NEW YORK STATE SENATE

THE STENOGRAPHIC RECORD

ALBANY, NEW YORK

May 14, 2025

3:41 p.m.

REGULAR SESSION

SENATOR SHELLEY B. MAYER, Acting President

ALEJANDRA N. PAULINO, ESQ., Secretary

P R O C E E D I N G S

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The Senate will come to order.

I ask everyone to please rise and recite the Pledge of Allegiance.

(Whereupon, the assemblage recited the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.)

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The Reverend Phillip Saywrayne, of Christ Assembly Lutheran Church on Staten Island, New York, will deliver today's invocation.

Reverend.

REVEREND SAYWRAYNE: Let us pray.

We begin the prayer in the name of the Father and of the Son and of the Blessed Holy Spirit.

Lord, Holy Father, Almighty Eternal God for Whom comes down every good and perfect gift. With the light of Your truth, we pray Thy merciful goodness You would bestow Your blessings upon members of the New York State Senate assembled here today.

That they, including the Governor, may be enlightened with the light of Your knowledge and wisdom to make celebratory

unanimous decisions to benefit everyone in the State of New York and even beyond.

Lead and guide each of the Senate members for effective governance to ensure good public health and prosperity without causing undue hardship.

God, through the eyes of faith, I stand with King David of the Old Testament to say:

The Lord is my shepherd; I shall not want. He maketh me to lie down in green pastures. He leadeth me beside the still waters. He restoreth my soul. He leadeth me in the paths of righteousness for His name's sake. Even though I walk through the valley of the shadow of death, I will fear no evil, for You are with me. Your rod and Your staff, they comfort me. You prepare a table before me in the presence of my enemies. You anointeth my head with oil; my cup runneth over. Surely goodness and mercy shall follow me all the days of my life, and I will dwell in the house of the Lord forever, amen.

Receive the benediction now. The Lord bless you and keep you. The Lord make His face shine upon you and be gracious unto you.

The Lord lift up His countenance upon you and grant you His peace.

Amen.

(Response of "Amen.")

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Reading of the Journal.

THE SECRETARY: In Senate, Tuesday, May 13, 2025, the Senate met pursuant to adjournment. The Journal of Monday, May 12, 2025, was read and approved. On motion, the Senate adjourned.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Without objection, the Journal stands approved as read.

Presentation of petitions.

Messages from the Assembly.

The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Senator Scarcella-Spanton moves to discharge, from the Committee on Veterans, Homeland Security and Military Affairs, Assembly Bill Number 4751A and substitute it for the identical Senate Bill 2623A, Third Reading Calendar 741.

Senator Krueger moves to discharge, from the Committee on Insurance, Assembly Bill Number 3795 and substitute it for the identical

Senate Bill 698, Third Reading Calendar 919.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: So ordered.

Messages from the Governor.

Reports of standing committees.

Reports of select committees.

Communications and reports from state officers.

Motions and resolutions.

Senator Serrano.

SENATOR SERRANO: Madam President, I wish to call up the following bills, which were recalled from the Assembly and are now at the desk: Senate Print Number 1194A and Senate Print Number 4188.

I move to reconsider the vote by which these bills were passed.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 402, Senate Print 1194A, by Senator Addabbo, an act to amend the Public Service Law.

Calendar Number 364, Senate Print 4188, by Senator Comrie, an act to amend the Penal Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The Secretary will call the roll on reconsideration.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 57.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bills are restored to their place on the Third Reading Calendar.

SENATOR SERRANO: Madam President, I now offer the following amendments.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The amendments are received.

Senator Serrano.

SENATOR SERRANO: Please take up -- let's move to resolutions. Please take up previously adopted Resolution 940, by Senator Cooney. Please read the resolution title only and recognize Senator Cooney.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Resolution 940, by Senator Cooney, commemorating the 75th Anniversary of the Indian Constitution on November 26, 2025.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator Cooney on the resolution.

SENATOR COONEY: Thank you, Madam President.

I am introducing this resolution in honor of the 75th anniversary of the Indian Constitution, a time to celebrate Indian independence and the many brave Indians who risked their lives for the betterment of their fellow countrymen.

I want to start by recognizing some of the dignitaries that are joining us here on the floor. We are joined by Ambassador Binaya Pradhan, Consul General of the Indian Consulate of New York City; his deputy, Dr. Shruti Pandey, as well as Dr. Vikram Dogra, a prominent leader in our Indian Rochester community.

This is a day to be celebrated not just in India, but worldwide. Across the globe Indians are making lasting impacts in their communities. This is an opportunity to join together to celebrate and reflect on our shared history, culture and heritage.

For nearly 200 years India was controlled by the British Empire. But due to the perseverance of our people and the leadership of figures like Gandhi, a decades-long struggle for

independence finally culminated in Indian independence and the adoption of the constitution on November 25, 1949.

This story of resiliency and the fight for self-determination is one of the bonds that ties our two great nations together. It was that desire for civil and political rights that fueled independence movements both in the U.S. and in India, making our countries kindred spirits in the fight for independence and sovereignty.

This anniversary also holds a special importance for me personally. As many of my colleagues know in the Senate, I was adopted from an orphanage in Calcutta. And throughout my life I have worked very hard to maintain a strong connection with India and Indians in my community.

That connection continues today as we honor the 75th anniversary of the Indian Constitution. Congratulations to Indians across the world who will be celebrating this landmark year. And thank you again to our friends from the Indian Consulate for making the time to join us here in the New York State Senate, and to our

Senate Majority Leader, Andrea Stewart-Cousins, for helping me bring forth today's resolution.

Madam President, I vote aye.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you, Senator Cooney.

Senator Stavisky on the resolution.

SENATOR STAVISKY: Yes, thank you, Madam President.

And thank you to our leader, Senator Stewart-Cousins, and especially to Senator Cooney.

I was struck by what Senator Cooney just said, because our two nations have very much in common. We too were subjects of the British Empire until we broke away.

It was mentioned that Gandhi is one of the leaders in the history, in the relatively brief history of independence for India. And we have our own -- we had our own Gandhi, I believe, in my opinion, in Martin Luther King. They both believed in nonviolence and paid a serious price for many of their beliefs.

We also share the idea of diversity. That is so important in India, but also in New York City and particularly in the borough

that I represent, Queens County.

I had the honor of meeting the Consul General last summer at the home of a mutual friend of ours in Jamaica Estates. It was a lovely evening. I remember it very well because they shared their rich cultural tradition, and that is part of the fabric that makes New York City and in fact our country so vibrant. And we face together the problems but also our common bond.

So I welcome our friends from the Consul General's office, from India and from the Rochester community, and I hope that you have a productive day.

Thank you, Madam President.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you, Senator Stavisky.

Senator Liu on the resolution.

SENATOR LIU: Thank you, Madam President.

I join Senator Stavisky in thanking Senator Cooney on this important resolution. This is the 75th anniversary of their independence, but actually India has been around for thousands of years. In fact, it is often

described as the oldest democracy on this planet. And so I'm very fortunate that we have Senator Cooney introducing this resolution.

Senator Cooney talks about the contributions of the Indian-American community -- in Queens, as Senator Stavisky mentioned, and many other parts of the State of New York. But Senator Cooney himself is a tremendous accomplishment on behalf of the entire community, being the first Asian-American and the first South Asian to be elected north of New York City.

