NEW YORK STATE SENATE

THE STENOGRAPHIC RECORD

ALBANY, NEW YORK

April 22, 2026

11:32 a.m.

REGULAR SESSION

SENATOR ROXANNE J. PERSAUD, Acting President

ALEJANDRA N. PAULINO, ESQ., Secretary

P R O C E E D I N G S

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The Senate will come to order.

I ask everyone to please rise and recite the Pledge of Allegiance.

(Whereupon, the assemblage recited the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: In the absence of clergy, let us bow our heads in a moment of silent reflection or prayer.

(Whereupon, the assemblage respected a moment of silence.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Reading of the Journal.

THE SECRETARY: In Senate, Tuesday, April 21, 2026, the Senate met pursuant to adjournment. The Journal of Monday, April 20, 2026, was read and approved. On motion, the Senate adjourned.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Without objection, the Journal stands approved as read.

Presentation of petitions.

Messages from the Assembly.

The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Senator Skoufis

moves to discharge, from the Committee on Housing, Construction and Community Development, Assembly Bill Number 3126B and substitute it for the identical Senate Bill 6368B, Third Reading Calendar 236.

Senator Brisport moves to discharge, from the Committee on Judiciary, Assembly Bill Number 8305 and substitute it for the identical Senate Bill 8372, Third Reading Calendar 675.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: So ordered.

Messages from the Governor.

Reports of standing committees.

Reports of select committees.

Communications and reports from state officers.

Motions and resolutions.

Senator Gianaris.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Good morning, Madam President.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Good morning.

SENATOR GIANARIS: There will be an immediate meeting of the Rules Committee in Room 332.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: There will be an immediate meeting of the Rules Committee in Room 332.

SENATOR GIANARIS: The Senate stands at ease.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The Senate stands at ease.

(Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease at 11:33 a.m.)

(Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at 11:42 a.m.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The Senate will return to order.

Senator Gianaris.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President, there's a report of the Rules Committee at the desk. Please take that up.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Senator Stewart-Cousins, from the Committee on Rules, reports the following bill: Senate Print 9999, by Senator Serrano, an act making appropriations for the support of government.

The bill reports direct to third

reading.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Move to accept the report of the Rules Committee.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: All those in favor of accepting the Rules Committee report please signify by saying aye.

(Response of "Aye.")

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Opposed, nay.

(No response.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The report of the Rules Committee is accepted.

Senator Gianaris.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Please take up the supplemental calendar.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 822, Senate Print 9999, by Senator Serrano, an act making appropriations for the support of government.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Is there a message of necessity and appropriation at the desk?

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: There is

a message of necessity and appropriation at the desk.

SENATOR GIANARIS: I move to accept the message.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: All those in favor of accepting the message please signify by saying aye.

(Response of "Aye.")

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Opposed, nay.

(Response of "Nay.")

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The message is accepted, and the bill is before the house.

SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill is laid aside.

That completes the reading of the supplemental calendar.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Please go to the reading of the controversial supplemental calendar.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The Secretary will ring the bell.

The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 822, Senate Print 9999, by Senator Serrano, an act making appropriations for the support of government.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator O'Mara, why do you rise?

SENATOR O'MARA: Thank you, Madam President.

Will the sponsor yield for some questions?

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR SERRANO: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The Senator yields.

SENATOR O'MARA: Thank you, Senator.

Here we are, April 22nd, now more than three weeks late on this budget, and we're taking up our sixth extender of the season. This extender, I believe, takes us into Monday.

What is this extender -- what are we extending with this to get us to Monday? And how much new spending is there?

SENATOR SERRANO: Through you,

Madam President. This extender allows for the continuation of our state government short of a fully enacted budget.

You're correct, this is our sixth extender. It takes us through Monday, April 27th. The total amount in this extender is $12.7 billion, which includes an additional 69 million in new spending.

And it covers things like general state charges, payments to the Metropolitan Commuter Transportation Mobility Tax. Department of Health, our WIC and EPIC programs, which are so vital. Department of Labor payments. Office of People with Disability payments. And Department of Veterans' Services and Homeless Veterans Housing payments.

SENATOR O'MARA: Thank you, Senator.

Madam President, if the Senator will continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR SERRANO: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR O'MARA: Thank you.

Senator, are we any closer to a final budget today than we were Monday?

SENATOR SERRANO: Through you, Madam President. Negotiations are still ongoing.

As I mentioned in our previous discussion on Monday, that I think things are moving in the right direction. There is certainly a sense of urgency involved, and all parties are very much interested in closing this down.

But again, as I said, you know, budgets are about priorities. And while it is important to have things done on time, and I'm all about deadlines and so on, it's also I think more important to have a good budget, a budget that reflects the needs of all New Yorkers -- issues involved with economic development, funding for our parks, for arts and culture, for so many different things.

It's really important that we have a very good budget. And we have been moving, I think, steadily towards an agreement, and hopefully we will have that done.

SENATOR O'MARA: Thank you,

Senator.

Madam President, if the Senator will continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the Senator yield?

SENATOR SERRANO: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The Senator yields.

SENATOR O'MARA: Senator, we have a joint budget conference committee set up that we're supposed to follow in the budget process. Are there any joint conference committees scheduled?

SENATOR SERRANO: Through you, Madam President, no.

SENATOR O'MARA: Through you, Madam President, if the Senator will continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR SERRANO: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The Senator yields.

SENATOR O'MARA: Have any table targets been set for the various budget

subcommittees to have something to work with on maybe not the major items of the budget?

SENATOR SERRANO: Through you, Madam President, no.

SENATOR O'MARA: Madam President, will the Senator continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the Senator yield?

SENATOR SERRANO: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The Senator yields.

SENATOR O'MARA: Senator, on the major issues that at least we've been reading about in the news, since we really get no information here, the issues holding it up -- modifications to the CLCPA, auto insurance reform, SEQR process, New York for All, and the ever present pressure to increase taxes -- are any of those major issues solidified in agreement yet?

SENATOR SERRANO: Through you, Madam President. As I mentioned before, there are ongoing discussions on these and many other issues involved in this budget. It is obviously a very complicated task.

But the bill before us does not contain any of those policy issues. The bill before us is an extender to ensure the operation of state government, to provide for some very basic funding to ensure that we meet our needs and obligations as a state. But the policy issues that we read about and that we hear about, those are not before us at this moment.

SENATOR O'MARA: Thank you, Senator.

Madam President, will the Senator continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the Senator yield?

SENATOR SERRANO: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The Senator yields.

SENATOR O'MARA: Senator, this morning I saw on the Empire Reports news website, attributed to the Governor, that she thought we would have a budget on May 19th.

There was really no -- no -- attribution to where that came from. Are you aware of the Governor having taken this position that we're still a month away from the budget?

SENATOR SERRANO: Through you, Madam President. No, I was not aware of that. I have no additional information on that.

SENATOR O'MARA: Okay, thank you.

Madam President, on the bill.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator O'Mara on the bill.

SENATOR O'MARA: Here we are, 22 days late on the budget for the fifth year in a row. It's a concerning process. I really see or feel no sense of urgency on getting this budget wrapped up as close to the constitutional required deadline of April 1st to get a budget done.

You know, we continue to just extend spending, although the Conservative Party of the State of New York, its chairman Gerry Kassar has expressed his gratitude to us because we're not spending any more and there's really no likelihood or expectation that this budget is going to spend less than last year overall or probably in any specific category at all. Spending will be greater.

So the Conservative Party at least feels, you know, we're a month late, we're a

month less of extra spending in the state.

But we really do need to get this budget done. As I talked about earlier in the week, our school budgets -- our school districts have to come out with their budgets to put to the voters in the middle of May. The time for putting those together is rapidly approaching.

And that's just a big problem for our districts, and it will only result in perhaps unnecessary property tax increases, not knowing what the state aid is going to be for these districts.

So we really need to get moving here. And if the Governor is really saying that it's going to be May 19th, you know, that's another month away. And we're getting no information here from the Majority on where any of these major issues, the sticking points, where they stand, what's being proposed, whether there's any language, whether there's any resolution on anything.

And that's just -- it's concerning. So I just implore the majorities and the Governor to -- let's get together and nail this thing out and do what we're supposed to do, our most

important job of the year as elected representatives in the State Legislature, to get this budget done.

Thank you, Madam President.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank you, Senator.

Are there any other Senators wishing to be heard?

