

1 NEW YORK STATE SENATE

2
3
4 THE STENOGRAPHIC RECORD

5
6
7
8
9 ALBANY, NEW YORK

10 June 12, 2025

11 1:38 p.m.

12
13
14 REGULAR SESSION

15
16
17
18 SENATOR ROXANNE J. PERSAUD, Acting President

19 ALEJANDRA N. PAULINO, ESQ., Secretary

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

P R O C E E D I N G S

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Hello.

The Senate will come to order.

I ask everyone present to please
rise and recite the Pledge of Allegiance.

(Whereupon, the assemblage recited
the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: In the
absence of clergy, let us bow our heads in a
moment of silent reflection or prayer.

(Whereupon, the assemblage respected
a moment of silence.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Reading
of the Journal.

THE SECRETARY: In Senate,
Wednesday, June 11, 2025, the Senate met pursuant
to adjournment. The Journal of Tuesday, June 10,
2025, was read and approved. On motion, the
Senate adjourned.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Without
objection, the Journal stands approved as read.

Presentation of petitions.

Messages from the Assembly.

The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Senator Skoufis

1 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
2 Assembly Bill Number 6277A and substitute it for
3 the identical Senate Bill 567A, Third Reading
4 Calendar 242.

5 Senator Addabbo moves to discharge,
6 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
7 Number 5921A and substitute it for the identical
8 Senate Bill 2618A, Third Reading Calendar 333.

9 Senator Bailey moves to discharge,
10 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
11 Number 2643A and substitute it for the identical
12 Senate Bill 5275A, Third Reading Calendar 459.

13 Senator Rivera moves to discharge,
14 from the Committee on Health, Assembly Bill
15 Number 2027 and substitute it for the identical
16 Senate Bill 3361, Third Reading Calendar 493.

17 Senator Skoufis moves to discharge,
18 from the Committee on Veterans, Homeland Security
19 and Military Affairs, Assembly Bill Number 291A
20 and substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
21 243A, Third Reading Calendar 737.

22 Senator Martinez moves to discharge,
23 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
24 Number 8485 and substitute it for the identical
25 Senate Bill 274B, Third Reading Calendar 738.

1 Senator Stavisky moves to discharge,
2 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
3 Number 7613B and substitute it for the identical
4 Senate Bill 6891B, Third Reading Calendar 906.

5 Senator Bailey moves to discharge,
6 from the Committee on Insurance, Assembly Bill
7 Number 5367A and substitute it for the identical
8 Senate Bill 6895A, Third Reading Calendar 925.

9 Senator Fahy moves to discharge,
10 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
11 Number 6943B and substitute it for the identical
12 Senate Bill 4879B, Third Reading Calendar 944.

13 Senator Sanders moves to discharge,
14 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
15 Number 8067A and substitute it for the identical
16 Senate Bill 7752A, Third Reading Calendar 1173.

17 Senator Hoylman-Sigal moves to
18 discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
19 Assembly Bill Number 26 and substitute it for the
20 identical Senate Bill 5534, Third Reading
21 Calendar 1264.

22 Senator Rivera moves to discharge,
23 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
24 Number 2520 and substitute it for the identical
25 Senate Bill 1616, Third Reading Calendar 1345.

1 Senator Scarcella-Spanton moves to
2 discharge, from the Committee on Labor,
3 Assembly Bill Number 2730A and substitute it for
4 the identical Senate Bill 4881A, Third Reading
5 Calendar 1514.

6 Senator May moves to discharge, from
7 the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill Number 584C
8 and substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
9 4070B, Third Reading Calendar 1618.

10 Senator Weber moves to discharge,
11 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
12 Number 5364 and substitute it for the identical
13 Senate Bill 5233, Third Reading Calendar 1627.

14 Senator Tedisco moves to discharge,
15 from the Committee on Investigations and
16 Government Operations, Assembly Bill Number 7634
17 and substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
18 6998, Third Reading Calendar 1640.

19 Senator Hinchey moves to discharge,
20 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
21 Number 8784 and substitute it for the identical
22 Senate Bill 8345, Third Reading Calendar 1664.

23 Senator Brouk moves to discharge,
24 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
25 Number 4762B and substitute it for the identical

1 Senate Bill 8210A, Third Reading Calendar 1858.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: So
3 ordered.

4 Messages from the Governor.

5 Reports of standing committees.

6 Reports of select committees.

7 Communications and reports from
8 state officers.

9 Motions and resolutions.

10 Senator Gianaris.

11 SENATOR GIANARIS: Good afternoon,
12 Madam President.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Good
14 afternoon.

15 SENATOR GIANARIS: There's a report
16 of the Finance Committee at the desk. Let's
17 begin by taking that up, please.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
19 Secretary will read.

20 THE SECRETARY: Senator Krueger,
21 from the Committee on Finance, reports the
22 following nominations:

23 As commissioners of the State Board
24 of Parole: Darlene Grant Bruce, Jose A. Gomerez,
25 Elizabeth Kase, Daniel J. O'Donnell.

1 As a member of the Port Authority of
2 New York and New Jersey: Marie Therese
3 Dominguez.

4 As members of the Metropolitan
5 Transportation Authority: Melva Miller and
6 James O'Donnell.

7 As nonvoting members of the
8 Metropolitan Transportation Authority:
9 Andrew Albert, Gerard Bringmann, and
10 Randolph Glucksman.

11 As members of the New York State
12 Bridge Authority: Freddimir Garcia and
13 Roger Higgins.

14 As a member of the Central New York
15 Regional Transportation Authority: Heather Snow.

16 As a member of the Niagara Frontier
17 Transportation Authority: Wesley Hicks, Jr.

18 As members of the Port of Oswego
19 Authority: Jennifer La Pietra and James Metcalf.

20 SENATOR GIANARIS: Move to accept
21 the report of the Finance Committee, and then ask
22 that you recognize Senator Krueger to speak first
23 on the nominations for the commissioners of the
24 Board of Parole.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: All

1 those in favor of accepting the report of the
2 Finance Committee please signify by saying aye.

3 (Response of "Aye.")

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Opposed,
5 nay.

6 (Response of "Nay.")

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
8 report of the Finance Committee is accepted.

9 Senator Krueger on the Board of
10 Parole nominations.

11 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you very
12 much, Madam President.

13 So today we are adding four
14 representatives to be commissioners on our
15 State Board of Parole.

16 And for people who might have
17 listened to I think two hours of back-and-forth
18 questioning of each of the four candidates, I
19 think people may have a better understanding of
20 the roles and responsibilities of these people in
21 their jobs -- which are extremely demanding,
22 which often find them putting themselves in
23 difficult situations where they know that
24 sometimes they will be making decisions that not
25 everyone agrees with, that they don't have

1 crystal balls, they can only work off the
2 information before them and the law and the
3 belief that this is a fair process that will
4 ensure people who have done their time or should
5 be let out of prison because they are not going
6 to be a danger to the public is the right
7 decision.

8 Other people may wish to speak after
9 me. I will just highlight that two of the four
10 are people I know quite well. In one case,
11 Daniel O'Donnell I've known for 30 years,
12 maybe -- maybe 30 years in various capacities.
13 And Elizabeth Kase, who I have known her and her
14 family now for quite a while as well.

15 And so I can speak strongly on their
16 behalf as both not only well, well prepared to
17 take on these jobs, and competent and
18 responsible, but good people that are the kinds
19 of people we want to see on our Parole Board.

20 I actually think that I can say that
21 all four are good people, responsible
22 professionals who bring their own skill sets and
23 history to this job. And it's a hard job. Who
24 wakes up in the morning and says, I want to be a
25 parole commissioner? Well, these four people

1 did. So thank you very much for waking up in the
2 morning and being willing to do this work.

3 So I hope that my colleagues will
4 join me in a yes vote on them.

5 Thank you, Madam President.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
7 you, Senator.

8 The question is on the nominations
9 to the Board of Parole.

10 Call the roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
13 the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: In relation to the
15 nominations, those Senators voting in the
16 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
17 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Gallivan, Helming,
18 Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Oberacker, Ortt,
19 Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk
20 and Weik.

21 Ayes, 37. Nays, 18.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
23 nominees as commissioners of the State Board of
24 Parole are confirmed.

25 Congratulations.

1 (Standing ovation.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
3 Gianaris.

4 SENATOR GIANARIS: And now
5 recognize Senator Krueger again on the remaining
6 nominations, please.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
8 Krueger on the nominations.

9 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you,
10 Madam President.

11 So some of us know that we received
12 nominations from the Governor's office for a very
13 long list of people being confirmed or
14 reconfirmed to various positions. Basically,
15 these are non-paid positions. Some of them we've
16 known, some of them we've interviewed in various
17 capacities -- perhaps not for the capacity that
18 they're being confirmed for today.

19 But after the review of multiple
20 committees -- because it depends on which agency
21 they're going to be confirmed to. We have
22 multiple committees. In the case of the
23 remainder of today's confirmations, we have
24 overlapped between the Finance Committee, the
25 Committee on Corporations and Authorities, the

1 Committee on Transportation.

2 All three committees took votes
3 separately, and all of the people before us today
4 have been confirmed through the three committees
5 to serve on these various, frankly very
6 important, authorities and commissions for the
7 State of New York: The MTA, Metropolitan
8 Transportation Authority; the New York State
9 Bridge Authority; the Central New York Regional
10 Transportation Authority; the Niagara Frontier
11 Transportation Authority; and the Port of Oswego
12 Authority.

13 So with that, Madam President, I do
14 hope my colleagues will join me in voting yes on
15 these nominees.

16 Thank you very much.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
18 question is on the nominations. All in favor
19 signify by saying aye.

20 (Response of "Aye.")

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Opposed,
22 nay -- sorry, call the roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
25 the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: In relation to the
2 nominations, those Senators voting in the
3 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
4 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Gallivan, Lanza,
5 Mattera, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec,
6 Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

7 Ayes, 39. Nays, 16.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
9 nominees are confirmed.

10 Senator Gianaris.

11 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,
12 please recognize Senator Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick
13 for an introduction.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
15 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick for an introduction.

16 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK:
17 Thank you, Madam President.

18 On a busy day like today it's so
19 nice to recognize a young woman from my district
20 who's here.

21 Brooke Boccio, from Girl Scout
22 Troop 2570 in Lynbrook, has been named the
23 VFW New York Scout of the Year, a top honor
24 recognizing a scout for leadership and community
25 service. Brooke has earned the prestigious

1 Girl Scout Gold Award, the highest achievement in
2 Girl Scouting, and her impactful work is raising
3 awareness about equine assisted therapy,
4 especially its use in helping veterans and first
5 responders.

6 Her Gold Award involved over
7 80 hours of hands-on service, and she was one of
8 only 11 Girl Scouts from Nassau County chosen to
9 represent the region at the National Girl Scout
10 Convention in Orlando, demonstrating her
11 leadership on a national stage.

12 Brooke's project focused on
13 educating the public about equine assisted
14 therapy and a lesser known yet highly effective
15 treatment for mental and physical health
16 especially beneficial to veterans and first
17 responders. Her work exemplifies the values of
18 service, compassion and innovation.

19 She has recently graduated from
20 Kellenberg Memorial High School and will continue
21 her studies on equine science and management at
22 the University of Kentucky.

23 I'm so proud to know you, Brooke,
24 and your family, Rob and Danielle. Thank you for
25 being here at the Capitol. And I'm so proud to

1 represent you.

2 Thank you, Madam President.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
4 you.

5 Brooke, congratulations, and we
6 welcome you. Continue doing great things. We
7 welcome you on behalf of the Senate. We extend
8 to you the privileges and courtesies of this
9 house.

10 Please rise and be recognized.

11 (Standing ovation.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
13 Gianaris.

14 SENATOR GIANARIS: I move to adopt
15 the Resolution Calendar -- no? No, we're not --
16 never mind, then. Okay.

17 We're going to simultaneously take
18 up the calendar and have an immediate meeting of
19 the Rules Committee. So please call a meeting of
20 the Rules Committee in Room 332 and take up the
21 calendar.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: There
23 will be an immediate meeting of the
24 Rules Committee in Room 332.

25 The Secretary will read.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 203, Senate Print 363A, by Senator Gianaris, an
3 act to amend the General Business Law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
7 act shall take effect on the first of January.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 (Pause.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
13 the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
15 Calendar 203, voting in the negative are
16 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
17 Chan, Helming, Martins, Mattera, Ortt, Palumbo,
18 Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk and Weik. Senator Rolison
19 in the negative as well.

20 Ayes, 41. Nays, 14.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
22 is passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 225, Senate Print 620A, by Senator Stavisky, an
25 act to amend the Education Law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
2 last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
4 act shall take effect immediately.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
9 the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 55.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 242, Assembly Print Number 6277A, by
15 Assemblymember Lupardo, an act to amend the
16 Alcoholic Beverage Control Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
20 act shall take effect immediately.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
25 the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 55.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 255, Senate Print 319, by Senator Salazar, an act
6 to amend the Correction Law.

7 SENATOR PALUMBO: Lay it aside.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Lay it
9 aside.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 258, Senate Print 1050, by Senator Salazar, an
12 act to amend the Correction Law.

13 SENATOR PALUMBO: Lay it aside.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Lay it
15 aside.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 297, Senate Print 934A, by Senator Gonzalez, an
18 act to amend the General Business Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
22 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
23 shall have become a law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
3 the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
5 Calendar 297, voting in the negative:
6 Senator Walczyk.

7 Ayes, 54. Nays, 1.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 305, Senate Print 3335A, by Senator Cooney, an
12 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
16 act shall take effect January 1, 2028.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
21 the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 55.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 333, Assembly Bill Number 5921A, by
2 Assemblymember Woerner, an act to amend the
3 Racing, Pari-Mutuel Wagering and Breeding Law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
7 act shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 55.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 350, Senate Print 3799C, by Senator Comrie, an
18 act to amend the Real Property Actions and
19 Proceedings Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
3 the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
5 Calendar 350, voting in the negative are
6 Senators Chan, Walczyk and Weik.

7 Ayes, 52. Nays, 3.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 356, Senate Print 3393A, by Senator Gounardes, an
12 act to amend the Education Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
16 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it
17 shall have become a law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
24 Calendar 356, voting in the negative are
25 Senators Martins and Walczyk.

1 Ayes, 54. Nays, 2.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 442, Senate Print 372A, by Senator Gianaris, an
6 act to amend the Labor Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
15 the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
17 Calendar 442, voting in the negative are
18 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
19 Chan, Martins, Mattera, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt,
20 Palumbo, Rhoads, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and
21 Weik.

22 Ayes, 44. Nays, 15.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 445, Senate Print 2236A, by Senator Gounardes, an
2 act to amend the Labor Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 459, Assembly Bill Number 2643A, by
17 Assemblymember Solages, an act to amend the
18 Education Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
22 act shall take effect on the same date and in the
23 same manner as Chapter 733 of the Laws of 2023.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
3 Bailey to explain his vote.

4 SENATOR BAILEY: Thank you,
5 Madam President.

6 We often wax poetic about the
7 importance of sports and athletes, but we have
8 to -- we cannot forget about the trainers, those
9 individuals who prepare them.

10 And right now, as it stands, you
11 know, we're going to be making trainers licensed
12 in the State of New York. And I want to thank
13 Senator Stavisky for helping me do that a couple
14 of years ago. But right now, as it would be
15 expiring in December, if we don't do this bill,
16 which I'm glad that we're doing now,
17 authorization would expire for out-of-state
18 trainers to be able to properly do the work that
19 they do for away games.

20 For professional sports teams, we
21 have the World Cup coming, we have a whole number
22 of things coming. And this is going to allow the
23 trainers to do the work that they need to do.

24 This was supported by all local
25 professional sports teams, including the ones I

1 don't like, but I will mention the ones that I do
2 like, like the New York Knicks. And I just want
3 to make sure -- Madam President, the New York
4 Knicks training staff was nominated to be the
5 Training Staff of the Year, and so we want to
6 make sure that the Training Staff of the Year is
7 able to continue to do the good work that they're
8 doing, and all the other training staffs for the
9 lesser-important teams that we don't like as
10 much.

11 Madam President, I proudly vote aye.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
13 Bailey to be recorded in the affirmative.

14 Announce the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 493, Assembly Bill Number 2027, by
20 Assemblymember Paulin, an act to amend the
21 Social Services Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
5 the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
8 is passed.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 499, Senate Print 54A, by Senator Fernandez, an
11 act to amend the Penal Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
15 act shall take effect immediately.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 558, Senate Print 3529, by Senator Cooney, an act

1 to amend the State Finance Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
5 act shall take effect two years after it shall
6 have become a law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
13 Calendar 558, voting in the negative:
14 Senator Brisport.

15 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 580, Senate Print 5331A, by Senator Bailey, an
20 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
24 act shall take effect December 31, 2028.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
6 Calendar 580, voting in the negative:
7 Senator Walczyk.

8 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 600, Senate Print 4576A, by Senator Skoufis, an
13 act to amend the New York State Urban Development
14 Corporation Act.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
18 act shall take effect immediately.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
25 Calendar 600, voting in the negative are

1 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Martins and
2 Palumbo. Also Senator Borrello.

3 Ayes, 55. Nays, 4.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 621, Senate Print 2057A, by Senator Webb, an act
8 to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This
12 act shall take effect one year after it shall
13 have become a law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
18 Webb to explain her vote.

19 SENATOR WEBB: Thank you,
20 Madam President. I rise to explain my vote.

21 Dangerous chemicals are in personal
22 care products that we use every day -- soap,
23 lotion, deodorant, makeup and more. Exposure to
24 these toxic chemicals begins in the womb. When
25 chemicals are absorbed by a pregnant mother, they

1 are transferred across the placenta and continue
2 through infancy and into adulthood.

3 Many personal care and cosmetic
4 products contain harmful chemicals like
5 formaldehyde, phthalates, parabens, lead and PFAS
6 that are linked to serious human health issues
7 and risks.

8 Madam President, these chemicals are
9 known to cause cancer, hormone disruption,
10 asthma, infertility and developmental disorders.
11 Women, people of color, and low-income
12 communities are disproportionately exposed to
13 toxic ingredients due to targeted marketing and
14 product availability.

15 By establishing a list of restricted
16 substances with known associated human health
17 risks, this bill addresses a public health equity
18 gap by reducing exposure in communities far too
19 often overlooked in regulatory decisions.

20 By passing the Beauty Justice Act
21 today, New York State has the opportunity to
22 again be a leader in environmental health and
23 justice by protecting all New Yorkers, especially
24 vulnerable groups that more frequently use and
25 are disproportionately impacted by these toxic

1 chemicals.

2 These harmful chemicals are not only
3 unnecessary in personal care products and
4 cosmetics, they are also unwanted and there are
5 alternatives that exist.

6 I want to thank our Senate staff for
7 all their help in bringing this legislation
8 forward, especially Mike Press and my team; also
9 Assemblymember Glick, for her sponsorship in the
10 Assembly; and of course all of our advocates.
11 And I appreciate the input from the industry on
12 this bill as well.

13 I vote aye, and I encourage my
14 colleagues to do the same.

15 Thank you.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
17 Webb to be recorded in the affirmative.

18 Senator Krueger to explain her vote.

19 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you,
20 Madam President.

21 I rise to strongly support
22 Senator Webb's bill, but also to take a moment
23 hopefully for some education of my colleagues who
24 choose to vote no, it seems, on everything
25 relating to the environment and health.

1 And so I just want to read you some
2 statistics. Up to 93 percent of all human
3 cancers are not hereditary and more likely caused
4 by interaction with environmental factors. The
5 rate of cancer is going up, and it's
6 environmentally caused.

7 And I get that we can't protect
8 ourselves from everything imaginable. But what
9 this bill and a number of other bills that are
10 moving this year does is say, Let's make sure
11 people know these things can be toxic. You can
12 find alternative hair products. I can guarantee
13 you can find alternative hair products that might
14 not cause the baby you're carrying in you to
15 absorb toxic chemicals, you yourself to face a
16 future cancer.

17 I just sincerely can't understand
18 why people don't vote for these bills. I of
19 course am voting yes.

20 Thank you, Madam President.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
22 Krueger to be recorded in the affirmative.

23 Announce the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
25 Calendar 621, voting in the negative are

1 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Chan, O'Mara, Ortt and
2 Weik.

3 Ayes, 53. Nays, 6.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 650, Senate Print 1100A, by Senator May, an act
8 to amend the Education Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
12 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it
13 shall have become a law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
18 May to explain her vote -- sorry.

19 Announce the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
21 Calendar 650, voting in the negative are
22 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Chan, Martins, O'Mara,
23 Ortt, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and
24 Weik.

25 Ayes, 47. Nays, 12.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
2 is passed.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 656, Senate Print 3581, by Senator Rivera, an act
5 to amend the Public Health Law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
14 Rivera to explain his vote.

15 SENATOR RIVERA: Thank you so much,
16 Madam President.

17 We are all aware -- certainly
18 scientists tell us for certain -- that any
19 exposure to lead, particularly for children, is
20 incredibly harmful. And so we've made some
21 efforts in the last couple of decades to try to
22 get rid of particularly lead pipes that lead to
23 drinking water or that have drinking water going
24 through them.

25 Unfortunately, our efforts are still

1 not done. But thanks to this bill, I think that
2 we will get closer to that.

3 This is the -- identifying lead
4 service lines across New York. This bill would
5 help us to identify -- this would mandate the
6 creation of an inventory of where these
7 lines are. And it's a critical first step in
8 getting lead pipes out of our communities and
9 ensuring safe drinking water.

10 I mean, as I said earlier, lead can
11 have long-lasting effects, particularly on
12 children, including permanent brain damage or
13 reduced cognitive function. This is something
14 that we have to address. And this bill would
15 lead us to be able to identify where these are,
16 to then hopefully -- considering where the
17 federal government is and how resistant they are
18 to the type of changes that we're trying to make
19 here -- to identify these lines and to get them
20 out of our way. This would go a long way to
21 being able to provide safe drinking water for
22 every single New Yorker.

23 So I proudly vote in the
24 affirmative. Thank you, Madam President.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator

1 Rivera to be recorded in the affirmative.

2 Announce the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
4 Calendar Number 656, voting in the negative are
5 Senators Borrello, Chan, Griffo, Oberacker, Stec
6 and Walczyk.

7 Ayes, 53. Nays, 6.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 668, Senate Print 6273A, by Senator Bailey, an
12 act authorizing and directing the Commissioner of
13 Education to conduct a study on the number of
14 children who are caregivers and how being a
15 caregiver impacts their education.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
19 act shall take effect immediately.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
2 is passed.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 680, Senate Print Number 4545A, by
5 Senator Hoylman-Sigal, an act to repeal
6 Section 2307 of the Public Health Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
15 the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
17 Calendar 680, voting in the negative are
18 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
19 Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins,
20 Mattera, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo,
21 Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber
22 and Weik.

23 Ayes, 38. Nays, 21.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
25 is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 696, Senate Print 5940, by Senator Skoufis, an
3 act to amend the Executive Law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
7 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
8 shall have become a law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
13 the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
15 Calendar 696, voting in the negative:
16 Senator Chan.

17 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 698, Senate Print 6971, by Senator Kavanagh, an
22 act to amend the Real Property Actions and
23 Proceedings Law.

24 SENATOR GIANARIS: Lay it aside for
25 the day, please.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
2 will be laid aside for the day.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 737, Assembly Bill Number 291A, by
5 Assemblymember Barrett, an act to amend the
6 General Construction Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
15 the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 738, Assembly Bill Number 8485, by
21 Assemblymember Stern, an act to amend the
22 Veterans' Services Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This

1 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
2 shall have become a law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 752, Senate Print 2032, by Senator Harckham, an
13 act to amend the Public Authorities Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
24 Calendar 752, voting in the negative are
25 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,

1 Gallivan, Griffo, Lanza, Martins, Mattera,
2 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco,
3 Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

4 Ayes, 42. Nays, 17.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
6 is passed.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 782, Senate Print 2061, by Senator Cooney, an act
9 to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
11 last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 7. This
13 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
14 shall have become a law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
19 Palumbo to explain his vote.

20 SENATOR PALUMBO: Thank you,
21 Madam President.

22 I rise to put this bill into
23 context, because it's a great idea. However,
24 these amendments have made drastic changes to
25 this bill. The fact that this bill originally

1 involved reckless driving, serious physical
2 injury or death, making that a crime and
3 enhancing the penalty, was very good. And I
4 certainly would support that. And the laudable
5 intent here, to further deter reckless drivers,
6 is helpful.

7 But in fact, this is watering down
8 our Penal Law. Because when you take this
9 practically, reckless driving which causes
10 serious physical injury or death -- it can
11 otherwise be vehicular assault, but when you
12 cause someone's death through reckless driving,
13 that's manslaughter in the second degree,
14 recklessly causing the death of another. So that
15 is currently a Class C felony, C as in Charlie.
16 And this is an A misdemeanor.

17 So I certainly appreciate the
18 sponsor has done a lot of work in this field.
19 But unfortunately, I'm going to vote no because
20 this is actually providing a lesser included
21 offense for the exact same charge. So instead of
22 someone who's driving recklessly on the road,
23 causing someone else's death, being charged with
24 a Class C felony, here they'll only be charged
25 with an A misdemeanor. It conflicts with current

1 law.

2 So as a result, I'm going to be
3 voting no. But I do appreciate the sponsor's
4 intent. Thank you.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
6 Palumbo to be recorded in the negative.

7 Announce the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
9 Calendar Number 782, voting in the negative are
10 Senators Ashby, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
11 Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Mattera,
12 O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Stec, Walczyk,
13 Weber and Weik.

14 Ayes, 43. Nays, 16.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 892, Senate Print Number 5196A, by
19 Senator Hoylman-Sigal, an act to amend the
20 Public Health Law.

21 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Lay it
23 aside.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 906, Assembly Bill Number 7613B, by

1 Assemblymember Peoples-Stokes, an act to amend
2 the Education Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
6 act shall take effect 12 months after it shall
7 have become a law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
14 Calendar 906, voting in the negative are
15 Senators Martins and Weber.

16 Ayes, 57. Nays, 2.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 917, Senate Print 4774A, by Senator C. Ryan, an
21 act to amend the Penal Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
25 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it

1 shall have become a law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
6 C. Ryan to explain his vote.

7 SENATOR C. RYAN: Thank you,
8 Madam President.

9 So I rise today in support of this
10 bill which will close a very dangerous and
11 unacceptable gap in our New York law, which will
12 ensure real accountability when reckless drivers
13 take innocent lives.

14 First and foremost, I'll say
15 thank you to Congressman Mannion, my predecessor
16 who carried this bill who is down in Washington,
17 D.C., and Senator Gianaris, for their versions of
18 this bill dating all the way back to 2013. Here
19 we are, 2025, a long fight, a long haul, but here
20 we are, going to pass this bill.

21 So I first tell you about a
22 20-year-old girl named Kyriakoula. Kyriakoula
23 was murdered when a friend was driving recklessly
24 on a suspended driver's license and hit a tree.
25 The driver was not charged with any crime. He

1 paid his license suspension fee and left the
2 state.

3 Since this horrible tragedy,
4 Kyriakoula's mother Rena has fought ceaselessly
5 to get this law passed. And, you know.
6 Tragically and unfortunately we're going to be
7 coming up on the fifth-year anniversary of her
8 daughter's death. So Rena, I know you're
9 watching from home right now. We appreciate your
10 efforts. And, you know, this bill is for you.

11 So unfortunately, though, this story
12 is not unique. Across the state, families have
13 been ripped apart by these tragedies. Right now
14 our laws unfortunately do not properly account
15 for the most egregious, intentional forms of
16 deadly driving, acts that don't just demonstrate
17 carelessness but deprive people of human life.

18 This bill isn't about -- to be very
19 clear, this bill isn't about punishing honest
20 mistakes, it's about stopping people who
21 knowingly and willfully break the law, endanger
22 others, and take lives without consequence.

23 We're talking about drivers who
24 operate a vehicle with a suspended license, speed
25 through crowded pedestrian zones, run red lights

1 at dangerous intersections -- at full speed,
2 even -- and they know all too well their deadly
3 consequences.

4 So this isn't intelligence
5 negligence, this is reckless disregard for life,
6 and it deserves a serious charge. I believe that
7 we owe it to Kyriakoula and Rena and every single
8 family in this state who have lost loved ones in
9 this kind of senseless tragedy.

10 So again, to the cosponsors, to the
11 many, many, many advocacy groups who brought this
12 and who have championed for this -- obviously my
13 previous Senator's friends who carried this bill,
14 and the leader for bringing this to the floor.

15 So I vote in the aye. Thank you.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
17 C. Ryan to be recorded in the affirmative.

18 Senator Rhoads to explain his vote.

19 SENATOR RHOADS: I also want to
20 rise and thank our sponsor for his hard work on
21 this bill, and also to thank one of my
22 constituents, Rena Gasparis, who has tirelessly
23 advocated for passage of this legislation.

24 And it's incredibly important
25 legislation as well. Punishing those who

1 intentionally drive on a suspended or revoked
2 license is a gap in our law that needed to be
3 closed. And again, I want to thank Senator Ryan.

4 I do want to thank Senator Gianaris,
5 as the previous sponsor of a version of this
6 legislation, and of course our leader, Andrea
7 Stewart-Cousins, for allowing the matter to come
8 to the floor, and for our colleagues voting in
9 favor.

10 I, Madam President, vote aye.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
12 Rhoads to be recorded in the affirmative.

13 Senator Gounardes to explain his
14 vote.

15 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Thank you,
16 Madam President.

17 I too rise to commend our sponsor
18 for passing this bill. I've gotten a chance to
19 know the Gasparis family, to hear about
20 Kyriakoula's life, her death. And I know how
21 important this is to bringing a closure to that
22 family. And not just for her, but for the
23 countless other families that have been impacted
24 similarly by the gap in our law.

25 We know that 75 percent of people

1 who have a suspended license continue to drive
2 anyway. So just the threat of a suspended
3 license is not sufficient enough in order to
4 change illegal or reckless behavior.

5 And this is a great example for many
6 in the Safe Streets movement, many who have come
7 up here time and time again for a lot of the
8 bills that we pass, through Families for Safe
9 Streets, about turning the pain of their loss,
10 turning the pain of their family's suffering into
11 purpose and into action. And I can think of no
12 greater example of that than the success of this
13 bill on this floor today.

14 Again, I want to commend
15 Senator Ryan for shepherding this over the finish
16 line, and I vote in the affirmative.

17 Thank you.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
19 Gounardes to be recorded in the affirmative.

20 Announce the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
22 Calendar 917, voting in the negative:
23 Senator Brisport.

24 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill

1 is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 918, Senate Print 7202A, by Senator Hinchey, an
4 act to amend the Penal Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
8 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it
9 shall have become a law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
14 the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 925, Assembly Bill Number 5367A, by
20 Assemblymember Weprin, an act to amend the
21 Insurance Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
5 the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
8 is passed.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 936, Senate Print 1349C, by Senator Cleare, an
11 act to amend the Education Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
15 act shall take effect July 1, 2026.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 938, Senate Print Number 3827A, by

1 Senator Hoylman-Sigal, an act to amend the
2 State Technology Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
13 Calendar Number 938, voting in the negative are
14 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
15 Fahy, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins,
16 Mattera, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo,
17 Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber
18 and Weik.

19 Ayes, 38. Nays, 21.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
21 is passed.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 944, Assembly Bill Number 6943B, by
24 Assemblymember Hunter, an act to amend the
25 General Business Law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
2 last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
4 act shall take effect immediately.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
9 the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
11 Calendar 944, voting in the negative:
12 Senator Walczyk.

13 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 945, Senate Print 5598, by Senator May, an act to
18 amend the General Business Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
22 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it
23 shall have become a law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
3 the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
5 Calendar 945, voting in the negative are
6 Senators Borrello, Oberacker, Stec and Walczyk.

7 Ayes, 55. Nays, 4.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1078, Senate Print 7720, by Senator Gallivan, an
12 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
16 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
17 shall have become a law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
25 is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 1090, Senate Print 5624, by Senator Kavanaugh, an
3 act to amend the Public Health Law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
7 act shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
14 Calendar 1090, voting in the negative:
15 Senator Walczyk.

16 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 1129, Senate Print 4500A, by Senator Fahy, an act
21 to amend the General Business Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 7. This
25 act shall take effect January 1, 2026.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
5 Fahy to explain her vote.

6 SENATOR FAHY: Thank you,
7 Madam President.

8 I rise today as the proud sponsor of
9 this very critical legislation. This is about
10 New Yorkers who rely on powered wheelchairs.

11 Across the country, over 3 to almost
12 5 million people rely on powered wheelchairs, yet
13 timely repairs become more of a luxury, even
14 though they are a lifeline.

15 When a wheelchair breaks down, there
16 are dire consequences. A 2022 study, a national
17 study said that 62 percent of powered wheelchair
18 users wait four or more weeks for repairs, and
19 93 percent of respondents at that time said they
20 needed at least one repair in the last year.

21 Yet in fact even one of my
22 constituents, Shamika Andrews, recently spent two
23 months -- two months in isolation in her home
24 waiting on a wheelchair repair. And her chair
25 itself got stuck at our local mall for a couple

1 of weeks waiting on somebody to even pick it up.
2 As Shamika put it, as she stated, there is no
3 AAA service for wheelchairs.

4 This bill would allow wheelchair
5 users the ability to repair their own wheelchairs
6 using independent technicians or even themselves
7 or their own creativity, just as we have done for
8 car owners, just as we -- I was proud to sponsor
9 a bill to allow cellphone users to do the same
10 just a couple of years ago.

11 This will allow independent repair
12 providers to enter this market, and without
13 violating any warranties, and hopefully spur on
14 more competition, lower costs, and definitely
15 reduce wait times. Independence matters.
16 Dignity matters.

17 And with that, I vote in the
18 affirmative. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
20 Fahy in the affirmative.

21 Senator Rolison to explain his vote.

22 SENATOR ROLISON: Thank you,
23 Madam President.

24 I want to thank Senator Fahy for
25 bringing this important piece of legislation

1 forward.

2 You know, this chamber has spent an
3 awful lot of great time in making sure that our
4 disability community has the ability to do
5 things, the ability to go places. But if you
6 can't get there because your wheelchair is
7 inoperable, well, then that's something that
8 needs to be addressed.

9 And you hear about the wait times,
10 and Senator Fahy just mentioned them. I've had
11 constituents in my district call, looking for a
12 place to get a repair. And there aren't a lot in
13 the 39th District. And because there isn't a
14 lot, it takes time. And some of these
15 individuals actually have to have home-site
16 visits by the repair people to even just analyze
17 what's going on with the chair.

18 So this a great bill. I hope the
19 Governor signs it as soon as possible. Because
20 we do a lot here, and this is important in the
21 overall scheme of things when it comes to what
22 we're trying to do for our communities that need
23 this kind of support.

24 So thank you, Senator Fahy.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator

1 Rolison to be recorded in the affirmative.

2 Senator Rhoads to explain his vote.

3 SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you,
4 Madam President.

5 I rise in proud support of this
6 legislation, and I want to thank Senator Fahy.
7 This is such an important bill.

8 I've had some personal experience --
9 my dad had multiple sclerosis and was in a
10 wheelchair, a motorized wheelchair for the last
11 15 years of his life. And it literally makes the
12 difference between having any level of
13 independence or simply being confined to home,
14 and oftentimes to bed.

15 These motorized wheelchairs are able
16 to accomplish not just the ability to get around,
17 but the ability to raise and lower themselves,
18 the ability to recline, which is so incredibly
19 important.

20 And there are so few repair
21 facilities that are approved and authorized to be
22 able to perform these repairs, that expanding the
23 number of facilities and options that families
24 have is so incredibly important. Because waiting
25 a day, much less one week, two weeks, three

1 weeks, four weeks, five weeks for these repairs
2 to be made by authorized facilities takes away
3 the ability for individuals to have the already
4 limited amount of independence that they enjoy
5 with the use of that wheelchair.

6 And so again, Senator Fahy, I want
7 to thank you for bringing this legislation to the
8 floor, and my colleagues for voting in favor.

9 I proudly vote aye.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
11 Rhoads to be recorded in the affirmative.

12 Senator Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick to
13 explain her vote.

14 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK:
15 Thank you, Madam President.

16 And I too want to rise to thank the
17 sponsor for this very important legislation.

18 And I want to give a shout out to my
19 husband, who actually coordinates the wheelchair
20 mission for the Knights of Columbus throughout
21 Nassau County. So he appreciates this so much,
22 because he sees how much -- there are so many
23 people in need. And I really appreciate that
24 we're going to help these people.

25 So thank you, Madam President. I

1 vote aye.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
3 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick to be recorded in the
4 affirmative.

5 Announce the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
8 is passed.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 1173, Assembly Bill Number 8067A, by
11 Assemblymember Epstein, an act to amend the
12 Banking Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
16 act shall take effect immediately.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
21 the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1192, Senate Print 4424A, by Senator Ramos, an
2 act to amend the Labor Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
13 Calendar 1192, voting in the negative are
14 Senators Borrello, Chan, Helming, Lanza,
15 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Stec,
16 Tedisco, Walczyk and Weik.

17 Ayes, 46. Nays, 13.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 1194, Senate Print 4473, by Senator Ramos, an act
22 to amend the Labor Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This

1 act shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
6 the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
8 Calendar 1194, voting in the negative are
9 Senators Borrello, Chan, Helming, Oberacker,
10 O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Walczyk and Weik.

11 Ayes, 50. Nays, 9.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
13 is passed.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 1208, Senate Print Number 7633C, by
16 Senator Hoylman-Sigal, an act to amend the
17 New York City Civil Court Act.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
21 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
22 shall have become a law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
2 the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
4 Calendar 1208, voting in the negative are
5 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
6 Gallivan, Griffio, Helming, Lanza, Martins,
7 Mattera, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rolison, Stec,
8 Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

9 Ayes, 41. Nays, 18.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 1209, Senate Print Number 7860B, by
14 Senator Hoylman-Sigal, an act to amend the
15 Judiciary Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
19 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
20 shall have become a law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
25 Hoylman-Sigal to explain his vote.

1 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Thank you,
2 Madam President.

3 We're passing this bill today in the
4 Senate because pro bono legal service should not
5 be part of an agreement that's made outside of
6 the provision of legal services for underserved
7 New Yorkers. We all have heard how major law
8 firms were forced into agreements with the
9 Trump administration because of the perceived
10 enemies within those firms by Trump and his
11 allies in the White House.

12 Our bill would exclude pro bono,
13 moving forward, that was provided as a result of
14 an agreement between a law firm and the federal
15 government.

16 Once again, pro bono is for
17 underserved New Yorkers, not part of a corrupt
18 deal between the federal government and major law
19 firms in the City of New York and elsewhere.

20 I vote aye.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
22 Hoylman-Sigal to be recorded in the affirmative.

23 Announce the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
25 Calendar 1209, voting in the negative are

1 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
2 Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins,
3 Mattera, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo,
4 Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber
5 and Weik.

6 Ayes, 38. Nays, 21.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
8 is passed.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 1221, Senate Print 4358A, by Senator Bailey, an
11 act to amend the Education Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
15 act shall take effect July 1, 2026.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
22 Calendar 1221, voting in the negative:
23 Senator Martins.

24 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill

1 is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 1229, Senate Print 14A, by Senator Skoufis, an
4 act to amend the Highway Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
8 act shall take effect immediately.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
13 the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
15 Calendar 1229, voting in the negative:
16 Senator Brisport.

17 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 1239, Senate Print 7699B, by Senator Skoufis, an
22 act to amend the Highway Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This

1 act shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
6 the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1244, Senate Print 7955A, by Senator Cooney, an
12 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
16 act shall take effect immediately.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
21 Cooney to explain his vote.

22 SENATOR COONEY: Thank you,
23 Madam President.

24 In 2019 this legislative body passed
25 legislation to protect our children on our

1 roadways. We passed a comprehensive statewide
2 bus stop-arm camera bill which would allow local
3 municipalities to opt in and to hold people
4 accountable when they go speeding past a school
5 bus, endangering the lives of our children.

6 Today's bill is an accountability
7 fix to make sure that the program works as
8 designed and to make sure that our children all
9 across New York State are kept safe.

10 Madam President, I'm proud to
11 support and vote aye for this legislation.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
13 Cooney to be recorded in the affirmative.

14 Announce the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
16 Calendar 1244, voting in the negative:
17 Senator Martinez. Also --

18 (Pause.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
20 C. Ryan to explain his vote.

21 SENATOR C. RYAN: I want to just
22 say thank you to Senator Cooney for bringing
23 this, and these amendments make a really good
24 bill better.

25 We did a lot of work with

1 municipalities -- and previously on the county
2 legislature -- to try to get as many school
3 districts, towns and villages to cooperate. And
4 again, this bill just gets a little bit better.
5 And anything that we can possibly do to keep our
6 children safe, I'll always be in favor of.

7 So again, thank you, Senator Cooney.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
9 C. Ryan to be recorded in the affirmative.

10 Announce the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
12 Calendar Number 1244, voting in the negative:
13 Senator Martinez.

14 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 1249, Senate Print 1819A, by Senator Fernandez,
19 an act to amend the Criminal Procedure Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
3 Palumbo to explain his vote.

4 SENATOR PALUMBO: Thank you,
5 Madam President.

6 I rise to discuss this bill as well
7 that is certainly well-intended, but I'm going to
8 be voting no because -- and I'd love to have a
9 conversation with the sponsor about this. The
10 exact purpose of the diversion court is for
11 people to take advantage of the ability for a
12 reduced sentence or a reduced plea on a criminal
13 charge in exchange for them jumping through the
14 hoops and getting sober.

15 So the fact that you can now conceal
16 a negative test from the judge -- I actually many
17 moons ago was the drug court ADA when I was a
18 young narcotics prosecutor in Suffolk County, and
19 the amount of people that at the -- when they
20 would graduate after a year of coming back every
21 week and getting tested. If they were positive,
22 the judge would actually set bail for a couple of
23 days, bring them back out.

24 They would cry, their family would
25 cry, it was such an incredible celebration of

1 sobriety. And the case would be virtually
2 dismissed.

3 That is the point of these diversion
4 courts, that you need to atone for mistakes.
5 Right? Relapse is a part of recovery on many
6 occasions. So when these folks are now -- I get
7 we've got to have a confidentiality issue. But
8 to conceal that from the judge at the defendant's
9 request is completely contrary to what these
10 diversion courts are about.

11 So for those reasons, I'll be voting
12 no.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
14 Palumbo to be recorded in the negative.

15 Announce the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
17 Calendar 1249, voting in the negative are
18 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
19 Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martinez,
20 Martins, Mattera, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt,
21 Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk,
22 Weber and Weik.

23 Ayes, 37. Nays, 22.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
25 is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Also Senator
2 Scarcella-Spanton.

3 Ayes, 36. Nays, 23.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Also Senator Fahy.

7 Ayes, 35. Nays, 24.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1264, Assembly Bill Number 26, by
12 Assemblymember Rosenthal, an act to amend the
13 Social Services Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
17 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
18 shall have become a law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
25 Calendar 1264, voting in the negative are

1 Senators Gallivan and Stec.

2 Ayes, 57. Nays, 2.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 1268, Senate Print 7782A, by Senator Skoufis, an
7 act to amend the Public Health Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
18 Calendar 1268, voting in the negative are
19 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Gallivan,
20 Griffo, Martins, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco and Weik.

21 Ayes, 50. Nays, 9.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 1300, Senate Print 7944A, by Senator Ramos, an

1 act to amend the Labor Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
5 act shall take effect immediately.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
10 the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
12 Calendar 1300, voting in the negative:
13 Senators Borrello and Walczyk.

14 Ayes, 57. Nays, 2.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 1331, Senate Print 4274C, by Senator Kavanagh, an
19 act to amend the Election Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
3 the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
5 Calendar 1331, voting in the negative:
6 Senator Walczyk.

7 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1336, Senate Print 7962, by Senator Gonzalez, an
12 act to amend the Election Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
16 act shall take effect immediately.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
21 the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1345, Assembly Bill Number 2520, by
2 Assemblymember McDonald, an act to amend the
3 Social Services Law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
7 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
8 shall have become a law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
13 Rivera to explain his vote.

14 SENATOR RIVERA: Thank you,
15 Madam President.

16 Durable medical equipment -- and we
17 all know what these are; we're talking about
18 wheelchairs, hospital beds, oxygen machines,
19 ventilators, prosthetics, orthotics and many
20 more -- are things that are basic to people's
21 lives. It is something that makes sure that
22 patients who need them can live with safety, with
23 dignity, and with independence.

24 But unfortunately some of the ways
25 that we are currently paying for this,

1 particularly Medicaid managed-care organizations,
2 unfortunately means that providers are being paid
3 less than what they should be paid. And this
4 bill will change that.

5 What this bill would do,
6 Madam President, is that it would make it so that
7 Medicaid managed-care organizations will have to
8 reimburse durable medical equipment providers at
9 no less than 100 percent of the Medicaid
10 fee-for-service rate for the same items or
11 services.

12 And this is essential, again,
13 because these are things that -- the impact that
14 it has had, having providers not being paid
15 enough, means that over 20 percent of providers
16 have shut down in recent years across New York.
17 Which means that physicians can't find suppliers,
18 patients are left waiting for vital equipment,
19 and that means again patients have less safety,
20 less dignity and less independence in their
21 lives.

22 So with this bill we will make sure
23 that we change that and we provide what is
24 necessary for patients to be able to live their
25 lives in the best way possible.

1 So I'm glad that we're passing it,
2 and I gladly vote in the affirmative.

3 Thank you, Madam President.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
5 Rivera to be recorded in the affirmative.

6 Announce the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1366, Senate Print 7332, by Senator C. Ryan, an
12 act to amend the State Administrative Procedure
13 Act.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
22 C. Ryan to explain his vote.

23 SENATOR C. RYAN: Thank you,
24 Madam President.

25 So today I rise and speak in favor

1 of this bill which will make life a lot easier
2 for small businesses and for local governments.

3 You know, unfortunately, all too
4 often we hear stories about how New York is
5 driving business out of our state, how great it
6 is to do business in other states and, you know,
7 things are -- or how great it is in Texas.

8 But today we're going to try to
9 start to fix that. What this bill does, quite
10 simply, it sets up an online hub, a small
11 businesses regulatory nexus where rules, forms
12 and help is needed and they can get all the help
13 they need and clarification in one place.

14 So, you know, right now in this
15 state too many business owners waste time hunting
16 down rules or trying to figure what laws apply to
17 them. So this is about cutting red tape. It's
18 about breaking down barriers. And this is about
19 ensuring businesses' laws -- the laws don't get
20 lost in bureaucracy.

21 So common sense for small business,
22 long overdue, and I urge my colleagues to vote
23 yes. And Senate District 50 says New York's open
24 for business. Thank you.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator

1 C. Ryan to be recorded in the affirmative.

2 Announce the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 1374, Senate Print 3492A, by Senator May, an act
8 to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
12 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
13 shall have become a law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
18 May to explain her vote.

19 SENATOR MAY: Thank you,
20 Madam President.

21 We all know that New York faces a
22 housing crisis and we need to build more housing
23 units. But we don't need them way out in
24 cornfields where people will have to drive
25 farther and farther to get to work or to school

1 or to the stores.

2 What we need is more housing in
3 areas where there are already employers, where
4 there is already transit, where there are
5 sidewalks and you can walk to school or to
6 shopping.

7 One of the big barriers to that,
8 though, in New York is the State Environmental
9 Quality Review Process, which does what it's
10 supposed to do, tries to protect the air, the
11 water, the soil, public health, but it also sets
12 up a number of opportunities for people to bring
13 lawsuits that end up dragging out the process of
14 getting a permit for the building. And it may
15 either just discourage the developers altogether
16 or make it last so long that the cost just goes
17 up and up and up and you can't build in an
18 affordable manner.

19 So we are, with this bill, trying to
20 streamline that process just a little bit for
21 specific areas where we most want housing to be
22 built, where people can live and shop and work in
23 close proximity. And this bill streamlines the
24 process just enough that we hope we will end up
25 with a lot more housing for people in the

1 places they want to live.

2 And I vote aye.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
4 May to be recorded in the affirmative.

5 Senator Martins to explain his vote.

6 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,
7 Madam President.

8 I have concerns with this bill. You
9 know, certainly I understand, I think we all
10 understand the need for more affordable housing
11 to be built in this state. It's been a priority,
12 frankly, for everyone that we get there.

13 But to do so at the expense of a
14 proper environmental review is troublesome.
15 Cutting corners at the expense of a SEQR
16 evaluation, which all it does is make sure that
17 when you build higher-density units, something
18 that will impact the environment, whether it is
19 water, sewer, air, quality of life for those in
20 the area.

21 Whether it is access to sewers,
22 whether it is traffic and parking impacts as a
23 result of a development, those are basic
24 questions anytime we build. And there should not
25 be any shortcuts, and we shouldn't cut corners

1 when it comes to environmental impacts for the
2 sake of building housing.

3 Now, I would agree that sometimes
4 the SEQR process can be tedious, it can be long,
5 it can be abused. And so that challenge is for
6 us to reevaluate the SEQR process to see how we
7 can streamline it in an effective way so that it
8 doesn't serve as a block holistically to
9 construction in this state.

10 But not under these circumstances,
11 and frankly not when we're dealing with sources
12 of water that are not sewered. I'm concerned
13 about it. I'll be voting no. I understand why
14 we're doing it, but not this way.

15 Thank you.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
17 Martins to be recorded in the negative.

18 Announce the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
20 Calendar 1374, those Senators voting in the
21 negative are Senators Borrello,
22 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Gallivan, Griffo,
23 Helming, Lanza, Martins, O'Mara, Ortt, Rhoads,
24 Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

25 Ayes, 43. Nays, 16.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
2 is passed.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 1376, Senate Print 4691A, by Senator Cleare, an
5 act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
9 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it
10 shall have become a law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
15 the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
17 Calendar 1376, voting in the negative are
18 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
19 Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Mattera, Oberacker,
20 O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco,
21 Walczyk and Weik.

22 Ayes, 43. Nays, 16.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1386, Senate Print 1239E, by Senator Kavanagh, an
2 act to amend the Agriculture and Markets Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 8. This
6 act shall take effect one year after it shall
7 have become a law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
12 Oberacker to explain his vote.

13 SENATOR OBERACKER: Thank you,
14 Madam President.

15 You know, as a food scientist who
16 built his company on finding healthy alternatives
17 to ingredients, this bill does just that. As a
18 father, as a grandfather -- or more
19 appropriately, as a Pop-Pop -- I am extremely
20 grateful to Senator Kavanagh for bringing this
21 bill forward and proud, Madam President, to be a
22 cosponsor.