And also, if he were not introducing our Ambassador Pradhan and his team today, he might actually very well be presiding over the Senate today.

So he is, as we know, a presiding officer of the New York State Senate and really is a testament to what the Indian-American community has done for us here in New York and beyond.

Thank you.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you, Senator Liu.

Senator Scarcella-Spanton on the resolution.

SENATOR SCARCELLA-SPANTON: Thank you, Madam President.

And thank you to my friend Senator Cooney for bringing forward this resolution.

I just wanted to stand to recognize our wonderful guests. And truly, from the bottom of my heart, I want to thank you for bringing this forward. You are a testament to the Indian community. Standing here before us, you're an inspiration to everybody in this room.

And also I am so proud to represent such a blossoming Indian community on Staten Island and in Southern Brooklyn as well, both culturally and community-wise. It's so impressive to see how the community sticks together, and you bring such a richness to everything that you do.

So thank you for being here. Thank you again, Senator Cooney. I proudly vote aye.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you.

To our guests, representatives of the Consul General's office, of the Indian community, we welcome you on behalf of the Senate. Please enjoy the privileges and

courtesies of the house, and please rise and be recognized.

(Standing ovation.)

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The resolution was previously adopted on May 13th.

Senator Serrano.

SENATOR SERRANO: Thank you.

Please take up previously adopted Resolution 958, by Senator Liu, read the resolution title only, and recognize Senator Liu.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Resolution 958, by Senator Liu, welcoming the descendants of the Chinese-American Transcontinental Railroad workers to the legislative chambers in Albany, New York, on May 14, 2025, and recognizing their families' vast contributions to the State of New York.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator Liu on the resolution.

SENATOR LIU: Thank you, Madam President. And thank you very much for entertaining this resolution.

Today is the 156th anniversary of

the completion of the United States Transcontinental Railroad. Most of us have learned it's one of the very few items that are taught in public schools that Chinese immigrant laborers were instrumental in, completing this railroad that then spurred over a century of economic growth and prosperity to this entire country from coast to coast.

But what, until relatively recently, was not known was how much Chinese-American immigrants actually contributed to this effort. In fact, if you look at the official photos of the ceremony that was conducted once the railroad was actually connected, the final connection, there was not a single Chinese face or Asian face in that photo.

Thankfully, a few years ago, one of our famed photographers -- who succumbed to COVID but nonetheless leaves a long legacy behind -- Corky Lee, he reenacted that completion of the Transcontinental Railroad, and this time it's historically accurate, where most of the people in the photo are descendants of the actual laborers who completed the railroad for our nation.

And so this speaks to the importance of the contributions of Chinese immigrants to the United States. It also speaks to the need to properly teach American history, of which this was an incredible milestone.

And so I just wanted to bring this resolution to my colleagues here and also take a chance to recognize some of the people who have joined us in the gallery.

First and foremost, Joseph Luo, who is a fifth-generation descendant of a worker who worked on the railroad. Thank you, Mr. Joseph Luo.

And also Yihui Rong, the president and the chairman of the American Association of Cantonese.

Kevin Liu, president of the MTA Chinese Association.

Lu Cunjun, the president of the Zhao Qing Association of America.

Dr. Tim Law, founder of Chinese American Social Services.

Michael Wu, president of the Hoysun Onfun Singmo School Alumni Association.

Michael Huang of the Zhanjiang

Association of America.

And Joy He and Kaylee Xu, student leaders who helped collect over 1,000 petition signatures across the State of New York for this resolution.

Madam President, please recognize them. And thank you very much for this privilege.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you, Senator Liu.

Senator Chan on the resolution.

SENATOR CHAN: Thank you, Madam President.

I want to thank Senator Liu for bringing forth this resolution. You know, it seems like lately a lot of these resolutions have something to do with me, and I kind of feel like Forrest Gump.

(Laughter.)

SENATOR CHAN: So let's talk about the Chinese laborers in the Transcontinental Railroad. They're called coolie laborers. And the word "coolie," in Chinese, practically means like shanghaied, hijacked, kidnapped. It's also known in China as "selling the piggy."

And coincidentally, it's very meaningful to us in my district because a lot of folks up here are from my district, and especially to me too, because I am a direct descendant of one of these coolie laborers. My great-grandfather was here in America building the railroads.

I'll tell you a little story. Most of the coolie laborers came from a province in China, a region called Taishan. That's where a lot of my constituents are from, Taishan, and that's where my ancestors are from, Taishan.

So a lot of us are descendants of these Taishanese people, and Taishan was the number-one feeder region of coolie laborers to the United States in the 1800s. Some of my distant cousins still live in Idaho and California today, as well as Wyoming.

When people talk about coolie laborers and the railroads, they often think of California, they think about the Gold Rush. Nobody ever talks about the Union Pacific in Wyoming, Council Bluffs. But today I want to tell a little story about a place in wild Wyoming Territory called Rock Springs.

On September 2, 1885, happened the Rock Springs Chinese massacre, where angry white men, Finnish, to be exact, from Finland, took up their Winchester repeating rifles and they slaughtered Chinese people, 28 of them confirmed -- there could have been as many as 50, a hundred, we'll never know. Because they were burned, they were dismembered, they were hung, they were mutilated. So we're never going to know that number.

The Chinese were chased out of Rock Springs. Why? Because they thought, the Finnish people thought that the Chinese people were there to steal their jobs.

And that is what happened. And Chinese people ran, they ran to Evanston, Evanston, Wyoming, and the federal government had to send in troops to escort them back to Rock Springs in the subsequent weeks. And when they returned to Rock Springs, they discovered that their livelihoods, their houses, their homes, their possessions, everything had been plundered so there was no choice but to leave Rock Springs.

And that was just one little story

in the history of coolie laborers in America. The hardships that we faced as a community were endless. My great-grandfather, coincidentally, around that time went back to China.

And the Chinese that remained and the Chinese that came after that contributed greatly and became a very important community that helped drive America forward. The Transcontinental Railroad was completed, as we know. Today is the anniversary. And America rocket-sledded into a new era of growth and prosperity like never seen before. And we have to thank, among others, the coolie laborers.

So after my grandfather went back to China, my family did not reimmigrate to the United States again until the year 1969, partially because of the Chinese Exclusion Act that was overturned in 1943, I believe. In 1969 -- and it was because of a white man in Binghamton, an executive for the Singer Sewing Machine Company, that brought my uncle over. And that's another story for another time.

It's history like this that no one talks about, history like this that we must talk about and teach our children so we can prevent

things like this from happening going into the future and going down the road for America.

I welcome our guests today. You're the legacy that was left behind by these coolies. Thank you for coming. The Transcontinental Railroad, ladies and gentlemen, could not have been built. And you continue to help make America great.

And that's all I have to say about that, Madam President.

(Laughter.)

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you, Senator Chan. Thank you very much.

Senator May on the resolution.

SENATOR MAY: Thank you, Madam President.

I want to thank Senator Liu and Senator Chan for their remarks and for this resolution.

And I want to welcome the students from my district as well as Taishan from my district too. And all of you who are here, I honor you and the legacy you have left, your families have left on this country.

I have talked a few times in this

chamber about my grandparents who were American historians who after the Civil Rights Act was passed, the State of California was looking for a textbook for 8th-graders that dealt with the entirety of American history, that included people who had been excluded from our history books in the past.

