

1 NEW YORK STATE SENATE

2
3
4 THE STENOGRAPHIC RECORD

5
6
7
8
9 ALBANY, NEW YORK

10 May 14, 2026

11 11:24 a.m.

12
13
14 REGULAR SESSION

15
16
17
18 SENATOR ROXANNE J. PERSAUD, Acting President

19 ALEJANDRA N. PAULINO, ESQ., Secretary

P R O C E E D I N G S

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
Senate will come to order.

I ask everyone to please rise and
recite the Pledge of Allegiance.

(Whereupon, the assemblage recited
the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: In the
absence of clergy, let us please bow our heads in
a moment of silent reflection or prayer.

(Whereupon, the assemblage respected
a moment of silence.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Reading
of the Journal.

THE SECRETARY: In Senate,
Wednesday, May 13, 2026, the Senate met pursuant
to adjournment. The Journal of Tuesday, May 12,
2026, was read and approved. On motion, the
Senate adjourned.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Without
objection, the Journal stands approved as read.

Presentation of petitions.

Messages from the Assembly.

The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Senator Sepúlveda

1 moves to discharge, from the Committee on
2 Judiciary, Assembly Bill Number 9144A, and
3 substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
4 Number 9286, Third Reading Calendar 571.

5 Senator Kavanagh moves to discharge,
6 from the Committee on Local Government,
7 Assembly Bill Number 9570C and substitute it for
8 the identical Senate Bill Number 8527B,
9 Third Reading Calendar 763.

10 Senator Comrie moves to discharge,
11 from the Committee on Transportation,
12 Assembly Bill Number 5134 and substitute it for
13 the identical Senate Bill 5164, Third Reading
14 Calendar 776.

15 Senator Sanders moves to discharge,
16 from the Committee on Banks, Assembly Bill
17 Number 3304B and substitute it for the identical
18 Senate Bill 9656, Third Reading Calendar 857.

19 Senator Scarcella-Spanton moves to
20 discharge, from the Committee on Veterans,
21 Homeland Security and Military Affairs,
22 Assembly Bill Number 10418 and substitute it for
23 the identical Senate Bill 9851, Third Reading
24 Calendar 862.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: So

1 ordered.

2 Messages from the Governor.

3 Reports of standing committees.

4 Reports of select committees.

5 Communications and reports from
6 state officers.

7 Motions and resolutions.

8 Senator Gianaris.

9 SENATOR GIANARIS: Good morning,
10 Madam President.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Good
12 morning.

13 SENATOR GIANARIS: On behalf of
14 Senator Hinchey, I wish to call up Senate Print
15 Number 1788, recalled from the Assembly, which is
16 now at the desk.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
18 Secretary will read.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 223, Senate Print 1788, by Senator Hinchey, an
21 act to amend the Real Property Tax Law.

22 SENATOR GIANARIS: Move to
23 reconsider the vote by which the bill was passed.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
25 Secretary will call the roll on reconsideration.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 56.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
4 is restored to its place on the Third Reading
5 Calendar.

6 SENATOR GIANARIS: I offer the
7 following amendments.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
9 amendments are received.

10 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,
11 there will be an immediate meeting of the
12 Rules Committee in Room 332.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: There
14 will be an immediate meeting of the
15 Rules Committee in Room 332.

16 SENATOR GIANARIS: The Senate
17 stands at ease.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
19 Senate will stand at ease.

20 (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease
21 at 11:26 a.m.)

22 (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at
23 11:31 a.m.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
25 Senate will return to order.

1 Senator Gianaris.

2 SENATOR GIANARIS: There's a report
3 of the Rules Committee at the desk.

4 Please take that up.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
6 Secretary will read.

7 THE SECRETARY: Senator
8 Stewart-Cousins, from the Committee on Rules,
9 reports the following bill:

10 Senate Print 10324, by
11 Senator Serrano, an act making appropriations for
12 the support of government.

13 The bill reports direct to third
14 reading.

15 SENATOR GIANARIS: Move to accept
16 the report of the Rules Committee.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: All
18 those in favor of accepting the report of the
19 Rules Committee please signify by saying aye.

20 (Response of "Aye.")

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Opposed,
22 nay.

23 (Response of "Nay.")

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
25 report of the Rules Committee is accepted.

1 Senator Gianaris.

2 SENATOR GIANARIS: Please take up
3 the supplemental calendar.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
5 Secretary will read.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 1121, Senate Print 10324, by Senator Serrano, an
8 act making appropriations for the support of
9 government.

10 SENATOR GIANARIS: Is there a
11 message of necessity and appropriation at the
12 desk?

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: There is
14 a message of necessity and appropriation at the
15 desk.

16 SENATOR GIANARIS: I move to accept
17 the message.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: All
19 those in favor of accepting the message please
20 signify by saying aye.

21 (Response of "Aye.")

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Opposed,
23 nay.

24 (Response of "Nay.")

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The

1 message is accepted, and the bill is before the
2 house.

3 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
5 is laid aside.

6 Senator Gianaris.

7 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,
8 please take up the reading of the supplemental
9 controversial calendar.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
11 Secretary will ring the bell.

12 The Secretary will read.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 1121, Senate Print 10324, by Senator Serrano, an
15 act making appropriations for the support of
16 government.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
18 O'Mara, why do you rise?

19 SENATOR O'MARA: Thank you,
20 Mr. President.

21 Would Senator Serrano, the sponsor
22 of this extender, answer some questions?

23 SENATOR SERRANO: Yes.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
25 Senator yield?

1 The Senator yields.

2 SENATOR O'MARA: Senator, here we
3 are, over a month and a half late on this budget.
4 Can you summarize for us where we stand in
5 getting this budget to a close and when you
6 expect that to happen?

7 SENATOR SERRANO: Through you,
8 Madam President.

9 Senator O'Mara, we've gone through a
10 few of these extenders. I can imagine it's a
11 little bit frustrating. But I do feel probably
12 more optimistic than ever that an end is in
13 sight.

14 We will certainly conclude, I
15 believe, shortly, but we're not quite there yet.
16 And the bill before us allows state government to
17 continue to move forward and execute all of the
18 different things that it needs to do until we get
19 to that moment.

20 But right now I don't have a
21 concrete update as to where we are with the final
22 budget.

23 SENATOR O'MARA: Thank you.

24 Madam President, if the Senator will
25 continue to yield.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
2 Senator yield?

3 SENATOR SERRANO: Yes.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
5 Senator yields.

6 SENATOR O'MARA: Senator, do you
7 expect us to have final budget bills next week or
8 after Memorial Day?

9 SENATOR SERRANO: Through you,
10 Madam President. It's very difficult for me to
11 speculate on that. I would hope that next week
12 we could start working on the final enacted
13 budget, but it's difficult for me to say.

14 SENATOR O'MARA: Thank you.

15 Madam President, if the Senator will
16 continue to yield.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
18 Senator yield?

19 SENATOR SERRANO: Yes.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
21 Senator yields.

22 SENATOR O'MARA: Senator, this
23 extender takes us till Monday of next week, three
24 days away.

25 In my experience, without having any

1 budget bills finalized at this point, there's
2 really no possible way to have a final and
3 completed group of budget bills by next Monday.
4 So why is this extender only going till Monday
5 and not going later?

6 SENATOR SERRANO: Through you,
7 Madam President. We don't control the length of
8 time the extenders cover, although it has been
9 sort of the pattern throughout these extenders
10 that they do carry us from the last day of
11 session in a particular week to the following
12 week, the beginning of the following week. So
13 this is just, I think, a continuation of that
14 pattern.

15 But beyond that, I cannot say -- I
16 can't really explain sort of the spacing of them.

17 SENATOR O'MARA: Thank you.

18 Madam President, if the Senator will
19 continue to yield.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
21 Senator yield?

22 SENATOR SERRANO: Yes.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
24 Senator yields.

25 SENATOR O'MARA: Senator, do we

1 have a schedule for the joint budget committees?

2 SENATOR SERRANO: Through you,
3 Madam President. No, we do not.

4 SENATOR O'MARA: Through you,
5 Madam President, if the Senator will continue to
6 yield.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
8 Senator yield?

9 SENATOR SERRANO: Yes.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
11 Senator yields.

12 SENATOR O'MARA: Do you expect that
13 the budget committees are going to meet again?

14 SENATOR SERRANO: Through you,
15 Madam President. I don't have any information on
16 that at this moment.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Through
18 you, Madam President, if the Senator will
19 continue to yield.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
21 Senator yield?

22 SENATOR SERRANO: Yes.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
24 Senator yields.

25 SENATOR O'MARA: There has been,

1 you know, several I guess statements, for lack of
2 a better word, by the Governor that there's a
3 budget deal. That was over a week ago. The
4 Governor said there was a budget deal. The
5 Governor had a press conference, a full
6 PowerPoint presentation on this budget deal. And
7 yet still we have no bills in print.

8 So, you know, you said it's
9 frustrating to have this, but it's concerning
10 also. There seems to be no sense of urgency in
11 getting this done, and very few details about
12 what these agreements may or may not be on the
13 major issues.

14 Can you tell us where we stand in
15 regards to the agreement on changes to Tier 6?

16 SENATOR SERRANO: Through you,
17 Madam President, I don't -- I don't have any
18 details on those policy issues.

19 And again, the bill before us does
20 not encompass any of those. I believe those, if
21 they do exist, will ultimately be part of a final
22 budget.

23 But to your previous statement,
24 Senator O'Mara, I do sense there is an urgency.
25 I think there's been an urgency from the very

1 beginning to get a good budget.

2 But this one has been particularly
3 difficult, and because of the many different
4 factors involved. But certainly it is an
5 important budget, and it's important for our
6 constituents to have a very good budget that
7 speaks to the needs of New Yorkers across the
8 state.

9 And I feel confident that we will
10 get to that point and it will be a good budget.
11 But right now it is still out there, so we still
12 have some work to do.

13 SENATOR O'MARA: Through you,
14 Madam President, if the Senator will continue to
15 yield.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
17 Senator yield?

