NEW YORK STATE SENATE

THE STENOGRAPHIC RECORD

ALBANY, NEW YORK

May 21, 2025

4:07 p.m.

REGULAR SESSION

SENATOR JAMAAL T. BAILEY, Acting President

ALEJANDRA N. PAULINO, ESQ., Secretary

P R O C E E D I N G S

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The Senate will come to order.

I ask everyone present to please rise and recite the Pledge of Allegiance.

(Whereupon, the assemblage recited the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.)

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: In the absence of clergy, let us bow our heads in a moment of silent reflection or prayer for the New York Knicks.

(Whereupon, the assemblage respected a moment of silence.)

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Reading of the Journal.

THE SECRETARY: In Senate, Tuesday, May 20, 2025, the Senate met pursuant to adjournment. The Journal of Monday, May 19, 2025, was read and approved. On motion, the Senate adjourned.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Without objection, the Journal stands approved as read.

Presentation of petitions.

Messages from the Assembly.

The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Senator C. Ryan moves to discharge, from the Committee on Health, Assembly Bill Number 3404A and substitute it for the identical Senate Bill 6223A, Third Reading Calendar 1091.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: So ordered.

Messages from the Governor.

Reports of standing committees.

Reports of select committees.

Communications and reports from state officers.

Motions and resolutions.

Senator Gianaris.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Good afternoon, Mr. President.

On behalf of Senator Sean Ryan, on page 21 I offer the following amendments to Calendar Number 188, Senate Print 641, and ask that said bill retain its place on Third Reading Calendar.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The amendments are received, and the bill will retain its place on the Third Reading Calendar.

Senator Gianaris.

SENATOR GIANARIS: On behalf of Senator Stavisky, I wish to call up Senate Print 607, recalled from the Assembly, which is now at the desk.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 899, Senate Print 607, by Senator Stavisky, an act to amend the Education Law.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Move to reconsider the vote by which the bill was passed.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the roll on reconsideration.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill is restored to its place on the Third Reading Calendar.

SENATOR GIANARIS: I offer the following amendments.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The amendments are received.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Please acknowledge Senator Weber for an introduction.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator

Weber for the purposes of an introduction.

SENATOR WEBER: Thank you, Mr. President.

We have some special guests here up in the gallery from my district in Rockland County.

I want to recognize the Indian Heritage Group and the Rockland Indian Cultural Heritage and Arts Awareness Club, who as I said are with us in the gallery today as we look ahead to Indian Heritage Month this coming August.

I would also like to extend a special welcome to Rockland County Legislator Dr. Aney Paul -- Dr. Paul, how are you today? -- who has joined us here today as well.

Legislator Paul, who is of Indian descent, is not only a dedicated public servant and tireless advocate, but was also a nurse, long-time nurse at Nyack Hospital, where my mother had worked for a number of years as well.

Dr. Paul personifies the goodness of the Rockland Indian-American community. Rockland is home to a very large and thriving Indian population, a community that I'm proud to represent and proud to get to know each and every

day.

And earlier today, along with Assemblyman Pat Carroll, we were able to tour the Capitol with my guests here today and we had lunch as well, and we had some great conversations about some of the concerns and some of the issues not only specific to the Indian community, but in Rockland County as well.

So I want to thank Dr. Aney Paul and the groups for being here. I see my friend Noah George there as well, I see Jacob there, and all the other members of the ICSR. Welcome here today.

Mr. President, please welcome them here to the gallery and please extend to them all the courtesies of this house.

Thank you.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank you, Senator Weber.

To our guests from the Indian-American community of Rockland, we welcome you to the Senate. We extend to you all the privileges and courtesies of this house.

Please remain standing and be recognized.

(Standing ovation.)

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator Gianaris.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President, please recognize Senator Palumbo for a motion.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator Palumbo.

SENATOR PALUMBO: Thank you, Mr. President.

On behalf of Senator Weber, on page 53 I offer the following amendments to Calendar Number 865, Print Number 6859, and I ask that the bill retain its place on the Third Reading Calendar.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The amendments are received, and the bill will retain its place on the Third Reading Calendar.

Senator Gianaris.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President, there's a report of the Finance Committee at the desk. Can we please take that up.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Senator Krueger, from the Committee on Finance, reports the

following nominations.

As commissioner of the Office for People with Developmental Disabilities, Willow Baer.

As members of the Justice Center Advisory Council: Lucina Clarke, Deborah L. Murray, Kanika N. Jefferies.

As a member of the Board of Visitors of the Capital Region Development Disabilities Services Office, Louise K. Thomas-Churchill.

As trustee of the City University of New York, Lorraine Cortés-Vázquez.

As trustee of the Higher Education Services Corporation, Francis Talty.

For promotion to Major General of the Air National Guard, Brigadier General Gary R. Charlton, II.

For promotion to Major General of the National Guard, Brigadier General Sean M. Flynn.

As a member of the Board of Visitors of the New York State Home for Veterans and Their Dependents at Batavia, Marlene L. Roll.

As a member of the Board of Visitors of the New York State Home for Veterans and Their

Dependents at Oxford, Lora A. Rowe.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Move to accept the report of the Finance Committee, and ask that you recognize Senator Krueger.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: All those in favor of accepting the report of the Finance Committee, please signify by saying aye.

(Response of "Aye.")

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Opposed, nay.

(No response.)

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The report of the Finance Committee is accepted.

Senator Krueger on the nominations.

SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you, Mr. President. On the nominations.

I would just like to point out we are confirming a list today that we just heard, and almost all of them are people that we actually don't pay, but they're willing to volunteer in these positions on behalf of the people of New York.

And I'm greatly appreciative that we still have so many committed people in the State of New York who are willing to give of their

time and their self to work to make sure our agencies and advisory councils and visiting programs work as best they can.

Of course we also have two military representatives who were promoted today to be Major General of the Air National Guard and Major General of the National Guard. Those are actually recommended by the federal government and paid by the federal government, but we still need to confirm them. And we are always appreciative of the commitments that we get, in coordination with our federal military agencies, to ensure these positions are appropriately filled.

But finally, I want to recognize the Commissioner of the Office for People with Developmental Disabilities, Willow Baer. She's up here with us today, perhaps with the entire agency. I'm not exactly sure.

(Laughter.)

SENATOR KRUEGER: Raise your hand if you work with Willow.

Yup, she's got the whole agency with her.

(Laughter.)

SENATOR KRUEGER: I will mention quickly that I have never received so many letters of support for a candidate in any hired position in the State of New York.

So apparently you have a very large fan club, which just means we are expecting an enormous amount from you.

