

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

NEW YORK STATE SENATE

THE STENOGRAPHIC RECORD

ALBANY, NEW YORK

March 17, 2026

3:19 p.m.

REGULAR SESSION

SENATOR ROXANNE J. PERSAUD, Acting President

ALEJANDRA N. PAULINO, ESQ., Secretary

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
3 Senate will come to order.

4 I ask everyone to please rise and
5 recite the Pledge of Allegiance.

6 (Whereupon, the assemblage recited
7 the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Reverend
9 Father Dan Quinn, of Blessed Sacrament Church in
10 Albany, will deliver today's invocation.

11 FATHER QUINN: Hello. Thank you
12 for having me.

13 I'm Father Quinn, from Blessed
14 Sacrament, up the street here in Albany. I've
15 got a couple of other parishes with their schools
16 as well.

17 You know, today is St. Patrick's
18 Day, so I know I'm dressed a little bit
19 traditional Irish with a kilt. But I know, of
20 course, the Irish are just one of many cultures
21 that have come together to form, you know, what
22 we have here as a state in New York.

23 And today, on the feast of one of
24 their great saints, one of their great leaders,
25 who himself was first a foreigner, sort of, as

1 the story goes, captured and sort of enslaved by
2 those people and escaped, but then went back
3 again as an immigrant and lived there as a man
4 with some new and different ideas that he had.
5 And eventually, as they caught on, he became the
6 bishop there, the man chiefly in charge of
7 praying for them, you know.

8 So we take a moment to pray,
9 certainly for the people of Ireland today on
10 their feast of their great saint. We take the
11 time to pray for our community here in New York,
12 and also for our leaders and for our legislators.

13 So let us pray.

14 In the name of the Father and of the
15 Son and the Holy Spirit, amen.

16 Lord God, we know that in Your
17 perfect fatherly love, You have given us laws to
18 guide all of our decisions, our growth to guide
19 our consciences. Through Moses, through the
20 prophets, and above all through Jesus, we have
21 received Your ways, which are so far above our
22 ways.

23 And yet they are written on each of
24 our hearts as the goal and the guide for our own
25 lives, most supremely expressed in Your command

1 to love -- to love You and to love our neighbor.

2 So we ask You to help us to honor
3 Your laws while we are engaged in composing ours,
4 in composing our laws, that our ways may be a
5 true reflection of Your perfect way. And that,
6 in the craft of lawmaking, You may protect us
7 from distortions, not allowing us to be satisfied
8 with easy solutions to complex problems.

9 So guide us to being true agents of
10 truth and of love, avoiding all that is really,
11 truly in our power to hate and to live according
12 to convenient falsehoods, or what is in our power
13 to cause destruction, to cause division, to cause
14 death.

15 Instead, help us to be people who
16 foster and protect life: The lives of all of our
17 citizens, our neighbors, the guests in our
18 state -- all life, young and old.

19 And so, in quoting St. Patrick, help
20 us, Lord, in all of this to arise, to rise to the
21 challenge, through -- quoting St. Patrick --
22 God's strength to pilot me, God's might to uphold
23 me, God's wisdom to guide me, God's eye to look
24 before me, God's ear to hear me, God's word to
25 speak for me, God's hand to guard me, God's

1 shield to protect me.

2 Christ with me, before me, behind
3 me, in me, beneath me, above me, on my right and
4 on my left.

5 May God's host save us and protect
6 us and give us the strength we need through
7 Christ our Lord. Amen.

8 (Response of "Amen.")

9 FATHER QUINN: Thank you for having
10 me. You'll be in my prayers.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Reading
12 of the Journal.

13 THE SECRETARY: In Senate, Monday,
14 March 16, 2026, the Senate met pursuant to
15 adjournment. The Journal of Friday, March 13,
16 2026, was read and approved. On motion, the
17 Senate adjourned.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Without
19 objection, the Journal stands approved as read.

20 Presentation of petitions.

21 Messages from the Assembly.

22 Messages from the Governor.

23 Reports of standing committees.

24 Reports of select committees.

25 Communications and reports from

1 state officers.

2 Motions and resolutions.

3 Senator Gianaris.

4 SENATOR GIANARIS: Good afternoon,
5 Madam President.

6 On behalf of Senator Myrie, on
7 page 15 I offer the following amendments to
8 Calendar Number 412, Senate 2539A, and ask that
9 said bill retain its place on the Third Reading
10 Calendar.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
12 amendments are received, and the bill will retain
13 its place on the Third Reading Calendar.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
15 Gianaris.