18 SENATOR SERRANO: Yes.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
20 Senator yields.

21 SENATOR O'MARA: I certainly agree
22 that it's better to have a good budget than an
23 on-time budget, but I don't think it's good
24 government to have a two-months-late budget
25 either, with the seeming lack of activity going

1 on here.

2 And we want a good budget for
3 New Yorkers, and we want New Yorkers to
4 understand what that budget is. And there's been
5 no information forthcoming other than some
6 overarching bullet points that tell us we have
7 deal on these policy agreements.

8 Now, it's come out that the Tier 6
9 agreement is going to cost about \$500 million.
10 Who is -- whose cost is that \$500 million? Is
11 that state government cost? Does that include
12 local governments' share in that? And is this a
13 one-time \$500 million or is this going to be
14 \$500 million every year going forward due to the
15 changes being proposed in Tier 6?

16 SENATOR SERRANO: Through you,
17 Madam President. Senator O'Mara, it's difficult
18 for me to give you any answers on that because I
19 don't have the details in front of me.

20 To your statement as to this budget
21 process and conveying that information, you know,
22 from the Executive Budget through our budget
23 one-house, these have been opportunities for us
24 to convey to our constituents about where our
25 budget priorities lie and solicit feedback from

1 them on different items -- which my office, and
2 I'm sure all of your offices have gotten.

3 So while it certainly has not been a
4 perfect process, it has been widely reported,
5 many of the details of the budget. And as we
6 continue to close down these different items, I
7 think we'll have more information to convey back
8 to our constituents.

9 SENATOR O'MARA: Through you,
10 Madam President, if the Senator will continue to
11 yield.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
13 Senator yield?

14 SENATOR SERRANO: Yes.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
16 Senator yields.

17 SENATOR O'MARA: Senator, is there
18 any other Senator present here today that
19 has information and details on this issue?

20 SENATOR SERRANO: Through you,
21 Madam President, I cannot say for sure.

22 But the bill before us is a bill
23 that I sponsor, so I'll be more than happy to
24 give you as much information as I can.

25 SENATOR O'MARA: Through you,

1 Madam President, if the Senator will continue to
2 yield.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
4 Senator yield?

5 SENATOR SERRANO: Yes.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
7 Senator yields.

8 SENATOR O'MARA: You know, having
9 no information as things progress (air quotes)
10 doesn't really make us feel that things are
11 progressing on this.

12 And seemingly every time the
13 Governor makes an announcement on where we stand,
14 there's more things being added, such as an
15 additional \$4 billion to bail out New York City,
16 in one of her most recent comments on that.

17 Can you tell us, this additional
18 \$4 billion, where's it coming from and what's it
19 going to, other than just New York City? Is
20 there parameters on what it's being used for?

21 SENATOR SERRANO: Through you,
22 Madam President. Senator O'Mara, it's difficult
23 for me to give you that answer without final
24 budget language in front of me.

25 But considering the size of the

1 State of New York and all of the different
2 agencies and programs and schools and really
3 worthy items that need to be addressed in this
4 budget, I think it's not surprising that it has
5 taken this long, considering the magnitude of our
6 budget.

7 However, I do feel good that we are
8 in the final stretch and that we are getting
9 closer to a resolution on this budget. And I
10 hope, in the coming days, to have budget language
11 that we can begin voting on.

12 SENATOR O'MARA: Through you,
13 Madam President, if the Senator will continue to
14 yield.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
16 Senator yield?

17 SENATOR SERRANO: Yes.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
19 Senator yields.

20 SENATOR O'MARA: We have these
21 general proposals of an additional \$5.5 billion
22 to bail out New York City.

23 We all represent various
24 constituencies, various local governments,
25 various school districts that all have their own

1 fiscal concerns. And while the dollar amounts
2 may not be as large, the percentages of what
3 these local governments are facing are equally as
4 large as what the City of New York is looking at.

5 So what, in addition to this
6 \$5.5 billion that the Governor's earmarking for
7 New York City, how much more is being discussed
8 to give to our local governments to help them
9 stave off property tax increases?

10 SENATOR SERRANO: Through you,
11 Madam President, in our Senate budget one-house
12 we tried our best to support all the localities
13 throughout the State of New York, with an
14 understanding that they have tremendous need and
15 they're also great economic generators for the
16 entire economy for the state.

17 So that can be, I think, a very
18 clear blueprint of where we stand and where
19 negotiations are. But certainly we feel very
20 strongly about the City of New York, as we do of
21 every town and village throughout the State of
22 New York, ensuring that they can have the
23 resources they need to thrive and to be part of
24 the great State of New York and be the economic
25 generators that they all are.

1 SENATOR O'MARA: Thank you.

2 Madam President, if the Senator will
3 continue to yield.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
5 Senator yield?

6 SENATOR SERRANO: Yes.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
8 Senator yields.

9 SENATOR O'MARA: Senator, I can
10 tell you that my local governments and school
11 districts aren't feeling it -- school districts
12 in particular, with budget votes next Tuesday.
13 And we're extending this budget until Monday.
14 There will be no budget on Monday.

15 You know, when it was initially --
16 came out of the agreements with an additional
17 \$1.5 billion going to New York City, and then
18 \$100 million for basically the rest of the state,
19 other than some amounts in particular for the big
20 cities along the Thruway.

21 But, you know, \$100 million to
22 \$1.5 billion is 1/15th. Now, we're at
23 5.5 billion. And I haven't done the math in my
24 head, but it's four or five times more of that
25 discrepancy between how much New York City's

1 getting and how much the rest of the state is
2 getting.

3 How is that balanced? And how can
4 you justify that?

5 SENATOR SERRANO: Through you,
6 Madam President. There is a very large
7 concentration of people in the City of New York,
8 and there certainly is a lot of need and need for
9 resources there.

10 But I can tell you, when it comes to
11 school districts -- you did mention that,
12 Senator O'Mara -- that the Executive Budget had a
13 good number in there. We in our Senate budget
14 one-house, we built up from there as well.

15 So while we don't have a final
16 enacted budget in front of us to vote on and to
17 point to as far as what school districts can
18 expect, I think it's safe to assume, based on
19 what the Executive Budget had and what our
20 one-house had, that it would be a good number.

21 SENATOR O'MARA: Through you,
22 Madam President, if the Senator will continue to
23 yield.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
25 Senator yield?

1 SENATOR SERRANO: Yes.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
3 Senator yields.

4 SENATOR O'MARA: Well, I can't
5 disagree with you strongly enough on that,
6 Senator. That, you know, the Governor's budget
7 came out with a 1 percent increase for some
8 65 percent of the school districts in this state.

9 And we don't have a firm number as
10 to where we are now. At best, from what I've
11 heard, those lower school districts, all
12 non-urban school districts, all rural, poor
13 school districts, getting 1 percent, maybe
14 2 percent in this budget -- but yet they're
15 putting budgets to their voters next Tuesday.

16 What is the total amount that's
17 agreed to at this point going to school aid?

18 SENATOR SERRANO: Through you,
19 Madam President. Thank you for that question,
20 Senator O'Mara.

21 In our Senate budget one-house we
22 actually had a 3 percent increase, so we were
23 building upon what the Governor had put forth.

24 But again, not to get too deep into
25 the speculation, because I will remind everyone

1 that the bill before us does not contain any of
2 this information. This is a budget extender.

3 But please know that all of us in
4 our conference care deeply about every town,
5 village, locality and school district throughout
6 the State of New York. And we want to ensure
7 that they have the resources that they need to
8 educate the kids, the children, the students in
9 their localities.

10 SENATOR O'MARA: Thank you,
11 Senator.

12 Madam President, if the Senator will
13 continue to yield.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
15 Senator yield?

16 SENATOR SERRANO: Yes.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
18 Senator yields.

19 SENATOR O'MARA: There's been a lot
20 of discussion around giving New York City the
21 opportunity to impose a pied-à-terre tax on
22 high-end second homes in New York City. And
23 there's been some discussion of spreading that to
24 upstate.

25 Can you tell us, is that going to be

1 spread across upstate and the rest of the state,
2 Long Island included? And what are the
3 parameters going to be? What's the criteria to
4 make a pied-à-terre qualify to have to pay this
5 tax, and what is that tax rate going to be?

6 SENATOR SERRANO: Through you,
7 Madam President. Senator O'Mara, I cannot
8 speculate on that. It's certainly not in the
9 bill before us.

10 SENATOR O'MARA: Through you,
11 Madam President. Thank you, Senator.

12 On the bill.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
14 O'Mara on the bill.

15 SENATOR O'MARA: That's the
16 problem. There's nothing in this bill before us
17 today on where things stand in the budget.

18 Things should be being resolved and
19 checked off, and we should be letting New Yorkers
20 know where we stand on these issues, where this
21 Legislature is, where the Governor is, what
22 agreements have been made so, you know, maybe, by
23 chance, we could get some actual feedback from
24 the citizens of New York across the state, not
25 just the interests of New York City, of where

1 this budget is headed, what they can expect.

2 I know there have been certain
3 agreements that are final. What they are and
4 what the details of those are, we don't know.

5 But there's no way that there aren't
6 some things that are finalized that we could be
7 informing New Yorkers of so they could be talking
8 to us and telling us what they think about that,
9 every one of us.

10 And we should be very concerned
11 about that, because we're their representatives.
12 They elect us to come here and represent them,
13 and look out for their interests and look out for
14 the interests of the state as a whole.

15 But keeping everybody in the dark,
16 now over a month and a half late on this budget,
17 as I've said many times on these extenders, it's
18 not good government. Really, it's embarrassing
19 that we operate this way. And we need to do
20 better for the citizens of this state.

21 Thank you, Madam President.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
23 you, Senator.

24 Are there any other Senators wishing
25 to be heard?

1 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
2 closed.

3 Senator Gianaris.

4 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,
5 we've agreed to restore this bill to the
6 noncontroversial calendar.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
8 has been restored to the noncontroversial
9 calendar.