And based on your interview with Finance and the Developmental Disabilities Committee yesterday, I feel that all of us who were in the room at the time and listened to the back-and-forth feel very confident that you are ready, willing and able to take on this enormous challenge as the official commissioner.

I'm not going to go on because we have another -- where did she go? Oh, hello -- we have another Senator who appropriately represents the committee you overlap with and who I think also might be your personal Senator, Senator Pat Fahy. So I'd now like to cede the rest of my time to Senator Pat Fahy.

Thank you, Mr. President.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank you, Senator Krueger.

Senator Fahy on the nominations.

SENATOR FAHY: Thank you. Thank you, Mr. President. Thank you for allowing me to speak.

I rise today in strong support of Willow Baer's nomination. I rise as chair of the Disabilities Committee. And yes, as Senator Krueger just alluded to, I'm proud to call her a constituent as well.

I just want to make note not only has she received just tremendous support, it's important to note that this is the largest -- she oversees the largest I/DD system in the country. And she has -- as an acting commissioner she has led that agency with compassion, with lived experience, and with a very serious vision.

Just to give a scope or a scale of this, there are 130,000 people that are served by OPWDD. Eighty thousand of those are served in state-supported settings, and it's very important that we continue to serve them.

I should also note 100 percent of the OPWDD population relies on Medicaid. And at a time when we are seeing looming and very serious threats to the budget, particularly the Medicaid budget, it is important that we have

somebody at the helm of that agency who understands the needs, who understands the importance and understands the individual rights as we face rather uncertain times.

She's also brought lots of creativity, pragmatism and recognizes the need to do more with possibly less in terms of integration, while making sure that each individual is served with sincere compassion.

We also face a very serious shortage with direct service professionals or DSPs, as we often refer to them, while needing to expand access to dental and preventative healthcare. There's so much more.

But this is -- with filling this post I think we are making a declaration of our values. And I think Ms. Baer brings the ability as well as the recognition of inclusion of all and service to all.

And again, I am in strong support of her nomination.

Thank you, Mr. President.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank you, Senator Fahy.

The question is on the nominations.

Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to the nominations, those Senators voting in the negative are Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Helming, Mattera, Murray, O'Mara, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk and Weik.

Ayes, 47. Nays, 12.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The nominees are confirmed.

Congratulations.

(Standing ovation.)

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator Gianaris.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President, we're going to return to motions and resolutions.

Please take up previously adopted Resolution 986, read that resolution's title, and recognize Senator Fahy from her traditional seat on that side of the chamber.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Resolution 986, by Senator Fahy, memorializing Governor Kathy Hochul to proclaim May 2025 as Cystic Fibrosis Awareness Month in the State of New York.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator Fahy on the resolution.

SENATOR FAHY: Thank you, Mr. President. I'm playing musical chairs.

I rise today in strong support of this resolution for cystic fibrosis. And we do have representatives in the gallery, I think to my left here. And I'm also rising and supporting this resolution on behalf of Senator Jake Ashby, who also has had constituents here today.

This is -- May of 2025 is Cystic Fibrosis Awareness Month. Cystic fibrosis is a genetic disease that causes persistent lung infections and limits the ability to breathe over time. Forty-thousand children and adults in the U.S., and over 1600 New Yorkers, deal with this, and I've known many families myself. Often it requires daily treatment regimens.

But we are making progress here, and the life expectancy has changed dramatically. But of course we do need more early detection

through infant blood screenings is essential. And the mission of the Cystic Fibrosis Foundation is to cure the disease and provide all with a long and healthy life.

And again, we've made tremendous advancements. We're proud that New York is home to 21 world-class CF -- or cystic fibrosis -- treatment centers, which provide comprehensive care and specialized treatment.

Again, I urge my colleagues to join me in recognizing the far-reaching impact of this. And I thank the foundation for helping to ensure that awareness turns into action on those that do suffer with this disease, and that we continue to make progress. And again, I thank Senator Ashby as well.

Thank you, Mr. President.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank you, Senator Fahy.

To our guests, I welcome you on behalf of the Senate. We extend to you all of the privileges and courtesies of this house.

Please rise and be recognized.

(Standing ovation.)

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The

resolution was adopted on May 20th.

Senator Serrano.

SENATOR SERRANO: At the request of the sponsors, the resolutions are open for cosponsorship.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The resolutions are open for cosponsorship. Should you choose not to be a cosponsor, please notify the desk.

Senator Serrano.

SENATOR SERRANO: Please take up the reading of the calendar.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 185, Senate Print 1409, by Senator S. Ryan, an act to amend the Uniform Justice Court Act.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This act shall take effect on the first of January.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce

the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 185, those Senators voting in the negative are Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Murray, O'Mara, Ortt, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

Ayes, 44. Nays, 15.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 241, Senate Print 566, by Senator Skoufis, an act to amend the Executive Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 241, voting in the negative are Senators Ortt, Rhoads, Walczyk and Weik.

Ayes, 55. Nays, 4.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 259, Senate Print 1191, by Senator Addabbo, an act to amend the Correction Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 259, voting in the negative are Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

Ayes, 45. Nays, 14.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 282, Senate Print 114, by Senator Cleare, an act

to amend the Banking Law.

SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Lay it aside.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 363, Senate Print 3909, by Senator Parker, an act to amend the Criminal Procedure Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This act shall take effect on the first of January.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 363, voting in the negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

Ayes, 38. Nays, 21.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 364, Senate Print 4188A, by Senator Comrie, an act to amend the Penal Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 384, Senate Print 3974, by Senator Sepúlveda, an act to amend the Correction Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 9. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 384, voting in the negative are Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

Ayes, 39. Nays, 20.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 525, Senate Print 643, by Senator Cleare, an act to amend the State Finance Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator Cleare to explain her vote.

SENATOR CLEARE: Thank you, Mr. President.

The purpose of the Youth Justice Innovation Fund is to unlock the potential of Raise the Age, which passed seven years ago. The Youth Justice Innovation Fund would direct $50 million to community-based organizations to provide a continuum of services, from prevention, early intervention, to alternatives to detention placement and incarceration for youth ages 12 through 25.

The Innovation Fund builds on successful statewide efforts like Project Rise, which has brought over $30 million to communities to combat gun violence through public health strategies, including credible messenger and violence interruption programs.

Overall, youth crime has consistently gone down since the Raise the Age law was first implemented in 2018. Evidence from across the state clearly shows how the law has improved community safety and youth well-being.

