

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

NEW YORK STATE SENATE

THE STENOGRAPHIC RECORD

ALBANY, NEW YORK

February 3, 2025

4:02 p.m.

REGULAR SESSION

SENATOR ROXANNE J. PERSAUD, Acting President

ALEJANDRA N. PAULINO, ESQ., Secretary

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
3 Senate will come to order.

4 I ask everyone present to please
5 rise and recite the Pledge of Allegiance.

6 (Whereupon, the assemblage recited
7 the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Imam
9 Tahir Kukaj, of the Albanian Islamic Cultural
10 Center in Staten Island, will deliver today's
11 invocation.

12 Imam Kukaj.

13 IMAM KUKAJ: In the name of God,
14 most gracious, most merciful, we thank
15 God Almighty for this beautiful gathering of
16 ours, and we thank our host.

17 In the Book of Genesis, God Almighty
18 tells us the way He has created the sky and water
19 and the planet and day and night. Later on, He
20 says that it was good. And God saw that it was
21 good.

22 Indeed, it's very good for me to
23 come for the second time to offer my prayers and
24 to offer my gratitude on behalf of Albanians and
25 Kosovars that we celebrate today the

1 17th anniversary of Kosovo's independence.

2 God Almighty says "And let there be
3 light in the sky," so we differentiate the day
4 from the night. Twenty-six years ago, with God's
5 mercy and with the United States and its allies'
6 interventions, the darkness that my people was
7 going through that the Serbian regime tried to
8 exterminate Albanians from Kosovo -- with God's
9 mercy and the intervention from the United States
10 of America and its allies, the new day began in
11 our country.

12 We, as Albanians, we are grateful
13 forever to this great nation. And with God's
14 mercy, the support of the United States for my
15 country, our country, continues as this chamber
16 and the State Assembly have recognized Kosovo's
17 Independence Day. This is our second, our second
18 annual celebration. Thank God Almighty. Thanks
19 to our wonderful leaders, Senator Jessica
20 Scarcella-Spanton and my dear brother and friend
21 and leader of Staten Island, State Assemblyman
22 Charles Fall.

23 We ask God Almighty to bless this
24 assembly, to guide you and to bless your hearts
25 with wisdom, to build a future that justice

1 prevails. To build a future that unity,
2 compassion, is always the value of our
3 communities. To have the hope that is shining as
4 a bright star for our future generations.

5 We pray for our heroes, Adem Jashari
6 and his friends, that they shed their blood, they
7 gave their lives for the freedom of Albanians.
8 We pray for our martyrs. We pray for Albanians
9 wherever they are. We pray for our State of
10 New York, the Empire State. And we always pray
11 for the United States of America.

12 God bless you all. God bless the
13 Albanian people. And God bless the United States
14 of America.

15 In Your name, God Almighty, we make
16 this prayer. Amen.

17 (Response of "Amen.")

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Reading
19 of the Journal.

20 THE SECRETARY: In Senate, Friday,
21 January 31, 2025, the Senate met pursuant to
22 adjournment. The Journal of Thursday,
23 January 30, 2025, was read and approved. On
24 motion, the Senate adjourned.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Without

1 objection, the Journal stands approved as read.

2 Presentation of petitions.

3 Messages from the Assembly.

4 The Secretary will read.

5 THE SECRETARY: Senator Cleare
6 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
7 Assembly Bill Number 440 and substitute it for
8 the identical Senate Bill 737, Third Reading
9 Calendar 12.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: May we
11 have some quiet in the chamber, please.

12 THE SECRETARY: Senator Mayer moves
13 to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
14 Assembly Bill Number 814 and substitute it for
15 the identical Senate Bill 746, Third Reading
16 Calendar 21.

17 Senator Gounardes moves to
18 discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
19 Assembly Bill Number 692 and substitute it for
20 the identical Senate Bill 748, Third Reading
21 Calendar 23.

22 Senator Hoylman-Sigal moves to
23 discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
24 Assembly Bill Number 419 and substitute it for
25 the identical Senate Bill 756, Third Reading

1 Calendar 31.

2 Senator Stavisky moves to discharge,
3 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
4 Number 430 and substitute it for the identical
5 Senate Bill 774, Third Reading Calendar 48.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:

7 Substitutions so ordered.

8 Messages from the Governor.

9 Reports of standing committees.

10 Reports of select committees.

11 Communications and reports from
12 state officers.

13 Motions and resolutions.

14 Senator Gianaris.

15 SENATOR GIANARIS: Good afternoon,
16 Madam President.

17 Please take up previously adopted
18 Resolution 259, by Senator Scarcella-Spanton,
19 read the resolution's title, and recognize
20 Senator Scarcella-Spanton.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
22 Secretary will read.