16 SENATOR GIANARIS: Please recognize
17 Senator Hinchey for an introduction.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
19 Hinchey for an introduction.

20 SENATOR HINCHEY: Thank you,
21 Madam President.

22 It's my honor to welcome some very
23 special guests to the chamber today, students
24 from my district who are part of student
25 government at Millbrook Middle School.

1 We are so happy that you're here
2 today.

3 These students made the trip from
4 Dutchess County to learn about New York State
5 history and the legislative process. And there's
6 no better way to do that than right here in this
7 chamber.

8 Student government is one of the
9 most important clubs that a student can join. It
10 proves that you don't have to wait until you're
11 adult to identify what matters to you, to
12 organize around it, and to work hard to make
13 school and your community a better place for
14 everyone.

15 And this group has already put that
16 mission into action. They ran a successful
17 holiday food drive for a local pantry, making
18 sure neighbors in need had food on their tables.

19 They organized a Valentine's Day
20 dance to raise funds so students have the chance
21 to go on meaningful field trips like this one.

22 And they've been advocating directly
23 for student-led improvements within their school.

24 Seeing our next generation engaged
25 in showing up like this is incredibly important,

1 and it gives me so much hope for our future. You
2 all are setting an example not only for your
3 peers but for all of us here today.

4 So thank you for being here. Thank
5 you for taking on leadership roles. Thank you
6 for being engaged and for caring about your
7 fellow students and your community at large.

8 And I want to shout out
9 your teachers, who helped make it all possible to
10 be able to be here today and to instill the
11 incredible work that something like student
12 government can give.

13 And so, Madam President, I would ask
14 you to welcome our guests to the chamber and to
15 give them all of the privileges.

16 Thank you very much.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
18 you.

19 To our guests from Millbrook
20 Middle School student government, congratulations
21 on all the things that you have done. I welcome
22 you on behalf of the Senate. We extend to you
23 the privileges and courtesies of this house.

24 Please remain standing and be
25 recognized.

1 (Standing ovation.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
3 Gianaris.

4 SENATOR GIANARIS: At this time,
5 Madam President, I move to adopt the
6 Resolution Calendar, with the exception of
7 Resolution 1739.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: All
9 those in favor of adopting the
10 Resolution Calendar, with the exception of
11 Resolution 1739, please signify by saying aye.

12 (Response of "Aye.")

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Opposed,
14 nay.

15 (No response.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
17 Resolution Calendar is adopted.

18 Senator Gianaris.

19 SENATOR GIANARIS: Now let's take
20 up Resolution 1739, by Senator Serrano, read its
21 title, and call on Senator Serrano.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
23 Secretary will read.

24 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1739, by
25 Senator Serrano, memorializing Governor Kathy

1 Hochul to proclaim March 2026 as Youth Art Month
2 in the State of New York.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
4 Serrano on the resolution.

5 SENATOR SERRANO: Thank you very
6 much, Madam President.

7 Youth Arts Month is really a very
8 special time here in the State of New York. It
9 gives us the opportunity to really talk about how
10 important the arts and culture are to students
11 across our state.

12 Plenty of studies show that exposure
13 to the arts, culture, music, dance, any of the
14 arts has a profound impact on students across our
15 state, allowing them to do better in all other
16 subjects. It really does create better,
17 well-rounded individuals and students. It makes
18 them more excited about school itself. And it
19 does have tremendously important outcomes.

20 But unfortunately, throughout the
21 State of New York we are not always hitting our
22 mark in ensuring that we have viable and robust
23 arts and music instruction across our state.

24 So it's important that we use
25 Youth Arts Month as a great opportunity to push

1 for more arts programming in schools, to support
2 our teachers so that they can do all the things
3 that we need to do, and also to think more about
4 how the arts and culture in our schools do so
5 much more than provide a moment that is
6 aesthetically pleasing, but actually has a
7 profound impact on test scores and ensuring that
8 students can do well.

9 I will also mention that the arts
10 are uniquely positioned to be a tremendous
11 vehicle for discussions on social justice. And
12 that artists across time, across history,
13 sometimes at their own detriment, have put forth
14 a lot of important messages that needed to be
15 heard, in ways that all of us can really do
16 things in very unstratified ways and come
17 together and build coalitions around important
18 things.

