

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

NEW YORK STATE SENATE

THE STENOGRAPHIC RECORD

ALBANY, NEW YORK

June 6, 2024

3:13 p.m.

REGULAR SESSION

SENATOR JEREMY A. COONEY, Acting President

ALEJANDRA N. PAULINO, ESQ., Secretary

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
3 Senate will come to order.

4 I ask everyone to please rise and
5 recite the Pledge of Allegiance.

6 (Whereupon, the assemblage recited
7 the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: In the
9 absence of clergy, let us bow our heads in a
10 moment of silent reflection or prayer.

11 (Whereupon, the assemblage respected
12 a moment of silence.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Reading
14 of the Journal.

15 THE SECRETARY: In Senate,
16 Wednesday, June 5, 2024, the Senate met pursuant
17 to adjournment. The Journal of Tuesday, June 4,
18 2024, was read and approved. On motion, the
19 Senate adjourned.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Without
21 objection, the Journal stands approved as read.

22 Presentation of petitions.

23 Messages from the Assembly.

24 The Secretary will read.

25 THE SECRETARY: Senator Rivera

1 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Health,
2 Assembly Bill Number 6022A and substitute it for
3 the identical Senate Bill 4787A, Third Reading
4 Calendar 451.

5 Senator Webb moves to discharge,
6 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
7 Number 8168 and substitute it for the identical
8 Senate Bill 7690, Third Reading Calendar 81.

9 Senator Brouk moves to discharge,
10 from the Committee on Children and Families,
11 Assembly Bill Number 4099A and substitute it for
12 the identical Senate Bill 4667A, Third Reading
13 Calendar 146.

14 Senator Kavanagh moves to discharge,
15 from the Committee on Housing, Construction and
16 Community Development, Assembly Bill Number 222
17 and substitute it for the identical
18 Senate Bill 563, Third Reading Calendar 104.

19 Senator Chu moves to discharge, from
20 the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
21 Number 9076A and substitute it for the identical
22 Senate Bill 7093A, Third Reading Calendar 697.

23 Senator May moves to discharge, from
24 the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill Number 6821
25 and substitute it for the identical Senate

1 Bill 6320, Third Reading Calendar 727.

2 Senator Scarcella-Spanton moves to
3 discharge, from the Committee on Codes,
4 Assembly Bill Number 8994A and substitute it for
5 the identical Senate Bill 7739B, Third Reading
6 Calendar 787.

7 Senator Hoylman-Sigal moves to
8 discharge, from the Committee on Health,
9 Assembly Bill Number 8475 and substitute it for
10 the identical Senate Bill 7809, Third Reading
11 Calendar 836.

12 Senator Rivera moves to discharge,
13 from the Committee on Health, Assembly Bill
14 Number 6799B and substitute it for the identical
15 Senate Bill 8695B, Third Reading Calendar 838.

16 Senator Tedisco moves to discharge,
17 from the Committee on Investigations and
18 Government Operations, Assembly Bill Number 9284
19 and substitute it for the identical Senate
20 Bill 8634, Third Reading Calendar 872.

21 Senator Liu moves to discharge, from
22 the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
23 Number 8081B and substitute it for the identical
24 Senate Bill 7801A, Third Reading Calendar 946.

25 Senator Palumbo moves to discharge,

1 from the Committee on Environmental Conservation,
2 Assembly Bill Number 5550 and substitute it for
3 the identical Senate Bill Number 2273,
4 Third Reading Calendar 960.

5 Senator Rivera moves to discharge,
6 from the Committee on Health, Assembly Bill
7 Number 9235A and substitute it for the identical
8 Senate Bill 8966A, Third Reading Calendar 998.

9 Senator Ashby moves to discharge,
10 from the Committee on Cities 2, Assembly Bill
11 Number 7271 and substitute it for the identical
12 Senate Bill 7007A, Third Reading Calendar 1025.

13 Senator Ashby moves to discharge,
14 from the Committee on Cities 2, Assembly Bill
15 Number 7270 and substitute it for the identical
16 Senate Bill 7008A, Third Reading Calendar 1026.

17 Senator Palumbo moves to discharge,
18 from the Committee on Investigations and
19 Government Operations, Assembly Bill Number 9124
20 and substitute it for the identical Senate
21 Bill 8550, Third Reading Calendar 1044.

22 Senator Sanders moves to discharge,
23 from the Committee on Consumer Protection,
24 Assembly Bill Number 7167 and substitute it for
25 the identical Senate Bill 4778, Third Reading

1 Calendar 1075.

2 Senator Kavanagh moves to discharge,
3 from the Committee on Health, Assembly Bill
4 Number 3703 and substitute it for the identical
5 Senate Bill 2984, Third Reading Calendar 1106.

6 Senator Addabbo moves to discharge,
7 from the Committee on Racing, Gaming and
8 Wagering, Assembly Bill Number 3475A and
9 substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
10 Number 1611A, Third Reading Calendar 1126.

11 Senator Gounardes moves to
12 discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
13 Assembly Bill Number 2583A and substitute it for
14 the identical Senate Bill 15A, Third Reading
15 Calendar 1185.

16 Senator Hinchey moves to discharge,
17 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
18 Number 9213A and substitute it for the identical
19 Senate Bill 8703A, Third Reading Calendar 1215.

20 Senator Myrie moves to discharge,
21 from the Committee on Housing, Construction and
22 Community Development, Assembly Bill Number 3866B
23 and substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
24 Number 220B, Third Reading Calendar 1236.

25 Senator Cleare moves to discharge,

1 from the Committee on Crime Victims, Crime and
2 Correction, Assembly Bill Number 7194 and
3 substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
4 Number 3176, Third Reading Calendar 1270.

5 Senator Sanders moves to discharge,
6 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
7 Number 4219 and substitute it for the identical
8 Senate Bill 4193, Third Reading Calendar 1345.

9 Senator Fernandez moves to
10 discharge, from the Committee on Health,
11 Assembly Bill Number 5984B and substitute it for
12 the identical Senate Bill 7177B, Third Reading
13 Calendar 1351.

14 Senator Fernandez moves to
15 discharge, from the Committee on Finance,
16 Assembly Bill Number 9632 and substitute it for
17 the identical Senate Bill 9144, Third Reading
18 Calendar 1403.

19 Senator Walczyk moves to discharge,
20 from the Committee on Investigations and
21 Government Operations, Assembly Bill Number 10010
22 and substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
23 Number 9128, Third Reading Calendar 1426.

24 Senator Borrello moves to discharge,
25 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill

1 Number 7071A and substitute it for the identical
2 Senate Bill 6671A, Third Reading Calendar 1409.

3 Senator Felder moves to discharge,
4 from the Committee on Social Services,
5 Assembly Bill Number 9269B and substitute it for
6 the identical Senate Bill 8662A, Third Reading
7 Calendar 1508.

8 Senator Fernandez moves to
9 discharge, from the Committee on Codes,
10 Assembly Bill Number 10105B and substitute it for
11 the identical Senate Bill 9294A, Third Reading
12 Calendar 1450.

13 Senator Ramos moves to discharge,
14 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
15 Number 9265A and substitute it for the identical
16 Senate Bill 8608A, Third Reading Calendar 1507.

17 Senator Fernandez moves to
18 discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
19 Assembly Bill Number 8837C and substitute it for
20 the identical Senate Bill 8119C, Third Reading
21 Calendar 1496.

22 Senator Palumbo moves to discharge,
23 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
24 Number 10042A and substitute it for the identical
25 Senate Bill 9183B, Third Reading Calendar 1592.

1 Senator Ramos moves to discharge,
2 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
3 Number 8427A, and substitute it for the identical
4 Senate Bill 8203, Third Reading Calendar 1579.

5 Senator Comrie moves to discharge,
6 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
7 Number 9827 and substitute it for the identical
8 Senate Bill 9188, Third Reading Calendar 1593.

9 Senator Fernandez moves to
10 discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
11 Assembly Bill Number 10215A and substitute it for
12 the identical Senate Bill 9365A, Third Reading
13 Calendar 1596.

14 Senator Skoufis moves to discharge,
15 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
16 Number 10318 and substitute it for the identical
17 Senate Bill 9386, Third Reading Calendar 1597.

18 And Senator Lanza moves to
19 discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
20 Assembly Bill Number 10462 and substitute it for
21 the identical Senate Bill 9765, Third Reading
22 Calendar 1623.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: So
24 ordered.

25 Messages from the Governor.

1 Reports of standing committees.
2 Reports of select committees.
3 Communications and reports from
4 state officers.

5 Motions and resolutions.

6 Senator Gianaris.

7 SENATOR GIANARIS: Good afternoon,
8 Mr. President.

9 Let me begin by apologizing to our
10 nominees who have been waiting dutifully. Those
11 who have had experience with the Legislature know
12 how it is. It should be just a few moments
13 longer, and we'll get right to them.

14 Let's begin by recognizing
15 Senator Scarcella-Spanton first for an
16 introduction.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
18 Scarcella-Spanton for an introduction.

19 SENATOR SCARCELLA-SPANTON: Thank
20 you.

21 I rise today to welcome the
22 Coney Island Sharks, Sharkettes, and the
23 South Brooklyn Youth Alliance, who I see giving
24 me a big wave. Anybody you see in the room
25 today, that's them.

1 I wanted to especially thank
2 Coach Knight and Priscilla for leading the
3 charge, getting you guys up to Albany on the very
4 last day, and thank you for your patience.

5 The Coney Island Sharks, hailing
6 from Coney Island, Brooklyn, has been a
7 community-based organization for the past
8 33 years, providing free youth programming that
9 not only includes sports like football, but life
10 skills, through mentoring, tutoring,
11 Youth Council, arts, and community service.

12 The South Brooklyn Youth Alliance is
13 part of the incredible Coney Island Sharks and
14 Sharkettes program and allows participants, young
15 people ages 8 to 18 -- but I think I've seen some
16 even younger than 8, if you've got little
17 siblings up there -- to voice their concerns on
18 issues concerning their communities and their
19 lives.

20 It also gives them a platform to
21 advocate with government representatives and
22 local businesses, to advocate for changes in
23 their community. Which is why I am so proud that
24 we were able to have you come up to Albany and do
25 just that today, for the second year in a row.

1 The Coney Island Sharks and
2 Sharkettes are a household name in Coney Island
3 and participate in so many of our community
4 events, including mostly every single one that I
5 have for my office. So thank you. You always
6 have great entertainment.

7 This program is truly a prime
8 example of investing in our young people and
9 giving them the skills, resources and
10 opportunities to thrive and succeed. I am so
11 incredibly grateful for the incredible work and
12 support of the Sharks and Sharkettes coach and
13 mentors throughout all the years, and it is my
14 honor to have you here today. And I'll be seeing
15 you home, since this is the last day of session.

16 So thank you.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
18 you, Senator.

19 (Applause from gallery.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: To our
21 guests, I welcome you on behalf of the Senate.
22 We extend to you the privileges and courtesies of
23 this house.

24 Please rise and be recognized.

25 (Standing ovation.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
2 Gianaris.

3 SENATOR GIANARIS: Okay, let's
4 stick with Senator Scarcella-Spanton and take up
5 previously adopted Resolution 2626, read that
6 resolution's title and recognize
7 Senator Scarcella-Spanton.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
9 Secretary will read.

10 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 2626, by
11 Senator Scarcella-Spanton, mourning the death of
12 Pastor Constance Marie Hulla, renowned religious
13 leader, distinguished citizen, and devoted member
14 of her community.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
16 Scarcella-Spanton on the resolution.

17 SENATOR SCARCELLA-SPANTON: Thank
18 you, Mr. President.

19 And I actually really did want the
20 Coney Island Sharks to be present for this
21 resolution, because everybody here knew
22 Pastor Connie and knew her well.

23 I proudly rise today to introduce a
24 resolution in honor of our renowned religious
25 leader, distinguished citizen, and a devoted

1 member of our community, Pastor Constance
2 Marie Hulla, known by all of the Coney Island
3 community as Pastor Connie.

4 Unfortunately, Pastor Connie died on
5 Tuesday, May 21, 2024, at the age of 75 years
6 old, and our loss was widely felt across the
7 entire community. She was viewed by so many as
8 the mother of Coney Island, and rightfully so.
9 Both inside and outside of the walls of the
10 Coney Island Gospel Assembly, Pastor Connie
11 faithfully led her community and stood as a
12 beacon of light to those seeking strength,
13 comfort and wisdom, offering services to those in
14 need without question.

15 Pastor Connie was truly a pillar of
16 the Coney Island community, and I had the
17 privilege of working alongside of her during my
18 time as a Senator and while I worked for my
19 predecessor, Senator Diane Savino. I deeply
20 appreciate all that she has shared with me. Her
21 love and care for her community was clear to
22 anyone who spent even just a minute with her. I
23 am certain that her spirit will live on through
24 everything she has done and all the lives that
25 she has touched.

1 And as a matter of fact, the last
2 time I actually saw her was at an awards ceremony
3 for the Coney Island Sharks. So I will always be
4 appreciative of that. And thank you for being
5 here to hear this today as well.

6 I am proud to present this
7 resolution in mourning of Pastor Constance Hulla.

8 Thank you.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
10 you, Senator.

11 The resolution was adopted on
12 June 4th.

13 Senator Gianaris.

14 SENATOR GIANARIS: Now,
15 Mr. President, I believe there's a report of the
16 Judiciary Committee at the desk. Can we please
17 take that up.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
19 Secretary will read.

20 THE SECRETARY: Senator
21 Hoylman-Sigal, from the Committee on Judiciary,
22 reports the following nominations.

23 As Judges of the Court of Claims:
24 R. Nadine Fontaine, Elizabeth Burns,
25 Jeffrey Pearlman, Carolyn Genovesi,

1 Peter Weinmann, Anna Grimaldi,
2 Francisco Calderon, Amy N. Quinn,
3 Veronica Guerrero, Melissa Catalan De Jesus,
4 Stephanie Saunders, Stephen Thomas Miller,
5 Scott Odorisi, Edwina Richardson,
6 Richard E. Sise, Brian Haak, Javier Vargas and
7 Debra Givens.

8 As Interim Justices of the
9 Supreme Court: Margaret Clancy, Edward King,
10 Rupert Barry, Denise Sher and Laura Ward.

11 And as Interim Judges of the
12 Rockland County Court: Djinsad Desir and
13 David M. Asher.

14 SENATOR GIANARIS: Move to accept
15 the report of the Judiciary Committee, and please
16 recognize Senator Hoylman-Sigal.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: All those
18 in favor of accepting the report of the
19 Judiciary Committee signify by saying aye.

20 (Response of "Aye.")

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Opposed,
22 nay.

23 (No response.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
25 report of the Judiciary Committee is accepted.

1 Senator Hoylman-Sigal on the
2 nominations.

3 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Thank you,
4 Mr. President.

5 I rise to submit this report from
6 the Judiciary Committee and move the slate of
7 judges, most of whom we have here today in the
8 gallery.

9 So welcome to you and your
10 families -- and the Sharks and Sharkettes. You
11 know, we're used to sharks in Albany; it's good
12 to see a different variety.

13 (Laughter.)

14 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: These
15 judges have been nominated by the Governor, and
16 credit to the Governor for the diverse selection
17 that she has provided this body for the Court of
18 Claims, interim justices of the Supreme Court,
19 and interim judges of the Rockland County Court.

20 We heard from these nominees in the
21 Judiciary Committee yesterday, and I want to
22 thank my colleagues on the committee for being so
23 thoughtful in their questioning -- on both sides
24 of the aisle.

25 In fact, it was commented by one of

1 our colleagues in realtime that they admired the
2 bipartisan nature of our review of these
3 nominations, particularly as compared to our
4 counterparts in Washington, D.C.

5 I'm happy to say, Mr. President,
6 that this year's slate of 25 candidates do
7 represent a variety of diverse personal,
8 geographic and professional backgrounds, from
9 attorneys with Legal Aid experience, to
10 prosecutors, to those who spent their career
11 within the court system itself.

12 Congratulations to all the nominees
13 and their families, again, who are here with us
14 today.

15 Mr. President, with that I move the
16 nominations to the floor and ask that you please
17 recognize any Senator who wishes to speak on
18 these nominations. Thank you.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
20 you, Senator.

21 Recognize Senator Ryan on the
22 nominations. There you are, sorry. Thank you.

23 SENATOR RYAN: So sitting on the
24 Judiciary Committee yesterday, it was a great
25 privilege to see judges from so many different

1 backgrounds, so many different parts of the
2 state, but one thing in common: Everybody was
3 committed to seeking justice and recognizing the
4 role the judiciary plays in the stability of our
5 democracy.

6 There's a few reappointments of
7 folks I know: Two Buffalonians, Judge Saunders
8 and Judge Givens, and a former colleague from the
9 Assembly, Brian Haak. I congratulate each of you
10 on your reappointment.

11 And there's a new judge appointed,
12 it will be Judge Peter Weinmann. So
13 Judge Weinmann -- for the first time I'll call
14 you that -- what a great success story. Peter's
15 mother is with him today, Margit. Margit fled
16 Nazi Germany, and she came to America, and what
17 an American success story, from fleeing
18 Nazi Germany to having a son who's being
19 nominated today to be a judge in New York State.

20 Peter is a well-respected attorney.
21 He is known for his professionalism and for his
22 integrity. He and his wife Amelida are
23 absolutely committed to our Western New York
24 community. They're active in philanthropic
25 causes. His family cannot be with him today

1 because some of them are out of the country, but
2 I know Madeleine, Benjamin, Aaron and Lillian are
3 all watching today.

4 So I wish you congratulations. I
5 know you're going to be great on the bench and
6 you're going to be a great representative from
7 the Western New York judiciary.

8 Congratulations, Judge Weinmann.

9 (Applause from the gallery.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
11 you, Senator.

12 Senator Krueger on the nominations.

13 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you,
14 Mr. President.

15 So people often see me standing up
16 here to talk about the nominees given to us by
17 the Governor. But it's not the judges. I don't
18 have to do the judges; that goes through
19 Judiciary. Everyone else comes through Finance.
20 And people might also know I don't get involved
21 with judge endorsements, because I'm not a lawyer
22 and really the only thing I could ask them is,
23 you know, how well they handled themselves at a
24 cocktail party. And that never seemed like a
25 good basis for deciding who should be our judges.

1 But I am standing here today both to
2 congratulate all of you, but also to specifically
3 point out new Court of Claims Judge Jeff
4 Pearlman, who I feel very confident I can speak
5 about because, when I first joined the Senate
6 almost 23 and a half years ago, Jeff was my first
7 counsel. And what an amazing counsel he proved
8 to be, when I hadn't a clue what I was supposed
9 to be doing as a new Senator and he knew exactly
10 how to guide me along the right path to learn the
11 ropes, to learn how to handle myself in this
12 complicated city and chamber.

13 And he hasn't been my lawyer for a
14 very long time, but he has remained a close
15 friend and a close advisor. And so I am just
16 delighted that he will now be on the Court of
17 Claims doing what I know he will do so well on
18 behalf of the people of New York State -- and you
19 all will do so well on behalf of the people of
20 New York State.

21 And since today we're having
22 discussions about congestion pricing and whether
23 it would be legal to cancel it, I'm hoping one of
24 you might have this in your court soon, because I
25 don't believe it is legal and that somebody

1 should sue the Governor on this issue.

2 So thanking her for giving you all
3 of us. Do great jobs. Thank you.

4 (Laughter.)

5 (Applause from the gallery.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
7 you, Senator.

8 Senator Gounardes on the
9 nominations.

10 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Thank you,
11 Mr. President.

12 I want to first commend
13 Senator Hoylman-Sigal for chairing, yet again,
14 another great Judiciary hearing yesterday,
15 ushering through 25 nominees. We heard from lots
16 of great judicial candidates yesterday -- varied
17 life experiences, coming to these nominations, to
18 this position in their careers, from different
19 walks of life, different backgrounds, different
20 upbringings, all of which are incredibly
21 important.

22 I'm incredibly proud that I can be
23 among the first to congratulate my friend
24 Judge Melissa De Jesus, who I have the privilege
25 of knowing for more than 15 years, and who's

1 someone who I went to law school with, along with
2 her husband John, who's here.

3 And I know you're going to do a
4 fantastic job and make the entire State of
5 New York proud once you take your place on that
6 bench.

7 And for my colleagues here, I just
8 want to share two sentences that Melissa included
9 in her application for judicial consideration,
10 which I think speaks to the values that I hope we
11 all are searching for when we are approving
12 judicial nominees. She said: "I believe that
13 the most important lessons I have learned over my
14 career were not about evidentiary rules or
15 voir dire, as essential as those practical skills
16 may be, but rather how public trust in our courts
17 often depends on seeing that those in power both
18 reflect and understand the histories, cultural
19 contexts, and life experiences of the people who
20 appear before them. When New Yorkers walk into a
21 courtroom and see the rich diversity of their
22 communities in the faces around them, they can
23 believe that they will be heard with empathy,
24 understanding and sensitivity."

25 And I'll also note, Mr. President,

1 that I believe Melissa, Judge De Jesus, will be
2 the first Filipina statewide judge in the State
3 of New York, and for that we also congratulate
4 you.

5 So congratulations to all of you,
6 and especially Judge De Jesus.

7 Thank you.

8 (Applause from gallery.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
10 you, Senator.

11 Senator Weber on the nominations.

12 SENATOR WEBER: Thank you,
13 Mr. President.

14 I want to rise to congratulate all
15 of the nominees today, and I want to highlight
16 two that I have come to know over the last number
17 of years.

18 We have Judge Desir, who's currently
19 a Town of Ramapo judge; we also have Judge David
20 Asher here, who's here, who's also a Clarkstown
21 judge. Two men that I've gotten to know over the
22 years as being honest, fair, and having a real
23 true love of the law.

24 So I'm proud to congratulate them
25 today, to congratulate all the other nominees.

1 I'll be proudly voting aye for everyone.

2 Thank you.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
4 you, Senator.

5 (Applause from gallery.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
7 Breslin on the nominations.

8 SENATOR BRESLIN: Thank you very
9 much, Mr. Chairman.

10 And as I rise as a member of the
11 Judiciary Committee for some 27 years, and being
12 the Senator from Albany, I know more than one who
13 are up there.

14 And as Senator Krueger talked about
15 Jeff Pearlman, I'm also a good friend of
16 Jeff Pearlman, and he'll make an excellent
17 addition to the bench.

18 And I look around, Amy Quinn from
19 the North Country -- again, another excellent
20 selection. And I might emphasize the diversity
21 in this group and the resumes of this group far
22 surpass any group I have seen in all of my years
23 here.

24 And then, after that, we have --
25 they took somebody from the Assembly who I served

1 with on the Ethics Commission. That's Brian
2 Haak, who will continue to do a great job as a
3 judge as he has in his number of years in the
4 Assembly.

5 And the chief judge, the chief judge
6 is Richard Sise, who's been in the Court of
7 Claims 24 years, under different
8 administrations --

9 (Applause from gallery.)

10 SENATOR BRESLIN: And it makes me
11 think, why would anyone want to stay in a job
12 more than 20 years?

13 (Laughter.)

14 SENATOR BRESLIN: But then I -- I
15 gave myself the proper answer.

16 And finally, finally, I have the
17 distinct pleasure of introducing Francisco
18 Calderon. Francisco, stand up.

19 And he fills all the boxes. And
20 when I say all the boxes, he was born in
21 Brooklyn, which some of us hold against him --
22 but he was born in Brooklyn, he's fluent in
23 Spanish, was a Fresh Air kid upstate for a little
24 bit when he was younger, attended college at
25 Siena, our local college, and then law school.

1 And he's been -- he's already checked a few
2 boxes -- married, with a wife and three children.
3 And I think of the jobs he's held, as a
4 prosecutor, the Albany County District Attorney's
5 office, as a public defender, as a trial lawyer
6 of renown in our community, and now a City Court
7 judge in Cohoes.

8 But most importantly, he has the
9 temperament, the temperament that we all cry out
10 for. And many lawyers in this chamber know
11 exactly what I mean. We don't want -- we don't
12 want judges who can't feel and do the right thing
13 in court and have a sensitivity for everyone who
14 appears in front of them. And I think in
15 Francisco Calderon we have that kind of a person.

16 And I congratulate you, Francisco.
17 I look forward to you serving for many years to
18 come. Congratulations.

19 (Applause from gallery.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
21 you, Senator.

22 Senator Webb on the nominations.

23 SENATOR WEBB: Thank you,
24 Mr. President.

25 I rise enthusiastically to lift up

1 one of our nominees who's from my district,
2 Senate District 52, and that is Elizabeth Burns.
3 She hails from Cortland.

4 And just a few things I want to
5 share with you about Elizabeth. She is someone
6 that comes from a family legacy of public
7 servants, and her parents, it started right with
8 them. Both her mother and father were involved
9 in the community. Her mother served on the
10 Cortland County Legislature for several years,
11 and her father helped to play a role in the
12 building of the I-81 interstate -- and we all are
13 familiar with that in this chamber most
14 certainly.

15 She currently serves as the
16 Cortland City Court judge. Also, prior to that
17 role, she served as a county attorney, a court
18 attorney referee, also a special counsel for the
19 town/village courts in all counties associated
20 with the Sixth Judicial District.

21 She is also someone that for --
22 anyone that knows Elizabeth knows that she takes
23 being a judge very seriously, and by that the
24 values of fairness and justice not only follow
25 her in the courtroom, but in the community. And

1 so not only does her service extend as it
2 pertains to being a judge; she also prioritizes
3 education, as someone who is a former board
4 member of the board of trustees of
5 Tompkins Cortland Community College, also known
6 as TC3.

7 And so I know we have a whole
8 incredible slate of nominees. And so, again,
9 this cohort, as my esteemed colleague
10 Senator Breslin lifted up, truly is an example of
11 some great leaders that will continue to bring
12 justice and fairness to our judicial system. I
13 proudly vote aye.

14 And thank you, Mr. President. And
15 congratulations, Elizabeth, who's right here in
16 our chamber, for your continued good work.

17 Thank you.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
19 you, Senator.

20 (Appause from gallery.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
22 Sepúlveda on the nominations.

23 SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA: Thank you,
24 Mr. President, for allowing me to speak on these
25 nominations.

1 Francisco Calderon, a great example
2 to many of us. He came from Brooklyn, like I
3 did.

4 Veronica Guerrero, who comes from
5 the greatest county in the world, and that's the
6 Bronx. Veronica did great work, lifted herself
7 up, became a lawyer, and is now serving -- and
8 will serve in the Court of Claims and make us
9 proud.

10 I also want to thank the
11 Acting Presiding Judge Sise, because from what
12 I've been told, he does a great job in the Court
13 of Claims.

14 And a particular individual that I
15 want to point out, Judge Javier Vargas. Javier
16 came to New York from a little town called
17 Arecibo, Puerto Rico, with a population of
18 87,000 people only. Javier suffered many of the
19 indignities of being an openly gay man on the
20 island, but that didn't stop him. He came here,
21 he educated himself, law degrees, worked with the
22 appellate division, several appellate divisions,
23 and the Court of Appeals.

24 I encourage all of you to go visit
25 Arecibo, Puerto Rico. It's a very small town.

1 And when you see where he comes from and where he
2 is now, he is an incredible human being. He's
3 going to make us proud. He's already made us
4 proud. But I know that he's going to continue to
5 do a wonderful job in the Court of Claims. He's
6 a role model for many Latinos, for many
7 individuals, and I'm proud to lift him up and
8 mention him here today.

9 I also want to thank Brad Hoylman,
10 Senator Hoylman, for a great job on the
11 Judiciary Committee. I want to thank all -- I
12 want to congratulate all of the nominees.

13 And I want to thank my colleagues on
14 the committee. Because, unlike what we see in
15 the rest of the country, what you saw there was
16 people that were definitely looking at details,
17 people that wanted to work together to analyze
18 the candidates without the vitriol that we see in
19 Washington and other places in this country. We
20 really, really did a wonderful job as a group,
21 all members on both sides of the aisle, and I'm
22 proud to call myself today a member of the
23 Judiciary Committee.

24 And I'm proud today to highlight
25 some of the great judges that will be serving on

1 the Court of Claims. Thank you.

2 (Applause from gallery.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
4 you, Senator.

5 Senator Bailey on the nominations.

6 SENATOR BAILEY: Thank you,
7 Mr. President.

8 I applaud the Governor for
9 letting -- continuing to make New York -- the
10 bench of New York look like actual New York.
11 What a thought process. Right? Before, you
12 know, those who were practicing long before I was
13 would walk into courtrooms and see people that
14 looked nothing like them, that had no ability to
15 relate to who they are, where they were from, or
16 what language they spoke.

17 But today is a new day. And I'm
18 here to congratulate all of you amazing nominees,
19 but two in particular. I may not be -- you may
20 not be shocked that they're both from the Bronx.

21 (Laughter.)

22 SENATOR BAILEY: More than
23 reappointing the amazing Edwina Richardson --
24 she's a reappointment and she comes from CUNY
25 Law School. And she's -- she's been someone who

1 has always been consistently present, not just on
2 the bench but present in terms of increasing
3 diversity on the bench, present in terms of
4 coming back to talk to BLSA and LALSA at
5 law school.

6 We don't forget those things as
7 young aspiring attorneys. When a member of your
8 school, somebody that graduated from where you
9 graduated from, that's on the bench, that takes
10 the time to come back to their alma mater to show
11 you that the positive -- excuse me, that that's
12 possible -- it means a great deal.

13 And the second is going to be a new
14 addition to the bench, Ms. Veronica Guerrero.
15 Veronica has had a storied legal career, and
16 she's had support from so many different areas in
17 the community, whether it be the judicial
18 community, hearing from other judges who have
19 practiced with her in the past, community
20 residents in areas that she doesn't do -- people
21 that she went to high school with.

22 We had all types of people giving us
23 calls about Veronica, and they all had the same
24 thing to say at the end of the day: Veronica
25 Guerrero will do you proud as a member of the

1 bench. She will not make you for a second think
2 about the decision that you made to support her.

3 And so I applaud all of my
4 colleagues. And Senator Hoylman-Sigal, again, an
5 artful, as always, hearing committee process.

6 And I encourage all of you to
7 continue to dispense justice fairly and equitably
8 and truly let justice be blind. And I applaud
9 you all on your nominations.

10 Thank you, Mr. President.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
12 you.

13 (Applause from gallery.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
15 Martins on the nominations.

16 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,
17 Mr. President.

18 I also rise to support the
19 nomination of all of these judges.

20 As a member of the
21 Judiciary Committee, as Senator Sepúlveda
22 mentioned, we had an opportunity yesterday to get
23 to know all of them a little bit. And some of
24 them were familiar to us because of where we come
25 from and our own backgrounds and our own legal

1 backgrounds. And perhaps some of them we had
2 appeared before, and so were able to relay some
3 of those experiences.

4 But I will tell you that to a
5 person, the idea that we have a group of nominees
6 who are sensitive to their role as judges, to how
7 they treat people who come before them, both
8 professionally and as members who are there
9 perhaps of the public for the first time, and
10 their responsibility to do so in a way that is
11 equitable, responsible and empathetic.

12 So I too rise, I want to recognize a
13 couple of members who are part of this group from
14 my own County of Nassau, which we all know here
15 in the chamber is truly the best county in
16 New York State.

17 (Laughter; applause.)

18 SENATOR MARTINS: And that is our
19 Supreme Court Justice Denise Sher, who has had a
20 wonderful career on the bench and has been a
21 wonderful jurist and continues to be, and I'm
22 glad to see that she will continue to serve as a
23 member of the bench in Nassau County.

24 I also want to recognize a newly
25 appointed Court of Claims judge, Carolyn

1 Genovesi, who we expect great things from and I
2 know certainly will be a great addition.

3 But Mr. President, I also want to
4 take the opportunity to recognize how important
5 it is that we have judges that are going to apply
6 the law. We have members here, and it bears
7 pointing out, who are public defenders. We have
8 members who were prosecutors. We have members
9 here who have done both and sat on the bench and
10 be able to provide what is most important, which
11 is an equitable application of the law for anyone
12 who comes before them. And that's all that we
13 should all be caring about when we decide who
14 will sit or not sit on a bench presiding over
15 cases in New York State.

16 And I would be remiss,
17 Mr. President, if I didn't take the opportunity,
18 since we are here in this great chamber
19 recognizing these wonderful nominees, if we
20 didn't take a moment to also recognize one of our
21 own who has spent 27 years on the
22 Judiciary Committee, and we will miss him.

23 Senator Breslin, God bless you.

24 Thank you.

25 (Applause.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
2 you, Senator.

3 Senator Tedisco on the nominations.

4 SENATOR TEDISCO: Thank you,
5 Mr. President.

6 I want to also congratulate all our
7 judges today for their service and thank them for
8 what I know is going to be an outstanding job as
9 they work across our state.

10 I especially want to try to answer
11 Senator Breslin's question about the Honorable
12 Richard E. Sise. He said, How could he possibly
13 serve 24 years? Well, the answer to that is --
14 because I know Dick pretty well -- is that I've
15 got two decades on that right now.

16 So I think he and I have something
17 in common. And that is when we step out of our
18 beds in the morning, we kind of feel like
19 Lou Gehrig. Remember when Lou Gehrig was out in
20 Yankee Stadium and he stood up and he said "Right
21 now" -- and he was in a bad situation -- "I feel
22 I'm the luckiest man on the face of the earth."
23 That's what Judge Dick Sise feels every single
24 day, because he loves the job he does. And
25 Senator Jim Tedisco loves the job he does also.

1 And I can tell that because of his
2 zeal, because of the effort he puts forth, and
3 because of the kind of character and quality of a
4 person that he is.

5 So as I congratulate all of the
6 individuals, I thank the man who loves the job he
7 does, as I love the job I do. And when you have
8 somebody who's in that type of position, you ask
9 that question, they tell you, I'm just a rookie.
10 I got many more years to go. And I think
11 Judge Dick Sise has many more years to go, as --
12 I'm sorry to say to some of you on that side --
13 does Senator Jim Tedisco.

