, Senate Print 6020A, by Senator Baskin, an  
10 act to amend the Executive Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
14 act shall take effect immediately.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
19 the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
22 is passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
24 968, Senate Print 1634A, by Senator Rivera, an  
25 act to amend the Insurance Law.

1                   SENATOR LANZA:   Lay it aside.

2                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:   Lay it  
3   aside.

4                   THE SECRETARY:   Calendar Number  
5   977, Assembly Bill Number 7840A, by  
6   Assemblymember Weprin, an act to amend the  
7   Public Health Law.

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:   Read the  
9   last section.

10                  THE SECRETARY:   Section 3. This  
11   act shall take effect on the 30th day after it  
12   shall have become a law.

13                  ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:   Call the  
14   roll.

15                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

16                  ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:   Announce  
17   the results.

18                  THE SECRETARY:   Ayes, 58.

19                  ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:   The bill  
20   is passed.

21                  THE SECRETARY:   Calendar Number  
22   1000, Senate Print 7484A, by Senator Mayer, an  
23   act to amend the Mental Hygiene Law.

24                  ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:   Read the  
25   last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
2 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it  
3 shall have become a law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
13 1021, Senate Print 9793, by Senator Sepúlveda, an  
14 act to repeal Section 470 of the Judiciary Law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
18 act shall take effect immediately.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
25 Calendar 1021, voting in the negative are

1 Senators Lanza and Skoufis.

2 Ayes, 56. Nays, 2.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
6 1023, Senate Print 2516A, by Senator Gounardes,  
7 an act to amend the Social Services Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This  
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
21 1030, Senate Print 6150, by Senator Parker, an  
22 act to amend the Banking Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This

1 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it  
2 shall have become a law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
12 1054, Senate Print 6225, by Senator Rivera, an  
13 act to amend the Social Services Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This  
17 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it  
18 shall have become a law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator  
23 Rivera to explain his vote.

24 SENATOR RIVERA: Thank you,  
25 Mr. President.

1 I'm very glad that we're voting on  
2 this bill today. We've passed it the last couple  
3 of years, and I'm hoping that we can get it over  
4 the finish line.

5 A few years ago I'm sure we've all  
6 heard about the tragedy of Nicholas Dominici, a  
7 young boy who was at a daycare center and  
8 unfortunately found some heroin that was being  
9 stashed away by the folks who were running the  
10 daycare center.

11 These folks -- he passed away that  
12 day. Some of his classmates were hurt but gladly  
13 did not pass away.

14 Those folks were found, they were  
15 held responsible, they were convicted, and I'm  
16 very glad that they were.

17 But this bill, Mr. President, is to  
18 make sure that parents can feel safe when they  
19 leave their children in a daycare center. It  
20 would create standards so that they would be able  
21 to inspect the childcare center to be able to  
22 make certain that it is safe for their children,  
23 as well as to provide both training for the folks  
24 who run the daycare centers, and set standards as  
25 to what they have to make sure that they

1 recognize as it relates to drug paraphernalia,  
2 et cetera, to make sure that they can keep the  
3 children that they are responsible for taking  
4 care of safe.

5 So I am glad that we're passing this  
6 today. And I should mention that I am  
7 particularly proud of this piece of legislation  
8 since it came to me directly from the parents  
9 themselves of Nicholas Dominici, who came to my  
10 staff and myself and wanted to make sure it did  
11 not happen to another kid.

12 So I'm glad that we're passing it  
13 today. I'm hoping that we can get it signed into  
14 law. I vote in the affirmative, Mr. President.

15 Thank you.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator  
17 Rivera to be recorded in the affirmative.

18 Announce the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
20 Calendar 1054, voting in the negative:  
21 Senator Walczyk.

22 Ayes, 57. Nays, 1.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1058, Senate Print 4887B, by Senator Walczyk, an  
2 act to amend the Tax Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
4 last section.

5 SENATOR GIANARIS: Lay it aside.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Lay it  
7 aside.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
9 1060, Senate Print 6047A, by Senator Skoufis, an  
10 act to amend the Tax Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
14 act shall take effect immediately.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
19 the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
21 Calendar 1060, voting in the negative are  
22 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Harckham,  
23 Helming, Hinchey, Lanza, Martinez, Ortt, Palumbo,  
24 Rhoads, Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton and Weik. Also  
25 Senator Tedisco.

1                   Ayes, 45.   Nays, 13.

2                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    The bill  
3   is passed.

4                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
5   1061, Senate Print 6834A, by Senator Oberacker,  
6   an act to amend the Tax Law.

7                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Read the  
8   last section.

9                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.  This  
10  act shall take effect immediately.

11                  ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Call the  
12  roll.

13                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

14                  ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Announce  
15  the results.

16                  THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
17  Calendar 1061, voting in the negative are  
18  Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Harckham,  
19  Helming, Lanza, Martinez, Ortt, Rhoads, Ryan,  
20  Scarcella-Spanton, Skoufis and Weik.

21                  Ayes, 47.   Nays, 11.

22                  ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    The bill  
23  is passed.

24                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
25  1063, Senate Print 7820B, by Senator Oberacker,

1 an act to amend the Tax Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
5 act shall take effect immediately.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
10 the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
12 Calendar 1063, voting in the negative are  
13 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Harckham,  
14 Helming, Lanza, Martinez, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,  
15 Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton, Skoufis and Weik.

16 Ayes, 46. Nays, 12.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
20 1064, Senate Print 7966A, by Senator  
21 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, an act to amend the  
22 Tax Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This

1 act shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
6 the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
8 Calendar 1064, voting in the negative are  
9 Senators Harckham, Helming, Lanza, Martinez,  
10 Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton,  
11 Skoufis and Weik.

12 Ayes, 47. Nays, 11.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
16 1065, Senate Print 8188A, by Senator Hinchey, an  
17 act to amend the Tax Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
3 Calendar 1065, voting in the negative are  
4 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Harckham,  
5 Helming, Lanza, Martinez, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,  
6 Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton, Skoufis and Weik.

7 Ayes 46. Nays, 12.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
11 1067, Senate Print 8482A, by Senator Stec, an act  
12 to amend the Tax Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
16 act shall take effect immediately.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
21 the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
23 Calendar 1067, voting in the negative are  
24 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Lanza, Ryan and  
25 Scarcella-Spanton. Also Senator Skoufis as well.

1                   Ayes, 53.   Nays, 5.

2                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    The bill  
3   is passed.

4                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
5   1068, Senate Print 9027, by Senator Borrello, an  
6   act to amend the Tax Law.

7                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Read the  
8   last section.

9                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.   This  
10   act shall take effect immediately.

11                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Call the  
12   roll.

13                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

14                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Announce  
15   the results.

16                   THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
17   Calendar 1068, voting in the negative are  
18   Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Harckham,  
19   Helming, Lanza, Martinez, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,  
20   Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton, Skoufis, Tedisco and  
21   Weik.

22                   Ayes, 45.   Nays, 13.

23                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    The bill  
24   is passed.

25                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number

1 1069, Assembly Bill Number 10032, by  
2 Assemblymember Eachus, an act to amend  
3 Chapter 283 of the Laws of 2023.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
7 act shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
14 Calendar 1069, voting in the negative are  
15 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Harckham,  
16 Hinchey, Lanza, Martinez, Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton  
17 and Stec.

18 Ayes, 50. Nays, 8.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
22 1070, Senate Print 9157A, by Senator Borrello, an  
23 act to amend the Tax Law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
25 last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
2 act shall take effect immediately.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
9 Calendar 1070, voting in the negative are  
10 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Harckham,  
11 Helming, Lanza, Martinez, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,  
12 Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton, Skoufis, Tedisco and  
13 Weik.

14 Ayes, 45. Nays, 13.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
18 1071, Senate Print 9264A, by Senator Rolison, an  
19 act to amend Chapter 295 of the Laws of 2023.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: There is  
21 a home-rule message at the desk.

22 Read the last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This  
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
6 Calendar 1071, voting in the negative are  
7 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Harckham, Lanza,  
8 Martinez, Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton and Skoufis.

9 Ayes, 51. Nays, 7.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
13 1072, Senate Print 9273, by Senator Krueger, an  
14 act to amend the Alcoholic Beverage Control Law.

15 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Lay it  
17 aside.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
19 1073, Senate Print 9314, by Senator Gallivan, an  
20 act to amend the Tax Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
6 Calendar 1073, voting in the negative are  
7 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Harckham,  
8 Helming, Lanza, Martinez, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,  
9 Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton, Skoufis, Tedisco and  
10 Weik.

11 Ayes, 45. Nays, 13.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
13 is passed.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
15 1075, Assembly Bill Number 10522, by  
16 Assemblymember Barrett, an act to amend the  
17 Tax Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
3 Calendar 1075, voting in the negative are  
4 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Harckham,  
5 Helming, Lanza, Martinez, Ortt, Palumbo, Ryan,  
6 Scarcella-Spanton, Skoufis, Tedisco and Weik.

7 Ayes, 46. Nays, 12.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
11 1076, Senate Print 9376A, by Senator Gallivan, an  
12 act to amend the Tax Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
16 act shall take effect immediately.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
21 the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
23 Calendar 1076, voting in the negative are  
24 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Harckham,  
25 Helming, Lanza, Martinez, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,

1 Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton, Skoufis, Tedisco and  
2 Weik.

3 Ayes, 45. Nays, 13.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
7 1077, Senate Print 9504A, by Senator Rolison, an  
8 act to amend Chapter 294 of the Laws of 2023.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: There is  
10 a home-rule message at the desk.

11 Read the last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This  
13 act shall take effect immediately.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
18 the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
20 Calendar 1077, voting in the negative are  
21 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Harckham, Lanza,  
22 Martinez, Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton and Skoufis.

23 Ayes, 51. Nays, 7.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
25 is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
2 1080, Assembly Bill Number 10737A, by  
3 Assemblymember Shrestha, an act to amend the  
4 Tax Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
8 act shall take effect immediately.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
13 the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
15 Calendar 1080, voting in the negative are  
16 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Harckham,  
17 Helming, Lanza, Martinez, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,  
18 Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton, Skoufis, Tedisco and  
19 Weik.

20 Ayes, 45. Nays, 13.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
22 is passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
24 1083, Assembly Bill Number 10932A, by  
25 Assemblymember McMahon, an act to amend the

1 Tax Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
5 act shall take effect immediately.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
10 the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
12 Calendar 1083, voting in the negative are  
13 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Helming, Lanza,  
14 Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Ryan, Tedisco and Weik.

15 Ayes, 49. Nays, 9.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
19 1084, Senate Print 9862A, by Senator Skoufis, an  
20 act to amend the Tax Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: There's a  
22 home-rule message at the desk.

23 Read the last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Call the  
2   roll.

3                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

4                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Announce  
5   the results.

6                   THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
7   Calendar 1084, voting in the negative are  
8   Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Harckham,  
9   Helming, Hinchey, Lanza, Martinez, Ortt, Palumbo,  
10   Rhoads, Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton, Stec, Tedisco  
11   and Weik.

12                   Ayes, 44.   Nays, 14.

13                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    The bill  
14   is passed.

15                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
16   1087, Senate Print 10029, by Senator Stec, an act  
17   to amend the Tax Law.

18                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Read the  
19   last section.

20                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.   This  
21   act shall take effect immediately.

22                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Call the  
23   roll.

24                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

25                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
3 Calendar 1087, voting in the negative are  
4 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Harckham,  
5 Helming, Lanza, Martinez, Rhoads, Ryan,  
6 Scarcella-Spanton, Skoufis, Tedisco and Weik.

7 Ayes, 47. Nays, 11.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
11 1090, Senate Print Number 10188, by  
12 Senator Skoufis, an act to repeal Section 2 of  
13 Chapter 316 of the Laws of 2025.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
24 Calendar 1090, voting in the negative are  
25 Senators Lanza, Martinez and Ryan.

1                   Ayes, 55.   Nays, 3.

2                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    The bill  
3   is passed.

4                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
5   1114, Senate Print 8690, by Senator Cleare, an  
6   act to amend the Alcoholic Beverage Control Law.

7                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Read the  
8   last section.

9                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.   This  
10   act shall take effect immediately.

11                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Call the  
12   roll.

13                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

14                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Announce  
15   the results.

16                   THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
17   Calendar 1114, voting in the negative are  
18   Senators Lanza and Martinez.

19                   Ayes, 56.   Nays, 2.

20                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    The bill  
21   is passed.

22                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
23   1115, Senate Print 10001, by Senator Skoufis, an  
24   act to amend the Alcoholic Beverage Control Law.

25                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
10 Calendar 1115, voting in the negative:  
11 Senator Martinez.

12 Ayes, 57. Nays, 1.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
16 1131, Assembly Bill Number 9520, by  
17 Assemblymember Pretlow, an act to amend the  
18 Local Finance Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: There is  
20 a home-rule message at the desk.

21 Read the last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
3 the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
5 Calendar 1131, voting in the negative:  
6 Senators Skoufis and Walczyk.

7 Ayes, 56. Nays, 2.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
11 1132, Senate Print 9839, by Senator Baskin, an  
12 act to amend the Local Finance Law.

13 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Lay it  
15 aside.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
17 1137, Senate Print 10266, by Senator Webb, an act  
18 to amend the Tax Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This  
22 act shall take effect immediately.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:   Announce  
2   the results.

3                   THE SECRETARY:   In relation to  
4   Calendar 1137, voting in the negative are  
5   Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Helming, Lanza,  
6   Palumbo, Ryan, Tedisco and Weik.

7                   Ayes, 51.   Nays, 7.

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:   The bill  
9   is passed.

10                  THE SECRETARY:   Calendar Number  
11   1153, Senate Print 267, by Senator Sanders, an  
12   act to amend the Executive Law.

13                  ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:   Read the  
14   last section.

15                  THE SECRETARY:   Section 2.   This  
16   act shall take effect on the 270th day after it  
17   shall have become a law.

18                  ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:   Call the  
19   roll.

20                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

21                  ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:   Announce  
22   the results.

23                  THE SECRETARY:   Ayes, 58.

24                  ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:   The bill  
25   is passed.

1                   THE SECRETARY:   Calendar Number  
2   1158, Senate Print Number 2073, by  
3   Senator Scarcella-Spanton, an act to amend  
4   the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

5                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:   Read the  
6   last section.

7                   THE SECRETARY:   Section 3. This  
8   act shall take effect immediately.

9                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:   Call the  
10   roll.

11                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

12                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:   Announce  
13   the results.

14                   THE SECRETARY:   Ayes, 58.

15                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:   The bill  
16   is passed.

17                   THE SECRETARY:   Calendar Number  
18   1162, Assembly Bill Number 7627B, by  
19   Assemblymember Kay, an act to amend the Veterans'  
20   Services Law.

21                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:   Read the  
22   last section.

23                   THE SECRETARY:   Section 3. This  
24   act shall take effect on the 90th day after it  
25   shall have become a law.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Call the  
2    roll.

3                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

4                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Announce  
5    the results.

6                   THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 58.

7                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    The bill  
8    is passed.

9                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
10   1163, Senate Print 8233, by Senator Sanders, an  
11   act to amend the New York City Charter.

12                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Read the  
13   last section.

14                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 3. This  
15   act shall take effect immediately.

16                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Call the  
17   roll.

18                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

19                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Announce  
20   the results.

21                   THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 58.

22                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    The bill  
23   is passed.

24                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
25   1167, Senate Print 10000, by Senator Brisport, an

1 act to amend the Family Court Act.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
5 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it  
6 shall have become a law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
13 Calendar 1167, voting in the negative are  
14 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Griffo,  
15 Helming, Martins, Mattera, Murray, Palumbo,  
16 Rhoads, Stec, Walczyk and Weik. Also  
17 Senator Tedisco.

18 Ayes, 45. Nays, 13.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
22 1168, Senate Print 79, by Senator Liu, an act to  
23 amend the Education Law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
25 last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
2 act shall take effect immediately.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
12 1195, Senate Print 1140A, by Senator Gonzalez, an  
13 act to amend the Tax Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
24 Calendar 1195, voting in the negative are  
25 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,

1 Chan, Cooney, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza,  
2 Martinez, Martins, Mattera, Murray, Ortt, Rhoads,  
3 Scarcella-Spanton, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber  
4 and Weik.

5 Ayes, 37. Nays, 21.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
9 1197, Senate Print 1192, by Senator Addabbo, an  
10 act to amend the Criminal Procedure Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
14 act shall take effect immediately.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
19 the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
21 Calendar 1197, voting in the negative:  
22 Senator Brisport.

23 Ayes, 57. Nays, 1.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
25 is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
2 1203, Senate Print 3243A, by Senator Cooney, an  
3 act to amend the Social Services Law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
7 act shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
17 1207, Senate Print 6025, by Senator Brouk, an act  
18 to amend the Social Services Law.

19 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Lay it  
21 aside.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
23 1210, Senate Print 7611B, by Senator Bynoe, an  
24 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This  
3 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it  
4 shall have become a law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
9 the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
14 1237, Senate Print 6980, by Senator Persaud, an  
15 act to create a temporary state commission to  
16 study and make recommendations concerning the  
17 incidence of asthma in the Borough of Brooklyn.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This  
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
6 1242, Senate Print 1695, by Senator Skoufis, an  
7 act to amend the Real Property Tax Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
18 Calendar 1242, voting in the negative are  
19 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Griffo,  
20 Lanza, Martinez, Martins, Mattera, Rhoads,  
21 Tedisco, Weber and Weik.

22 Ayes, 47. Nays, 11.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1245, Senate Print 5168A, by Senator Rolison, an  
2 act to amend the Real Property Tax Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
13 Calendar 1245, voting in the negative are  
14 Senators Griffo, Lanza, Martinez, Rhoads,  
15 Scarcella-Spanton, Weber and Weik.

16 Ayes, 51. Nays, 7.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
20 1251, Senate Print 9968, by Senator Gallivan, an  
21 act in relation to establishing the Harris Hill  
22 Volunteer Fire Company Benevolent Association.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This

1 act shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
6 the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
11 1252, Assembly Bill Number 10325, by  
12 Assemblymember Kassay, an act in relation to  
13 authorizing the assessor of the Town of  
14 Brookhaven to accept an application for a real  
15 property tax exemption.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This  
19 act shall take effect immediately.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: In relation to

1 Calendar 1252, voting in the negative:

2 Senator Skoufis.

3 Ayes, 57. Nays, 1.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
7 1271, Assembly Bill Number 9351A, by  
8 Assemblymember Magnarelli, an act to amend the  
9 Vehicle and Traffic Law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
11 last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
13 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it  
14 shall have become a law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator  
19 Ryan to explain his vote.

20 SENATOR RYAN: Thank you. Thank  
21 you, Mr. President.

22 So I rise in support of this bill.  
23 This is legislation that I wrote to address an  
24 issue directly brought to my attention by a  
25 constituent -- not just any constituent, but a

1 disabled veteran who had experienced firsthand  
2 the frustrating and unnecessary barriers this  
3 bill seeks to eliminate.

4 At its core, what this legislation  
5 is about, it's about respect and it's also about  
6 common sense. Currently, today, veterans who  
7 have already been determined by the United States  
8 Department of Veterans Affairs to be 100 percent  
9 service-connected disabled are still forced to  
10 navigate an additional duplicative process in  
11 order to obtain a license plate bearing the  
12 universal symbol of access.

13 For veterans living with  
14 life-altering injuries and chronic health  
15 challenges, these hurdles -- they're more than  
16 just frustrating, they're burdensome and they're  
17 truly unnecessary.

18 This bill simply aligns state  
19 practice with federal determinations by  
20 recognizing a veteran's 100 percent VA disability  
21 rating as sufficient proof of eligibility for  
22 accessibility of accommodations.

23 Our veterans answered the call to  
24 serve this country. Too many return home  
25 carrying permanent wounds as a result of that

1 noble service. The least that we can do is  
2 ensure that they are not forced to fight through  
3 unnecessary red tape just to access the  
4 accommodations that they have already earned.

5 I certainly want to thank my  
6 constituent who brought this issue to my  
7 attention, and I urge my colleagues to support  
8 this great bill.

9 Thank you. I vote aye.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator  
11 Ryan to be recorded in the affirmative.

12 Announce the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
17 1275, Senate Print 9238, by Senator Mayer, an act  
18 to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: There is  
20 a home-rule message at the desk.

21 Read the last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This  
23 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it  
24 shall have become a law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
6 Calendar 1275, voting in the negative are  
7 Senators Bynoe, Lanza and Martinez.

8 Ayes, 55. Nays, 3.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
12 1277, Assembly Bill Number 10722, by  
13 Assemblymember Paulin, an act to amend  
14 Chapter 460 of the Laws of 2021.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: There is  
16 a home-rule message at the desk.

17 Read the last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
19 act shall take effect immediately.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: In relation to

1 Calendar 1277, voting in the negative are  
2 Senators Bynoe, Martinez and Murray.

3 Ayes, 55. Nays, 3.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
7 1306, Senate Print 7100, by Senator Lanza, an act  
8 to rename the Oakwood Beach wetland the Oakwood  
9 Beach-Detective Russel Timoshenko Preserve.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
11 last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
13 act shall take effect immediately.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
18 the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
20 Calendar 1306, voting in the negative:  
21 Senator Brisport.

22 Ayes, 57. Nays, 1.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1309, Senate Print 9202, by Senator Ortt, an act  
2 to amend Chapter 389 of the Laws of 2024.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
13 Calendar 1309, voting in the negative are  
14 Senators Brisport and Martinez.

15 Ayes, 56. Nays, 2.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
19 1312, Senate Print 3233A, by Senator Kavanagh, an  
20 act to amend the Elections Law.

21 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Lay it  
23 aside.

24 Senator Gianaris, that completes the  
25 reading of today's calendar.

1                   SENATOR GIANARIS:   Mr. President,  
2     going back to motions and resolutions, on behalf  
3     of Senator Salazar I offer the following  
4     amendments to Calendar Number 1376, Senate Print  
5     8353, and ask that said bill retain its place on  
6     the Third Reading Calendar.

7                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:   The bill  
8     is restored to its place on the Third Reading  
9     Calendar.

10                  Senator Gianaris.

11                  SENATOR GIANARIS:   I'd also like to  
12     lay aside for the day Calendar 670, which was  
13     previously laid aside.

14                  ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:   Calendar  
15     Number 670 is laid aside for the day.

16                  Senator Gianaris.

17                  SENATOR GIANARIS:   All right,  
18     Mr. President. Cha-cha-cha. Let's take up  
19     previously adopted Resolution 2214, by  
20     Senator Webb, read its title and call on  
21     Senator Webb.

22                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   The  
23     Secretary will read.

24                  THE SECRETARY:   Resolution 2214, by  
25     Senator Webb, memorializing Governor Kathy Hochul

1 to proclaim June 2026 as Black Music Month in the  
2 State of New York.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator  
4 Webb on the resolution.

5 SENATOR WEBB: Thank you,  
6 Madam President.

7 I rise very proudly and excited  
8 today to commemorate Black Music Month here in  
9 our chamber here in our great State of New York.

10 Every June, Black Music Month is  
11 celebrated not only in our state, but nationally.  
12 It was first established in 1979, when Dyana  
13 Williams, Ed Wright, and Kenny Gamble approached  
14 then-President Jimmy Carter to establish this  
15 commemoration.

16 He hosted the first inaugural  
17 celebration on June 7, 1979, and years later,  
18 once Bill Clinton taken office, Dyana Williams  
19 wanted the White House to resume this celebration  
20 but was shocked to find out that President Carter  
21 had never actually officially signed the official  
22 presidential proclamation.

23 So she wrote House Concurrent  
24 Bill 509, got it passed in Congress, and brought  
25 it to President Clinton, who then finally signed

1 an official proclamation to officially recognize  
2 June as Black Music Month.

