

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

NEW YORK STATE SENATE

THE STENOGRAPHIC RECORD

ALBANY, NEW YORK

May 6, 2025

11:35 a.m.

REGULAR SESSION

SENATOR SHELLEY B. MAYER, Acting President

ALEJANDRA N. PAULINO, ESQ., Secretary

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The Senate
3 will come to order.

4 I ask everyone present to please
5 rise and recite the Pledge of Allegiance.

6 (Whereupon, the assemblage recited
7 the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Rabbi
9 Dr. Moshe P. Weisblum, of Congregation Beth
10 Tikrah, in Wantagh, New York, will deliver
11 today's invocation.

12 Rabbi.

13 RABBI WEISBLUM: It's a pleasure to
14 be here.

15 Members of the Senate, I wrote a
16 special poem. I call it "A Call to Serve."

17 "When the Holy One calls out your
18 name,

19 May courage burn like steadfast
20 flame.

21 When harsh words fly and tempers
22 sear,

23 Let wisdom guide, both firm and
24 clear.

25 "May all your words bring calm and

1 peace,
2 And from your silence, strength
3 increase.
4 Let kindness walk in all you do,
5 And broken hearts find hope through
6 you.
7 "You hold the tales none else can
8 hear --
9 Their silent dreams, their hidden
10 fear.
11 Be steadfast when the strong have
12 fled,
13 A light where weary souls are led.
14 "You do not bear this weight alone,
15 The One who called you claims His
16 own.
17 So walk with love and serve with
18 grace,
19 Let mercy fill this sacred place.
20 "Hold this trust with heart and
21 soul,
22 To heal the hurt, to make lives
23 whole.
24 Let every breath be laced with
25 prayer,

1 To overcome each barrier.
2 "May wisdom guide your hearts and
3 minds,
4 And strength to lead in troubled
5 times.
6 With every choice, may courage rise,
7 To seek the truth, to act with eyes
8 That see beyond the fleeting gain,
9 And build a future free from strain.
10 "In service, may your hearts remain,
11 A light of hope to end the pain."
12 And let us say amen. Thank you.
13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you
14 very much, Rabbi.
15 Reading of the Journal.
16 THE SECRETARY: In Senate, Monday,
17 May 5, 2025, the Senate met pursuant to
18 adjournment. The Journal of Friday, May 2, 2025,
19 was read and approved. On motion, the Senate
20 adjourned.
21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Without
22 objection, the Journal stands approved as read.
23 Presentation of petitions.
24 Messages from the Assembly.
25 Messages from the Governor.

1 Reports of standing committees.

2 Reports of select committees.

3 Communications and reports from
4 state officers.

5 Motions and resolutions.

6 Senator Gianaris.

7 SENATOR GIANARIS: Good morning,
8 Madam President.

9 On behalf of Senator Comrie, on
10 page 12 I offer the following amendments to
11 Calendar Number 350, Senate Print 3799A, and ask
12 that said bill retain its place on the
13 Third Reading Calendar.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
15 amendments are received, and the bill will retain
16 its place on the Third Reading Calendar.

17 Senator Gianaris.

18 SENATOR GIANARIS: On behalf of
19 Senator Serrano, I wish to call up Senate Print
20 1380, recalled from the Assembly, which is now at
21 the desk.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
23 Secretary will read.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 662, Senate Print 1380, by Senator Serrano, an

1 act to amend the Parks, Recreation and Historic
2 Preservation Law.

3 SENATOR GIANARIS: Move to
4 reconsider the vote by which the bill was passed.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
6 Secretary will call the roll on reconsideration.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
10 is restored to its place on the Third Reading
11 Calendar.

12 SENATOR GIANARIS: I offer the
13 following amendments.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
15 amendments are received.

16 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,
17 at this time there will be an immediate meeting
18 of the Rules Committee in Room 332.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: There will
20 be an immediate meeting of the Rules Committee in
21 Room 332.

22 SENATOR GIANARIS: The Senate will
23 stand at ease.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The Senate
25 stands at ease.

1 (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease
2 at 11:39 a.m.)

3 (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at
4 11:45 a.m.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The Senate
6 will return to order.

7 Senator Gianaris.

8 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,
9 there's a report of the Rules Committee at the
10 desk. Please take it up.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
12 Secretary will read.

13 THE SECRETARY: Senator
14 Stewart-Cousins, from the Committee on Rules,
15 reports the following bill:

16 Senate Print 935, by
17 Senator Krueger, an act making appropriations for
18 the support of government.

19 The bill reports direct to third
20 reading.

21 SENATOR GIANARIS: Move to accept
22 the report of the Rules Committee.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: All those
24 in favor of accepting the report of the
25 Rules Committee please signify by saying aye.

1 (Response of "Aye.")

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Opposed,
3 nay.

4 (No response.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The report
6 of the Rules Committee is accepted.

7 Senator Gianaris.

8 SENATOR GIANARIS: Please take up
9 the supplemental calendar.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
11 Secretary will read.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 935, Senate Print 7766, by Senator Krueger, an
14 act making appropriations for the support of
15 government.

16 SENATOR GIANARIS: Is there a
17 message of necessity and appropriation at the
18 desk?

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: There is a
20 message of necessity and appropriation at the
21 desk.

22 SENATOR GIANARIS: I move to accept
23 the message.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: All those
25 in favor of accepting the message please signify

1 by saying aye.

2 (Response of "Aye.")

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Opposed,
4 nay.

5 (No response.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
7 message is accepted, and the bill is before the
8 house.

9 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
11 is laid aside.

12 Senator Gianaris, that completes the
13 reading of the supplemental calendar.

14 SENATOR GIANARIS: Let's take up
15 the controversial calendar, please.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
17 Secretary will ring the bell.

18 The Secretary will read.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 935, Senate Print 7766, by Senator Krueger, an
21 act making appropriations for the support of
22 government.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
24 O'Mara, why do you rise?

25 SENATOR O'MARA: I -- Senator --

1 Madam President, if Senator Krueger would yield
2 for some questions.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
4 Krueger, do you yield?

5 SENATOR KRUEGER: I do indeed.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
7 Senator yields.

8 SENATOR O'MARA: Senator, last week
9 we had a little humor on April 27th with
10 Monty Python. And I think unbeknownst to either
11 you or I, it was the actual 50th anniversary date
12 of The Holy Grail's release. Which is --

13 (Laughter.)

14 SENATOR O'MARA: I don't know
15 what's going on that throws Monty Python in our
16 minds on that day.

17 But here we are doing an
18 11th extender. Can you tell us what status we're
19 at? Now we're hearing some bills are done. When
20 we walked in here, there was -- before we walked
21 in here, I didn't see any bills actually listed
22 as updated on the LRS. When will those become
23 publicly available?

24 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
25 Madam President. No one expects the Spanish

1 Inquisition.

2 (Laughter.)

3 SENATOR KRUEGER: I'm sorry, we're
4 on a roll. I just had to.

5 So I think we're going to see budget
6 bills very soon. I believe that the Speaker of
7 the Assembly said that we will have budget bills
8 by Wednesday. I'm not officially sure that
9 that's true. But when you've got one of the two
10 houses saying it, probably that is true.

11 I feel pretty good about this being
12 our last extender for this unbelievably long
13 cycle, I forget what day of March it is now.
14 March 48th? I don't know what it is. March
15 48th? I don't know.

16 But I feel like it could be the --
17 should be the last extender. It's a straight
18 extender. And budget bills should be coming,
19 rolling off the press soon.

20 I actually think the Governor said
21 yesterday they'll be dropping any second. I
22 don't think they drop, actually. They actually
23 go through a process, go through the LRS.

24 But I know staff have been working
25 incredibly hard, and I don't even want to ask

1 them when they got a good night's sleep. So
2 that's my answer.

3 But I like the Spanish Inquisition
4 line also. Thank you.

5 SENATOR O'MARA: Through you,
6 Madam President, if the Senator will yield.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
8 continue to yield?

9 SENATOR KRUEGER: Absolutely.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator.

11 SENATOR O'MARA: Yeah, I'm sorry, I
12 have no comeback for that one today.

13 But do you have a total number on
14 what this budget is going to come in at?

15 SENATOR KRUEGER: Shockingly, we
16 don't, Madam President.

17 The Governor had used a number last
18 week when she announced the budget was done, and
19 I pointed out I think the word "done" is a
20 linguistically interpreted word. And so the
21 number that was given last week is not
22 necessarily the number that will be the final
23 budget.

24 SENATOR O'MARA: Through you,
25 Madam President, if the Senator will continue to

1 yield.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
3 continue to yield?

4 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
6 Senator yields.

7 SENATOR O'MARA: You said this may
8 be the last extender. This only goes through
9 tomorrow, is my read of it. I don't see any
10 logistical way that we could have the budget
11 completed by then. So how do we not have to do
12 another extender tomorrow?

13 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
14 Madam President. This is correct, so I am
15 incorrect. I think two weeks ago we had the
16 storyline where we did one extender but then we
17 needed another one the next day to cover certain
18 things that were not covered in the first day's
19 extender. So I think there will be a
20 supplemental extender tomorrow.

21 So Senator O'Mara is correct. Even
22 though I think we will also have budget bills, we
23 will need to do some kind of extender tomorrow.

24 SENATOR O'MARA: Thank you,
25 Madam President. That's all I have.

1 Thank you, Senator.

2 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Are there
4 any other Senators wishing to be heard?

5 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
6 closed. The Secretary will ring the bell.

7 Read the last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 12. This
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
14 the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
16 Calendar 935, voting in the negative are
17 Senators Borrello, Lanza, Ortt and Weik.

18 Ayes, 56. Nays, 4.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
20 is passed.

21 Senator Gianaris, that completes the
22 reading of the controversial calendar.

23 SENATOR GIANARIS: At this time
24 let's return to resolutions and move to adopt the
25 Resolution Calendar, with the exception of

1 Resolution 930.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: All those
3 in favor of adopting the Resolution Calendar,
4 with the exception of Resolution 930, please
5 signify by saying aye.

6 (Response of "Aye.")

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Opposed,
8 nay.

9 (No response.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
11 Resolution Calendar is adopted.

12 SENATOR GIANARIS: And let's take
13 up previously adopted Resolution 738, by
14 Senator Stavisky, read that resolution's title
15 and recognize Senator Stavisky.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
17 Secretary will read.