Despite this significant progress, New York State has failed to fully deliver on its promise to fund community-based services and programs that provide alternatives to incarceration, and reentry programs for young

people. From 2019 to 2023, only a third of the money appropriated for youth justice under Raise the Age has been spent.

Ultimately, the Youth Justice Innovation Fund will supercharge our efforts under Raise the Age and direct money expressly into our communities for prevention, intervention, and enrichment.

I proudly vote aye.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator Cleare to be recorded in the affirmative.

Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 525, voting in the negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello, Chan, Mattera, Murray, Palumbo, Rhoads, Walczyk and Weik.

Ayes, 50. Nays, 9.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 593, Senate Print 4957, by Senator Bailey, an act to amend the Judiciary Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This

act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 593, voting in the negative are Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

Ayes, 40. Nays, 19.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 613, Senate Print 2453, by Senator Gianaris, an act to amend the Criminal Procedure Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 613, voting in the negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

Ayes, 38. Nays, 21.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 723, Senate Print 7048, by Senator Webb, an act to amend the Public Health Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator Webb to explain her vote.

SENATOR WEBB: Thank you, Mr. President.

I rise today in very strong support of this legislation that takes a necessary and urgent step towards protecting maternal and infant health in New York State.

As we all know, perinatal care, which is care before, during and shortly after birth, is a critical part of ensuring safe and healthy outcomes for both mothers and babies. Across New York, especially in underserved areas and in rural areas, we've seen a very troubling trend -- hospitals quietly eliminating or reducing perinatal services without community notice, transparency, or proper oversight.

This bill would require any addition, decertification, or major change in the way perinatal services are delivered by a general hospital to be reviewed and approved under Article 28 of the Public Health Law.

This means that more individuals and families will be aware of these essential services and more involved with the decision-making processes that impact their quality of care and more accountability from our medical providers.

Mr. President, as the chair of our

Senate Committee on Women's Issues, and as someone who represents rural areas where access to care is already a major challenge, I know firsthand how devastating it can be when labor and delivery units shut down. Pregnant people are forced to travel farther and sometimes across multiple counties, increasing the risk of complications and negative outcomes.

This legislation is not about red tape, it is about ensuring that decisions that impact maternal and infant lives are made thoughtfully, with full oversight and community input. Together we can continue to strengthen maternal care, protect families, and ensure that no New Yorker is left without the care they need at one of the most vulnerable and important moments of their lives.

I proudly vote aye and encourage my colleagues to do the same.

Thank you, Mr. President.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator Webb to be recorded in the affirmative.

Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill

is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 739, Senate Print 896, by Senator Martinez, an act to amend the Executive Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect on the 90th day after it shall have become a law.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 765, Senate Print 187A, by Senator Hoylman-Sigal, an act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Lay it aside.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

767, Senate Print 2292A, by Senator Harckham, an act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This act shall take effect on the 180th day after it shall have become a law.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick to explain her vote.

SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK: Thank you, Mr. President.

I rise to thank the sponsor for this legislation.

As the sponsor's memo states, in less than three months at the end of 2023, beginning of 2024, 12 dead whales washed ashore in New York and New Jersey, and the postmortems indicated that many of these deaths were caused by boat strikes.

Earlier in 2023 there was a stretch where three dead whales washed ashore on the tristate beaches in a four-day period, including

one on Long Beach, in my community.

This bill is a great first step to educate boaters about what goes on with whale strikes and how to prevent them. And we need to be diligent about other initiatives coming out of the state, such as the push to fast-track offshore wind projects, even those that are opposed by local communities, so that they do not have unintended consequences of disrupting these sensitive yet vital ecosystems.

For that reason I'm proud to cosponsor this legislation, and I'm proud to vote aye.

Thank you, Madam President.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick to be recorded in the affirmative.

Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 767, voting in the negative:
Senator Walczyk.

Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

884, Senate Print 1425, by Senator Liu, an act to amend the Public Health Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 884, voting in the negative are Senators Borrello, Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Oberacker, O'Mara, Palumbo, Rolison, Stec, Walczyk and Weber.

Ayes, 48. Nays, 11.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 950, Senate Print 6641A, by Senator Gounardes, an act to amend the General Municipal Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This

act shall take effect July 1, 2025.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 978, Senate Print 2122A, by Senator Fahy, an act to amend the Real Property Actions and Proceedings Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator Fahy to explain her vote.

SENATOR FAHY: Thank you. Thank you, Mr. President.

I rise today to note this

legislation which expands the legal window for action against zombie properties to include a period after the foreclosure judgment, which would allow localities to address this loophole that now leads to more neglect of properties. For years, they go without accountability, and it can often lead to more years than a foreclosure sale.

The Department of Financial Services, or DFS, has not prosecuted zombie property cases in recent years due to these current legal constraints. This bill will empower the department to reengage with those properties to take an active role in enforcement, along with municipalities.

Here in Albany and many municipalities across the state, we have a burden of enforcing these zombie property laws, and this will provide much-needed support to local governments. Right here in the City of Albany we have over a thousand -- a thousand -- zombie properties. It can lead to quite a corrosive effect in neighborhoods and communities as well as a whole host of safety standards, and the red X's seem to just mark the vandalism and blight.

So in short, this legislation will help communities across the state address this blight with vacant properties, and introduce new housing stock to vigorously address our current housing crisis.

And with that, I thank you, Mr. President.

SENATOR O'MARA: Senator Fahy to be recorded in the affirmative.

Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 978, voting in the negative are Senators Chan and Oberacker.

Ayes, 57. Nays, 2.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 988, Senate Print 3036, by Senator Hoylman-Sigal, an act to amend the Civil Practice Law and Rules.

SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Lay it aside.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 1006, Senate Print 7117, by Senator Salazar, an act to amend the Executive Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This act shall take effect on the 60th day after it shall have become a law.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 1006, voting in the negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martinez, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

Ayes, 37. Nays, 22.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 1010, Senate Print 6576, by Senator Hinchey, an act to amend the State Finance Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This act shall take effect one year after it shall have become a law.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 1086, Senate Print 2261, by Senator Cooney, an act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This act shall take effect on the 180th day after it shall have become a law.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 1091, Assembly Bill Number 3404A, by Assemblymember Lavine, an act to amend the Public Health Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill is passed.

Senator Serrano, that completes the reading of the noncontroversial calendar.

SENATOR SERRANO: Can we please go to the reading of the controversial calendar.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The Secretary will ring the bell.

The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 282, Senate Print 114, by Senator Cleare, an act to amend the Banking Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator Borrello, why do you rise?

SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President, would the sponsor yield for a question.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator Cleare, do you yield?