3 Now, every June, we recognize the  
4 accomplishments and the enduring legacy of Black  
5 artists, writers, performers, producers,  
6 countless others -- and the impact that their  
7 music has had on our culture, the culture of our  
8 state, country, and the world.

9 Throughout our nation's history  
10 Black music has been and is and always will be  
11 the very heartbeat of American culture, whether  
12 it is the powerful spirituals sung in the face of  
13 slavery, to the jazz clubs of Harlem, the hip-hop  
14 beats of the Bronx -- and we won't go into the  
15 contestment around them -- just kidding -- Black  
16 music has told the story of our struggle, our  
17 resilience, our joy, our determination for  
18 justice, and quite frankly for our shared  
19 absolute human right for dignity and respect.

20 It has always been about more than  
21 entertainment. We know that music is a form of  
22 protest. It calls attention to not only the  
23 trials and tribulations of the world, but it also  
24 is what brings us together and helps to create  
25 innovation, joy, and so much more.

1                   It also helps our communities to  
2                   heal. It brings people from all walks of life  
3                   together for one collective moment that most  
4                   certainly makes us even stronger.

5                   I think of a quote by one of the  
6                   founders of Black Music Month, Kenny Gamble --  
7                   and folks are familiar with Kenny Gamble, pioneer  
8                   of the "Philadelphia Sound," one of the founders.  
9                   He said that "Black is more than just a color, it  
10                  is a frame of mind. All genres of music created  
11                  by Black folks in America are our heart and  
12                  soul's gifts as well as a universal language  
13                  widely felt and embraced worldwide."

14                 Madam President, New York is deeply  
15                 connected to this movement. Dyana Williams, the  
16                 mother of Black Music Month, is from Harlem --  
17                 shout out to Senator Cordell Cleare, her  
18                 district. We are the home of countless  
19                 genre-defining artists whose voices have shaped  
20                 the very sound of music and continue to inspire  
21                 today.

22                 As we continue to journey forward  
23                 into the month of June to celebrate Black Music  
24                 Month, my colleagues and I held a reception  
25                 yesterday evening where we honored such

1     incredible artists who are both living and have  
2     gone on to be with our ancestors. Many of them  
3     are here with us today in the chamber, and it is  
4     truly my deep and profound honor and pleasure to  
5     name and recognize them not only by name, but  
6     also to further lift up the fact that the work  
7     that they do, and our taking this time to pause  
8     to recognize them, that we are not only  
9     recognizing their incredible gifts and talents,  
10    but as a legislative body we are inscribing their  
11    names forever into the annals of history here in  
12    our great State of New York.

13                 And so I would like to lift up the  
14    names of all of our honorees with us today in the  
15    chamber:

16                 The incredible and incomparable  
17    MC Lyte, also a Rock & Roll Hall of Fame  
18    inductee.

19                 DJ Beverly Bond, who has shown all  
20    of us Black girls how to rock.

21                 The incredible lyricist and  
22    conscious rapper and entrepreneur, Mr. Talib  
23    Kweli.

24                 Posthumously, I want to recognize  
25    Mr. Bob Law, who is here represented by his

1 beautiful daughter, Ms. Aisha Patrice Law.

2 And no one can ever underestimate  
3 the influence of jazz and most certainly one of  
4 jazz's sons, and that is none other than Mr. John  
5 Coltrane, who this year it is his 100th birthday.  
6 And we are joined today by his daughter,  
7 Michelle Coltrane.

8 We also understand the power and  
9 influence of Black radio, and we are joined today  
10 by incredible entrepreneur, CEOs and pioneers in  
11 that space. Coming from Buffalo, Ms. Sheila  
12 Brown, CEO and owner of WUFO Radio.

13 And of course last but not most  
14 certainly not least, Mr. Andre Langston, CEO and  
15 owner of WDKX Radio out of Rochester, whose  
16 actual radio station is named in honor of such  
17 important and great leaders like Frederick  
18 Douglass, Malcolm X, and Dr. Martin Luther King.

19 Madam President. Let us continue to  
20 make space for the creativity, protect cultural  
21 institutions, do not allow policy to erase the  
22 contributions of not just simply Black artists,  
23 but Black people and our shared experiences.  
24 That we commit in this chamber to commemorating  
25 Black Music Month and all the work that we do in

1     this chamber to uplift the next generation of  
2     Black artists and creatives whose voices will  
3     define not only our future, but most certainly  
4     shape and influence our present.

5                 I want to thank our Senate Majority  
6     Leader for supporting this resolution; all of my  
7     colleagues for the work that you've done over the  
8     last two days. It is my sincere hope and prayer  
9     that all of our honorees feel loved, appreciated,  
10    seen, celebrated.

11                And with that, I proudly vote aye,  
12    and Happy Black Music Month.

13                Thank you, Madam President.

14                ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,  
15    Senator Webb.

16                Senator Baskin on the resolution.

17                SENATOR BASKIN: Thank you,  
18    Madam President. I stand here today to recognize  
19    Black Music Month as the celebration of legacy  
20    that has shaped the culture and the soul of our  
21    nation.

22                I want to lift up our leader, Andrea  
23    Stewart-Cousins, for bringing this resolution  
24    forward. To our colleagues, who are part of the  
25    Black Task Force; to Elm Core for sponsoring this

1 beautiful two-day experience of celebratory  
2 celebrations of Black music here in the State  
3 Legislature; and to my colleague Senator Lea  
4 Webb, for leading the way on this wonderful,  
5 wonderful tribute.

6 Now that it is my second year in the  
7 State Senate, it is just such a beautiful,  
8 beautiful experience to take part in.

9 Black music has long been the  
10 soundtrack of the African-American experience in  
11 this country. It has told the story of struggle,  
12 resilience, resistance, freedom, joy and triumph.

13 It is more than just entertainment.  
14 It is protest. Black music is education. Black  
15 music is identity.

16 As we honor our distinguished guests  
17 who are here with us today -- who traveled so  
18 far, and I'm so happy to welcome them -- at this  
19 Black Music Month, I also want to recognize the  
20 leadership of so many others in our country who  
21 have contributed to this form of music.

22 As we celebrate here today, we must  
23 also remember Black music's painful history in  
24 this country. Our African ancestors brought here  
25 in chains, against their will, carried with them

1 traditions and cultural expressions that even the  
2 most inhumane forms of oppression could not  
3 erase.

4 Through spirituals, rhythm, dance  
5 and songs born from both suffering and hope, they  
6 created music that would lay the foundations for  
7 generations to come.

8 From gospel to jazz to blues to R&B  
9 to hip-hop, Black music has continuously evolved  
10 over the decades, shaping the music that we know  
11 and love today.

12 When I was growing up,  
13 Madam President, I was surrounded by generations  
14 of Black music. My grandparents would listen to  
15 Black artists of the 1950s and '60s: Little  
16 Richard, Ray Charles, James Brown, Ella  
17 Fitzgerald and Nat King Cole. My parents would  
18 always be seen blasting Earth, Wind and Fire,  
19 Stevie Wonder, Prince, and Michael Jackson around  
20 the house.

21 Those sounds became a part of my  
22 childhood. And as I got older, I adopted and was  
23 attracted to genres of my own. My favorite as an  
24 '80s baby and '90s kid was New Jack Swing. When  
25 I think of Teddy Riley, Jimmy Jam, Terry Lewis,

1 Janet Jackson, Babyface, that genre that defined  
2 the era of my childhood, it means so very much to  
3 me. That was the music that motivated me. I  
4 learned my first choreographed dance to New Jack  
5 Swing, New Edition.

6 When I hear these songs today, that  
7 brings me right back to my childhood, to feelings  
8 of joy and nostalgia.

9 So today as we celebrate Black Music  
10 Month, let us honor generations of Black  
11 musicians, creators, performers and pioneers who  
12 have transformed their pain into the soundtrack  
13 that continues to inspire us all. Let us lift up  
14 Sheila Brown, who I was able to speak on today at  
15 our press conference as the first Black woman to  
16 own a radio station here in the great State of  
17 New York, and all that she has contributed to  
18 Black music in uplifting Black voices across this  
19 country.

20 And a special shout out to MC Lyte.  
21 I was privileged to be able to shake her hand  
22 today and tell her that I don't think I would  
23 have the guts to be a Senator had it not been for  
24 her music. Paper Thin was an album that I  
25 listened to over and over and over again.

1                   And I really, really appreciate her  
2                   contributions to me in paving the way for me to  
3                   be the first Black woman from my City of Buffalo  
4                   to ever ascend to the State Senate.

5                   So may God continue to bless the  
6                   gifts, the creativity, and the artistry of Black  
7                   musicians for generations and generations to  
8                   come.

9                   Madam President, I proudly vote aye.

10                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Thank you,  
11                  Senator Baskin.

12                  Senator Zellner on the resolution.

13                  SENATOR ZELLNER:    Thank you,  
14                  Madam President.

15                  I rise today in support of this  
16                  resolution recognizing Black Music Month, and I  
17                  want to thank Senator Webb and Senator Baskin for  
18                  her comments, and Senator Webb for bringing it  
19                  before the Senate here.

20                  Black music and jazz are woven into  
21                  the fabric of Buffalo. For generations the  
22                  Colored Musicians Club has been the center of  
23                  that history. Legendary artists like  
24                  Duke Ellington, Billie Holiday, Ella Fitzgerald  
25                  came through those doors while traveling across

1 the country. It became a place where Black  
2 artists could gather, create and build community  
3 during a time when many spaces were closed off to  
4 them.

5 And more than a century later, the  
6 Colored Musicians Club is still standing. It  
7 remains the only continuously operated  
8 Black-owned music venue in the United States, and  
9 that is something Buffalo and all of Western  
10 New York and all of New York should be very proud  
11 of.

12 And that legacy continues today  
13 through Sheila Brown, who's with us here in  
14 chambers. Sheila started at WUFO, woof-o, at  
15 just 21 years old and worked her way up from a  
16 salesperson to owner, becoming the first  
17 African-American woman to own a radio station in  
18 Buffalo and Western New York.

19 Sheila didn't just make history in  
20 Buffalo; she helped preserve a piece of Buffalo  
21 history that could have been easily lost.  
22 Through WUFO she has spent decades uplifting  
23 Black voices, supporting local artists,  
24 preserving Buffalo's cultural history, and  
25 creating a platform that generations of people in

1 Buffalo have turned to for music, conversation,  
2 and connection.

3 But WUFO is more than just a radio  
4 station. It has become a voice for our  
5 community. And it has become the town hall for  
6 our community.

7 I want to recognize Sheila Brown for  
8 her leadership and everything she has done for  
9 Buffalo and Western New York and the importance  
10 of Black Music Month.

11 Thank you, Madam President. I vote  
12 aye.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,  
14 Senator.

15 Senator Bailey on the resolution.

16 SENATOR BAILEY: Thank you,  
17 Madam President.

18 This is one of those days here. To  
19 quote Common in "I Used to Love H.E.R.," "Now,  
20 Black music is Black music, and it's all good."  
21 I'm not going to go with the rest of the verse;  
22 it's not really chamber-appropriate.

23 But what Common was saying in "I  
24 Used to Love H.E.R.," was how the feeling that he  
25 had about hip-hop -- he met this girl when he was

1 nine years old, but what he loved so much had so  
2 much soul.

3 And that's Black music in general,  
4 Madam President. It's not just hip-hop, which is  
5 one of the greatest American art forms, along  
6 with jazz. It's gospel, it's R&B, it's reggae,  
7 it's calypso and soca.

8 It's Sunday morning listening to  
9 Hal Jackson and BLS, cleaning your house when  
10 your mom's making you clean your house, to that  
11 cleaning music. It is those driving songs that  
12 you had on your way to North Carolina in the  
13 summer for the family reunions.

14 We can talk about "Country Cousins,"  
15 Kweli, for a little bit. That's one of those  
16 songs that those of us from New York, we relate  
17 to that with that family down South.

18 But I'm just in awe of these legends  
19 in Black music, Madam President. Bob Law, with  
20 being a Black talk show radio host. We didn't  
21 have a lot of those. And Mr. Langston and  
22 Ms. Brown, they are Black folks north of  
23 Mount Vernon, right? It is really important to  
24 show that there's diversity in that the music  
25 experience and you're cultivating those

1 experiences north.

2 And DJ Beverly Bond, just thank you  
3 for letting the world know that Black Girls Rock!  
4 It's really important to not just speak about it,  
5 but to say it.

6 And to the family of John Coltrane,  
7 I know Ms. Michelle Coltrane had to go, but we  
8 had a resolution and we spoke about his legendary  
9 impact.

10 But you know I'm hip-hop 366 days a  
11 year.

12 (Laughter.)

13 SENATOR BAILEY: And just to be in  
14 the presence of MC Lyte and Talib Kweli, I don't  
15 think you realize how big of a deal this is.

16 We know about her storied career,  
17 but MC Lyte, my favorite verse from you ever was  
18 self-destruction. That was my favorite verse.  
19 Because like I remember it, it's one of these  
20 core memories. I'm in my grandparents' basement,  
21 and I told Uncle Ralph this the first time I met  
22 him. I watched that video, and I saw the  
23 scrolling thing on the bottom. "MC Lyte's on the  
24 microphone/Leave the knives and the guns at  
25 home."

1                   And that stuck with me. Not only  
2                   were you one of the first female MCs to really do  
3                   it in a major way, you were on that track  
4                   spreading positivity. And it was something that  
5                   me as a young man, like learning what hip-hop  
6                   was, it stuck with me.

7                   And look, there's so many great  
8                   songs. "Poor Georgie," like give your flowers to  
9                   those before -- you know, you never know when  
10                  you're going to lose somebody. My mom didn't let  
11                  me listen to "Ruffneck" because, I'm gonna tell  
12                  you the story, she thought that when the song  
13                  "gotta get a whatcho," she thought it was saying  
14                  "got to get arrested." So my mom was like, nah,  
15                  you're not listening to that in this house.

16                  (Laughter.)

17                  SENATOR BAILEY: And then I told  
18                  her what it was, she said, "Okay, you're still  
19                  not listening to that."

20                  (Laughter.)

21                  SENATOR BAILEY: But we talk a lot  
22                  about great diss songs. Ten Percent, diss songs,  
23                  sometimes forgets -- sometimes people forget  
24                  about it. You know, there was a song that was in  
25                  Quiet Storm that she got that from MC Lyte.

1 Right? Hit 'Em Up, they got that from MC Lyte.  
2 Like that was one of the classic -- again, we're  
3 not going to go into those lyrics here today, but  
4 you should listen to that song.

5 Brother Kweli, in this chamber we go  
6 through episodes too, like Attack of the Clones.  
7 Thank you for shaping what conscious hip-hop was,  
8 along with Rawkus Records and independent labels  
9 and showing that we as Black people, Black men,  
10 cannot just be constrained by labels, but go out  
11 on our own and make independent labels hot.

12 And "Country Cousins," I talked  
13 about that song that you did with UGK. It was  
14 one of the songs that -- it was kind of before  
15 its time where people really weren't doing  
16 New York and down South tracks like that -- "Rest  
17 in Peace," KMC.

18 And it was really like you were  
19 talking about you're from Brooklyn and going down  
20 South and having that same vibe. And the flow  
21 that you started out with at the top of the song  
22 was really important because it was sort of like  
23 when Biggie did it on "Notorious Thugs," to show  
24 that we can rap in different ways in New York.  
25 We're versatile.

1                   Like I am really like a student of  
2                   this, and it's just -- it makes me feel so proud  
3                   that ambassadors of a culture that was born under  
4                   such conditions at 1520 Sedgwick Avenue on  
5                   August 11, 1973, in the Bronx -- there's no  
6                   dispute, Lea.

7                   And I just want to make sure, before  
8                   I forget, I want to make sure I shout out Lea. I  
9                   mentioned at the press conference thank you for  
10                  doing so much to uplift and extend what  
11                  Black Music Month is in this chamber.

12                 And Reflection Eternal, "Never Been  
13                 in Love," one of the greatest hip-hop love songs  
14                 of all time, people don't give you enough credit  
15                 for that.

16                 But as I close, I just want to leave  
17                 you with this. Black Music Month is officially  
18                 in June, but it's 365. The music takes you to a  
19                 certain place. Any time I listen to a song in a  
20                 shuffle, it takes me to a certain place where I  
21                 remember that. The mental download, the download  
22                 of the music on Napster -- I'm sorry, I didn't  
23                 have any money back then, I wasn't paying for the  
24                 records.

25                         (Laughter.)

1                   SENATOR BAILEY:    But Black music is  
2   so critically important to my development as not  
3   just a legislator, as a man, as a husband, as a  
4   father.  And I have you all to thank for the  
5   impact that you have made on my life.

6                   I'm glad I was able to get through  
7   that because, again, this is a big deal.  I  
8   proudly vote aye on this resolution, and  
9   Black music forever!

10                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Thank you,  
11   Senator Bailey.

12                  Senator Comrie on the resolution.

13                  SENATOR COMRIE:   Thank you,  
14   Madam President.  After all that history from  
15   Brother Bailey, I should just sit down.

16                  (Laughter.)

17                  SENATOR COMRIE:   But I do need to  
18   stand up and thank Leader Cousins for allowing  
19   this to happen, this resolution.

20                  And to Lea Webb for making sure that  
21   Black Music Month is truly a real celebration  
22   here in Albany, where we have an opportunity to  
23   celebrate artists and people and  
24   industry-makers -- not just artists, but  
25   entrepreneurs, businesspeople, songwriters and

1 musicians.

2 She's truly made this a memorable  
3 event, and I want to thank her for all of her  
4 efforts and the hundreds of hours that she put  
5 into making this happen. So thank you,  
6 Sister Webb.

7 I really want to thank the honorees.  
8 You know, I represent Queens. I don't want to be  
9 in Brooklyn.

10 (Laughter.)

11 SENATOR COMRIE: But Queens,  
12 Southeast Queens has been a home to Black artists  
13 for centuries, going back to when James Brown  
14 lived in Addisleigh Park, Ella Fitzgerald, a lot  
15 of other artists.

16 But we have people here today that  
17 have truly impacted music -- Sheila Brown, as you  
18 heard from Senator Baskin, and Andre Langston,  
19 who I'm just meeting for the first time today --  
20 but truly pioneers that have created  
21 opportunities for many people to listen and  
22 appreciate and enjoy Black music.

23 Bob Law, who I had the honor of  
24 meeting, was truly a renaissance man, truly  
25 someone that we all depended on to keep it real

1 and to keep the truth.

2 John Coltrane, truly, thank you to  
3 his family for coming today. There was so much  
4 that he did to help us in music. Brother Bailey  
5 broke down Brother Kveli so deeply, I won't even  
6 touch all of that. But, you know, I don't have  
7 that music history engrained in my soul as  
8 Brother Bailey.

9 But I do know it's music that moves  
10 us. It's music that inspires us. It's music  
11 that keeps us going in difficult times, and the  
12 Black musicians that are here as well.

13 Beverly Bond, I always say  
14 DJ Beverly Bond -- Black Girls Rock! -- thank you  
15 for your vision. Thank you for your focus.  
16 Thank you for creating a national environment to  
17 empower all Black women.

18 And to MC Lyte, I had the honor of  
19 having a sitdown with you last year, just to find  
20 out that you're a deep sister. You care about  
21 the world. You care about issues. You've  
22 utilized your music to empower women. You're  
23 truly a special person.

24 Thank you all for coming today. I  
25 really appreciate everything that's happening.

1 I'm sorry that we weren't at the reception last  
2 night, but we were here passing the budget. But  
3 we will be honoring you in every way possible.  
4 Today is just a small token of our appreciation,  
5 of our love and respect for all of you, for all  
6 the things that you've done.

7 Thank you, Senator Webb, for making  
8 this happen.

9 Thank you, Madam President.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,  
11 Senator Comrie.

12 Senator Myrie on the resolution.

13 SENATOR MYRIE: Thank you,  
14 Madam President.

15 Let me first thank Senator Lea Webb  
16 for all of her leadership in making this event  
17 and yesterday's event really I think a historic  
18 celebration of Black music during this month.  
19 And of course to our leader, Andrea  
20 Stewart-Cousins, for bringing this resolution.

21 We had a chance to meet a lot of the  
22 honorees at the press conference earlier today,  
23 so I won't go through everyone.

24 I just wanted to elevate two in  
25 particular, the first being DJ Beverly Bond, who,

1     you know, I was thinking as we were going through  
2     what might be the best thing to say about you  
3     during this speech and at the press conference.  
4     And, you know, I thought, Well, we have Senator  
5     Lea Webb, a powerful and strong Black woman. We  
6     have Andrea Stewart-Cousins, the first Black  
7     woman, the first woman to lead the Senate  
8     Majority in the history of this state. I of  
9     course came from a Black woman. I am married to  
10    a Black woman.

11                 And what you have done with Black  
12    Girls Rock -- the affirmation that it gives for  
13    so many that look like you, that look like our  
14    families, our community. It's bigger than the  
15    music.

16                 And I want to publicly thank you for  
17    everything that you have done there and that you  
18    will continue to do, and what it has grown to be.

19                 And then of course to Talib, who as  
20    we all know is from Brooklyn. But he also went  
21    to the best high school in the State of New York,  
22    Brooklyn Tech. I have the honor of also  
23    representing Medgar Evers College, where another  
24    powerful Black woman, his mom, Dr. Greene, has  
25    been a professor and a scholar and someone who I

1 take great humility and joy in working with to  
2 achieve things for our community.

3 Talib, what you did for young Black  
4 men like me, who was listening to rap music and  
5 reciting lyrics that I had no idea what -- like  
6 what we -- I'm talking street stuff that I have  
7 no idea what I'm talking about.

8 (Laughter.)

9 SENATOR MYRIE: I don't live that  
10 life. I didn't grow up that way.

11 But then there came you, someone who  
12 was rapping about things that I did relate to and  
13 that I did know about, and teaching me things and  
14 saying, Look, you can do this and be cool, and  
15 you don't got to be all this over here.

16 That has stuck with me forever. And  
17 I just wanted to say thank you for the example  
18 that you have set and continue to set for many  
19 Black boys and many Black men -- that you can  
20 stand in both spaces and be just as cool and just  
21 as powerful.

22 So as we celebrate Black Music  
23 Month, I want to thank all the honorees for  
24 taking the time to be with us here in the  
25 chamber. Thank you for your patience as we've

1       gone through the legislative process.

2                   I very, very, very proudly vote aye  
3       on the resolution. Thank you.

4                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,  
5       Senator Myrie.

6                   Senator Fernandez on the resolution.

7                   SENATOR FERNANDEZ: Thank you,  
8       Madam President.

9                   So I don't know if anybody or many  
10       people know this, but I grew up dancing. I was  
11       always in dance class, jazz, ballet, tap,  
12       everything. And one of my favorite things is --  
13       was learning about the music. Every time my  
14       teacher put on a different song, we're going to  
15       dance to this, she would give us -- he/she would  
16       give us a little history about who the artist was  
17       and when it was popular, when it came out.

18                   And one of my most I guess favorite  
19       things about music in general is that  
20       Black artists originated every genre, almost.  
21       For those that don't know, again, I'm a big fan  
22       of Beyoncé and I do love her.

23                   (Laughter.)

24                   SENATOR FERNANDEZ: One of my  
25       favorite things to know and to share and to talk

1 about is how she is using her position now to  
2 elevate the history of Black music, from Act 1:  
3 Renaissance, and giving credit to the Black LGBT  
4 community and Donna Summer and DJ Frankie  
5 Knuckles for how they inspired that genre of  
6 music. Country music was taken from  
7 Black artists, and rock music. I'm excited for  
8 Act 3 coming out.