18 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 738, by
19 Senator Stavisky, memorializing Governor Kathy
20 Hochul to proclaim May 6, 2025, as Queens Day in
21 the State of New York.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
23 Stavisky on the resolution.

24 SENATOR STAVISKY: Thank you,
25 Madam President.

1 Thank you, Senator Gianaris, from
2 the great State of Astoria in Queens.

3 And welcome to our friends from the
4 Queens Chamber of Commerce and their guests. On
5 behalf of the 2.3 million Queens residents, I
6 welcome everybody to the chamber in the Senate
7 and hope that this is a productive visit.

8 Let me very briefly go over a couple
9 of things that are truly unique to Queens County.
10 We are a county, a borough, of neighborhoods. If
11 I were to ask Senator Comrie, who is sitting next
12 to me, Where are you from, he's not going to say
13 Queens, he's going to say --

14 SENATOR COMRIE: St. Albans.

15 SENATOR STAVISKY: -- St. Albans.

16 The areas in Queens that I represent
17 include Astoria, and College Point and Whitestone
18 and Bayside and Littleneck and Douglaston and
19 Queens Village and Jamaica, et cetera.

20 We are a borough of neighborhoods
21 with neighborhood needs and neighborhood issues
22 and neighborhood businesses. We have
23 neighborhood economic groups, the merchants
24 associations. We are a county of restaurants.
25 Because I know everybody is looking forward to

1 this evening where many of them will join us in
2 the Hart Lounge between 5 and 7 to show off the
3 great Epicurean delights that we have in Queens.
4 You'll never go hungry if you come to Queens.

5 We are a neighborhood of sports. We
6 have all kinds of sports activities. I'm going
7 to not mention them; I'm sure others will.

8 We are a neighborhood of people who
9 come from all over the world. More than half the
10 residents of Queens were born outside the
11 United States. And it's this diversity, this
12 sense of equality, this sense of inclusiveness
13 that makes Queens such a unique place not only to
14 live but also to work and do business.

15 So on behalf of our friends, we
16 welcome you from the Chamber of Commerce to
17 Albany. And I thank you, Madam President, and
18 will hopefully see everybody this evening.

19 Thank you.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you.

21 Senator Addabbo on the resolution.

22 SENATOR ADDABBO: Thank you,

23 Madam President.

24 I want to thank Senator Stavisky for
25 this resolution.

1 As a proud lifetime, longtime
2 resident of Queens, I want to congratulate the
3 Queens Chamber and welcome them.

4 And of course as proud member of
5 Queens, we're proud of our diversity and all that
6 it has to offer, being the greatest welcome mat
7 to the world, as we have two of the major
8 airports, JFK and La Guardia, in Queens.

9 And again, one of the most
10 successful gaming sites in the country,
11 Resorts World, and other amenities that create
12 great jobs.

13 But I'm going to quote someone who
14 is from Queens -- actually, she's from my
15 hometown of Ozone Park. And it's Cyndi Lauper,
16 who's being inducted into the Rock and Roll Hall
17 of Fame this year. And Cyndi Lauper says, "I do
18 speak the Queen's English, it's just the wrong
19 Queens, that's all."

20 (Laughter.)

21 SENATOR ADDABBO: And if
22 Cyndi Lauper was to speak the language of Queens,
23 she'd speak over 140 different languages, if not
24 more.

25 That's the power of Queens, its

1 diversity. It's diversity that has led to
2 resilience, whether it be through a pandemic,
3 through Hurricane Sandy, through recessions. Our
4 businesses have struggled but yet survived; our
5 people have struggled and yet survived. And I
6 think it's that diversity that makes Queens
7 survive.

8 So again, to the Queens Chamber, I
9 want to say thank you to all our residents of
10 Queens. I want to say God bless you all and
11 thank you for allowing me to be a part of that
12 borough, that great borough of Queens.

13 Thank you so much, Madam President.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
15 Senator Addabbo.

16 Senator Comrie on the resolution.

17 SENATOR COMRIE: Thank you,
18 Madam President.

19 I rise today to second my voice and
20 third my voice on this resolution. This is one
21 of our best days of the year in Albany for me,
22 because I get to talk about the borough that
23 raised me, that shaped me, and that's created the
24 opportunities for me and the honor of
25 representing part of the borough as a

1 State Senator.

2 It's Queens Day in Albany. We have
3 people from Queens that are here working to let
4 folks know that, you know, we have a great
5 borough. We have the best food, the best music,
6 the best constituents, and -- other than a couple
7 of rows in Manhattan -- the best culture.

8 There's no other county that's able
9 to capture the beauty and diversity of the
10 world's borough -- of the world. Queens is the
11 world's borough. And it's that diversity that
12 lets Queens shape the world in return, through
13 politics, music, theater, literature and
14 industry.

15 There are a lot of sights and sounds
16 in Queens. In fact, as Senator Addabbo said,
17 there's over 140 languages. You're walking
18 through different corners of the borough, you see
19 that there's so much going on. You can walk down
20 the street and see five different cultures, five
21 different restaurants that you can experience.

22 You can see everything from mosques
23 to shuls to Hindu temples to historic churches.
24 You know, Queens is just so much that you can do
25 to just visit and see so many different sights,

1 sounds and wonders.

2 But one thing you can be sure of is
3 that no matter what language you speak, the
4 people will be there with you through good and
5 bad. If you fall down, your neighbor will pick
6 you up. If you start a business, the family down
7 the street is going to shop there. If you ask
8 for help, a civic group or community board will
9 be there for you. And if you throw a block
10 party, there will be plenty of resources and
11 unity.

12 Queens' emphasis and sustenance on
13 the arts is the reason that it's the home and
14 origins of such icons as LL Cool J, Nas, A Tribe
15 Called Quest, Roxanne Shante, Kelly Price,
16 Run-D.M.C., Broadway legends Idina Menzel,
17 Leslie Odom, Richard Rodgers. Jazz legend Louis
18 Armstrong, who had a home there; Count Basie also
19 had a home in Queens. Tony Bennett.

20 I'm a Seinfeld fan. I just was
21 thinking about the Seinfeld episode the other day
22 because I had a fire in my district office last
23 week, in the bathroom. And I asked my staff, who
24 was the George Costanza?

25 (Laughter.)

1 SENATOR COMRIE: If anybody watches
2 Seinfeld, you should know that episode. I'm
3 going to ask people who is the George Costanza in
4 the office, and who stood up and dealt --
5 fortunately, it was a minor fire. My staff was
6 there. Everybody's okay, other than the fire
7 department coming and destroying the back part of
8 my office. But everybody's fine.

9 But getting back to Queens. In
10 Queens you can also find a level of
11 intergenerational care that you're unlikely to
12 come across elsewhere. We have an incredible
13 culture of respect and appreciation for those who
14 raised us and paved the way, especially in
15 government. And for so many Queens residents,
16 those who gave them the opportunity to grow up,
17 study, eventually work here in the U.S. And with
18 that comes an insistence on quality support and
19 care for our older community.

20 Queens' motto, under Borough
21 President Donovan Richards, is "Queens get the
22 money." And we do, because the economic -- we
23 are the economic epicenter of the city. Queens
24 is home to Aqueduct and Belmont, the Billie Jean
25 King National Tennis Center, Citi Field ballpark,

1 both major airports, LaGuardia and JFK,
2 Kaufman Astoria Studios, Silvercup Studios,
3 Museum of the Moving Image, Roy Wilkins Park. We
4 have the Unisphere -- those of you that watched
5 all of the Will Smith movies know the
6 Unisphere -- and many flourishing businesses.
7 Sports, music, tourism, cuisine and culture:
8 Queens has it all.

9 Organizations, like we have to thank
10 the Queens Chamber of Commerce, who's hosting the
11 annual Queens Night tonight. And the Queens
12 Economic Development Corporation, steadfast in
13 their ability to develop and educate
14 entrepreneurs, which benefits the local
15 community.

16 Who do we have to thank for Queens'
17 greatness? It's a decade of brilliant and
18 committed public servants who have fought every
19 day to build us up, whether that's on the
20 community, borough, state or federal level.

21 Last week I honored a young woman
22 that spent 44 years in the community serving as
23 district manager. It's that type of long-term
24 commitment that we have from hundreds of
25 Queens residents that spend time in their

1 community, often in voluntary capacities, trying
2 to make sure that Queens stays the family
3 borough, the borough that people want to go to.
4 One of the only boroughs in the last 10 years
5 that population has increased because people want
6 to live in Queens.

7 So I'm glad to be here today with
8 our representatives. I can't overstate how proud
9 I am to have spent my life in Queens serving the
10 people.

11 I look forward every year to sharing
12 this love and culture with my colleagues here,
13 all of you in Albany. You've got to come to
14 Queens and spend some time. Any of you that come
15 to Queens, please let me know. We will treat you
16 to the best evening of your life.

17 So with that, I want to vote aye on
18 the resolution. I want to thank Senator Stavisky
19 and Leader Stewart-Cousins for allowing us every
20 year to bring it to the floor. And please come
21 to the Hart Lounge later today.

22 Thank you, Madam President.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
24 Senator Comrie.

25 Senator Ramos on the resolution.

1 SENATOR RAMOS: Thank you,
2 Madam President.

3 It is with enormous pride and lots
4 of swagger that I raise my voice today in
5 celebration of the boldest, the most brilliant,
6 most beautiful county in New York State: Queens.
7 We're the world's borough, the people's borough,
8 the future's borough.

9 I was born in Queens. I was raised
10 in Queens. I'm raising my family in Queens. I
11 rep Queens, I bleed Queens. And when it's all
12 said and done, I'll still be Queens.

13 Now, I know every member in this
14 chamber has love for their district, but let's be
15 real. If New York is a mosaic, Queens is the
16 part where all of the colors collide and
17 something extraordinary happens. Queens is where
18 the entire world doesn't just live together, we
19 thrive together.

20 We're the most linguistically
21 diverse place on the planet, with over
22 200 languages spoken. That means we don't just
23 speak your language, we probably speak your
24 grandmother's too. We're where immigrants don't
25 just survive, they start a new chapter for their

1 families and our neighborhoods.

2 In Queens, being different isn't a
3 challenge. It's a superpower. Our borough gave
4 the world the likes of Fran Drescher and
5 Donald Trump. So clearly Queens can make you
6 laugh or Queens can make you nervous, depending
7 on your politics.

