

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

NEW YORK STATE SENATE

THE STENOGRAPHIC RECORD

ALBANY, NEW YORK

March 18, 2026

3:51 p.m.

REGULAR SESSION

SENATOR JEREMY COONEY, Acting President

ALEJANDRA N. PAULINO, ESQ., Secretary

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The  
3 Senate will come to order.

4 I ask everyone to please rise and  
5 recite the Pledge of Allegiance.

6 (Whereupon, the assemblage recited  
7 the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The  
9 Reverend Dr. Darren M. Morton, of  
10 Macedonia Baptist Church in Mount Vernon,  
11 New York, will deliver today's invocation.

12 REVEREND DR. MORTON: Let us all  
13 pray.

14 Father God, we come, we thank You  
15 for this day. We thank You for everything that  
16 You have done and everything that You will do in  
17 our lives. We thank You, God, for the new  
18 mercies of each and every day.

19 God, we thank You for this here,  
20 this Senate. We ask now, God, that You will  
21 bless each and every one who transacts business  
22 on behalf of the New York State residents.

23 God, we ask that You bless not only  
24 the chambers, but You bless each individual and  
25 bless their constituents.

1                   God, that we will always continue to  
2 do what is the responsibility of public servants,  
3 and that is to serve Your people to the best of  
4 our ability, that we may invoke all of the  
5 kindness and the love but most of all, God, that  
6 we may provide the proper service to those people  
7 whom You have put underneath the charge of these,  
8 your leaders.

9                   This we ask in Thy precious name,  
10 amen.

11                   (Response of "Amen.")

12                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:   Reading  
13 of the Journal.

14                   THE SECRETARY:    In Senate, Tuesday,  
15 March 17, 2026, the Senate met pursuant to  
16 adjournment. The Journal of Monday, March 16,  
17 2026, was read and approved. On motion, the  
18 Senate adjourned.

19                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:   Without  
20 objection, the Journal stands approved as read.

21                   Presentation of petitions.

22                   Messages from the Assembly.

23                   Messages from the Governor.

24                   Reports of standing committees.

25                   Reports of select committees.

1                   Communications and reports from  
2 state officers.

3                   Motions and resolutions.

4                   Senator Gianaris.

5                   SENATOR GIANARIS:    Good afternoon,  
6 Mr. President.

7                   On behalf of Senator Kavanaugh, I  
8 wish to call up Senate Print 1239E, recalled from  
9 the Assembly, which is now at the desk.

10                  ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    The  
11 Secretary will read.

12                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
13 213, Senate Print 1239E, by Senator Kavanaugh, an  
14 act to amend the Agriculture and Markets Law.

15                  SENATOR GIANARIS:    Move to  
16 reconsider the vote by which the bill was passed.

17                  ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    The  
18 Secretary will now call the roll on  
19 reconsideration.

20                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

21                  THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 60.

22                  ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    The bill  
23 is restored to its place on the Third Reading  
24 Calendar.

25                  SENATOR GIANARIS:    I offer the

1 following amendments to make it an F print.

2 (Laughter.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The  
4 amendments are received.

5 SENATOR GIANARIS: Please recognize  
6 Senator Webb for an introduction.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator  
8 Webb for an introduction.

9 SENATOR WEBB: Thank you,  
10 Mr. President.

11 I rise as the chair of the  
12 Women's Issues Committee in the Senate, and I  
13 have the distinct honor and pleasure of  
14 recognizing our 2026 honorees for the New York  
15 State Legislative Women's Caucus, as part of our  
16 Women's History Month continued commemoration.

17 Women's History Month is more than a  
18 time to reflect on the past; it is a moment to  
19 recognize the living, breathing legacy of women  
20 whose leadership continues to shape our  
21 communities every single day across our great  
22 state.

23 In New York, that legacy runs very  
24 deep, from the early organizers of the suffrage  
25 movement who gathered in our state to demand a

1 voice in democracy, to trailblazers like Shirley  
2 Chisholm, Constance Baker Motley, Ida Sammis,  
3 Ruth Bader Ginsburg. Our history is filled with  
4 women who refused to accept the limits that  
5 society tried to place on them.

6 They challenged the status quo, they  
7 broke barriers often that were glass and most  
8 certainly, in most cases, brick ceilings, they  
9 transformed institutions that once excluded them.

10 The story of women's history is not  
11 confined to textbooks or monuments, it is  
12 unfolding right now in classrooms, hospitals,  
13 courtrooms, small businesses, community  
14 organizations, and most certainly in chambers  
15 like this one.

16 Across New York, women are leading  
17 in many spaces, advocating for communities that  
18 quite often go unheard. The women we honor today  
19 represent that same spirit. They are educators,  
20 advocates, entrepreneurs, public servants, and  
21 community builders. They are unstoppable leaders  
22 whose dedication represents the best of us  
23 because they are committed to improving the lives  
24 of people across our state.

25 Their work reminds us that progress

1 is never inevitable. It is built step-by-step by  
2 people who choose to speak out and move their  
3 communities forward.

4 Honoring these great leaders that  
5 are here today, it is important to not only  
6 recognize them, but it is also an opportunity we  
7 have to ensure that the next generation sees what  
8 leadership looks like, for women and girls across  
9 New York understand that their voices belong in  
10 every room where decisions are made.

11 Here in the New York State Senate,  
12 we have worked to carry that responsibility  
13 forward by advancing policies that strengthen  
14 women's healthcare, promote economic opportunity,  
15 support families, and protect the fundamental  
16 right to live and work free from discrimination.

17 And so today as we celebrate and  
18 honor women who have already made an incredible  
19 impact, we want to thank all of our honorees for  
20 the example that you set, the differences that  
21 you make in our communities across this great  
22 state. Not just this month, but every month, we  
23 celebrate you.

24 And so I am pleased to be joined by  
25 my honoree, Ms. Phoebe Brown, who served eight

1 years as the Central New York coordinator for the  
2 Alliance of Families for Justice, supporting  
3 families impacted by incarceration and advocating  
4 for reform of our criminal justice system.

5 She has committed her life to public  
6 service, and she reflects not only her commitment  
7 to those who are most vulnerable, but she is  
8 someone that makes Senate District 52 proud.

9 And she is also joined by many other  
10 incredible women from across this great state  
11 that my colleagues have chosen as their  
12 respective honorees. And their names are:  
13 Elissa Montati, Candace Aguirre Holley,  
14 Mayor Sharon Owens, Nicola Armacost,  
15 Denise Olivo, Dr. May Edward Chin,  
16 Lorraine Stevens, Stacey Mrva, Randi Shibin  
17 Dresner, Stacy Pettigrew, Manna Jo Greene,  
18 Kim Smith, and Dr. April Aycock. And there are  
19 many other honorees as well.

20 These are lifelong advocates,  
21 educators, electeds whose contributions are truly  
22 what make us better. To all of our honorees, we  
23 want you to know that what you do every single  
24 day brings us great pride, and we thank you for  
25 all you have done and what you will continue to

1 do.

2 I also want to thank our  
3 Senate Majority Leader, Senator Andrea  
4 Stewart-Cousins, and of course our New York State  
5 Legislative Women's Caucus chair for not only  
6 elevating this year's honorees, but also once  
7 again commemorating this important month this  
8 year and for many more years to come.

9 I proudly vote aye and also ask for  
10 our great leader to acknowledge all of our  
11 honorees here in the chamber today and extend  
12 them the privileges of the house.

13 Thank you.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank  
15 you, Senator Webb.

16 Senator Gianaris.

17 SENATOR GIANARIS: Now please  
18 recognize Senator Helming for more remarks from  
19 the Minority.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator  
21 Helming for an introduction and remarks.

22 SENATOR HELMING: Thank you,  
23 Mr. President.

24 As Senator Webb shared, earlier  
25 today many of us had the opportunity to take part

1 in a truly inspiring Legislative Women's Caucus  
2 Women's History Month celebration. One of the  
3 highlights of today was this afternoon's luncheon  
4 celebration where we heard about the remarkable  
5 stories from women from all across the State of  
6 New York.

7           These women, as Senator Webb said,  
8 were business owners, educators, healthcare  
9 providers, public servants, passionate advocates.  
10 They were mothers and grandmothers, women whose  
11 talents, dedication and leadership are making our  
12 communities, making our state and our entire  
13 nation so much stronger.

14           Each story we heard today was very  
15 unique, but I found that there was a common  
16 thread. That was resilience, determination, and  
17 a willingness to lead, to not let anything stand  
18 in your way.

19           First thing this morning we had the  
20 opportunity to meet with Governor Hochul, and she  
21 talked about New York State being at the center  
22 of the women's rights movement. Well, if  
23 New York State is the center, the heart is the  
24 Finger Lakes region, a region that I am so proud  
25 to represent, and it's widely known as the

1 birthplace of the women's rights movement.