23 You know, there are alternatives to
24 these ingredients, and I've worked with them.
25 Madam President -- and you probably know this,

1 that lycopene could be used, which is derived
2 from tomatoes, as a red dye. I'm going to throw
3 a word -- oleoresin. Oleoresin of paprika could
4 be used in places where we want to use red dye.
5 All great alternatives.

6 I'm going to throw a word out at
7 you. It's called Dactylopius coccus. And I
8 know, Madam President, you know what that is.
9 But for those that don't, that is the derivative
10 where we get carminic acid from, which is one of
11 the main ingredients for the red dyes that we're
12 looking at trying to omit. It comes from a
13 little red bug.

14 My colleagues and those on both
15 sides of the aisle, I will leave you with this.
16 You are what you eat.

17 I proudly, Madam President, proudly
18 cosponsor and vote aye on this bill.

19 Thank you.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
21 Oberacker to be recorded in the affirmative.

22 Senator Kavanagh to explain his
23 vote.

24 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Thank you,
25 Madam President.

1 I'd first like to thank my colleague
2 from the other side of the aisle for his very
3 kind words and for his science lesson.

4 I am not a scientist, but I just
5 wanted to stand and say this is a tremendously
6 important thing we're doing today. The federal
7 food regulatory system has major gaps, and it is
8 up to us to step in and close one of those gaps
9 today.

10 The biggest effect of this bill will
11 be to substantially close what's sometimes called
12 the GRAS loophole. It is the notion that if a
13 food company designates certain food ingredients
14 as generally recognized as safe, with their own
15 science behind closed doors, they can, under
16 federal law, include that ingredient in our food
17 without revealing, in some cases that they're
18 including that ingredient and certainly without
19 revealing the science.

20 Science works best when it is done
21 in the open, when people can review the results,
22 especially if the science that's being done is in
23 a self-interested way. We have an opportunity
24 today in New York to make sure that anybody who's
25 providing food to New Yorkers, who is doing it

1 pursuant to this loophole at the federal level,
2 will have to disclose the presence of those
3 ingredients and the science to New Yorkers.
4 Ag and Markets will then make that available to
5 all of us.

6 I'm very proud to vote aye and thank
7 my colleagues for their support.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
9 Kavanaugh to be recorded in the affirmative.

10 Announce the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
12 Calendar 1386, voting in the negative:
13 Senator Borrello.

14 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 1390, Senate Print Number 7297A, by
19 Senator Hoylman-Sigal, an act to amend the
20 Public Health Law.

21 SENATOR GIANARIS: Lay it aside for
22 the day, please.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
24 will be laid aside for the day.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1409, Senate Print 4655, by Senator Fahy, an act
2 to amend the General Business Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
13 Calendar 1409, voting in the negative are
14 Senators Borrello, Helming and Walczyk.

15 Ayes, 56. Nays, 3.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 1415, Senate Print 7494A, by Senator Gianaris, an
20 act to amend the General Business Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 7. This
24 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
25 shall have become a law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
5 the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
7 Calendar 1415, voting in the negative are
8 Senators Borrello, Chan, Griffo, Helming,
9 Oberacker, Weber and Weik.

10 Ayes, 52. Nays, 7.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 1417, Senate Print 7821A, by Senator May, an act
15 to amend the General Business Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
19 act shall take effect January 1, 2026.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: In relation to

1 Calendar 1417, voting in the negative:

2 Senator Walczyk.

3 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 1429, Senate Print Number 8195, by
8 Senator Hoylman-Sigal, an act to amend the
9 Civil Practice Law and Rules.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
11 last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
13 act shall take effect immediately.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
18 the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
20 Calendar Number 1429, voting in the negative:
21 Senator Oberacker.

22 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1434, Senate Print 2520B, by Senator Skoufis, an
2 act to amend the Public Officers Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
6 act shall take effect June 21, 2026.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 1450, Senate Print 6441A, by Senator Skoufis, an
17 act to amend the Insurance Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator

1 Rhoads to explain his vote.

2 SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you,
3 Madam President.

4 While I certainly understand the
5 intent of the sponsor's legislation, in the State
6 of New York we go to great lengths to attempt to
7 respect all faiths. The blanket inclusion of
8 mandated coverage without there being a
9 good-faith religious exemption creates an issue
10 for faith-based healthcare companies that might
11 have a good-faith religious exemption to the
12 provision of contraceptives.

13 So while I understand the purpose of
14 the bill, the failure to exclude faith-based
15 healthcare institutions requires me to vote no.

16 Thank you, Madam President.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
18 Rhoads to be recorded in the negative.

19 Announce the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
21 Calendar 1450, voting in the negative are
22 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Lanza, Rhoads,
23 Walczyk and Weber. Also Senator Borrello.

24 Ayes, 53. Nays, 6.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill

1 is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 1484, Senate Print 3886, by Senator Gianaris, an
4 act to amend the Administrative Code of the City
5 of New York.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
9 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
10 shall have become a law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
15 the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
17 Calendar 1484, voting in the negative:
18 Senator Walczyk.

19 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
21 is passed.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 1508, Senate Print Number 5500, by
24 Senator Hoylman-Sigal, an act to amend the
25 General Business Law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
2 last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
4 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
5 shall have become a law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
10 the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
12 Calendar 1508, voting in the negative:
13 Senator Walczyk.

14 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 1509, Senate Print 6954A, by Senator Gounardes,
19 an act to amend the General Business Law.

20 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Lay it
22 aside.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 1510, Senate Print 7599C, by Senator Gonzalez, an
25 act to amend the State Technology Law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
2 last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 10. This
4 act shall take effect immediately.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
9 the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
11 Calendar 1510, voting in the negative:
12 Senator Walczyk.

13 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 1514, Assembly Bill Number 2730A, by
18 Assemblymember Barrett, an act to amend the
19 Labor Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
3 the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
6 is passed.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 1516, Senate Print 7923A, by Senator Gonzalez, an
9 act in relation to authorizing and directing the
10 New York State Energy Research and Development
11 Authority to conduct a study to determine the
12 possibility of closing the peaker plant electric
13 generating facilities in Brooklyn, New York.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
22 Gonzalez to explain her vote.

23 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Thank you,
24 Madam President.

25 Long before I took office as

1 State Senator for Senate District 59, I organized
2 with my neighbors as a grassroots climate justice
3 advocate alarmed by the toll that Astoria's
4 "Asthma Alley" was taking on my community.

5 For far too long, my district has
6 been disproportionately burdened with supporting
7 our state's energy reliability needs. In
8 Greenpoint in Western Queens, there are four
9 peaker plant facilities, including two at the
10 Ravenswood Generating Station.

11 Representing my district means
12 confronting a long legacy of fossil fuel
13 infrastructure. And by passing this bill we'll
14 be actually creating a plan to close the peaker
15 plants, especially in Brooklyn by Kent Avenue. I
16 think that's important, given that I represent
17 generations of Greenpointers and Northern
18 Brooklyn residents who have been deeply impacted
19 by that peaker plant, who have family members who
20 have passed away from not only related illnesses
21 from Newtown Creek, but others.

22 So I want to thank this body for
23 moving on this piece of legislation. I want to
24 thank the advocates who helped us craft this
25 piece of legislation. And certainly, and

1 enthusiastically, I vote aye.

2 Thank you.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
4 Gonzalez to be recorded in the affirmative.

5 Announce the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
7 Calendar 1516, voting in the negative are
8 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
9 Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Mattera,
10 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco,
11 Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

12 Ayes, 41. Nays, 18.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 1534, Senate Print 5379, by Senator Harckham, an
17 act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
21 act shall take effect on the first of January.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator

1 Harckham to explain his vote.

2 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Thank you very
3 much, Madam President.

4 I want to thank the Majority Leader
5 for bringing this bill to the floor once again.

6 You may remember this bill. It
7 passed last year by a comfortable bipartisan
8 margin in both houses, went to the Governor, and
9 unfortunately was vetoed.

10 We are more determined than ever.
11 This is one of a series of bills for those of us
12 who believe public money deserves prevailing
13 wage. And there are a number of Senators who
14 carry great bills in this space, Senator Mayer
15 and others.

16 But this is an important bill
17 because brownfield work is a public tax credit.
18 It's sensitive work. And developers have done
19 some really great work cleaning up brownfield
20 sites for housing, affordable housing, mixed-use,
21 commercial -- whatever the need, the projects are
22 getting done.

23 But they need to be done by
24 professionals. The operating engineers, the
25 laborers.

1 And so once again, we are proud to
2 put this legislation forward, more determined
3 than ever to get the Governor to sign this bill.

4 I want to thank Marina O'Donnell
5 from the operating engineers, Amanda Jensen from
6 the laborers -- among the many people who worked
7 on this bill -- for their tenacity.

8 I proudly vote aye.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
10 Harckham to be recorded in the affirmative.

11 Announce the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
13 Calendar 1534, voting in the negative are
14 Senators Borrello, Chan, Griffo, Helming, O'Mara,
15 Ortt and Walczyk. Also Senator Gallivan.

16 Ayes, 51. Nays, 8.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 1549, Senate Print 7611A, by Senator Bynoe, an
21 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This
25 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it

1 shall have become a law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
6 the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1568, Senate Print 8104, by Senator S. Ryan, an
12 act to amend the Alcoholic Beverage Control Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
16 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it
17 shall have become a law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
24 Calendar 1568, voting in the negative:
25 Senator Walczyk.

1 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 1600, Senate Print 1148, by Senator Gounardes, an
6 act to amend Public Authorities Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 10. This
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
15 Gounardes to explain his vote.

16 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Thank you,
17 Madam President.

18 I rise to speak in strong support of
19 the Rider Representation Act, because in a city
20 and a region where public transit is the backbone
21 of our daily lives, it's time that the people who
22 rely on transit the most have a say and a seat at
23 the table in how their transit system is run.

24 For far too long our rider
25 representatives on the MTA Board have had a seat

1 but not a voice. They've been to able to listen,
2 but not been able to speak. And so they have not
3 been able to fully represent the views, the
4 needs, the concerns of the millions of members of
5 the riding public who depend on public transit,
6 whether in New York City or in the suburbs. It's
7 like inviting someone to dinner and then refusing
8 to give them a plate to put food for themselves.

9 This bill gives rider
10 representatives full voting privileges. It
11 allows them to matter. It allows them to lead.
12 But it also adds a new seat to the MTA Board to
13 represent specifically the disability community.
14 And we know, specifically in New York City
15 Transit, the incredible accessibility challenges
16 that still remain. This will empower the
17 disability community to have a real seat at the
18 table as the MTA continues to make good on its
19 commitments to make our system as accessible as
20 possible.

21 This is not just about good
22 governance, this is about justice and good
23 transit administration. And I am proud to vote
24 aye. Thank you.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator

1 Gounardes to be recorded in the affirmative.

2 Announce the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
4 Calendar 1600, voting in the negative are
5 Senators Ashby, Chan, Griffo, Lanza, Oberacker
6 and Stec.

7 Ayes, 53. Nays, 6.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1618, Assembly Bill Number 584C, by
12 Assemblymember Steck, an act to amend the
13 Labor Law.

14 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Lay it
16 aside.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 1621, Senate Print Number 4544B, by
19 Senator Hoylman-Sigal, an act to amend the
20 Education Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
4 Mayer to explain her vote.

5 SENATOR MAYER: Thank you,
6 Madam President.

7 I rise to vote in favor of this
8 bill, the Jack Reid Protect All Students Act.
9 And first I want to thank Senator Hoylman-Sigal,
10 who really made it his work to get this over the
11 finish line.

12 This bill is in the memory of
13 Jack Reid, whose parents, Elizabeth and Bill,
14 took an incredible tragedy when their son took
15 his own life after relentless bullying at a
16 non-public school, and made it their mission to
17 change the law so this would not happen to
18 another child.

19 I personally promised them that I
20 would do everything in my ability to get a bill
21 over the finish line, and finally we are able to
22 do so. We had tremendous cooperation from the
23 non-public school community, and I appreciate
24 that. But this bill extends many of the
25 protections of DASA, the Dignity for All Students

1 Act, to nonpublic schools, requiring them to have
2 a written anti-bullying policy, investigate
3 reports of bullying, and take action to stop the
4 bullying and protect students from retaliation.

5 This bill will require our
6 non-public schools to work proactively to prevent
7 bullying and protect their students without
8 compromising their integrity as independent
9 schools. It's a critical step forward. It's a
10 more -- it's a sad celebration of the loss of
11 life, but it is in tribute to his parents and to
12 their suffering and tragedy that they turned this
13 terrible moment into what will be a success in
14 changing the lives of so many future students in
15 non-public schools in New York State.

16 I vote aye. And again I thank my
17 colleagues, I thank the leader, and I thank
18 everyone who helped make this possible,
19 particularly Senator Hoylman-Sigal.

20 I vote aye.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
22 Mayer to be recorded in the affirmative.

23 Senator Hoylman-Sigal to explain his
24 vote.

25 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Thank you,

1 Madam President.

2 And thank you to my colleagues,
3 Leader Stewart-Cousins, and my esteemed chair of
4 the Senate Education Committee, Senator Mayer,
5 for her support and work on this bill.

6 This bill, the Jack Reid Protect All
7 Students Act, is modeled after the Dignity for
8 All Students Act, which applies only to public
9 schools. And just earlier in this chamber today
10 we had the author of that bill, former
11 Assemblymember Danny O'Donnell. That bill was
12 passed back in 2010. But students in private
13 schools, up until this bill will be passed and
14 signed into law, have not been protected.

15 The Jack Reid Protect All Students
16 Act requires all non-public schools, like public
17 schools under the current law, to develop and
18 implement policies prohibiting bullying and the
19 harassment of students. The law also requires
20 schools to promptly investigate all complaints
21 and take steps reasonably calculated to protect
22 students and stop the bullying. And it also
23 protects students against retaliation for making
24 any reports.

25 As a result, students at non-public

1 schools will be entitled to the same protections
2 and dignity as all other students in New York
3 State, no matter who they are.

4 And this is so important,
5 Madam President, because we know the rates of
6 bullying have skyrocketed here in New York and
7 elsewhere. The majority of LGBTQ youth, the
8 majority, 52 percent, who are enrolled in middle
9 or high school reported being bullied either in
10 person or electronically in the last year.

11 And of course this is in memory and
12 a testament to the family that has pushed this
13 legislation forward. In the memory of Jack Reid,
14 I want to thank Elizabeth and Bill for their
15 tireless efforts -- for turning, as has been
16 said, pain into purpose, to creating a better and
17 safer learning environment for all students in
18 the State of New York in the memory of their dear
19 son who tragically died in 2022 at just age 17.

20 I vote aye, Madam President.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
22 Hoylman-Sigal to be recorded in the affirmative.

23 Senator Tedisco to explain his vote.

24 SENATOR TEDISCO: I want to thank
25 the sponsors of this particular bill.

1 You know, bullying has been, is now
2 and probably will be in the future a difficult
3 problem for our schools. The Dignity for
4 All Students Act was a good piece of legislation.
5 And I don't think we can make anything perfect,
6 but it's far from perfect.

7 Moving that portion of what we can
8 do in terms of the private and public schools,
9 and all schools, I think is an important thing to
10 do.

11 But I have to ask a question to
12 everybody in this room, people in the balcony:
13 If your child was being bullied in school or your
14 child was the bully in the school, just raise
15 your hand so I can see if you would not want to
16 be notified. I'm just going to look around here.
17 Everybody in this room would want to be notified.

18 The Dignity for All Students Act --
19 and let me say this. All of us probably at one
20 time or another were probably bullied in school.
21 I won't ask you to raise your hand about this,
22 but how many of us ran home and told our parents
23 what happened? We didn't, most of us probably.
24 I didn't. I sucked it up. Okay?

25 Now, I wasn't bullied to an extreme

1 extent. Maybe you weren't either. But now this
2 bullying can take place 24/7 in schools. It used
3 to be stopping at the gates of the schools. We
4 know with the websites now that it's 24/7 on
5 occasion. And it just happens over and over and
6 over again.

7 Nobody raised their hand. You would
8 want to be notified if your child was being
9 bullied in school. You would want to be notified
10 because it's a terrible thing to have your child
11 be a bully in school.

12 I'll tell you a story about
13 Jacobe Taras and the Taras family in my district.
14 Jacobe was going to school every day, basically
15 being bullied, maybe 24/7. His parents never
16 knew hardly the extent of that bullying. You
17 know why? Because the Dignity for All Students
18 Act, and now the private and public schools being
19 involved with that, doesn't say, believe it or
20 not, when your child is the bullier or your child
21 is being bullied in school or any of the 19.5 to
22 20 million people in New York State have a child
23 that may be involved in that way --

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
25 Tedisco.

1 SENATOR TEDISCO: -- you know what
2 the bill says?

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
4 Tedisco.

5 SENATOR TEDISCO: You have to
6 report it to the State Education Department --

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
8 Tedisco.

9 SENATOR TEDISCO: -- but you don't
10 have to tell the parents.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
12 Tedisco, how do you vote?

13 SENATOR TEDISCO: I'm going to vote
14 yes on this, and I hope my bill --

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
16 you, Senator.

17 SENATOR TEDISCO: -- for
18 Jacobe Taras to involve you and all the students
19 who didn't raise your hand here, and all the
20 parents are notified when their child is a
21 bullier or being bullied.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
23 Tedisco --

24 SENATOR TEDISCO: Thank you,
25 Madam President.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
2 you, Senator.

3 Senator Tedisco to be recorded in
4 the affirmative.

5 Announce the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
7 Calendar 1621, voting in the negative are
8 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Ortt, Stec and
9 Walczyk.

10 Ayes, 55. Nays, 4.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 1627, Assembly Bill Number 5364, by
15 Assemblymember P. Carroll, an act to amend the
16 Real Property Tax Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
20 act shall take effect immediately.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
25 the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
2 Calendar 1627, voting in the negative:
3 Senator Fahy.

4 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
6 is passed.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 1632, Senate Print 5713, by Senator Skoufis, an
9 act to amend the Railroad Law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
11 last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
13 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it
14 shall have become a law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
19 the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

21 Oops -- oh, sorry. In relation to
22 Calendar 1632, voting in the negative:
23 Senator Walczyk.

24 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill

1 is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 1635, Senate Print 6693B, by Senator Jackson, an
4 act to amend the Education Law.

5 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Lay it
7 aside.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 1640, Assembly Bill Number 7634, by
10 Assemblymember McDonald, an act to amend the
11 Tax Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
15 act shall take effect immediately.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
22 Calendar 1640, voting in the negative are
23 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan,
24 Harckham, Helming, Lanza, Martinez, O'Mara,
25 Palumbo, C. Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton, Skoufis and

1 Weik.

2 Ayes, 47. Nays, 12.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 1644, Senate Print 7222A, by Senator Bailey, an
7 act to amend the Insurance Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 7. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 1653, Senate Print 8021B, by Senator Hinchey, an
22 act to amend the Executive Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This

1 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it
2 shall have become a law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
9 Calendar 1653, voting in the negative:
10 Senator Brisport.

11 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
13 is passed.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 1664, Assembly Bill Number 8784, by
16 Assemblymember Barrett, an act to amend the
17 Chapter 465 of the Laws of 2016.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
3 Calendar 1664, voting in the negative are
4 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Harckham, Lanza,
5 Martinez, C. Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton, Skoufis,
6 and Weik.

7 Ayes, 51. Nays, 8.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1665, Senate Print Number 8346, by
12 Senator Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, an act to amend
13 Chapter 846 of the Laws of 1970.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
24 Calendar 1665, voting in the negative:
25 Senator Fahy.

1 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 1679, Senate Print 1511A, by Senator Liu, an act
6 to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
10 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
11 shall have become a law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
18 Calendar 1679, voting in the negative:
19 Senator Walczyk.

20 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
22 is passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 1695, Senate Print 6231A, by Senator Webb, an act
25 to amend the General Business Law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
2 last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 12. This
4 act shall take effect one year after it shall
5 have become a law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
10 the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
12 Calendar 1695, voting in the negative:
13 Senator Walczyk.

14 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 1800, Senate Print 1455A, by Senator Kavanagh, an
19 act to amend the Executive Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
3 the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
5 Calendar 1800, voting in the negative are
6 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
7 Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Lanza, Mattera,
8 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Stec,
9 Tedisco, Walczyk and Weik.

10 Ayes, 42. Nays, 17.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 1808, Senate Print 4045C, by Senator Gounardes,
15 an act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 7. This
19 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
20 shall have become a law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
25 Gounardes to explain his vote.

1 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Thank you,
2 Madam President.

3 In 2009 the State Legislature
4 adopted Leandra's Law, which required those who
5 are found to be driving while intoxicated or
6 convicted of driving while intoxicated to have an
7 ignition lock installed on their vehicle, to make
8 sure that they never get behind the wheel of a
9 car while they were under the influence and they,
10 God forbid, hit and kill someone. That law has
11 been incredibly successful.

12 Today our chamber is taking another
13 step towards making sure that our streets are
14 safe for all by adopting the same concept, but
15 for reckless drivers. We are now for the first
16 time saying that those drivers across the state
17 who are extremely reckless, those who have their
18 license at risk of suspension or those who rack
19 up an egregious number of speed camera violation
20 tickets in the City of New York, or elsewhere
21 that has a speed camera program, they can be
22 subject, by a court order, to having a speed
23 limiting device installed on their car.

24 The process is the same as we have
25 under Leandra's Law. And this is going to make a

1 difference to save people's lives.

2 Many of you probably remember this
3 past March there was a terrible tragedy in
4 Brooklyn where 35-year-old Natasha Saada was
5 walking along Ocean Parkway with her daughters
6 Diana and Debra, and they were run over by a
7 woman who had 90 violations on her car --
8 including 18 speed camera violations in one
9 year -- and killed them. She had a suspended
10 license, and yet she continued to drive.

11 Requiring a speed limiter on
12 reckless drivers' cars will help us keep streets
13 safe. We are not taking someone's car away.
14 That's ineffective. We're not suspending their
15 license. That's ineffective. We're not racking
16 up fines. That's ineffective.

17 We can slow people down and keep
18 people alive, and for that I proudly vote aye.

19 Thank you.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
21 Gounardes to be recorded in the affirmative.

22 Senator Chan to explain his vote.

23 SENATOR CHAN: Thank you,
24 Madam President.

25 I thank the sponsor for addressing

1 this issue. I know about the accident that
2 happened on Ocean Parkway in an adjacent district
3 back in March.

4 Unfortunately, this bill is
5 punishing a car. When a car speeds through a red
6 light camera or a speeding camera, it is the car
7 that is speeding. We don't know who's driving
8 that car.

9 I agree with the other aspects of
10 the bill where if they're speeding for a certain
11 amount of -- if they rack up a certain amount of
12 points, the driver should have this limiter
13 installed in their car.

14 There has to be a better way of
15 addressing this. Earlier today our sponsor said
16 that a reckless driver -- in regards to another
17 bill that a reckless driver is going to be a
18 reckless driver 75 percent of the time. And
19 likewise, a speeding driver, in this case, is
20 still going to be a speeding driver when he or
21 she is driving somebody else's car or a rental
22 car or in another city.

23 So to address this issue by slowing
24 down the vehicle is not the answer. But I am up
25 on the bill, just to clarify. There's got to be

1 other solutions. We have to arrest these
2 drivers, possibly jail time.

3 And to be clear, a reckless driver
4 and a speeding driver is two different things. I
5 think I'm qualified to speak about that, having
6 done over -- maybe 5,000 car stops in my days as
7 a law enforcement agent.

8 But I am up on the bill and I do
9 thank the sponsor in trying to make a difference
10 here. Thank you.

11 Thank you, Madam President.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
13 Chan to be recorded in the affirmative.

14 Announce the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
16 Calendar 1808, voting in the negative are
17 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
18 Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Mattera,
19 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Rhoads, Stec, Walczyk
20 and Weik.

21 Ayes, 44. Nays, 15.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 1818, Senate Print 5759C, by Senator Harckham, an

1 act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
5 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it
6 shall have become a law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
11 Harckham to explain his vote.

12 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Thank you very
13 much, Madam President.

14 I want to thank the Majority Leader
15 for bringing this bill to the floor. You know,
16 in this chamber we talk about a lot of different
17 things. A couple of those are protecting water
18 quality from the dangers of PFAS, PFOA, heavy
19 metals and other contaminants. And we also talk
20 about protecting our farmers and their most
21 valuable asset, their farmland.

22 Well, a body of science has
23 uncovered across the country and here in New York
24 a practice that was once thought as being helpful
25 to farmers actually has turned out that it could

1 be very dangerous to farmers. And that is using
2 the biosolids from wastewater as fertilizer on
3 their land. And what we've come to learn is that
4 what really was an elegant solution 20 years
5 ago -- what do we do with the biosolids from
6 wastewater -- has now become a really dangerous
7 situation as we concentrate PFAS, PFOA,
8 pharmaceuticals, heavy metals, really creating a
9 toxic sludge.

10 And unfortunately, this has been
11 given to farmers, and now the body of science is
12 showing this is impacting wells, water quality,
13 and could impact crop health.

14 So this bill is a confluence of
15 those two efforts -- a lot of farmers coming
16 together, environmentalists coming together. And
17 this will be a five-year moratorium on that
18 practice to give us time to do more research, to
19 figure out what to do with these biosolids.

20 Unfortunately, in the last waste
21 management plan New York State did, it calls for
22 more spreading of biosolids. So we do need to
23 think of an alternative and also what we can do
24 to help farmers with testing and remediation.

25 So I want to thank Senator Hinchey

1 and her team for their work on this bill. A huge
2 shout-out to Assemblymember Anna Kelles, who did
3 amazing work on this bill. And again to the
4 farmers and the environmental advocates, who came
5 together in a very short time.

6 So with that, Madam President, I
7 vote aye.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
9 Harckham to be recorded in the affirmative.

10 Announce the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
12 Calendar 1818, voting in the negative are
13 Senators Borrello, Chan, Gallivan, Griffio,
14 Mattera, Oberacker, Rhoads, C. Ryan, Stec,
15 Walczyk and Weik.

16 Ayes, 48. Nays, 11.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 1832, Senate Print 7501A, by Senator Mayer, an
21 act to amend the General Municipal Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
5 Mayer to explain her vote.

6 SENATOR MAYER: Thank you,
7 Madam President.

8 This modest but important bill was a
9 very long time coming. After COVID, or even in
10 the midst of COVID, it became clear to me and to
11 thousands of others that our EMS system was
12 broken. EMS workers were truly essential workers
13 and heroes of the COVID moment -- going into
14 houses when they did not know what the disease
15 was, what the risks were. And they took both
16 personal risk and professional risks in their
17 business.

18 And then it became clear that our
19 whole EMS system was really quite a hodgepodge of
20 different regulations, different rules, different
21 financing. And yet people's lives were on the
22 line. And everyone thought that if they called
23 911, EMS had to come.

24 We have worked tirelessly since 2022
25 to come up with a way to address this, and we've

1 been unsuccessful in coming up with a major
2 effort. But we finally have come up with some
3 modest efforts that will make a difference.

4 This bill today focuses on
5 establishing a local review and planning process
6 involving counties, cities, towns and villages
7 directed towards assessing service levels in
8 every county, and developing a plan -- and this
9 is so important -- to ensure every New Yorker is
10 provided reliable EMS service.

11 This county-by-county assessment
12 will provide a road map for statewide
13 improvements, and we will match it going forward
14 with a statewide plan that matches the variety of
15 ways EMS services are provided.

16 I could not have gotten this far
17 without my colleague Assemblymember Steve Otis,
18 all the municipal officials -- NYCOM, NYSAC --
19 EMS providers, fire officials, fire unions all
20 across the state who have worked so hard to find
21 a solution here.

22 I also want to acknowledge my
23 colleague Senator May's bill, which hopefully we
24 will pass, which allows localities to exceed the
25 tax cap when necessary to pay for these vital

1 services.

2 We can't stop here. We have to use
3 this as a beginning to continue the work to put
4 our EMS system on a solid footing and ensure that
5 our EMS providers get the respect, recognition
6 and resources they deserve and sorely need to
7 continue to provide this vital service to every
8 New Yorker.

9 I vote aye. I'm incredibly grateful
10 to our leadership and to all my colleagues who
11 realize that EMS is a statewide issue requiring a
12 statewide solution. And we're finally beginning
13 that process today. I vote aye.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
15 Mayer to be recorded in the affirmative.

16 Announce the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 1837, Senate Print 7677A, by Senator Skoufis, an
22 act to amend the Town Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This

1 act shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
6 the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1858, Assembly Bill Number 4762B, by
12 Assemblymember Chandler-Waterman, an act to amend
13 the Executive Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
17 act shall take effect one year after it shall
18 have become a law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
25 Calendar 1858, voting in the negative are

1 Senators Borrello, Chan, Griffo, Lanza,
2 Oberacker, O'Mara, Rhoads, Walczyk and Weik.

3 Ayes, 50. Nays, 9.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
5 is passed.

6 Senator Gianaris, that completes the
7 reading of today's active list.

8 SENATOR GIANARIS: I believe
9 there's a report of the Rules Committee at the
10 desk. Let's take that up, please.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
12 Secretary will read.

13 THE SECRETARY: Senator
14 Stewart-Cousins, from the Committee on Rules,
15 reports the following bills:

16 Senate Print 590A, by
17 Senator Krueger, an act to repeal paragraphs (e),
18 (f) and (g) of subdivision 5 of Section 36 of the
19 Municipal Home Rule Law;

20 Senate Print 1169A, by
21 Senator Gonzalez, an act to amend the
22 Civil Rights Law;

23 Senate Print 1515, by Senator May,
24 an act to amend the General Municipal Law;

25 Senate Print 1695, by

1 Senator Skoufis, an act to amend the
2 Real Property Tax Law;

3 Senate Print 1897, by
4 Senator O'Mara, an act to amend the Highway Law;
5 Senate Print 2461, by
6 Senator Rhoads, an act in relation to authorizing
7 the New York State and Local Employees'
8 Retirement System to accept an application for
9 disability retirement benefits from Andrew
10 Reilly, Jr.;

11 Senate Print 2602, by
12 Senator Addabbo, an act to amend the
13 Executive Law, in relation to establishing the
14 Office of Native American Affairs;

15 Senate Print 3330, by
16 Senator Cooney, an act to amend the Tax Law;

17 Senate Print 4043, by
18 Senator Harckham, an act in relation to
19 authorizing the Bedford Hills Fire District to
20 file an application for exemption from school
21 taxes;

22 Senate Print 4073, by Senator Webb,
23 an act to amend the Tax Law;

24 Senate Print 4615B, by Senator Weik,
25 an act to amend the Highway Law;

1 Senate Print 4725, by
2 Senator Skoufis, an act in relation to
3 authorizing Michael Winston Hoard, the widower of
4 Kathy Marie Dwyer-Hoard, to file a new service
5 retirement application;

6 Senate Print 5224B, by
7 Senator Rolison, an act in relation to
8 authorizing the Town of Union Vale, County of
9 Dutchess, to alienate and discontinue the use of
10 certain parklands;

11 Senate Print 5505, by
12 Senator Salazar, an act to amend the
13 Social Services Law;

14 Senate Print 5677, by
15 Senator Tedisco, an act to amend the Vehicle and
16 Traffic Law;

17 Senate Print 5929A, by
18 Senator Martins, an act authorizing the
19 Commissioner of General Services to transfer and
20 convey certain state land to the Syosset Central
21 School District;

22 Senate Print 5941B, by
23 Senator Skoufis, an act to amend the
24 General Business Law;

25 Senate Print 6048, by

1 Senator Skoufis, an act to authorize
2 Susan Gillinder, the widow of Robert C. Ritchie,
3 to file a new service retirement application and
4 option election form with the New York State and
5 Local Employees' Retirement System;

6 Senate Print 6266, by
7 Senator Salazar, an act to amend the
8 Social Services Law;

9 Senate Print 6664A, by
10 Senator Hinchey, an act to amend the Town Law;

11 Senate Print 6817, by Senator Bynoe,
12 an act authorizing the assessor of the County of
13 Nassau to accept from the Incorporated Village of
14 Hempstead an application for exemption from real
15 property taxes;

16 Senate Print 6818, by Senator Bynoe,
17 an act in relation to authorizing the County of
18 Nassau assessor to accept an application for a
19 real property tax exemption;

20 Senate Print 6819A, by
21 Senator Bynoe, an act in relation to authorizing
22 the County of Nassau assessor to accept an
23 application for a real property tax exemption;

24 Senate Print 6953B, by
25 Senator Gounardes, an act to amend the

1 General Business Law;
2 Senate Print 6977, by
3 Senator Harckham, an act to amend the
4 Real Property Tax Law;
5 Senate Print 7078A, by
6 Senator Harckham, an act to amend the Tax Law;
7 Senate Print 7143, by Senator S.
8 Ryan, an act to amend the Retirement and
9 Social Security Law;
10 Senate Print 7157B, by
11 Senator Cooney, an act to amend Chapter 416 of
12 the Laws of 2007;
13 Senate Print 7189A, by
14 Senator Rhoads, an act to amend the Highway Law;
15 Senate Print 7273A, by
16 Senator Baskin, an act to amend Chapter 296 of
17 the Laws of 1992;
18 Senate Print 7321B, by
19 Senator Bailey, an act to amend the Tax Law;
20 Senate Print 7322, by
21 Senator Bailey, an act to amend the Tax Law;
22 Senate Print 7397, by
23 Senator Skoufis, an act in relation to
24 authorizing Liliana Fernandez-Clemente, the widow
25 of Daniel Clemente, to file a new service

1 retirement application and option election form
2 with the New York State and Local Employees'
3 Retirement System;
4 Senate Print 7650A, by
5 Senator Skoufis, an act to amend the Tax Law;
6 Senate Print 7663A, by
7 Senator Bynoe, an act in relation to authorizing
8 the County of Nassau assessor to accept an
9 application for a real property tax exemption;
10 Senate Print 7687A, by
11 Senator Palumbo, an act to amend the
12 Public Authorities Law;
13 Senate Print 7692A, by Senator May,
14 an act to amend the Tax Law;
15 Senate Print 7714A, by
16 Senator Gonzalez, an act to amend the
17 Public Health Law;
18 Senate Print 7758, by Senator Webb,
19 an act to authorize the City of Binghamton to
20 offer an optional retirement plan to Firefighter
21 David Edwards;
22 Senate Print 7775, by
23 Senator Stewart-Cousins, an act to amend the
24 Vehicle and Traffic Law;
25 Senate Print 7790, by

1 Senator Harckham, an act to amend the Tax Law;
2 Senate Print 7817, by
3 Senator Baskin, an act to authorize the widow of
4 William James Middlebrooks to file a retirement
5 option election form;

6 Senate Print 7836, by
7 Senator Skoufis, an act to amend the Tax Law;
8 Senate Print 7844, by
9 Senator Baskin, an act to authorize the widow of
10 Gerald J. Sullivan to file an application with
11 the New York State and Local Police and
12 Fire Retirement System;

13 Senate Print 7853A, by
14 Senator Harckham, an act to amend the
15 Village Law;

16 Senate Print 7880A, by
17 Senator Krueger, an act to amend the Tax Law;

18 Senate Print 7927A, by
19 Senator Mayer, an act to amend the County Law;

20 Senate Print 7989A, by
21 Senator Mayer, an act to amend Chapter 799 of the
22 Laws of 2021;

23 Senate Print 8077, by Senator May,
24 an act to amend Part B of Chapter 56 of the
25 Laws of 2020;

1 Senate Print 8155, by
2 Senator Griffo, an act to amend the Tax Law;
3 Senate Print 8161, by Senator Weber,
4 an act in relation to authorizing the assessor of
5 the Town of Ramapo, County of Rockland, to accept
6 an application for a real property tax exemption;
7 Senate Print 8162, by Senator Weber,
8 an act in relation to authorizing the assessor of
9 the Town of Ramapo, County of Rockland, to accept
10 an application for a real property tax exemption;
11 Senate Print 8218, by
12 Senator Cooney, an act to amend the
13 Education Law;
14 Senate Print 8220A, by Senator S.
15 Ryan, an act to amend the Education Law;
16 Senate Print 8222, by Senator Brouk,
17 an act to amend the Public Health Law;
18 Senate Print 8241A, by
19 Senator Harckham, an act to amend the
20 Public Authorities Law;
21 Senate Print 8269A, by
22 Senator Baskin, an act to amend the Tax Law;
23 Senate Print 8276, by
24 Senator Harckham, an act to amend the
25 Public Officers Law;

1 Senate Print 8285, by
2 Senator Skoufis, an act to amend the
3 General Business Law;

4 Senate Print 8308, by
5 Senator Scarcella-Spanton, an act to amend the
6 Public Health Law;

7 Senate Print 8311A, by
8 Senator Kavanagh, an act to amend the
9 Public Housing Law;

10 Senate Print 8314, by
11 Senator Sanders, an act to amend the
12 Alcoholic Beverage Control Law;

13 Senate Print 8315, by
14 Senator Sanders, an act to amend the
15 Alcoholic Beverage Control Law;

16 Senate Print 8328, by Senator Stec,
17 an act to amend the Alcoholic Beverage Control
18 Law;

19 Senate Print 8374, by
20 Senator Persaud, an act to amend the
21 Family Court Act;

22 Senate Print 8379, by
23 Senator Gianaris, an act to amend the
24 Alcoholic Beverage Control Law;

25 Senate Print 8382, by Senator S.

1 Ryan, an act to amend the Family Court Act;
2 Senate Print 8385, by
3 Senator Comrie, an act to amend the
4 State Finance Law;
5 Senate Print 8387, by Senator Ramos,
6 an act to amend the Workers' Compensation Law;
7 Senate Print 8388, by
8 Senator Hinchey, an act to amend the
9 Agriculture and Markets Law;
10 Senate Print 8389, by Senator Ramos,
11 an act to amend the Labor Law;
12 Senate Print 8397, by
13 Senator Martinez, an act to amend the
14 Business Corporation Law;
15 Senate Print 8402, by
16 Senator Gianaris, an act to amend Chapter 801 of
17 the Laws of 2021;
18 Senate Print 8403, by Senator Webb,
19 an act in relation to authorizing the Town of
20 Cortlandville to discontinue the use of certain
21 parklands;
22 Senate Print 8404, by
23 Senator Sepúlveda, an act to amend the
24 Coordinated Construction Act for Lower Manhattan;
25 Senate Print 8405, by

1 Senator Sepúlveda, an act to amend Chapter 322 of
2 the Laws of 2014;

3 Senate Print 8406, by
4 Senator Sanders, an act to amend the Banking Law;

5 Senate Print 8407, by Senator Fahy,
6 an act to amend the Social Services Law;

7 Senate Print 8408, by
8 Senator Krueger, an act to amend the
9 Financial Services Law;

10 Senate Print 8409, by
11 Senator Martinez, an act to amend Chapter 670 of
12 the Laws of 2022;

13 Senate Print 8411, by
14 Senator Skoufis, an act to amend the
15 Public Officers Law;

16 Senate Print 8413, by
17 Senator Gounardes, an act in relation to
18 authorizing a loan from the state to the City of
19 Dunkirk;

20 Senate Print 8415, by
21 Senator Salazar, an act to amend the
22 Correction Law;

23 Senate Print 8417, by
24 Senator Krueger, an act to amend the
25 Public Service Law;

1 Senate Print 8418, by
2 Senator Gianaris, an act to amend the
3 Judiciary Law;

4 Senate Print 8419, by
5 Senator Addabbo, an act to amend the Racing,
6 Pari-Mutuel Wagering and Breeding Law;

7 Senate Print 8421, by
8 Senator Krueger, an act to amend the
9 Public Service Law;

10 Senate Print 8434, by Senator S.
11 Ryan, an act to amend the Economic Development
12 Law;

13 Senate Print 8438, Senate Budget
14 Bill, an act to amend Chapter 53 of the Laws of
15 2025.

16 All bills reported direct to third
17 reading.

18 SENATOR GIANARIS: Move to accept
19 the report of the Rules Committee.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: All those
21 in favor of accepting the report of the
22 Rules Committee please signify by saying aye.

23 (Response of "Aye.")

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Opposed,
25 nay.

1 (Response of "Nay.")

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The report
3 of the Rules Committee is accepted.

4 Senator Gianaris.

5 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,
6 I have a motion here -- oh, wait, this is not
7 mine.

8 I believe we have some messages from
9 the Assembly.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
11 Secretary will read.

12 THE SECRETARY: Senator Krueger
13 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
14 Assembly Bill Number 3665A and substitute it for
15 the identical Senate Bill 590A, Third Reading
16 Calendar 1866.

17 Senator May moves to discharge, from
18 the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
19 Number 2177A and substitute it for the identical
20 Senate Bill 1515, Third Reading Calendar 1868.

21 Senator Cooney moves to discharge,
22 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
23 Number 3141 and substitute it for the identical
24 Senate Bill 3330, Third Reading Calendar 1873.

25 Senator Webb moves to discharge,

1 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
2 Number 2328A and substitute it for the identical
3 Senate Bill 4073, Third Reading Calendar 1875.

4 Senator Weik moves to discharge,
5 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
6 Number 5493B and substitute it for the identical
7 Senate Bill 4651B, Third Reading Calendar 1876.

8 Senator Hinchey moves to discharge,
9 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
10 Number 6918A and substitute it for the identical
11 Senate Bill 6664A, Third Reading Calendar 1885.

12 Senator S. Ryan moves to discharge,
13 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
14 Number 7861 and substitute it for the identical
15 Senate Bill 7143, Third Reading Calendar 1892.

16 Senator Cooney moves to discharge,
17 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
18 Number 7385A and substitute it for the identical
19 Senate Bill 7157B, Third Reading Calendar 1893.

20 Senator Baskin moves to discharge,
21 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
22 Number 7651A and substitute it for the identical
23 Senate Bill 7273A, Third Reading Calendar 1895.

24 Senator Bailey moves to discharge,
25 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill

1 Number 7341C and substitute it for the identical
2 Senate Bill 7321B, Third Reading Calendar 1896.

3 Senator Bailey moves to discharge,
4 from the Committee on Investigations and
5 Government Operations, Assembly Bill Number 7348
6 and substitute it for the identical Senate
7 Bill 7322, Third Reading Calendar 1897.

8 Senator Skoufis moves to discharge,
9 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
10 Number 1969A and substitute it for the identical
11 Senate Bill 7650A, Third Reading Calendar 1899.

12 Senator Palumbo moves to discharge,
13 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
14 Number 8374A and substitute it for the identical
15 Senate Bill 7687A, Third Reading Calendar 1901.

16 Senator Gonzalez moves to discharge,
17 from the Committee on Finance, Assembly Bill
18 Number 778A and substitute it for the identical
19 Senate Bill 7714A, Third Reading Calendar 1903.

20 Senator Webb moves to discharge,
21 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
22 Number 7915 and substitute it for the identical
23 Senate Bill 7758, Third Reading Calendar 1904.

24 Senator Harckham moves to discharge,
25 from the Committee on Investigations and

1 Government Operations, Assembly Bill Number 8348
2 and substitute it for the identical Senate
3 Bill 7790, Third Reading Calendar 1906.

4 Senator Harckham moves to discharge,
5 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
6 Number 8558A and substitute it for the identical
7 Senate Bill 7853A, Third Reading Calendar 1910.

8 Senator Griffo moves to discharge,
9 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
10 Number 8490A and substitute it for the identical
11 Senate Bill 8155, Third Reading Calendar 1915.

12 Senator S. Ryan moves to discharge,
13 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
14 Number 761C and substitute it for the identical
15 Senate Bill 8220A, Third Reading Calendar 1919.

16 Senator Skoufis moves to discharge,
17 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
18 Number 5852A and substitute it for the identical
19 Senate Bill 8285, Third Reading Calendar 1924.

20 Senator Sanders moves to discharge,
21 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
22 Number 8418 and substitute it for the identical
23 Senate Bill 8314, Third Reading Calendar 1927.

24 Senator Sanders moves to discharge,
25 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill

1 Number 8639A and substitute it for the identical
2 Senate Bill 8315, Third Reading Calendar 1928.

3 Senator Stec moves to discharge,
4 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
5 Number 8795 and substitute it for the identical
6 Senate Bill 8328, Third Reading Calendar 1929.

7 Senator Hinchey moves to discharge,
8 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
9 Number 8419 and substitute it for the identical
10 Senate Bill 8388, Third Reading Calendar 1936.

11 Senator Sepúlveda moves to
12 discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
13 Assembly Bill Number 8679 and substitute it for
14 the identical Senate Bill 8404, Third Reading
15 Calendar 1941.

16 Senator Sepúlveda moves to
17 discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
18 Assembly Bill Number 8678 and substitute it for
19 the identical Senate Bill Number 8405,
20 Third Reading Calendar 1942.

21 Senator Martinez moves to discharge,
22 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
23 Number 8657 and substitute it for the identical
24 Senate Bill 8409, Third Reading Calendar 1946.

25 And Senator S. Ryan moves to

1 discharge, from the Committee on Commerce,
2 Economic Development and Small Business,
3 Assembly Bill 8411 and substitute it for the
4 identical Senate Bill 8434, Third Reading
5 Calendar 1954.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: So
7 ordered.

8 Senator Gianaris.

9 SENATOR GIANARIS: Let's move on,
10 Madam President, to the supplemental calendar.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
12 Secretary will read.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 1866, Assembly Bill Number 3665A, by
15 Assemblymember Simone, an act to repeal
16 paragraphs (e), (f) and (g) of subdivision 5 of
17 Section 36 of the Municipal Home Rule Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
3 Calendar 1866, voting in the negative are
4 Senators Addabbo, Borrello,
5 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Fahy, Gallivan,
6 Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martinez, Martins,
7 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Rhoads,
8 Scarcella-Spanton, Stavisky, Stec, Tedisco,
9 Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

10 Ayes, 37. Nays, 22.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 1867, Senate Print 1169A, by Senator Gonzalez, an
15 act to amend the Civil Rights Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
19 act shall take effect one year after it shall
20 have become a law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
25 the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
2 Calendar 1867, voting in the negative are
3 Senators Borrello, Chan, Griffo, Lanza, O'Mara,
4 Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk and Weik. Senator
5 Lanza, pardon me, in the affirmative.

6 Ayes, 50. Nays, 9.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
8 is passed.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 1868, Assembly Bill Number 2177A, by
11 Assemblymember Lupardo, an act to amend the
12 General Municipal Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
16 act shall take effect immediately.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
21 May to explain her vote.

22 SENATOR MAY: Thank you,
23 Madam President. And thank you for shouting this
24 bill out just a few minutes ago which will allow
25 local municipalities to remove EMS from the limit

1 on property taxes.

2 This is something a lot of our
3 smaller municipalities have clamored for so that
4 they can put more resources into emergency
5 medical services. And I know you have worked
6 very hard to build up our EMS system across the
7 state. It is suffering from lack of investment
8 and just struggling to get people and to do their
9 job that we all depend on them.

10 And I'm hopeful that this will be
11 one way that we can get more investment and
12 enable local people to continue to take for
13 granted that they can have emergency services
14 when they need them.

15 So I vote aye. Thank you.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
17 May to be recorded in the affirmative.

18 Announce the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
20 Calendar 1868, voting in the negative are
21 Senators Borrello, Griffo, Stec and Walczyk.

22 Ayes, 55. Nays, 4.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1869, Senate Print 1695, by Senator Skoufis, an
2 act to amend the Real Property Tax Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
13 Calendar 1869, voting in the negative are
14 Senators Chan and Lanza.

15 Ayes, 57. Nays, 2.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 1870, Senate Print 1897, by Senator O'Mara, an
20 act to amend the Highway Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 1871, Senate Print 2461, by Senator Rhoads, an
10 act in relation to authorizing the New York State
11 and Local Employees' Retirement System to accept
12 an application for disability retirement benefits
13 from Andrew Reilly, Jr.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
25 is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 1872, Senate Print 2602, by Senator Addabbo, an
3 act to amend the Executive Law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
7 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
8 shall have become a law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
13 the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 1873, Assembly Bill Number 3141, by
19 Assemblymember Lunsford, an act to amend the
20 Tax Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
6 Calendar 1873, those Senators voting in the
7 negative are Senators Borrello,
8 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Griffio, Helming, Lanza,
9 O'Mara, Palumbo, Rhoads, Walczyk and Weik.

10 Ayes, 49. Nays, 10.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 1874, Senate Print 4043, by Senator Harckham, an
15 act in relation to authorizing the Bedford Hills
16 Fire District to file an application for
17 exemption from school taxes.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 1875, Assembly Bill Number 2328A, by
7 Assemblymember Angelino, an act to amend the
8 Tax Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
12 act shall take effect immediately.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
19 Calendar 1875, voting in the negative are
20 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan,
21 Harckham, Lanza, Martinez, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,
22 C. Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton, Skoufis and Weik.

23 Ayes, 47. Nays, 12.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
25 is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 1876, Assembly Bill Number 5493B, by
3 Assemblymember Durso, an act to amend the
4 Highway Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
8 act shall take effect immediately.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
13 the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 1877, Senate Print 4725, by Senator Skoufis, an
19 act in relation to authorizing Michael Winston
20 Hoard, the widower of Kathy Marie Dwyer-Hoard, to
21 file a new service retirement application.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
5 the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
8 is passed.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 1878, Senate Print 5224B, by Senator Rolison, an
11 act in relation to authorizing the Town of Union
12 Vale, County of Dutchess, to alienate and
13 discontinue the use of certain parklands.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
24 Calendar 1878, voting in the negative:
25 Senator Fahy.

1 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 1879, Senate Print 5505, by Senator Salazar, an
6 act to amend the Social Services Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
15 the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 1880, Senate Print 5677, by Senator Tedisco, an
21 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
25 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it

1 shall have become a law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
6 the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
8 Calendar 1880, voting in the negative are
9 Senators Lanza and Martinez.

10 Ayes, 57. Nays, 2.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 1881, Senate Print 5929A, by Senator Martins, an
15 act authorizing the Commissioner of
16 General Services to transfer and convey certain
17 state land to the Syosset Central
18 School District.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This
22 act shall take effect immediately.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
2 the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 1882, Senate Print 5941B, by Senator Skoufis, an
8 act to amend the General Business Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
12 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
13 shall have become a law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
18 the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
21 is passed.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 1883, Senate Print 6048, by Senator Skoufis, an
24 act to authorize Susan Gillinder, the widow of
25 Robert C. Ritchie, to file a new service

1 retirement application and option election form
2 with the New York State and Local Employees'
3 Retirement System.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
7 act shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 1884, Senate Print 6266, by Senator Salazar, an
18 act to amend the Social Services law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
22 act shall take effect immediately.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
2 the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 1885, Assembly Bill Number 6918A, by
8 Assemblymember Barrett, an act to amend the
9 Town Law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
11 last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
13 act shall take effect immediately.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
18 the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
20 Calendar 1885, voting in the negative are
21 Senators Ashby, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
22 Gallivan, Lanza, Martinez, Mattera, O'Mara, Ortt,
23 Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco, Weber and Weik. Also
24 Senator Scarcella-Spanton.