And they wrote about -- not just about the railway workers who had come from China but about what happened afterwards. Just about 13 years after the railroad was completed, the United States Congress passed the Chinese Exclusion Act, which said that new Chinese could not immigrate to the United States and that those who were here, if they were not born here, they could not be naturalized and become citizens. And a lot of those people who had worked on the railroads and worked in the gold mines and done a lot of the really hard labor in this country went back to China because they didn't feel welcome here.

In the State of California, where a lot of Chinese and Japanese immigrants settled, they passed laws preventing them from owning property, they required them to go to segregated

schools. It was not a -- ours was not a country that was welcoming or willing to recognize this incredible contribution that your ancestors made to shaping our entire country and the economy of this continent.

And so it was shameful then. The textbook my grandparents wrote in the sixties became the target of a lot of death threats, and parents pulled their kids out of class so they didn't have to learn about this kind of inclusive history. I feel like we're going through a similar period right now where inclusive history is being censored in this country. I think it's so important that we have resolutions like this, that we tell these stories and that we honor you all for everything you bring to this country.

So thank you for being here, and I vote aye.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you, Senator May.

To our guests representing the Chinese American community, the contributions of this community to the completion of the railroad and beyond, we welcome you on behalf of the Senate. We hope you enjoy the privileges and

courtesies --

(Applause.)

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: -- of the house. Please rise and be recognized.

(Standing ovation.)

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The resolution was previously adopted on May 13th.

Senator Serrano.

SENATOR SERRANO: Thank you, Madam President. Let's now take up previously adopted Resolution 976, by Senator Webb. Please read that resolution title only and recognize Senator Webb.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Resolution 976, by Senator Webb, recognizing Lisa Cortés for her valuable contributions to the film, television, music and entertainment industries.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator Webb on the resolution.

SENATOR WEBB: Thank you, Madam President.

I rise today to recognize and honor Lisa Cortés, a groundbreaking director, producer

and visionary whose contributions to film, television, music and entertainment have enriched our culture and expanded our collective understanding of truth and justice.

As a resident of Harlem -- shout out to Senator Cleare -- Lisa Cortés is a trailblazer in every sense of the word. She began her career in the music industry working at Def Jam Records during the rise of hip-hop, and later serving as the vice president of A&R at Mercury Records. There she made history as the first African-American woman to launch her own label, entitled Loose Cannon Records, under a major record company.

From the very beginning Lisa was carving her own path, one that sent her innovation, creativity and courage. We know that in our society that storytellers and those who help to shape and form narratives, that power and that talent that they have fuels the ability to create positive impact and most certainly change.

And Lisa is in that number. She is a gifted storyteller. Through her production company, Cortés Filmworks, Lisa has committed herself to telling complex, often overlooked

stories. From the cultural iconography of Little Richard: I Am Everything, to the inspiring documentary The Apollo and the Oscar-winning film Precious, her work has earned her accolades from Sundance, Tribeca, the Emmys and beyond.

And more importantly, it has sparked conversation, empowered communities, and shed light on the truths that we too often ignore.

Madam President, her most recent work continues in that tradition. With her new docuseries Murder Has Two Faces, Lisa Cortés brings social justice into focus once again by highlighting the lesser-known murder cases that were ignored by the media. These are stories of victims, often BIPOC women and girls, whose lives mattered but whose stories were eclipsed.

As colleagues, we are all too familiar with the work of addressing BIPOC missing and murdered women and girls. As we all recall, we passed a law last year to establish a BIPOC Missing and Murdered Women and Girls Task Force.

Lisa's work seeks justice not only in the courtroom but in the court of public

consciousness. It is bold, it is necessary, and it is deeply impactful. Lisa uses her art to challenge injustice, to elevate marginalized voices, and to push our society toward equity and accountability. Whether she's producing powerful films or uncovering hidden truths or mentoring emerging creators, Lisa is expanding the boundaries of what media can do.

Lisa, we thank you for your brilliance, your talent, your vision, your bravery, and your unyielding dedication to telling the stories that need to be told, for creating a space for those who are far too often rendered voiceless.

I proudly vote aye on this important resolution, and I encourage my colleagues to do the same. Thank you.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you, Senator Webb.

To our guest, Ms. Lisa Cortés, we welcome you on behalf of the Senate. We extend to you the privileges and courtesies of the house. Thank you for your work.

Please rise and be recognized.

(Standing ovation.)

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The resolution was previously adopted on May 13th.

Senator Serrano.

SENATOR SERRANO: Thank you, Madam President.

Let's now take up previously adopted Resolution 985, by Senator Sean Ryan. Please read that resolution title only and call on Senator Ryan.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Resolution 985, by Senator Sean Ryan, commemorating the three-year anniversary of the shooting at Tops Friendly Markets in Buffalo, New York, on May 14, 2025, and honoring the victims, survivors, families and community at large in the wake of this devastating tragedy.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator Ryan on the resolution.

SENATOR SEAN RYAN: Thank you, Madam President.

Today is the three-year anniversary of one of the darkest days in Buffalo's history. On May 14th -- a beautiful sunny day -- 2022 a

hate-filled racist who was only 18 years old drove from his home, drove two and a half hours to a supermarket on the East Side of Buffalo, to murder people who were complete strangers to him just because of the color of their skin, because they were Black.

Ten lives were stolen that day: Celestine Chaney, Roberta Drury, Andre Mackneil, Katherine Massey, Margus Morrison, Heyward Patterson, Aaron Salter, Geraldine Talley, Ruth Whitfield and Pearl Young.

Three others -- Christopher Braden, Zaire Goodman, and Jennifer Warrington -- were wounded but survived.

Three years later, this is all still fresh in our minds. I'll never forget the day -- I was doing yard work in my back yards -- and I started seeing helicopters flying overhead. Then I started hearing sirens, and I was wondering what's going on, and I went over to my cellphone and it was lit up with messages.

And I couldn't believe what I was seeing, that this was happening just two miles from my home. And today I still feel the confusion, the anger, the sorrow, just the

disbelief that I felt on that day. I can't for a second imagine the trauma that the survivors who were shopping there that day are still dealing with, knowing that it could have been them instead, wondering why they got out and others didn't.

Today my heart's with them, my heart's with the families of the victims who continue to grieve, who continue to hurt. Anyone who's lost a loved one -- I'm sure everyone in this room has -- knows that the grief never goes away, it just gets less painful in a different way. We learn how to live with the grief, we learn how to live around the grief. We build around it. And that's what Buffalo and these families have gone through in the last three years.

This horrible tragedy could have further divided us. It could have broken us. Instead, it galvanized an entire community. And it drew national attention to the inequities that Buffalo's East Side has faced for decades.

The people of the East Side are descendants of the great migration, people who left the South, hoping for freedom, but they met

the Northern version of Jim Crow -- redlining, disinvestment, housing discrimination, employment discrimination, banking discrimination, and much more.

It's no secret, we all know it, the effects of the discrimination and disinvestment are abundantly clear. The root causes and the challenges those neighborhoods face today are clear. In Buffalo you can see it just by driving in the neighborhood. Streets are left barren, potholes are unfilled, houses were demolished with nothing rebuilt. Every social indicator, whether it's individual wealth, homeownership, health outcomes -- Black Buffalonians on the East Side are worse off than anyone else in the city.

But the only way we can begin to fix it is to acknowledge the reality and to acknowledge the problem that we have caused. It's the harms done by leaders of the past generations. But that harm was intentional and it was purposeful, so we have to be intentional and purposeful in our efforts to reverse it.

