

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

NEW YORK STATE SENATE

THE STENOGRAPHIC RECORD

ALBANY, NEW YORK

February 25, 2025

4:12 p.m.

REGULAR SESSION

SENATOR JEREMY COONEY, Acting President

ALEJANDRA N. PAULINO, ESQ., Secretary

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
3 Senate will come to order.

4 I ask everyone to please rise and
5 recite the Pledge of Allegiance.

6 (Whereupon, the assemblage recited
7 the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: In the
9 absence of clergy, let us bow our heads in a
10 moment of silent reflection or prayer.

11 (Whereupon, the assemblage respected
12 a moment of silence.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Reading
14 of the Journal.

15 THE SECRETARY: In Senate, Monday,
16 February 24, 2025, the Senate met pursuant to
17 adjournment. The Journal of Friday, February 21,
18 2025, was read and approved. On motion, the
19 Senate adjourned.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Without
21 objection, the Journal stands approved as read.

22 Presentation of petitions.

23 Messages from the Assembly.

24 Messages from the Governor.

25 Reports of standing committees.

1 Reports of select committees.

2 Communications and reports from
3 state officers.

4 Motions and resolutions.

5 Senator Gianaris.

6 SENATOR GIANARIS: Good afternoon,
7 Mr. President.

8 I move to adopt the
9 Resolution Calendar, with the exception of
10 Resolution Number 346.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: All in
12 favor of adopting the Resolution Calendar, with
13 the exception of Resolution Number 346, please
14 signify by saying aye.

15 (Response of "Aye.")

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Opposed,
17 nay.

18 (No response.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Hearing
20 none, the Resolution Calendar is adopted.

21 Senator Gianaris.

22 SENATOR GIANARIS: Let's now begin
23 with previously adopted Resolution 100, by
24 Senator Persaud, read that resolution's title and
25 recognize Senator Persaud.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
2 Secretary will read.

3 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 100, by
4 Senator Persaud, memorializing Governor Kathy
5 Hochul to proclaim February 28, 2025, as
6 Rare Disease Day in the State of New York.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
8 Persaud.

9 SENATOR PERSAUD: Thank you,
10 Mr. President.

11 Today I stand before you to
12 recognize Rare Disease Day on February 28th, to
13 raise awareness for the 1.8 million people in
14 New York State and more than 300 million people
15 worldwide who are impacted by rare diseases.

16 In the United States a rare disease
17 is classified as rare if it affects fewer than
18 200,000 individuals, according to the U.S.
19 Federal Orphan Drug Act.

20 Let me share with you some
21 staggering statistics. Seventy percent of rare
22 diseases begin in childhood. Seventy-two percent
23 of rare diseases are genetic. One in five
24 cancers is classified as rare. And approximately
25 7,000 rare diseases impact 25 to 30 million

1 Americans -- that is one in 10 people.

2 Those numbers are eye-opening and
3 highlight the vast range of disorders, many of
4 which are not well understood or researched,
5 leaving patients without sufficient information
6 about their symptoms and available treatments.

7 Today with us we have an
8 organization called NORD. And NORD, the National
9 Organization for Rare Diseases, reports that it
10 can take an average of six years for someone with
11 a rare disease to receive an accurate diagnosis.
12 This lengthy delay is often due to limited
13 research and challenges in accessing specialized
14 medical care.

15 I'd also like to acknowledge the
16 guests who are here from NORD, and after
17 Senator Murray speaks they will stand and we ask
18 that you given them the cordialities of this
19 house.

20 Their work is instrumental in
21 creating meaningful lasting changes that help
22 individuals with rare diseases live fuller,
23 healthier lives. And I want to thank them for
24 their work, and I want to thank them for working
25 with me on legislation.

1 So it's crucial that we recognize
2 the unique challenges faced by those living with
3 rare diseases, and strive for equitable access to
4 diagnosis, treatment of healthcare and social
5 care, and overall opportunities for people who
6 are affected by rare diseases.

7 Please join me today, Mr. President,
8 in acknowledging NORD. Thank you.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
10 you, Senator Persaud.

11 Before we introduce our guests,
12 Senator Murray on the resolution.

13 SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you,
14 Mr. President.

15 I want to sincerely thank my
16 colleague Senator Persaud for leading the charge
17 on this important issue.

18 You know, Rare Disease Day takes
19 place worldwide, typically on or near the last
20 day of February each year, to raise awareness
21 among policymakers and the public about rare
22 diseases and their impact on patients' lives.

23 Rare Disease Day is the globally
24 coordinated movement on rare diseases, working
25 towards equity and social opportunity,

1 healthcare, and access to diagnosis and therapies
2 for people living with a rare disease.

3 Since its creation in 2008, Rare
4 Disease Day has played a critical part in
5 building an international new disease community
6 that is multi-disease, global and diverse, but
7 united in purpose.

8 Rare Disease Day is observed every
9 year on the 28th of February -- or the 29th in
10 Leap Years, and that is the rarest day of the
11 year.

12 Rare Disease Day was set up and is
13 coordinated by Eurordis and 65-plus national
14 alliance patient organization partners.