9 But I have to stand up to thank the  
10 sponsor, Lea Webb, for bringing this resolution,  
11 because it is a moment that we should appreciate.  
12 It's a contribution to this country that we  
13 should appreciate and recognize every day.

14 And I'm truly grateful to all our  
15 guests here for sharing your -- my God, your  
16 spirit, your stardom, your influence, and for  
17 everything you've contributed to music in our  
18 country and society, and the love that we have  
19 celebrating as humans.

20 So thank you. I proudly vote aye  
21 too.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,  
23 Senator Fernandez.

24 Senator Hinchey on the resolution.

25 SENATOR HINCHEY: Thank you,

1 Madam President.

2 I rise, first and foremost, to thank  
3 my seatmate, Senator Lea Webb, who has put so  
4 much energy into this over the last few years.  
5 Your passion and excitement is palpable, and it  
6 just makes me so excited.

7 But even larger, I rise to celebrate  
8 Black music. I represent and grew up in a  
9 predominantly, almost exclusively white  
10 community, but Black music helped shape my way of  
11 thinking. Listening to Black music as a kid  
12 opened my eyes to different cultures, opened my  
13 eyes to different ways of life. Opened my eyes  
14 to some very good music.

15 And it's something that we would  
16 talk about with my friends all the time. It was  
17 accessible. We listened to it, we loved it. And  
18 it was just a huge part of growing up.

19 I too grew up dancing, and it's some  
20 of the best music to dance to. But being able to  
21 listen to some of the lyrics, you know, to  
22 understand where people are coming from, it  
23 shaped my life today.

24 Talib Kweli, listening to you  
25 growing up in upstate New York, in the Catskills

1 and the Hudson Valley -- thank you.

2 Listening to Missy Elliott, blasting  
3 her from my car down our rural roads, while  
4 people are listening to God knows what, was so  
5 much fun and important for people to be able to  
6 hear and learn from.

7 Listening to Eve is just so -- was  
8 so much fun and so, again, important for our  
9 learning and way of life.

10 And so I want to say thank you for  
11 everything that all of you have done. Thank you  
12 to the families, but thank you, more broadly, to  
13 the way that Black music has shaped our culture  
14 and really spoken to people in the more rural  
15 area and white communities, bringing us all  
16 together.

17 Thank you so much.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,  
19 Senator Hinchey.

20 Senator Sepúlveda on the resolution.

21 SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA: Thank you,  
22 Madam President, for allowing me to speak on this  
23 resolution now.

24 My colleague Jamaal Bailey speaks  
25 about hip-hop and the newer generation of music,

1 but I grew up in Brooklyn, New York, with my  
2 grandfather, and I grew up listening to Latin  
3 music, salsa music, which has a large African  
4 influence. But also my grandfather was a revered  
5 and loved jazz musician. So while I listened to  
6 all kinds of music, every -- almost every day I  
7 had to listen to one of the probably greatest  
8 jazz saxophonists ever, John Coltrane.

9 We listened to Charlie Parker, Sonny  
10 Rollins, who passed away a couple of days ago,  
11 Miles Davis, Duke Ellington, Billie Holiday,  
12 Dizzy Gillespie, Charlie Parker -- Bill Evans was  
13 one of the greatest composers and jazz pianists  
14 to exist.

15 And of course the man who probably  
16 deserves the most credit for creating one of the  
17 only two American forms of music -- one is salsa  
18 music, which was formed in Harlem -- and jazz.  
19 These are the only two true forms of pure  
20 American music.

21 And the person who changed American  
22 music, the history of American music was none  
23 other than a man named Louie Armstrong. Louie  
24 Armstrong changed music completely in this  
25 country and throughout the world. The concept of

1       syncopation he brought to music, where prior to  
2       Louie Armstrong music was like a marching band.  
3       You know, you'd listen to the marching band  
4       music, and he brought in syncopation and changed  
5       it completely.

6                       So to all the artists today, Black,  
7       white, no matter where you're from, you all owe a  
8       debt of gratitude to Louie Armstrong, because he  
9       changed our music, he created everything today  
10      that's been used in creating hip-hop and other  
11      forms of music -- country music, rock and roll,  
12      all of that -- all of them owe a debt of  
13      gratitude to a Black man named Louie Armstrong.

14                     I vote aye. Thank you.

15                     ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,  
16      Senator Sepúlveda.

17                     Senator Cleare to close.

18                     SENATOR CLEARE: Thank you,  
19      Madam President.

20                     I rise to speak in support of the  
21      Black Music Month resolution, and I want to offer  
22      special thanks to our incredible collaborators on  
23      the Black Music Month program. But the grandest  
24      shout-out of all to Senator Lea Webb, for her  
25      incredible vision and commitment.

1                   I represent Harlem, the epicenter of  
2     Black history, culture, thought, art,  
3     scholarship, and music. A significant part of  
4     the history of Black music is rooted in my  
5     district, including the quintessential venues of  
6     the Harlem Renaissance, such as the Alhambra  
7     Ballroom, the Cotton Club, Count Basie's Lounge,  
8     the Lenox Lounge, the Renaissance Ballroom, the  
9     Savoy, Monette's Supper Club, Bill's Place,  
10    Minton's Playhouse, the Apollo Theater, the  
11    original Red Rooster.

12                  Moreover, many of the finest  
13    Black musicians lived in, played in, and  
14    frequented Harlem, including Louie Armstrong,  
15    Duke Ellington, Earl "Fatha" Hines, Cab Calloway,  
16    Thelonious Monk, Dizzy Gillespie, Count Basie,  
17    Jelly Roll Morton, Charlie Parker, Fats Waller,  
18    Ella Fitzgerald, Bessie Smith, Paul Robeson,  
19    Ethel Waters, Bill "Bojangles" Robinson,  
20    Lena Horne, Billie Holiday, and Josephine Baker,  
21    just to name a few.

22                  Black music has played a significant  
23    role in all areas of life globally. Black  
24    musicians have historically been dispatched as  
25    cultural ambassadors to foster goodwill, bring

1 people together, and represent American values,  
2 using music to connect with global audiences in  
3 ways that politics and traditional diplomacy  
4 could not.

5 Beginning in the 1950s and '60s, the  
6 U.S. government, through the Department of State,  
7 dispatched Black jazz icons such as Louie  
8 Armstrong, Duke Ellington, Dizzy Gillespie and  
9 others, to tour the world.

10 Blues, gospel, R&B evolved out of  
11 the African-American experience in the American  
12 South. And as these genres migrated north, many  
13 were popularized and perfected in some ways  
14 during the Harlem Renaissance. Ultimately these  
15 genres have become the pillars of rock and the  
16 pop industry.

17 Black music dominates the global  
18 cultural economy and is one of the largest  
19 exports of the United States of America.  
20 Streaming data places rap and hip-hop on one of  
21 the most consumed genres globally. Black music  
22 influences design, fashion, and various youth  
23 subcultures around the world.

24 This year's ceremony honors  
25 Ms. Sheila Brown, of WUFO Radio in Buffalo. And

1 we have to thank each and every one of these  
2 individuals. Ms. Brown, we thank you for keeping  
3 the music alive. And not just the music -- the  
4 history, the legacy, the opportunity. Andre  
5 Langston of WDKX Radio in Rochester, we thank you  
6 too for elevating and continuing the legacy.

7 The family of Bob Law, Aisha  
8 Patrice, thank you so much -- unknowingly -- for  
9 sharing your family with all of us. I feel like  
10 he was a part of my own family. We waited to  
11 hear him come on. That was our voice, and we  
12 felt like we knew him.

13 The family of John Coltrane and  
14 Alice Coltrane -- Michelle, who was here  
15 earlier -- thank you so much for John's  
16 contributions. John would have been 100 this  
17 year. We're so excited about all the events.

18 And I have to lift up the names of  
19 so many others who would be 100 this year. Very  
20 interestingly, Jimmy Heath, Randy Weston,  
21 Miles Davis, all would be 100 years old this  
22 year. Makes you wonder what was going on in the  
23 20s, huh?

24 Talib, we share a high school; your  
25 mother tells me all the time. And, you know,

1     what else should we expect, the son of  
2     Dr. Greene, for you to touch a whole 'nother  
3     generation with the same legacy and the same  
4     originality.

5                   Ms. Beverly Bond, you're a writer, a  
6     businesswoman, a philanthropist. Thank you for  
7     the give-back. Thank you for showing us the way  
8     to do it.

9                   And MC Lyte -- oof. You showed us  
10    our place in hip-hop, in a powerful and dignified  
11    way. I thank you for that.

12                  Today is a great day as we honor  
13    those who are here. And I can't leave, I can't  
14    take my seat without of course lifting up the  
15    great, Harlem's own, cultural icon Rob Base, who  
16    we just lost this week. It takes two to make a  
17    thing go right.

18                  And also, as was mentioned before,  
19    the jazz great -- are you signing, John Liu?

20                  (Laughter.)

21                  UNIDENTIFIED SENATOR:

22    Internationally known.

23                  SENATOR CLEARE:    Internationally  
24    known.

25                  (Laughter.)

1                   SENATOR CLEARE:   -- the jazz great  
2     Sonny Rollins, who resided in Senator Hinchey's  
3     district but also had a great relationship with  
4     Harlem.

5                   You know, for hundreds of years  
6     Black music has been the drumbeat and the  
7     lifeblood of existence, of resistance, of  
8     freedom, of storytelling, creativity and history.  
9     Before we were allowed to read, before we were  
10    allowed to go to schools, before we were  
11    integrated, we brought music with us. And music  
12    was how we communicated with each other. And it  
13    is how we communicate with the world.

14                  I am so proud to celebrate our music  
15    in Black Music Month. Thank you, Leader  
16    Stewart-Cousins, for allowing this resolution to  
17    be brought to the floor. It is so important.

18                  Black music, long may it live.

19                  Thank you.

20                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Thank you,  
21    Senator Cleare.

22                  To our incredibly distinguished  
23    honorees who are here for Black Music Month, who  
24    have been named and celebrated on this floor here  
25    today, we welcome you on behalf of the Senate.

1 We extend to you the privileges and cordialities  
2 of the house. We honor all you have contributed,  
3 and in those whose memory we speak as well.

4 Congratulations. Please rise and be  
5 honored on the floor.

6 (Enthusiastic standing ovation.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
8 resolution was previously adopted on May 27th.

9 Senator Gianaris.

10 SENATOR GIANARIS: Please call on  
11 Senator Gonzalez for an introduction.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator  
13 Gonzalez for an introduction.

14 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Thank you,  
15 Madam President.

16 Today it is my honor to rise and  
17 welcome Ambassador Satoshi Katahira, of the  
18 Consulate General of Japan in New York, and the  
19 distinguished Japanese delegation alongside  
20 Senator Liu, to the New York State Senate.

21 Ambassador Katahira has a long  
22 history in international and economic affairs  
23 that has taken him across the world to places  
24 like Brazil and the United Kingdom. He began his  
25 post here in October 2025, and is continuing to

1 build on the deep and broad friendship between  
2 Japan and the United States through cultural and  
3 economic exchange, reinforcing the bond between  
4 our two countries.

5 As we celebrate Asian American and  
6 Pacific Islander Heritage Month, we recognize his  
7 leadership and the generations of AAPI  
8 communities whose culture, advocacy, and public  
9 service have shaped New York.

10 The Consulate General of Japan  
11 serves millions of people across our state, which  
12 is currently home to 61,000 Japanese residents.  
13 Myself and Senator Liu have the privilege of  
14 joining many of our Japanese neighbors at the  
15 Japan Day Parade, where Ambassador Katahira  
16 rolled out their new Mascot, Happi, a squirrel  
17 that represents the relationship between New York  
18 City and Japan. And for those who may have  
19 missed it, he even dressed up as Happi the  
20 Squirrel.

21 I have also had the privilege of  
22 partnering with the Consulate General on a number  
23 of initiatives. Every year we bring together a  
24 delegation of Japanese high school students to  
25 meet with students in my own district and

1 understand their experiences.

2 Watching younger people connect  
3 across languages, cultures, and experiences is a  
4 powerful reminder that diplomacy is not only  
5 conducted between governments, it is built every  
6 day through human connection, curiosity, and  
7 shared learning.

8 As many of you know, I have also had  
9 a chance to do some of that learning. I am  
10 marrying into a Japanese family and have yearly  
11 been able to visit my soon-to-be  
12 grandmother-in-law in Hyuga, a small surf town.  
13 And while Hyuga looks very different from Queens,  
14 where I grew up, I can say what feels so familiar  
15 are the shared values of family, of food, of art  
16 at the center of community.

17 At a time when division and  
18 isolation can feel all too common, these  
19 exchanges matter deeply. They help foster a  
20 generation that understands the value of cultural  
21 appreciation and solidarity despite different  
22 backgrounds.

23 Learning from Japanese-American  
24 political history, organizing, and activism in  
25 the United States is so instructive to how we

1       should view the world today.

2                   And we are also proudly joined today  
3       by a World War II veteran. Thank you so much for  
4       your service.

5                   With Ambassador Katahira there is  
6       also a delegation of Japanese business leaders.  
7       Japanese businesses make over \$800 billion in  
8       investments into the American economy. These  
9       companies range from the financial and  
10      real estate sectors to manufacturing and  
11      entrepreneurs leading innovation and industries.

12                  So to Ambassador Katahira and the  
13      broader delegation, I want to say {in Japanese},  
14      and I want to welcome you and thank you for your  
15      continued friendship with the people of New York.

16                  Madam President, please join me in  
17      extending all the privileges of this chamber to  
18      our distinguished guests.

19                  Thank you.

20                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,  
21      Senator Gonzalez.

22                  To Ambassador Katahira, to our  
23      distinguished delegation representing the  
24      business community of Japan, we welcome you to  
25      the Senate. On behalf of our members, we extend

1 to you the privileges and courtesies of the  
2 house.

3 Please rise, if you are able, and we  
4 look to recognize you.

5 (Standing ovation.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator  
7 Gianaris.

8 SENATOR GIANARIS: All right,  
9 Madam President, let's now begin the  
10 controversial calendar with Calendar 927, please.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
12 Secretary will ring the bell.

13 The secretary will read.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
15 927, Senate Print 5134, by Senator Harckham, an  
16 act to amend the Correction Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator  
18 Rhoads, why do you rise?

19 SENATOR RHOADS: I was hoping that  
20 Senator Harckham might yield to a few questions.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator  
22 Harckham, do you yield?

23 SENATOR HARCKHAM: I do.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator  
25 Harckham yields.

1                   SENATOR RHOADS:    Thank you,  
2   Senator Harckham.

3                   Through you, Madam President, of  
4   course. Am I correct in my understanding that  
5   the purpose of this bill is to create a standard  
6   electronic medical records database for  
7   correctional centers?

8                   SENATOR HARCKHAM:   Through you,  
9   Madam President, that is correct.

10                  SENATOR RHOADS:    And will the  
11   sponsor continue to yield?

12                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Do you  
13   continue to yield?

14                  SENATOR HARCKHAM:   Yes.

15                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   The  
16   sponsor yields.

17                  SENATOR RHOADS:    And am I also  
18   correct in my understanding that this piece of  
19   legislation was actually introduced and passed  
20   back in the '23-'24 session as well, correct?

21                  SENATOR HARCKHAM:   Through you,  
22   Madam President, that is correct.

23                  SENATOR RHOADS:    And will the  
24   sponsor continue to yield?

25                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Do you

1 continue to yield?

2 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Yes.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
4 sponsor yields.

5 SENATOR RHOADS: Were there any  
6 revisions or modifications to the bill that  
7 appears before us today in comparison to the bill  
8 that was actually introduced and passed by this  
9 body -- and by the Assembly, incidentally -- back  
10 in 2024?

11 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Through you,  
12 Madam President, no, there have not been.

13 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor  
14 continue to yield?

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you  
16 continue to yield?

17 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Yes.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
19 sponsor yields.

20 SENATOR RHOADS: Am I also correct  
21 in my understanding that after being passed in  
22 2023, in the '23-'24 session, by the Senate and  
23 the Assembly, the Governor actually vetoed this  
24 piece of legislation?

25 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Through you,

1 Madam President, that is correct.

2 SENATOR RHOADS: Why is it being --  
3 will the sponsor continue to yield?

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you  
5 continue to yield? Senator Harckham, do you  
6 continue to yield?

7 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Yes.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
9 sponsor yields.

10 SENATOR RHOADS: Why is the bill  
11 being reintroduced?

12 SENATOR HARCKHAM: I'm sorry, could  
13 you repeat that, please?

14 SENATOR RHOADS: Sure.

15 Why is the bill being reintroduced?

16 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Through you,  
17 Madam President. The bill is being reintroduced,  
18 one, because the need is still there.

19 And I would just share a brief aside  
20 on the way this legislation came about. I have  
21 three correctional facilities in my district  
22 which I visit annually, and I was meeting with  
23 PEF and CSEA members who are on the medical staff  
24 through OMH. And they were telling me of the  
25 problems of having paper files -- our entire

1 medical system and medical economy decades ago  
2 transferred to an electronic system -- and this  
3 was an impediment both to care and efficient  
4 staff work.

5                   You know, often in here we hear that  
6 we're not being responsive to the needs of folks  
7 working in correctional facilities. Well, this  
8 bill came as a suggestion from folks working in  
9 correctional facilities.

10                   So the need is still there. The  
11 difference is in the budget yesterday, in fact,  
12 we passed \$35.8 million for this purpose; there  
13 was just no Article VII language accompanying it.  
14 So this is just a two-sentence bill that directs  
15 the commissioner to do it, in consultation with  
16 DOH and OMH, and to promulgate rules.

17                   SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you,  
18 Senator.

19                   Will the sponsor continue to yield?

20                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you  
21 continue to yield?

22                   SENATOR HARCKHAM: Yes.

23                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
24 Senator yields.

25                   SENATOR RHOADS: Well, I certainly

1 understand the motivation behind the bill, no  
2 question about that.

3 The Governor's veto message spelled  
4 out the reason why, however, the bill was vetoed  
5 in the initial instance, in that DOCCS as well as  
6 the Office of Mental Health is already putting  
7 together an electronic medical records system for  
8 use in correctional centers.

9 And her concern was that since this  
10 process is up to the RFP stage already, through  
11 your legislation having to restart the process,  
12 would require significant reengineering, would  
13 render the already-completed work obsolete, and  
14 would undo the substantial time and cost to the  
15 state that they've already invested to get it to  
16 the RFP stage.

17 With that being the case, why are we  
18 reintroducing the legislation if it's something  
19 that's already being created by the state and  
20 funded through our budget yesterday?

21 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Through you,  
22 Madam President, I reject, respectfully, that  
23 that is the case, that they do have to go back  
24 and undo everything.

25 This codifies it. I believe we in

1 the Legislature have responsibility to proscribe  
2 what our agencies do. We have seen time and  
3 again agencies go down a path only to walk away  
4 from a project.

5 They started this eight years ago.  
6 In 2018 is when they started this, eight years  
7 ago. And so there was a feeling among us on the  
8 Majority side that it was time to step in and  
9 codify this legislatively so this gets done once  
10 and for all.

11 SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you,  
12 Senator Harckham.

13 On the bill.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator  
15 Rhoads on the bill.

16 SENATOR RHOADS: The Governor's  
17 veto message was very clear. It's not something  
18 I made up. The veto message, No. 73, issued in  
19 2024 on November 22nd, indicated: "While I  
20 recognize the need to align medical records  
21 across state agencies, this bill would be  
22 duplicative of an existing effort from the Office  
23 of Information Technology, which is working on  
24 separate electronic health record projects with  
25 DOCCS and the Office of Mental Health, exactly

1       that this bill prescribes.

2               "This bill would render the work  
3 already completed obsolete, require significant  
4 reengineering, and delay implementation of this  
5 important work, all at a substantial and  
6 unnecessary cost to the state, which is the  
7 reason I therefore am constrained to veto this  
8 bill."

9               It's an interesting dynamic. What  
10 apparently is happening between the majorities in  
11 the Assembly and the Senate and the Governor's  
12 office is that they seem incapable of getting on  
13 the same page.

14              Yesterday we just approved 36 --  
15 \$35.8 million for the very project that the  
16 Governor was talking about, a project that is at  
17 the RFP stage. Which means all the preliminary  
18 work behind putting together a plan in order to  
19 issue the RFP and actually have companies bid on  
20 the right to perform the work, has already been  
21 performed.

22              And so now the concern from the  
23 Governor -- and it's odd that I ever, on this  
24 side of the aisle, align myself with anything  
25 that the Governor says or does -- that the

1 Governor has indicated is already far enough  
2 along that the passage of this bill would  
3 actually cost the state additional resources and  
4 would require them to backtrack.

5 And I know that my colleague  
6 Senator Harckham mentioned that this has already  
7 taken eight years to come to fruition. We  
8 certainly can't start back at square one by  
9 passing this legislation today and delaying this  
10 project even further.

11 So I will be voting no,  
12 Madam President, and I would encourage my  
13 colleagues to do the same.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,  
15 Senator Rhoads.

16 Senator Martins, why do you rise?

17 SENATOR MARTINS: Just wondering if  
18 the sponsor would yield for a few questions.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Will the  
20 Senator yield?

21 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Absolutely.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
23 Senator yields.

24 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,  
25 Madam President. Through you.

1                   Senator Harckham, can you tell us,  
2   if you know, how much money has already been  
3   spent on this effort to create electronic medical  
4   records for incarcerated persons?

5                   SENATOR HARCKHAM:   Through you,  
6   Madam President, we do not have that information.

7                   SENATOR MARTINS:   Through you,  
8   Madam President, if the sponsor would continue to  
9   yield.

10                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Will you  
11   continue to yield?

12                  SENATOR HARCKHAM:   Yes.

13                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   The  
14   Senator yields.

15                  SENATOR MARTINS:   And, Senator, do  
16   you know whether that will include all persons  
17   who are incarcerated in New York State or whether  
18   there will be an option for persons to opt out  
19   and to continue to use paper records?

20                  SENATOR HARCKHAM:   Through you,  
21   Madam President. We are unaware of what DOCCS  
22   has been working on for the last eight years  
23   other than the report that they are working on  
24   it.

25                  But a uniform medical system for

1 everyone in the system does not contemplate  
2 opting out. It's a uniform system so that when  
3 someone goes from provider to provider to  
4 provider, just the way we do through NYSHIP,  
5 those medical records are there for that  
6 provider.

7 SENATOR MARTINS: Through you,  
8 Madam President, if the sponsor would continue to  
9 yield.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you  
11 continue to yield?

12 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Yes.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
14 Senator yields.

15 SENATOR MARTINS: And with regard  
16 to certain medical data and information in a  
17 person's file, would that incarcerated person be  
18 able to unilaterally decide that they wanted to  
19 exclude information from their electronic record  
20 and not make it uniformly available so that  
21 future providers would have the benefit of being  
22 able to access that information?

23 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Through you,  
24 Madam President, this bill is neutral on that  
25 subject.

1                   This bill simply directs DOCCS, DOH,  
2                   and OMH to develop a system and promulgate rules.  
3                   So this bill is silent on that question.

4                   SENATOR MARTINS:    Last question,  
5                   Madam President, if the sponsor would yield for  
6                   one more.

7                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Do you  
8                   continue to yield?

9                   SENATOR HARCKHAM:    Yes.

10                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   The  
11                  Senator yields.

12                  SENATOR MARTINS:    Senator, do you  
13                  believe that the system is better if everyone  
14                  participates in the electronic system without  
15                  carveouts and removing information from their  
16                  medical records?

17                  SENATOR HARCKHAM:    Through you,  
18                  Madam President.  As I mentioned to the Senator  
19                  before, this bill is neutral on that.  It simply  
20                  tells the commissioner of OMH and DOH to develop  
21                  a system and promulgate rules.