8 We're home to jazz legends like many
9 of the ones that Senator Comrie mentioned, but
10 including Dizzy Gillespie and Ella Fitzgerald,
11 and punk icons like the Ramones. We were the set
12 of the King of Queens, and so many incredible TV
13 shows.

14 We have lots of hip-hop royalty. In
15 addition to the ones that Leroy mentioned,
16 Nicki Minaj, Mobb Deep, Noreaga, and the Beatnuts
17 were all from Queens.

18 And yes, we root for the home team,
19 the one and only Mets, which will rise again this
20 year.

21 Queens is a sanctuary for the LGBTQ
22 community, a safe harbor for transgender
23 New Yorkers, a laboratory for small businesses
24 innovation, and a haven for street vendors with
25 Michelin-star flavor.

1 We're the transit pulse of the
2 state, connecting JFK, La Guardia, Amtrak, the
3 LIRR, and the MTA, like a living, breathing
4 artery of our city and state.

5 And the food -- listen, you haven't
6 lived until you've had a Tibetan momo in Jackson
7 Heights, a Guyanese roti in Richmond Hill, a
8 Greek souvlaki in Astoria, and a Dominican chimi
9 from a Corona food truck. All in the same
10 afternoon. That's not dinner, that's diplomacy.

11 What I'm trying to say is Queens is
12 New York. Queens is the future of America. And
13 honestly, Queens might just be the universe's
14 best-kept secret, though we're not very good at
15 keeping quiet about it.

16 So on this Queens Day I urge my
17 colleagues to join me in celebrating not just a
18 borough, but a beacon of hope, of hustle, and of
19 humanity.

20 I want to thank all the members of
21 the Queens Chamber of Commerce who are here,
22 especially the owner of Friend's Tavern, which is
23 the oldest LGBTQ-owned establishment in Queens
24 County, and many others who make us so proud to
25 always rep the best borough -- Queens.

1 Thank you.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
3 Senator Ramos.

4 Senator Sanders on the resolution.

5 SENATOR SANDERS: I merely ask one
6 thing: In the future, please let me not go after
7 Senator Ramos. Senator Ramos has said it so
8 well. There are so many things to say about
9 Queens, and yet she has.

10 I will only say this. I
11 represent -- I am a southerner from the
12 southernmost part of Southeast Queens, and the
13 way we look at the world is everything for us is
14 up. Everything for us is up.

15 And we are happy to work with the
16 Queens Chamber of Commerce to do many different
17 things. I want to just point out that they work
18 a lot on the issue of incubators, business
19 incubators, ways of bringing all of these
20 communities together.

21 We all speak about the glory of
22 America, and we understand that the business of
23 America is business. And we understand that
24 Queens understands that and the Chamber
25 understands that by making sure that Queens stays

1 as the site of business incubation in America.

2 I want to thank the Chamber. I want
3 to thank all the guests from Queens. And I look
4 forward to seeing you all at Queens Day, where
5 you can taste some of the great cuisine of
6 Queens.

7 Thank you kindly.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
9 Senator.

10 Senator Gonzalez on the resolution.

11 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Thank you.

12 I rise today to enthusiastically
13 vote aye on this resolution.

14 As many of you know, I was born and
15 raised in Queens, in Elmhurst and Jackson
16 Heights. It's still where my family is. And I
17 have the immense privilege of representing two
18 incredible neighborhoods in Queens: Astoria and
19 Long Island City.

20 And so many of my colleagues today
21 have been able to point out the incredible
22 history the borough has, how our diversity is our
23 strength, the role small businesses play, the
24 role that our celebrities that were born and
25 raised in Queens play in our borough's culture.

1 But I really wanted to take a moment
2 to call out in just two small neighborhoods how
3 every neighborhood in Queens like mine punches
4 way above its weight.

5 In Astoria we have a vibrant Greek
6 community, as you heard, some of the best Greek
7 food in the city. We also have a large
8 Middle Eastern and South Asian community, a large
9 Latino community. We have the largest public
10 housing complex in the entire country between
11 Queensbridge with the addition of Ravenswood and
12 Astoria Houses.

13 And this diversity, both of the
14 people who are there and also the institutions
15 that we have -- calling out the Noguchi Museum,
16 the Museum of the Moving Image, and certainly
17 MOMA PS 1 down in Long Island City -- it
18 represents a standard. It represents that when
19 we have neighborhoods of working-class people
20 from everywhere in the world, that our
21 communities can thrive and that we certainly can
22 show what it means to be the best city in the
23 world, some of the best places in the world, and
24 contribute to the broader economy as well.

25 So I really -- I do want to call out

1 just all of the incredible work that my district
2 has done too in Astoria, Long Island City, and
3 then call out that as someone born and raised
4 there, I certainly would not be who I am today
5 without my Queens culture.

6 So with that, I want to say thank
7 you again for bringing this resolution to the
8 floor and vote affirmatively.

9 Thank you.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
11 Senator Gonzalez.

12 Senator Liu on the resolution.

13 SENATOR LIU: Madam President, go
14 Queens!

15 (Laughter.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
17 Senator Liu.

18 (Laughter.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
20 Gianaris to close.

21 SENATOR GIANARIS: I don't know how
22 to follow Senator Liu's eloquent remarks.

23 (Laughter.)

24 SENATOR GIANARIS: But when you
25 think of Queens, you heard my colleagues say it:

1 Diversity is the word that most comes to mind --
2 diversity of culture, diversity of language,
3 diversity of food. And of course that all comes
4 from the diversity of its people.

5 And when you walk from one
6 neighborhood to the next in Queens, it's like
7 you're entering a different country. And perhaps
8 that's why we identify ourselves by our
9 neighborhoods in Queens, as opposed to the
10 county.

11 You know, when I was growing up, we
12 used to say in my neighborhood we had both types,
13 Greeks and Italians.

14 (Laughter.)

15 SENATOR GIANARIS: And now of
16 course it has changed so much because Queens
17 lives and breathes more than any other place in
18 the world. You have one tide of immigrants
19 replacing the previous one, which then is
20 replaced by another. And that is why we are so
21 rich from each other's experiences.

22 That is why if you do enjoy food,
23 please go to the Queens Chamber's event in the
24 Hart Lounge today. But if you like that, come
25 back and go to the Queens Night Market right by

1 the Hall of Science, which is a culinary
2 experience unlike any you will ever have.
3 Literally food from all over the world from one
4 stall to the next. And not just food to sample,
5 but food to enjoy. It is among the great
6 attractions of our borough.

7 It also happens to be right next to
8 Citi Field, home of the best team in baseball,
9 the New York Mets. And of course the Mets every
10 so often eclipse the Yankees in terms of interest
11 and attention. And now the Yankees were kind
12 enough to cede Juan Soto to the Mets, we are once
13 again in that situation in our great city.

14 I do want to recognize the leaders
15 of the Queens Chamber who are here. Senator
16 Stavisky was kind enough to let me have this
17 honor of introducing Tom Grech, the president,
18 and Carl Mattone, the chairman of the board, who
19 are well known to all of us. We appreciate their
20 attendance today, and we'll get to socialize with
21 them a little bit more later this afternoon.

22 But mostly I just want to talk about
23 what a great, great experience living and being
24 raised and being born in this county is, where
25 this Greek boy was able to meet a Peruvian

1 immigrant and now you all saw, a couple of weeks
2 ago, the family that we've built together. It is
3 a story that can only be told in Queens, and I'm
4 so happy to be a part of it.

5 Madam President, thank you very
6 much. And I appreciate my colleagues for
7 indulging us.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
9 Senator Gianaris.

10 To our guests from the Queens
11 Chamber, we welcome you on behalf of the Senate.
12 We extend to you the privileges and courtesies of
13 the house.

14 Please rise and be recognized.

15 (Standing ovation.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
17 resolution was previously adopted on April 8th.

18 Senator Gianaris.

19 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,
20 let us move on now to previously adopted
21 Resolution 455, which I mistakenly thought should
22 have been brought up yesterday when I thought it
23 was about Margaritaville.

24 (Laughter.)

25 SENATOR GIANARIS: But it is in

1 fact a resolution by Senator Oberacker honoring
2 the Village of Margariteville {sic}. Read its
3 title and recognize Senator Oberacker, please.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
5 Secretary will read.

6 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 455, by
7 Senator Oberacker, commemorating the
8 150th Anniversary of the Village of Marguerite
9 {sic}, New York.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
11 Oberacker on the resolution.

12 SENATOR OBERACKER: Thank you,
13 Madam President.

14 And just as a point of order, it is
15 pronounced Margaretville.

16 Madam President, you have to bear
17 with me. I've kind of come down with a little
18 bit of a cold -- which feels oddly appropriate
19 for my first time rising to speak on my own
20 resolution. Perhaps there's no better way to
21 show how meaningful this moment is than standing
22 here a little bit under the weather.

23 Today I rise with great pride to
24 recognize the 150th anniversary of the founding
25 of the Village of Margaretville, located in the

1 Town of Middletown in Delaware County, tucked
2 along the East Branch of the Delaware River in
3 the heart of the beautiful -- and I do mean
4 beautiful -- Catskill Mountains.

5 And we are honored to be here today
6 to be joined with some of the individuals who
7 help keep the village running. We have here in
8 the chamber Mayor John Hubbell, Town Supervisor
9 Glen Faulkner, Trustee and Town Clerk Sarah
10 Hubbell, Trustee Iris Mead, and Town Historian
11 Diane Galusha.

12 You know, as a former town
13 supervisor, Madam President, and board member
14 myself, I know all too well the challenges and
15 commitment required in these roles. Your work
16 may not always make the headlines, but your
17 impact is undeniable.

18 Thank you for your service not only
19 to Margaretville, but to Delaware County and to
20 my 51st Senate District.

21 Margaretville's story began shortly
22 after the American Revolution, when settlers
23 first arrived and called the area Pakataghkan.
24 I'll have you know, Madam President, I spent most
25 of the night learning how to pronounce that

1 correctly. The name would later be changed to
2 Margaretville, in honor of Margaret Lewis, the
3 granddaughter of Robert Livingston, on whose land
4 the original village was established.

5 And like many villages, many
6 villages in towns and hamlets throughout my
7 district, Margaretville was shaped by the arrival
8 of the railroad, which brought prosperity through
9 commerce and tourism. And like so many places in
10 upstate New York, its spirit has been defined not
11 just by industry but by the resilience of its
12 people -- those who built it, those who stayed
13 and who continue to care for it.