15 Rare Disease Day provides an energy
16 and focal point that enables rare diseases
17 advocacy work to progress on the local, national
18 and international levels.

19 Though Rare Disease Day is
20 patient-led, everyone -- including individuals,
21 families, caregivers, healthcare professionals,
22 researchers, clinicians, policymakers, industry
23 representatives, and the general public -- can
24 participate in raising awareness and taking
25 action today for this vulnerable population who

1 require immediate and urgent attention. It
2 brings together the entire rare disease community
3 to highlight the challenges that people with rare
4 diseases face, including finding better
5 diagnosis, treatments and social support.

6 Now, many monuments and public
7 buildings around the world will be lit up in the
8 Rare Disease Day colors to show solidarity with
9 those who are affected. Meanwhile, I'm
10 personally asking everyone to wear green, which
11 is one of the rare disease colors, to not only
12 honor the day but also the amazing young advocate
13 who has brought attention to this day and so many
14 other issues affecting young people with chronic
15 and rare diseases in my district.

16 Fourteen-year-old Caitlyn Michaels
17 is the founder of Caitlyn's Vision, a nonprofit
18 organization helping those, and especially young
19 people, with the diseases affecting their vision.
20 Caitlyn is a constituent, she's the daughter of
21 one of my staff members, and I consider her a
22 dear friend.

23 In late January, she petitioned the
24 Suffolk County Legislature to have the county
25 recognize February 28th as Rare Disease Day in

1 the county -- and yes, they will light up the
2 county building green on February 28th. That
3 request was overwhelmingly approved, so
4 congratulations to her.

5 Thank you, Senator Persaud. Thank
6 you to all those who make this day special.

7 Thank you, Mr. President. I support
8 this resolution.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
10 you, Senator Murray.

11 To our guests, I welcome you on
12 behalf of the Senate. We extend to you the
13 privileges and courtesies of this house.

14 Please rise and be recognized.
15 (Standing ovation.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
17 resolution was adopted on January 14th.

18 Senator Gianaris.

19 SENATOR GIANARIS: Now let's please
20 move on to Resolution 346, by Senator Sepúlveda,
21 read that resolution's title and recognize
22 Senator Sepúlveda.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
24 Secretary will read.

25 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 346, by

1 Senator Sepúlveda, honoring Dr. Pablo Ulloa for
2 his staunch advocacy on behalf of
3 Dominican-Americans in the State of New York and
4 for hosting an important event series in the
5 Bronx and Manhattan, New York.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
7 Sepúlveda on the resolution.

8 SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA: Thank you,
9 Mr. President, for allowing me to discuss this
10 resolution with my colleagues, distinguished
11 guests, friends and members of this community.

12 As part of the celebration of
13 Dominican Heritage Month, it is an honor for me
14 to recognize a Dominican whose tireless work in
15 defense of human rights and social justice has
16 been crucial in protecting the most vulnerable.

17 His brave and dedicated work is a
18 testament to the true spirit of public service,
19 focused on his efforts to educate the population
20 about their rights and duties, bringing the
21 institution closer to the communities. This
22 individual is Dr. Pablo Ulloa, the ombudsman of
23 the Dominican Republic -- or, as we know him here
24 in the City of New York, the public advocate for
25 the Dominican Republic.

1 I'm honored to present this
2 recognition to Dr. Ulloa for his commitment to
3 the Dominican people in his role as ombudsman.

4 Ulloa is the mastermind behind the
5 "Animated Constitution," a work of art that
6 illustrates the concept of the Constitution in a
7 visual way, using animation to represent
8 interactively and accessibly the fundamental
9 elements of the Dominican Constitution.

10 This work is an example of how
11 digital media can be used to simplify the
12 understanding of complex topics such as human
13 rights, government structure, and the fundamental
14 laws of a nation.

15 Additionally, Dr. Ulloa seeks to
16 connect with Dominicans in the Diaspora through
17 various organizations so that everyone can learn
18 about the great work of the Dominican Republic
19 and of the ombudsman.

20 {Repeating introduction in Spanish:
21 "Estimados colegas, distinguidos invitados,
22 amigos y miembros de nuestra querida comunidad:
23 Como parte de la celebración del mes de la
24 Herencia Dominicana es un honor para mí reconocer
25 a un dominicano, cuya incansable labor en defensa

1 de los derechos humanos y la justicia social ha
2 sido fundamental para proteger a los más
3 vulnerables.

4 Su trabajo valiente y dedicado es un
5 testimonio del verdadero espíritu de servicio
6 público, enfocado en sus esfuerzos por educar a
7 la población sobre sus derechos y deberes,
8 acercando la institución a las comunidades. Se
9 trata del doctor Pablo Ulloa, Defensor del Pueblo
10 de República Dominicana.

11 Me siento honrado de entregar este
12 reconocer al doctor Ulloa por su compromiso con
13 los dominicanos desde sus funciones como Defensor
14 del Pueblo.

15 Ulloa es el ideólogo de la
16 'Constitución animada,' una obra de arte que
17 ilustra el concepto de la Constitución de una
18 manera visual y dinámica, utilizando animación
19 para representar de forma interactiva y accesible
20 los elementos fundamentales de una constitución.