Seeing and hearing none, debate is closed.

The Secretary will ring the bell.

Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 15. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator Gianaris.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President, we've agreed to restore this bill to the noncontroversial calendar.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: On consent, the bill is restored to the noncontroversial calendar.

Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar Number 822, voting in the negative: Senator Weik.

Ayes, 57. Nays, 1.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill is passed.

Senator Gianaris, that completes the reading of the controversial calendar.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Okay, let's move back to motions and resolutions.

We will begin with previously adopted Resolution 1699, by Senators Sepúlveda and Stavisky. Please read that resolution's title and call on Senator Stavisky.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1699, by Senator Sepúlveda, memorializing Governor Kathy Hochul to proclaim April 14, 2026, as Bangla New Year Day in the State of New York.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator

Stavisky on the resolution.

SENATOR STAVISKY: Yes, thank you, Madam President.

And thank you to the leader and to Senator Gianaris for bringing this resolution up today.

As was said, April 12th is the New Year for the people from Bangladesh. And we have a long history of folks from Bangladesh, starting in the late 19th century, coming to the United States, particularly to New York City, and to Queens County in particular. In fact, the number that is cited is 10,000 people per year.

And when they arrive in our communities, they very quickly become leaders in both the business community and education, in technology, in healthcare, in arts and literature, et cetera.

And they make an incredible contribution to not only the business, the economy, but also the cultural life of living in New York City's communities.

And in fact I was interested to learn that Bangla is the sixth-most-spoken language in the world. And that is an incredible

number of people who have had a very significant impact on life in the United States.

In 2023, with redistricting, my lines changed, and I represent many people from Bangladesh. And I don't want to leave out a community, but many live in Queens Village, in Floral Park, in Hollis, et cetera.

And they have made not only a significant impact on the community in various areas, but I have found them to be so welcoming. And they have quickly become my friends. We work together on many issues.

And when I mention this to my colleagues, they all shake their heads and say, "Yes!" And that is a quality that is sorely needed.

So we're joined here today in the gallery by a number of leaders in the Bangladesh community, and the foundation -- I apologize -- Muktadhara, known as NRB, led by their leader and founder Saha, who I know is in contact with my office on many occasions, and we work on many issues together.

So Madam President, I hope that you will extend a warm welcome to our guests and

extend all of the privileges to which they are entitled.

Thank you, Madam President.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank you, Senator.

To our guests from the Bangla community, Happy Bangla New Year. I welcome you on behalf of the Senate. We extend to you the privileges and courtesies of this house.

Please rise and be recognized.

(Standing ovation.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The resolution was adopted on March 10th.

Senator Gianaris.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Let's continue with the theme and take up previously adopted Resolution 1846, by Senator Liu, read that resolution's title, and call on Senator Liu.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1846, by Senator Liu, commending the Bangladesh-USA Chamber of Commerce and Industry and USA-Bangladesh Business Links upon the occasion of hosting the 5th Annual Bangladesh Remittance

Fair.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator Liu on the resolution.

SENATOR LIU: Thank you, Madam President.

I want to thank Senator Stavisky for speaking on the preceding resolution and thank Senator Sepúlveda for introducing that resolution.

I also want to thank my colleagues for cosponsoring my resolution today commemorating the great work of the Bangladesh USA Chamber of Commerce and Industry, led also by our friend Bishawjit Saha, who I guess he's on this side, so I can't see him. But -- what's up, Saha?

Anyway, it's -- I think Senator Stavisky already explained a great deal of the immense contributions of the Bangladeshi-American community that we have thriving in Queens, but also in many other parts of the State of New York.

In addition to education, culture, history, and other aspects and strengths that the community brings to the great State of New York,

they clearly bring a great deal of hard work ethic as well, and success in small business and enterprise. And the Chamber of Commerce and Industry is just one of the organizations, perhaps the leading organization that brings together the business community within the Bangladeshi-American community.

And they in turn not only provide for their families here in New York, but also contribute immensely to our economy. And they in turn invest in the motherland, in Bangladesh, where they have remitted billions of dollars over the years. So they in effect contribute to the global economy as well.

I want to thank them for all their hard work and contributions.

And, Madam President, I hope that you can recognize them as well.

Thank you.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank you, Senator.

To the members of the Bangla Chamber of Commerce, I wish you continued success. I welcome you on behalf of the Senate. We extend to you the privileges and courtesies of this

house.

Please, again, rise and be recognized.

(Standing ovation.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The resolution was adopted on April 21st.

Senator Gianaris.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President, next up is previously adopted Resolution 1816, by Senator Stec. Read that resolution's title and call on Senator Stec, please.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1816, by Senator Stec, congratulating the Bolton Central School Boys Varsity Basketball Team and Coach Cody Kober upon the occasion of capturing the Class D State Championship.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator Stec on the resolution.

SENATOR STEC: Thank you, Madam President.

Again, it's always wonderful to greet guests here in the chamber, especially young guests that have reached a significant

achievement as a sports team. The Bolton Boys Class D State Champions are here with us today.

Bolton, for those of you that don't know, is a small town on the west shore of Lake George in Warren County, just up the road from where I live.

A lot of you know -- a lot of the basketball fans here know that most of the time the state championship games are played in Glens Falls. Unfortunately, if there's one downside to this, it's that instead of getting to play in front of a hometown crowd, the championship happened this year in Binghamton.

But they amassed a 26-and-1 record for the year, very impressive. And in the championship game they defeated the Sackets Harbor Patriots, 66 to 49, so it wasn't even close, another North Country team -- right, Senator Walczyk?

SENATOR WALCZYK: Okay.

(Laughter.)

SENATOR STEC: But anyways, it's great to have you all here, and your coaches. A tremendous achievement.

In that championship game, one of

their players, Jace Hubert, scored his career 1,000th point, and that's impressive. But also as impressive is that he joined two other teammates that also scored a thousand for the season, Jaxon Egloff and Liam Foy.

So, you know, it just -- it takes a team. And certainly those individual accolades are nice, but I know that those boys also recognize that they didn't get there alone.

And just briefly, the team that's with us here today: Lance Corey, Jaxon Egloff, Abram Figueroa, Liam Foy, Sam Foy, Jacob French, Will Hens, Jace Hubert, Andy Morehouse, Brendon Pagan, Jack Pfau, Teddy Phelps, John Roemer; Varsity Boys Coach Cody Kober; Assistant Coach Angel Figueroa; Athletic Director Mark Andrejkovics, as well as School Superintendent Chad Shippee.

Chad, don't worry about your budget, we're going to get those numbers to you soon so that you're ready for your budget vote.

But to the boys, again, congratulations on the wonderful season. This is something that you're going to remember for the rest of your lives: How you got there, the work

that you put in, the achievement, the thrill of victory.

I think the only defeat you had was to the Syracuse Orangemen, I heard?

(Laughter.)

SENATOR STEC: So an impressive season. I'm just kidding about that part.

But it's thrilling to have you here with us. Thank you for bringing the team down.

And, Madam President, if you wouldn't mind, please give them the cordialities of the house and share with them your congratulations for a wonderful state championship season.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: To the Bolton Central Boys Basketball Team, congratulations. And to the 1,000-point scorers, congratulations on that feat.

We welcome you on behalf of the Senate. We extend to you the privileges and courtesies of this house. And to your coaches, also, we welcome you.

Please stand and be recognized.

(Standing ovation.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The

resolution was adopted on March 31st.

Senator Gianaris.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Next up, previously adopted Resolution 1395, by Senator Persaud and Senator Harckham. Please read that resolution's title and call on Senator Harckham.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1395, by Senator Persaud, commemorating the 56th Annual Anniversary of Earth Day on April 22, 2026.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Happy Earth Day.

Senator Harckham on the resolution.

SENATOR HARCKHAM: Thank you, Madam President. And thank you for sponsoring this important resolution.

Happy Earth Day, everyone. I want to thank Madam Leader for bringing this resolution forward as well.

You know, Earth Day is a day of renewal. It's a community day. We come together to express our shared and common humanity in projects to clean the environment. Our local

communities pick up trash, do plantings. It's really just a great educational, community-bonding day.

And yet in this chamber we have, I believe, a more serious responsibility on Earth Day. It's our job to set policies to address the challenges we face, which are many.

You know, we talk a lot about emissions, we talk about PFAS, we talk about water quality and water infrastructure funding. We talk about emissions. There are a lot of things that we address in this chamber and have done so in a bipartisan way on many of these issues.