19 So the arts are so many things. And
20 really, we should ensure that our students have
21 that ability to partake in it. And that's why
22 I'm so grateful to my colleagues for supporting
23 Youth Arts Month for March in the State of
24 New York.

25 Thank you.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
2 you.

3 Senator Bailey on the resolution.

4 SENATOR BAILEY: Thank you,
5 Madam President.

6 Thank you, Senator Serrano, for this
7 really important resolution.

8 I know we fund schools and we fund
9 programs in schools, and we should continue to do
10 so. But when it's at home, you see it
11 differently.

12 My oldest, Giada, has taken up the
13 violin, and she's become quite good at it,
14 Madam President. And you ultimately see a
15 confidence boost in her. There's a higher level
16 of her abilities to feel like she's doing
17 something positive because she's taken up that
18 violin.

19 My youngest, Carina -- youngest
20 daughter, Carina, has taken up the drums, and
21 she's very talented, way better -- both of them
22 way better than I ever was in music. But this
23 also has -- you see a growth in her academic
24 performance.

25 Julian is almost two, he's not

1 really playing anything officially yet unless you
2 count banging on pots and pans, at which he is an
3 Olympic gold medalist.

4 But still, it's very crucial that we
5 fund music and arts. Because I always believe
6 that the creative fuels the critical. You can't
7 be a critical thinker without being a bit
8 creative. You can't be a good lawyer or debater
9 without thinking about a creative path towards
10 that debate.

11 So it is really important to make
12 sure that we continue to have arts and music in
13 schools, because it is a vital part of who we
14 should be as a society.

15 And I'm grateful to Senator Serrano
16 for this resolution and his leadership in his
17 committee, and to all our colleagues for
18 continuing -- no matter what place you live in
19 this great state, that you're supporting your
20 students and children, because it does matter.
21 It makes a difference.

22 Thank you, Madam President. I vote
23 aye.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
25 you, Senator.

1 The question is on the resolution.

2 All those in favor signify by saying aye.

3 (Response of "Aye.")

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Opposed,
5 nay.

6 (No response.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
8 resolution is adopted.

9 Senator Gianaris.

10 SENATOR GIANARIS: Let's take up
11 the calendar, please, Madam President.

12 (Pause.) I neglected to open that
13 resolution for cosponsorship, Madam President.
14 Let's do that first and then take up the
15 calendar.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: At the
17 request of the sponsor, the resolution is open
18 for cosponsorship. Should you decide not to be a
19 cosponsor, please notify the desk.

20 Senator Gianaris.

21 SENATOR GIANARIS: Calendar,
22 please.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:
24 Calendar, please. The Secretary will read.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 237, Senate Print 6600B, by Senator Jackson, an
2 act to amend the Multiple Dwelling Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
13 Calendar 237, voting in the negative are
14 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
15 Chan, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming, Lanza, Martins,
16 Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt,
17 Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk,
18 Weber and Weik.

19 Ayes, 38. Nays, 22.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
21 is passed.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 325, Senate Print 228A, by Senator Skoufis, an
24 act to amend the Real Property Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
10 Calendar 325, voting in the negative are
11 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
12 Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins,
13 Mattera, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo,
14 Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk and Weik.

15 Ayes, 41. Nays, 19.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 328, Senate Print 3819A, by Senator Rivera, an
20 act to amend the Executive Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
6 Calendar 328, voting in the negative are
7 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
8 Chan, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming, Martins,
9 Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt,
10 Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk,
11 Weber and Weik.

12 Ayes, 39. Nays, 21.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 354, Senate Print 4514A, by Senator Ramos, an act
17 to amend the Labor Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator

1 Ramos to explain her vote.

2 SENATOR RAMOS: Yeah, thank you,
3 Madam President.

4 You know, today we're taking a step
5 towards something fundamental, making sure that
6 in New York, hard work is not synonymous with
7 hardship.

8 Too many families in our state are
9 doing everything right and still falling behind.
10 They're working full-time, they're raising
11 children, contributing to their communities, and
12 yet struggling to afford rent, childcare and
13 basic necessities.

14 Poverty in New York is not just
15 about income, it's about instability. It's about
16 whether a family can plan for the future or is
17 constantly forced to react to crisis. And what
18 we know and what has been widely reported is that
19 when government makes intentional investments in
20 working families, poverty goes down. Not
21 abstractly, in real terms for real people. That
22 is what good governance looks like.