That means sustained investment where there was disinvestment in Black

communities. One year ago I stood in this chamber and said we can only solve these problems if we're all pulling the same direction. We all know that on a federal level things are not going in the direction we wanted them to go in. We've got a new administration that thinks acknowledging sins of the past is a bad thing, that thinks equity is a dirty word.

But that makes our work in New York State all the more important. We need to continue to fight back against federal backsliding. We also need to make sure that we're keeping up our end of the bargain.

I'm proud of the way that New York State has stepped up for the East Side since the attack. We've invested in home renovations, infill housing to fill in the sea of vacant lots. We've put millions into small business grants and workforce development. And we've invested money to combat food insecurity, prevent foreclosures, and to make home ownership more attainable.

But we have got a long way to go. It's a great start, but it's just a drip in the bucket of the problem that we have. Money alone's not going to solve it. We need to make

sure we're investing in it properly. We need to make sure we listen to the community to get guidance from the community.

This weekend I attend the Buffalo Black Caucus. It's an annual event that was organized after 5/14 by Buffalo Councilwoman Zeneta Everhart, whose son was shot that day. He is one of the survivors. Every year the event brings together community leaders to uplift Black voices and to strengthen Buffalo's Black community.

It's a remarkably powerful way to honor those that were taken from us, the community coming together to do good. We will not let hate win. We will not let hate keep us down. We will not let hate continue to divide us. We will remember, and we will move forward together.

Thank you, Madam President.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you, Senator Ryan.

Minority Leader Ortt on the resolution.

SENATOR ORTT: Thank you, Madam President. I rise to speak on this

resolution.

I guess in doing so I just want to address some of the -- what we just heard. But also I want to say obviously this was a terrible day. It's a terrible day in America when this happens. It's a terrible day in New York. I remember when it happened, and I felt particularly shamed and I felt upset, maybe more so, because it happened in Western New York, because it happened in my community, our community, where we're not used to this kind of thing happening.

And there was a different feeling, I think, when -- whenever it happens in our community, there's a feeling like I can't believe it happened here. Even though it happens a lot in different ways. Hateful acts happen all over the world every day, and of course in today's day and age we are able to get instant knowledge of this on our phones. And yet still when it happens to someone you know, or in your community, I think we always are surprised.

Because I think and I believe in Western New York we are not a hateful community. There's hateful people across the world. But I

think my shock is because most of the people I know are not hateful people. In fact, I think Western New York, as someone who's grown up there, is a very loving community. And what we lack sometimes in affluence and financial resources, I can promise you we make up in other ways and in support for our fellow neighbor. The City of Good Neighbors is often a moniker that is tossed around in Buffalo and in Western New York.

And of course it wasn't a Western New Yorker that perpetrated this. And it was someone -- an evil person, someone who did an evil act. A racist person, a hateful person. And you know what? Sadly, there's people like him walking around the globe of all different backgrounds who have that hateful feeling in them. And it manifests in this horrible way that cost people their lives because they were shopping in a grocery store.

As Senator Ryan mentioned, that community -- I was there shortly after the shooting because the grocery store was closed and that was really the only grocery store in that neighborhood. And so we -- a lot of folks were there handing out food, making sure that they had

hot meals, making sure they had some level of grocery goods to keep them sustained until the store could reopen.

But I think sometimes -- and maybe it's natural -- we as logical people, I think as good people, we try to understand how something like this could happen. And so it's natural to think how can we prevent it. What can we do to make sure that it doesn't happen in the future? That's a natural thing and it's a good thing and as elected leaders I think we should always try to think in that vein.

But sometimes in doing that -- and this is a minor or a small difference, but I think it has a big impact -- it's also easy to miss what happened. There are a lot of things that we debate in this chamber and around this state, things that are important. We talk about lifting communities out of poverty. It shouldn't take ten people getting shot to do that. We talk about that anyways. And we do talk about it, and we do make those attempts, and we have policy discussions and debates on that.

This happened because of the actions of one individual, a hateful, racist, bad person

who did an evil thing. And probably a lot of people in that person's life missed all the signs that were readily there. But he and he alone is responsible for the deaths that happened in my community, in Senator Ryan's community, in Senator Baskin's community, Senator Gallivan, Senator Borrello. He did it.

And I won't even mention his name because it's not worthy of this chamber to mention his name. But Senator Ryan mentioned the names of the people who lost their lives. And the other side of that, when you focus on what happened there, you also are reminded in the face of evil you often see the best parts of people. And we did see that that day, in the response from the community. We see it in the survivors who have taken and become community leaders to try to make sure that that community comes back stronger, that it never forgets those people who lost their lives.

We see it in the individual of Aaron Salter. Now, Aaron Salter was a Lockport native. His wife, I believe his family still lives in Lockport, in my district. He was a retired Buffalo police officer. He was the security

guard that day at the grocery store.

Now, Aaron Salter is not a hero because he died that day. He's a hero because of way he lived and because he died consistent with how he lived -- protecting others, serving others. I never like the idea of lionizing someone because they died. We should lionize people for how they lived. We all are going to die. The question is, do we meet our end consistent with who we are? Aaron Salter did. He was there protecting people when he gave his last for that community. And he's a hero because he did it every day -- not just on his last day, he did it long before then.

And yes, we should try to always lift communities out of poverty, to eliminate racism where it exists in law, to condemn acts like this when and where they happen. But I think it's also important to condemn it by saying what it is. This individual did something that is disgusting, that is evil.

Senator Ryan talked about the people who survived. I don't know, I don't know what the answer is. My answer to them would be it was not your time. God had a different plan and has

a different plan for you.

Now, some people might scoff at that or maybe think it's simplistic. But I dare you to come up with a better reason. The good Lord had a different plan for those individuals who survived. And He called home the individuals who didn't come out of that store alive.

But it is absolutely the evil, heinous acts. We should condemn it, we should call it out. And we should remember the heroic acts that happened by people -- Aaron Salter was a retired cop, had the training. But there was all kinds of heroism that happened in that store by people who didn't have the training, who showed love and compassion in the face of racism and evil and hate.

And so I rise to recognize Aaron Salter, to remember him, to remember how he lived, not just how he died that day. Obviously the lives of the other victim that day, their families. I think about the moms. Just this past Mother's Day I'm certain, I'm certain that had to be and remains and will always be a very difficult day when you're the mother of a child who's no longer here. Or when your mother is no

longer here, because there were certainly mothers and grandmothers who were part of the victims.

So it's a horrible thing. And there's a lot of things we can learn from it. And as elected leaders, there's different ways we have to look at it. But I always think it's important to remember who did it. And I think it's also important to do due credit and service to the victims, to the families, to the survivors. Because in the face of such evil we'll never maybe understand it. I don't know that I'll ever understand it. As I get older, I think I understand sometimes these things even less than I used to think I used to understand it.

But I can tell you right now, our conference and the Majority Conference grieves with the people of Buffalo, with the people of Western New York, with the people of that neighborhood. And we shouldn't only remember it as the scene or the site of a terrible act, but we should try to remember it as a community that survived and came out hopefully stronger and better out of such a horrible event that happened three years ago today.

So I want to thank the sponsor for bringing the resolution to the floor. Madam President, I thank you for your indulgence.

And I proudly support this resolution.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you, Senator Ortt.