SENATOR CLEARE: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you. Through you, Mr. President.

Thank you, Senator Cleare, for once again engaging on this bill.

I want to start off -- since it's been a while, we'll go back a bit. Can we confirm, please, yes or no, does New York State allow private contractors to operate prisons?

SENATOR CLEARE: Say that again, I didn't hear you, Senator.

SENATOR BORRELLO: Can -- I'm sorry, can --

SENATOR CLEARE: Through you,

Mr. President.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator Borrello, by all means, please clarify.

SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you.

Does New York State allow private contractors to operate prisons?

SENATOR CLEARE: No.

SENATOR BORRELLO: Okay. Through you, Mr. President, will the sponsor continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR CLEARE: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR BORRELLO: So with that being said, we're talking about a bill that would impact only New York State-chartered banks, which is a shrinking population, since most banks in New York State are federally chartered.

So we're telling New York State banks that they cannot invest in contractors who operate prisons outside of New York State, is that correct?

SENATOR CLEARE: Wherever they are,

no private prisons.

SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President, will the sponsor continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR CLEARE: Through you, Mr. President, I do.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR BORRELLO: So isn't this bill, then, in effect punishing New York State-chartered banks, who again are a continually shrinking population of banks?

SENATOR CLEARE: The purpose of the bill is to make sure that we are not investing in private prisons.

SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President, will the sponsor continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR CLEARE: Through you, Mr. President, yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR BORRELLO: So I think this

is a slippery slope that we're telling banks what they can and cannot invest in, particularly because, as I said, state-chartered banks are community banks, the banks that often make local decisions on loans, things that are important. So it's important for them to have the freedom to invest; otherwise, they can just become a federally chartered bank.

But with that being said, weren't you successful in getting non-state-chartered banks, federally chartered banks to disinvest in private prisons?

SENATOR CLEARE: I have participated in activism and advocacy that I feel brought that on, yes.

SENATOR BORRELLO: Yes.

Mr. President, will the sponsor continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR CLEARE: Through you, Mr. President, I do.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR BORRELLO: So I applaud you

for that. I may disagree with it, but I applaud you for your advocacy.

Wouldn't it be more effective to continue that than to just target and kind of unfairly punish state-chartered banks?

SENATOR CLEARE: Like I said, the purpose of this bill is to make sure that it doesn't happen. Advocacy is always good, activism, but this is another tool.

SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President, could the sponsor continue to yield?

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR CLEARE: Through you, Mr. President, yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR BORRELLO: Shouldn't these state-chartered banks -- again, community banks -- shouldn't they be able to decide for themselves who they want to do business with?

SENATOR CLEARE: I don't think this bill tells them not to do business, and I think they've been able to do business with whomever they wanted to up until now.

But I think it's very important that we do not invest in private prisons.

SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President, will the sponsor continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR CLEARE: I do.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR BORRELLO: But you said that we're not telling them what to do, but we are, actually. Aren't we telling them that they cannot invest in a company that's business is to run private prisons, obviously in states outside of New York?

SENATOR CLEARE: (Conferring.) New York State has already said that we should not have private prisons. So it is only logical that we should say to our chartered banks not to invest in private prisons.

SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President, will the sponsor continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR CLEARE: Through you,

Mr. President, yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR BORRELLO: So from what I can see, contractor-operated prisons in other states actually have lower -- or have lower rates of recidivism, they typically are newer facilities that have invested more heavily in the facilities.

You know, we have aging infrastructure here. I can tell you that, you know, prisons and jails in New York State certainly look like something, you know, from a century ago, if not more.

With that track record, I'm not sure why we wouldn't want a private contractor -- it appears that they're at least having the ability to provide better results and better facilities for inmates.

SENATOR CLEARE: I have experienced, through my own constituents, unfortunately, who have served time in other -- in private prisons outside of New York State. And I've not found it to be the case that they are run more efficiently.

In fact, there are complaints and actually proof of cells that do not lock. The worker turnover rate is 43 percent. There's less training for those officers. There are more incidents of inmate-on-inmate violence as well as inmate-on-staff violence and vice versa.

So I don't share that. Through you, Mr. President.

SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President, on the bill.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator Borrello on the bill.

SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you, Senator Cleare.

We can have a philosophical difference. You know, I think I've been debating this bill since my first year in the New York State Senate, so for five -- this is probably my sixth time debating this bill.

But this year's a little different for me. In the past, as I've said, I think advocacy works. It's worked effectively. Senator Cleare's done a good job with that, as others have.

In the past I've said -- and it

still stands true, in my opinion -- that, you know, we are setting a dangerous precedent by telling banks what they can or cannot invest in. But this year, in light of the prison crisis here in New York State, we are the last state to be telling any other state how they should be running their prisons. Are you kidding me.

Inmate-on-inmate violence is up dramatically. Inmate-on-staff violence is up dramatically. Morale is down. I mean, I can't think of another state at the moment, unless we go to some third-world banana republic, that has done a worse job of running their prisons than New York State has.

So this year my message is: Who the hell are we to tell anybody else how to run their prisons?

I'll be voting no. Thank you.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator Borrello to be recorded in the negative.

Are there any other Senators wishing to be heard? Seeing and hearing none, debate is closed.

The Secretary will ring the bell.

Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator Cleare to explain her vote.

SENATOR CLEARE: Thank you, Mr. President.

While this bill has come to the floor on many occasions, today it's probably more important than any other time in recent history. That is because on the federal level, under the current administration, the use of private prisons for incarceration and detention is on the rise.

In January, an executive order rescinded the Biden directive that required the Justice Department not to renew contracts with private prison firms. Increased ICE activity virtually guarantees the for-profit companies who operate private prisons a pipeline of revenue.

However, in New York we are taking the opposite course. This bill sets a very clear moral and policy principle which follows upon the

fact that we already prohibit the operation of private prisons in New York State, per Section 121 of the Correction Law.

Senate Bill 114 extends this principle further by prohibiting any state-chartered banking institution from providing financing or investing in the stocks, securities or other obligations of an entity that owns or operates a private correctional facility.

New York has been wise enough to ban the very existence of private prisons in this state, and thus it is completely logical to prohibit banks chartered by the very same state from investing in an activity that we have declared is not only prohibited but morally unpalatable.

As we stand here today, over 115,000 people in this country are in private prisons, and the number being detained by ICE only adds to this alarming figure.

In my public service career I have helped numerous constituents who have family members in private prisons, and the experience was horrendous. It is often impossible to make contact with your family member or loved one, to

set up visits or perform any kind of wellness check. There's no accountability, no care or compassion. Safety, health, labor and other standards are lax.