22                  So as the sponsor of this, I am not  
23                  asserting one way or the other whether folks  
24                  should opt in, should opt out, whether the system  
25                  is better with that.  We'll leave that to the

1 medical record professionals to develop.

2 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,  
3 Madam President. On the bill.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator  
5 Martins on the bill.

6 SENATOR MARTINS: And I thank  
7 Senator Harckham. Because, you know, we had this  
8 debate just a week ago, maybe two weeks ago here  
9 on the floor dealing with the integrity of  
10 medical records, electronic medical records, and  
11 the transition from paper to medical records and  
12 the ability of people to carve out different  
13 elements of those records unilaterally.

14 And I think we had a disagreement,  
15 obviously, across the aisle between the Majority  
16 and those of us who felt that the integrity of  
17 the system and the protections that the integrity  
18 of the system would provide for the patient  
19 themselves in the event that there were a need  
20 for intervention in the future, should supercede.

21 And here we are again, spending -- I  
22 heard a figure of \$38 million had been allocated  
23 in yesterday's budget for an effort. And  
24 obviously spending that money without preserving  
25 the integrity of the system seems rather futile

1 if people can just circumvent and decide not to  
2 participate in the process.

3           There either is a purpose to doing  
4 this or there is not a purpose to doing this.  
5 Either those persons that Senator Harckham  
6 referred to who suggested the benefits in doing  
7 this and moving away from paper -- either they  
8 are right or they are not.

9           And so either from a policy  
10 standpoint we should go dive into the integrity  
11 of a process that actually provides a system that  
12 protects people and allows for those medical  
13 records to be readily accessible by healthcare  
14 professionals, or we don't.

15           And so in light of debates we've had  
16 on the floor here where that has been eroded, I  
17 hope that this effort doesn't lead us down that  
18 same road, Madam President.

19           I am supporting this bill because I  
20 do believe in the integrity of electronic medical  
21 records and I believe that we have committed to  
22 that. I hope we don't take further steps to  
23 erode that effort, because I do think we're doing  
24 New Yorkers and our residents a disservice when  
25 we do that.

1                   Madam President, I vote aye.

2                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Thank you,  
3   Senator.

4                   Are there any other Senators wishing  
5   to be heard?

6                   Seeing and hearing none, debate is  
7   closed.   The Secretary will ring the bell.

8                   Read the last section.

9                   THE SECRETARY:   Section 2.   This  
10   act shall take effect on the 180th day after it  
11   shall have become a law.

12                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Call the  
13   roll.

14                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

15                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Announce  
16   the results.

17                  THE SECRETARY:   In relation to  
18   Calendar 927, voting in the negative are  
19   Senators Borrello, Ortt, Rhoads, Tedisco and  
20   Walczyk.

21                  Ayes, 54.   Nays, 5.

22                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   The bill  
23   is passed.

24                  Senator Gianaris.

25                  SENATOR GIANARIS:   Madam President,

1 before we continue on with the controversial  
2 calendar, please recognize Senator Skoufis.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator  
4 Skoufis.

5 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Thank you,  
6 Madam President.

7 I'd like to formally request that  
8 Calendar Number 1286, Senate Bill 2294, be  
9 starred until formal further notice.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Calendar  
11 Number 1286, S2294, is starred.

12 Senator Gianaris.

13 SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you,  
14 Madam President.

15 Congratulations to Senator Skoufis  
16 for starring a bill.

17 Let's move on to Calendar 874,  
18 please.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
20 Secretary will read.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
22 874, Senate Print 1280B, by Senator Krueger, an  
23 act to amend the General Business Law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator  
25 Borrello, why do you rise?

1                   SENATOR BORRELLO:    Madam President,  
2   I know that the sponsor is not here, but can  
3   someone answer questions on this bill?

4                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Senator  
5   Rivera, do you yield?

6                   SENATOR RIVERA:    As long as my  
7   colleague is sure about it, that he wants to do  
8   it, then yes, I'll -- yes, I yield.

9                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   The  
10   Senator yields.

11                  SENATOR BORRELLO:    I've never been  
12   so sure about anything in my life, so --

13                  SENATOR RIVERA:    Go ahead, buddy.

14                  SENATOR BORRELLO:    So first of all,  
15   I guess the first question is -- I know a lot of  
16   you folks down in the city don't have natural  
17   gas -- do you have a gas stove?

18                  SENATOR RIVERA:    Through you,  
19   Madam President, I certainly do.

20                  SENATOR BORRELLO:    All right.  
21   Madam President, will the sponsor continue to  
22   yield?

23                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Do you  
24   continue to yield?

25                  SENATOR RIVERA:    Yes.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The  
2   Senator yields.

3                   SENATOR BORRELLO:    I do as well,  
4   and I love my gas stove.  There's really no way  
5   to finish a steak any better than a gas stove.  
6   Certainly not an electric stove.  So maybe we can  
7   agree on that, at least.

8                   But my concern is -- is that this is  
9   a label requirement for a gas stove, a warning  
10   label.  I know.  Be still your beating heart.

11                  There's actually a Biden-appointed  
12   federal judge that has issued an injunction  
13   against a similar law in Colorado, basically  
14   saying it's a violation of the 1st Amendment.

15                  So why would we move this forward?  
16   Why would we not wait to see how that's been  
17   adjudicated first?

18                  SENATOR RIVERA:    Through you,  
19   Madam President, a couple of things.

20                  First, I did gasp over here,  
21   Madam President.  I did.  I stopped myself.  
22   Because yes, all this bill does is add a warning,  
23   either in a sticker that can be removed or on a  
24   box -- actually, on both.  The bill requires it  
25   on both, Madam President.  A warning, a simple

1 warning. That's what it does.

2 Now, as it relates to my colleague's  
3 question, we know that there has been -- that  
4 there was a legal action that was brought against  
5 the State of Colorado, I believe, that was --  
6 they have their version of the bill. We feel  
7 pretty confident that this, since it's only a  
8 label, Madam President, we feel pretty confident  
9 it's okay.

10 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,  
11 will the sponsor continue to yield?

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you  
13 continue to yield?

14 SENATOR RIVERA: Sure will.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
16 Senator yields.

17 SENATOR BORRELLO: I see the  
18 facetiousness with which you see this.

19 But I can tell you as a small  
20 business owner that the burdens that happen on  
21 businesses large and small, in this chamber and  
22 in this state, in this city, have driven out a  
23 lot of businesses, raised the price of a lot of  
24 things.

25 So if anything requires a warning

1 label, it should be the budget we just passed.

2 With that being said, let me ask  
3 this question, then. Who's supposed to pay this  
4 fine? It's really not clear. Is it the  
5 manufacturer, is it the wholesaler, is it the  
6 retailer? Who is supposed to attach this label?  
7 And if it's not there, who's responsible for  
8 paying the fine?

9 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,  
10 Madam President, the manufacturer.

11 And certainly, while I'm very --  
12 certainly as concerned as my colleague is with  
13 impositions on small business, I don't think that  
14 a small business that I know of makes gas stoves.  
15 It probably is made by big companies that can  
16 probably afford to put a warning label --

17 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,  
18 will the --

19 SENATOR RIVERA: Unless it's a  
20 golden one, Madam President, in which case -- and  
21 I don't think the bill includes that.

22 Sorry, go ahead.

23 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,  
24 will the sponsor continue to yield?

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you

1 continue to yield?

2 SENATOR RIVERA: Yup.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
4 Senator yields.

5 SENATOR BORRELLO: So it's the  
6 manufacturer that's required to put this on. It  
7 doesn't seem clear in the language that it's the  
8 sole responsibility of the manufacturer.

9 Because at the end of the day, if we  
10 want the consumer, the person that's buying the  
11 stove that's going to install it, to understand  
12 the danger of buying a gas stove, then shouldn't  
13 that -- we have to make sure that the wholesaler  
14 keeps that label on, doesn't take it off, that  
15 the retailer keeps that label on, doesn't take it  
16 off.

17 Wouldn't that be a liability for all  
18 of them, and a potential fine? How is the  
19 manufacturer going to know if the label ends up  
20 at the final destination of the retail floor?

21 (Pause.)

22 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,  
23 Mr. President. There were a few -- there were a  
24 few parts to that question. Let's break it down.  
25 If my colleague could give me the first part of

1 the question, I wanted to make sure that I could  
2 answer the correct one.

3 If I'm not mistaken, the first part  
4 of the question had to do with the -- with who  
5 was supposed to put the warning label on the  
6 thing?

7 SENATOR BORRELLO: Who is  
8 responsible -- Madam President, through you, a  
9 clarification. Who is responsible for that  
10 warning label to make sure that it is affixed to  
11 the end -- when it ends up in the hands of the  
12 consumer? In other words, who will pay the fine?

13 (Pause.)

14 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,  
15 Madam President. It will be the responsibility  
16 of the manufacturer.

17 And certainly much like those pesky  
18 stickers on mattresses -- remember those? -- the  
19 manufacturer makes sure that they are -- in the  
20 factory, that they are affixed to it. And then  
21 the person who sells it does not yank it off.

22 The consumer can do whatever they  
23 want with it. But the responsibility to affix it  
24 and to make sure that it's on both the product  
25 itself and the box or, you know, whatever it

1 comes in, is the manufacturer.

2 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,  
3 will the sponsor continue to yield?

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you  
5 continue to yield?

6 SENATOR RIVERA: Yes.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
8 sponsor yields.

9 SENATOR BORRELLO: Okay. So it's  
10 the manufacturer's responsibility. So is it --  
11 but at the end of the day, it's -- the goal is to  
12 warn of the hazards of a natural gas stove to the  
13 final consumer.

14 What happens if that label somehow  
15 disappears, accidentally or on purpose? Because  
16 it goes from the manufacturer to a distribution  
17 warehouse to a wholesaler to a retailer and then  
18 finally to the consumer. Somewhere along the way  
19 in that supply chain, and in the transition, the  
20 transportation, that label could come off.

21 At the end of the day I don't think  
22 we're sending, you know, our version of the  
23 mattress police, the gas stove police, to the  
24 manufacturing facility, you know, in China or  
25 wherever it might be.

1                   They're going to find out whether or  
2                   not this label is affixed at the store.

3                   So how are we going to make the  
4                   manufacturer responsible for the label that our  
5                   mattress police, slash, gas stove police are  
6                   going to -- they obviously have to find it in the  
7                   retail location, right? So how are they going to  
8                   be responsible for that?

9                   SENATOR RIVERA:    Madam President,  
10                  through you. Most products -- I'm not sure what  
11                  my colleague purchases, but most products that I  
12                  purchase come enclosed somewhere. They come in  
13                  boxes which are sealed from the factory.

14                  And so, since the bill requires that  
15                  the manufacturers are the ones who actually put  
16                  the thing in the box, put it in the box all the  
17                  way over wherever they produce it. It is  
18                  unlikely in most cases, now, Madam President --  
19                  it may be different in other places, but I know  
20                  that when I go to a store, certainly when I'm  
21                  looking, let's say, at a refrigerator, and I'm  
22                  looking at a refrigerator, they're not going to  
23                  sell me -- unless in very specific circumstances  
24                  they might sell me the one that's right there.

25                  But more than likely they're going

1 to sell me something that's in a box, that's  
2 self-contained. So the thing is sealed in there.

3 Since this -- and as far as the box  
4 is concerned, well, the box doesn't even have to  
5 have a sticker. It could have words that can be  
6 printed right onto the box; therefore, it's much  
7 less likely that they'll fall off.

8 It seems that my colleague is  
9 looking for some obscure thing -- again, that  
10 we're trying to do something which is more than  
11 what the bill intends to do. Which is, again, to  
12 inform people about the potential dangers.  
13 Because it is true, it is not non-factual, it is  
14 factual that studies have for decades documented  
15 the health hazards that are involved,  
16 potentially, in a gas stove.

17 Which by the way, Madam President,  
18 as I said, I have one, and I have no intention of  
19 changing it. I like to cook on my gas stove.  
20 And guess what? If this bill passes and is  
21 signed into law, it will do absolutely nothing to  
22 change that.

23 And when that gas stove -- which is  
24 a newer one, so hopefully it will last for a long  
25 time. But when it goes away, I probably will get

1 another gas stove. And this one, egads,  
2 hopefully will have a little sticker on it that  
3 I'll remove as soon as I begin -- before I begin  
4 cooking, that will document for anybody who  
5 purchases it, that there is a potential danger,  
6 that there's health-harming pollutants like  
7 carbon monoxide, nitrogen dioxide, formaldehyde,  
8 and benzene that could come from me cooking on  
9 that.

10 Now that I know that,  
11 Madam President, I will take the thing off and  
12 will make some fresh carbonara for you, for my  
13 colleague, and for anybody else that wants it.

14 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,  
15 will the sponsor continue to yield?

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you  
17 continue to yield?

18 SENATOR RIVERA: I certainly will.

19 SENATOR BORRELLO: I am certain  
20 your carbonara will be fantastic.

21 But that being said, we still  
22 haven't really addressed how this is actually  
23 going to work.

24 You just got done saying you could  
25 print it on the box. But then again, you know,

1 if an appliance is delivered and installed by a  
2 professional -- you know, my father did that as a  
3 plumber, he installed appliances as well -- what  
4 happens if the sticker's not there? How are  
5 we -- we're not going to be able to warn these  
6 people of the dangers of a gas stove if it was  
7 taken out of the box that had the warning printed  
8 on it, outside the sight of the consumer, and  
9 installed.

10 So now how is that installer  
11 responsible for warning them of the dangers of  
12 gas stoves?

13 (Pause.)

14 SENATOR RIVERA: So,  
15 Madam President, again, in the very unlikely  
16 situation that there is -- the words that are  
17 printed on the box are not there, or the thing  
18 that is affixed, the sticker that is affixed to  
19 the actual stove, if it should come off, there  
20 is -- there is no -- there wasn't any funding  
21 yesterday in the budget, nor will there ever be a  
22 gas stove police function here in the State of  
23 New York.

24 The bill allows for, in a situation  
25 where somebody is alleging that there's a

1 violation, whomever they -- the -- for example,  
2 the distribution, the distributor or the person  
3 who sells it could be -- could have the  
4 opportunity to be heard to be able to make the  
5 case that they were not responsible for its  
6 removal.

7                   It just seems to me to be like an  
8 overly complicated thing. It's a sticker. I'm  
9 not done. It's a sticker, Madam President.  
10 Or -- or words on the box, the both of those  
11 things. It's a sticker.

12                   SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,  
13 will the sponsor continue to yield?

14                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you  
15 continue to yield?

16                   SENATOR RIVERA: Yup.

17                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
18 Senator yields.

19                   SENATOR BORRELLO: But are we sure  
20 it's a sticker? I mean, we don't really have  
21 anything -- how is this going to work? Is it a  
22 sticker, is it a label, is it something that's  
23 going to hang off of one of the knobs that the  
24 consumer should take off?

25                   And then who's going to be enforcing

1     this rule? Who's going to be the ones going out  
2     there, policing this and assessing fines and  
3     going after the manufacturer?

4                 So you've described a lot of  
5     potential scenarios. What's the bill actually  
6     say has to be done in order for this to be  
7     compliant?

8                 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,  
9     Madam President. This bill is not -- not that my  
10    colleague is suggesting this, but this bill is  
11    not a way to just catch people in the act of  
12    removing these labels or stickers or what have  
13    you and then charging them a whole bunch of  
14    money.

15                We're instead saying that if you're  
16    a manufacturer, that you're making these  
17    things -- which, again, scientific evidence  
18    exists that you potentially could be harmed by  
19    something that happens to it, like -- I also make  
20    a mean pizza, Madam President, from scratch. I  
21    do. And put it right in my oven over there.  
22    Which is also a gas oven, Madam President.

23                So if we do that, if we have a  
24    manufacturer who makes it and there is -- at some  
25    point between it being manufactured and being

1 delivered to the consumer, the thing is off, it  
2 is not like somebody is going to go, Aha, we  
3 gotcha, there it is, now you owe us five grand or  
4 whatever it is that the fine is. The warning,  
5 I'm sorry. Warning, and then the fine. So  
6 there's a warning first, Madam President.

7                   There is no obscure situation here  
8 that we're looking for. Ultimately what this  
9 bill aims to do is to just provide information to  
10 the consumer. That's it. There is no conspiracy  
11 here. There's nothing that we're trying to see  
12 if we can catch somebody in the act of doing  
13 something inappropriate.

14                   We're simply saying you as a  
15 manufacturer, you're making a product which is a  
16 good product, which makes some good steaks, but  
17 you should just let folks know perhaps you should  
18 open the window. You should just know that there  
19 are side effects that might come from what you  
20 cook here. There might be some health-harming  
21 pollutants that are possible with you continuing  
22 to cook on this.

23                   So we just want you to be informed  
24 of it. But after you're informed, purchase that,  
25 purchase that bad boy, hook it up, make steaks

1       for everybody, and God bless America.

2                   SENATOR BORRELLO:    Madam President,  
3       will the sponsor continue to yield?

4                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Do you  
5       continue to yield?

6                   SENATOR RIVERA:    Yup.

7                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The  
8       Senator yields.

9                   SENATOR BORRELLO:    I guess I'm  
10      still not understanding who is responsible within  
11      New York State government for compliance.  How  
12      will they be doing this?  Because at the end of  
13      the day, most of these appliances are not  
14      manufactured here anymore in the United States,  
15      sadly.

16                   And by the way, we have online  
17      retailers that could deliver a stove to your  
18      house in a box, and that wholesaler, that online  
19      retailer, could be in another state, another  
20      country.

21                   Who is going to be responsible for  
22      enforcing this, and how?

23                   (Pause.)

24                   SENATOR RIVERA:    So,  
25      Madam President, through you.  So if we're going

1 to get to technicalities, it would be either the  
2 Department of State or the Attorney General who  
3 would be -- who would have potentially the  
4 responsibility to do this.

5 But let's just be clear; we are not  
6 asking for some sort of dragnet from either one  
7 of those agencies to go and look to make sure  
8 that if this becomes law that every single one of  
9 them has it.

10 We're just saying to manufacturers,  
11 consumers should be informed about the choices  
12 that they're making. They can continue to make  
13 the choice. Nobody's banning nothin'. We're  
14 just saying you should know what you're putting  
15 into your home, that simple.

16 There's sometimes, for example,  
17 in -- and we know this in poor neighborhoods like  
18 the ones that I live in, sometimes when the  
19 heat's not working, people will open up their  
20 ovens and they would leave them open, without  
21 anything in it, just to warm the house. And we  
22 warn people not to do that because of the CO2  
23 that they're putting into their apartment  
24 building. And by locking the doors and  
25 everything to try to make it hot, it could

1 actually make them poisoned -- it might poison  
2 them because of what they're doing to keep their  
3 house warm.

4 So this is the type of thing that  
5 can happen with any type of appliance. And all  
6 that we're saying is that people should be  
7 informed about it, that people should have the  
8 information. They're still going to make the  
9 choice. They will. I know I will.

10 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,  
11 will the sponsor continue to yield?

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you  
13 continue to yield?

14 SENATOR RIVERA: Yup.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
16 Senator yields.

17 SENATOR BORRELLO: So I guess the  
18 answer you gave to my original question was it's  
19 going to be either the Department of State or the  
20 Attorney General's office.

21 So they are going to have to create  
22 like a gas stove division? Otherwise, how is  
23 this going to be enforced? I don't understand  
24 it.

25 SENATOR RIVERA: Madam President,

1 through you, no.

2 If somebody says to the Department  
3 of State or to the Attorney General, Hey, we  
4 believe that there is this vast conspiracy to  
5 remove these stickers from these foreign hordes  
6 of appliances that are coming into our country,  
7 then I guess they'll investigate and they'll  
8 be -- they'll do what they need to do in that  
9 regard.

10 Ultimately this is not -- these are  
11 the agencies that will be responsible for  
12 potentially enforcing this. But this is not  
13 something that we're looking to create some sort  
14 of gotcha situation. It is simply, once again --  
15 through you, Madam President -- just to provide  
16 information to the consumer about what they're  
17 putting into their homes. Which they can still  
18 continue to choose to do.

19 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,  
20 will the sponsor continue to yield?

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you  
22 continue to yield?

23 SENATOR RIVERA: Yeah.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
25 Senator yields.

1                   SENATOR BORRELLO:    Okay, so I think  
2   you mentioned "vast conspiracy," but I don't  
3   think that's going to be the case. I think  
4   someone's going to buy a gas stove, maybe  
5   somebody goes to a store who doesn't like gas  
6   stoves, and checking all the stoves to see if  
7   there's a sticker on it, and then they're going  
8   to call the Attorney General's office, allegedly,  
9   or the Department of State, and say, I saw a gas  
10  stove or I bought a gas stove without the warning  
11  label, what are you going to do about it?

12                   What happens when that gets  
13  triggered? What going to happen next?

14                   SENATOR RIVERA:    Well, through you,  
15  Madam President, first of all, whomever's on the  
16  other side of the phone will probably roll their  
17  eyes a little bit. And after they get through  
18  that, they'll say, All right, tell me about the  
19  situation that you're trying to describe.

20                   And then they might investigate it,  
21  and they find that there's evidence of it, then  
22  they'll go to the law and the law would say that  
23  they would potentially receive a warning and that  
24  eventually, if that warning is not heeded -- in  
25  other words, if there's other instances of the

1 same thing being found -- then the manufacturer  
2 would be held responsible for just -- for not  
3 having -- for not having them.

4 Oh, \$250, I'm sorry. Two hundred  
5 and fifty bucks. I'm not sure if Whirlpool can  
6 actually manage the \$250, Madam President,  
7 but that's how it potentially would happen.

8 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,  
9 will the sponsor continue to yield?

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you  
11 continue to yield?

12 SENATOR RIVERA: Yup.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
14 Senator yields.

15 SENATOR BORRELLO: So what if it's  
16 a used stove that you bought, the stove had the  
17 label, and now you're turning around and you're  
18 selling the stove without the label. Is that  
19 person selling the stove now responsible for that  
20 \$250 fine without a label on it?

21 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,  
22 Madam President, the shortest answer I will give  
23 today. No.

24 SENATOR BORRELLO: Glad to hear it.  
25 All right. Madam President, on the

1 bill.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator  
3 Borrello on the bill.

4 SENATOR BORRELLO: And I know we  
5 have others that want to ask questions here.

6 Look, folks, this is silly. We all  
7 know this is silly. And the true evidence is  
8 that there's no infrastructure here. There's no  
9 plan. I couldn't get answers to something as  
10 simple as who's really responsible for this.

11 The manufacturer, okay, great. So  
12 Whirlpool, whoever it might be -- you know, some  
13 Italian or Japanese or Chinese or Korean, we're  
14 going to go after them, we're going to send, you  
15 know, a group to go exact a \$250 fine from  
16 somebody in another country?

17 I don't understand how this is going  
18 to work, because I don't think it's actually  
19 going to work. And we've passed this bill  
20 before. It's just ridiculous to think that this  
21 is actually going to do anything other than make  
22 some people feel good that we're allegedly  
23 warning people about a device that has been  
24 around for, I don't know, 70 years now, that now  
25 we're going to let them know that maybe you

1 shouldn't buy one because it might cause a  
2 problem.

3               So this is just a feel-good,  
4 do-nothing bill that in the end isn't going to  
5 warn anybody about anything they probably don't  
6 already know. But most importantly, it's going  
7 to create, I think, a potential for this to go to  
8 the next level, where they're going to start  
9 fining people -- you know, retail stores.