21 Este trabajo es un ejemplo de cómo
22 se pueden utilizar medios digitales para
23 facilitar la comprensión de temas complejos como
24 los derechos humanos, la estructura del gobierno
25 y las leyes fundamentales de una nación.

1 Ademas, el doctor Ulloa busca
2 conectar con los dominicanos en la Diásporas por
3 medio de diferentes organizaciones para que todos
4 conozcan de su gran labor y de sus derechos que
5 tienen los dominicanos."}

6 Mr. President, I know that you're
7 English-challenged, but I ask you to offer the
8 cordialities to Dr. Ulloa, who is a great
9 Dominican and a great member of public service.
10 Thank you.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
12 you, Senator.

13 To our guests, I welcome you on
14 behalf of the Senate. We extend to you the
15 privileges and courtesies of this house.

16 Please rise and be recognized.

17 (Standing ovation.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
19 question is on the resolution.

20 All in favor signify by saying aye.

21 (Response of "Aye.")

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Opposed,
23 nay.

24 (No response.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The

1 resolution is adopted.

2 Senator Gianaris.

3 SENATOR GIANARIS: Now let's take
4 up previously adopted Resolution 316, by
5 Senator Harckham. Please read that resolution's
6 title and recognize Senator Harckham.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
8 Secretary will read.

9 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 316, by
10 Senator Harckham, mourning the death of Mary E.
11 Rainey, distinguished citizen and devoted member
12 of her community.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
14 Harckham on the resolution.

15 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Thank you very
16 much, Mr. President.

17 You know, it's fitting that we are
18 here in the midst of Black History Month, where
19 we acknowledge that Black history is American
20 history, Black history is New York history,
21 Black history is the history of great cities like
22 Peekskill, New York. And it's also the history
23 of strong Black women like Mary Rainey, who we
24 rise today to eulogize, to celebrate her life,
25 and to mourn her passing.

1 Mary was a beloved mother, a
2 grandmother, and a great-grandmother who passed
3 away last month at her home in Peekskill,
4 New York.

5 And many of her family members are
6 here with us today, including her grandson, my
7 dear friend the Honorable Former Mayor of
8 Peekskill André Rainey and his family. And I
9 welcome them, and thank you for sharing this
10 occasion with us and sharing Mary with all of us.

11 Along with her dedication to her
12 family -- which is four children, seven
13 grandchildren, 15 great-grandchildren -- what
14 truly distinguished Mary's life was her work in
15 the community and an abiding commitment to
16 helping others, reflecting the advice her own
17 grandmother had once given her to "Do all the
18 good you can do."

19 She was born in Petersburg,
20 Tennessee, at the end of World War II. Mary
21 moved as a young child with her family to
22 New York as part of the great migration of
23 Black Americans from the South to the North,
24 where at the time there were more jobs and
25 educational opportunities.

1 Mary graduated from Peekskill
2 High School in 1963 and received her degree in
3 social work from Pace University, by which time
4 she had already started a family with her beloved
5 husband, Russel Rainey.

6 Those two strands of focus, family
7 life and an ambition to make a difference in the
8 lives of others, were evident from the start of
9 her professional life. She first worked as a
10 teacher at Aunt Bessy's Open Door, a Head Start
11 daycare in Peekskill, New York, before spending
12 nine years working for West COP, an entity that's
13 known to many of us in Westchester County.

14 And then finally, in 1976, at the
15 age of 32, she became the director at the
16 Westchester Community Action Program at the
17 Kiley Youth Center in Peekskill, where she spent
18 the next 40 years overseeing community
19 initiatives.

20 Mary's focus on the needs of
21 Peekskill's youth was prescient, because today we
22 recognize that too many of our young residents
23 across New York have needs that are best
24 addressed by big-hearted individuals invested in
25 their community -- people like Mary.

1 She was a mentor, a listener, a
2 leader, and she was always there empowering
3 residents to help them find ways through the many
4 challenges that exist for young Black students
5 today.

6 Mary worshipped in Mount Lebanon
7 Baptist Church in Peekskill and held several
8 leadership roles at the church over her years.
9 Her faith was truly a well for the love that
10 filled her life and guided her career.

11 So I rise today, Mr. President, to
12 support this resolution, and I thank colleagues
13 for supporting the resolution and the Rainey
14 family during this difficult time.

15 I vote aye.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
17 you, Senator Harckham.

18 To our guests, I welcome you on
19 behalf of the Senate. We extend to you the
20 privileges and courtesies of this house.

21 Please rise and be recognized.

22 (Standing ovation.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
24 resolution was adopted on February 11th.

25 Senator Gianaris.

1 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
2 at the request of the sponsors of the resolutions
3 we took up today, they are open for
4 cosponsorship.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
6 resolutions are open for cosponsorship. Should
7 you choose not to be a cosponsor on the
8 resolutions, please notify the desk.

9 Senator Gianaris.

10 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
11 we have a tradition in this chamber, when former
12 members are visiting, that we make sure to
13 recognize them. So I want to recognize that
14 former Senator Robert DiCarlo is in the chamber
15 today.