25 Ayes, 44. Nays, 15.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
2 is passed.

3 THE SECRETARY: Also Senator Bynoe
4 as well. Pardon me.

5 Ayes, 43. Nays, 16.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
9 Calendar 1885, voting in the negative are
10 Senators Ashby, Bynoe, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
11 Chan, Gallivan, Helming, Lanza, Martinez,
12 Martins, Mattera, O'Mara, Ortt, Rhoads,
13 Scarcella-Spanton, Stec, Tedisco, Weber and Weik.

14 Ayes, 41. Nays, 18.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 1886, Senate Print 6817, by Senator Bynoe, an act
19 authorizing the assessor of the County of Nassau
20 to accept from the Incorporated Village of
21 Hempstead an application for exemption from real
22 property taxes.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This

1 act shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
6 the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
8 Calendar 1886, voting in the negative:
9 Senator O'Mara.

10 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 1887, Senate Print 6818, by Senator Bynoe, an act
15 in relation to authorizing the County of Nassau
16 assessor to accept an application for a real
17 property tax exemption.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
3 Calendar 1887, voting in the negative:
4 Senator O'Mara.

5 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 1888, Senate Print 6819A, by Senator Bynoe, an
10 act in relation to authorizing the County of
11 Nassau assessor to accept an application for a
12 real property tax exemption.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
16 act shall take effect immediately.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
21 the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
23 Calendar 1888, voting in the negative:
24 Senator O'Mara.

25 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
2 is passed.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 1889, Senate Print 6953B, by Senator Gounardes,
5 an act to amend the General Business Law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
9 act shall take effect.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
14 Gounardes to explain his vote.

15 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Thank you,
16 Madam President.

17 You know, artificial intelligence is
18 an incredibly powerful tool that is changing by
19 leaps and bounds. I'm not talking about your
20 chatbots or using ChatGPT to get you an answer to
21 a question or using your Gemini assistant. I'm
22 talking about the most expensive technology being
23 created right now at the highest level of
24 computing power that is being developed all
25 around the world far beyond our ability to fully

1 understand what this technology is fully capable
2 of.

3 And that's not just Andrew Gounardes
4 saying that, that is some of the world's leading
5 AI computer scientists saying this as well. That
6 is some of the CEOs of these labs and of these
7 companies that are investing hundreds of billions
8 of dollars into developing this technology saying
9 this technology that we're creating that has the
10 power to transform humanity and the planet can
11 also create incredible harm and destruction.

12 And so right now there's no
13 requirement that these companies, these
14 platforms, these machines, have a safety plan
15 developed. The leading CEO, one of the leading
16 CEOs for a company called Anthropic, a major AI
17 company, just last week published an op-ed in the
18 New York Times saying we are creating something
19 that we don't fully understand, we need
20 protection. We need government to require us to
21 have a safety plan. And we need government to
22 require us to put guardrails in place. We need
23 government to help us have a pull-the-plug
24 contingency plan.

25 And that's what we're doing with the

1 RAISE Act today. This would require companies
2 that at the frontier developing these so-called
3 frontier models, the highest level of
4 computational power, to develop safety plans for
5 the creation of their models.

6 This will, if enacted, become the
7 first law in the country to require these safety
8 plans. And it's the first step in what I think
9 are many important steps we need to be taking as
10 governments at all levels, at the federal and
11 state level, to making sure that we are
12 harnessing the incredible power of this
13 technology and making sure it's being used for
14 public good and not for the creation of chemical
15 weapons, the creation of biological weapons and
16 things of that like, which this technology right
17 now is fully capable of.

18 There's a lot more work to be done
19 in this space, but this is a significant first
20 step, and I'm grateful to this chamber for
21 passing this measure today.

22 I vote in the affirmative. Thank
23 you.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
25 Gounardes to be recorded in the affirmative.

1 Announce the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
3 Calendar 1889, voting in the negative:
4 Senator Cooney.

5 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 1890, Senate Print 6977, by Senator Harckham, an
10 act to amend the Real Property Tax Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
14 act shall take effect on the first of January.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
19 the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
22 is passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 1891, Senate Print 7078A, by Senator Harckham, an
25 act to amend the Tax Law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
2 last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
4 act shall take effect immediately.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
9 the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
11 Calendar 1891, voting in the negative are
12 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Lanza,
13 Martinez, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, C. Ryan,
14 Skoufis and Weik. Also Senator Helming.

15 Ayes, 47. Nays, 12.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 1892, Assembly Bill Number 7861, by
20 Assemblymember Peoples-Stokes, an act to amend
21 the Retirement and Social Security Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
5 the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
8 is passed.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 1893, Assembly Bill Number 7385A, by
11 Assemblymember Bronson, an act to amend
12 Chapter 416 of the Laws of 2007.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
16 act shall take effect immediately.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
21 Cooney to explain his vote.

22 SENATOR COONEY: Thank you,
23 Madam President.

24 As the first graduate of the
25 Rochester City School District to serve in this

1 State Senate in decades, the students and faculty
2 of RCSD have always played a special part in my
3 life and have a special role in my legislation.

4 As part of my work to help create a
5 positive learning environment, I helped spearhead
6 the initial investment into the Rochester School
7 Modernization Project way back in 2021, one of
8 the largest public works investments in
9 Rochester's history.

10 This investment today represents a
11 commitment to our young learners, a commitment
12 that regardless of one's zip code you should have
13 access to a quality education. By modernizing
14 RCSD's facilities, we are ensuring that our
15 schools' infrastructure is up-to-date and able to
16 meet the needs of students and staff for years to
17 come.

18 This bill is another step in helping
19 that project come to fruition, giving the
20 district greater flexibility and allowing them to
21 finish the upgrades on time. Passing this bill
22 is about supporting the educational needs of our
23 students, creating good-paying jobs, especially
24 good-paying union jobs, and allowing for a
25 seamless process that does not disrupt our school

1 services and innovation.

2 As a proud alum, I will always go to
3 bat for our students in Rochester. And,
4 Madam President, I am proud to vote aye.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
6 Cooney to be recorded in the affirmative.

7 Announce the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
9 Calendar 1893, voting in the negative are
10 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
11 Palumbo, Rhoads and Weik.

12 Ayes, 54. Nays, 5.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 1894, Senate Print 7189A, by Senator Rhoads, an
17 act to amend the Highway Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
3 Calendar 1894, voting in the negative:
4 Senator Brisport.

5 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 1895, Assembly Bill Number 7651A, by
10 Assemblymember Chludzinski, an act to amend
11 Chapter 296 of the Laws of 1992.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
15 act shall take effect immediately.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 1896, Assembly Bill Number 7341C, by

1 Assemblymember Pretlow, an act to amend the
2 Tax Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
13 Calendar 1896, voting in the negative are
14 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan,
15 Harckham, Helming, Lanza, Martinez, O'Mara, Ortt,
16 Palumbo, Rhoads, C. Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton,
17 Skoufis and Weik.

18 Ayes, 45. Nays, 14.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1897, Assembly Bill Number 7348, by
23 Assemblymember Pretlow, an act to amend the
24 Tax Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
10 Calendar 1897, those Senators voting in the
11 negative are Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
12 Gallivan, Harckham, Helming, Lanza, Martinez,
13 Martins, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, C. Ryan,
14 Scarcella-Spanton, Skoufis and Weik.

15 Ayes, 44. Nays, 15.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 1898, Senate Print 7397, by Senator Skoufis, an
20 act in relation to authorizing Liliana
21 Fernandez-Clemente, the widow of Daniel Clemente,
22 to file a new service retirement application.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This

1 act shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
6 the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1899, Assembly Bill Number 1969A, by
12 Assemblymember Maher, an act to amend the
13 Tax Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
24 Calendar 1899, voting in the negative are
25 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan,

1 Harckham, Helming, Hinchey, Lanza, Martinez,
2 O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, C. Ryan,
3 Scarcella-Spanton and Weik.

4 Ayes, 45. Nays, 14.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
6 is passed.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 1900, Senate Print 7663A, by Senator Bynoe, an
9 act in relation to authorizing the County of
10 Nassau assessor to accept an application for a
11 real property tax exemption.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
15 act shall take effect immediately.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
22 Calendar 1900, voting in the negative:
23 Senator O'Mara.

24 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill

1 is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 1901, Assembly Bill Number 8374A, by
4 Assemblymember Kassay, an act to amend the
5 Public Authorities Law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
14 the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 1902, Senate Print 7692A, by Senator May, an act
20 to amend the Tax Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
6 Calendar 1902, those Senators voting in the
7 negative are Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
8 Chan, Gallivan, Harckham, Helming, Lanza,
9 Martinez, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, C. Ryan,
10 Scarcella-Spanton, Skoufis and Weik.

11 Ayes, 44. Nays, 15.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
13 is passed.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 1903, Assembly Bill Number 778A, by
16 Assemblymember Rosenthal, an act to amend the
17 Public Health Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
21 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
22 shall have become a law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
2 the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 1904, Assembly Bill Number 7915, by
8 Assemblymember Lupardo, an act to authorize the
9 City of Binghamton to offer an optional
10 retirement plan to Firefighter David Edwards.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: There is
12 a home-rule message at the desk.

13 Read the last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
15 act shall take effect immediately.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 1905, Senate Print 7775, by

1 Senator Stewart-Cousins, an act to amend the
2 Vehicle and Traffic Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: There is
4 a home-rule message at the desk.

5 Read the last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
7 act shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 1906, Assembly Bill Number 8348, by
18 Assemblymember Levenberg, an act to amend the
19 Tax Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
3 the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
5 Calendar 1906, voting in the negative are
6 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan,
7 Helming, Hinchey, Lanza, Martinez, O'Mara, Ortt,
8 Palumbo, Rhoads, C. Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton,
9 Skoufis and Weik.

10 Ayes, 45. Nays, 14.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 1907, Senate Print 7817, by Senator Baskin, an
15 act to authorize the widow of William James
16 Middlebrooks to file a retirement option election
17 form.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 1908, Senate Print 7836, by Senator Skoufis, an
7 act to amend the Tax Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
18 Calendar 1908, those Senators voting in the
19 negative are Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
20 Gallivan, Harckham, Helming, Hinchey, Lanza,
21 Martinez, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, C. Ryan,
22 Scarcella-Spanton and Weik.

23 Ayes, 45. Nays, 14.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
25 is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 1909, Senate Print 7844, by Senator Baskin, an
3 act to authorize the widow of Gerald J. Sullivan
4 to file an application with the New York State
5 and Local Police and Fire Retirement System.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
14 the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 1910, Assembly Bill Number 8558A, by
20 Assemblymember Levenberg, an act to amend the
21 Village Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
5 the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
7 Calendar 1910, voting in the negative:
8 Senator Weik.

9 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 1911, Senate Print 7880A, by Senator Krueger, an
14 act to amend the Tax Law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
18 act shall take effect immediately.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
25 Calendar 1911, voting in the negative are

1 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
2 Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins,
3 Mattera, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo,
4 Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber
5 and Weik.

6 Ayes, 38. Nays, 21.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
8 is passed.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 1912, Senate Print 7927A, by Senator Mayer, an
11 act to amend the County Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
15 act shall take effect immediately.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 1913, Senate Print 7989A, by Senator Mayer, an

1 act to amend Chapter 799 of the Laws of 2021.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: There is
3 a home-rule message at the desk.

4 Read the last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 1914, Senate Print 8077, by Senator May, an act
17 to amend Part B of Chapter 56 of the Laws of
18 2020.

19 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Lay it
21 aside.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 1915, Assembly Bill Number 8490A, by
24 Assemblymember Buttenschon, an act to amend the
25 Tax Law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
2 last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
4 act shall take effect immediately.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
9 the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
11 Calendar 1915, voting in the negative are
12 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan,
13 Harckham, Lanza, Martinez, O'Mara, Palumbo,
14 Rhoads, C. Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton, Skoufis and
15 Weik.

16 Ayes, 47. Nays, 12.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 1916, Senate Print 8161, by Senator Weber, an act
21 in relation to authorizing the assessor of the
22 Town of Ramapo, County of Rockland, to accept an
23 application for a real property tax exemption.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
25 last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
2 act shall take effect immediately.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
7 Skoufis to explain his vote.

8 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Thank you very
9 much, Mr. President.

10 On its face, this appears like an
11 innocuous bill, the type that we take up on
12 occasion here at the end of session to provide
13 for a retroactive property tax exemption.

14 But when you dig in, there are some
15 alarming elements to this bill that I feel ought
16 to be brought to the attention of this chamber.

17 Up until March 24, 2023, this
18 property was used as a single-family home. There
19 was a real estate transaction on March 24, 2023,
20 that transacted the property to Yeshivas Nachlas
21 Sofrim, the applicant who is seeking retroactive
22 property tax exemption.

23 Now, what is particularly
24 concerning, putting aside the previous use as a
25 single-family home, is that this applicant is

1 before the planning board, the local planning
2 board, on June 24th to convert the property to a
3 school.

4 And so why are we providing a
5 retroactive property tax exemption for a building
6 that was previously a single-family home, was
7 then purchased by a school, a nonpublic school
8 organization, a yeshiva, but the building cannot
9 be used for a school until June 24th at the
10 earliest if the planning board grants the
11 conversion.

12 I believe voting for this bill opens
13 up the possibility, the real possibility for tax
14 fraud, and I recommend my colleagues vote against
15 it. If we do pass it, I recommend the Governor
16 veto it.

17 Thank you.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
19 Skoufis to be recorded in the negative.

20 Senator Krueger to explain her vote.

21 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you.

22 I also rise to vote no and reaffirm
23 the points that Senator Skoufis is making.
24 Because as I learn about this, basically it's the
25 Legislature participating in the possibility of

1 opening up a whole new precedent that private
2 homes can somehow get defined differently than
3 the use of the home and avoid school taxes.

4 So imagine if everybody who didn't
5 want to pay their school taxes in all of our
6 communities decided to try to get legislation to
7 exempt themselves by claiming they're something
8 they're not. That would be pretty scary.

9 So I also vote no.

10 Thank you, Mr. President.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
12 Krueger to be recorded in the negative.

13 (Pause.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
15 the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
17 Calendar 1916, voting in the negative are
18 Senators Hoylman-Sigal, Jackson, Krueger, May,
19 O'Mara, Sanders and Skoufis. Also
20 Senator Kavanagh. Also Senator Cleare.

21 Ayes, 50. Nays, 9.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 1917, Senate Print 8162, by Senator Weber, an act

1 in relation to authorizing the assessor of the
2 Town of Ramapo, County of Rockland, to accept an
3 application for a real property tax exemption.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
7 act shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
14 Calendar 1917, voting in the negative:
15 Senator O'Mara.

16 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 1918, Senate Print 8218, by Senator Cooney, an
21 act to amend the Education Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
5 the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
7 Calendar 1918, voting in the negative:
8 Senator Weik.

9 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 1919, Assembly Bill Number 761C, by
14 Assemblymember R. Carroll, an act to amend the
15 Education Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
19 act shall take effect on the first of July.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
2 is passed.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 1920, Senate Print 8222, by Senator Brouk, an act
5 to amend the Public Health Law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
14 Cooney to explain his vote.

15 SENATOR COONEY: Thank you,
16 Mr. President.

17 I want to rise and thank our bill
18 sponsor on behalf of the Rochester delegation for
19 her focus on the needs of older adults.

20 This bill allows not-for-profit
21 nursing homes to work together to collaborate on
22 staffing and quality-of-care issues, with the
23 goal of trying to find efficiencies to better
24 operate, meaning that we can serve more people if
25 they need skilled nursing care.

1 It's a great bill, and I thank the
2 bill sponsor for her leadership.

3 Mr. President, I vote aye.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
5 Cooney to be recorded in the affirmative.

6 Announce the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
8 Calendar 1920, voting in the negative are
9 Senators Ortt and Walczyk.

10 Ayes, 57. Nays, 2.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 1921, Senate Print 8241A, by Senator Harckham, an
15 act to amend the Public Authorities Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
19 act shall take effect immediately.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
2 is passed.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 1922, Senate Print 8269A, by Senator Baskin, an
5 act to amend the Tax Law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
14 the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
16 Calendar 1922, voting in the negative are
17 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Harckham,
18 Helming, Lanza, Martinez, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo,
19 Rhoads, C. Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton, Skoufis and
20 Weik.

21 Ayes 46. Nays, 13.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 1923, Senate Print 8276, by Senator Harckham, an

1 act to amend the Public Officers Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
5 act shall take effect immediately.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
10 the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
12 Calendar 1923, voting in the negative:
13 Senator Weik.

14 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 1924, Assembly Bill Number 5852A, by
19 Assemblymember Steck, an act to amend the
20 General Business Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
24 act shall take effect one year after it shall
25 have become a law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
5 Skoufis to explain his vote.

6 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Thank you very
7 much, Mr. President.

8 Briefly, this bill, in conjunction
9 with a companion bill by Senator Fahy, looks to
10 finally put some guardrails around kratom, which
11 is a relatively new substance here in the
12 United States becoming very popular, but comes
13 with significant dangers to some individuals.

14 And so this bill looks to allow for
15 a label to be placed on these products and better
16 inform consumers of the potential risks
17 associated with the substance.

18 I do want to state for the record
19 that there are likely some technical issues that
20 need to be cleaned up through a chapter amendment
21 process, and look forward to working with the
22 Assemblyman, Assemblyman Steck, and the Governor
23 on that process.

24 Thank you very much.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator

1 Skoufis to be recorded in the affirmative.

2 Announce the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 1925, Senate Print Number 8308, by
8 Senator Scarcella-Spanton, an act to amend the
9 Public Health Law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
11 last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
13 act shall take effect immediately.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
18 the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
21 is passed.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 1926, Senate Print 8311A, by Senator Kavanagh, an
24 act to amend the Public Housing Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
10 Calendar 1926, those Senators voting in the
11 negative are Senators Gallivan, Griffo, Helming,
12 Lanza, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison,
13 Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik. Also
14 Senator Fernandez.

15 Ayes, 45. Nays, 14.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 1927, Assembly Bill Number 8418, by
20 Assemblymember Bichotte Hermelyn, an act to amend
21 the Alcoholic Beverage Control Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
5 the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
7 Calendar 1927, voting in the negative:
8 Senator Martinez.

9 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 1928, Assembly Bill Number 8639A, by
14 Assemblymember Bichotte Hermelyn, an act to amend
15 the Alcoholic Beverage Control Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
19 act shall take effect immediately.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: In relation to

1 Calendar 1928, voting in the negative:

2 Senator Martinez.

3 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 1929, Assembly Bill Number 8795, by
8 Assemblymember Woerner, an act to amend the
9 Alcoholic Beverage Control Law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
11 last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
13 act shall take effect immediately.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
18 the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
20 Calendar 1929, voting in the negative:
21 Senator Martinez.

22 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1930, Senate Print 8374, by Senator Persaud, an
2 act to amend the Family Court Act.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
6 act shall take effect on the 270th day after it
7 shall have become a law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 1931, Senate Print 8379, by Senator Gianaris, an
18 act to amend the Alcoholic Beverage Control Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
22 act shall take effect immediately.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
2 the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
4 Calendar 1931, voting in the negative:
5 Senator Martinez.

6 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
8 is passed.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 1932, Senate Print 8382, by Senator S. Ryan, an
11 act to amend the Family Court Act.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
15 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
16 shall have become a law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
21 the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1933, Senate Print 8385, by Senator Comrie, an
2 act to amend the State Finance Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
6 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it
7 shall have become a law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
13 is passed.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 1935, Senate Print 8387, by Senator Ramos, an act
16 to amend the Workers' Compensation Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
20 act shall take effect immediately.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
25 the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
2 Calendar 1935, voting in the negative are
3 Senators Borrello, Chan, Gallivan, Griffo,
4 Helming, Lanza, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo,
5 Rolison, Tedisco, and Walczyk.

6 Ayes, 46. Nays, 13.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
8 is passed.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 1936, Assembly Bill Number 8419, by
11 Assemblymember Conrad, an act to amend the
12 Agriculture and Markets Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
16 act shall take effect on the 120th day after it
17 shall have become a law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
24 Calendar 1936, voting in the negative:
25 Senator Walczyk.

1 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 1937, Senate Print 8389, by Senator Ramos, an act
6 to amend the Labor Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
15 the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 1938, Senate Print 8397, by Senator Martinez, an
21 act to amend the Business Corporation Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 8. This
25 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it

1 shall have become a law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
6 the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1939, Senate Print 8402, by Senator Gianaris, an
12 act to amend Chapter 801 of the Laws of 2021.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
16 act shall take effect immediately.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
21 the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
23 Calendar 1939, voting in the negative:
24 Senator Ashby.

25 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
2 is passed.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 1940, Senate Print 8403, by Senator Webb, an act
5 in relation to authorizing the Town of
6 Cortlandville to discontinue the use of certain
7 parklands.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: There is
9 a home-rule message at the desk.

10 Read the last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 7. This
12 act shall take effect immediately.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
19 Calendar 1940, voting in the negative:
20 Senator Fahy.

21 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 1941, Assembly Bill Number 8679, by

1 Assemblymember Burke, an act to amend the
2 Coordinated Construction Act for Lower Manhattan.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
13 Calendar 1941, voting in the negative:
14 Senator Rhoads.

15 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 1942, Assembly Bill Number 8678, by
20 Assemblymember Burke, an act to amend Chapter 322
21 of the Laws of 2014.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
5 the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
7 Calendar 1942, voting in the negative are
8 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
9 Chan, Lanza, Martins, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo,
10 Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.
11 Also Senator Rolison. Also Senator Mattera.

12 Ayes, 42. Nays, 17.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 1943, Senate Print 8406, by Senator Sanders, an
17 act to amend the Banking Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
3 Calendar 1943, voting in the negative:
4 Senator Walczyk.

5 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 1944, Senate Print 8407, by Senator Fahy, an act
10 to amend the Social Services Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
14 act shall take effect immediately.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
19 the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

21 SENATOR GIANARIS: The bill is
22 passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 1945, Senate Print 8408, by Senator Krueger, an
25 act to amend the Financial Services Law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
2 last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This
4 act shall take effect immediately.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
9 the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 1946, Assembly Bill Number 8657, by
15 Assemblymember Otis, an act to amend Chapter 670
16 of the Laws of 2022.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
20 act shall take effect immediately.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
25 the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 1947, Senate Print 8411, by Senator Skoufis, an
6 act to amend the Public Officers Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 11. This
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
15 the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
17 Calendar 1947, voting in the negative are
18 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
19 Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins,
20 Mattera, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo,
21 Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber
22 and Weik.

23 Ayes, 38. Nays, 21.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
25 is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 1948, Senate Print 8413, by Senator Gounardes, an
3 act in relation to authorizing a loan from the
4 state to the City of Dunkirk.

5 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Lay it
7 aside.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 1949, Senate Print 8415, by Senator Salazar, an
10 act to amend the Correction Law.

11 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Lay it
13 aside.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 1950, Senate Print 8417, by Senator Krueger, an
16 act to amend the Public Service Law.

17 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Lay it
19 aside.

20 There's a substitution at the desk.

21 The Secretary will read.

22 THE SECRETARY: Senator Gianaris
23 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
24 Assembly Bill Number 8883 and substitute it for
25 the identical Senate Bill 8418, Third Reading

1 Calendar 1951.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
3 substitution is so ordered.

4 The Secretary will read.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 1951, Assembly Bill Number 8883, by
7 Assemblymember Rivera, an act to amend the
8 Judiciary Law.

9 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Lay it
11 aside.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 1952, Senate Print 8419, by Senator Addabbo, an
14 act to amend the Racing, Pari-Mutuel Wagering and
15 Breeding Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
19 act shall take effect immediately.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: In relation to

1 Calendar 1952, voting in the negative:

2 Senator Skoufis.

3 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 1953, Senate Print 8421, by Senator Krueger, an
8 act to amend the Public Service Law.

9 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Sensing a
11 trend. Lay it aside.

12 (Laughter.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Calendar
14 Number 1954, Assembly Bill Number 8411, by
15 Assemblymember Stirpe, an act to amend the
16 Economic Development Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
20 act shall take effect immediately.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
25 the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
3 is passed.

4 Calendar Number 1955 will be
5 temporarily laid aside.

6 Senator Gianaris, that completes the
7 reading of the supplemental calendar.

8 SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you,
9 Mr. President.

10 Let's move on to the controversial
11 calendar. We're going to do these a little bit
12 out of order. So let's begin with, where is it,
13 Calendar Number 1951.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
15 Secretary will ring the bell.

16 The Secretary will read.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 1951, Assembly Bill Number 8883, by
19 Assemblymember Rivera, an act to amend the
20 Judiciary Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
22 Palumbo, why do you rise?

23 SENATOR PALUMBO: Thank you,
24 Mr. President. I wonder if the sponsor would
25 yield for a few questions, the acting sponsor of

1 the bill.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
3 sponsor yield?

4 SENATOR GIANARIS: I am the sponsor
5 of this bill, and I will gladly yield.

6 (Laughter.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
8 sponsor of the bill will yield.

9 SENATOR PALUMBO: Thank you,
10 Senator Gianaris. Could you please explain to us
11 what this bill does?

12 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes. This bill
13 deals with decades of underrepresentation that
14 various communities, in the western part of the
15 state particularly, have faced in terms of their
16 judiciary that -- whose makeup in the Fourth
17 Department particularly -- does not reflect the
18 communities that live in those parts of the
19 state.

20 SENATOR PALUMBO: Will the sponsor
21 continue to yield.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
23 sponsor yield?

24 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The

1 sponsor yields.

2 SENATOR PALUMBO: So just, I guess,
3 to speed things up a little for our colleagues,
4 it currently takes the 13 judicial districts in
5 New York State and carves out two new ones, is
6 that accurate?

7 SENATOR GIANARIS: Correct.

8 SENATOR PALUMBO: If the sponsor
9 will continue to yield.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
11 sponsor yield?

12 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
14 sponsor yields.

15 SENATOR PALUMBO: Now, we've just
16 had this bill filed in indexing just for a few
17 days, I believe. And so were there any public
18 hearings held with respect to the creation of new
19 judicial districts in New York State?

20 SENATOR GIANARIS: Allow me to also
21 save some time, because I think I know where
22 you're going.

23 This is the result of legislation
24 that's been around for quite some time. Senator
25 Sean Ryan had a bill that dealt solely with

1 Erie County in this regard. There was a bill, I
2 think it was in the Assembly originally, that
3 dealt with Monroe County. And rather than
4 consider these piecemeal, we came up with a
5 comprehensive approach that dealt with all the
6 regions of the state that were being considered.

7 But the individual proposals have
8 been around for quite some time.

9 SENATOR PALUMBO: Will the sponsor
10 continue to yield.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
12 sponsor yield?

13 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
15 sponsor yields.

16 SENATOR PALUMBO: Has the Office of
17 Court Administration weighed in on the creation
18 of these new districts at all?

19 SENATOR GIANARIS: I believe they
20 have. We've talked to them at various points
21 throughout this week. They have expressed their
22 support for the goals of this legislation. And
23 they probably said some other things.

24 SENATOR PALUMBO: Will the sponsor
25 continue to yield.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
2 sponsor yield?

3 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
5 sponsor yields.

6 SENATOR PALUMBO: And with regard
7 to the actual geographic maps themselves, has
8 there been any input from the Office of Court
9 Administration or any other administrative bodies
10 that you can think of?

11 SENATOR GIANARIS: I don't --

12 SENATOR PALUMBO: Expressing
13 support or not supporting it?

14 SENATOR GIANARIS: On the specific
15 ways we've divided up the districts?

16 SENATOR PALUMBO: Yes, that's
17 correct.

18 SENATOR GIANARIS: No, there was no
19 specific comment on that.

20 SENATOR PALUMBO: Will the sponsor
21 continue to yield.

22 SENATOR GIANARIS: But again, they
23 did express --

24 SENATOR PALUMBO: Oh, I'm sorry.

25 SENATOR GIANARIS: They did express

1 support for what we're trying to do by carving it
2 up the way we did.

3 SENATOR PALUMBO: Will the sponsor
4 continue to yield?

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
6 sponsor yield?

7 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
9 sponsor yields.

10 SENATOR PALUMBO: Well, as we sit
11 here today, there are elections coming up in
12 November. And I saw in the bill text that each
13 of these specific judges were now reapportioned
14 into these essentially four new districts. And I
15 have the map in front of me. And just to be
16 clear -- maybe it will help my colleagues to
17 understand -- that essentially the Eighth
18 Judicial District, which includes Erie County,
19 Allegany, Wyoming, Genesee, Niagara, Orleans,
20 Chautauqua, and Cattaraugus -- basically from
21 Genesee west -- that's now being reapportioned so
22 that Erie County is its own judicial district,
23 and then all around it those counties I just
24 mentioned plus Livingston and Steuben. Is that
25 accurate?

1 SENATOR GIANARIS: I take your word
2 for it. I don't have the map in front of me like
3 you do. But it sounds right.

4 SENATOR PALUMBO: Okay, thank you.
5 Will the sponsor continue to yield?

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
7 sponsor yield?

8 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
10 sponsor yields.

11 SENATOR PALUMBO: And I believe
12 they pronounce it Stu-ben out that way, not
13 Stoob-en. But --

14 SENATOR GIANARIS: -- the counties,
15 Senator Palumbo.

16 SENATOR PALUMBO: Yes. So that
17 essentially carves out into two districts, the
18 Eighth and then we have -- we slice up the others
19 so that Erie is its own judicial district and
20 Onondaga, which includes Syracuse, is its own
21 judicial district. Is that correct?

22 SENATOR GIANARIS: Correct. And
23 Monroe is also its own, correct.

24 SENATOR PALUMBO: And Monroe, I
25 apologize. Yes.

1 SENATOR GIANARIS: Correct.

2 SENATOR PALUMBO: Will the sponsor
3 continue to yield?

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
5 sponsor yield?

6 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
8 sponsor yields.

9 SENATOR PALUMBO: Can you tell me
10 if there's been any consultation or if you could
11 explain to us how this affects our Regents.
12 Because the Regents are of course sliced up by
13 judicial districts, so that's something that I
14 assume was contemplated when this map was drawn.

15 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yeah, that's a
16 really good question. And in fact this will
17 increase representation for this part of the
18 state in the Regents.

19 There will be two new Regents,
20 because the Regents are apportioned by judicial
21 district. And since we're adding two new
22 judicial districts, there will be two new Regents
23 that will be appointed from the western part of
24 the state.

25 SENATOR PALUMBO: Will the sponsor

1 continue to yield.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
3 sponsor yield?

4 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
6 sponsor yields.

7 SENATOR PALUMBO: Thank you,
8 Senator. Through you, Mr. President.

9 We now have a bunch of judges who
10 are on the ballot in all of these judicial
11 districts, the new ones and the current ones. So
12 have we apportioned where they will end up?
13 Since now these districts are completely moved
14 around geographically. And they're not contained
15 within the bill because we haven't had an
16 election yet. That's in November still.

17 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yeah, let me
18 just clarify something, because you keep
19 referring to the election that's coming up this
20 November.

21 This bill does not take effect until
22 the 2026 elections, and then the new districts
23 would be in place as of January 2027. So if
24 anyone's on the ballot this year, they would be
25 unaffected.

1 SENATOR PALUMBO: Understood.

2 Will the sponsor continue to yield?

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
4 sponsor yield?

5 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
7 sponsor yields.

8 SENATOR PALUMBO: So then I have
9 the same question for the 2026 election. This
10 will also be mystery judges until we know who's
11 elected.

12 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes. And the
13 way -- and we've -- I should mention that we
14 modeled this based on the last time this was done
15 that split off Staten Island from Brooklyn, I
16 believe. Senator Lanza was the sponsor of that
17 legislation in 2007. And it specifically
18 identifies all of the judges who are currently in
19 that district and where they would be assigned,
20 so that there's no confusion about where
21 everybody is.

22 What we did -- because this may be
23 your next question -- what we did in terms of how
24 we went about doing that is we attempted to place
25 the various judges in the districts in which they

1 reside. And to the extent the apportionment
2 required some movement, we allowed the
3 most-senior judges to remain in the districts
4 they reside in and reapportioned the less-senior
5 members.

6 SENATOR PALUMBO: Will the sponsor
7 continue to yield.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
9 sponsor yield?

10 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
12 sponsor yields.

13 SENATOR PALUMBO: Thank you,
14 Senator.

15 So when drawing these districts, was
16 there any reconsideration with regard to voter
17 enrollment? Because it just so happens that
18 these other districts now -- some are very,
19 quote, Republican.

20 And Erie's demographics I saw are
21 about two to one, 300,000 Democrats to 164,000
22 Republicans. Onondaga I did not look up, but I
23 do know that that also is a blue area. And all
24 the others seem to be quite Republican. Was that
25 a factor when considering the maps that are

1 currently drawn?

2 SENATOR GIANARIS: No. And, you
3 know, I guess it says more about you than me that
4 you figured that out, because we did not take
5 that into consideration.

6 What we did, however, was look at
7 the racial makeup of the judges in these parts of
8 the state. And frankly I, was aghast to see what
9 the numbers were. This is a part of the state
10 where there's a significant population of people
11 of color. And yet out of 67, I believe -- is
12 that right? -- 67 judges in this department, two
13 are Black, zero are Asian, zero are Hispanic.
14 That's what we're trying to solve for. That we
15 looked at.

16 And frankly we were shocked to find
17 out that you have a very homogenous, almost all
18 white judiciary from this part of the state.

19 SENATOR PALUMBO: Will the sponsor
20 continue to yield?

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
22 sponsor yield?

23 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
25 sponsor yields.

1 SENATOR PALUMBO: Through you,
2 Mr. President. So when I looked at some of those
3 demographics as well -- because I thought that
4 was a concern -- my understanding is in now the
5 soon-to-be Eighth Judicial District that just
6 includes Erie County, Erie County has one person
7 of color on the bench countywide, and that is an
8 African-American Family Court judge who is
9 actually a Republican.

10 So despite that being a very blue
11 area, do you know if -- can you -- did your
12 investigation reveal any reason why the
13 Erie County Democratic Party didn't seem to be
14 running any individuals of color, just the
15 Republicans?

16 SENATOR GIANARIS: No. And, you
17 know, we could have a whole other debate on
18 another bill about how to select judges in this
19 state, which I would be in favor of having. But
20 I did not investigate how Erie County has chosen
21 its Family Court judges, no.

22 SENATOR PALUMBO: Will the sponsor
23 continue to yield.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
25 sponsor yield?

1 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
3 sponsor yields.

4 SENATOR PALUMBO: Thank you.

5 Senator Gianaris, you indicated that
6 you also evaluated these districts statewide.
7 Are you aware of, in the First Judicial District,
8 New York County, they have had one elected Latina
9 judge ever, Mary Rosado? And currently on the
10 bench in New York County, which has an enrollment
11 last year of 779,000 registered Democrats,
12 86,000 registered Republicans, New York County
13 has one Asian-American judge and two Latino
14 judges, in the progressive County of New York.

15 So did that come into your analysis
16 at all? Because you obviously were evaluating
17 racial makeup upstate. But did you decide to
18 take a look at all downstate? Because that's of
19 real concern to us.

20 SENATOR GIANARIS: Well, first of
21 all, I'm glad you asked the question the way you
22 did, because initially you said I did look at the
23 whole state, and that would be misrepresenting
24 what I said at the outset.

25 This came to us because our members

1 and members of the Assembly from the parts of the
2 state this bill affects had individual proposals
3 specifically dealing with those parts of the
4 state.

5 I happen to agree with you that the
6 representation statewide is lacking, but at least
7 the geography of the districts downstate
8 accurately gives the power to these communities
9 in the selection process that they should have.

10 What's happening upstate is the
11 population centers that have these communities
12 within them have been diluted by the way the
13 districts are drawn.

14 Now, I would say to you I'm happy to
15 work with you, and Senator Sepúlveda has been a
16 leader in efforts to have more Latinos on the
17 bench, and Senator Liu in terms of trying to get
18 more Asians on the bench. It's a goal I
19 wholeheartedly support.

20 This is a great step towards moving
21 in that direction. So you should support this if
22 you care about that.

23 SENATOR PALUMBO: Would the sponsor
24 continue to yield?

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the

1 sponsor yield?

2 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
4 sponsor yields.

5 SENATOR PALUMBO: Thank you,
6 Senator.

7 And last year you and I had some
8 discussion offline about some comments in the
9 past 24 hours that we both made. And last year
10 we had a bill that required all Election Law
11 challenges to only be brought in four counties in
12 the state. That would be Erie County, Albany
13 County, New York County, and Westchester County,
14 even for the 10th Judicial District, which is
15 where I live.

16 So if I had a constitutional
17 challenge on an election law case from Eastern
18 Long Island, I would have to travel to
19 Westchester.

20 Was that part of any consideration
21 to carve out Erie County? Which is a blue
22 county in and of itself, but the current
23 Eighth Judicial District is not.

24 SENATOR GIANARIS: No, it was not.

25 SENATOR PALUMBO: Thank you,

1 Senator Gianaris.

2 On the bill, please.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
4 Palumbo on the bill.

5 SENATOR PALUMBO: Well,
6 Mr. President, this is a little suspect to me,
7 that this came to us in very short order and
8 carves out areas that I think will -- certainly
9 on their face it would be denying many residents
10 of adequate representation in the Supreme Court,
11 quite frankly.

12 And the comments I was talking
13 about, I believe that this was done for purely
14 political purposes. And unfortunately the most
15 sacrosanct area of our government is supposed to
16 be the judiciary. And so that's -- it's a very
17 significant concern that when you look at these
18 demographics that now we are essentially
19 gerrymandering districts so that Erie is carved
20 out.

21 And actually the Supreme Court
22 judges, this is what I believe is the number,
23 that it goes from -- in Erie County they actually
24 get three extra. Because the Eighth Judicial
25 District had 28 judges, and now it -- that had

1 all of those counties. Now, between that area
2 that was sliced up, it goes up to 31. And the
3 Eighth Judicial district, Erie County is going to
4 get 18 judges, when I think about Erie County has
5 less than a million people. I'm in the
6 10th Judicial District; we have 3 million people.

7 So it's unfortunate that I have to
8 really address this as a political move. But
9 when you think about the judges that are in that
10 Eighth Judicial District, I believe almost all of
11 them outside of Erie County, all but one, out of
12 14, are Republicans.

13 So unfortunately I'm going to have
14 to have to oppose this because I don't think that
15 the actual intent of this bill is accurate.
16 Because when you look at Erie County, the only
17 individuals of color are Republicans. And when
18 you look at places like New York County, that's
19 where we should be really thinking about who are
20 the ones that are not nominating for Supreme
21 Court judge individuals who should represent the
22 communities in which they serve.

23 I mean, I've looked at a little more
24 information. Albany County has never elected an
25 Asian-American to the Supreme Court.

1 So this is a problem, I certainly
2 agree with that. We need to have an accurate
3 reflection of this. This is something that's a
4 little bit near and dear to my heart. As a
5 little refresher, about a year and a half ago I
6 sued some of my colleagues because we had an
7 historic nominee for chief judge in Hector
8 LaSalle that was rejected by that side of the
9 room.

10 So we do need to do more on this.
11 But this is politically motivated. For those
12 reasons, Mr. President I'll be voting no.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Are there
14 any other Senators wishing to be heard?

15 Senator Walczyk, why do you rise?

16 SENATOR WALCZYK: Thank you,
17 Mr. President. Would the sponsor yield.

18 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes!

19 (Laughter.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: It is not
21 Walczyk Wednesdays, it is Walczyk Thursdays.

22 The sponsor yields.

23 SENATOR GIANARIS: A day late. A
24 day late, Senator Walczyk. We'll take it.

25 SENATOR WALCZYK: Mr. President,

1 Senator Gianaris is more excited about it than I
2 am for sure.

3 (Laughter.)

4 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
5 Mr. President, has the population increased,
6 shifted? Have demographics changed significantly
7 in the areas of Central and Western New York?

8 SENATOR GIANARIS: Well, yes, I
9 would imagine they would, since these districts
10 were created about a century ago, from what I
11 understand.

12 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
13 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
14 yield?

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
16 sponsor yield?

17 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
19 sponsor yields.

20 SENATOR WALCZYK: In what way, for
21 the group. I mean, this bill is only three days
22 old. Could you explain why redistricting needed
23 to happen here? What demographics shifted or
24 what populations changed?

25 SENATOR GIANARIS: I believe I

1 already explained that, but I'm happy to do it
2 again.

3 And in fact it's not so much about
4 the shifting, which I'm certain has occurred. I
5 didn't go back and look at the census data from
6 the last 100 years, but what I do know is that
7 the judges who represent this part of the state
8 are grossly misrepresentative of the demographics
9 of the people who live in this part of the state.

10 So whether that has changed and
11 gotten worse over time or it was just bad to
12 begin with when they were first drawn and has
13 never been remedied, I don't know.

14 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
15 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
16 yield?

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
18 sponsor yield?

19 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
21 sponsor yields.

22 SENATOR WALCZYK: You've mentioned
23 the racial makeup when you were talking to my
24 colleague. When was the last time that Democrats
25 nominated a person of color to run in the

1 Fifth Judicial District?

2 SENATOR GIANARIS: I don't know the
3 answer to that.

4 But I think anyone who is in this
5 chamber is very familiar with the flawed process
6 of selecting judges that we have. And what ends
7 up happening is often the parties collude with
8 each other to nominate people who can win. And
9 if you have districts that are drawn in such a
10 way that these communities' power, voting power
11 is specifically diluted, they will end up not
12 doing that.

13 SENATOR WALCZYK: Thank you.

14 Madam President, through you, if the
15 sponsor would continue to yield.

16 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
18 Gianaris, do you --

19 Yes, Senator Gianaris yields.

20 SENATOR WALCZYK: The answer is
21 never.

22 Today is our last day of session. A
23 bill is required to age for three days. When was
24 this legislation introduced?

25 SENATOR GIANARIS: I believe it was

1 Monday. But again, let me point out that the
2 individual components of this proposal have been
3 around for much longer.

4 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
5 Madam President, would the sponsor continue to
6 yield.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Will the
8 sponsor yield?

9 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

10 SENATOR WALCZYK: So it has the
11 minimum of three days of age today?

12 SENATOR GIANARIS: I think I
13 answered you already.

14 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
15 Madam President, would the sponsor continue to
16 yield?

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
18 continue to yield?

19 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
21 sponsor yields.

22 SENATOR WALCZYK: Speaking of
23 threes, we have three coequal branches of
24 government in New York and in the United States.
25 Was the OCA consulted on this bill?

1 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

2 SENATOR WALCZYK: And through you,
3 Madam President, would the sponsor continue to
4 yield?

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
6 continue to yield?

7 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
9 sponsor yields.

10 SENATOR WALCZYK: What feedback did
11 you receive from the Office of Court
12 Administration?

13 SENATOR GIANARIS: As I mentioned
14 earlier, they indicated support for the goals of
15 the legislation. They -- we had various
16 technical questions that they answered for us to
17 make sure that the bill was technically sound.
18 And then they I believe expressed some interest
19 in continuing the dialogue.

20 SENATOR WALCZYK: And through you,
21 Madam President, would the sponsor continue to
22 yield.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
24 continue to yield?

25 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
2 sponsor yields.

3 SENATOR WALCZYK: Was the Unified
4 Court system contacted? Did you receive feedback
5 from them?

6 SENATOR GIANARIS: You mean as
7 opposed to OCA? I believe they're the same
8 people you're talking about.

9 SENATOR WALCZYK: And through you,
10 Madam President, would the sponsor continue to
11 yield?

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
13 continue to yield?

14 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
16 sponsor yields.

17 SENATOR WALCZYK: The Onondaga Bar
18 Association that this impacts, did you hear back
19 from them?

20 SENATOR GIANARIS: I understand
21 they put out some kind of statement today.

22 SENATOR WALCZYK: And through you,
23 Madam President, would the sponsor continue to
24 yield.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you

1 continue to yield?

2 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
4 Senator yields.

5 SENATOR WALCZYK: In three days --
6 and I know it's not a lot of time, but often in
7 legislation we'll receive memos of support and
8 opposition. Are there any memos in support of
9 this bill?

10 SENATOR GIANARIS: I don't know.

11 SENATOR WALCZYK: Thank you.

12 Madam President, on the bill.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
14 Walczyk on the bill.

15 SENATOR WALCZYK: From the Unified
16 Court System of New York State: "UCS fully
17 supports the Legislature's goal of increasing the
18 diversity of the judiciary in these districts.
19 Diversity in the courts has been a priority of
20 this administration. We have worked to diversify
21 the bench and leadership of the courts.

22 "Unfortunately, this bill would
23 substantially alter our current operations and
24 require consideration of a wide variety of
25 factors, including determining which districts

1 should be impacted, reviewing the number of
2 judges allocated to each district, the likely
3 caseload impacts, and the impact on
4 infrastructure operations and the public.

5 "In our view, this legislation
6 should be deferred until next session to allow
7 all interested parties to analyze the above
8 issues and also give everyone sufficient time to
9 consider whether this is the best way to divide
10 the existing districts and whether any other
11 districts shall be altered or created, which can
12 be done only once every 10 years."

13 The Onondaga County Bar Association
14 has also urged a delay until next session for
15 many similar reasons.

16 But we know what this is about. If
17 you can't win an election, you force it into a
18 court that's favorable for you to make a decision
19 on elections. And if that's not working out for
20 you, then you redistrict the courts in the State
21 of New York to stack courts and then do it this
22 way.

23 The judiciary is not supposed to
24 operate under these circumstances. We have three
25 coequal branches in the State of New York. And

1 I'll be voting no.

2 Thank you, Madam President.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
4 Senator Walczyk.

5 Are there any other Senators wishing
6 to be heard?

7 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
8 closed.

9 The Secretary will ring the bell.

10 Read the last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
12 act shall take effect immediately.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
17 Bailey to explain his vote.

18 SENATOR BAILEY: Thank you. Thank
19 you, Madam President.

20 Irony is something that happens in
21 this chamber often. Senator Palumbo
22 mispronounced Steuben County. And it is rich to
23 hear about the shifting and forum shopping of
24 judges when the aforementioned Steuben County was
25 randomly chosen by a Surrogate's Court judge to

1 deal with a redistricting matter.

2 But that's not necessarily germane,
3 Madam President. I apologize for that statement
4 of clear fact which is what happened.

5 What I'm going to talk about is
6 attorneys of color and judges of color, because I
7 happen to be an attorney of color. A lot has
8 been spoken about attorneys of color not by
9 attorneys of color. And I can tell you, as an
10 attorney of color, judicial representation
11 matters. When you walk into courtrooms and you
12 don't see judges that look like you that have
13 similar experiences to you, that matters.

14 I am proud that in the Bronx we have
15 the most diverse bench in the entire state, but
16 it cannot be limited just to the borough of the
17 Bronx. The rest the state deserves that
18 opportunity. Young law students, young lawyers,
19 young people of color who are practicing
20 attorneys deserve the opportunity to have the
21 option for more judges of color to be able to do
22 that.

23 In the OCA memo that was read, the
24 statement of diversity was the first thing that
25 happened, and that rings true. Senator Gianaris,

1 thank you for introducing this important
2 legislation to the people of Western New York.
3 While I do not reside there, this is a matter of
4 statewide importance.

5 And I am proud to vote on this
6 matter of statewide importance, and I cast my
7 vote in the affirmative.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
9 Bailey to be recorded in the affirmative.

10 Senator May to explain her vote.

11 SENATOR MAY: Thank you,
12 Madam President.

13 And I want to thank Senator Bailey
14 for that insight. I was thinking about the
15 residents of my City of Syracuse who might have
16 to appear in court and never have had the
17 opportunity to appear before a Supreme Court
18 justice who looked like them. So I am very
19 grateful to Senator Gianaris and my colleagues
20 for putting this plan together and bringing it to
21 the floor.

22 I also am interested to hear my
23 colleagues across the aisle talk about these new
24 districts as gerrymandered, when clearly what
25 exists now is something that has created an

1 enormous imbalance in terms of who sits on the
2 bench and, at least in my district, who runs for
3 these offices. Over and over again we have seen
4 judicial races where there was only one candidate
5 on the ballot because people just took themselves
6 out of the running, knowing that they had no
7 chance of getting elected.

8 So I'm hopeful that we may have more
9 competitive races in the future and more
10 opportunity for the voters to choose the justices
11 rather than the justices choosing themselves.

12 I vote aye.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
14 May to be recorded in the affirmative.

15 Senator Palumbo to explain his vote.

16 SENATOR PALUMBO: Thank you,
17 Madam President.

18 And just to make one more point --
19 and I have a lot of respect for my colleagues --
20 talking about forum shopping and judge shopping.
21 Well, there's no need to judge-shop now,
22 particularly on Election Law cases, because it
23 was done by legislation.

24 This is the ultimate judge shopping.
25 The other shoe has dropped. If we had done this

1 in an inverted manner, if we had changed the
2 judicial districts last year, and then today we
3 were passing an Election Law bill where you can
4 only bring your challenges in overwhelmingly
5 Democrat small areas in those different counties,
6 then it might be a different story.

7 But now we have -- and particularly,
8 I mean, I pointed out the Erie County Democrat
9 and Republican parties. The Republican Party
10 seems to be the only one who are running people
11 of color. But let's talk about New York County
12 as well. Every lever of government is controlled
13 by Democrats. And most of those judges I believe
14 are appointed in New York County. And we have
15 two Latino and one Asian. And even if they're
16 not all of them, it's up to the party chairs to
17 run people and select candidates who fit the
18 demographic of their communities.

19 So, Madam President, shame on them.
20 I vote no.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
22 Palumbo to be recorded in the negative.

23 Senator Gianaris to close.

24 SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you,
25 Madam President. Just a couple of closing

1 remarks.

2 Let me be clear, because I heard a
3 couple of things that struck me as funny from my
4 colleagues.

5 This matter is quite specifically
6 left to the Legislature to decide. The court
7 system does not get to draw the lines for the
8 judicial districts. The Constitution does not
9 contemplate that. So we are exercising our
10 constitutional duty to decide how the judicial
11 districts are drawn.

12 I heard one of my colleagues say if
13 you can't win an election, do it some other way.
14 We won the elections. Here we are, some of our
15 members sit on that side of the aisle because we
16 have so many. Which means we get to decide what
17 passes in this chamber.

18 The Assembly has already passed
19 this, I understand, a little while ago. So this
20 is actually democracy showing itself. If you
21 don't like the outcome, I'm sorry for you. But
22 if you can't win an election, as you said, that's
23 too bad for you.