10              It's very easy to buy something  
11 online and have it delivered to your house, have  
12 it installed. But you know what? Our  
13 brick-and-mortar retailers, they're the ones that  
14 are paying property taxes and employing people.  
15 They're the ones that keep our small communities  
16 alive and actually having, you know, economic  
17 activity, and this problem is going to be a  
18 burden on them at some point. Because I don't  
19 think we really know who it's going to.

20              We even read through this bill, and  
21 it appears that we don't know who's actually  
22 supposed to pay this fine. It makes the most  
23 sense that at the final point of sale, the retail  
24 location, they're the ones who are going to be  
25 held responsible for this. That's really what's

1 going to happen.

2                   Because if I was the manufacturer, I  
3 would just simply say, Hey, that sticker was on  
4 there when it left our facility. I don't know  
5 why it's not on at the retail level. Because  
6 that's the only place you're going to be able to  
7 go and see whether or not there's a sticker on  
8 there.

9                   And we don't know if it's a sticker.  
10 We don't know if it's printing on a box. We  
11 don't know if it's some kind of like, you know,  
12 whatever, hermetically sealed -- if you broke  
13 this seal, don't buy this stove, because it might  
14 not have the warning label on it.

15                   It's just absolutely ridiculous.  
16 But unfortunately, all too often, all too common,  
17 the things that come out of Albany are pretty  
18 ridiculous to the average commonsense person.

19                   So I'll be voting no, like we did  
20 last time on this. But I would certainly love to  
21 see some real, genuine answers to this. I don't  
22 know, it's just a sticker -- if you knew the  
23 amount of burdens that we put on businesses in  
24 this state that pile up one after another after  
25 another, it's death by a thousand cuts. And this

1 is another one.

2 So I'll be voting no. Thank you.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator  
4 Murray, why do you rise?

5 SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you,  
6 Madam President. Would the sponsor yield for a  
7 few questions?

8 SENATOR RIVERA: Sure.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator  
10 Rivera yields.

11 SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you,  
12 Madam President. Through you.

13 So a similar bill was put in place,  
14 I believe -- or passed by the legislature out in  
15 California. But the governor, Gavin Newsom,  
16 vetoed that legislation. Are you familiar with  
17 that? Do you know why he vetoed it?

18 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,  
19 Madam President. This was in California? I'm  
20 not Newsom, so no.

21 SENATOR MURRAY: Through you,  
22 Madam President, will the sponsor continue to  
23 yield?

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you  
25 continue to yield?

1                   SENATOR RIVERA:    Yup.

2                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The  
3   Senator yields.

4                   SENATOR MURRAY:    So let me move on  
5   to the reason for targeting gas stoves.  So the  
6   World Health Organization funded a 2024 study  
7   that found that compared with electric stoves,  
8   using electricity as opposed to using gas for  
9   cooking or heating, it did not result in any  
10   higher risk estimate for asthma in children or in  
11   adults.  So --

12                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Can I just  
13   clarify?  Are you asking a question?

14                  SENATOR MURRAY:    No, I'm asking a  
15   question.

16                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Yes, a  
17   question is being asked.  Thank you.

18                  SENATOR MURRAY:    Based on that, why  
19   are we not requiring all stoves, not just gas but  
20   electric as well, to have this warning label if,  
21   according to the World Health Organization, it's  
22   equally at risk?

23                  SENATOR RIVERA:    Through you,  
24   Madam President.  First of all, that study did  
25   identify -- although I'm not familiar with it,

1     this is why you surround yourself with smarter  
2     people than yourself. And in this case some of  
3     these smart folks here have -- are familiar with  
4     that study. And in it, it does identify a lower  
5     risk for electrical stoves.

6                 But I certainly welcome my  
7     colleague's introduction of a bill to do just  
8     that for electric stoves as well.

9                 SENATOR MURRAY: Madam President,  
10    would the sponsor continue to yield.

11                ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you  
12    continue to yield?

13                SENATOR RIVERA: Yup.

14                ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
15    Senator yields.

16                SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you.  
17    Through you, Madam President.

18                Well, the Lawrence Berkeley National  
19    Laboratory found that to eliminate risk, whether  
20    it be an electric or gas stove, the best way to  
21    do that would be through ventilation, just using  
22    the fan, the vent to do it, to remove basically  
23    all of the risk.

24                So why wouldn't we just educate the  
25    public on ventilating?

1                   SENATOR RIVERA:   Through you,  
2   Madam President.  Funny that my colleague should  
3   ask, because -- since, as the bill is written,  
4   the actual wording on it, part of it is certainly  
5   in the bill, but there could actually be a  
6   determination made by the Department of State  
7   when the actual label requirements are being  
8   created that could add that language as well.

9                   So we could actually say to people,  
10   Hey, if you're going to, as I said earlier,  
11   continue to cook on a gas stove, then you should  
12   make sure that you open up that window, if you  
13   can, because that will make it a little bit less  
14   likely that you will have some of the concerns  
15   that exist with this type of stove.

16                  SENATOR MURRAY:   Madam President,  
17   will the sponsor continue to yield?

18                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Do you  
19   continue to yield?

20                  SENATOR RIVERA:   Yup.

21                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   The  
22   sponsor yields.

23                  SENATOR MURRAY:   Thank you.

24                  Through you, Madam President.  So  
25   I'm glad we agree on the ventilation aspect.

1                   So it goes back to begging the  
2                   question, then, why are we not requiring it for  
3                   all stoves? The risk is virtually the same,  
4                   according to most of the studies. So why aren't  
5                   we requiring it on every stove?

6                   SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,  
7                   Madam President. Well, the bill is not mine. It  
8                   is through our great and phenomenal colleague who  
9                   I hope is watching. I'm not sure if it's this  
10                  one or that one. Liz, wherever you at, love ya!

11                  So our colleague chose to introduce  
12                  the bill related to gas stoves, but we certainly  
13                  could in the future look at expanding it also to  
14                  electrical stoves. Because ultimately,  
15                  Madam President, as I made clear earlier, this is  
16                  not about stopping anybody from doing anything.  
17                  This is just about making sure that people have  
18                  information, that as consumers they're better  
19                  educated. And certainly ventilation is one of  
20                  them.

21                  But even when that is not the case,  
22                  even when there is ventilation, there is still a  
23                  risk, so people should just know it. And, like  
24                  myself, keep on cooking that steak on that gas  
25                  stove.

1                   SENATOR MURRAY:    Madam President,  
2   will the sponsor continue to yield?

3                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Do you  
4   continue to yield?

5                   SENATOR RIVERA:    Yup.

6                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The  
7   Senator yields.

8                   SENATOR MURRAY:    Thank you.  
9   Through you, Madam President.

10                   So why not gas dryers?  There are  
11   many, many gas dryers where we dry our clothing.  
12   And usually they're in an enclosed laundry room  
13   or something that doesn't really  have great  
14   ventilation.  So are we requiring labels on those  
15   as well?

16                   (Pause.)

17                   SENATOR RIVERA:    Through you,  
18   Madam President, a couple of things.

19                   Number one, it is not open  
20   combustion, so it is a different type of thing.

21                   But second, I believe -- he's not in  
22   the room, but Senator Kavanaugh has a bill related  
23   to those types of dryers, so you should ask --  
24   our colleague should ask Senator Kavanaugh.

25                   SENATOR MURRAY:    Madam President,

1 would the sponsor continue to yield.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you  
3 continue to yield?

4 SENATOR RIVERA: Yup.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
6 Senator yields.

7 SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you.

8 Through you, Madam President. How  
9 about vacuum cleaners? We're worried about  
10 breathing and asthma and problems like that. A  
11 little known fact, I used to sell vacuum  
12 cleaners, believe it or not, going door to door.

13 I went to sell the vacuum cleaners  
14 and during my demonstration, I used to show every  
15 time you turn on that vacuum cleaner, the dust  
16 and everything that emits out of those bags, it  
17 would make you gag.

18 I will guarantee you, it's a lot  
19 more than anything emitting from a gas stove or  
20 dryer or electric -- why not warning labels on  
21 vacuum cleaners?

22 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,  
23 Mr. President. My colleague is going to continue  
24 going down the list of things --

25 SENATOR MURRAY: Mm-hmm.

1                   SENATOR RIVERA:   -- that we might  
2     need to put a warning on.  And I would say very  
3     likely, if there is a danger in those things,  
4     then we should put a warning on them.

5                   Because again, a warning label,  
6     which is a piece of plastic or a piece of --  
7     even, in some cases, not even a piece of plastic,  
8     because as I stated earlier, it could be written  
9     on the box.  In this case it has to be on the box  
10    and in an actual sticker.

11                  But say that my colleague introduces  
12    something related to safety -- you know,  
13    precautions that are to be not on a sticker  
14    but -- not even on a sticker, but on the box.  
15    Great, they're on the box.  So they're in the  
16    instruction booklet or whatever.

17                  It is not meant to do anything but  
18    inform the consumer about what they're getting  
19    themselves into.  And it is in the interest of  
20    the consumer to have -- it should be in the  
21    interest of us, who care about our constituents,  
22    to have them have the most information possible.

23                  It doesn't stop them from doing  
24    anything.  This will not stop anybody from buying  
25    a gas stove.  I don't know what my colleagues are

1       having a conniption fit about. I really don't.

2                       So, again, they can be a warning  
3       label just to inform consumers about whether  
4       there's a danger to this, a danger -- I don't  
5       know that much about, you know, vacuum cleaners  
6       myself, but if my colleague, as a former purveyor  
7       of such accoutrement, knows about the dangers of  
8       them, then they should put a bill together to put  
9       a warning on them so that folks have the  
10      information increase to make better choices about  
11      what they purchase.

12                    SENATOR MURRAY:    Madam President,  
13      would the sponsor continue to yield.

14                    ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Do you  
15      continue to yield?

16                    SENATOR RIVERA:    Yup.

17                    ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The  
18      Senator yields.

19                    SENATOR MURRAY:    Thank you.

20                    Through you, Madam President. Are  
21      you familiar with the process for manufacturing a  
22      gas stove?

23                    SENATOR RIVERA:    Through you,  
24      Madam President, I am not.

25                    SENATOR MURRAY:    Thank you.

1                   Madam President, on the bill.

2                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Senator  
3                   Murray on the bill.

4                   SENATOR MURRAY:   Thank you.

5                   And thank you, Senator Rivera.

6                   So through this conversation with  
7                   myself and Senator Borrello, we've heard the  
8                   sponsor say how simple it is, it's so -- it's  
9                   just a sticker. Yet he doesn't know the process  
10                  for manufacturing stoves. I'm guessing he  
11                  doesn't know the process for distributing large  
12                  appliances as well.

13                  See, we live in a tri-state area, so  
14                  when we do things like this and we require a  
15                  specific thing for a product, whereas other  
16                  states in the tri-state do not, it makes  
17                  distribution extremely difficult.

18                  So it's not simple. It's not just a  
19                  label. The label doesn't magically jump onto the  
20                  product or onto the box either. There is cost  
21                  involved in putting it together and in getting  
22                  into the assembly line and putting a process in  
23                  place, usually with machinery. So again, not as  
24                  simple as it seems.

25                  I always find that the people that

1 don't know are the ones that tell everyone else  
2 how simple it is. So it isn't simple. But the  
3 problem is this. And the reason I was going down  
4 the line of different products is because we can  
5 do this all day, and unfortunately New York does.  
6 There's a reason we have the nickname of the  
7 nanny state. It's because this is what we do.

8                   You know, 62 percent of the  
9 households in New York have gas stoves. They've  
10 been around for years and years and years and  
11 years. If we're really worried about the health,  
12 then let's target some of the things, like the  
13 vacuum cleaners, like electric stoves, gas  
14 dryers. I could go on and on and on.

15                   I could, but I'm afraid because, if  
16 I do, we'll have a litany of bills that again  
17 will, as my colleague put it, basically make  
18 these small businesses or the big businesses die  
19 a death of a thousand cuts, because there will be  
20 bill after bill requiring all of these  
21 nanny-state things.

22                   You know, it's funny, we talk about  
23 when we pick up a product -- you know, you'll  
24 pick up a hemorrhoid product and it has a warning  
25 that it's not to be taken orally. And people

1 laugh and say, Why would you even think that?  
2 Well, because somebody made a bill requiring them  
3 to do it.

4 Now, you keep saying it's real  
5 simple and everything, and yet there's a warning  
6 the first time, then a civil penalty of \$250 and  
7 subject to a penalty of up to a thousand dollars.  
8 We'll have the Department of State involved,  
9 we'll have the Attorney General involved -- I'm  
10 telling you, it doesn't sound simple to me. It  
11 sounds like quite a process.

12 So for that reason, Madam President,  
13 I think we need to just take a step back and --  
14 you know, we're all adults. We understand, when  
15 we're buying something, maybe do a little  
16 research -- is it dangerous, is it not.

17 But for the 62 percent of households  
18 in New York that have gas stoves, I haven't  
19 quaked in my boots. I have one, so I feel pretty  
20 safe.

21 So I'll be voting no. Thank you.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Are there  
23 any other Senators wishing to be heard?

24 Seeing and hearing none, debate is  
25 closed. The Secretary will ring the bell.

1 Read the last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This  
3 act shall take effect one year after it shall  
4 have become a law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator  
9 Rivera to explain his vote.

10 SENATOR RIVERA: Thank you,  
11 Madam President.

12 So it is true, Madam President, and  
13 for my colleagues, it is true that maybe I was a  
14 little flippant as it relates to the simplicity  
15 of this.

16 But I would think that the idea that  
17 basically every product that you get already has  
18 things that are attached to it, already has words  
19 that are printed on it, already has stickers that  
20 we require on there because of all sorts of  
21 issues that have occurred in the past where  
22 private companies, for the sake of pursuing their  
23 own benefit and their own -- as they do, to  
24 pursue their own benefit and to pursue the most,  
25 you know, bang for their buck, they would cut

1 corners if it wasn't for the fact that  
2 government, whether it's the State of New York or  
3 the federal government, actually curtails some of  
4 the worst actions of the private sector and the  
5 worst actions of private companies that just want  
6 to make a buck.

7                   It means that there's a whole slew  
8 of safety standards that would not exist -- that  
9 is a fact. That is a reality. So it is true, it  
10 would add a step or two.

11                   Now, I would say to a company that  
12 is selling, you know, Whirlpool or whatever other  
13 company is selling, they're probably selling  
14 certainly all over the world and all over the  
15 country. New York is probably a big market. So  
16 there probably would be a way for them to say  
17 like if we're going to sell a hell of a lot of,  
18 you know, stoves or what have you, that we could  
19 probably, as they already probably do, have a  
20 process that's strictly for those so that they  
21 can add something that might not be necessary in  
22 other states or might not be necessary in other  
23 countries.

24                   These are things that I think can  
25 certainly be achieved. And ultimately, this is

1 the thing. This is -- as we have said in the  
2 past, there's scientific studies that for decades  
3 have established that there's health hazards in  
4 gas stoves that can release harming pollutants  
5 like carbon monoxide, nitrogen dioxide,  
6 formaldehyde, benzene, et cetera. And still it  
7 makes a hell of a steak.

8 And still, and saying it as somebody  
9 who has a gas stove at home -- and I will not get  
10 an induction one, even if that one breaks,  
11 because it's a better cook for me. So I'm going  
12 to continue to do that, whether this is the law  
13 or not.

14 And I would urge my colleagues to do  
15 the same thing, to keep getting it. No problem  
16 whatsoever. But ultimately this, as in many  
17 other pieces of legislation that we have approved  
18 in the State of New York and we will consider in  
19 the future, have to do with informing people so  
20 that just a consumer is prepared, they know what  
21 is good, what is bad, and they make the best  
22 choice possible for themselves and their  
23 families.

24 So yes, I will cook up some steak, I  
25 will cook up some carbonara, and I will continue

1 to do it in a gas stove and hopefully, if mine  
2 ever breaks, one that will have a sticker on it  
3 that says, Hey, just so you know the risks  
4 involved. And I'll say I know the risks  
5 involved, rip, let's cook up some carbonara, why  
6 don't we.

7 I will vote in the affirmative.

8 Thank you, Madam President.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator  
10 Rivera to be recorded in the affirmative.

11 Senator May to explain her vote.

12 SENATOR MAY: Thank you,  
13 Madam President.

14 I want to say, as Consumer  
15 Protection chair, I want to reassure my  
16 colleagues on the other side of the aisle, we  
17 know how to do labels in New York State.

18 If you buy packaged food that you  
19 want to cook on your gas stove, that package has  
20 to be labeled with the ingredients and the  
21 sell-by date of that food. If you buy a vacuum  
22 cleaner that claims to meet the HEPA standards,  
23 which stands for high efficiency particulate air  
24 standards, it has to be labeled that it does  
25 that.

1                   So we know how to do this. It's not  
2                   that hard. You generally only buy one stove  
3                   in -- for your home at, you know, over many, many  
4                   years. So one label isn't a huge deal.

5                   I do want to say, though, we are  
6                   joined here by firefighter and actor and  
7                   all-round Renaissance man Tim Guinee. Tim came  
8                   to my home last winter and he measured the  
9                   nitrogen dioxide emissions from my stove. After  
10                  10 minutes of the stove being on in my kitchen,  
11                  the emissions had gone up by 13 times the  
12                  baseline. And they reached two and-a-half times  
13                  the -- what was the safe limit set by the EPA for  
14                  short-term exposure.

15                 Nitrogen dioxide is associated with  
16                 13 percent of all childhood asthma cases in this  
17                 country, as well as cardiovascular problems in  
18                 adults, older people, and increased mortality  
19                 from diabetes.

20                 Tim did not measure benzene, carbon  
21                 monoxide, formaldehyde or particulate matter. If  
22                 he had, I might have been alarmed even more.

23                 But I will say that electric stoves  
24                 do not emit benzene, carbon monoxide, nitrogen  
25                 dioxide or formaldehyde. And so labeling them

1 for these things wouldn't make any sense at all.

2 Many people enjoy cooking with  
3 gas --

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator,  
5 how do you vote?

6 SENATOR MAY: I was trying to speak  
7 on the bill before, and Senator Gianaris said I  
8 could have a little bit of extra time.

9 Sorry. I'm almost done.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Okay.

11 SENATOR MAY: Many people,  
12 including me, enjoy cooking with gas, but we  
13 should have full disclosure of the risks,  
14 especially with the health of children in the  
15 household or elderly folks.

16 This is a minor requirement, and I  
17 want to thank Senator Rivera for his spirited  
18 defense of just putting stickers on a gas stove.  
19 It makes eminent sense. It could save lives.

20 I vote aye.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator  
22 May to be recorded in the affirmative.

23 Announce the results. No, hold on  
24 one sec.

25 Senator Weik to explain her vote.

1                   SENATOR WEIK:   Thank you,  
2   Madam President.

3                   I recently bought a thing of  
4   beauty -- it's an eight-burner, two-oven gas  
5   unit. And I'm a terrible cook, so of course it's  
6   got the vent above it because I set everything on  
7   fire.

8                   So when I bought this thing, of  
9   course it's difficult to use, it comes with an  
10   instruction booklet. So in the instruction  
11   booklet the warning you're talking about is  
12   already in that instruction booklet.

13                  I also have the misfortune of having  
14   another place that I visit where I cook. It's  
15   got an electric stove that I had to replace.  
16   Brand new electric stove, the only good part of  
17   it is it also acts as an air fryer.

18                  Again, in that booklet it tells you  
19   all of the warnings of using an electric unit,  
20   just like when you buy a hair dryer or a curling  
21   iron. It basically says don't stand in a full  
22   bathtub when you operate this item. Not a joke,  
23   it's serious.

24                  But yes, we have to put these  
25   things -- it's already in the instruction

1 booklet. I hope you take a look at the  
2 instruction booklet, because this is a  
3 duplicative requirement. It's kind of an  
4 anti-business thing that we're asking of --  
5 again, these warnings are already in the  
6 instruction booklet for these units.

7 And for that reason I'll be voting  
8 no.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator  
10 Weik to be recorded in the negative.

11 Senator Murray to explain his vote.

12 SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you,  
13 Madam President.

14 First, let me say thank God  
15 Senator Rivera is okay. You've cooked a lot of  
16 steaks on that dangerous, dangerous gas stove  
17 without any warning, but you managed to survive.  
18 So thank God you're with us.

19 With that said, I'll also say this.  
20 Listen, we sit here and we hear how simple  
21 everything is, and then the suggestions by the  
22 Senator on how to distribute these products. It  
23 isn't that simple.

24 When you're distributing, especially  
25 to a large market like New York, it's not just

1 the New York market, it is the tri-state market.  
2 When they bring these things in, they usually go  
3 to a distribution center, which now the liability  
4 is out of the hands of the manufacturer, it's now  
5 to the distribution center.

6 If they happen to bring a stove --  
7 that was supposed to go to Jersey -- by mistake  
8 on their route to New York, they're now -- the  
9 manufacturer is now going to be subjected to  
10 possible fines.

11 What I'm saying here is it's not as  
12 simple as everyone likes to make it sound. It is  
13 a process, and once again a process we're  
14 imposing on businesses over and over and over  
15 again. And we wonder why these businesses are  
16 leaving the state. This is why. This is why.  
17 Because we are such a nanny state.

18 With that said, I know my time is  
19 almost up. I'll also say Tim is a great guy. I  
20 know he means well, and I appreciate all of his  
21 hard work.

22 With that said, I'm still a no.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator  
24 Murray to be recorded in the negative.

25 Announce the results.

1                   THE SECRETARY:   In relation to  
2   Calendar 874, voting in the negative are  
3   Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,  
4   Gallivan, Griffio, Helming, Lanza, Martins,  
5   Mattera, Murray, Ortt, Rhoads, Rolison, Ryan,  
6   Scarcella-Spanton, Skoufis, Stec, Tedisco,  
7   Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

8                   Ayes, 38.   Nays, 21.

9                   ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:   The bill  
10   is passed.

11                  Senator Gianaris.

12                  SENATOR GIANARIS:   Okay, let's move  
13   on to Calendar 1072, please.

14                  ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:   The  
15   Secretary will read.

16                  THE SECRETARY:   Calendar Number  
17   1072, Senate Print 9273, by Senator Krueger, an  
18   act to amend the Alcoholic Beverage Control Law.

19                  ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:   Senator  
20   Martins, why do you rise?

21                  SENATOR MARTINS:   Thank you,  
22   Madam President.   I was hoping that the sponsor  
23   would yield for a few questions.

24                  ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:   Will the  
25   sponsor yield?

1                   SENATOR SKOUFIS:    I'm not the  
2                   sponsor, but on behalf of the sponsor, I'm  
3                   delighted to yield.

4                   SENATOR MARTINS:    Filling in  
5                   today --

6                   SENATOR SKOUFIS:    Yes.

7                   ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:    The  
8                   surrogate yields.

9                   SENATOR MARTINS:    Thank you.

10                  Madam President, through you.  
11                  Senator, are you familiar with the "tied-house"  
12                  laws in New York State?

13                  SENATOR SKOUFIS:    Through you,  
14                  Madam President, yes.

15                  SENATOR MARTINS:    Madam President,  
16                  through you, if the sponsor would continue to  
17                  yield.

18                  ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:    Will the  
19                  Senator yield?

20                  SENATOR SKOUFIS:    Yes.

21                  ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:    The  
22                  Senator yields.

23                  SENATOR MARTINS:    So as I  
24                  understand it, it's to prevent different layers  
25                  or tiers from having undue influence with each

1 other -- in this case, manufacturers, wholesalers  
2 and retailers, to keep them separate.

3 In this particular case we're being  
4 asked to pass a law specific to a location, and  
5 there isn't the necessary detail in the bill or  
6 in the memo to express why we should be doing  
7 that.