2           And my honoree is from the  
3 Finger Lakes region and the birthplace of the  
4 women's rights movement. She's here today,  
5 Stacey Mrva. Her husband Tom is also here with  
6 her. I'm so proud to be able to honor Stacey in  
7 this way. Stacey is a welder, a metal sculptor  
8 and small businesses owner. She owns  
9 Ironwood Studios in Livingston County.

10           She has built an incredibly  
11 successful career in a field that's long been  
12 dominated by men. She's not only breaking  
13 barriers, but she's helping so many others to do  
14 the same.

15           Stacey's metalwork is on display  
16 throughout the Finger Lakes region. I had the  
17 opportunity to be at one of her unveilings of  
18 sculptures in the Village of Churchville. I was  
19 particularly moved by a piece that paid tribute  
20 to suffragette Frances Willard. Frances believed  
21 that when women gain independence and  
22 opportunity, our communities grow stronger.

23           That message still resonates very  
24 strongly today, and it's one of the reasons why I  
25 selected Stacey. Through her welding workshops,

1 Stacey teaches women of all ages, military  
2 veterans, and individuals rebuilding their lives  
3 to find the spark within themselves, to discover  
4 strength, confidence, and new possibilities.  
5 Stacey is not just shaping metal, she is helping  
6 shape the future of so many.

7 I just want to take a moment too to  
8 recognize Heather Ferrero. She's the deputy  
9 director of planning for Livingston County. She  
10 was nominated by Assemblywoman Andrea Bailey.

11 I appreciate the tremendous work  
12 that Heather is doing to protect and preserve the  
13 Finger Lakes region.

14 Each of the women recognized today  
15 represents the very best of our state. And  
16 today, to all of our honorees and to the women  
17 across our state who every day lead, serve, and  
18 lift up others, you have our deepest respect and  
19 our sincere appreciation.

20 Thank you, Mr. President.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank  
22 you, Senator Helming.

23 To our women honorees, we welcome  
24 you on behalf of the Senate. We extend to you  
25 the privileges and courtesies of the house.

1                   Please rise and be recognized.

2                   (Standing ovation.)

3                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Senator  
4 Gianaris.

5                   SENATOR GIANARIS:    Please recognize  
6 Mason Kevin Parker for an introduction, please.

7                   (Laughter.)

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Mason and  
9 Senator Parker for an introduction.

10                  SENATOR PARKER:    Thank you,  
11 Mr. President.

12                  Many of you know me as State Senator  
13 Kevin Parker who represents the 21st District in  
14 Brooklyn, the chair of the Energy and  
15 Telecommunications Committee and the  
16 Senior Assistant Majority Leader of the New York  
17 State Senate.

18                  But in my life outside of here, in  
19 The Most Worshipful Prince Hall Grand Lodge of  
20 the State of New York, I hold several other  
21 titles.  And today is Prince Hall Day.

22                  And so I'm also known as Past Master  
23 of Sons of Kings Lodge Number 123, current  
24 Worthy Patron of Sunshine Chapter Number 34.  I  
25 am the Illustrious Potentate of Abu Bekr Temple

1 Number 91, as well as the Captain of the Guard in  
2 Mystic Tie Council Number 8 of Royal and Select  
3 Masters, as well as the King in the Holy Royal  
4 Arch Masons of the State of New York,  
5 Mount Moriah Chapter Number 3, as well as being a  
6 member of Deborah Chapter in the Heroines of  
7 Jericho and Mystic Tie Chapter Number 3 in the  
8 Ladies of the Circle of Perfection.

9           And so in that world, I have been  
10 elevated to have an opportunity to work with a  
11 group of people who are really amazing and  
12 oftentimes unsung. There is a mythology about  
13 Masonry generally, about it being a secret  
14 society. And it's not really a secret society.  
15 Right? Like we don't -- we have shirts and hats  
16 that says we're Masons. Right? But it is a  
17 society of secrets.

18           And when you want to understand what  
19 Masonry is, what we say it is is a beautiful  
20 system of morality veiled in allegory and  
21 illustrated by symbols. But at base, it's a  
22 fraternity and sorority and a charity. It is a  
23 group of people who have gotten together in the  
24 cause of mutual aid to support one another in  
25 their daily trials and tribulations.

1                   And they lift as they climb by doing  
2 all sorts of charity work. Probably the biggest  
3 thing that you've seen Masonic communities do is  
4 probably the Shriners Hospital, right?  
5 Everybody's familiar with it, right? So even  
6 though that's on the Shriners side, it is -- all  
7 those folks are Masons as well.

8                   But I'm a member of The Most  
9 Worshipful Prince Hall Grand Lodge of the State  
10 of New York, where I'm also the chair of the  
11 Civic Action Committee. And today we're having  
12 Prince Hall Day, and so we have members of the  
13 Prince Hall Society here.

14                   And before I introduce them, I  
15 quickly want to tell you who Prince Hall was.  
16 Prince Hall was a man who was born in enslavement  
17 in Boston and got his freedom and became an  
18 abolitionist. And he was trying to work to free  
19 other people of African descent in Boston. You  
20 know, in the mid-1700s, right, before the  
21 American Revolution.

22                   And what he found was that a lot of  
23 the people who were in charge at that time were  
24 Masons, so he sought to be a Mason to come into  
25 common cause and to get into connection with

1 those important people. And at that time they  
2 were not -- they would not make somebody of  
3 African descent a Mason.

4 And so he finally found an Irish  
5 military lodge that on -- I'm sure you'll like  
6 this date -- on March 6, 1775, which is actually  
7 my and Senator Shelley Mayer's birthday -- well,  
8 not 1775. We're a little bit after that.

9 (Laughter.)

10 SENATOR PARKER: But on March 6th,  
11 he and 14 others that we now lovingly refer to as  
12 the Immortal 15 were initiated, passed and raised  
13 to the sublime degree of Master Mason. And after  
14 a confluence of issues of things that kind of  
15 went on, they became African Lodge Number 1, and  
16 then later on became African Lodge Number 459.

17 And Prince Hall becomes the patron  
18 saint of that sector of Masons. And now you find  
19 Masonic -- Prince Hall Masonic Lodges all over  
20 the world. And here in New York State, we have a  
21 very prominent group of people.

22 And I'd like to ask all of the  
23 Prince Hall Masons and the members of the  
24 Eastern Stars to please rise and be recognized.

25 And here with us today is the

1 Most Worshipful Grand Master, Dr. Darren M.  
2 Morton, who is the conservator of Prince Hall  
3 Masonry. We have the Deputy Grand Master,  
4 Brother Jean Apollon; Brother Sandino Sanchez,  
5 who is the Junior Grand Warden. We have  
6 Brother Grant Valentine, who is the Grand Worthy  
7 Patron. And last but certainly not least, our  
8 Grand Worthy Matron, Sister Marsha Mack.

9           And I want to thank them for being  
10 here. I want to thank them for taking the time  
11 and, not seeing a robbery, to being engaged,  
12 again, in the communities around this state.  
13 There are probably very few districts represented  
14 in this room that do not have a Prince Hall  
15 Masonic Lodge, and if not a Prince Hall, a  
16 Grand Lodge of the State of New York Lodge.

17           We have a number of people in this  
18 chamber who are members of Prince Hall, including  
19 Senator Leroy Comrie. And -- well, Senator  
20 Fernandez, Nathalia Fernandez was looking for  
21 who's been with us today.

22           And I really am thankful for this  
23 body and for the openness as we've done this, to  
24 take meetings, have conversations with their  
25 constituents about some of these issues. The

1 things that the members of the Order of the  
2 Eastern Star and the members of the craft are  
3 talking about are the same day-to-day  
4 bread-and-butter issues that we're concerned  
5 about. Right? Affordability. We have a number  
6 of vets in this organization, and providing  
7 services for them, making sure that their civil  
8 rights are held up, making sure that we have  
9 affordable housing and accessible healthcare.

10 And so, you know, we work in common  
11 cause, and this work must continue as another  
12 important group that does this work today.

13 And so thank you for the  
14 recognition, and thank you for us for this  
15 opportunity to be recognized by the New York  
16 State Senate.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank  
18 you, Senator Parker.

19 To our guests, I welcome you on  
20 behalf of the Senate. We extend to you the  
21 privileges and courtesies of the house.

22 Please rise and be recognized.

23 (Standing ovation.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator  
25 Gianaris.

1                   SENATOR GIANARIS:    Mr. President,  
2     please take up previously adopted  
3     Resolution 1734, by Senator Hinchey, have its  
4     title read, and call on Senator Hinchey.

5                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    The  
6     Secretary will read.