10 There's a substitution at the desk.

11 The Secretary will read.

12 THE SECRETARY: Senator Serrano
13 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
14 Assembly Bill Number 11365 and substitute it for
15 the identical Senate Bill 10324, Third Reading
16 Calendar 1121.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
21 Rhoads to explain his vote.

22 SENATOR RHOADS: Just to clarify,
23 Madam President. Is this vote on the
24 substitution, or is this vote on the
25 bill-in-chief?

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: There's
2 a substitution at the desk. It is the bill,
3 but --

4 SENATOR RHOADS: So it is the bill.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Yes.

6 SENATOR RHOADS: Okay. Madam
7 President, I rise to explain my vote.

8 Budgets are supposed to be about
9 priorities. Senator Serrano tried to explain
10 where the Majority's budget priorities are. He
11 uses the term "ours." These are not the
12 priorities of the Republican Conference. They
13 are certainly not my priorities in this budget.

14 But the problem is we are now
15 passing our 12th budget extender. The budget is
16 now 45 days -- is almost 45 days late. We are
17 spending 10 percent of last year's State Budget
18 this year by extender.

19 We have the Governor, who came out
20 last week and not only announced the fact that we
21 had a budget deal, but had an entire PowerPoint
22 presentation with details about the budget bill.

23 We had the Majority in the Assembly
24 and the Senate come out and say, We have no idea
25 what they're talking about, but we don't think

1 we'll have another extender that's going to
2 influence payroll.

3 As of today, we are guaranteed to
4 have to pass another extender that is going to
5 deal with payroll.

6 Bipartisan budget subcommittees,
7 conference subcommittees, have not met in
8 two months, which is the process that we're
9 supposed to be going through by this budget.

10 Apart from the fact that we don't
11 know whether people are lying, don't know what's
12 happening, we can't get any information --
13 there's no transparency in this process.

14 The people of the State of New York
15 and their representatives, at least on this side
16 of the aisle, haven't been told anything about
17 what is happening in this process other than what
18 we're hearing on the floor, which is
19 essentially -- with all due respect, is
20 essentially answers without answers.

21 What this process has been turned
22 into -- and I thank you, Madam President, there
23 is no urgency. We, after we consider today's
24 calendar, will be going home. Not staying here
25 to work over the weekend, but going home.

1 This budget process has been turned
2 into an abomination of the democratic process. I
3 don't know --

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator,
5 how do you vote?

6 SENATOR RHOADS: I do not want to
7 support a shutdown. However, I don't know
8 another way to register my opposition to what
9 that process has been turned into.

10 I'm voting in the negative.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
12 Rhoads in the negative.

13 Announce the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
15 Calendar 1121, voting in the negative are
16 Senators Rhoads and Weik.

17 Ayes, 56. Nays, 2.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
19 is passed.

20 Senator Gianaris, that completes the
21 reading of the controversial calendar.

22 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,
23 let's get back to motions and resolutions and
24 take up previously adopted Resolution 1896, by
25 Senator Bailey, read that resolution's title and

1 call on Senator Bailey.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
3 Secretary will read.

4 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1896, by
5 Senator Bailey, mourning the death of the
6 Honorable Eliot Engel, Assemblyman, Congressman,
7 distinguished citizen, and devoted member of his
8 community.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
10 Bailey on the resolution.

11 SENATOR BAILEY: Thank you,
12 Madam President.

13 I'm rising with a heavy heart,
14 almost a month post the untimely death of the
15 great Eliot Engel. And I do so at this time, at
16 the onset of my remarks I just want to let my
17 colleagues here know, let the public know that
18 there will be a public memorial this coming
19 Sunday for Congressman Engel at Lehman College,
20 his alma mater, from 6:00 to 8:00 p.m., which is
21 why the timing of this was important, so that we
22 can remind people about what Congressmember Engel
23 was able to accomplish in his life.

24 But my first interaction with
25 Congressman Engel wasn't by virtue of my working

1 in government or being around government, it was
2 when I went to school with his daughter Julia.
3 People would say that her dad is a Congressman,
4 and I was like, What's that?

5 Well, we learned what it was. And I
6 went to elementary school and junior high school
7 with Julia. And some of the things that
8 Congressman Engel did were quite inspirational.

9 He grew up in Eastchester Gardens
10 public housing. Went from public housing to
11 teaching public school. Then he wanted to be a
12 public servant, and he ran for the Assembly. He
13 served in the Assembly for about 11 years, and
14 then ran for Congress, and did a lot more for
15 America and our district than just standing on
16 the edge of the aisle.

17 A lot of people knew Eliot Engel
18 because he stood on the edge of the aisle to
19 shake most president's hands, Madam President.
20 But Eliot Engel did a lot more.

21 He did great things in Co-Op City,
22 where he represented and where he once lived
23 also. He did great things -- he was a sponsor or
24 cosponsor of single-payer healthcare back in
25 2003. Before it became a national talking point,

1 Congressman Eliot Engel was talking about how we
2 needed to do better amongst our society.

3 But I wanted to focus on the man
4 Eliot Engel, Madam President. He was someone who
5 really cared. He actually really cared about his
6 community. And he would show up in the most
7 random places by himself, without his staff, even
8 though his staff wouldn't want him to go to these
9 places by himself.

10 Long before his reelection,
11 Eliot Engel would be at a block party or a street
12 renaming with three other people. And he would
13 sit there and talk to the three other people that
14 were there because he loved his community.

15 I specifically remember the street
16 renaming for J.W. Smith, Madam President. It was
17 95 degrees that day. And everybody that was
18 supposed to come, most of them didn't come.
19 Eliot showed up. Now, this wasn't because he was
20 running, because he didn't have a primary that
21 year. This wasn't because he needed electoral
22 credit. Because he cared about his community,
23 and he showed up. And that's a shining moment of
24 how I remember Eliot.

25 His wife, Pat, amazing woman. I

1 remember her from when I was a kid, seeing the
2 family at PTA conferences. They were a very
3 civically involved family with their other
4 children, Philip and Jonathan -- and Julia, as I
5 mentioned earlier.

6 And I just wanted us to remember
7 that he had a life well-lived outside of the
8 space of Washington.

9 And recently -- I just wanted to
10 make sure this is record. Congressman Latimer
11 reached out the other day and noticed that the
12 House Foreign Affairs Committee, one of the few
13 bipartisan things that's happening in Washington,
14 they voted 39-7 so that building of the
15 chancellory in Kosovo would be named after Eliot.

16 Eliot did a lot of great thing for
17 the residents of Kosovo and Albania. He's very
18 highly regarded over there.

19 But I think that this should show
20 who he was, Madam President. That even in times
21 of deep political discord and division that when
22 we're looking to do something for Eliot Engel, we
23 can do so in a bipartisan manner.

24 I just want to make sure I send my
25 love again to Pat and the family and to the

1 Team Engel folks like Bill Weitz and
2 John Calvelli and so many other from the
3 Team Engel tree. We know how much you loved him,
4 and we loved him as well.

5 I thank you for the opportunity to
6 be able to present this resolution. May
7 Congressmember Eliot Engel's memory be an eternal
8 blessing.

9 I vote aye, Madam President.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
11 you, Senator.

12 Leader Stewart-Cousins on the
13 resolution.

14 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: Thank you
15 so much, Madam President.

16 And I rise also to pay tribute to
17 someone who was a friend, who was demonstrably,
18 as Senator Bailey said, committed to community
19 and to public service. And thank you again for
20 sponsoring this resolution and having this moment
21 to talk about someone who was, for those of us
22 who knew him, really a friend.

23 You know, yeah, he was a politician.
24 And yes, he was a public servant. But he was
25 also a guy that you could always talk to and ask

1 his opinion. He would never be the person who
2 would say, "By the way, what I think you should
3 do" -- unless you asked. But if you asked, he
4 would tell you. In a way that you understood it,
5 he would explain his reasoning and give you an
6 opportunity to really assess what your options
7 were.

8 And in times where we know, as
9 politicians, it can be difficult to determine
10 whose advice you can really take, Eliot Engel was
11 not one of those people. You knew that what he
12 was saying was heartfelt and that he was doing it
13 to help you.

14 So I really appreciated this about
15 him. And the fact that when I got into politics,
16 actually it was '92, and Eliot was my
17 Congressperson. I'd moved to Yonkers from the
18 Bronx. He and I had very similar paths. I grew
19 up in public housing, he grew up in public
20 housing. Went to public schools, taught. And
21 actually he and I went to the same high school.

22 So we had a lot in common. But the
23 first Congressperson that I was aware of when we
24 moved to Westchester was Eliot Engel. And so in
25 that regard, he was a model for so many who were

1 growing up in politics. And again, to have
2 someone who had the title of Congressman but who
3 was accessible, who was willing to be in your
4 community no matter how big or how small, left an
5 indelible impression on me and so many others
6 about what public service looks like and what it
7 means to actually be someone who is not only
8 active in D.C. or on the floor of Congress, but
9 also in our very communities.

10 So I too want to give my condolences
11 to the Engel family, to Pat, to Julia, to Philip
12 and Jonathan, and his grandchildren. And, you
13 know, to let them know that his service, whether
14 it was on an international stage in his role
15 as -- he always used to say foreign relations,
16 foreign affairs. We would always laugh about how
17 they are two different things in the Senate and
18 in the Congress.

19 But whether it's an international
20 role, a national role, and most importantly a
21 very, very local role, his legacy will be
22 treasured, remembered, emulated.

23 And again, we wish that he rest in
24 peace, because he has contributed over 44 years
25 to taking care of the rest of us.

1 So thank you.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
3 you, Madam Leader.

4 Senator Mayer on the resolution.

5 SENATOR MAYER: Thank you,
6 Madam President.

7 And thank you, Senator Bailey and
8 Leader Stewart-Cousins, for talking about our
9 friend Eliot Engel.

10 He really was, for those of us who
11 were in his world, a friend as well, as the
12 leader said, a congressman and a leader in the
13 Washington world.