14 (Laughter.)

15 SENATOR TEDISCO: So
16 congratulations, everybody. And congratulations
17 to Dick Sise. Great job.

18 (Applause from gallery.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
20 you, Senator.

21 The question is on the nominations.
22 Call the roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
25 the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: In relation to the
2 nominations, those Senators voting in the
3 negative are Senators Griffo, Helming, Murray and
4 Weik.

5 Ayes, 56. Nays, 4.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
7 nominees are confirmed.

8 Please rise and be recognized.

9 (Sustained standing ovation.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
11 Gianaris.

12 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
13 there's also a report of the Finance Committee at
14 the desk. Let's take that up.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
16 Secretary will read.

17 THE SECRETARY: Senator Krueger,
18 from the Committee on Finance, reports the
19 following nominations.

20 As a member of the State Board of
21 Parole: Laura El-Bahtity.

22 As a member of the Public Service
23 Commission: Radina Valova.

24 As members of the Battery Park City
25 Authority: Angela Pinsky and Clinton L. Plummer.

1 As director of the New York
2 Convention Center Operating Corporation:
3 Lee H. Perlman.

4 As a member of the Roosevelt Island
5 Operating Corporation: Conway Ekpo.

6 As members of the Urban Development
7 Corporation: Francine DelMonte and
8 Laureen Harris.

9 As a member of Ogdensburg Bridge and
10 Port Authority: Nicole Terminelli.

11 As a member of the Port Authority:
12 Elizabeth Fine.

13 As a member of the Citizens' Policy
14 and Complaint Review Council: Tammi Chaboty.

15 As a member of the Allegany State
16 Park, Recreation and Historic Preservation
17 Commission: Margaret Gray.

18 As members of the State Council on
19 the Arts: Janet Langsam, Amy B. Hau,
20 Monica Ramirez-Montagut, Brian Higgins,
21 Maria Lora, Patrick Willingham and
22 Peter Pockriss.

23 As members of the Board of Visitors
24 of the Finger Lakes Developmental Disabilities
25 Services Office: Jeffrey Thomas and

1 Kathleen Button.

2 As members of the New York State
3 Energy Research and Development Authority:
4 Dale S. Bryk, Joanne L. Hewett, Lindsay S. Greene
5 and Jennifer Hensley.

6 As members of the Helen Hayes
7 Hospital Board of Visitors: Ivonne S. Santos and
8 Robert D'Amelio.

9 As members of the Behavioral Health
10 Services Advisory Council: Alicia A. McFarlane,
11 April Aycock, Debbian Fletcher-Blake and
12 Traci Donnelly.

13 As a member of the Board of Visitors
14 of the Creedmoor Psychiatric Center:
15 Ellen Gordon.

16 As members of the Board of Visitors
17 of the Elmira Psychiatric Center: Jill Kasprzyk,
18 Salvatore Garozzo and Susan Gray.

19 (Off the record.)

20 THE SECRETARY: And also, as
21 members of the Board of Visitors of the
22 Kingsboro Psychiatric Center: Katrina Jeffries
23 and Maryellen Goble.

24 As a member of the Board of Visitors
25 of the Manhattan Psychiatric Center:

1 Deborah A. Wance.

2 As a member of the Board of Visitors
3 of the New York City Children's Center:

4 Jonnel C. Doris.

5 As a member of the Board of Visitors
6 of the Rockland Psychiatric Center:

7 Anne McGrory.

8 As a member of the South Beach
9 Psychiatric Center: Joseph Conte.

10 As Major Generals of the New York
11 Army National Guard: Brigadier General Jack A.
12 James, Brigadier General Isabel R. Smith,
13 Brigadier General Michele L. Kilgore and
14 Brigadier General Michael W. Bank.

15 SENATOR GIANARIS: Now I move to
16 accept the report of the Finance Committee and
17 ask that you recognize Senator Krueger.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: All those
19 in favor of accepting the report of the
20 Finance Committee signify by saying aye.

21 (Response of "Aye.")

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Opposed,
23 nay.

24 (No response.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The

1 report of the Finance Committee is accepted.

2 Senator Krueger on the nominations.

3 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you.

4 Aren't we all glad this is the last
5 day we're doing this for a while?

6 I want to, first off, thank the
7 Governor for sending us a very extensive list of
8 confirmees who have met all of the requirements
9 through the review and vetting and interviews
10 with individual members and votes through
11 committees.

12 Just two of the people on this very
13 long list are actually being accepted as paid
14 employees full-time for the State of New York.
15 One is Radina Valova to be the third new member
16 of the Public Service Commission, and
17 Laura El-Bahtity to be a member of the
18 State Board of Parole.

19 I can say that I have interviewed
20 both of those candidates, have seen them come
21 through multiple committees, and they're
22 extraordinarily qualified for their new, very
23 important positions in the State of New York.

24 But we also have an extraordinary
25 list of people being nominated and confirmed to

1 other important agencies in the State of
2 New York. And as I often try to point out, these
3 are basically responsibilities that come with a
4 lot of work and a lot of time and pretty much no
5 money, because they're just per diem
6 reimbursements when they have to travel to get to
7 their appointments.

8 And thank goodness people are
9 willing to be volunteers on various of these
10 important commissions and committees that assure
11 that our agencies are working the best they can
12 on behalf of all 20 million New Yorkers.

13 I also just want to highlight that
14 four of the people today are Brigadier Generals
15 with the New York State Army National Guard, and
16 they are technically I guess funded through the
17 federal government, nominated through the
18 National Guard process, but also being confirmed
19 on this floor today. And we know how much we
20 count on our National Guard for so many
21 responsibilities in the State of New York -- more
22 and more, it seems.

23 So I hope all of my colleagues will
24 join me in voting yes on everyone today. But of
25 course you have the right to individually choose

1 to vote no on any selected person or people and
2 to let the front know if that's the case.

3 So thank you very much. Appreciate
4 it, Mr. President.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
6 you, Senator Krueger.

7 Senator Ryan on the nominations.

8 SENATOR RYAN: Thank you,
9 Mr. President.

10 I rise today in support of the
11 nomination of Laura El-Bahtity for Parole Board.

12 Why don't you stand up, Laura.
13 Minutes ago you had all these people around you,
14 but the judges all left, so --

15 (Laughter.)

16 SENATOR RYAN: Laura approached me
17 about two years ago to talk about being on the
18 Parole Board.

19 And she's from outside of the public
20 life; she's a dedicated public defender, she
21 spent two decades providing defense to indigent
22 criminal defendants. She's a Legal Aid lawyer.
23 She has institutional knowledge of the
24 complexities surrounding the parole system. She
25 spoke about her extensive legal background, but

1 also her commitment to constructive post-release
2 environments, which is just critical both for
3 people reentering but for public safety as a
4 whole.

5 And I of course was committed to
6 helping her get on the Parole Board. I'm so
7 happy that she wanted to come in to the more
8 public side of life to do this.

9 Laura in herself, in addition to
10 having a great resume -- you know, B.A. from
11 University at Albany, J.D. from Albany Law
12 School -- but she's also a first-generation
13 Egyptian American. Her mom can't be with us
14 today, but she is in Egypt. And she, along with
15 other members of the extended family, are
16 watching this on simulcast, so we have an
17 international audience today.

18 Her children, Layla and Luca,
19 they're also watching on the livestream. And
20 she's joined by her sister Lotus, who's a teacher
21 in Albany.

22 So you're a great success story.
23 Your parents came to America to seek a better way
24 of life. And here you are today in front of the
25 New York State Senate.

1 But here's what I'll say about Laura
2 that really I think will make her the best for
3 the Parole Board. She's a joyous person. She
4 exudes positive energy. She has a wonderful
5 personality. She's a consensus decisionmaker.
6 But on top of that, she's decisive and has a
7 sharp intellect.

8 Twenty years' experience, your
9 background, you are just what the Parole Board
10 needs. And it's my honor to stand in favor of
11 your nomination.

12 And I thank Governor Hochul for
13 recognizing, you know, your skills and talent,
14 and I thank Senator Salazar for helping usher you
15 through this process.

16 So congratulations to you, Laura.

17 (Applause.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
19 you, Senator.

20 Senator Salazar on the nominations.

21 SENATOR SALAZAR: Thank you,
22 Mr. President.

23 I also would like to congratulate
24 Laura El-Bahtity on her nomination to serve on
25 the New York State Board of Parole.

1 As Senator Ryan has already noted,
2 her extensive legal expertise, her decades of
3 experience working with indigent clients makes
4 her well-qualified to serve on the Parole Board.

5 Her nomination to the board gives me
6 hope, and her willingness to serve inspires me.
7 And I'm very proud to vote aye on her nomination
8 today.

9 Thank you.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
11 you, Senator.

12 Senator Fernandez on the
13 nominations.

14 SENATOR FERNANDEZ: Thank you,
15 Mr. President.

16 I rise to speak in support of
17 Dr. Debbian Fletcher-Blake. She's not here
18 today, but watching at home.

19 I wanted to congratulate her and
20 thank her for her lifelong work to substance use
21 disorder and the services needed, the support
22 needed to help everyone enter that path to
23 recovery.

24 She's currently the CEO of
25 VIP Community Services in the Bronx, in the heart

1 of the epidemic. And I know she will do
2 tremendous things and be a very big asset to the
3 fight against overdoses and addiction.

4 So congratulations, Dr. Debbi.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
6 you, Senator.

7 The question is on the nominations.

8 Call the roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: In relation to the
13 nominations, voting in the negative are
14 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
15 Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martinez,
16 Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt,
17 Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Weber
18 and Weik.

19 Ayes, 40. Nays, 20.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
21 nominees are confirmed.

22 Please rise and be recognized.

23 (Standing ovation.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
25 Gianaris.

1 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President, I
2 move to adopt the Resolution Calendar, with the
3 exception of Resolutions 2649, 2663 and 2682.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: All in
5 favor of adopting the Resolution Calendar, with
6 the exception of Resolutions 2649, 2663, and
7 2682, please signify by saying aye.

8 (Response of "Aye.")

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Opposed,
10 nay.

11 (No response.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
13 Resolution Calendar is adopted.

14 Senator Gianaris.

15 SENATOR GIANARIS: Okay, we are now
16 going to simultaneously take up the resolutions
17 while we have an immediate meeting of the
18 Rules Committee.

19 So please call a Rules Committee
20 meeting in Room 332 and take up Resolution 2649,
21 by Senator Hoylman-Sigal, read its title and
22 recognize Senator Hoylman-Sigal.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
24 Secretary will read.

25 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 2649, by

1 Senator Hoylman-Sigal, memorializing
2 Governor Kathy Hochul to proclaim June 2024 as
3 Gay Pride Month in the State of New York.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:
5 Simultaneously, there will be a meeting of the
6 Rules Committee in Room 332.

7 Senator Hoylman-Sigal on the
8 resolution.

9 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Thank you,
10 Mr. President.

11 I rise to speak on the resolution
12 commemorating LGBTQ Pride Month. Happy Pride to
13 all of my colleagues.

14 I represent a district on the
15 West Side of Manhattan which is one of the most
16 heavily populated with LGBTQIA+ New Yorkers,
17 although some of my colleagues might contend with
18 that because their populations are growing and
19 becoming more vocal and outward in their
20 expression of their true selves.

21 My district, Mr. President, runs
22 from Christopher Street on the west side all the
23 way up to West 103rd -- or, as we like to say in
24 my district, from the gay bars to Zabar's.

25 (Scattered laughter.)

1 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Thank you.

2 (Louder laughter.)

3 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: And
4 speaking of Christopher Street, Christopher
5 Street is the locale of the historic Stonewall
6 Inn, which on June 28, 1969 -- 55 years ago --
7 was the site of the upheaval that resulted in the
8 contemporary LGBTQ human rights movement.

9 So I'm honored to have the
10 Stonewall Inn in my district. I'm also honored
11 that this chamber, just yesterday, renamed,
12 Mr. President, the MTA station at Christopher
13 Street to be the Christopher Street-Stonewall
14 National Monument station.

15 As we all know, those Stonewall
16 protesters, like generations of LGBTQ people
17 before them, were subject to police harassment
18 and discrimination based simply because of who
19 they were and who they loved.

20 This uprising, this upheaval,
21 brought much-needed attention to the movement for
22 civil rights for the LGBTQ community and led to
23 the creation of LGBTQ human rights organizations,
24 movements, local ordinances and laws all across
25 the country.

1 One year after the Stonewall
2 Uprising, in June 1970, the first Pride marches
3 took place in New York City, Los Angeles and
4 San Francisco. And each year since the
5 Stonewall Uprising, Pride Month has been
6 celebrated with marches and other events being
7 held throughout New York State, including in many
8 of my colleagues' districts and throughout the
9 world.

10 Today, as we celebrate Pride and the
11 progress that has been made, we must also,
12 Mr. President, acknowledge how much work is left
13 to be done. LGBTQ people, specifically
14 transgender young people, and their families and
15 their physicians, are under attack. Right now
16 there are over 500 anti-LGBTQ bills targeting
17 transgender children specifically in state
18 legislative houses across the country. Four in
19 10 transgender youth live in the 25 states that
20 have banned, banned outright gender-affirming
21 care. And even in our own state we have elected
22 officials trying to raise their poll numbers on
23 the backs of transgender kids and their families
24 and strip away their rights.

25 But we know that in New York State,

1 love will always trump hate. And thanks to the
2 dedication of so many LGBTQ activists, New York
3 has a lot to celebrate. Last year we passed the
4 historic Transgender Safe Haven Law to officially
5 designate our state as a safe haven for trans
6 youth, their families and their healthcare
7 providers, ensuring that families from across the
8 country can come to New York State for legal
9 gender-affirming care, without fear of
10 prosecution.

11 And just this week this body
12 expanded upon those protections. In this session
13 we have also passed legislation that will end the
14 unfair criminalization and stigma of people
15 living with HIV/AIDS who have had consensual
16 relationships with other people.

17 We also have passed legislation to
18 increase access to PrEP and PEP, the lifesaving
19 drugs that stop HIV from being transmitted, by
20 prohibiting insurers from requiring prior
21 authorization.

22 And later today, Mr. President, we
23 will be passing a bill to finally bring New York
24 State in line with 48 other states -- with the
25 exception of our dear friends in Nebraska -- to

1 align our state with CDC guidelines to ensure
2 that every New Yorker has the opportunity to know
3 their HIV status.

4 And we also this session have passed
5 legislation requiring social media companies to
6 report their terms of service for online hate
7 speech, including homophobia and trans phobia.

8 I'm incredibly proud, Mr. President,
9 of all the work we've done under the fantastic
10 leadership of Andrea Stewart-Cousins and all of
11 my colleagues.

12 So as we close out this session and
13 look forward to New York City Pride on June 30th,
14 and giving a shout out to my fellow colleague in
15 my community, Jabari Brisport, I have one
16 request. As you meet with your LGBTQ
17 constituents and activists this summer and next
18 session, please keep all of the realities that
19 are having an impact on our transgender youth and
20 our young LGBTQ folks in mind. The rising
21 legislative and physical attacks on the
22 LGBTQ community are a glaring reminder that the
23 progress we've made thus far isn't a down payment
24 on the future. I take solace in knowing that
25 New Yorkers and New York State are committed to

1 fighting back.

2 I introduced this legislation to
3 celebrate the beauty and diversity of New York's
4 LGBTQ community, to be ambitious in our fight to
5 protect and expand LGBTQ rights and in particular
6 defend the rights of transgender youth.

7 Thank you, Mr. President. I vote
8 aye.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
10 you, Senator Hoylman-Sigal.

11 Senator Brisport on the resolution.

12 SENATOR BRISPORT: Thank you,
13 Mr. President.

14 And thank you, Senator
15 Hoylman-Sigal, my fellow member of the
16 Queer Caucus, for introducing this resolution.

17 There is a common sentiment in the
18 LGBTQ+ community that we come out of the closet
19 not for ourselves, but for each other. Not
20 everyone is in a position to live openly and
21 pridefully. But for those who are, doing so
22 builds our collective political power and makes
23 life better for all of us.

24 Over the past few years,
25 unfortunately, we've seen Republican leaders

1 double their efforts to demonize and silence us.
2 The right has very effectively fostered a
3 national climate in which those who hate
4 queer people feel a renewed permission to openly
5 target us. The situation has gotten so bad that
6 last year the Human Rights Campaign declared a
7 national state of emergency.

8 Our connection to our community is
9 all the more important under these conditions,
10 but that too has been targeted by the right.
11 Policies like Florida's "Don't Say Gay" rule let
12 teachers afraid to let slip any mention of their
13 spouses, while just a few months ago our own
14 Capitol hosted a far-right hate group advocating
15 to ban books that address gender and sexuality
16 from school libraries.

17 It is no accident that these kinds
18 of policies keep queerness hushed up.
19 Republicans know that to make queer people
20 believe we are alone, isolating us from our
21 community has always been one of the most
22 effective political weapons against us. And the
23 impacts of this go well beyond robbing queer
24 people of political agency. For queer children
25 in particular, not knowing about and having

1 access to the broader queer community is
2 life-threatening. It leaves them intensely
3 vulnerable to depression, bullying and suicide.

4 We exist, and every child should
5 learn this before they spend a single day
6 believing they're alone. So to any young queer
7 people watching, know this: You are not alone.
8 Your people are fighting for you even when you
9 cannot hear us. Your heritage is one of
10 greatness, of solidarity, and of a fierce,
11 determined, nation-shaping love. It will get
12 better, because together we will make it better.

13 And to all those wielding power to
14 spread hate and to erase queer people, I leave
15 you with this. In the end, you will lose. We
16 are more united, we are more determined, and we
17 are more fabulous than you could ever imagine.
18 We are the Alphabet Mafia. Generations have
19 fought for our right to be who we are, and we
20 will not go quietly back into the closet.

21 Thank you, Mr. President.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
23 you, Senator Brisport.

24 Senator Ramos on the resolution.

25 SENATOR RAMOS: Thank you,

1 Mr. President.

2 I rise as the proud State Senator
3 representing the second-largest LGBTQ community
4 in New York State.

5 In fact, Senator Hoylman-Sigal might
6 have the biggest population as his constituency,
7 but everybody knows that Pride Month in New York
8 State is kicked off by the Queens Pride Parade,
9 which just took place this past Sunday -- with
10 record attendance, over two hours long, filled
11 with the vibrant LGBTQ community on full display.
12 It's a parade that sadly started because of the
13 murder of Julio Rivera, a gay man who lived in
14 Jackson Heights and was killed by white
15 supremacists who were looking to, quote, unquote,
16 hunt someone that night.

17 And then a few years later, we
18 suffered the death of Edgar Garzon, who I knew as
19 a young girl, and was also a Columbian gay man
20 who was an incredible artist and gave us so much
21 hope and light.

22 My district is also home to
23 luminaries such is Lorena Borjas and
24 Cecilia Gentili -- who we lost this year -- and
25 of course Oswaldo Gomez, who was known as

1 Ms. Colombia and sported a colorful beard
2 everywhere he went.

3 We're also home to Friend's Tavern,
4 the oldest LGBTQ-owned bar in all of Queens.

5 And, well, the only other thing left
6 to celebrate is of course the incredible body of
7 work that's been done by this body under the
8 leadership of Andrea Stewart-Cousins and Brad
9 Hoylman-Sigal. We're so thankful to them for
10 their leadership on GENDA, on banning conversion
11 therapy and so much more.

12 But ultimately this celebration of
13 Pride is more than any one person. It really is
14 about the visibility that the community must
15 maintain in order for every single child in
16 New York to know that they are safe and that they
17 are loved for exactly who they are.

18 Thank you.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank you
20 Senator Ramos.

21 Senator May on the resolution.

22 SENATOR MAY: Thank you,
23 Mr. President.

24 I want to thank my New York City
25 colleagues for their eloquent comments. And I

1 need to lift up Syracuse as well, which has been
2 listed as one of the top 25 places to live in the
3 country if you are LGBTQ. It has features -- it
4 may be the largest Pride day celebration outside
5 of New York City in this state, and is really
6 getting a name for itself as a wonderful,
7 welcoming, accepting place for LGBTQ folks.

8 So I am really proud of Syracuse in
9 that way, and welcome everybody to come to our
10 Pride Festival later this month.

11 Thank you.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
13 you, Senator May.

14 The question is on the resolution.
15 All in favor signify by saying aye.

16 (Response of "Aye.")

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Opposed,
18 nay.

19 (No response.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
21 resolution is adopted.

22 Senator Serrano.

23 SENATOR SERRANO: Thank you.

24 Let's please take up
25 Resolution 2663, by Leader Andrea

1 Stewart-Cousins. Please read that resolution
2 title only and call on Senator Scarcella-Spanton
3 for the resolution.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
5 Secretary will read.

6 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 2663, by
7 Senator Stewart-Cousins, commemorating the
8 80th Anniversary of the D-Day Invasion on June 6,
9 2024.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
11 Scarcella-Spanton on the resolution.

12 SENATOR SCARCELLA-SPANTON: Thank
13 you, Mr. President.

14 And I would like to thank our
15 Majority Leader, Andrea Stewart-Cousins, for
16 carrying this resolution to the floor and leading
17 this house in memorializing D-Day.

18 Eighty years ago today, the combined
19 Allied forces, brave men from around the world,
20 and all walks of life, stormed the beaches of
21 Normandy to relieve Europe from the Axis powers.

22 From the air, the land and the sea,
23 our troops commenced what would be a year-long
24 journey to the heart of Germany to defeat the
25 fascist war machine.

1 My grandfather, my mom's dad, was
2 among the great men and women who made that push,
3 fighting hard through France and ultimately
4 joining General Patton at the Battle of the
5 Bulge.

6 While we recognize the importance of
7 this day for history, really truly we pause to
8 recognize those like my grandfather who we aptly
9 called the Greatest Generation. We owe a
10 tremendous debt of gratitude to them, both the
11 veterans who made it home and those who made the
12 ultimate sacrifice.

13 Thank you. And I proudly vote aye.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
15 you, Senator.

16 The question is on the resolution.
17 All in favor signify by saying aye.

18 (Response of "Aye.")

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Opposed,
20 nay.

21 (No response.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
23 resolution is adopted.

24 Senator Gianaris.

25 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,

1 the resolution sponsors would like to open them
2 up for cosponsorship.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
4 resolutions are open for cosponsorship.

5 Should you choose not to be a
6 cosponsor, please notify the desk.

7 Senator Gianaris.

8 SENATOR GIANARIS: There's a report
9 of the Rules Committee at the desk. Let's take
10 that up.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
12 Secretary will read.

13 THE SECRETARY: Senator
14 Stewart-Cousins, from the Committee on Rules,
15 reports the following bills:

16 Senate Print 902B, by
17 Senator Brisport, an act to amend the
18 Social Services Law;

19 Senate Print 1292A, by
20 Senator Parker, an act to amend the
21 Environmental Conservation Law;

22 Senate Print 2279C, by
23 Senator Cleare, an act to amend the
24 General Business Law;

25 Senate Print 2566B, by

1 Senator Cooney, an act to amend the Cannabis Law;

2 Senate Print 2812A, by

3 Senator Gounardes, an act to amend the

4 Vehicle and Traffic Law;

5 Senate Print 3144E, by

6 Senator Mannion, an act to amend the

7 Retirement and Social Security Law;

8 Senate Print 3250, by

9 Senator Salazar, an act to amend the

10 Correction Law;

11 Senate Print 3400A, by

12 Senator Breslin, an act to amend the

13 Public Health Law;

14 Senate Print 3565A, by

15 Senator Cleare, an act to amend the Arts and

16 Cultural Affairs Law;

17 Senate Print 3587A, by

18 Senator Helming, an act to amend the

19 Mental Hygiene Law;

20 Senate Print 4199, by

21 Senator Sanders, an act to amend the

22 Insurance Law;

23 Senate Print 4457A, by Senator Liu,

24 an act to amend the General Business Law;

25 Senate Print 5623A, by

1 Senator Krueger, an act to amend the
2 Judiciary Law;

3 Senate Print 5877A, by
4 Senator Salazar, an act to amend the
5 Correction Law;

6 Senate Print 6306B, by
7 Senator Jackson, an act to amend the
8 Retirement and Social Security Law;

9 Senate Print 6623, by
10 Senator Scarcella-Spanton, an act to amend
11 Chapter 154 of the Laws of 1921;

12 Senate Print 7128B, by
13 Senator Gounardes, an act to amend the
14 General Municipal Law;

15 Senate Print 7498A, by
16 Senator Jackson, an act to amend the
17 Retirement and Social Security Law;

18 Senate Print 7567A, by
19 Senator Sepúlveda, an act to amend the
20 Retirement and Social Security Law;

21 Senate Print 7649A, by
22 Senator Mannion, an act to amend the Canal Law;

23 Senate Print 7694A, by
24 Senator Gounardes, an act to amend the
25 General Business Law;

1 Senate Print 7695B, by
2 Senator Gounardes, an act to amend the
3 General Business Law;

4 Senate Print 7759A, by
5 Senator Gianaris, an act to amend the
6 Executive Law;

7 Senate Print 7810, by
8 Senator Cleare, an act to amend the
9 Public Health Law;

10 Senate Print 7837, by
11 Senator Mannion, an act to amend the
12 Volunteer Firefighters' Benefit Law;

13 Senate Print 8338A, by
14 Senator Borrello, an act to amend the
15 Highway Law;

16 Senate Print 8422C, by
17 Senator Skoufis, an act to amend the Penal Law;

18 Senate Print 8498A, by
19 Senator Comrie, an act to amend the State
20 Finance Law;

21 Senate Print 8506A, by
22 Senator Harckham, an act to amend the
23 General Business Law;

24 Senate Print 8715, by Senator Brouk,
25 an act to amend the Social Services Law;

1 Senate Print 8788, by
2 Senator Jackson, an act to amend the
3 Retirement and Social Security Law;

4 Senate Print 8907A, by
5 Senator Gonzalez, an act to direct the
6 Department of Health to complete a report on the
7 impact of hospital closures;

8 Senate Print 8932A, by
9 Senator Hinchey, an act to amend the
10 Environmental Conservation Law;

11 Senate Print 8958, by
12 Senator Hinchey, an act to amend the
13 General Municipal Law;

14 Senate Print 9049, by
15 Senator Scarcella-Spanton, an act to amend the
16 Public Health Law;

17 Senate Print 9050, by
18 Senator Hinchey, an act to amend the
19 Real Property Tax Law;

20 Senate Print 9085, by Senator
21 Martins, an act authorizing the County of Nassau
22 assessor to accept an application for a real
23 property tax exemption;

24 Senate Print 9283, by
25 Senator Kavanagh, an act to amend the

1 Public Health Law;

2 Senate Print 9332A, by
3 Senator Martins, an act in relation to
4 authorizing the Town of Oyster Bay to discontinue
5 as parklands and convey such parkland to the
6 Department of Environmental Conservation;

7 Senate Print 9339A, by
8 Senator Comrie, an act to enact the "New York
9 Utility Corporation Securitization Act";

10 Senate Print 9343, by
11 Senator Persaud, an act to amend the
12 Social Services Law;

13 Senate Print 9361, by
14 Senator Cooney, an act to amend the Vehicle and
15 Traffic Law;

16 Senate Print 9373, by
17 Senator Gounardes, an act to amend the
18 Retirement and Social Security Law;

19 Senate Print 9408C, by
20 Senator Hoylman-Sigal, an act to amend the
21 Hudson River Park Act;

22 Senate Print 9658, by
23 Senator Harckham, an act to amend the
24 Transportation Law;

25 Senate Print 9721A, by

1 Senator Stavisky, an act to amend the
2 Real Property Law;

3 Senate Print 9744, by
4 Senator Parker, an act to amend the
5 Public Authorities Law;

6 Senate Print 9797, by
7 Senator Parker, an act to amend the
8 Not-For-Profit Corporation Law;

9 Senate Print 9827, by
10 Senator Parker, an act to amend the
11 Social Services Law;

12 Senate Print 9829, by
13 Senator Stewart-Cousins, an act to amend
14 Chapter 118 of the Laws of 1969;

15 Senate Print 9831A, by
16 Senator Jackson, an act to amend the
17 Retirement and Social Security Law;

18 Senate Print 9832, by
19 Senator Hoylman-Sigal, an act to amend the
20 Labor Law;

21 Senate Print 9837, by Senator Myrie,
22 an act to amend the Election Law;

23 Senate Print 9838, by
24 Senator Skoufis, an act to amend the
25 Public Health Law;

1 Senate Print 9839, by
2 Senator Hoylman-Sigal, an act to amend the
3 Family Court Act;

4 Senate Print 9842, by
5 Senator Hoylman-Sigal, an act to amend the
6 Insurance Law;

7 And Senate Print 9847, by
8 Senator Gianaris, an act to amend the
9 Agriculture and Markets Law.

10 All bills reported direct to third
11 reading.

12 SENATOR GIANARIS: Move to accept
13 the report of the Rules Committee.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: All those
15 in favor of accepting the report of the
16 Rules Committee signify by saying aye.

17 (Response of "Aye.")

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Opposed,
19 nay.

20 (No response.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
22 report of the Rules Committee is accepted.

23 Senator Gianaris.

24 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
25 let's take up the reading of the calendar.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
2 Secretary will read.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 81,
4 Assembly Bill Number 8168, by
5 Assemblymember Paulin, an act to amend the
6 Social Services Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
15 Webb to explain her vote.

16 SENATOR WEBB: Thank you,
17 Mr. President. I rise to explain my vote.

18 This bill is a continuation of the
19 efforts that we've been engaging in in our
20 chamber to address the very real and
21 unfortunately continually growing crisis around
22 maternal mortality.

23 In the United States, approximately
24 23.5 deaths per 100,000 live births -- the worst
25 of any country in the world -- is happening.

1 Also, New York ranks 22nd for the highest
2 maternal mortality rate. And from 2018 to 2020,
3 the New York State Department of Health reported
4 a maternal mortality rate of 19.3 per 100,000
5 live births.

6 Mr. President, we know that there
7 are a few key factors that drive the maternal
8 mortality crisis; namely, poor access to prenatal
9 care, having to miss necessary healthcare
10 appointments due to cost barriers or -- excuse
11 me, skipping necessary healthcare appointments
12 due to cost barriers such as insurance coverage,
13 transportation or an inability to take off work
14 to get to appointments.

15 This legislation addresses this
16 issue by ensuring that remote ultrasound scans
17 and remote fetal non-stress tests are covered by
18 Medicaid. Telemedicine, specifically remote
19 patient monitoring, also known as RPM, has been
20 proposed by many as a solution to the maternal
21 health crisis.

22 The American College of the
23 Obstetricians and Gynecologists has endorsed the
24 use of RPM services to improve maternal morbidity
25 and mortality, recommending that state Medicaid

1 agencies urge their participating healthcare
2 practitioners to utilize these services where
3 appropriate.

4 And now, while New York State
5 Medicaid provides coverage for RPM services, the
6 guidance is ambiguous for providers, and
7 therefore services like remote ultrasound scans
8 and remote fetal non-stress tests are not
9 utilized to the extent that they should be.

10 This legislation would clarify and
11 codify in statute these services. Also, other
12 states such as Pennsylvania, Ohio, Missouri have
13 already clarified the utilization of billing for
14 these services.

15 I want to thank the Majority Leader
16 for bringing this legislation to the floor. I
17 proudly vote aye, and I encourage my colleagues
18 to do the same.

19 And I also want to thank the bill
20 sponsor in the Assembly, Assemblymember Paulin,
21 for also bringing forth this critical
22 legislation.

23 Thank you so much.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
25 Webb to be recorded in the affirmative.

1 Announce the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 88,
6 Senate Print 7515A, by Senator Stewart-Cousins,
7 an act to amend the Real Property Tax Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 98,
21 Senate Print 3529C, by Senator Fernandez, an act
22 to amend the General Business Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This

1 act shall take effect 12 months after it shall
2 have become a law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
7 Fernandez to explain her vote.

8 SENATOR FERNANDEZ: Thank you,
9 Mr. President.

10 This bill seeks to address the
11 presence of harmful chemicals in menstrual
12 products. Consider this, that an individual can
13 use over 16,000 menstrual products in their
14 lifetime. These products, which come into direct
15 contact with our bodies, often contain a myriad
16 of unhealthy and dangerous chemicals, including
17 PFAS, mercury, formaldehyde and lead.

18 It's important to restrict the use
19 of these harmful substances in menstrual
20 products. My bill does just that, by prohibiting
21 the use of these substances in menstrual
22 products.

23 By passing this legislation, we can
24 assure that individuals can assess safe and
25 reliable products without compromising their

1 health.

2 I thank my colleagues for bringing
3 this to the floor once again, and look forward to
4 seeing it pass in both houses to become a
5 reality.

6 Thank you, and I vote aye.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
8 Fernandez to be recorded in the affirmative.

9 Announce the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 104, Assembly Bill Number 222, by
15 Assemblymember Rosenthal, an act to repeal
16 paragraph 9 of subdivision (a) of Section 26-405.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
20 act shall take effect immediately.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
25 the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 146, Assembly Bill Number 4099A, by
6 Assemblymember Clark, an act to amend the
7 Social Services Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
16 Brouk to explain her vote.

17 SENATOR BROUK: Thank you,
18 Mr. President.

19 Lack of childcare is consistently
20 cited as a major challenge for New York families.
21 It's a barrier to reentering the workforce, it's
22 a barrier to continuing their education, and it's
23 cost-prohibitive in many cases. Right now even
24 families that qualify for assistance are waiting
25 months to be approved, while they lose job and

1 educational opportunities.

2 My bill that we're passing today
3 will presume eligibility for these families
4 seeking assistance, eliminating the months-long
5 wait that often prohibits them from entering and
6 reentering the workforce. And it will better
7 utilize federal dollars that can be used to fund
8 this change. That's right -- we can actually
9 save state and local dollars while also expanding
10 access to childcare with this bill.

11 In my district in Monroe County, we
12 are already doing this and have seen tremendous
13 results that we hope to see across New York State
14 to help even more working families.