7                   THE SECRETARY:    Resolution 1734, by  
8     Senator Hinchey, memorializing Governor Kathy  
9     Hochul to proclaim March 15 through 21, 2026, as  
10    Agriculture Week in the State of New York.

11                  ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Senator  
12    Hinchey on the resolution.

13                  SENATOR HINCHEY:    No farms, no  
14    food, Mr. President.

15                         When folks think about agriculture,  
16    they often picture tractors and rural areas.  But  
17    what agriculture is, is our food supply.  That  
18    makes New York agriculture one of the most  
19    important things that we have a responsibility to  
20    protect and support.

21                         We have over 30,000 family farms  
22    that generate nearly \$90 billion in economic  
23    impact.  Our farms grow and produce what's called  
24    the "full plate" -- fruits, vegetables, grains,  
25    meats, and dairy.  And we lead the entire

1 Northeast in production for many products. For  
2 instance, we are number one in yogurt, sour cream  
3 and cottage cheese. We are number two in maple  
4 syrup, apples and cabbage. And we're  
5 number three in grapes, snap beans and squash, up  
6 from fourth just last year.

7           And thanks to state funding in ag  
8 research and technology, New York's dairy cows  
9 outproduce those in Pennsylvania and Vermont by  
10 more than 500 gallons of milk per year. That's  
11 attracted major economic investment into our  
12 state from global dairy brands, including  
13 Chobani, Fairlife, and others.

14           To quote our commissioner of Ag &  
15 Markets, "I'm incredibly excited about the future  
16 of New York agriculture."

17           These are remarkable  
18 accomplishments, but they again don't come close  
19 to capturing what agriculture actually is. It's  
20 one of humanity's most enduring and personally  
21 traditions, the act of tending to the earth to  
22 feed your family and your neighbors, which is not  
23 something you can measure in market share. It's  
24 something that you feel in the weight of growing  
25 something from nothing and the pride of passing

1 that craft to the next generation, to those who  
2 will pick up the mantle.

3 This legislative body understands  
4 that. And I'm incredibly proud of the work that  
5 we're doing to fight for our farmers, to expand  
6 access to food across New York State.

7 For instance, we are working to  
8 expand Farm-to-School, so that students can eat  
9 fresh, healthy food while expanding a critical  
10 market for our farmers.

11 We're working to create the  
12 first-ever farm weather resiliency grants, so  
13 that farmers can have a lifeline to recover  
14 losses from severe weather.

15 We're pushing for clearer "use by"  
16 food labeling dates, so that more food reaches  
17 people's plates and less food ends up in the  
18 landfills.

19 And we're working to increase  
20 support for vital programs like Nourish New York  
21 and Double Up Food Bucks, which have supported  
22 our farmers and have made sure that people across  
23 our state, regardless of where they live or that  
24 their means may be, can eat Locally sourced  
25 healthy food.

1                   And we've partnered with the SUNY  
2 chancellor, John King, to launch the first SUNY  
3 Agritech Center to spark interest in ag careers  
4 for students all over the state and to expand  
5 access to cutting-edge training that will keep  
6 New York agriculture strong for generations to  
7 come.

8                   In New York we know that if we do  
9 right by our farmers, we protect a stable, local  
10 food supply as well as businesses that care about  
11 the communities in which they operate.

12                   I want to thank all of my colleagues  
13 for joining me in standing up for New York  
14 agriculture, which supports all of our  
15 communities.

16                   Thank you, Mr. President, and Happy  
17 Agriculture Week.

18                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Thank  
19 you, Senator Hinchey.

20                   The resolution was adopted on  
21 March 17th.

22                   Senator Gianaris.

23                   SENATOR GIANARIS:    Next up,  
24 Mr. President, is previously adopted  
25 Resolution 1725, by Senator Liu. Please read

1 that resolution's title and recognize  
2 Senator Liu.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The  
4 Secretary will read.

5 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1725, by  
6 Senator Liu, memorializing Governor Kathy Hochul  
7 to proclaim March 23, 2026, as Pakistan-American  
8 Heritage Day in the State of New York.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator  
10 Liu on the resolution.

11 SENATOR LIU: Thank you,  
12 Mr. President.

13 I'm so delighted and honored to  
14 stand today to talk about a community that  
15 has made New York State the greatest state in the  
16 universe.

17 We often talk about how our  
18 diversity makes us strong, and part of that  
19 diversity is a community -- a very proud and  
20 successful community, a hardworking community  
21 with ethics and professionalism, and that is the  
22 Pakistani-American community. Which for -- not  
23 necessarily a new immigrant community, but now  
24 for generations. In fact, it's been said that on  
25 average, we are in the second generation of

1 Pakistani-Americans who first emigrated here  
2 several decades ago and have made America and  
3 indeed our State of New York their home, setting  
4 up small businesses and now large businesses as  
5 well, professional practices, excelling in our  
6 public schools, creating places of worship and  
7 cultural celebrations.

8           The Pakistani-American community has  
9 contributed so much to the State of New York.  
10 And we honor the community on March 23rd,  
11 designating it Pakistani-American Day in the  
12 State of New York.

13           I'm so proud to present this  
14 resolution for all of my colleagues to consider,  
15 and especially proud that we are joined today by  
16 the very -- very prolific organization that  
17 advocates for the community, the American  
18 Pakistani Advocacy Group. They are in the  
19 gallery. Welcome.

20           Don't stand yet, because the  
21 president is going to ask you to stand.

22           (Laughter.)

23           SENATOR LIU: They are led by our  
24 brother, our friend, Ali Rashid, who is here on  
25 the floor with us. And he is joined by

1 His Excellency, none other than Rizwan Saeed  
2 Sheikh, the Pakistani ambassador to the  
3 United States, as well as Aamer Ahmed Atozai, the  
4 Consul General of Pakistan here in New York.

5 It is with great pride that I  
6 present all these individuals and recognize the  
7 illustrious Pakistani-American community,  
8 Mr. President.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank  
10 you, Senator Liu.

11 Senator Stavisky on the resolution.

12 SENATOR STAVISKY: Yes, thank you,  
13 Mr. President.

14 And I too am honored to represent so  
15 many people from the South Asian community and  
16 especially from Pakistan. We are celebrating  
17 with you on March 23rd.

18 Welcome to the ambassador, and to  
19 Rashid Ali and the people, the folks, our friends  
20 and neighbors from the advocacy group.

21 I was intrigued by your mission  
22 statement: The three Es, engage, empower and  
23 elevate. And that is a message not just for the  
24 Pakistani-American community but for everybody:  
25 To engage in the community, to participate, to

1 the leaders in all of the fields that Senator Liu  
2 has mentioned, the STEM, the teaching, education,  
3 et cetera.

4 We are proud to have you here.

5 And Mr. President, I know you will  
6 extend the welcome that they so richly deserve.

7 Thank you, Mr. President.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank  
9 you, Senator.

10 Senator Comrie on the resolution.

11 SENATOR COMRIE: Thank you,  
12 Mr. President.

13 Today I rise to recognize and  
14 celebrate Pakistan Day, a day that marks the  
15 historic Lahore resolution which laid the  
16 foundation for the creation of Pakistan.

17 Pakistan Day commemorates the  
18 enduring aspirations of people for  
19 self-determination, democratic governance, and  
20 national identity. It is a moment not only of  
21 historical reflection but of pride in the  
22 resilience, culture and contributions of  
23 Pakistani people around the globe.

24 Here in New York, particularly in  
25 Southeast Queens and throughout the state, we are

1 proud to be home to a vibrant and growing  
2 Pakistani-American community. The contributions  
3 of the community enrich our neighbors in  
4 countless ways, through small businesses that  
5 power our local economy, through active civic  
6 engagement that strengthens our democracy, and  
7 through cultural traditions that add to the rich  
8 tapestry of our state.

9 In Senate District 14, I've had the  
10 privilege of working alongside many leaders,  
11 including Rashid Ali, who is here today, and  
12 other members of the Pakistani community to  
13 develop a strong community. Whether in  
14 education, healthcare, public service, or the  
15 arts, their impact is both meaningful and  
16 lasting.

17 As the Pakistani community continues  
18 to grow in my district, we want to make sure that  
19 whatever they're doing and however they want to  
20 contribute, we give them that opportunity for  
21 respect, for recognition, and for an enduring  
22 presence in our community.

23 I want to thank the ambassador for  
24 coming today as well, to celebrate with  
25 Pakistanis throughout the state.

1                   And I want to remind all of our  
2                   colleagues that we need to make sure that as we  
3                   recognize, in the Pakistani community, their  
4                   traditions, their opportunities, and their  
5                   desires, that we can continue to do that for all  
6                   of the residents of New York State, that we can  
7                   continue to allow this state to be what it was  
8                   meant to be originally -- a state that has  
9                   diversity, acceptance, and an opportunity for all  
10                  people to become great residents of New York  
11                  State.