14 I just want to for a minute focus on
15 his role as chair of the Foreign Affairs
16 Committee. Many members of Congress who have
17 such distinguished roles don't translate it for
18 the people they represent, but he did.

19 And in Yonkers, where there's so
20 many people who are either first or second
21 generation coming from another country here, in
22 those years, whether it was from Ukraine,
23 Albania, Kosovo, he was present in our community
24 standing up with tremendous courage on behalf of
25 their families at home.

1 And I remember being at the
2 Ukrainian festival many times, with the leader
3 and others in Yonkers, with thousands of people
4 of Ukrainian heritage who cared and were
5 concerned about their families back home,
6 welcoming him as if he was a fellow
7 Ukrainian-American. And the same when we were in
8 the Albanian-American community.

9 Each of these immigrant communities,
10 he was able to translate his own history as a
11 child of immigrants into a real sympathy and
12 empathy with the next generation of Americans.

13 We miss having that kind of
14 leadership now, someone who understands the next
15 generation of our friends and neighbors. Eliot
16 Engel was exceptional in translating that into a
17 meaningful connection to the people he
18 represented at home, as well as on the
19 international stage.

20 We were very, very fortunate to have
21 his leadership. Toward the end of his term, I
22 was in a church in Tuckahoe with him in a very
23 tough time. He was courageous, thoughtful,
24 empathetic, and exhibited leadership.

25 We really treasure his memory. May

1 his memory be a blessing.

2 And I proudly vote aye.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
4 you, Senator.

5 Senator Stavisky on the resolution.

6 SENATOR STAVISKY: Thank you,
7 Madam President.

8 And as I'm listening to
9 Senator Bailey -- and thank you for introducing
10 this resolution -- and the leader and
11 Senator Mayer, I'm struck by the warmth that we
12 all felt for Eliot Engel.

13 We do a lot of resolutions here, and
14 often we don't really know the people
15 individually. But this is different. As many of
16 you know, many years ago my husband was in the
17 Assembly and chaired the Assembly Education
18 Committee. And I think it was in the '70s when
19 he had a person active in Bronx politics by the
20 name of Patty Ennis on his staff, and she worked
21 in the district office for quite a number of
22 years.

23 And she had the same qualities as
24 Eliot, and in fact they were dating for a long
25 time. She was dating this young teacher active

1 in Bronx politics.

2 And one day there was a vacancy in
3 the Bronx for the Assembly, and she -- her
4 partner, so to speak, was running for the seat.
5 He was a teacher at the time. So she asked
6 Leonard and me, and ultimately my son, to come to
7 the Bronx and ring doorbells. They gave us
8 sheets, and we rang doorbells. And I remember
9 going home around 2:30 or so to pick up my son,
10 who was in elementary school, and the three of us
11 rang doorbells in Co-Op City for Eliot.

12 He was elected to the Assembly,
13 obviously, and then to Congress.

14 And I do have a connection to his
15 congressional career, because I spent some time
16 in Rockland County. And of course it was great
17 watching him as a member of Congress. And I
18 remember the post office dedication for somebody
19 we knew in common. And I saw the warmth that the
20 people felt for him.

21 This was not somebody who was aloof
22 and arrogant. This was a teacher who never
23 forgot where he came from.

24 So to Pat and to his family, we will
25 all miss him.

1 Thank you, Madam President.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
3 you, Senator.

4 The resolution was adopted on
5 April 21st.

6 Senator Gianaris.

7 SENATOR GIANARIS: Next let's move
8 on to previously adopted Resolution 1843, by
9 Senator Ashby, read that resolution's title and
10 call on Senator Ashby, please.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
12 Secretary will read.

13 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1843, by
14 Senator Ashby, congratulating the
15 Christian Brothers Academy Varsity
16 Basketball Team upon the occasion of capturing
17 the 2026 New York State Public High School
18 Athletic Association Class AAA Boys Basketball
19 Championship.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
21 Ashby on the resolution.

22 SENATOR ASHBY: Thank you,
23 Madam President, for allowing me to introduce
24 today the Christian Brothers Academy Varsity
25 Basketball Team for capturing the New York State

1 2026 Class AAA Boys Basketball Championship.

2 Undeclared season, first AAA boys
3 basketball season to go undeclared and win the
4 New York State Championship.

5 We're joined by players
6 Jacob Bowden, Brandt Cadet, Amare Coffil,
7 Sebastien Dorcelus, Jack Hulett, Rae'vel Johnson,
8 Kieon Pollydore, Theodore Tidgewell, Jason Vogel,
9 Austin Osinski and Jayden Osinski.

10 And for some of us, these names may
11 sound a little familiar. Osinski, legendary
12 coach from Schalmont. Corey Osinski,
13 Kevin Osinski, both standout players in the
14 Capital Region, both of whom I fouled
15 tremendously during my time on the court. It was
16 a privilege to play with them.

17 We are also joined by Head Coach
18 Galal Cancer, Assistant Coaches Malcolm Austin
19 and William Banagan, Athletic Director Blaine
20 Drescher, Assistant Athletic Director Tina
21 Slingerland, Team Manager Trustin Tolliver, and
22 staff members Andrew Goodemote and
23 William Toomey.

24 Madam President, please congratulate
25 them, offer them all the cordialities of this

1 august body.

2 And just a tremendous accomplishment
3 for you guys. I know that we will be welcoming
4 you back here next year.

5 Thank you, Madam President.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
7 you.

8 To the undefeated Class AAA
9 Christian Brothers Academy Varsity Basketball
10 Team, congratulations on everything that you've
11 accomplished. Continue doing well. Continue
12 being excellent not only in academics but in
13 sports.

14 We welcome you on behalf of the
15 Senate. We extend to you the privileges and
16 courtesies of this house.

17 Please rise and be recognized.

18 (Standing ovation.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
20 resolution was adopted on April 21st.

21 Senator Gianaris.

22 SENATOR GIANARIS: Now let's take
23 up previously adopted Resolution 2083, by
24 Senator Baskin, read that resolution's title, and
25 call on Senator Baskin.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
2 Secretary will read.

3 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 2083, by
4 Senator Baskin, commemorating the four-year
5 anniversary of the shooting at Tops Friendly
6 Markets in Buffalo, New York, on May 14, 2026,
7 and honoring the victims, survivors, families and
8 community at large in the wake of this
9 devastating tragedy.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
11 Baskin on the resolution.

12 SENATOR BASKIN: Thank you,
13 Madam President.

14 Madam President, last year I stood
15 in this very chamber and I spoke about the
16 horrific events of May 14, 2022, at Tops Grocery
17 Store on Jefferson Avenue in my district in
18 Buffalo, New York.

19 There was a part of me last year
20 that was fixated on not crying, because I believe
21 that moments of extreme emotion should be
22 reserved for privacy. I did not want to cry last
23 year. I did not want to be embarrassed.

24 Last year, in the days leading up to
25 the anniversary of the senseless massacre that

1 took 10 of my community members, I wrote my
2 remarks and I prepared myself not to cry. I did
3 not want to talk about the tragedy of 5/14 while
4 consumed by tears.

5 But anyone who experienced May 14th
6 as a frontline witness, like the residents of the
7 63th District did, anyone who sat with and held
8 members of their community as they grieved their
9 inconceivable loss, that person should feel pain.
10 That person should feel grief and anger, and that
11 person should cry.

12 When we remember that on a normal
13 sunny Saturday afternoon a racist white
14 nationalist came into my community and sought to
15 terrorize and kill as many Black people as
16 possible, that he drove two hours to deliberately
17 target the only grocery store in a historic Black
18 neighborhood -- yes, we should cry.

19 Madam President, I know that there
20 are Black people across this nation who are born
21 into hardship every day, a hardship that this
22 country specifically designed for them. But I
23 also know personally many, many Black people in
24 Buffalo, in the 63rd District, and I know their
25 trauma. I know their stories. You see,

1 Madam President, 5/14 was not a standalone trauma
2 for my community. It was a re-trauma. It was a
3 reminder. It was not a dark day; it was a darker
4 day. It was a deeper sadness in a life already
5 afflicted by pain.

6 The people of Buffalo have been
7 carrying the trauma of May 14th every single day
8 for the past four years. Again, not as a trauma,
9 but as a re-trauma. Ask anyone in the community
10 where they were or what they were doing when they
11 first heard about the shooting. They remember.
12 Survivors relive the fear they felt that
13 afternoon. Children in my community are growing
14 up with the memory of hate and violence attached
15 to a place that should have simply been known as
16 a neighborhood grocery store.

17 So we should cry. We should mourn
18 when we speak the names of the victims who were
19 ripped away from their families, ripped away from
20 our community in a pure act of hatred and
21 cruelty: Celestine Chaney; Roberta Drury;
22 Andre Mackneil; Katherine Massey;
23 Margus Morrison; Heyward Patterson; Aaron Salter;
24 Geraldine Talley; Ruth Whitfield; and
25 Pearl Young.

1 Madam President, we should cry when
2 we think about the re-trauma endured by the
3 survivors on that darker day, including the three
4 who were shot and wounded: Zaire Goodman;
5 Jennifer Warrington; Christopher Braden.

6 We should cry when we remember the
7 10 people stolen from us that day and the lives
8 that they lived. They were nurturing mothers and
9 fathers. (Weeping.) They were grandparents.
10 They were cherished children. They were
11 siblings. They were dedicated community
12 activists who worked to improve their
13 neighborhood. They were public servants who
14 protected people.

15 They were selfless caregivers who
16 provided for their loved ones. They were
17 faithful leaders who spread God's light
18 throughout their communities.

19 The May 14th shooter, who was
20 radicalized online to hate people who were
21 different from him, wanted to divide my community
22 further. He wanted to break my community. But
23 the opposite happened.

24 The pain that we felt on May 14,
25 2022, does not disappear because time has passed.

1 And I guarantee that every year that we remember
2 this day on the floor of the New York State
3 Senate, that I will feel sorrow, I will feel
4 anger, and I will cry.