8 And I was hoping you'd be able to  
9 give us some details with regard to this  
10 location, the level of interaction between these  
11 tiers, so that we could have an informed vote.

12 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,  
13 Madam President, I appreciate the question and  
14 I'll do my best to provide those details you're  
15 looking for.

16 Basically, the specific property and  
17 company that we are looking to provide an  
18 exemption to here in this bill is Christie's  
19 Auction House at 20 Rockefeller Plaza, which I  
20 assume is in Senator Krueger's district.

21 They actually have a tied-house  
22 exemption that as part of this bill we are  
23 repealing and replacing with a different  
24 tied-house exemption. And the purpose of this  
25 exemption is to allow for this auction house to

1       sell wines.

2                       And the reason why this is needed is  
3       because some of the ownership of Christie's  
4       Auction House has partial ownership in vineyards  
5       I believe overseas.

6                       SENATOR MARTINS:    Thank you,  
7       Madam President.  Thank you, Senator.  I  
8       appreciate it.

9                       On the bill.

10                      ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:    Senator  
11       Martins on the bill.

12                      SENATOR MARTINS:    So I -- again,  
13       I'm not opposed to this.  I just find it  
14       important that when we do receive a bill and we  
15       are making an exception -- and for those who  
16       aren't aware, in state law there is no  
17       discretion.  The SLA can't grant exemptions.  The  
18       only way that they can get it is to come here.

19                      So it's important that we ask the  
20       questions.  What is the level of interference,  
21       what is the level of I guess co-mixing between  
22       the different tiers to make sure that there isn't  
23       going to be undue influence and we're not just  
24       agreeing to something without, quite frankly,  
25       understanding what it is we're being asked to do.

1                   In this case, as I understand it,  
2                   there is a large international entity. Part of  
3                   its ownership may own some portions of a vineyard  
4                   overseas, and as a result that would trigger the  
5                   tied laws here in New York State, not allowing  
6                   them to have an interest in a retail sales of  
7                   alcohol, wine, and the like.

8                   So understanding this more  
9                   completely, Madam President, I'll be voting aye.

10                  Thank you, Senator Skoufis.

11                  ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank  
12                  you, Senator.

13                  Are there any other Senators wishing  
14                  to be heard?

15                  Seeing and hearing none, debate is  
16                  closed. Read the last section.

17                  THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This  
18                  act shall take effect immediately.

19                  ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the  
20                  roll.

21                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

22                  ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce  
23                  the results.

24                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
25                  Calendar Number 1072, voting in the negative:

1 Senator Martinez.

2 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill  
4 is passed.

5 Senator Gianaris.

6 SENATOR GIANARIS: Next up,  
7 Calendar 1132, please.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The  
9 Secretary will read.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
11 1132, Senate Print 9839, by Senator Baskin, an  
12 act to amend the Local Finance Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator  
14 Martins, why do you rise?

15 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,  
16 Madam President. If the sponsor would yield for  
17 a few questions.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the  
19 sponsor yield?

20 SENATOR BASKIN: Yes,  
21 Madam President, I yield.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The  
23 sponsor yields.

24 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,  
25 Senator.

1                   In the budget that was voted on  
2                   yesterday, there was an amount that was included  
3                   in appropriations, that was included specifically  
4                   for the City of Buffalo. Do you recall how much  
5                   that was?

6                   SENATOR BASKIN: I believe it was  
7                   25 million.

8                   (Pause.)

9                   SENATOR BASKIN: But 55 million in  
10                  additional funding. Through you,  
11                  Madam President, 55 million in additional  
12                  funding.

13                  SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you.

14                  Madam President, through you, if the  
15                  sponsor would continue to yield.

16                  ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the  
17                  sponsor yield?

18                  SENATOR BASKIN: Yes, I yield.

19                  ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The  
20                  sponsor yields.

21                  SENATOR MARTINS: And, Senator, are  
22                  you familiar with the Buffalo Fiscal Stability  
23                  Authority?

24                  SENATOR BASKIN: Through you,  
25                  Madam President, yes, I am.

1                   SENATOR MARTINS:   Thank you.

2                   Through you, Madam President, if the  
3 sponsor would continue to yield.

4                   ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:   Will the  
5 sponsor yield?

6                   SENATOR BASKIN:   Yes.

7                   ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:   The  
8 sponsor yields.

9                   SENATOR MARTINS:   So can you tell  
10 us, what's the makeup of the fiscal authority?  
11 How long has it been in place? How are those  
12 appointments made, if you know? Just some  
13 background on this particular fiscal authority.

14                   SENATOR BASKIN:   Through you,  
15 Madam President. The Buffalo Fiscal Stability  
16 Board has been enacted for decades. It's made up  
17 of a variety of members that are appointed  
18 through recommendations to the Governor's office  
19 in the City of Buffalo. And their primary  
20 purpose is to have oversight of the city's  
21 finances, mostly in the event of a fiscal crisis.

22                   SENATOR MARTINS:   Thank you.

23                   Madam President, if the sponsor  
24 would continue to yield.

25                   ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:   Does the

1 sponsor yield?

2 SENATOR BASKIN: Yes, I yield,  
3 Madam President.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The  
5 sponsor yields.

6 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you.

7 In dealing with the Buffalo Fiscal  
8 Stability Authority, there are times when it is  
9 under a control period, and there are times when  
10 it is dormant. Right now, can you tell us  
11 whether the authority is under a control period  
12 or whether it is in fact dormant?

13 SENATOR BASKIN: Through you,  
14 Madam President. Currently the Buffalo Fiscal  
15 Stability Board members are not a -- what we call  
16 a hard board, where they are making complete  
17 decisions about the city's finances at this time.

18 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you.

19 Madam President, through you, if the  
20 sponsor would continue to yield.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the  
22 sponsor yield?

23 SENATOR BASKIN: Yes,  
24 Madam President.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The

1 sponsor yields.

2 SENATOR MARTINS: So as I  
3 understand it, there are a couple of instances in  
4 which the board would go into a control period  
5 and become active and take over the finances of  
6 the city, I guess when they are in financial  
7 distress or something of the like.

8 Are you familiar with what the  
9 triggers are that would require the control board  
10 to take control of the city's finances?

11 (Pause.)

12 SENATOR BASKIN: Through you,  
13 Madam President. In order for the Fiscal  
14 Stability Board to be completely in control, the  
15 city has to carry and be in a deficit.

16 At this time, the city may have a  
17 projected deficit, but they do not have a current  
18 deficit. The City of Buffalo's budget is  
19 balanced at the moment, which would explain why  
20 the Fiscal Stability Board is not currently  
21 enacted.

22 SENATOR MARTINS: Through you,  
23 Madam President, if the sponsor would continue to  
24 yield.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the

1 sponsor yield?

2 SENATOR BASKIN: Yes,  
3 Madam President.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The  
5 sponsor yields.

6 SENATOR MARTINS: So as I  
7 understand it, the control period can be declared  
8 if the city is projected, projected, to incur a  
9 substantial operating funds deficit and other  
10 things as well.

11 Given the fact that yesterday the  
12 budget included, you know, 50 million-plus for  
13 the City of Buffalo for just that reason, do  
14 you -- are you saying that the control board has  
15 not declared a control period for the City of  
16 Buffalo?

17 SENATOR BASKIN: Currently the --  
18 through you, Madam President, currently the  
19 City of Buffalo's budget is balanced.

20 SENATOR MARTINS: Okay.  
21 Madam President, through you, if the sponsor  
22 would continue to yield.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the  
24 sponsor yield?

25 SENATOR BASKIN: Yes.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:    The  
2   sponsor yields.

3                   SENATOR MARTINS:    So the city's  
4   budget is balanced, but we just shelled out  
5   \$50 million to help them.

6                   How about -- how many people sit on  
7   the Buffalo Fiscal Stability Authority?

8                   SENATOR BASKIN:    Through you,  
9   Madam President, the board is made up of nine  
10  members.

11                  SENATOR MARTINS:    Thank you.

12                  Madam President, through you, if the  
13  sponsor would continue to yield.

14                  ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:   Does the  
15  sponsor yield?

16                  SENATOR BASKIN:    Yes,  
17  Madam President, I yield.

18                  ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:   The  
19  sponsor yields.

20                  SENATOR MARTINS:    So the board has  
21  seven voting members, two ex officio members,  
22  which includes the mayor of the city and the  
23  county executive of the County of Erie.

24                  The seven actual voting members are  
25  appointed by the Governor, three of them upon the

1 recommendation each of the Senate Majority  
2 Leader, the Speaker of the Assembly, and the  
3 Comptroller, four being appointed by the  
4 Governor, including the chair and the vice chair.

5 Can you tell me, of the seven  
6 members who are appointed, how many of them --  
7 how many of those appointments are vacant right  
8 now?

9 SENATOR BASKIN: Through you,  
10 Madam President. I don't have the number of  
11 vacancies currently on the Buffalo Fiscal  
12 Stability Board with me at the moment.

13 SENATOR MARTINS: Through you,  
14 Madam President, if the sponsor would continue to  
15 yield.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the  
17 sponsor yield?

18 SENATOR BASKIN: Yes,  
19 Madam President, I yield.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The  
21 sponsor yields.

22 SENATOR MARTINS: Senator, are you  
23 aware that the chair of the fiscal authority  
24 is -- that spot is vacant and has been vacant now  
25 for months, if not over a year?

1                   SENATOR BASKIN: Through you,  
2                   Madam President. There may be an official  
3                   vacancy, but there has been an acting chair who  
4                   has been presiding over the Fiscal Stability  
5                   Board to date.

6                   SENATOR MARTINS: Madam President,  
7                   through you, if the sponsor would continue to  
8                   yield.

9                   ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the  
10                  sponsor yield?

11                  SENATOR BASKIN: Yes,  
12                  Madam President.

13                  ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The  
14                  sponsor yields.

15                  SENATOR MARTINS: Are you familiar  
16                  or aware that the vice chair of the authority is  
17                  also vacant at this point? Not only the chair  
18                  but the vice chair as well, that spot is vacant  
19                  and has not been appointed.

20                  SENATOR BASKIN: Through you,  
21                  Madam President. It is not uncommon for  
22                  government oversight boards that are voluntary to  
23                  have vacancies. Just because there is a vacancy  
24                  in a particular seat, it does not mean that the  
25                  board does not have leadership.

1                   SENATOR MARTINS:   Through you,  
2   Madam President, if the sponsor would continue to  
3   yield.

4                   ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:   Does the  
5   sponsor yield?

6                   SENATOR BASKIN:   Yes, Madam  
7   President, I yield.

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:   The  
9   sponsor yields.

10                  SENATOR MARTINS:   To your  
11   knowledge, has the board or the authority met to  
12   address the request for the \$50 million that was  
13   provided, as well as for this piece of  
14   legislation that we're being asked to vote on  
15   today, has -- have you received or has the Senate  
16   received any request on behalf of the Buffalo  
17   Fiscal Stability Authority for the authority that  
18   we're being asked to provide them, which is to  
19   borrow money?

20                         (Pause.)

21                  SENATOR BASKIN:   Through you,  
22   Madam President. The bill before us is focused  
23   on a period of extension for the board to be able  
24   to do borrowing. So a lot of my colleague's  
25   questions are really not focused on the bill that

1 are before us.

2 I will, through you, answer that the  
3 Fiscal Stability Board did have a public meeting.  
4 I believe that meeting was between 30 and 60 days  
5 ago. And in order for there to be business  
6 before the board where they have to actually take  
7 control of the city's finances or vote, the city  
8 has to be in an official deficit. And the city  
9 currently has a balanced budget.

10 SENATOR MARTINS: We heard that.

11 Madam President, through you, if the  
12 sponsor would continue to yield.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the  
14 sponsor yield?

15 SENATOR BASKIN: Yes,  
16 Madam President, I yield.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The  
18 sponsor yields.

19 SENATOR MARTINS: So, Senator, who  
20 asked for this bill? Who requested the bill?

21 SENATOR BASKIN: This bill came to  
22 be through conversations with the current mayor  
23 of the City of Buffalo.

24 SENATOR MARTINS: Through you,  
25 Madam President, if the sponsor would continue to

1     yield.

2                   ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:     Does the  
3     sponsor yield?

4                   SENATOR BASKIN:     Yes,  
5     Madam President, I yield.

6                   ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:     The  
7     sponsor yields.

8                   SENATOR MARTINS:     Aside from a  
9     discussion with Mayor Ryan, were there any  
10    discussions with anyone on the Buffalo Fiscal  
11    Stability Authority with regard to what we're  
12    being asked to vote on here today?

13                   Which is, by the way, to authorize  
14    the Buffalo Fiscal Stability Authority to  
15    borrow -- to not only extend their term, but to  
16    borrow up to \$150 million.

17                   SENATOR BASKIN:     Through you,  
18    Madam President. Just again for a point of  
19    clarity, the bill before us is a bill that  
20    extends the City of Buffalo's authority to bond  
21    for more than one year. And this agreement has  
22    been in place for 40 years.

23                   Could my colleague repeat his  
24    question?

25                   SENATOR MARTINS:     I will.

1                   Madam President, through you, if the  
2                   sponsor would continue to yield.

3                   ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:   Does the  
4                   sponsor yield?

5                   SENATOR BASKIN:   Yes, I yield.

6                   ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:   The  
7                   sponsor yields.

8                   SENATOR MARTINS:   So if I do  
9                   understand correctly, and I may be wrong, but  
10                  this bill authorizes the authority -- that is,  
11                  the Buffalo Fiscal Stability Authority -- to  
12                  borrow money, not the City of Buffalo itself,  
13                  correct?

14                  SENATOR BASKIN:   No. Through you,  
15                  Madam President, my colleague is incorrect.

16                  (Pause.)

17                  SENATOR BASKIN:   The bill before  
18                  us -- through you, Madam President, the bill  
19                  before us allows for the City of Buffalo to  
20                  extend their ability to bond in private sales for  
21                  an additional year. That is the bill before us.

22                  There is a separate bill about  
23                  deficit borrowing that has been introduced, but  
24                  that is not the bill before us. And my  
25                  colleague's line of questioning is not germane to

1 the topic of the bill before us.

2 SENATOR MARTINS: So  
3 Madam President, through you, if the sponsor  
4 would continue to yield.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the  
6 sponsor yield?

7 SENATOR BASKIN: Yes,  
8 Madam President.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The  
10 sponsor yields.

11 SENATOR MARTINS: So if a city has  
12 distress and requested \$50 million in a grant  
13 from the State of New York and is now  
14 requiring -- or requesting the ability to borrow,  
15 while they have a fiscal control board, are you  
16 suggesting that we should ignore the  
17 fiscal control board and allow the city to  
18 continue to borrow without having a plan or  
19 oversight?

20 (Pause.)

21 SENATOR BASKIN: Through you,  
22 Madam President. The bill before us is subject  
23 to oversight by the State Comptroller.

24 SENATOR MARTINS: Madam President,  
25 on the bill.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:    Senator  
2   Martins on the bill.

3                   SENATOR MARTINS:    You know,  
4   Madam President, I'm sitting here reading the  
5   bill. I have it right here. So I'm going to  
6   take the opportunity to read the bill number,  
7   Section 9839, which is the calendar number we  
8   have here tonight, or this afternoon, 9839, which  
9   is Calendar Number 1132, which is the bill we are  
10   debating here today.

11                  And it's an act to amend the  
12   Local Finance Law in relation to facilitating the  
13   marketing of any issue of serial bonds or notes  
14   of the City of Buffalo issued on or before a  
15   certain date, with the purpose being to authorize  
16   the Buffalo Fiscal Stability Authority to issue  
17   bonds between July 1, 2025, and June 30, 2029.

18                  Right from the memo that's  
19   associated with the bill.

20                  So I would hope that I'd be able to  
21   get some answers to some questions about the  
22   Fiscal Stability Authority, because it is that  
23   which we are being asked to vote on today by the  
24   bill and the memo itself. Not the City of  
25   Buffalo, but the Stability Authority.

1                   And just think about what we're  
2 going through here and the exercise we're going  
3 through. I have no issue whatsoever with  
4 assisting a city in this state that is going  
5 through a fiscal crisis and allowing the city the  
6 opportunity to get its act together and to pay  
7 its bills and to continue to provide services for  
8 its residents, to continue to pay its public  
9 employees, to continue to honor its contracts.  
10 None. And I'm happy to support your efforts when  
11 that is in fact the case.

12                   But as I mentioned yesterday, if  
13 we're going to hand \$50 million to a city and  
14 then we're going to say here on the floor of the  
15 Senate that they are -- they have a balanced  
16 budget and that they're not going through fiscal  
17 distress and somehow their fiscal board, which is  
18 a seven-member voting board where three of the  
19 members aren't there and haven't been reappointed  
20 by the Governor -- so you only have four people  
21 there -- they're asking for \$50 million. They're  
22 asking for the ability to borrow \$150 million.  
23 The memo itself should serve as proof to this  
24 body that they are in fiscal distress, because it  
25 speaks to the need to get their fiscal house in

1 order and be able to borrow so that they can put  
2 a plan in place and to be able to phase in that  
3 plan over several years.

4 So as we've done in the past, it  
5 requires a plan. If the state is going to come  
6 in and provide money, going to come in and  
7 provide the authority to borrow, it requires a  
8 plan. There has to be a restructuring plan.

9 The idea that we have a request that  
10 comes before us and says, No, we're fine, we have  
11 a balanced budget, we're okay. No, no, no,  
12 nobody can claim that we're in deficit or that  
13 we're in distress, just give us the \$50 million.  
14 We're going to ignore -- we're going to ignore  
15 this fiscal stability board that was created by  
16 this body, and we're just going to allow that  
17 board, even though they haven't asked us for it,  
18 to borrow \$150 million, is just odd.

19 The request came from the mayor of  
20 the city, a former colleague of ours, and I wish  
21 him well. But that's not how this works. You  
22 want to come in, declare the fact that you have  
23 an emergency, declare the fact that you need  
24 help, declare the fact that you're asking the  
25 rest of the state, the taxpayers of the rest of

1 the estate to come up with the revenue to get you  
2 over this hurdle. That's fine.

3 But show us what that plan looks  
4 like. Show us that you're serious about actually  
5 refinancing or reworking your finances so that  
6 you're able to make ends meet.

7 So what do we have? We have a  
8 \$50 million ask. You voted for that yesterday.  
9 It's done. The City of Buffalo will be getting  
10 their money. Gap filled.

11 But now we're being asked to let the  
12 city borrow up to \$150 million, and not include  
13 the very board that this body, the Assembly and  
14 the Governor, this state placed on Buffalo to  
15 make sure that they had those safeguards in  
16 place.

17 So as the city has been going  
18 through periods of distress over the course of we  
19 know years -- and again, I wish the mayor all the  
20 luck in the world, and we're here to support his  
21 efforts and the fiscal board's efforts in helping  
22 Buffalo meet their obligations.

23 But to come in here and to tell us  
24 the budget is balanced, they're not disastrous  
25 distressed, and there hasn't been a trigger for

1 the Buffalo Fiscal Stability Authority to enter a  
2 control period is a joke.

3 Madam President, we have other  
4 control boards in this state, other control  
5 boards that are in place, other control boards  
6 that are active and are doing their job. Before  
7 we are asked to vote on whether or not to  
8 authorize \$150 million, we should have an idea of  
9 what that plan looks like, what the  
10 responsibility is of that board, and help.

11 We should at least know that the  
12 board is fully constituted and meeting and  
13 engaged and actually working with the City of  
14 Buffalo, its mayor, its comptroller, in terms of  
15 coming up with solutions and alternatives to make  
16 sure that they get through this fiscal crisis.

17 Madam President, if the sponsor  
18 would yield for a question.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Does the  
20 sponsor yield?

21 SENATOR BASKIN: Yes,  
22 Madam President, I yield.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
24 sponsor yields.

25 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you.

1 Do you know how much debt the City  
2 of Buffalo has currently?

3 SENATOR BASKIN: As of a week ago,  
4 the city comptroller has a projected deficit of  
5 \$103 million.

6 SENATOR MARTINS: Deficit of  
7 103 million --

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Are you  
9 asking if the Senator will yield?

10 SENATOR MARTINS: I'm just  
11 repeating the words, Madam President.

12 If the Senator will yield for  
13 further questions?

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Will you  
15 yield for a further question?

16 SENATOR BASKIN: Yes, I yield.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
18 Senator yields.

19 SENATOR BASKIN: Yes, I yield.

20 SENATOR MARTINS: So the projected  
21 deficit is \$103 million. Do you know how much  
22 outstanding debt the city has currently for which  
23 it has outstanding bond obligations --

24 SENATOR BASKIN: Through you --

25 SENATOR MARTINS: Excuse me. I'll

1 leave it at that.

2 SENATOR BASKIN: Through you,  
3 Madam President. The bill before us is about  
4 capital borrowing. And this chamber allows for  
5 extensions on -- for authorities to be able to do  
6 bonding and be able to have the powers to be able  
7 to bond when the city will be in need, all the  
8 time.

9 And my colleague's line of  
10 questioning just does not align with what it is  
11 that we are actually voting on today, which is  
12 allowing the City of Buffalo to just extend for  
13 one year their ability to be able to go to the  
14 bond market should they so choose to do so.

15 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,  
16 Madam President.

17 And thank you, Senator Baskin.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator  
19 Martins, are you on the bill?

20 SENATOR MARTINS: I am on the bill.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator  
22 Martins on the bill.

23 SENATOR MARTINS: So we're being  
24 asked to allow the city, I guess, under these  
25 circumstances -- there's a 100-plus-million

1 dollar-projected deficit, Madam President. There  
2 is a request that the city be able to borrow  
3 money directly. The Fiscal Stability Authority  
4 has not been engaged even though they have the  
5 ability and, frankly, I would say the obligation  
6 to engage when they find that there's a  
7 substantial operating funds deficit or one that  
8 exists or one that is projected.

9 This body has already provided the  
10 City of Buffalo with \$50 million through its  
11 budget voted on just yesterday. And yet rather  
12 than go through the fiscal stability board that  
13 exists and that exists for the purpose of  
14 extending oversight over the city specifically  
15 for instances such as this, we're now giving  
16 the -- we're ignoring the fiscal stability board,  
17 which, by the way, is still there, and through  
18 legislative act giving the city the opportunity  
19 to go out and borrow that money themselves.

20 Madam President, thank you for your  
21 time. Senator Baskin, thank you for yours.

22 I wish, Madam President, that the  
23 memo reflected the bill itself. Thank you.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Are there  
25 any other Senators wishing to be heard?

1                   Seeing and hearing none, debate is  
2 closed. The Secretary will ring the bell.

3                   Read the last section.

4                   THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
5 act shall take effect immediately.

6                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
7 roll.

8                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

9                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
10 the results.

11                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

12                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
13 is passed.

14                  Senator Gianaris.

15                  SENATOR GIANARIS: Next up is  
16 Calendar 305.

17                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
18 Secretary will ring the bell.

19                  The Secretary will read.

20                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
21 305, Senate Print 5939C, by Senator Skoufis, an  
22 act to amend the Public Health Law.

23                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:  
24 Senator Ashby, why do you rise?

25                  SENATOR ASHBY: Madam President,

1 would the sponsor yield?

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator  
3 Skoufis, do you yield?

4 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
6 Senator yields.

7 SENATOR ASHBY: Through you,  
8 Madam President. Can you tell me how this bill  
9 will impact the Essential Plan?

10 (Pause.)

11 SENATOR SKOUFIS: While staff looks  
12 over their notes, I understand you have another  
13 question. Would you like to go to that one?

14 SENATOR ASHBY: Through you,  
15 Madam President. Can you tell me how this bill  
16 would impact Child Health Plus?

17 SENATOR SKOUFIS: So let me answer  
18 both of those questions this way. The bill  
19 before us is focused on commercial health plans.  
20 And we look to provide for the same floor as  
21 exists for Medicaid reimbursement.