14 Anniversaries like this are the
15 moments to reflect but also to look forward. The
16 Village of Margaretville has endured for
17 150 years, and I have no doubt, Madam President,
18 no doubt it will endure for another 150.

19 And when the future Senator stands
20 here -- hopefully in better health -- to mark the
21 village's 300th anniversary, I hope they'll see
22 what I see today: A community that honors its
23 past, a community that serves its people, and a
24 community which continues to contribute mightily
25 to the great State of New York.

1 Thank you, Madam President. I
2 kindly ask that we extend the courtesies to our
3 honored guests in the chamber today.

4 Thank you.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
6 Senator Oberacker.

7 To our guests here representing the
8 150th anniversary of the Village of
9 Margaretville, I welcome you on behalf of the
10 Senate. We extend to you the privileges and
11 courtesies of the house.

12 Please rise and be recognized.

13 (Standing ovation.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
15 resolution was previously adopted on March 11th.

16 Senator Gianaris.

17 SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you,
18 Madam President.

19 I apologize for the mispronunciation
20 introducing that resolution.

21 Let's move on to previously adopted
22 Resolution 818, by Senator Baskin, read that
23 resolution's title and recognize Senator Baskin.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
25 Secretary will read.

1 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 818, by
2 Senator Baskin, celebrating the life of John A.
3 Feroletto.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
5 Baskin on the resolution.

6 SENATOR BASKIN: Thank you,
7 Madam Chair.

8 I rise to acknowledge and pay
9 tribute to a leader in our great state who
10 suddenly passed away last month. John Feroletto
11 was a dedicated and highly respected trial
12 attorney known for his unwavering commitment to
13 justice, and a steadfast advocate for the rights
14 of individuals.

15 A native of Buffalo's West Side,
16 John was proud of his Italian heritage. He
17 started his own business painting homes at the
18 age of 16 and continued through law school,
19 financing his education.

20 He graduated from the University at
21 Buffalo School of Law, where he met his wife,
22 Paula. She currently serves as a New York State
23 Supreme Court judge.

24 In addition to Judge Feroletto,
25 John is survived by their children and

1 grandchildren as well as extended family,
2 friends and colleagues, including the many
3 attorneys that he mentored who were fortunate to
4 experience his warmth, his humor, and his
5 generosity.

6 I am so grateful for my friend
7 John Feroletto's support over my years as an
8 elected official, and the impact that his family
9 has had on our community.

10 May John Feroletto rest in peace, and
11 may his family find comfort in his legacy.

12 Thank you, Madam President.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
14 Senator Baskin.

15 Senator Gallivan on the resolution.

16 SENATOR GALLIVAN: Thank you,
17 Madam President.

18 I too rise to honor and remember
19 John Feroletto, who was an incredible upstanding
20 member of the Western New York community. Of
21 course, born and raised and lived in Buffalo his
22 whole life. Set an example for so many.

23 You've heard from Senator Baskin,
24 who I thank for bringing this resolution forward,
25 about his accomplishments as an attorney, about

1 his family, a family of servants -- some public,
2 some citizens.

3 And John Feroletto was a citizen
4 servant who did so many things beyond practicing
5 law -- helping so many individuals in need, and
6 being an individual who a community is very, very
7 proud of, and one that we can all aspire to be.

8 So I again thank Senator Baskin for
9 bringing this forward. I'm grateful to have
10 known John Feroletto, grateful that he was part of
11 the Western New York community. And my thoughts
12 and prayers go out to his family.

13 Thank you very much.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you.

15 The resolution was previously
16 adopted on April 29th.

17 Senator Gianaris.

18 SENATOR GIANARIS: Next up is
19 Resolution 930, by Senator Ramos. Let's take up
20 that resolution, read its title, and recognize
21 Senator Ramos.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
23 Secretary will read.

24 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 930, by
25 Senator Ramos, memorializing Governor Kathy

1 Hochul to proclaim May 1, 2025, as May Day in the
2 State of New York.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
4 Ramos on the resolution.

5 SENATOR RAMOS: Thank you,
6 Madam President.

7 And Happy May Day to all Senators,
8 who are workers for our districts, representing
9 our neighbors and our communities.

10 I personally, as the daughter of
11 working-class immigrants, am very proud to chair
12 the Labor Committee in this great chamber, and
13 it's my honor to carry this resolution every
14 year.

15 On May 1st we honor the labor
16 movement with one urgent, simple demand: Safety
17 for workers. That demand has seeded, over time,
18 the child labor ban, has launched the Workers'
19 Compensation Board. It's set modern safety
20 standards, it's strengthened unions and built the
21 protections we still rely on today and must
22 continue to improve for all New Yorkers.

23 From the Warehouse Worker Injury
24 Reduction Act, the Nail Salon Minimum Standards
25 Council Act, the Wage Theft Deterrence package,

1 to temporary disability reform, TEMP, and even
2 workers' comp reform, these bills laid the
3 foundation for the next chapter of protections
4 for working-class New Yorkers.

5 This is legislation that mandates
6 every workplace is safe and our long-term health
7 is protected so that every worker in our state
8 returns home safely at the end of their shift.
9 The worker safety agenda is what will sustain the
10 longevity and the health of the economy of
11 New York State.

12 This resolution, as always, is
13 dedicated to every working New Yorker. May they
14 clock out and return home safe, healthy and
15 whole. This is the promise May Day carries, and
16 one that we now enshrine in history every year
17 and must continue to keep.

18 Thank you.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you.

20 The question is on the resolution.

21 All in favor signify by saying aye.

22 (Response of "Aye.")

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Opposed,
24 nay.

25 (No response.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
2 resolution is adopted.

3 Senator Gianaris.

4 SENATOR GIANARIS: Now let's move
5 on to previously adopted Resolution 257. Please
6 read that resolution's title and recognize
7 Senator Jackson on his resolution.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
9 Secretary will read.

10 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 257, by
11 Senator Jackson, memorializing Governor Kathy
12 Hochul to proclaim May 2025 as Muslim History
13 Month in the State of New York.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
15 Jackson on the resolution.

16 SENATOR JACKSON: Thank you,
17 Madam President.

18 My colleagues, I rise today and I
19 greet you with peace and blessings. Asalamu
20 Alaikum. I rise not only as a legislator, but as
21 a proud Muslim American and the first Muslim ever
22 elected to this distinguished body.

23 This moment is profoundly personal
24 and historically significant. Today we take an
25 important step -- a step towards recognition,

1 towards truth telling, towards honoring a history
2 too often silenced and too often distorted. We
3 memorialize Governor Kathy Hochul to proclaim
4 May 2025 as Muslim History Month in our great
5 State of New York.

6 And what a history it is. A history
7 older than the borders that we draw, richer than
8 the narratives we've been handed. A history of
9 mathematicians who gave us algebra, of science
10 who mapped the stars and unlocked the mysterious
11 vision of healers whose medical wisdom crossed
12 continents and centuries. A history of artists,
13 architects, philosophers, poets. A history of
14 mothers and fathers, immigrants, neighbors and
15 friends who have also helped shape the foundation
16 of our state.

17 And yet too often our stories are
18 erased, our contributions overlooked, our faith
19 misunderstood. And too often we are treated as
20 strangers in a state we also help lead.

21 But make no mistakes. We are not
22 new here. We are not visitors. We are not
23 footnotes. We are part of New York's story. And
24 this resolution, proclamation, reminds every
25 student and every classroom, every New Yorker on

1 every street, that Muslim history is not
2 something apart. It is something among. It
3 belongs to all of us.

4 I want every Muslim child in
5 New York to look at this month and know your
6 faith is not a barrier. It's a bridge. Your
7 history is not a burden. It is a blessing. Your
8 presence is not a threat. It's a gift.

9 By proclaiming Muslim History Month,
10 we are not asking for special treatment, we are
11 asking for honest treatment. We are asking for
12 our rightful place in the narrative of this
13 state.

14 And we are saying to every
15 Muslim New Yorker: We see you, we honor you, we
16 walk beside you.

17 As someone who has marched for
18 fairness, fought for equity, and now stands here
19 a Muslim serving in the New York State Senate, I
20 carry this moment with both reverence and
21 responsibility. From humble beginnings in
22 Northern Manhattan, to this chamber, I know what
23 it means to be seen. I know the power of
24 representation.

25 And this proclamation will remind

1 every young Muslim across New York that they too
2 belong in every room, every table, every seat
3 where decisions are made.

4 Let's move forward with this
5 resolution honoring the past and embracing a
6 future of inclusivity and respect. Asalamu
7 Alaikum -- peace be upon you. Alhamdulillah --
8 hope and thank God.

9 Thank you.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
11 Senator Jackson.

12 Senator Ramos on the resolution.

13 SENATOR RAMOS: Asalamu Alaikum,
14 Madam President.

15 I rise in solidarity with so many of
16 my Muslim neighbors back home in Jackson Heights,
17 Corona, East Elmhurst, Elmhurst, and the few
18 blocks of Forest Hills and Rego Park that I
19 proudly represent.

20 I believe that we have an obligation
21 to ensure that Muslim American history is taught.
22 Islam came to New York and the United States when
23 people from Africa were kidnapped from their home
24 and brought here against their will to do
25 backbreaking work.

1 And we have an obligation to
2 recognize the many contributions that have been
3 made. In fact, former President Thomas Jefferson
4 is known to have kept a Koran at the presidential
5 home to make sure that all Americans continue to
6 educate themselves.

7 And we in this chamber have an
8 obligation to carry on that intention so that we
9 can celebrate our diversity, fight Islamophobia
10 and ignorance, and ensure that we are building
11 bridges across our communities. So that when we
12 do hear the words Allahu Akbar or Alhamdulillah,
13 we know that it is not offensive but actually a
14 deep praise to the God that we share, that we
15 believe in, and to whom we are thankful for
16 giving us the opportunity to serve each other.

17 So thank you, Madam President. And
18 thank you to the members of the Muslim American
19 community who are here in the chamber today.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
21 Senator Ramos.

22 Senator Krueger on the resolution.

23 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you,
24 Madam President. I proudly stand in support of
25 this resolution.

1 I'm a Jewish American. And we have
2 so much in common: Our two religions, our two
3 histories, and our two stories as immigrants to
4 America.

5 And this country is great because we
6 are a country built by immigrants from all over
7 the world, from all countries and from all
8 religions. And frankly, we're at a moment in
9 history where there's too much stress targeted at
10 both the Muslim American community and the Jewish
11 American community.