And yet serious issues still remain. The American Lung Association came out with a report yesterday, I believe. And just after having taken a quick look at it, 2 million seniors and children in New York State live with unhealthy levels of air pollution. Two million vulnerable seniors and children in the State of New York still live with dangerous air pollution on a daily basis.

And yet while we should be making progress, here in New York we've canceled NY-Sun,

we've put on hold the All-Electric Buildings Act, we've put on hold the 100-foot rule, we've put on hold cap-and-invest. And now we're talking about rolling back our signature climate law, the CLCPA.

And so I just want to remind folks on this Earth Day that when we talk about these issues -- the CLCPA is not an accounting document. It's a public health document. And we're talking about these 2 million children and seniors who are breathing unhealthy air, and that's why we passed that law.

And so there may be changes to that that come through the budget, I recognize that. But let us all be cognizant, please, that while we have made great progress in this great state and we have a lot of work that we can be proud of on a bipartisan basis, we have so much more work to be done.

And let's not take our focus off what this is about, and that's public health of our children.

I vote aye. Thank you.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank you, Senator.

Senator May on the resolution.

SENATOR MAY: Thank you, Madam President.

All of us celebrated last week when the crew of the Artemis came back from the moon and we saw the beautiful photographs that they took.

And it kept reminding me of that photograph from Apollo 17, in 1972, that's known as the Blue Marble, that beautiful image of the earth taken from space. Which was a very, very powerful image at the time to remind people living on this planet that it is a small planet and what we do here in our communities, in our backyards, has an impact on people in every corner of our planet.

Our atmosphere is a small atmosphere. It is very thin. And we absolutely depend on it for our survival, for agriculture, for any kind of stability that we have in terms of understanding what our climate -- what to expect from our climate and how to live our lives and produce food and have homes that are safe.

And so the work that we're doing to try to address the climate crisis is about

everyone living on this earth and protecting that tiny film of atmosphere that we all need to be responsible for.

I'm very proud of some of the work we did yesterday here, and the work that we are trying to do, and I join Senator Harckham in saying we've got to keep working on this as if our lives depended on it, because they do.

Thank you.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank you.

Senator Martins on the resolution.

SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you, Madam President.

I want to thank the sponsor.

And I want to thank -- you know, I want to thank all the people back home who each and every year take the opportunity to do cleanup on Earth Day.

You know, as you all know, I represent a district that encompasses the North Shore of Nassau County from the Queens line to the Suffolk line. So we have a concerted effort to not only maintain our communities, but specifically those coastal areas that are most

impacted.

You know, and it's really beautiful to watch the community come together in that way. And we should celebrate that in each of our districts.

And then in a broader sense, Madam President, to the point that our colleague just made, yes, we have a responsibility to the environment. I think we all agree to that. We all do. We all live on the same planet, we all breathe the same air, we're all impacted by what happens in other places.

There are no boundaries that limit our exposure to what happens somewhere else.

But I also think we should celebrate the progress that this state has made over time, that our residents have made because of policies that have been in place for decades. This isn't just a new process where we decided to begin to move in the right direction. It's been taking place literally for decades, where we are at a point where our carbon footprint as a state is small. It can be smaller, but it's small.

So let's celebrate the successes that we've had as a state, and then let's

remember that we need to do more.

My concern, Madam President, is that we place artificial dates on things and then we trigger certain consequences.

Now, I would say that our first responsibility in this chamber to our residents is to make sure that they're safe -- make sure that they have heat in the winter, make sure that they have access to energy and electricity, and that when we have natural disasters, storms, hurricanes, nor'easters, that they have access to energy so that they can keep themselves safe.

So in the context of moving forward and continuing our efforts collaboratively, in a bipartisan way, to reach the end goal, let's not lose sight of what the real issue here is.

We will get there together as long as we don't set artificial dates that aren't going to be met for the purpose of virtue signaling that we are somehow doing something beyond what we are able to do. Because our responsibility is, first and foremost, to make sure that those who are most vulnerable in our societies continue to have access to safety in their homes and for their families.

So yeah, we're heading in that direction, and that's the great news. Now, I just read a statistic that we are 15 percent below our carbon footprint just over the last 30 years. So we're getting there. And we'll continue to get there together. But let's not forget that it can't come at the expense of the safety of our residents.

Let's celebrate Earth Day. Congratulations. Thank you to the sponsor.

I vote aye.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank you, Senator.

Senator Sanders on the resolution.

SENATOR SANDERS: Thank you, Madam President.

It is good that we take a day where we speak of the earth, our shared heritage, and we say the things that we need to ensure that we're making it work.

We're celebrating at a unique time, of course, where we're -- some are talking about weakening the goals that we have set. And it puts a strange place for us to be celebrating Earth Day.

I want to remind people that there is no Plan B. There is no Planet B. If we don't get this one right, all of these words that we've used of -- that we'll be a little slower, we'll get there, may ring very hollow to our children and grandchildren when they say, Why didn't you go with science? Why didn't you accept that the conditions are moving faster than you anticipate?

I also want to take a moment to thank the people of my district who have come out and they did a beach cleanup. From one end of the Rockaways to the other end, we did a beach cleanup. I had every intention to be with these people. I did not know that we would be struggling with the budget at that time.

But they're doing excellent work with trying, at a local place, to ensure that we do our part for the earth.

Thank you, Madam President.

And to all my fellow earthlings, bless you, Science.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank you, Senator.

Senator Rolison on the resolution.

SENATOR ROLISON: Thank you,

Madam President.

I want to thank the sponsors for this resolution.

I would say that every day is Earth Day. And that it started on April 22, 1970, Madam President. And as we've heard in the chamber today, and we'll continue to hear, we've done a lot and there's a lot of work to be done to help this earth.

But I wanted to preface my comments today, Madam President, on all the great work that is done throughout this great state, but in the 39th District where there are Earth Day cleanups going on continually in the next week or so.

And the fact that we're teaching our children about Earth Day and understanding what it means every day.

And I'm a little bummed because I didn't bring the book that I bought for my granddaughter Alena in the gift shop, which says "My Very First Earth Day," which I'm going to give her this weekend so she can understand what Earth Day means at age 4.

And we have that responsibility to

teach. We also have the responsibility to clean up and to do the things that make our neighborhoods and communities look better, feel better.

And as Senator Harckham talked about the statistics that we have in this state when it comes to all the issues related to health, especially in children -- and we have those issues in Dutchess County with asthma rates. It is something that we need to continue to focus on, because of the prevailing winds from the New York metropolitan area that affect Dutchess more than Ulster. Most people don't know that.

But again, getting back to the 39th District -- and I'm just going to throw this out to my colleagues today -- we started something called the 7-minute cleanup. I'm just going to leave with this. You can clean a lot in 7 minutes, and we've encouraged people to do that in front of their homes, in front of their stores. Seven minutes can keep a block, a street, and a neighborhood clean.

So we're going to be talking more about that 7-minute cleanup.

But on Earth Day, again, I wanted to

thank the sponsors of this, I want to thank this chamber for the work that they do. And again, Madam President, every day is Earth Day.

Thank you.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank you, Senator.

Senator Hinchey on the resolution.

SENATOR HINCHEY: Thank you, Madam President.

I rise to thank the sponsors of this resolution for bringing this forward to celebrate Earth Day, but to also give us an opportunity to talk about the incredible things that we are doing in this chamber to support our planet for generations to come.

The Hudson Valley was the birthplace of the modern environmental movement. Before it was in the lexicon of everyone's discussion, people were doing the work to actually elevate the importance of protecting our planet and our waterways and our soil and our air.

People like Manna Jo Greene, who I had the honor of honoring for Women's History Month through the LWC this year. People like Pete Seeger and Riverkeeper and Clearwater, the

folks who founded those two great organizations. People who were battling corporate greed for the betterment of our communities, our societies, and for that next generation.

If you talk to younger people today, high school students, Gen Z, they'll tell you one of the major reasons why they feel completely disaffected from government, from politics, is because of the state of the climate and the planet. That's what they say.

They feel like they won't have a planet to live on. They're not even sure if they can plan for a family. They don't know if they can have kids in the future because we don't know what Planet Earth will look like in 15, 20 or 100 years from now.

These are the conversations that people are having today. And while it might feel strange and uncomfortable that that's the reality and it's easier to dismiss that as just people being hyperbolic, that is true. Many of us are concerned about what the future is going to hold.