5 But grief is not weakness. Tears
6 are not weakness. Anger at injustice is not
7 weakness. These are emotions, and these emotions
8 are proof of our humanity. They are proof that
9 we love people. (Weeping.) They are proof that
10 other communities other than ours matter. They
11 are proof that we care about lives that are
12 stolen from us.

13 May God bless the City of Buffalo
14 and all the people that are back home today who
15 are anguished. May God remind all of us in this
16 chamber that we have a responsibility to respond
17 to the violence of May 14th with progress. And
18 may He remind me that it's only on the day that I
19 stand to memorialize May 14th and I don't cry,
20 that's the day that I should feel embarrassed.

21 I also want to ask God for a special
22 prayer and a special healing for the East Side of
23 Buffalo.

24 I want to thank all of my colleagues
25 in this chamber who will vote in favor of this

1 resolution and who will continue to keep my
2 district in prayer.

3 Thank you, Madam President.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
5 you, Senator.

6 Senator Zellner on the resolution.

7 SENATOR ZELLNER: Thank you,
8 Madam President.

9 I rise today as a Senator from
10 Buffalo but, more importantly, to advocate for a
11 community still carrying the pain of May 14th
12 every single day.

13 And as our Senator April Baskin
14 reminded this chamber, four years ago today a
15 neighborhood grocery store became the site of one
16 of the most horrific acts of racist violence in
17 modern history. Ten innocent people were
18 murdered simply because of the color of their
19 skin.

20 And I think all of us remember where
21 we were when we heard that news. But this felt
22 different because this was Buffalo. This was our
23 community. These were our neighbors.

24 For many people on Buffalo's
25 East Side, May 14th did not create the pain. It

1 was the moment the rest of the country finally
2 paid attention to pain that existed for
3 generations. A community that had already
4 endured segregation, disinvestment, food
5 insecurity, violence, and loss.

6 And yet even after unimaginable
7 loss, this community still chose compassion.
8 That is Buffalo. And what stays with me the most
9 is who we lost. People like Pearl Young. I knew
10 Pearl in my time as board of elections
11 commissioner. She was one of our dedicated
12 elections inspectors. Pearl lived a life
13 centered on helping others.

14 And Geraldine Talley. If you asked
15 people who knew Gerry Talley, they would tell you
16 that she was an amazing mom, an amazing baker,
17 someone who made birthday cakes for every one of
18 her colleagues' birthdays every single year.
19 That was who she was.

20 And today we remember the other
21 eight innocent people who never returned home
22 that day. We remember the survivors, the
23 workers, the shoppers, and the people forced to
24 run for their lives.

25 Four years later, there are still

1 some of our neighbors carrying the intense pain
2 of that day.

3 One of the voices to emerge from
4 this tragedy has been Gerry's son Mark Talley.
5 And over the last four years he has reminded
6 people that for Buffalo, May 14th did not end
7 when the memorials were over.

8 And while Buffalo will never forget
9 the 10 innocent lives taken too soon, we also
10 know there is plenty of work ahead. Work to make
11 sure families can afford to stay in the
12 neighborhoods they built. Work to make sure
13 children grow up with opportunities close to
14 home. Work to make sure communities have access
15 to fresh food. Work to make sure people feel
16 safe in their own community.

17 Because the people we lost should
18 still be here. They should still be with their
19 families. They should still have been able to
20 walk into a grocery store on a Saturday afternoon
21 and come home.

22 So today we remember them. But the
23 best way we can remember them and to honor them
24 is to continue working to build the kind of
25 community that they deserve.

1 Thank you, Madam President.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
3 you.

4 Senator Sanders on the resolution.

5 SENATOR SANDERS: Thank you,
6 Madam President.

7 This attack certainly took place in
8 Buffalo, but Buffalo is all of us.

9 I was visiting Buffalo on a banking
10 tour, and I came across a supermarket, a very
11 bland-looking supermarket. And the only thing
12 that stood out was that there was some -- it was
13 a tree or something of that nature where there
14 was a plaque or something on it. And I
15 questioned people. I said, What is this? And
16 they said, That is where the attack took place.

17 It was so typical. There was
18 nothing extraordinary about the supermarket. It
19 was just a supermarket that you would find
20 anywhere. And that's what struck me, my friends,
21 that this was an attack that would have taken
22 place anywhere, to any of us. A sick and
23 troubled mind decided that this was the area --
24 it could have been your area. Just luck of the
25 draw, if you wish, that it was theirs.

1 There's a group of people out there
2 that call themselves the accelerationists. They
3 believe that America is falling, that America is
4 hit and we're going to the bottom, and it should
5 be dissolved. And if they could just end it,
6 they'll create something in their minds better.
7 The accelerationists.

8 And they want to accelerate
9 America's downfall. These are white supremacists
10 who have a very twisted view of America, and they
11 are hard at work accelerating this downfall that
12 they see.

13 Now, the American people should take
14 a different position. We should become
15 decelerationists. We should combat the nonsense
16 and the mindset that they have by committing
17 ourselves to these values that we call ourselves
18 holding, values that are worth fighting for and
19 worth dying for.

20 America is an unfinished product.
21 Nobody can say this more than Black people.
22 America is certainly not the finished product or
23 not the place that has everything together.

24 But America is worth keeping.
25 America is worth defending. These ideals put up

1 by imperfect people are bigger than those people.
2 And therefore, attacks by people who want to
3 accelerate the end of America should be stopped
4 by every single person who calls themselves an
5 American.

6 Buffalo is not an isolated place.
7 Belief is a warning shot across the bow to all of
8 us in America, that there are those who are
9 committed to make sure that this union that so
10 many people have fought and died for goes down
11 the drain.

12 We in this chamber should commit
13 ourselves that we are not going to let it happen.
14 We're going to reach across the aisle. We're
15 going to -- we could disagree, but we don't have
16 to become disagreeable. We don't have to just
17 say no when we know we should say yes, or
18 vice versa.

19 We can be bigger than these things,
20 my friends. We can perhaps show the rest of the
21 nation where this country could go if it just
22 believed in the words that were written.

23 America is larger than any of us in
24 here and deserves to be fought for. And this is
25 why Buffalo should never stand by itself and

1 never be -- and we should always say it. And not
2 just Buffalo, Charleston -- we could go down the
3 line, all of these places where we're getting
4 these shootings. This is anti-American, and all
5 of us should say it and stand with it.

6 I'll be kind and end there by saying
7 we stand -- in the Talented Tenth Senatorial
8 District, we stand with Buffalo.

9 Thank you, Madam President.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
11 you, Senator.

12 Senator Comrie on the resolution.

13 SENATOR COMRIE: Thank you,
14 Madam President.

15 I stand to support the resolution
16 marking four years of a tragedy that happened at
17 the Tops Supermarket in Buffalo.

18 The tragedy that happened, the fact
19 that we had a child that was raised in the State
20 of New York that wanted to commit mass murder of
21 people he didn't know, is a tragedy that we can't
22 walk away from. It's a situation that we have to
23 face, that we as a state have not made sure that
24 our children understand the beauty of New York.

25 New York was founded to create

1 opportunities for people. New York embraced
2 immigrants, from the Statute of Liberty, from all
3 of the people that emigrated here from different
4 parts of the world, New York has always been a
5 state that embraces culture. A state that allows
6 people from different areas to come and
7 understand what America is, understand how to
8 make a new life, understand how to escape
9 oppression.

10 But the fact that we had a young man
11 from New York State that wanted to kill people
12 for no reason, other than listening to hate blogs
13 and being on hatred websites, is something that
14 we need to change. We have lost civics teaching
15 in our schools. We have lost the ability to make
16 sure that our children understand and embrace
17 other cultures. We have broken down our
18 education system because people don't want to
19 take the time to make that happen.

20 This tragedy should have never
21 happened. There is no New Yorker that should
22 ever want to hurt anyone.

23 The only Native New Yorkers here are
24 Indians. We are all from different cultures.
25 We're from all different backgrounds. We all

1 need to respect each other.

2 I grieve for the people in Buffalo
3 that are still hurting from this. I hope that
4 they can continue to get the services and
5 resources that they need to continue to try to
6 live through this -- because you can never forget
7 it.

8 And we should never forget that as
9 legislators we need to do more to be responsible
10 to all our children so that no child in New York
11 ever wants to do a hatred act like this again.

12 Thank you, Madam President.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
14 you, Senator.

15 Senator Bailey on the resolution.

16 SENATOR BAILEY: Thank you,
17 Madam President.

18 Senator Baskin, thank you. Senator
19 Zellner, thank you. But Senator Baskin, you
20 talked about crying.

21 I'm talking about Psalm 30:5 -- you
22 know what I'm getting ready to say. Weeping may
23 endure for a night, but joy -- I said joy -- I
24 said joy, it comes in the morning.

25 And so we will cry with you every

1 night, April. We will collectively cry as a
2 community until that joy comes in the morning.

3 I'd be lying to you,
4 Madam President, if I was certain when that joy
5 is coming. But I know it's going to come.
6 There's too much weeping. Too much racism. And
7 I'm glad that we lift up the names of the
8 victims, because we become desensitized,
9 Madam President. The year after, when we had the
10 display in the LOB, everybody stopped. And then
11 the year after that, less people stopped. And
12 this year, people just seemed to be walking on
13 By. They just seemed -- that it happened, it was
14 what it was. Those 10 people are still gone.

15 Their families will never forget.
16 When we lose people, either loved ones or
17 society, we got to be there for them longer than
18 just post a funeral, Madam President. The cards,
19 the influx, the calls, the love for Buffalo --
20 six months, a year -- four years later we still
21 have to remember those folks that were just
22 trying to eat. If we really distill this down to
23 a basic societal and human need, these folks were
24 just trying to eat.

25 And they were killed because they

1 were trying to eat and they were poor and Black.
2 You don't deserve to die because you're hungry.
3 You don't deserve to die because you're Black.
4 That's why they died. We can't forget that.

5 We can't forget that there's an
6 idiot running around the incident who I'm not
7 going to dignify that's been going around
8 claiming in the name of free speech that he's
9 calling people this and that. And people are
10 clicking on this garbage.