22 Typically providers want way more  
23 than a Medicaid level of reimbursement. If you  
24 go ask any hospital, any FQHC, any solo  
25 practitioner, the gold standard is commercial

1 reimbursement amongst the payer mix, with  
2 Medicare usually being second and Medicaid being  
3 well below cost.

4 In this case, what we've seen is  
5 PBMs actually reimbursing pharmacies, and  
6 especially those pharmacies that they do not have  
7 vertical integration with -- because I remind my  
8 colleagues that there are some PBMs that also own  
9 pharmacies. And what this bill looks to do is to  
10 simply set a floor at the Medicaid level of  
11 reimbursement, because many of these PBMs to many  
12 of these pharmacies are actually reimbursing  
13 below Medicaid and below the at-cost value of  
14 dispensing certain drugs, including lifesaving  
15 drugs like children's inhalers for asthma.

16 And so to the extent that  
17 Child Health Plus or the Essential Plan is  
18 captured by what I just described, which again  
19 affects commercial plans, then that same impact  
20 would extend to those programs.

21 SENATOR ASHBY: Will the sponsor  
22 continue to yield?

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator  
24 Skoufis, do you continue to yield?

25 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The  
2   Senator yields.

3                   SENATOR ASHBY:    Through you,  
4   Madam President.  So what impact and cost would  
5   it have on those two programs?

6                   SENATOR SKOUFIS:   Through you,  
7   Madam President.  In other states that have  
8   advanced a proposal identical if not similar to  
9   what we are debating right now, we have not seen  
10   premiums increase.  We have not seen an impact on  
11   costs in programs like the ones that we are  
12   talking about.

13                   And I think that could be for a  
14   variety of reasons.  First, PBMs make their money  
15   predominantly in the reimbursements sort of side  
16   of their ledger, not through undercutting  
17   reimbursements below Medicaid levels to  
18   independent pharmacies.

19                   And furthermore, plans can tell  
20   PBMs -- if a PBM, after we pass this, comes to a  
21   health plan and says, Well, we want to charge  
22   this now to you, the health plan can simply say  
23   no.  And I suspect that health plans will have  
24   very little if any interest in making upwards  
25   adjustments so that PBMs can accommodate their

1 profits despite only offering Medicaid-level  
2 reimbursements.

3 SENATOR ASHBY: Thank you,  
4 Senator Skoufis.

5 Thank you, Madam President.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,  
7 Senator.

8 Are there any other Senators wishing  
9 to be heard?

10 Seeing and hearing none, debate is  
11 closed. The Secretary will ring the bell.

12 Read the last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This  
14 act shall take effect January 1, 2027.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
19 the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
21 Calendar 305, voting in the negative are  
22 Senators Ashby and Walczyk.

23 Ayes, 57. Nays, 2.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
25 is passed.

1 Senator Gianaris.

2 SENATOR GIANARIS: Next up,  
3 Madam President, is Calendar 1312, once  
4 Senator Kavanagh walks through that door.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
6 Secretary will read.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
8 1312, Senate Print 3233A, by Senator Kavanagh, an  
9 act to amend the Election Law.

10 SENATOR GIANARIS: There he is.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator  
12 Borrello, why do you rise?

13 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,  
14 would the sponsor yield for some questions?

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator  
16 Kavanagh, do you yield?

17 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Through you,  
18 Madam President, yes.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
20 Senator yields.

21 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you.

22 Through you, Madam President. You  
23 know, as I read through this -- the modifications  
24 to this, it appears that this is going to  
25 severely limit who can challenge, you know, an

1 absentee ballot or an affidavit ballot.

2 So my concern is -- my first  
3 question is, you know, if a candidate wants to  
4 challenge the validity of an absentee ballot in  
5 their race -- which is a standard practice, we  
6 all know that -- how will this bill impact that?

7 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Through you,  
8 Madam President. This bill will not meaningfully  
9 restrict the ability of people to challenge.

10 It has several different provisions.  
11 It mostly addresses the circumstances in which  
12 people are doing challenges on the spot where the  
13 voters are present. And it amends a portion of  
14 the law that lays out a very detailed process  
15 when somebody is asserting that someone is  
16 ineligible to vote and they're issuing a  
17 challenge.

18 And it first of all adds a very --  
19 there's a thing called the preliminary -- there's  
20 a thing called the preliminary -- there's a  
21 preliminary portion of that process that adds a  
22 specific question about citizenship if that is  
23 the basis for the challenge. And it allows then  
24 a series of questions to go through.

25 It does create a much more formal

1 process for a specific kind of challenge, which  
2 is when people use -- there's a practice  
3 sometimes people do where they send a large  
4 volume of mail to people and then they get the  
5 mail that's returned. And then they say, well,  
6 given that this piece of mail is returned, we're  
7 going to challenge whether you live at that  
8 address. So it's a formal structure for that  
9 process.

10 But it does not change the fact that  
11 at a poll site, at any poll site, under current  
12 law unchanged by this, there is an inspector from  
13 each party, there's -- there are up to three  
14 poll watchers for any candidate. And all those  
15 people will still be available and they'll still  
16 be able to issue challenges to voters that they  
17 have reason to believe are ineligible to vote.

18 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,  
19 will the sponsor continue to yield?

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you  
21 continue to yield?

22 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Yes,  
23 Madam President.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
25 Senator yields.

1                   SENATOR BORRELLO:    Section 8 here  
2   reads: "Information concerning the citizenship  
3   status of individuals, when collected and  
4   transmitted pursuant to this section, shall not  
5   be retained, used or shared for any other purpose  
6   except as may be required by law."

7                   So -- and it also essentially says  
8   that if someone fails to certify that they're an  
9   actual citizen, which is what the qualification  
10   is to vote in New York State, that that shall be  
11   considered an innocent error. And "Such person  
12   failing to certify United States citizenship  
13   shall not be considered as attempting to register  
14   to vote."

15                  So how can you -- how is this law  
16   assuming that someone who is not being truthful  
17   about their citizenship did so in error?

18                  SENATOR KAVANAGH:   First of all,  
19   just for those -- I'm sure there are many people  
20   following along at home, we're talking about  
21   Section 5 of the bill, which adds a new  
22   subdivision 8 to Section 8.504 --

23                  SENATOR BORRELLO:    Sorry, yes.

24                  SENATOR KAVANAGH:    Just to clarify.

25                  SENATOR BORRELLO:    I stand

1 corrected.

2 SENATOR KAVANAGH: No, just  
3 clarifying where we are.

4 So yeah, there are a couple of very  
5 distinct provisions here. Actually, yes, this  
6 bill provides -- in the first sentence of that  
7 provision provides the information about  
8 citizenship shouldn't be shared with other  
9 authorities. It doesn't mean the Board of  
10 Elections cannot use that information for the  
11 purpose for which it's collected, which is to  
12 determine the citizenship status of folks.

13 And there have been -- you know,  
14 we've had a number of initiatives recently that  
15 are intended not to make particular -- to make  
16 information about citizenship or suspicions of  
17 citizenship something that is broadly shared for  
18 purposes other than the reason it's collected.

19 Just to be clear, information  
20 concerning citizenship status of individuals,  
21 when collected and transmitted pursuant to this  
22 section, this section is the section about  
23 developing challenges to voters. There's nothing  
24 in this law that changes the fact that it  
25 continues to be a crime to -- attempt to -- to

1 vote if you're not eligible to vote because of  
2 citizenship.

3 This is about the information that's  
4 concerning citizenship collected pursuant to  
5 8-504. And it says to the extent that it's  
6 collected by boards, they can retain it for their  
7 -- they can use it for the purpose of verifying  
8 eligibility to vote, but not for other purposes.  
9 And not share it with other agencies, for  
10 example.

11 The innocent-error thing -- again,  
12 there are three sentences. The second sentence  
13 is about a poll worker or an inspector -- who,  
14 again, might be an inspector of either party, who  
15 generally do them as joint -- this process  
16 jointly. But it's the failure to certify that an  
17 individual is a citizen of the United States  
18 shall be considered an innocent error.

19 And again, this is embedded in  
20 Section 8-504, which lists a series of  
21 specifically phrased -- there's actually  
22 statutory language that lists all the things that  
23 you're supposed to say to a voter before they  
24 certify they're eligible to vote. And what we're  
25 saying is if the election worker doesn't say this

1 out loud, that shall be considered an innocent  
2 error.

3 It does not, again, suggest that if  
4 somebody willfully or intentionally permits  
5 somebody to vote who's not eligible to vote --  
6 but this is like -- sort of like a sin of  
7 omission. If you fail to read those exact words,  
8 from the perspective of the election worker,  
9 that's an innocent mistake that isn't going to  
10 get the election worker in trouble.

11 The third sentence there is about  
12 the person failing to certify their citizenship.  
13 And again, that shall not be considered an  
14 attempt to register to vote.

15 And that is a reference to the fact  
16 that if I -- if I show up at a poll site and I  
17 believe I'm eligible to vote and I am challenged  
18 and they say "You're not on the voting rolls," I  
19 am sometimes given an affidavit ballot.

20 And we changed the law, an  
21 enterprising young Assemblymember named Kavanagh  
22 many years ago changed the law such that when  
23 you're given an affidavit ballot -- envelope, you  
24 can say "If I'm not on the list, I will use this  
25 affidavit envelope to register."

1                   So what this is saying is if you  
2 fail to certify that you're a citizen, then you  
3 are ineligible -- then this -- that shall not be  
4 construed as an attempt to vote if you say -- you  
5 say you're not a citizen. You don't say that  
6 you're a citizen.

7                   SENATOR BORRELLO:    Madam President,  
8 will the sponsor continue to yield?

9                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Do you  
10 continue to yield?

11                  SENATOR KAVANAGH:    Yes.

12                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   The  
13 Senator yields.

14                  SENATOR BORRELLO:    Okay, I want to  
15 go back to what you said like 10 minutes ago --

16                         (Laughter.)

17                  SENATOR BORRELLO:    -- that -- that  
18 the information concerning citizenship, that they  
19 can retain that for the purposes of verifying  
20 citizenship.

21                         But the -- specifically that  
22 subsection 8 says that if they -- once that  
23 information is collected, it cannot be retained.  
24 The word "retained" is right in line 12.

25                         Isn't that a conflict with what you

1 said?

2 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Not be retained  
3 for any other purpose --

4 SENATOR BORRELLO: No, no, no. No,  
5 cannot be retained --

6 SENATOR KAVANAGH: -- except as  
7 required by law.

8 SENATOR BORRELLO: It says "shall  
9 not be retained, used or shared," but it starts  
10 with "retained."

11 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Right, it can't  
12 be --

13 SENATOR BORRELLO: So how do you --

14 SENATOR KAVANAGH: If it's  
15 collected -- sorry. Through you,  
16 Madam President. If it's collected for the  
17 purpose of complying with this law, which is all  
18 about determining whether people are eligible to  
19 vote, it can't be retained or transmitted -- it  
20 cannot be retained, used or shared for any other  
21 purpose.

22 But it's collected -- the "other"  
23 refers to not this section, which is the section  
24 of Election Law that's about determining whether  
25 you're eligible to vote.

1                   SENATOR BORRELLO:    Thank you.

2                   Madam President, will the sponsor  
3 continue to yield?

4                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Do you  
5 continue to yield?

6                   SENATOR KAVANAGH:    Yes,  
7 Madam President.

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The  
9 Senator yields.

10                  SENATOR BORRELLO:    So last  
11 question, based on your previous answer. So if  
12 someone -- if an election worker fails to ask the  
13 necessary questions to verify the citizenship of  
14 a voter, this will automatically be considered an  
15 innocent error.

16                  How are we knowing the intent is an  
17 innocent error? How -- how is that assumption  
18 made for the purpose of this change to the law?  
19 Why are we making that assumption? Shouldn't  
20 there be a level of fear of consequence if  
21 someone does have nefarious intentions?

22                  SENATOR KAVANAGH:    And we -- this  
23 is -- this provision deals with the situation at  
24 a poll site where the election officials who have  
25 to administer a lengthy oath that is in statute

1 fail to affirmatively say the words about  
2 citizenship.

3 And we're saying that is an innocent  
4 error. Because we don't want our harried  
5 election workers, who have to read the words that  
6 are in this statute, to get in trouble if they  
7 fail to certify that.

8 If they -- if there was some  
9 evidence that they intentionally invited people  
10 to vote or they snuck the person in,  
11 notwithstanding the fact that there are both  
12 parties represented, that would be a different  
13 matter.

14 This is just saying -- again, in a  
15 provision of law, Section 8-504, that has  
16 multiple oaths that you might have to administer  
17 in different circumstances, we're actually adding  
18 an extra oath about citizenship to that law right  
19 now in this bill.

20 So we're not trying to skirt the  
21 need to confirm citizenship. We're in fact  
22 enhancing that. But if they fail to  
23 affirmatively certify that, they are not presumed  
24 to have made an error merely by failing to  
25 certify that. Not to make a pernicious error,

1       it's an -- it's considered an innocent mistake.

2                   SENATOR BORRELLO:     Madam President,  
3       on the bill.

4                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:     Senator  
5       Borrello on the bill.

6                   SENATOR BORRELLO:     Thank you,  
7       Senator Kavanaugh. I'm always impressed with the  
8       level of knowledge you have on all of these  
9       things.

10                   And so that being said, this was  
11       brought to the attention -- to us by some  
12       elections professionals that have concerns about  
13       this. So I bring it up to say that the  
14       perception is this is going to loosen and not  
15       tighten the process here to ensure integrity in  
16       that election.

17                   So if that's the case, then I really  
18       think this should be looked at again. Because it  
19       sounds like my impression and Senator Kavanaugh's  
20       impression were diametrically opposed.

21                   Therefore, I think that this --  
22       whether it was intentional or not needs to be  
23       tightened up and strengthened so people have that  
24       confidence that this is indeed going to  
25       strengthen and not weaken our election integrity.

1                   So with that, I will be voting no.

2                   Thank you, Madam President.

3                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Senator  
4                   Martins, why do you rise?

5                   SENATOR MARTINS:    Thank you,  
6                   Madam President.  If the sponsor would yield for  
7                   a few questions.

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Senator  
9                   Kavanagh, do you yield?

10                  SENATOR KAVANAGH:   Yes, succinctly,  
11                  Madam Speaker -- or Madam President, I will  
12                  yield.

13                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   The  
14                  Senator yields.

15                  SENATOR MARTINS:    Thank you,  
16                  Senator.

17                  You know, I feel pretty strongly --  
18                  extremely strongly that for every person who  
19                  votes who shouldn't vote, they are diluting a  
20                  vote from someone who had a right to vote, and  
21                  therefore stealing that person's voice.

22                  I know oftentimes in this house  
23                  the -- the -- that it's expressed frankly the  
24                  same sentiment, but in an opposite view.  But I  
25                  believe that we need to protect the ability of

1 people who shouldn't vote not to vote. That is,  
2 prevent them from voting and -- in order not to  
3 dilute the rights of people who have a right to  
4 vote.

5 And my concern with this -- well,  
6 first of all, do you agree?

7 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Through you,  
8 Madam President, I agree.

9 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you.

10 Madam President, through you, if the  
11 sponsor would continue to yield.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you  
13 continue to yield?

14 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Yes,  
15 Madam President.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator  
17 Kavanagh yields.

18 SENATOR MARTINS: And so, you know,  
19 we've all been to polling places in the past.  
20 It's part of, I guess, an occupational hazard for  
21 all of us that we spend a bit of time there.

22 And I find that oftentimes it's  
23 those very people that are there in the polling  
24 place that have a sense of their community and  
25 know if so-and-so shows up to vote and says that

1       they live at 123 Main Street and you live a  
2       couple of houses away and you know that that  
3       person isn't familiar to you, you have an  
4       obligation, I would think, to challenge that  
5       person as to whether or not they actually in fact  
6       live in that location.

7                       Don't you agree?

8                       SENATOR KAVANAGH:    I generally  
9       agree that that is an appropriate thing for  
10      somebody with information that they think -- I'm  
11      not sure I'd call it an obligation, but I think  
12      that is a part of the process. And this bill  
13      doesn't change that. And I think that's a fine  
14      part of the process.

15                      SENATOR MARTINS:    Through you,  
16      Madam President, if the sponsor would continue to  
17      yield.

18                      ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Do you  
19      continue to yield?

20                      SENATOR KAVANAGH:    Yes,  
21      Madam President.

22                      ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   The  
23      sponsor yields.

24                      SENATOR MARTINS:    And yet if this  
25      bill is to proceed, it would limit the types of

1 questions that can be asked, the form that it can  
2 be asked, and limit the ability of that person to  
3 intervene in order to prevent someone who they  
4 believe should not be voting from voting.

5 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Through you,  
6 Madam President, there we disagree.

7 This bill limits a particular manner  
8 of challenging people's address, which is sending  
9 a large volume of mail out into the world and  
10 then sort of brandishing a returned piece of  
11 mail. It is not about having personal knowledge,  
12 because you live on the street, that that person  
13 doesn't live there.

14 And it creates a structure so that  
15 that information can be properly reviewed and  
16 used. Just as, for example, we don't allow  
17 people to challenge people's petition signatures  
18 on the spot, there's a process.

19 And I think this is similar to that,  
20 but it does not limit the ability for somebody to  
21 point out evidence that somebody doesn't live on  
22 the street or to ask that question, or the  
23 current process where people have oaths  
24 administered and if there's a doubt, they can be  
25 given an absentee ballot -- an affidavit ballot

1 so it can be decided later.

2 SENATOR MARTINS: Madam President,  
3 through you, if the sponsor would continue to  
4 yield.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you  
6 continue to yield?

7 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Yes,  
8 Madam President.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
10 Senator yields.

11 SENATOR MARTINS: So if a mailing  
12 goes out, a political mailing is sent out and a  
13 piece of mail is returned as undeliverable or  
14 that the person no longer lives at that address,  
15 would that trigger a requirement under this  
16 statute -- under this bill?

17 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Through you,  
18 Madam President. This bill deals with  
19 circumstances where somebody sends a mailing with  
20 the intent of using it for challenges or with a  
21 reasonable expectation that that's the purpose of  
22 the mailing.

23 So if you -- if someone comes into  
24 possession of information that demonstrates that  
25 that somebody doesn't live at a particular

1 address -- not through this particular practice,  
2 which has become something that, you know, people  
3 have used in recent years -- then that  
4 information can still be presented.

5 SENATOR MARTINS: I'm sorry,  
6 that --

7 SENATOR KAVANAGH: The  
8 information -- if you have information that  
9 indicates I live on Main Street and they say they  
10 live on Main Street but I know they don't live on  
11 Main Street because Mrs. Jones moved into that  
12 house last week, that information can be still  
13 presented.

14 If I have a piece of mail that's  
15 been returned, this bill does not necessarily  
16 deal with an individual piece of mail. But  
17 there's a presumption that if you're sending  
18 large volumes of mail for the purpose of  
19 generating challenges, then you notify -- you  
20 provide a copy of the mail and you provide the  
21 list of people you send it to in advance so all  
22 parties can review that and determine how it's  
23 being used.

24 SENATOR MARTINS: Through you,  
25 Madam President, if the sponsor would continue to

1     yield.

2                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Do you  
3     continue to yield?

4                   SENATOR KAVANAGH:    Yes,  
5     Madam President.

6                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The  
7     sponsor yields.

8                   SENATOR MARTINS:    But just to be  
9     clear, if you do send out mail, political mail,  
10    and it is returned and you collect those returned  
11    pieces, then with the intent of pursuing it, but  
12    it wasn't your intent when you sent out the mail,  
13    but it is your intent once you get those pieces  
14    back, you would not have to comply with the  
15    requirements of this bill, right?

16                   SENATOR KAVANAGH:    You would --  
17    there might be a question of fact whether you  
18    knew or whether you intended that or reasonably  
19    knew that that mail would be used.  Somebody  
20    might be skeptical if your campaign is using  
21    returns, you presumably knew you'd get returns  
22    and now you're using them to challenge.

23                   But the bill deals with the  
24    situation where you either expressly intended the  
25    mail to be used in that way or reasonably

1 anticipated that it would be used in that way.

2 I would suggest that if I'm a  
3 campaign that intends to use that mail, it would  
4 be logical to -- and this statute passes, it  
5 would be logical to comply with this statute and  
6 say, Here's a copy of a piece of mail and here's  
7 who we sent it to, and we intend to use it as  
8 challenges. And then the process would proceed.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Through  
10 you, Madam President, if the sponsor would  
11 continue to yield. Do you continue to yield?

12 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Yes,  
13 Madam President.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
15 sponsor yields.

16 SENATOR MARTINS: So just -- so  
17 every campaign in New York State for every level  
18 of state government, local government, or federal  
19 government that sends out a piece of mail and --  
20 and -- for campaign purposes, and then expects  
21 there may be, because there invariably is, as we  
22 all know, pieces of mail that come back, in order  
23 to be safe, are you suggesting that every  
24 campaign send every campaign piece to the Board  
25 of Elections with a list of who they sent it to,

1 in the off chance that some of those pieces may  
2 come back and they may want to challenge whether  
3 or not something actually lives where they say  
4 they live?

5 SENATOR KAVANAGH: They may. And  
6 if they want to be challenging that voter's right  
7 to vote on Election Day at the poll site by  
8 telling a voter who is presenting themselves as  
9 eligible to vote, that they're not going to be  
10 allowed to vote today -- if they want to use the  
11 mail for that purpose, then yes, a good practice  
12 would be for them to indicate that they intend  
13 to -- they intend to do that.

14 SENATOR MARTINS: Madam President,  
15 through you -- you know what? I appreciate it.  
16 Thank you very much to the sponsor.

17 Thank you, Madam President. On the  
18 bill.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator  
20 Martins on the bill.

21 SENATOR MARTINS: So we started out  
22 our discussion with a very simple premise. By  
23 allowing somebody who shouldn't have a right to  
24 vote, whether because they don't live there or  
25 because of citizenship they don't have a right to

1 vote -- those are the primary characteristics  
2 eliminating a person's ability to vote currently.  
3 There are others; we'll focus on those.

4 If we can identify that someone  
5 should not be voting, what this bill does is it  
6 handcuffs us and it handcuffs the local community  
7 members, boards of elections, parties,  
8 candidates, from being able to say, Stop, you  
9 can't vote. You don't have a right to vote.

10 Requiring the off-chance erring on  
11 the side of providing layers of bureaucracy,  
12 providing details to the Board of Elections for a  
13 condition of being able to safeguard what  
14 everyone in this body has always regarded as  
15 being a sacrosanct right, the right to vote, also  
16 means making sure that those who shouldn't be  
17 voting don't.

18 So I question why it is that we  
19 would put those obligations on this process.  
20 Because it should be everyone's responsibility --  
21 all of us, certainly everyone back home, and  
22 those who care -- to ensure that only people who  
23 are entitled to vote actually do vote. Whoever  
24 they happen to be.

25 So the idea that we're going to

1     require, frankly, all of us and everyone else out  
2     there who's engaged in this process to go through  
3     this process of sending mailings to the Board of  
4     Elections, along with lists of people they mailed  
5     to, along with lists of returned mail in the  
6     off chance that that person who happens to not  
7     have received a mail because they have moved, if  
8     they happen to show up on Election Day at the  
9     polls asking to vote and you received that piece  
10    of mail back and you didn't send it to the  
11    Board of Elections, somehow you did something  
12    wrong.

13                 Why does it default against those  
14    who are trying to ensure the integrity of the  
15    system? Madam President, I'm at a loss as to why  
16    we would possibly support a bill like this and  
17    create these kinds of hurdles in order to do what  
18    each and every one of us should do as a matter of  
19    course.