And so while Earth Day is a day where we can all stand up together and support the incredible work that we do on a bipartisan

basis, it's also really important to recognize that these are real fears that people have.

The work that we do, whether it's through the CLCPA or trying to shift to a clean energy economy that actually makes things cheaper, energy cheaper for folks -- I actually was just meeting with the head of a large financial institution who, unprompted, told us that renewable energy was cheaper and they were actually helping invest in that because it's better for their clients.

When we actually push those things forward, we have to understand what we're actually fighting for here. It's not virtue-signaling to our constituents and to advocacy groups. We're actually trying to make sure that we have a planet and a future to live for.

So I thank the sponsors of this resolution. And I am hopeful that through the rest of this session and beyond, we can really understand what people are facing in this moment when we're talking about the climate crisis.

Thank you.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank

you, Senator.

The resolution was adopted on January 21st.

Senator Gianaris.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you, Madam President.

Let's move on to previously adopted Resolution 1927, by Senator Salazar, read that resolution's title and call on Senator Salazar.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1927, by Senator Salazar, memorializing Governor Kathy Hochul to proclaim April 19-25, 2026, as Crime Victims' Rights Week in the State of New York.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator Salazar on the resolution.

SENATOR SALAZAR: Thank you, Madam President.

This resolution marks this week as Crime Victims' Rights Week in the State of New York consistent with National Crime Victims Rights Week.

It is a recognition that represents

our renewed commitment to every New Yorker who has been harmed, who has sought justice, and who deserves to be heard.

This year's national theme is Listen, Act, Advocate. I want to emphasize those words for a moment, because they cannot be abstract. They must be a call to action.

What do we mean by "listen" in this context? Far too often, survivors of crime are spoken about, rather than spoken with and heard. They navigate court systems that were not designed with them in mind.

We have processes that make it complicated for victims to access the support they need, whether that is legal support, financial, psychological, or medical support.

Survivors are asked to relive the worst moments of their lives in cold, bureaucratic settings. They are told their cases have been closed, their perpetrators released, their benefits exhausted, with little explanation and without compassion.

Listening means building systems where survivors have a real voice, not just a case number.

To act. Awareness without action is hollow. Action looks like investing in services, streamlining access, and removing every barrier between a survivor and the support they are owed.

An aspect more difficult for our society to reckon with is how often incarcerated individuals are survivors of crime themselves, now part of a cycle of violence. Providing responsible parties, when a crime is committed, with rehabilitative opportunities is critical to ensuring that they properly heal, transition back into society, contribute positively to our communities, and end these perpetual cycles of harm.

We've made progress as a state in our efforts to address the needs of New Yorkers impacted by crime. In 2019 we passed the Domestic Violence Survivors Justice Act. However, we've seen many cases in which this important law has not been applied as intended to support survivors.

That same year, we also passed the Child Victims Act, modifying the statute of limitations for New Yorkers who survived sexual abuse as a minor.

This year, the Fair Access to Victim Compensation Act went into effect, eliminating certain arbitrary barriers that survivors faced in seeking financial compensation.

To advocate is needed because there's clearly so much more for us to do. It is the responsibility of each of us in this chamber to advocate for change. Change like through the Survivors First Act, which would remove even more obstacles that victims face when seeking compensation to recover from harm they've experienced. Legislation that would improve the level of support provided to survivors during the interview process by law enforcement.

We must also step up to empower our victim services organizations. Currently many of them are being threatened by the federal government, punished for their work specifically in serving certain communities -- namely, immigrant survivors of crime and LGBTQ individuals. Many have already seen their federal funding cut.

New York must reject these blatant attacks and instead take opportunities to fill those funding gaps. It is what is required of us

so that victims of domestic violence, of sexual assault, of hate crimes, of gun violence, and especially those of them who are of marginalized identities will no longer feel alone.

To every survivor who might hear these words, you deserve a system that sees you. You deserve to have your voice centered in our pursuit of justice.

I urge my colleagues to support this resolution and, more importantly, to carry its spirit into the legislative work ahead of us.

Thank you, Madam President.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank you, Senator.

Senator Murray on the resolution.

SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you, Madam President.

And I thank Senator Salazar for bringing this resolution to the floor.

Some of the words in the speech -- I didn't write a speech for this because I think if there is ever a subject that should come from the heart, I think it's this. I think it's how we look at, think of, deal with victims of crime.

Let's look at the two sides when

there is a crime. You have the criminal, the one that did the act, a conscious choice to violate someone else. You have the victim, who had no choice. A victim who doesn't want to be a victim, who never would want that.

During my colleague's speech just now it was mentioned that some of those in prison now were victims themselves. And that amazes me, because if there was ever someone that should know what impact crime has on a victim, it should be them. And yet they chose to do it anyway.

You know, we -- it's Crime Victims' Rights Week. I think, personally, every hour of every day, of every week, of every month, of every year we should be thinking about those victims and how we can help them.

We -- let me preface this by saying I don't think anyone purposefully is trying to hurt anyone or does this out of any animosity or anything. I think it's a case where we just don't think about it.

So on the agenda today we have a bill that expunges convictions, another one that addresses inmates' efforts to reduce their prison time. Another one, that I actually think is a

pretty good bill, that gives vocational training to the inmates.

Some would think, Well, what's that have to do with victims? And if you asked that question, then you don't know. If you asked that question, you haven't been listening. You haven't talked to a victim. Because everything we do in this body, every piece of legislation we pass that reduces a sentence or does this or that, or moves parole sooner, impacts those victims.

This past Sunday -- every year when National Crime Victims' Rights Week comes up, it's kicked off by vigils that are held all over, and I attend those every year. If I had one wish, it would be that every policymaker and every lawmaker in this state would have to attend that vigil.

I attended it this year. And what they'll do is they'll tell their stories. And this particular group was the parents and other survivors of murdered crime victims. When you hear these stories, it breaks your heart. And then you listen to them reading off the names -- 600 names just in the vigil I was at in

Suffolk County. Think about that.

And every name on that list is not just a name, it's someone that had loved ones, family members, a spouse, children, someone -- or people that loved them, that cared for them. And now they don't have them. Why? Because someone decided to take their life. Someone made the conscious decision to end their life.

And they don't -- it doesn't end with the crime. In fact, unfortunately for the loved ones, that's where it starts. That's where the pain starts. It doesn't go away.

And so every time the convicted criminal goes for parole and it's denied and then they want to -- we want to give them an appeal. And then we want to move up the next parole hearing.

But what you're forgetting is every parole hearing, every time that comes up, the victims have to relive it. And I assure you they don't wake up that morning and say, Oh, I think I'll tell my story today. No. They're putting that testimony together.

As my colleague said, they have to go before this cold bureaucratic group of people

they don't know and tell the most intimate, painful story of their lives, to fight to keep the person that took their loved one from getting out.

What I would say is this. I just ask this, and I just wish this. Just consider them. Every day we should do what this week is about. We should think about the crime victims and the impact that what we do here has on them. Because I promise you, I promise you, it impacts them.

I want to thank Leader Ortt and my colleague Senator Rolison. Leader Ortt approved, I guess you would say, us having crime victims roundtables across the state over the past few months, where we met with law enforcement, district attorneys, crime victims, advocates groups. But most importantly, we met with victims and listened to them.

And I've got to tell you, it was amazing to hear some of these stories but to also hear some of the things that they say they experienced that never crossed my mind. We didn't even think about it. But it gave us the fuel to move forward. We're going to be

releasing a report about all of the information that we got from that.

And it's the Victims First Agenda, because the victims need to come first. That should be our first thought: How will it impact them? And I hope we'll read this report, I hope we'll consider what policy changes or what things that we can do here to help give them -- they'll never completely get peace. But to just help a little and to send the message that it's not just Crime Victims' Rights Week, it's every day. Every day we will hear you, we will consider you, we will think of you.

So with that, I thank the sponsor again for bringing the resolution to the floor.

Madam President, I proudly vote aye.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank you, Senator.

Senator Martins on the resolution.

SENATOR MARTINS: Madam President, I have nothing left to say. I want to thank my colleague for his thoughts. I think he was extraordinarily eloquent.

I add my own comments to his and would just urge our colleagues, when we decide to

pass laws in this chamber that sometimes don't prioritize our victims, that we think twice about the opportunities that we have to give justice to victims and their families in the context of other things that sometimes we're trying to achieve.