24 We're sitting here now because there
25 is a gross misrepresentation of people in a part

1 of this state. It's funny to hear one of my
2 colleagues talk about forum shopping. He's been
3 doing that himself for a couple of years, picking
4 his preferred judges to bring suits against this
5 body.

6 So I'm sorry if you're not going to
7 get to do that as much, if you can't cheat the
8 system as much as you have been for all these
9 decades that it's been taking place. But this
10 Senate changed hands in the last decade because
11 the people wanted it to. And we're passing laws
12 that we are constitutionally empowered to pass.
13 You just don't like the outcome.

14 I do want to say one last thing,
15 because one thing that was lost in this
16 conversation that we didn't talk about is the
17 benefit that this will provide to the rural
18 counties upstate, because they are even
19 underrepresented at the hands of the larger
20 population centers.

21 So if you compare the populations of
22 some of these counties to what their proportional
23 number of judges should be, I'm going to tell you
24 who benefits. Allegany County would gain judges
25 if that was the case. Cattaraugus, Cayuga,

1 Chautauqua, Genesee, Livingston, Niagara, Oneida,
2 Ontario, Orleans, Seneca, Steuben, Wayne, and
3 Wyoming. All have more percentage of population
4 of these judicial districts than judges they have
5 on the bench. So by creating districts that
6 would focus on those counties, they should also
7 see greater representation.

8 This is good in so many ways,
9 Madam President. Most importantly, it's good for
10 the people of Western New York, who will have a
11 more accurate judiciary that represents the
12 populations of that part of the state.

13 Thank you. I vote yes.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
15 Gianaris to be recorded in the affirmative.

16 Announce the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
18 Calendar 1951, those Senators voting in the
19 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
20 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Gallivan, Griffio,
21 Helming, Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Oberacker,
22 O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec,
23 Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

24 Ayes, 38. Nays, 21.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill

1 is passed.

2 Senator Gianaris.

3 SENATOR GIANARIS: Next up,
4 Madam President, is Calendar 258.

5 I'm sorry, that's Calendar 1949.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 1949, Senate Print 8415, by Senator Salazar, an
8 act to amend the Correction Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
10 Stec, why do you rise?

11 SENATOR STEC: Thank you,
12 Madam President. If the sponsor would yield for
13 a few questions.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Will the
15 sponsor yield?

16 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
18 sponsor yields.

19 SENATOR STEC: Thank you.

20 The first question, does this bill
21 contain any changes at all that would address any
22 of the concerns that we've been hearing about for
23 years from corrections officers and people that
24 work in our prisons regarding the HALT Act?

25 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,

1 Madam President. This bill has nothing to do
2 with the HALT Solitary Confinement Act.

3 SENATOR STEC: Will the sponsor
4 continue to yield?

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
6 continue to yield?

7 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
9 sponsor yields.

10 SENATOR STEC: Why not take this
11 opportunity, on the last day of session,
12 following a historic wildcat strike where almost
13 10,000 of our employees walked off the job due to
14 safety concerns in their workplace that affects
15 both them and inmates, and the data's there to
16 back it up? Why several months later, here on
17 the last day of session, doesn't this bill, this
18 omnibus bill that I presume has taken a lot of
19 effort to get to the floor here this week -- just
20 a few days ago it just aged -- why not take that
21 opportunity to address what was obviously one of
22 the most concerning things that's happened in
23 corrections in the last three decades?

24 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
25 Madam President. This is an omnibus bill that

1 consists essentially of language from
2 10 different pieces of legislation, some of which
3 we have actually passed previously in this
4 chamber, and that have been pending in the
5 Legislature for years.

6 The focus of this omnibus bill is
7 conditions in correctional facilities. It is
8 bringing accountability and transparency to our
9 prison system that woefully lacks both, and
10 additionally is in part a response to the crisis
11 in our state prisons in which two incarcerated
12 men have been murdered by corrections staff in
13 just the past six months alone.

14 SENATOR STEC: If the sponsor will
15 continue to yield.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Will the
17 sponsor continue to yield?

18 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
20 sponsor yields.

21 SENATOR STEC: I agree that -- and
22 I think we all agree it's important we address
23 violence within our prisons. And the death of
24 the two people that you're referring to is
25 certainly unfortunate, certainly outrageous, and

1 the criminal justice system should do what I
2 think this side of the aisle expects it to do.

3 But does this bill do anything to
4 target the well-documented inmate-on-inmate
5 violence that's occurring in our prisons?

6 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
7 Madam President. I would say that the bills
8 contained within this omnibus bill do seek to
9 improve safety for everyone in our state prisons,
10 including staff, incarcerated individuals,
11 visitors, anyone who finds themselves in a state
12 correctional facility.

13 SENATOR STEC: Will the sponsor
14 continue to yield.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
16 continue to yield?

17 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
19 sponsor yields.

20 SENATOR STEC: So you referred to
21 the deaths of the two inmates previously.
22 However -- and you've heard me talk about this
23 before, last year -- there were four inmates that
24 died due to overdoses in our prisons. Does this
25 bill do anything to address the contraband that

1 is causing these overdoses?

2 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
3 Madam President. There is a part of this bill
4 that includes expanding fixed cameras and
5 ensuring comprehensive coverage of audio and
6 video footage in state correctional facilities.
7 I would argue that that increases security in
8 facilities and may play a role in reducing
9 contraband.

10 SENATOR STEC: Will the sponsor
11 continue to yield?

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
13 continue to yield?

14 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
16 sponsor yields.

17 SENATOR STEC: Does this bill
18 address in any way the use of body scanners to
19 combat contraband?

20 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
21 Madam President. Body scanners are not addressed
22 in this legislation.

23 This body has previously taken
24 action to ensure that body scanners are one of
25 the ways in which security is implemented in our

1 correctional facilities for visitors, for
2 incarcerated individuals, and not necessarily for
3 staff, but certainly for other people who are
4 entering correctional facilities.

5 SENATOR STEC: Will the sponsor
6 continue to yield?

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
8 continue to yield?

9 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
11 sponsor yields.

12 SENATOR STEC: Does this
13 legislation in any way address contraband getting
14 into the prisons through the mail and legal mail
15 that goes into these prisons that is soaked in
16 contraband chemicals and drugs?

17 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
18 Madam President, that is not addressed in this
19 legislation. Although I do know that DOCCS has
20 relatively recently implemented a stricter policy
21 with regard to screening legal mail.

22 SENATOR STEC: Will the sponsor
23 continue to yield?

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
25 continue to yield?

1 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
3 sponsor yields.

4 SENATOR STEC: Does this
5 legislation in any way address the contraband
6 that's entering through our vendor system and
7 implementing a secure vendor program? Which has
8 been invented and used in several states around
9 the country, so we don't need to invent anything,
10 we just need to use a tool that's available.

11 Does this address the secured vendor
12 question?

13 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
14 Madam President, there is already an existing
15 secure vendor program in DOCCS, and that's not
16 addressed in this legislation.

17 SENATOR STEC: Will the sponsor
18 continue to yield?

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
20 continue to yield?

21 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
23 sponsor yields.

24 SENATOR STEC: So there's no
25 question, and DOCCS's own data will show

1 inmate-on-staff and inmate-on-inmate violence has
2 skyrocketed since HALT went into effect.

3 Wouldn't restoring the disciplinary
4 options that were eliminated through HALT, the
5 HALT Act, help to address the rise in this
6 violence, thus increasing safety for both inmates
7 and staff in our correctional facilities?

8 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
9 Madam President. What this legislation seeks to
10 address is in part the fact that according to the
11 Correctional Association of New York, 143
12 incarcerated individuals died while in DOCCS
13 custody last year alone. That's a 34 percent
14 increase in deaths of incarcerated individuals in
15 DOCCS from the previous year.

16 What this legislation is seeking to
17 address is conditions in our state correctional
18 facilities and failures of accountability,
19 transparency, and oversight in our state
20 corrections system.

21 SENATOR STEC: Will the sponsor
22 continue to yield?

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
24 continue to yield?

25 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
2 sponsor yields.

3 SENATOR STEC: As you know, DOCCS
4 has been facing an unprecedented staffing
5 shortage, impairing the ability of correction
6 officers to maintain safety and security and
7 protect both staff and inmates. The impossible
8 working conditions created by both the staffing
9 shortage and the HALT Act caused the CO strike
10 earlier this year.

11 What does this bill do to address
12 the issues and concerns raised by
13 10,000 corrections officers both during and after
14 that strike?

15 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
16 Madam President. I think that this legislation
17 addresses many concerns that anyone who is
18 incarcerated or works in one of our state prisons
19 might have.

20 I'll also note that we received a
21 memo of support today from PEF, whose members
22 include 5,000 employees in DOCCS. So I would
23 argue that this legislation does address concerns
24 of some of our state employees who work in our
25 correctional facilities.

1 SENATOR STEC: Will the sponsor
2 continue to yield?

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
4 continue to yield?

5 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
7 sponsor yields.

8 SENATOR STEC: Does your
9 legislation do anything to help recruit and
10 retain corrections staff?

11 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
12 Madam President. I believe that by improving
13 conditions in our correctional facilities, which
14 I believe that this legislation will do, that it
15 will create a safer work environment for
16 everyone, including correction officers, who work
17 in our state prisons.

18 SENATOR STEC: Will the sponsor
19 continue to yield?

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
21 continue to yield?

22 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
24 sponsor yields.

25 SENATOR STEC: Just last night,

1 when we were in this chamber voting on
2 end-of-session legislation, at Clinton
3 Correctional in Clinton County, in my Senate
4 district, 17 people went to the emergency room
5 for medical emergencies -- and I was told that
6 these were all chemical exposures -- including
7 four staff.

8 So I'm not sure if it was 13 inmates
9 or 17 inmates plus four staff, but somewhere in
10 the neighborhood of a dozen and a half people,
11 both inmates and staff, had medical emergencies
12 in Clinton Correctional last night.

13 We've seen a number of incidents
14 where officers and staff are exposed to unknown
15 substances, sometimes causing illness. And I
16 talked about it in a previous debate where over
17 25 people at another one of my correctional
18 facilities, in Franklin County, went to the
19 emergency room in January of this year.

20 Does your legislation do anything to
21 address contraband that killed four inmates last
22 year in your bill?

23 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
24 Madam President. If the question is if this
25 legislation would address deaths in correctional

1 facilities, would address overdoses -- it seems
2 like this is what Senator Stec may be asking --
3 yes, I absolutely think that this legislation
4 will seek to address those issues.

5 SENATOR STEC: Will the sponsor
6 continue to yield?

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
8 continue to yield?

9 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
11 sponsor yields.

12 SENATOR STEC: Part H. How is
13 Part H changing the makeup of the Commission of
14 Corrections?

15 SENATOR SALAZAR: (Conferring.)
16 I'm sorry, Madam President.

17 So right now there are three
18 commissioners on the State Commission of
19 Correction. This bill would increase the
20 membership from those three members to nine
21 individuals.

22 It also will ensure that the
23 Governor appoints three of those individuals,
24 that the Speaker of the Assembly appoints two,
25 and that the Majority Leader or the Temporary

1 President of the Senate would appoint two
2 individuals as well. Additionally, that the
3 Correctional Association of New York would
4 appoint two of those nine commissioners.

5 SENATOR STEC: Will the sponsor
6 continue to yield?

7 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
9 sponsor yields.

10 SENATOR STEC: Just so we're all
11 clear, under current law the Governor appoints
12 three members and the Senate must confirm these
13 members, is that correct?

14 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
15 Madam President. Yes, that is correct.

16 It also demonstrates that the
17 State Commission of Correction is really a very
18 small agency relative to their responsibility in
19 statute. They are responsible for conducting
20 oversight and accountability for both state and
21 local correctional facilities in statute, and
22 that is something that I don't believe they are
23 able to adequately do with the number of
24 commissioners and staff size that they currently
25 have.

1 SENATOR STEC: Will the sponsor
2 continue to yield?

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
4 continue to yield?

5 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
7 sponsor yields.

8 SENATOR STEC: So these six
9 additional members, just to be clear again, two
10 would be appointed by the Assembly, two by the
11 Senate, and two would be appointed by the
12 Correctional Association of New York, is that
13 correct?

14 SENATOR SALAZAR: That's correct.

15 SENATOR STEC: Thank you.

16 Would the sponsor continue to yield?

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
18 continue to yield?

19 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
21 sponsor yields.

22 SENATOR STEC: Is there any
23 requirement in your bill that the members, those
24 six new members be approved by the Senate?

25 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,

1 Madam President. Of the new members, they would
2 not need to be confirmed by the Senate.

3 SENATOR STEC: Will the sponsor
4 continue to yield?

5 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
7 sponsor yields.

8 SENATOR STEC: Thank you.

9 Article 5, Section 4 of the
10 State Constitution reads "the members of all
11 boards and commissions, excepting temporary
12 commissions for special purposes, shall be
13 appointed by the Governor by and with the advice
14 and consent of the Senate."

15 The Commission of Corrections is not
16 a temporary commission for special purposes, is
17 it?

18 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
19 Madam President. There are other exceptions in
20 state law to this. It's not just the State
21 Commission of Correction in this case.

22 SENATOR STEC: Will the sponsor
23 continue to yield?

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
25 continue to yield?

1 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
3 sponsor yields.

4 SENATOR STEC: Thank you.

5 In fact, the Commission of
6 Corrections is a constitutionally created
7 commission, correct?

8 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
9 Madam President. The State Commission of
10 Correction is in statute. I don't believe that
11 it's actually in the State Constitution.

12 SENATOR STEC: On the bill briefly.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
14 Stec on the bill.

15 SENATOR STEC: Thank you.

16 The answer to my question is yes,
17 Article XVII, Section 5 states, quote, There
18 shall be a state commission of correction which
19 shall visit and inspect or cause to be visited
20 and inspected by members of its staff, all
21 institutions used for the detention of sane
22 adults charged with or convicted of a crime, end
23 quote.

24 Will the sponsor continue to yield?

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Will the

1 sponsor yield?

2 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
4 sponsor yields.

5 SENATOR STEC: Thank you.

6 How do the provisions of this
7 legislation comply with the constitutional
8 requirement that members of the state commission
9 must be appointed by the Governor -- no one
10 else -- with the advice and consent of the
11 Senate?

12 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
13 Madam President. We do have the ability to
14 change the statutory language regarding the State
15 Commission of Correction. It does not require
16 changing the Constitution to do so.

17 SENATOR STEC: Will the sponsor
18 continue to yield?

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
20 continue to yield?

21 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
23 sponsor yields.

24 SENATOR STEC: We disagree. The
25 bill requires that one of the members would have

1 to be a former inmate, correct?

2 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
3 Madam President. The bill requires that one of
4 the nine members would need to be someone who was
5 formerly incarcerated in a state facility.

6 SENATOR STEC: Will the sponsor
7 continue to yield?

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
9 continue to yield?

10 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
12 sponsor yields.

13 SENATOR STEC: Thank you.

14 According to Section 45 of
15 Correction Law, the commission of Correction is
16 responsible for promulgating rules and
17 regulations establishing minimum standards for
18 the care, custody, correction, treatment,
19 supervision, discipline and other correctional
20 programs for all inmates in correctional
21 facilities.

22 So this bill, if it became law,
23 would require that a former inmate be involved in
24 establishing minimum standards for correctional
25 facilities, is that correct?

1 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
2 Madam President, yes, a former incarcerated
3 individual would be required to be one of the
4 members of the SCOC.

5 SENATOR STEC: Will the sponsor
6 continue to yield?

7 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
9 sponsor yields.

10 SENATOR STEC: Thank you.

11 Is there any requirement that a
12 member of the Commission of Correction be a
13 former correction officer or have previous
14 corrections experience?

15 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
16 Madam President. While that is not required,
17 there is nothing in this legislation or statute
18 that precludes a person who has formerly been a
19 correction officer from serving on the SCOC.

20 However, if -- you know, current
21 statute does require that commissioners on the
22 SCOC be in that role full-time. So, for example,
23 somebody who is currently a correction officer,
24 of course, or if they had another job, they
25 wouldn't be able to hold that position while

1 simultaneously serving on the SCOC.

2 SENATOR STEC: Will the sponsor
3 yield?

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
5 continue to yield?

6 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
8 sponsor yields.

9 SENATOR STEC: Isn't it important
10 to have individuals with expertise in corrections
11 participating in the creation of minimum
12 standards for correctional facilities?

13 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
14 Madam President, yes, I believe that that is
15 true.

16 And there is nothing in this
17 legislation that would prevent someone with
18 experience in a correctional facility, including
19 working in a correctional facility, from serving
20 on the State Commission of Correction.

21 SENATOR STEC: Will the sponsor
22 continue to yield?

23 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
25 sponsor yields.

1 SENATOR STEC: Thank you. I'll
2 pivot to Part I, just a few questions there.

3 Part I requires DOCCS to provide a
4 significant amount of information to the
5 Correctional Association of New York on a
6 quarterly basis. Have you spoken with DOCCS
7 regarding their ability to comply with that
8 requirement?

9 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
10 Madam President, I don't think that this will be
11 an issue, because DOCCS currently complies with
12 this requirement.

13 SENATOR STEC: Will the sponsor
14 continue to yield?

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
16 continue to yield?

17 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
19 sponsor yields.

20 SENATOR STEC: What is the purpose
21 of ensuring that that data is provided to CANY?

22 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
23 Madam President. The Correctional Association
24 is the only independent entity that has the
25 ability in statute, or rather is tasked in

1 statute with oversight of our correctional
2 facilities. And I think in order for them to
3 adequately perform that responsibility, they need
4 to have access to this data.

5 SENATOR STEC: Will the sponsor
6 continue to yield?

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
8 continue to yield?

9 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
11 Senator yields.

12 SENATOR STEC: In developing
13 this omnibus -- and I acknowledge that you said
14 that several parts of it came from former pieces
15 of legislation. But in recent months, as you've
16 developed this, have you met with the
17 commissioner of DOCCS or senior members of his
18 staff, consulted with him? Did he have input
19 with you on this?

20 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
21 Madam President. I frequently speak to
22 Commissioner Martuscello about legislation and
23 have had conversations with him about the
24 State Commission of Correction, as well as the
25 Correctional Association, and DOCCS' relationship

1 with both of these entities that are tasked in
2 different ways with overseeing our correctional
3 facilities.

4 SENATOR STEC: Will the sponsor
5 continue to yield?

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
7 yield.

8 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
10 sponsor yields.

11 SENATOR STEC: So at the end of
12 this strike this past winter, one of the outcomes
13 of that, one of the promises of that, one of the
14 conditions of that cessation was that some
15 working group -- and I can't recall what it was
16 called, but there was going to be a working group
17 that was going to sit down DOCCS, stakeholders,
18 members of the unions, staff, presumably
19 legislative people, to come up with a list of
20 recommendations.

21 That was a big selling point to the
22 10,000 officers that left the job because they're
23 afraid for their lives.

24 How often has that group met?

25 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,

1 Madam President. I will note that the creation
2 of that group by DOCCS was actually subject to an
3 agreement that was not honored by the other
4 party.

5 So in other words, it was only to be
6 enforceable if a critical mass of officers
7 returned to work, which they did not do. That
8 was not met.

9 However, it is my understanding that
10 despite that, DOCCS convened this working group.
11 I couldn't tell you how many times they have met.
12 It wasn't, you know, created by statute. It
13 didn't include members of the Legislature. So I
14 have no way of knowing how often they've met.

15 SENATOR STEC: Do you yield?

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
17 continue to yield?

18 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
20 sponsor yields.

21 SENATOR STEC: Do you honestly
22 believe that the participants in that working
23 group would endorse as complete or substantially
24 addressing their safety concerns in your
25 legislation? Do you think that your legislation

1 would match up well with what was going to be the
2 work product of that group that may or may not
3 have been meeting?

4 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
5 Madam President, I know for a fact that they
6 would because some of them have.

7 As I mentioned earlier, the
8 Public Employees Federation, PEF, who again
9 represents 5,000 workers in DOCCS, they were part
10 of that committee or working group that DOCCS
11 formed, and they have submitted a memo of support
12 for this omnibus bill.

13 SENATOR STEC: Will the sponsor
14 continue to yield?

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
16 continue to yield?

17 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
19 sponsor yields.

20 SENATOR STEC: Do you have a memo
21 of support from NYSCOPBA?

22 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
23 Madam President, I do not have any memo from
24 NYSCOPBA regarding this legislation.

25 SENATOR STEC: Thank you.

1 If the sponsor would continue to
2 yield.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
4 continue to yield?

5 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
7 sponsor yields.

8 SENATOR STEC: Do you have a memo
9 of support from Council 82?

10 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
11 Madam President. At the moment I don't think I
12 have any memo from Council 82 on this
13 legislation. Although I did speak to a
14 representative of Council 82 --

15 SENATOR STEC: If the --

16 SENATOR SALAZAR: -- about this
17 legislation.

18 SENATOR STEC: -- sponsor would
19 continue to yield.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Yes. But
21 respectfully, can you let her finish the
22 question.

23 SENATOR STEC: I thought she had.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Okay.

25 Will the sponsor continue to yield?

1 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

2 SENATOR STEC: Do you have a memo
3 of support from CSEA?

4 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
5 Madam President, I don't have a memo of support
6 nor a memo of opposition from CSEA.

7 SENATOR STEC: If the sponsor would
8 continue to yield.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
10 continue to yield?

11 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
13 sponsor yields.

14 SENATOR STEC: In the 13 years that
15 I've been in the Legislature, in the months
16 leading up to the strike, many, many times during
17 the strike, and many times since the strike, I
18 visited all seven of my corrections facilities --
19 I used to have 10 -- and I've talked to a lot of
20 corrections officers in the last six months.

21 I know what their concerns are, and
22 I talked about them in the first part of the
23 debate when I asked about contraband and HALT and
24 staffing. And I can tell you that this
25 legislation, you -- by your own admission this

1 legislation doesn't address any of those things.

2 The employees that I talked to --
3 the nurses, the members of PEF, the instructors,
4 the civilian staff and most especially the
5 corrections officers -- have grave safety
6 concerns regarding HALT and contraband and
7 staffing levels in the facilities. And your
8 legislation I don't think meets it. And I'm
9 pretty sure they don't think it does either.

10 My question is, you stated
11 earlier -- and I want to make sure -- you believe
12 that those people that would be at that
13 roundtable talking about this in the group that
14 was going to meet post-strike, they would endorse
15 this as yes, thank you, Senator Salazar, you hit
16 the nail on the head, this is what we went on
17 strike for, thank you, put a bow on it?

18 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
19 Madam President. I believe that the previously
20 mentioned memo of support from PEF demonstrates
21 yes, that is true.

22 SENATOR STEC: On the bill.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
24 Stec on the bill.

25 SENATOR STEC: I thank Senator

1 Salazar for her time here.

2 Again, monumental lost opportunity
3 to address serious, bona fide safety concerns of
4 more than 10,000 of our employees and tens of
5 thousands of incarcerated individuals.

6 In my travels I've talked to inmates
7 in the facilities that have told me the guys that
8 are in special housing, that are in solitary
9 confinement, have a better deal than the guys on
10 the honor block.

11 And I have often -- you know, it
12 took me a while before it clicked, and it finally
13 clicked. It's because with the limited
14 resources, when we say we've got to do this
15 because HALT says we must do X, Y and Z, those
16 resources, those staff come out of the general
17 population, they come out of the honor blocks,
18 because they're going to hold hands in special
19 housing.

20 And so I hear from inmates that the
21 guys in special housing have more privileges,
22 more services -- yes, their movements are more
23 regulated. Some of them prefer that. Yes, they
24 spend a little more time in their cells.
25 However, comma, as one of the signs I saw outside

1 the Capitol here earlier this year at one of the
2 protests said, "New York State solitary
3 confinement has wifi."

4 The inmates have said, We're left
5 alone, we have our wifi, our tablet, we are free
6 to -- it's a better deal for many of them. A lot
7 of them say they feel safer in there. A lot of
8 them feel they felt safer before HALT went into
9 effect. And again, because the resources are
10 pulled from the general population to try to meet
11 the statutory requirements of HALT.

12 Now, with that said, if I had a
13 nickel for every corrections officer or member of
14 one of those four unions that I mentioned that
15 I've talked to in the North Country in the last
16 several months that said we want it to be safer,
17 then this is not what they're looking for, I can
18 assure you of that.

19 We had an opportunity -- you know,
20 those guys, they went on strike, they took the
21 hit in the tail a lot. Two days pay for every
22 day they were out. And then on top of that, at
23 the end, after saying we're going to fire you,
24 we're going to fire you, we're going to fire you,
25 just kidding, just kidding, just kidding -- and

1 then the fourth time they fire you -- we've still
2 got untrained, unqualified young people in our
3 National Guard running around these facilities
4 carrying cellphones -- not supposed to have
5 cellphones in these facilities, some of them.
6 They're carrying cellphones. Why that's
7 happening, you'd have to ask Commissioner
8 Martuscello.

9 We've done nothing to address the
10 safety concerns. We have a staffing shortage,
11 and the solution to that was to fire 2,000 and
12 not hire many of them back. We're going to close
13 a couple of facilities, perhaps, it sounds like.
14 That was a priority in the budget.

15 But here at the end of session, an
16 omnibus bill on corrections that doesn't do
17 anything to address contraband or staffing levels
18 or the shortcomings of HALT that have led to a
19 hockey-stick-shaped curve when it comes to
20 assaults on fellow inmates and on staff -- it
21 would be laughable if it wasn't tragic.

22 So we're going to leave here maybe
23 this weekend, depending on how the rest of the
24 day goes, I guess, and the work of corrections is
25 going to go on. And the 10,000 people that left

1 that are still back there, they're going to have
2 to live with the fact that we've done nothing.
3 And we're going to continue to read the stories
4 in the news. And I hope that we don't see any
5 more overdose deaths in our facilities like we've
6 seen.

7 I hope that the phone calls that I
8 got last night about 17 people went to the
9 emergency room in the North Country that work in
10 one of our facilities, because they were exposed
11 to chemicals, or 25 people that went to the
12 North Country hospital in January -- I don't want
13 any more of those calls. Because one of these
14 days it's not going to be 25 went to the
15 emergency room, it's going to be 24 went to the
16 emergency room and one went to the morgue. And
17 maybe it's a staff member or maybe it's an
18 inmate. But it's avoidable. And I don't want to
19 be standing here next year telling all of you, I
20 told you so.

21 We have a responsibility to those
22 inmates and our staff. And whether you fall on
23 one side or the other of who you prefer, they're
24 all people. And we as the leaders of this state
25 have an obligation to protect them. And you have

1 failed them.

2 I'll be voting no on this. I'm
3 looking for some meaningful work in the area of
4 corrections to make it safer for inmates and
5 staff.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
7 Helming, why do you rise?

8 SENATOR HELMING: Thank you,
9 Madam President. On the bill real quick.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
11 Helming on the bill.

12 SENATOR HELMING: Thank you.

13 So I want to thank Senator Stec for
14 asking so many detailed questions, and I'd like
15 to go on the record as having many of the same
16 concerns that this bill doesn't really address
17 the safety issues or the crisis within our
18 prisons.

19 There are so many issues -- I would
20 have preferred to see something done to HALT.
21 I've heard that from inmates as well as COs and
22 others, that we need to make some changes to
23 HALT.

24 But if the sponsor would yield to a
25 question or two, I do have a couple of questions.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
2 Salazar, do you yield?

3 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
5 Senator yields.

6 SENATOR HELMING: Thank you.
7 Through you, Madam President.

8 Senator Salazar, as you know, this
9 crisis in our prisons, it's really resulted in a
10 backup in our local jails as well. Our local
11 sheriffs are holding people who are ready to be
12 moved into DOCCS facilities. Fifty-seven out of
13 58 sheriffs have expressed concern that they've
14 not been compensated for holding state-ready
15 incarcerated individuals. They are expending a
16 lot of money on medications, that MAT
17 programming, and so much more.

18 Does this bill do anything to
19 address that situation?

20 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
21 Madam President. I would say that some of the
22 provisions of this bill, including the data
23 reporting, the expanded oversight, the expansion
24 of the SCOC, which is tasked with monitoring
25 local correctional facilities and state

1 correctional facilities -- I would say that all
2 of those things can potentially help with
3 staffing issues and challenges faced both by
4 state and local correctional facilities.

5 SENATOR HELMING: Through you,
6 Madam President, if the sponsor will continue to
7 yield.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
9 continue to yield?

10 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
12 sponsor yields.

13 SENATOR HELMING: Just to drill
14 down with you a little more specifically, is
15 there anything in this bill that directs
16 resources to our local sheriffs to compensate
17 them for the state's problems?

18 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
19 Madam President, no, that's not the purpose of
20 this legislation.

21 SENATOR HELMING: Through you,
22 Madam President, if the sponsor will continue to
23 yield.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
25 yield?

1 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
3 sponsor yields.

4 SENATOR HELMING: Does this bill by
5 any chance address the earnings cap for part-time
6 corrections officers both in our local jails and
7 also in state facilities?

8 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
9 Madam President, no, that's not the purpose of
10 this legislation.

11 SENATOR HELMING: Through you,
12 Madam President, if the sponsor will continue to
13 yield.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
15 continue to yield?

16 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
18 sponsor yields.

19 SENATOR HELMING: Senator Salazar,
20 I would argue that that is a concern that's being
21 driven by the legislation that is being passed or
22 the actions taken by this body.

23 If these issues are not addressed in
24 this bill, do you have any plans to address this
25 situation before we have the same sort of issues

1 in our local jails that we've had at the prisons,
2 where people say enough is enough and just walk?
3 It creates unsafe conditions, as you mentioned.

4 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
5 Madam President, there is a lot in this omnibus
6 bill that can be used to improve conditions in
7 our state correctional facilities.

8 And I think that there is still more
9 to be done just beyond just passing this omnibus
10 bill, which focuses on accountability and
11 transparency. And I certainly think that we can
12 continue to take action to address the concerns
13 that Senator Helming is raising.

14 SENATOR HELMING: Thank you.

15 On the bill real quick,
16 Madam President.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
18 Helming on the bill.

19 SENATOR HELMING: So,
20 Senator Salazar, I appreciate you answering those
21 questions. I mean, I know what's in the bill,
22 basically, and what isn't in the bill. But I
23 want to raise the issue of what's happening in
24 our local jails.

25 Like I said, 57 out of 58 sheriffs

1 have sent letters asking for help, asking for
2 reimbursement, asking to raise the cap for
3 part-time corrections officers. They've sent
4 that to the leaders of this body, they've sent it
5 to the Governor, and they deserve a response and
6 they deserve some action.

7 Also, this body -- I hear a lot
8 about accountability, and there shall be
9 accountability. Prisoners should not be treated
10 like the two who were murdered inside. But
11 accountability starts at the top. And I haven't
12 heard a lot of discussion about that.

13 And we also need to have
14 accountability for incarcerated individuals who
15 commit crimes while they're within the state
16 facilities, and I haven't heard a lot about that
17 as well.

18 Madam President, I think there are
19 so many shortcomings with this bill, I will be
20 voting no.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
22 Senator Helming.

23 Senator Walczyk, why do you rise?

24 SENATOR WALCZYK: On the bill,
25 Madam President.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
2 Walczyk on the bill.

3 SENATOR WALCZYK: This bill is
4 aimed at providing some transparency in our state
5 correctional facilities. Allow me to provide
6 some transparency. The Governor has ignored
7 staff and inmate concerns for safety. Thousands
8 of corrections officers protested unsafe working
9 conditions. Thousands of them were fired.
10 Thousands more walked off the job permanently.

11 3,600-plus National Guard members
12 are still in our facilities today. And nothing
13 has been done to address the staff shortage and
14 corrections officers' and staff concerns about
15 safety in our facilities.

16 Instead, this bill stacks the
17 Commission on Correction with partisan
18 appointments, violating the Constitution. It
19 extends the statute of limitations for prisoners
20 to be able to sue corrections officers and the
21 taxpayers for three additional years after they
22 get out of prison.

23 And by the way, to the sponsor, the
24 PEF memo also states "We need to do more on
25 safety." I hope you read that line.

1 What should this bill do? It
2 should create a secure vendor program. It should
3 require visitors be screened for drug mules. It
4 should get drugs out of our facilities. It
5 should repeal HALT. It should listen to the
6 law-abiding, hardworking corrections officers and
7 staff that do a dangerous job every single day to
8 keep you and your families safe.

9 It doesn't, and I'll be voting no.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Are there
11 any other Senators wishing to be heard?

12 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
13 closed. The Secretary will ring the bell.

14 Read the last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
16 act shall take effect immediately.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
21 Cooney to explain his vote.

22 SENATOR COONEY: Thank you,
23 Madam President.

24 Robert Brooks's father,
25 Robert Ricks, lives in Rochester and is my

1 constituent. I've met with him and heard the
2 pain that emanates from him when he talks about
3 the loss of his son and the heartbreak of
4 watching his son be brutally murdered on camera
5 by the guards that were sworn to protect him.

6 This package that we are advancing
7 today is focused on oversight, and that is an
8 important first step. But it is only the
9 beginning.

10 To truly honor Robert Brooks, we
11 must do more than monitor the system. We must
12 offer a fair pathway home for incarcerated people
13 who have transformed while they are inside. We
14 must acknowledge and incentivize transformation
15 and rehabilitation.

16 The Earned Time Act is a bill that
17 advances both safety and justice. It reduces
18 violence for everyone inside, lowers recidivism,
19 and makes our communities safer, now and in the
20 future.

21 It is a bill that's supported by
22 many of us in this room, and labor unions, and by
23 our communities.

24 My yes vote today on this bill is
25 for accountability, but it is also a vote for the

1 future and for our ongoing commitment to change
2 the culture within the four prison walls, to
3 reorient towards rehabilitation rather than
4 perpetual punishment.

5 I want to thank Senator Salazar, the
6 bill's sponsor, and of course our Majority Leader
7 for bringing this important package to the floor.

8 I vote aye.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
10 Cooney to be recorded in the affirmative.

11 Senator Salazar to explain her vote.

12 SENATOR SALAZAR: Thank you,
13 Madam President.

14 This omnibus bill is the minimum
15 action we must take in seeking justice for the
16 murders of Robert Brooks, Messiah Nantwi, and
17 others such as Terry Cooper who have been killed
18 while in state custody, including others whose
19 names we may never even know.

20 I want to thank the father of
21 Robert Brooks, Robert Ricks, for his advocacy,
22 which played a critical role in this legislation
23 and ensuring

24 That we actually pass this bill
25 today, and I'm sure will continue to advocate for

1 more change to our state correction system.

2 I mentioned Terry Cooper. Clinton
3 Correctional Facility was mentioned on the floor,
4 and so I want to talk briefly about Terry Cooper.
5 In May of 2016 Terry Cooper, who had just turned
6 25 years old, was brutally assaulted by DOCCS
7 correction officers at Clinton Correctional
8 Facility. He died that day. Mr. Cooper weighed
9 about 115 pounds and was about five-foot-five.
10 He was about my size. But he was assaulted by
11 several correctional officers. They ultimately
12 killed him.

13 His official cause of death was
14 determined to be from asthma. However, it was
15 clear from photographs that were later discovered
16 during the course of a civil lawsuit brought by
17 Mr. Cooper's family that he had been beaten by
18 batons, and in fact that the cause of death
19 clearly was the beating that he suffered from
20 correction officers.

21 Ultimately in that case the jury
22 awarded a total of \$9.25 million to Mr. Cooper's
23 family because of the constitutional violations
24 that resulted in his death. The jury also
25 decided that two of the COs would have to pay

1 punitive discharge damages. That civil
2 settlement was the largest civil rights verdict
3 in the Northern District's history. That is what
4 it cost our state, in addition to costing
5 Mr. Cooper his life.

6 We address this problem in this
7 legislation by including the language of a bill
8 that I sponsor known as the Terry Cooper Autopsy
9 Accountability Act.

10 There is a lot in this bill. I
11 won't go through all of it; I don't have time.
12 But there is much in this bill to address the
13 woefully inadequate oversight in our state
14 correctional facilities. But there is more work
15 to do, including expanding pathways for release
16 through sentencing reform, bringing fairness to
17 our state's parole system, and much more.

18 But each part of today's legislation
19 will directly contribute to improving conditions
20 in our state's very violent prisons, from
21 ensuring that oversight agencies have the staff
22 that they need to fulfill their purpose,
23 requiring a swift timeline for reporting deaths,
24 ensuring the Attorney General's office actually
25 has prompt access to video footage when murders

1 have occurred inside of our state prisons.

2 The passage of this legislation is a
3 very important step forward, and I am proud to
4 veto aye. Thank you.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
6 Salazar to be recorded in the affirmative.

7 Announce the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
9 Calendar 1949, voting in the negative are
10 Senators Addabbo, Ashby, Borrello,
11 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Gallivan, Griffo,
12 Helming, Lanza, Martinez, Martins, Mattera,
13 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,
14 Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

15 Ayes, 36. Nays, 23.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
17 is passed.

18 Senator Gianaris.

19 SENATOR GIANARIS: Let's move on to
20 Calendar 1948, please.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
22 Secretary will read.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 1948, Senate Print 8413, by Senator Gounardes, an
25 act in relation to authorizing a loan from the

1 state to the City of Dunkirk.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
3 Borrello, why do you rise?

4 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
5 let me start off by going on the bill, please.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
7 Borrello on the bill.

8 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you,
9 Madam President.

10 So this is actually a loan to the
11 City of Dunkirk, which is in my district in
12 Western New York. Now, Dunkirk is not just a
13 city in my district, it is a place that I really
14 have called home. I grew up in the
15 Dunkirk-Fredonia area. In fact, I live just
16 10 miles down the road. My friends own
17 businesses there. In fact in our businesses we
18 employ right now, currently, today, eight people
19 that live in the City of Dunkirk.

20 So this is a very personal issue for
21 me to watch the City of Dunkirk which has gone
22 into a horrible financial crisis. After years
23 and years and years of neglect and, quite
24 frankly, I would say malfeasance, the City of
25 Dunkirk is in dire financial straits. Now,

1 myself and former Assemblymember Andy Goodell
2 passed a fiscal rescue act, but unfortunately the
3 City of Dunkirk wasn't able to complete any of
4 the steps.

5 So now we have this bill before us.
6 So with that, will the sponsor yield for a
7 question?

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the
9 sponsor yield?

10 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Yes,
11 Madam President.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
13 sponsor yields.

14 SENATOR BORRELLO: Through you,
15 Madam President. Senator Gounardes, have you
16 spent any time in the City of Dunkirk?

17 SENATOR GOUNARDES: No, but I look
18 forward to accepting your invitation to visit in
19 the future.

20 (Laughter.)

21 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
22 will the sponsor continue to yield?

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
24 sponsor yield?

25 SENATOR GOUNARDES: I do.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
2 sponsor yields.

3 SENATOR BORRELLO: So you haven't
4 been to the City of Dunkirk. Have you spoken to
5 any citizens of the City of Dunkirk about this
6 loan?

7 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Through you,
8 Madam President, no, I have not had any direct
9 conversations with residents of Dunkirk, although
10 they have been calling my office at
11 Senator Borrello's urging for the last couple of
12 days. So my staff has spoken to residents of the
13 City of Dunkirk.

14 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
15 will the sponsor continue to yield?

16 SENATOR GOUNARDES: I do.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
18 sponsor yields.

19 SENATOR BORRELLO: So you haven't
20 spoken to anyone there. You haven't spoken to
21 any elected officials in the City of Dunkirk?

22 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Through you,
23 Madam President, I have not had any direct
24 conversations with elected officials from the
25 City of Dunkirk.

1 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
2 will the sponsor continue to yield?

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
4 sponsor yield?

5 SENATOR GOUNARDES: I do indeed.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
7 sponsor yields.

8 SENATOR BORRELLO: So you haven't
9 been there, you haven't spoken to any elected
10 officials there. So I'm just -- why are you
11 carrying this bill?

12 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Through you,
13 Madam President, this bill is meant to avoid the
14 potential catastrophic default of the City of
15 Dunkirk, which I do know is the westernmost city
16 in the State of New York, so I did a little bit
17 of homework --

18 SENATOR BORRELLO: We're on the
19 way.

20 SENATOR GOUNARDES: -- to prevent
21 the first municipal default of any municipality
22 in the State of New York's history, which will
23 happen in about three weeks' time because the
24 City of Dunkirk does not have the \$12 million and
25 change that it needs to pay off an existing debt

1 that it owes.

2 And so it has asked and the
3 Governor, at her -- and this bill is being
4 introduced at the Governor's request -- has asked
5 for assistance to make sure they can meet their
6 obligations so that we don't have the City of
7 Dunkirk -- and the first city in New York's
8 history -- go into default.

9 SENATOR BORRELLO: Will the sponsor
10 continue to yield?

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
12 sponsor yield?

13 SENATOR GOUNARDES: I do.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
15 sponsor yields.

16 SENATOR BORRELLO: Are you familiar
17 with the tax levy in the City of Dunkirk?

18 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Through you,
19 Madam President, I would ask a clarifying
20 question. Do you mean the dollar amount of the
21 tax levy, Senator Borrello?

22 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
23 yes.

24 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Through you,
25 Madam President, I'm not sure what the existing

1 tax levy for the City of Dunkirk is. I know
2 they've -- they're currently in a deficit. They
3 just recently, six months ago, raised their
4 property taxes quite significantly to pay for
5 some of the debt that they owe because of their
6 financial troubles. But I don't know the dollars
7 amount of the tax levy.

8 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
9 will the sponsor continue to yield?

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the
11 sponsor yield?

12 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Yes.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
14 sponsor yields.

15 SENATOR BORRELLO: Through you,
16 Madam President, do you know how much they raised
17 the taxes this year?

18 SENATOR GOUNARDES: I'm sorry, say
19 that again?

20 SENATOR BORRELLO: Do you know how
21 much they raised the taxes in the City of Dunkirk
22 this year?

23 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Through you,
24 Madam President, just to clarify, the property
25 taxes?

1 SENATOR BORRELLO: Yeah, property
2 taxes.

3 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Yes. It's my
4 understanding that in December the City Council
5 approved an 84 percent property tax increase for
6 the residents of Dunkirk, again to cover their
7 debt and to keep the lights on in the city while
8 they're going through this financial crisis.

9 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
10 will the sponsor continue to yield?

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
12 sponsor yield?

13 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Yes, I do.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
15 sponsor yields.

16 SENATOR BORRELLO: So an 84 percent
17 tax increase, that's pretty stiff. A lot of
18 people are really struggling to pay their taxes
19 now in the City of Dunkirk.

20 Do you happen to know, has there
21 been any investigation by the Attorney General's
22 office into what's happened in the City of
23 Dunkirk that caused this financial crisis?

24 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Through you,
25 Madam President, I am not of the understanding

1 that the Attorney General has conducted an
2 investigation, or the Attorney General's office.

3 It's my understanding that there is
4 a -- there was a grand jury subpoena issued to
5 the treasurer's office in Dunkirk to preserve
6 records, receive records based -- financial
7 records from the City of Dunkirk.

8 I also know that there have been,
9 through legislation that I think my colleague
10 referenced, the Recovery Act, there have been
11 efforts from the Comptroller's office to get
12 records from the City of Dunkirk.

13 It's also my understanding that many
14 of these records are not digitized, there are
15 paper receipts, paper records. Not all of them
16 are properly maintained, and so there's been some
17 difficulty in being able to do any type of
18 review, let alone an investigation by the AG's
19 office.

20 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
21 on the bill briefly.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
23 Borrello on the bill.

24 SENATOR BORRELLO: So I know my
25 colleagues on the other side of the aisle might

1 think of my district and they think of a bunch of
2 people that look like me driving around on ATVs.

3 But let me tell you about the City
4 of Dunkirk. The City of Dunkirk is actually a
5 majority-minority city. More than 50 percent of
6 the population are racial and ethnic
7 minorities -- a lot of Hispanics, as a matter of
8 fact. There's a very large Puerto Rican
9 population. Twenty percent are senior citizens
10 on fixed incomes. The average household income
11 in the City of Dunkirk, the family income, is
12 \$49,000 a year. And that means everybody in this
13 room makes about -- at least double if not triple
14 what an entire family lives off of in the City of
15 Dunkirk.

16 Twenty percent of the population do
17 not speak English as a first language at home.
18 This is a very diverse and very poor city, people
19 living on fixed incomes.

20 Now, as you just heard, we had an
21 84 percent property tax increase in the City of
22 Dunkirk. And yet nothing has actually been done
23 to fix the problems. And in fact the
24 State Comptroller has been beside themselves.
25 Here's a letter dated on May 30th of this year

1 from the comptroller's office to the mayor
2 talking about that documentation that was asked
3 for.

4 The Fiscal Recovery Act that we
5 passed last year required something pretty
6 simple: Please certify the debt that you have.
7 Please ensure that if we're going to issue bonds,
8 that you actually can issue bonds.

9 And according to this letter from
10 May 30th of this year, it says: "Unfortunately,
11 to date, the city has been unable to provide the
12 documentation needed by our office to certify the
13 deficits and adequately monitor the city's
14 financial condition:

15 "On multiple occasions, including a
16 letter dated September 5, 2024, October 5, 2024,
17 we conveyed to the mayor, treasurer, fiscal
18 affairs officer, members of the city council our
19 concern over the accuracy and reliability of the
20 city's financial records, and we requested that
21 the city officials keep us apprised of their
22 progress in correcting these deficiencies.

23 "However, we have not been informed
24 of what progress has been made and have not been
25 asked for additional guidance."

1 They have not asked the
2 comptroller's office for any guidance on how they
3 can get themselves through this.

4 So that's the problem. They cannot
5 actually issue the bonds they need, which they
6 agreed to do a year ago. We passed that bill a
7 year ago, and they have not -- they haven't even
8 answered the phone calls, quite frankly, and
9 spoken with the comptroller's office to ensure
10 they can actually do this.

11 So the solution that we're given now
12 is, well, we're just going to go ahead and turn
13 this into a payday loan scheme for the City of
14 Dunkirk, for the poor folks that live in the City
15 of Dunkirk.

16 Madam President, with that, will the
17 sponsor continue to yield.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the
19 sponsor yield?

20 SENATOR GOUNARDES: I do,
21 Madam President.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
23 sponsor yields.

24 SENATOR BORRELLO: So this loan,
25 this rescue plan that you have, can you tell me

1 what the terms of this loan are?

2 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Through you,
3 Madam President. This loan would authorize -- we
4 extended about \$13.8 million, I believe -- 13.7,
5 excuse me -- \$13.7 million which would cover the
6 principal and interest on a loan that is due to
7 be paid on July 24th -- July 24th, just a couple
8 of weeks away. That loan -- the interest rate on
9 that loan is 7.5 percent. (Pause.) Yes.

10 SENATOR BORRELLO: Anything else?
11 Oh.

12 Madam President, will the sponsor
13 continue to yield.

14 SENATOR GOUNARDES: I'll also say,
15 Madam President, that it's my -- under the terms
16 of this legislation that that interest rate can
17 be lowered by the {inaudible} and the budget
18 director so that, as the city's able to make its
19 payments, there's flexibility and discretion to
20 make that -- bring that interest rate lower.

21 It's my understanding that the state
22 is not trying to profit off of the backs of the
23 residents of Dunkirk in any way. They're just
24 trying to make sure that they do not experience
25 the first municipal bankruptcy in the state's

1 history, which would have catastrophic impacts
2 not just to Dunkirk, not just to the county, but
3 to the entire region and perhaps the state.

4 It will make borrowing more
5 expensive for other municipalities. Right now
6 it's my understanding that the City of Dunkirk
7 does not even have a bond rating, so they can't
8 even go and get their own -- issue their own
9 bonds even if they had met all of the paperwork
10 requirements from the comptroller's office, which
11 I agree with my colleague is concerning.

12 So right now we're in a situation
13 where the City of Dunkirk is on fire, and I don't
14 believe that they are in a position to be
15 haggling over the price of the water when the
16 fire department's showing up.

17 SENATOR BORRELLO: Will the sponsor
18 continue to yield.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the
20 sponsor yield?

21 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Yes, I do.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
23 sponsor yields.

24 SENATOR BORRELLO: Well, you are
25 right about one thing: They're not in a position

1 to haggle on anything, which is why the Governor
2 has assigned a 7.5 percent interest rate. You
3 think 7.5 percent maybe is a little excessive for
4 the City of Dunkirk?

5 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Through you,
6 Madam President. Right now if the City of
7 Dunkirk had a bond rating -- which they don't,
8 because their finances are in such disarray --
9 they would not be able to get a 7.5 percent rate,
10 they would get one much higher. Because no
11 private lender would give the City of Dunkirk
12 money to cover their deficits, to allow deficit
13 financing, given the state of their finances.

14 And so 7.5 percent is actually a
15 competitive rate for the market. It is a good
16 offer for the residents to take in order to meet
17 their obligations, which are due on July 24th.

18 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
19 will the sponsor continue to yield.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
21 sponsor yield?

22 SENATOR GOUNARDES: I do.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
24 sponsor yields.

25 SENATOR BORRELLO: Are you familiar

1 with my bill to institute a control board for the
2 City of Dunkirk?

3 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Through you,
4 Madam President, yes, I am.

5 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
6 will the sponsor continue to yield.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the
8 sponsor yield?

9 SENATOR GOUNARDES: I do.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
11 sponsor yields.

12 SENATOR BORRELLO: You know that if
13 a control board had been put in place that they
14 actually would have been able to bond at a much
15 lower rate.

16 Why would we not support a control
17 board? Because there's actually been no
18 accountability. Currently, under the terms of
19 the Fiscal Recovery Act that we passed last year
20 or a year ago and signed, there was supposed to
21 be reporting that was done, and they failed to do
22 so. So why wouldn't we have a control board in
23 place to restore accountability and transparency
24 in the City of Dunkirk -- and also, by the way,
25 be able to bond at a much lower rate than

1 7.5 percent?

2 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Through you,
3 Madam President. It's my understanding that with
4 the recovery act that we passed last year, we did
5 create a structure in place for financial
6 oversight, for fiscal oversight.

7 I would agree with my colleague that
8 it's been a challenge to have that oversight
9 be -- the demands of that oversight be met by the
10 city. I think there's a lot that we can talk
11 about there. I am not opposed -- you know, if my
12 colleague is able to pass legislation again to
13 create a control board, I certainly would support
14 it if these efforts fail.

15 However, right now the City of
16 Dunkirk needs financial assistance to pay their
17 debt. Otherwise, they will go bankrupt in three
18 to four weeks. That would be a catastrophe much
19 worse than any that we could possibly contemplate
20 right now.

21 And I also want to call my
22 colleague's attention to a press release from
23 March 24th of this year. You might recognize the
24 author. It says: "Over the past several months
25 I've had many conversations with the mayor,

1 city council members, county and state leaders,
2 including New York State Comptroller Tom
3 DiNapoli, as well as constituents who are very
4 concerned about the future of the city.