16 (Standing ovation.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Welcome
18 back, Senator.

19 Senator Gianaris.

20 SENATOR GIANARIS: Please take up
21 the calendar.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
23 Secretary will read.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 108, Senate Print 487, by Senator Fernandez, an

1 act to amend the Executive Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
5 act shall take effect immediately.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
10 the results.

11 Senator Fernandez to explain her
12 vote.

13 SENATOR FERNANDEZ: Thank you,
14 Mr. President.

15 Overdose Awareness Day is not just a
16 day of awareness, but it is a true call to
17 action. Behind every statistic is a person -- a
18 son, a daughter, a friend, someone who should
19 still be here. And the truth is that every
20 overdose is preventable. Overdose deaths are
21 100 percent preventable.

22 We know what works. Narcan saves
23 lives. Drug testing saves lives. And treating
24 addiction as a health crisis, not a crime, will
25 save lives.

1 I commend this body for the support
2 in the recent years to make sure that we do have
3 a system that is seeing people for who they are,
4 what their needs are, and meeting them there at
5 their needs; for supporting recovery services to
6 keep people on a better path; and to make sure
7 that we are keeping people alive. Everything
8 that we do related to this topic, to addiction
9 services, the main goal is to keep people alive.
10 So we must be brave and look at policies that
11 will do just that.

12 When we recognize Overdose Awareness
13 Day, we do more than remember, we commit. We
14 commit to breaking the cycle of addiction, to
15 making sure no one feels alone on their path to
16 recovery, and to building a system that actually
17 works.

18 Thank you. I vote aye.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
20 Fernandez to be recorded in the affirmative.

21 Announce the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 168, Senate Print 640, by Senator S. Ryan, an act
2 in relation to enacting the "City of Buffalo
3 Historic Preservation Receivership Act."

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 12. This
7 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
8 shall have become a law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
13 the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 172, Senate Print 1615, by Senator Brisport, an
19 act to amend the Real Property Actions and
20 Proceedings Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
6 Calendar 172, those Senators voting in the
7 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
8 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Gallivan, Griffo,
9 Helming, Lanza, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, Ortt,
10 Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk,
11 Weber and Weik.

12 Ayes, 40. Nays, 20.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 194, Senate Print 903, by Senator Sanders, an act
17 to amend the Elder Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 199, Senate Print 2459, by Senator Comrie, an act
7 to repeal subdivision 6 of Section 51 of the
8 Public Officers Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
12 act shall take effect immediately.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
19 Calendar 199, those Senators voting in the
20 negative are Senators Ashby,
21 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Helming, Lanza,
22 Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt,
23 Palumbo, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco, Weber and Weik.

24 Ayes, 44. Nays, 16.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill

1 is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 204, Senate Print 488, by Senator Fernandez, an
4 act to amend the General Business Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
8 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
9 shall have become a law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
14 Fernandez to explain her vote.

15 SENATOR FERNANDEZ: Thank you,
16 Mr. President.

17 And I thank our Majority Leader for
18 prioritizing affordability.

19 And I hope that thumbs down isn't
20 for me just yet. I didn't speak yet.

21 (Laughter.)

22 SENATOR FERNANDEZ: But we all know
23 this, we hear the complaints from our
24 constituents that prescription drugs are too
25 high, and for many New Yorkers they are just

1 simply unaffordable -- not because of innovation,
2 not because of supply, but because of corporate
3 deals that are designed to block competition and
4 keep costs inflated.

5 That's why I introduced this bill,
6 which we titled the Manufacturer Disclosure and
7 Transparency Act. This bill takes direct aim at
8 pay-for-delay agreements, backroom deals where
9 brand-name drug manufacturers pay to keep
10 lower-cost generics off the market. These
11 agreements don't serve patients. They don't
12 improve healthcare. They serve to only protect
13 profits while families, seniors and taxpayers
14 foot the bill.

15 The impact is clear: Life-saving
16 medication remains out of reach. Costs continue
17 to rise, and our healthcare system bears the
18 burden.

19 By requiring transparency, this bill
20 ensures that drug companies can no longer hide
21 behind secrecy while New Yorkers struggle to
22 afford their prescriptions. Transparency is the
23 first step towards accountability, and
24 accountability leads to change.

25 It is time to put patients before

1 profits and ensure harmful practices do not
2 continue, and ensure that every New Yorker has
3 access to affordable medication. I urge my
4 colleagues to vote yes.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
6 Fernandez to be recorded in the affirmative.

7 Announce the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
9 Calendar 204, those Senators voting in the
10 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
11 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffio, Mattera,
12 Palumbo, Stec, Walczyk and Weber. Also
13 Senator Tedisco.

14 Ayes, 49. Nays, 11.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 232, Senate Print 438, by Senator Myrie, an act
19 to amend the Insurance Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
23 act shall take effect on the 150th day after it
24 shall have become a law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
6 Calendar 232, voting in the negative are
7 Senators Borrello, Oberacker, Stec and Walczyk.