Given the fact that private prisons are a moral, ethical and policy scourge filled with nonexistent safety standards for incarcerated individuals and employees, initiatives to keep people incarcerated longer, and long histories of corruption, this bill makes complete sense.

New York banks should not be allowed to profit from institutions that the state itself deems impermissible to even exist, plain and simple.

I proudly vote aye.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator Cleare to be recorded in the affirmative.

Senator Krueger to explain her vote.

SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you very much, Mr. President.

So I was listening to the debate and doing a little research on my smartphone -- thank goodness for these things -- and it turns out the federal government absolutely has the right to

tell chartered banks at the state and federal level what they can and cannot invest in.

So it is not unprecedented for New York State to decide that certain kinds of business activity are not approvable at the state level.

And in fact, what disturbed me perhaps was that how many conservative states have done equivalent laws saying that you can't invest in companies that refuse to do firearms and private prisons, so the opposite side of this argument.

So it may be a little new for New York State to pass a bill like this saying there are certain activities we recognize as not being in the best interests of people. And there's more than enough research showing very disturbing outcomes at many private prisons throughout this country, which is why I'm very proud New York State doesn't let them in our state.

But it's not unprecedented and apparently it's not even unusual for banks to be regulated by some level of government as to the kinds of investments they can and cannot make.

And so I'm very glad you brought the bill to the floor, made me educate myself, and I'm very happy to vote for this bill.

Thank you, Mr. President.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator Krueger to be recorded in the affirmative.

Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 282, voting in the negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, C. Ryan, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

Ayes, 37. Nays, 22.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 765, Senate Print 187A, by Senator Hoylman-Sigal, an act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator Walczyk, why do you rise?

SENATOR WALCZYK: Mr. President, would the sponsor yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you, Mr. President. Is your goal to protect human health and the environment from PFAS?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through you, Mr. President. This bill, which is very similar to one we passed last session -- and that passed 60 to 1, with support on both sides of the aisle -- would ban PFAS, which is another word for per- and polyfluoroalkyl chemicals, which we know cause a variety of adverse health effects, including reproductive problems, cancer, kidney damage, and behavioral and cognitive effects.

We know that the World Health Organization has listed PFAS as a carcinogen, as has the NCI. And our own EPA has said that there is no safe amount of PFAS for a human.

So the goal is to ban intentionally added PFAS from a variety of consumer products and restrict PFAS that is unintentionally present in these products above the level of detection.

The short answer to my colleague's question: Yes, to protect human health.

SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you, Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR WALCZYK: The bill that you're presenting today has provided a number of exceptions for industrial applications, industrial water treatment, industrial manufacturing processes, et cetera. Why not an all-out ban of all PFAS in the State of New York?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through you, Mr. President. Well, we are certainly taking every step that we think is reasonable at this time, having the information that we know.

So I hope my colleague agrees that this is a prudent measure in the sense that for what we are proposing to ban, we have scientific evidence to back it up.

SENATOR WALCZYK: And through you,

Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR WALCZYK: But there are exceptions in this bill, correct?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through you, Mr. President, yes.

SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you, Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to yield?

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR WALCZYK: Have you had input from producers and users of products that would be affected by the ban in the State of New York?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through you, Mr. President, yes.

SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you, Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR WALCZYK: If PFAS is detectable at very low levels in water, and manufacturers use that water in their production processes, how will this bill's second-phase ban on PFAS to some level be determined feasible by DEC?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through you, Mr. President. The idea is similar to what we have instituted in the ban on PFAS for apparel, and I'm assuming also fast food packaging and firefighting foam.

The DEC and the Department of Health will regulate after we pass this legislation and make, you know, their decision based on information that's tailored to the product from which we are trying to ban PFAS.

SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,

Mr. President will the sponsor continue to yield?

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR WALCZYK: If manufacturers are using water in the State of New York in the production of their products, PFAS has been found in water sources everywhere. Will they be expected to remove the PFAS from the water before they produce products here in the State of New York?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through you, Mr. President. What we are trying to do is to upstream this problem and actually focus on the source. And in this case these are products that contain a contaminant.

Look, I don't have to tell my colleagues across the aisle about the travails of the good people in the Town of Hoosick Falls, where a water contamination due to a century-old plant that produced a Teflon-like material has resulted in scores of illnesses and other ailments for that local community.

I'm very proud that New York State has recently stepped in and instituted a new water treatment facility, but at the cost of millions of dollars and after, you know, over a decade of lawsuits, lawsuits that, you know, still linger.

And it's not just Hoosick Falls, it's Newburgh and other towns that have contaminated water supplies. In fact, the EPA recently said that New York State has significantly more dangerous drinking water than any other state in the entire country.

Between 2019 and 2023, more than 50 percent of residents of our state drank from public water systems that committed health-based violations during that period, according to the EPA.

So we're trying to address the problem at the head of the river, not downstream. And we think by removing PFAS -- by mandating the removal of PFAS from a variety of consumer products will incentivize manufacturers, companies and other corporate actors to take this step now rather than wait for the contamination later.

SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you, Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to yield?

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR WALCZYK: The question was specifically on manufacturers, whether they'll have to remove PFAS from water if they're using water in the State of New York in the manufacturing process.

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through you, Mr. President. If it's certainly feasible, yes.

SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you, Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR WALCZYK: How did you

select January 1, 2027, for an enactment date for this legislation?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through you, Mr. President, we thought that was a reasonable timeline in order to gain compliance for this law.

And mind you, New York has already taken steps -- again, I mentioned firefighting foam and fast food pizza boxes and apparel.

And New York's not alone. There are other states -- in fact, states like Minnesota, Connecticut, Rhode Island, Maine, Washington, Colorado, Vermont, that have taken similar steps as this bill would propose.

SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you, Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR WALCZYK: Solar panels are coated with applications which contain PFAS. Would the coating for solar panels be banned

under this new legislation?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through you, Mr. President. No, that's a specialty industrial coating which does not fall under our legislation. In fact, it's one of the exceptions.

SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you, Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to yield?

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR WALCZYK: What about architectural paint, interior/exterior paint that people use on their homes, would that be banned under this legislation?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through you, Mr. President. Architectural paint, yes.

SENATOR WALCZYK: And through you, Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR WALCZYK: And when we say architectural paint, by definition we're talking about that would be paint that somebody buys off of the shelf at a big box store and uses to paint the outside or the inside of their home, is that correct?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through you, Mr. President, yes.