11 You know why, Madam President?
12 Because the lounge conversations aren't the floor
13 conversations. We all get along, most of the
14 time. We get along. But they don't see that.
15 They see the clips of the debates and they see
16 the you versus this and the D versus the R. They
17 don't see the humanity.

18 We've got to show them the humanity.
19 The lounge conversations have got to come to the
20 floor one day, Madam President. That's the only
21 way that the joy will come in the morning, when
22 we collectively as a country have those
23 conversations.

24 And I'll leave you with this,
25 because I know more people want to speak on this.

1 Today is 5/14. And one of my
2 favorite verses is from Matthew 5:14: You are
3 the light of the world. A town built on a hill
4 cannot be hidden.

5 On 5/14, remember Chapter 5,
6 Verse 14: Be that light. Shine the light.
7 Shine the light in places where you didn't think
8 it needed to be shown. But shine the light
9 nonetheless. Because you can't hide the light.
10 Everywhere you go, you've got to let it shine.

11 God bless the legacy -- not just the
12 memory, the legacy, tragedy to triumph, of those
13 lost in Buffalo. The memories are always going
14 to be a blessing. But we have to make sure we
15 let our light shine.

16 I vote aye, Madam President.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
18 you.

19 Senator Harckham on the resolution.

20 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Thank you,
21 Madam President.

22 I want to thank Senator Baskin for
23 the resolution and your powerful words.

24 You know, if we can't shed a tear in
25 the face of such horror and evil, it's okay. We

1 can shed a tear. And Senator Zellner and my
2 colleagues, thank you for your remarks.

3 I was up in Buffalo a little over a
4 week after the tragedy, went up to see our former
5 colleague Senator Kennedy, Senator Ryan, to be
6 moral support. We went to the makeshift memorial
7 outside Tops with piles of flowers and home
8 photographs. Met with grieving constituents of
9 now Senator Baskin. Met a woman whose son had
10 been shot through the neck that day.

11 And yet on the flip side, we met
12 with the volunteers across the street who were
13 distributing food because the supermarket was
14 closed. And the community coming together.

15 But as many colleagues pointed out,
16 this was such an act of evil because these folks
17 were killed because of the color of their skin.
18 They were hunted down because they were Black.

19 And yet there are too many people
20 who look like me saying we're all of a sudden a
21 colorblind society. That we don't have to deal
22 with the inequities of the past, and that we
23 can't even say words like "diversity" or "equity"
24 or "inclusion."

25 And yet we know there are inequities

1 in our education system, there are inequities in
2 housing, there are inequities in our legal
3 system, there are inequities in education.
4 There's environmental inequities. We deal with
5 environmental injustice and racism on a daily
6 basis in this body.

7 And so there is so much more work to
8 do. And we cannot pretend that this was simply a
9 one-off by a madman, because the seeds of that
10 evil are still here.

11 And so I rise today to support the
12 resolution and support my friends and colleagues
13 in Buffalo, but also to support my constituents
14 in Peekskill and Ossining and Brewster and
15 Mount Kisco who still live with this indecency on
16 a daily basis.

17 And so that is what we strive to do,
18 and that's why these resolutions are so
19 important -- not only to remember those who we've
20 lost, but certainly the charge that we have as
21 lawmakers and the work we still have to do.

22 I vote aye.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
24 you, Senator.

25 Senator Webb on the resolution.

1 SENATOR WEBB: Thank you,
2 Madam President.

3 I want to again thank Senator Baskin
4 for introducing this resolution. Of course all
5 of my colleagues who have spoken and will most
6 certainly speak.

7 You know, as it's been mentioned,
8 four years ago not only did the City of Buffalo
9 suffer a tremendous loss, but our entire state.
10 And no one can deny the continuous trauma that
11 has ensued, especially after that day.

12 And we know that it was due in large
13 part to the public sickness and pervasiveness of
14 racism.

15 The many cries and the questions of
16 why still remain to this day. And what do we
17 know, Madam President? Well, what we do know is
18 that our communities deserve to be safe,
19 especially those that are historically
20 marginalized. And unfortunately gun violence,
21 like racism, continues to be a chronic public
22 safety issue.

23 So whether it's mass shootings like
24 the one that happened in Buffalo four years ago,
25 domestic violence, suicide, or everyday gun

1 violence in our neighborhoods, we must address
2 the root causes with urgency, compassion, and a
3 commitment to justice.

4 With this tragedy, Madam President,
5 we know that it was racially motivated. It took
6 place in a predominantly Black neighborhood. The
7 sheer fact of 10 people losing their lives simply
8 going about their day, and three other people
9 injured, that trauma stays not only with those
10 who were lost, their families, but the community
11 at large.

12 Every person, no matter their zip
13 code, their race, ethnicity, however they
14 culturally identify, should not have to worry
15 about being killed or injured through violence or
16 through policy that sanctions that violence.

17 Everyone deserves to be able to have
18 a better quality of life. And behind each
19 statistic, this is a loved one, a community
20 member, a future stolen far too soon.

21 Madam President, we also can't
22 ignore the role of policy in government in this
23 conversation. Almost exactly a year ago the
24 federal Department of Justice canceled roughly
25 \$500 million in grants for criminal justice

1 organizations that work on safety and justice
2 initiatives.

3 We know this decision will hurt our
4 communities not just in New York State, but
5 across the country, especially those that are
6 already suffering due to having some of the
7 highest rates of violence due to many years of
8 historic underinvestment.

9 Madam President, gun violence is a
10 public health tragedy, it is a criminal justice
11 tragedy, and it is a mental health tragedy. We
12 have to keep pushing for commonsense gun safety
13 legislation.

14 We also have to ensure that we
15 commit ourselves to addressing the mindset and
16 the actions that foster hate and bigotry. That
17 we have to take a role, especially in our
18 chamber, an active role to make sure that we
19 continue to center our shared humanity.

20 And, Madam President, we have to
21 commit ourselves to centering the right to
22 dignity and respect, compassion and love.

23 Today I stand with all of our
24 colleagues here to not only commemorate this
25 tragedy, but may we strengthen our resolve to

1 fight against the hate and the violence that
2 resulted in this racially motivated massacre.

3 May we continue to commit to
4 advancing, not only through policy, but also
5 budgetary investments, practices that will center
6 our shared humanity.

7 I vote aye, Madam President.

8 And thank you again, Senator Baskin.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
10 you.

11 Senator Myrie on the resolution.

12 SENATOR MYRIE: Thank you,
13 Madam President.

14 It has been said that only love can
15 drive out hate. So I want to begin with love for
16 the 10 beautiful souls that were lost four years
17 ago. Love for their families that are changed
18 forever because of what happened four years ago.
19 Love for the neighborhoods that are impacted by
20 what happened four years ago.

21 And from Brooklyn to Buffalo, love
22 to you, April, for your district, for your
23 community that had to endure such a tragedy.

24 But it isn't just love that drives
25 out hate. We are and should be a society of laws

1 that drive out hate. Right now there is a young
2 man in his basement being radicalized, being fed
3 algorithms that are watering the seeds of hatred
4 that become a forest, that rob people of their
5 lives, literally.

6 We have to be a state of laws that
7 drive out this hate. Laws that provide food
8 access for the people of Buffalo. Laws that give
9 the young people of Buffalo something to do, a
10 place to be, community to have. A state that,
11 yes, has laws to hold the gun industry
12 accountable, to hold big corporations
13 accountable, people who profit off of anger and
14 hate and violence.

15 We have to be a state of laws so
16 that May 14th becomes a day of love. A day of
17 celebration. A day of change, a day of hope,
18 where we say this is how we used to be, but we
19 have changed that together.

20 So to the people of Buffalo, we got
21 your back. Brooklyn got your back. New York
22 has your back. We will never relent until we rid
23 ourselves of the tragedy that stole 10 beautiful
24 souls.

25 I vote aye.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
2 you, Senator.

3 Senator Bynoe on the resolution.

4 SENATOR BYNOE: Thank you,
5 Madam President.

6 I stand today in support of the
7 resolution marking the death and the murders of
8 the 10 innocent people in Buffalo.

9 As many of my colleagues have spoken
10 today, I have similar sentiments. I wanted to
11 talk today as a woman of great faith, a woman who
12 leans on the word of God and the promises of God
13 in times of these struggles. I wanted to talk a
14 bit about weeping may endure for a night, but joy
15 comes in the morning. But hope comes in the
16 morning. But solace comes in the morning. And
17 resilience comes in the morning.

18 But faith without works is dead. We
19 must, we must as a chamber, as representatives
20 from across this great State of New York, make
21 sure that God's greatest commandment, which is
22 love, is sealed in every policy and every
23 decision that we make here in this chamber.

24 We must understand, as Senator Myrie
25 said, that only love can drive out hate. Love.

1 Love for our communities. Love even in
2 differences.

3 But standing on commonality, the
4 commonality of our desire to serve our
5 communities and do best by them.

6 So today, I stand with Buffalo. And
7 I am praying for a peace that can transcend all
8 understanding on a day that they have to relive
9 the trauma of the individual who decided to come
10 there and prey -- not pray to God, but prey on
11 innocent victims.

12 May God bless and keep the great
13 people of Buffalo.

14 Thank you.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
16 you, Senator.

17 Senator Cleare to close.

18 SENATOR CLEARE: Thank you,
19 Madam President.

20 I stand today with the people of
21 Buffalo, but with Black people across this
22 country and all over the world.

23 I remember when this news first came
24 to me -- and I thought it was so ironic -- I have
25 relatives that live in the South, Florida,

1 calling me to ask me was I okay. That was so odd
2 to me, because it seemed like it was always the
3 other way around. This doesn't happen up here.

4 And the other thing that it made me
5 think about was, why does all this hate still
6 exist? We pass laws. People know the harms and
7 the dangers. But we have not had equality.
8 We've not had equity. And when we talk about a
9 Black curriculum and teaching Black history, some
10 people may think it's just for Black people. But
11 it's more important in some ways, and clearly
12 from this example, that all people know
13 Black history and see Black people as human.
14 You've got to understand what it takes to kill a
15 person -- a person, someone who did nothing to
16 you -- let alone to go kill 10 or as many as you
17 can.