15 I want to profusely thank our
16 Majority Leader, Andrea Stewart-Cousins, for her
17 support of working families.

18 And I also want to thank
19 Assemblymember Sarah Clark, the founding member
20 of the Mom Squad here in Albany, for all of her
21 leadership in helping working families across
22 New York State.

23 Thank you, and I proudly vote aye.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
25 Brouk to be recorded in the affirmative.

1 Announce the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 251, Senate Print 3231, by Senator Hoylman-Sigal,
7 an act to amend the Public Housing Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11 act shall take effect on the first of January.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
16 Martins to explain his vote.

17 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,
18 Mr. President.

19 You know, I'm hoping, Mr. President,
20 that next year that this body will actually take
21 up real measures to provide affordable housing by
22 making sure that those in rent-stabilized housing
23 who receive the benefits of lower rents than
24 market-rate rents but earn multiples of the area
25 median income, don't have access to those

1 apartments and those apartments actually go to
2 people who actually qualify, who we would expect
3 and who need the ability and the affordability
4 that those apartments bring.

5 Expanding the definition of those
6 who would be entitled to these apartments and
7 keeping them in the hands of the ultrawealthy I
8 think is a mistake. I think we have to make
9 those apartments available at those rents to
10 those who are eligible. If we means-test it,
11 we're able to do that.

12 And for that I vote aye -- vote nay,
13 excuse me.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
15 Martins to be recorded in the negative.

16 Announce the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
18 Calendar 251, those Senators voting in the
19 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
20 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
21 Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker,
22 O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec,
23 Tedisco, Weber and Weik.

24 Ayes, 40. Nays, 20.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill

1 is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 301, Senate Print 519, by Senator Comrie, an act
4 to amend the Administrative Code of the City of
5 New York.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: There is
7 a home-rule message at the desk.

8 Read the last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
15 the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
17 Calendar 301, voting in the negative:
18 Senator Oberacker.

19 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
21 is passed.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 334, Senate Print Number 7528, by
24 Senator Scarcella-Spanton, an act to amend the
25 Cannabis Law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
2 last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
4 act shall take effect immediately.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
9 the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 363, Senate Print 181, by Senator Jackson, an act
15 to amend the Correction Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
19 act shall take effect immediately.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
2 is passed.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 364, Senate Print 302, by Senator Salazar, an act
5 to amend the Correction Law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
9 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
10 shall have become a law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
15 the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
17 Calendar 364, those Senators voting in the
18 negative are Senators Borrello,
19 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
20 Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker,
21 O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco,
22 Weber and Weik.

23 Ayes, 42. Nays, 18.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
25 is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 375, Senate Print 6342A, by Senator Stavisky,
3 an act to amend the Education Law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
7 act shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
14 Calendar 375, those Senators voting in the
15 negative are Senators Borrello,
16 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Lanza, O'Mara, Ortt,
17 Palumbo, Rhoads and Weik.

18 Ayes, 52. Nays, 8.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 400, Senate Print 7547A, by Senator Tedisco, an
23 act to amend the Real Property Actions and
24 Proceedings Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: There is

1 a home-rule message at the desk.

2 Read the last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
4 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
5 shall have become a law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
10 the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
12 Calendar 400, voting in the negative:
13 Senator Helming.

14 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 403, Senate Print 7543B, by Senator Gonzalez, an
19 act to amend the State Technology Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
3 the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
6 is passed.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 422, Senate Print 225C, by Senator Myrie,
9 Concurrent Resolution of the Senate and Assembly
10 proposing an amendment to Article 1 of the
11 Constitution.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
13 roll on the resolution.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
16 Borrello to explain his vote.

17 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you,
18 Mr. President.

19 I take exception with the idea that
20 there is slavery in our prisons. You know, there
21 are inmates who voluntarily work, and I realize
22 some folks feel we don't pay them enough money.

23 However, there's a very large cost
24 to their incarceration. So if we'd like to pay
25 the minimum wage and also charge them back for

1 their room, their board, their healthcare, the
2 victim's services that are provided to their
3 victims, charge all that back to them and pay the
4 minimum wage, they're going to owe us money.

5 So if we want to do that, that's
6 fine. But this is not slavery. This is an
7 opportunity for them to actually work instead of
8 sitting around while they serve out their
9 sentence.

10 So I'll be voting no.

11 Thank you.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
13 Borrello to be recorded in the negative.

14 Announce the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
16 Calendar 422, those Senators voting in the
17 negative are Senators Borrello,
18 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
19 Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Rhoads,
20 Stec, Tedisco and Weik.

21 Ayes, 46. Nays, 14.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 444, Senate Print 8212, by Senator Parker, an act

1 directing the New York State Energy Research and
2 Development Authority to study the feasibility of
3 creating, storing and transferring of hydrogen
4 energy.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
8 act shall take effect immediately.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
13 the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 451, Assembly Bill Number 6022A, by
19 Assemblymember Paulin, an act to amend the
20 Social Services Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 464, Senate Print 7829, by Senator Persaud, an
10 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
14 act shall take effect immediately.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
19 the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
22 is passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 504, Senate Print 8139A, by Senator Sanders, an
25 act to amend the Executive Law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
2 last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
4 act shall take effect on the 270th day after it
5 shall have become a law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
10 the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
13 is passed.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 558, Senate Print 2079, by Senator Kavanagh, an
16 act to amend the Public Health Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
20 act shall take effect one year after it shall
21 have become a law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
3 Calendar 558, those Senators voting in the
4 negative are Senators Borrello,
5 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
6 Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker,
7 O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco,
8 Weber and Weik.

9 Ayes, 42. Nays, 18.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 575, Senate Print 1883, by Senator Skoufis, an
14 act to amend the New York State Urban Development
15 Corporation Act.

16 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
18 is laid aside.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 665, Senate Print 7507A, by Senator Brouk, an act
21 to amend the Public Health Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 10. This
25 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it

1 shall have become a law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
6 the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
8 Calendar 665, voting in the negative are
9 Senators Mannion and Martinez.

10 Ayes, 58. Nays, 2.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 678, Senate Print 1744, by Senator Ramos, an act
15 to amend the Correction Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
19 act shall take effect immediately.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: In relation to

1 Calendar 678, those Senators voting in the
2 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
3 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
4 Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker,
5 O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec,
6 Tedisco, Weber and Weik.

7 Ayes, 40. Nays, 20.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 697, Assembly Bill Number 9076A, by
12 Assemblymember Santabarbara, an act to amend the
13 Education Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
25 is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 705, Senate Print 4467C, by Senator Mayer, an act
3 to amend the Executive Law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
7 act shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
14 Calendar 705, those Senators voting in the
15 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello, Helming,
16 O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo and Stec.

17 Ayes, 53. Nays, 7.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 708, Senate Print 6110C, by Senator Borrello, an
22 act to amend the Public Officers Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This

1 act shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
6 the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 727, Assembly Bill Number 6821, by
12 Assemblymember Lupardo, an act to amend the
13 Environmental Conservation Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
22 May to explain her vote.

23 SENATOR MAY: Thank you,
24 Mr. President.

25 As of now, if you want to do

1 business activity in a state forestland, you can
2 get a five-year lease -- which is enough if your
3 goal is to, say, cut down the trees and then
4 leave. But if your goal is to do something in a
5 more long-term and productive sense like maple
6 syrup production, you need a longer lease.

7 I learned this when I visited
8 Dutch Hill Maple Farm in my district, and they
9 taught me all about this problem. And so I'm
10 thrilled that we are passing this legislation to
11 solve that problem so that they could get a
12 10-year lease on state forestland and we can
13 start using our state forests for maple
14 production.

15 I vote aye.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
17 May to be recorded in the affirmative.

18 Announce the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
21 is passed.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 728, Senate Print 8654, by Senator Stec, an act
24 to amend the Executive Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 743, Senate Print 8722A, by Senator Breslin, an
14 act to amend the Arts and Cultural Affairs Law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
18 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
19 shall have become a law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: In relation to

1 Calendar 743, those Senators voting in the
2 negative are Senators Borrello, Griffo, Lanza,
3 Martins and Rhoads.

4 Ayes, 55. Nays, 5.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
6 is passed.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 784, Senate Print 8728, by Senator Jackson, an
9 act to amend the New York City Charter.

10 SENATOR GIANARIS: Lay it aside for
11 the day.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
13 will be laid aside for the day.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 787, Assembly Bill Number 8994A, by
16 Assemblymember Paulin, an act to amend the
17 General Business Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
21 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
22 shall have become a law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
2 the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 789, Senate Print 8688A, by Senator Bailey, an
8 act to amend the Criminal Procedure Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
12 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it
13 shall have become a law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
18 the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
20 Calendar 789, those Senators voting in the
21 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
22 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
23 Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker,
24 O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec,
25 Tedisco, Weber and Weik.

1 Ayes, 40. Nays, 20.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 817, Senate Print 7565B, by Senator Harckham, an
6 act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
15 the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 836, Assembly Bill Number 8475, by
21 Assemblymember Paulin, an act to amend the
22 Public Health Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This

1 act shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
6 the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
8 Calendar 836, voting in the negative are
9 Senators Martinez and May.

10 Ayes, 58. Nays, 2.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 838, Assembly Bill Number 6799B, by
15 Assemblymember Paulin, an act to amend the
16 Public Health Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
20 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
21 shall have become a law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 860, Senate Print 8624A, by Senator Fernandez, an
7 act to amend the Correction Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it
12 shall have become a law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
17 Fernandez to explain her vote.

18 SENATOR FERNANDEZ: Thank you,
19 Mr. President.

20 This bill aims to address a
21 fundamental lack of understanding within our
22 correctional system. The goal of this bill is to
23 help ensure access to certified recovery peer
24 advocates for those battling substance use
25 disorders within correctional facilities.

1 These peer advocates, individuals
2 who have walked the same path as those they seek
3 to help, are invaluable assets in the journey
4 towards recovery.

5 Unfortunately, correctional
6 facilities bar entry to many of these advocates
7 solely based on their past history of
8 incarceration. This practice deprives
9 incarcerated individuals of the very essence of
10 peer advocacy, lived experience.

11 The evidence is clear. Peer
12 advocacy works. Studies have shown that
13 individuals with a history of incarceration who
14 engage with peer advocacy programs experience
15 better health and behavioral outcomes.
16 Furthermore, access to treatment has been linked
17 to reduced recidivism rates.

18 While New York State took a step in
19 the right direction in 2021 by mandating peer
20 support in jails, the implementation has been
21 marred by inadequacy. County jails in particular
22 can impose restrictive policies that effectively
23 exclude individuals from serving as peer
24 advocates due to their own history of
25 incarceration, perpetuating a cycle of exclusion

1 and marginalization.

2 These bill fights for those
3 struggling with recovery behind bars by
4 rectifying this injustice by prohibiting
5 correctional facilities from denying peer support
6 advocates based solely on their prior history.

7 In conclusion, I urge everyone to
8 vote in the affirmative for this legislation and
9 stand in solidarity with those working towards
10 recovery behind bars.

11 I vote aye.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
13 Fernandez to be recorded in the affirmative.

14 Announce the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
16 Calendar 860, those Senators voting in the
17 negative are Senators Helming and Stec.

18 Ayes, 58. Nays, 2.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 872, Assembly Bill Number 9284, by
23 Assemblymember Walsh, an act to amend the
24 Public Officers Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 883, Senate Print 7748C, by Senator Breslin, an
14 act to amend the Insurance Law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
18 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
19 shall have become a law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
2 is passed.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 884, Senate Print 7785, by Senator Mannion, an
5 act to amend the Insurance Law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
9 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it
10 shall have become a law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
15 the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 886, Senate Print 8553C, by Senator Addabbo, an
21 act to amend the Insurance Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
25 act shall take effect January 1, 2026.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
5 the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
8 is passed.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 900, Senate Print 8947A, by Senator Hinchey, an
11 act authorizing the Town of Kinderhook to
12 transfer ownership of certain parkland to the
13 Valatie Volunteer Rescue Squad.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: There is
15 a home-rule message at the desk.

16 Read the last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
18 act shall take effect immediately.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill

1 is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 929, Senate Print Number 8724B, by
4 Senator Hoylman-Sigal, an act to amend the
5 Family Court Act.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 11. This
9 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it
10 shall have become a law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
15 the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 945, Senate Print 7676B, by Senator Ramos, an act
21 to amend the General Obligations Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
25 act shall take effect January 1, 2025.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
5 Ramos to explain her vote.

6 SENATOR RAMOS: Thank you,
7 Mr. President.

8 You know, at the height of Hot Labor
9 Summer last year I proudly joined actors and
10 writers on the picket line as they fought for a
11 fair contract. And from that picket line, I
12 announced this bill to protect actors from their
13 likeness being replicated by AI without their
14 informed consent.

15 You see, the studios had a habit of
16 burying language in legalese that would give them
17 ownership over an actor's likeness to feed into
18 AI. This allowed them to buy someone's face or
19 voice without the person really understanding
20 what they had agreed to. So imagine the
21 experience of turning on your TV and seeing
22 yourself in a commercial or a movie that you
23 actually never filmed.

24 I'm proud to say that this bill is
25 the result of continued negotiations between SAG

1 and their employers. It's a commonsense solution
2 the entire industry recognizes is fair. In the
3 end, AI is here. This year's budget already made
4 investments to make sure New York State stays on
5 top of this emerging technology. But part of
6 staying on top of it means we update our laws to
7 keep workers and consumers safe.

8 This is the next frontier for labor,
9 and we are ready.

10 I vote aye.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
12 Ramos to be recorded in the affirmative.

13 Announce the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 946, Assembly Bill Number 8081B, by
19 Assemblymember Bores, an act to amend the
20 Civil Practice Law and Rules.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
6 Calendar 946, voting in the negative:
7 Senator Lanza.

8 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 960, Assembly Bill Number 5550, by
13 Assemblymember Thiele, an act to amend the
14 Environmental Conservation Law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
18 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it
19 shall have become a law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
2 is passed.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 989, Senate Print 505, by Senator Rivera, an act
5 to amend the Public Health Law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
14 the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
16 Calendar 989, those Senators voting in the
17 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
18 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
19 Lanza, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt,
20 Palumbo, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco, Weber and Weik.

21 Ayes, 42. Nays, 18.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 994, Senate Print 7667A, by Senator Cleare, an

1 act to amend the Social Services Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
5 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
6 shall have become a law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
11 Cleare to explain her vote.

12 SENATOR CLEARE: Thank you,
13 Mr. President.

14 For far too long a number of
15 medically necessary dental procedures have not
16 been covered by Medicaid, leaving many of our
17 residents, including our older New Yorkers,
18 without critical coverage for their oral health
19 needs. Damaged and/or missing teeth are
20 especially problematic as it interferes with
21 eating and getting proper nourishment to some of
22 the most vulnerable among us.

23 With the passage of this bill, this
24 can change for many of our New Yorkers. Oral
25 health is not only linked to changes in mental,

1 emotional and social well-being, but it's also
2 linked to other significant health impacts,
3 including damage to the heart, lungs, immune
4 system, pancreas and more.

5 I proudly vote aye on this
6 legislation and encourage my colleagues to do the
7 same.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
9 Cleare to be recorded in the affirmative.

10 Announce the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
13 is passed.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 998, Assembly Bill Number 9235A, by
16 Assemblymember Paulin, an act to amend the
17 Public Health Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 1007, Senate Print Number 4032A, by
7 Senator Scarcella-Spanton, an act to amend the
8 Civil Rights Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. this
12 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
13 shall have become a law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
18 the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
20 Calendar 1007, voting in the negative are
21 Senators Borrello, Griffo, Helming, Lanza and
22 Ortt.

23 Ayes, 55. Nays, 5.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
25 is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 1025, Assembly Bill Number 7271, by
3 Assemblymember McDonald, an act in relation to
4 permitting the City of Troy to retroactively
5 extend a real property tax exemption.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
14 the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 1026, Assembly Bill Number 7270, by
20 Assemblymember McDonald, an act in relation to
21 permitting the City of Troy to retroactively
22 extend a real property tax exemption.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This

1 act shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
6 the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1044, Assembly Bill Number 9124, by
12 Assemblymember Thiele, an act to amend the
13 Indian Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
22 Palumbo to explain his vote.

23 SENATOR PALUMBO: Thank you,
24 Mr. President.

25 I just want to thank my colleagues

1 for passing this bill again. I believe this is
2 the fifth or sixth time we've done this.

3 This is about the Montaukett Nation
4 that's been on Long Island since the 1600s. Some
5 of my colleagues have indicated there are statues
6 of Chief (Sachem) Wantagh in the high school in
7 Nassau.

8 And in 1910, just very briefly,
9 there was a lawsuit over some land. And quite
10 frankly, in one of the worst and likely racist
11 decisions, they stripped state recognition of the
12 Montaukett Nation in the Suffolk County Supreme
13 Court. And since then, they've been trying to
14 just get the dignity and recognition that they
15 deserve.

16 So this is simply reinstating that
17 status that they rightfully deserve. I hope --
18 the Governor has vetoed this a few times, we've
19 made some tweaks to this. My colleague
20 Assemblyman Thiele has worked very closely as
21 well to try and get this over the finish line.
22 So I'm really hopeful that they finally get what
23 they deserve.

24 I proudly vote aye, Mr. President.

25 Thank you.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
2 Palumbo to be recorded in the affirmative.

3 Announce the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
5 Calendar 1044, voting in the negative:
6 Senator Rhoads.

7 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1075, Assembly Bill Number 7167, by
12 Assemblymember Solages, an act to amend the
13 Personal Property Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
17 act shall take effect on the first of January.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
24 Calendar 1075, those Senators voting in the
25 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,

1 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
2 Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker,
3 O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco,
4 Weber and Weik.

5 Ayes, 41. Nays, 19.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 1076, Senate Print 5643A, by Senator Cleare, an
10 act to amend the General Business Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
14 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
15 shall have become a law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
22 Calendar 1076, voting in the negative are
23 Senators Gallivan and Weik.

24 Ayes, 58. Nays, 2.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill

1 is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 1092, Senate Print 6989, by Senator Sanders, an
4 act to amend the Lien Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
8 act shall take effect immediately.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
13 the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
15 Calendar 1092, those Senators voting in the
16 negative are Senators Borrello,
17 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Griffo, Helming, Martins,
18 Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt,
19 Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Weber
20 and Weik.

21 Ayes, 43. Nays, 17.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 1097, Senate Print Number 7926, by

1 Senator Hoylman-Sigal, an act to amend the
2 General Obligations Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
13 Calendar 1097, those Senators voting in the
14 negative are Senators Borrello,
15 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
16 Lanza, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt,
17 Palumbo, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco and Weik.

18 Ayes, 44. Nays, 16.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1106, Assembly Bill Number 3703, by
23 Assemblymember Epstein, an act to amend the
24 Public Health Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
3 act shall take effect on the first of April.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
10 Calendar 1106, voting in the negative are
11 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
12 Felder, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza,
13 Martins, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara,
14 Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco, Weber and
15 Weik.

16 Ayes, 40. Nays, 20.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 1109, Senate Print 3372A, by Senator Skoufis, an
21 act to amend the Executive Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
5 the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
7 Calendar 1109, those Senators voting in the
8 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
9 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
10 Martins, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara,
11 Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco,
12 Weber and Weik.

13 Ayes, 41. Nays, 19.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 1126, Assembly Bill Number 3475A, by
18 Assemblymember Pretlow, an act to amend the
19 Racing, Pari-Mutuel Wagering and Breeding Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
3 the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
6 is passed.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 1171, Senate Print 5472A, by Senator Rivera, an
9 act to amend the Social Services Law.

10 SENATOR GIANARIS: Lay it aside for
11 the day, please.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
13 will be laid aside for the day.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 1175, Senate Print 9115, by Senator Rivera, an
16 act to amend the Public Health Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
20 act shall take effect immediately.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
25 the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 1185, Assembly Bill Number 2583A, by
6 Assemblymember Hevesi, an act to amend the
7 Social Services Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 1208, Senate Print 7779B, by Senator Brouk, an
22 act to amend the Public Health Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This

1 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it
2 shall have become a law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
7 Brouk to explain her vote.

8 SENATOR BROUK: Thank you,
9 Mr. President.

10 As many of us know, in January we
11 made history here in New York State when we
12 launched our statewide Doula Medicaid
13 Reimbursement Program. This morning, though, I
14 went on the Department of Health's new Community
15 Doula Directory and counted how many doulas are
16 eligible for reimbursement to serve Medicaid
17 patients. The number of doulas I found was not
18 many: 68.

19 Right now, 68 doulas are ready to
20 offer pregnant people the informational, physical
21 and emotional support that they need before,
22 during and after pregnancy. But do you know how
23 many women under Medicaid actually give birth in
24 New York every year? In 2022, 47.5 percent of
25 our births were covered by Medicaid. That's

1 nearly 100,000 women -- and just 68 doulas to
2 serve all of them.

3 That's why this legislation to
4 create a Community Doula Expansion Fund is so
5 crucial. It will bring the resources needed to
6 community doula organizations who are tasked with
7 recruiting, training, mentoring and supporting
8 community doulas that New York State clearly
9 needs.

10 Sixty-eight doulas is not enough to
11 serve the women of this state. That's why I'm
12 proud to vote aye on this bill, and I am grateful
13 to my colleagues.

14 Thank you.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
16 Brouk to be recorded in the affirmative.

17 Announce the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
19 Calendar 1208, voting in the negative are
20 Senators Borrello and Oberacker.

21 Ayes, 58. Nays, 2.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 1215, Assembly Bill Number 9213A, by

1 Assemblymember Fahy, an act to amend the
2 Navigation Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
6 act shall take effect on the 120th day after it
7 shall have become a law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
14 Calendar 1215, those Senators voting in the
15 negative are Senators Borrello, Griffo, Helming,
16 Martins, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara,
17 Ortt, Rhoads, Stec and Weik.

18 Ayes, 48. Nays, 12.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1217, Senate Print 8827A, by Senator Bailey,
23 an act to amend the Election Law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
25 last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
2 act shall take effect on the first of July.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
7 Bailey to explain his vote.

8 SENATOR BAILEY: Thank you,
9 Mr. President.

10 Building off the momentum of
11 Senator Mayer's bill, making it easier for young
12 people to vote should be something that we're
13 doing in this chamber every single day.

14 My grandfather, the original J.T.
15 Bailey, James Thomas Bailey, said that when you
16 turn 18 you get two things: You get a voter
17 registration in one hand, and you get a lottery
18 ticket in the other. And that voter registration
19 card is much more of a sure bet than that lottery
20 scratch-off ticket would be. It provides you the
21 ability to be a part of active democracy.

22 And this bill is a nonpartisan bill.
23 It doesn't say that you have to vote Republican
24 or Democrat or whatever. It just says that when
25 you graduate high school, it's a great event in

1 your life; before you go to City Island in the
2 Bronx and get something to eat after your
3 graduation -- wherever you live, when you go to
4 Sammy's or whatever, I don't want to -- I can't
5 advertise, Roxie. Don't get me in trouble. I
6 can't advertise for locations. But whatever
7 place, wherever you go to eat, before you eat you
8 should be able to think about the future of
9 democracy and how important it is and the role
10 that you can play and have that voter
11 registration card in your hand.

12 So for that reason, I am proud to
13 vote aye on this bill, Mr. President.

14 Thank you.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
16 Bailey to be recorded in the affirmative.

17 Senator Borrello to explain his
18 vote.

19 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you,
20 Mr. President.

21 I think the idea of giving out voter
22 registration cards is a laudable goal. My
23 concern is the fact that we put the obligation
24 now on the schools to collect those cards and
25 make sure that they're delivered to the Board of

1 Elections. That's where I have a concern.

2 First and foremost, we're telling
3 you, you're an adult now, you're graduating high
4 school, it's time to take on personal
5 responsibility. But we don't expect you to
6 actually return that voter registration card to
7 actually register to vote. I think that's the
8 wrong message we're sending to our youth.

9 But most importantly, there's a
10 chain of custody issue here as well. Those could
11 be manipulated after they leave the hands of
12 those kids before they end up into the hands of
13 the Board of Elections.

14 So for that reason, I'll be voting
15 no. But again, I think it's a good idea.

16 Thank you.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
18 Borrello to be recorded in the negative.

19 Senator Fernandez to explain her
20 vote.

21 SENATOR FERNANDEZ: Thank you,
22 Mr. President.

23 I want to share a cute story,
24 because my high school government teacher chose
25 to have that be part of the curriculum. He

1 wouldn't graduate us or have us pass the class
2 unless we did register to vote.

3 And I thank him because it was the
4 real moment of my life that I knew that I had a
5 choice, that I knew that I could make decisions
6 for not just my country but to even my
7 neighborhood. So I want to thank Mr. Bores for
8 doing so.

9 And fun fact, years later,
10 Assemblyman Alex Bores tells me that that was his
11 uncle. So George Bores, thank you for helping me
12 to register to vote and ultimately bringing me
13 here to the Senate chambers.

14 I vote aye.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
16 Fernandez to be recorded in the affirmative.

17 Announce the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
19 Calendar 1217, those Senators voting in the
20 negative are Senators Borrello, Griffo, Helming,
21 Lanza, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Rhoads, Stec,
22 Tedisco, Weber and Weik.

23 Ayes, 48. Nays, 12.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
25 is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 1225, Senate Print 3604A, by Senator Webb, an act
3 to amend the Real Property Tax Law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This act
7 shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 1236, Assembly Bill Number 3866B, by
18 Assemblymember Jackson, an act to amend the
19 Public Housing Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
3 Myrie to explain his vote.

4 SENATOR MYRIE: Thank you,
5 Mr. President.

6 Close to two years ago I got a call
7 to my office from the tenant association
8 president of Langston Hughes Houses, and he
9 informed us that for months many of the residents
10 had not had gas to cook. They were forced to use
11 hot plates, they were forced to buy food, and
12 NYCHA had no obligation to resolve this issue.

13 If you go and check today's outages,
14 there are nearly 61 in the entire NYCHA
15 development portfolio, some that date back to
16 2023. In this chamber we often endeavor to
17 tackle kitchen-table issues, and it does not get
18 more kitchen table than this.

19 So I am proud to sponsor this bill.
20 I want to thank my Assembly sponsor,
21 Chantel Jackson, and I want to thank the staff,
22 my staff, that helped get this across the finish
23 line, as well as Nayram and Bobby on the Senate
24 central staff.

25 I proudly vote aye.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
2 Myrie to be recorded in the affirmative.

3 Announce the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
5 Calendar 1236, voting in the negative are
6 Senators Borrello, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
7 Rhoads, Weber and Weik.

8 Ayes, 53. Nays, 7.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 1263, Senate Print 9516A, by Senator Comrie, an
13 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
25 is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 1270, Assembly Bill Number 7194, by
3 Assemblymember Dilan, an act to amend the
4 Correction Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
8 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
9 shall have become a law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
14 the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
16 Calendar 1270, those Senators voting in the
17 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
18 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
19 Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker,
20 O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco and
21 Weik.

22 Ayes, 42. Nays, 18.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1272, Senate Print 7132A, by Senator Salazar, an
2 act to amend the Correction Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
13 Calendar 1272, those Senators voting in the
14 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
15 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
16 Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker,
17 O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec,
18 Tedisco, Weber and Weik.

19 Ayes, 40. Nays, 20.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
21 is passed.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 1285, Senate Print 8976B, by Senator Mayer, an
24 act to amend the Education Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
3 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
4 shall have become a law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
9 the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 1286, Senate Print 9107A, by Senator Mayer, an
15 act to amend the Education Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
19 act shall take effect immediately.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
2 is passed.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 1292, Senate Print 9032A, by Senator Ryan, an act
5 to amend the State Administrative Procedure Act.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
14 the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
16 Calendar 1292, those Senators voting in the
17 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
18 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
19 Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker,
20 O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec,
21 Tedisco, Weber and Weik.

22 Ayes, 40. Nays, 20.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1298, Senate Print 3437, by Senator Skoufis, an
2 act to amend the New York City Urban Development
3 Corporation Act.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. this
7 act shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
14 Calendar 1298, those Senators voting in the
15 negative are Senators Borrello,
16 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Martins,
17 Mattera, Murray, Palumbo, Rhoads and Weik.

18 Ayes, 51. Nays, 9.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1305, Senate Print 9383A, by Senator Sanders, an
23 act to amend the Banking Law.

24 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill

1 is laid aside.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 1309, Senate Print Number 5648F, by
4 Senator Hoylman-Sigal, an act to amend the
5 Environmental Conservation Law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
9 act shall take effect January 1, 2026.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
14 the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
16 Calendar 1309, voting in the negative:
17 Senator Oberacker.

18 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1345, Assembly Bill Number 4219, by
23 Assemblymember Rivera, an act to direct the
24 New York State Department of Health to conduct a
25 study on the incidences of cancer clusters in

1 cities.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
5 act shall take effect immediately.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
10 the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
13 is passed.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 1351, Assembly Bill Number 5984B, by
16 Assemblymember McDonald, an act to amend the
17 Public Health Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
21 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
22 shall have become a law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
2 Fernandez to explain her vote.

3 SENATOR FERNANDEZ: Thank you,
4 Mr. President.

5 This bill seeks to bridge the gap
6 between federal and state regulations regarding
7 the dispensing of lifesaving medication for
8 individuals battling substance abuse disorder.

9 In March of 2022, the
10 Drug Enforcement Administration permitted
11 clinicians in hospitals, clinics and emergency
12 rooms to dispense three days worth of
13 buprenorphine and methadone to those with a
14 substance use disorder. However, here in
15 New York State the Bureau of Narcotic Enforcement
16 continues to restrict the dispensing of these
17 medications to only 24 hours.

18 My bill seeks to rectify this
19 disparity by empowering New York State to align
20 our regulations with the current federal
21 standard. Permitting three days worth of
22 medication has the potential to significantly
23 lower barriers to treatment for individuals
24 battling substance use disorders by reducing the
25 time and financial burden associated with

1 obtaining this lifesaving medication.

2 In many urban and rural areas,
3 access to healthcare is already limited. By
4 enacting this commonsense change, we can ensure
5 that medication-assisted treatment is accessible
6 to all.

7 I urge my colleagues to vote aye,
8 and I thank everyone for supporting this
9 legislation to seize the opportunity to remove
10 unnecessary barriers from treatment.

11 Thank you.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
13 Fernandez to be recorded in the affirmative.

14 Announce the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 1357, Senate Print 9353, by Senator Rivera, an
20 act to repeal Section 3372 of the Public Health
21 Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
5 the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
7 Calendar 1357, those Senators voting in the
8 negative are Senators Borrello,
9 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
10 Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Oberacker, Palumbo,
11 Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Weber and Weik.

12 Ayes, 44. Nays, 16.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 1361, Senate Print 7679A, by Senator Borrello, an
17 act to amend the Highway Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
3 Calendar 1361, voting in the negative:
4 Senator Brisport.

5 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 1364, Senate Print 8607A, by Senator Hinchey, an
10 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: There is
12 a home-rule message at the desk.

13 Read the last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
15 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it
16 shall have become a law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
21 the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
23 Calendar 1364, voting in the negative are
24 Senators Felder, Lanza, Martins and Palumbo.
25 Also Senator Mattera.

1 Ayes, 55. Nays, 5.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 1369, Senate Print 9133A, by Senator Cooney, an
6 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
10 act shall take effect January 1, 2028.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
15 the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 1392, Senate Print 6419E, by Senator Kavanagh, an
21 act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
23 last section.

24 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill

1 is laid aside.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 1403, Assembly Bill Number 9632, by
4 Assemblymember Paulin, an act to amend the
5 State Finance Law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
14 the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 1407, Senate Print 9450A, by Senator Gonzalez, an
20 act to amend the General Business Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
24 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
25 shall have become a law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
5 Gonzalez to explain her vote.

6 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Thank you,
7 Mr. President.

8 I rise before you today to speak in
9 favor of this bill. As many of you know, a few
10 weeks ago there was a story that showed that a
11 generative-AI-based chatbot was putting out
12 misinformation about members of this chamber,
13 myself included.

14 And since then, I've spoken to so
15 many New Yorkers who are concerned about the rise
16 of misinformation due to the rise of generative
17 AI. The truth is while this technology is
18 exciting and has so much potential to benefit our
19 society, it is also imperfect. And it has the
20 risk of spreading misinformation on a scale that
21 we've never seen before.

22 And so this bill is a start to a
23 larger fight that we will all have to protect our
24 democracy. Not only do we need to ensure that
25 New Yorkers know that sometimes the result of an

1 AI-based tool can be inaccurate or be
2 misinformation, but we also need to create a
3 system that holds companies and tools accountable
4 so that we can always ensure that we're creating
5 the best possible experience for New Yorkers, for
6 society, and of course, again, working to protect
7 our democracy from misinformation.

8 So thank you. And with that, I
9 enthusiastically vote aye.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
11 Gonzalez to be recorded in the affirmative.

12 Announce the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 1409, Assembly Bill Number 7071A, by
18 Assemblymember Giglio, an act to amend the
19 Tax Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
3 the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
5 Calendar 1409, voting in the negative are
6 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Felder,
7 Griffo, Harckham, Helming, Hinchey, Lanza,
8 Mannion, Martinez, Mattera --

9 SENATOR BORRELLO: It's my bill!

10 (Laughter.)

11 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
12 Calendar 1409, voting in the negative are
13 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Felder, Griffo,
14 Harckham, Helming, Hinchey, Lanza, Mannion,
15 Martinez, Mattera, Murray, O'Mara, Palumbo,
16 Rhoads, Scarcella-Spanton, Skoufis, Tedisco, Webb
17 and Weik.

18 Ayes, 41. Nays, 19.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1426, Assembly Bill Number 10010, by
23 Assemblymember Smullen, an act to amend the
24 Public Officers Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 1436, Senate Print 8913A, by Senator Gonzalez, an
14 act to amend Alcoholic Beverage Control Law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
18 act shall take effect immediately.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
25 Calendar 1436, voting in the negative:

1 Senator Martinez.

2 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 1446, Senate Print 4421, by Senator Fernandez, an
7 act to amend the Criminal Procedure Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
16 Fernandez to explain her vote.