Senator Baskin on the resolution.

SENATOR BASKIN: Thank you, Madam President.

We all remember where we were when a tragedy strikes our life, those moments that sear themselves into our memories forever. For my community, that day was three years ago today. It remains an unimaginable massacre that shook us to our core when a white nationalist infiltrated our city and terrorized our community. In his violent mind he decided members of our community were expendable. Ten innocent lives were stolen on what should have been an ordinary sunny Saturday afternoon.

These weren't just names. (Pausing.) These weren't just names, these were parents, these were grandparents, these were community activists, these were writers, these

were teachers, these were caregivers, these were pillars of faith. They were the heart of our community ripped away in an act of pure hatred meant to intimidate and divide us.

As I wrestle with my own grief and anger, one that kept haunting me, the shooter chose because what he saw was our vulnerability. This racist murderer didn't just stumble onto our neighborhood. He drove more than two hours to deliberately target us. He didn't know the rich history of Jefferson Avenue, once the proud home of the Buffalo Bills, or the resilience of our community. But what he did know, what he could see, was the result of decades of systemic neglect and disinvestment: A community stripped of resources, starved of opportunity, infrastructure crumbling from intentional neglect, policies that denied families mortgages and businesses funding.

He didn't know the history behind those decisions. He could see the consequences -- a community left to fight against all odds, a community left exposed. And he exploded that vulnerability with devastating cruelty.

But the truth is our community, my community, we are not just victims. We are survivors. Through education, through meaningful legislation and through unrelenting determination, this community will endure.

We honor those lives that were stolen from us by demanding better. Whether it's through congregations in our churches, through the classrooms, through the workplace or through any public space, voices that call out racism and hate must not be silenced and should not be erased from our history.

We cannot allow ourselves to believe that the fight is over or that the work here is done. The dark cloud of systemic racism and hate still looms over us, threatening to strike again if we let our guard down.

So let us stay vigilant and let us stay united. And above all, let us fight -- not just for those that we lost but for our sanity, for our dignity, for our lives, and for the kind of community that we desire, a community where no one else will ever have to endure what we have endured for these last three years.

Madam President, as I look up at

some young women from the City of Buffalo who are here with us today in these chambers, on May 14, young Black leaders from the confident girl mentoring group, I can't help but have an honest moment of transparency about May 14th. At this moment, God has allowed me the privilege to be serving our community and our state as a State Senator, under the leadership of a passionate conference leader, under the leadership of a passionate deputy leader, and amongst colleagues in my conference, some of the most passionate people that I've ever met in my life, fighting for the rights of New Yorkers.

On May 14th when my younger brother Lawrence called me to check on me and to see where I was, to make sure that I was not shopping at Tops Markets, he told me that there had been a mass shooting and that there were many, many people who were dead. My immediate thought, Madam President, was what have we done, what have we done to our community now. And when I say "we," I meant Black people.

The humiliation that I felt internally over the last three years, from that moment when I arrived to the crime scene to learn

that Black people were not the instigators of 5/14, they were hand-picked victims. The humiliation that I've had to wrestle with over these years, branding myself as an advocate who fights daily against implicit bias, to know that it sometimes even festers inside of me. The realization that the lynching and the residue of Jim Crow is not confined to this country's southern states, but it does still residue here in New York State. Because the truth of the matter, Madam President, is that another New Yorker killed 10 of my neighbors three years ago today. And that has been and remains a traumatic experience, a sad, dark residue over our community.

And so as I stand here today grieving those that have been lost in our community and celebrating the victories that we have been able to achieve since, I implore my colleagues -- through you, Madam President -- to reflect on the privilege that we all have.

There are nearly 20 million people who call New York State home, and God saw fit to pick 63 of them to serve as New York Senators. I and my colleagues, each of us are one of those

63 people, and we sit at the highest level of policy and legislative procedure-in-making here in this great state. If the ceasing of violence against Black people in this state does not begin with the actions that we, the 63 people who sit in these chambers, take, the legislation that we put forward, and what we choose to advocate for and what we choose to fight for -- if it does not begin with us, then I fear, Madam President, that it will not begin at all.

May God bless my city, Buffalo, New York, and those who are still traumatized by what happened today three years ago on May 14th.

Thank you.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you, Senator Baskin.

Senator Comrie on the resolution.

SENATOR COMRIE: Thank you, Madam President.

I rise today with a heavy heart to speak on this resolution, one that commemorates lives taken far too soon in a senseless act of hate and violence.

I want to thank Senator Ryan for making sure this resolution came to the floor

again, on this third anniversary of this tragedy, to honor the memory of the innocent individuals who were murdered and injured at the Tops Friendly Market in Buffalo on May 14, 2022. There were mothers, fathers, grandparents, neighbors, pillars of the East Buffalo community, people simply going about their day on a Saturday afternoon. Their lives matter. Their stories matter. And their absence is deeply felt by loved ones, the Buffalo community, and New Yorkers from all over the state.

This was not just a mass shooting, it was a racially motivated act of domestic terrorism. We know the shooter targeted this community because it's predominantly Black. This was hatred weaponized, fueled by white supremacist ideology that has no place in our state or our nation.

This young man got radicalized and never got taught how beautiful this country really is by making sure that we have our diversity in our educational system that can teach tolerance.

We need to make sure that never happens again. We need to make sure that

tolerance is taught in all of our schools, that our young people understand the beauty and culture of all of our nationalities that make up residents of New York State so that they would never want to target and become radicalized like this person was.

I'm proud to be a member of this body, though, where I can unequivocally state we all have zero tolerance for hate and racism and will continue to stand up against that. We must call this evil what it is, but we must not look away but act. While this act sought to divide, the aftermath showed the true strength of Buffalo and of New York: Neighbors helping neighbors, people of all backgrounds coming together in grief and solidarity.

We as lawmakers have a responsibility not to mourn but to act, to pass legislation that addresses hate crimes, gun violence and the disinformation that breeds this sort of extremism, to make sure our schools teach tolerance, teach real American history and not just a minute of what history is. Remind people that New York State was one of the states that really made sure that we had an opportunity for

people to thrive and recognize all of our nationalities to come to live in this state, so that we can make sure that every child in this state understands and becomes tolerant and not become radicalized.

We must also continue to work with the family members and continue to fight to ensure that the Buffalo area gets all the resources it needs, especially in the light of the fact that there has been disinvestment in that area.

I also want to recognize our Governor, former Buffalo mayor Byron Brown, our former colleague in the Senate Tim Kennedy, along with the families of those lost and injured and other community stakeholders for working to create the 5/14 Memorial Commission to honor the lives and legacies of those that were lost and the community impacted by this tragedy.

We cannot grow numb to these tragedies. Each time we say never again, we must follow up on it with action rooted in compassion, rooted in justice.

In closing, Madam President, again I want to thank Senator Ryan and our leader,

Andrea Stewart-Cousins, for making sure this resolution comes before us every year, and urge this body to not just pass this resolution as a formality but as a heartfelt gesture of remembrance, solidarity and commitment.

Let this resolution stand as a promise that we will never forget, we will never stop working towards a New York free from hate.

Thank you, Madam President.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you, Senator Comrie.

Senator Bailey on the resolution.

SENATOR BAILEY: Thank you, Madam President.

Thank you, Senator Ryan, Senator Baskin, the Western New York delegation for being strong, Buffalo strong.