12                  Thank you, Mr. President, for the  
13                  opportunity to celebrate Pakistan. Thank you,  
14                  Senator Liu, for the opportunity to bring this  
15                  resolution and this annual day forward.

16                  Thank you.

17                  ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank  
18                  you, Senator.

19                  Senator Ramos on the resolution.

20                  SENATOR RAMOS: Thank you,  
21                  Mr. President.

22                  What kind of Queens State Senator  
23                  would I be if I too did not rise to celebrate my  
24                  Pakistani neighbors in Jackson Heights,  
25                  East Elmhurst, Elmhurst and Corona? I mean, the

1 contributions from our Pakistani neighbors have  
2 been endless, countless, for decades. And I am  
3 very thankful for all of their support in making  
4 our community vibrant.

5 We have delicious Pakistani  
6 restaurants that everyone should enjoy, whether  
7 it's Dera Restaurant, Kabab King -- and I could  
8 stand here all day.

9 But most of all, we know that as  
10 Ramadan is coming to a close, we want to also  
11 recognize all of the efforts of our immigrant  
12 generation of Pakistanis, and of course their  
13 children and grandchildren, who are quickly  
14 becoming professionals, outstanding citizens, who  
15 just add to the vibrancy of our community every  
16 day.

17 So even though Independence Day is  
18 in August, today we want to recognize our  
19 Pakistani neighbors and wish them the very best  
20 as they continue to make New York a better place.

21 Thank you.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank  
23 you, Senator.

24 Senator Martins on the resolution.

25 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,

1 Mr. President. I too rise to support the  
2 resolution.

3 New York is a better place because  
4 of the Pakistani community in our state. As I  
5 can attest, in the 7th Senate District -- vibrant  
6 community, hardworking, civically engaged. And  
7 certainly when it comes to the three Es, as  
8 Senator Stavisky said, to engage, to elevate and  
9 to empower, they are reflective of the efforts of  
10 the community and we see it each and every day.

11 So thank you, Senator Liu, for  
12 sponsoring the resolution.

13 And to our Pakistani friends here  
14 and across New York State, thank you for all you  
15 do to make this state all that it is.

16 Thank you.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank  
18 you, Senator.

19 To our guests, I welcome you on  
20 behalf of the Senate. We extend to you the  
21 privileges and courtesies of the house.

22 Please rise and be recognized.

23 (Standing ovation.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The  
25 resolution was adopted on March 17th.

1 Senator Gianaris.

2 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,  
3 please call on Senator Rhoads for an  
4 introduction.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator  
6 Rhoads for an introduction.

7 SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you,  
8 Senator Gianaris, and thank you, Mr. President.

9 So my first visit to our lovely  
10 State Capitol was actually 44 years ago, when as  
11 a 7th grader in junior high school, I came up to  
12 lobby, for additional state aid to education, our  
13 then State Assemblyman Fred Parola and our then  
14 State Senator Norman Levy, whose seat I am now  
15 honored to hold.

16 And it is a -- it's always a special  
17 treat when we have students, young, bright minds  
18 coming up from Long Island to come visit us. And  
19 I want to recognize one such group today. We are  
20 proud to welcome to the Senate chamber some of  
21 New York's shining stars visiting us today from  
22 the Mercaz Academy.

23 Opening its doors in the  
24 Plainview-Old Bethpage community, which I am  
25 proud to represent with Senator Jack Martins, the

1       Mercaz Academy provides preschool through  
2       6th-grade students a foundation in Judaic and  
3       secular studies, emphasizing personal growth in  
4       an intimate and innovative environment,  
5       cultivating tomorrow's leaders through building  
6       character and reinforcing values in an inclusive,  
7       warm and supportive atmosphere.

8                       Now, back in November I had the  
9       chance to visit with their principal,  
10      Rabbi Kalman Fogel, who is with us today, and  
11      President Jeffrey Lichtman, as well as a group of  
12      about 50 third-through-sixth-grade students  
13      talking about public service, the role of state  
14      government in the lives of New York families, and  
15      our efforts to confront and combat growing  
16      antisemitism across our state.

17                      And this was followed by a  
18      question-and-answer session where I was grilled  
19      by some of the most thoughtful and intuitive  
20      questions that I've ever had, certainly maybe  
21      than any endorsement of you, I can you tell you  
22      that. They were great.

23                      And since the timing of my visit  
24      coincided with Election Day, I met with their  
25      student council candidates, discussed campaigns,

1 messaging and strategy. And I am pleased to  
2 report that in spite of my insights, some of  
3 those candidates actually won their races and  
4 have joined us in the gallery today, along with  
5 the group from Mercaz Academy.

6           And so I want to introduce their  
7 student council president, Rami Kirschenbaum;  
8 vice president, Jason Glasser; treasurer,  
9 Yair Weissman; their secretary, Meira Blackman;  
10 as well as Saira Baradarian, Elianna Biniamin,  
11 Noa Blackman, Talia Blackman, Evan Dahan,  
12 Sarah Eshaghian, Raphael Hakim, Eliana Kersch,  
13 Aaron Nejatheim, Evelyn Shamalov, and  
14 Liora Sternbach.

15           And their chaperones for today, in  
16 addition to Rabbi Fogel: Jenny DeMeo,  
17 Chavi Kersch, Shmuela Sternbach, and Ira Glasser,  
18 who are with us in the gallery.

19           Mr. President, I would ask that you  
20 welcome them to the chamber -- Madam President.  
21 I see we've had a change. Madam President, I  
22 would ask that you welcome them to the chamber on  
23 behalf of the Senate and please extend to them  
24 all of the privileges and courtesies of the  
25 house.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:    Thank  
2    you.

3                   To our guests, I welcome you on  
4    behalf of the Senate. We extend to you the  
5    privileges and courtesies of this house.

6                   Please rise and be recognized.

7                   (Standing ovation.)

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:    Senator  
9    Gianaris.

10                  SENATOR GIANARIS:    Madam President,  
11    let's take up previously adopted Resolution 1702,  
12    by Senator Cooney. Please read its title and  
13    recognize Senator Cooney.

14                  ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:    The  
15    Secretary will read.

16                  THE SECRETARY:    Resolution 1702, by  
17    Senator Cooney, commemorating the  
18    175th Anniversary of Albany Law School.

19                  ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:    Senator  
20    Cooney on the resolution.

21                  SENATOR COONEY:    Thank you,  
22    Madam President.

23                  It is truly my honor and privilege  
24    today to recognize the 175th anniversary of  
25    Albany Law School, a nationally renowned

1 institution that I am so very proud to call my  
2 alma mater.

3 Today we are joined in the chamber  
4 by President and Dean Cinnamon Carlarne;  
5 Pat Wildes, the director of the Government Law  
6 Center; and Andrew Jensen, a second-year law  
7 student.

8 Since 1851, Albany Law School has  
9 trained the leaders of tomorrow in the shadow of  
10 our great State Capitol, giving law students the  
11 opportunity to learn and grow in the heart of our  
12 state's political center. And when I was a  
13 first-year law student, I worked in the  
14 Governor's counsel's office -- interestingly  
15 enough, on transportation policy.

16 It's no surprise that Albany Law was  
17 recently named the best law school in the nation  
18 for public service by PreLaw magazine, an honor  
19 that is a testament to the strong tradition of  
20 excellence that Albany Law promotes.

21 Over half of Albany Law School's  
22 graduates go into public service. Many of our  
23 great lawyers and leaders in state government  
24 reflect this recognition. The law school has  
25 always led with a dedication toward legal

1 scholarship, strong New York practice, and a  
2 commitment to justice.

3 Many of our staff members are  
4 graduates, including our talented counsel staff  
5 who is here on the floor with me; Alejandra  
6 Paulino, the Secretary of the Senate, and her  
7 counsel, Jellisa Joseph.

8 As we reflect on our past, it's  
9 important to also look to the future and the  
10 commitment of Albany Law School to preparing the  
11 next generation of leaders, advocates and  
12 change-makers. So to every alum, current and  
13 future student, and to the faculty and staff, I  
14 say congratulations.

15 Madam President, I vote aye.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank  
17 you.

18 Senator Fahy on the resolution.

19 SENATOR FAHY: Thank you,  
20 Madam President.

21 I want to join Senator Cooney.  
22 While he is a graduate, I am not. I am a proud  
23 representative of the college and want to join in  
24 all of the accolades. So many of my  
25 constituents, so many friends -- our former or

1 recent mayor, former Mayor Kathy Sheehan, and so  
2 many others have been wonderful advocates --  
3 sorry, wonderful graduates from the law school.