SENATOR WALCZYK: And through you, Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR WALCZYK: So this legislation, the way that it's written, that essentially bans most of the architectural paint that New Yorkers are currently purchasing in the State of New York, right?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through

you, Mr. President, we think not. We think it's about 8 percent, as I understand it to be, of paint products on the shelves at your local Sherwin-Williams store.

SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you, Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR WALCZYK: The industry has certainly given me a percentage number much higher than that. I'm not sure where 8 percent came from.

But the industry is pretty concerned about this being an all-out ban for almost all of the paint products for architectural paint that they currently purchase.

You did mention Maine and Minnesota, a number of other states that have done similar legislation, which I think there's a great merit to a lot of the issue that you're tackling here.

Those bans actually haven't included

architectural paint. They didn't include paint because they followed good science showing that paint isn't contributing to the health or the environment the way that PFAS is in a number of other applications.

Why was paint included in your legislation where it was left out in the other states?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through you, Mr. President. We think those other states actually -- although the ban isn't specifically mentioned in terms of paint, we think based on the -- our understanding of those statutes in different states that they are included in some of those states.

And your question again, I'm so sorry, why -- I apologize.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator Walczyk, please clarify the question.

SENATOR WALCZYK: Yeah. Through you, Mr. President. My question was, why did you choose to ban architectural paint where other states have not?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through you, Mr. President. We -- again, I take issue

with the fact that my colleague says that other states have not banned architectural paint that contains PFAS. Our reading of some of those statutes suggests they have, in fact.

Secondly, the industrial production of these paints can lead to contamination of water supply.

SENATOR WALCZYK: And through you, Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR WALCZYK: Well, one of the exceptions that you're providing in this legislation is specifically the industrial water-treatment exception. So that would suggest to me that you're not concerned about PFAS when it comes to those coatings and industrial uses, when it comes to water treatment facilities in the State of New York.

Am I reading that wrong?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through

you, Mr. President, yes, I think you are reading into our intentions wrong. We are concerned about paint.

I'm not certain what your specific question is.

SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you, Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the sponsor yield? Senator Hoylman-Sigal, do you yield?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR WALCZYK: So on page 2, the first three lines here go through the definition of architectural paint, which you define, and we've already talked about interior/exterior. But it then goes on to say that architectural paint shall not include industrial original equipment for specialty coatings. Is that correct?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through you, Mr. President, yes.

And the reason we are including it,

we think there are feasible alternatives. And that's why we included it.

SENATOR WALCZYK: And through you, Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR WALCZYK: And underneath that definition, industrial products specifically -- so these are under the "cleaning product" definition, specifically if you look at line 13, that's where you say industrial water treatment. So this, for industrial water treatment, would not be included.

That's a carveout for industrial water treatment, is that correct?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through you, Mr. President, yes.

SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you, Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to yield?

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the

sponsor yield?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR WALCZYK: New Yorkers actually buy $870 million worth of paint. Are you concerned about the economic impact or sales tax impact in the State of New York if New Yorkers get a new regulation? Some of the paint -- you say 8 percent, the industry says over half of the paint that's on the shelves right now contains some of the chemical compositions that this legislation would ban.

Are you concerned that those residents of the State of New York will be going to New Jersey or Pennsylvania or Canada to purchase their paint? Are you concerned about the economic impact?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through you, Mr. President. Well, the timeline that my colleague mentioned, until 2027, is an off-ramp for these retail establishments to sell the paint that this bill proposes to impose the ban on PFAS.

But I would just say, generally

speaking, I'm more concerned about human health than I am about paint sales.

SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you, Mr. President, will the sponsor continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR WALCZYK: On that topic, so PFAS has been used in a number of products in paint and coatings. Fluoropolymers are used for thermal, chemical, photochemical, hydrolytic, oxidative and biostability principles within paint products. They are considered, by the federal government, low toxicity.

Also non-bioavailable, so the human health concern is that those PFAS products and the way that the chemicals are structured within the paint products that the industry is currently producing -- non-bioavailable, non-water soluble, and nonmobile -- would suggest that those don't impact human health as approved to date. That's how I understand it.

Is that how you understand it as well?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through you. No.

SENATOR WALCZYK: And through you, Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes. Yes, thank you.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR WALCZYK: So paints have been built to last and proven not to contaminate water or to endanger human health for the reasons that I've just outlined. And that's why I was curious why paint was included.

I do agree with a number of the provisions within this, but as I started with a question right at the top, if you're concerned about the environmental impact or the human health impact, I just don't know how that translates into paint products that New Yorkers would currently buy off the shelf.

I wouldn't want to alarm people to think that there is a current product that will remain even if this legislation passes and is signed into law, a current product that is dangerous to them that will still be sold in the State of New York.

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through you, Mr. President. Well, I think there's widespread acknowledgment that products that contain these contaminants are dangerous.

I think that we as a legislative body need to take steps to remove those products, as far as we can, with the exceptions that we've listed.

And third, I would say that consumers have to make these decisions for themselves and their families.

But we've provided a timeline for compliance, but we acknowledge through this bill and through the other bans on fast food packaging, firefighting foam, and apparel, that PFAS and PFOS are dangerous to human health, as the World Health Organization and the National Cancer Institute have stated.

And so we are trying to be prudent

here -- not trying to be alarmist, but trying to be prudent.

SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you, Mr. President, will the sponsor continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR WALCZYK: So over time we've changed, and I think with some good cause in the past, paint products in the State of New York. Current law requires paint to be low volatile organic compound -- in order to meet air quality standards, actually. And new paints have reduced emissions by using fluoropolymer binder structure.

Doesn't this take a step backwards if we're putting older technology in paint and increasing emissions that paint products may have in the State of New York?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through you, Mr. President. Specifically about fluoropolymers such as Teflon, they are a family

of high-performance plastics and the production of them is dangerous, as has been shown recently in a medical journal called The Lancet that connected these type of chemicals to male infertility, among other things.

SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you, Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR WALCZYK: So the U.S. Department of Energy has stated the unique characteristics of fluoropolymers can enhance product durability, sustainability and safety. Products that are lighter, longer-lasting, will generally have lower life-cycle costs, embodied energy, transportation-related emissions, and safety risks.

So if we're taking a reduction by going to -- reduction in quality by going to a more organic paint, say, why reduce the quality in the paint and expect New Yorkers to paint

their homes more frequently, the insides of their homes more frequently, to have paint that's more likely to chip, bubble, need to be repainted more frequently? Isn't that a concern?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: I just learned -- through you, Mr. President -- that there's an organization called the American Coating Association, and they apparently have themselves, a trade association group, shown that paints without PFAS and with alternatives are actually as durable and have very similar qualities as the ones with fluoropolymers.