23 This bill is about making sure our
24 policies actually reflect that understanding,
25 that we are not just measuring poverty but

1 actively reducing it, that we are aligning our
2 systems to support stability, not perpetuate
3 struggle.

4 The goal is not to simply manage
5 poverty, but to reduce it, to give families the
6 ability to stay in their homes, to raise their
7 children with dignity, and to build a future in
8 this state.

9 When working people have stability,
10 New York is stronger, our economy is stronger,
11 our communities are stronger. That's the work
12 before us, and that's what this bill moves us
13 closer to achieving.

14 Thank you.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
16 Ramos to be recorded in the affirmative.

17 Announce the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
19 Calendar 354, voting in the negative are
20 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
21 Griffo, Helming, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt,
22 Rhoads, Stec, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

23 Ayes, 46. Nays, 14.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
25 is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 418, Senate Print 879A, by Senator May, an act to
3 amend the Agriculture and Markets Law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This
7 act shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
12 May to explain her vote.

13 SENATOR MAY: Thank you,
14 Madam President.

15 Since I don't get to debate this
16 bill today, I would like to at least take a
17 moment to make a few comments about why I'm proud
18 to put forward this legislation that allows
19 New Yorkers to manage their lawns for food
20 production and habitat for beneficial species.

21 The American lawn is the largest
22 irrigated crop on this continent, covering about
23 forty to 50 million acres. It takes up a third
24 of all the water that's used for residential
25 uses, and uses about four times as much water as

1 most other crops do.

2 In addition to that, we use
3 pesticides, we use gas-powered equipment to mow
4 the lawns, and all of that contributes to water
5 pollution, air pollution, and noise pollution.

6 At the same time, the species that
7 we grow in our lawns are non-native and typically
8 invasive species from Northern Europe and Russia
9 that are not habitat for any native species here
10 in North America.

11 So I am pleased that with this bill
12 we are saying that we want people to be able to
13 make their yards into something that is part of a
14 flourishing habitat for the State of New York,
15 and I vote aye.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
17 May to be recorded in the affirmative.

18 Senator Martins to explain his vote.

19 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,
20 Madam President.

21 Maybe we should have debated this
22 bill this year. But for the sake of everyone
23 else in the room, we'll just explain our vote,
24 Madam President.

25 We had this discussion last year.

1 You know, the difference between someone
2 perceives as being a garden in their front lawn
3 and what they will allow to grow or overgrow or
4 interfere with their neighbor's property is a
5 real concern.

6 We've seen it in real time, maybe
7 many of us have seen it in our communities, where
8 someone decides that they're going to keep their
9 house in a certain condition and allow their
10 overgrowth in their property -- maybe it's a
11 small lot, but it brings different creatures to
12 the community and different impacts on the
13 neighbors.

14 And as much as that person may love
15 the look of their house and want to avail
16 themselves of that, we do live in communities,
17 Madam President, where we have to live together.
18 And oftentimes what that person may want for
19 themselves will automatically translate into an
20 impact to their neighbors.

21 So why don't we allow things to be
22 as they are when we only allow local communities
23 to make those decisions for themselves. Why
24 don't we allow the kind of civility that we have
25 seen historically, as opposed to allowing the

1 outlier to actually control the narrative.

2 It would be great if the sponsor's
3 vision was actually true. It would be great if
4 the person actually maintained a property
5 properly. But that rarely happens,
6 Madam President.

7 Therefore, I'll vote no.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
9 Martins to be recorded in the negative.

10 Announce the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
12 Calendar 418, voting in the negative are
13 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffo,
14 Lanza, Martins, O'Mara, Ortt, Rhoads, Ryan,
15 Walczyk and Weik. Also Senator Weber.

16 Ayes, 48. Nays, 12.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 423, Senate Print 5265, by Senator Bailey, an act
21 to amend the Correction Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
5 Bailey to explain his vote.

6 SENATOR BAILEY: Thank you,
7 Madam President.

8 In a day and time when people are
9 able to feed themselves less and less, I see more
10 and more folks voting against this bill. When
11 people are not able to sustain themselves, this
12 is not the time for us to think about taking food
13 out of people's mouths, literally.