17 SENATOR FERNANDEZ: Thank you.

18 This bill we name after Gittel.

19 Gittel's Law seeks to amend the Penal Law to
20 expand the definition of mental health care
21 provider for cases involving sex offenses.

22 Mental health care providers can have a great
23 amount of influence over their emotionally
24 vulnerable patients.

25 As it stands, the current definition

1 of mental health care provider fails to encompass
2 the full spectrum of licensed professionals
3 within the mental health field. This oversight
4 leaves gaps in protection for individuals seeking
5 mental health care, potentially exposing them to
6 exploitation and harm and leaving victims without
7 recourse.

8 This was the case for Gittel, a
9 young woman who sought treatment from a mental
10 health provider earlier this year. Gittel's
11 licensed mental health counselor took advantage
12 of her sexually, but due to the gap in current
13 law that did not explicitly list LMHCs under the
14 definition of "mental health care provider," the
15 district attorney could not prosecute.

16 By broadening the definition to
17 include licensed mental health counselors and
18 licensed marriage and family therapists, we are
19 taking a crucial step towards closing the gaps in
20 the law and ensuring the safety and well-being of
21 all patients.

22 I want to thank Assemblyman
23 Sam Berger for entrusting me with this bill, and
24 I proudly vote aye.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator

1 Fernandez to be recorded in the affirmative.

2 Announce the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 1448, Senate Print Number 7365B, by
8 Senator Hoylman-Sigal, an act to amend the
9 Penal Law.

10 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
12 will be laid aside.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 1450, Assembly Bill Number 10105B, by
15 Assemblymember Berger, an act to amend the
16 Penal Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
20 act shall take effect immediately.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
25 the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 1455, Senate Print 8606A, by Senator Hinchey, an
6 act to amend the Agriculture and Markets Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
15 the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 1487, Senate Print 7426A, by Senator Thomas, an
21 act to amend the Election Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
25 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it

1 shall have become a law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
6 the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1496, Assembly Bill Number 8837C, by
12 Assemblymember Cruz, an act to amend the
13 Veterans' Services Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
17 act shall take effect on the 150th day after it
18 shall have become a law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
23 Fernandez to explain her vote.

24 SENATOR FERNANDEZ: And to correct
25 myself. Apologies. I explained for another

1 bill, but they were just so close together and it
2 was, you know, too much time.

3 But this bill we name after Alex R.
4 Jimenez. This bill honors the legacy of
5 Staff Sergeant Alex R. Jimenez by providing vital
6 support to the immigrant families of New York
7 State's veterans and servicemembers.

8 Born in New York City to a large,
9 tightly knit immigrant family from the
10 Dominican Republic, Alex was the spirit of
11 service and sacrifice. During his deployment,
12 Alex and his wife, Yaderlin Hiraldo Jimenez, an
13 immigrant from the Dominican Republic, filed
14 papers with USCIS to obtain a green card for
15 Yaderlin. Unfortunately, Alex was captured by
16 enemy forces during active duty. While the U.S.
17 Military was searching for Alex in Iraq, his wife
18 back home in the United States was being deported
19 by the U.S. government. Two months later, Alex's
20 remains were found.

21 The story of Alex Jimenez serves as
22 a reminder of the challenges faced by immigrant
23 families within the military community. This
24 bill establishes a comprehensive program to
25 support foreign-born active duty servicemembers

1 and veterans and their families in securing legal
2 immigration status in the United States,
3 including citizenship.

4 By establishing a structured program
5 rather than relying solely on discretionary
6 options, we can provide consistent support for
7 all eligible individuals, ensuring that no family
8 is left behind.

9 I thank the leader for supporting
10 and bringing this important piece of legislation
11 to the floor, as well as my colleague
12 Senator Ashby for starting this process and
13 trusting me to lead the charge.

14 I urge my Senate colleagues to join
15 me in honoring the legacy of Staff Sergeant
16 Alex R. Jimenez and ensuring that every immigrant
17 family of our servicemembers has the opportunity
18 to secure their rightful place in the
19 United States.

20 Thank you.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
22 Fernandez to be recorded in the affirmative.

23 Senator Ashby to explain his vote.

24 SENATOR ASHBY: Thank you,
25 Mr. President.

1 I just want to take this opportunity
2 to thank my colleagues Senator Fernandez and
3 Assemblywoman Cruz for continuing to push this
4 bill. I know that the Governor had vetoed it
5 previously, citing it was duplicative. But in
6 reality, when we look at this, it's so
7 duplicative it would be the first program in the
8 nation.

9 And so I want to thank my colleagues
10 again for continuing to push this legislation
11 that I think will help bring us together on what
12 is often a rather divisive issue, and giving
13 New York State an opportunity to lead again.

14 Thank you.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
16 Ashby to be recorded in the affirmative.

17 Announce the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1506, Senate Print Number 8596A, by
23 Senator Scarcella-Spanton, an act to amend the
24 Education Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 1507, Assembly Bill Number 9265A, by
14 Assemblymember Bronson, an act to amend the
15 Labor Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
19 act shall take effect immediately.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
24 Ramos to explain her vote.

25 SENATOR RAMOS: You know,

1 Mr. President, very often when I am proposing a
2 new worker safety measure I'm told, "Well, the
3 DOL should already be enforcing that." And while
4 that's undoubtedly true, it's not a real solution
5 to put everything on the DOL without giving them
6 the tools to modernize or improve their
7 efficiency.

8 What this bill does is provide a
9 more streamlined system for the DOL to collect
10 and maintain certified payroll, something they
11 are already required to do. Better yet, the
12 system will pay for itself in terms of increased
13 efficiency for DOL enforcement activities and
14 resulting collections.

15 Imagine you're a DOL worker --
16 shout-out to PEF -- responsible for wage theft or
17 misclassification enforcement. Or a member of
18 the Comptroller's staff responsible for enforcing
19 prevailing wage. Rifling through piles and piles
20 of hard-copy payroll documents is a sure-fire way
21 to miss something.

22 This is going to improve all the
23 programs that have prevailing wage and strong
24 labor standards built in. It's another proactive
25 tool for helping workers get every penny they've

1 earned back in their pocket.

2 And for that reason, I vote aye.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
4 Ramos to be recorded in the affirmative.

5 Announce the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
8 is passed.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 1508, Assembly Bill Number 9269B, by
11 Assemblymember Berger, an act to amend the
12 Social Services Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
16 act shall take effect six months after it shall
17 have become a law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
25 is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 1511, Senate Print 8756A, by Senator Jackson, an
3 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

4 SENATOR GIANARIS: Lay it aside
5 temporarily.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
7 will be laid aside temporarily.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 1519, Senate Print 8978A, by Senator Ryan, an act
10 to amend the Real Property Tax Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
14 act shall take effect immediately.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
19 the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
22 is passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 1546, Senate Print 9735, by Senator Bailey, an
25 act to amend Chapter 101 of the Laws of 2014.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: There is
2 a home-rule message at the desk.

3 Read the last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
5 act shall take effect immediately.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
10 the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
12 Calendar 1546, those Senators voting in the
13 negative are Senators Felder, Martinez, Mattera,
14 Murray, Palumbo and Weik.

15 Ayes, 54. Nays, 6.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 1574, Senate Print 7420, by Senator Krueger, an
20 act to amend the Financial Services Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
4 Krueger to explain her vote.

5 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you,
6 Mr. President.

7 I am hopeful this can be the year we
8 get this bill passed in both houses.

9 We live in a world where in the
10 banking industry, the insurance industry, the
11 cyber currency industry, a new something pops up
12 every day. It pops up in our email, it pops up
13 on our websites. We don't even understand what
14 they're offering, but they make it all sound
15 really, really great.

16 And they're not licensed in New York
17 State, but DFS doesn't have the authority to go
18 after, in any way, unlicensed entities if it's
19 not clear that they have authority.

20 So this is allowing DFS to move into
21 the 21st century, to try to move at least at some
22 pace to keep up with the new kinds of businesses,
23 some of which I'm sure are completely legitimate
24 and many of which are not. But right now, as
25 long as they don't even try to get a license as

1 some category, nobody does anything. But people
2 are losing their money.

3 So this is to allow oversight and a
4 mechanism for civil penalties, and I think it's
5 extremely important. And I encourage people to
6 vote yes.

7 Thank you, Mr. President.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
9 Krueger to be recorded in the affirmative.

10 Announce the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
12 Calendar 1574, those Senators voting in the
13 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
14 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
15 Lanza -- Senator Helming in the affirmative --
16 Martins, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara,
17 Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco,
18 Weber and Weik.

19 Ayes, 41. Nays, 19.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
21 is passed.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 1575, Assembly Bill Number 3499B, by
24 Assemblymember Carroll, an act to amend the
25 General Business Law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
2 last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 13. This
4 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
5 shall have become a law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
10 the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
12 Calendar 1575, those Senators voting in the
13 negative are Senators Chu, Felder, Gallivan,
14 Salazar, Skoufis and Weber.

15 Ayes, 54. Nays, 6.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 1578, Senate Print 7859, by Senator Gounardes, an
20 act to amend the Banking Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
24 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it
25 shall have become a law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
5 the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
8 is passed.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 1579, Assembly Bill Number 8427A, by
11 Assemblymember Epstein, an act to amend the
12 Alcoholic Beverage Control Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
16 act shall take effect immediately.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
21 Ramos to explain her vote.

22 SENATOR RAMOS: Thank you,
23 Mr. President.

24 You know, at the height of the
25 pandemic this body passed a bill in 2021 that

1 threw a real lifeline to the small businesses in
2 New York City. Outside of New York City, for a
3 long time bars and restaurants had access to
4 temporary liquor licenses, a key tool in helping
5 a new business get a solid financial footing and
6 bring in real revenue.

7 Just as our commercial corridors
8 started to reopen, we fixed that exclusion and
9 granted New York City small businesses access to
10 temporary liquor licenses.

11 My office has helped guide countless
12 businesses through this process, and it's really
13 been a huge success. Access to a temporary
14 liquor license has proven to help restaurants
15 open faster, fill vacant storefronts, employ
16 people sooner, and start generating tax revenue
17 earlier without compromising on the community
18 engagement process needed to win a full liquor
19 license.

20 The SLA currently has about a
21 10-to-12-month backlog to issue permanent liquor
22 licenses, and they're working as hard as they
23 can. But we have a pressure valve that we know
24 works. This is a small but mighty economic
25 development measure, and I want to thank all of

1 the stakeholders who helped us work through some
2 unnecessary roadblocks to get here.

3 Thank you to the leader and to all
4 the staff. I proudly vote aye.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
6 Ramos to be recorded in the affirmative.

7 Announce the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 1580, Senate Print 8412A, by Senator Fernandez,
13 an act to amend the State Finance Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
22 Fernandez to explain her vote.

23 SENATOR FERNANDEZ: Thank you.

24 In relation to the Opioid
25 Stewardship Fund, this bill takes important steps

1 in fighting the overdose epidemic by directing
2 funds towards recovery services, enhancing
3 transparency, and addressing the pressing need
4 for comprehensive support amid the opioid
5 epidemic by ensuring effective allocation of
6 resources.

7 The overdose epidemic has inflicted
8 significant damage on our state, claiming
9 thousands of lives and leaving countless families
10 shattered in its wake. In 2018 alone, we mourned
11 the loss of 3,697 individuals to overdose deaths.
12 Tragically, that number has only continued to
13 rise, with over 6,400 overdose deaths recorded in
14 2023, a staggering 73 percent increase in just
15 three years.

16 It's abundantly clear that we are
17 facing a public health emergency with
18 unprecedented magnitude, and we must respond with
19 urgency and determination. One of the most
20 pressing challenges we face in combating this
21 crisis is ensuring access to comprehensive
22 recovery support services for those struggling
23 with addiction. Recovery services are not only
24 evidence-based practices, but also lifelines for
25 individuals and families navigating the long and

1 arduous journey of recovery. They provide vital
2 person-centered care that is essential to
3 rebuilding lives affected by addiction.

4 Yet despite their proven
5 effectiveness, recovery support services in
6 New York State have long been underfunded and
7 underappreciated. As treatment centers closed
8 their doors during the pandemic, it was our
9 recovery centers that remained steadfast,
10 providing essential support to those in need.
11 However, the lack of sustainable funding
12 mechanisms has left these vital services
13 teetering on the brink of collapse.

14 This legislation seeks to rectify
15 the injustice by directing at least 10 percent of
16 the funds from the Opioid Stewardship Fund
17 towards recovery services and support.
18 Additionally, by removing the sunset on the fund,
19 we can create a permanent source of funding for
20 these programs and ensure that those on the
21 frontlines of the overdose crisis have the
22 resources they need to continue their lifesaving
23 work.

24 Furthermore, this bill mandates an
25 annual report to the Legislature regarding

1 distribution of funds from the Opioid Stewardship
2 Fund, enhancing transparency and accountability
3 in our efforts to combat the crisis.

4 We owe it to the people of New York
5 to ensure that every dollar allocated to this
6 fund is used effectively and efficiently to save
7 lives and promote recovery.

8 I proudly vote aye.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
10 Fernandez to be recorded in the affirmative.

11 Senator Jackson to explain his vote.

12 SENATOR JACKSON: Thank you,
13 Mr. President.

14 I'm rising in order to support the
15 bill from my colleague. And in fact there is
16 another bill which I had, but I read her bill and
17 I said, Your bill has everything combined in
18 there that you need.

19 For example, to make sure that at
20 least 10 percent of the fund goes towards helping
21 people recover from the type of substance abuse
22 that they may be having, plus the fund having a
23 list of all those that you give it to, the amount
24 of money, and then have it up on the board so
25 it's public.

1 We need to make sure that the money
2 is spent in an appropriate way. And my colleague
3 and I had a discussion about that, and I
4 complimented her on her bill and said, I support
5 it wholeheartedly, even though I have one which
6 is not as -- as like hers, but hers is better.
7 And so I support her wholeheartedly.

8 Thank you. I vote aye.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
10 Jackson to be recorded in the affirmative.

11 Announce the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 1581, Senate Print 8504A, by Senator Harckham, an
17 act to amend the Public Authorities Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
3 Calendar 1581, voting in the negative:
4 Senator Borrello.

5 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 1586, Senate Print 9031, by Senator Helming, an
10 act authorizing the Commissioner of
11 General Services to transfer and convey certain
12 state land to the Livingston County Water and
13 Sewer Authority.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
25 is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 1587, Senate Print 9065A, by Senator Palumbo, an
3 act to amend the Town Law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 7. This
7 act shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 1589, Senate Print 9071, by Senator Kavanagh,
18 an act to amend the Tax Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
22 act shall take effect immediately.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
2 the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 1590, Senate Print 9130A, by Senator Ryan, an act
8 to amend the State Finance Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
12 act shall take effect on the first of April.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1592, Assembly Bill Number 10042, by
23 Assemblymember Thiele, an act in relation to
24 authorizing the trustees of Tuckahoe Common
25 School District to submit a proposition to the

1 qualified voters.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. this
5 act shall take effect immediately.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
10 the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
13 is passed.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 1593, Assembly Bill Number 9827, by
16 Assemblymember Barrett, an act to amend the
17 Public Service Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
21 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it
22 shall have become a law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
2 the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 1596, Assembly Bill Number 10215A, by
8 Assemblymember Bores, an act to amend the
9 General Business Law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
11 last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
13 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it
14 shall have become a law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
19 Fernandez to explain her vote.

20 SENATOR FERNANDEZ: You know,
21 Mr. President, back in my day, when you wanted to
22 make a reservation at a restaurant, you just had
23 to call and give them the time and the date, and
24 they would put you on their schedule and you'd
25 come at that time. But apparently that's not

1 where we are today.

2 This bill is important because it
3 prohibits unauthorized parties from arranging
4 reservations with food service establishments
5 without their consent. The purpose of this bill
6 is to ensure that online third-party food service
7 reservation apps contain consent from the
8 restaurants before marketing or making seating
9 reservations on their behalf.

10 The need for this bill is clear.
11 The rise of predatory third-party online
12 platforms has inflicted significant harm on our
13 restaurant industry and its consumers. Imagine,
14 you've got to pay \$500 for a reservation and then
15 \$500 for the meal. It's crazy.

16 These platforms, operating without
17 authorization from restaurants, exploit loopholes
18 to the market and sell reservations at crazy
19 prices, leaving consumers burdened with excessive
20 fees and restaurants with empty seats. Moreover,
21 instances of double-booking reservations further
22 exacerbate the problem, leaving both consumers
23 and the restaurant at a loss.

24 I urge my Senate colleagues to join
25 me in sending a clear message that New York

1 stands with its restaurants and the customers,
2 and that we will not tolerate predatory practices
3 that threaten the vitality of our hospitality
4 industry.

5 Thank you, and I vote aye.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
7 Fernandez to be recorded in the affirmative.

8 Senator Borrello to explain his
9 vote.

10 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you,
11 Mr. President.

12 As a restaurant owner, I can tell
13 you this is an interesting situation. We now
14 have scalping when it comes to restaurant
15 reservations. That's what this amounts to,
16 essentially. These companies book up
17 reservations at typically restaurants that are
18 difficult to get a reservation, and then they
19 sell them online, as Senator Fernandez
20 described -- you know, basically scalping that
21 reservation.

22 But now with the implementation of
23 AI, we're seeing it go even further. At my
24 restaurant we've received phone calls from an
25 AI robot making a reservation on behalf of

1 someone who never called for it. It's really
2 quite amazing.

3 So I think I -- I want to thank the
4 sponsor for this bill. I think this is
5 responsible, so we can preserve the integrity of
6 the restaurant industry here in New York State.

7 I vote aye. Thank you.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
9 Borrello to be recorded in the affirmative.

10 Announce the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
13 is passed.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 1597, Assembly Bill Number 10318, by
16 Assemblymember Eachus, an act authorizing the
17 Town of New Windsor to alienate certain parklands
18 for use as a sewer treatment plant.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: There is
20 a home-rule message at the desk.

21 Read the last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)
2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
3 the results.
4 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.
5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
6 is passed.
7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 1608, Senate Print 9672, by Senator Gianaris,
9 an act to amend the Executive Law.
10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
11 last section.
12 THE SECRETARY: Section 10. This
13 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
14 shall have become a law.
15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
16 roll.
17 (The Secretary called the roll.)
18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
19 the results.
20 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
21 Calendar 1608, voting in the negative:
22 Senator Mannion.
23 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.
24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
25 is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 1609, Senate Print 9677A, by Senator Gianaris, an
3 act to amend the Election Law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
7 act shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
14 Calendar 1609, those Senators voting in the
15 negative are Senators Gallivan and Ortt.

16 Ayes, 58. Nays, 2.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 1610, Senate Print 9679A, by Senator Hinchey, an
21 act to amend the Cannabis Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
5 the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
7 Calendar 1610, those Senators voting in the
8 negative are Senators Ashby,
9 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffio, Lanza,
10 Martinez, Martins, Mattera, Murray, Ortt,
11 Palumbo, Rhoads, Stec, Weber and Weik.

12 Ayes, 45. Nays, 15.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 1623, Assembly Bill Number 10462, by
17 Assemblymember Fall, an act to amend Chapter 306
18 of the Laws of 2011.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
22 act shall take effect immediately.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
2 the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 1642, Senate Print 5779E, by Senator Oberacker,
8 an act to amend the Real Property Tax Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
12 act shall take effect immediately.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1682, Senate Print 9809, by Senator Thomas, an
23 act authorizing the Town of Hempstead to transfer
24 ownership of certain parkland to the Village of
25 Freeport.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: There is
2 a home-rule message at the desk.

3 Read the last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This
5 act shall take effect immediately.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
10 the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
13 is passed.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 1693, Senate Print 6678B, by Senator Rolison, an
16 act to amend the General Municipal Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: There is
18 a home-rule message at the desk.

19 Read the last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 1750, Senate Print 9822, by Senator Sepúlveda, an
7 act to amend the Real Property Tax Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
19 is passed.

20 Senator Gianaris, that completes the
21 reading of today's calendar.

22 SENATOR GIANARIS: Let's move on to
23 the supplemental calendar, please.

24 (Pause.)

25 SENATOR GIANARIS: I understand we

1 have messages from the Assembly before we take up
2 the supplemental calendar.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
4 Secretary will read.

5 THE SECRETARY: Senator Cleare
6 moves to discharge, from the Committee on
7 Consumer Protection, Assembly Bill Number 43C and
8 substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
9 2279C, Third Reading Calendar 1825.

10 Senator Cleare moves to discharge,
11 from the Committee on Cultural Affairs, Tourism,
12 Parks and Recreation, Assembly Bill Number 717A
13 and substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
14 3565A, Third Reading Calendar 1831.

15 Senator Sanders moves to discharge,
16 from the Committee on Insurance, Assembly Bill
17 Number 2866 and substitute it for the identical
18 Senate Bill 4199, Third Reading Calendar 1833.

19 Senator Scarcella-Spanton moves to
20 discharge, from the Committee on Veterans,
21 Homeland Security and Military Affairs,
22 Assembly Bill Number 6834A and substitute it for
23 the identical Senate Bill 6623, Third Reading
24 Calendar 1838.

25 Senator Cleare moves to discharge,

1 from the Committee on Health, Assembly Bill
2 Number 8410 and substitute it for the identical
3 Senate Bill 7810, Third Reading Calendar 1846.

4 Senator Harckham moves to discharge,
5 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
6 Number 9330A and substitute it for the identical
7 Senate Bill 8506A, Third Reading Calendar 1851.

8 Senator Hinchey moves to discharge,
9 from the Committee on Finance, Assembly Bill
10 Number 8374 and substitute it for the identical
11 Senate Bill 8958, Third Reading Calendar 1856.

12 Senator Scarcella-Spanton moves to
13 discharge, from the Committee on Health,
14 Assembly Bill Number 9204 and substitute it for
15 the identical Senate Bill 9049, Third Reading
16 Calendar 1857.

17 Senator Kavanagh moves to discharge,
18 from the Committee on Health, Assembly Bill
19 Number 7516A and substitute it for the identical
20 Senate Bill 9283, Third Reading Calendar 1861.

21 Senator Persaud moves to discharge,
22 from the Committee on Social Services,
23 Assembly Bill Number 10230 and substitute it for
24 the identical Senate Bill 9343, Third Reading
25 Calendar 1864.

1 Senator Cooney moves to discharge,
2 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
3 Number 8557 and substitute it for the identical
4 Senate Bill 9361, Third Reading Calendar 1865.

5 Senator Parker moves to discharge,
6 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
7 Number 9403A and substitute it for the identical
8 Senate Bill 9797, Third Reading Calendar 1871.

9 Senator Brouk moves to discharge,
10 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
11 Number 9018 and substitute it for the identical
12 Senate Bill 8715, Third Reading Calendar 1852.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: So
14 ordered.

15 Senator Gianaris.

16 SENATOR GIANARIS: Let's take up
17 the supplemental calendar, please.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
19 Secretary will read.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 1823, Senate Print 902B, by Senator Brisport, an
22 act to amend the Social Services Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This act

1 shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
6 Brisport to explain his vote.

7 SENATOR BRISPORT: Thank you,
8 Madam President.

9 With jaw-dropping frequency,
10 Black children and children of color in the U.S.
11 are separated from safe, loving families, often
12 solely on the basis of poverty, and placed into a
13 famously dangerous and underfunded foster care
14 system. They are cut off from their loved ones,
15 their heritage, and their sense of stability.

16 And becoming the subject of a CPS
17 investigation is not only terrifying because of
18 these extraordinary stakes, but because the
19 investigation itself can be a waking nightmare.
20 Children are subjected to strip searches by a
21 stranger, seeing their parents powerless to stop
22 it, and not understanding why.

23 Parents are often made to feel like
24 they have to risk losing their job by missing
25 work to accommodate the investigation. Children

1 fall behind in school as they are repeatedly
2 pulled out of class and questioned by CPS agents.

3 An experience this damaging should
4 be rare, yet by the time they turn 18 over half
5 of all Black children in the U.S. will be the
6 subject of a CPS investigation. This process is
7 so traumatic and so easy to trigger that it's
8 also an enormously effective means of harassment
9 for those with a score to settle. If a
10 vulnerable parent, particularly a poor person or
11 a woman of color, has the audacity to anger
12 anyone in her life, she risks them retaliating by
13 subjecting her to this awful scenario.

14 This becomes especially dangerous in
15 cases of domestic abuse. Those who manage to
16 escape an abusive relationship often find that
17 their abuser escalates the harassment. For an
18 abuser, CPS is the perfect weapon. With one
19 phone call, he can drag his victim through a
20 terrifying process, and he can do it over and
21 over and over again.

22 Making false reports like this is
23 illegal, but there is virtually no way for them
24 to get caught because the phone call is
25 completely anonymous.

1 With such an effective means of
2 harassment available, it's unsurprising that of
3 the 10,000 anonymous reports made to CPS each
4 year, only 3.5 percent turn out to be credible.

5 This bill will go a long way to
6 protecting vulnerable people from harassment
7 reporting by requiring the state to collect
8 identifying information about those who make a
9 report to CPS. That information will be
10 confidential and unknown to the public, but the
11 state will finally have a path to investigate
12 cases of harassment reporting.

13 Yet we must also acknowledge that
14 our CPS system has only been a viable weapon
15 because it is so enormously traumatic and
16 destructive to those who experience it. This is
17 a historic step toward protecting families' civil
18 rights, and I hope that it is quickly followed by
19 action to address the root issues.

20 I vote aye.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
22 Brisport to be recorded in the affirmative.

23 Announce the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
25 Calendar 1823, voting in the negative:

1 Senator Martinez.

2 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 1824, Senate Print 1292A, by Senator Parker,
7 an act to amend the Environmental Conservation
8 Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Calendar
10 1824 is high and will be laid aside for the day.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 1825, Assembly Bill Number 43C, by
13 Assemblymember Rosenthal, an act to amend the
14 General Business Law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
18 act shall take effect immediately.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
25 Calendar 1825, those Senators voting in the

1 negative are Senators Borrello, Gallivan, Griffo,
2 Oberacker, Ortt and Stec. Also Senator O'Mara.

3 Ayes, 53. Nays, 7.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 1826, Senate Print 2566B, by Senator Cooney, an
8 act to amend the Cannabis Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 14. This
12 act shall take effect immediately.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
19 Calendar 1826, those Senators voting in the
20 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
21 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Helming,
22 Martins, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara,
23 Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco, Weber and
24 Weik. Also Senator Martinez.

25 Senator Murray in the affirmative.

1 Ayes, 43. Nays, 17.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 1827, Senate Print 2812A, by Senator Gounardes,
6 an act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

7 SENATOR SERRANO: Lay it aside
8 temporarily.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
10 will be laid aside temporarily.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 1828, Senate Print 3144E, by Senator Mannion, an
13 act to amend the Retirement and Social Security
14 Law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
18 act shall take effect immediately.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Excuse

1 me. Senator Mannion to explain his vote.

2 SENATOR MANNION: Thank you,
3 Madam President.

4 You know, municipalities, state
5 agencies, law enforcement that are working in
6 municipalities are having greater and greater
7 challenges in relation to staffing those
8 departments. We need to make sure that we
9 maintain our bridges, deal with constituent
10 issues, and keep our communities safe. It is
11 time to raise the earning limitations on
12 individuals that are retired without a waiver.

13 Currently that number is \$35,000.
14 This legislation proposes that it be raised to
15 \$50,000. We're talking about individuals that
16 have already served in this capacity. They're
17 trained, they're experienced, and it's time to
18 make sure that we support them. And, in that
19 sense, we're supporting our municipalities.

20 I proudly vote aye. Thank you,
21 Madam President.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
23 Mannion to be recorded in the affirmative.

24 Announce the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
2 is passed.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 1829, Senate Print 3250, by Senator Salazar, an
5 act to amend the Correction Law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
14 the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
16 Calendar 1829, those Senators voting in the
17 negative are Senators Borrello,
18 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
19 Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker,
20 O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco,
21 Weber and Weik.

22 Ayes, 42. Nays, 18.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1831, Assembly Bill Number 717A, by
2 Assemblymember Gibbs, an act to amend the
3 Arts and Cultural Affairs Law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
7 act shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 1832, Senate Print 3587A, by Senator Helming, an
18 act to amend the Mental Hygiene Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
22 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it
23 shall have become a law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)
2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
3 the results.
4 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.
5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
6 is passed.
7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 1833, Assembly Bill Number 2866, by
9 Assemblymember Pheffer Amato, an act to amend the
10 Insurance Law.
11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
12 last section.
13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
14 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
15 shall have become a law.
16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
17 roll.
18 (The Secretary called the roll.)
19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
20 the results.
21 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.
22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
23 is passed.
24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 1834, Senate Print 4457A, by Senator Liu, an act

1 to amend the General Business Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
5 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
6 shall have become a law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
11 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick to explain her vote.

12 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK:
13 Thank you, Madam President.

14 While I recognize the need to
15 protect an individual's biometric information, I
16 believe this legislation should have an exclusion
17 for the collection and retention of biometric
18 information for security purposes as it relates
19 to the state's critical infrastructure.

20 In many instances across New York
21 State, collected biometric information is a
22 critical tool used for the protection of national
23 security and critical infrastructure, and the
24 collection and retention of that information
25 should be allowed as an exemption under this

1 state law.

2 So for those reasons,
3 Madam President, I'll be voting in the negative.

4 Thank you.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
6 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick to be recorded in the
7 negative.

8 Announce the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
10 Calendar 1834, those Senators voting in the
11 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
12 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Griffo, Helming, Lanza,
13 Martins, Mattera, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt,
14 Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Weber
15 and Weik.

16 Ayes, 42. Nays, 18.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 1835, Senate Print 5623A, by Senator Krueger, an
21 act to amend the Judiciary Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
5 the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
7 Calendar 1835, those Senators voting in the
8 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
9 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
10 Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker,
11 O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec,
12 Tedisco, Weber and Weik.

13 Ayes, 40. Nays, 20.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 1836, Senate Print 5877A, by Senator Salazar, an
18 act to amend the Correction Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
22 act shall take effect immediately.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
2 the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
4 Calendar 1836, those Senators voting in the
5 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
6 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
7 Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker,
8 O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec,
9 Tedisco, Weber and Weik.

10 Ayes, 40. Nays, 20.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 1837, Senate Print 6306B, by Senator Jackson, an
15 act to amend the Retirement and Social Security
16 Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
20 act shall take effect immediately.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
25 the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 1838, Assembly Bill Number 6834A, by
6 Assemblymember Jean-Pierre, an act to amend
7 Chapter 154 of the Laws of 1921.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
16 Sepúlveda to explain his vote.

17 SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA: Thank you,
18 Madam President, for allowing me to explain my
19 vote.

20 This bill was put together to
21 correct an injustice that happens to those
22 members who are part of the judiciary. If any
23 person -- a police officer or a teacher -- dies
24 while in office, that person's family will be
25 entitled to receive their entire pension.

1 However, for some curious reasons, judges were
2 not afforded the same consideration.

3 If a judge died while in office,
4 then his family or her family would receive a
5 one-time payout which is considerably less than
6 the benefits that the family -- that the person,
7 the judge, would have received had he been alive
8 and retired. Thus they call it the Death Gamble
9 Bill, because any judge who died while in office,
10 their families would get a much -- significantly
11 smaller portion of their pension benefits.

12 What this bill would do, it will
13 treat judges the same way you treat teachers,
14 police officers, and allow the family members of
15 those judges who die while in office to receive
16 the pension benefits that the judge would have
17 received had he remained alive. So the family
18 will now receive a considerable amount of money
19 commensurate with the pension benefits that the
20 judge would have been receiving.

21 So this bill is strongly supported
22 by several bar associations, by multiple judges'
23 associations, because it's the right thing to do.
24 We should treat our judges the same way we treat
25 many of our public employees.

1 I vote aye.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
3 Sepúlveda to be recorded in the affirmative.

4 Just to clarify, this is
5 Calendar Number 1838.

6 Announce the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1839, Senate Print 7128B, by Senator Gounardes,
12 an act to amend the General Municipal Law.

13 SENATOR SERRANO: Lay it aside
14 temporarily.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
16 will be laid aside temporarily.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 1840, Senate Print 7498A, by Senator Jackson, an
19 act to amend the --

20 SENATOR SERRANO: Lay it aside
21 temporarily.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
23 will be laid aside temporarily.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 1841, Senate Print 7567A, by Senator Sepúlveda,

1 an act to amend the Retirement and
2 Social Security Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA: Thank you,
11 Madam President, for allowing me to reexplain my
12 vote at the right time.

13 (Laughter.)

14 SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA: There was a
15 little confusion. I indicated that I wanted to
16 speak on my bill, but there was some confusion,
17 so I jumped the gun.

18 But I'll reiterate what I said. The
19 bill was designed to give the judges the same
20 treatment that other public employees receive,
21 like police officers and teachers.

22 Currently if a judge dies while in
23 office, the family will receive a small portion
24 of the judge's retirement benefits, a one-time
25 payment that is significantly less than if the

1 judge had lived and retired. Thus it's called
2 the Death Gamble Bill, because a judge is
3 gambling on not dying while in office.

4 What this bill does, it corrects an
5 injustice. Everyone, all public employees,
6 should be treated equally. What will happen now
7 with this bill is that the judge's family will
8 receive the same benefits that the judge, had he
9 lived, would have received upon retirement.

10 This bill has a lot of support
11 amongst many bar associations, amongst many
12 judges' associations, because it's the right
13 thing to do. We should treat our judges with the
14 same consideration that we treat other employees.

15 I vote aye. Thank you.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
17 Sepúlveda to be recorded in the affirmative.

18 Senator Bailey to explain his vote.

19 SENATOR BAILEY: Thank you,
20 Madam President.

21 I want to thank Senator Sepúlveda
22 for introducing this important piece of
23 legislation.

24 As Senator Sepúlveda said, this is
25 going to be very important for the members of the

1 judiciary to receive some -- a bit of assurance
2 that if something were untimely to happen to
3 them, that they would receive the same assurances
4 that many members in other municipal classes do.