5 "To that end, I have tried my best
6 to be supportive and allow the process to
7 continue under local control. However, the
8 problems have proven to be too large and complex.
9 With an 84 percent property tax increase already
10 in place and essentially services at risk, it's
11 time for the state to step in and provide the
12 necessary resources and oversight to restore
13 fiscal stability and ensure long-term
14 accountability."

15 Of course those words are of my
16 colleague from three months ago.

17 We're trying to provide the
18 necessary resources from the state that you have
19 asked for and that you publicly called for three
20 months ago.

21 There is a fire happening right now
22 in the City of Dunkirk. The state is willing to
23 come in and put the fire out so that you can get
24 the city back on track. That is the assistance
25 that is being provided here.

1 And again, I agree with my colleague
2 there seems to be a lot more that needs to be
3 done on the long-term structural changes to the
4 city's finances, whether it be under the
5 Fiscal Recovery Act or under a control board or
6 any other type of system that we put in place.
7 That's the long-term fix. We have to keep the
8 city's lights on in three weeks. That's what
9 this bill does.

10 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
11 will the sponsor continue to yield.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the
13 sponsor yield?

14 SENATOR GOUNARDES: I do.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
16 sponsor yields.

17 SENATOR BORRELLO: Yes, you did
18 quote something that I had written, and you kind
19 of really just kind of sped through the last part
20 about transparency and accountability.

21 What transparency and what
22 accountability is in this loan document? What
23 kind of accountability to the City of Dunkirk
24 will be built into this loan?

25 SENATOR GOUNARDES: (Conferring.)

1 Through you, Madam President. The legislation
2 that is currently before us does require annual
3 attestations by the mayor that they are trying to
4 raise the funds through the bond markets. In the
5 future that they currently have those, that they
6 are still currently in debt, it does also require
7 that the city maintain compliance and reporting
8 requirements that are in place from the
9 Fiscal Recovery Act that was previously
10 referenced and response to the comptroller's
11 recommendations each year.

12 So there are requirements that
13 reference the Fiscal Recovery Act requirements
14 and the system of fiscal oversight that was put
15 in place by last year's legislation.

16 SENATOR BORRELLO: Will the sponsor
17 continue to yield?

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
19 sponsor yield?

20 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Gladly.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
22 sponsor yields.

23 SENATOR BORRELLO: I just read you
24 a letter from less than two weeks ago where the
25 comptroller said the city hasn't met any of the

1 requirements that they've been asked for. What
2 is going to make this situation different?

3 SENATOR GOUNARDES: (Conferring.)
4 Through you, Madam President. It's my
5 understanding that there were some
6 recommendations issued by the comptroller's
7 office that the city has responded to, in terms
8 of going -- making some changes to its budget and
9 others. Though I also acknowledge that they have
10 not been fully compliant, as my colleague laid
11 out.

12 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
13 will the sponsor continue to yield.

14 SENATOR GOUNARDES: I do.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
16 sponsor yields.

17 SENATOR BORRELLO: Can you explain
18 to me what the state is requiring in this in
19 order to secure this loan? Obviously, you know,
20 the City of Dunkirk is being given a
21 high-interest loan, it's going to cost them about
22 a million dollars a year just in interest alone.

23 So what is the state going to
24 require of the city in order to ensure that this
25 loan is paid back?

1 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Through you,
2 Madam President. There's nothing additional, no
3 additional requirements being imposed on the
4 city. If the city is unable to repay the terms
5 of the loan, the state reserves the right to
6 withhold aid payments to Dunkirk in the future to
7 cover the cost of the loan that was given to
8 them. Again, so that they can prevent default in
9 three weeks -- four weeks.

10 SENATOR BORRELLO: Will the sponsor
11 continue to yield.

12 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Yes.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
14 sponsor yields.

15 SENATOR BORRELLO: Actually, yeah,
16 they're going to -- the terms of this, of your
17 legislation says they're going to withhold
18 \$1.5 million a year in AIM payments. Now, by
19 New York City standards that's not a lot of
20 money. But the entire tax levy, even after the
21 84 percent property tax increase, is 9.7 million.
22 So they're going to withhold almost 15 -- more
23 than 15 percent of the total tax levy in aid to
24 the city.

25 So we're going to pay about a

1 million dollars a year in interest, a million and
2 a half dollars a year in interest and principal,
3 and they're going to lose a million and a half
4 dollars a year in revenue. You don't think
5 that's going to create a bigger financial crisis
6 in the City of Dunkirk?

7 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Through you,
8 Madam President. First I'll just remind my
9 colleague that New York City does not get AIM
10 payments, though I know many in this chamber from
11 the city would like to see New York City receive
12 an increase in municipal assistance.

13 This is meant to help avert a crisis
14 right now. This is meant to keep the lights on
15 past July. There is a long-term structural
16 problem facing the City of Dunkirk that needs
17 remediation.

18 Under the terms of the Recovery Act,
19 it's my understanding that there is requirements
20 for three-year planning -- a three-year -- a
21 financial plan. There is requirements to have
22 budgets approved by the Comptroller's office.
23 There's requirements for quarterly updates of
24 required records. All of those things are good
25 accounting practices designed to help move a

1 municipality from fiscal distress towards fiscal
2 health.

3 We know, because we have other cases
4 in New York history where other jurisdictions
5 have gone through similar types of oversight and
6 financial -- or fiscal restructuring and fiscal
7 oversight.

8 But the key here is none of that
9 will matter if the lights close in July. If the
10 City of Dunkirk defaults in July, it would be a
11 catastrophe much worse than having to pay back a
12 loan to the state that the state has flexibility
13 on making more affordable for them in the future.
14 It will completely eliminate the ability of the
15 city to go do any type of deficit financing in
16 the future. It will result in the cutting of
17 essential services, the closing of firehouses and
18 hospitals and police precincts and stations and
19 all of that, closing of schools.

20 We don't want that worst-case
21 scenario to happen. So again, the City of
22 Dunkirk is on fire. The state is offering to
23 come in with a fire hose to put the fire out.
24 And then, once we put the fire out, we can
25 continue to work on the long-term fiscal health

1 of the city.

2 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
3 will the sponsor continue to yield.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
5 sponsor yield?

6 SENATOR GOUNARDES: I do,
7 Madam President.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
9 sponsor yields.

10 SENATOR BORRELLO: I so appreciate
11 your concern for the City of Dunkirk.

12 Do you have a home-rule message for
13 this bill?

14 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Through you,
15 Madam President, I do not. This bill was
16 introduced at the request of the Governor.

17 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
18 will the sponsor continue to yield.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
20 sponsor yield?

21 SENATOR GOUNARDES: I do.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
23 sponsor yields.

24 SENATOR BORRELLO: Are you aware
25 that a majority of the city council has sent a

1 letter to the Governor stating that they do not
2 want this loan and would rather have a control
3 board put in place?

4 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Madam
5 President, I was not aware of that.

6 But that's really immaterial,
7 because even with the control board, if they
8 default on their debt, the show's over, go home.

9 So we still need to solve the
10 immediate problem in front of us right now, which
11 is keeping the lights on in the City of Dunkirk.

12 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
13 on the bill.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
15 Borrello on the bill.

16 SENATOR BORRELLO: I know that the
17 sponsor was asked to carry this bill. And I
18 appreciate the fact that he's just doing as the
19 Governor has asked.

20 You know, today on this floor we
21 approved a bill to give the Rochester school
22 system \$125 million not on budget. We've given
23 away countless millions of dollars. But when it
24 comes to the City of Dunkirk, we're going to have
25 the Kathy Hochul Loan Shark Bill passed here

1 today. Because that's what this is.

2 Kathy Hochul is going to lend the
3 City of Dunkirk, at usury rates -- for a
4 municipality, at least -- \$13 million over
5 15 years that's going to create an obligation of
6 \$1.5 million a year for a city that only takes in
7 less than 10 million in taxes.

8 And who are these people in the City
9 of Dunkirk? As I mentioned before, it is a
10 majority-minority community where one in five
11 households don't speak English as their first
12 language, where the average income is \$49,000 a
13 year. Where they just suffered an 84 percent
14 property tax increase. Where they have totally
15 ignored the requests of the Fiscal Recovery Act
16 that we passed a year ago. And where the
17 comptroller himself is beside himself because
18 they can't even get basic accounting answers from
19 Dunkirk.

20 So what is the solution? Well, the
21 solution that I provided and that my colleague
22 Assemblyman Molitor provided, was to create a
23 control board which could actually bond at a
24 reasonable rate. A bridge loan could have been
25 given to the City of Dunkirk, I would expect at

1 zero percent until the control board was up and
2 running -- because God knows we can give away
3 \$100 million to the Rochester School District,
4 but we can't give \$13 million to the City of
5 Dunkirk to stop that municipal bankruptcy that
6 you're very concerned about.

7 So what's this about? This is about
8 the fact that just like any other situation,
9 where you have someone come to you that has
10 fallen on hard times and needs to borrow some
11 money, and you lend them some money. And then
12 they don't actually -- you know, they don't pay
13 you back, they don't tell you what's going on,
14 they haven't changed what they have done, and
15 they come back to you for some more money.

16 Most people want to know, what have
17 you done to make sure this doesn't happen again?
18 But that question is not being asked in Dunkirk.
19 No. What's being said is: We'll give it to you,
20 but at a much higher rate. Because they can't
21 get a traditional kind of loan.

22 The Kathy Hochul payday loan store
23 is open, and that's what we got, a payday loan
24 from Governor Kathy Hochul to the City of Dunkirk
25 at a high rate that's going to reduce their

1 annual revenues by \$1.5 million and increase the
2 chances that they're actually probably going to
3 default, with no changes whatsoever. They can't
4 even get an answer to the question of "Can you
5 certify the debt that you have?"

6 Do I want to see the City of Dunkirk
7 go bankrupt? Absolutely not. But I do want to
8 see some accountability and some transparency,
9 and that's currently not happening.

10 And who is it hurting? The
11 12,000 residents, a quarter of which live in
12 poverty, that just saw their taxes double.
13 That's who this is hurting. And what's Kathy
14 Hochul's solution? Here's a high-rate loan
15 that's guaranteed by money that you can't afford
16 to lose, your AIM funding. That's what this is
17 going to do.

18 If this was a good deal for Dunkirk,
19 I would have carried it. If this was a good deal
20 for Dunkirk, the city council would have
21 supported it. If this was a good deal for
22 Dunkirk, hundreds of people would have not called
23 the sponsor's office to tell him, Don't do it.

24 And by the way, no other members of
25 the Western New York delegation within a

1 hundred miles of the City of Dunkirk would carry
2 this bill. That should tell you something as
3 well.

4 The Governor has a lot of resources
5 at her disposal. She's used none of them for the
6 City of Dunkirk. And if you want to see a payday
7 loan scheme on the majority-minority community of
8 the City of Dunkirk that they can't afford, then
9 you vote yes on this bill.

10 If you want to do something good for
11 the City of Dunkirk, we should have passed my
12 bill to provide some accountability with a
13 control board and to stop the madness in the City
14 of Dunkirk. I'll be voting no, and I would
15 certainly appreciate and encourage all of my
16 colleagues to do the same.

17 Thank you, Madam President.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
19 you.

20 Senator Martins. Senator Martins?
21 (Senator Martins shaking head.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Are
23 there any other Senators wishing to be heard?

24 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
25 closed. The Secretary will ring the bell.

1 Read the last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
10 Calendar 1948, voting in the negative are
11 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
12 Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins,
13 Mattera, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo,
14 Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber
15 and Weik.

16 Ayes, 38. Nays, 21.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
18 is passed.

19 Senator Gianaris.

20 SENATOR GIANARIS: Next we're going
21 to take up Calendar 953, please, by
22 Senator Krueger.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
24 Secretary will read.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1953, Senate Print 8421, by Senator Krueger, an
2 act to amend the Public Service Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
4 Mattera, why do you rise?

5 SENATOR MATTERA: Madam President,
6 it's great to see you up there.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Great to
8 see you.

9 SENATOR MATTERA: And Senator
10 Krueger, I guess we're going to have another
11 round doing this again. I thought I was going to
12 hear some really good news that we weren't going
13 to see this this year.

14 Can you do me a favor, can you
15 explain why we -- excuse me. Would
16 Senator Krueger please yield for a couple of
17 questions, please.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
19 Krueger, do you yield?

20 SENATOR KRUEGER: I certainly
21 yield, yes.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
23 Senator yields.

24 SENATOR MATTERA: Yes. And thank
25 you so much again, Senator Krueger.

1 Give me a heads up, like why did we
2 change the name, the New York HEAT Act we had,
3 now it's called the Customer Savings and
4 Reliability Act. Is there a reason for this
5 change?

6 SENATOR KRUEGER: There is,
7 Madam President. First off, we've actually
8 changed quite a few things in the bill. But one
9 of the things that was confusing to people was
10 they didn't quite understand what the New York
11 HEAT Act was under that name. So we decided we
12 would make it clear that this bill will offer
13 customer savings and reliability for energy going
14 forward.

15 But that's obviously not the only
16 change in this bill. There's quite a few changes
17 in the bill, and I'm assuming you're going to ask
18 me questions about it. And I look forward to
19 answering.

20 SENATOR MATTERA: Through you,
21 Madam President, would the sponsor continue to
22 yield, please.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
24 sponsor yield?

25 SENATOR KRUEGER: I do.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
2 sponsor yields.

3 SENATOR MATTERA: Exactly how is
4 this bill going to protect all New York
5 ratepayers, many of who rely on clean natural gas
6 for their homes and businesses? You know, we
7 talked about this a lot. You said in the bill
8 that the customers affected by the neighborhood
9 gas transition projects have continued access to
10 safe and reliable energy services for heating,
11 cooling, cooking and water heating.

12 Senator Krueger, what are those
13 reliable energy services? What -- what are we
14 looking at that changes and that our customers
15 have to change their lives because of bills that
16 are unfunded-mandate bills like this?

17 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
18 Madam President. Right now, customers don't have
19 choice. Most of them are forced to be on gas as
20 the costs of gas and oil continue to grow and are
21 usually out of the control of them as customers,
22 us as a state, or even the United States of
23 America.

24 I just want to point out from
25 memory, two years ago at the very end of session

1 we were also debating very important bills on the
2 environment and alternative directions in energy.
3 And that was the day that when you looked outside
4 your window, the sky was yellow and terrifying.
5 I know my colleague remembers.

6 Well, today the skies aren't as
7 yellow, but the data shows the fire impacts in
8 Canada, as we speak sending their fumes across
9 New York State, are actually more dangerous
10 although less colorful than two years ago. The
11 crisis grows. Literally, we're on fire.

12 I know that was just used as a
13 reference for Dunkirk, but it's beyond Dunkirk.

14 And so we need to move forward with
15 the process that has been held up of providing
16 for options to transition from gas/oil to other
17 kinds of more reliable, far less costly energy.
18 And that's what this bill does.

19 It lays out a complete plan for the
20 state to transition, with participation at the
21 community and neighborhood level, at the
22 guarantee that nobody will be taken off of oil
23 and gas until there's an alternative available to
24 them and people have signed off on that, of
25 ensuring that we're decreasing the amount of

1 money we're spending building more pipes into
2 areas where we know already through other laws
3 we've passed, like the All-Electric Buildings
4 Law, we aren't going to need the pipes.

5 So it does save money. It does
6 increase opportunities and choices for consumers
7 throughout the state. It does require their
8 participation. And it also requires the
9 participation of their utility companies, who
10 even in this version of the bill have the choice
11 of opting out.

12 Through you, Madam President, I
13 believe I've answered.

14 SENATOR MATTERA: Thank you.

15 Madam President, would the sponsor
16 continue to yield, please.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
18 sponsor yield?

19 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes, I do.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
21 sponsor yields.

22 SENATOR MATTERA: Senator Krueger,
23 you keep on saying that it's going to save money.
24 We have residents of New York State leaving here
25 because of this. Our rates are going up right

1 now in all of our districts.

2 How do you -- where are you getting
3 this data from that it's saving New Yorkers money
4 when we have over 2 million residents have left
5 New York State because of unfunded mandates just
6 like this? The utility bills are going up. They
7 are not happy. I am not happy when I have to
8 listen to my constituents.

9 This -- where are you coming up with
10 this data? Please, everybody needs to know.
11 New York State residents need to know how is this
12 saving money. Because it's costing trillions of
13 dollars -- wind, solar and especially battery
14 storage, which is nothing but an experiment. And
15 it's just really gouging us, that we're leaving,
16 there's a reason why we're leaving.

17 And if you could tell me that, in
18 other words, we have residents that are staying
19 because they're saving money, we would all love
20 to hear this.

21 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
22 Madam President. New Yorkers are paying some of
23 the highest utility bills in the country, we
24 don't disagree. But it's not because we are
25 trying to transition off of oil and gas, it's

1 because we aren't doing enough.

2 The costs that are being referenced
3 are being charged by the utility companies to us,
4 the ratepayers, to do upgrading of gas and oil
5 pipes at an incredible cost per year, billions
6 and billions of dollars required to upgrade oil
7 and gas pipes that in fact we shouldn't even be
8 planning to use for the future.

9 Because of solar, wind, thermal,
10 there are some up-front costs for infrastructure.
11 But the research shows that we are already saving
12 money in a very rapid time when we transition.
13 And the truth is the kilowatt hour cost of
14 energy, particularly from solar and geothermal,
15 quickly reduces to almost zero.

16 So people who have already
17 transitioned are actually saving significant
18 amounts of money on their monthly utility bills.
19 And the truth is the utilities keep asking us for
20 more money, and that will be paid for by
21 ratepayers unless we can shift the dynamic and
22 move further towards alternative energy.

23 And you know what, it's working and
24 it's saving money. Just ask someone who's
25 shifted already, who's transitioned into solar or

1 geothermal or actually wind. They are saving a
2 lot of money per month on their utilities.

3 And yet the estimate is that because
4 we haven't changed even just the one section of
5 this bill, the 100-foot rule, every new mile of
6 gas pipeline is costing an average of \$3 million
7 to \$6 million, 60,000 per customer on that line,
8 all being subsidized by existing ratepayers.

9 In this bill the transition cost of
10 infrastructure will have to be picked up by the
11 utilities, not the ratepayers. So this is a
12 solution to the problem.

13 But I don't disagree, we have a
14 problem.

15 SENATOR MATTERA: Madam President,
16 would the sponsor still continue to yield,
17 please.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the
19 sponsor yield?

20 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
22 sponsor yields.

23 SENATOR MATTERA: And you still --
24 again, Senator Krueger, you didn't answer the
25 question where are you getting your data from and

1 your reports from.

2 How can we pass this now with NYISO
3 raising warnings about capacity and calling for
4 the repowering of fossil fuel generation
5 statewide?

6 SENATOR KRUEGER: Madam President,
7 through you. I think the question is how are we
8 going to do it if we don't have the capacity on
9 the grid.

10 And the answer is then we won't.
11 Because this whole plan is based on step-by-step
12 integration between the communities, the
13 utilities, and our state regulators. This is not
14 an overnight plan. This is literally a multiyear
15 process.

16 So no one's going to be forced into
17 a situation where we don't have the transmission
18 grid that's necessary and the reliability built
19 in.

20 SENATOR MATTERA: Through you,
21 Madam President, will the sponsor continue to
22 yield.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
24 sponsor yield?

25 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
2 sponsor yields.

3 SENATOR MATTERA: So then,
4 Senator Krueger, are you talking about that we're
5 going to do a pause after 2030, the year 2030?
6 Because we have a mandate right now to do away
7 with natural gas. So are you saying right now
8 that we're going to be having a pause in any way?

9 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
10 Madam President. I just want a clarification. I
11 believe Senator Mattera is referencing the
12 All-Electric Building requirements by 2030.

13 This is not that bill. It does not
14 actually affect that law. So I just want a
15 clarification.

16 SENATOR MATTERA: Through you,
17 Madam President, will the sponsor continue to
18 yield.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
20 sponsor yield?

21 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
23 sponsor yields.

24 SENATOR MATTERA: The CLCPA
25 mandates obviously after 2030 to eliminate pretty

1 much all natural gas. That is in the mandate
2 with the CLCPA.

3 So right now with the CLCPA it shows
4 right here -- with the PSC, excuse me, that in
5 other words since the inception of the CLCPA
6 that -- through 2023 that the bills have
7 increased, residential customers' bills have
8 increased close to 10 percent more since the
9 CLCPA's inception. Because of the CLCPA.

10 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
11 Madam President. The CLCPA is a law that then
12 had a scoping plan and a plan and target dates.
13 Implementation, we are at the very beginning.

14 So there's nothing in CLCPA that is
15 actually causing rates to go up. In fact, it's
16 the opposite. The rates are going up because
17 we're not taking the actions to get off of oil
18 and gas as quickly as possible. And I don't
19 believe the CLCPA mandates no gas by 2030. I
20 don't think that is correct. In fact, the CLCPA
21 is very explicit that there's a requirement for
22 reliability before there's any step-by-step
23 transition off of oil and gas. Although that is
24 our target goal.

25 And the good news is our agencies

1 don't even need to come back to us, the
2 Legislature, if we're running behind. It's
3 within their purview and authority to say our
4 target dates have to be extended. But that is
5 not, again, that particularly relevant to the
6 legislation before us.

7 SENATOR MATTERA: Madam President,
8 would the sponsor continue to yield, please.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
10 sponsor yield?

11 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
13 sponsor yields.

14 SENATOR MATTERA: So, Senator, do
15 you feel that the PSC report from 2003 is wrong,
16 it's not correct?

17 MINORITY COUNSEL: 2023.

18 SENATOR KRUEGER: Did he say 2003?

19 SENATOR MATTERA: '23.

20 SENATOR KRUEGER: You said '23, I'm
21 so sorry.

22 And which report are you
23 referencing?

24 SENATOR MATTERA: To the PSC, the
25 PSC report that was --

1 SENATOR KRUEGER: Well, they put
2 out a lot of reports, so give me a little more.

3 Sorry, through you, Madam President.
4 Which PSC report are we talking about, and what
5 is it saying?

6 SENATOR MATTERA: This is the first
7 annual report that -- from the PSC. On the
8 implementation of the Climate Leadership and
9 Community Protection Act.

10 And it shows that, in other words,
11 since the CLCPA's inception that, in other words,
12 rates have gone up 10 percent because of this.

13 So do you feel again that -- you're
14 saying they're saving money. But how is it
15 saving money when our rates are going up?
16 Because of -- just because of things just like
17 your bill. And now we're going to be talking
18 about the hundred-foot rule next, because we're
19 going to have a debate on that one next. And I
20 just don't -- really, New Yorkers need to
21 understand that it's costing them more because of
22 these unfunded mandates.

23 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
24 Madam President. The plan within the CLCPA does
25 not have any new mandates that have gone into

1 increasing the utility costs for customers.

2 We are on a system that we've been
3 on for, I don't know, a hundred years where the
4 costs keep going up because the costs of oil and
5 gas keep going up. The system of pipes which are
6 quite old are requiring massive rebuilding at an
7 incredible cost. And so those costs are real.

8 That is why we need to make these
9 changes so that we can actually finally start to
10 reverse the pattern of increasing utility costs.
11 And there's nothing that the PSC has put out that
12 says the reason our utility costs are going up is
13 because of the CLCPA or transition to alternative
14 energy.

15 In fact, the research -- PSC,
16 NYSERDA, national organizations, international
17 organizations -- is that as you move off of old
18 systems of oil and gas, you move into cheaper,
19 more reliable, and far, far less toxic options.
20 So it's our failure to move that's increasing our
21 utility costs.

22 And let's not forget a huge amount
23 of the oil and gas costs are driven by
24 international policies that have driven up, on an
25 international level, the costs of oil and gas.

1 It's not a law that we passed in New York State
2 saying we should be moving forward.

3 We need laws like that so that
4 this -- so that we can move forward. This is a
5 bill to provide a transitional plan in a rational
6 way to move off of oil and gas into alternative
7 forms of energy. It will need to be coordinated
8 on a regional level with utilities, at the
9 community level, even down to the neighborhood
10 level. No one will have their gas shut down
11 unless there's in fact an alternative plan that
12 is reliable and cheaper.

13 And the infrastructure costs to get
14 from this to where we need to go will be picked
15 up by utilities, not the ratepayers.

16 SENATOR MATTERA: Through you,
17 Madam President, would the sponsor continue to
18 yield, please.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
20 sponsor yield?

21 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
23 sponsor yields.

24 SENATOR MATTERA: So do you feel,
25 Senator Krueger, that the infrastructure costs to

1 electrify compared to retooling our existing
2 power plants, do you feel that the infrastructure
3 costs are less or more to retrofit?

4 SENATOR KRUEGER: So this bill,
5 Madam President, actually requires cost
6 efficiencies. So in order to transition in any
7 specific area, that would actually have to be
8 proved, that it is more cost-efficient.

9 What we do know right now is that
10 the utilities keep coming to us for rate
11 increases at very disturbing numbers because of
12 their claim that they need to retrofit and
13 upgrade the existing system, which -- again, at
14 mind-bogglingly expensive costs.

15 This bill requires that as we
16 transition there will have to be a basis to show
17 that the costs of the transition are
18 cost-efficient and justified based on the demand
19 in the area, the other alternatives in the area,
20 and the participation at the community level,
21 with the cooperation of the utilities.

22 SENATOR MATTERA: Through you,
23 Madam President, would the sponsor continue to
24 yield, please.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the

1 sponsor yield?

2 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
4 sponsor yields.

5 SENATOR MATTERA: You know -- and I
6 will get you that, by the way, that PSC -- if you
7 would like to see that, that report. Because it
8 is a true report. I am not just making that up,
9 by the way.

10 I do have a bill that's out. I was
11 just wondering if you, as a climate action cost
12 council, that would be aboard, that will show all
13 of our residents the cost that it would cost them
14 to transition from natural gas to electric. Is
15 that something that you'd be interested in
16 looking at?

17 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
18 Madam President. I'm always happy to look at any
19 bill that any member submits. I suspect we're
20 not going to get to that this year, given the
21 hour and the day.

22 But the fact is, and I just want to
23 clarify, you're referencing PSC reports.
24 Anything that happens when this bill passes has
25 to meet PSC approval. So we're not taking PSC or

1 their knowledge base or their research out of the
2 formula. They are front and center of having to
3 agree to any steps that are taken within this
4 law.

5 SENATOR MATTERA: Through you,
6 Madam President, would the sponsor still continue
7 to yield.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
9 sponsor yield?

10 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
12 sponsor yields.

13 SENATOR MATTERA: You know what was
14 upsetting to me that wasn't in this bill -- and
15 we had this discussion also too, me being with a
16 background with plumbing. You know, we have
17 plumbers, pipefitters, utility workers that are
18 very, very concerned about this. We have over
19 50,000, with the contractors, of these workers
20 that in other words are there for us every day.

21 And next thing you know there is
22 nothing that -- I mean, I thought I was going to
23 see something about there was going to be
24 something there for educating these workers.
25 Because now their careers are in jeopardy, and

1 they really want to know.

2 And I got actually a text message
3 from a union delegate at a Local 1 saying that,
4 please, ask Senator Krueger, what are we doing
5 about these jobs? We thought that you were going
6 to maybe put something in this bill that was
7 going to educate all these workers and their
8 families that are going to be losing their jobs.

9 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
10 Madam President. We have discussed this before.
11 We discussed it in the earlier version of
12 New York HEAT. But I will just repeat and
13 clarify again. Most people working on the gas
14 system today will still be working on it until
15 they retire. This is a transitional process.
16 It's not overnight.

17 (Reading.) CSRA opens the door to
18 new jobs for gas utility workers building thermal
19 energy networks and working on the other
20 neighborhood-scale transitions, including
21 specific language to ensure those jobs have good
22 labor standards.

23 CSRA is critical to building a
24 unionized decarbonized workforce of the future.
25 And there has been much research about the

1 increased number of jobs that will be available
2 in building a green infrastructure and working it
3 into the future.

4 So unions may have workers with
5 different job descriptions, but they will have
6 workers. And we are working to make sure they
7 will have good unionized jobs in the green
8 economy that we have no choice but to move into.

9 SENATOR MATTERA: Through you,
10 Madam President, would the sponsor continue to
11 yield, please.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the
13 sponsor yield?

14 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

15 SENATOR MATTERA: So how do you
16 feel like the --

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
18 sponsor yields.

19 SENATOR MATTERA: Oh, I'm sorry.

20 How do you feel that the IBEW is
21 opposed to this bill? I mean, and to go and look
22 at all different, you know, contractors and other
23 unions -- and non-union -- that are opposed to
24 this bill. I mean, have you had any discussions
25 with any of these organizations -- union,

1 nonunion -- at all?

2 SENATOR KRUEGER: Absolutely.

3 SENATOR MATTERA: Really.

4 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
5 Madam President. There are many unions who do
6 support transition to the green economy and
7 recognize that as long as we build into our laws
8 protections, that we continue to have union
9 labor, they understand that the job descriptions
10 for people they represent will be changing and
11 transitioning over decades, but there will be no
12 reduction in union workers.

13 And there are some unions who oppose
14 and I do think it is because -- I don't want to
15 speak for them, and they're not in the room to
16 share with us -- they get concerned that they
17 don't see the storyline where the workers have
18 the new jobs, and they're very comfortable with
19 the model they have.

20 I get it. If you're a gas-pipe
21 layer or repair person, you think that's your
22 job. And we're assuring people, and it will be,
23 because the life -- how do I put it. The number
24 of years that the average worker in these unions
25 works is such that there will still be work for

1 them through the end of their careers.

2 But if their son or their daughter
3 or their niece or nephew or their neighbor
4 decides to go into this kind of energy work in
5 the future, they'll probably have a different job
6 description. Maybe with the exact same union.

7 SENATOR MATTERA: Through you,
8 Madam President, would the sponsor continue to
9 yield, please?

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
11 sponsor yield?

12 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
14 sponsor yields.

15 SENATOR MATTERA: So you are
16 guaranteeing all these workers that are going to
17 be losing their jobs, you're going to be
18 guaranteeing them a position to have a different
19 career change and you will be working with every
20 single one of these hardworking men and women of
21 labor?

22 SENATOR KRUEGER: So through you,
23 Madam President, just to give an example -- no,
24 before I give the example. Again, nobody's
25 coming and taking your jobs away now. We're

1 talking about transitioning over an extensive
2 number of years. So you will, I believe, remain
3 in the job you have now and may likely be of
4 retirement age before you even want to explore
5 retraining for some variation on that job.

6 But New York's planning for that
7 because in this budget that we passed in -- was
8 it July? June. We're still in June. Sorry, was
9 -- it was May? The one that was 40 days late?
10 So I'm losing track of the date. We actually put
11 funds in for the New York State pipe trades
12 industry to establish solar/thermal technology
13 training, 344,000 reappropriated for exactly that
14 purpose.

15 So New York State not only is aware
16 that we're going to need to help invest in making
17 sure that some people will need retraining and
18 that they can get it. We're already ahead of
19 this legislation by putting money in the budget
20 to do that.

21 SENATOR MATTERA: Just one more
22 question. Through you, Madam President, would
23 the sponsor continue to yield.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
25 sponsor yield?

1 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes, I do.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
3 sponsor yields.

4 SENATOR MATTERA: Senator Krueger,
5 do you have any kind of a number to -- that -- to
6 retro -- the grid, to the infrastructure, the
7 grid is antiquated on Long Island and all of
8 New York State. There was a number that was out
9 there. And who would that cost actually go to?

10 I was told at a committee meeting,
11 because I had to finally get it out of the
12 Energy Committee meeting that the cost is finally
13 going to go to the ratepayer. The ratepayer will
14 be paying for this.

15 And to retro -- to -- how can I put
16 this -- the grid, to expand on the grid, to do
17 electrification, what kind of number do you think
18 you would put on something like that for New York
19 State? Because I remember with the CLCPA they
20 actually had a number of \$270 billion. That
21 wouldn't even cover the City of New York.

22 So do you have like any kind of a
23 number?

24 And again, who would be paying for
25 that? Because now if we're going to go

1 all-electric, especially on Long Island, the grid
2 is antiquated, that it needs to -- it needs to be
3 revamped before we can move forward.

4 And this is something that -- is
5 this going to hurt everything that we are trying
6 to do here?

7 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
8 Madam President. New York utility payers are
9 already paying for all the infrastructure costs
10 of our system, whether it's electric grid -- grid
11 or oil and gas pipes. And in fact, with oil and
12 gas pipes, they are costing, as I referenced
13 before, every ratepayer an enormous amount of
14 money. That's already the storyline.

15 Now, are we talking about expanding
16 the electric grid instead of oil and gas? We
17 are. Well, here's the good news. One, we have
18 to anyway. There's constant repair and upgrading
19 done for the electric grid. And so, yes, we're
20 paying for it now even if we never had
21 conversations like this. There's electric grid
22 repairs and upgrading that are needed. More and
23 more of the business world is using more and more
24 energy, hence requiring an expanded grid, which
25 we are all paying for.

1 And the good news is upgrading the
2 energy grid for electricity is actually cheaper
3 than upgrading and redoing and expanding oil and
4 gas infrastructure. So it's a little bit of a
5 savings just if we did nothing as we need more
6 energy. But again, with electric, electricity,
7 once you've shifted to a more sustainable model,
8 the kilowatt hour costs are radically lower. And
9 there is no documentation that the cost of oil
10 and gas is going to go down anytime in the
11 future. In fact, just the opposite. It keeps
12 going up all the time.

13 SENATOR MATTERA: And on the bill.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
15 Mattera on the bill.

16 SENATOR MATTERA: And I thank you,
17 Senator Krueger.

18 Again, I just want to let all
19 New Yorkers understand what is going on over here
20 to eliminate natural gas. There's a reason why
21 we have over 2 million residents of New York
22 State that are exiting out of our great state
23 because of mandates, unfunded mandates just like
24 this. And we're going to be having another
25 discussion, because the hundred-foot rule was

1 taken out of this, so now we have another bill
2 because we aren't happy that that was taken out
3 of the HEAT Act. Now we have a new name. And
4 you know what? We're just continuing, continuing
5 to hurt all of our residents in New York State.

6 You know what, dare we sit there and
7 say that it's not going to cost anything to
8 retrofit our grid. That's going to be on the
9 backs of all New Yorkers, because we're telling
10 all New Yorkers, guess what, you can't have
11 natural gas in your lives anymore. That's what
12 we're doing. We did that with the all-electric
13 bill that this came out, that people are losing
14 jobs with that. We could sit there and say, Oh,
15 guess what, they're going to age out and we're
16 going to make sure now that everybody's going to
17 be becoming an electrician.

18 And again, New Yorkers want better.
19 New Yorkers want to have their natural gas. Very
20 important. We need to go -- and, yes, care about
21 renewable energies for the future. We need to
22 make sure that we retool our existing power
23 plants. That's the most efficient way and most
24 economical way to retool our existing power
25 plants for carbon capture. That's what we need

1 to do to protect our atmosphere.

2 But right now everybody has to
3 understand something. By not bringing in the
4 Constitution Pipeline and not bringing in the
5 NESE pipeline, which is very, very important for
6 the future of New York State, but it's okay that
7 we have frozen natural gas on our roadways -- and
8 I had to go to the Governor and had to explain
9 that to her, to say do you realize that we have
10 natural gas, frozen natural gas up and down our
11 roadways -- guess what, we're on our roadways,
12 guess what, carbon going far up into the
13 atmosphere, using energy to liquify it so we have
14 to pump it into the system.

15 Because we are trying to do whatever
16 we have to do to eliminate natural gas, which
17 70 percent of New Yorkers want. And I hope
18 Senator Krueger talked to those 70 percent of
19 people, because they want natural gas in our
20 lives. All-electric is going to cost everybody
21 so much money with their utility bills that are
22 going up, way -- 10 times? It's going to be a
23 lot more than 10 times.

24 And you know what? That means how
25 many more people are going to be exiting out of

1 New York State like it is right now. Again,
2 Tennessee, Florida, Texas, even South Dakota, the
3 Carolinas -- that's where everybody is moving to.
4 Our great New York taxpayer is leaving because of
5 bills just like this.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
7 you, Senator. Senator, just to let you know,
8 you've exceeded your time.

9 SENATOR MATTERA: And I vote no.
10 Thank you. Thank you,
11 Madam President.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
13 you, Senator.

14 Senator Walczyk, why do you rise?

15 SENATOR WALCZYK: Madam President,
16 I was hoping the sponsor would yield for some
17 more questions.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the
19 sponsor yield?

20 SENATOR KRUEGER: I shall.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
22 sponsor yields.

23 SENATOR WALCZYK: So under this
24 legislation the PSC will be forced to create a
25 gas decommissioning plan. In this bill, that's

1 within two years. And your bill calls, on
2 page -- is that correct?

3 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through -- oh,
4 hello, Mr. President. We had a gender change
5 suddenly. Hello.

6 So no, it's not within two years,
7 it's in any specific community there's at least
8 two years of a planning process.

9 And in fact this bill doesn't
10 require PSC to end use of gas/oil. Various
11 sections of other bills we have passed -- CLCPA,
12 All-Electric, move us towards less usage of
13 gas/oil. But this bill not only doesn't do that,
14 just to clarify from my -- your previous
15 colleague, it's not a mandate, because you can
16 opt out. A mandate is you got to do it. Nothing
17 in this bill says you got to do it.

18 So I just wanted to clarify that
19 also.

20 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
21 Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
22 yield.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Does the
24 sponsor yield?

25 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
2 sponsor yields.

3 SENATOR WALCZYK: I think we'll
4 probably circle around to the mandate and the
5 opt-out in a minute. But first I want to focus
6 on the decommissioning plan. On page 1, line 10,
7 your bill says it will be -- has to remain
8 orderly, affordable, and equitable when we're
9 right-sizing our gas utilities.

10 What is the definition of
11 "affordable" for purposes of this section?

12 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
13 Madam -- oh, I'm so sorry. I was so used to the
14 "Madam President."

15 Through you, Mr. President,
16 "affordable" is always an interesting question.
17 But PSC, in existing regulation, clarifies that
18 no household should have to be paying more than
19 6 percent of their income towards utilities. So
20 that is the PSC target.

21 When you're asking the question can
22 we meet that target through reforms and
23 transition of the CSRA, I believe that the PSC
24 will probably use that as the measurement. But
25 we don't require them to define for us what the

1 measurement is. That is up to them.

2 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
3 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
4 yield?

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
6 sponsor yield?

7 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
9 sponsor yields.

10 SENATOR WALCZYK: So that
11 definition won't be in statute, there's not a
12 definition of "affordable" in this bill?

13 SENATOR KRUEGER: No. We decided
14 that we should leave that up to PSC and that
15 there was already language in PSC regulation.

16 SENATOR WALCZYK: And through you,
17 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
18 yield?

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
20 sponsor yield?

21 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
23 sponsor yields.

24 SENATOR WALCZYK: What do you mean
25 by the word "equitable" in this section? Page 1,

1 line 10.

2 SENATOR KRUEGER: So that section
3 of the bill references regional equity and
4 fairness in the delivery of services in
5 transition. So we want to make sure that
6 low-income communities have their needs addressed
7 as well as higher-income communities.

8 There are communities that are made
9 up of many more new construction, which have more
10 options to them than some communities that might
11 have -- I think I was just talking to one
12 legislator about if the average house was built
13 in the 1890s we'd have a very different set of
14 situations than if you're talking about large,
15 new, multi-family-dwelling buildings.

16 So that's the meaning of equity in
17 that section.

18 SENATOR WALCZYK: And through you,
19 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
20 yield?

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
22 sponsor yield?

23 SENATOR KRUEGER: Indeed.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
25 sponsor yields.

1 SENATOR WALCZYK: So you say in
2 this bill that utilities have to generate savings
3 and redirect resources to help consumers
4 electrify. Where do they get the money?

5 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
6 Mr. President, there's a combination of options.

7 So we don't say they have to. The
8 utility actually has the option to opt out in
9 this legislation. I think most utilities won't,
10 but we don't know yet.

11 But -- so if utilities don't opt out
12 and choose to participate, I think actually it's
13 because they think it's advantageous to modernize
14 and move off of oil and gas, that they understand
15 when they are agreeing to participate that they
16 have to pick up the new infrastructure costs for
17 a transition. But they're calculating that into
18 what they won't have to do anymore, which is
19 continue to build a gas/oil pipe system or
20 upgrade and spend a fortune on the modernization
21 of old gas/oil pipes.

22 So it is really left up to
23 negotiation between the utility and
24 Public Service Commission to figure out what
25 model would work best for them, because it will

1 be different in different, literally,
2 neighborhoods of the state.

3 And that's why this bill focuses
4 heavily on regional participation and planning.
5 Which is why the two-year question is not some
6 two-year-and-drop-dead timeline, but rather when
7 a utility and an area say, We want to go down
8 this road together with the PSC, that starts a
9 two-year planning process.

10 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
11 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
12 yield.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
14 sponsor yield?

15 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
17 sponsor yields.

18 SENATOR WALCZYK: Yet when you talk
19 about generating savings and redirecting
20 resources, though, you're talking about the
21 utility actually working to insulate and buy
22 equipment for someone to electrify their home.
23 Right? Isn't that what the purpose of that
24 section is?

25 SENATOR KRUEGER: (Conferring.)

1 Through you, Mr. President. So when the utility
2 decides they're going to go down this path and
3 they're going to participate in a shifting and a
4 transition, let's say of a group of homes in a
5 community from being on oil/gas to alternatives,
6 yes, they have to work to make sure that they are
7 covering the costs of bringing that energy into
8 the home and then, with coordination with PSC,
9 NYSERDA, other state programs, making sure that
10 the homeowner or building owner, if it's a
11 multi-family dwelling, have the resources to
12 potentially upgrade the internal system in the
13 building, upgrade appliances, transition from gas
14 appliances to non-gas appliances, et cetera.

15 SENATOR WALCZYK: And through you,
16 Mr. President, will the sponsor continue to
17 yield.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
19 sponsor yield?

20 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
22 sponsor yields.

23 SENATOR WALCZYK: So same question,
24 where do they get the money for that?

25 SENATOR KRUEGER: The utilities get

1 the money primarily from the same way they get it
2 now, us as ratepayers. But they are making the
3 decision to shift, not paying for the old system
4 and paying for the new system instead.

5 And again, if it's not
6 cost-efficient for them to do this, they probably
7 won't be agreeing to do this in that specific
8 area.

9 SENATOR WALCZYK: Thank you.

10 Through you, Mr. President, would
11 the sponsor continue to yield.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
13 sponsor yield?

14 SENATOR KRUEGER: Indeed.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
16 sponsor yields.

17 SENATOR WALCZYK: Yup, ratepayers
18 was the answer that I was looking for there.

19 On neighborhoods or areas, you
20 mentioned that they're going to actually vote on
21 whether they would transition as a neighborhood
22 or as an area. How would that election run?

23 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
24 Mr. President. Yes, in order for a utility to
25 move forward with the PSC for a transition plan

1 for a specific area, they have to get agreement
2 from at least 50 percent of the people living
3 there currently.

4 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
5 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
6 yield.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
8 sponsor yield?

9 SENATOR KRUEGER: Okay, 50 percent
10 of the gas customers living there currently.
11 There might be people off of gas already.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Does the
13 sponsor yield?

14 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes, of course.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
16 sponsor yields.

17 SENATOR WALCZYK: Who runs that
18 election, that vote?

19 SENATOR KRUEGER: The utility and
20 Public Service Commission will go together to
21 make sure that they have confirmation. I don't
22 know that there's anything laying out a specific
23 voting process here.

24 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
25 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to

1 yield.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
3 sponsor yield?

4 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
6 sponsor yields.

7 SENATOR WALCZYK: But it would just
8 be a simple majority, so 50 percent plus one?

9 SENATOR KRUEGER: Of those on gas,
10 correct.

11 SENATOR WALCZYK: And through you,
12 Mr. President, will the sponsor continue to
13 yield.

14 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
16 sponsor yields.

17 SENATOR WALCZYK: So what if a
18 community decides that they want to keep gas
19 service? Do they keep gas service?

20 SENATOR KRUEGER: (Conferring.)
21 Through you, Mr. President. So before 2030,
22 absolutely, everyone can keep their gas if they
23 wish to.

24 After 2030, if the neighborhood and
25 the community is going through this process and

1 they agree to transition, even then nobody's
2 coming to take away your gas. But the utility
3 very likely wouldn't agree to do new gas into
4 that community.

5 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
6 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
7 yield.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
9 sponsor yield?

10 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
12 sponsor yields.

13 SENATOR WALCZYK: What if a
14 community decides that they want to discontinue
15 gas service by 50 percent plus one, but there's
16 no electric capacity in order to do so? What
17 would happen in those instances?

18 SENATOR KRUEGER: This only works
19 if there is reliability in alternatives.

20 So if there isn't adequate electric
21 or alternatives to gas, then PSC and the utility
22 won't go forward.

23 Now, again, it really varies on the
24 part of the state you live in, because some parts
25 of the state very few people are actually on oil

1 and gas right now. So we're not talking about
2 transitioning them because they're not even in
3 the system.

4 Some people, some communities, there
5 has been much more active participation in moving
6 into, for example, geothermal. Therefore, they
7 are not on gas already.

8 And while I'm not sure I could say
9 that anybody is doing 100 percent solar for
10 private homes for both their heating and their
11 electricity, that could be moving forward as
12 well. And they might end up that they use very,
13 very little oil and gas.

14 So this bill is designed to support
15 a transition that is very focused on ensuring
16 community participation, utility participation,
17 and the recognition that one size does not fit
18 all.

19 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
20 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
21 yield?

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
23 sponsor yield?

24 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The

1 sponsor yields.

2 SENATOR WALCZYK: You keep saying
3 oil. How this does bill affect oil?

4 SENATOR KRUEGER: So I don't know
5 in upstate New York; maybe I should only be
6 saying gas. But in New York City we use a lot of
7 oil-based heaters, heating systems. And so
8 you're talking oil and gas.

9 SENATOR WALCZYK: And through you,
10 Mr. President, will the sponsor continue to
11 yield.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
13 sponsor yield?

14 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
16 sponsor yields.

17 SENATOR KRUEGER: And for some
18 reason I forgot the word "boiler," which is what
19 I wanted to say in the previous sentence. We use
20 oil-driven boilers for heating in our buildings.

21 SENATOR WALCZYK: And I assume,
22 with over 700,000 oil and propane users in
23 New York City, that's what you're referring to.
24 Are those delivered by pipeline and by utilities?
25 Is that why you keep saying "oil"?

1 SENATOR KRUEGER: It really varies.
2 We're a lot like the rest of the state, and
3 almost every building is a different story.
4 Different neighborhoods are different stories.
5 We actually in Manhattan, that I represent, we
6 have a large steam-heat system through pipes
7 underground, so it's neither oil or gas but
8 rather steam.

9 So I would never say that there was
10 one answer even for my own community.

11 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
12 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
13 yield?

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
15 sponsor yield?

16 SENATOR KRUEGER: I do.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
18 sponsor yields.

19 SENATOR WALCZYK: As we speak --
20 and it's nice that you can get these live
21 updates -- 514 New York customers are
22 experiencing a power outage.

23 During blackouts we know that
24 mortality rates increase by 28 percent. And at
25 peak outage last year, over 600,000 New Yorkers

1 lost electric service.

2 Do you know how many New Yorkers
3 died because they lost gas service last year?

4 SENATOR KRUEGER: I'm looking, but
5 I don't think we do.

6 We do know that whenever there's
7 power outages, even under our current system,
8 everything shuts down for people because most of
9 the heating systems, even if they are gas-driven,
10 require electricity to actually function.

11 So I don't even know if you can
12 separate those questions into separate numbers.

13 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
14 Mr. President, will the sponsor continue to
15 yield.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
17 sponsor yield?

18 SENATOR KRUEGER: Of course.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
20 sponsor yields.

21 SENATOR WALCZYK: I can separate
22 them into separate numbers. The number is zero.

23 Did you know that 60 percent of
24 New York households are fueled by natural gas?

25 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,

1 Mr. President, was the word "metro" gas?

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Natural.

3 SENATOR WALCZYK: Natural.

4 SENATOR KRUEGER: Natural gas, I'm
5 so sorry. I want to make sure I heard what you
6 said.

7 I believe I do know that number,
8 yes, sir.

9 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
10 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
11 yield.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
13 sponsor yield?

14 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
16 sponsor yields.

17 SENATOR WALCZYK: Given the
18 mortality rates for blackouts, how many people do
19 you think will die as a result of this
20 transition?

21 SENATOR KRUEGER: I'm hoping no
22 one. I hope no one ever dies from energy
23 problems.

24 But actually huge numbers of people
25 are dying because we haven't transitioned off of

1 toxic forms of energy. Earlier in the day, on a
2 different bill I was referencing, that the
3 scientific research is that 93 percent of cancers
4 that we are getting are environmentally caused.
5 Gas and oil inhalation actually is a cause of
6 serious medical illnesses and deaths,
7 unfortunately. Things that blow up from gas and
8 oil also cause deaths.

9 So can we highlight that some number
10 of people may die in any situation? Yes. But I
11 don't accept the argument that there is greater
12 risk to people's lives if they are using
13 electricity, thermal energy, wind power or solar
14 to provide for themselves and their families than
15 they remain on oil and gas.

16 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
17 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
18 yield.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
20 sponsor yield?

21 SENATOR KRUEGER: I'm sorry. Yes,
22 of course.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
24 sponsor yields.

25 SENATOR WALCZYK: Yeah, it's really

1 an issue of reliability when you're talking about
2 natural gas service versus electric service.

3 The point is that electric service
4 often causes mass blackouts, not as reliable as
5 gas service, which does not black out. There can
6 be small incidents. There's also times where you
7 might be without service for scheduled repairs.
8 But a much more reliable system with pipes that
9 are buried in the ground, and consistent.

10 But I want to move along. Who
11 decides what part of the gas system can receive
12 maintenance or upgrade under this bill? Would
13 that be the utility or would that be the PSC once
14 this is in full effect?

15 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
16 Mr. President. I had another answer to the
17 previous question, so I'll answer that first and
18 then follow up.

19 So while I still don't know exactly
20 how many people might ever die from a blackout,
21 we do have data that 2,000 New Yorkers per year
22 die prematurely because of oil and gas incidents.
23 That's a lot of deaths. I'm not sure we would
24 see that much from blackouts.