14 Some of us live to eat, but you must
15 eat in order to live. And there's no exemption
16 for that for individuals that are coming home
17 from incarceration. They should eat. They need
18 to eat, Madam President. We should screen them
19 for SNAP eligibility. This is all this does, is
20 to screen. This is not granting anybody
21 anything. This is merely a screen.

22 Because when you're coming home from
23 incarceration there's so many reasons, there's so
24 many things that you're facing. Senseless
25 violence. Really, so many reasons. Mental

1 health reasons. Financial reasons.

2 You know, people sometimes don't
3 love the city. But I love the city.

4 Madam President, I think we should be supporting
5 this bill so people can eat.

6 I vote aye.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
8 Bailey to be recorded in the affirmative.

9 Senator Hinchey to explain her vote.

10 SENATOR HINCHEY: Thank you,
11 Madam President.

12 I rise to thank the sponsor for
13 introducing this bill and the leader for bringing
14 it to the floor today.

15 Access to food should be a right.
16 You cannot live in our society if you are hungry
17 and seeking food. You cannot live your fullest
18 life or be acclimated back into your community if
19 you're wondering where your next meal is going to
20 come from.

21 And too often we do not have enough
22 services for people who are coming back to better
23 their lives in our communities. We don't set
24 them up for success. We say: Good luck out
25 there, figure it out.

1 Having access to food is a basic
2 necessity. That if we are not helping people
3 figure out how they're going to find their next
4 meal or take that worry off the table, quite
5 literally, then we are not actually looking out
6 for our constituents and the rest of our
7 community members who are all just going about
8 our daily lives.

9 And so when someone needs food, we
10 should be, in this body, doing everything we can
11 to make sure that that is not a question. And
12 SNAP is a big part of that.

13 And so I thank you, Senator Bailey,
14 for bringing this bill forward. I encourage all
15 of my colleagues in every community that we
16 represent to vote in favor. And I proudly vote
17 in favor of this bill.

18 Thank you.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
20 Hinchey to be recorded in the affirmative.

21 Senator Martins to explain his vote.

22 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,
23 Madam President.

24 I also want to thank Senator Bailey
25 for introducing this bill. I think it's

1 important. At a time when we are dealing with,
2 you know, so much concern across the state with
3 regard to affordability, people's access to basic
4 necessities should be something that should
5 concern all of us.

6 I would just remind my colleagues
7 that in this context, this state has increased
8 spending in its budget by over \$80 billion in the
9 last six or seven years alone. Eighty billion
10 dollars.

11 There is no reason why there should
12 be anybody in this state that is hungry when
13 you're spending \$80 billion more year over
14 seven years ago.

15 And so as we debate these issues and
16 discuss these issues, I do want to thank the
17 sponsor for bringing this to the floor, and we
18 can address this small piece of this equation.
19 But I would remind everyone, as we discuss the
20 budget this year, remember, that \$80 billion is
21 gone. Go figure out why we can't feed people.

22 Madam President, I vote yes.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
24 Martins to be recorded in the affirmative.

25 Senator Murray to explain his vote.

1 SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you,
2 Madam President.

3 I too would like to praise the
4 sponsor for bringing this to the floor.

5 It's -- you've got someone who's
6 served their time. They did something wrong,
7 went to prison, they served their time. They're
8 done. They're about to come out into society,
9 they're about to hopefully become a very
10 successful member of society and acclimate back
11 in.

12 We need to do all we can to help
13 them do that, to make that transition as smooth
14 as possible so that they can do that and they
15 will have that advantage. They're going to be
16 hungry when they get out, whether they qualify or
17 not. So why not help them on the way out and
18 give them that extra help as they finish serving
19 their time and they're going back into society.

20 I proudly vote aye for this bill.
21 Thank you.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
23 Murray to be recorded in the affirmative.

24 Senator Gianaris to explain his
25 vote.

1 SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you,
2 Madam President.

3 I'm compelled to stand up and point
4 out to my colleagues that it's -- well, I was
5 going to say it's unfortunate, but it's really
6 not -- that my colleagues across the aisle are in
7 the Minority.

8 So it's easy to stand up and cast
9 aspersions without remembering the fact that some
10 of these good colleagues served in the Majority.
11 And in that time, under Governor Pataki's
12 leadership when Senator Bruno was majority
13 leader, spending, believe it or not, in this
14 state went up by \$60 billion. Doubled, doubled
15 in that time.