Three years ago we all remember where we were, it was Saturday. And, you know, there just became a cascade of text messages, alerts, tweets, notifications that something unspeakable had happened. And I was stunned, I was saddened, I was shocked. Then a heavy weight came over me once I realized why it happened. Being Black in America. I wouldn't be anything

else, Madam President. But being Black in America can have you killed walking down the street, can have you killed in a grocery store -- for no other reason than you being Black.

It wasn't because these people had been negative individuals in their community. It wasn't because they had beefs between each other. It wasn't because there were personal problems. It was because they were Black. And it's okay to say that. It's because they were Black. No other reason. A white supremacist decided to look that up. And he looked up other communities too. It could have been any of our districts. He chose, he chose, the coward chose Black people.

I do think that it is incumbent upon us in this chamber to do more. We can talk about all the statutory construction and we can debate policy. Gil Scott-Heron said the revolution will not be televised. The resolution should be more televised, Madam President. What do I mean by that? It is one of the only times in this chamber when we have collegial exchanges sometimes. It is one of the only times in this chamber when we get to laugh and joke with each

other and the outside world gets to see that the 63 of us don't hate each other, so you shouldn't hate each other either.

The resolution shall be televised, Madam President. It has to be. Because they need to know that Jack Martins and Jamaal Bailey talk about the Mets. They need to know that. They need to know that there are relationships outside of the parties that we represent. They need to know that. They need to know that George Borrello talks to me about ties all the time.

(Laughter.)

SENATOR BAILEY: He has a lot of nice ties.

They need to know that we understand the world outside is a rough one. And I do believe that despite some of our differences policywise there's not a person in this chamber that harbors that hate, that harbors any kind of hate. But we have to do more to deprogram our constituents.

You said it was just one person. It was just one coward, yes. But that coward learned that nonsense from somewhere, and he

wasn't told it was nonsense. He wasn't told that no, no, these folks aren't here to hurt you. He wasn't told that these folks are just as productive as you are. He wasn't told that. So probably he was met with a wink and a nod or a smile and a grin that said, Go about your way, you're not hurting us.

We have to do better. Senator Baskin said it, summed it up perfectly: God gave us, the 63 of us, point-00000000000001 percent of the population of 20 million, to represent them. I think that days like today should wake us the hell up about who we are to each other.

And as I close, Madam President, I just want us never to forget those who lost their lives and their families who live with the trauma every single day. You should know that your loved ones may have been lost, but their lives were not lost in vain. We never met them, but we love them, Madam President. We love their spirits and their souls. And we just hope that eventually "never again" actually means never again.

Thank you, Madam President.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,

Senator Bailey.

The resolution was previously adopted on May 13th.

Senator Serrano.

SENATOR SERRANO: At the request of the sponsors, the resolutions are open for cosponsorship.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The resolutions are open for cosponsorship. Should you choose not to be a cosponsor on the resolutions, please notify the desk.

Senator Serrano.

SENATOR SERRANO: Thank you.

Madam President, on behalf of Senator Fahy, on page 64 I offer the following amendments to Calendar 944, Senate Print Number 4879A, and I ask that this bill retain its place on Third Reading Calendar.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The amendments are received, and the bill will retain its place on the Third Reading Calendar.

SENATOR SERRANO: And I'd like to call up Print Number 2627, recalled from the Assembly, which is now at the desk.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The

Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 187, Senate Print 2627, by Senator Kavanagh, an act to amend the Real Property Law.

SENATOR SERRANO: I now move to reconsider the vote by which this bill was passed.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The Secretary will call the roll on reconsideration.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 57.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill is restored to its place on the Third Reading Calendar.

SENATOR SERRANO: I now offer the following amendments.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The amendments are received.

SENATOR SERRANO: Thank you.

Let's please take up the reading of the calendar.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 138, Senate Print 2022, by Senator Cooney, an act

to amend the Social Services Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 57.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 150, Senate Print 2182A, by Senator Hinchey, an act to amend the Public Service Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect on the 180th day after it shall have become a law.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce

the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 150, voting in the negative: Senator Walczyk.

Ayes, 56. Nays, 1.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 174, Senate Print 116, by Senator Cleare, an act to amend the Criminal Procedure Law.

SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill is laid aside.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 216, Senate Print 2289, by Senator Bailey, an act to amend the Private Housing Finance Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 57.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 247, Senate Print 2304, by Senator Krueger, an act to amend the Legislative Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 247, voting in the negative are Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Gallivan, Helming, Martins, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco and Walczyk.

Ayes, 44. Nays, 13.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 267, Senate Print Number 2070, by

Senator Scarcella-Spanton, an act to amend the Veterans' Services Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect on the 180th day after it shall have become a law.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator Scarcella-Spanton to explain her vote.

SENATOR SCARCELLA-SPANTON: Thank you, Madam President.

And thank you to my colleagues. This is the second year in a row that we passed this bill, I think unanimously, to create a registry of everything that veterans and their families can avail themselves to in New York State.

One of the things that I found most frustrating when I got elected is learning how many resources that New York State does have to offer veterans and their families, but being on the other side of this as a spouse, we came home,

my husband got out of the military in 2015, we had a one-year-old baby, and we had no idea what families could avail themselves to. I'm talking housing benefits, education benefits, mental health help -- not just for the veteran, but for the spouse and for the family.

There are so many organizations that provide these resources, but the problem is nobody knows that they exist. This has been probably my biggest qualm since I was privileged enough to come into this seat. This bill is critically important in making sure that it's easy to access, when a family is in crisis especially, everything that New York has to offer.

So once again, I thank all my colleagues. And I hope to see this bill turned into law this year. I proudly vote aye.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator Scarcella-Spanton to be recorded in the affirmative.

Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 57.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 341, Senate Print 3247, by Senator Cooney, an act to amend the Public Authorities Law.

SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill is laid aside.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 405, Senate Print 2253, by Senator Comrie, an act to amend the Public Service Law.

SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill is laid aside.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 556, Senate 1218, by Senator Bailey, an act to amend the Executive Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This act shall take effect on the 90th day after it shall have become a law.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 556, voting in the negative are Senators Borrello, Chan, Griffo, Helming, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Stec and Walczyk.

Ayes, 47. Nays, 10.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 569, Senate Print 4191, by Senator Gounardes, an act to amend the Energy Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect on the 180th day after it shall have become a law.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 569, those Senators voting in the negative are Senators Borrello, Bynoe, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Murray,

Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Rhoads, Rolison, C. Ryan, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk and Weber.

Ayes, 36. Nays, 21.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 574, Senate Print 1741, by Senator Martinez, an act to amend the Agriculture and Markets Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 57.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 731, Senate Print 181, by Senator Persaud, an act to amend the Social Services Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 57.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 741, Assembly Bill Number 4751A, by Assemblymember Rajkumar, an act to amend the Veterans' Services Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 57.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill

is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 919, Assembly Bill Number 3795, by Assemblymember Weprin, an act to amend the Insurance Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This act shall take effect on the 30th day after it shall have become a law.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 57.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 928, Senate Print 955, by Senator Kavanagh, an act to amend the Multiple Dwelling Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This act shall take effect on the 180th day after it

shall have become a law.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 928, voting in the negative are Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Murray, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Skoufis, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk and Weber.