20                 I will tell you this. If that piece  
21    of mail is returned, my expectation, and everyone  
22    in this room's expectation, is that person isn't  
23    showing up at the polling place. But if they do,  
24    I'll be holding that piece of mail -- hopefully  
25    someone will -- in order to challenge that person

1 and why they took the opportunity to vote.

2 And it may be innocent. It may be.

3 But they have every right to question that  
4 person's vote on that day and ask that person for  
5 clarification. This bill would prevent that, and  
6 that's why I'm voting no.

7 Thank you, Madam President.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Are there  
9 any other Senators wishing to be heard?

10 Seeing and hearing none, debate is  
11 closed. The Secretary will ring the bell.

12 Read the last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 9. This  
14 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it  
15 shall have become a law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
22 Calendar 1312, voting in the negative are  
23 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,  
24 Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins,  
25 Mattera, Murray, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison,

1       Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

2                   Ayes, 39.   Nays, 20.

3                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   The bill  
4   is passed.

5                   Senator Gianaris.

6                   SENATOR GIANARIS:   Next up,  
7   Madam President, is Calendar 968.

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Senator  
9   Rhoads, why do you rise?

10                  SENATOR RHOADS:   I was hoping that  
11   the sponsor would yield to a couple of questions.

12                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Senator  
13   Rivera --

14                  SENATOR RIVERA:   Yes.

15                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Senator --  
16   I'm sorry.  Oh, the Secretary will read.  I  
17   jumped over, I apologize.

18                  THE SECRETARY:   Calendar Number  
19   968, Senate Print 1634A, by Senator Rivera, an  
20   act to amend the Insurance Law.

21                  SENATOR RHOADS:   Now I'm hoping  
22   that the Senator will yield to a few questions.

23                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Now.  That  
24   was my mistake.  Thank you, Senator Rhoads.

25                  SENATOR RIVERA:   Yes.

1                   SENATOR RHOADS:   Thank you,  
2   Madam President.   And thank you, Senator Rivera.

3                   Madam President, through you.   The  
4   bill focuses on creating a healthcare -- health  
5   plan allocation of 12.5 percent of spending for  
6   primary care, is that correct?

7                   SENATOR RIVERA:   Through you,  
8   Madam President.   With the recognition that  
9   primary care being the first point of contact  
10   with individuals -- should be the first point of  
11   contact with individuals, the place where people  
12   can get their routine medical care, this bill --  
13   what this bill would do is over a period of years  
14   it would establish a 1 percent per year increase  
15   up to 12.5 percent of the Medicaid spend so that  
16   it goes to primary care.

17                  But it would not be an immediate  
18   thing.   That would be the ultimate goal.   But it  
19   would not be an immediate thing.

20                  SENATOR RHOADS:   Will the sponsor  
21   continue to yield?

22                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Do you  
23   continue to yield?

24                  SENATOR RIVERA:   Yes.

25                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   The

1 Senator yields.

2 SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you.

3 Through you, Madam President.

4 My understanding is that the  
5 immediate threshold is 12.5 percent. That is  
6 intended to be the max. If they are under  
7 12.5 percent, then there's a 1 percent per year  
8 plan -- they have to develop a plan for a  
9 1 percent increase until they get to  
10 12.5 percent. Is that not correct?

11 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,  
12 Madam President, the ultimate goal would be to  
13 get to 12.5 percent. It would be -- I am -- we  
14 are not -- we don't have -- that is not being met  
15 now. We don't know exactly where the percentage  
16 is, but it is below 12.5 percent.

17 The goal ultimately,  
18 Madam President, is to make sure that we have  
19 more folks in the Medicaid program who have  
20 access to primary care -- therefore, being able  
21 to identify chronic conditions earlier, being  
22 able to take care of -- to focus on wellness as  
23 opposed to sick care.

24 And it is -- I believe it is a good  
25 way not only to spend money more wisely, but to

1 make sure that people have better and healthier  
2 lives.

3 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor  
4 continue to yield?

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you  
6 continue to yield?

7 SENATOR RIVERA: Yes.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
9 Senator yields.

10 SENATOR RHOADS: Through you,  
11 Madam President. I know you said you don't know  
12 what the percentage is now, but you think it's  
13 less than 12.5 percent.

14 Milbank Memorial Fund's Primary Care  
15 Scorecard says that spending on primary care as a  
16 total share of healthcare spending in New York is  
17 actually 13.3 percent in the commercial market  
18 and 10.1 percent for Medicaid.

19 So if the commercial market is  
20 already meeting its threshold but the state is  
21 not, in terms of Medicaid spending, why aren't we  
22 focusing just on the state's portion of Medicaid?

23 (Pause.)

24 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,  
25 Madam President. So the -- the national average

1 as far as -- is about 5 percent, is what we know.

2 But if the bill were to become law,  
3 then we would actually get reports from both  
4 Medicaid spending as well as private plans and  
5 would then -- we would make -- we would make a  
6 plan to hit the 12.5 eventually.

7 If there is -- if that number is  
8 exceeded already, then God bless America -- we're  
9 done. But if it's not, which is what we believe,  
10 then it would be -- the goal would be to go  
11 1 percent a year until we get to 12.5.

12 SENATOR RHOADS: And will the  
13 sponsor continue to yield?

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you  
15 continue to yield?

16 SENATOR RIVERA: Yes.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
18 Senator yields.

19 SENATOR RHOADS: So with the  
20 understanding that if in fact healthcare spending  
21 in the commercial market, competitive  
22 marketplace, is 13.3 percent, they would have  
23 already met the goals, the legislation authorizes  
24 the commissioner to promulgate rules and  
25 regulations. Do these rules and regulations

1 include penalties at some point if in fact  
2 private health plans -- if in fact health plans  
3 do not meet these goals?

4 (Pause.)

5 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,  
6 Madam President. First of all, the -- we would  
7 have to see plan by plan what percentage we're  
8 talking about. There might be some plans that  
9 actually exceeded; there might be some that don't  
10 meet it. And so we would look towards -- to get  
11 there.

12 And if there is -- and if it's -- if  
13 the -- if it's not met, then the fines would  
14 correspond to Public Health Law that already  
15 exists that would be up to -- the fines would be  
16 up to \$2,000.

17 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor  
18 continue to yield?

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you  
20 continue to yield?

21 SENATOR RIVERA: Yes.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
23 sponsor yields.

24 SENATOR RHOADS: So there is no  
25 provision for -- through you, Madam President,

1       there is no provision for fines in the  
2       legislation itself other than the reference to  
3       the Public Health Law, which lays out the fine  
4       schedule?

5                   SENATOR RIVERA:    Through you,  
6       Madam President, that is correct.

7                   SENATOR RHOADS:    Okay.  And will  
8       the sponsor continue to yield.

9                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:  Do you  
10      continue to yield?

11                  SENATOR RIVERA:    Yes.

12                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:  The  
13      Senator yields.

14                  SENATOR RHOADS:    The bill focuses  
15      on health plans meeting these targets.  Oh,  
16      actually I'll withdraw that question for a moment  
17      and I'll switch to another question, the state  
18      and its administration of Medicaid.

19                  Are there sanctions against the  
20      state if it fails to meet these primary care  
21      goals?

22                  SENATOR RIVERA:    Through you,  
23      Madam President.  The majority of Medicare --  
24      Medicaid, pardon me, in the State of New York  
25      is -- currently operates through managed care

1 organizations. Therefore, there are middlemen  
2 and so therefore the fine, if it were to be  
3 assessed, probably would be assessed on those  
4 plans, not on the state itself.

5 SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you.

6 Will the sponsor continue to yield?

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Will you  
8 continue to yield?

9 SENATOR RIVERA: Yes.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
11 Senator yields.

12 SENATOR RHOADS: The focus is on  
13 health plans meeting these targets. But why  
14 weren't provider systems factored into this  
15 equation?

16 Because my understanding of the way  
17 that this works -- obviously I'm a consumer, I  
18 decide that I'm going to go to my primary care  
19 physician for whatever preventative care that I  
20 need. I make the choice to go to a specific  
21 physician. The services that are provided to me  
22 are services that are provided by the physician.  
23 The health plan only gets involved in the  
24 equation when they receive the bill.

25 Do we have an issue where they're

1 denying primary care services? Are people not  
2 being provided primary care services because the  
3 health plans themselves aren't providing it? How  
4 does this help encourage people to seek primary  
5 care, if that's the ultimate goal?

6 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,  
7 Madam President. The reality is that we find  
8 that most folks do not avail themselves of  
9 primary care if it is available to them. And  
10 this would be a way to kind of encourage the  
11 spend so that it goes in that direction, with the  
12 understanding that providing -- that spending  
13 more money in routine medicine, in the first  
14 point of contact, it would actually be -- it  
15 would be better for the system.

16 As I said, as I stated earlier,  
17 having folks be able to identify chronic  
18 conditions earlier means that folks who have  
19 asthma, diabetes, or any other chronic condition  
20 could focus on making sure that that condition  
21 gets better, as opposed to just focusing on  
22 episodes where they have either had an asthma  
23 attack or have to be hospitalized for low blood  
24 sugar, et cetera, et cetera.

25 So ultimately this is about trying

1 to switch up the total spend. It's about  
2 encouraging more -- have it be available more.  
3 It is not about -- you know, it's not about  
4 finding more places to fine people. Instead, it  
5 is about trying to focus our total healthcare  
6 expenditures in places where it would cause  
7 people to be healthier and to lead better lives.

8 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor  
9 continue to yield?

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you  
11 continue to yield?

12 SENATOR RIVERA: Yes.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
14 sponsor yields.

15 SENATOR RHOADS: Through you,  
16 Madam President, I get all that. I mean, I get  
17 what the goal of the legislation is.

18 But by putting the burden on the  
19 health plan, I'm trying to understand what it is  
20 that that the health plan is supposed to do to  
21 actually encourage people to seek primary care  
22 more frequently.

23 How does this actually -- you're  
24 focusing on the percentage of spend, but the  
25 health plan is actually paying the bills that

1       come to them. Right? It's not -- it's  
2       apparently not the case that you have health  
3       plans that are denying coverage for primary care;  
4       people aren't seeking primary care.

5                       So how does this actually encourage  
6       people to seek primary care, which is the  
7       ultimate goal?

8                       (Pause.)

9                       SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,  
10      Madam President. First of all, it is  
11      certainly -- as we've said many times, insurance  
12      companies kind of live for the instances in which  
13      they can deny care.

14                      So I can't tell in every single  
15      instance, but certainly there are many instances,  
16      as many as they can muster, where they will deny  
17      care to an individual, whether it be primary or  
18      otherwise.

19                      But, second, the bill actually  
20      speaks to creating a set of incentives that  
21      actually would work to increase the amount of  
22      spending, particularly since we have -- there are  
23      definitely visits to primary care providers, but  
24      it doesn't necessarily show in the spend.

25                      Now, it is true that we would have

1 to get -- if the bill were to pass and be made  
2 into law, we would get more exact percentages.  
3 At this point we're operating with analysis that  
4 doesn't have all the information. There would  
5 have to be a study done to determine how close or  
6 how far away we are from the 12.5.

7 But also in Section (2) and  
8 Section (2)(d) and throughout all of it, there  
9 are a set of different actions that would be --  
10 that are suggested for the Department of Health  
11 and the commissioner to encourage the -- the --  
12 more folks utilizing primary care.

13 So it's all in the bill already, all  
14 the different methods that can be utilized to get  
15 more folks to be -- to avail themselves of  
16 primary care.

17 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor  
18 continue to yield?

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you  
20 continue to yield?

21 SENATOR RIVERA: Yes.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
23 sponsor yields.

24 SENATOR RHOADS: You brought up the  
25 issue of a study, and I just want to briefly

1 touch on that. This version of the bill has  
2 passed in prior years. And the version in prior  
3 years that was vetoed by the Governor included a  
4 commission for DOH and DFS to study the delivery  
5 of primary care. So it's exactly the study that  
6 you were talking about, but in this particular  
7 version it's removed.

8                   Wouldn't the study portion of it, to  
9 study how we can encourage more people to make  
10 use of primary care, be the important precursor  
11 to putting policy in place, law in place, where  
12 there are actual penalties?

13                   SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,  
14 Madam President, not to bring up bad memories,  
15 but that was known kindly among some of us as the  
16 Thanksgiving Day massacre, in which a whole host  
17 of bills, every study bill under the sun, was  
18 vetoed at the same time by the Governor, whether  
19 it had to do with healthcare, whether it had to  
20 do with transportation, whether it had to do with  
21 anything under the sun.

22                   So that bill was actually a more  
23 curtailed version of this one. This one would  
24 actually require -- if it were to be signed into  
25 law, would require a study to make the

1 determination as far as where we are as far as  
2 percentages, and then it would create -- and  
3 there would be set, as we've discussed before,  
4 the goals on a yearly basis to go up to 12.5.

5 SENATOR RHOADS: Would the sponsor  
6 yield for one final question?

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you  
8 continue to yield?

9 SENATOR RIVERA: Yes.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
11 Senator yields.

12 SENATOR RHOADS: That massacre was  
13 because there was a budgetary impact to these --  
14 to those studies that were to be conducted. So  
15 perhaps this bill should have been included as  
16 part of the budget, along with the study.

17 But the last point is I notice that  
18 urgent cares are exempted from this particular  
19 legislation, which in many portions of the state  
20 you may not have an abundance of primary care  
21 providers, so primary care is provided by urgent  
22 cares or by hospitals.

23 Why would we remove that? And then  
24 doesn't that impact the overall number? If  
25 people are seeking primary care from their

1 urgent-care provider but we're not counting those  
2 numbers in our statistics to determine whether a  
3 health plan has met that 12.5 percent, isn't that  
4 artificially making it more difficult for health  
5 plans to meet the goals that are set forth in the  
6 legislation?

7 (Pause.)

8 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,  
9 Madam President. Recognizing certainly that  
10 there are limits -- and we've talked about  
11 workforce, healthcare workforce shortages. This  
12 is certainly an issue that I care deeply about  
13 and we have spoken about in the past.

14 This is in recognition, this  
15 exclusion is in recognition, Madam President, of  
16 the fact that urgent cares are for -- are more,  
17 at least in their design, although they're not  
18 totally defined in state law in the State of  
19 New York, it does actually -- is therefore other  
20 types of episodes that are not necessarily having  
21 to do with routine medicine and first point of  
22 contact, which is ultimately what we want to  
23 focus on.

24 But it's certainly something worth  
25 looking at in the future.

1                   SENATOR RHOADS:    Thank you,  
2   Senator Rivera.

3                   Briefly on the bill.

4                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Senator  
5   Rhoads on the bill.

6                   SENATOR RHOADS:    I understand the  
7   motivations and I agree with the motivations.  We  
8   should be increasing primary care usage if we  
9   can.

10                  I just think we're putting the cart  
11   before the horse.  Let's get the data and come up  
12   with a constructive solution on how to do that  
13   before we actually put policy in place.

14                  I'll be voting no, Madam President.

15                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Are there  
16   any other Senators wishing to be heard?

17                  Seeing and hearing none, debate is  
18   closed.  The Secretary will ring the bell.

19                  Read the last section.

20                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 3.  This  
21   act shall take effect immediately.

22                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
23   roll.

24                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

25                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Senator

1 Rivera to explain his vote.

2 SENATOR RIVERA: Thank you,  
3 Madam President.

4 And I thank my colleague for some of  
5 the questions here.

6 Ultimately, there is -- it is  
7 clear -- not only is it common sense, but there's  
8 data that demonstrates that having primary care  
9 more accessible, spending more on that means that  
10 people will avail themselves of it, which means  
11 that they'll be able to identify chronic  
12 conditions earlier, they would lead better lives,  
13 and it would make the system as a whole less  
14 expensive.

15 So ultimately what this bill means  
16 to do -- and by the way, Madam President,  
17 20 other states have enacted similar laws and  
18 regulations to report on an increase in  
19 primary-care spending, anything from  
20 West Virginia to Colorado to Connecticut to  
21 Maine, et cetera, et cetera, et cetera.

22 So it is -- we believe that this is  
23 an important measure that, if it becomes a law,  
24 would actually move us towards the place where we  
25 could have people avail themselves of primary

1 care earlier in their lives, be able to have  
2 better lives for themselves and their family, to  
3 have the system as a whole be cheaper.

4 So I certainly hope that we can get  
5 it passed this year, and I'll be voting in the  
6 affirmative.

7 Thank you, Madam President.

8 PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator Rivera to  
9 be recorded in the affirmative.

10 Announce the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
12 Calendar 968, voting in the negative are  
13 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,  
14 Chan, Gallivan, Griffio, Lanza, Martins, Mattera,  
15 Murray, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco,  
16 Walczyk and Weik.

17 Ayes, 42. Nays, 17.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
19 is passed.

20 Senator Gianaris.

21 SENATOR GIANARIS: Calendar 866 up  
22 next, please.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
24 Secretary will read.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 866, Senate Print 6882, by Senator Harckham, an  
2 act to amend the General Municipal Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator  
4 Martins, why do you rise?

5 SENATOR MARTINS: Madam President,  
6 on the bill.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator  
8 Martins on the bill.

9 SENATOR MARTINS: So this bill  
10 would allow a preemption of local zoning across  
11 New York State for solar panels on carports.  
12 Sounds like a straightforward bill.

13 Obviously there are a lot of  
14 concerns in our chamber historically amongst many  
15 of us about preempting local control, especially  
16 when it comes to zoning. And so the idea of a  
17 carport -- when I think of a carport I think of a  
18 house and I think of, you know, that piece next  
19 to the house, maybe, you know, sort of a  
20 shed-like enclosure where you park your car,  
21 Madam President.

22 And, you know, if that's the case,  
23 if you're looking at it, probably 10 feet by  
24 20 feet or so, that itself would probably take  
25 about 10 to 12 panels and would produce about 5

1 kilowatts of electricity. Something as small as  
2 that, about that, a small shed over a car.

3 But that's not we're talking about,  
4 Madam President. We're talking about preempting  
5 local zoning to allow for 5 megawatts. And so to  
6 talk about 5 megawatts, five megawatts is defined  
7 or at least described as a small-to-medium  
8 utility-scale installation which covers about  
9 20 acres or so.

10 In order for solar panels to produce  
11 about 5 megawatts of electricity, you're talking  
12 about a small-to-medium-scale utility-type  
13 installation. In order to create 5 megawatts of  
14 electricity, you'd have to provide coverage for  
15 literally 20, 25 acres.

16 And so in the context of preempting  
17 local zoning for our villages, our towns and our  
18 cities, the idea of someone just being able to  
19 put that much or that kind of structure up for  
20 20 acres or more, to reach that 5 megahertz --  
21 megawatts, excuse me -- threshold,  
22 Madam President, is a real concern.

23 Now, obviously I would be concerned  
24 if it were just a carport on the side of a house.  
25 I would be. Because local communities should be

1     able to make those decisions for themselves, and  
2     we should be loath to preempt local communities  
3     and their home rule.

4                 But when it's 5 megawatts, what  
5     we're talking about here is on a scale that if it  
6     were to be imposed on our local communities,  
7     every supermarket parking lot, every school  
8     parking lot, can go out and just put these  
9     carports. And frankly, some people may like it.  
10    Some people may not. But that's a local zoning  
11    decision that each local community should be able  
12    to make for themselves without preempting zoning  
13    on that scale.

14                And so although I appreciate the  
15    intent and the effort behind the bill and the  
16    idea to promote solar and renewable energy as an  
17    alternative, I would certainly prefer to see it  
18    more as a collaborative effort allowing our local  
19    communities to opt in and not preempting their  
20    local zoning prerogative.

21                Because obviously depending on where  
22    it is, depending on its proximity to homes,  
23    depending on its proximity to parks and to other  
24    decisions that are typically made by our local  
25    communities because they're there, something on

1       this size and this scale frankly is just too  
2       much.

3                       And so, Madam President, I can't  
4       support this bill. I'll be voting no. Although  
5       I again want to thank Senator Harckham because I  
6       do understand it's coming from a good place.

7                       I just can't get there on this bill,  
8       so I'll be voting no. And I thank you for your  
9       time.

10                      ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Thank you.  
11                      Are there any other Senators wishing  
12       to be heard?

13                      Seeing and hearing none, debate is  
14       closed. The Secretary will ring the bell.

15                      Read the last section.

16                      THE SECRETARY:   Section 2. This  
17       act shall take effect on the first of January.

18                      ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Call the  
19       roll.

20                      (The Secretary called the roll.)

21                      ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Announce  
22       the results.

23                      THE SECRETARY:   In relation to  
24       Calendar 866, voting in the negative are  
25       Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,

1 Chan, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming, Lanza, Martinez,  
2 Martins, Mattera, Murray, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,  
3 Rolison, Ryan, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk and Weber.

4 Ayes, 38. Nays, 21.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
6 is passed.

7 Senator Gianaris.

8 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,  
9 by consent with the Minority, we are removing the  
10 lay-asides on Calendars 1207, 698, and 1058.

11 Can we please take those up on the  
12 noncontroversial calendar.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Pursuant  
14 to agreement, on Calendars 1207, 698 and 1058 the  
15 lay-asides are removed and the bills will retain  
16 their place on the noncontroversial calendar.

17 There is a substitution at the desk.

18 The Secretary will read.

19 THE SECRETARY: Senator Krueger  
20 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,  
21 Assembly Bill Number 9111C and substitute it for  
22 the identical Senate Bill 8512C, Third Reading  
23 Calendar 698.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
25 Secretary will read.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
2 698, Assembly Bill Number 9111C, by  
3 Assemblymember Gallagher, an act to amend the  
4 Public Service Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This  
8 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it  
9 shall have become a law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
14 the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
16 Calendar 698, voting in the negative:  
17 Senator Walczyk.

18 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
22 1058, Senate Print 4887B, by Senator Walczyk, an  
23 act to amend the Tax Law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
25 last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
2 act shall take effect immediately.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
9 Calendar 1058, voting in the negative are  
10 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Harckham,  
11 Helming, Lanza, Martinez, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,  
12 Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton, Skoufis and Webb.

13 Ayes, 47. Nays, 12.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
17 1207, Senate Print 6025, by Senator Brouk, an act  
18 to amend the Social Services Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
22 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it  
23 shall have become a law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
3 the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
5 Calendar 1207, voting in the negative are  
6 Senators Borrello, Lanza, Murray, Ortt, Rhoads  
7 and Walczyk.

8 Ayes, 53. Nays, 6.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
10 is passed.

11 Senator Gianaris.

12 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,  
13 returning to motions for a second, on behalf of  
14 Senator Fahy, on page 61 I offer the following  
15 amendments to Calendar Number 1294, Senate Print  
16 4500A, and ask that said bill retain its place on  
17 Third Reading Calendar.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
19 amendments are received, and the bill will retain  
20 its place on the Third Reading Calendar.

21 Senator Gianaris.

22 SENATOR GIANARIS: The sponsors of  
23 the resolutions we took up earlier today would  
24 like to open them for cosponsorship.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The

1 resolutions we took up today are open for  
2 cosponsorship. Should you choose not to be a  
3 cosponsor, please notify the desk.

4 Senator Gianaris.

5 SENATOR GIANARIS: Is there any  
6 further business at the desk?

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: There is  
8 no further business at the desk.

9 SENATOR GIANARIS: I move to  
10 adjourn until tomorrow, Friday, May 29th, at  
11 11:00 a.m.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: On motion,  
13 the Senate stands adjourned until Friday,  
14 May 29th, at 11:00 a.m.

15 (Whereupon, at 5:35 p.m., the Senate  
16 adjourned.)

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25