23 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 259, by
24 Senator Scarcella-Spanton, commemorating the
25 17th Anniversary of Kosovo's Independence.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
2 Scarcella-Spanton on the resolution.

3 SENATOR SCARCELLA-SPANTON: Thank
4 you, Madam President. And thank you to all my
5 colleagues.

6 I want to extend a warm welcome to
7 all my friends and constituents who have joined
8 us today as we gather to celebrate Kosovo's
9 Independence Day here in New York State.

10 Today is a significant moment in
11 recognizing Kosovo's remarkable journey to
12 independence. Once again, here in New York, an
13 independence achieved through years of
14 perseverance and resilience. Despite facing
15 numerous obstacles, the people of Kosovo have
16 shown extraordinary strength, determination and
17 will, which brings us to this important occasion,
18 our second annual Kosovo Day of Independence.
19 Thank you.

20 Kosovo's Declaration of Independence
21 in 2008 was a historic moment, signaling an end
22 of years of struggle and the beginning of a new
23 chapter for the people of Kosovo -- a chapter
24 built on hope, unity, and the tireless pursuit of
25 freedom.

1 As we reflect on this journey, we
2 honor the sacrifices made and the many challenges
3 overcome in their pursuit of freedom and
4 self-determination.

5 It is truly my honor to sponsor this
6 resolution in recognition of Kosovo's
7 Independence Day. Today we stand in solidarity
8 with the Kosovar people, celebrating their
9 triumphs and looking forward to a brighter
10 future.

11 And I want to thank, of course,
12 Imam Tahir, all of our constituents who are here
13 today, and my Staten Island director,
14 Vanesa Limani, who's here with me. She's from
15 Kosovo. She does an amazing job. And she helped
16 plan and put this all together.

17 So thank you so much, and thank you
18 to all my colleagues for your support, and to
19 everyone who has joined us in honoring this
20 significant day.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
22 Fernandez on the resolution.

23 SENATOR FERNANDEZ: Thank you,
24 Madam Speaker.

25 Thank you so much,

1 Senator Scarcella-Spanton, for bringing this
2 resolution to the floor, because it is always
3 important to give the grace, the dignity to a
4 community that exists, that is here, and that is
5 continually contributing to our great state.

6 The Kosovo community, the
7 Sheepbay {ph} community, is one very close to my
8 heart, and I'm honored to cosponsor this
9 resolution and to make sure that we as
10 New Yorkers are always identifying them and
11 giving them their right to existence here in
12 New York, in America, and in the world.

13 So Happy Independence Day. Que viva
14 Kosova!

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
16 you, Senator.

17 To our guests, I welcome you on
18 behalf of the Senate. We extend to you the
19 privileges and courtesies of this house.

20 Happy Independence! Please rise and
21 be recognized.

22 (Standing ovation.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
24 resolution was adopted on January 28th.

25 Senator Gianaris.

1 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,
2 Senator Scarcella-Spanton would like to open that
3 resolution for cosponsorship.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
5 resolution is open for cosponsorship. Should you
6 choose not to be a cosponsor, please notify the
7 desk.

8 Senator Gianaris.

9 SENATOR GIANARIS: Please take up
10 the calendar.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
12 Secretary will read.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 12,
14 Assembly Bill Number 440, by Assemblymember
15 De Los Santos, an act to amend the
16 General Business Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. this
20 act shall take effect on the same date and in the
21 same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2024.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 13,
6 Senate Print 738, by Senator Cleare, an act to
7 amend the General Business Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11 act shall take effect on the same date and in the
12 same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2024.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
19 Calendar Number 13, voting in the negative:
20 Senator Walczyk.

21 Ayes, 61. Nays, 1.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 15,
25 Senate Print 740, by Senator Ramos, an act to

1 amend the Labor Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
5 act shall take effect immediately.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
10 the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
12 Calendar 15, those Senators voting in the
13 negative are Senators Borrello, Griffo, Martins,
14 O'Mara, Ortt and Walczyk.