12 And we have Jewish American History
13 Month established by Congress, so it seems only
14 appropriate that in the great State of New York
15 we have a Muslim American History Month.

16 So I'm proud to stand in favor of
17 this resolution. Thank you, Madam President.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
19 Senator Krueger.

20 Senator Harckham on the resolution.

21 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Thank you very
22 much, Madam President.

23 I want to thank Senator Jackson for
24 this resolution. I want to thank the
25 Majority Leader for bringing this to the floor.

1 I want to thank colleagues for their comments.

2 You know, as has been expressed,
3 what makes New York such a wonderful place to
4 live is our great diversity. And the
5 Lower Hudson Valley that you and I represent,
6 Madam President, is no exception. The Hudson
7 Valley Islamic Center, the Northern Westchester
8 Islamic Center, the Peekskill Islamic Center --
9 just wonderful communities.

10 And as Senator Jackson said in his
11 wonderfully eloquent remarks, not apart from. We
12 are a part of, and together. And just -- it's so
13 important, as Senator Ramos mentioned, that we
14 speak out against Islamophobia and misinformation
15 and that the beautiful tapestry of New York is
16 all of us together. And that's why this
17 resolution is so important.

18 Again, thank you to Senator Jackson.

19 I proudly vote aye. Thank you.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
21 Gianaris to close.

22 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,
23 I was just going to ask you to please recognize
24 Senator Jackson again so he can introduce the
25 guests who are with us for this resolution.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
2 Jackson.

3 SENATOR JACKSON: So thank you,
4 Madam President. My apologies to two of the
5 leaders that are here, part of MUNA Alliance for
6 Peace and Justice. Sawha Abdullah -- would you
7 please stand -- and also Abdulla Mohammad.

8 These are two leaders of MUNA
9 Alliance for Peace and Justice. They have about
10 a hundred members up there today that are
11 lobbying about the issues and concerns that
12 impact them -- food, education, all of the things
13 that basically people want in their society as
14 far as doing what's right and doing what's good
15 for the people that they represent.

16 So thank you for coming here today
17 to Albany.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
19 Senator Jackson.

20 To our guests who are here on behalf
21 of the resolution, supporting the Muslim
22 acknowledgment of this Muslim resolution here on
23 the floor, thank you for being here. We extend
24 to you the privileges and courtesies of the
25 Senate.

1 Congratulations.

2 (Standing ovation.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
4 resolution was previously adopted on January 28.

5 Senator Gianaris.

6 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,
7 now the moment you've been waiting for --

8 (Laughter.)

9 SENATOR GIANARIS: -- previously
10 adopted Resolution 835, recognizing New York
11 State Constitution Day, by Senator Gounardes.
12 Please read its title and recognize
13 Senator Gounardes.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
15 Secretary will read.

16 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 835, by
17 Senator Gounardes, memorializing Governor Kathy
18 Hochul to recognize April 20, 2025, in honor of
19 the 248th Anniversary of the adoption of the
20 first New York State Constitution.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
22 Gounardes on the resolution.

23 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Thank you,
24 Madam President.

25 Good afternoon, colleagues. I know

1 you have been waiting for this resolution as
2 eagerly as I have, because this past April 20th
3 we celebrated New York's 248th birthday. That's
4 right, April 20, 1777, the State of New York
5 ratified our very first constitution after we
6 declared independence in July of 1776.

7 And as I have for several years now,
8 I look forward to this day to talk about a
9 chapter in our state's constitutional history
10 that is both relevant to the work we do in this
11 chamber and to the issues of our time.

12 Today is no different. Today we're
13 going to be talking about New York's Bill of
14 rights and, more specifically, the free speech
15 and free press protections guaranteed by the
16 New York State Constitution.

17 So let's go back to the early days
18 of our state to January 13, 1787, when our
19 Legislature adopted an act concerning the rights
20 of the citizens of this state. This statutory
21 enactment contained 13 provisions, each outlining
22 specific rights derived from historic English
23 common law rights and embodied in various
24 documents such as the Magna Carta, the Petition
25 of Right, the 1689 Bill of Rights, and the

1 U.S. Constitution.

2 Among these rights were the
3 following: All authority is derived from the
4 people. No citizen can be imprisoned or deprived
5 of property without due process. You cannot be
6 imprisoned without an indictment. You cannot be
7 put on trial without a chance to defend yourself.
8 You cannot be executed without due process. You
9 cannot pay any amount of money to sway the
10 justice system.

11 Fines and fees cannot be charged
12 without good cause, and they must be reasonable.
13 Excessive bail or fines are prohibited, as is
14 cruel and unusual punishment.

15 There must be free elections. The
16 right to petition government is guaranteed, as is
17 the right of the legislature to have freedom of
18 speech and debate.

19 There can be no taxation or military
20 service without legislative approval. And
21 lastly, you cannot force private citizens to
22 quarter soldiers.

23 Now, this is two years before the
24 ratification of our own federal Bill of Rights.
25 But did you notice what was not included on that

1 list? That's right, no mention of freedom of
2 speech. No mention of freedom of press.

3 In fact, it was not until 1821, some
4 30-plus years after the adoption of our Bill of
5 Rights, that New York even contemplated adopting
6 a constitutional Bill of Rights.

7 During a constitutional convention
8 called that year, delegates debated reforms to
9 New York's judiciary, the process of revising
10 vetoing legislation, and even creating a
11 mechanism to amend the Constitution itself, which
12 the original constitution of 1777 did not
13 include.

14 But delegates also debated adopting
15 a formal constitutional Bill of Rights. Which
16 some did not think were necessary because they
17 believed that the American experiment of
18 federalism was so successful there was no need to
19 enshrine additional constitutional liberties.

20 As Peter Livingston, a State Senator
21 and convention delegate from Dutchess County
22 explained: "A Bill of Rights is the mere
23 repetition of the fundamental rights of this
24 people, which have never been violated and which,
25 after 40 years of practice under our

1 Constitution, we need not fear to see violated."

2 Another delegate, a former
3 State Senator, former Attorney General, and then
4 U.S. Senator and future President Martin Van
5 Buren said: "I would express my doubt whether by
6 adopting any Bill of Rights at all we are
7 materially benefiting the Constitution of this
8 state."

9 Nevertheless, in the Constitution
10 that was adopted by the convention in 1821, a
11 formal constitutional Bill of Rights was included
12 which incorporated a combination of the statutory
13 rights first enacted in 1787 as well as
14 protections from the U.S. Bill of Rights which
15 were ratified in 1789.

16 And included in Section 8 of the
17 Bill of Rights was the following. "Every citizen
18 may freely speak, write and publish his
19 sentiments on all subjects, being responsible for
20 the abuse of that right, and no law shall be
21 passed to restrain or abridge the liberty of
22 speech or of the press.

23 "In all prosecutions or indictments
24 for libels, the truth may be given in evidence to
25 the jury, and if it shall appear to the jury that

1 the matter charged as libelous is true and was
2 published with good motives and for justifiable
3 ends, the party shall be acquitted and the jury
4 shall have the right to determine the law and the
5 fact."

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 Now, immediately three things should
2 jump out at us about this provision. First,
3 contrary to the First Amendment of the U.S.
4 Constitution -- which, as we all know, says
5 Congress shall make no law abridging the freedom
6 of speech or of the press -- the New York
7 Constitution states that the right to free speech
8 is an affirmative grant of free expression for
9 all citizens.

10 This is significant because it
11 suggests that our right to free speech under our
12 own Constitution was not intended merely to be a
13 protection from encroachment by an overbearing
14 government. Under our State Constitution, we
15 enjoy a fundamental right to speak, write and
16 publish freely.

17 This mirrored similar protections
18 that were adopted by several other states in
19 their constitutions, including Pennsylvania,
20 Mississippi, Connecticut and Maine.

21 Second, the right to free speech is
22 not absolute. A citizen's right to speak, write
23 and publish freely is limited by civic obligation
24 to not abuse that right.

25 Now, this idea might seem quaint by

1 the standards of today's understanding of the
2 First Amendment. But at that time freedom of
3 speech was not simply an end in itself, but it
4 was deemed fundamental to the notion of
5 self-government. In other words,
6 Madam President, freedom of speech was necessary
7 to exercise good citizenship.

8 And lastly, the Constitution's
9 freedom of speech provision includes a fairly
10 lengthy discussion about truth and good
11 intentions being defenses in cases for criminal
12 libel. In fact, nearly the entire debate about
13 Section 8 at the constitutional convention was
14 all about criminal libel, a further reflection
15 that the common understanding of free speech at
16 that time was not about the right to say whatever
17 you wanted whenever you wanted to, but to allow
18 citizens to participate in the public discourse
19 of the day without saying something that was
20 deemed injurious or offensive to someone else.

21 Now, to understand this last point
22 we have to take one more step back in time to
23 1804, to a courtroom in Claverack, which is I
24 believe in Senator Hinchey's district, to witness
25 the criminal prosecution of a gentleman named

1 Harry Croswell for criminal libel.

2 I'm going to read the first sentence
3 of the indictment issued against Harry Croswell.
4 "It is represented that Harry Croswell, late of
5 the City of Hudson in the County of Columbia,
6 being a malicious and seditious man of a depraved
7 mind and wicked and diabolical disposition, and
8 also deceitfully, wickedly and maliciously
9 devising, contriving and intending to detract
10 from, scandalize, traduce" -- what a great word,
11 traduce -- "vilify and to represent Thomas
12 Jefferson, Esquire, President of the
13 United States, as unworthy of the confidence,
14 respect and attachment of the people of the said
15 United States, and to alienate and withdraw from
16 the said Thomas Jefferson the obedience, fidelity
17 and allegiance of the citizens of the State of
18 New York."

19 Now, if you listened carefully, you
20 might have picked up on the two words in that
21 sentence that explain the entire background of
22 this case: "Seditious" and "alienate."

23 You see, Harry Croswell was a
24 Federalist newspaper printer. And as we remember
25 from our American history, the early days of our

1 country were marked by deep partisan divisions
2 between Federalists and Democratic-Republicans,
3 which often played out in the founding
4 generation's version of Twitter: Partisan
5 newspapers.