Ayes, 37. Nays, 20.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 940, Senate Print 1314, by Senator Gounardes, an act to amend the General Business Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. this act shall take effect on the 60th day after it shall have become a law.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the

roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 57.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 942, Senate Print 1859, by Senator Myrie, an act to amend the General Business Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 942, voting in the negative are Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk and Weber.

Ayes, 41. Nays, 16.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 953, Senate Print 913, by Senator Kavanagh, an act to amend the Social Services Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 953, voting in the negative:
Senator Walczyk.

Ayes, 56. Nays, 1.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill is passed.

Senator Serrano, that completes the reading of today's calendar.

SENATOR SERRANO: Let's go to the reading of the controversial calendar.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The Secretary will ring the bell.

The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 174, Senate Print 116, by Senator Cleare, an act to amend the Criminal Procedure Law.

(Pause.)

SENATOR SERRANO: Madam President, can we begin with Calendar Number 341.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 341, Senate Print 3247, by Senator Cooney, an act to amend the Public Authorities Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator Lanza, why do you rise?

SENATOR LANZA: Madam President, I believe there's an amendment at the desk. I waive the reading of that amendment and ask that you recognize Senator Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you, Senator Lanza. Upon review of the amendment, in accordance with Rule 6, Section 4B, I rule it nongermane and out of order.

SENATOR LANZA: Accordingly,

Madam President, I appeal the ruling of the chair and ask that Senator Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick be heard on that appeal.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The appeal has been made and recognized, and Senator Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick may be heard.

SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK: Thank you, Madam President.

I rise today because the amendment is germane to the bill-in-chief because the amendment repeals the state's electric vehicle mandate, and the bill-in-chief deals with electric vehicle charging stations.

This amendment would appeal the state's unrealistic electric vehicle mandate and give choice back to the consumers. The state is far behind its electric vehicle mandate. Electric vehicles currently make up about 10 percent of car sales statewide, well behind the 2026 mandate requiring that 35 percent of the sales be electric vehicles.

Under the current EV mandate, 100 percent of car sales must be EV by 2035. Based on the availability and current sales, it's very unlikely that we will reach that goal.

That is why just yesterday Vermont's governor announced that they are pausing their electric vehicle mandate, which followed an announcement by the governor of Maryland just last month to delay the enforcement of their EV mandate.

Because of these mandates, people won't have the ability to choose the kind of vehicle they can afford and that they feel is best for their family, because the only vehicles that will be available will be what the Department of Environmental Conservation allows. Or alternatively, which is much worse, our New Yorkers will travel across state lines to purchase vehicles in other states, thereby harming New York businesses and also New York loses out on their sales tax revenue.

Another downside of the electric vehicle mandate is the fact that electric vehicles are more expensive than gas-powered vehicles. In 2023 the average price of an electric vehicle was about $12,000 more than the average price of a gas-powered vehicle.

Repealing the EV mandate will ensure New York is a more affordable place to live,

something that we all spoke about in this chamber extensively during the recent budget process.

For New Yorkers who want to have an electric vehicle or a hybrid vehicle, if that choice works for them, I think that's great. I myself drive a hybrid, and I love the savings that I have at the gas pump.

However, if I were to be required to purchase an electric vehicle, I would not be able to drive to Virginia to pick up my daughter from college in one trip. Many if not most electric vehicles don't have the range to make it that far. And I am not aware of any that have the range for the return trip. That would mean I'd need to stop and charge at least once, if not multiple times. And I hope that there's -- and I don't even know if there's a place for me to do so when I need it.

Therefore, I ask that my colleagues join me in voting to pass this amendment to give consumers back the right to choose which vehicle is best for them.

Thank you, Madam President.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you, Senator.

I want to remind the house that the vote is on the procedures of the house and the ruling of the chair.

Those in favor of overruling the chair, signify by saying aye.

(Response of "Aye.")

SENATOR LANZA: Show of hands.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: A show of hands has been requested and so ordered.

Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 21.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The ruling of the chair stands, and the bill-in-chief is before the house.

Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect on the same date and in the same manner as Chapter 618 of the Laws of 2024.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 341, voting in the negative are

Senators O'Mara, Ortt and Walczyk.

Ayes, 54. Nays, 3.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill is passed.

Senator Serrano.

SENATOR SERRANO: Let's take up Calendar 174.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 174, Senate Print 116, by Senator Cleare, an act to amend the Criminal Procedure Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator Martins, why do you rise?

SENATOR MARTINS: Madam President, if the sponsor would yield for a few questions.

SENATOR CLEARE: I do.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator Cleare, do you yield?

SENATOR CLEARE: I do yield --

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: She yields.

SENATOR CLEARE: -- Madam President, through you.

SENATOR MARTINS: Madam President,

through you, I want to compliment the sponsor on this bill and thank you for bringing this to the floor once again.

But I seem to recall that a similar provision was included in the Executive Budget this year. But for the one-year lookback period, there was an identical provision in the Executive Budget that had been rejected by the Legislature. And I would ask if you know why it was rejected in the Executive Budget.

SENATOR CLEARE: Why the lookback was rejected?

SENATOR MARTINS: Why the language for this bill that was included in the Executive Budget was rejected and not included in the final budget.

SENATOR CLEARE: I can't say. But I know it was included in the one-house for the Senate. I don't know why.

SENATOR MARTINS: Again, Madam President, through you, I want to thank the sponsor for this bill.

And I'd like to go on the bill.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator Martins on the bill.

SENATOR MARTINS: This bill passed the Senate in 2023 unanimously through the Rules Committee, 20 to zero. That's remarkable. There aren't many bills in this house that pass 20-0 through Rules, and this is one of them.

And then it went to the floor and it passed the Senate 58-0, Madam President, 58-0 in 2023, unanimously again. In 2024, in keeping with 2023, it passed Codes 13-0 -- again, remarkable -- and yet came to the floor and passed the Senate 59-0. Fifty-nine to zero in 2024. And then this year, in 2025, it passed Codes 12-0.

So in three years, through each committee and on the floor of this Senate, this bill has passed this house unanimously, which is extraordinary.

I think we would all agree that when you have a bill that passes this house that often in those committees and there isn't even one member of this chamber that has voted no -- and then this year, the Governor put this bill and this language in the Executive Budget. And yet in the final -- and it was in the Senate budget, in the Senate one-house, excuse me. And yet in

the final budget that came before us all to vote, it was not there and it had been rejected.

So I rise, Madam President, to highlight that fact, not to tell my colleagues something they probably don't already know. But to also highlight the fact that there is one group that is missing. Because in all of that time during all these years where it has passed this house unanimously and clearly has the support of the Executive on the second floor, it has yet to come out of committee in the New York State Assembly.

And that is an absolute disgrace. Because when we talk about child sex trafficking and we talk about the ability to hold people criminally and civilly responsible for such atrocities, the idea that that has been held up in the Assembly needs to be highlighted. And every one of us -- and everyone who may be listening -- needs to be aware that that's where this is getting bottled up.

It's time we stop passing bills unanimously in this house and started holding people who are bottling up these bills in the other house, hold them accountable. Especially

when it's something like this that demands our attention because it goes to our priorities and it goes to our humanity.

So I'm doing that today, and I want to thank Senator Cleare for once again bringing this bill before us. I want to thank my colleagues for again supporting this bill and showing this is a priority for this house. And yes, let's call out the other house and let's make sure there's questions asked as to why this bill can't even make it out of committee.

Madam President, I vote aye.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you, Senator Martins.

Are there any other Senators wishing to be heard?