5 As Senator Sepúlveda also said,
6 there are a number of other bar associations,
7 Supreme Court Justice associations, who have been
8 telling us that this is something that they need
9 for their livelihood in the event that something
10 happens to them. So I'm very glad that we got
11 this done today.

12 I vote aye, Madam President.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
14 Bailey to be recorded in the affirmative.

15 Senator Jackson to explain his vote.

16 SENATOR JACKSON: Thank you,
17 Madam President.

18 I rise to support the bill. As the
19 chair of the Civil Service and Pensions
20 Committee, this is the type of bill that we work
21 on. So clearly I support that, with respect to
22 someone dying while they're in office versus, you
23 know, when they retire, the amount of money that
24 they receive for their families is extremely
25 important.

1 So Madam President, I highly support
2 this bill.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
4 Jackson to be recorded in the affirmative.

5 Announce the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
8 is passed.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 1842, Senate Print 7649A, by Senator Mannion, an
11 act to amend the Canal Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
15 act shall take effect immediately.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
22 Calendar 1842, voting in the negative are
23 Senators Ashby and Oberacker.

24 Ayes, 58. Nays, 2.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill

1 is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 1843, Senate Print 7694A, by Senator Gounardes,
4 an act to amend the General Business Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
8 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
9 shall have become a law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
14 Gounardes to explain his vote.

15 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Thank you,
16 Madam President.

17 My comments are going to be about
18 both this bill and the following bill on the
19 calendar.

20 I'm standing here today for one
21 simple reason, because I want our children, my
22 children, to live in a world where Big Tech does
23 not profit at their expense -- doesn't profit off
24 of their mental health, doesn't profit off of
25 their personal data, and most of all doesn't

1 profit off of their lives.

2 Social media is an overwhelming
3 presence in the lives of our children. Up to
4 95 percent of American teenagers use social
5 media, with more than a third saying they use it
6 almost constantly. And it's not just teens --
7 nearly 40 percent of children aged 8 to 12 say
8 they use social media as well.

9 This transformation of young
10 people's lives has come with nearly no oversight
11 or regulation, and the consequences of
12 government's failure to act have been
13 catastrophic. In fact the last time Congress
14 passed comprehensive internet safety legislation
15 for kids was -- wait for it -- 1998. That's
16 right, back when we were all still getting
17 America Online discs sent to us in the mail
18 multiple times a week.

19 By now the link between social media
20 and mental health is clear: Teens who use social
21 media for more than three hours each day face
22 twice the risk of having depression and anxiety.

23 One study found that amongst young
24 girls, the correlation between negative mental
25 health impacts and social media use was stronger

1 than the links with binge drinking, sexual
2 assault or hard drug use.

3 In the last year, nearly one in
4 three teenage girls reported having seriously
5 considered suicide. One in five LGBTQ teens said
6 the same. Over the last decade plus,
7 self-poisonings amongst 10-to-12-year-old girls
8 have quadrupled. Hospital admissions for
9 self-harm have tripled among young girls aged
10 10 to 14, and their suicide rate has doubled.
11 And emergency room visits for suicidal ideation
12 have doubled amongst all adolescents.

13 And the U.S. Surgeon General -- not
14 Andrew Gounardes, but the chief public health
15 official in the country -- says that social media
16 is a driving factor in this crisis, and that
17 social media is unsafe for kids. He compared
18 what's happening in social media to the
19 equivalent of having children in cars that have
20 no safety features and driving on roads with no
21 speed limits, no traffic lights, and no rules
22 whatsoever.

23 Now, social medias claim to care
24 about this crisis. They claim that they're doing
25 everything they can to protect young users and to

1 create safe spaces online, notwithstanding the
2 fact that they have fought us every step of the
3 way to get to this point, spending a million
4 dollars to lobby against these bills in
5 particular.

6 The fact of the matter is that their
7 very business model is built on maximizing user
8 engagement and keeping our eyes glued to their
9 screens for as long as possible so that they can
10 sell us ads.

11 And the numbers prove it. In 2022
12 social media companies like Instagram and TikTok
13 made nearly \$11 billion in ad revenue just from
14 users under the age of 18. Care about this
15 crisis? Big Tech is profiting off of it. If
16 Big Tech had their way, they would keep kids in
17 speeding cars without seat belts.

18 But today, today we're going to act.
19 Today we're putting seat belts back in cars. The
20 SAFE For Kids Act and the New York Child Data
21 Protection Act get at the heart of this crisis by
22 regulating two of social media's most harmful
23 tools against youth -- addictive algorithms and
24 predatory data collection.

25 All of us who use social media know

1 how powerful these algorithms can be -- these
2 algorithms that are intentionally designed to
3 mimic the psychological dependencies created by
4 slot machines and online gambling sites,
5 resulting in what psychologists refer to as
6 variable reinforcement schedules: The phenomenon
7 that we are inexplicably drawn back to our feeds
8 and keep scrolling in the hopes that we'll find
9 something that is redeeming or engaging, much
10 like a gambler is drawn back to a slot machine to
11 pull the lever just one more time -- because this
12 time they know they might hit that payoff.

13 What makes these algorithms so
14 powerful and so profitable is social media
15 companies' ability to collect, manipulate and
16 sell our children's personal information. These
17 algorithms feed off of kids' searches and data,
18 bombarding them with content to keep them online
19 as long as possible, no matter how much more
20 anxious, depressed, marginalized or simply
21 distracted they feel afterwards.

22 We don't have to just contemplate
23 hypotheticals. I'm thinking today about a young
24 16-year-old boy named Chase Nasca, whose family
25 lives in Senator Weik's district, I believe.

1 Chase tragically took his life two years ago this
2 past March.

3 His parents recently shared with me
4 a video recording of his TikTok feed, which was
5 filled with what can only be described as
6 psychologically disturbing videos that preyed
7 upon his teenage insecurities and actually
8 encouraged suicide.

9 One clip had music playing against a
10 backdrop of a rainstorm while a narrator said:
11 Is it really worth it if you're only happy some
12 of the time?

13 This was followed by a video saying
14 "All it takes is four tablespoons of salt" --
15 which is literally a how-to guide for self-harm
16 and suicide -- followed immediately by a video of
17 a cartoon character pleading to another
18 character, "Please tell me I'm a good person.
19 Please tell me I'm a good person. Please tell me
20 it will be okay," followed by silence.

21 Just think for a moment how content
22 like that could affect a young person who's
23 suffering from anxiety or depression, or even
24 just going through a period of self-doubt and
25 searching, during an incredibly impressionable

1 age. He was just 16. We were all 16 at one
2 point. I'm sure we all had those moments in our
3 lives. Now imagine seeing that content over and
4 over and over thousands of times over again, just
5 like Chase did.

6 Social media algorithms are
7 heat-seeking missiles designed to target a user's
8 vulnerabilities and maximize user engagement at
9 ail costs. They found Chase. They find all of
10 us eventually.

11 The SAFE For Kids Act restricts
12 social platforms from offering addictive feeds to
13 users under 18 without parental consent.
14 Instead, kids will see a chronological feed of
15 content from pages they already follow or of
16 generally popular content -- the same way social
17 media used to work.

18 The bill also prohibits social media
19 platforms from sending notifications to minors
20 from midnight to 6 a.m. without parental consent.

21 The Child Data Protection Act
22 prohibits internet companies from collecting,
23 using, sharing and selling kids' personal data
24 for commercial purposes unless they too receive
25 consent.

1 These laws will protect children and
2 teens from the addictive algorithms and predatory
3 data collection that we know are keeping young
4 people glued to their screens and hurting their
5 mental health.

6 Now, you may have seen over the last
7 few months how tech has responded to our efforts
8 here. They've created astroturf coalitions to
9 feign opposition to our bills and tried to
10 convince us that social media algorithms are
11 good. They've waged a vigorous whisper campaign
12 to sow doubt about our efforts and instead have
13 asked us to trust them to protect kids on their
14 platforms. And they've spread misinformation
15 about what these bills do and have tried to claim
16 that these bills will shut down the internet for
17 minors.

18 In other words, Madam President,
19 they want us to believe that kids are safer
20 without seat belts. But we know better.

21 These regulations are not radical.
22 They are not restrictions on free speech. They
23 are not anti-innovation, and they are certainly
24 not anti-tech. They are common sense. They
25 create an internet that is safer and better for

1 everyone. They make clear that our children's
2 privacy and their mental health are not for sale.
3 They are a statement of our values, that our kids
4 come first.

5 So in closing, I want to first thank
6 our Majority Leader, Andrea Stewart-Cousins, who
7 never wavered in her commitment to ensure that we
8 act to protect children from the harms of social
9 media.

10 I want to thank Governor Hochul and
11 Attorney General James for their steadfast
12 support of these measures.

13 I want to thank my colleague
14 Assemblymember Nily Rozic for channeling her
15 anxieties as a parent -- as have I -- into taking
16 bold action to protect our children.

17 And I want to thank the staff that
18 worked tirelessly to make these bills a reality,
19 including both our own central staff as well as
20 my legislative staff.

21 And most of all, Madam President, I
22 want to thank our incredible coalition of
23 parents, teachers, doctors and young people
24 themselves, for giving us the strength and
25 momentum to take on some of the most powerful

1 companies in the world and, after this vote,
2 winning.

3 As a New Yorker and as a dad, I'm
4 immensely proud to be sponsoring these bills and
5 to vote aye to pass them here on this floor
6 today. And I encourage all of my colleagues to
7 do the same.

8 Thank you.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
10 Gounardes to be recorded in the affirmative.

11 Senator Martins to explain his vote.

12 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,
13 Madam President.

14 I rise to also support this bill and
15 the following bill.

16 Clearly I think we all understand
17 the scourge that social media has been on our
18 youth. We've seen examples across this country.
19 There are lawsuits by municipalities in
20 Washington State. There's a law that was passed
21 in the State of Utah very similar to what we're
22 passing here today. Unfortunately, they did it
23 about a year and a half ago; we're doing it now.

24 But I'm glad we're doing it, because
25 it's never too late to do the right thing. And

1 we all understand that our children have been at
2 risk because of the algorithms and the data
3 collection and the targeting that has happened
4 systemically for far too long.

5 I would have liked to have seen more
6 parental oversight included in these bills. For
7 an example, you can go back and look at that
8 Utah legislation or you can look at a piece of
9 legislation that was introduced in this chamber
10 since April of 2023, six months before this
11 legislation was actually introduced, which did
12 just that.

13 I'm not complaining,
14 Madam President, I'm merely pointing it out. I'm
15 commending the sponsor for having done the job
16 that we all voted for just now, because it's rare
17 to see unanimity in this chamber on something as
18 important as this, and I'm glad we are.

19 But I would have liked to have seen
20 more parental oversight when it comes to access
21 to these accounts, overseeing them. Because one
22 of the things we should rely on is family, and
23 the ability of family and parents to have access
24 to those accounts, monitor those accounts.
25 Because as the father of children myself, I've

1 seen that that's all too often a missing
2 ingredient when we see the kind of bullying and
3 attacks and targeting that take place on social
4 media.

5 So I call to commend the sponsor and
6 the chamber for the universal support that we
7 have for this. I will lament that I would like
8 to see something else, but that's perhaps
9 something we can work on as we go forward
10 together.

11 Madam President, I vote aye.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
13 Martins to be recorded in the affirmative.

14 Senator Myrie to explain his vote.

15 SENATOR MYRIE: Thank you,
16 Madam President.

17 Let me first congratulate and
18 commend Senator Gouardes, who has been
19 absolutely relentless in his pursuit of getting
20 this done. There's an entire generation of
21 New Yorkers and, dare I say it, a young
22 generation across the country that are going to
23 benefit because of the fight that he put up to
24 get this done. So I think it's important for us
25 to recognize that, as well as the Office of the

1 Attorney General and Assemblymember Rozic.

2 For anyone that questions what the
3 real-life implications of this bill are, we here
4 in New York City have seen children ride subways
5 and die because these were in their social media
6 feeds. Tensions between young people that in the
7 past would have dissipated in person, escalate to
8 social media beefs where people bring guns to
9 schools and people kill each other. And they get
10 that content fed to them continuously.

11 So this is a public safety measure
12 today that I am so proud to be voting in support
13 of, and that I'm grateful to our leadership and
14 to the families that fought to make it happen.

15 I proudly vote aye. Thank you.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
17 Myrie to be recorded in the affirmative.

18 Senator Bailey to explain his vote.

19 SENATOR BAILEY: Thank you,
20 Madam President.

21 There is no greater force in this
22 Legislature than a determined parent. And
23 Senator Andrew Gounardes is not just a determined
24 parent, he's a damn good lawmaker with a
25 relentless spirit and a good spirit to make sure

1 that the future of New York will be safe.

2 As you've heard me, Madam President,
3 I have a 9-year-old daughter, Giada, a 7-year-old
4 daughter, Carina, and I have a -- he'll be
5 eight weeks old, Julian, my son. Julian will
6 benefit from Andrew Senator Gounardes's
7 legislation. By the time he's able to pick up
8 the iPad for the first time, he will not see
9 these addictive feeds. He will not see, he will
10 not have to go through what so many of our kids
11 go through right now.

12 Right now this man who sits right
13 next to me is going to change the life of my son.
14 If that doesn't get to you, if that doesn't tell
15 you how real this is, Madam President, then I
16 don't know what -- I don't know what we're doing
17 in this chamber.

18 The Information Superhighway used to
19 be much simpler when there was just AOL CDs and
20 the dial-up and the AOL Instant Messenger. But
21 now we're in a different era. And who of us in
22 this chamber has not gone down the YouTube rabbit
23 hole or the Instagram real rabbit hole and have
24 had to tell ourselves it's time to stop?

25 Well, the young individual doesn't

1 have that ability to have that impulse control.
2 They don't know when it's time to stop. But
3 Andrew Gounardes is telling them it's time to
4 stop. It is time to stop the doom scrolling. It
5 is time to stop the addictive feeds. It is time
6 to stop the data collection. It is time to stop.

7 I thank you, Senator Gounardes.

8 I thank Attorney General Tish James.

9 I thank Assemblywoman Nily Rozic.

10 And I proudly vote aye,
11 Madam President.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
13 Bailey to be recorded in the affirmative.

14 Senator Sepúlveda to explain his
15 vote.

16 SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA: Thank you,
17 Madam President, for allowing me to explain my
18 vote.

19 I have to modify a little bit what
20 my colleague Senator Bailey said. The biggest
21 motivating factor in our society is when we do
22 good for our children.

23 I have a 12-year-old. I see the
24 impact that these platforms have, these websites
25 have on his mindset. I can see when he gets

1 depressed, he gets angry. And when I speak to
2 his young friends, when you take away the phones
3 and you take away their access to these
4 platforms, it really has a deleterious effect on
5 their mentality. We've read about suicides.
6 We've read about children engaging in destructive
7 behavior and dangerous behavior as a result of
8 what they see on these platforms.

9 And so what we're doing today is
10 passing legislation that's going to protect
11 generations of children.

12 Now, I have to really thank
13 Senator Gounardes, who also has a young child,
14 and my former colleague in the Assembly,
15 Nily Rozic, because I personally know the
16 difficulty that he had, the hard work that he had
17 to put in to pass this bill. I personally know
18 about some of the barriers that he had to face,
19 some of the artificial barriers and some of the
20 lobbying efforts that went on to prevent this
21 bill from passing.

22 So I want to thank you,
23 Senator Gounardes. What you've done will help my
24 child and generations of children to come. Thank
25 you for your great effort. You are a warrior,

1 and for that I will always be grateful.

2 I vote aye.

3 Oh, and I also want to thank, I'm
4 sorry, Attorney General Tish James, because I
5 know she worked diligently on this bill, and so
6 let's congratulate her as well.

7 Thank you.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
9 Sepúlveda to be recorded in the affirmative.

10 Senator Scarcella-Spanton to explain
11 her vote.

12 SENATOR SCARCELLA-SPANTON: Thank
13 you, Madam President.

14 And I really wanted to commend the
15 work that Senator Gounardes did on this bill, and
16 Assemblywoman Nily Rozic as well.

17 My kids are 10 and 8, so they're
18 right at the age where use of any iPads and stuff
19 is beginning to get really scary. I think that
20 this is going to set the model for what we should
21 do across the country. And I mean this from the
22 bottom of my heart, on behalf of every parent in
23 here, thank you to Andrew Gounardes.

24 I always joke that my daughter, when
25 I first got elected, her one wish was that I

1 would not ban iPads in the New York State Senate.
2 But to me, this is something that will allow her
3 to use that safely, making sure that I don't have
4 to be fearful of something she's going to stumble
5 upon.

6 But truly, thank you. And I very,
7 very proudly vote aye.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
9 Scarcella-Spanton to be recorded in the
10 affirmative.

11 Senator May to explain her vote.

12 SENATOR MAY: Thank you,
13 Madam President.

14 About a dozen years ago I came home
15 from work and turned on the family computer and
16 there on the desktop was a manual for how to
17 starve yourself. It said, number one, don't eat.
18 Number two, if you have to eat, eat only lettuce
19 and drink only water.

20 My preteen had clearly found this
21 online and was exploring how to become anorexic
22 or -- or kill herself, I don't know. But to this
23 day I think it was left there on the desktop as a
24 cry for help, but I have always wondered what if
25 my child had a laptop or a tablet or a cellphone

1 and it wasn't -- it wasn't something that was
2 shared with a parent.

3 And I -- I just also want to add my
4 voice to thanking Senator Gounardes for this
5 legislation and for helping parents in the future
6 avoid the kind of terror that I experienced at
7 that time, or the lack of knowledge that so many
8 have right now, about what their children are
9 seeing and what might be affecting their lives.

10 So I vote aye as well. Thank you.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
12 May to be recorded in the affirmative.

13 Announce the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
16 is passed.

17 (Applause.)

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 1844, Senate Print 7695B, by Senator Gounardes,
20 an act to amend the General Business Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
24 act shall take effect one year after it shall
25 have become a law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
5 the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
8 is passed.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 1845, Senate Print 7759A, by Senator Gianaris, an
11 act to amend the Executive Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
15 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
16 shall have become a law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
21 Weik to explain her vote.

22 SENATOR WEIK: Thank you,
23 Madam President.

24 I fear that committing this practice
25 into law encourages the behavior that could

1 really put bystanders, victims, alleged offenders
2 and law enforcement in harm's way.

3 And because it disregards the safety
4 of law enforcement, I'll be voting in the
5 negative.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
7 Weik to be recorded in the negative.

8 Announce the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
10 Calendar 1845, those Senators voting in the
11 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
12 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
13 Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker,
14 O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec,
15 Tedisco, Weber and Weik.

16 Ayes, 40. Nays, 20.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 1846, Assembly Bill Number 8410, by
21 Assemblymember Sillitti, an act to amend the
22 Public Health Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This

1 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
2 shall have become a law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
9 Calendar 1846, those Senators voting in the
10 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello, Gallivan,
11 Griffo, Helming, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker,
12 O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec,
13 Tedisco, Weber and Weik.

14 Ayes, 43. Nays, 17.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 1847, Senate Print 7837, by Senator Mannion, an
19 act to amend the Volunteer Firefighters' Benefit
20 Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
24 act shall take effect on the 120th day after it
25 shall have become a law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
5 the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
8 is passed.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 1848, Senate Print 8338A, by Senator Borrello, an
11 act to amend the Highway Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
15 act shall take effect immediately.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 1849, Senate Print 8422C, by Senator Skoufis, an

1 act to amend the Penal Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
5 act shall take effect on the first of November.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
10 the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
13 is passed.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 1850, Senate Print 8498A, by Senator Comrie, an
16 act to amend the State Finance Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
20 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
21 shall have become a law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 1851, Assembly Bill Number 9330A, by
7 Assemblymember Burdick, an act to amend the
8 General Municipal Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
12 act shall take effect July 1, 2025.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
19 Calendar 1851, those Senators voting in the
20 negative are Senators Borrello, Lanza, Oberacker,
21 Ortt, Rhoads and Weber. Also Senator O'Mara.

22 Ayes, 53. Nays, 7.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1852, Assembly Bill Number 9018, by
2 Assemblymember Bronson, an act to amend the
3 Social Services Law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
7 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
8 shall have become a law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
13 the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
15 Calendar 1852, those Senators voting in the
16 negative are Senators Borrello, Lanza, O'Mara,
17 Ortt and Weber.

18 Ayes, 55. Nays, 5.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1853, Senate Print 8788, by Senator Jackson, an
23 act to amend the Retirement and Social Security
24 Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 1854, Senate Print 8907A, by Senator Gonzalez, an
14 act to direct the Department of Health to
15 complete a report on the impact of hospital
16 closures.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
20 act shall take effect immediately.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
25 Gonzalez to explain her vote.

1 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Thank you,
2 Mr. President.

3 I am standing today to speak in
4 favor of this bill.

5 In the last year I have learned that
6 we have an undeclared health crisis in New York
7 State. We have seen, over the last two decades,
8 over 19 hospitals close across the city. And in
9 my own district, Mount Sinai Beth Israel, one of
10 the last full-scale hospitals in Lower Manhattan,
11 has moved to close and submitted their
12 application not once, but twice, putting
13 400,000 New Yorkers at risk.

14 The reason we have worked on this
15 bill, in addition to passing Senator Rivera's
16 bill to ensure that communities are engaged in
17 the hospital closures process -- processes, is
18 because when it comes to making the most critical
19 decisions about our communities' healthcare, we
20 need the maximum amount of data.

21 And right now, while the Department
22 of Health collects a significant amount of data,
23 it's on a case-by-case basis. And if we don't
24 aggregate that data and understand what the
25 individual closure impact will be on nearby

1 hospitals and especially on the local community,
2 we are doing our communities an inherent
3 disservice.

4 And so this bill aims to fix that by
5 requiring the Department of Health to aggregate
6 that data and identify distressed hospital zones.

7 And this isn't just a downstate
8 issue, as we saw this year not only with
9 Mount Sinai Beth Israel but the fight around SUNY
10 Downstate -- but we've also seen it upstate,
11 where there are numerous distressed hospitals.
12 And in the fight for Burdett, while I'm happy
13 that we've been able to save some of our
14 hospitals and critical services, we need to
15 ensure that moving forward we are setting a clear
16 standard for what a comprehensive closure process
17 looks like so we are never leaving any New Yorker
18 without the health access that they deserve.

19 So thank you. I want to thank the
20 leader. I want to thank the conference. And
21 again, I enthusiastically vote aye.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
23 Gonzalez to be recorded in the affirmative.

24 Announce the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
2 is passed.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 1855, Senate Print 8932A, by Senator Hinchey, an
5 act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
9 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
10 shall have become a law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
15 the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 1856, Assembly Bill Number 8374, by
21 Assemblymember McDonald, an act to amend the
22 General Municipal Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This

1 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
2 shall have become a law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 1857, Assembly Bill Number 9204, by
13 Assemblymember Paulin, an act to amend the
14 Public Health Law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
18 act shall take effect immediately.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill

1 is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 1858, Senate Print 9050, by Senator Hinchey, an
4 act to amend the Real Property Tax Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
8 act shall take effect immediately.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
13 the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 1859, Senate Print 9085, by Senator Martins, an
19 act authorizing the County of Nassau assessor to
20 accept an application for a real property tax
21 exemption.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
5 the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
7 Calendar 1859, voting in the negative:
8 Senator O'Mara.

9 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 1861, Senate Print 7516A, by Assemblymember Fall,
14 an act to amend the Public Health Law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
18 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it
19 shall have become a law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
2 is passed.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 1862, Senate Print 9332A, by Senator Martins, an
5 act in relation to authorizing the Town of
6 Oyster Bay to discontinue as parklands and convey
7 such parkland to the Department of Environmental
8 Conservation.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: There is
10 a home-rule message at the desk.

11 Read the last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 7. This
13 act shall take effect immediately.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
18 the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
21 is passed.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 1863, Senate Print 9339A, by Senator Comrie, an
24 act to enact the New York Utility Corporation
25 Securitization Act.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
2 last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 13. This
4 act shall take effect immediately.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
9 the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 1864, Assembly Bill Number 10230, by
15 Assemblymember Davila, an act to amend the
16 Social Services Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
20 act shall take effect immediately.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
25 the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 1865, Assembly Bill Number 8557, by
6 Assemblymember Magnarelli, an act to amend the
7 Vehicle and Traffic Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
11 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
12 shall have become a law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
19 Calendar 1865, those Senators voting in the
20 negative are Senators Ashby, Griffio, Helming,
21 Lanza, Oberacker, O'Mara and Ortt.

22 Ayes, 53. Nays, 7.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1866, Senate Print 9373, by Senator Gouardes, an
2 act to amend the Retirement and Social Security
3 Law.

4 SENATOR GIANARIS: Lay it aside
5 temporarily.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
7 will be laid aside temporarily.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 1867, Senate Print Number 9408C, by
10 Senator Hoylman-Sigal, an act to amend the
11 Hudson River Park Act.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This
15 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
16 shall have become a law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
21 the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1868, Senate Print 9658, by Senator Harckham, an
2 act to amend the Transportation Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
11 Borrello to explain his vote.

12 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you,
13 Mr. President.

14 The issue of road salt when it comes
15 to our inland waterways had been an issue for a
16 long time, going to back to my days as a county
17 legislator. I represent several inland lakes, as
18 do many of my Republican colleagues.

19 Unfortunately, this does not include
20 any input from my Republican colleagues. So most
21 of the lakes that are stressed and impacted
22 potentially by road salt will not have a
23 representative from the Minority Conference.

24 Now, you might say, well, there are
25 some lake groups that are in your districts. But

1 some of these lake groups don't have the balanced
2 approach that we need for something as important
3 to decide as whether we're going to sacrifice
4 public safety for environmental safety.

5 So I'll be voting no on this bill
6 until it's more balanced. Thank you.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
8 Borrello to be recorded in the negative.

9 Announce the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
11 Calendar 1868, those Senators voting in the
12 negative are Senators Borrello, Griffo, Helming,
13 Lanza, Mattera, Murray, O'Mara, Ortt, Rhoads,
14 Tedisco, Weber and Weik.

15 Ayes, 48. Nays, 12.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 1869, Senate Print 9721A, by Senator Stavisky, an
20 act to amend the Real Property Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
22 is high and will be laid aside for the day.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Calendar
24 Number 1870, Senate Print 9744, by
25 Senator Parker, an act to amend the

1 Public Authorities Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
5 act shall take effect immediately.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
10 the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
12 Calendar 1870, voting in the negative are
13 Senators Borrello, O'Mara and Ortt.

14 Ayes, 57. Nays, 3.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 1871, Assembly Bill Number 9403A, by
19 Assemblymember Santabarbara, an act to amend the
20 Not-For-Profit Corporation Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 1872, Senate Print 9827, by Senator Parker, an
10 act to amend the Social Services Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
14 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it
15 shall have become a law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
22 Calendar 1872, voting in the negative are
23 Senators Martins and Oberacker.

24 Ayes, 58. Nays, 2.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill

1 is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 1873, Senate Print 9829, by
4 Senator Stewart-Cousins, an act to amend
5 Chapter 118 of the Laws of 1969.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
14 the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 1874, Senate Print 9831A, by Senator Jackson, an
20 act to amend the Retirement and Social Security
21 Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
23 last section.

24 I'm sorry, the bill is high and will
25 be laid aside.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Calendar
2 1875, Senate Print Number 9832, by
3 Senator Hoylman-Sigal, an act to amend the
4 Labor Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
8 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
9 shall have become a law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
14 the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
16 Calendar 1875, those Senators voting in the
17 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
18 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Griffio, Helming, Lanza,
19 Martins, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara,
20 Ortt, Stec, Tedisco, Weber and Weik.

21 Ayes, 44. Nays, 16.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 1876, Senate Print 9837, by Senator Myrie, an act

1 to amend the Election Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
5 act shall take effect September 1, 2024.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
10 the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
12 Calendar 1876, those Senators voting in the
13 negative are Senators Borrello,
14 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
15 Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt,
16 Palumbo, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco, Weber and Weik.

17 Ayes, 43. Nays, 17.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 1877, Senate Print 9838, by Senator Skoufis, an
22 act to amend the Public Health Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This

1 act shall take effect 18 months after it shall
2 have become a law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
7 Borrello to explain his vote.

8 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you,
9 Mr. President.

10 I know that there are people who
11 think that this is the panacea that's going to
12 solve the prescription drug affordability
13 problem, but it's really not.

14 In fact, other states have passed
15 similar legislation -- Florida, Vermont,
16 Colorado, Maine, New Mexico, New Hampshire -- and
17 they have yet to be approved by the federal
18 government to import products.

19 But probably most importantly, the
20 biggest opponent to us importing products from
21 Canada is Canada itself. In fact, the Canadian
22 government has stated that their market is far
23 too small to have a real impact on U.S. drug
24 prices. And that the Minister of Health stated:
25 "There is no way we will allow any jurisdiction,

1 be it the state or another foreign jurisdiction,
2 to endanger the Canadian drug supply. We're
3 going to do everything in our power to make sure
4 that another country cannot be given the ability
5 to pillage our healthcare system for its own
6 benefit."

7 Now, I realize that Canada is a lot
8 smaller than us, and we can probably beat them in
9 a war. But I don't think this is the war we want
10 to pick. So with that, I do not think this is
11 the solution that we're looking for, so I'll be
12 voting no.

13 Thank you.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
15 Borrello to be recorded in the negative.

16 Senator Martins to explain his vote.

17 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,
18 Mr. President.

19 You know, a theme I hear throughout
20 my district -- and I think all of us hear
21 throughout our districts -- is that the cost of
22 healthcare in New York State is too high, the
23 cost of prescription drugs in New York is just
24 too high.

25 And so I have a different approach,

1 Mr. President. I have an all-tools-in-the-
2 toolbox approach. We should do everything we
3 can, in our power, to make drugs more accessible,
4 cheaper for everyone in New York State, including
5 senior citizens on fixed incomes, because that's
6 what we're supposed to do.

7 Mr. President, I vote aye.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
9 Martins to be recorded in the affirmative.

10 Senator Helming to explain her vote.

11 SENATOR HELMING: Thank you,
12 Mr. President.

13 I rise in support of the bill before
14 us. I certainly support doing whatever we can to
15 provide our constituents with more affordable
16 prescription drugs.

17 But I carry legislation that
18 incentivizes manufacturing drugs, other products
19 that we need, right here in New York State in the
20 United States of America. That's what we should
21 be working on, making sure that these important
22 items that New Yorkers depend upon are
23 manufactured here right here in the United
24 States, in New York State.

25 I vote aye, Mr. President.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
2 Helming to be recorded in the affirmative.

3 Announce the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
5 Calendar 1877, voting in the negative are
6 Senators Borrello and Gallivan.

7 Ayes, 58. Nays, 2.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1878, Senate Print Number 9839, by
12 Senator Hoylman-Sigal, an act to amend the
13 Family Court Act.

14 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
16 will be laid aside.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 1879, Senate Print Number 9842, by
19 Senator Hoylman-Sigal, an act to amend the
20 Insurance Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
22 is high and will be laid aside.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 1880, Senate Print 9847, by Senator Gianaris, an
25 act to amend the Agriculture and Markets Law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
2 is high and will also be laid aside.

3 Senator Serrano, that completes the
4 reading of the supplemental calendar.

5 SENATOR SERRANO: Thank you.

6 Can we please take up the
7 controversial calendar, starting with
8 Calendar 575, please.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
10 Secretary will ring the bell.

11 And the Secretary will read.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 575, Senate Print 1883, by Senator Skoufis, an
14 act to amend the New York State Urban Development
15 Corporation Act.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
17 Lanza, why do you rise?

18 SENATOR LANZA: Mr. President, I
19 believe there's an amendment at the desk. I
20 waive the reading of that amendment and ask that
21 you recognize Senator Weber.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
23 you, Senator Lanza.

24 Upon review of the amendment, in
25 accordance with Rule 6, Section 4B, I rule it

1 nongermane and out of order at this time.

2 SENATOR LANZA: Mr. President,
3 accordingly, I appeal the ruling of the chair and
4 ask that Senator Weber be recognized on the
5 appeal.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
7 appeal has been made and recognized, and
8 Senator Weber may be heard.

9 SENATOR WEBER: Thank you,
10 Mr. President.

11 This amendment is germane because
12 the bill at hand deals with economic development.
13 And just yesterday Governor Kathy Hochul
14 suspended the implementation of congestion
15 pricing until after the November election.
16 Right? And belatedly acknowledged the fact that
17 congestion pricing was going to negatively impact
18 economic development.

19 Despite the many warnings that
20 myself, my colleagues have been expressing, it
21 finally became painfully obvious to the governing
22 majority and those who voted for this
23 legislation -- people in this chamber -- that
24 congestion pricing will hurt working-class
25 New Yorkers across the state. Congestion pricing

1 is a tax -- a tax on workers, a tax on families.
2 A tax that New Yorkers cannot afford.

3 It is long overdue for my colleagues
4 who were previously for this tax to be switching
5 sides in order to protect New Yorkers. It's
6 okay. Come across, let's all get together on
7 this. New Yorkers need our protection from
8 unfair taxes, especially in these times of
9 economic hardship.

10 The police officers who protect our
11 streets need protection from this tax. The
12 nurses who put their lives on the frontlines
13 during the COVID crisis need protection from this
14 tax. The teachers who have to spend their own
15 money to provide student resources need
16 protection from this tax. Every New Yorker who
17 is scraping by needs protection from this tax.

18 You know, while it is disappointing
19 that this course reversal is a result of
20 political considerations, and we know the
21 Governor was recently down in Washington, D.C.,
22 where I think she was really got up to speed on
23 the fact that the polling on Long Island and in
24 the Hudson Valley are not doing well for her
25 candidates. Change of course.

1 But I'm happy to see that proponents
2 of this tax are finally starting to see the light
3 at the end of the tunnel. You know, I recently
4 read this morning that some people are now
5 talking about increasing the MTA tax. Right?
6 We're preventing the robbing of Peter again, but
7 on the other hand we're going to rob Peter again,
8 just in a different hand. Not the way to go,
9 especially in this time of this economic
10 environment.