4 And it is quite extraordinary to  
5 think that they've reached 175 years as the  
6 oldest independent law school in the nation, and  
7 to think it's right here in Albany.

8 So I just want to share my  
9 enthusiasm and support. And thank you, Senator,  
10 for bringing this and bringing our dean and  
11 student here. It is really important, at a time  
12 when we are turning to our courts more and more,  
13 especially in the last plus year where so much is  
14 being litigated right now, it is something we  
15 value more than ever.

16 And again, a true welcome to those  
17 who will carry Albany Law into the next  
18 hundred years. Thank you.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank  
20 you.

21 To our guests, I welcome you on  
22 behalf of the Senate. We extend to you the  
23 privileges and courtesies of this house.  
24 Congratulations on 175 years.

25 Please rise and be recognized.

1 (Standing ovation.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The  
3 resolution was adopted on March 10th.

4 Senator Gianaris.

5 SENATOR GIANARIS: The sponsors of  
6 today's resolutions would like to open them for  
7 cosponsorship.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The  
9 resolutions are open for cosponsorship. Should  
10 you choose not to be a cosponsor, please notify  
11 the desk.

12 Senator Gianaris.

13 SENATOR GIANARIS: Please take up  
14 the reading of the calendar.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The  
16 Secretary will read.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
18 159, Senate Print 119, by Senator Cleare, an act  
19 to amend the Emergency Tenant Protection Act.

20 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill  
22 will be laid aside.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
24 218, Senate Print 3820B, by Senator Rivera, an  
25 act to amend the Insurance Law.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Read the  
2    last section.

3                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 4.  This  
4    act shall take effect immediately.

5                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Call the  
6    roll.

7                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Announce  
9    the results.

10                  THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 61.

11                  ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    The bill  
12    is passed.

13                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
14    402, Senate Print 2289, by Senator Bailey, an act  
15    to amend the Private Housing Finance Law.

16                  ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Read the  
17    last section.

18                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.  This  
19    act shall take effect immediately.

20                  ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Call the  
21    roll.

22                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

23                  ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Announce  
24    the results.

25                  THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 61.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    The bill  
2    is passed.

3                   THE SECRETARY:     Calendar Number  
4    407, Senate Print 7048, by Senator Webb, an act  
5    to amend the Public Health Law.

6                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Read the  
7    last section.

8                   THE SECRETARY:     Section 2.  This  
9    act shall take effect immediately.

10                  ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:   Call the  
11   roll.

12                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

13                  ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:   Senator  
14   Webb to explain her vote.

15                  SENATOR WEBB:     Thank you,  
16   Mr. President.

17                  I'm very proud of the work we've  
18   been doing in the Women's Issues Committee, and  
19   this bill is a continuation of those efforts,  
20   especially when we talk about the very real  
21   challenges around maternal health and the crisis  
22   that maternal health is in in our state.

23                  One of our many goals is to reduce  
24   the number of healthcare deserts impacting  
25   families across our state, especially in rural

1 districts like mine. Access to quality maternity  
2 care is essential if we want to reduce bad  
3 outcomes related to pregnancy and eliminate  
4 health disparities that disproportionately impact  
5 communities of color and rural communities.

6 Mr. President, since 2008,  
7 28 hospitals across the state have closed or  
8 reduced OB-GYN care. And as of 2022, more than  
9 4 percent of women in New York did not have a  
10 birthing hospital within 30 minutes of their  
11 homes.

12 And in rural districts such as mine,  
13 the data reveals an even more dangerous picture,  
14 with 47 percent of women living more than  
15 30 minutes away from a birthing center.

16 These are very troubling statistics  
17 for women in labor or dealing with dangerous  
18 complications like preeclampsia or living in a  
19 maternal health desert.

20 What this legislation provides is  
21 that it requires an increase in transparency  
22 around the availability of maternal healthcare.

23 Under the current law, there is no  
24 requirement that major changes to maternity care  
25 undergo a full review before the Public Health

1 and Health Planning Council, meaning that  
2 significant changes in availability of labor and  
3 delivery services in the community can move  
4 forward without community input or oversight and  
5 agreement.

6 The legislation requires the  
7 Public Health and Health Planning Council, also  
8 known as PHHPC, to regulate any changes in  
9 perinatal services offered by general hospitals  
10 in our state.

11 Mr. President, if we are truly to  
12 address the maternal health crisis in New York,  
13 we must safeguard access to healthcare and  
14 maternity services. I proudly vote aye and  
15 encourage my colleagues to do the same.

16 Thank you.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:  
18 Senator Webb to be recorded in the affirmative.

19 Announce the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill  
22 is passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
24 472, Senate Print 4956, by Senator Harckham, an  
25 act to amend the Mental Hygiene Law.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Read the  
2    last section.

3                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.  This  
4    act shall take effect immediately.

5                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Call the  
6    roll.

7                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Announce  
9    the results.

10                  THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 61.

11                  ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    The bill  
12    is passed.

13                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
14    477, Senate Print 947, by Senator Jackson, an act  
15    to amend the Real Property Law.

16                  SENATOR LANZA:    Lay it aside.

17                  ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    The bill  
18    will be laid aside.

19                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
20    478, Senate Print 1142, by Senator Gounardes, an  
21    act to amend the Civil Practice Law and Rules.

22                  ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Read the  
23    last section.

24                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.  This  
25    act shall take effect on the 60th day after it

1 shall have become a law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the  
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce  
6 the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
8 Calendar 478, voting in the negative are  
9 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,  
10 Helming, Lanza, Martins, O'Mara, Ortt, Rhoads,  
11 Walczyk and Weik.

12 Ayes, 50. Nays, 11.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill  
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
16 481, Senate Print 5089, by Senator Sepúlveda, an  
17 act to amend the Real Property Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the  
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This  
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the  
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill  
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
6 489, Senate Print 903, by Senator Sanders, an act  
7 to amend the Elder Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the  
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the  
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce  
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill  
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
21 505, Senate Print 8941, by Senator Martinez, an  
22 act authorizing the Farmingdale First Baptist  
23 Church, Inc., to receive retroactive real  
24 property tax exempt status.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the  
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce  
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
10 Calendar 505, voting in the negative are  
11 Senators O'Mara and Skoufis.

12 Ayes, 59. Nays, 2.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill  
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
16 510, Senate Print 7858, by Senator Salazar, an  
17 act to amend the Public Authorities Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the  
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This  
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the  
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill  
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
6 533, Senate Print 1610, by Senator Harckham, an  
7 act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the  
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
11 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it  
12 shall have become a law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the  
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce  
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
19 Calendar 533, voting in the negative:  
20 Senator Walczyk.

21 Ayes, 60. Nays, 1.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill  
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
25 534, Senate Print 2411, by Senator Parker, an act

1 to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

2 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill  
4 will be laid aside.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
6 536, Senate Print 6831A, by Senator Hinchey, an  
7 act to amend the Navigation Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the  
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
11 act shall take effect on the 120th day after it  
12 shall have become a law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the  
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce  
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
19 Calendar 536, voting in the negative are  
20 Senators Griffo, Martins, Oberacker, O'Mara,  
21 Ortt, Rhoads, Stec, Walczyk and Weik.

22 Ayes, 52. Nays, 9.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill  
24 is passed.

25 Senator Gianaris, that completes the

1 reading of today's calendar.

2 SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you,  
3 Mr. President.

4 Let's move on to the controversial  
5 calendar, beginning with Calendar 534.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The  
7 Secretary will ring the bell.

8 The Secretary will read.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
10 534, Senate Print 2411, by Senator Parker, an act  
11 to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator  
13 Lanza, why do you rise?

14 SENATOR LANZA: Thank you,  
15 Senator Gianaris.

16 And, Mr. President, I believe  
17 there's an amendment at the desk. I waive the  
18 reading of that amendment and ask that you  
19 recognize Senator Ashby.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank  
21 you, Senator Lanza.

22 Upon review of the amendment, in  
23 accordance with Rule 6, Section 4B, I rule it  
24 nongermane and out of order.

25 SENATOR LANZA: Accordingly,

1 Mr. President, I appeal the ruling of the chair  
2 and ask that Senator Ashby be heard on the  
3 appeal.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The  
5 appeal has been made and recognized, and  
6 Senator Ashby may be heard.

7 SENATOR ASHBY: Thank you,  
8 Mr. President, on the amendment.

9 Some important context on the CLCPA  
10 that gets lost. This isn't new. This has been  
11 the law for almost seven years. We've spent  
12 billions of taxpayer dollars trying this. Here's  
13 what we have to show for it: 2,000 net megawatts  
14 of reliable power has been decommissioned from  
15 our grid. Utility bills have skyrocketed over  
16 54 percent. And the Governor's own  
17 administration recently admitted the pain our  
18 constituents are feeling now is just the  
19 beginning.