Thank you, Madam President. I vote aye.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank you, Senator.

The resolution was adopted on April 21st.

SENATOR GIANARIS: I guess my colleague had something left to say after all, Madam President.

Next up, previously adopted Resolution 1925, by Senator Hinchey. Please read that resolution's title and call on Senator Hinchey.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1925, by Senator Hinchey, memorializing Governor Kathy Hochul to proclaim May 2026 as Lyme Disease Awareness Month in the State of New York.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator Hinchey on the resolution.

SENATOR HINCHEY: Thank you, Madam President.

If you spend any time outdoors, you know that Lyme disease and other tick-borne illnesses are a major threat. And we have a responsibility to drive up public awareness and promote early detection.

While the Hudson Valley has historically been a hotspot for Lyme, we are now seeing it in nearly every corner of New York State, and it's on the rise. Tick submissions have jumped 145 percent in a single year, according to the Upstate Tick Testing Laboratory. And SUNY researchers are predicting an early and tick-heavy season this year because of rising temperatures.

And that is true. We're already seeing it -- we're doing this resolution today, in the end of April, because May has become actually too late for Lyme and tick-borne disease awareness for anyone in our communities.

Because of the warm weather that we had just about a week ago, ticks were prevalent

everywhere. Personally, in one day, I pulled three ticks off my dog as they were running through the woods.

If you talk to anyone in our communities, they've already had major run-ins with wood ticks and deer ticks, kind of in every corner of our state.

And this year is going to be especially bad because of the winter that we had. Some people may think that because of the freezing temperatures it would actually be a better year with fewer insects and fewer ticks. But because of the amount of snow that we had, it actually insulated the ground -- which means this year we are going to have even more bugs, more insects, and more ticks than we would in any other season, or we have in seasons past.

We have to be aware of what happens and what we're looking for when we're spending time outside. We live in one of the most beautiful places in the world. We want to enjoy our forests and our parks, we want to spend time outdoors with our pets. We need to be able to keep each other and ourselves safe.

In New York, our state averages over

17,500 new Lyme cases a year, and many of them are actually undetected. And it's not just Lyme anymore, it's other tick-borne diseases as well. We just saw the rise of something called alpha-gal that our agencies are looking into. It feels like we're constantly being bombarded with new tick-borne illnesses.

A study by the Cary Institute found that more than 38 percent of tested ticks were carrying pathogens for at least one of these diseases. And nearly 11 percent of tested ticks were positive for both Lyme and babesiosis at the end of that study.

Prevention right now is the best protection for tick-born diseases and prevention, and that starts with awareness. So if you are spending time outside, make sure that you're wearing long pants, that you're wearing bright colors. Don't wear black, because the ticks will blend in. And always do a tick check when you come in from outdoors. Also check your pets.

And if you do find a tick, make sure to remove it immediately. And you have to really dig in there and get the head because otherwise it stays. Ticks are really -- really disgusting.

So make sure that you're checking your pets and yourself. Monitor the area, if you find a tick, for 30 days. And make sure that you are spreading this information to your friends and neighbors so we can keep more people safe from Lyme disease and tick-borne illnesses across our state.

Thank you very much.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank you, Senator.

Senator Ryan on the resolution.

SENATOR RYAN: Thank you, Madam President.

Thank you, Senator Hinchey, for bringing this resolution forward.

I rise to support May as the Lyme Awareness Month, certainly a time to raise awareness, encourage prevention, and support so many New Yorkers who are dealing with this very terrible disease.

Obviously Lyme disease is the most common tick-borne illness. But here in New York it's something that tragically too many families know firsthand. So as Senator Hinchey pointed out, prevention is key.

But we also want to recognize the people who are living with Lyme disease and the challenges that they face every day getting diagnosed, treated, and hopefully recovering.

So earlier this season the Senate passed my bill, Senate Bill 4816, to help ensure that workers exposed to tick-borne illness on the job can access the care that they need.

And I'm certainly optimistic and hopeful that the Assembly will pass that bill so we can continue strengthening the support for those that are the greatest at risk.

And lastly, I would be remiss if I did not recognize the hard work being done back home in the 50th Senate District by the hardworking group at the CNY Lyme and Tick-Borne Disease Alliance.

Thank you. I vote aye.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank you, Senator.

The resolution was adopted on April 21st.

Senator Gianaris.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you, Madam President.

Now let's move to previously adopted Resolution 1864, by Senator Rolison, have that resolution's title read and call on Senator Rolison.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1864, by Senator Rolison, memorializing Governor Kathy Hochul to proclaim April 2026 as Pet Cruelty Awareness Month in the State of New York, in conjunction with the observance of National Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Month.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator Rolison on the resolution.

SENATOR ROLISON: Thank you, Madam President.

I want to thank the chamber for allowing me to introduce this resolution on a topic, quite frankly, that is heartbreaking.

Like many of you, we watch TV. And when my wife and I are watching TV, of course our dog Madison is with us. And most of you know how we feel about our dog. We adore her, we love her, and she is so important to Lori and I.

And invariably there's always

advertisements and public awareness of cruelty to animals on TV -- asking for help, asking for funding. And we have to change that immediately; I cannot look at those animals that they are showing us who don't have it like our dog, who are not cared for, who are abused and neglected.

And so when we talk about Animal Cruelty Month, there are people that are actually doing the work to help these animals.

And animal cruelty, Madam President, is defined as the infliction of unjustifiable pain, suffering or death upon an animal, either through intentional abuse or neglect. It includes physical violence, starvation, abandonment, chronic tethering, lack of proper shelter, and organized fighting.

I know that goes on, Madam President, but I have an extremely hard time in accepting it at all. And there are individuals who are dedicated to the protection of animals who do that as their work, as their career. We need to acknowledge them for what they do, because quite frankly most of us could not do that.

But we want them to do that,

Madam President. And without their dedication -- and that's a love of animals, individuals that do this work, whether in the shelters, ASPCA officers, animal control officers, individuals who take animals in to foster them. They're doing the work that our communities need.

On April 10th I had the opportunity to visit a facility that was built in my district in the Town of Pawling. And it's the ASPCA New York Operations Recovery & Rehabilitation Center, which opened last fall.

This facility cost $38 million to construct. It is the primary shelter for abused dogs that come out of New York City through the NYPD. Currently it has 60 dogs there. It can handle 80, and at some point they will have 80. And these are all part of animal cruelty cases, active animal cruelty cases by the NYPD and other agencies.

This center employs 67 individuals. It has a veterinary clinic and all medically available services for those dogs.

Now, it was designed and constructed using the latest technology infrastructure by specialized architects that only do this work.

It is an amazing, amazing place for those dogs.

And, Madam President, I got to tour that facility and to see the work that they're doing. And I met a dog in one of the staff rooms, and her name was Coco. And Coco had been seized by the NYPD in an animal cruelty case. And I don't know the specifics, because of course I didn't want to know.

But she was underneath like a cubicle in a staff office, intently looking at me because she didn't know who I was. And you tell through her eyes that she was looking at me sort of suspiciously: Who is this guy?

And all the staff people, of course, she knows them. And she's with them because they are working on getting her to a point where she can be with other people and maybe someday can be adopted.

And just -- and I'll end with this, Madam President, is that the love and the care that I saw that day in Pawling was so heartfelt. And when I left there -- as difficult as it may have been to go in, walking out I felt pretty darn good, because those dogs are being cared for and rehabilitated.

And they have seen unspeakable horrors. And they can't stand up for themselves, Madam President. They need others to do that.

So with this resolution, and this particular month, we are saying thank you to the individuals that do that work and will continue to do the work.

And I am also very proud of this chamber and the members who support that. We have passed bills in this chamber to protect animals, and that is something that we all can be proud of.

Thank you, Madam President. And of course I proudly vote aye on this resolution.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank you, Senator.

Senator Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick on the resolution.

SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK: Thank you, Madam President.

I want to thank my friend Senator Rolison for bringing this resolution to the floor to recognize April as National Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Month.

There's a lot of common themes here

today. We just heard about ticks and checking our pets for ticks, which is a serious issue, especially where I live. And then we also have to acknowledge the fact that there's a connection between cruelty to animals and domestic violence, cruelty to humans.

And there's -- so there's a common theme today. I'm very proud of our chamber today for recognizing these issues.