11 You know, congestion pricing, as
12 I've always said, is a scheme. It's a money grab
13 that puts New Yorkers on a long, dark track to
14 ruin. And it clearly not only needs to be
15 delayed, but it needs to be repealed. This is
16 our opportunity I think to start the conversation
17 of repealing this unfair tax. New Yorkers
18 deserve so much more.

19 And for that reason, Mr. President,
20 this amendment is germane, and I appeal the
21 ruling of the chair.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
23 you, Senator.

24 I want to remind the house that the
25 vote is on the procedures of the house and the

1 ruling of the chair. Those in favor of
2 overruling the chair, signify by saying aye.

3 (Response of "Aye.")

4 SENATOR LANZA: Show of hands.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: A show of
6 hands has been requested and so ordered.

7 Announce the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 20.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
10 ruling of the chair stands, and the bill-in-chief
11 is before the house.

12 Senator Serrano.

13 SENATOR SERRANO: Upon consent,
14 we've agreed to restore this bill to the
15 noncontroversial calendar.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
17 will be restored to the noncontroversial
18 calendar.

19 Read the last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
4 is passed.

5 Senator Serrano.

6 SENATOR SERRANO: Mr. President,
7 let's return to the controversial calendar and
8 take up Calendar 1392, by Senator Kavanagh.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
10 Secretary will ring the bell.

11 The Secretary will read.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 1392, Senate Print 6419E, by Senator Kavanagh, an
14 act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
16 O'Mara, why do you rise?

17 SENATOR O'MARA: Yes, thank you,
18 Mr. President. Will the sponsor yield for some
19 questions.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
21 sponsor yield?

22 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Yes,
23 Mr. President.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
25 sponsor yields.

1 SENATOR O'MARA: Thank you,
2 Senator.

3 This bill before us for mattress
4 recycling is an effort that the mattress
5 producers are in favor of, except for the removal
6 of the ability to set a fee on these mattresses.

7 We have a very successful paint
8 program in this state that had a fee set on it,
9 and the manufacturers of that willingly
10 participated. And it's been a great program. It
11 really resulted in a whole other industry and a
12 lot of jobs right here in New York.

13 So there are four other states in
14 the country that have a mattress recycling
15 requirement. All four of those have a fee that's
16 set at the point of sale. So why are you doing
17 it in this manner with no fee being set by the
18 industry?

19 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Through you,
20 Mr. President. My colleague is correct that the
21 fee is -- a specific fee charged to the consumer
22 is a component of the paint program. I also
23 agree that the paint program has been successful.

24 But we have a lot of experience with
25 various versions of EPR in New York, and it has

1 generally been our approach in New York not to
2 require a specific fee for consumers to
3 participate in this program.

4 So the electronic waste bill does
5 not allow a fee to be charged. The carpeting EPR
6 bill we passed in this chamber a couple of years
7 ago does not have a fee associated with it.
8 There's a battery bill we passed a couple of days
9 ago that does not have a fee associated with it.

10 The logic of not having a specific
11 fee is that if the government basically engages
12 in a kind of price control and sets a specific
13 fee, that does not encourage efficiency.

14 As it stands, the industry -- if
15 this bill is passed today and signed by the
16 Governor, the industry will be permitted to come
17 up with a program that meets the standards that
18 are set in this thing that will collect
19 mattresses at a certain rate and recycle them at
20 a certain rate. And they can do that in a manner
21 that is most efficient, that is most
22 cost-effective and most efficient.

23 If you tell them, You get X dollars
24 per mattress, then they have no incentive to do
25 it efficiently because they're going to pass

1 along that amount to the consumer regardless of
2 the efficiency of the program.

3 So, you know, I think the programs
4 in California and Connecticut and Rhode Island
5 have been quite successful, but it is not the fee
6 that makes them successful. It is the basic
7 concept of EPR, which is a direction we're now
8 moving in in New York State.

9 SENATOR O'MARA: Thank you.

10 Mr. President, on the bill.

11 Thank you, Senator.

12 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Thank you.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
14 O'Mara on the bill.

15 SENATOR O'MARA: I raise this
16 concern of the fee because the paint program has
17 been extremely successful in New York. The
18 mattress -- International Sleep Products
19 Association is supportive of the efforts to
20 recycle mattresses. And they're requesting the
21 ability to have this fee as it's worked in other
22 states.

23 You know, the bill here actually
24 says -- the bill actually says the program shall
25 be free to the consumer. Well, there's nothing

1 free about this whole program. And those costs
2 are going to be built into the price of the
3 mattress.

4 And we have a scheme that's set up
5 in here on determining who's going to contribute
6 to this by various producers, various retailers
7 that are involved in the production and sale of
8 mattresses, a good portion of which come from out
9 of the country and certainly out of the state.
10 And it's going to be a complicated process to
11 figure out who needs to contribute what.

12 If there was a point-of-sale fee on
13 it, we would know that every mattress sold in
14 New York, that fee would be collected and the
15 program would run very efficiently.

16 There is a manufacturer right here
17 in the Capital District, a Sealy Mattress
18 manufacturing company, that their Local 17-14T
19 Workers United has provided a memo in opposition
20 based on the very fact of not having this fee and
21 the concerns over foreign manufacturers not
22 paying their fair share on it. They believe it's
23 a competitive disadvantage, and they're concerned
24 about the existence of their jobs here in
25 New York at that manufacturer right here in

1 Green Island, New York.

2 So it's very concerning that when we
3 have an industry that wants to be cooperative,
4 wants to do the right thing, and is requesting
5 the way to do it, that we disregard that in this
6 body so many times. When we have willing
7 participants, we should work with them.

8 I believe that's a fatal flaw in
9 this bill, not having the point-of-sale fee. And
10 because of that, and in support of the workers of
11 Local 17-14T, I am requesting and suggesting that
12 we vote no on this bill and send it back to be
13 amended to include the fee structure.

14 Thank you, Mr. President.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
16 you, Senator O'Mara.

17 Senator Ashby, why do you rise?

18 SENATOR ASHBY: Thank you,
19 Mr. President. Will the sponsor yield?

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
21 sponsor yield?

22 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Yes,
23 Mr. President.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
25 sponsor yields.

1 SENATOR ASHBY: Through you,
2 Mr. President.

3 So Green Island is in my district.
4 Were you aware of any opposition to this bill for
5 the reasons that were previously stated?

6 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Through you,
7 Mr. President, I've been generally aware of the
8 industry's concern that they would prefer to have
9 a set fee, which as I've articulated I think is
10 contrary to the interest of buyers of mattresses,
11 consumers of mattresses.

12 I will note we passed this bill last
13 year, we had that conversation then. I would
14 also note that the bill is on an E print now,
15 which means this is the sixth version of this
16 bill we've worked on today. We passed it
17 previously in this chamber this year. We
18 recalled it to make additional amendments.
19 Several of those amendments are amendments that
20 were requested by the industry.

21 The particular union, which is a
22 local of a union that represents lots of makers
23 of apparel and other things, is -- we only
24 received that specific memo in the last couple of
25 days. I will be in touch with the union.

1 But just to clarify -- and I've read
2 the memo -- there is nothing in this bill that
3 exempts foreign producers. Any mattress that is
4 sold in New York will have to be subject to a
5 producer plan that is -- that the producer is
6 participating in. This is the way we've done
7 these programs in -- throughout the country.
8 This is the way the other programs -- whether you
9 have a fee or not, you have to make sure you're
10 capturing the entire market. This bill is not
11 different from other EPR programs in other states
12 or in this state in that way.

13 The fee -- again, my objection to
14 the fee is that, again, if you say no matter how
15 much it costs to recycle a mattress, you're going
16 to pay \$20 as a consumer, even if it costs the
17 industry only \$5 to recycle it, they're going to
18 charge the \$20. They're going to, you know, keep
19 the difference. And consumers will be harmed by
20 that.

21 So this program requires all
22 participants in the industry to work together to
23 come up with the most efficient way to recycle
24 mattresses and to internalize that cost.

25 And yes, there's no -- there's

1 nothing free for either producers or consumers.
2 But this program is designed not to pass an
3 artificially high cost on to consumers.

4 SENATOR ASHBY: Will the sponsor
5 yield?

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
7 sponsor yield?

8 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Yes,
9 Mr. President.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
11 sponsor yields.

12 SENATOR ASHBY: So it sounds like
13 you were aware, based on it's an E print and the
14 fact that it has gone through so many revisions.
15 And it is different, because it doesn't have the
16 fee.

17 Are you aware of the percentage of
18 foreign mattresses that are being sold into this
19 market, the margin that it occupies?

20 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Through you,
21 Mr. President. I don't have that data. I think
22 defining what a foreign mattress would mean would
23 be hard to do in any case.

24 But this bill does not
25 distinguish -- you -- whether you are a foreign

1 or a domestic producer, you will not be able to
2 sell a mattress in this state, if this is passed,
3 without fully participating and sharing the costs
4 of the recycling.

5 SENATOR ASHBY: Will the sponsor
6 yield?

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
8 sponsor yield?

9 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Yes,
10 Mr. President.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
12 sponsor yields.

13 SENATOR ASHBY: So foreign would
14 mean not made in the United States. And it's
15 roughly a third.

16 And right now they wouldn't have
17 this fee. I understand that they would be able
18 to come up with a methodology, but is there any
19 methodology listed in the legislation as it
20 exists right now?

21 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Through you,
22 Mr. President, I'm not sure I understand the
23 question.

24 The bill would require anybody who
25 wants to sell mattresses or any -- it defines the

1 producer as including anybody who imports a
2 mattress into the state, and it would require
3 them to come up with a specific plan that
4 explains how they're going to recycle mattresses
5 and how they're going to collect them, how
6 they're going to make collection convenient for
7 the consumers, how they're going to recycle them,
8 how they're going to dispose of what things they
9 can't collect.

10 And then that plan would have to be
11 approved in advance by the DEC, and then it would
12 have to go into effect six weeks -- six months
13 later. And if they do not have an approved plan,
14 they would be prohibited from selling mattresses
15 and retailers would be prohibited from selling
16 their mattresses.

17 So there is no aspect of this bill
18 that provides any advantage at all to a mattress
19 producer that is not a domestic or an in-state
20 mattress producer.

21 SENATOR ASHBY: Thank you.

22 On the bill.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
24 Ashby on the bill.

25 SENATOR ASHBY: So as it exists

1 right now, there is no fee. This would give a
2 real advantage to foreign markets and really put
3 at a disadvantage a business in my district and
4 the labor that exists there.

5 And again, this is a trend that we
6 continue to see here in New York in small
7 businesses that are struggling. And being that
8 this is the E print and we've had to go on and
9 make revisions to this several times, I plead
10 with the sponsor to do it again and make good on
11 this promise to work with this business.

12 Thank you, Mr. President.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
14 you, Senator.

15 Are there any other Senators wishing
16 to be heard?

17 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
18 now closed.

19 The Secretary will ring the bell.

20 Senator Serrano.

21 SENATOR SERRANO: Hi. Upon
22 consent, we've agreed to restore this bill to the
23 noncontroversial calendar.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
25 will be restored to the noncontroversial

1 calendar.

2 Read the last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
4 act shall take effect immediately.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
9 May to explain her vote.

10 SENATOR MAY: Thank you,
11 Mr. President.

12 And I want to thank the sponsor for
13 this bill.

14 When I served on the board of the
15 Onondaga County Resource Recovery Agency, I was
16 startled to discover that mattresses were an
17 enormous portion of the waste stream. And they
18 were really difficult to deal with because they
19 were made up of so many different kinds of
20 materials.

21 And the beauty of an EPR system is
22 that this will now put it in the lap of producers
23 to think about how those materials can be
24 separated and reused so that they will make sure
25 that the metals and the wood and the fabric and

1 the stuffing is -- are easily separable and
2 reusable and have fewer toxins in them and are
3 simply better, I think, for the consumer as well
4 as for the environment.

5 So it's an elegant solution, and I
6 am proud to vote aye. And once again, I thank
7 the sponsor for his work on this really difficult
8 but important legislation. I vote aye.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
10 May to be recorded in the affirmative.

11 Senator Helming to explain her vote.

12 SENATOR HELMING: Thank you,
13 Mr. President.

14 One of the reasons why I am voting
15 no on this legislation -- because I do think we
16 need to do more to keep products out of landfills
17 and to recycle more. But I think, as this bill
18 is currently written, it excludes certain
19 recycling from the definition of recycle.

20 By banning advanced recycling from
21 the definition of recycle -- which this bill
22 does -- that limits the technologies that could
23 allow for some of these old materials from
24 mattress components, including foam, to be
25 recycled to produce new mattresses. So it

1 actually prevents us from doing the maximum
2 amount of recycling that we possibly could be
3 doing.

4 So for that reason and many more,
5 I'll be voting no.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
7 you. Senator Helming to be recorded in the
8 negative.

9 Senator Kavanagh to explain his
10 vote.

11 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Thank you,
12 Mr. President. Just to wrap up here.

13 You know, about 50,000 mattresses a
14 day are discarded in the U.S., and a great
15 majority of them go to landfills. There are
16 three states that have programs that are actually
17 operational. And as a result of those programs,
18 13 million mattresses have been collected and
19 recycled. Each of the three states that have
20 this have achieved 74 percent recycling rates as
21 a result of their programs.

22 The great majority of that recycling
23 is standard mechanical recycling. This bill does
24 not ban what is sometimes called chemical or
25 advanced recycling. It permits those practices

1 to go on. It is our view, ensconced in this
2 bill, that those practices are not nearly as
3 advanced as they suggest and shouldn't constitute
4 recycling for the purpose of meeting the targets
5 in this bill. But there's nothing in this bill
6 that prohibits those practices.

7 This bill will result in localities
8 throughout the state not having to deal with this
9 enormous amount of waste that currently our
10 taxpayers are planning to dispose of. It will
11 make enormous amounts of materials available.
12 And again, it will have no adverse effect on
13 domestic producers of mattresses relative to
14 non-domestic producers. This will treat
15 everybody equally.

16 And again, we've gotten many
17 programs -- the fee is just one aspect of this.
18 There are lots of design features in this
19 program. Overall, this is a program that meets
20 the needs of New York State.

21 And I think -- I want to thank our
22 environmental chair, Senator Harckham, all the
23 staff who have worked on this, my colleague in
24 the Assembly, Amy Paulin, who's the sponsor over
25 there.

1 And we are really now moving forward
2 in New York toward really addressing our solid
3 waste problems in a way that does not put the
4 cost on consumers and local governments, but on
5 the producers. I vote aye.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
7 Kavanagh to be recorded in the affirmative.

8 Announce the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
10 Calendar 1392, those Senators voting in the
11 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
12 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
13 Lanza, Martinez, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker,
14 O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Scarcella-Spanton,
15 Stec, Tedisco, Weber and Weik.

16 Ayes, 41. Nays, 20.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
18 is passed.

19 Senator Serrano.

20 SENATOR SERRANO: Thank you,
21 Mr. President.

22 Can we return to the controversial
23 calendar, taking up Calendar 1305, by
24 Senator Sanders.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The

1 Secretary will ring the bell.

2 The Secretary will read.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 1305, Senate Print 9383A, by Senator Sanders, an
5 act to amend the Banking Law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
7 Borrello, why do you rise?

8 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
9 would the sponsor yield for a question.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
11 sponsor yield for a question, Senator Sanders?

12 SENATOR SANDERS: I'm still in the
13 fight, sir. Absolutely.

14 (Laughter.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
16 sponsor's still in the fight.

17 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you.

18 Through you, Mr. President.

19 Senator Sanders, I know we are
20 trying to address an issue that impacts some
21 people when they have a joint account. But can
22 you first walk me through what happens currently
23 when someone goes into a bank to open up a joint
24 account?

25 SENATOR SANDERS: I can give you an

1 example -- through you, Mr. President, I can give
2 you an example of what happens and what goes
3 wrong.

4 A distant relative of mine was --
5 became infirm, and he had his long-term-
6 girlfriend's daughter try to help him pay his
7 bills. Shortly thereafter, he passed, and the
8 daughter decided to keep all of the money. And
9 she would not even give money to help bury him.
10 And it was a sizable amount, and the judges -- or
11 the lawyers are saying that they won't be able to
12 get this money from her, that that is over.

13 That's the situation that we have
14 now, and that's what we're trying to address.

15 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
16 will the sponsor continue to yield.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
18 sponsor yield?

19 SENATOR SANDERS: Absolutely.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
21 sponsor yields.

22 SENATOR BORRELLO: And I certainly
23 don't like to hear a story like that, a tragic
24 story like that. But my question is, we're
25 trying to address this issue on a global scale,

1 if you will, at least for state-chartered banks.

2 So tell me now what the process will
3 be if we're going to change from the current
4 process, which has been in place since the 1960s,
5 to this new process.

6 SENATOR SANDERS: Through you,
7 Mr. President. The process that we're trying to
8 go to -- which, incidentally, 20-plus states,
9 other states have -- is one where in a clearly
10 defined way a person goes in and they decide,
11 this is what I want this person to do for me,
12 whether it's just to buy the goods or help pay a
13 bill. And they are not going to be the ones who
14 will receive the monies upon the passing.

15 That will be -- they'll sign a clear
16 form. And if they're in front of a bank -- if
17 they're in the bank, they don't have to have it
18 notarized. If they do this form outside of the
19 bank, however, they'll have to have it notarized.

20 So in a clear, simple form the
21 person will be able to protect their -- who is
22 supposed to get the money upon their death.

23 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
24 will the sponsor continue to yield.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the

1 sponsor yield?

2 SENATOR SANDERS: Absolutely.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
4 sponsor yields.

5 SENATOR BORRELLO: So what will
6 happen now to all of the thousands of existing
7 joint accounts in New York State in
8 state-chartered banks?

9 SENATOR SANDERS: They -- the --
10 there are many accounts that have been out there
11 already. They will be notified there's a new
12 process afoot. And they will have to update
13 their process. Through you, Mr. President.

14 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
15 will the sponsor continue to yield.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
17 sponsor yield?

18 SENATOR SANDERS: Absolutely.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
20 sponsor yields.

21 SENATOR BORRELLO: So can you walk
22 me through what this new process is going to be?
23 Who's going to -- what's going to happen? How
24 are they going to change this and be able to be
25 in compliance and for the banks to be in

1 compliance with this new process on joint
2 accounts?

3 SENATOR SANDERS: Through you,
4 Mr. President. Just as the bank sends out
5 information every day, seemingly -- we all get
6 information from the banks saying that things are
7 going on hopefully right -- a letter will be sent
8 telling the person that they'll have to update
9 and get into compliance with the new process.

10 I think that's an answer, sir.

11 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
12 will the sponsor continue to yield.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
14 sponsor yield?

15 SENATOR SANDERS: Absolutely.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
17 sponsor yields.

18 SENATOR BORRELLO: Well, it's my
19 understanding that now we're going to say to the
20 banks: You have to update all these accounts.
21 And that's going to be sending out live signature
22 cards to their many accountholders and then
23 somehow ensuring that all of those accounts have
24 been updated, whether that be the person signs
25 it, gets a notary.

1 What happens if someone says, you
2 know what, I just don't want to bother with all
3 this, I'm just going to change accounts, I'm
4 going to change banks, I don't want to bother
5 with all this stuff? Who's going to be
6 responsible for ensuring that these joint
7 accounts, you know, are fully updated?

8 SENATOR SANDERS: Through you,
9 Mr. President. The banks don't have to -- the
10 banks only have to make a good-faith effort, sir.
11 They're not going to be penalized if the people
12 don't comply. But at least we'll have a process
13 by which the fraud that's occurring in many cases
14 now is abated.

15 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
16 will the sponsor continue to yield.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
18 sponsor yield?

19 SENATOR SANDERS: Absolutely.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
21 sponsor yields.

22 SENATOR BORRELLO: So there's no
23 penalty, but -- so what you're saying is so the
24 obligation of the bank is just to send those
25 cards out, notify the accountholders that there's

1 a change, and then no follow-up is required?

2 SENATOR SANDERS: This good
3 faith -- through you, Mr. President, this
4 good-faith effort that they have to do, they'll
5 have to do it twice. And at that, they would
6 have completed what they have to do. They'll
7 have to make two attempts.

8 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you.
9 Mr. President, will the sponsor
10 continue to yield.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Does the
12 sponsor yield?

13 SENATOR SANDERS: Absolutely.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
15 sponsor yields.

16 SENATOR BORRELLO: All right, so
17 let's say that there's two attempts made, and the
18 accountholders don't respond, and there's a
19 situation like you described.

20 Is there a liability on the part of
21 the banking institutions if there is such a fraud
22 that occurred and they did not get the new
23 signature cards updated?

24 SENATOR SANDERS: Through you,
25 Mr. President. My understanding is that there's

1 no liability to the banks, that it then becomes
2 an issue of the Surrogate's Court.

3 SENATOR BORRELLO: Would you repeat
4 that last part? I'm sorry, I didn't hear you.

5 SENATOR SANDERS: The Surrogate's
6 Court would have to take over if the -- if the --
7 through you, Mr. President, if the people are
8 challenging this process.

9 SENATOR BORRELLO: Okay. Great.
10 Mr. President, will the sponsor
11 continue to yield?

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
13 sponsor yield?

14 SENATOR SANDERS: Absolutely.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
16 sponsor yields.

17 SENATOR BORRELLO: So I realize
18 that we could say there's no liability; that's
19 easy for us to say in this chamber. But we know
20 how civil actions work and we know that that's,
21 you know -- do we have any kind of true
22 indemnification for these banks should a fraud
23 occur, they made the good-faith effort but did
24 not get those signatures? Are we indemnifying
25 the banks in any way in this legislation?

1 SENATOR SANDERS: Through you,
2 Mr. President. The bank will be in the current
3 status that they are now. They would -- they'll
4 be as indemnified as they are currently, sir.

5 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
6 will the sponsor continue to yield.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
8 sponsor yield?

9 SENATOR SANDERS: Absolutely.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
11 sponsor yields.

12 SENATOR BORRELLO: Well, I'm a
13 little concerned when you say that, because right
14 now we are -- this is a federal law that governs
15 the current joint account, you know, regulations.
16 So now the state's saying we're going to subvert
17 that and this is -- we're going to put this new
18 added protection in place. And this bank that
19 did not get these signature cards back is now, I
20 guess, not in compliance with the federal law
21 either.

22 So shouldn't we have some kind of a
23 real indemnification for these banks should there
24 not -- should there be a failure for compliance
25 on the part of their customer?

1 SENATOR SANDERS: Through you,
2 Mr. President. The current signature card does
3 exactly what you're saying. It discharges the
4 responsibilities from the banks.

5 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
6 will the sponsor continue to yield.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
8 sponsor yield?

9 SENATOR SANDERS: Absolutely.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
11 sponsor yields.

12 SENATOR BORRELLO: Through you,
13 Mr. President. So this new signature card, it's
14 my understanding, will include a line that says
15 that you should seek advice from an attorney
16 before you open this account. I mean, sir,
17 you've been a great champion of unbanked and
18 underbanked people which are low-income. Don't
19 you feel that this is now going to burden those
20 folks with having to consult with an attorney --
21 which, you know, doesn't come for free -- before
22 opening up something as simple as a joint
23 checking account?

24 SENATOR SANDERS: Through you,
25 Mr. President. Through dialogue with the

1 Bankers Association -- massive dialogue that
2 we've been doing -- we are going to take that
3 particular sentence out.

4 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
5 will the sponsor continue to yield.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
7 sponsor yield?

8 SENATOR SANDERS: Absolutely.

9 SENATOR BORRELLO: But it remains
10 in this current piece of legislation that we're
11 going to pass today.

12 SENATOR SANDERS: Through you,
13 Mr. President, it does remain. I assure you I'm
14 going to deal with that in another moment.

15 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
16 on the bill.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
18 Borrello on the bill.

19 SENATOR BORRELLO: First of all,
20 thank you, Senator Sanders. And I take you at
21 your word on that particular piece.

22 But here's my concern. You know,
23 I've been on the Banks Committee for a long time,
24 and Senator Sanders and I have had a great
25 partnership there. And I'm proud to be the

1 ranking member of the Banks Committee. But the
2 Banks Committee only impacts state-chartered
3 banks. I know people in this chamber have heard
4 me say this before. Our state-chartered banks
5 are community banks, the ones with local
6 decision-making, the ones that have local
7 branches still in communities that maybe can't
8 support a bank as much as they used to with
9 population loss.

10 And this is the only -- in most
11 cases, almost every case, the bills that we pass
12 here, the laws that we pass only impact those
13 community banks. So if someone has a joint
14 account at Citibank or the Bank of America, you
15 name it, a federally chartered bank, they will
16 not be complying with this.

17 But also we're asking banks to
18 essentially get into the business of being
19 involved in estate planning, essentially. We're
20 asking them to be burdened with this. And I have
21 concerns. I have a lot of concerns. It's going
22 to take a massive effort to try to update all of
23 these accounts. And our state-chartered banks
24 are disappearing at a rapid rate. We are losing
25 state-chartered banks because, quite frankly,

1 it's just much easier to be a federally chartered
2 bank here in New York State.

3 But we lose local banking when we do
4 that. I understand the intention. Nobody wants
5 to see somebody be defrauded. But this is an
6 estate planning issue. This is not a banking
7 issue. And we're trying to force that square peg
8 into that round hole.

9 So for that, I'll be voting no.

10 Thank you.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
12 you, Senator Borrello.

13 Senator Martins, why do you rise?

14 SENATOR MARTINS: Mr. President, on
15 the bill.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: On the
17 bill?

18 SENATOR MARTINS: Yes.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
20 Martins on the bill.

21 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,
22 Mr. President.

23 You know, the entire country has a
24 certain way of doing things when it comes to
25 banking. As we've just heard, there are

1 federally chartered banks, there are
2 state-chartered banks. And the entire country
3 follows a certain model with regard to how we
4 hold bank accounts, the ability of people to set
5 up those accounts so that those accounts have a
6 right of survivorship. There's certainty in it,
7 there's clarity in it, because that's what we've
8 done for years.

9 And, you know, we see language
10 oftentimes in our legislation, when people don't
11 like things they say this is antiquated. It's an
12 antiquated term. The reality is this antiquated
13 term is actually the baseline for what we do and
14 what federally chartered banks do across the
15 country.

16 So we now have the prospect of a
17 person in New York, maybe not understanding
18 whether or not they're dealing with a
19 New York-chartered bank or a federally chartered
20 bank, walking into a bank to open an account,
21 understanding that they believe that they're
22 going to be treated the same way as other banks
23 in other states, or as things have always been,
24 and perhaps not get what they want.

25 So I don't know why we are looking

1 to fix a problem that is not a problem. If
2 someone has an issue with it -- and I understand
3 there are concerns about Surrogate's Court. But
4 if there's an issue, deal with it in Surrogate's
5 Court, don't change the entire system that has
6 become standardized, not only here but in every
7 federally chartered bank across the country.

8 For that reason, I'll be voting no.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
10 you, Senator Martins.

11 Are there any other Senators wishing
12 to be heard?

13 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
14 closed.

15 Senator Serrano.

16 SENATOR SERRANO: We've agreed to
17 restore this bill to the noncontroversial
18 calendar.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
20 will be restored to the noncontroversial
21 calendar.

22 Read the last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
24 act shall take effect July 1, 2025.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
4 Sanders to explain his vote.

5 SENATOR SANDERS: Thank you. Thank
6 you.

7 I want to express my thanks to
8 Assemblymember Wallace for bringing this bill
9 forward. She did a great job.

10 It's been said that people could go
11 to the Surrogate's Court. I want to remind my
12 colleagues that everyone does not have the money
13 for the lawyers to go to such a place.

14 It's been also said that the
15 problem -- we're doing something that -- not at
16 the federal level. This -- I will remind my
17 colleagues that more than 20 states already have
18 done this. Those liberal states like Alabama,
19 Utah and other bastions of liberalism have
20 already done these things. We are -- we are
21 behind the eight ball, if you wish.

22 I want to remind us all that the
23 standard that we are creating, the ultimate
24 standard is not whether we are doing right by the
25 banks, but are we doing right by the people of

1 New York. Are we protecting the average person,
2 who may not have the lawyers or the education or
3 whatever is necessary to ensure that they get a
4 fair deal, but all they wanted to do was get
5 their rent paid or food purchased, and now their
6 entire estate is given to perhaps a stranger,
7 just because they didn't understand all of these
8 things.

9 No, no, New York is better than
10 that. And I believe that we are better than that
11 as the protectors of the good people of New York.
12 So that's the reason I'm voting yes, and I'm
13 encouraging everyone to. Even at this late
14 moment, you can change. Come along.

15 Thank you, Mr. President.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
17 Sanders to be recorded in the affirmative.

18 Announce the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
20 Calendar 1305, those Senators voting in the
21 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
22 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Cooney, Gallivan, Griffo,
23 Helming, Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Murray,
24 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,
25 Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Weber and Weik.

1 Ayes, 40. Nays, 21.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
3 is passed.

4 Senator Serrano.

5 SENATOR SERRANO: Thank you.

6 Returning to the controversial
7 calendar, let's take up Calendar 1448, by
8 Senator Hoylman-Sigal.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
10 Secretary will ring the bell.

11 The Secretary will read.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 1448, Senate Print Number 7365B, by
14 Senator Hoylman-Sigal, an act to amend the
15 Penal Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
17 Murray, why do you rise?

18 SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you,
19 Mr. President. Would the sponsor yield for a few
20 questions?

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
22 sponsor yield?

23 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes,
24 Mr. President.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The

1 sponsor yields.

2 SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you,
3 Mr. President. Through you. I just need to get
4 some -- just some clarification on the bill
5 itself. And let's start with -- I know we're
6 talking about a pistol converter or converting
7 the triggers. And I've had a question just,
8 again, for clarification purposes.

9 Does this legislation place
10 limitations on trigger systems that don't alter
11 the rate of fire? For example, a trigger
12 mechanism that reduces creep or increases
13 sensitivity.

14 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Would you
15 repeat the last part? Through you,
16 Mr. President. For example --

17 SENATOR MURRAY: Through you,
18 Mr. President. For example, trigger mechanisms
19 that reduce creep or increase sensitivity. So
20 the sensitivity of the pull when you're shooting.

21 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through
22 you, Mr. President. If I might ask the -- our
23 colleague, are you referring to any device that
24 might convert a semiautomatic weapon to becoming
25 an automatic weapon? Or is this another device?

1 SENATOR MURRAY: Through you,
2 Mr. President. Actually, we're asking that.
3 Does this bill -- I know that the bill is talking
4 about, you know, changing it to -- from a
5 semiautomatic to automatic and increasing the
6 fire and rapidity of the fire.

7 But does it apply to any other --
8 because when we're talking about, you know,
9 changing the trigger, there are different ways
10 you can do this. Adjust it to the shooter
11 themselves -- as I said, sensitivity for the pull
12 for -- there's different ways. Are we only
13 focusing on one aspect or all aspects of
14 adjusting the trigger?

15 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through
16 you, Mr. President, let me just say what the bill
17 does.

18 First, the bill would add a new
19 definition of "pistol converter" to the
20 Penal Law. That would identify the kinds of
21 switches that are used, for example, to turn
22 Glocks -- which has been called America's gun,
23 one of the most popular pistols sold in this
24 country -- and their copycat pistols, into fully
25 automatic. In other words, turning these pistols

1 into machine guns.

2 The second part of the very short
3 bill would update the list of reasonable controls
4 and procedures in our General Business Law, which
5 would add to the list to require that gun
6 manufacturers take reasonable steps to prevent
7 the installation and use of a pistol converter on
8 their products. Meaning that they have to design
9 their guns in a way that makes them not easily
10 convertible into machine guns.

11 And if they would fail to take these
12 reasonable steps, then they can be held
13 accountable in civil court by the
14 Attorney General, by survivors of gun violence
15 harmed by the manufacturer's conduct, or by
16 municipalities.

17 So the answer would be yes, if
18 you're talking about pistol converters.

19 SENATOR MURRAY: Through you,
20 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
21 yield.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
23 sponsor yield?

24 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The

1 sponsor yields.

2 SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you.

3 Through you, Mr. President. First,
4 we were just on different trajectories there.
5 But I did get the answer. Basically, "no" would
6 be the answer to my question, in that it would
7 not affect --

8 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL:

9 (Inaudible).

10 SENATOR MURRAY: It would not
11 affect that, yes.

12 So let me move on to the part -- the
13 second part that you read, and that was "and
14 taking reasonable steps to prevent the
15 installation and use of a pistol converter."

16 Can we define "reasonable"? What
17 steps exactly are they supposed to take that
18 they're not already taking?

19 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through
20 you, Mr. President, that's for a court to decide,
21 what is reasonable, based on the facts of the
22 case.

23 SENATOR MURRAY: Through you,
24 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
25 yield?

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
2 sponsor yield?

3 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
5 sponsor yields.

6 SENATOR MURRAY: Okay. So these
7 converters, the Glock switch, as you brought up,
8 it's already illegal. It's already illegal.

9 So I'm going to give an example. So
10 a store owner, a gun store owner makes a sale,
11 sells the Glock. What exactly -- what reasonable
12 step at that point does he or she take to make
13 sure that that customer does not go home and
14 convert it themselves? Go on a black market, buy
15 the Glock switch, and do it themselves? Are they
16 now responsible for that? And what reasonable
17 step could they possibly take to know they would
18 take that illegal action?

19 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through
20 you, Mr. President. And thank you for the
21 question, because it's a very important point.

22 And a misunderstanding, which I want
23 to clarify in this bill. We're not holding the
24 retailer responsible. It's the manufacturer.
25 It's Glock and other gun manufacturers that have

1 not taken these steps for decades. Glock among
2 other manufacturers, potentially, but Glock is
3 the one that we mention here, is the
4 largest-selling brand of semiautomatic pistols in
5 the United States.

6 They have known that their product
7 can be easily turned into an illegally fully
8 automatic machine gun by using this device that
9 we call a pistol converter, or it's called a
10 Glock switch, or it's called an auto-sear.