25 And the answer to the question of

1 who was responsible for -- did you say
2 continuation or repair on an oil/gas --

3 SENATOR WALCZYK: Yeah, for
4 maintenance or upgrades to the existing natural
5 gas service once this is in effect.

6 SENATOR KRUEGER: The utility of
7 that region, whoever is the utility provider,
8 continues to be responsible.

9 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
10 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
11 yield.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
13 sponsor --

14 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
16 sponsor yields.

17 SENATOR WALCZYK: So the PSC
18 wouldn't be able to decide whether a utility
19 could then upgrade its service or do any
20 maintenance along any of its existing once this
21 is in full effect?

22 SENATOR KRUEGER: So PSC basically
23 works with the utility and the community to set
24 up the program and the model, and it is then the
25 utility's responsibility to make sure that

1 whatever deal has been set up for that area, it's
2 maintained and kept in good functioning order.

3 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
4 Mr. President, if the sponsor will continue to
5 yield.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
7 sponsor yield?

8 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
10 sponsor yields.

11 SENATOR WALCZYK: Largely the PSC
12 was the answer that I was looking for there.

13 Part of identifying an affected
14 region involves looking at the age and health of
15 the gas infrastructure and prioritizing areas
16 where it is in most need of replacement. If the
17 community in the affected region votes not to cut
18 off gas service, could those gas lines still be
19 replaced under this bill?

20 SENATOR KRUEGER: (Conferring.)
21 Through you, Mr. President. This bill doesn't
22 change the current model where, again, before
23 2030 all of this is very much a community-by-
24 community decision about transition.

25 But after 2030, the PSC and

1 utilities continue their existing arrangements,
2 agreements, commitments for major gas lines. So
3 that would be between them and the Public Service
4 Commission.

5 But this law doesn't actually
6 address that question.

7 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
8 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
9 yield.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
11 sponsor yield?

12 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
14 sponsor yields.

15 SENATOR WALCZYK: Well, a little
16 concerned about the timing. Because the New York
17 State Independent Systems Operator has recently
18 raised warnings about capacity and has actually
19 called for the repowering of fossil fuel
20 generating statewide in order to meet the need so
21 that we don't have blackouts in this year, 2025.

22 How can we bring this bill forward,
23 given that recommendation and the fact that the
24 State Energy Plan is being completely redone
25 right now?

1 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
2 Mr. President. NYISO is actually a partner in
3 the decisions that will be made through PSC in
4 coordination with determining do we have adequate
5 energy by area, by need, by source. So we're not
6 overlooking ISO, we are actually saying yes, we
7 are factoring in and making sure.

8 Now, states who have actually moved
9 forward faster than us have also learned the
10 advantages of having multiple options. I know
11 Texas was referenced in an earlier question and
12 answer. Texas, let's face it, it's an oil state.
13 Right? Texas actually is on record as saying the
14 reason we are not having brownouts and blackouts,
15 the reason we are controlling our utility costs
16 better than some other states is because we have
17 such an effective combination of alternative
18 electricity, better electric transmission
19 systems, and we strongly support the moving
20 forward with geothermal, solar and wind.

21 So the great oil state of Texas --
22 and I'm very rarely complimenting Texas, by the
23 way, recently. But the great oil state of Texas
24 is actually saying you all should be doing what
25 we're doing, it's working.

1 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
2 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
3 yield?

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
5 sponsor yield?

6 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
8 sponsor yields.

9 SENATOR WALCZYK: You know, I'll
10 just go back to mortality for a brief second.
11 Not a fun topic. But since you brought up Texas,
12 didn't almost 500 people die when they had a
13 blackout in Texas because their electricity went
14 out because of frozen windmills and such?

15 SENATOR KRUEGER: So it turns out
16 that the blackouts in Texas were caused by a cold
17 front freezing the gas and oil lines, causing the
18 blackout. So I think again it also highlights
19 the dangers of gas and oil.

20 SENATOR WALCZYK: And through you,
21 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
22 yield.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
24 sponsor yield?

25 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
2 sponsor yields.

3 SENATOR WALCZYK: Whatever the
4 cause, it was an electrical blackout and there
5 were close to 500 people dead at the end of that
6 blackout in Texas. Would you agree?

7 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes. And
8 apparently it was caused by gas and oil lines
9 freezing. Hence, if their system hadn't been
10 dependent on the gas/oil lines, I don't know what
11 actually would have happened instead.

12 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
13 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
14 yield?

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
16 sponsor yield?

17 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
19 sponsor yields.

20 SENATOR KRUEGER: I do.

21 SENATOR WALCZYK: The
22 Public Service Commission is supposed to be the
23 expert regulatory authority overseeing this
24 program. They are very familiar with the
25 operation of the utilities they regulate. If a

1 utility wants to opt out, as you were talking
2 about earlier, and the PSC says no -- which I
3 think is probably likely -- if they're issuing
4 the initial order, why is there not a third party
5 to appeal the order to provided in this bill?

6 SENATOR KRUEGER: In this bill PSC
7 does not have the power to tell a utility: You
8 can't opt out. So I don't know what the appeal
9 would be needed for.

10 Oh, excuse me. The utility has to
11 prove they have a reasonable basis. And then PSC
12 can actually say, no, you haven't proved your
13 legitimate basis.

14 So then if I understand your
15 question right, is there a third party that deals
16 with the dispute? I don't actually know what
17 happens now when utilities and the PSC have
18 disputes. I think they probably happen every
19 day.

20 (Conferring.) So the staff make the
21 original decision within PSC, but then the actual
22 Public Service Commission -- which are
23 commissioners, bipartisan, oil/gas involvement,
24 utility involvement -- then would make that final
25 decision if there was a dispute.

1 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
2 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
3 yield.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
5 sponsor yield?

6 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
8 sponsor yields.

9 SENATOR WALCZYK: Yeah, briefly the
10 point was that if the PSC is running the program
11 and you're putting the onus on them to push this
12 entire program, then having them adjudicate
13 whether someone should be able to opt out or not
14 doesn't seem fair.

15 But I do -- I want to turn to
16 another portion of the bill. So in -- I'm
17 looking at page 4, and it's Section 10, so that
18 would be Section 10 under 66-y.

19 SENATOR KRUEGER: I need to get my
20 glasses out. Give me a minute.

21 SENATOR WALCZYK: Sure.

22 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thanks.

23 SENATOR WALCZYK: Earlier you said
24 that the cost would be paid by the utility. But
25 Section 10 here, starting on line 23 says

1 "Programs approved pursuant to this section shall
2 not compromise the ability of the gas corporation
3 to seek to recover prudent, commission-approved
4 investments in infrastructure that was used and
5 useful." What does that mean?

6 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
7 Mr. President. That section of the bill was put
8 in at the request of the utility companies to
9 make sure that they were -- that this law was in
10 line with existing PSC regulations and agreements
11 that have been made.

12 And it's standard in all these deals
13 that they are allowed to recover reasonable and
14 standard amounts for investments.

15 SENATOR WALCZYK: And through you,
16 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
17 yield.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
19 sponsor yield?

20 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
22 sponsor yields.

23 SENATOR WALCZYK: So, in short,
24 when the utility is recovering their cost, that
25 means the ratepayer will be the one that pays?

1 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
2 Mr. President. As we discussed I think several
3 times, pretty much the ratepayer pays for
4 infrastructure for utilities now, under the
5 existing system, and ultimately in the big
6 picture, no matter what system we're using, will
7 also have a share of the cost.

8 And whether we modernize, whether we
9 shift to electric, whether we maximize uses of
10 geothermal and solar and wind, or whether we just
11 stick with oil and gas, that will be reality.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
13 Walczyk, you've got about 30 seconds left for
14 your 30-minute period.

15 SENATOR WALCZYK: Thank you,
16 Mr. President. I'll try and make it snappy.

17 Does your building in Manhattan have
18 natural gas ranges currently?

19 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
20 Mr. President. Yes, my building has natural gas
21 hookups for stoves and perhaps dryers, but we
22 don't heat with natural gas in the building.

23 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
24 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
25 yield?

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
2 sponsor yield?

3 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
5 sponsor yields.

6 SENATOR WALCZYK: Will you be the
7 first to convert in New York State, or are you
8 going to expect others to go forward?

9 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
10 Mr. President. There's a New York City law that
11 actually goes into effect earlier than for the
12 rest of the state requiring the buildings in
13 New York City to transition to -- off of oil and
14 gas into electric. So my building, which is a
15 1929 building, is already exploring how we meet
16 the requirements of that city law.

17 Again, we don't have gas heat, so
18 that's one less concern for my specific building.
19 Again, I live in an area of the city that has a
20 steam system through Con Edison. But we are
21 absolutely talking about other ways we can become
22 more energy-efficient and meet our standards and
23 avoid penalties -- because under the city law,
24 you actually get hit with penalties if you aren't
25 meeting those standards.

1 Is it likely that people won't
2 continue to buy new gas stoves when their old one
3 breaks? Probably. Is there any requirement
4 being placed on my building? And there won't be
5 one in this bill either that says I have to get
6 rid of my gas stove. I have one, because when I
7 moved into the building it had one.

8 I so rarely cook, it never gets
9 turned on, so they might as well take it away
10 anyway. But I think that answers your question.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
12 you, Senator Walczyk.

13 Senator O'Mara, why do you rise?

14 SENATOR O'MARA: Yes, thank you,
15 Mr. President. A lot's been covered here. I
16 have a few questions for the sponsor if she's
17 willing to yield.

18 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
20 sponsor yield?

21 The sponsor yields.

22 SENATOR O'MARA: Senator Krueger,
23 it's kind of like déjà vu from a year ago, that
24 we're in the final day or -- that we did the HEAT
25 Act last year. I don't remember if it was the

1 last day or it was the final couple of days, I
2 believe.

3 SENATOR KRUEGER: Last year around
4 this time, yes, sir.

5 SENATOR O'MARA: And this bill was
6 introduced on March 9th, and we're at March 12th
7 today --

8 SENATOR KRUEGER: No, we're not.

9 SENATOR O'MARA: I'm sorry. June.

10 SENATOR KRUEGER: You're trying to
11 test me, aren't you?

12 (Laughter.)

13 SENATOR O'MARA: No. No. I don't
14 know where I got March from.

15 SENATOR KRUEGER: How about June?

16 SENATOR O'MARA: I'm wishing we
17 went back to March --

18 SENATOR KRUEGER: Okay, fine.

19 SENATOR O'MARA: -- because of all
20 the time we spend here, particularly on the
21 budget.

22 Through you, Mr. President, if the
23 sponsor will yield.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
25 sponsor yield?

1 SENATOR KRUEGER: Indeed.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
3 sponsor yields.

4 SENATOR O'MARA: So the HEAT Act
5 was around for quite a while, and we rammed it
6 through last minute last year. The Assembly did
7 not do it. And now apparently the Assembly's not
8 going to do the HEAT Act again this year, so
9 you've dropped this new bill just three days ago,
10 on June 9th. What time of day was that dropped
11 on the LRS?

12 SENATOR KRUEGER: I have no idea,
13 since I don't work that part of the system. I
14 guess there's a code number that would tell us?
15 Maybe you know the answer?

16 SENATOR O'MARA: Do I know the
17 answer for sure? No.

18 SENATOR KRUEGER: Okay.

19 SENATOR O'MARA: And I'm sure there
20 is a code that says something. But around here
21 clocks sometimes stop around deadlines. And to
22 get it under the three-day window, I'm somewhat
23 surmising that this might have missed that
24 midnight deadline on the 9th.

25 SENATOR KRUEGER: Oh. No, I'm

1 quite sure it did not miss the deadline. And the
2 Assembly and the Senate were in continuing
3 discussions about this revamped NY HEAT Act
4 because we were meeting with all kinds of
5 stakeholders, members of the Legislature who had
6 voiced concern, more in the Assembly than the
7 Senate.

8 And to be quite honest, we were
9 hoping that the Assembly would introduce it
10 before us for some reasons. So that's why there
11 were drafts being worked on for quite a while.
12 But it did get introduced fairly late in session,
13 you're correct.

14 SENATOR O'MARA: Thank you.

15 Mr. President, if the Senator will
16 continue to yield.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
18 sponsor yield?

19 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
21 sponsor yields.

22 SENATOR O'MARA: Can you -- we've
23 been here a long time on this already, and I'm
24 sorry to ask this.

25 SENATOR KRUEGER: Sure.

1 SENATOR O'MARA: But can you --
2 what's the difference between your HEAT Act that
3 for many years has been pending until -- to this
4 one that just dropped three days ago?

5 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you for
6 asking. I was hoping somebody would.

7 Okay. So through you,
8 Mr. President. This -- the changes are there's a
9 regional affordable gas transition plan from the
10 Public Service Commission which must recognize
11 the unique needs of every region in the state.

12 A regional savings and reliability
13 program must include a process for utilities to
14 opt out.

15 Guardrails for regional savings and
16 reliability programs are updated to explicitly
17 clarify that customers will bear no cost for
18 being transitioned off of gas.

19 And difficult-to-electrify
20 industrial or commercial uses, energy-intensive
21 and trade-exposed industries and critical
22 infrastructure will not have service discontinued
23 through these programs.

24 Neighborhood gas transition projects
25 will not proceed unless approved by at least

1 50 percent of affected gas customers after 2030.
2 Prior to 2030, the threshold is 100 percent for
3 affected customers.

4 Language is cut that would have
5 required the PSC to develop a plan for achieving
6 its existing goals to protect customers from
7 bearing an energy burden greater than 6 percent
8 of their income. And we cut that out because
9 that already exists in PSC regulations, and it
10 seemed to be confusing to people to be repeating
11 it in a different section of law.

12 Language that is cut would have
13 required gas utilities to review capital
14 construction plans and examine feasible
15 alternatives and require the participation of
16 overlapping electric utilities. And that was
17 because that was asked to make it easier for
18 them.

19 Language was cut that would have
20 repealed Section 66-b of the Public Service Law
21 which requires the continuation of gas service
22 following demolition.

23 Language was cut that would have
24 limited the expansion of gas service into new
25 service territories -- also a concern we heard.

1 Language was cut that would have
2 repealed Section 66-g of the Public Service Law
3 which requires the purchase of Indigenous natural
4 gas by electric utilities.

5 That's my list.

6 SENATOR O'MARA: Thank you,
7 Senator.

8 Through you, Mr. President, if the
9 Senator will continue to yield.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
11 sponsor yield?

12 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
14 sponsor yields.

15 SENATOR O'MARA: So it seems like
16 one of the major differences here is that a
17 utility can opt out of pursuing this. Is that
18 correct?

19 SENATOR KRUEGER: That is a major
20 change. But it also builds in more flexibility
21 for them in working with communities and the PSC.

22 SENATOR O'MARA: Through you,
23 Mr. President, if the Senator will continue to
24 yield.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Does the

1 sponsor yield?

2 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
4 sponsor yields.

5 SENATOR O'MARA: My understanding
6 was that that change was really -- for a utility
7 to drop out was driven by the Assembly, where
8 they had many reluctant majority members from the
9 National Fuel territory in Western New York.
10 Rather than take a vote on the old version, you
11 do this, basically bought off their votes to get
12 them to support this version of it, because
13 National Fuel can opt out.

14 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
15 Mr. President. Both Senator O'Mara and I have
16 been here a long time, and we know that
17 complicated bills go through many amendments to
18 try to address the concerns we hear as we're
19 working on our bills.

20 So is it true that there was more
21 concern from certain members of the Assembly from
22 certain parts of the state in the majority? That
23 is factual. Did we try to address those
24 concerns -- which personally I believe also
25 addressed the concerns of the areas of the state

1 represented by many of my colleagues here in the
2 Senate from the other party? I think they
3 addressed the same concerns in both houses. But
4 of course we amended the bill to try to get
5 people to go, "This actually makes sense now.
6 This gives us some options we can work with now.
7 We're not opposed anymore." So yes.

8 SENATOR O'MARA: Through you,
9 Mr. President, if the Senator will continue to
10 yield.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
12 sponsor yield?

13 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
15 sponsor yields.

16 SENATOR O'MARA: Senator, you
17 mentioned before about the New York ISO. And I
18 believe that the only reference to that is on
19 page 2, line 11, where it talks about the ability
20 of the grid to safely, adequately and reliably
21 support this new load. It shall include
22 participation by the relevant electric
23 corporations and the federally designated bulk
24 system operator -- which would be NYISO, I
25 believe, is that correct?

1 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

2 SENATOR O'MARA: So that talks
3 about their participation. It doesn't say that
4 NYISO has any vote to stop this. Is that
5 correct?

6 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
7 Mr. President. I don't know exactly what powers
8 NYISO has currently for anything that happens
9 with utilities in this state. But I know that we
10 aren't changing any of those powers. Oh, sorry.

11 (Conferring.) Thank you. On
12 page 4, line 20 to line 22, No. 9: "The
13 commission shall ensure that any program approved
14 pursuant to this section will not compromise the
15 safety and reliability of the electric
16 distribution grid or gas distribution grid."

17 SENATOR O'MARA: Through you,
18 Mr. President, if the Senator will continue to
19 yield.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Does the
21 sponsor yield?

22 SENATOR KRUEGER: Indeed. Yes.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
24 sponsor yields.

25 SENATOR O'MARA: Yes. But that

1 language talks about the commission. It doesn't
2 talk about NYISO and NYISO's ability to say no,
3 this isn't going to work.

4 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
5 Mr. President, my understanding is that NYISO
6 exists so that it can work in coordination with
7 PSC and utilities to make sure we are functioning
8 as a state safely and reliably.

9 So again, this bill doesn't change
10 NYISO's authority now. So however the system
11 works now, whenever there's a concern that's
12 raised between NYISO and PSC, that system would
13 continue to operate the same way.

14 SENATOR O'MARA: Through you,
15 Mr. President, if the Senator will continue to
16 yield.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
18 sponsor yield?

19 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
21 sponsor yields.

22 SENATOR O'MARA: We've heard for
23 several years now, since the passage of the
24 CLCPA, in NYISO's annual reports about future
25 reliability. And they're raising the alarm and

1 concerns in the last several years at least --
2 and their most recent one just came out a few
3 weeks ago, and they're very concerned about the
4 adequacy of electricity to meet the rising
5 demands.

6 And we're creating even more demand
7 with a program like this. What concerns do you
8 have about going forward, about the adequacy of
9 our electric grid?

10 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you for the
11 question. Mr. President, I also am concerned
12 about the adequacy of our electric grid.

13 We are having massive new models of
14 construction in upstate New York for various
15 kinds of manufacturing with chips and other forms
16 of technology that we know are going to be
17 enormous drains on our electric grid.

18 We are using more electricity in
19 every part of our lives. It's a concern for my
20 region. It's a concern for upstate New York. So
21 that is a reality, and we need to deal with that.

22 This bill doesn't do anything to
23 hurt that reality and I believe actually offers
24 some ways to help. Because this bill ensures
25 transition options for communities to move into

1 modern green technology, which is frankly more
2 likely to be local grid realities -- gas --
3 excuse me, solar, geothermal, wind, and therefore
4 change demands on our grid. Not necessarily
5 decrease electricity usage and probably increase
6 electricity usage, but in very different ways.

7 All of that can work together as we
8 move to do what I think we agree on. We need to
9 modernize our transition system. We need to make
10 sure that we can produce more electricity here at
11 home for endless needs.

12 SENATOR O'MARA: Thank you,
13 Senator.

14 Through you, Mr. President, if the
15 Senator will continue to yield.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
17 sponsor yield?

18 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
20 sponsor yields.

21 SENATOR O'MARA: Looking at page 2
22 of the bill, line 14, Paragraph 4 talks about
23 prioritizing the voluntary disconnections from
24 gas service to minimize the cost of transition.

25 Now, if we're prioritizing voluntary

1 disconnections, that implies that at some point
2 there's going to be involuntary disconnections
3 from natural gas. Is that correct?

4 SENATOR KRUEGER: Only if it's
5 after 2030, if the neighborhood has actually
6 decided that they want to move forward, and the
7 PSC has approved that there is
8 adequate alternatives.

9 So it's voluntary, it's spelled out
10 right there. But involuntary is a multi-step
11 storyline into the future.

12 SENATOR O'MARA: Through you,
13 Mr. President, if the Senator will continue to
14 yield.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
16 sponsor yield?

17 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
19 sponsor yields.

20 SENATOR O'MARA: So is this program
21 set up here on these plans, this is going to
22 remain in effect after 2030? Or after 2030 is
23 the Public Service Commission just going to come
24 in and say, Okay, that neighborhood, you didn't
25 comply, you didn't want to do it, but now you

1 have to?

2 SENATOR KRUEGER: No. 2030 is when
3 these programs technically begin as any kind of
4 moving forward other than some neighborhoods who
5 actually might be very excited to jump in sooner.

6 SENATOR O'MARA: Through you,
7 Mr. President, if the Senator will continue to
8 yield.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
10 sponsor yield?

11 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
13 sponsor yields.

14 SENATOR O'MARA: Again, on page 2,
15 line 27, subparagraph (i), it says the capacity
16 of the relevant electric plant to provide safe
17 and adequate service. What is meant by "the
18 relevant electric plant"? Because we have a
19 grid, and that's why we have NYISO, and they
20 manage the flow from all kinds of different
21 sources to make sure it's there.

22 So what do you mean by "the relevant
23 electric plant"?

24 SENATOR KRUEGER: So it's written
25 that way because that's consistent with the

1 definitions of how electricity is talked about in
2 other sections of law. So that includes the
3 plant that they may be connected to, the overall
4 grid, the regional availability of electricity.

5 So it's not -- I would agree it's
6 confusing because you think I'm talking about
7 some box somewhere that's producing --

8 (Overtalk.)

9 SENATOR O'MARA: -- plants set up
10 in our neighborhoods.

11 SENATOR KRUEGER: No, but
12 apparently the reason we wrote it this way is
13 that -- because it's consistent with how they
14 talk about this in other sections of Energy Law.

15 SENATOR O'MARA: Through you,
16 Mr. President, if the Senator will continue to
17 yield.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
19 sponsor yield?

20 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
22 sponsor yields.

23 SENATOR O'MARA: And I just said we
24 don't have like neighborhood -- your neighborhood
25 plant, although down in New York City we've got

1 these peaker plants. They're kind of in
2 neighborhoods. And they're problematic.

3 SENATOR KRUEGER: Agreed.

4 SENATOR O'MARA: And really our
5 lack of an energy plan in this state was
6 exacerbated by the premature closure of
7 Indian Point, which has resulted in an over
8 40 percent increase of emissions in that
9 metropolitan New York area that was served by
10 Indian Point, requiring the increased use of
11 peaker plants.

12 I just -- I don't believe that we
13 have a thought-out plan here when such a glaring
14 mistake like that was made.

15 SENATOR KRUEGER: Going back one
16 second, not forgetting that question -- through
17 you, Mr. President. So the reason that we use
18 this language on page 2 is because it matches the
19 definition: "The term 'electric plant' when used
20 in this chapter of Energy Law includes all real
21 estate fixtures, personal property, operated,
22 owned, used or to be used for or in connection
23 with or to facilitate the generation,
24 transmission, distribution, sale or furnishing or
25 electricity for light, heat or power," and it

1 goes on and on and on. We could get you that.

2 But to answer the question you got
3 to, you were talking about closing nuclear plants
4 and the issue of peakers. None of that is
5 actually part of this piece of legislation.

6 I personally feel very good about
7 the decision to close the nuclear power plant in
8 Westchester County. It was leaking dangerous
9 radioactive chemicals into the ground, into the
10 groundwater, into the Hudson River. And I know
11 the people of those communities are feeling much
12 better about that not continuing at the rate it
13 was happening before. That was a power plant
14 that was way beyond its intended life span.

15 And, I suppose most disturbingly,
16 since I live downwater from that plant, it was
17 built on a fault in the earth. Under today's
18 laws you would never be allowed to build a
19 nuclear power plant on top of a fault line,
20 because you are increasing the risk from any kind
21 of earthquake or shifting experience to
22 completely blow the place up.

23 So did we have other alternatives
24 to produce more energy sooner once we made the
25 decision to close that nuclear plant? I actually

1 think this Legislature and my conference has been
2 urging the state to move more rapidly, to expand
3 options, to improve our grid, increase the
4 sources of energy.

5 So I don't disagree with my
6 colleague. The peakers are not a great option
7 for New York City. We were supposed to close
8 them years ago also. I don't think we should be
9 reopening old nuclear power plants. But I think
10 we should be moving forward with exactly the kind
11 of legislation we're talking about tonight.

12 Through you, Mr. President.

13 SENATOR O'MARA: Through you,
14 Mr. President, if the Senator will continue to
15 yield.

16 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
18 sponsor yield?

19 The sponsor yields.

20 SENATOR O'MARA: With regards to
21 those peaker plants, you know, they could
22 certainly be replaced with more efficient,
23 lower-emitting peaker plants, albeit still using
24 fossil fuel, but much more efficiently and lower
25 output now, because I think the residents in

1 those neighborhoods where they're operating don't
2 really agree that it's been a great idea to close
3 Indian Point, and all those extra emissions
4 coming from these.

5 So -- and there isn't any account
6 that I've heard of going forward, based on all
7 renewables, that we're not going to need backup
8 power. And we're going to need
9 fossil-fuel-powered plants, natural gas
10 preferably, cleaner burning, for quite a period
11 of time.

12 But during this whole transition
13 doesn't it make sense to maybe make those plants
14 more efficient, lower emitting?

15 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
16 Mr. President. I don't -- one, I'm not aware of
17 people in New York City saying they wish we
18 didn't close that nuclear power plant. I
19 actually have never had anybody come to me to say
20 that.

21 Two, we had the peaker plants while
22 we had the nuclear plant, so we didn't trade a
23 closed nuclear power plant for the 10 peakers in
24 New York City. They were there, they were a
25 problem. They're still there. They're still a

1 problem. We just also don't have Indian Point
2 open.

3 And if the question is shouldn't we
4 also be doing something to either expand or
5 modernize existing natural gas facilities,
6 there's nothing in this bill that stops that. I
7 personally don't think that's a great idea, and I
8 suppose I'd be happy to debate a bill like that
9 if it was before us. But I just want to make
10 clear there's nothing in this bill that changes
11 that question for New York State.

12 SENATOR O'MARA: Well, through you,
13 Mr. President, if the Senator will continue to
14 yield.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
16 sponsor yield?

17 SENATOR KRUEGER: I will.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
19 sponsor yields.

20 SENATOR O'MARA: I have another
21 section to move on to, but before that, I think
22 that the closure of Indian Point was not well
23 timed out because it has caused a significant
24 increase in emissions by the extra use of these
25 peaker plants that have had to be ramped up from

1 that.

2 SENATOR KRUEGER: Oh, I'm sorry,
3 just for reference --

4 SENATOR O'MARA: Sure.

5 SENATOR KRUEGER: -- just a fact.

6 Indian Point was agreed to be closed
7 in 2017 when my colleagues on the Republican side
8 of the aisle were the majority. So they agreed
9 to close Indian Point. Just a historical fact.

10 Sorry, please keep going.

11 SENATOR O'MARA: Thank you,
12 Senator.

13 Mr. President, if the Senator will
14 continue to yield.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
16 sponsor yield?

17 SENATOR KRUEGER: Indeed.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
19 sponsor yields.

20 SENATOR O'MARA: Can you clarify
21 for me -- because I really don't see any
22 definitions in here. We talk about nice things
23 like regional plan, community plan, neighborhood
24 plan. What is a region, what is a community, and
25 what is a neighborhood?

1 (Pause.)

2 SENATOR KRUEGER: So it's actually
3 right there in the first paragraph on page 1,
4 starting at line 5, 66-x, Regional affordable gas
5 transition plans." (Reading): The commission
6 shall divide the state into gas transition
7 planning regions, giving consideration to utility
8 service territories, and, in consultation with
9 local governments and gas corporations,
10 publish -- and it goes on and on about -- we're
11 saying we're even letting the utilities and the
12 communities decide the definitions of how these
13 territories will be divvied up, so to speak.

14 SENATOR O'MARA: Through you,
15 Mr. President, if the Senator will continue to
16 yield.

17 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
19 sponsor yields.

20 SENATOR O'MARA: So how is this
21 decision -- and who are the decision-makers going
22 to be, and who's going to have the ultimate final
23 say on what a region is, what a community is, and
24 what the neighborhood is?

25 SENATOR KRUEGER: So the

1 Public Service Commission currently makes those
2 decisions about utility territory, regions and
3 communities, so they would continue to do that.

4 SENATOR O'MARA: Through you,
5 Mr. President, if the Senator will continue to
6 yield.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
8 sponsor yield?

9 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
11 sponsor yields.

12 SENATOR O'MARA: Moving on to
13 upgrades that may be needed to convert homes from
14 natural gas to fully electric. It says in here
15 in a couple of different places that there will
16 be no cost to that property owner for this.

17 How is that cost going to be borne?

18 SENATOR KRUEGER: So the CSRA
19 requires utilities to ensure that any
20 transitioning customer has access to safe,
21 reliable energy services for heating, cooling,
22 cooking, water heating prior to any cessation of
23 gas service, with funding and technical support,
24 including for the purchase and installation of
25 customer-owned equipment at no cost.

1 Some utilities are already doing
2 this, providing customers with non-gas appliances
3 as part of gas transitions. For example,
4 New York SEG and RG&E non-pipe alternative
5 projects offer customers a basic package of free
6 heat pumps and other electric appliances, with
7 options for customers to upgrade.

8 National Grid is offering customers
9 more than 10,000 to \$20,000 to electrify in areas
10 where electrification would help avoid costly
11 gas-line replacements. Con Ed is developing a
12 package for customers with old service lines to
13 electrify that will provide customers free
14 non-gas appliances that complement the company's
15 existing heat pump incentives.

16 So interestingly, while we're here
17 debating tonight, this is actually already
18 happening without our setting up a statewide
19 plan. Which is why I know the vast majority of
20 utilities are going to participate and aren't
21 going to opt out, because they already know this
22 saves money and is the right way to go. Because
23 that's what they're doing already.

24 Through you, Mr. President.

25 SENATOR O'MARA: Through you,

1 Mr. President, if the Senator will continue to
2 yield.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
4 sponsor yield?

5 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
7 sponsor yields.

8 SENATOR O'MARA: Thank you. But
9 that doesn't really answer my question. Who's
10 ultimately paying for those upgrades, the
11 equipment, what have you?

12 SENATOR KRUEGER: As we said, this
13 bill requires it's the utilities' responsibility.

14 SENATOR O'MARA: Through you,
15 Mr. President, if the Senator will yield.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
17 sponsor yield?

18 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
20 sponsor yields.

21 SENATOR O'MARA: Does the utility
22 get to build that cost into their rate case?

23 SENATOR KRUEGER: (Conferring.) So
24 through you, Mr. President. If a utility goes
25 for a rate increase for costs, first they have to

1 show that we are maximizing the use of all these
2 assorted state programs to support this, and they
3 have to show that the savings they have from no
4 longer having to invest so much in oil and gas
5 continuation still leaves them with additional
6 need.

7 And then and only then would they be
8 approved for a utility rate increase for this
9 purpose.

10 SENATOR O'MARA: Through you,
11 Mr. President, if Senator will continue to yield.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
13 sponsor yield?

14 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
16 sponsor yields.

17 SENATOR O'MARA: Well, I myself, I
18 would fully expect that they're going to have a
19 greater need than what all the other programs
20 might be out there.

21 And if and when they do go back to
22 the rate case and say, We've spent this many
23 hundreds of millions of dollars on heat pumps or
24 whatever to convert these homes from gas to
25 electric, and the Public Service Commission

1 agrees and says, Yeah, you can recover those,
2 then the rates are going to increase. And the
3 rates are going to increase for every ratepayer,
4 correct, in that utility region?

5 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
6 Mr. President. When there are utility rate
7 increases, yes, all ratepayers pay.

8 Now, what is also I think important
9 to remember, as we transition -- and we are
10 transitioning. As I said, this is happening
11 already. People are shifting voluntarily to
12 cheaper options for themselves. As fewer and
13 fewer people are using gas/oil, even if we didn't
14 pass this law, the cost for the remaining people
15 in gas and oil continues to go up. Because they
16 are the last ones, so there's a smaller number of
17 people having to absorb the cost of an entire
18 system of oil and gas.

19 That's actually happening already
20 even without this law. So yes, if you -- the
21 longer you stay on oil and gas, probably the
22 reality is the more you're going to pay and the
23 bigger share of the cost you will have, because
24 there will be fewer ratepayers to share that cost
25 with you. That's if we do nothing.

1 If we do this, we are at least
2 setting up options of how people can be
3 transitioned with planning, with their
4 participation, with community input, and with the
5 utilities and the state helping to pick up some
6 of those changed infrastructure costs to shift us
7 off of oil and gas.

8 SENATOR O'MARA: Through you,
9 Mr. President, if the Senator will continue to
10 yield.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
12 sponsor yield?

13 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
15 sponsor yields.

16 SENATOR O'MARA: Senator, if and
17 when those costs ultimately get spread across all
18 the ratepayers, will there be any relief for that
19 homeowner or business that has voluntarily
20 undertaken these changes on their own, on their
21 own dime? Or are they going to be sharing in the
22 higher rate with everybody else that hasn't?

23 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
24 Mr. President. If you've already shifted off of
25 oil and gas, voluntarily before tonight or after

1 tonight, your costs from utilities are going to
2 be lower.

3 So if there's some increase for
4 ratepayers, it's not like an even distribution
5 because there are 12 people here, it's a
6 percentage increase in what your bill is.

7 So if your bill is very low -- for
8 example, I don't use my gas stove very much, so
9 my gas bill every month I think is about \$14. So
10 even if they increase my gas prices, it's only a
11 percentage on \$14. Versus someone who's paying
12 \$500 a month for their gas because they're
13 dependent on it for everything, so they would see
14 a far more significant increase in their cost.

15 So you absolutely are a winner in
16 this storyline if you are using less and less oil
17 and gas.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
19 you, Senator O'Mara --

20 SENATOR O'MARA: Through you,
21 Mr. President, if the Senator will continue to
22 yield.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Your time
24 has elapsed. Your 30 minutes has elapsed, sir.

25 SENATOR O'MARA: Thirty minutes?

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thirty
2 minutes.

3 SENATOR KRUEGER: I thought it felt
4 like hours, personally, but --

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Time
6 flies when you're having fun.

7 SENATOR O'MARA: Thank you,
8 Senator Krueger.

9 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you,
10 Senator.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Are there
12 any other Senators wishing to be heard?

13 Seek and hearing none, debate is
14 closed. The Secretary will ring the bell.

15 Read the last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 11. This
17 act shall take effect December 31, 2025.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
22 Harckham to explain his vote.

23 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Thank you very
24 much, Mr. President. The hour is late; I'll be
25 brief.

1 I want to thank Senator Krueger for
2 this revised legislation and for her work on this
3 over the years.

4 I rise just to reinforce a few facts
5 and correct a few other facts from this debate.

6 We talk about health and people
7 dying. To Senator Krueger's point, over
8 2,000 New Yorkers die prematurely of heart and
9 lung disease because of our consumption of fossil
10 fuels.

11 We talk about the Texas blackout.
12 It was not because windmills froze, it was their
13 gas infrastructure froze. That is very clear.
14 It was their gas infrastructure that froze.

15 And what have they done since then?
16 They have added renewables. Wind, solar and
17 battery storage at a relentless pace, a
18 nation-leading pace. And now they have added to
19 their resiliency, and their rates have come down.
20 Because as we know, the economics say a kilowatt
21 of clean energy is cheaper than a kilowatt of
22 fossil fuel energy.

23 A couple more quick points. We
24 would -- if we didn't have a CLCPA or add a
25 single solar panel, we would have to do the grid

1 upgrades we're doing now because our grid is
2 antiquated.

3 And we talk about jobs. If we stop
4 blocking the CLCPA, we can be creating
5 200,000 good, union-paying jobs. Look at the
6 200 million that we allocated for thermal
7 networks. That is just the beginning of what we
8 could do.

9 I thank Senator Krueger.

10 I vote aye.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
12 Harckham to be recorded in the affirmative.

13 Announce the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
15 Calendar 1953, voting in the negative are
16 Senators Ashby, Baskin, Borrello,
17 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Gallivan, Griffio,
18 Helming, Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Oberacker,
19 O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, C. Ryan,
20 Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

21 Ayes, 36. Nays, 23.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
23 is passed.

24 Senator Gianaris.

25 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,

1 let's go to Calendar 1950.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
3 Secretary will read.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 1950, Senate Print 8417, by Senator Krueger, an
6 act to amend the Public Service Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
8 Borrello, why do you rise?

9 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
10 would the sponsor yield for a question.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
12 sponsor yield?

13 SENATOR KRUEGER: I will as soon as
14 I text "Bring cough drops from my desk."

15 (Laughter.)

16 SENATOR BORRELLO: You want to get
17 yourself a Gatorade or something?

18 SENATOR KRUEGER: No, I've got
19 liquid, but thank you so much.

20 Okay, pressing send.

21 Yes, please. Of course I will
22 happily answer questions.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
24 sponsor yields.

25 SENATOR BORRELLO: All right.

1 Through you, Mr. President. Do you
2 happen to know where the first natural gas well
3 in the entire world was actually dug?

4 SENATOR KRUEGER: No, I do not,
5 Mr. President. I suspect my colleague does.

6 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
7 yes, I do. Will the sponsor yield for a
8 question.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
10 sponsor yield?

11 SENATOR KRUEGER: It's Dunkirk?
12 (Laughter.)

13 SENATOR BORRELLO: Close. It's
14 actually Dunkirk's next-door neighbor Fredonia --
15 (Laughter.)

16 SENATOR BORRELLO: -- is where the
17 first natural gas well in America was drilled.

18 So, Mr. President, will the sponsor
19 continue to yield.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
21 sponsor yield?

22 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
24 sponsor yields.

25 SENATOR BORRELLO: Yes. So we'll

1 just call it the greater Dunkirk-Fredonia area,
2 which I am from, which is where the first natural
3 gas well was dug.

4 And I bring it up because do you
5 know that Western New York relies very heavily on
6 natural gas for heating? That's just a yes-or-no
7 question.

8 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
9 Mr. President, I will accept that New York uses
10 quite a bit of natural gas.

11 I will also point out that once upon
12 a time people used arsenic on their face, except
13 that we learned it was poisonous so then we
14 didn't anymore.

15 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
16 will the sponsor continue to yield.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
18 sponsor yield?

19 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
21 sponsor yields.

22 SENATOR BORRELLO: Don't knock the
23 whole arsenic-on-the-face thing. It's making my
24 face nice and smooth, so --

25 (Laughter.)

1 SENATOR BORRELLO: So in December
2 of 2022 there was a massive snowstorm in the
3 City of Buffalo. It really -- unfortunately,
4 40 lives were lost in that snowstorm.

5 Do you happen to know how many
6 electrical outages there were during that massive
7 snowstorm Christmas week of December 2022?

8 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
9 Mr. President, I don't. My colleague does.

10 But again, to repeat myself from an
11 earlier discussion, when there are electric
12 blackouts, the natural gas systems don't work
13 either. So it's not a solution or an
14 alternative, because it's still using
15 electricity. Which is why it is so important
16 that we have a functioning transmission grid for
17 the state.

18 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
19 will the sponsor continue to yield.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
21 sponsor yield?

22 SENATOR KRUEGER: I will.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
24 sponsor yields.

25 SENATOR BORRELLO: I didn't hear an

1 answer to my question. I just wanted to know if
2 you happen to know how many electrical outages
3 there were in Buffalo in December 2022.

4 SENATOR KRUEGER: I said no, I did
5 not know the number. I was simply pointing out
6 that an electric blackout means the gas heating
7 system doesn't work either.

8 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
9 will the sponsor continue to yield?

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
11 sponsor yield?

12 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
14 sponsor yields.

15 SENATOR BORRELLO: Did you say you
16 have a natural gas stove? Are you familiar with
17 a natural gas stove? Do you know like how it
18 works? Natural gas stove.

19 SENATOR KRUEGER: No. Beyond
20 knowing that they -- a small amount of gas comes
21 into the stove with a pilot light, you turn the
22 gas on or you turn it into flame. Beyond that,
23 probably not.

24 SENATOR BORRELLO: Okay.

25 Mr. President, on the bill briefly.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
2 Borrello on the bill.

3 SENATOR BORRELLO: You are correct.
4 In fact, where I live in Western New York, you
5 do, you have natural gas that's either a
6 continuous pilot light, which doesn't require
7 electrical ignition, so if the power goes out you
8 can still turn your gas stove on, you can still
9 turn your gas fireplace on, you can still -- and
10 even in cases where you do have electric
11 ignition, if it fails, you can simply light it
12 with one of those little handy-dandy butane
13 lighters.

14 So people in Buffalo survived for
15 multiple days without electricity because they
16 were able to turn their gas stoves on and keep
17 themselves warm.

18 So -- and the number of electrical
19 outages in Buffalo, just in Buffalo, during that
20 storm over the course of three days was 150,000.

21 And I know you know that I already
22 have the answer to this question, but do you know
23 how many natural gas outages there were in that
24 same period of time?

25 SENATOR KRUEGER: I'm sorry,

1 Mr. President, I didn't hear the end of the
2 question.

3 SENATOR BORRELLO: Yes, sorry for
4 that word salad. Do you know how many natural
5 gas outages there were during that same period of
6 time?

7 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
8 Mr. President, I don't have the same research as
9 my colleague, so I don't know about natural gas
10 outages in that same area that same time.

11 I do know that people are strongly,
12 strongly recommended not to use their gas stoves
13 to heat themselves or their homes because there
14 is enormous health risk and likelihood of things
15 blowing up and failed ventilation.

16 So I understand in an emergency
17 situation like a blackout, people might have to,
18 but I certainly hope that none of us are urging
19 our families and friends and constituents to
20 started heating their home through their gas
21 stoves.

22 SENATOR BORRELLO: Okay.
23 Mr. President, will the sponsor continue to
24 yield?

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the

1 sponsor yield?

2 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
4 sponsor yields.

5 SENATOR BORRELLO: During an
6 emergency it's often incredibly important,
7 particularly for places like hospitals and
8 nursing homes and fire stations to have backup
9 generators. Do you know how a backup generator
10 typically is powered?

11 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
12 Mr. President. There are various forms of backup
13 generators. Some are gas, some are propane, some
14 are battery, some are geothermal.

15 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
16 will the sponsor continue to yield.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
18 sponsor yield?

19 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
21 sponsor yields.

22 SENATOR BORRELLO: You know, you
23 kind of dovetailed into something I want to talk
24 about anyway. I've heard you talk about
25 geothermal in the past. Could you explain to me

1 how a geothermal system works?

2 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
3 Mr. President. You dig down into the ground and
4 you connect to naturally occurring heat and steam
5 from underneath the ground, and you connect it to
6 your home or your building.

7 In New York City we have a number of
8 pilots that are being -- actually have come
9 onto -- are working, where they're digging down
10 into Manhattan Island, which has some of the
11 toughest rock formations in the world, and we are
12 doing geothermal energy and heat in my own
13 district.

14 In fact, some of us are hoping to be
15 at St. Patrick's Cathedral tomorrow morning for a
16 funeral. St. Patrick's Cathedral is heated by
17 geothermal energy. Rockefeller Center, directly
18 across the street, is in the process of moving to
19 geothermal.

20 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
21 on the bill.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
23 Borrello on the bill.

24 But before you begin, Senator, can
25 we have some order in the chamber. Thank you.

1 SENATOR BORRELLO: I would
2 appreciate that also, thank you.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
4 Borrello, the floor is yours.

5 SENATOR BORRELLO: So I've heard a
6 lot about geothermal from my colleagues on the
7 other side of the aisle, and I think that you
8 have this misconception that we're digging down
9 to the center of the earth and bringing hot magma
10 up to heat our homes with. That's actually not
11 how geothermal works.

12 Here's how geothermal works. You
13 dig down a couple of hundred feet to access a
14 consistent 50-degree temperature, and then you
15 have to then bring that air up and you have to
16 either heat it to the 60, 70 degrees that you
17 want to keep your home, or you have to cool it.
18 Either way, you need a source of energy.

19 Geothermal heat is nothing but a
20 consistent temperature that comes up from digging
21 down a couple hundred feet. So when you get that
22 50-degree air up to your -- up to your furnace,
23 you still need natural gas or electric to
24 actually heat it.

25 So I want to dispel that rumor

1 because I had this feeling that when everybody
2 talks about geothermal, they think there's some
3 kind of magical process where we're bringing heat
4 up from the center of the earth. We're not. You
5 still need natural gas or electricity to operate
6 a geothermal system. That's how it works.

7 So with that, will the sponsor
8 continue to yield.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
10 sponsor yield?

11 SENATOR KRUEGER: I'm sorry, we're
12 back. I was hoping we'd get to the 100-foot-rule
13 question. Yes, please.

14 SENATOR BORRELLO: So this bill
15 would essentially tell natural gas companies they
16 are no longer allowed to provide a free
17 connection to their system to someone that's
18 building a home. When have we ever told any
19 company that they can no longer provide something
20 complimentary to their customers?

21 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
22 Mr. President. It's not free. All of us are
23 paying for it. All of the utility ratepayers are
24 paying for that last hundred foot cost into the
25 building.

1 We have, as a state, passed a law
2 saying we are going to all-electric new
3 buildings. There isn't a reason that we should
4 still have on our books a law that says utilities
5 must put in gas pipes for the last hundred feet
6 and have utility ratepayers pay it. We, the
7 people, are paying a minimum of \$200 million a
8 year for this law that isn't even justified under
9 existing rules that the state has put into
10 effect.

11 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
12 will the sponsor continue to yield?

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
14 sponsor yield?

15 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
17 sponsor yields.

18 SENATOR BORRELLO: I've heard you
19 throwing around this number before. Is there
20 some kind of a line item on our gas bills that we
21 should be looking for that shows what it's
22 costing us for that hundred-foot rule?

23 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
24 Mr. President, I don't think that we line-item
25 many of the costs for our utilities from -- on

1 our individual electric bills.

2 But there have been multiple
3 research projects -- yes? (Conferring.)

4 The utilities actually do identify
5 these costs in the utility filings they do with
6 PSC. So somebody has actually gone through and
7 added those up. And it is a minimum of
8 \$200 million a year that the utilities are
9 charging us ratepayers to do the
10 last-hundred-foot rules.

11 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
12 will the sponsor continue to yield?

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
14 sponsor yield?

15 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
17 sponsor yields.

18 SENATOR BORRELLO: I think you know
19 that I'm a business owner, and I've certainly
20 filed a lot of, you know, P&Ls and so forth. So
21 you're saying because they have a line item that
22 talks about the cost of the hundred-foot rule
23 that you are assuming that's being passed along
24 to the customer.

25 So if they list the fact that they

1 have to buy utility trucks and bucket trucks,
2 should we tell them that they should no longer
3 buy utility trucks and bucket trucks because
4 they're passing the cost of that bucket truck
5 along to their ratepayers?

6 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
7 Mr. President. If we get to a point in history
8 where you don't need those things anymore, yes, I
9 would say you shouldn't do that.

10 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
11 will the sponsor continue to yield.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
13 sponsor yield?

14 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
16 sponsor yields.

17 SENATOR BORRELLO: Let's talk about
18 property taxes. Because the interesting about
19 thing about all of these green energy projects is
20 that they're not paying -- they're paying very
21 little in property taxes, in most cases pennies
22 on the dollar for the true assessed value of the
23 wind and solar installations that are going up.

24 Yet natural gas lines are taxed
25 pretty much fully. So what are we going to do

1 about the hundreds of millions if not billions of
2 dollars in lost property tax revenues from the
3 decommissioning of all these gas lines?

4 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
5 Mr. President. This bill does not address that.
6 The hundred-foot rule is specific to the
7 building last hundred foot of pipe into
8 buildings, pretty much new buildings because the
9 others already have gas. Although I suppose you
10 could have an old building that you want to run a
11 gas pipeline in.

12 So as to the question of how
13 property taxes are scheduled by any specific
14 locality and what percentage come from what kind
15 of business, I think that's up to the property
16 tax reform crowd, not specific to this
17 legislation.

18 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
19 will the sponsor continue to yield.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
21 sponsor yield?

22 SENATOR KRUEGER: Indeed.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
24 sponsor yields.

25 SENATOR BORRELLO: Well, it may not

1 be specific to this legislation, but it is going
2 to be a side effect. Essentially, you're making
3 no bones about it, you want to eliminate natural
4 gas in New York State, right? We want to no
5 longer use natural gas, and natural gas companies
6 pay probably over a billion dollars in property
7 taxes a year, if not more.

8 So what are we going to do to make
9 that up when the wind and solar project that
10 you've commissioned is paying pennies -- in some
11 cases, zero -- in property taxes? How are we
12 going to make up that loss of revenue for every
13 municipality, particularly in upstate New York,
14 that is hosting a green energy project that's
15 paying nothing, versus the gas lines that are
16 paying a pretty substantial percentage of the
17 property taxes?

18 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
19 Mr. President. This bill doesn't say that gas
20 pipes can't be built in the last hundred feet.
21 It says if you want one, you should pay it
22 instead of all of us having to pay it.

23 If my colleague's broader question
24 is we should stay with a system that is
25 destroying our environment, causing serious

1 illness, putting us at risk and increasing our
2 costs -- that are beyond comprehension to some of
3 us -- so that somebody will still pay a property
4 tax, I don't think that's a very good argument.

5 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
6 will the sponsor continue to yield.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
8 sponsor yield?

9 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
11 sponsor yields.

12 SENATOR BORRELLO: So you're saying
13 that the problem is that the emissions from
14 natural gas are having a negative impact on
15 climate change.

16 So my question to you is, if that's
17 the case, then why are we importing power for
18 New York from coal and natural-gas-fired power
19 plants outside of New York? If it's global
20 climate change, why aren't we shutting that stuff
21 off right now because New York is having such a
22 high demand because we've shut down things like
23 Indian Point nuclear power plant and we've not
24 expanded things like hydroelectric power?

25 Why are we still firing up dirty

1 coal plants and natural gas plants in states like
2 in Ohio and Pennsylvania to power New York if
3 this is such an emergency that we need to shut
4 down our natural gas system?

5 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
6 Mr. President, we in New York don't have the
7 authority to shut down other states' dirty coal
8 plants. But the faster we don't need the dirty,
9 polluting forms of energy, the less that will be
10 a problem for us.

11 And to answer the earlier question
12 about what about the property taxes not being
13 paid by the utilities if they have less gas
14 lines -- who pays the cost now? Consumers. Our
15 utility ratepayers.

16 So the imagination that it's the
17 companies paying property taxes, not the people
18 who pay rates paying the property taxes -- guess
19 what? We're paying them now. So it's not
20 somebody else or us, it's already us.

21 Through you, Mr. President.

22 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
23 will the sponsor continue to yield.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
25 sponsor yield? Will the sponsor yield?