20 NYSERDA says when the law is fully  
21 enforced and fully implemented, upstate energy  
22 bills will spike an additional \$340 a month.  
23 These mandates were passed before we built out an  
24 electric grid that could even possibly handle  
25 them.

1                   These mandates made a massive bet on  
2 solar and wind in a state that for much of the  
3 year is neither sunny nor windy. These mandates  
4 are impossible to enforce, and the Governor has  
5 argued as much in court. The state's new  
6 official energy plan involves using natural gas  
7 as a bridge to our clean energy future.

8                   Sounds good to me, probably sounds  
9 good to you too. Too bad that's outlawed by the  
10 CLCPA.

11                   Every single reasonable person would  
12 agree that working toward a cleaner, more  
13 sustainable energy future is important. However,  
14 no reasonable person would argue that this is  
15 going well or that the CLCPA represents a  
16 balanced, workable approach.

17                   My constituents need help. I have  
18 seniors on fixed incomes who are choosing between  
19 paying out-of-pocket costs for prescription drugs  
20 or keeping the heat on. They need our help  
21 today. We can do something about it right now by  
22 supporting this amendment.

23                   Thank you, Mr. President.

24                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank  
25 you, Senator.

1 I want to remind the house that the  
2 vote is on the procedures of the house and the  
3 ruling of the chair.

4 Those in favor of overruling the  
5 chair, signify by saying aye.

6 (Response of "Aye.")

7 SENATOR LANZA: Show of hands,  
8 please.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: A show of  
10 hands has been requested and so ordered.

11 Announce the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 22.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The  
14 ruling of the chair stands, and the bill-in-chief  
15 is before the house.

16 Read the last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
18 act shall take effect immediately.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the  
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,  
23 we'll be restoring this to the noncontroversial  
24 calendar, please.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank

1 you, Senator Gianaris.

2 Read the last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
4 act shall take effect immediately.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the  
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce  
9 the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill  
12 is passed.

13 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,  
14 let's move to Calendar 159, please.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The  
16 Secretary will read.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
18 159, Senate Print 119, by Senator Cleare, an act  
19 to amend the Emergency Tenant Protection Act.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator  
21 Martins, why do you rise?

22 SENATOR MARTINS: On the bill.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator  
24 Martins on the bill.

25 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,

1 Mr. President.

2 The issue outlined by the sponsor in  
3 the memo is to try to address the issue of  
4 warehousing of units. That is, Mr. President,  
5 there are vacant units in New York City that  
6 remain vacant, that are identified as part of the  
7 DHCR's annual survey, and somehow this bill is  
8 meant to address the underlying issue of these  
9 vacant units.

10 The DHCR recently, back in December  
11 of 2025, updated their dashboard to include a lot  
12 of additional information which does make it  
13 easier to identify vacant units. But again, the  
14 real problem is that they aren't collecting the  
15 information about the why of the vacancy.

16 That is, Mr. President, even though  
17 they ask whether the unit is vacant, at no point  
18 do they ask the landlord why it's vacant.

19 And so if we're going to address the  
20 issue of warehousing of units and we're going to  
21 address the issue of vacant units that I think  
22 people understand exist, I think it's important  
23 that we understand the why.

24 And frankly, I'm not sure that this  
25 bill goes to that question by merely asking for

1 LLCs to provide information with regard to  
2 ownership structure.

3 So through you, Mr. President, if  
4 the sponsor would yield to a few questions.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Would the  
6 sponsor yield?

7 SENATOR CLEARE: Yes.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The  
9 sponsor yields.

10 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,  
11 Senator.

12 So would you agree that DHCR should,  
13 in addition to tracking vacant units, also  
14 request that the business owner provide the  
15 reason for why the units are vacant?

16 SENATOR CLEARE: I'm not speaking  
17 to that.

18 The reason we're here today is  
19 because I feel as if DHCR should track the owners  
20 for the purpose of identifying owners when we are  
21 seeking repairs in these units.

22 That's the spirit of this bill, so  
23 that we can know trends and we can know patterns  
24 and we are able to identify those persons and  
25 they don't hide behind different LLCs, and we

1 have these consistent and persistent problems  
2 that exist in some of our properties.

3 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,  
4 Senator.

5 Thank you, Mr. President. Through  
6 you, if the sponsor would continue to yield.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the  
8 sponsor yield?

9 SENATOR CLEARE: Yes.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The  
11 sponsor yields.

12 SENATOR MARTINS: So to be clear,  
13 notwithstanding the memo that accompanied the  
14 bill, the purpose of the bill, to you as the  
15 sponsor, is not for identifying vacant units, but  
16 rather to identify persons responsible for those  
17 units so that if units need to be repaired,  
18 there's a person to contact?

19 SENATOR CLEARE: Yes. And  
20 especially in cases where -- and I have seen in  
21 my district and in other places there's a  
22 persistent pattern that exists with certain  
23 owners. But it is difficult to -- it's difficult  
24 to know who they are when you're just dealing  
25 with an LLC.

1                   This information should be available  
2 to HCR so that they can see if there's someone  
3 who is constantly having this problem and not  
4 addressing it. Through you, Mr. President.

5                   SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you.

6                   Mr. President, if the sponsor would  
7 continue to yield.

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the  
9 sponsor yield?

10                  SENATOR CLEARE: Through you,  
11 Mr. President, yes, I do.

12                  ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The  
13 sponsor yields.

14                  SENATOR MARTINS: So for purposes  
15 of identifying a responsible person, would it be  
16 easier, do you think, for DHCR to require the  
17 owner to identify an individual to whom that  
18 outreach can take place, short of providing  
19 information with regard to beneficial ownership  
20 with regard to the LLC?

21                  SENATOR CLEARE: Sometimes. But,  
22 you know, oftentimes decisions that have to be  
23 made, especially in emergency cases, cannot be  
24 made by these designated persons.

25                  Sometimes we really have to reach

1 those persons who are responsible for the  
2 property. And especially, you know, we've had a  
3 brutal winter, we've had buildings where there is  
4 a persistent lack of heat, lack of hot water.  
5 And that's not something that we can play with.

6 We need to be able to identify these  
7 people, and especially if they continuously do  
8 this and exhibit this kind of behavior.

9 SENATOR MARTINS: Through you,  
10 Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to  
11 yield.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the  
13 sponsor yield?

14 SENATOR CLEARE: Yes.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The  
16 sponsor yields.

17 SENATOR MARTINS: So given that one  
18 of the worst landlords in New York City by far  
19 happens to be the City of New York itself,  
20 through the NYCHA program and the catastrophe  
21 that that has been with regard to access to heat  
22 and hot water, living conditions, the responsible  
23 person for that, I'm assuming, would also be the  
24 mayor of the City of New York, right?

25 Would that the beneficial owner, the

1 person to contact in the event of all of those  
2 terrible things that are going on in NYCHA  
3 facilities and holding somebody responsible?

4 SENATOR CLEARE: This bill deals  
5 with rent-stabilized housing, not public housing.

6 SENATOR MARTINS: Through you,  
7 Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to  
8 yield.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the  
10 sponsor yield?

11 SENATOR CLEARE: Through you,  
12 Mr. President, yes, I do.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The  
14 sponsor yields.

15 SENATOR MARTINS: But we're dealing  
16 with a condition with regard to living  
17 conditions. Would you consider amending the bill  
18 to include the plight of people living in  
19 public housing, in NYCHA facilities, and the very  
20 real concerns that we should all have with regard  
21 to the conditions they're living under?

22 SENATOR CLEARE: Again, I just have  
23 to say this bill specifically relates to  
24 rent-stabilized housing and our ability to have  
25 access to know who is ultimately responsible for

1 addressing and remediating heat and hot water,  
2 power outages, habitability issues, displacement  
3 issues, buyouts and forced vacancies, and also  
4 tenant and resident harassment.

5           These are things that we want to  
6 identify, and it has been difficult to do that in  
7 many of these properties that are owned by LLCs.

8           SENATOR MARTINS: Through you,  
9 Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to  
10 yield.

11           ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the  
12 sponsor yield?

13           SENATOR CLEARE: Through you,  
14 Mr. President, I do.

15           ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The  
16 sponsor yields.

17           SENATOR MARTINS: I notice that the  
18 bill does not include any other forms of  
19 ownership like corporations.

20           Certainly if a corporation was to  
21 own housing units and multiple housing units, I  
22 would think that the same concerns that you're  
23 voicing with regard to LLCs should occur with  
24 regard to multiple types or different types of  
25 ownership structures.