6 Croswell was being prosecuted for
7 libel for printing a story that was previously
8 published by another federalist newspaper that
9 accused Thomas Jefferson of paying someone in
10 Virginia to not just publish a tax against his
11 nemesis John Adams, but also to label
12 George Washington as a traitor, robber and
13 perjurer, and to grossly slander the private
14 characters of men who he well knew were virtuous.

15 Now, Jefferson, as president, while
16 publicly opposed to the Alien and Sedition Acts
17 signed into law by John Adams, privately
18 encouraged his allies to use the law to arrest
19 and silence his own critics.

20 Croswell was charged under this law,
21 and at trial the only issue was whether or not he
22 actually reprinted the allegations against
23 Thomas Jefferson in his newspaper. And that was
24 because, under the common law at that time, as
25 was the precedent from English common law, truth

1 was not a defense to a charge of libel.

2 So the mere fact that Harry Crosswell
3 published a story that stated someone else
4 published a story about Thomas Jefferson, he was
5 charged with libel and convicted.

6 Now, Crosswell appealed and, on
7 appeal, he had a new lawyer join his defense
8 team, someone we all know: Federalist luminary
9 Alexander Hamilton.

10 In what would be one of the final
11 cases he ever argued in court in his career,
12 Hamilton spent six hours arguing that English
13 common law was wrong to reject truth as a defense
14 to libel, because before English law there was
15 Roman law. And under Roman law, truth was a
16 defense against a charge of libel.

17 He argued that the liberty of the
18 press consists in the right to publish with
19 impunity the truth, with good motives for
20 justifiable ends, although reflecting on
21 government, magistracy, or individuals. The
22 right of giving the truth in evidence in cases of
23 libel is all important to the liberties of the
24 people. And the allowance of this right is
25 essential to the preservation of a free

1 government. And the disallowance of it is fatal.

2 Now, the New York Supreme Court
3 deadlocked on the case that day. But the
4 following year the Legislature, our body, passed
5 a law adopting Hamilton's position that truth is
6 a defense to a charge of libel. And it was this
7 law that was then further enshrined as a
8 constitutional principle when the Constitution of
9 1821 was later adopted.

10 Now, as a quick aside, while
11 Hamilton was representing Croswell on his appeal,
12 he was staying here in Albany at the home of a
13 friend. Over dinner one evening he happened to
14 make some harsh comments to a dinner guest about
15 his rival, Aaron Burr, which were later published
16 in a newspaper. It was the publication of these
17 comments which broke the proverbial camel's back
18 in the ongoing feud between Burr and Hamilton,
19 which led to the infamous duel between them not
20 six months later.

21 So, my colleagues, New York's free
22 speech protections now date back more than
23 200 years. But for at first 100-plus years after
24 Section 8 was adopted, freedom of speech did not
25 enjoy the same embrace by the judiciary as did

1 the freedom of the press.

2 In fact, if you look at the court
3 cases going back throughout the 1800s, emphasis
4 was more about the abuse of the right to speech
5 rather than a protection of that right. But
6 after the Supreme Court's decision in *Gitlow v.*
7 *New York* in 1925, which applied the
8 First Amendment to state governments, that began
9 to shift. Today our judiciary has reaffirmed
10 time and time again that our right to speak
11 freely, write freely, and publish freely is
12 broader than the protections afforded by the U.S.
13 First Amendment. It is designed to protect the
14 expression of controversial and unpopular views
15 and provides for the absolute protection of
16 opinion.

17 And at this moment it feels like
18 these principles are threatened and that the
19 importance of free speech to the exercise of
20 self-government is in jeopardy.

21 So as we contemplate what is
22 happening all around us, we would be wise to
23 remember what Alexander Hamilton said in his
24 appeal on behalf of Harry Crosswell: That the
25 road to tyranny will be opened by the stifling of

1 the press and by silencing leaders and patriots.
2 Prescient words indeed, Madam President.

3 And so with that, I want to end by
4 saying happy belated birthday to New York, and to
5 all of my colleagues here, a very, very happy
6 New York Constitution Day.

7 Thank you.

8 (Applause.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
10 Senator Gounardes.

11 Senator Martins on the resolution.

12 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,
13 Madam President.

14 And I want to thank the sponsor for
15 once again highlighting not only the state's
16 anniversary, but the Constitution and how
17 important it is that we not only have free
18 speech, but transparency.

19 You know, I happen to believe the
20 Constitution not only of the United States but
21 here in the State of New York is an important
22 formative document, and it's something that we
23 should follow, always, and understand the spirit
24 under which those provisions were enacted,
25 adopted.

1 And I want to draw everyone's
2 attention, including the Governor, to Article 3,
3 Section 14 of the Constitution that speaks
4 specifically to the aging of bills on the floor
5 of this chamber.

6 You know, it's not just a tradition,
7 it's a constitutional provision that requires the
8 aging of bills on the floor to allow for the
9 public to review them, for members of this
10 chamber to properly review those documents, those
11 bills that come before us, so that we can
12 responsibly have the opportunity to debate those
13 bills on the substance here on the floor.

14 Now, it's true, it does provide for
15 messages of necessity when there are emergencies
16 that require it. Certainly we would not want to
17 put the state in danger or not allow state
18 government to respond in an emergency. But when
19 it comes to budget bills -- and certainly I would
20 suggest when it comes to budget bills that are
21 now five weeks late, Madam President, I would
22 hope that in the spirit of Constitution Day and
23 the Constitution of the State of New York, and in
24 the spirit of the tradition of this chamber and
25 the need for transparency when it comes to

1 important bills that come before this chamber,
2 that we highlight the necessity for our budget
3 bills to be properly aged on everyone's desk and
4 give it the necessary three days so that we can
5 all properly review them and the public can
6 properly review them before they're forced to a
7 vote here on the Senate floor.

8 So in the spirit of Constitution Day
9 and celebrating the State Constitution, and
10 understanding full well where we are in the
11 budget process this year, I would thank again the
12 sponsor for this resolution. I will support the
13 resolution and remind everybody messages of
14 necessity are a requirement only when there's an
15 emergency. There is no emergency. The
16 Constitution requires three days aging of bills
17 on our desks. And let's honor the Constitution
18 in that way as well.

19 Madam President, I vote aye.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you.

21 Senator Walczyk on the resolution.

22 SENATOR WALCZYK: Thank you,

23 Madam President.

24 I rise on the Constitution Day
25 resolution and thank my colleague for bringing it

1 forward.

2 In 1777, as he pointed out, we were
3 endeavoring on a very interesting project here in
4 New York State and in the United States of
5 America: How do you take consolidated power on
6 autocratic kings and make sure that that's put on
7 to the citizens? How do we make sure that people
8 are represented?

9 And so we created checks and
10 balances within the United States Constitution
11 and New York State's Constitution. Actually,
12 each one of us in this chamber swore an oath to
13 uphold that Constitution making sure that the
14 power, through our republic, is ultimately on the
15 people of the State of New York.

16 So we can have a Constitution Day
17 resolution, or we can honor the principles of
18 that Constitution which were laid down by our
19 founders. We could allow citizens to see
20 New York State's budget before we vote on it. We
21 could reject messages of necessity on
22 non-emergency legislation.

23 And if we've continued the budget
24 process by extender after extender after
25 extender, obviously there's no emergency that

1 would necessity a message of necessity at this
2 point. We can check those autocratic monarch
3 principles. We can check the Executive and we
4 can reject those.

5 So we can not just talk about it, we
6 could also take the principles that Alexis de
7 Tocqueville and John Stuart Mill brought our
8 founders. Tyranny of the majority. We could
9 make sure that every single legislator in both
10 the Senate and Assembly is heard from on this,
11 has the opportunity to review the budget for at
12 least the constitutional three days that are
13 provided, just by rejecting that message of
14 necessity.

15 So let's not subject New Yorkers to
16 the tyranny of the majority that they warned us
17 about, or to make sure that those checks and
18 balances that our founders cared so much about --
19 that are actually not just in a resolution where
20 we celebrate Constitution Day -- but in practice
21 in everything that we do here in the New York
22 State Legislature, and carry those principles of
23 our Constitution into the work that we do every
24 single day.

25 So I vote aye on this resolution. I

1 think it's critically important to talk about our
2 Constitution and to educate our citizenry on it.
3 But I think it's even more importantly for the
4 members of this house, the house across the hall,
5 and for our Executive to have that power checked.

6 Thank you, Madam President.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you.

8 Senator Tedisco on the resolution.

9 SENATOR TEDISCO: Thank you very
10 much, Madam President.

11 I thank the sponsor for this
12 resolution. I think it's an extremely important
13 one. And I think all of us in this room, both
14 sides of the aisle, agree that we revere the
15 Constitution of this state and the Constitution
16 of the United States of America.

17 I think it was Winston Churchill who
18 said representative democracy, the United States,
19 it's the worst form of government -- except for
20 all the rest.

21 Is it perfect? I think our
22 Constitution is as close to perfect as we could
23 have ever made without being the individual who
24 brought us into this world with all those
25 inalienable rights that are in the Constitution.

1 One thing we have to understand:
2 Our Founding Fathers were tremendous individuals.
3 They fought a king. They dispatched themselves
4 for it. They created the greatest nation in the
5 world. I think they created the second greatest
6 document in the world. For me, the Holy Bible is
7 first, but the Constitution of the
8 United States -- and our State Constitution is
9 pretty good also -- are tremendous documents.

10 But no man or no woman gave us the
11 rights and freedoms that are embedded in these
12 constitutions. And no man or no woman can take
13 these rights away from us.

14 Inalienable rights? That was
15 fantastic. The reason we get to live these
16 rights in freedom are no different than the
17 reasons why every other citizen from every other
18 part of the world get to live those, if they
19 could, in the same way. They have the same exact
20 rights we have. We get to live them because of a
21 group of individuals who we honored -- they were
22 part of it, the Korean War heroes. We get to
23 live them because of the best, the brightest, the
24 most courageous and compassionate fighting force
25 for good: The men and women of the United States

1 fighting forces.

2 They're the ones who give us the
3 ability every day to stand up to come here. And
4 to show you the reverence I have, I carry this
5 document of the Constitution of the United States
6 and the state with me every time I walk into this
7 building. Every time I walk into this building,
8 it's in my pocket. Because I'm mindful of the
9 fact that everything we do here has to be in
10 respect for that. So important for us.

11 Now, a part of the Constitution for
12 this state and for the United States of America,
13 is to be able to change the Constitution or add
14 to the Constitution. The Bill of Rights, the
15 amendments we've made over the years -- we can
16 make it in the state, we can be part of making it
17 nationally.