I'm a proud cosponsor of this resolution, and I'm even a prouder dog mom to Oreo and Biscuit, who are truly a part of my family. We kind of have a joke at home that if, God forbid, we ever had a fire, my daughters would save the dogs before they saved their sisters and their brother, because that's how important they are to us.

It's really remarkable, as Senator Rolison referred to the people that are doing the work. I want to give a shout-out to Posh Pets in Long Beach. Within the last few months they took on 40 or so animals from an abandoned home, and it was well above the number of animals that they could take on.

I happened to be in the area, and I

stopped by with blankets and sheets and things that they needed. And the director looked at me and broke down and cried and was so happy to see me and support the work that she was doing.

And it was a really powerful moment because all I did was show up. She was there taking care of a dog that was horribly matted and in pain. And it took so long to shave this animal that really had been so horribly abused.

Animal cruelty is not just an issue of neglect; it's a serious public safety concern. And research shows that connection. The Humane World for Animals said that 71 percent of domestic violence victims in one survey reported that the abuser also targeted their pets.

And in another study -- suspected child abuse -- when they were watching those families they said 88 percent of those families under supervision for physical abuse of children were also found to have abused their pets.

And that's why this resolution is so important. Because by recognizing it, we're sending a strong message that abuse of any kind will not be tolerated. We need to have stronger protections, enforcement and education. This

resolution gives a voice to the voiceless, and that is so powerful.

New Yorkers care deeply about the welfare of their animals, whether they be furry, feathery, or even scaly, and we need to make sure that we raise awareness and encourage reporting, compassion, and prevention.

So thank you again to the sponsor.

Thank you, Madam President. I proudly vote aye.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank you, Senator.

The resolution was adopted on April 21st.

Senator Gianaris.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President, all of today's resolutions are open for cosponsorship.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The resolutions are open for cosponsorship. Should you choose not to be a cosponsor, please notify the desk.

Senator Gianaris.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Please take up the calendar.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 236, Assembly Print Number 3126B, by Assemblymember Lunsford, an act to amend the Executive Law.

SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Lay it aside.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 290, Senate Print 3974A, by Senator Sepúlveda, an act to amend the Correction Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 9. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 290, voting in the negative are Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Murray,

Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Skoufis, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

Ayes, 37. Ayes, 21.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 350, Senate Print 985A, by Senator Brouk, an act to amend the Tax Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect on the first day of the sales tax quarterly period.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 384, Senate Print 940, by Senator Sanders, an act to amend the Social Services Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect on the 180th day after it shall have become a law.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 541, Senate Print 2393, by Senator Persaud, an act to amend the General Business Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect on the 90th day after it shall have become a law.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce

the results.

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 587, Senate Print 329A, by Senator Bailey, an act to amend the Criminal Procedure Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect on the 60th day after it shall have become a law.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 587, voting in the negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

Ayes, 37. Nays, 21.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill

is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 596, Senate Print 1946, by Senator Rivera, an act to amend the Criminal Procedure Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect on the 180th day after it shall have become a law.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 596, voting in the negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martinez, Martins, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

Ayes, 36. Nays, 22.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

616, Senate Print 5110A, by Senator Scarcella-Spanton, an act to amend the Penal Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 621, Senate Print 4357, by Senator Bailey, an act to amend the Correction Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This act shall take effect on the 180th day after it shall have become a law.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 656, Senate Print 3460, by Senator Gounardes, an act to amend the Labor Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect on the 60th day after it shall have become a law.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 656, voting in the negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

Ayes, 37. Nays, 21.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 664, Senate Print 4464A, by Senator Mayer, an act to amend the General Municipal Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This act shall take effect on the 180th day after it shall have become a law.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 664, voting in the negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello, Griffo, Murray, Oberacker, Ortt, Stec, Walczyk and Weik. Also Senator O'Mara.

Ayes, 48. Nays, 10.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 675, Assembly Print Number 8305, by

Assemblymember Berger, an act to amend the Civil Practice Law and Rules.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect on the 60th day after it shall have become a law.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 683, Senate Print 7974, by Senator Gonzalez, an act to amend the General Business Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 683, voting in the negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello, Helming, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

Ayes, 43. Nays, 15.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill is passed.

Senator Gianaris, that completes the reading of today's calendar.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Let's move on to the controversial calendar, please.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The Secretary will ring the bell.

The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 236, Assembly Bill Number 3126B, by Assemblymember Lunsford, an act to amend the Executive Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator Rhoads, why do you rise?

SENATOR RHOADS: Madam President, I was hoping the sponsor would yield to what

hopefully will be only a few questions.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes, of course.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you, madam President. Through you, of course.

Senator Skoufis, my understanding is the general purpose of the bill is to increase transparency so that people who make complaints actually can receive information regarding the complaints that they've made back, so that they know that there's some sort of response. Correct?

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you, Madam President, yes, that's correct.

SENATOR RHOADS: Okay. And will the sponsor continue to yield?

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the sponsor yield?

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR RHOADS: It's also my

understanding -- through you, Madam President -- that this applies to the State Energy Conservation Code, the Uniform Fire Prevention and Building Code, and the Local Building Code, is that correct?

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you, Madam President, yes, that's correct.

SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor continue to yield?

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the sponsor yield?

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR RHOADS: And through you, Madam President, this would include violations of village, town or other localities' building codes as well, correct?

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes, that's correct.

SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the sponsor yield?

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR RHOADS: And through you, Madam President. This applies -- it's my understanding this applies to orders to remedy notices of violations as well as actual violations themselves that are issued by any local department, correct.

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes, that is correct.

SENATOR RHOADS: And will the sponsor continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the sponsor yield?

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The Senator yields.

SENATOR RHOADS: Through you, Madam President. Are there any provisions in this legislation that -- I'll withdraw that question, actually, and ask a different one.

Through you, Madam President. Does this bill dictate the form in which those notices are to be sent to the complainants?

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,

Madam President, yes. The form that's required is mail, certified or registered.

SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor yield to --

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Or in person. Sorry.

SENATOR RHOADS: Okay. Will the sponsor yield to another question?

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the sponsor yield?

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR RHOADS: And would this be done -- I know it's got to be certified mail. But would this be done through correspondence, through actual copies of violation notices?

What information would actually be sent?

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you, Madam President. The bill does not prescribe.

SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor yield to another question.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.
ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The sponsor yields.
SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you, Madam President. Through you, of course.
Would the complainant's information be included if it's sent by letter? Would the complainant's information be included on the actual letter?
SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you, Madam President, the bill does not prescribe. But the Secretary may promulgate regulations that speak to that.
SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor yield to another question?
ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the sponsor yield?
SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.
ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The sponsor yields.
SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you, Madam President. Through you.
Are there any provisions within the law that would actually exempt correspondence with the claimant directly from FOIL?

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you, madam President, there is no exemption in the bill.

SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you, Madam President. On the bill.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator Rhoads on the bill.

SENATOR RHOADS: I certainly understand the premise and the purpose of the -- the premise and the purpose of the legislation so that complainants actually receive some comfort by the fact that they know that their complaints are being heard and responded to.

My concern, however, is that without the protections of an exemption from FOIL that information concerning complainants, which is typically excluded from being received by the building owner, may become subject to FOIL due to the absence of any FOIL exception being put in play within the legislation that we're sponsoring today.

For that reason, I'll be voting no. I would encourage my colleagues to do the same.

Thank you, Madam President.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank

you, Senator.

Senator Martins, why do you rise?

SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you, Madam President. If the sponsor would yield to a few questions.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR MARTINS: Would this legislation apply to all municipalities -- local municipalities, villages, towns and cities?

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you, Madam President, yes.

SENATOR MARTINS: Through you, Madam President, if the sponsor would continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the sponsor yield?

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR MARTINS: Including the City of New York?

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you, Madam President, yes.

SENATOR MARTINS: Madam President, through you, if the sponsor would continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the sponsor yield?

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR MARTINS: Is there a consequence to a municipality not complying with this legislation?

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you, Madam President, an Article 78 remedy could exist, much as it does with many other similar types of laws.

SENATOR MARTINS: Through you, Madam President, if the sponsor would continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the sponsor yield?

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The Senator yields.

SENATOR MARTINS: Sure. Of course there's an Article 78 if someone's willing to go through that process.

But is there any consequence to either the municipality's action in enforcing the code or any consequence with regard to a separate intervention by a complainant who doesn't receive notice?

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you, Madam President. On the first, this bill doesn't speak to the first. And there's certainly plenty of other sections of the law that do speak to proper enforcement of the code. This bill, as my colleague knows, speaks simply to notice of resolution.