8 Ayes, 56. Nays, 4.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 250, Senate Print 3274, by Senator Cooney, an act
13 to amend the Alcoholic Beverage Control Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
17 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it
18 shall have become a law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill

1 is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 251, Senate Print 1281, by Senator Persaud, an
4 act to amend the Social Services Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
8 act shall take effect immediately.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
13 the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 278, Senate Print 1071, by Senator Serrano, an
19 act to amend the Parks, Recreation and Historic
20 Preservation Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 305, Senate Print 3335, by Senator Cooney, an act
10 to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
14 act shall take effect on the first of January.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
19 Oberacker to explain his vote.

20 SENATOR OBERACKER: Thank you,
21 Mr. President. And also thank you for sponsoring
22 this bill.

23 You know, every once in a while we
24 get things right. And it's really important to
25 acknowledge that. I know a lot of times we go

1 back and forth across the chamber in some very
2 interesting and deep debates. There should be no
3 debate on this bill. It's common sense. It is
4 going to save lives.

5 And I'm reminded of a quote that
6 Teddy Roosevelt said. And he said, When there
7 comes a time for a decision, he says, the best
8 thing you can do is the right thing. He says:
9 The next best thing you can do is the wrong
10 thing. He says: But the worst thing you can do
11 is nothing.

12 I would encourage each and every one
13 of my colleagues to register as a bone-marrow
14 donor. You're going to be saving a life. I
15 can't think of a better life lived than one
16 saved. And I proudly, proudly vote yes on this
17 bill, and I ask all my colleagues to do the same.

18 Thank you, Mr. President.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
20 Oberacker to be recorded in the affirmative.

21 Announce the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 306, Senate Print 1724, by Senator Jackson, an
2 act to amend the Civil Service Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 313, Senate Print 373, by Senator Gianaris, an
17 act to amend the Urban Development Corporation
18 Act.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
22 act shall take effect immediately.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
2 the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 314, Senate Print 1410, by Senator S. Ryan, an
8 act to amend the Public Authorities Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This
12 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
13 shall have become a law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
18 the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
20 Calendar 314, those Senators voting in the
21 negative are Senators Borrello,
22 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Gallivan, Griffio,
23 Helming, Mattera, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt,
24 Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk and Weik.

25 Ayes, 46. Nays, 15.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
2 is passed.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 319, Senate Print 3876, by Senator Hoylman-Sigal,
5 an act to amend the General Business Law.

6 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Lay it
8 aside.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 321, Senate Print 4391, by Senator Gounardes, an
11 act to amend the General Business Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
15 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
16 shall have become a law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
21 the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 322, Senate Print 4433, by Senator Skoufis, an
2 act to amend the General Business Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
6 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
7 shall have become a law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
14 Calendar 322, voting in the negative are
15 Senators Borrello, Chan, Walczyk and Weik.

16 Ayes, 57. Nays, 4.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 332, Senate Print 2613, by Senator Addabbo, an
21 act to amend the Tax Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
5 the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
7 Calendar 332, voting in the negative are
8 Senators Griffo and Ortt.

9 Ayes, 59. Nays, 2.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
11 is passed.

12 Senator Gianaris, that completes the
13 reading of today's calendar.

14 SENATOR GIANARIS: Let's move on to
15 the controversial calendar, please.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
17 Secretary will ring the bell.

18 The Secretary will read.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 319, Senate Print 3876, by Senator Hoylman-Sigal,
21 an act to amend the General Business Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
23 Lanza, why do you rise?

24 (Senator Lanza and Senator Borrello
25 rise.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
2 Lanza, why do you rise?

3 (Laughter.)

4 SENATOR LANZA: Thank you very
5 much, Mr. President.

6 I believe there's an amendment at
7 the desk. I waive the reading of that amendment
8 and ask that you recognize Senator
9 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
11 you, Senator Lanza.

12 Upon review of the amendment, in
13 accordance with Rule 6, Section 4B, I rule it
14 nongermane and out of order at this time.

15 SENATOR LANZA: Accordingly,
16 Mr. President, I appeal the ruling of the chair
17 and ask that you recognize Senator
18 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick to be heard on that appeal.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
20 appeal has been made and recognized, and
21 Senator Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick may be heard.

22 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK:
23 Thank you, Mr. President.

24 I rise to appeal the ruling of the
25 chair. The proposed amendment is germane to the

1 bill at hand because the bill at hand requires a
2 side-by-side comparison of utility prices from
3 an ESCO, an energy service company.

4 And ESCO consumers pay to be
5 provided -- I'm sorry, what is provided on the
6 first page of their customer's bill is an
7 itemized list of the charges by the ESCO for
8 energy-related value-added products.

9 The amendment I'm offering seeks to
10 bolster transparency in energy bills by requiring
11 residential utility bills to include a line item
12 that clearly shows ratepayers how much of their
13 bill is a result of the mandates of the CLCPA.

14 The sponsor's memo for the bill at
15 hand notes that ESCOs often promise that
16 customers transition away from their utility to
17 an ESCO, they will see a host of benefits,
18 including a reduced energy bill, greener energy,
19 and other side benefits. This sounds very
20 familiar to the promises made by the CLCPA.