18 When I walk through that corridor
19 and I look at those faces, I see my aunties, I
20 see my uncles, grandmother, grandfather. I can
21 never harm anybody like that. This had to be
22 someone who was just that cold and ruthless.

23 So as we fight to understand these
24 things -- yes, we need gun laws. Absolutely we
25 need them. But we also do need to strongly

1 oppose these forces of evil that swallow people
2 up and get into their heads. We can't let it go
3 by. We can't ever think or let anyone think that
4 someone else is not valuable.

5 Senator Bailey, every year I walk
6 past every name and I call it out. I speak it.
7 And I say a prayer for their families and for
8 them. Because I know that on that day, they did
9 not know this was their last moment. They didn't
10 have the opportunity to even say "God help me."
11 They never thought that's what was going to
12 happen. And I think about that.

13 And Senator Baskin, I am with you.
14 The shock and the trauma spread all the way to
15 Harlem, to the Upper West Side, to every part of
16 my district and every part of this country and
17 even other parts of the world. And we'll always
18 be shocked, and we should always be shocked. We
19 should always be traumatized by this. And let it
20 be a reminder of the work we have to do to truly
21 be one nation under God.

22 Thank you.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
24 you.

25 So I misspoke. Senator Lanza to

1 close.

2 SENATOR LANZA: Thank you,
3 Madam President.

4 I just want to make sure that I
5 don't let the moment pass without saying I too --
6 on behalf of the people I represent on
7 Staten Island and on behalf of my conference,
8 that we stand with Buffalo. We stand with the
9 people of Buffalo.

10 You know, ever since evil slithered
11 into the Garden of Evil -- Garden of Eden. Ever
12 since that day, Madam President, it has stalked
13 us. It wants us. And it needs us in order to
14 spread evil across the earth. And it is a
15 choice.

16 I've listened to the wonderful words
17 today and the inspirational words, words of love.
18 Too often it seems that it's easier to hate. Too
19 often it seems that while we're not looking, evil
20 snatches one of us to do its deeds.

21 And I think part of the response,
22 we've heard about it today -- part of the
23 response is that by deed and by words we can keep
24 evil at bay. But it's a choice. It's a choice
25 every day, every minute, because evil wants us.

1 And evil needs us.

2 And so I think of the words today.
3 And if you're searching for the right words, if
4 you're searching to know what it is you ought to
5 think and you ought to say, I would look no
6 further than the words of Senator Baskin, Senator
7 Comrie, Senator Bailey, Senator Sanders, Senator
8 Bynoe. Those are the words. That we're better
9 than it. That we will not let it take our souls.

10 Those words are powerful. I sat
11 here, and I was moved. And the trick, as so many
12 said, is to hold on to that.

13 But I believe, I believe that if you
14 embrace love, and if we do stick together and we
15 do crowd out hate, I believe with those words we
16 can ensure, and they will usher in, that light in
17 the morning, as Senator Bailey so eloquently
18 reminded us of.

19 So, Madam President, I stand with
20 Buffalo. And I vote in favor of the resolution.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
22 you, Senator.

23 The resolution was adopted on
24 May 12th.

25 Senator Gianaris.

1 SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you,
2 Madam President.

3 Thank you to all my colleagues for
4 their words on that last resolution.

5 At the request of the sponsors, all
6 the resolutions we took up today are open for
7 cosponsorship.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
9 resolutions are open for cosponsorship. Should
10 you choose not to be a cosponsor, please notify
11 the desk.

12 Senator Gianaris.

13 SENATOR GIANARIS: I have a motion
14 here.

15 On behalf of Senator Krueger, I wish
16 to call up Senate Print 8512B, recalled from the
17 Assembly, which is now at the desk.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
19 Secretary will read.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 698, Senate Print 8512B, by Senator Krueger, an
22 act to amend the Public Service Law.

23 SENATOR GIANARIS: Move to
24 reconsider the vote by which the bill was passed.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The

1 Secretary will call the roll on reconsideration.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
5 is restored to its place on the Third Reading
6 Calendar.

7 SENATOR GIANARIS: I offer the
8 following amendments.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
10 amendments are received.

11 SENATOR GIANARIS: Please take up
12 the calendar.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
14 Secretary will read.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 250, Senate Print 7942A, by Senator Oberacker, an
17 act to amend the Highway Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
3 Calendar 250, voting in the negative:
4 Senator Brisport.

5 Ayes, 57. Nays, 1.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 459, Senate Print 1838, by Senator Skoufis, an
10 act to amend the General Municipal Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
14 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
15 shall have become a law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
22 Calendar 459, voting in the negative are
23 Senators Chan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martinez,
24 Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, Ortt, Walczyk, Weber
25 and Weik.

1 Ayes, 46. Nays, 12.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 464, Senate Print 4033C, by Senator Harckham, an
6 act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 7. This
10 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
11 shall have become a law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
18 Calendar 464, voting in the negative:
19 Senator Borrello.

20 Ayes, 57. Nays, 1.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
22 is passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 504, Senate Print 8378B, by Senator Palumbo, an
25 act to amend Chapter 495 of the Laws of 2011.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
2 last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
4 act shall take effect immediately.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
9 the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
11 Calendar 504, voting in the negative:
12 Senator Skoufis.

13 Ayes, 57. Nays, 1.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 528, Senate Print 3371A, by Senator Persaud, an
18 act to amend the Executive Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
22 act shall take effect January 1, 2027.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
2 the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 571, Assembly Bill Number 9144A, by
8 Assemblymember Lavine, an act to amend the
9 Civil Practice Law and Rules.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
11 last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
13 act shall take effect immediately.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
18 the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
20 Calendar 571, voting in the negative:
21 Senator Walczyk.

22 Ayes, 57. Nays, 1.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 607, Senate Print 3836, by Senator Hinchey, an
2 act to amend the Alcoholic Beverage Control Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
13 Calendar 607, voting in the negative:
14 Senator Oberacker.

15 Ayes, 57. Nays, 1.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 682, Senate Print 7713A, by Senator Krueger, an
20 act to amend the General Business Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
24 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it
25 shall have become a law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
5 the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
7 Calendar 682, voting in the negative are
8 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Chan, Gallivan, Griffo,
9 Helming, Lanza, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker,
10 O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec,
11 Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

12 Ayes, 38. Nays, 20.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 724, Senate Print 9742A, by Senator Kavanagh,
17 an act to amend the Multiple Dwelling Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
21 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
22 shall have become a law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
2 the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
4 Calendar 724, voting in the negative are
5 Senators Ashby, Bynoe, Gallivan, Griffio, Murray,
6 Oberacker, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco and Walczyk.

7 Ayes, 48. Nays, 10.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 763, Assembly Bill Number 9570C, by
12 Assemblymember Lee, an act to amend the
13 Real Property Tax Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
24 Calendar 763, voting in the negative are
25 Senators Martinez and Skoufis.

1 Ayes, 56. Nays, 2.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 776, Assembly Bill Number 5134, by
6 Assemblymember Solages, an act to amend the
7 Public Authorities Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Oh, excuse me.
21 Sorry.

22 In relation to Calendar Number 776,
23 voting in the negative are Senators Bynoe and
24 Martinez.

25 Ayes, 56. Nays, 2.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
2 is passed.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 811, Senate Print 4969, by Senator Bailey, an act
5 to amend the Public Health Law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
9 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
10 shall have become a law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
15 the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
17 Calendar 811, voting in the negative are
18 Senators Borrello, Gallivan, Griffo, Lanza,
19 Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco,
20 Walczyk and Weik.

21 Ayes, 46. Nays, 12.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 857, Assembly Bill Number 3304B, by

1 Assemblymember Tapia, an act to amend the
2 Banking Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
6 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
7 shall have become a law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
14 Calendar 857, voting in the negative are
15 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Gallivan, Griffo,
16 Lanza, Mattera, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Stec,
17 Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

18 Ayes, 44. Nays, 14.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 862, Assembly Bill Number 10418, by
23 Assemblymember Stern, an act to amend the
24 Veterans' Services Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 909, Senate Print 8371, by Senator Brisport, an
14 act to amend the Education Law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
18 act shall take effect immediately.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill

1 is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 921, Senate Print 8369, by Senator Stavisky, an
4 act to amend the Education Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
8 act shall take effect immediately.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
13 the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 926, Senate Print 9997, by Senator Stavisky, an
19 act to amend the Education Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
23 act shall take effect one year after it shall
24 have become a law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 939, Senate Print 4849, by Senator Fahy, an act
10 directing the Department of Transportation to
11 conduct a traffic and planning study on the
12 feasibility of transforming the Harriman Campus.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
16 act shall take effect immediately.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
21 Fahy to explain her vote.

22 SENATOR FAHY: Thank you. Thank
23 you, Madam President.

24 I just want to take a moment because
25 this is a bill and an issue that I've worked on

1 for many, many years.

2 This is about undertaking a
3 comprehensive traffic and planning study for the
4 future of the Harriman State Office Campus,
5 created in the 1960s and '70s, and we are
6 desperately trying to get it into the
7 21st century.

8 We have now relocated a new
9 Wadsworth Lab, a modernized Wadsworth Lab, and
10 we've got to convert the entire campus from what
11 I refer to as the "Uptown Parking Lot District."
12 And it could be so much more.

13 So this is beyond a traffic study.
14 This is really about reimagining what is the
15 largest and most strategically located state
16 office campus in New York State. It's a few
17 hundred acres.

18 And we want to connect it better
19 with the City of Albany, where it is located.
20 For decades it has really served as an isolated
21 office complex, with some of the worst of 1960s
22 planning decisions.

23 This is a once-in-a-lifetime
24 opportunity which has been really enabled by a
25 \$1.7 billion investment in what will be new

1 world-class Wadsworth public health labs,
2 something I have long supported.