1 SENATOR KRUEGER: Of course. I'm
2 sorry.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
4 sponsor yields.

5 SENATOR BORRELLO: Okay. So we're
6 not worried about who's going to pay the property
7 taxes. Let's talk about the jobs. Do you have
8 any idea what the average salary of a gas utility
9 worker is in New York State?

10 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
11 Mr. President, I do not. Again, we are not going
12 to be laying off existing workers. They are
13 going to continue the work they do, probably
14 until retirement age, and then there will be
15 other workers coming along to work in alternative
16 forms of energy. Some of them may still be in
17 gas. And we are requiring the same labor
18 standards and practices for the new kinds of
19 jobs.

20 So I suspect probably approximately
21 the same, adjusted for inflation.

22 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
23 will the sponsor continue to yield.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
25 sponsor yield?

1 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
3 sponsor yields.

4 SENATOR BORRELLO: Well, I don't
5 know if that's going to be the case. It's hard
6 to take a guy that's making \$120,000 a year
7 working on the natural gas infrastructure in New
8 York State and tell him he should go to China to
9 make solar panels and make the same amount of
10 money. That's probably not going to happen.

11 But with that being said, we're
12 talking about affordable housing, we need more
13 affordable housing. Do you know what it costs if
14 we're going to burden a new house -- someone's
15 building a new house, with having to pay for
16 their own hookup? Any idea what it would cost
17 for them to have to now pick up that cost with
18 the hundred-foot rule being eliminated?

19 SENATOR KRUEGER: According to my
20 data, the National Grid Metro New York Gas
21 Company reports the average new connection cost
22 for residential customers currently covered by
23 the hundred-foot rule would be about \$14,000 a
24 year. For National Grid Long Island natural gas
25 in that period, the average new connection cost

1 for residential customers was about \$9200 and
2 about \$5300 for residential underground
3 development customers.

4 SENATOR BORRELLO: Will the sponsor
5 continue to yield?

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
7 sponsor yield?

8 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes, I do.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
10 sponsor yields.

11 SENATOR BORRELLO: (Sound effect.)
12 You're right! That's right, it's about \$17,000
13 to put a natural gas hookup --

14 (Laughter.)

15 SENATOR KRUEGER: You're a little
16 excited.

17 (Laughter.)

18 SENATOR KRUEGER: No props. No
19 props.

20 (Laughter.)

21 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

22 SENATOR BORRELLO: It's a bottle of
23 water.

24 But my point is that perhaps on Long
25 Island or, you know, downstate, \$17,000 to the

1 cost of a million-dollar home isn't much. But as
2 you heard earlier in my debate on Dunkirk, you
3 know, the houses in upstate New York and
4 certainly the average salary is much lower.

5 So to add a \$17,000 burden onto
6 someone who's building a house that's probably
7 going to cost them \$200,000 for the structure
8 itself is a significant amount of money.

9 So how can we be talking about
10 making more affordable housing in New York State
11 when we're talking about adding costs to those
12 who in our area will likely want to still choose
13 to have natural gas?

14 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
15 Mr. President. Just for the record, nobody has
16 to pay for the cost of a new gas hookup because
17 nobody building a new house needs to have a new
18 gas hookup. They can actually start out with
19 alternatives. Therefore, they would never have
20 to pay that cost or the high cost of heating with
21 natural gas once they get into their new house.

22 SENATOR BORRELLO: Oh, other
23 Mr. President.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Still
25 Mr. President, sir.

1 SENATOR BORRELLO: That's right.

2 That's right. Mr. President, on the bill.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
4 Borrello on the bill.

5 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you again,
6 Senator Krueger. You've once again shown amazing
7 stamina here with all these questions.

8 So New York State is a state that is
9 rich in natural gas. As I said, the first
10 natural gas well in the world was dug in my
11 hometown of Fredonia. Natural gas is affordable.
12 It's cleaner, much cleaner than other forms of
13 fossil fuels. But it's also consistent. It's
14 reliable. It's something that we can actually
15 continue to use while we figure out what the next
16 steps are.

17 But one thing we know for sure is we
18 do not have the electrical grid capacity in
19 New York State, not even close, to meet the needs
20 of a fully electrified New York State.

21 Then you add into it all of the
22 businesses that rely on natural gas to keep those
23 jobs here. We just opened up a state-of-the-art
24 cheesemaking plant in Farmersville, New York,
25 that is heavily reliant on natural gas.

1 Natural gas is used by most
2 homeowners where I live in Western New York
3 because it's a cheaper alternative. And, like I
4 mentioned, in a horrible, deadly snowstorm in
5 Buffalo, thank God that we had natural gas. If
6 everybody was on electric heat instead of
7 40 people, add another zero onto that as far as
8 the number of casualties that would have been in
9 the City of Buffalo were it not for natural gas.

10 The list goes on and on.

11 Now, I understand that everyone
12 thinks we need to do this so quickly that we
13 don't even have to have a plan as to how we're
14 going to execute this, because that's what this
15 is about. But in this case we are telling
16 companies that are providing that that
17 last-hundred feet at no charge to those
18 customers, that they can no longer do that. When
19 have we ever told a company you can't provide
20 something for free?

21 In fact, you know what most of our
22 bills do here? Most of the bills we pass here
23 say you must provide something for free. You
24 can't charge that copay. You can't charge that
25 fee. That's what most of the bills we pass in

1 this chamber do. We tell companies, we don't
2 care what it costs you, you're going to provide
3 this for free because we, the New York State
4 Legislature, says you should.

5 But in this case we're going in the
6 opposite direction. I understand the philosophy
7 behind it. But at the end of the day, it's based
8 on a false premise that somehow getting away from
9 natural gas and continuing to import more and
10 more power from out of state -- mostly on coal, I
11 might add -- that that's the better solution, so
12 we can pretend that we're doing something about
13 climate change. Because that's what this is
14 really about in New York. We are pretending
15 we're having an impact on climate change. We're
16 not. Not at all.

17 So this is about affordability,
18 which is a big talking point here, but we're
19 actually not doing anything to make New York more
20 affordable. It's about keeping those jobs, all
21 those good-paying union jobs that the energy
22 industry provides. And it's about ensuring that
23 going forward the people of New York State have
24 the choice that they have for safe, affordable,
25 reliable energy.

1 So I'll be voting no. Thank you,
2 Mr. President.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Are there
4 any other Senators wishing to be heard?

5 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
6 closed. The Secretary will ring the bell.

7 SENATOR MATTERA: (Inaudible.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
9 Mattera, you'll be able to explain when we get to
10 the explanation of votes. We'll get to you in a
11 second.

12 The Secretary will ring the bell.

13 Read the last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
15 act shall take effect immediately.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
20 Mattera to explain his vote.

21 SENATOR MATTERA: Thank you,
22 Mr. President.

23 And this had been very interesting,
24 and over the years. But what this bill and the
25 previous bill are really about is choice. The

1 environmentalists and my friends across the aisle
2 in Albany don't think New Yorkers should have the
3 freedom to choose their sources of energy that
4 they pay for.

5 Once again, New York State is
6 putting the cart before the horse as it works to
7 cut off homes and businesses from natural gas,
8 which is the cleanest and most reliable fuel.

9 Instead, we should be supporting the
10 NESE and the Constitution pipelines, support the
11 expanded capacity of the Iroquois Pipeline, and
12 to get liquefied natural gas, LNG, trucks off of
13 our roadways where they continue to be utilized
14 to supply homes and businesses with the fuel they
15 need.

16 My friends across the aisle don't
17 bring that up. It is time for New York State to
18 accept the reality and let 59 percent of
19 New Yorkers who oppose banning of these
20 pipelines, and the overwhelming 71 percent who
21 oppose banning natural gas, know that they are
22 being heard. And yes, we are making sure they're
23 being heard every day.

24 These are the numbers directly from
25 the recent Natural Allies for a Clean Energy

1 Future poll. These are real facts. The reality
2 is that the recent joint report from Northwood
3 University McNair Center for the Advancement of
4 Free Enterprise and Entrepreneurship and the
5 Mackinac Center for Public Policy found,
6 unsurprisingly, that natural gas is the best
7 source of energy now.

8 And again, I always say this: We
9 need to retool our existing power plants -- and
10 you know what, that will create good-paying jobs
11 also -- that that is the most efficient and
12 economical way to go. That is based on factors
13 like reliability and environmental impact costs.

14 We need to get the LNG trucks off
15 our roadways, like I said, and we need to ensure
16 New Yorkers have access to affordable, reliable
17 and clean energy. And we need to keep our rates
18 from increasing even more than they have been.

19 It is time that Albany Democrats
20 realize that they are hurting all of our
21 homeowners and our businesses with little benefit
22 to our environment. New York State residents
23 have to pay for all of this. Goals are fine, but
24 mandates are wrong. Albany must let common sense
25 and reality guide our state's energy policies.

1 We urge all and agree that we support moving to a
2 cleaner fuel, and it is to be accomplished by
3 protecting our residents, our hardworking men and
4 women of labor, and small businesses.

5 I urge Governor Kathy Hochul and
6 Albany Democrats to listen to all New Yorkers and
7 work with us to find realistic solutions to
8 protect those who we jointly serve together. We
9 need to study sources of energy like green
10 hydrogen, geothermal networks, sewage heat
11 recovery expansion, which we're doing that up in
12 Jamestown, in Senator Borrello's district.
13 Retooling, again, our existing power plants for
14 carbon capture. Nuclear small modular units.

15 This effort, combining clean energy
16 with natural gas, is supported by over 66 percent
17 of the voters, including 74 percent of our state
18 Democratic voters, and will allow us to move
19 forward into a better energy future without
20 harming our residents who are speaking loud
21 enough with their feet. We urge NYSERDA and the
22 PSC, the Democrats in the Legislature and
23 Governor Hochul, to listen to them and to protect
24 our ratepayers. That is what we all are here to
25 do.

1 We need a realistic plan and not
2 unrealistic, costly bans. Mr. President, I vote
3 no.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
5 Mattera to be recorded in the negative.

6 Senator Rhoads to explain his vote.

7 SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you,
8 Mr. President.

9 Clean, safe, affordable, dependable
10 energy -- that should be your right as a
11 New Yorker. And what we're seeing by the bill we
12 just considered and what we're seeing by this
13 latest hundred-foot ban on your being able to
14 connect to gas service, is the steady erosion of
15 those rights by this Legislature.

16 They're telling you you'll be able
17 to keep your electric stove. You won't. You'll
18 be able to keep gas service to your house -- you
19 won't. Nothing's preventing utilities from
20 providing the hundred feet to your house for
21 free. Well, this bill is. Because what will
22 happen over time is not that they will ban gas --
23 though they might -- but they will make it so
24 unaffordable for you to choose that option or
25 make it so impossible for the utility that

1 provides that service to your house to stay in
2 business, that gas will no longer be an option
3 for you. That's the path that we're going down.

4 And what are we getting in its
5 place? We're getting hope. We're getting talk.
6 But hope and talk is not a plan. We're getting
7 promises with no hope of there being actual
8 solutions.

9 The simple fact of the matter is,
10 and we were talking about statistics a little
11 earlier, that according to the National Fire
12 Protection Association, despite the fact that 60
13 percent of U.S. households are heated by natural
14 gas, there are over three times as many
15 electrical fires caused in homes than there are
16 fires that have to do with gases to heat your
17 home.

18 You are being fed a line of
19 nonsense, and today is the latest step in that.
20 Protect your own right to be able to --

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
22 Rhoads, how do you vote?

23 SENATOR RHOADS: -- get clean, safe
24 and dependable natural gas.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator

1 Rhoads, how do you vote?

2 SENATOR RHOADS: I will vote no on
3 this bill --

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
5 Rhoads to be recorded in the negative.

6 Announce the results.

7 SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you,
8 Mr. President.

9 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
10 Calendar 1950, voting in the negative are
11 Senators Ashby, Baskin, Borrello, Bynoe,
12 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Gallivan, Griffo,
13 Helming, Lanza, Martinez, Martins, Mattera,
14 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,
15 Rolison, C. Ryan, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber
16 and Weik.

17 Ayes, 34. Nays, 25.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
19 is passed.

20 Senator Gianaris.

21 SENATOR GIANARIS: Next up is
22 Calendar 1509.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
24 Secretary will ring the bell.

25 The Secretary will read.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 1509, Senate Print 6954A, by Senator Gounardes,
3 an act to amend the General Business Law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
5 Walczyk, why do you rise?

6 SENATOR WALCZYK: I'm hoping the
7 sponsor will yield, Mr. President.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
9 sponsor yield?

10 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Yes,
11 Mr. President. Yes.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
13 sponsor yields.

14 SENATOR WALCZYK: So artificial
15 intelligence, an emerging technology, we've
16 ventured to become a hub for AI development here
17 in New York State. How does this bill compare to
18 other states we're competing with to become that
19 AI hub?

20 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Through you,
21 Mr. President, what I think would be helpful is
22 for us to state what this bill does, and I can
23 answer my colleague's questions.

24 SENATOR WALCZYK: Sure.

25 SENATOR GOUNARDES: This bill is

1 the Stop Deep Fakes Act, and it's very simple.
2 It just requires that in this age of AI, in this
3 age of having applications where artificial
4 intelligence can conjure up images or audio or
5 video, that there be metadata attached to
6 these -- the creation of these files that say
7 this was generated by AI, this was created by
8 this AI platform, this was made on this date by
9 this user, potentially.

10 Just like right now, if you click on
11 a digital photo, there is metadata saying the
12 size of the photo, who owns the photo, when it
13 was created, et cetera.

14 And so by adopting this standard we
15 are joining California, which also passed a
16 nearly identical standard. And the standard that
17 we are adopting here is one that is -- I believe
18 I can say used across the globe and is quickly
19 becoming the industry standard internationally.

20 So I don't think that this has any
21 impact on still making New York a competitive
22 place where companies want to come and invest and
23 develop future AI capabilities.

24 SENATOR WALCZYK: Thank you.

25 Through you, Mr. President, would

1 the sponsor yield.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
3 sponsor yield?

4 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Yes.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
6 sponsor yields.

7 SENATOR WALCZYK: Thank you.

8 And that answered a few of the
9 questions off the list, so I'm glad you gave a
10 thorough explanation.

11 On page 3 -- so this is under
12 Section 1511, subsection 4 of your bill.
13 Subsection 4 says: "The provisions of this
14 section shall only apply to synthetic content
15 creations systems that were created or modified
16 after the effective date of this article."

17 Won't that discourage new AI from --
18 businesses from locating New York State if it
19 only applies to them and not preexisting AI?

20 SENATOR GOUNARDES: (Conferring.)
21 Through you, Mr. President, no.

22 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
23 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
24 yield.

25 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Yes.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
2 sponsor yield?

3 The sponsor yields.

4 SENATOR WALCZYK: Would this apply
5 to both 2D and 3D media, videos?

6 SENATOR GOUNARDES: To just
7 clarify, you said 2D?

8 SENATOR WALCZYK: Yeah,
9 two-dimensional and three-dimensional, to include
10 videos.

11 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Through you,
12 Mr. President, yes. As long as the content is
13 either a fully synthetic creation or
14 substantially or materially synthetically
15 modified, yes.

16 SENATOR WALCZYK: And through you,
17 Mr. President, will the sponsor continue to
18 yield.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
20 sponsor yield?

21 SENATOR GOUNARDES: I yield,
22 Mr. President.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
24 sponsor yields.

25 SENATOR WALCZYK: So this is called

1 the Stop Deep Fakes Act, which I think is a
2 laudable goal and title. Will this apply to
3 3D media which isn't a deep fake?

4 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Through you,
5 Mr. President. The intent of this is to make
6 sure that there is transparency in the creation
7 of digital media through the use of AI platforms
8 like Dolly or Facebook or Instagram or Midjourney
9 and others.

10 We know that we are living in a
11 moment where imaging can be created or videos can
12 be created or audio clips can be created that are
13 deep fake, that are not real. There can be a
14 video created using this technology right now of
15 Senator Borrello thanking me for sponsoring the
16 Save Dunkirk Act. And it would be a fraudulent
17 video, but no one would know. And I could post
18 that video to my Facebook page and say that
19 Senator Borrello is thankful for what I did.

20 And so the intent here is to make
21 sure that with all of the creation of this data
22 and all of these images and all of these media,
23 that there is a way to track and trace who
24 created it, how it was created, when it was
25 created, and what platform was used to create it.

1 By shining a light on those
2 features, that is how we are able to stop deep
3 fakes like the video that I -- I know Senator
4 Borrello wants me to make but I won't.

5 (Laughter.)

6 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
7 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
8 yield.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Does the
10 sponsor yield?

11 SENATOR GOUNARDES: I will, yes.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
13 sponsor yields.

14 SENATOR WALCZYK: But this bill
15 wouldn't just apply to deep fakes, it would be
16 anything that's created by AI in the State of
17 New York, is that correct?

18 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Through you,
19 Mr. President, yes.

20 But the whole intention here is that
21 that deep fake is a type of digital media that is
22 being used in a, you know, malicious or
23 fraudulent way that is not what that picture is
24 meant to convey or does not represent a fact or a
25 reality.

1 So this applies to all digital media
2 that's created. And the reason why we call it
3 the Stop Deep Fakes Act is because you might
4 create a photo or an image or a video or an audio
5 clip that is not malevolent or with malicious
6 intent or misleading or has, you know,
7 disinformation. Those types of files are
8 deep fakes. We call those deep fakes because
9 they're not real. And not that they're
10 artificial in that they are not purporting to be
11 what is based in reality.

12 So this applies to all digital media
13 that's created using these tools.

14 SENATOR WALCZYK: And through you,
15 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
16 yield.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Does the
18 sponsor yield?

19 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Yes.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
21 sponsor yields.

22 SENATOR WALCZYK: What about
23 filters in social media apps? So, you know, a
24 filter on Snapchat or on Instagram which they use
25 within those applications, would they be included

1 in this legislation?

2 SENATOR GOUNARDES: So through you,
3 Mr. President, a Snapchat filter is not a wholly
4 synthetic content creation system. So the filter
5 itself would not count.

6 However, in the case of Snapchat if
7 a user uploads a photo to Snapchat to make a snap
8 that has otherwise been substantially modified,
9 synthetically modified with one of these AI
10 platforms, Snapchat would have to keep that
11 metadata that we're requiring here, this
12 provenance data attached to that photo because it
13 was otherwise synthetically modified.

14 SENATOR WALCZYK: And through you,
15 Mr. President, will the sponsor continue to
16 yield.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
18 sponsor yield?

19 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Yes, I do.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
21 sponsor yields.

22 SENATOR WALCZYK: How will this
23 apply to livestreams, if that kind of technology
24 is utilized in a livestream? Because you can't
25 really attach metadata while you're streaming

1 live.

2 SENATOR GOUNARDES: So through you,
3 Mr. President, it's our understanding that there
4 is no technology that applies to livestreams in
5 realtime.

6 However, if content is otherwise
7 synthetically modified or created, the
8 requirements of this act would apply.

9 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
10 Mr. President, will the sponsor continue to
11 yield?

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
13 sponsor yield?

14 SENATOR GOUNARDES: I do.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
16 sponsor yields.

17 SENATOR WALCZYK: So you could
18 create, in a sense, a deep fake as long as it's
19 livestreaming and the content creation is
20 happening live, there wouldn't be anything
21 attached to it.

22 Am I understanding that correctly?

23 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Through you,
24 Mr. President. That would be correct.

25 I'll also say that the -- as

1 technology, as AI is changing, as the standards
2 are constantly changing, this is meant to be a
3 flexible and evolving standard. Right now, in
4 this moment in time, the international tech
5 community has coalesced around these core
6 principles. Using this level of provenance
7 transparency, that will continue to evolve.

8 It's our expectation that, based on
9 how we have structured this bill, that as those
10 standards change, as those newer ways of ensuring
11 transparency come online, that there will be
12 options to -- opportunities to include that data
13 in the future.

14 SENATOR WALCZYK: And through you,
15 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
16 yield.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
18 sponsor yield?

19 SENATOR GOUNARDES: I do.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
21 sponsor yields.

22 SENATOR WALCZYK: What about the
23 application for small businesses? Have you heard
24 from that small business community? I mean, many
25 times they're using AI to create either 2D --

1 mostly 2D images. Have you heard back from the
2 business community about what the impacts will be
3 on them?

4 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Through you,
5 Mr. President, we have not. But we don't expect
6 this to be any burden on small businesses or
7 individual creators.

8 Really, this responsibility attaches
9 to the software or to the tool itself. And so as
10 it creates the image, you know, I can go in and I
11 say, to the app, create a video of
12 George Borrello saying Andrew Gounardes is great.
13 Right? And then the app, as it makes that video,
14 will have to attach that metadata explaining how
15 it was made, which software was used, the date,
16 et cetera. That's on the content creation side.
17 So it's not on the individual user who's
18 inputting the request to generate the image, the
19 audio clip or the video.

20 So we don't anticipate this being
21 any burden on either a small business trying to
22 use AI to create images for their business or
23 individuals.

24 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
25 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to

1 yield.

2 SENATOR GOUNARDES: I do.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
4 sponsor yield?

5 The sponsor yields.

6 SENATOR WALCZYK: What do the
7 penalties for noncompliance look like? If a
8 social media platform doesn't have the data
9 that's required under this legislation -- I see
10 that you've given some permissions to the
11 Attorney General here. What's the biggest
12 penalty that somebody could face?

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Through
14 you, Mr. President. The penalties that we
15 empower the Attorney General to enforce are civil
16 penalties of no more than \$25,000 for each
17 violation.

18 SENATOR WALCZYK: Thank you,
19 Mr. President.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Are there
21 any other Senators wishing to be heard?

22 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
23 closed. The Secretary will ring the bell.

24 Read the last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This

1 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
2 shall have become a law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
9 Calendar 1509, voting in the negative:
10 Senator Walczyk.

11 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
13 is passed.

14 Senator Gianaris.

15 SENATOR GIANARIS: Let's move on to
16 Calendar 1635, please.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
18 Secretary will ring the bell.

19 The Secretary will read.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 1635, Senate Print 6693B, by Senator Jackson, an
22 act to amend the Education Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
24 Helming, why do you rise?

25 SENATOR HELMING: Thank you,

1 Mr. President. If the bill's sponsor will yield
2 for a couple of questions.

3 SENATOR GIANARIS: It's Senator
4 Stavisky that will be answering.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
6 Stavisky will answer in place of the sponsor.

7 Senator Stavisky, will you yield?

8 SENATOR STAVISKY: Yes, of course.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
10 Senator yields.

11 SENATOR HELMING: Thank you,
12 Mr. President. Through you.

13 Senator Stavisky, it's my
14 understanding the bill before us is a scope of
15 practice expansion for a podiatrist. Does this
16 bill allow podiatrists to undertake or to
17 complete total ankle replacements?

18 SENATOR STAVISKY: Yes.

19 SENATOR HELMING: Through you,
20 Mr. President, if the sponsor will continue to
21 yield.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
23 Senator yield?

24 SENATOR STAVISKY: Yes.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The

1 Senator yields.

2 SENATOR HELMING: Senator Stavisky,
3 are podiatrists considered physicians under
4 New York State law?

5 SENATOR STAVISKY: There's a
6 separate licensure for podiatry. And let me
7 expand on that very quickly.

8 Podiatrists go to college for four
9 years, four years of podiatry school, three years
10 of a hospital residency, and many continue to
11 do -- with a fellowship of one, two or three
12 years.

13 However, there are only 11 podiatry
14 schools in the entire country, one in New York
15 State. And the one in New York State, in Harlem,
16 graduates approximately 90 podiatrists a year.
17 And of the 90 podiatrists, 85 percent, they buy a
18 one-way ticket for their residency, they leave
19 New York, they don't come back.

20 The reason they do this is because
21 they are trained to do various procedures
22 including ankle replacements and ankle implants,
23 and New York State does not allow them to do
24 that. So as a result, we are losing our
25 podiatrists who are well trained, well educated,

1 and leave New York for other places where, in
2 40-some-odd states they are allowed to do ankle
3 replacements and more.

4 And of the residency slots available
5 in New York, about half are unfilled.

6 SENATOR HELMING: Through you,
7 Mr. President, if the sponsor will continue to
8 yield.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
10 Senator yield?

11 SENATOR STAVISKY: Yes.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
13 Senator yields.

14 SENATOR HELMING: Thank you,
15 Senator.

16 I have received a number of pieces
17 of correspondence from a long list of
18 organizations who are opposed to this, citing
19 concerns about patient safety. These
20 organizations include the Medical Society of the
21 State of New York, the New York chapter of the
22 American College of Surgeons, the New York State
23 Academy of Family Physicians, the New York State
24 Society of Dermatology and Dermatological
25 Surgery, New York Neurologic Society, New York

1 State Society of Anesthesiologists, the New York
2 State Society of Orthopedic Surgeons, the
3 New York State Society of Plastic Surgeons, the
4 New York State Ophthalmological Society, the
5 New York State Society of Otolaryngology, and the
6 New York State Radiological Society.

7 And again, they're all concerned, it
8 seems, primarily about the public safety
9 associated with and the lack of training that
10 podiatrists have in order to do the ankle
11 surgeries.

12 It's my understanding that there
13 were several meetings held where you had like the
14 orthopedics, the podiatrists, SED and other
15 interested parties meeting together to discuss
16 the bill and what should and shouldn't be
17 included.

18 Were the considerations of the
19 orthopedics and the organizations I just read
20 considered in this B print?

21 SENATOR STAVISKY: Let me -- that's
22 a two-part question.

23 The first part, you're reading a
24 list of organizations that say that they don't
25 support the bill. But they're not permitted to

1 do this, so how can they know it's dangerous when
2 they're not permitted to do it in New York State
3 at all, even though they're trained?

4 Secondly, the second part of the
5 question was -- what was it?

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:
7 Senator Helming, could you restate the second
8 part of the question?

9 SENATOR HELMING: Yes,
10 Mr. President, through you.

11 SENATOR STAVISKY: Oh, I'm sorry.
12 That was a meeting -- I was not there, so I
13 cannot testify what took place. It took place at
14 the end of April in Westchester County.

15 SENATOR HELMING: Through you,
16 Mr. President. Senator Stavisky --

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: First of
18 all, Senator Stavisky --

19 SENATOR HELMING: Through you,
20 Mr. President.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
22 Senator yield?

23 SENATOR STAVISKY: Yes.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
25 Senator yields.

1 SENATOR HELMING: Thank you,
2 Mr. President.

3 Senator, are you aware that there is
4 another bill, I believe it's a Senator Cooney
5 bill, that calls for a study to determine the
6 need for podiatrists to have an expanded scope?
7 And the study would then make recommendations.

8 Wouldn't it be more reasonable to
9 wait until we have those results before passing
10 this legislation?

11 SENATOR STAVISKY: No, I'm not
12 familiar with the bill. But this has been under
13 discussion since 2012 when my predecessor,
14 Senator LaValle, from the other side of the
15 aisle, held a series of meetings, et cetera, and
16 worked out --

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
18 Stavisky, one second.

19 SENATOR STAVISKY: -- a very
20 similar bill, so --

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Excuse
22 me. The hour's late. If we can please have some
23 order in the house. Thank you.

24 Senator Stavisky, continue.

25 SENATOR STAVISKY: So the bottom

1 line is that this bill has been around really in
2 various forms since 2012, since the original
3 chapter was signed, Senator LaValle's chapter.
4 And they are well-trained, and I think they are
5 fully capable of doing -- of increasing the --
6 really, we're defining and modernizing
7 Senator LaValle's bill.

8 SENATOR HELMING: Thank you.

9 Mr. President, on the bill.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
11 Helming on the bill.

12 SENATOR HELMING: Senator Stavisky,
13 thank you very much for your responses. I
14 appreciate it.

15 I would just ask that we continue to
16 look at whether or not it is in the best interest
17 of the patients, prioritize the safety of the
18 patients over the loss of podiatrists on allowing
19 for the total ankle replacement by podiatrists.

20 Thank you, Mr. President.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
22 you, Senator Helming.

23 Are there any other Senators wishing
24 to be heard?

25 Seeing and hearing none, debate is

1 closed. The Secretary will ring the bell.

2 Read the last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
4 act shall take effect 18 months after it shall
5 have become a law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
10 Stavisky to explain her vote.

11 SENATOR STAVISKY: Thank you,
12 Mr. President.

13 We've been studying this bill since
14 2013. It's time to act. We are short of
15 podiatrists. They are trained to do this, and
16 they do it outside New York State. We can't
17 afford to continue losing our population to other
18 states because it is more attractive. I've heard
19 this from the other side of the aisle: We can't
20 compete because it's more attractive elsewhere.

21 Let's start bringing our folks back
22 to New York where they were trained. I vote aye.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
24 Stavisky to be recorded in the affirmative.

25 Senator Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick to

1 explain her vote.

2 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK:

3 Thank you, Mr. President.

4 While I understand the concept that
5 we need to make -- we need more professionals
6 to -- providers of medical care, my concern is
7 that we are expanding our scope of practice when
8 people are not properly trained and we are
9 putting people at risk that they are not going to
10 get the proper care.

11 For those reasons, I'm voting no.

12 Thank you, Mr. President.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
14 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick to be recorded in the
15 negative.

16 Announce the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
18 Calendar 1635, voting in the negative are
19 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Cooney,
20 Helming, Krueger, Martins, O'Mara, Rhoads,
21 Scarcella-Spanton, Tedisco and Walczyk. Also
22 Senator Rolison.

23 Ayes, 47. Nays, 12.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
25 is passed.

1 Senator Gianaris.

2 SENATOR GIANARIS: Next up,
3 Mr. President, is Calendar Number 1618.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
5 Secretary will ring the bell.

6 Read the last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 1618, Assembly Bill Number 584C, by
9 Assemblymember Steck, an act to amend the
10 Labor Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
12 Borrello, why do you rise?

13 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
14 would the sponsor yield for a question.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
16 sponsor yield?

17 SENATOR MAY: I would.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
19 May yields.

20 SENATOR BORRELLO: Through you,
21 Mr. President. So your bill talks about if an
22 employer decides that they want to pay for the
23 training for an employee, that they are not
24 allowed to essentially have an agreement that you
25 can't -- you have to pay it back before you leave

1 employment, is that correct?

2 SENATOR MAY: Through you,
3 Mr. President. This is about what are known as
4 training reimbursement agreement provisions. And
5 typically they are -- they don't specify an
6 amount that the person would need to pay back,
7 they're much more vague than that.

8 And this is saying you can't just
9 stick somebody with a charge for leaving your
10 employment in that way.

11 SENATOR BORRELLO: Okay.

12 Mr. President, will the sponsor
13 continue to yield.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
15 sponsor yield?

16 SENATOR MAY: I would.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
18 sponsor yields.

19 SENATOR BORRELLO: So I understand
20 what you're saying. Like if they've come up with
21 this charge of what it costs them to train
22 somebody, and then they're sticking -- I can
23 understand that.

24 But let's just say -- let's take a
25 real example. Let's say I need people to drive

1 trucks, and we're going to pay for the CDL
2 license, which is an expensive training. It
3 takes a few months, 2500 to \$5,000, and I want --
4 and once they have it, that's for them. They now
5 have that training and they can take that
6 anywhere.

7 Can I not have an agreement that
8 says I'll pay the money you don't have for you to
9 become a licensed CDL driver, which you can use
10 somewhere down the road, but I really need you to
11 work for me for at least a year? Would that be a
12 violation of this law?

13 SENATOR MAY: So technically, yes,
14 this would disallow that. But it's really about
15 them clawing back a certain amount of money if
16 the employee wishes to leave.

17 And the way this is playing out most
18 of the time is more -- much more vague than that.
19 It's future profits or it's administrative costs
20 plus some previously undisclosed amount that the
21 employer decides after the fact to charge the
22 people in order for them to leave their
23 employment.

24 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
25 will the sponsor continue to yield?

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
2 sponsor yield?

3 SENATOR MAY: Yes.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
5 sponsor yields.

6 SENATOR BORRELLO: The business
7 that we are in, we employ lifeguards and security
8 guards. Both have to be trained and certified.
9 Most of the folks in our area, you know, they
10 can't afford the \$250 to become a licensed
11 security guard, so we will pay for that. In
12 exchange, we want them to work for us and not --
13 because, again, that's a certification they can
14 take anywhere. And they would need it to be a
15 security guard anywhere that requires you to have
16 a license to be a security guard.

17 So if we pay that money and say,
18 Look, unless you work for us X amount of hours,
19 you're going to have to pay us that money back --
20 you know, because we could pay for certification
21 and they could work one hour for us and we'd be
22 out that money.

23 How would this law impact that
24 agreement?

25 SENATOR MAY: So this doesn't

1 interfere with agreements to repay advanced --
2 like if you have paid for that in advance of
3 their coming to work for you, you can have an
4 agreement like that. And you -- or you could
5 just require that they have got the CDL or the --
6 or, you know, lifesaving before you would employ
7 them at all.

8 But if you brought them on and were
9 training them at the same time and then charged
10 them for that after the fact, that's what this
11 would stop.

12 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
13 will the sponsor continue to yield?

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
15 sponsor yield?

16 SENATOR MAY: Yes.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
18 sponsor yields.

19 SENATOR BORRELLO: So I just want
20 to be clear, because I think this has a potential
21 impact on a lot of folks that employ particularly
22 young people.

23 If we're going to pay for your
24 lifeguard certification, you have to be certified
25 before you can go one day as a lifeguard, you

1 know, at a swimming beach like we have. So if we
2 pay for that lifeguard certification and they
3 never actually work for us, can we -- we never
4 ask them for the money back. We don't ask them
5 to repay the money. We just say please work for
6 us for an extended period of time in order, you
7 know, to justify the investment that we made in
8 that training.

9 Is that disallowed by this?

10 SENATOR MAY: (Conferring.) What
11 this is trying to forestall -- through you,
12 Mr. President -- is people going into debt
13 because they need to leave. Either they have to
14 leave the employment for some reason, or the
15 conditions of employment turn out to be really
16 onerous in some way and they -- or it's just a
17 horrible fit for them.

18 But if you're a good employer and
19 you have done these things, part of it is you're
20 only going to train these people because there's
21 competition for workers out there. And part of
22 the competition is that you create the conditions
23 where people want to stay in your employment.

24 If you are bringing them on, even if
25 you're offering the training but then you are

1 abusing them, mistreating them, creating
2 conditions where they just cannot stay, then I
3 think, you know, that's a risk that the employer
4 takes on.

5 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
6 on the bill.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
8 Borrello on the bill.

9 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you,
10 Senator May.

11 I understand what you're trying to
12 accomplish with this bill. My concern is this.
13 There are people out there that just simply can't
14 afford to pay for the training.

15 You know, we have 16-year-old kids
16 that are lifeguards and we pay for them to become
17 lifeguards because they can't afford the \$250 for
18 the training. Same thing with the security
19 licenses. On a higher scale, a CDL license.
20 Anybody that has some kind of a truck-driving
21 company needs truck drivers, and they're willing
22 to pay \$2500 or more to train that person.

23 So the problem I see with this bill
24 is we're basically saying you aren't really
25 allowed to give -- set a condition for you to pay

1 for that. And that's my concern with this bill.

2 So I think the -- I understand what
3 you're saying. If someone's being abused at
4 work, we have laws for that. If someone is in a
5 situation where their employer is taking
6 advantage of them, we have labor laws for that.

7 What this bill could possibly do is
8 just eliminate the opportunity for people to get
9 the training that they otherwise could not get
10 because an employer is willing to front that
11 money -- not because they're training them
12 in-house and charging them -- which I understand
13 was probably what this bill is supposed to do,
14 stop somebody from, you know, setting up some
15 kind of a scheme where they're training people
16 and profiting off of it. I get that.

17 But I think the wording of this bill
18 is vague enough that it will have a negative
19 impact on those of us that genuinely are willing
20 to invest in people, give them something that
21 they'll have, in some cases for life that they
22 can take to their future employment, and all
23 we're asking in return is that, you know, please
24 at least give us a return on our investment in
25 you by working for us.

1 So for that reason, I'll be voting
2 no, and I'm hoping that there's a way to clarify
3 this perhaps in the bill. Thank you.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
5 you, Senator Borrello.

6 Are there any other Senators wishing
7 to be heard?

8 Senator Rhoads, why do you rise?

9 SENATOR RHOADS: Thanks so much,
10 Mr. President. I just want to speak on the bill.
11 I'm not going to ask Senator May any additional
12 questions.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
14 Rhoads on the bill.

15 SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you so much.

16 Even worse -- and Senator Borrello
17 made some terrific points -- this extends far
18 beyond employers. Because with experience in the
19 volunteer fire service, when you want to train
20 somebody as an EMT or an AMT -- because this bill
21 very clearly states that it applies to volunteers
22 as well -- when you want to train somebody as an
23 EMT or an AMT, the fire department will pay for
24 that training.

25 That training can cost three, four,

1 five thousand dollars, depending on how far you
2 go. Generally the department will pay for that
3 in exchange for a written agreement that you will
4 actually stay as a volunteer for some period of
5 time -- a year, two years, three years. That's
6 not uncommon. In fact, that's I would say the
7 rule more than the exception.

8 And even though Senator May had
9 indicated that there is some wiggle room in her
10 interpretation of what the statute means, the
11 statute says what the statute says. There is no
12 wiggle room in the statute.

13 Those which she terms as employment
14 promising notes, or promissory notes, she's
15 talking about a contract. She's talking about a
16 contract just like the employer who's willing to
17 pay for the CDL class which has a defined cost,
18 which you can quantify in an agreement, and
19 you're agreeing to stay with that company for six
20 months, for a year, whatever it is, in exchange
21 for being provided that free training that you
22 can now take with you anywhere that you go.

23 Same thing with the volunteer fire
24 service. Same thing with the SAFER Grant
25 program, right, where we're paying for -- in

1 Nassau County we have this -- we're paying for
2 your college tuition if you agree to be a member
3 of the volunteer fire department, your equivalent
4 of Nassau Community College. That type of
5 agreement, under the wording of this bill as it
6 is written, would be illegal.

7 Our Excelsior Grant program, a
8 New York State program, theoretically, where
9 we're agreeing to provide you tuition to be able
10 to go to college in exchange for your requirement
11 to stay and work in the State of New York --
12 under the wording of this bill, that might very
13 well be illegal.

14 So while I understand the concept
15 and the principle that you don't want someone
16 taking advantage of an employee in a difficult
17 situation with an expense that was never
18 quantified in advance, this bill specifically
19 deals with the contracts that would spell that
20 out in advance. That's the language of the bill.

21 And so I would strongly encourage my
22 colleagues, even if you agree with the concept,
23 the way this bill is worded is so vague and is so
24 easily misinterpreted to prohibit so many things
25 that are essential to our emergency services, to

1 our volunteer fire departments, to employers who
2 rely upon qualified individuals and are willing
3 to provide the training to get them the
4 qualifications that they need, that would impact
5 so many of them that it would really cause a
6 tremendous hindrance to those organizations and,
7 quite frankly, to the employees who cannot afford
8 that training and want to receive it in exchange
9 for employment.

10 We're talking about agreements
11 between employers and employees. You're talking
12 about arm's-length transactions where all of the
13 facts and information are out there in the open,
14 those would be prohibited by this agreement.

15 So I would strongly urge my
16 colleagues to vote against this bill. Let's come
17 back next year with something that's a little
18 better drafted that truly accomplishes the
19 objectives that Senator May attempted to explain,
20 and let's do this the right way.

21 But for now, this is a bad
22 bill that's going to cause more harm than good.

23 Thank you.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
25 you, Senator Rhoads.

1 Are there any other Senators wishing
2 to be heard?

3 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
4 closed. The Secretary will ring the bell.

5 Read the last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
7 act shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
12 May to explain her vote.

13 SENATOR MAY: Thank you,
14 Mr. President.

15 And thank you to my colleagues for
16 your questions.

17 This bill is designed to deal with
18 some really serious entrapment situations for
19 employees who find themselves -- for example,
20 nurses who are qualified, they receive a job and
21 then they are required to go through a training
22 program and if they leave that job, they are then
23 charged for the costs of the training program
24 plus interest plus administrative costs, and they
25 leave the job with a -- seriously in debt.

1 And it works out sort of like the
2 old company store where, if you lived in the town
3 where your coal mine was and you had to shop at
4 the store that was owned by the company, you
5 could end up further and further and further in
6 debt to the company.

7 This is a real problem. I
8 definitely hear my colleagues, and I know if it
9 is a good employer who makes it clear at the
10 beginning that this is -- that this training is
11 being provided and there's an expectation the
12 person will stay, if you're a good employer,
13 generally they will stay. But there are lots of
14 situations where people find themselves truly
15 trapped by these training reimbursement agreement
16 provisions, or traps, that they are stuck at work
17 and the only way they can leave is going to send
18 them deeply into debt.

19 So I hear my colleagues' concerns,
20 but I still think this is something where we need
21 to protect a lot of people from this.

22 So I vote aye. Thank you.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
24 May to be recorded in the affirmative.

25 Announce the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
2 Calendar 1618, voting in the negative are
3 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
4 Chan, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming, Lanza, Martins,
5 Mattera, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo,
6 Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber
7 and Weik.

8 Ayes, 38. Nays, 21.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
10 is passed.

11 Senator Gianaris.

12 SENATOR GIANARIS: Calendar Number
13 258 is next, Mr. President.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
15 Secretary will ring the bell.

16 The Secretary will read.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 258, Senate Print 1050, by Senator Salazar, an
19 act to amend the Correction Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
21 Stec, why do you rise?

22 SENATOR STEC: If the sponsor would
23 please yield for some questions.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
25 Salazar, do you yield?

1 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
3 sponsor yields.

4 SENATOR STEC: Hello again,
5 Senator. This is, I guess, Round 2 of
6 corrections-related bills on the last day of
7 session here.

8 The first question I have is this
9 bill's really regarding phone calls from inmates
10 upon their transfer from one facility to another
11 facility, is that correct?

12 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
13 Mr. President. This bill is about notifying the
14 next of kin or a personal representative
15 designated by an incarcerated individual before
16 the incarcerated individual's transfer.

17 It also would allow, within 24 hours
18 before the transfer, the opportunity for that
19 incarcerated individual to make a phone call, at
20 no cost to themselves, to a family member in order
21 to inform them of the transfer, as long as that
22 call would not pose an unacceptable risk to the
23 safety or security of the facility.

24 SENATOR STEC: If the sponsor would
25 yield.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
2 sponsor yield?

3 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

4 SENATOR STEC: The sponsor yields.

5 SENATOR STEC: So is it correct
6 that current law is that a phone call is allowed
7 within 24 hours after a transfer, but this bill
8 would require an attempt at notification and
9 offer that free phone call to the inmate
10 immediately before transfer? Is that basically
11 the change from current law to future law in this
12 bill?

13 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
14 Mr. President, that is partly true, with the
15 important caveat that the phone call would not
16 happen if it were deemed to create an
17 unacceptable risk to the safety of incarcerated
18 individuals or department staff.

19 SENATOR STEC: If the sponsor would
20 yield.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
22 sponsor yield?

23 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
25 sponsor yields.

1 SENATOR STEC: Did you discuss this
2 legislation with DOCCS?

3 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
4 Mr. President, yes, previously. Although I've
5 had this legislation for quite a while at this
6 point. It has previously passed the Senate.

7 SENATOR STEC: If the sponsor would
8 yield.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
10 sponsor yield?

11 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
13 sponsor yields.

14 SENATOR STEC: Let me rephrase.

15 In discussing this with DOCCS, did
16 DOCCS express support that this was a good idea,
17 that they wanted to see the change from current
18 law to what this bill has? Were they in favor?

19 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
20 Mr. President. I didn't receive support nor
21 opposition from DOCCS.

22 SENATOR STEC: I'm sorry, I didn't
23 hear that part.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
25 Salazar, could you rephrase? I'm sorry. No,

1 could you repeat your answer? Senator Stec could
2 not hear you.

3 SENATOR SALAZAR: Sorry. So I
4 said, through you, Mr. President, I didn't
5 receive support nor opposition to this bill from
6 DOCCS.

7 SENATOR STEC: If the sponsor would
8 continue to yield.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
10 sponsor yield?

11 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
13 sponsor yields.

14 SENATOR STEC: Thank you.

15 NYSCOPBA, Council 82, PEF, CSEA --
16 letters of support?

17 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
18 Mr. President, neither letters of support nor
19 opposition to this bill from any of them.

20 SENATOR STEC: Will the sponsor
21 continue to yield.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
23 sponsor yield?

24 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The

1 sponsor yields.

2 SENATOR STEC: I recall you and I
3 debated this bill or one very much like it
4 last -- a year ago. Did the Governor veto the
5 bill last year? And if so, what did her veto
6 message say?

7 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
8 Mr. President. The Governor vetoed a version of
9 this bill carried by another Senator or former
10 Senator in 2022.

11 SENATOR STEC: Will the sponsor
12 continue to yield.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
14 sponsor yield?

15 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
17 sponsor yields.

18 SENATOR STEC: In our previous
19 debate you stated that family members had -- you
20 had expressed stories anecdotally that family
21 members had traveled to visit an inmate at one
22 facility only to get there and find out that they
23 had missed him and he had been transferred to
24 another.

25 And again, current law is that

1 within 24 hours of transfer that kind of phone
2 call is supposed to happen. So we're talking
3 about a window of a day or two at most.

4 I'm wondering, since that debate, do
5 you have any -- instead of anecdotal information,
6 do you have any like hard data of how often that
7 happens, where somebody shows up to say, "I'm
8 here to see Joe Schmoe" -- "Sorry, you just
9 missed him, he was on the bus last night"?

10 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
11 Mr. President, I couldn't possibly know how often
12 exactly it happens.

13 I have heard on multiple occasions
14 from loved ones of incarcerated individuals that
15 they spend a lot of time traveling to see their
16 loved one or, alternatively, they seek to contact
17 their loved one at the facility that they were
18 last supposed to be housed at; the family and
19 loved ones were not notified of -- there even was
20 going to be a transfer, let alone where their
21 loved one is in the state.

22 And as a result, they were either
23 unable to visit their loved one after traveling
24 to the facility where their loved one had
25 previously been housed, or they were unable to

1 reach their loved one, causing them a lot of
2 unnecessary distress.

3 SENATOR STEC: Will the sponsor
4 continue to yield.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
6 sponsor yield?

7 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
9 sponsor yields.

10 SENATOR STEC: So if DOCCS didn't
11 ask for this legislation and you don't have memos
12 of support, and I'm sure that CSEA, PEF, NYSCOPBA
13 and Council 82 do not ask for this, I'm
14 wondering, who is asking for this legislation?

15 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
16 Mr. President, I know that this legislation is
17 really important to many of the loved ones of
18 incarcerated individuals.

19 And I think it's important for us to
20 consider that, especially because what we do know
21 is that -- and what there's abundant evidence of
22 is that when incarcerated individuals maintain
23 close ties and relationships to their family, to
24 their support system while they're incarcerated
25 and throughout the period of incarceration, they

1 are less likely to recidivise after they have
2 completed their prison sentence.

3 So I think it's important for those
4 relationships to be maintained, and this
5 legislation would contribute positively to that.

6 SENATOR STEC: Will the sponsor
7 continue to yield.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
9 sponsor yield?

10 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
12 sponsor yields.

13 SENATOR STEC: Thank you.

14 Do you understand the very real
15 concerns that DOCCS has with this proposal? I've
16 talked to people at DOCCS, I've talked to people
17 that work in facilities, and they all -- when
18 this subject comes up, that requiring advanced
19 notice of inmate movement from one facility to
20 another promotes an escape attempt where there's
21 help from the outside.

22 Now, we've talked a lot in this
23 chamber in the past about solitary confinement.
24 And again, everyone's conception of what solitary
25 confinement is comes from the movies. Well,

1 we've all seen movies where, hey, you know,
2 they're moving this prisoner and they hit the
3 bus. We've all seen those movies.

4 That is a very real concern that
5 DOCCS has, and that can happen. Are you aware of
6 that concern? Do you share that concern?

7 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
8 Mr. President. I've visited more than half of
9 the state prisons. I take great care in
10 conducting official visits in my capacity as
11 chair of the committee. My ideas about the
12 reality in state prisons do not come from films.
13 They come from these experiences and taking my
14 role as the chair of the committee very
15 seriously.

16 I have not, once again, heard from
17 anyone in DOCCS -- from Central Office, from
18 DOCCS staff, from anyone -- concerns about this
19 legislation.

20 And I will mention again that there
21 is a caveat in this bill that if it were to
22 create an unacceptable risk to the safety of
23 staff or incarcerated individuals, that an
24 incarcerated individual would not be permitted to
25 make a call prior to their transfer.

1 It also does not require DOCCS to,
2 in their notification to a designated person or
3 family member of the to-be-transferred
4 incarcerated individual, does not require them to
5 name a facility that the person is going to be
6 transferred to.

7 So there really is no reason to
8 suspect that this would in any way pose a risk of
9 safety. It really is just going to serve the
10 purpose of ensuring that incarcerated
11 individuals are able to stay in contact with
12 their loved ones.

13 SENATOR STEC: If the sponsor would
14 yield for one more question before I go on the
15 bill.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
17 sponsor yield?

18 SENATOR SALAZAR: Yes.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: I'm not
20 going to say "one question" or people will be
21 changing their minds.

22 SENATOR STEC: It's going to be one
23 question, if it gets answered.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
25 sponsor yield?

1 SENATOR SALAZAR: For one question
2 or multiple questions, yes.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
4 sponsor yields.

5 SENATOR STEC: What year were you
6 elected to the Legislature?

7 SENATOR SALAZAR: Through you,
8 Mr. President. I was elected in 2018.

9 SENATOR STEC: Thank you.
10 Mr. President, on the bill.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
12 Stec on the bill.

13 SENATOR STEC: First, for starters,
14 I said one question, I got a good answer, and it
15 was one question.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
17 you, Senator Stec.

18 SENATOR STEC: Thank you,
19 Mr. President.

20 Ten years ago this month, I believe,
21 2015, two convicted murderers escaped from
22 Clinton Correctional Facility in Dannemora, in
23 Clinton County, in my district. In a previous
24 debate I talked about, last night, several
25 inmates and staff members were exposed to some

1 sort of contraband substance that required
2 medical -- emergency medical treatment.

3 So, same facility, Sweat and Matt
4 escaped. Three weeks on the lam, three weeks in
5 my district. It wasn't my Senate district then,
6 it was Senator Little's Senate district. For
7 three weeks, everyone in the North Country was on
8 pins and needles. Everyone in the North Country
9 had their guns not locked up in their closets.
10 They were scared.