21 The sponsor's memo further notes
22 that the bill at hand will allow ESCOs who claim
23 to provide a genuine benefit to the customers to
24 demonstrate evidence backing up that claim on
25 each bill while providing notice to the consumers

1 who are being unfairly overcharged.

2 I agree with the bill at hand, and
3 these are laudable principles of transparency in
4 pricing, especially at a time when energy and
5 utility rates are skyrocketing. Which is why we
6 should extended these provisions to the costs
7 associated with the CLCPA. Why should the
8 principles of fair and transparent pricing be
9 limited to ESCOs and not applied to the state's
10 own claims of providing greener energy, reduced
11 bills, and other side benefits?

12 The Climate Action Council's own
13 estimates for the costs of CLCPA are up to
14 \$340 billion. And an Empire Center report noted
15 that there are reasons to doubt the validities of
16 these estimates with the potential for cost to
17 inflate to over \$1 trillion. I'm also told that
18 the council hasn't met in three years.

19 New Yorkers who are already
20 struggling to keep up with their utility bills
21 have the right to know the impact the policies
22 out of Albany will have on their bills and on
23 their wallets.

24 This legislation would ensure
25 transparency in utility bills so ratepayers know

1 who is responsible for increasing their costs.

2 For these reasons, Mr. President, I
3 strongly urge you to reconsider your ruling.

4 Thank you.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
6 you, Senator.

7 I want to remind the house that the
8 vote is on the procedures of the house and the
9 ruling of the chair.

10 Those in favor of overruling the
11 chair, signify by saying aye.

12 (Response of "Aye.")

13 SENATOR LANZA: Show of hands.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: A show of
15 hands has been requested and so ordered.

16 Announce the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 22.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
19 ruling of the chair stands, and the bill-in-chief
20 is now before the house.

21 Senator Borrello, why do you rise?

22 SENATOR BORRELLO: Now it's my
23 turn, Mr. President.

24 Would the sponsor yield for a
25 question?

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
2 sponsor yield?

3 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
5 sponsor yields.

6 SENATOR BORRELLO: Okay. Through
7 you, Mr. President. Senator Hoylman, does the --
8 do you know if -- does the Public Service
9 Commission regulate these energy service
10 companies?

11 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: I'm sorry,
12 I didn't hear that.

13 SENATOR BORRELLO: Does the Public
14 Service Commission, the PSC, regulate these
15 energy service companies?

16 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: To my
17 knowledge, yes.

18 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you.
19 Mr. President, would the sponsor
20 yield for another question?

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Does the
22 sponsor yield?

23 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
25 sponsor yields.

1 SENATOR BORRELLO: So they're all
2 regulated by the PSC; they have to ask for
3 permission for rate increases and so forth. So
4 do you have any data to support that there is
5 actual savings that are provided, on average,
6 with the energy service companies versus, you
7 know, a standard utility?

8 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through
9 you, Mr. President. The bill at hand would add
10 another layer of transparency and amend the ESCO
11 Consumer Bill of Rights. As your colleague
12 pointed out, ESCOs, for those who don't know,
13 stand for energy services companies, which
14 provide energy services as a competitive
15 alternative to electric and natural gas utilities
16 across New York State.

17 What our bill would do would require
18 that the billing statements delivered to
19 customers by ESCOs, which seems to have been
20 endorsed by your colleague, include a
21 side-by-side comparison showing both the price
22 charged by the ESCO for the commodity and
23 delivery service during the prior bill period,
24 and the price the customer would have paid with
25 their local utility company.

1 So, you know, they say transparency,
2 in comparison, is the thief of joy. But this is
3 truly I think an important issue for so many
4 New Yorkers who are facing these astronomical,
5 increasing rate hikes by their local energy
6 utility.

7 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
8 will the sponsor yield for another question.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
10 sponsor yield?

11 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
13 sponsor yields.

14 SENATOR BORRELLO: I think we can
15 agree that, yes, energy prices are up. But what
16 I hear from energy service providers, from
17 utilities, public utilities, private for-profit
18 utilities, is meeting the demands of the CLCPA
19 are actually what are the main driver of these
20 cost increases.

21 So in the interest of transparency,
22 why don't we show folks exactly how much every
23 month it's costing them to meet the mandates of
24 the CLCPA?

25 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: I don't

1 know if -- you know, I'm here debating not the
2 CLCPA requirements.

3 But I will say this, that there are
4 a number of examples where these ESCOs have been
5 engaged in deceptive practices. Attorney General
6 James secured over \$2 million for consumers
7 deceived by an ESCO in 2022. She secured
8 \$1.5 million for consumers deceived by an ESCO in
9 December of 2022. And the PSC itself identified
10 violations by three companies for failing to
11 abide by the ESCO Bill of Rights.

12 There's cause for concern here,
13 Mr. President, because we know that ESCOs have
14 very aggressive sales tactics. I don't know
15 about you, but in my local farmers market, every
16 Sunday there's at least one ESCO sales team
17 trying to sell me clean energy.

18 I think New Yorkers have a right to
19 know whether they're getting their money's worth
20 because it's often portrayed as a cost savings.

21 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
22 will the sponsor continue to yield?

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
24 sponsor yield?

25 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
2 sponsor yields.