3 But that should not be a standalone
4 investment. We shouldn't be doing standalone
5 public investments. We can do so much more here
6 and make it a true hub for the life sciences,
7 biotech, and public health research, as well as
8 adding commercial retail and critically needed
9 housing.

10 The bottom line is we need the
11 campus to turn into a vibrant mixed-use
12 innovation district with space for all of the
13 above.

14 And it will help take some of this
15 state-owned property and put it on the tax rolls
16 by privatizing pieces of it for the City of
17 Albany, where we know there have been tremendous
18 fiscal challenges, partly because well over
19 60 percent of the City of Albany's land is
20 state-owned, state or publicly owned land, and
21 not taxable.

22 So this is about planning
23 intelligently, really thinking about how we get
24 out of the 1960s and make sure that as we're
25 recruiting scientists and more, this is a

1 multi-use, innovative campus connected to the
2 city and surrounding communities.

3 And with that, Madam President, I
4 vote in the affirmative, and thank you.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
6 Fahy to be recorded in the affirmative.

7 Announce the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 962, Senate Print 10071, by Senator Bottcher, an
13 act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
24 Calendar 962, voting in the negative:
25 Senator Skoufis.

1 Ayes, 57. Nays, 1.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 988, Senate Print 2484, by Senator Parker, an act
6 in relation to directing the State Energy and
7 Planning Board to conduct a study on the
8 time frames for replacing or upgrading battery
9 energy storage systems.

10 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Lay it
12 aside.

13 Senator Gianaris, that completes the
14 reading of today's calendar.

15 SENATOR GIANARIS: Let's move on to
16 the controversial calendar, please.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
18 Secretary will ring the bell.

19 The Secretary will read.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 988, Senate Print 2484, by Senator Parker, an act
22 in relation to directing the State Energy
23 Planning Board to conduct a study on the
24 time frames for replacing or upgrading battery
25 energy storage systems.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
2 Murray, why do you rise?

3 SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you,
4 Madam President. Would the sponsor yield for a
5 question or two?

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the
7 sponsor yield?

8 SENATOR PARKER: Yes,
9 Madam President.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
11 sponsor yields.

12 SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you.

13 Through you, Madam President.

14 Senator, there's a lot of important
15 issues that are being covered in this study, but
16 I've heard from constituents, I've heard from
17 many firefighters concern about fire.

18 Is there a reason -- I don't see
19 anything in here covering that issue. Has that
20 been purposely omitted, or is that just not in
21 there?

22 SENATOR PARKER: Madam President,
23 through you.

24 Recently there was an interagency
25 task force led by NYSERDA and the PSC, the

1 Public Service Commission, that actually
2 addressed the issues of fire safety around
3 battery storage.

4 In that study, and I will make sure
5 you get a copy of it, they actually upgrade and
6 institute standards and sets of criteria around
7 battery storage that ensure safety.

8 They were already, you know, frankly
9 relatively safe. Like anything else, this deals
10 with technology. There have been some accidents
11 but nothing, you know, in the State of New York
12 that has, you know, rose to the level of concern
13 in that kind of way with this technology.

14 The other thing to know is that when
15 you look at accidents that have happened with
16 battery storage, and what -- the current
17 technology is being used is different technology.
18 Right? So there's an upgrade in the technology.
19 There's an upgrade in the standards. There's an
20 upgrade in the criteria, mostly based on
21 recommendations made by the New York City Fire
22 Department, which is the gold standard nationally
23 for fire safety.

24 In this particular bill, this is not
25 about siting, but just a study about where we

1 should use them. And so there's no need to refer
2 to that, one, because that work is being done
3 someplace else, and that this bill is not about
4 particular siting around communities as much as
5 it is around planning for battery storage within
6 the context of the CLCPA, the Climate Leadership
7 and Community Protection Act, which is the ruling
8 guide for both environmental and energy policy
9 for the State of New York.

10 SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you,
11 Madam President. On the bill.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
13 Murray on the bill.

14 SENATOR MURRAY: And thank you,
15 Senator Parker.

16 And I do understand that. I
17 understand there was other studies. What I also
18 understand in talking to people within the
19 industry is that this is ongoing. The technology
20 continues to change.

21 But there continues to be a concern.
22 And so for the purposes of both public safety and
23 for the concerns of the firefighters of my
24 constituents, I think that any study bill on this
25 issue should include fire safety. Because as was

1 said by the sponsor himself, the technology is
2 changing. And so as we continue to do these
3 studies, I think it's necessary that that be
4 included.

5 So for that reason, I'll be voting
6 in the negative.

7 Thank you.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
9 you, Senator.

10 Are there any other Senators wishing
11 to be heard?

12 Seeing and hearing none, the debate
13 is closed.

14 Senator Gianaris.

15 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,
16 we've agreed to restore this bill to the
17 noncontroversial calendar.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
19 is restored to the noncontroversial calendar.

20 Read the last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
22 act shall take effect immediately.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
2 Parker to explain his vote.

3 SENATOR PARKER: Thank you,
4 Madam President.

5 Ladies and gentlemen of the Senate,
6 thank you for your attention. This bill is an
7 actually fairly straightforward bill that directs
8 NYSERDA to conduct a study on preparing, you
9 know, around renewable energy.

10 Again, we have the CLCPA creates,
11 you know, a set of guidelines for us to protect
12 our environment. We need to build a clean energy
13 economy here in the State of New York. First,
14 because we need to protect our actual planet.

15 But it also will deal with the issue
16 of utility costs. And actually the more that we
17 kind of pay attention and put our energy into a
18 clean energy economy, the lower the bills for our
19 constituents and the ratepayers of the State of
20 New York will be.

21 But the other thing is as we look at
22 the building out of our clean energy economy, it
23 is the next best opportunity to build full-time
24 jobs at a living wage with benefits.

25 So as we talk about where is our

1 economy going, particularly in the context of AI
2 and those kind of things, those opportunities are
3 still in the clean energy economy.

4 So this is really something that we
5 need to lean into.

6 And we've heard many times from my
7 colleagues across the aisle about how we need to
8 prepare, about how we need plans. Well, here's a
9 plan. Here's something linking a particular set
10 of technologies around battery storage and we're
11 developing a plan for it.

12 Battery storage is critical because
13 it's part of what I refer to as the holy trinity
14 of sustainable energy. Right? Solar during the
15 day, wind at night, battery storage for all other
16 times. Right?

17 And so as we start developing more
18 and more of these projects, and particularly
19 looking at one of my favorite things that I think
20 we need to do about -- around resiliency, which
21 is build microgrids around things like SUNY,
22 CUNY, hospitals, NYCHA, right, to make sure
23 there's both energy resilience and effective
24 energy consumption and use, battery storage is
25 going to be an important part of this.

1 This bill provides a planning
2 process. And so I ask you all to vote aye as we
3 go forward to build this clean energy economy.

4 Thank you, Madam President.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
6 Parker to be recorded in the affirmative.

7 Senator Comrie to explain his vote.

8 SENATOR COMRIE: Madam President, I
9 support this bill. But I do want to take the
10 opportunity, as we talk about battery energy
11 storage, to point out that I do hope the study
12 talks about issues of fire and burning.

13 Because right now we've been told
14 that the only thing they can do is watch the fire
15 burn. And it's self-contained. And fortunately
16 it hasn't spread to other areas, and there hasn't
17 been a major incident.

18 But the fumes from a fire and the
19 toxicity coming from a fire freaks out urban
20 communities.

21 Residents in my district, in a
22 historic community -- an entrepreneur is putting
23 a battery energy storage facility less than
24 30 feet from someone's home. Less than 30 feet.
25 Literally, you could reach across his

1 driveway and touch the walls of the facility.

2 This person is a third-generation
3 homeowner, in a historic community. We've been
4 trying to get them to be considerate, giving them
5 other locations in the area. Because there's no
6 doubt that with all of the tech that we're using,
7 with all of the electronics that are happening,
8 we need to do more for energy storage.

9 But for companies and for NYSERDA
10 not to take responsibility to try to fix this
11 problem is a travesty.

12 So I cannot not note that during
13 this time -- and I cannot not note that I hope
14 that this study will include what happens with a
15 total burn. Because the fumes and the toxicity
16 are freaking out -- the possibility is freaking
17 out consumers, residents in my area, and
18 throughout the state.

19 No one wants to have to be sitting
20 or living next to a facility that may burn
21 internally or externally for hours. And we need
22 to make sure that while they are improving the
23 technology, that there are some real studies done
24 to address this issue.

25 Thank you, Madam President.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
2 Comrie to be recorded in the affirmative.

3 Senator Stavisky to explain her
4 vote.

5 SENATOR STAVISKY: Yes, thank you,
6 Madam President.

7 And thank you, Senator Comrie.

8 I don't want to be repetitive, but I
9 too have issues in the district concerning the
10 placement and the operation of battery storage
11 facilities. And this is something that we've got
12 to deal with.

13 And let us hope that we can provide
14 both the energy but, more importantly, the safety
15 for the local residents.

16 Thank you, Madam President.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
18 Stavisky to be recorded in the affirmative.

19 Announce the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
21 Calendar 988, voting in the negative are
22 Senators Borrello, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
23 Lanza, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Stec,
24 Tedisco, Walczyk and Weik.

25 Ayes, 45. Nays, 13.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
2 is passed.

3 Senator Gianaris, that completes the
4 reading of the calendar.

5 SENATOR GIANARIS: Is there any
6 further business at the desk?

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: There is
8 no further business at the desk.

9 SENATOR GIANARIS: I move to
10 adjourn until Monday, May 18th, at 11:00 a.m.,
11 with the intervening days being legislative days.

12 Since we're breaking for the
13 weekend, once again, let's go, Sabres!

14 The Knicks may have the weekend off,
15 but if they play, let's go, Knicks!

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Okay.

17 On motion, the Senate stands
18 adjourned until Monday, May 18th, at 11:00 a.m.,
19 with intervening days being legislative days.

20 (Whereupon, at 1:14 p.m., the Senate
21 adjourned.)

22

23

24

25