11 And you're right, they're prohibited
12 by both federal and state law, but they are
13 extremely easy to obtain illegally. I just
14 Googled "Glock switch" on my iPad, and there's
15 one for sale here for 150 bucks, but some of them
16 go for \$25 or \$10, and you can download them on
17 the internet or print them on a 3D printer at
18 home.

19 Glock has known for decades that its
20 handguns are uniquely susceptible to being
21 converted into illegal machine guns, even by
22 people with little or no engineering skill, in
23 just a few minutes. And the company, the company
24 has refused to redesign their handguns to solve
25 the problem.

1 You know, we heard a quote the other
2 day when the judges were here, and it was so
3 meaningful to me. It said -- it was a quote by
4 Archbishop Desmond Tutu: "We need to stop
5 pulling people out of the river and go upstream
6 to find out why they're falling in."

7 And that's exactly what we are
8 hoping to do with this legislation to hold gun
9 manufacturers accountable for a dangerous product
10 that they are knowingly making available to the
11 public.

12 SENATOR MURRAY: Through you,
13 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
14 yield.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
16 sponsor yield?

17 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
19 sponsor yields.

20 SENATOR MURRAY: So I just want to
21 clarify. What you are saying is that the
22 manufacturer, the person that made -- the company
23 that made the weapon, that could be anywhere in
24 America, would be held responsible if someone in
25 New York bought the Glock, went home and broke

1 the law and knowingly, willingly themselves
2 purchased something that is already illegal and
3 changed the product that was purchased legally,
4 but they are going to be held responsible for
5 that illegal action.

6 Is that what you're saying, and what
7 this bill would do?

8 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through
9 you, Mr. President. Only if a court determined
10 that they had not taken those reasonable steps to
11 make their product safer.

12 Thanks to Senator Myrie, we have a
13 bill on the books in New York State that requires
14 gun manufacturers to be held accountable for
15 sales of dangerous products. We're simply adding
16 this specific provision, this pistol converter
17 paragraph, to that very important Chapter 237 of
18 the Laws of 2021.

19 SENATOR MURRAY: On the bill.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
21 Murray on the bill.

22 SENATOR MURRAY: Senator
23 Hoylman-Sigal, thank you very much. I appreciate
24 that. And by the way, the quote -- I thought the
25 quote was fantastic. I think you're right.

1 I think we should take every step we
2 can to cut down on gun violence. We've had
3 several bills recently, gun bills that have come
4 through that I've supported because we don't want
5 illegal guns in the hands of people that are
6 doing harm. We don't want that.

7 But this step is so far beyond. You
8 brought up 3D printers. Who would have thought
9 that we would have a printer that could make the
10 things they can make now? As the ranker on the
11 Libraries Committee I've visited a bunch of
12 libraries that have these 3D printers, and I've
13 been blown away with what they can do and what
14 they can create.

15 My point is just five, 10 years ago
16 that wasn't even imagined. They adjust. You
17 know who adjusts the best? Criminals. They'll
18 find a way. If they want to break the law,
19 they're going to find a way.

20 So to say that the manufacturer
21 should take "reasonable steps" -- again, the
22 definition of "reasonable steps" I'm still trying
23 to figure out what exactly that is. What
24 steps -- if they adjust something and the
25 criminal comes back and they adjust something and

1 now they do the same thing, where does it end?

2 The point is if you want to go
3 upriver and find out why they're falling in, how
4 about we stop letting the criminals that are
5 breaking the law go back out and do it over and
6 over and over again. How about we actually crack
7 down and punish the ones that are doing it wrong.
8 The criminals have decided to break the law. The
9 gun wasn't illegal. The Glock is not illegal.
10 If they follow the process, they're doing it
11 right.

12 The manufacturer, the retailer, they
13 didn't break the law. The criminal did. When
14 are we going start holding them accountable?

15 And for that reason, Mr. President,
16 I'll be voting no.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
18 you, Senator Murray.

19 Are there any other Senators wishing
20 to be heard?

21 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
22 now closed.

23 Senator Gianaris.

24 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
25 we've agreed to restore this bill to the

1 noncontroversial calendar.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
3 will be restored to the noncontroversial
4 calendar.

5 Read the last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
7 act shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
12 Myrie to explain his vote.

13 SENATOR MYRIE: Thank you,
14 Mr. President.

15 And thank you to
16 Senator Hoylman-Sigal for bringing this forward.

17 I just wanted to clarify something
18 for the record. As my colleague mentioned, this
19 adds a definition to an existing law, one that
20 has, by the way, been adopted by nine other
21 states across the country, and one in which the
22 gun industry has tried to upend in accord.

23 And they have made legal arguments
24 to say that we have not been descriptive enough
25 in this section of the General Business Law.

1 They have said that we have not outlined what
2 reasonable controls are. But when we do, when we
3 are more descriptive, when we say that a Glock
4 switch that changes a semiautomatic pistol into
5 machine gun, one that can kill people rapidly,
6 they oppose that.

7 So this is an attempt to clarify.
8 This is an attempt to adjust to the realities of
9 gun violence. I'm very proud to support my
10 colleague Senator Hoylman-Sigal, and I proudly
11 vote in the affirmative.

12 Thank you.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
14 Myrie to be recorded in the affirmative.

15 Senator Hoylman-Sigal to close.

16 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Thank you.

17 And once again, credit to
18 Senator Myrie for this landmark legislation that
19 holds gun manufacturers accountable, just the
20 same way we hold Big Tobacco, Big Petroleum and
21 pharmaceutical companies for knowingly selling
22 dangerous products.

23 This isn't a situation where we're
24 trying to hold all gun manufacturers responsible
25 for the actions of criminals, even if they're not

1 aware that there's a fixable problem with their
2 product, or if they are aware but then take
3 reasonable steps to rectify it. This is when a
4 gun manufacturer is complicit, complicit for not
5 making a product that's safe for consumers.

6 This bill would apply equally to all
7 gun manufacturers. It just so happens that the
8 other gun manufacturers -- SIG Sauer, Smith &
9 Wesson and Ruger -- designed their semiautomatic
10 handguns in a way that they cannot be easily
11 converted into machine guns through the use of
12 these pistol converters or Glock switches.

13 Glock has a fifth generation of
14 pistols that are still easily converted into
15 machine guns. What's the definition of insanity
16 here, folks? And they have included a small
17 plastic tab at the rear of the frame where a
18 switch would be installed, but that can be easily
19 filed down.

20 Glock has a big media campaign where
21 they say they're working with federal officials.
22 But the truth is that the company can easily
23 modify its pistols in multiple ways to prevent
24 the installation of Glock switches, and they have
25 refused to do so.

1 It is past time that we hold Glock
2 accountable for these switches. It's past time
3 that you can buy them on the internet and that
4 Glock makes millions and millions of dollars
5 putting profit above public safety.

6 I vote aye.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
8 Hoylman-Sigal to be recorded in the affirmative.

9 Announce the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
11 Calendar 1448, those Senators voting in the
12 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello, Gallivan,
13 Griffo, Helming, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker,
14 O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco and Weik.

15 Ayes, 48. Nays, 13.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
17 is passed.

18 Senator Gianaris.

19 SENATOR GIANARIS: Back to the
20 controversial calendar, can we take up
21 Calendar 1878, by Senator Hoylman-Sigal.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
23 Secretary will ring the bell.

24 The Secretary will read.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1878, Senate Print Number 9839, by
2 Senator Hoylman-Sigal, an act to amend the
3 Family Court Act.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
5 Lanza, why do you rise?

6 SENATOR LANZA: Mr. President,
7 would the sponsor yield for some questions.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
9 sponsor yield?

10 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: the
12 sponsor yields.

13 SENATOR LANZA: Through you -- and
14 thank you, Senator Hoylman-Sigal. Through you,
15 Mr. President.

16 It's my understanding that this
17 legislation would establish 12 new Civil Court
18 judges for New York City, is that correct?

19 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: I'm sorry.
20 Through you, Mr. President, did you say
21 Civil Court? Oh, yes. Yes, 12 Civil Court
22 judges.

23 In addition -- through you,
24 Mr. President -- four Family Court judges for
25 New York City and 12 Family Court judges across

1 the state.

2 The impetus, I just have to say, was
3 a hearing that I conducted with Senator Brisport
4 on the crisis in New York's Family Courts, which
5 I happen to have a copy right here. Thank you.

6 SENATOR LANZA: Will the sponsor
7 yield for another question?

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
9 sponsor yield?

10 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
12 sponsor yields.

13 SENATOR LANZA: Through you,
14 Mr. President. I agree that there is certainly a
15 crisis. There are many crises involving what's
16 happening across New York City.

17 But this creates 12 new Civil Court
18 judges to in part begin to address that crisis.
19 Can you tell us, Senator Hoylman, where will
20 these 12 new Civil Court judges be seated?

21 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through
22 you, Mr. President. Well, we allocated
23 \$12 million in the budget for Family Court
24 judges. This is the statutory authority to make
25 those judges a reality. The 12 Civil Court

1 judges would include four in the boroughs of
2 Bronx, Manhattan, Queens and Brooklyn -- Kings.

3 SENATOR LANZA: Will the sponsor
4 yield?

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
6 sponsor yield?

7 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
9 sponsor yields.

10 SENATOR LANZA: Maybe I didn't hear
11 you correctly. Did you mention Staten Island?

12 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through
13 you, Mr. President, you did hear me correctly. I
14 did not mention Staten Island.

15 SENATOR LANZA: I thought so.
16 Would the sponsor yield?

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
18 sponsor yield?

19 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
21 sponsor yields.

22 SENATOR LANZA: Why is it that
23 given that 12 new Civil Court judge positions
24 have been created for New York City -- which is
25 comprised, as you know, of five boroughs -- that

1 there's only one borough which will not receive a
2 single one of those judicial seats?

3 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through
4 you, Mr. President. Well, I would argue that we
5 are creating an additional four Family Court
6 judges for the whole of New York City, who are
7 mayoral appointments. Those judges could, and I
8 think you would argue should, be assigned to
9 Staten Island. Otherwise, this was a formula
10 that was negotiated with our partners on the
11 other side of the Capitol, with the input from
12 the Office of Court Administration.

13 SENATOR LANZA: Would the sponsor
14 yield?

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
16 sponsor yield?

17 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
19 sponsor yields.

20 SENATOR LANZA: Through you,
21 Mr. President. When I hear the word "formula," I
22 naturally think of mathematics. And if you look
23 at the math, there are 130 Civil Court seats in
24 the City of New York. Four are on Staten Island.
25 The last time that a seat was added to

1 Staten Island was 1968. Since that time the
2 population of Staten Island has nearly doubled,
3 presently at over 500,000 citizens.

4 If you look at the math, however you
5 look at it, Senator Hoylman-Sigal -- with respect
6 to caseloads, the caseloads on Staten Island, I
7 would imagine that those experts that are looking
8 at how to allocate these seats would look at
9 caseloads. So even if you put my numbers aside
10 and say, Well, who cares how many people live on
11 Staten Island, who cares how many judges they
12 have, who cares whether or not if you're looking
13 for justice in the court system, whether you're a
14 child or an adult, who cares if you've got to
15 wait on line and there's no judge for you to
16 see -- but if there's a formula, it seems to me
17 everyone -- I think you would agree -- the
18 formula that matters the most is caseload.

19 The caseload on Staten Island is as
20 high or higher than every borough in New York
21 City. And yet not a single one of these seats is
22 being allocated to Staten Island.

23 So I would ask the sponsor, could
24 you describe for us the nature of that formula,
25 how the analysis worked?

1 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through
2 you, Mr. President. Well, let's -- I do want to
3 clarify something. The 12 Civil Court judges
4 that are going to these four boroughs, the
5 intention, as indicated by the Office of Court
6 Administration, is that these will all be Family
7 Court judges. Every single one of them.

8 And in terms of the formula, well,
9 it's a negotiation. As you know when you were in
10 the majority, that you negotiate this type of
11 bill with the Assembly, and you do it in
12 conjunction -- with the Assembly Majority, and
13 you do it in conjunction with the Office of Court
14 Administration. That's what happened here.

15 SENATOR LANZA: Would the sponsor
16 yield?

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
18 sponsor yield?

19 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
21 sponsor yields.

22 SENATOR LANZA: I do recall being
23 in the Majority, and whenever there were seats
24 allocated to New York City, not a single time,
25 not a single time were seats allocated to

1 Staten Island without those being allocated to
2 the rest of New York City. Not once.

3 So you call it negotiation. There
4 are all kinds of negotiations. There are
5 negotiations based on a concern for fairness and
6 equity, and there are those that are not.
7 Clearly, the result here speaks to the fact that
8 this was not.

9 But now that we understand -- and I
10 do, Senator Hoylman -- that this was a
11 negotiation, in terms of how this allocation was
12 determined, were -- was Governor Hochul involved
13 in that determination?

14 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through
15 you, Mr. President, not to my knowledge.

16 SENATOR LANZA: Are you aware of
17 any conversations that occurred between anyone
18 working for Governor Hochul and any folks on
19 Staten Island as to a potential deal being struck
20 with respect to judges who might be seated on
21 Staten Island?

22 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through
23 you, Mr. President, no.

24 SENATOR LANZA: Will the sponsor
25 yield?

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
2 sponsor yield?

3 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
5 sponsor yields.

6 SENATOR LANZA: The sponsor --
7 Senator Hoylman, as chairman of the Judiciary
8 Committee -- and thank you for that service --
9 were you in any conversations with anyone with
10 respect to determining, first, that there ought
11 to be 12 new Civil Court judges for New York City
12 and, second, that none of those would be seated
13 in Staten Island?

14 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through
15 you, Mr. President. My advocacy, through our
16 report and hearing back in February, was that we
17 desperately need new Family Court judges. In
18 2022, the backlog in Family Court grew by
19 5,000 cases. I was basically, like, give us
20 judges wherever we can get them.

21 But no, to answer your question
22 specifically, I was not involved in any
23 discussions involving Civil Court judges in -- on
24 Staten Island.

25 SENATOR LANZA: Would the sponsor

1 yield?

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
3 sponsor yield?

4 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
6 sponsor yields.

7 SENATOR LANZA: And,
8 Senator Hoylman, I want to take this moment to
9 thank you. I know that you have been a staunch
10 advocate with respect to this issue. I think
11 most of the folks in this -- if not everyone in
12 this body -- understands the crisis and has been
13 advocating in their respective districts to do
14 something about it. And I have watched your
15 advocacy, and I do appreciate it on behalf of the
16 people of the State of New York.

17 My question is, then, when was the
18 first time you learned that it would be 12 new
19 judges for New York City and none for
20 Staten Island?

21 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: I think it
22 was in the last 48 hours. Through you,
23 Mr. President.

24 SENATOR LANZA: Would the sponsor
25 yield?

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
2 sponsor yield?

3 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
5 sponsor yields.

6 SENATOR LANZA: So, you know, I've
7 done this once before. So somebody had to put
8 those numbers on a piece of paper and call it a
9 bill. Do you know who it is that decided to put
10 those numbers on that piece of paper and call it
11 a bill?

12 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through
13 you, Mr. President. It was the leadership of
14 both houses negotiating a bill and sending it to
15 drafting.

16 So I would say the drafting -- our
17 drafters, who do such an amazing job and we
18 should thank them for all the work they've done
19 over the last few weeks, to say the least.

20 SENATOR LANZA: Would the sponsor
21 yield?

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
23 sponsor yield?

24 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The

1 sponsor yields.

2 SENATOR LANZA: Senator Hoylman,
3 when you finally saw this legislation and you saw
4 that there were 12 new seats for New York City
5 and not a single one for Staten Island, what did
6 you make of that?

7 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through
8 you, Mr. President. Well, I did speak to my
9 colleague Senator Scarcella-Spanton, and we have
10 an understanding that these are decisions that
11 are made through a negotiated settlement between
12 the houses. And this is what we ended up with.

13 SENATOR LANZA: Would the sponsor
14 yield?

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
16 sponsor yield?

17 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
19 sponsor yields.

20 SENATOR LANZA: Through you,
21 Mr. President. I want to be very clear here,
22 Senator Hoylman. Because I accept completely,
23 with complete certitude, that when you tell me
24 that you were not aware of these negotiations
25 which -- not that you were not aware, that you

1 were not part of the analysis and determination
2 that resulted in 12 new Civil Court judges for
3 New York City and not a single one for
4 Staten Island. I accept that you were not part
5 of those negotiations, that it was not your
6 determination.

7 And so I'm going to ask you a
8 question, slightly hypothetical. If, for
9 example, if there were, as part of these
10 negotiations, discussions between folks in
11 Governor Hochul's office, folks in the Assembly,
12 that suggested that these could be allocated
13 evenly amongst -- throughout New York City, two
14 for Staten Island, maybe three for the rest of
15 the boroughs, they're larger.

16 If there was an assurance that there
17 be a cross-endorsement such -- resulting that at
18 least one of those seats would be a Democrat and
19 one be a Republican, as opposed to just leaving
20 it to the people, would you agree that if those
21 types of conversations occurred and that as a
22 result of that offer not being accepted, this was
23 the result and the offer for those two seats for
24 Staten Island was taken away, would you agree
25 that that would constitute a felony in the State

1 of New York?

2 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through
3 you, Mr. President. Wait, that's -- I honestly
4 can't even follow that hypothetical. I have to
5 be honest.

6 SENATOR LANZA: Mr. President, will
7 the sponsor yield?

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
9 sponsor yield?

10 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
12 sponsor yields.

13 SENATOR LANZA: Through you,
14 Mr. President, I'll break it down.

15 If, through these negotiations,
16 someone in office in Albany -- the Governor's
17 office, for instance -- said we're going to
18 create a bunch of new Civil Court seats for
19 New York City; we'd like to distribute them
20 evenly, each borough receiving at least one -- at
21 least two. And if that person or people reached
22 out to folks in politics and said, Hey, we want a
23 cross-endorsement. We want -- we'll give you two
24 seats if you make sure one's a Democrat and one's
25 a Republican. And if the answer was no, and this

1 person in a position of authority to be able to
2 be one of those people that handed you this piece
3 of paper that had these numbers on it, decided
4 because the answer was no to eliminate
5 Staten Island and to decide to take those judges
6 and spread them to the other boroughs, would you
7 not agree that that is what we know to be a quid
8 pro quo and a felony in the State of New York, if
9 that occurred?

10 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through
11 you, Mr. President. Again, I have no knowledge
12 that the Governor's office was involved in this
13 in any way. And I prefer not to answer a
14 hypothetical that may cast aspersions on any
15 party that was involved in this negotiation,
16 especially when there is an earnest attempt to
17 address the crisis in New York's Family Courts.

18 And I appreciate your advocacy and
19 my colleague's advocacy, Senator
20 Scarcella-Spanton, for more judges on
21 Staten Island.

22 SENATOR LANZA: Through you,
23 Mr. President, on the bill.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
25 Lanza on the bill.

1 SENATOR LANZA: Mr. President,
2 first I want to thank Senator Hoylman.

3 And with respect to the answer to
4 that last long hypothetical question, I accept
5 your answer completely. And I really respect
6 what you've done with respect to your work on the
7 Judiciary.

8 At the end of the day, however, I am
9 left with the fact that 12 new Civil Court seats
10 have been created for New York City. The people
11 I represent reside in New York City. They pay
12 New York City taxes. I've said that it's been
13 since 1968 that we've received a new Civil Court
14 seat. The population has doubled since then.
15 Caseloads are off the charts. People are having
16 a hard time receiving the justice they deserve.

17 You acknowledge, everyone
18 acknowledges here this is a crisis. We have an
19 attempt to address the crisis. And I am supposed
20 to believe that something -- I've got to be
21 careful -- that something that is not untoward,
22 that is not improper, that perhaps does not cross
23 the line, that some formula, some good-faith
24 negotiation, resulted in there being 12 new Civil
25 Court seats for New York City and not one of them

1 is coming to Staten Island.

2 And I'm supposed to believe that it
3 has nothing to do with the fact that one of the
4 few places in New York City that a Republican has
5 a chance to get elected is on Staten Island.
6 It's too much for any person of any common sense
7 to accept.

8 I know we walk these halls and we
9 say, Well, this is the way it is, we all know how
10 this has happened, it's been happening for
11 9 million years. It doesn't make it okay.
12 Doesn't make it okay.

13 This is unacceptable. This is
14 wrong. I will say on this floor -- because I'm
15 going to be careful, the way Senator Hoylman was
16 careful. And I hope he understands and knows I
17 was not casting a single accusatory aspersion his
18 way. Not one. Because I know, I know -- even if
19 he doesn't, I know what's going on here. And
20 this is not the last you're going to hear from me
21 on this subject.

22 And I know Governor Hochul is afraid
23 of the voters on Staten Island. She should,
24 because they're on to her. And this number does
25 not get on this page that we call a law without

1 the Governor's office being involved, period.
2 And the people of Staten Island send me here to
3 fight for them. And by God, that's what I'm
4 going to do. And I'm going to do whatever it
5 takes, whatever the results, to get to the bottom
6 of this, and let the chips fall where they might.

7 Staten Islanders are used to this
8 you-know-what. Talk about minority, minority.
9 Staten Island is a political minority in the City
10 of New York. And they've been getting the shaft
11 from the political majority of the rest of
12 New York City from before I was born. So we're
13 used to this crap.

14 We're used to New York City
15 Democrats saying, Hey, we're going to commit the
16 worst environmental crime in the history of
17 New York right in your backyard. We're going to
18 pick the most pristine place with saltwater and
19 freshwater, estuaries, wetlands, natural area,
20 the most pristine natural ecosystem in New York
21 City, and we're going to dump the rest of the
22 city's garbage there. And it's going to be in
23 violation of every federal law, of every New York
24 State law. There's not going to be a lining.
25 And we're just going to keep dumping and dumping

1 and dumping.

2 And if people are going to have
3 cancer as a result of it, if environments are
4 going to be utterly destroyed because of it,
5 tough luck. You're a political minority on
6 Staten Island, and we don't care about you.

7 You live on Staten Island, and you
8 can see Manhattan and you pay taxes to be part of
9 that city. And folks like Governor Hochul until
10 yesterday say, You want to travel within your own
11 city? You're going to pay for it. We're going
12 to give you a special deal. We're going to tax
13 you. Oh, and it's about congestion. Oh, no,
14 wait a minute, it's about the environment. Oh,
15 no, wait a minute, our own study says it's going
16 to be worse for the environment. And people both
17 sides of the aisle around the city see through
18 it, and the Governor all of a sudden says -- the
19 Governor who doesn't control the MTA, "Nothing I
20 can do about it" -- now all of a sudden saying:
21 I'm going to do something about it. We'll see
22 how long that lasts. I don't believe it.

23 But the people of Staten Island are
24 used to this. The people of Staten Island are
25 used to being punished for getting in their cars

1 when New York City Democrats refuse to live up to
2 their responsibility at the MTA and provide
3 adequate public transportation. There's a legacy
4 of neglect in that regard unequaled in the
5 country. We're used to it.

6 This is rotten to the core. And you
7 can smile about it, and you can say, Well, this
8 is the way it is. This is absolutely disgusting.
9 And those in the Majority have the power to make
10 sure that this did not happen. And you have the
11 power -- because yes, Senator Hoylman, I was in
12 the majority -- you have the power to make sure
13 this is fixed. I will work with you and anyone
14 else on this good planet to see whether or not we
15 can fix it.

16 But in the meantime, Mr. President,
17 I'm going to get to the bottom of this. I'm
18 going to get to the bottom of this on behalf of
19 the people of Staten Island.

20 Thank you, Mr. President.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
22 you, Senator Lanza.

23 Senator Stec, why do you rise?

24 SENATOR STEC: Good evening,
25 Mr. President. How you doing?

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Good
2 evening, Senator Stec.

3 SENATOR STEC: If the sponsor would
4 please rise for a few questions.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
6 sponsor yield?

7 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
9 sponsor yields.

10 SENATOR STEC: Thank you,
11 Mr. President. Thank you, Senator.

12 The bill before us was -- so just to
13 be clear, because I'm not a member of the
14 Judiciary Committee. It's been fascinating to
15 watch you and Senator Lanza, two attorneys, go at
16 it. I am just a -- just a North Country
17 engineer, nuclear engineer. We'll see if I can
18 follow this.

19 This was not an OCA program bill, in
20 front of us right now?

21 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through
22 you, Mr. President, no.

23 SENATOR STEC: All right, thank
24 you.

25 If the sponsor would continue to

1 yield.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
3 sponsor yield?

4 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
6 sponsor yields.

7 SENATOR STEC: But the OCA did
8 provide a draft, they did provide their own
9 suggestions that was the framework of this. When
10 did they provide that draft to us -- to you?

11 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through
12 you, Mr. President. They -- the Office of Court
13 Administration provided some guideposts based on
14 caseload. Again, this is a Family Court
15 initiative: The 12 Civil court judges, four
16 Family Court judges, Family Court judges across
17 the state.

18 SENATOR STEC: Mr. President, if
19 the sponsor will continue to yield.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
21 sponsor yield?

22 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
24 sponsor yields.

25 SENATOR STEC: Can we have a copy

1 of those guideposts? Are those -- is that
2 public? Is that something that we could see?

3 And again, my first question was,
4 when was that provided to us?

5 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through
6 you, Mr. President. Yes, we can provide you
7 OCA data on caseloads in Family Court. That was
8 basically a data compilation that is publicly
9 available but which we received from OCA, to my
10 knowledge.

11 SENATOR STEC: Will the sponsor
12 continue to yield?

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
14 sponsor yield?

15 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
17 sponsor yields.

18 SENATOR STEC: I would love to see
19 that guidance.

20 But again, so OCA used some sort of
21 metrics and statistics and data on caseload. I
22 assume it's probably comparable to county
23 population. And since I don't have the OCA data
24 in front of me, in a little bit I'll be talking
25 about comparing sizes of counties and how many

1 Family Court judges they have.

2 But -- so the OCA provides a list,
3 based on their analysis. And they said -- I'm
4 now going to talk about outside New York City.
5 So 12 new Family Court judges outside of New York
6 City -- a couple on Long Island, the rest
7 upstate.

8 The -- your bill differs from what
9 OCA provided. So, I mean, the Office of Court
10 Administration is the one that keeps all these
11 statistics. They're a whole entity filled with
12 lawyers and judges that manage the state's court
13 system. They come up with a list, and somehow
14 that list gets changed and so no longer are we
15 using their data and their metrics. But do we
16 have our own set of metrics that we substituted
17 for theirs? Or was it just some sort of
18 negotiation or -- how did the list get changed if
19 we're not using OCA's numbers?

20 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through
21 you, Mr. President. It's a negotiated settlement
22 between the two houses. And this is the product
23 of that negotiation.

24 SENATOR STEC: All right. So if
25 the sponsor would continue to yield, please.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
2 sponsor yield?

3 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
5 sponsor yields.

6 SENATOR STEC: All right. Now,
7 again, I'm familiar with we're supposed to let
8 bills age for three days. This bill is not high.
9 Your bill was put in on June 3rd. But a few
10 minutes ago you said that you found out 48 hours
11 ago. Is that contemporaneously?

12 You're the sponsor of the bill. So
13 when you submitted the bill, you knew that, to
14 Senator Lanza's question, Staten Island was not
15 getting a --

16 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through
17 you, Mr. President, yes.

18 SENATOR STEC: All right. Will the
19 sponsor continue to yield, please.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
21 sponsor yield?

22 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
24 sponsor yields.

25 SENATOR STEC: All right. Senator

1 Sigalman-Hoyle {sic}, now I'm going to pivot to
2 the Fourth Judicial District. The Fourth
3 Judicial District comprises 11 counties, most of
4 northeastern New York. My entire Senate district
5 rests inside it. The Fourth Judicial District is
6 not receiving a single new Family Court judge.

7 Do you recall at least a handful of
8 times over the last few years me catching you in
9 the hall, knocking on your door, coming to your
10 office with -- or my staff, with data and a
11 request and a copy of a bill that's been around
12 since September of 2017 when Senator Little
13 carried it here and I carried it in the Assembly.

14 Do you recall a few of those
15 requests from me about Essex County?

16 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through
17 you, Mr. President, yes. And I appreciate your
18 reaching out to me and sitting right here and
19 discussing the matter.

20 SENATOR STEC: I appreciate it.
21 And I appreciate you listening to me.

22 If the sponsor would continue to
23 yield, please.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Does the
25 sponsor yield?

1 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Yes.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
3 sponsor yields.

4 SENATOR STEC: All right. So in
5 the data that I gave you -- and again, this is
6 now -- so Essex County, they have a County Court
7 judge that does everything: Surrogate, County
8 Court, Family Court. Been there forever, about
9 to retire, new judge is going to be elected. But
10 the court itself was begging for a family judge.
11 The district attorney's office was complaining
12 about the backlog of cases. And in fact the
13 Essex County Board of Supervisors has repeatedly
14 formally supported and asked for this
15 legislation, wanted a Family Court judge.

16 One of the documents that I handed
17 to you was their data. And I won't bother to
18 read the whole thing, but it says in 2022 the
19 Legislature determined that Saratoga County --
20 not in my district, to the south of mine,
21 Senator Tedisco's fine district, which will be
22 hosting the Belmont's probably sometime around
23 the time that we're finished with session --
24 needed and deserved a third Family Court judge.
25 And based on those numbers at the time, each

1 judge would have 830 new cases and 2724
2 appearances per judge.

3 Now in 2021 and 2022, the
4 Family Court numbers for Essex County were both
5 higher than those thresholds. You know, so
6 Saratoga County is a larger county, much larger
7 population. Again, Essex County is one of about
8 10 or 11 counties in the state that don't have a
9 Family Court judge. On the list today are a
10 couple of counties that are smaller than them
11 that are getting a Family Court judge, a few that
12 are much larger than them that are getting a
13 Family Court judge.

14 The county feels like their needs,
15 their caseload, their Family Court caseload
16 involving women and children in the North Country
17 in Essex County, has been ignored for six years.
18 They've been begging for this for six years.

19 We talked about it at the time
20 during the budget hearings. OCA was in, I made a
21 similar plea at the time. And I went out to
22 stretch my legs, and I was jumped by -- "jumped"
23 is probably not the right word, but, you know, I
24 was greeted enthusiastically by several people
25 from OCA saying, Yeah, we're going to look at

1 that, we're going to look at that.

2 Here we are at the end of session,
3 as it always is, we get a bill that comes in, 12
4 counties are going to get a Family Court judge.
5 The bill differs from what was recommended by
6 OCA. What's it going to take for Essex County to
7 finally get a Family Court judge?

8 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Through
9 you, Mr. President. I would say that we
10 allocated \$12 million in this year's budget for
11 Family Court judges. And there is potential to
12 do the same in next year's budget or even use
13 this funding for additional judges.

14 This is not the end of allocating
15 Family Court judges by any means. I like to
16 think it's just the beginning to address the
17 problem that surely exists in your district but
18 also statewide.

19 SENATOR STEC: Mr. President, on
20 the bill.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
22 Stec on the bill.

23 SENATOR STEC: I appreciate
24 Senator Sigalman-Hoyle's -- sorry,
25 Senator Hoylman-Sigal's, my apologies -- time

1 here this evening and his advocacy on the issue.
2 I -- certainly I believe his heart's in the right
3 place. He's trying to address a Family Court
4 issue.

5 However, I'm very frustrated with
6 OCA for their lack of action on what is now a
7 six-year-old ask from Essex County. I mean, I
8 often compare, you know, counties and activities
9 to Hamilton County -- our friend Senator Mark
10 Walczyk's not with us tonight, he's serving the
11 country across the world. But he represents
12 Hamilton County. Hamilton County has one judge
13 that handles Surrogate, County Court and
14 Family Court, and they have 5,000 people.

15 I have one judge in Essex County
16 that is serving 37,000 people that is doing the
17 same thing. He has been screaming that he needs
18 help. OCA is not listening to him, so he turns
19 to his county board. The county board is asking
20 the Legislature to help. We've been talking
21 about this for six years. Essex County, home of
22 Lake Placid, that is a place where miracles
23 happen. Apparently it has been easier to beat
24 the Russians on the ice in Essex County than it
25 is to get a Family Court judge.

1 For that reason and others, I'll be
2 voting against this bill until we get it right.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
4 you, Senator Stec.

5 Are there any other Senators wishing
6 to be heard?

7 Seeing and -- oh. Senator Krueger,
8 why do you rise?

9 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you. I'm
10 not sure it's on the bill, but it's certainly on
11 the debate.

12 Listening very carefully to
13 Senator Lanza's questions and statements,
14 Robert Moses, a Republican, created Fresh Kills
15 on Staten Island. It wasn't the Democrats.

16 Thank you.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
18 you, Senator Krueger.

19 Are there any other Senators wishing
20 to be heard?

21 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
22 now closed.

23 Senator Gianaris. Restore it?

24 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes, we've
25 agreed to restore this to the noncontroversial

1 calendar, Mr. President.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
3 will be restored to the noncontroversial
4 calendar.

5 Read the last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
7 act shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
12 Scarcella-Spanton to explain her vote.

13 SENATOR SCARCELLA-SPANTON: Thank
14 you so much.

15 And thank you, Senator Stec, for
16 providing a buffer between me and my colleague
17 from Staten Island, Senator Lanza.

18 But I rise today to explain my vote.
19 I will be voting no on this legislation. For
20 many, many years Staten Island gets a
21 reputation -- Senator Lanza pointed out since
22 before he was born, so it's certainly before I
23 was born -- that we are the forgotten borough.

24 (Laughter.)

25 SENATOR SCARCELLA-SPANTON: That we

1 are the forgotten borough. And this legislation
2 is emblematic of this issue.

3 The fact that Staten Island is not
4 getting any judges through this legislation -- we
5 too have a Family Court. We too have
6 constituents who stand in line and they have
7 their cases dragged along. And we too deserve to
8 have representation in our New York City court
9 system.

10 And for anybody who forgets,
11 Staten Island is indeed part of New York City. I
12 know that we oftentimes don't like to include it
13 in there.