3 SENATOR BORRELLO: I'm so glad you
4 said that, because I agree with you. We all know
5 that green energy is costing us more, but these
6 guys are trying to sell us on the fact that it's
7 actually cheaper. So I think there is a
8 transparency issue here.

9 So I'll go back. Why don't we
10 explain to folks that, you know, the cost of wind
11 and solar is many multiples more than traditional
12 forms of energy generation like natural gas? So
13 I don't know why we couldn't make that clear. So
14 that would address the question you just brought
15 up, the, you know, kind of green energy scam
16 that's involved with a lot of these things.

17 That's a question. Why don't we do
18 that?

19 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Well --

20 SENATOR BORRELLO: The question is,
21 why don't we then allow these companies to be
22 completely transparent and tell them exactly what
23 it costs to deliver wind and solar versus
24 traditional forms of energy?

25 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Again,

1 Mr. President, this bill is specific to energy
2 service companies for the reasons I laid out.

3 You know, the -- many residents of
4 different parts of this state have been harangued
5 by sales teams that are selling these energy
6 products. And frankly, I think this bill would
7 go a long way toward letting consumers know if
8 they choose one of these energy services
9 companies, whether they're getting their money's
10 worth.

11 And I think we agree that
12 transparency is the best course of action here.
13 And that's why I hope you vote in favor of this
14 bill.

15 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
16 will the sponsor continue to yield?

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
18 sponsor yield?

19 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yeah.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
21 sponsor yields.

22 SENATOR BORRELLO: So in order for
23 this to be published, they're going to have to
24 get that information accurately. Is there any
25 requirement for those companies to get that data

1 so they can list it on the bills?

2 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through
3 you, Mr. President. Already that requirement
4 exists under the law that we passed two years
5 ago. Now it will just move that data to a
6 customer's monthly bill so the customer can make
7 an easy comparison with the ESCO price and the
8 local utility price. That would be on their
9 statement every month.

10 Now it's my understanding that the
11 customer would actually have to pursue that data,
12 which does exist, but it's certainly not in an
13 easily attainable or understandable format, as it
14 would be under this bill.

15 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
16 will the sponsor continue to yield?

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
18 sponsor yield?

19 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
21 sponsor yields.

22 SENATOR BORRELLO: Well, but you
23 said not that easy to obtain, but don't you know
24 the PSC already requires that -- offers that
25 comparison online? Wouldn't it just be simple

1 for folks to make that by looking at the PSC
2 website?

3 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through
4 you, Mr. President. Those comparisons are only
5 estimates.

6 And I'm sure my colleague would
7 agree, Mr. President, that the consumer should
8 have that on their bill, side-by-side comparison.
9 We shouldn't have to direct a consumer to a
10 website to understand if they're getting their
11 money's worth.

12 I think that's one of the reasons
13 why the -- our colleagues in the other house have
14 passed this bill twice already. I'm glad that
15 the Senate's taking it up today as part of the
16 Senate Majority Conference's affordability
17 package. This is about affordability, making
18 certain that New Yorkers have the transparency
19 they need to make good choices.

20 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
21 will the sponsor continue to yield?

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
23 sponsor yield?

24 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The

1 sponsor yields.

2 SENATOR BORRELLO: So we're talking
3 about consumers being educated in order to make
4 good choices, and I don't disagree with that.
5 But, you know, sometimes people make a decision
6 based on the circumstances they're under.

7 I mean, you know, last night I
8 stopped to buy a bottle of Gatorade at the gas
9 station. I could have went to the grocery store
10 down the street. Should I -- should that gas
11 station have a price that, you know, here's how
12 much it is at the grocery store down the street
13 versus right there at that convenient spot that
14 I'm picking it up? Wouldn't that be also a
15 consumer-choice advocacy policy?

16 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through
17 you, Mr. President. As I understand, one of our
18 colleagues has a bill that might make a similar
19 requirement for dynamic pricing.

20 So I think we are very much in
21 agreement, Mr. President, that transparency is
22 the -- is best for the consumer, and that's what
23 this bill advances. If we can seek transparency
24 and comparison in other markets, by all means, I
25 think we should be considering legislation in

1 that regard too. Perhaps you'll write a bill.

2 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
3 on the bill.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
5 Borrello on the bill.

6 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you,
7 Senator Hoylman. I know that was my idea, but it
8 was actually a stupid idea. But thank you anyway
9 for that endorsement of that idea.

10 So here's the issue I have with all
11 of this. We're very good at telling other people
12 they need to be transparent, but we as government
13 are not good at it, as evidenced by the CLCPA and
14 the fact that we really don't want anyone to know
15 what it's going to cost. We have the Majority
16 that's actively engaged in trying to cover up
17 what it's really going to cost the people of
18 New York State.

19 Now, they will say, Well, the cost
20 of not doing it is greater. How about we let the
21 people of New York make that decision?