16 And so like I said, it's an easy job
17 to do when you just sit there and throw out wild
18 claims to try and make your point. But the fact
19 is when you actually have to govern, you spend to
20 support the people of this state. The
21 Republicans did it when they were in charge, and
22 we're certainly doing it.

23 We're doing it better and in ways
24 that are supporting working people, as opposed to
25 just the wealthy.

1 Thank you, Madam President.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
3 Gianaris to be recorded in the affirmative.

4 Announce the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
6 Calendar 423, voting in the negative are
7 Senators Borrello, Chan, Gallivan, Griffo,
8 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Rhoads, Stec, Walczyk
9 and Weik. Also Senator Tedisco.

10 Ayes, 48. Nays, 12.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 442, Senate Print 4482, by Senator Mayer, an act
15 to amend the Election Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
19 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
20 shall have become a law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
25 the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
2 Calendar 442, voting in the negative:
3 Senator Lanza.

4 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
6 is passed.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 458, Senate Print 1368, by Senator Serrano, an
9 act to create a temporary state commission to
10 study and make recommendations concerning the
11 application of pesticides.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
15 act shall take effect immediately.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 476, Senate Print 887A, by Senator Sepúlveda, an

1 act to amend the Surrogate's Court Procedure Act.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
5 act shall take effect immediately.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
10 the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
13 is passed.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 482, Senate Print 5288, by Senator Sepúlveda, an
16 act to amend the Civil Practice Law and Rules.

17 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Lay it
19 aside.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 501, Senate Print 7663A, by Senator Bynoe, an act
22 in relation to authorizing the County of Nassau
23 assessor to accept an application for a real
24 property tax exemption.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
10 Calendar 501, voting in the negative:
11 Senator O'Mara.

12 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 516, Senate Print 553, by Senator Liu, an act to
17 amend the Education Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 518, Senate Print 6334, by Senator Fahy, an act
7 to amend the Education Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11 act shall take effect 18 months after it shall
12 have become a law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
19 Calendar 518, voting in the negative are
20 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Martins, Walczyk
21 and Weik.

22 Ayes, 56. Nays, 4.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 520, Senate Print 6759, by Senator Fernandez, an
2 act to amend the Education Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
13 Calendar 520, voting in the negative:
14 Senator Weik.

15 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 521, Senate Print 6929A, by Senator Webb, an act
20 to amend the Education Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
24 act shall take effect one year after it shall
25 have become a law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
5 Webb to explain her vote.

6 SENATOR WEBB: Thank you,
7 Madam President.

8 This legislation aims to strengthen
9 transparency and accountability with the dental
10 laboratory industry. This is an industry that
11 quietly plays a vital role in the health and
12 well-being of thousands of New Yorkers every
13 single year.

14 Dental laboratories manufacture
15 dentures, crowns, bridges, orthodontic appliances
16 that are placed in patients' mouths. When a
17 dentist places a crown or a denture, patients
18 naturally assume that the products that they are
19 receiving were made safely and with quality
20 materials, and dentists assume the same thing.

21 This assumption, however, is not
22 always backed by transparency or accountability.
23 Madam President, currently there's no requirement
24 that a dental laboratory inform the dentist of
25 the materials used in the restoration, or the

1 point of origin of manufacture. This lack of
2 transparency matters.

3 Also, poorly manufactured
4 restorations can lead to infections, allergic
5 reactions, structural failures, and the need for
6 costly corrective procedures.

7 Recent surveys have shown that
8 nationwide, approximately 25 percent of domestic
9 dental laboratory sales and 38 percent of dental
10 restorations are manufactured overseas.

11 The goal of this legislation is not
12 to burden businesses with unnecessary regulation
13 but to, rather, establish accountability and
14 oversight in an area directly tied to patient
15 health. Dental appliances and prosthetics are
16 medical devices that must meet certain standards
17 of safety, quality and traceability.

18 I vote aye and encourage my
19 colleagues to do the same.

20 Thank you, Madam President.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
22 Webb to be recorded in the affirmative.

23 Announce the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
25 Calendar 521, voting in the negative:

1 Senator Walczyk.

2 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
4 is passed.

5 Senator Gianaris, that completes the
6 reading of the noncontroversial calendar.

7 SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you,
8 Madam President.

9 Please call on Senator Comrie for an
10 introduction.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
12 Comrie for an introduction.