1                   Can you tell us why this bill only  
2 deals with LLCs and not any other structure?

3                   SENATOR CLEARE:   Well, that might  
4 be an idea for another bill.  But right now it  
5 deals with the LLCs, and those are the ones that  
6 seem to pop up under different names from time to  
7 time, but it's the same people behind these LLCs.

8                   SENATOR MARTINS:   Through you,  
9 Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to  
10 yield.

11                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:   Does the  
12 sponsor yield?

13                   SENATOR CLEARE:   Through you,  
14 Mr. President, I yield.

15                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:   The  
16 sponsor yields.

17                   SENATOR MARTINS:   Thank you,  
18 Senator.

19                   With regard then to the group that  
20 would have to be identified, I think there is the  
21 term "beneficial owner" in the bill, and then the  
22 bill goes on to speak to what is meant by  
23 beneficial owners.  And I want to be clear as to  
24 the scope of the bill.

25                   You know, we've talked now, just

1 anecdotally, about ownership, people who own and  
2 are members of the LLC. Is it your understanding  
3 that this bill includes those owners and only  
4 those people who own the LLC?

5 SENATOR CLEARE: Okay, I'm told  
6 that the definition is in the bill of the owner.  
7 It is in the bill, who we're talking about.

8 SENATOR MARTINS: I understand.  
9 And that's why -- through you, Mr. President, if  
10 the sponsor would continue to yield.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the  
12 sponsor yield?

13 SENATOR CLEARE: Yes.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The  
15 sponsor yields.

16 SENATOR MARTINS: I understand it's  
17 within the bill. I read it, and so I understand  
18 what it says.

19 And so given the broad scope of the  
20 language -- and Mr. President, through you, I  
21 will read it. Since, you know, that's what I was  
22 directed to do, let's all understand what we're  
23 talking about.

24 It says that a beneficial owner  
25 (reading) shall mean an individual who directly

1 or indirectly, through any contract, arrangement,  
2 understanding, relationship, or otherwise -- or  
3 otherwise -- owns any equity interest of an  
4 entity and/or has a level of control over the  
5 funds or assets of the entity that, as a  
6 practical matter, enables the individual directly  
7 or indirectly to control, manage or direct the  
8 entity and the use of its funds and assets or any  
9 part thereof.

10 So I -- having read that definition,  
11 my concern is just how broad it is and whether or  
12 not that definition, being as broad as it is, can  
13 fairly be replied to, because if it were just the  
14 membership, ownership of the LLC, we can check  
15 that box. But this doesn't say that.

16 So I'd love to have your sense of  
17 what it does or does not include so that we can  
18 give clarity to those people who are going to be  
19 expected to actually comply with this bill.

20 SENATOR CLEARE: The language  
21 matches the LLC Transparency Act definition, the  
22 bill that we passed in 2023. It's the same  
23 language.

24 SENATOR MARTINS: Mr. President --

25 SENATOR CLEARE: Through you,

1 Mr. President. Sorry.

2 SENATOR MARTINS: -- if the sponsor  
3 would continue to yield?

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the  
5 sponsor yield?

6 SENATOR CLEARE: Through you,  
7 Mr. President, I do.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The  
9 sponsor yields.

10 SENATOR MARTINS: So the LLC  
11 Transparency Act and the requirements, from what  
12 I recall, was actually vetoed because of concerns  
13 about just this kind of language and, you know,  
14 where it would place New York State LLCs as  
15 opposed to other LLCs throughout the country, and  
16 perhaps put the state at a disadvantage.

17 Are you aware of that?

18 SENATOR CLEARE: So it's my  
19 understanding that this part -- this was passed  
20 in 2023. And the part that you're talking about,  
21 that part was vetoed on a federal level. Okay.  
22 But what we passed in 2023 is this definition.

23 SENATOR MARTINS: Through you,  
24 Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to  
25 yield.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Will the  
2 sponsor yield?

3                   SENATOR CLEARE:    Through you,  
4 Mr. President.

5                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    The  
6 sponsor yields.

7                   SENATOR MARTINS:    So if someone  
8 fails to provide that information, what is the  
9 penalty assessed to that building owner for  
10 failure to provide the information required by  
11 the bill?

12                                   (Pause.)

13                   SENATOR CLEARE:    So that would be  
14 considered an incomplete filing with the  
15 registration.  Sometimes people do, and that --  
16 you know, HCR has their methods for dealing with  
17 that.  But the bill does not state any penalty.

18                   SENATOR MARTINS:    Through you,  
19 Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to  
20 yield.

21                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Does the  
22 sponsor yield?

23                   SENATOR CLEARE:    Through you,  
24 Mr. President, I do.

25                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    The

1 sponsor yields.

2 SENATOR MARTINS: So through you,  
3 Mr. President. Are you familiar with the  
4 requirement that if there is an incomplete  
5 filing, that the penalty that is assessed by DHCR  
6 is actually \$500 per day per unit until the  
7 filing is completed or corrected? Are you  
8 familiar with that?

9 SENATOR CLEARE: No. But --  
10 through you, Mr. President, I don't know the  
11 exact dollar amount. I don't know the penalty,  
12 no.

13 SENATOR MARTINS: Mr. President, on  
14 the bill.

15 Senator, thank you.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator  
17 Martins on the bill.

18 SENATOR MARTINS: So here we are,  
19 we're being asked to vote on a bill where the  
20 language encompassing who may or may not be  
21 required to report is ambiguous, is broad.  
22 Frankly, it can include anyone from the owner to  
23 anyone who has the authority to sign checks or  
24 anyone who's managing the property.

25 It is overly broad in the context of

1 a group that is managing multifamily housing in  
2 New York City. And yet the penalty for getting  
3 it wrong that will be absorbed by the ownership  
4 could be up to \$500 per day per unit for every  
5 day that they got it wrong. And they're forced  
6 to guess as to what it is or who they can or have  
7 to actually submit.

8 Now, I certainly share the sponsor's  
9 concerns with regard to conditions and conditions  
10 in housing, because no one should be in a  
11 position of not having heat in the winter, clean  
12 water, access to utilities, and to live in a safe  
13 environment. I agree with the sponsor a thousand  
14 percent. And I thank her, because I understand  
15 that the bill comes from a good place. I do.

16 My concern is that oftentimes what  
17 we do is we pass bills in this chamber hoping to  
18 reach a certain result, but we come up short.  
19 And so there are other ways by which we can make  
20 sure that people comply with those requirements.

21 And maybe we need to be more  
22 aggressive in how we do that and not exclude  
23 public housing and not exclude corporations. And  
24 maybe we need to be more aggressive to make sure  
25 that people are living in safe housing

1 conditions.

2 But the idea, Mr. President, that we  
3 are going to somehow solve this issue by creating  
4 a requirement that isn't clear, but that comes  
5 with significant consequences and penalties, is  
6 something that we should avoid, frankly, as a  
7 body.

8 And so to the extent that there is  
9 an opportunity for us to work together to come up  
10 with an alternative that requires these things  
11 and holds people accountable, count me in.

12 But we're not going to exclude NYCHA  
13 in the City of New York, and we shouldn't exclude  
14 any housing units in New York City or anywhere  
15 else in the state.

16 And certainly if we're going to  
17 impose penalties and we're going to try and get  
18 there, let's make sure we get there in a way that  
19 is fair so that people understand what they have  
20 to do in order to comply, and it's not subject to  
21 interpretation.

22 And so I share the sponsor's  
23 mission. I look forward to hopefully working  
24 with her on other initiatives as we move forward.  
25 But unfortunately, Mr. President, I will not be

1 able to support this bill at this time for the  
2 reasons that I just explained.

3 And again, I want to thank the  
4 sponsor.

5 Thank you, Mr. President.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank  
7 you, Senator Martins, on the bill.

8 Are there any other Senators wishing  
9 to be heard?

10 Seeing and hearing none, debate is  
11 now closed.

12 The Secretary will ring the bell.

13 Senator Gianaris.

14 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,  
15 let's return this to the noncontroversial  
16 calendar as well.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: We'll  
18 return it to the noncontroversial calendar.

19 Read the last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This  
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the  
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator

1 Cleare to explain her vote.

2 SENATOR CLEARE: Thank you,  
3 Mr. President.

4 This bill is about three things.  
5 This bill serves multiple purposes. One, it  
6 builds on the Senate Majority's efforts to  
7 provide disclosure and transparency with respect  
8 to LLCs.

9 Secondly, by providing more  
10 disclosure of ownership interests in housing  
11 LLCs, we can get a greater picture of trends that  
12 are occurring, including buyouts, forced  
13 vacancies, harassment and so on.

14 Third, in cases where it may be  
15 appropriate to raise issues to owners, we can  
16 deal with real names and human beings, not LLCs  
17 with mailboxes.

18 In my role as State Senator, I'm  
19 often tasked with getting to the bottom of  
20 things. The mailing addresses of LLCs and even  
21 publicly available information about management  
22 companies is not always sufficient to resolve  
23 issues.