22 So the issue that I have with it is
23 not the transparency. I actually agree that it
24 is good for things to be transparent. But at
25 what point do we hold our own government, the

1 people's servants, to the same standard that we
2 want to hold every single business in New York
3 State -- I don't care if they're a utility
4 provider, I don't care what you do, what service
5 or product you deliver. We're very good at
6 telling them how to do their job, but yet we
7 really don't want to be accountable to the people
8 that we serve, that sent us here. That's why I
9 have a problem with this bill. We really don't
10 want to tell people that it's going to cost
11 probably a trillion dollars to implement the
12 CLCPA.

13 Maybe we should let people decide.
14 Maybe they can look at it every month on the
15 utility bill to decide how much are they willing
16 to pay every month in order to achieve these
17 radical goals?

18 So with that I'm going to be down on
19 this -- not because I don't support the idea of
20 transparency, but I don't like the double
21 standard when it comes to government.

22 So thank you, Mr. President.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
24 you, Senator Borrello.

25 Are there any other Senators wishing

1 to be heard? Seeing and hearing none, debate is
2 now closed.

3 Senator Gianaris.

4 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
5 we've agreed to restore this bill to the
6 noncontroversial calendar.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Please
8 read the last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
10 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
11 shall have become a law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
16 Harckham to explain his vote.

17 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Thank you very
18 much, Mr. President. I just want to rise and
19 correct some inaccurate information we just
20 heard.

21 The fact that we don't know how much
22 this CLCPA is going to cost -- Chapter 10. I
23 encourage colleagues to read Chapter 10. That is
24 the cost of implementing the CLCPA plan that
25 hundreds of people spent thousands of hours

1 developing.

2 The costs are laid out in detail.
3 And the cost to not make this transition will
4 cost New Yorkers \$115 billion. New Yorkers are
5 already paying the costs of climate change in
6 their everyday lives.

7 The other thing I would like to add,
8 the high utility costs that we are facing right
9 now have nothing to do with the CLCPA. It's a
10 perfect storm of rate cases involving resiliency,
11 colder weather than normal with higher user
12 demand so the spot market comes up, and commodity
13 pricing -- that's oil and gas.

14 The fact is a kilowatt of clean
15 energy is less expensive than a kilowatt of
16 carbon-based energy. That's why Wall Street is
17 investing more in clean energy, and 80 percent of
18 the new generation online last year nationally
19 was clean energy. Because it's a lot cheaper,
20 and that's where the markets are going.

21 So I thank the Senator for this
22 bill. I vote aye.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
24 Harckham to be recorded in the affirmative.

25 I ask for order in the house.

1 Senator Mayer to explain her vote.

2 SENATOR MAYER: Thank you,
3 Mr. President.

4 Thank you, Senator Hoylman-Sigal,
5 for taking another step to ensure that our
6 constituents understand the price that they are
7 paying for utilities.

8 That is the simple issue here in
9 this bill. Our constituents are entitled to
10 understand -- which I would say they currently
11 can't understand -- their bill, whether they
12 choose an ESCO or they have Con Ed or some other
13 provider. They simply don't understand their
14 bill. Then when they figure it out, they are
15 outraged at how expensive it is. And it is not
16 just the lack of understanding, it's that the
17 Public Service Commission and these utility
18 companies are using our constituents to fund
19 their shareholders, their executives and others.

20 This bill is an important step to
21 ensuring that our constituents can actually
22 understand who they are paying, how much they are
23 paying, and the basis for the bill.

24 I'm happy to be voting yes. I
25 encourage my colleagues to do the same.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
2 Mayer to be recorded in the affirmative.

3 Announce the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
5 Calendar 319, those Senators voting in the
6 negative are Senators Borrello, Chan, Gallivan
7 and Walczyk -- sorry.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
9 Rhoads -- I'm sorry, Senator Walczyk to explain
10 his vote.

11 SENATOR WALCZYK: Thank you,
12 Mr. President. Sorry to interrupt the roll call
13 there. I thought I had your attention.

14 The Comptroller and NYSERDA
15 confirmed the CLCPA will cost New Yorkers
16 \$340 billion -- 340 billion, with a B, dollars.

17 So I'm not confused about how much
18 this costs. That's coming from this
19 administration that wants probably to put the
20 lowest price tag possible on that thing. And
21 they're saying \$340 billion over the next
22 25 years.

23 So what is that going to do for your
24 energy bill? If you pare that out over the next
25 25 years for every man, woman and child in the

1 State of New York, that's \$177,000. That's a
2 mortgage payment for every man, woman and child
3 in the State of New York.

4 Affordability? This bill's a joke.
5 I vote no.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
7 Walczyk to be recorded in the negative.

8 Announce the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
10 Calendar 319, voting in the negative are
11 Senators Borrello, Chan, Gallivan and Walczyk.

12 Ayes, 57. Nays, 4.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
14 is passed.

15 Senator Gianaris, that completes the
16 reading of today's calendar.

17 SENATOR GIANARIS: Is there any
18 further business at the desk?

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: There is
20 no further business at the desk.

21 SENATOR GIANARIS: I move to
22 adjourn until tomorrow, Wednesday, February 26th,
23 at 2:00 p.m.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: On
25 motion, the Senate stands adjourned until

1 Wednesday, February 26th, at 2:00 p.m.

2 (Whereupon, at 5:02 p.m., the Senate

3 adjourned.)

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25