And again, there are no penalties prescribed in this bill. But certainly most of us in this chamber have faith that our municipalities, all of whom have legal counsel, are going to follow this and other municipal laws.

SENATOR MARTINS: Through you, Madam President, if the sponsor would continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the

sponsor yield?

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR MARTINS: So the language of the bill speaks to -- you know, uses the term "initially" when referencing whoever the complainant happens to be. Is this limited to just that first complaint that is received with regard to a property? Or is there a responsibility to issue certified mailings to every person who issues a complaint that results in the issuance of an enforcement action by a municipality?

SENATOR SKOUFIS: The intention -- and I believe the bill does read this way -- is to apply to any and all complaints, not just a first of what could be multiple complaints.

SENATOR MARTINS: Madam President, through you, if the sponsor would continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the sponsor yield?

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The

sponsor yields.

SENATOR MARTINS: And with respect to the notice requirements of this bill, is there anything in this bill that requires that the municipality provide that notice prior to issuing the violation, simultaneously with issuing the violation, or subsequent to issuing the violation?

Is there any time frame in this bill within which the municipality would have to issue the notice to the complainant?

SENATOR SKOUFIS: There are two requirements in this bill. One is a copy of the actual complaint, and the second is a resolution.

On the first, there is no prescription of timing. On the second, there's no prescription, but certainly if it is speaking to a resolution, it would be subsequent to any determined resolution.

SENATOR MARTINS: Through you, Madam President, if the sponsor would continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the sponsor yield?

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The Senator yields.

SENATOR MARTINS: So I know you, like I, have many local municipalities in our districts, and certainly there are hundreds across the state.

Were there any municipalities that reached out to you and asked you to sponsor this as a way of addressing a concern that they may have?

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you, Madam President. No specific municipality requested this bill, no.

SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you, Madam President. Through you, if the sponsor would continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the sponsor yield?

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR MARTINS: Did you reach out to any of the municipalities in your district and ask them whether they thought it was a good idea and a good use of public resources to require

that they have to send these notices out by certified mail, return receipt requested, and to then use and occupy time from their staff in doing so?

Did any of your municipalities in your district tell you that they thought this was a good idea?

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you, Madam President. I'll answer that in a little bit of a different way.

There are many municipal leaders who are very much aware of this bill, and none of them reached out to me expressing concern or opposition to this bill.

And I think I know where my colleague is going with this. Certified mail is about $6. And I thought this line of questioning might have come from the previous debater, and so I looked up Glen Cove. And in Glen Cove there are about 600, maybe a little bit north of 600 annual complaints, building code complaints that are filed with the city.

And given, again, there are two notices here, not one, we're talking about 1200 correspondences. And that assumes they're

all in mail; they can be, again, in person. And so we're talking about $7200.

The City of Glen Cove's budget -- and again, this is representative of all the municipalities around the state that we're talking about here. The City of Glen Cove's budget is about $70 million. And so $7200 over that much larger sum of money amounts to 0.01 percent of the budget.

And the reason why this is important -- through you, Madam President -- is that someone who files a complaint in many cases, if not most cases, is filing a complaint because they themselves or their residents -- sorry, they, their families, or their residents are endangered by the alleged issue in the neighboring units or the neighboring property.

And we heard yesterday, you know, one of our colleagues expressed interest in Sharia law. In Sharia law, the premise of their building regulations is do no harm. In New York State, our Building Code's premise is certainly to protect those in that residence, to protect first responders who may enter that residence, and to protect the neighbors of that residence.

And if there is an illegal natural gas hookup, if there is an overloaded electrical box, if there's hazardous waste on a neighboring property, that does not just endanger the residents of that property, but it could potentially endanger the residents of neighboring units or the neighboring properties as well.

And so it is critically important that those who file these complaints do hear back and are provided notice as to whether that potentially dangerous situation and problem is resolved.

That's what this bill calls for. Again, it is a minuscule percentage in mailing literally a postage item in any building department's budget, certainly in any municipal budget. And for that reason, it is worth the pennies that it would cost.

SENATOR MARTINS: Madam President, through you, if the sponsor would continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the sponsor yield?

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The

sponsor yields.

SENATOR MARTINS: So in many instances people who call and complain with regard to a condition on the block -- maybe someone hasn't mowed their lawn, whatever the case may be -- maybe they left their garbage pail out overnight when it was only supposed to come out the morning -- they will call and they'll make a complaint, and they'd rather not leave their address or their identifying information, they would just like the municipality to address the issue.

How does your bill square away with that? Is there an obligation, then, on the municipality who's receiving the complaint to insist upon getting an address and a way of contacting the complainant so as to send out a certified mailing and comply with the requirements here?

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Most complaint forms that I've seen do include contact information.

And so what this bill calls for I don't think would lead to, would result in, you know, any amendments to existing forms. Maybe

there are some that I've not seen around the state that don't.

But the ones that I've seen do include a field for contact information. Because oftentimes not only -- even if a municipality, which many if not most do not provide for notice of resolution, oftentimes a building department, code enforcement officers will need to follow up with the complainant for additional information.

And so I believe that's why they seek that contact information on those complaint forms.

SENATOR MARTINS: Madam President, through you, if the sponsor would continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the sponsor yield?

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR MARTINS: So are you familiar with the fact that not every municipality has a policy requiring a written complaint form be filled out, and that oftentimes -- and frankly, probably most of the

time -- the complaints actually come in by phone, by people who although they have a concern, do not want to leave their name, they'd rather remain anonymous?

And so my question is, is there a concern or is there a requirement of this bill, since it requires that they be notified in a certain way -- certified mail to their address, even though they may want to remain anonymous -- is there a concern or a requirement in this bill that they have to provide their contact information?

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you, Madam President, I am aware that some municipalities have even a hotline, if not certainly just a general phone number that people can call in to, to make complaints.

My understanding is that many of those municipalities that have that opportunity to file complaints through nonwritten means do still request for contact information when someone does call in.

Certainly, you know, I think this bill, if enacted, and the Assembly did pass this bill for the first time this session, may well

lead to building departments collecting contact information if they were not already checking contact information. It's a fair question.

There's nothing that prevents the Secretary, in promulgating regulations, from redactions or exemptions from FOIL. That is something that your colleague raised in the previous debate that I think is a fair point and one that we can work with the Secretary on following enactment.

SENATOR MARTINS: Through you, Madam President, if the sponsor would continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the sponsor yield?

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR MARTINS: You opened up the possibility during our discussion here, you know, and for purposes of creating a record, I want to be clear.

And it's important certainly to people who are out there complaining about something and a condition in their neighborhood

who do not want to leave a name.

Would this then prevent the municipality from acting upon a complaint where the complainant would not leave their name or their contact information, and therefore not put an obligation on the community to -- or the municipality to address that complaint?

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you, Madam President, no.

SENATOR MARTINS: Okay.

Madam President, on the bill.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator Martins on the bill.

SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you, Senator Skoufis.

So look, the City of Glen Cove, a $70 million budget, 600 I guess violations or ordinance violations issued. I'm glad you picked Glen Cove. Great. The reality is, as I'm sure everybody in the room knows, Glen Cove is in my district, so it's pretty convenient. And kudos to you, Senator Skoufis, for picking that as well.

But that doesn't mean that the number of people who actually filed complaints

with regard to those were 600 people. It could literally be thousands of people who are then obligated to be put on notice by certified mail. It doesn't speak to the multiplier of $6 for certified mail.

And I assure all of you, and certainly the sponsor, that there's nobody in municipal government that's sitting on their hands waiting for something to do because they don't have anything to do and they'd like to occupy their time by filling out certified mail mailings to people who frankly may not even want it.

Now, our municipalities are obligated to do these things, and they will investigate and they will proceed as they see fit. The idea of adding layers of bureaucracy and cost to our municipalities -- and to what end?

And what's most interesting here, for me, is if they just choose not to. They're not going to do it. They're not going to send out the certified mail, and somebody will bring an Article 78 to compel them to do so. Okay, that's not a threat, realistically.

So let's understand what it is we're doing here, just adding another layer and another obligation for someone to send out mailings if they get a complaint, there'll be confusion as to whether or not they need to get the person's name or address in order to put them on notice.

And sometimes -- sometimes enough is enough. So it's not about the 600 mailings or the 6,000 mailings and the $6 per mailing. It really is about what is it that we're trying to address here?