24 If you want to own housing,  
25 especially rent-regulated housing in this state,

1 we should know exactly who you are and how to  
2 reach you. LLCs fail miserably often in this  
3 regard, and that is why disclosure is needed.

4 I proudly vote aye and ask my  
5 colleagues to do the same.

6 Thank you.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator  
8 Cleare to be recorded in the affirmative.

9 Announce the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
11 Calendar 159, voting in the negative are  
12 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,  
13 Cooney, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Martins,  
14 Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt,  
15 Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk,  
16 Weber and Weik.

17 Ayes, 40. Nays, 21.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill  
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
21 477, Senate Print 947, by Senator Jackson, an act  
22 to amend the Real Property Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator  
24 Walczyk, why do you rise?

25 SENATOR WALCZYK: Mr. President, I

1 hope the sponsor would yield for some questions.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the  
3 sponsor yield?

4 SENATOR JACKSON: So, how you  
5 doing, brother?

6 (Laughter.)

7 SENATOR WALCZYK: Good. How are  
8 you, neighbor?

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The  
10 sponsor is definitely yielding.

11 SENATOR WALCZYK: So current law --  
12 through you, Mr. President, current law states  
13 that electronic billing and/or payment for rent,  
14 a landlord shall not require a lessee or tenant  
15 to use electronic billing and/or a payment system  
16 as the only method for the payment of rent, and a  
17 landlord shall not assess any fee or other charge  
18 for the lessee or tenant that chooses not to use  
19 electronic billing and/or payment system. So  
20 that's the current law.

21 What changes to current law does  
22 this bill propose?

23 SENATOR JACKSON: I don't know. I  
24 didn't -- I'm not concerned with that.

25 I'm concerned with when the landlord

1 has sent out notice to everyone in the building  
2 that they have an option of paying rent through  
3 one of these organizations, an automated  
4 clearinghouse. So the tenants can say yes, I  
5 would like to do that, what is it going to cost?  
6 Or it's going to cost nothing or, you know, no,  
7 I'm not interested.

8 So basically that's what happened,  
9 but overall, when someone agrees that they want  
10 to use a clearinghouse. So for me, I looked at  
11 the situation, okay, now I would have to write a  
12 check, pay for the stamp, and then mail it.  
13 That's the process that was happening before.  
14 Okay?

15 And now there's an automatic  
16 clearinghouse where the landlord has suggested  
17 that this is -- would make it easier for  
18 everyone.

19 And so I, as a tenant for 48 years,  
20 with my wife and family, took advantage of that  
21 because it was okay by me.

22 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,  
23 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to  
24 yield.

25 SENATOR JACKSON: Yes.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Will the  
2    sponsor yield?

3                   The sponsor yields.

4                   SENATOR WALCZYK:    So if this bill  
5    that you're proposing prohibits the landlord from  
6    assessing that fee through those processes for a  
7    payment of rent, how will that fee get paid for?  
8    How will that get assessed?

9                   SENATOR JACKSON:    I don't think  
10   that the landlord is -- I think that what happens  
11   is that the fee that the automatic clearinghouse  
12   pays by the tenant who wants to have the easier  
13   way in order to process their rent, it meets  
14   their recommendations.   So they do it.

15                   But other than that, there's no  
16   necessity for them to act if they don't want to  
17   act.   And so this is not where you're being  
18   forced to do it.   If you want to do it, you have  
19   a right to do it.

20                   SENATOR WALCZYK:    Through you,  
21   Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to  
22   yield.

23                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Will the  
24   sponsor yield?

25                   SENATOR JACKSON:    Yes.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    The  
2    sponsor yields.

3                   SENATOR WALCZYK:    Yeah, I  
4    understand that they wouldn't be forced to do it.  
5    But those systems do have a cost to run.  I'm  
6    sure that landlords subscribe to these systems  
7    and they have some overhead that currently --  
8    similar to when you're using your credit card, a  
9    certain percentage or a certain payment of your  
10   credit card goes to the actual vendor for the  
11   credit card machines and how they get processed,  
12   so that that ultimately gets charged to your  
13   bank.

14                   I'm curious about who will  
15   ultimately pay those fees when landlords  
16   subscribe to use one of these convenience things  
17   for their tenant, like you've taken advantage of.

18                   SENATOR JACKSON:    I am not in  
19   response to that.  As long as I've agreed to the  
20   system where I won't do anything but the  
21   automatic clearinghouse, basically, when it's  
22   time to pay my rent, the rent is being paid.  And  
23   that's coming out of my checking account, and  
24   that's it.  I'm not looking for a second job,  
25   monitoring what everybody else is paying.

1                   SENATOR WALCZYK:    Through you,  
2   Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to  
3   yield.

4                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:   Will the  
5   sponsor yield?

6                   SENATOR JACKSON:    Yes.

7                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:   The  
8   sponsor yields.

9                   SENATOR WALCZYK:    So the Governor  
10  signed a law a few years ago explicitly allowing  
11  for these payments for the automated  
12  clearinghouses to be passed through to consumers.  
13  And we specifically enumerated -- but not if the  
14  tenant is paying by cash or check, because we  
15  didn't want to hem up rent increases into  
16  additional fees.

17                   But how does this square up with  
18  that?  Aren't you are concerned that that  
19  convenience will come away if there's no way for  
20  a landlord to pay for it?

21                   SENATOR JACKSON:    I'm not  
22  concerned.  I'm not concerned because it's a  
23  process that's worked.  It's working for me.

24                   And if you are living there with  
25  your family, and if there's a fee, let's say of

1       \$2 or something like that, you have to decide  
2       whether or not you want to accept that and make  
3       it easier for you, rather than you or your spouse  
4       writing a check, putting it in the envelope and  
5       stamped and then mailing it and making sure that  
6       it gets received by the owner of the building.

7                        So it makes life easier for everyone  
8       overall if you can afford a dollar or two  
9       dollars, whatever it costs.

10                      SENATOR WALCZYK:    Through you,  
11       Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to  
12       yield.

13                      ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Will the  
14       sponsor yield?

15                      SENATOR JACKSON:    Yes.

16                      ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    The  
17       sponsor yields.

18                      SENATOR WALCZYK:    I see.  So you're  
19       really just looking to provide transparency for  
20       what that fee will be for the convenience of the  
21       automatic -- automated clearinghouse.  Am I  
22       understanding you correctly?

23                      SENATOR JACKSON:    If they told me  
24       the fee was \$2, I have to decide whether or not I  
25       wanted -- if they said 10, 15 dollars, I have to

1 decide.

2 But I say this to you. If it was  
3 10, 15 dollars, I'm not using it. I mean, you  
4 have to evaluate what's best for you and your  
5 family.

6 SENATOR WALCZYK: Thank you.

7 Thank you, Mr. President.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank  
9 you, Senator Walczyk.

10 Are there any other Senators wishing  
11 to be heard?

12 Seeing and hearing none, debate is  
13 now closed.

14 The Secretary will ring the bell.

15 SENATOR GIANARIS: Let us also  
16 restore this to the noncontroversial calendar,  
17 please.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Per  
19 Senator Gianaris, the bill will be restored to  
20 the noncontroversial calendar.

21 Read the last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the  
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator  
3 Martins to explain his vote.

4 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,  
5 Mr. President.

6 I want to thank the sponsor for this  
7 legislation.

8 I think, frankly, transparency in  
9 these situations are paramount. And certainly as  
10 long as the only thing the bill requires is that  
11 the landlord provide notice to the tenants and  
12 give them the option of doing that, then it makes  
13 sense.

14 And so it's up to the tenant to  
15 decide whether or not they're willing to pay that  
16 fee, and certainly they can arrange their own  
17 finances accordingly.

18 So to the extent that the bill just  
19 requires that the landlord provide that, I vote  
20 aye, and thank the sponsor.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator  
22 Martins to be recorded in the affirmative.

23 Announce the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
25 Calendar 477, voting in the negative are

1 Senators Borrello, Palumbo, Rhoads, Skoufis,  
2 Walczyk and Weik.

3 Ayes, 55. Nays, 6.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill  
5 is passed.

6 Senator Gianaris, that completes the  
7 reading of today's calendar.

8 SENATOR GIANARIS: Is there any  
9 further business at the desk?

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: There is  
11 no further business at the desk.

12 SENATOR GIANARIS: I move to  
13 adjourn until tomorrow, Thursday, March 19th, at  
14 11:00 a.m.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: On  
16 motion, the Senate stands adjourned until  
17 Thursday, March 19th, at 11:00 a.m.

18 (Whereupon, at 5:10 p.m., the Senate  
19 adjourned.)

20

21

22

23

24

25