15 Ayes, 56. Nays, 6.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 18,
19 Senate Print 743, by Senator Gianaris, an act to
20 amend the Penal Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
24 act shall take effect on the same date and in the
25 same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2024.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
5 the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
7 Calendar 18, those Senators voting in the
8 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
9 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Gallivan, Griffo,
10 Helming, Lanza, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker,
11 O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco,
12 Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

13 Ayes, 42. Nays, 20.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 19,
17 Senate Print 744, by Senator Hoylman-Sigal, an
18 act to amend the Penal Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
22 act shall take effect on the same date and in the
23 same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2024.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
3 the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
5 Calendar 19, those Senators voting in the
6 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello, Gallivan,
7 Griffo, Helming, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker,
8 O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco and Walczyk.

9 Ayes, 49. Nays, 13.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 20,
13 Senate Print 745, by Senator Myrie, an act to
14 amend the General Business Law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
18 act shall take effect on the same date and in the
19 same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2024.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: In relation to

1 Calendar 20, those Senators voting in the
2 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello, Gallivan,
3 Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Mattera, Murray,
4 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rolison, Stec,
5 Tedisco, Walczyk and Weik.

6 Ayes, 45. Nays, 17.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
8 is passed.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 21,
10 Assembly Bill 814, by Assemblymember Benedetto,
11 an act to amend the Public Health Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
15 act shall take effect immediately.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
22 Calendar 21, those Senators voting in the
23 negative are Senators Borrello, Oberacker,
24 O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk and Weik.

25 Ayes, 54. Nays, 8.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
2 is passed.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 23,
4 Assembly Print 692, by Assemblymember Rosenthal,
5 an act to amend the Public Health Law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
14 the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 26,
19 Senate Print 751, by Senator Sepúlveda, an act to
20 amend the Real Property Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
24 act shall take effect on the same date and in the
25 same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2024.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
5 the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
7 Calendar 26, those Senators voting in the
8 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello, Chan,
9 Gallivan, O'Mara, Ortt, Stec and Weber.

10 Ayes, 54. Nays, 8.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 27,
14 Senate Print 752, by Senator Hoylman-Sigal, an
15 act to amend the Election Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This
19 act shall take effect on the same date and in the
20 same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2024.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
25 the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
2 Calendar 27, those Senators voting in the
3 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
4 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Gallivan, Griffo,
5 Helming, Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Murray,
6 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,
7 Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

8 Ayes, 40. Nays, 22.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 29,
12 Senate Print 754, by Senator Martinez, an act to
13 amend the Transportation Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
17 act shall take effect on the same date and in the
18 same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2024.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
25 Calendar 29, those Senators voting in the

1 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
2 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Gallivan, Griffo,
3 Helming, Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Murray,
4 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,
5 Skoufis, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

6 Ayes, 40. Nays, 22.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
8 is passed.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 30,
10 Senate Print 755, by Senator Ramos, an act to
11 amend the Workers' Compensation Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
15 act shall take effect immediately.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
22 Calendar 30, those Senators voting in the
23 negative are Senators Borrello, Griffo, Helming,
24 Lanza, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Stec and
25 Weik. Also Senator Tedisco.

1 Ayes, 51. Nays, 11.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 31,
5 Assembly Print 419, by Assemblymember Carroll, an
6 act to amend the Insurance Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
10 act shall take effect on the same date and in the
11 same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2024.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
18 Calendar 31, voting in the negative:
19 Senator Walczyk.

20 Ayes, 61. Nays, 1.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
22 is passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 48,
24 Assembly Print 430, by Assemblymember Rosenthal,
25 an act to amend the Insurance Law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
2 last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
4 act shall take effect on the same date and in the
5 same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2024.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
10 the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
13 is passed.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 56,
15 Senate Print 782, by Senator Palumbo, an act to
16 amend the Real Property Tax Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
20 act shall take effect on the same date and in the
21 same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2024.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
3 Calendar 56, voting in the negative:
4 Senator Skoufis.

5 Ayes, 61. Nays, 1.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
7 is passed.

8 Senator Gianaris, that completes the
9 reading of today's calendar.

10 SENATOR GIANARIS: Is there any
11 further business at the desk?

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: There is
13 no further business at the desk.

14 SENATOR GIANARIS: I move to
15 adjourn until tomorrow, Tuesday, February 4th, at
16 3:00 p.m.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: On
18 motion, the Senate stands adjourned until
19 tomorrow, Tuesday, February 4th, at 3:00 p.m.

20 (Whereupon, at 4:23 p.m., the Senate
21 adjourned.)

22

23

24

25