18 I think the way you do that, for
19 two-thirds to call a convention, is two-thirds of
20 the states -- I think it's in the Fourth
21 Amendment, maybe -- two-thirds of the states call
22 for a convention, they can call one. You can
23 make an amendment by three-fourths of the votes
24 of the states at that convention. Or both bodies
25 at the federal level can do it and make an

1 adjustment.

2 I'm so proud of the fact that in
3 this state I was to able to help do something
4 that made a serious amendment to the State
5 Constitution we have. A while back, when I was
6 in the New York State Assembly, I stood up at my
7 desk and I had the budget bills right in front of
8 me, one after the other. And I spoke through
9 those budget bills on a bill that was an
10 amendment that eventually was passed from both
11 houses, got on the ballot, and it was pretty
12 simple. We had a part of the Constitution of the
13 State of New York which we still have. I don't
14 know if you remember that. The bills have to be,
15 as has been said here by my colleague, three days
16 on our desks. Well, our Founding Fathers were
17 smart. They never realized we'd have computers
18 and tablets like this on the desk. I call these
19 Jimmies, because I think I had a part in making
20 this happen here.

21 Do you know every year, starting
22 from back when this happened -- and it's much
23 more that we're saving right now -- we saved
24 \$13 million a year without putting those budget
25 documents on our desks, having to print them,

1 having to print all the other bills, and it made
2 us more effective.

3 I open this up on occasion and I
4 look through, and I don't have to try to -- a
5 stack this big was on my desk. How could I go
6 through there and see every section and talk
7 about every section, or go to it in a debate. I
8 can open this up right now, and go to it. I can
9 get every bill that's going to come before us.
10 Because our Founding Fathers were smart. Three
11 days you have to have on that bill on our desks.

12 And as Senator Martins was talking
13 about, they were right. But they never knew we'd
14 have the technology we have now. So that's an
15 important part of the amendments we can make as a
16 state. Important part of the amendments we can
17 possibly make nationally. Thirteen million
18 dollars a day then. I don't know how many years
19 ago that amendment got onto the ballot. And all
20 the constituents in this representative
21 democracy, I think it was close to 70 percent,
22 said, Yeah, I want to save \$13 million a year and
23 I don't want to put ink-filled paper in landfills
24 by the tons and I don't want you chopping down
25 our forestlands and everything to create that

1 paper.

2 It was a win for the environment.
3 It was a win for making us more effective. It
4 was a win for saving us millions of dollars. But
5 you know what it wasn't a win for? We didn't
6 make that adjustment for a message of necessity,
7 which Senator Martins was talking about.

8 I have a bill that will allow you to
9 do that. And I would love to see that bill come
10 to the floor for a constitutional amendment to
11 actually clarify what a message of necessity
12 means, what the good Senator next to me kind of
13 clarified for you. If we get attacked by a
14 foreign power or something, or we have a
15 COVID virus, or we have a weather condition,
16 those are emergencies. Hustle us in here, put a
17 document on my desk, I'll be ready to vote for
18 it.

19 But not to hustle up to bring us in
20 in the middle of the night where somebody once
21 said, In darkness democracy dies. And democracy
22 dies sometimes in this body, unfortunately,
23 because there's a rush to judgment. Now, I'd
24 love to see the fourth estate be able to see a
25 bill three days in advance. I'd love to join

1 them in seeing those three days in advance. I
2 don't want to be like Chicken Little and say, The
3 sky is falling, the sky is falling, and look up
4 and say, No, it's not falling.

5 Kind of the Governor was the Chicken
6 Little about a week ago. We have a budget! We
7 have a budget! This is it, this is -- I'm
8 looking around, I don't see any budget. It's not
9 in my desk here. It's not underneath here. It's
10 not in my tablet here. Okay?

11 So we don't need messages of
12 necessity. We need sunlight. It's the
13 disinfectant. We need sunlight. You need to
14 give us those bills, you need to have those
15 bills -- it's not only us that need to be
16 informed. You, as the body that controls all
17 levers of power in government here, do you
18 realize it's the first time in over 40 years that
19 that takes place? Republicans used to blame
20 Democrats for late bills. Democrats, when
21 Joe Bruno was here, he had the majority, they
22 used to blame Republicans.

23 We kind of know who can't do budgets
24 now, because for the last seven years you've
25 controlled all levers of power here. There's

1 nobody to blame for a late budget this year, I'm
2 sorry to say. You control the Senate, you
3 control the Assembly, you control the Governor.

4 We'd like to have the bills a little
5 bit earlier, like the three days our
6 Founding Fathers said they should be here, unless
7 there was a serious emergency. And I bet, if you
8 tell the truth, you'd like to have the bills
9 three days earlier too. So you could understand
10 it.

11 And I bet the media would like to
12 have the bills three days earlier so they can
13 inform the public so we could be what we really
14 should be, above elected officials and above
15 public servants. Above all that, guess what we
16 are? Representatives. And a representative has
17 to get back to their constituents and say, You
18 see this, you see that -- what do you think I
19 should do on this? Three days is the least that
20 we should have to do that.

21 So I appreciate Constitution Day.
22 There's a piece of it which allows us as
23 governing bodies to go before the voters and let
24 them decide if we can make it a better
25 constitution and make us a better government.

1 And I bet you if you put it on the
2 ballot, would you really like to define what a
3 message of necessity should be, should be an
4 emergency, I bet you it would pass close to that
5 one we passed when I was able to help support you
6 and all the others who voted for it -- or some of
7 you who were here back then. Which may not be
8 too many of you, because I've been here for a
9 little while. I bet you it would pass with great
10 numbers.

11 So I'm happy to support our
12 Constitution. I think it's a great document in
13 the state. I think it's a great document
14 nationally. We're the greatest nation in the
15 world, but there's always room for improvement.

16 And I appreciate what
17 Winston Churchill had to say. We're still the
18 greatest form of government in the world, but we
19 can make it better.

20 Thank you very much,
21 Madam President.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
23 Senator Tedisco. Thank you very much.

24 Senator Krueger on the resolution.

25 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you,

1 Madam President.

2 You know, I think Senator Gounardes
3 sometimes thinks we're making fun of him when we
4 tell him how much we look forward to his speech
5 on his resolution every year. But I very
6 sincerely look forward to it. Because probably
7 the most important thing for us all to remember
8 as our job description is to uphold the
9 Constitution. And it matters every day in every
10 way to us and to 19.5 million New Yorkers.

11 And even today's story about
12 Hamilton and Burr and the court case -- I just
13 have to say, for the record, so because we all
14 know the musical, we all are in the room where it
15 happened. And that is so important. So
16 important to us and our future.

17 Now, in response to some of my
18 colleagues' comments I want to go rogue, as usual
19 for Liz Krueger. I completely agree, budget
20 bills should not be done with messages of
21 necessity when there are no emergencies. And
22 when you're on Day March 48th or 49th, let's be
23 honest, there's no emergency.

24 And for the record, it's not a
25 partisan fight. As a new Senator, Democrat,

1 23 years ago, one of the first things I did was
2 sue Joe Bruno, the Governor, and Shelly Silver
3 for the uses of messages of necessity
4 inappropriately. And I sued on a number of
5 constitutional grounds. And people weren't very
6 excited about me, on both sides, frankly, because
7 I believe that the constitutional protections of
8 our rights as all 19.5 million New Yorkers, are
9 critical.

10 I lost at the Court of Appeals, who
11 said these are political decisions not to be
12 dealt with in a court situation. I disagreed
13 then, but lost. And here we are, 23 years later,
14 different parties in different positions, same
15 issue. I will lose this fight, I believe, as you
16 will lose this fight this week. But I agree that
17 we should make clear: Budget bills are, as Jim
18 Tedisco described -- I remember, so thank you for
19 your amendment that said we didn't have to kill
20 so many trees every year and try to pretend we
21 were reading a stack this tall of bills that we
22 got with 10 minutes' notice, because I was in the
23 Minority.

24 So these are important issues, and
25 we need to address them. But I don't think any

1 of us here who share that view -- and I think
2 many of my colleagues on both sides share that
3 view -- we will lose that fight. And so I
4 believe we will have budget bills with messages
5 of necessity. And it's a shame. And since I've
6 tried the constitutional route in court, maybe
7 the constitutional amendment route is the only
8 way to ever get this done.

9 So, Madam President, mostly I stood
10 up to thank my colleague Senator Gounardes
11 profusely for always making sure to remind us at
12 least one day of the year how truly important
13 these sometimes thought of as esoteric documents
14 such all the Bill of Rights in the New York State
15 Constitution are to all of us.

16 And to remind everybody really it
17 would be very nice if the federal government
18 noticed this issue as well at the federal level.

19 Thank you, Madam President.

20 Thank you.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
22 Senator Krueger.

23 Senator Gounardes -- oh, Senator
24 Gounardes? Senator Gianaris. I got the G's
25 mixed.

1 To close, Senator Gianaris.

2 SENATOR GIANARIS: Happens all the
3 time, Madam President.

4 (Laughter.)

5 SENATOR GIANARIS: Partisanship.
6 Partisanship leads to some moments that are very
7 rich in hypocrisy.

8 And so I could not listen to this
9 discussion and not get up and point out that so
10 many of my colleagues who were speaking on the
11 other side of the aisle served in the Majority
12 here -- some briefly, some for longer periods of
13 time. And it's interesting, but I never heard
14 one peep from them about messages of necessity
15 when they were approving them time and time and
16 time again.

17 Senator Martins spoke out. He
18 served in the Majority a long time. I was here,
19 sitting on that side at the time. I watched it
20 happen. Never heard from him about messages of
21 necessity.

22 Senator Tedisco only had a year or
23 two in the Majority, if I'm not mistaken. But in
24 fact in those years, Senator Tedisco, many, many
25 messages of necessity were approved by the

1 then-Majority that you were part of.

2 Senator Walczyk was only here in the
3 Minority, but he did work here for a Majority
4 member for five years, and I don't remember him
5 imposing upon or giving advice to his Senator at
6 the time to not approve these messages of
7 necessity. It's an affront to our democracy, he
8 should have said.

9 But lo and behold, now our friends
10 across the aisle are in the minority, deep in the
11 Minority, and don't have as much to say about
12 ends up in the budget, and so their world view
13 has shifted. Now they rail against things that
14 they have nothing to say about.