Now, if we had heard from the sponsor, Madam President, that there were municipalities out there that felt that this was a good idea and this was the best practice, okay. But that's not what we heard. If there were groups of people out there who stood up and said, No, this is something that needs to be addressed -- all right, maybe we could.

But I've got 43 villages and a city and two towns in my district. I have never gotten a request to support something like this. I, as a former mayor and village official, never thought that this was even remotely a good idea.

It's good practice for the community

and the building department to maintain regular contact with complainants when they want to be contacted. And certainly each municipality has the ability to do that. It's good practice. These are residents of the municipality. They're voters. They're people you want to actually engage with. So we don't need a bill to tell a municipality how to engage with their local community.

But let's talk about -- let's talk about the City of New York. How many complaints do they receive every year? To the building department, think about how many complaints come through and have to be processed. You know, we had the number for Glen Cove, I wonder what the number would be for the City of New York.

You know, I hear -- I hear that there is a shortfall, a budgetary shortfall in the City of New York, Madam President. It should be a concern for everybody. Billions of dollars in shortfall in the City of New York. You know, I even saw a video recently of the mayor of the of the City of New York tapping on a lens saying something about keeping a campaign promise about taxing the rich.

You know, that's interesting, because as far as I'm concerned, we here in this chamber have yet to vote on a budget. So I don't know where he says he's taxing the rich, but maybe he assumes everybody in this chamber has already signed off on a tax increase that has only been proposed. I don't know. We'll see what happens when that comes up. That should be a concern for all of us.

But the cost that that's going to place on the City of New York to send out certified mailings, return receipt requested, for the thousands if not tens or hundreds of thousands of the complaints that they get, for all kinds of things -- you know, frankly, when you have 8 or 9 million people living in a city and all of those either rental or, you know, owner-occupied homes, and you have the opportunity for people to actually file complaints, it is incredible to me that we wouldn't consider what the impact would be for a place like the City of New York.

Or, you know, let's go down the line. Let's talk about the City of Buffalo, let's talk about the City of Rochester, let's

talk about the City of Syracuse or Albany or Binghamton or Yonkers and what this is going to cost those municipalities who have hundreds of thousands of residents or millions of residents and how much that's going to cost that municipality to actually comply with that.

Not only in terms of dollars for certified mail, but also in terms of time for those people who actually work in those municipalities and frankly, I guarantee you, are not sitting on their hands waiting for something to do. They're busy, and we're going to take them away from the work that they're doing and actually have them filling out certified mail, return receipts, to what end?

So somebody may think this not a big deal, so what? It's another certified mailing. We'll just push another obligation on to our local communities. But the reality is everything here provides a cost, takes someone away from something else that they would otherwise be doing, and is going to impact all of our communities. And again, to what end?

So I'll be voting no, Madam President, no surprise there. But for all

of you who are thinking about voting yes, think about what it means back home to your local communities. Think about what it means back home to your cities. Think about the additional cost and expense and time that's going to be spent back home complying with something that actually isn't going to move the needle. Because I assure you, most of our communities are already working with their local residents and seeing these complaints through.

So, again, here we are. Madam President, I'll be voting no. To our sponsor, appreciate the discussion. Thanks for the effort, but I think it misses the mark.

Thank you, Madam President.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank you, Senator.

Are there any other Senators wishing to be heard?

Seeing and hearing none, the debate is closed.

Senator Gianaris.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President, we have agreed to restore this bill to the noncontroversial calendar.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill is restored to the noncontroversial calendar.

Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This act shall take effect on the 180th day after it shall have become a law.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator Skoufis to explain his vote.

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Thank you very much, Madam President.

I appreciate my colleagues for the debate.

I want to respond to -- my colleague asked to what end are we doing this, to what end are we requiring that what amounts to a rounding error -- again, 0.01 percent of these municipal budgets, why are we requiring this? To what end?

If I'm a neighbor and identify that the unit next to mine, the single-family house next to mine has an illegal gas hookup that could lead to an explosion on my street or in my apartment building, and I file a complaint, I

want to know how that's resolved on behalf of my family and myself and the safety of our neighborhood, our apartment building, be it what it may.

So that is to the end that we're looking to pass this bill. This is a public safety bill.

I know, you know, there is the lens by which some of my colleagues across the aisle are looking at this legislation through, through the dollars and cents. And again, we're talking cents, not dollars. But this is a public safety matter. There are families who file complaints. Those complaints are on dangerous matters that could potentially affect not just folks in that unit where the complaint is located, but many others potentially even dozens, if it's an apartment building.

That's why I vote yes.

Thank you, Madam Leader -- Madam President.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator Skoufis to be recorded in the affirmative.

Senator Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick to explain her vote.

SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK:

Thank you, Madam President.

Unfortunately, this bill should have been tailored, then, to address safety concerns. Because I'm thinking about the 14 villages that I represent, a town, and a city. And having been a former village official, knowing that the building department in my hometown is staffed with two full-timers and two part-timers -- thinking about the Hewlett Harbor Village, where they only have two employees in the entire incorporated village.

And now it's not about the cost of the certified mailing. It's the cost of the time of those people that are already burdened with trying to do so much in so little time, and now we're adding to their job. We're taking away from the review of applications. We're taking away from the review of extensions on a home or other things that they could be doing.

And unfortunately, we are once again burdening our local municipalities with another requirement. So on behalf of all of those people that I represent, I'm voting in the negative.

Thank you, Madam President.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick to be recorded in the negative.

Senator Martins to explain his vote.

SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you, Madam President.

I feel compelled to stand to talk about the concept of this being a public safety bill, as if somehow sending a notice to a complainant actually is going to make the building department and the building officials do their job.

No. They're going to take the complaint, they're going to act on the complaint, regardless of whether a mailing goes to somebody by certified mail. This has nothing to do with enforcing public safety. This has everything to do with adding bureaucratic layers.

Because, Madam President, I assure you that that municipality, from the mayor on down to every person who works in that municipality, is going to ensure that that complaint gets the attention it deserves, including sending people out there to issue the violation.

Notice, this bill requires that the notice go out when the building violation is issued. So that issue has already been taken care of. The municipality has issued the violation. This is an afterthought. The idea that this is a public safety bill is a farce.

I vote no.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator Martins to be recorded in the negative.

Senator Mayer to explain her vote.

SENATOR MAYER: Thank you, Madam President.

And I want to thank my colleague Senator Skoufis for this.

To me, this addresses a fundamental complaint of our constituents: Government does not work for me. No one is worried about me. I made a complaint based on a fear of something happening or a legitimate safety complaint. I made a complaint to my local municipality, and I want to know what happened. I want to know what the decision is. And no one is willing to tell me.

This says: Municipality, this is what people expect of their government. When

they make a complaint, they want to know the resolution, the determination. And it makes a lot of sense that a notice would be sent to them providing that information.

Thank you for doing this for our constituents.

I vote aye.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator Mayer to be recorded in the affirmative.

Senator Lanza to explain his vote.

SENATOR LANZA: Madam President, I vote aye.

(Laughter.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator Lanza to be recorded in the affirmative.

Senator Helming to explain her vote.

SENATOR HELMING: Thank you, Madam President. I too will be voting aye on this bill.

In my district, I have some of the largest populations of people living in manufactured homes, et cetera. My office often gets calls for assistance because they register complaints -- serious, as was said, public safety complaints, they have issues, and they never get

a response. This will help people get that response that they, as has already been said, they deserve to hear back.

So I vote yes. Thank you.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator Helming to be recorded in the affirmative.

Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 236, voting in the negative are Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Martins, Mattera, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

Ayes, 47. Nays, 11.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill is passed.

Senator Gianaris, that completes the reading of today's calendar.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you, Madam President.

I have a motion here. On behalf of Senator Gounardes, on page 22 I offer the following amendments to Calendar 324, Senate Print 8839, and ask that said bill retain its place on Third Reading Calendar.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The

amendments are received, and the bill will retain its place on the Third Reading Calendar.

Senator Gianaris.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Is there any further business at the desk?

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: There is no further business at the desk.

SENATOR GIANARIS: I move to adjourn until Monday, April 27th, at 3:00 p.m., with the intervening days being legislative days.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: On motion, the Senate stands adjourned until Monday, April 27th, at 3:00 p.m., with intervening days being legislative days.

(Whereupon, at 1:28 p.m., the Senate adjourned.)