So I don't think we're sending any consumers into the desert when it comes to painting their homes.

SENATOR WALCZYK: Thank you, Mr. President. On the bill.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator Walczyk on the bill.

SENATOR WALCZYK: Elimination of PFAS in many different applications, I think to the sponsor's greater point here, is important, and we've made a lot of headway. This bill does do some good in phasing out PFAS in certain products that could endanger the health of

New Yorkers as well as our environment.

However, this bill is really ignoring some good science, especially when we're talking about polymers, paints, coatings that have proven not to be a danger to human health or to the environment -- and I think could actually have the reverse effect, especially when we're talking about the environment.

This may set New York back on emissions standards, will obviously frustrate consumers come January 1, 2027, as was pointed out, and I think ignores some good science.

I think in the marketplace of ideas, looking at the other states that have had PFAS bans, and even our neighbor to the north, Canada, there is a reason why -- you know, they had looked at paints, but they also looked at the science and decided, all right, these chemical compounds actually aren't a biodanger, they're non-water soluble, they're not going to be a problem like some other PFAS are.

And it's because of these provisions that I'll be voting no.

Thank you, Mr. President.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Are there

any other Senators wishing to be heard?

Senator Oberacker, to explain or are you asking the sponsor to yield?

SENATOR OBERACKER: Explain.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: So we're going to go through and just want to make sure.

Seeing and hearing none, debate is closed. The Secretary will ring the bell.

Read the last section.

Senator Serrano.

SENATOR SERRANO: Mr. President, upon consent, we've agreed to restore this bill to the noncontroversial calendar.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill will be restored to the noncontroversial calendar.

Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This act shall take effect January 1, 2027.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator Oberacker to explain his vote.

SENATOR OBERACKER: Thank you,

Mr. President.

You know, right now I'm having amnesia and déjà vu at the same time. I think I have forgotten this before. I was the lone vote no the last time this bill came to the floor, and I voted no more so on the issue that chemicals lately -- since I've been here in the Senate, Mr. President, five years -- chemicals here are starting to take on this ominous -- this ominous figure, this ominous position that all chemicals are bad, and they're not.

I do think there are some areas this bill addresses that do make sense, but I would propose to you, Mr. President, that the carveout that we've seen and that my colleague brought up about the solar panels, the scientist in me would say if we had a 40- or 50-acre solar array with these panels that are treated, that are being I would say attacked by ultraviolet rays that tend to break down chemicals, and then we have these rains that we've seen, these microburst storms that we're seeing that would bring the rainwater in and so on.

So where are all these chemicals that leach off of this, where are they going?

Are they more detrimental to the health and welfare of our New Yorkers?

Because I can tell you unequivocally, Mr. President, that if we were to sample that, I believe that we would see that the chemicals that we're talking about would definitely be at levels of concern.

So I find it interesting that we're worried about it in clothing. You know, Mr. President, as an outdoorsman who loves to go out in the outdoors, but when it's raining I love to have the rain shed off of my Gore-Tex suit.

So with that in mind, Mr. President, I will be voting no. And I would hope that we would allow our companies to have a little bit more time to institute these changes as we move forward in regards to chemicals.

Thank you, Mr. President.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator Oberacker to be recorded in the negative.

Senator Krueger to explain her vote.

SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you, Mr. President.

I enjoyed the debate. That's one of the things I love about being a Senator, you get

to listen to all these debates from intelligent people and you get to read some research while they're doing it.

So I think it was fascinating that the discussion seemed to focus on paint, because it turns out there's a really good reason not to let PFAS "forever" chemicals in paint. And you know why we know this? Ever hear about lead in paint and the problems that we're now living with decades later, as children eat the crumbling paint off the walls and develop brain damage, as that paint just sort of turns into dust that is inhaled by people living in homes with lead-based paint?

The odor when you paint something has the chemicals in it. We all know what an apartment or a house smells like when you're painting it.

Those exact problems and the research that we know from decades on lead is exactly why PFAS in paint should be a priority for this Legislature to say: Let's stop, guys.

And I heard the concerns about how much paint has PFAS in it. And to be honest, I don't know that either side knew. But I did do

research, and pretty much every major paint corporation that we're familiar with the names and we are buying paint from now, offer non-PFAS paint as well as PFAS paint.

So I don't actually think New Yorkers will have to leave the state to buy paint. I don't even think they'll have to leave their local store where they're buying paint now. They just should ask for no PFAS in my paint, please, or by January '27 I guess not be able to buy PFAS paint.

But every major brand I could look up has options. So I think the bill overall is the right thing to do. I think clearly getting PFAS out of paint that we're using in our homes is a critical thing to do. And with all due respect, maybe we should also outlaw it on solar panels. I don't know, I think it's worth doing more research. Of course solar panels are on the outside of our homes, not on the inside of our homes, so less likely the baby's going to be peeling the solar panel and nibbling on it than on the wall.

But maybe we should do even more research and find alternatives for solar panels

as well.

I very happily vote yes, Mr. President. Thank you.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator Krueger to be recorded in the affirmative.

Senator Walczyk to explain his vote.

SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you, Mr. President. The Federal Trade Commission allows labeling of products with fluoropolymer binders to be labeled PFAS-free, which is why a quick Google search allowed you to see that there are a number of paint products out there that are labeled PFAS-free.

However, the binders that are banned in this legislation will allow even those PFAS -- those PFAS-free labeled products would come off the shelves for New Yorkers.

I continually vote no. Thank you.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator Walczyk to be recorded in the negative.

Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 765, voting in the negative are Senators Chan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk and

Weik.

Ayes, 47. Nays, 12.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 988, Senate Print 3036, by Senator Hoylman-Sigal, an act to amend the Civil Practice Law and Rules.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator Palumbo, why do you rise?

SENATOR PALUMBO: Thank you, Mr. President. Would the sponsor yield for a few questions, please.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR PALUMBO: Thank you, Senator. And through you, Mr. President.

Just a few questions regarding what this bill does. And there are really two aspects to it. And the title indicates that it makes some changes to the Civil Practice Law and Rules regarding making technical corrections to ensure gender-neutrality for the admission to practice

law.

And when I look at this, Chairman, I just have a -- just to clarify that it essentially just takes the "chairman" language, changing it to "chairperson," the references to "his" it changes to "they," "their" and "the applicant." So it's gender-neutrality with respect to the language in that particular bill. Is that accurate?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through you, Mr. President, yes.

SENATOR PALUMBO: Thank you.

Will the sponsor continue to yield?