15 But the fact is the Governor decides
16 when a message is appropriate. The Majority in
17 this body decides whether to accept it. This is
18 the essence of a democratic process.

19 If you are not -- don't have the
20 numbers to affect the outcome, that's on you, my
21 friends. The people of this state have chosen to
22 put you in the Minority. The people of this
23 state have chosen to give us the power to decide
24 whether a message of necessity is appropriate or
25 not. And we have availed ourselves of that

1 power. We will continue to do so.

2 I appreciate Senator Gounardes and
3 his history lesson year after year. I can't wait
4 till next year's comes about. And we're also
5 going to educate people about the history of this
6 chamber when we get a chance to do so.

7 Thank you, Madam President.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
9 Senator Gianaris.

10 The resolution was previously
11 adopted on April 29th.

12 Senator Gianaris.

13 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,
14 at this time let's take up the reading of the
15 calendar, please.

16 SENATOR TEDISCO: (Mic off) --
17 explain my vote?

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Not on a
19 resolution, Senator -- no, not on the resolution.

20 SENATOR TEDISCO: (Inaudible.)

21 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,
22 let's take up the calendar.

23 SENATOR TEDISCO: Point of order.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
25 Tedisco, on the resolution you do not explain

1 your vote, you vote yes or no.

2 SENATOR TEDISCO: (Inaudible.) I
3 have a point of order.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: What is
5 your point of order?

6 SENATOR TEDISCO: My point of order
7 is this. I have never voted for an extender in
8 the history of my elected officials. I vote no
9 on every extender. I voted no when I was in the
10 Minority. I voted no every two years in the
11 Majority. You don't record those, but every time
12 you say "Do you support it," I vote no on the
13 message of necessity that is not truly an
14 emergency.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Your point
16 of order has been made.

17 SENATOR TEDISCO: Point of order.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
19 Tedisco, your point of order has been made.
20 Thank you.

21 SENATOR TEDISCO: I got another one
22 for you.

23 (Laughter.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: No, you
25 can't just -- you can't just make up points of

1 order.

2 (Laughter.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: You had a
4 point of order, I allowed you to speak. Please
5 sit down, and we will move -- the resolution has
6 been adopted.

7 SENATOR TEDISCO: -- haven't heard
8 my second point of order.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
10 Lanza, why do you rise?

11 SENATOR LANZA: Madam President, we
12 don't know whether it's made up until we hear it.
13 So let it be heard.

14 (Laughter.)

15 SENATOR TEDISCO: My second point
16 of order is that I appreciate the Senator giving
17 his opinion. And this is a part of the
18 Constitution. He has the right to be wrong, and
19 that's what's called the First Amendment. So I
20 do appreciate that.

21 But I want to go on record saying he
22 was wrong about me voting for messages of
23 necessity.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you
25 for your point of order.

1 SENATOR TEDISCO: Thank you for
2 those two points of order.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you.
4 Senator Gianaris, that completes the
5 reading of the Resolution Calendar.

6 We now move to the calendar.

7 The Secretary will read.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 420, Senate Print 4960, by Senator Bailey, an act
10 to amend the Insurance Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
14 act shall take effect immediately.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
19 the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
22 is passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 564, Senate Print 4780, by Senator Skoufis, an
25 act to amend the General Municipal Law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
2 last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
4 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it
5 shall have become a law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
10 the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
12 Calendar 564, voting in the negative are
13 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
14 Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Martins, Mattera,
15 Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,
16 Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk and Weik.

17 Ayes, 41. Nays, 19.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 644, Senate Print 6848, by Senator Webb, an act
22 to amend the Agriculture and Markets Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This

1 act shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
6 Webb to explain her vote.

7 SENATOR WEBB: Thank you,
8 Madam President. I rise to explain my vote,
9 although it is not on the Constitution, but most
10 certainly on another important subject matter,
11 and that is our farming and agricultural
12 community.

13 I want to thank our Majority Leader,
14 Andrea Stewart-Cousins, and our Agriculture
15 chair, Senator Hinchey, for their leadership in
16 bringing this important package of legislation to
17 the floor today that is lifting up support for
18 farming and agriculture.

19 Our farmers play a critical role in
20 our regional economies in ensuring that our
21 communities have access to locally grown food
22 that is also healthy. The purpose of this bill
23 is to improve access to healthy food and promote
24 healthier lifestyles by providing some assistance
25 to help establish or expand existing regional

1 farmers markets in those areas of the state that
2 have poor consumer access to high quality and
3 reasonably priced fresh food and farm products.

4 The regional farmers markets to be
5 created would facilitate the marketing and sale
6 of these foods on a large scale and at the
7 wholesale and bulk level.

8 In addition, these regional farmers
9 markets will increase the access to fresh foods
10 to local supermarkets and restaurants that sell
11 or prepare these foods, especially in food
12 deserts.

13 By providing our farmers and
14 producers with new local markets, this
15 legislation also helps to make sure that more of
16 the food that we produce right here in our great
17 State of New York is eaten by New York families
18 and beyond.

19 I proudly vote aye on this
20 legislation and encourage my colleagues to do the
21 same.

22 Thank you, Madam President.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
24 Webb to be recorded in the affirmative.

25 Announce the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 720, Senate Print 3665, by Senator Hinchey, an
6 act to amend the Real Property Tax Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
10 act shall take effect one year after it shall
11 have become a law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 747, Senate Print 592, by Senator Hinchey, an act
22 to amend the Agriculture and Markets Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This

1 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
2 shall have become a law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 749, Senate Print 1529, by Senator Parker, an act
13 to amend the Agriculture and Markets Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 9. This
17 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
18 shall have become a law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill

1 is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 756, Senate Print 3204, by Senator Krueger, an
4 act to amend the Penal Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
8 act shall take effect on the first of November.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
13 Krueger to explain her vote.

14 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you,
15 Madam President.

16 I appreciate my colleagues' support
17 for this bill.

18 I just want to highlight, since
19 we're in budget time, we are losing up to
20 \$1.7 billion a year in sales tax revenue that is
21 collected from the citizens of New York but never
22 given to us, the State of New York, because we
23 continue to allow these systems that we used to
24 call zappers, but have gotten so much more
25 sophisticated to be used by certain companies

1 prepared to violate the law by collecting the
2 sales tax and then using technology to hide the
3 fact that there was the sale with the sales tax
4 collected.

5 So not only are we losing an
6 enormous amount of revenue that we desperately
7 need, we are sending the message continually that
8 you can be a bad player, not follow our Tax Law,
9 commit tax fraud to your advantage, to the
10 disadvantage of all the businesses who are
11 following the law and contributing the sales tax
12 once they collect it.

13 So we've passed this bill before,
14 thank you, pretty much with unanimous support. I
15 really hope this year is the year we can get it
16 done and signed by the Governor, because I
17 guarantee you we need all this revenue.

18 Thank you, Madam President.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
20 Krueger to be recorded in the affirmative.

21 Announce the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 760, Senate Print 4755, by Senator Bailey, an act
2 to amend the Agriculture and Markets Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Excuse me.

16 Actually, in relation to
17 Calendar 760, voting in the negative:
18 Senator Walczyk.

19 Ayes, 60. Nays, 1.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
21 is passed.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 783, Senate Print 4804, by Senator C. Ryan, an
24 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 13. This
3 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
4 shall have become a law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
9 Chris Ryan to explain his vote.

10 SENATOR CHRIS RYAN: Thank you,
11 Madam President.

12 Today I rise in support of
13 Senate Bill 4804, which addresses a critical
14 issue faced by many of our first responders,
15 including but not limited to our police officers,
16 our firefighters, and our ambulance companies
17 across this great state.

18 In particular, many of our
19 communities rely on volunteer emergency
20 responders. These individuals are not always
21 stationed at the firehouse or the EMS station
22 24/7. Instead, they respond to emergencies from
23 their homes, their jobs, or wherever they may be
24 when emergency strikes.

25 Time often is of the essence in

1 these moments, and every second counts. Yet too
2 often the location of our stations present risks
3 or obstacles for many of our volunteers. Many of
4 those facilities lack traffic control systems
5 like stoplights or warning lights that would give
6 safe passage to emergency vehicles leaving their
7 stations. In other cases, parking lots for
8 volunteers are located across the street from the
9 station itself. That means responders must cross
10 roadways, often busy ones, in a rush, and put
11 themselves at risk.

12 So let me be clear, we have
13 situations in this state where first responders
14 are literally dodging traffic to answer their 911
15 calls. Often motorists do not yield the right of
16 way. We've had injuries, we've had delays, and
17 every delay puts further lives at risk. Not just
18 those that are rushing to help, but those that
19 are in need of services.

20 So this bill is pretty
21 straightforward. It gives our local governments
22 and fire districts the authority to install
23 signage, markings, and traffic control devices
24 near emergency station, alerting drivers to the
25 presence of the first responders and emergency

1 vehicles.

2 It also, more importantly, poses
3 higher fines or violations and requires a
4 one-year mandatory license suspension after three
5 failure-to-yield convictions.

6 So in simple, it's a very low cost
7 solution that could save many lives. So let's
8 not wait for another injury or worse to take
9 action. Let's give the first responders the
10 necessary safety protections that they have.

11 I vote in the affirmative, and I
12 hope we can sign this bill into law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you.

14 Senator Ryan to be recorded in the
15 affirmative.

16 Announce the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 785, Senate Print 7120, by Senator S. Ryan, an
22 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 9. This

1 act shall take effect one Year after it shall
2 have become a law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
10 is passed.

11 Senator Gianaris, that completes the
12 reading of the calendar.

13 SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you,
14 Madam President.

15 Just to set expectations for my
16 colleagues for the next couple of days. At the
17 conclusion of this session, the Majority will be
18 convening a conference back in the Majority
19 Conference Room.

20 Tomorrow we expect to be a very
21 lengthy day where we will take up the bulk of the
22 budget bills, if not all of them, in addition to
23 it being Fort Drum Day. So we're going to get an
24 early start tomorrow.

25 And with that, is there any further

1 business at the desk today?

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: There is
3 no further business at the desk.

4 SENATOR GIANARIS: I move to
5 adjourn until tomorrow, Wednesday, May 7th, at
6 10:00 a.m.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: On motion,
8 the Senate stands adjourned until Wednesday,
9 May 7th, at 10:00 a.m.

10 (Whereupon, at 1:19 p.m., the Senate
11 adjourned.)

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25