13 SENATOR COMRIE: Thank you,
14 Madam President.

15 I rise today to acknowledge that we
16 have a group of people that are here from Queens
17 today that were brought by our borough president,
18 Donovan Richards. They're in the gallery now.
19 Some of them, it's their first time in Albany.

20 And I just wanted to thank them for
21 coming. They're here to work to make sure that
22 Queens gets the money.

23 (Laughter.)

24 SENATOR COMRIE: They're here to
25 make sure that Queens doesn't get hit with

1 property taxes, which we don't do in this state.
2 And we were able to convince them today to go
3 back downstate and let the mayor know that that
4 will not happen and we're not going to do
5 anything with property taxes. That's something
6 that has to be done on the city level.

7 But they're also here today to help
8 argue the fight for some of the shifts that were
9 burdened on the city during the de Blasio
10 administration when the previous Governor, who
11 shall not be named --

12 (Laughter.)

13 SENATOR COMRIE: -- shifted a lot
14 of money from the state to the city to burden.
15 Which is one reason why the city's in a financial
16 struggle right now.

17 So I just wanted to thank them for
18 coming. Our borough president is probably
19 meeting with the Speaker right now, Donovan
20 Richards. He's not here. But I just wanted to
21 thank you all for coming.

22 We had a great day. A lot of
23 legislators got to meet you. You've learned a
24 lot. I hope you can come back on a regular basis
25 to join the throngs of people that are up here to

1 make sure that Queens gets the money.

2 Thank you.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
4 you.

5 To the delegation from Queens civic
6 organizations, I welcome you on behalf of the
7 Senate. We extend to you the privileges and
8 courtesies of this house. Please rise and be
9 recognized.

10 (Standing ovation.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
12 Gianaris.

13 SENATOR GIANARIS: Let's take up
14 the controversial calendar, please.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
16 Secretary will ring the bell.

17 The Secretary will read.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 482, Senate Print 5288, by Senator Sepúlveda, an
20 act to amend the Civil Practice Law and Rules.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
22 Rhoads, why do you rise?

23 SENATOR RHOADS: Madam President, I
24 was hoping that Senator Sepúlveda, as the
25 sponsor, might yield to a few questions.

1 SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA: Through you,
2 Madam President, I yield for those questions.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
4 Senator yields.

5 SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you,
6 Madam President. Through you, Madam President.

7 Senator, I understand the -- I think
8 I understand the purpose of the bill, but I do
9 have a couple of questions with regard to its
10 scope.

11 My understanding is that this
12 legislation is intended to address a specific
13 circumstance with regard to pendente lite child
14 and spousal support applications, presumably to
15 the Family Court.

16 However, the legislation itself
17 amends CPLR 2101 to add a subdivision H, which
18 would apply to every court in the State of
19 New York.

20 What's the reason for such a broad
21 application when it's designed to address,
22 according to your justification memo, a specific
23 circumstance in only the Family Court?

24 SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA: Through you,
25 Madam President.

1 My colleague, I'm not sure if we're
2 reading the same bill. This bill is a simple
3 bill about tabs and exhibits when you file any
4 kind of pleading in the courts.

5 My experience as an attorney for
6 34 years, dealing with myself and colleagues that
7 have filed things like motions or orders to show
8 cause, where on the cusp, on the verge of
9 statute of limitations expiring, a judge will
10 reject a pleading because a person didn't put a
11 tab on an exhibit, that the case will be -- that
12 the filing will be denied, the statute of
13 limitations expires, and a person loses the
14 ability to have his day in court for a simple
15 tab. It has nothing to do with what you
16 indicated.

17 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor
18 continue to yield?

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator,
20 if you can just hold a minute, please. Thank
21 you.

22 (Pause.)

23 SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA: I know it
24 mentions Family Court --

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: One

1 moment, please.

2 SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA: Oh, sorry.

3 (Pause.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Okay,
5 Senator.

6 SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA: Okay. The case
7 that's in the memo is one particular case in a
8 bucket of cases. But that's where the most
9 egregious situations have occurred, in
10 Family Court cases.

11 So you stand corrected about the
12 actual type of case, but this is to fix a problem
13 that's beyond just those pleadings in
14 Family Court.

15 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor
16 continue to yield?

17 SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA: Through you,
18 Madam President, yes, I do.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
20 Senator yields.

21 SENATOR RHOADS: Through you,
22 Madam President. Is this a situation where it's
23 pro se applications that are a problem, or are
24 these applications that are actually filed by
25 attorneys?