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR PALUMBO: And thank you for that clarification.

So the other mechanics of the bill don't have anything to do with gender-neutrality, so to speak, it has to do with the application for admission to the bar. And specifically, the meat of it is a few lines.

It says (reading): The questionnaire shall not include any questions requiring the disclosure of the applicant's history of interaction with law enforcement or the criminal justice system, if such interaction, one, is no longer pending and did not result in a conviction; two, resulted in a juvenile proceeding or youthful offender adjudication; or, three, resulted in a conviction which is now sealed. And I'm assuming that's at the time of the application.

So through you, Mr. President, my question is that would also include -- let me rephrase that. That would actually be more expansive than the current application process, which requires you to offer any interaction with law enforcement.

Is that also accurate?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through you, Mr. President, yes.

SENATOR PALUMBO: Will the sponsor continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR PALUMBO: Thank you.

And I see here the language in question, or at issue, is that they ask you -- and for the nonlawyers here, if I could just go on the bill just for one second, after --

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator Palumbo on the bill.

SENATOR PALUMBO: Thank you.

After you graduate law school and after you pass the bar examination, you then have a character and fitness interview, which is essentially -- we used to call it the ethics interview -- where you are also interviewed by an admitted lawyer, usually someone who is a member of the Bar Association, who would then determine your, quote, character and fitness.

And one of those questions on that application is: Have you ever, either as an adult or a juvenile, been cited, ticketed, arrested, taken into custody, charged with, indicted, convicted or tried for or pleaded guilty to the commission of any felony or misdemeanor or the violation of any law or been

the subject of any juvenile delinquency or youthful offender proceeding? Traffic violations that occurred more than 10 years before the filing of this application need not be reported, except alcohol or drug-related traffic violations, which must be reported in all cases, irrespective of when they occurred. Do not report parking violations.

That's the language at issue that would now be stricken as a result of this legislation.

So would the sponsor continue to yield, Mr. President.

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator Hoylman, do you yield? Senator Hoylman-Sigal yields.

SENATOR PALUMBO: Thank you.

And Senator, with regard to that, any -- any conviction or any sealed conviction -- I'll really just address the third part because I really don't have too much issue with the first two, juvenile adjudications or cases that did not result in any sort of action by the criminal justice system -- an acquittal or something.

Regarding that, so if someone, for example, under New York law was convicted of a grand larceny eight or nine years earlier and through Clean Slate that particular conviction is now sealed, would they not have to disclose that with -- in light of this new legislation if they were applying for admission to the bar?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through you, Mr. President. Yes. Our colleague is correct.

And we are following the recommendations of both the New York State Bar and the City Bar. We think that this bill brings the Civil Practice Law and Rules specifically in connection with admission to practice law, in line with the New York State Human Rights law and the law that we proudly passed in the last five year called Clean Slate.

So this is parallel to those reforms and reports that have supported that effort.

SENATOR PALUMBO: Thank you.

Would the sponsor continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR PALUMBO: Thank you.

And currently admitted lawyers -- like I believe the two of us are -- if we're convicted of a felony, we lose our license automatically, isn't that accurate? You can't even reapply for admission for at least seven years. That's the current state of the law for conviction while admitted to practice. Is that accurate?

SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes. Through you, Mr. President.

SENATOR PALUMBO: Thank you.

On the bill, please.

Thank you for your comments, Chairman.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator Palumbo on the bill.

SENATOR PALUMBO: So, Mr. President, this is a bridge way too far. When you think about character and fitness for admission to the bar, that doesn't necessarily prohibit you from being admitted, but it's important. If you're convicted, if you are a

serial thief, you steal for years and years from your employer, from the elderly, you commit mortgage fraud, that's important when it comes to character and fitness as a lawyer.

Why, do you ask? People don't like lawyers, right, they think we're all a little bit slippery at some point just because that's the perception. But lawyers have one of the most important responsibilities in society when it comes to overseeing -- not only representing people, but overseeing other people's money.

When I was in a busy practice we had millions of dollars on any given day in our escrow accounts of other people's money that was not ours, that we were supposed to watch. And if you see, being a member on the Judiciary Committee, being a ranking member in both houses, I get a lot of information regarding lawyers being admonished, being censured, suspended and being disbarred. You have them getting -- if you're convicted of a felony, you're gone. Your license is gone. You can try again in seven years -- which it usually takes much longer than that to get readmitted to the bar.

But more importantly, in the event

you are -- you have misdemeanors or there are other suspensions and so forth, and other aspects of the Ethics Code or disciplinary proceedings when you're convicted of a crime. But if you touch your escrow, on almost every occasion people -- I've represented lawyers -- DWIs, other different -- the charge is a felony, you get it reduced, they keep their license. You mess with escrow, you're gone. They punch your ticket. You lose it.

And they should, because that is a very, very important thing that is very unique to the practice of law.

So if you do not have this sort of screening -- and as I said, the first two, you've rehabilitated yourself -- this is a wrinkle. This is a problem I had with -- not to get too far afield, this was the problem with Clean Slate. You don't need to be proven that you're rehabilitated. You don't need to make an application like the law was just before we enacted Clean Slate. You would have to go back to court and say, Look, mea culpa, look at me now, I'm a productive member of society, please seal this conviction.

It's automatic. And that's a concern. You can have bad people who should have no business practicing law and being entrusted with other people's money and their lives because of this legislation.

I get it, it's well intended. But this is actually dangerous to our members of society. And as a result, I'll be voting no and I encourage my colleagues to do the same.

Thank you.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank you, Senator Palumbo.

Are there any other Senators wishing to be heard?

Seeing and hearing none, debate is closed.

Senator Serrano.

SENATOR SERRANO: Mr. President, upon consent, we've agreed to restore this bill to the noncontroversial calendar.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Upon consent, this bill is restored to the noncontroversial calendar.

Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This

act shall take effect on the 60th day after it shall have become a law.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 988, voting in the negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martinez, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, Ortt, O'Mara, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, C. Ryan, Skoufis, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

Ayes, 35. Nays, 24.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill is passed.

Senator Serrano, that completes the reading of today's controversial calendar.

SENATOR SERRANO: Thank you.

Is there any further business at the desk?

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: There is no further business at the desk.

SENATOR SERRANO: I move to adjourn

until tomorrow, Thursday, May 22nd, at 11:00 a.m.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: On motion, the Senate stands adjourned until Thursday, May 22nd, at 11:00 a.m.

In New York you know what time it is: Go New York, Go New York, Go!

(Whereupon, at 5:32 p.m., the Senate adjourned.)