Seeing and hearing none, debate is closed. The Secretary will ring the bell.

Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 14. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator

Cleare to explain her vote.

SENATOR CLEARE: Thank you, Madam President.

Upon election to the Senate I made it my mission to work to eradicate human trafficking. We have listened to survivors, we've passed meaningful legislation and held community conversations. But there's so much more to accomplish. Sadly, we know that at present, due to many variables, effective cases of prosecution for the crime of human trafficking are very challenging to bring in a timely, meaningful and preventative manner.

Thus the bill that we're highlighting today will empower district attorneys all over the state to be able to effectively prosecute the most heinous and grievous acts of human trafficking in a way that will not only hold people accountable but will help change the system for good.

Senate Bill 116 would eliminate the criminal statute of limitations for sex trafficking and extend the window for survivors to file lawsuits that will allow them to gain a measure of justice.

Many thanks to this Senate body, which has always stood up for survivors and supported this bill. 2025 is the year to make it law. I vote aye and encourage you all to do the same.

Thank you.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator Cleare to be recorded in the affirmative.

Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 57.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 405, Senate Print 2253, by Senator Comrie, an act to amend the Public Service Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator Martins, why do you rise?

SENATOR MARTINS: Madam President, I was hoping the sponsor would yield for just a few questions.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator Comrie, do you yield?

SENATOR COMRIE: No. No.

(Laughter.)

SENATOR MARTINS: Okay,

Madam President, on the bill.

(Laughter.)

SENATOR COMRIE: Yes, I yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The Senator yields.

SENATOR MARTINS: Senator, thank you. Madam President, through you. Senator, did the Public Service Commission ask for this bill?

SENATOR COMRIE: This bill was -- I'm sorry. Through you, Madam President. This bill was requested by many advocates and homeowners that are dealing with the fact that they can never understand their rates and that they have been petitioning the Public Service Commission to try to come up with a standard and a set of responsible numbers that they could really appreciate so that they could know what the cost of their water bills are.

Unfortunately, throughout the state there's a wide array of costs for a water bill for the same amount of water from different municipalities. So this bill is simply to ask the Public Service Commission to develop a formula, to publish that formula as to how those rates are done so that the communities can know

exactly what they're paying for.

SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you, Senator.

Madam President, through you, if the Senator will continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you continue to yield?

SENATOR COMRIE: Yes, I do.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The Senator yields.

SENATOR MARTINS: The Public Service Commission doesn't have jurisdiction over authorities or municipalities or districts, but over private utilities, power authorities -- excuse me, private utilities, including water.

Is there any authority within the Public Service Commission that would allow them to have this jurisdiction over municipalities?

SENATOR COMRIE: This is not to try to establish authority or autonomy over municipalities. This is simply to collect information, public information.

This bill would direct them to develop a formula for the calculation of a residential water cost index and publish a report

on every qualifying waterworks corporation's respective residential water cost index. It would only create an opportunity for the PSC to gather information and share information. This is not about trying to go in and tell a municipality what they could do or anything to usurp their authority or autonomy.

SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you, Senator.

Madam President, on the bill.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator Martins on the bill.

SENATOR MARTINS: I want to thank Senator Comrie because I do think that this is a worthy goal for us, that we have a metric by which we can compare the cost of water.

My concern stems from the fact that the Public Service Commission simply doesn't have the authority to manage and oversee municipal utilities. They don't have authority over the New York Power Authority, they don't have authority over the Long Island Power Authority, they don't have authority over our water districts and water authorities. And they never have. Private utilities, they do. Public and

municipal, they don't.

And so I'm concerned about the metric by which our public or municipal districts, or some of our villages have water departments, would be asked to provide information to an entity that they don't normally have oversight of, they don't provide information to.

I have 43 villages in my district. I have dozens of water districts in my district. And I'm concerned that they are not prepared for something like this, although I think we should all work towards a metric that allows us to get to this.

The idea of creating a new requirement for districts and villages that they're not prepared for, let alone perhaps the Public Service Commission that doesn't have I believe the authority to look at municipalities and oversee municipalities and require them to provide that information because they are here to regulate private utilities, creates some serious concerns for me.

I certainly understand and I want to thank the sponsor because, you know, the idea

that, you know, in certain parts of the state and even certain parts of the same town or the same county there can be disparities in the cost of water is a concern and should be a concern to us. And we should figure out what that metric looks like and how we can go about putting something together.

I'm just -- my concern here is I'm not sure it's the Public Service Commission and I'm not sure it should be done in a way that doesn't include our municipal districts, our water districts, our villages and water departments as part of that discussion before we pass something that may obligate them to a cost that they are not accustomed to and to a relationship with the PSC that they simply don't have.

Now, if this were directed at private water companies, sure. The private water companies have to go to the PSC for a rate change every time they want to change rates. The public utilities or private utilities, the Con Eds of the world, have to go to the Public Service Commission any time they want a rate change. Our municipalities and our districts do not.

So this is a difference that's important. And so before we move with a piece of legislation like this that may have unintended consequences and may add burdens to districts that don't have the ability to meet them, let's have a conversation. Let's include them in the conversation. Let's assess the cost of this, and let's figure out how we get this done.

Thank you, Madam President.

Thank you to the sponsor as well.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you, Senator Martins.

Are there any other Senators wishing to be heard?

Seeing and hearing none, debate is closed. The Secretary will ring the bell.

Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator Comrie to explain his vote.

SENATOR COMRIE: I just want to

thank Senator Martins for his insight and focus on trying to make sure that municipalities are protected.

We believe that this would be very cost de minimis for municipalities, because we're directing the PSC to come up with a formula and do all the work. We're not looking to try to give an unintended mandate to try to spend money on things they don't know.

So hopefully we can, you know, come up with a formula and procedures that would make it illuminative for constituents, because this is why it was brought to us. We have many constituents across the state that are concerned because they have no idea what their price of the water is, and they would love to see a process that could show them and illuminate it for them in the way that they can appreciate.

So hopefully we will get to that point. I understand your concerns about the Public Service Commission. I have -- we all want to make sure that at the end of the day our consumers know what they're purchasing or know what they have to spend money on or understand what their budgeting is.

So hopefully -- according to everything that we talked about, we think that the Public Service Commission can come up with a formula and not wind up with municipalities having to do it themselves.

I would urge everybody to vote aye.

Thank you, Madam President.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator Comrie to be recorded in the affirmative.

Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 405, voting in the negative are Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Helming, Martins, Tedisco and Walczyk.

Ayes, 52. Nays, 5.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill is passed.

Senator Serrano.

(Pause.)

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you.

That completes the reading of the calendar. Thank you, my colleagues.

(Laughter.)

SENATOR SERRANO: Madam President, can we go back to motions.

On behalf of Senator Ramos, on page 25 I offer the following amendments to Calendar Number 379, Senate Bill 1692, and I ask that said bill retain its place on Third Reading Calendar.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The amendments are received, and the bill will retain its place on the Third Reading Calendar.

Senator Serrano.

SENATOR SERRANO: Is there any further business at the desk?

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: There is no further business at the desk.

(Laughter.)

SENATOR SERRANO: I move to adjourn until tomorrow, Thursday, May 15th, at 11:00 a.m.

ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: On motion, the Senate stands adjourned until Thursday, May 15th, at 11:00 a.m.

(Whereupon, the Senate adjourned at 5:18 p.m.)