1 SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA: Both.

2 SENATOR RHOADS: Both?

3 SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA: Yes.

4 SENATOR RHOADS: Okay.

5 Thank you, Senator --

6 SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA: Both, sorry.

7 SENATOR RHOADS: I'm going to speak
8 on the bill.

9 Thank you, Senator. I appreciate
10 it.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
12 Rhoads on the bill.

13 SENATOR RHOADS: I promised my
14 colleagues that I would only ask two questions.
15 I asked two questions, just for the record.

16 (Laughter.)

17 SENATOR RHOADS: I was -- I'm
18 concerned -- I certainly understand the intent of
19 the legislation. I feel as though
20 attorneys-at-law should be qualified. Certainly
21 most are and, certainly most paralegals are, to
22 be able to put exhibit tabs on exhibits.

23 I'm concerned that this may apply to
24 any filing -- like, for example, when I have to
25 submit premarked exhibits for trial, where we're

1 sort of using a specific example and instead of
2 using a scalpel to fix that specific example,
3 we're kind of using a meat cleaver and putting in
4 a piece of legislation that would apply to a
5 broad number of cases.

6 I could understand if these were pro
7 se applications that were being made where you
8 don't have trained attorneys that are actually
9 filing these applications. That certainly would
10 make sense to me.

11 But when the purpose of exhibit tabs
12 are so that everyone can agree on -- the court
13 and the parties to litigation can agree on what
14 we're speaking about when we're referring to
15 particularly cases with multiple exhibits, I
16 think we -- we should have been a little more
17 specific in this legislation.

18 And I don't know that the Office of
19 Court Administration, the State Bar Association,
20 or any of the organizations were consulted, much
21 less asked for or support this particular
22 legislation.

23 And so while I understand the
24 purpose, I unfortunately will vote no, and I
25 would encourage my colleagues to do the same. If

1 this bill were a little tighter, it might be a
2 different result.

3 Thank you, Madam President.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
5 you, Senator.

6 Are there any other Senators wishing
7 to be heard?

8 Senator Sepúlveda on the bill.

9 SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA: Thank you,
10 Madam President. I just want to be able to
11 clarify something.

12 Exhibits on pleadings can be handled
13 several ways. When you have multiple judges
14 throughout the court system with different part
15 rules, that is where the problem is created.

16 You can start -- you can label an
17 exhibit page with an 8.5-by-11 and you can type
18 in, in larger font, "Exhibit A." Where the
19 problem has existed is that unless you have
20 what's called a little tab to notate that
21 exhibit, some judges throughout the system will
22 reject that pleading.

23 What this says is either you put a
24 page where you type in, literally, "Exhibit A,"
25 in black print at the bottom before you put the

1 exhibit, or you use a tab. Either one is
2 acceptable.

3 The problem occurs when judges say
4 you have to use a specific tab, and that is
5 highly unfair. And especially in cases where
6 either statute of limitations are expiring or you
7 need particular relief immediately -- for a judge
8 to reject it because that's the way you want to
9 notify about a particular exhibit in a pleading,
10 is inherently unfair and confusing because there
11 are so many judges with different rules in
12 different parts.

13 Thank you. And I vote aye.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
15 you.

16 Are there any other Senators wishing
17 to be heard?

18 Seeing and hearing none, the debate
19 is closed.

20 Senator Gianaris.

21 SENATOR GIANARIS: Let's restore
22 this to the noncontroversial calendar, by
23 consent, please.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: By
25 consent, the bill will be restored to the

1 noncontroversial calendar.

2 Read the last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
4 act shall take effect immediately.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
9 the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
11 Calendar 482, voting in the negative are
12 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
13 Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Mattera, Murray,
14 Oberacker, O'Mara, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk
15 and Weik.

16 Ayes, 45. Nays, 15.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
18 is passed.

19 Senator Gianaris, that completes the
20 reading of today's calendar.

21 SENATOR GIANARIS: Is there any
22 further business at the desk?

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: There is
24 no further business at the desk.

25 SENATOR GIANARIS: I move to

1 adjourn until tomorrow, Wednesday, March 18th, at
2 3:00 p.m.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: On
4 motion, the Senate stands adjourned until
5 Wednesday, March 18th, at 3:00 p.m.

6 Enjoy your St. Patrick's Day!
7 (Whereupon, at 4:03 p.m., the Senate
8 adjourned.)

9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25