11 There were roadblocks everywhere. I
12 believe it was a million dollars a day that that
13 cost the taxpayers. But more importantly, you
14 had tens of thousands of New Yorkers terrified
15 because of the escape. Oh, by the way, that
16 escape was facilitated by contraband. Thank God
17 we're not aware that they had any help on the
18 outside besides the employee that helped them
19 with the contraband.

20 But escape is a very real phenomenon
21 and a very real concern. And alerting a loved
22 one, Hey, I'm getting moved in two hours and I'll
23 be on a bus -- it may be a loved one, it may be
24 an associate, it may be a gang member. It may be
25 somebody you owe money to. It may be somebody

1 that you do business with.

2 But dangerous things can happen,
3 which is why they don't allow cellphones in
4 prisons, which is why they control movements in
5 and out of prisons and they don't want -- they
6 don't want people knowing when people are
7 leaving. And that's my experience from the
8 people at DOCCS and what the people in the
9 facilities that I visit have expressed to me
10 about this bill over the years.

11 This is unnecessary. If you're
12 going to have a phone call within 24 hours from
13 when you get to where you get -- you know what,
14 those are the breaks. You're in prison. Public
15 safety comes first.

16 If the inmate and their family is
17 inconvenienced by that 24-hour window that, jeez,
18 I happened to drive three hours from New York
19 City up to the Adirondacks and I missed my loved
20 one because he moved -- if I had a nickel for
21 every time I heard a legislator say "if this bill
22 saves one life." Well, if not passing this bill
23 avoids one more escape, that will be fine.

24 This is unnecessary, bad -- and
25 again, I didn't ask the question, but this bill

1 doesn't do anything about contraband, this bill
2 doesn't do anything about staffing, this bill
3 doesn't do anything about HALT, this bill doesn't
4 do a thing about safety in these facilities.

5 All it does is it coddles people
6 that were convicted by a jury of their peers and
7 are behind bars because they deserve it and they
8 need to be there for the public's safety. Public
9 safety has got to come first.

10 This bill is almost as ridiculous as
11 the omnibus bill. I'll be a firm no.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
13 you, Senator Stec.

14 Are there any other Senators wishing
15 to be heard?

16 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
17 closed. The Secretary will ring the bell.

18 Read the last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
20 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it
21 shall have become a law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator

1 Salazar to explain her vote.

2 SENATOR SALAZAR: Thank you,
3 Mr. President.

4 We all know that this bill does not
5 pose any threat to public safety. It does not
6 pose a threat to the safety of incarcerated
7 individuals or anyone inside correctional
8 facilities. Quite the contrary.

9 We know that when incarcerated
10 individuals are able to stay in touch with their
11 support system, when they are able to stay in
12 touch with their loved ones, when they have
13 access to visitation, it reduces recidivism, it
14 has been demonstrated to improve morale and
15 behavior while incarcerated.

16 I'm really glad that the Senate has
17 chosen to pass this bill multiple times and is
18 passing this bill once again today. I cannot
19 imagine the pain of traveling a great distance,
20 especially perhaps from my district or downstate
21 to one of the dozens of correctional facilities
22 in our state, only to find that the person that
23 you have traveled there to visit is not only no
24 longer at the facility, but you don't even know
25 where they are.

1 I cannot imagine that pain, and it
2 is unnecessary. It is avoidable. And we will
3 help prevent that from happening by passing this
4 bill.

5 Thank you, Mr. President.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
7 Salazar to be recorded in the affirmative.

8 Announce the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
10 Calendar 258, voting in the negative are
11 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
12 Chan, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming, Lanza, Martins,
13 Mattera, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo,
14 Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber
15 and Weik.

16 Ayes, 38. Nays, 21.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
18 is passed.

19 Senator Gianaris.

20 SENATOR GIANARIS: Let's take up
21 Calendar 1914, please.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
23 Lanza, why do you rise?

24 The Secretary will read, excuse me.
25 Sorry.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 1914, Senate Print 8077, by Senator May, an act
3 to amend Part B of Chapter 56 of the Laws of
4 2020.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Now,
6 Senator Lanza, why do you rise?

7 SENATOR LANZA: I repeat, why do I
8 rise. Mr. President, I believe that there's an
9 amendment at the desk. I waive the reading of
10 that amendment and ask that you recognize
11 Senator Oberacker.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
13 you, Senator Lanza.

14 Upon review of the amendment, in
15 accordance with Rule 6, Section 4B, I rule it
16 nongermane and -- Tito, Michael, Jackie, Janet,
17 and any other Jackson -- out of order at this
18 time.

19 SENATOR LANZA: Accordingly,
20 Mr. President, I appeal the ruling of all those
21 folks and you, the chair, and ask that you
22 recognize Senator Oberacker to be heard on that
23 appeal.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
25 appeal has been made and recognized, and in

1 addition to the Jackson 5, Senator Oberacker may
2 be heard.

3 SENATOR OBERACKER: Thank you,
4 Mr. President.

5 Due to the lateness of the hour, I
6 won't try to sing any of my Jackson 5 tunes.

7 Mr. President, I rise to appeal the
8 ruling of the chair. The proposed amendment is
9 germane to the bill, as both deal with the
10 eligibility of certain students to participate in
11 athletic activities.

12 So I rise today to offer a hostile
13 amendment to this bill because we have a glaring
14 inconsistency in New York State, one that
15 discriminates against a group of children simply
16 because of how they are educated.

17 Right now in New York, if you're
18 home-schooled, you can participate in the chess
19 club, you can audition for the school play, you
20 can join the math team or the band. But if you
21 want to try out for a sports team, forget it.
22 You're locked out, you're denied. Not because
23 you're unqualified, not because you're a danger,
24 but because of an outdated policy that treats
25 home-schoolers like second-class citizens.

1 Now, let me be clear. These are not
2 unvaccinated children. To participate in
3 extracurricular activity through the local public
4 schools, home-schooled students must meet the
5 same vaccination requirements as their public
6 school peers. And here's the kicker. Sports,
7 kicker? Got it.

8 These same home-schooled kids are
9 playing alongside public school students right
10 now on travel teams across the state. They're on
11 the field together, the court together, the ice
12 together. They are teammates on Saturday, but
13 come Monday the home-schoolers can't try out for
14 the school team.

15 Mr. President, we are denying these
16 students the opportunity to compete, to grow and
17 to represent their communities. Athletics
18 teaches us discipline, teamwork, resilience. So
19 what are we really saying to those values?
20 Should they only be available to certain
21 children?

22 At a time when we talk so much about
23 equity, inclusion and opportunity, why are we
24 actively choosing to exclude kids who want to be
25 part of something bigger than themselves?

1 This is not just a bad policy, it's
2 shameful. So let's stop punishing families for
3 choosing different educational path. Let's
4 support all children, all children. Let's pass
5 this amendment, Mr. President, and give
6 home-schooled students the chance to play.

7 So for these reasons, Mr. President,
8 I strongly urge you to reconsider your ruling.

9 Thank you.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
11 you, Senator Oberacker.

12 I want to remind the house that this
13 vote is on the procedures of the house and the
14 ruling of the chair.

15 Those in favor of overruling the
16 chair please signify by saying aye.

17 (Response of "Aye.")

18 SENATOR LANZA: Show of hands.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: A show of
20 hands has been requested and so ordered.

21 Announce the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 21.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
24 ruling of the chair stands, and the bill-in-chief
25 is before the house.

1 Read the last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
11 is passed.

12 Senator Gianaris.

13 SENATOR GIANARIS: Did we pass the
14 bill?

15 (Laughter.)

16 SENATOR GIANARIS: Okay. Just want
17 to make sure.

18 Okay, Mr. President, we're going to
19 lay aside for the day Calendar 255 and
20 Calendar 892.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Those
22 bills will be laid aside for the day.

23 SENATOR GIANARIS: I move to adopt
24 the Resolution Calendar.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: All those

1 in favor of adopting the Resolution Calendar
2 please signify by saying aye.

3 (Response of "Aye.")

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Opposed,
5 nay.

6 (No response.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
8 Resolution Calendar is adopted.

9 Senator Gianaris.

10 SENATOR GIANARIS: At this time
11 we're going to break for respective party
12 conferences.

13 Please call on Senator Lanza.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
15 Lanza.

16 SENATOR LANZA: Mr. President,
17 there will be an immediate meeting of the
18 Republican Conference in Room 315 of the Capitol.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Immediate
20 meeting of the Republican Conference in Room 315
21 of the Capitol.

22 Senator Gianaris.

23 SENATOR GIANARIS: And an immediate
24 meeting of the Democratic Conference in Room 332.

25 And the Senate will stand at ease

1 until 10:30.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Immediate
3 meeting of the Democratic Conference in Room 332.

4 The Senate stands at ease until
5 10:30 p.m.

6 (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease
7 at 9:25 p.m.)

8 (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at
9 11:10 p.m.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
11 Senate will return to order.

12 Senator Gianaris.

13 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,
14 I believe we had a temporary lay-aside on
15 Supplemental Calendar 67A earlier,
16 Calendar Number 1955.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: May we
18 have some order, please.

19 SENATOR GIANARIS: Can we remove
20 that lay-aside and take up the budget bill,
21 please. Calendar Number 1955, off of
22 Supplemental Calendar 67A, it was earlier
23 temporarily laid aside. Remove the lay-aside and
24 take up the bill, please.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: There's

1 a substitution at the desk.

2 The Secretary will read.

3 THE SECRETARY: Senator Krueger
4 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
5 Assembly Bill Number 8896 and substitute it for
6 the identical Senate Bill 8438, Third Reading
7 Calendar 1955.

8 SENATOR GIANARIS: Is there a
9 message of necessity at the desk?

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: There is
11 a message of necessity at the desk.

12 SENATOR GIANARIS: I move to accept
13 the message of necessity.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: All
15 those in favor of accepting the message please
16 signify by saying aye.

17 (Response of "Aye.")

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Opposed,
19 nay.

20 (Response of "Nay.")

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
22 message is accepted, and the bill is before the
23 house.

24 The Secretary will read.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1955, Assembly Bill Number 8896, Budget Bill, an
2 act to amend Chapter 53 of the Laws of 2025.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 (Pause.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
10 Calendar 1955, voting in the negative are
11 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
12 Gallivan, Helming, Lanza, Mattera, Oberacker,
13 O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk and Weik.

14 Ayes, 45. Nays, 14.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
16 is passed.

17 Senator Gianaris, that completes the
18 reading of the calendar.

19 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,
20 there's a supplemental active list floating
21 around. Pay no attention to the "Wednesday" on
22 the top of the page; it should say "Thursday,
23 June 12."

24 We're going to simultaneously take
25 up Supplemental Active List 1 and call an

1 immediate meeting of the Rules Committee in
2 Room 332.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: There
4 will be an immediate meeting of the
5 Rules Committee in Room 332.

6 The Secretary will read.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 392, Senate Print 73A, by Senator Kavanaugh, an
9 act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
11 last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 11. This
13 act shall take effect immediately.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
18 the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
20 Calendar 392, voting in the negative:
21 Senator Scarcella-Spanton.

22 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 401, Senate Print 98A, by Senator Comrie, an act
2 to amend the Public Service Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
13 Calendar 401, voting in the negative are
14 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
15 Chan, Helming, Lanza, Martins, Mattera,
16 Oberacker, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec,
17 Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik. Also
18 Senator C. Ryan.

19 Ayes, 40. Nays, 19.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
21 is passed.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 409, Senate Print 3734A, by Senator Mayer, an act
24 to amend the Public Service Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
3 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
4 shall have become a law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
9 the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
11 Calendar 409, voting in the negative are
12 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
13 Chan, Helming, Ortt, Stec, Walczyk, Weber and
14 Weik. Also Senator Tedisco.

15 Ayes, 48. Nays, 11.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 539, Senate Print 3413, by Senator Jackson, an
20 act to amend the Civil Practice Law and Rules.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 630, Senate Print 409A, by Senator Skoufis, an
10 act to amend the Alcoholic Beverage Control Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
14 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
15 shall have become a law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
20 Borrello to explain his vote.

21 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you,
22 Madam President.

23 First of all, I want to thank the
24 sponsor for this bill.

25 You know, this is a pretty simple

1 bill. Imagine it's a Friday night and you own a
2 restaurant or a bar and you have run out of
3 something that people like -- it could be a
4 bottle of Bacardi or Jameson or whatever. By
5 law, in New York State you can't do what most
6 people think you could do: Go to a local liquor
7 store, buy a bottle so you can serve your patrons
8 and give them the product they want.

9 That's what this bill does. It's
10 pretty simple. You can buy six bottles, six --
11 not six cases, six bottles to get you through the
12 weekend.

13 And yet there are still big
14 corporations that are opposed to this, that are
15 actually accusing people like myself and other
16 restaurant owners of potentially trying to evade
17 taxes. It's ridiculous.

18 This is a pro-small business bill.
19 The folks that are against this are against it
20 because they make a lot of money off of New York
21 State's unfair wholesale retail laws. And on a
22 Friday night or a St. Patrick's Day or whatever
23 it might be, those sales -- which New York State
24 will make sales tax revenue on -- are never
25 coming back if that bottle can't be purchased

1 from that local retailer.

2 But the wholesale industry has taken
3 advantage of New York State's pro-monopoly laws,
4 and they won't even give us six bottles a week.
5 They still don't like it. This is outrageous
6 that we actually have to fight this battle.

7 So I would encourage all of my
8 colleagues to vote yes, and I hope that they pass
9 this in the Assembly. And I hope that they don't
10 bow to the big, you know, multinational
11 corporations that want to keep their neck on the
12 boot of small businesses {sic}.

13 I proudly vote aye.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
15 Borrello to be recorded in the affirmative.

16 Announce the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

18 SENATOR PERSAUD: The bill is
19 passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 655, Senate Print 3363, by Senator Rivera, an act
22 to amend the Public Health Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This

1 act shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
6 the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
8 Calendar 655, voting in the negative:
9 Senator Walczyk.

10 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
12 is passed.

13 There's a substitution at the desk.

14 The Secretary will read.

15 THE SECRETARY: Senator Bailey
16 moves to discharge, from the Committee on
17 Insurance, Assembly Bill Number 7038A and
18 substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
19 6897A, Third Reading Calendar 926.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 926, Assembly Bill Number 7038A, by
24 Assemblymember Weprin, an act to amend the
25 Insurance Law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
5 the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
8 is passed.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 1000, Senate Print 7160, by Senator Cleare, an
11 act to amend the Elder Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
15 act shall take effect immediately.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
23 is passed.

24 There's a substitution at the desk.

25 The Secretary will read.

1 THE SECRETARY: Senator Cleare
2 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Aging,
3 Assembly Bill Number 8090 and substitute it for
4 the identical Senate Bill 7671, Third Reading
5 Calendar 1001.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
7 Secretary will read.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 1001, Assembly Bill Number 8090, by
10 Assemblymember Seawright, an act to amend the
11 Elder Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
15 act shall take effect immediately.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 1049, Senate Print 6702, by Senator Jackson, an

1 act to amend the Retirement and Social Security
2 Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: There's
4 a home-rule message at the desk.

5 Read the last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
7 act shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 1073, Senate Print 6815, by Senator Comrie, an
18 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
22 act shall take effect immediately.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
2 the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
5 is passed.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: There's
7 a substitution at the desk.

8 The Secretary will read.

9 THE SECRETARY: Senator Parker
10 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Energy
11 and Telecommunications, Assembly Bill Number 6768
12 and substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
13 5509, Third Reading Calendar 1098.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:
15 Substitution so ordered.

16 The Secretary will read.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 1098, Assembly Bill Number 6768, by
19 Assemblymember Bronson, an act to amend the
20 Public Service Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 7. This
24 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
25 shall have become a law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
5 the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
8 is passed.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 1137, Senate Print 1335B, by Senator Parker, an
11 act to amend the General Municipal Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
15 act shall take effect immediately.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
22 Calendar 1137, voting in the negative are
23 Senators Lanza, Mattera, Oberacker, Ortt, Stec
24 and Walczyk. Also Senator Chan. Also
25 Senator Weik. Also Senator Helming.

1 Ayes, 50. Nays, 9.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 1152, Senate Print 5932, by Senator Mattera, an
6 act in relation to too.

7 SENATOR SERRANO: Lay it aside for
8 the day, please.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
10 will be laid aside for the day.

11 There's a substitution at the desk.

12 The Secretary will read.

13 THE SECRETARY: Senator Parker
14 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
15 Assembly Bill Number 4502B and substitute it for
16 the identical Senate Bill 4257A, Third Reading
17 Calendar 1169.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:
19 Substitution so ordered.

20 The Secretary will read.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1169, Assembly Bill Number 4502B, by
23 Assemblymember Cunningham, an act to amend the
24 Social Services Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
3 act shall take effect on the 120th day after it
4 shall have become a law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
9 the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
11 Calendar 1169, voting in the negative are
12 Senators Borrello, Chan, Helming, Lanza,
13 Oberacker, Ortt, Stec, Walczyk and Weik. Also
14 Senator Tedisco.

15 Ayes, 49. Nays, 10.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
17 is passed.

18 There's a substitution at the desk.

19 The Secretary will read.

20 THE SECRETARY: Senator Cleare
21 moves to discharge, from the Committee on
22 Higher Education, Assembly Bill Number 7053A and
23 substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
24 7580A, Third Reading Calendar 1180.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The

1 substitution is so ordered.

2 The Secretary will read.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 1180, Assembly Bill Number 7053A, by
5 Assemblymember Bichotte Hermelyn, an act to amend
6 the Education Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
10 act shall take effect July 1, 2026.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
15 the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 1193, Senate Print 4468A, by Senator Mayer, an
21 act to amend the Workers' Compensation Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
25 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it

1 shall have become a law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
6 Mayer to explain her vote.

7 SENATOR MAYER: Thank you,
8 Madam President.

9 Unfortunately, one in four families
10 knows the pain of child loss. In New York State,
11 3,000 families experience a stillbirth each year,
12 3,000. But these parents facing devastating loss
13 are ineligible for New York's Family Leave
14 Program. Many have to go back to work the next
15 day or just a few days later.

16 I've spoken with many of these
17 mothers who have chosen to share their stories of
18 stillbirth and their disappointment and
19 frustration about the lack of support New York
20 provides during the toughest moments of their
21 family's lives. These women felt ignored at
22 every level in state policymaking, and the time
23 has come to change that.

24 Any parent who has experienced the
25 loss of a child understands we must bring these

1 stories out of the shadows and into chambers like
2 this. We have an obligation to do better by
3 them, and that begins with changing the law so
4 that parents can take time to grieve and heal.

5 Parents who have paid into the
6 system for family leave should be entitled upon a
7 stillbirth. This bill does that. I vote aye.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
9 Mayer to be recorded in the affirmative.

10 Announce the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
13 is passed.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 1215, Senate Print 1457A, by Senator Kavanaugh, an
16 act to amend the Real Property Tax Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 7. This
20 act shall take effect immediately.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
25 the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 1304, Senate Print Number 1325C, by
6 Senator Hoylman-Sigal, an act to amend the
7 Education Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
18 Calendar 1304, voting in the negative:
19 Senator Ortt.

20 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
22 is passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 1349, Senate Print 3364, by Senator Rivera, an
25 act to amend the Public Service Law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
2 last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
4 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
5 shall have become a law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
10 Rivera to explain his vote.

11 SENATOR RIVERA: Thank you,
12 Madam President.

13 Back in 2011, the State of New York
14 created the Medical Indemnity Fund. The purpose
15 of it is to make sure that -- it was a promise
16 that the state made to parents of children who
17 had birth-related neurological injuries. And
18 over the last 14 years at this point, there have
19 been many issues that the parents have brought to
20 us, concerns that we've been trying to fix.

21 This bill would establish the
22 ombudsman, the ombudsperson for the Medical
23 Indemnity Fund, as well as the Medical Indemnity
24 Fund Advisory Panel. The goal here is to make
25 sure that, as I said, that we keep the commitment

1 that we made to these families. If their child
2 was born with a birth-related neurological
3 injury, we want to make sure that they can take
4 care of these children for the rest of their
5 lives.

6 We have a responsibility and an
7 obligation to these parents. This bill, if
8 signed into law, would make it easier for those
9 parents to make sure that that commitment can be
10 kept by the state.

11 So I vote in the affirmative,
12 Madam President. Thank you.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
14 Rivera to be recorded in the affirmative.

15 Announce the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
17 Calendar 1349, voting in the negative:
18 Senator Walczyk.

19 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
21 is passed.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 1351, Senate Print 4033B, by Senator Harckham, an
24 act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 83. This
3 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
4 shall have become a law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
9 the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 1361, Senate Print 6437, by Senator Jackson, an
15 act to amend the Retirement and Social Security
16 Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: There is a
18 home-rule message at the desk.

19 Read the last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 1364, Senate Print 7843, by Senator Kavanagh, an
7 act to amend the Retirement and Social Security
8 Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: There is a
10 home-rule message at the desk.

11 Read the last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 13. This
13 act shall take effect immediately.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
18 the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
21 is passed.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 1389, Senate Print 6698A, by Senator Jackson, an
24 act to amend the Public Health Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
11 is passed.

12 There's a substitution at the desk.

13 The Secretary will read.

14 THE SECRETARY: Senator Rivera
15 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
16 Assembly Bill Number 7011A, and substitute it for
17 the identical Senate Bill Number 7331A, Third
18 Reading Calendar 1391.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:
20 Substitution so ordered.

21 The Secretary will read.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 1391, Assembly Bill Number 7011A, by
24 Assemblymember Tapia, an act to amend the
25 Public Health Law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
2 last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
4 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
5 shall have become a law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
10 the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
13 is passed.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 1397, Senate Print 4155, by Senator Sanders, an
16 act to amend the Executive Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
20 act shall take effect immediately.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
25 the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
2 Calendar 1397, voting in the negative:
3 Senator Walczyk.

4 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
6 is passed.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 1398, Senate Print 5784, by Senator Fahy, an act
9 to direct the commissioner of the Office of
10 General Services to erect a monument to be known
11 as the New York State Holocaust Memorial.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
15 act shall take effect immediately.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
20 Fahy to explain her vote.

21 SENATOR FAHY: Thank you,
22 Madam Speaker. I appreciate the opportunity to
23 speak on this bill, which is to erect a monument
24 for the New York State Holocaust Memorial.

25 This legislation represents a

1 long-term effort which began with an original
2 site as the Capital Region Holocaust Memorial,
3 supposed to be in the Town of Niskayuna. We are
4 now moving it here to the Empire State Plaza.

5 The Holocaust, as many know, was a
6 systemic state-sponsored persecution taken out by
7 the Nazi regime, its allies and collaborators,
8 which led to the deaths of millions of Jews and
9 other people.

10 It is to honor those victims and pay
11 tribute to those who survived the atrocities as
12 well. And it is dedicated -- this will be a
13 dedicated state-level Holocaust memorial to
14 memorialize those as well as educate regarding
15 Nazism, fascism, and the banality of evil.

16 It is really intended to be an
17 educational memorial here at the Empire State
18 Plaza, not only to memorialize the victims but to
19 teach all New Yorkers about the history of the
20 Holocaust, the dangers of antisemitism, racism
21 and all forms of intolerance. One in five
22 Americans are estimated -- between the ages of 18
23 and 29 are estimated to be either Holocaust
24 deniers or simply just do not know what happened.

25 So this troubling and growing

1 indifference and ignorance is something that the
2 memorial will help to address. I want to thank
3 the founder, Dr. Michael Lozman, as well as the
4 president, Dan Dembling, and the entire board of
5 the Capital Region Jewish Holocaust Memorial, who
6 have spent years on this.

7 As well as, of course, many thanks
8 to the leader for helping to bring this
9 legislation forward.

10 And with that I vote in the
11 affirmative. Thank you, Madam President.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
13 Fahy to be recorded in the affirmative.

14 Announce the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
17 is passed.

18 There is a substitution at the desk.

19 The Secretary will read.

20 THE SECRETARY: Senator
21 Hoylman-Sigal moves to discharge, from the
22 Committee on Judiciary, Assembly Bill Number 56B
23 and substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
24 3845B, Third Reading Calendar 1420.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:

1 Substitution so ordered.

2 The Secretary will read.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 1420, Assembly Bill Number 56B, by
5 Assemblymember Epstein, an act to amend the
6 Real Property Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
15 the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
17 Calendar 1420, voting in the negative are
18 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
19 Chan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins, Mattera,
20 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,
21 Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.
22 Also Senator Skoufis.

23 Ayes, 38. Nays, 21.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
25 is passed.

1 There's a substitution at the desk.

2 The Secretary will read.

3 THE SECRETARY: Senator Comrie
4 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
5 Assembly Bill Number 5600A and substitute it for
6 the identical Senate Bill 5347A, Third Reading
7 Calendar 1449.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:

9 Substitution so ordered.

10 The Secretary will read.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 1449, Assembly Bill Number 5600A, by
13 Assemblymember Hunter, an act to amend the
14 Insurance Law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
18 act shall take effect immediately.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
25 Calendar 1449, voting in the negative:

1 Senator Krueger.

2 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 1507, Senate Print 4505, by Senator Gounardes, an
7 act to amend the General Municipal Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
11 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
12 shall have become a law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1532, Senate Print 4830A, by Senator C. Ryan, an
23 act to amend the Public Authorities Law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
25 last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
2 act shall take effect on the 120th day after it
3 shall have become a law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
10 Calendar 1532, voting in the negative are
11 Senators Rhoads, Walczyk and Weik.

12 Ayes, 56. Nays, 3.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 1556, Senate Print 7822, by Senator
17 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, an act to amend
18 Chapter 821 of the Laws of 1970.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: There is a
20 home-rule message at the desk.

21 Read the last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
3 the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
5 Calendar 1556, voting in the negative:
6 Senator Skoufis.

7 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1559, Senate Print 7885, by Senator Mattera, an
12 act to amend Chapter 431 of the Laws of 2018.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: There is a
14 home-rule message at the desk.

15 Read the last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
25 is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 1572, Senate Print 8180, by Senator Sepúlveda, an
3 act to amend Chapter 548 of the Laws of 2010.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: There is a
5 home-rule message at the desk.

6 Read the last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
8 act shall take effect immediately.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
13 the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 1643, Senate Print 7148, by Senator Jackson, an
19 act to amend the Retirement and Social Security
20 Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: There's a
22 home-rule message at the desk.

23 Read the last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
5 the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
8 is passed.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 1796, Senate Print 1012A, by Senator Brouk, an
11 act to amend the Public Service Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
15 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
16 shall have become a law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
21 the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1797, Senate Print 1162A, by Senator Krueger, an
2 act to amend the General Business Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
6 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
7 shall have become a law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
14 Calendar 1797, voting in the negative are
15 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
16 Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Mattera, Oberacker,
17 O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk and Weber.

18 Ayes, 45. Nays, 14.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Senator Gianaris,
22 that completes the reading of the supplemental
23 active list.

24 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,
25 we're going to stand at ease briefly while we

1 await the bill jackets for the Rules meeting that
2 just finished.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The Senate
4 will stand at ease briefly.

5 (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease
6 at 11:34 p.m.)

7 (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at
8 11:52 p.m.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
10 Senate will come to session.

11 Senator Gianaris.

12 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
13 there are several privileged resolutions at the
14 desk. Can we take those up, please.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: There are
16 several privileged resolutions at the desk. The
17 Secretary will read.

18 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1231, by
19 Senator Stewart-Cousins, establishing a plan
20 setting forth an itemized list of grantees for
21 certain appropriations for the 2019-2020 state
22 fiscal year.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
24 question is on the resolution.

25 Call the roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
3 the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: In relation to the
5 resolution, voting in the negative are
6 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Gallivan,
7 Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Mattera, Oberacker,
8 O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk and Weik.

9 Ayes, 45. Nays, 14.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
11 resolution is adopted.

12 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1232, by
13 Senator Stewart-Cousins, amending Senate
14 Resolution R2861 of 2022 establishing a plan
15 setting forth an itemized list of grantees for a
16 certain appropriation for the 2022-2023 state
17 fiscal year.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
19 question is on the resolution.

20 Call the roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: In relation to the
25 resolution, voting in the negative are

1 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
2 Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Mattera,
3 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk
4 and Weik.

5 Ayes, 44. Nays, 15.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
7 resolution is adopted.

8 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1233, by
9 Senator Stewart-Cousins, amending Senate
10 Resolution R2860 of 2022 establishing a plan
11 setting forth an itemized list of grantees for a
12 certain appropriation for the 2022-23 state
13 fiscal year.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
15 question is on the resolution.

16 Call the roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
19 the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: In relation to the
21 resolution, voting in the negative are
22 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
23 Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Mattera,
24 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk
25 and Weik.

1 Ayes, 44. Nays, 15.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
3 resolution is adopted.

4 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1234, by
5 Senator Stewart-Cousins, amending Senate
6 Resolution R1397 of 2023, establishing a plan
7 setting forth an itemized list of grantees for a
8 certain appropriation for the 2023-24 state
9 fiscal year.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
11 question is on the resolution.

12 Call the roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
15 the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: In relation to the
17 resolution, voting in the negative are
18 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
19 Gallivan, Griffio, Helming, Lanza, Mattera,
20 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk
21 and Weik.

22 Ayes, 44. Nays, 15.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
24 resolution is adopted.

25 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1235, by

1 Senator Stewart-Cousins, amending Senate
2 Resolution R1408 of 2023 establishing a plan
3 setting forth an itemized list of grantees for a
4 certain appropriation for the 2023-24 state
5 fiscal year.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
7 question is on the resolution.

8 Call the roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: In relation to the
13 resolution, voting in the negative are
14 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
15 Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Mattera,
16 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk
17 and Weik.

18 Ayes, 44. Nays, 15.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
20 resolution is adopted.

21 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1236, by
22 Senator Stewart-Cousins, amending Senate
23 Resolution R2697 of 2024, a plan setting forth an
24 itemized list of grantees for a certain
25 appropriation for the 2024-25 state fiscal year.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
2 question is on the resolution.

3 Call the roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
6 the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: In relation to the
8 resolution, voting in the negative are
9 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
10 Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Mattera,
11 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk
12 and Weik.

13 Ayes, 44. Nays, 15.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
15 resolution is adopted.

16 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1237, by
17 Senator Stewart-Cousins, amending Senate
18 Resolution R2698 of 2024, establishing a plan
19 setting forth an itemized list of grantees for a
20 certain appropriation for the 2024-25 state
21 fiscal year.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
23 question is on the resolution.

24 Call the roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
2 the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: In relation to the
4 resolution, voting in the negative are
5 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
6 Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Mattera,
7 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk
8 and Weik.

9 Ayes, 44. Nays, 15.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
11 resolution is adopted.

12 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1238, by
13 Senator Stewart-Cousins, amending Senate
14 Resolution R2699 of 2024, establishing a plan
15 setting forth an itemized list of grantees for a
16 certain appropriation for the 2024-25 state
17 fiscal year.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
19 question is on the resolution.

20 Call the roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: In relation to the
25 resolution, voting in the negative are

1 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
2 Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Mattera,
3 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk
4 and Weik.

5 Ayes, 44. Nays, 15.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
7 resolution is adopted.

8 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1239, by
9 Senator Stewart-Cousins, amending Senate
10 Resolution R2701 of 2024, establishing a plan
11 setting forth an itemized list of grantees for a
12 certain appropriation for the 2024-25 state
13 fiscal year.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
15 question is on the resolution.

16 Call the roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
19 the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: In relation to the
21 resolution, voting in the negative are
22 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
23 Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Mattera,
24 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk
25 and Weik.

1 Ayes, 44. Nays, 15.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
3 resolution is adopted.

4 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1240, by
5 Senator Stewart-Cousins, establishing a plan
6 setting forth an itemized list of grantees for a
7 certain appropriation for the 2024-25 state
8 fiscal year.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
10 question is on the resolution.

11 Call the roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 THE SECRETARY: In relation to the
14 resolution, voting in the negative are
15 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
16 Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Mattera,
17 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk
18 and Weik.

19 Ayes, 44. Nays, 15.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
21 resolution is adopted.

22 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1241, by
23 Senator Stewart-Cousins, establishing a plan
24 setting forth an itemized list of grantees for a
25 certain appropriation for the 2024-25 state

1 fiscal year.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
3 question is on the resolution.

4 Call the roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 THE SECRETARY: In relation to the
7 resolution, voting in the negative are
8 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
9 Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Mattera,
10 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk
11 and Weik.

12 Ayes, 44. Nays, 15.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
14 resolution is adopted.

15 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1242, by
16 Senator Stewart-Cousins, amending Senate
17 Resolution R3725 of 2010, establishing a plan
18 setting forth an itemized list of grantees for
19 the New York State Economic Development
20 Assistance Program.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
22 question is on the resolution.

23 Call the roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: In relation to the
3 resolution, voting in the negative are
4 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
5 Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Mattera,
6 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk
7 and Weik.

8 Ayes, 44. Nays, 15.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
10 resolution is adopted.

11 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1243, by
12 Senator Stewart-Cousins, establishing a plan
13 setting forth an itemized list of grantees for a
14 certain appropriation for the 2025-26 state
15 fiscal year.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
17 question is on the resolution.

18 Call the roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
21 the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: In relation to the
23 resolution, voting in the negative are
24 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
25 Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Mattera,

1 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk
2 and Weik.

3 Ayes, 44. Nays, 15.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
5 resolution is adopted.

6 Senator Gianaris.

7 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
8 pursuant to Rule 5, I move without objection that
9 we stay in session past the hour of midnight.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Without
11 objection, so ordered.

12 The Secretary will read.

13 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1244, by
14 Senator Stewart-Cousins, establishing a plan
15 setting forth an itemized list of grantees for a
16 certain appropriation for the 2025-26 state
17 fiscal year.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
19 question is on the resolution.

20 Call the roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: In relation to the
25 resolution, voting in the negative are

1 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
2 Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Mattera,
3 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk
4 and Weik.

5 Ayes, 44. Nays, 15.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
7 resolution is adopted.

8 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1245, by
9 Senator Stewart-Cousins, establishing a plan
10 setting forth an itemized list of grantees for a
11 certain appropriation for the 2025-26 state
12 fiscal year.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
14 question is on the resolution.

15 Call the roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
18 the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: In relation to the
20 resolution, voting in the negative are
21 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
22 Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Mattera,
23 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk
24 and Weik.

25 Ayes, 44. Nays, 15.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
2 resolution is adopted.

3 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1246, by
4 Senator Stewart-Cousins, establishing a plan
5 setting forth an itemized list of grantees for a
6 certain appropriation for the 2025-26 state
7 fiscal year.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
9 question is on the resolution.

10 Call the roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
13 the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: In relation to the
15 resolution, voting in the negative are
16 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
17 Gallivan, Griffio, Helming, Lanza, Mattera,
18 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk
19 and Weik.

20 Ayes, 44. Nays, 15.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
22 resolution is adopted.

23 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1247, by
24 Senator Stewart-Cousins, establishing a plan
25 setting forth an itemized list of grantees for a

1 certain appropriation for the 2025-26 state
2 fiscal year.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
4 question is on the resolution.

5 Call the roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: In relation to the
10 resolution, voting in the negative are
11 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
12 Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Mattera,
13 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk
14 and Weik.

15 Ayes, 44. Nays, 15.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
17 resolution is adopted.

18 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1248, by
19 Senator Stewart-Cousins, establishing a plan
20 setting forth an itemized list of grantees for a
21 certain appropriation for the 2025-26 state
22 fiscal year.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
24 question is on the resolution.

25 Call the roll.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
2 the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: In relation to the
4 resolution, voting in the negative are
5 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
6 Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Mattera,
7 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk
8 and Weik.

9 Ayes, 44. Nays, 15.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
11 resolution is adopted.

12 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1249, by
13 Senator Stewart-Cousins, establishing a plan
14 setting forth an itemized list of grantees for a
15 certain appropriation for the 2025-26 state
16 fiscal year.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
18 question is on the resolution.

19 Call the roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
24 resolution, voting in the negative are
25 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,

1 Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Mattera,
2 Oberacker, O'Mara Ortt Stec Tedisco Walczyk and
3 Weik.

4 Ayes, 44. Nays, 15.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
6 resolution is adopted.

7 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1250, by
8 Senator Stewart-Cousins, establishing a plan
9 setting forth an itemized list of grantees for
10 certain appropriations for the 2025-26 state
11 fiscal year.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
13 question is on the resolution.

14 Call the roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: In relation to the
19 resolution, voting in the negative are
20 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
21 Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Mattera,
22 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk
23 and Weik.

24 Ayes, 44. Nays, 15.

25 SENATOR GIANARIS: The resolution

1 is adopted.

2 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1251, by
3 Senator Stewart-Cousins, establishing a plan
4 setting forth an itemized list of grantees for
5 certain appropriations and reappropriation for
6 the 2025-26 state fiscal year.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
8 question is on the resolution.

9 Call the roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 THE SECRETARY: In relation to the
12 resolution, voting in the negative are
13 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
14 Gallivan, Griffio, Helming, Lanza, Mattera,
15 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk
16 and Weik.

17 Ayes, 44. Nays, 15.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
19 resolution is adopted.

20 Senator Gianaris.

21 SENATOR GIANARIS: That's all the
22 finance resos. That's very exciting.

23 Can we now take up Resolution 1252,
24 by Senator Hoylman-Sigal, read its title, but
25 recognize Senator Brisport on the resolution.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
2 Secretary will read.

3 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1252, by
4 Senator Hoylman-Sigal, memorializing
5 Governor Kathy Hochul to proclaim June 2025 as
6 LGBTQIA+ Pride Month in the State of New York.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
8 Brisport on the resolution.

9 SENATOR BRISPORT: Thank you,
10 Mr. President. Happy Pride Month.

11 I'd like to start by honoring some
12 icons whose shoulders I stand on: Sylvia Rivera,
13 Marsha P. Johnson, Harvey Milk, and always the
14 incredible Cecilia Gentili. Their fight lives on
15 in every queer activist who works to carry the
16 torch forward.

17 However, this moment we now face is
18 an echo of the past. In 1930s Germany the
19 government actively worked to erase queer
20 Germans, targeting the Institute for Sexual
21 Research, burning books, destroying artistic
22 works before eventually escalating to imprisoning
23 and purging queer people along with Jewish people
24 and other targeted groups.

25 In 2020s America, we are watching

1 multiple attacks on queer Americans, with dozens
2 of states passing bans on gender-affirming care
3 and a federal government bent on removing any
4 mention of gender or gender identity from
5 America, and defunding research into queer
6 health.

7 This should worry everyone. If you
8 believe you are safe because you are cisgender or
9 straight or because you're an American citizen or
10 because you're white or male, know this. If they
11 eradicate us, they will turn their weapons on you
12 next. Because the hate that they stoke is not
13 ideological, it's functional. It serves the
14 purpose of convincing you to transfer your power
15 over to them.

16 If you believe you are safe because
17 you follow the law, hear this. They will not
18 care that you are following the law. They do not
19 care to follow the law themselves.

20 If you believe you are safe because
21 you are armed, remember this: The most powerful
22 military in human history is under their control.

23 In this moment your path to
24 liberation is the same as ours. It is
25 solidarity. By standing with and for each other,

1 no matter who is in the crosshairs, we will come
2 through this whole and free. This is why the
3 Trump machine is working so hard to alienate us
4 from one another.

5 Within the LGBTQ+ community, our
6 differences are real, they are complex, but we do
7 not aim to sweep them under the rug or divide up
8 into factions. Instead, we strive to work
9 through them together, and we fight to hold onto
10 each other. There is no power greater than what
11 we build together when we choose to value and
12 fight for each other.

13 This Pride, I invite you to join us
14 in that choice and to step into a brave and
15 radical solidarity.

16 Thank you, Mr. President.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
18 you, Senator Brisport.

19 The resolution was adopted on
20 June 12th.

21 Senator Gianaris.

22 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President, I
23 believe there's a report of the Rules Committee
24 at the desk. Let's take that up, please.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The

1 Secretary will read.

2 THE SECRETARY: Senator
3 Stewart-Cousins, from the Committee on Rules,
4 reports the following bills:

5 Senate Print 287, by Senator Rhoads,
6 an act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law;

7 Senate Print 601C, by
8 Senator Gallivan, an act to amend the
9 Highway Law;

10 Senate Print 1004A, by
11 Senator Brouk, an act to amend the
12 Criminal Procedure Law;

13 Senate Print 1047, by
14 Senator Salazar, an act to amend the
15 Public Authorities Law;

16 Senate Print 1163, by
17 Senator Krueger, an act to amend the
18 Real Property Law;

19 Senate Print 1672B, by
20 Senator Martinez, an act to amend the
21 Education Law;

22 Senate Print 2485, by
23 Senator Parker, an act to amend the
24 Public Service Law;

25 Senate Print 2516A, by

1 Senator Gounardes, an act to amend the
2 Social Services Law;

3 Senate Print 2536A, by
4 Senator Jackson, an act to amend the Labor Law;

5 Senate Print 2681B, by
6 Senator Cooney, an act to amend the
7 Executive Law;

8 Senate Print 3266, by
9 Senator Palumbo, an act in relation to the
10 Southampton Village Ocean Rescue;

11 Senate Print 3285B, by
12 Senator Gonzalez, an act to amend the
13 Public Health Law;

14 Senate Print 3815B, by
15 Senator Rivera, an act to amend the
16 General Municipal Law;

17 Senate Print 3879A, by
18 Senator Hoylman-Sigal, an act to amend the
19 Civil Practice Law and Rules;

20 Senate Print 4091, by
21 Senator Parker, an act to amend the
22 Public Authorities Law;

23 Senate Print 4263, by
24 Senator Kavanagh, an act to amend the
25 Environmental Conservation Law;

1 Senate Print 4351A, by
2 Senator Cleare, an act to amend the Elder Law;
3 Senate Print 4417, by Senator May,
4 an act to amend the Social Services Law;
5 Senate Print 4527A, by
6 Senator Comrie, an act to amend the Tax Law;
7 Senate Print 4554A, by
8 Senator Scarcella-Spanton, an act to amend the
9 Administrative Code of the City of New York;
10 Senate Print 4598, by
11 Senator Jackson, an act to amend the
12 Retirement and Social Security Law;
13 Senate Print 4727, by
14 Senator Jackson, an act to amend the
15 Retirement and Social Security Law;
16 Senate Print 4824A, by
17 Senator Jackson, an act to amend the
18 General Municipal Law;
19 Senate Print 4894, by
20 Senator Jackson, an act to repeal paragraph (g)
21 of subdivision 4 of Section 209 of the
22 Civil Service Law;
23 Senate Print 4966, by
24 Senator Bailey, an act to amend the New York
25 City Charter;

1 Senate Print 5056A, by
2 Senator Rivera, an act to amend the
3 Public Health Law;

4 Senate Print 5257A, by
5 Senator Hinchey, an act to amend the
6 General Business Law;

7 Senate Print 5742A, by
8 Senator Cleare, an act to amend the
9 Public Health Law;

10 Senate Print 5883, by Senator Lanza,
11 an act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law;

12 Senate Print 5939B, by
13 Senator Skoufis, an act to amend the
14 Public Health Law;

15 Senate Print 5998B, by
16 Senator Skoufis, an act to amend the
17 Domestic Relations Law;

18 Senate Print 6247A, by
19 Senator Skoufis, an act to ratify and confirm the
20 creation of Water District No. 14 of the Town of
21 Monroe;

22 Senate Print 6277, by
23 Senator Scarcella-Spanton, an act to amend the
24 Public Service Law;

25 Senate Print 6338, by Senator Weber,

1 an act to amend the Town Law;

2 Senate Print 6351B, by
3 Senator Addabbo, an act to amend the
4 General Municipal Law;

5 Senate Print 6421A, by
6 Senator Borrello, an act authorizing the City of
7 Batavia to alienate certain parklands for use as
8 a municipal parking lot;

9 Senate Print 6439, by Senator Fahy,
10 an act in relation to issuing the Village of
11 Nelliston incorporation documents;

12 Senate Print 6661, by
13 Senator Griffo, an act to amend the
14 Veterans' Services Law;

15 Senate Print 6929A, by Senator Webb,
16 an act to amend the Education Law;

17 Senate Print 7028C, by
18 Senator Walczyk, an act in relation to
19 authorizing the City of Little Falls, in the
20 County of Herkimer, to finance certain deficits
21 by the issuance of bonds;

22 Senate Print 7049A, by
23 Senator Fernandez, an act authorizing the City of
24 New York to discontinue certain parkland in
25 Ferry Point Park;

1 Senate Print 7053, by Senator Webb,
2 an act to amend the County Law;

3 Senate Print 7072, by Senator Webb,
4 an act to amend the General Municipal Law;

5 Senate Print 7201, by
6 Senator Harckham, an act to amend the
7 Village Law;

8 Senate Print 7223, by
9 Senator Persaud, an act in relation to
10 authorizing the conveyance of certain property by
11 the City of New York to the Bedford-Stuyvesant
12 Volunteer Ambulance Corps, Inc.;

13 Senate Print 7314C, by
14 Senator Jackson, an act to amend the
15 Retirement and Social Security Law;

16 Senate Print 7364B, by
17 Senator Rolison, an act to amend the
18 Public Authorities Law;

19 Senate Print 7667, by
20 Senator Murray, an act in relation to authorizing
21 the assessor of the Town of Brookhaven to accept
22 an application for a real property tax exemption;

23 Senate Print 7675A, by Senator Ortt,
24 an act to amend Chapter 220 of the Laws of 1976;

25 Senate Print 7748, by

1 Senator Jackson, an act to amend the
2 General Municipal Law;

3 Senate Print 7749, by
4 Senator Jackson, an act to amend the
5 General Municipal Law;

6 Senate Print 7756A, by Senator May,
7 an act to amend Chapter 198 of the Laws of 2021;

8 Senate Print 7868A, by
9 Senator Martins, an act authorizing the
10 Village of Kings Point, Town of North Hempstead,
11 County of Nassau, to alienate and discontinue
12 certain parklands for the purpose of providing
13 additional parking for the community center;

14 Senate Print 7950A, by
15 Senator Bailey, an act to amend the
16 Workers' Compensation Law;

17 Senate Print 8024B, by
18 Senator Martinez, an act relating to disability
19 retirement benefits for Deputy Sheriff
20 Richard Stueber;

21 Senate Print 8071A, by
22 Senator Addabbo, an act to amend the
23 Civil Practice Law and Rules;

24 Senate Print 8087, by
25 Senator Gounardes, an act to amend the

1 Retirement and Social Security Law;
2 Senate Print 8121A, by
3 Senator Jackson, an act to amend the
4 Retirement and Social Security Law;
5 Senate Print 8183, by
6 Senator Martins, an act to amend the Village Law;
7 Senate Print 8233, by
8 Senator Sanders, an act to amend the New York
9 City Charter;
10 Senate Print 8247, by
11 Senator Harckham, an act to amend the Elder Law;
12 Senate Print 8263, by
13 Senator Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, an act authorizing
14 the Congregation Khal Mevakshei Hashem, Inc., to
15 receive retroactive real property tax exempt
16 status;
17 Senate Print 8265A, by
18 Senator Sutton, an act to amend the
19 Insurance Law;
20 Senate Print 8306A, by Senator Ortt,
21 an act to amend Chapter 978 of the Laws of 1966;
22 Senate Print 8313, by
23 Senator Harckham, an act authorizing the
24 Commissioner of General Services to transfer and
25 convey certain unappropriated state land to

1 The Arc Westchester New York;

2 Senate Print 8341A, by
3 Senator Stavisky, an act to amend the
4 Education Law;

5 Senate Print 8344, by
6 Senator Gounardes, an act to amend Chapter 189 of
7 the Laws of 2013;

8 Senate Print 8349A, by
9 Senator Palumbo, an act in relation to directing
10 the Department of Transportation to grant a
11 permanent access and construction easement to the
12 Metropolitan Transportation Authority;

13 Senate Print 8358, by
14 Senator Addabbo, an act to amend the
15 Racing, Pari-Mutuel Wagering and Breeding Law;

16 Senate Print 8391, by
17 Senator Gianaris, an act to amend the
18 Civil Rights Law;

19 Senate Print 8393, by Senator Webb,
20 an act to amend the Executive Law;

21 Senate Print 8400, by
22 Senator Serrano, an act in relation to a
23 feasibility study and report on the potential
24 reestablishment of the Empire State Summer Games;

25 Senate Print 8420A, by

1 Senator Gianaris, an act to amend the
2 General Business Law;

3 Senate Print 8428, by
4 Senator Rhoads, an act to amend the Highway Law;

5 Senate Print 8432, by
6 Senator Hoylman-Sigal, an act to amend the
7 Limited Liability Company Law.

8 All bills reported direct to third
9 reading.

10 (Pause.)

11 THE SECRETARY: Senate Print 6243,
12 by Senator Rolison, an act to amend the Tax Law;

13 Senate Print 6618A, by
14 Senator Rolison, an act to amend the Tax Law.

15 SENATOR GIANARIS: Move to accept
16 the report of the Rules Committee.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: All those
18 in favor of accepting the report of the
19 Rules Committee please signify by saying aye.

20 (Response of "Aye.")

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Opposed,
22 nay.

23 (No response.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
25 report of the Rules Committee is accepted.

1 Senator Gianaris.

2 SENATOR GIANARIS: Please recognize
3 Senator Lanza for a motion.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
5 Lanza.

6 SENATOR LANZA: Thank you,
7 Senator Gianaris.

8 Mr. President, I wish to call up
9 Senator Mattera's bill, Print Number 1171,
10 recalled from the Assembly, which is now at the
11 desk.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
13 Secretary will read.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 1467, Senate Print 1171, by Senator Mattera, an
16 act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

17 SENATOR LANZA: Mr. President, I
18 now move to reconsider the vote by which this
19 bill was passed.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
21 Secretary will call the roll on reconsideration.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
25 is restored to its place on the Third Reading

1 Calendar.

2 SENATOR LANZA: I now offer the
3 following amendments.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
5 amendments are received.

6 SENATOR GIANARIS: Please continue
7 to recognize Senator Lanza for an announcement.

8 SENATOR LANZA: I'm back.

9 Thank you, Senator Gianaris.

10 Mr. President, there will be an
11 immediate meeting of the Republican Conference in
12 Room 315 of the Capitol.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: There
14 will be an immediate meeting of the
15 Republican Conference in Room 315 of the Capitol.

16 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President, I
17 move that we adjourn until -- well, I guess I
18 should ask if there's any further business at the
19 desk.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: There is
21 no further business at the desk.

22 SENATOR GIANARIS: I move that we
23 adjourn until Friday the 13th, June 13th, in a
24 half an hour, at 12:45 a.m.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The

1 Senate will stand adjourned until Friday,
2 June 13th, at 12:45 a.m.

3 (Whereupon, the Senate adjourned at
4 12:19 a.m.)

5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25