14 But in response to this, I have
15 introduced legislation, it's S9855A, which would
16 give Staten Island parity with the rest of
17 New York City and restoring four judges which
18 should be rightfully there to begin with. I'm
19 hoping that we can get a chapter amendment on
20 this and make sure that we right this wrong.

21 Again, it's always important that we
22 stick together as Staten Islanders, no matter
23 what your party is, no matter what your
24 background is. It's important that we have a
25 unified front. And I will certainly be voting no

1 on this legislation.

2 Thank you.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
4 Scarcella-Spanton to be recorded in the negative.

5 Announce the results.

6 Oh, I'm sorry, Senator Lanza to
7 explain his vote.

8 SENATOR LANZA: Yeah, I'll be
9 voting in the negative for obvious reasons.

10 But I don't want this moment to pass
11 without me thanking my colleague from Staten
12 Island. A lot of the things that we do as
13 members does not happen on this floor. It's the
14 hard work behind the scenes -- lobbying,
15 advocating, begging, pleading, sometimes
16 threatening. And I know Jessica -- Senator
17 Jessica Scarcella has been working on this
18 feverishly, and I pledge to work with her as
19 well.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
21 Lanza to be recorded in the negative.

22 Announce the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
24 Calendar 1878, those Senators voting in the
25 negative are Senators Borrello,

1 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Helming, Lanza, Martins,
2 Mattera, O'Mara, Ortt, Rhoads, Scarcella-Spanton,
3 Stec, Tedisco and Weik.

4 Ayes, 48. Nays, 13.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
6 is passed.

7 Senator Gianaris.

8 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
9 at this time we're going to break for respective
10 party conferences and return at 9:45, so just a
11 little more than an hour.

12 So please call an immediate meeting
13 of the Democratic Conference in Room 332 and
14 recognize Senator Lanza for an announcement.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
16 Lanza.

17 SENATOR LANZA: Can I do this
18 first?

19 SENATOR GIANARIS: Plus a motion.

20 SENATOR LANZA: Thank you,
21 Senator Gianaris.

22 On behalf of Senator Martins, on
23 page 44 I offer the following amendments to
24 Calendar Number 1809, Senate Print 9778A, and ask
25 that said bill retain its place on Third Reading

1 Calendar.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
3 amendments are received, and the bill will retain
4 its place on the Third Reading Calendar.

5 SENATOR LANZA: And, Mr. President,
6 there will be an immediate meeting of the
7 Republican Conference in Room 315.

8 SENATOR GIANARIS: The Senate will
9 stand at ease until 9:45.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
11 Senate will stand at ease until 9:45.

12 (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease
13 at 8:28 p.m.)

14 (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at
15 11:33 p.m.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
17 Senate will return to order.

18 Senator Gianaris.

19 SENATOR GIANARIS: Good evening,
20 Mr. President.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Good
22 evening.

23 SENATOR GIANARIS: On behalf of
24 Senator Bailey, on page 10 I offer the following
25 amendments to Calendar 397, Senate Print 3249,

1 and ask that said bill retain its place on the
2 Third Reading Calendar.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
4 amendments are received, and the bill will retain
5 its place on the Third Reading Calendar.

6 Senator Gianaris.

7 SENATOR GIANARIS: Okay, there are
8 a number of bills we laid aside temporarily
9 earlier, for which we were waiting for home-rules
10 that have now arrived.

11 So let us take up Calendars 1511,
12 1827, 1839, 1840 and 1866.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
14 Secretary will read.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 1511, Senate Print 8756A, by Senator Jackson, an
17 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: There is
19 a home-rule message at the desk.

20 Read the last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 15. This
22 act shall take effect one year after it shall
23 have become a law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
3 the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
5 Calendar 1511, voting in the negative:
6 Senator Martinez.

7 Ayes, 60. Nays, 1.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1827, Senate Print 2812A, by Senator Gounardes,
12 an act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: There is
14 a home-rule message at the desk.

15 Read the last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 SENATOR MARTINS: Can you tell us
22 which calendar number we're voting on?

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: This is
24 Calendar 1827. Off of the supplemental.

25 Announce the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
2 Calendar 1827, those Senators voting in the
3 negative are Senators Borrello,
4 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Felder, Gallivan, Griffo,
5 Helming, Lanza, Martinez, Martins, Mattera,
6 Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Rhoads, Stec,
7 Tedisco, Weber and Weik.

8 Ayes, 42. Nays, 19.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 1839, Senate Print 7128B, by Senator Gounardes,
13 an act to amend the General Municipal Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: There is
15 a home-rule message at the desk.

16 Read the last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
18 act shall take effect immediately.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill

1 is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 1840, Senate Print 7498A, by Senator Jackson, an
4 act to amend the Retirement and Social Security
5 Law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: There is
7 a home-rule message at the desk.

8 Read the last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
15 the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 1866, Senate Print 9373, by Senator Gounardes, an
21 act to amend the Retirement and Social Security
22 Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: There is
24 a home-rule message at the desk.

25 Read the last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
2 act shall take effect immediately.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
9 Calendar 1866, those Senators voting in the
10 negative are Senators Griffio, Helming, O'Mara,
11 Ortt and Stec.

12 Ayes, 56. Nays, 5.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
14 is passed.

15 Senator Gianaris.

16 SENATOR GIANARIS: We're going to
17 now simultaneously call a meeting of the
18 Rules Committee in Room 332 and take up the
19 supplemental active list, please.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: There
21 will be a meeting of the Rules Committee in
22 Room 332.

23 SENATOR GIANARIS: Before the
24 supplemental active list, two orders of business.

25 First of all, pursuant to Rule 5, I

1 move that we stay in session past the hour of
2 midnight.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Without
4 objection, so ordered.

5 SENATOR GIANARIS: And I believe
6 there's some messages from the Assembly.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
8 Secretary will read.

9 THE SECRETARY: Senator Parker
10 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Energy
11 and Telecommunications, Assembly Bill
12 Number 4098B and substitute it for the identical
13 Senate Bill 4305B, Third Reading Calendar 220.

14 Senator Rivera moves to discharge,
15 from the Committee on Health, Assembly Bill
16 Number 8247C and substitute it for the identical
17 Senate Bill 8470A, Third Reading Calendar 454.

18 Senator Oberacker moves to
19 discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
20 Assembly Bill Number 4924B and substitute it for
21 the identical Senate Bill 5937B, Third Reading
22 Calendar 462.

23 Senator Ramos moves to discharge,
24 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
25 Number 8939B and substitute it for the identical

1 Senate Bill 6328B, Third Reading Calendar 530.

2 Senator Rivera moves to discharge,
3 from the Committee on Transportation,
4 Assembly Bill Number 8232A and substitute it for
5 the identical Senate Bill 8561, Third Reading
6 Calendar 564.

7 Senator Stewart-Cousins moves to
8 discharge, from the Committee on Transportation,
9 Assembly Bill Number 8359 and substitute it for
10 the identical Senate Bill 8121, Third Reading
11 Calendar 796.

12 Senator Martinez moves to discharge,
13 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
14 Number 6244C and substitute it for the identical
15 Senate Bill 4993C, Third Reading Calendar 1131.

16 Senator Cleare moves to discharge,
17 from the Committee on Cultural Affairs, Tourism,
18 Parks and Recreation, Assembly Bill Number 860
19 and substitute it for the identical Senate
20 Bill 8895, Third Reading Calendar 1137.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: So
22 ordered.

23 The Secretary will read.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 220, Assembly Bill Number 4098B, by

1 Assemblymember Cunningham, an act to amend the
2 General Business Law.

3 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
5 will be laid aside.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 383, Senate Print 4622B, by Senator Rivera, an
8 act to amend the Public Health Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
12 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
13 shall have become a law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
18 the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
20 Calendar 383, those Senators voting in the
21 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
22 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Helming, Lanza, Mattera,
23 Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Palumbo, Rhoads, Stec,
24 Tedisco, Weber and Weik. Also Senator Ortt.

25 Senator Weik in the affirmative.

1 Ayes, 46. Nays, 15.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 454, Assembly Bill Number 8247C, by
6 Assemblymember Paulin, an act to amend the
7 Public Health Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 (Pause.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: For
17 Calendar Item 397, the bill is high and will be
18 laid aside for the day.

19 We will continue to Calendar Item
20 454.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 454, Assembly Bill Number 8247C, by
23 Assemblymember Paulin, an act to amend the
24 Public Health Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 462, Assembly Bill Number 4924B, by
14 Assemblymember Angelino, an act to amend the
15 Highway Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
19 act shall take effect immediately.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: In relation to

1 Calendar 462, voting in the negative:

2 Senator Brisport.

3 Ayes, 60. Nays, 1.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 530, Assembly Bill Number 8939B, by
8 Assemblymember Bronson, an act to amend the
9 Labor Law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
11 last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
13 act shall take effect immediately.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
18 the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
20 Calendar 530, those Senators voting in the
21 negative are Senators Borrello, Oberacker,
22 O'Mara, Ortt, Tedisco and Weber.

23 Ayes, 55. Nays, 6.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
25 is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 564, Assembly Bill Number 8232A, by
3 Assemblymember Paulin, an act to amend the
4 Public Health Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
8 act shall take effect immediately.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
13 the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 780, Senate Print 7523, by Senator Hoylman-Sigal,
19 an act to amend the Civil Practice Law and Rules.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
3 the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
5 Calendar 780, those Senators voting in the
6 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
7 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Martins, Mattera, Murray,
8 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,
9 Rolison, Tedisco, Weber and Weik.

10 Ayes, 46. Nays, 15.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 796, Assembly Bill Number 8359, by
15 Assemblymember Sillitti, an act to amend the
16 Highway Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
20 act shall take effect immediately.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
25 the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
2 Calendar 796, voting in the negative:
3 Senator Brisport.

4 Ayes, 60. Nays, 1.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
6 is passed.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 891, Senate Print 6689, by Senator Helming, an
9 act to amend the Village Law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: There is
11 a home-rule message at the desk.

12 Read the last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
14 act shall take effect immediately.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
19 the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
22 is passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 940, Senate Print 2604A, by Senator Krueger, an
25 act to amend the Civil Practice Law and Rules.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
2 last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
4 act shall take effect immediately.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
9 the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
11 Calendar 940, those Senators voting in the
12 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
13 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Martins, Mattera, Murray,
14 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,
15 Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Weber and Weik.

16 Ayes, 45. Nays, 16.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 995, Senate Print 7846, by Senator Webb, an act
21 to amend the Public Health Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
5 the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
7 Calendar 995, voting in the negative:
8 Senator Stec.

9 Ayes, 60. Nays, 1.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 999, Senate Print 8987A, by Senator Rivera, an
14 act to amend the Public Health Law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
18 act shall take effect immediately.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
25 Calendar 999, those Senators voting in the

1 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
2 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Helming, Martins, Mattera,
3 Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,
4 Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Weber and Weik.

5 Ayes, 44. Nays, 17.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 1131, Assembly Bill Number 6244C, by
10 Assemblymember Stern, an act to amend the Parks,
11 Recreation and Historic Preservation Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
15 act shall take effect on the 120th day after it
16 shall have become a law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
21 the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1137, Assembly Bill Number 860, by
2 Assemblymember Gibbs, an act to amend the
3 Economic Development Law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
7 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
8 shall have become a law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
13 the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
15 Calendar 1137, those Senators voting in the
16 negative are Senators Ashby, Helming, Lanza,
17 Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,
18 Rolison and Weik.

19 Ayes, 50. Nays, 11.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
21 is passed.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 1177, Senate Print 5918C, by Senator Harckham, an
24 act to amend the Public Service Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
3 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
4 shall have become a law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
9 the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
11 Calendar 1177, voting in the negative:
12 Senator Rhoads.

13 Ayes, 60. Nays, 1.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 1194, Senate Print 4563A, by Senator Skoufis, an
18 act to amend the Highway Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
22 act shall take effect immediately.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
2 the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
4 Calendar 1194, voting in the negative:
5 Senator Brisport.

6 Ayes, 60. Nays, 1.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
8 is passed.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 1265, Senate Print 911A, by Senator Liu, an act
11 to amend the Education Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
15 act shall take effect immediately.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 1471, Senate Print 4686A, by Senator Parker, an

1 act to amend the Criminal Procedure Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This
5 act shall take effect on the first of January.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
10 the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
12 Calendar 1471, those Senators voting in the
13 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
14 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
15 Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker,
16 O'Mara, Ortt, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco,
17 Weber and Weik. Also Senator Palumbo.

18 Ayes, 41. Nays, 20.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1494, Senate Print 8097A, by Senator Persaud, an
23 act to amend the Public Health Law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
25 last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
2 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
3 shall have become a law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
8 Murray to explain his vote.

9 SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you,
10 Mr. President.

11 First, I want to sincerely thank the
12 sponsor, Senator Persaud, for this.

13 You know, it's -- a lot of times
14 when we have these sorts of bills where we're
15 just kind of educating or calling awareness to
16 something, we don't maybe take it as seriously.
17 But let me put this one in perspective. This is
18 something that hit me personally.

19 So in 2010, when I was in much
20 better shape and much younger, I had just won a
21 special election to the State Assembly and I was
22 playing Sunday softball and the Sunday just
23 before I'm coming up here, I blew my knee out,
24 just blew it up. Had to get surgery on it. End
25 up coming up here.

1 And at the time, I was the ranker on
2 the Tourism Committee, and it was just before
3 Memorial Day weekend. And my first year was the
4 year we had the budget that went all the way till
5 August or September or something. So we were
6 going with weekly extenders and we were trying to
7 decide, do we keep the parks open or not.

8 So we were in the chamber just for
9 hours and hours on end, and I'm in a wheelchair
10 at the time, stuck in that wheelchair for
11 about -- it seemed like 72 hours straight.
12 Little did I know, after you have surgery you
13 need to get up and circulate a little bit.

14 Well, I didn't know this. I didn't
15 know about blood clots. I didn't know about
16 pulmonary embolisms and things like this. So lo
17 and behold, I go home for the weekend, I'm on
18 crutches. And at the time, as I said, I was in
19 much better shape, so I used to work out quite a
20 bit. My chief of staff noticed that I got out of
21 the car, used the crutches to go up on stage,
22 made a speech, came right back down and by the
23 time I got to the car, I could barely catch my
24 breath.

25 I was having some chest pains,

1 didn't know what was going on. And he called
2 attention to it. He said, you know, "This is
3 crazy. What's going on here?" So I said it's no
4 big deal. I'm sure it's nothing.

5 We drive up to Albany, we're here on
6 a Tuesday. So we decide to call the doctor, the
7 doctor who did the surgery. We call him up, and
8 he said: "Here are your options. You can come
9 right now, or you can wait till Thursday." I
10 said, "Well, we better come now."

11 We come to see him, he examines me
12 and says, "I think I need to send you to go get
13 an MRI," or an ultrasound or something. He sends
14 me to the next place. And everywhere they sent
15 me, it got more and more serious. And the
16 urgency in their voice got more and more serious.
17 And I started to get more serious and more
18 worried.

19 Come to find out, after the third
20 stop, it was the emergency room, and they told
21 me, "You've got a blood clot, you threw the blood
22 clot, you have a pulmonary embolism. A lot of
23 people die from that." They put me on the hep
24 drip, I'm in the hospital for four straight days.
25 I didn't know -- when they even told me "you have

1 a pulmonary embolism," I didn't know what that
2 meant. I had no clue. I didn't know what to
3 look for, what were the signs, nothing. I could
4 have died right then and there, and I just didn't
5 know why.

6 So things like this, and bringing
7 awareness -- the signs, what to look for, what to
8 do. Come to find out I ended up having more and
9 more blood clots after that surgery, had to get
10 an emergency filter put in, and am now on blood
11 thinners for the rest of my life.

12 But had I known what the signs were,
13 maybe it wouldn't have gotten to the point where
14 I had the pulmonary embolism. Maybe we could
15 have done something sooner. So these types of
16 bills, where they may seem benign and not that
17 important, they could save a life.

18 So again, I thank the sponsor for
19 this. This was important and obviously touched
20 me personally, so I'm proud to cosponsor it and
21 proud to vote yes.

22 Thank you, Mr. President.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
24 Murray to be recorded in the affirmative.

25 Senator Persaud to explain her vote.

1 SENATOR PERSAUD: Thank you,
2 Mr. President.

3 I just wanted to stand here and
4 thank my staff, Michelle Edwin, for bringing this
5 to my attention. When she spoke about blood
6 clotting disease and the things that she has
7 suffered, I was astonished, because I had never
8 heard anyone speak of going through what she had
9 gone through.

10 When someone talks blood clots, you
11 think, oh, you have a cut and so, you know, a
12 clot. But a blood clot can cause someone to die.
13 Blood clots can appear at all parts of the body.
14 And if they're not taken seriously the outcome,
15 as I said, can be fatal.

16 So when she brought it to my
17 attention, she says, We have to ensure that
18 there's a working group so that people can be
19 informed. We must bring this to the attention of
20 the general population. It must be a
21 conversation that we should have on a daily basis
22 so people would know.

23 After you've had surgery, you know,
24 you go along, they give you a prescription and
25 tell you things that you should do. But no one

1 tells you of the signs that you should look for
2 that a blood clot can occur.

3 So again, I want to thank Michelle
4 for bringing this to our attention.

5 I want to thank Senator Murray for
6 having the conversations with Michelle and for
7 cosponsoring this legislation with me.

8 I also want to thank Senator
9 Hoylman-Sigal for his input also, when we were
10 talking about the issues of blood clots and what
11 should be part of the working group.

12 So again, thank you, Mr. President.
13 And I vote aye. And I encourage my colleagues to
14 read up and to know as much as possible about
15 blood clots. Because blood clots -- we are all
16 sitting here, you never know. Blood clots can
17 appear. It can be hereditary. But it can just
18 also just appear, and you never know. So please,
19 we want to ensure that the working group forms
20 the information that will be shared with everyone
21 so that no one should be left in the dark about
22 what a blood clot can do.

23 So again, thank you, Mr. President.

24 I vote aye.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator

1 Persaud to be recorded in the affirmative.

2 Senator Hoylman-Sigal to explain his
3 vote.

4 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Thank you.

5 I wanted to thank Senator Persaud
6 and Senator Murray, to prove that blood clots are
7 bipartisan issue. I myself am a blood clot
8 survivor. In the last three weeks here in
9 Albany, I was at the Hilton Hotel, that luxurious
10 locale --

11 (Laughter.)

12 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: -- when I
13 coughed up blood in my hotel room. And that is
14 obviously an alarming sign for anyone,
15 particularly someone who considers themselves,
16 you know, middle-aged yet healthy. And it was a
17 pulmonary embolism, that Senator Murray
18 experienced and Senator Persaud's colleague did
19 as well.

20 There are, as Senator Persaud said,
21 a number of signs that people should be aware of.
22 I have a family history. And frankly, had I been
23 more mindful of that family history, perhaps I
24 would have taken steps earlier to head off either
25 a clot or a pulmonary embolism.

1 Here is a shocking statistic. Up to
2 30 percent of untreated blood clots result in
3 death. So Senator Murray and I are really here
4 by the grace of God and the grace of good
5 physicians and intervention. They are treatable
6 and manageable, but you do need to know the
7 signs. Hydration is very important, as is
8 exercise. Knowing your family history and being
9 aware, particularly after surgical events or
10 trauma that could lead to clots.

11 So thank you, Senator Persaud and
12 your colleague, for raising awareness for this
13 task force and making certain that New Yorkers
14 "Stop the Clot." I vote aye.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
16 Hoylman-Sigal to be recorded in the affirmative.

17 Announce the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1687, Senate Print 2754A, by Senator Bailey, an
23 act to amend the Criminal Procedure Law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
25 last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
2 act shall take effect on the first of November.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
9 Calendar Number 1687, those Senators voting in
10 the negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
11 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
12 Martins, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara,
13 Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco,
14 Weber and Weik.

15 Ayes, 42. Nays, 19.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 1703, Senate Print 7462B, by Senator Ryan, an act
20 to amend the Education Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
24 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it
25 shall have become a law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
5 the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
8 is passed.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 1718, Senate Print 8951A, by Senator Chu, an act
11 to amend the Highway Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
15 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
16 shall have become a law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
21 the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
24 is passed.

25 There's a substitution at the desk.

1 The Secretary will read.

2 THE SECRETARY: Senator Ryan moves
3 to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
4 Assembly Bill Number 10362B and substitute it for
5 the identical Senate Bill 9327B, Third Reading
6 Calendar 1786.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
8 substitution is so ordered.

9 The Secretary will read.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1786, Assembly Bill Number 10362B, by
12 Assemblymember Wallace, an act to amend the
13 Insurance Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
24 Calendar 1786, those Senators voting in the
25 negative are Senators Ashby, Stec, Weber and

1 Weik.

2 Ayes, 57. Nays, 4.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 1792, Senate Print 9525B, by Senator Gounardes,
7 an act to amend the Education Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it
12 shall have become a law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
20 is passed.

21 Senator Gianaris, that completes the
22 reading of the calendar.

23 SENATOR GIANARIS: I believe
24 there's a report of the Rules Committee at the
25 desk. Can we take that up, please.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
2 Secretary will read.

3 THE SECRETARY: Senator
4 Stewart-Cousins, from the Committee on Rules,
5 reports the following bills:

6 Senate Print 206B, by
7 Senator Cleare, an act to amend
8 the Judiciary Law;

9 Senate Print 4246D, by
10 Senator Harckham, an act to amend the
11 Environmental Conservation Law;

12 Senate Print 4559C, by
13 Senator Martinez, an act to amend the
14 General Business Law;

15 Senate Print 6141B, by
16 Senator Jackson, an act to amend the
17 Retirement and Social Security Law;

18 Senate Print 7011A, by
19 Senator Weber, an act granting retroactive
20 Tier IV membership in the New York State and
21 Local Employees' Retirement System to
22 Raymond Ruckel;

23 Senate Print 8100, by
24 Senator Walczyk, an act to amend the Highway Law;

25 Senate Print 8426, by

1 Senator Skoufis, an act to amend the
2 Social Services Law;

3 Senate Print 8432, by
4 Senator Comrie, an act to amend the
5 Insurance Law;

6 Senate Print 8666A, by
7 Senator Mannion, an act to amend the
8 Public Health Law;

9 Senate Print 8797B, by
10 Senator Mannion, an act in relation to directing
11 the New York State Department of Labor to
12 establish a voluntary training and certification
13 program;

14 Senate Print 8908A, by
15 Senator Palumbo, an act relating to permitting
16 the Setauket Fire District to enter into
17 contracts with the State University of New York
18 at Stony Brook;

19 Senate Print 9227B, by
20 Senator Sepúlveda, an act to amend the
21 Real Property Law;

22 Senate Print 9258, by
23 Senator Scarcella-Spanton, an act to amend the
24 Veterans' Services Law;

25 Senate Print 9269A, by

1 Senator Tedisco, an act authorizing the
2 Village of Ballston Spa to transfer ownership of
3 the Woods Hollow Nature Preserve to the Town of
4 Milton;

5 Senate Print 9295, by
6 Senator Scarcella-Spanton, an act to authorize
7 the Honorable Joseph J. Maltese to receive
8 compensation and service credit;

9 Senate Print 9306, by
10 Senator Stewart-Cousins, an act to amend
11 Chapter 54 of the Laws of 1938;

12 Senate Print 9307A, by
13 Senator Stewart-Cousins, an act to amend
14 Chapter 624 of the Laws of 1940;

15 Senate Print 9359, by
16 Senator Cooney, an act to amend the Tax Law;

17 Senate Print 9364B, by
18 Senator Cooney, an act to amend the
19 State Finance Law;

20 Senate Print 9519A, by
21 Senator Scarcella-Spanton, an act to amend the
22 Public Health Law;

23 Senate Print 9631A, by
24 Senator Skoufis, an act in relation to
25 authorizing Michael Winston Hoard to file a

1 new service retirement application;

2 Senate Print 9673A, by
3 Senator Addabbo, an act to amend the Racing,
4 Pari-Mutuel Wagering and Breeding Law;

5 Senate Print 9678B, by
6 Senator Gonzalez, an act to amend the
7 Election Law;

8 Senate Print 9766, by Senator Weber,
9 an act to amend the Town Law;

10 Senate Print 9826, by
11 Senator Skoufis, Concurrent Resolution of the
12 Senate and Assembly proposing amendments to
13 Section 21 of Article 6, Article 13, and
14 Section 6 of Article 4 of the Constitution;

15 Senate Print 9849, by
16 Senator Comrie, an act to amend the New York City
17 Public Works Investment Act.

18 All bills reported direct to third
19 reading.

20 SENATOR GIANARIS: Move to accept
21 the report of the Rules Committee.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: All those
23 in favor of accepting the report of the
24 Rules Committee signify by saying aye.

25 (Response of "Aye.")

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Opposed,
2 nay.

3 (No response.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
5 report of the Rules Committee is accepted.

6 Senator Gianaris.

7 SENATOR GIANARIS: Take up the
8 supplemental calendar, please.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
10 Secretary will read.

11 SENATOR GIANARIS: Let's take care
12 of messages from the Assembly first.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
14 Secretary will read.

15 THE SECRETARY: Senator Comrie
16 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
17 Assembly Bill Number 9099 and substitute it for
18 the identical Senate Bill 8432, Third Reading
19 Calendar 1888.

20 Senator Mannion moves to discharge,
21 from the Committee on Health, Assembly Bill
22 Number 8560A and substitute it for the identical
23 Senate Bill 8666A, Third Reading Calendar 1889.

24 Senator Sepúlveda moves to
25 discharge, from the Committee on Judiciary,

1 Assembly Bill Number 9329 and substitute it for
2 the identical Senate Bill 9227, Third Reading
3 Calendar 1892.

4 Senator Scarcella-Spanton moves to
5 discharge, from the Committee on Veterans,
6 Homeland Security and Military Affairs,
7 Assembly Bill Number 9850 and substitute it for
8 the identical Senate Bill 9258, Third Reading
9 Calendar 1893.

10 Senator Scarcella-Spanton moves to
11 discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
12 Assembly Bill Number 10263 and substitute it for
13 the identical Senate Bill 9295, Third Reading
14 Calendar 1895.

15 Senator Stewart-Cousins moves to
16 discharge, from the Committee on
17 Local Government, Assembly Bill Number 9573 and
18 substitute it for the identical Senate Bill 9306,
19 Third Reading Calendar 1896.

20 Senator Stewart-Cousins moves to
21 discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
22 Assembly Bill Number 8842A and substitute it for
23 the identical Senate Bill 9307A, Third Reading
24 Calendar 1897.

25 Senator Cooney moves to discharge,

1 from the Committee on Investigations and
2 Government Operations, Assembly Bill Number 10196
3 and substitute it for the identical Senate
4 Bill 9359, Third Reading Calendar 1898.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: So
6 ordered.

7 Moving to the calendar, the
8 Secretary will read.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 1881, Senate Print 206B, by Senator Cleare, an
11 act to amend the Judiciary Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
15 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
16 shall have become a law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
21 Cleare to explain her vote.

22 SENATOR CLEARE: Thank you,
23 Mr. President.

24 It is with a great sense of pride
25 and purpose that I rise to speak about the

1 "Jury of Our Peers" bill.

2 The New York State court system
3 hears over 3 million cases each year. And while
4 not every proceeding turns into a trial by jury,
5 for those that do, those involved expect to have
6 the constitutional right to be judged by their
7 peers.

8 However, in New York State right now
9 any individual convicted of a felony is barred
10 for their entire lifetime from jury service. We
11 have an elected Assemblyman who was formerly
12 convicted of a felony, and he cannot sit on a
13 jury but can sit on the Judiciary Committee.

14 We have formerly convicted
15 individuals who have become attorneys, they've
16 passed the bar and have been admitted to practice
17 in this state, and though they can argue a case
18 in front of a jury or all way to the
19 Supreme Court, they cannot sit on a jury.

20 New York's lifetime ban on jury
21 service simply makes no sense as a matter of law,
22 policy, justice or equity. The most important
23 part of incarceration is rehabilitation and the
24 opportunity to return to your community and
25 participate in civic life and to feel that you're

1 a part of society. Sitting on a jury is the
2 quintessential act of civic life. It should be
3 open to all.

4 To completely eliminate thousands of
5 otherwise eligible individuals from the civic and
6 social good that is jury service is nonsensical.
7 It may also be unconstitutional. At a minimum,
8 it perpetuates a cycle of inequitable outcomes
9 that is not acceptable.

10 The bill in front of us solves this
11 problem by changing our laws to ensure that all
12 individuals who have served their time can be
13 reinstated to jury service. And in doing so,
14 New York will join nearly half the states in this
15 nation who also restore jury service.

16 For the formerly incarcerated, the
17 opportunity to learn, grow and rehabilitate is
18 inextricably linked to the principle that one may
19 use these tools to contribute to the betterment
20 of society. With passage of Jury of Our Peers,
21 we will ensure that people in districts like mine
22 have the opportunity to be judged by those who
23 have walked in their shoes, those who have a
24 similar lived experience, and those that know the
25 path of growth.

1 This bill would not have been
2 possible if not for the efforts of our
3 outstanding leader -- our understanding leader,
4 Andrea Stewart-Cousins; counsel Eric Katz; the
5 exceptional assistant deputy counsel
6 Adriele Douglas, dozens of the very finest
7 advocates in the state, and my Assembly partner,
8 the incomparable and legendary Jeffrion Aubry,
9 who has carried this bill and for which I hope it
10 serves as a fitting capstone to his illustrious
11 career as a crusader for justice.

12 I vote aye with an immense sense of
13 pride.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
15 Cleare to be recorded in the affirmative.

16 Announce the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
18 Calendar 1881, those Senators voting in the
19 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
20 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
21 Lanza, Martinez, Martins, Mattera, Murray,
22 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,
23 Rolison, Scarcella-Spanton, Stec, Tedisco, Weber
24 and Weik.

25 Ayes, 39. Nays, 22.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
2 is passed.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 1882, Senate Print 4246D, by Senator Harckham, an
5 act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

6 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
8 is high and will be laid aside for the day.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 1883, Senate Print 4559C, by Senator Martinez, an
11 act to amend the General Business Law.

12 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Lay it
14 aside.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 1884, Senate Print 6141B, by Senator Jackson, an
17 act to amend the Retirement and Social Security
18 Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
22 act shall take effect immediately.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
2 the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 1885, Senate Print 7011A, by Senator Weber, an
8 act granting retroactive Tier IV membership in
9 the New York State and Local Employees'
10 Retirement System to Raymond Ruckel.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: There is
12 a home-rule message at the desk.

13 Read the last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
15 act shall take effect immediately.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 1886, Senate Print 8100, by Senator Walczyk, an

1 act to amend the Highway Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: There is
3 a home-rule message at the desk.

4 Read the last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
13 Calendar 1886, voting in the negative:
14 Senator Skoufis.

15 Ayes, 60. Nays, 1.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 1887, Senate Print 8426, by Senator Skoufis, an
20 act to amend the Social Services Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 1888, Assembly Bill Number 9099, by
10 Assemblymember Anderson, an act to amend the
11 Insurance Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
15 act shall take effect immediately.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
20 Martins to explain his vote.

21 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,
22 Mr. President.

23 I rise to support this bill. I also
24 rise to recognize the bill's sponsor,
25 Senator Comrie, and the work he's done in getting

1 this bill over the finish line.

2 I want to recognize one of our
3 advocates, Leroy Morrison, who did such a
4 wonderful job also, working the halls of the
5 entire LOB, I think every floor, every single
6 office.

7 But really my hat's off to
8 Senator Comrie, because without his effort and
9 really putting his back into this one, this
10 wouldn't have happened. Our communities are
11 better off as a result.

12 I vote aye.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
14 Martins to be recorded in the affirmative.

15 Announce the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 1889, Assembly Bill Number 8560A, by
21 Assemblymember Burdick, an act to amend the
22 Public Health Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This

1 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
2 shall have become a law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 1890, Senate Print 8797B, by Senator Mannion, an
13 act in relation to directing the New York State
14 Department of Labor to establish a voluntary
15 training and certification program.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
19 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
20 shall have become a law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
25 the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 1891, Senate Print 8908A, by Senator Palumbo, an
6 act relating to permitting the Setauket
7 Fire District to enter into contracts with the
8 State University of New York at Stony Brook.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
12 act shall take effect immediately.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1892, Assembly Bill Number 9329, by
23 Assemblymember Jackson, an act to amend the
24 Real Property Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. this
3 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it
4 shall have become a law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
9 the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
11 Calendar 1892, those Senators voting in the
12 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
13 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffio, Mattera,
14 Murray, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rolison, Stec,
15 Tedisco and Weber.

16 Ayes, 47. Nays, 14.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 1893, Assembly Bill Number 9850, by
21 Assemblymember Jean-Pierre, an act to amend the
22 Veterans' Services Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This

1 act shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
6 the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1894, Senate Print 9269A, by Senator Tedisco, an
12 act authorizing the Village of Ballston Spa to
13 transfer ownership of the Woods Hollow Nature
14 Preserve to the Town of Milton.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: There is
16 a home-rule message at the desk.

17 Read the last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 7. this
19 act shall take effect immediately.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
2 is passed.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 1895, Assembly Bill Number 10263, by
5 Assemblymember Fall, an act to authorize the
6 Honorable Joseph J. Maltese to receive
7 compensation and service credit.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 1896, Assembly Bill Number 9573, by
22 Assemblymember Shimsky, an act to amend
23 Chapter 54 of the Laws of 1938.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
25 last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
2 act shall take effect immediately.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 1897, Assembly Bill Number 8842A, by
13 Assemblymember Shimsky, an act to amend
14 Chapter 624 of the Laws of 1940.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
18 act shall take effect immediately.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
25 Calendar 1897, voting in the negative:

1 Senator Weik.

2 Ayes, 60. Nays, 1.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 1898, Assembly Bill Number 10196, by
7 Assemblymember Lupardo, an act to amend the
8 Tax Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
12 act shall take effect immediately.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
19 Calendar 1898, those Senators voting in the
20 negative are Senators Borrello,
21 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Lanza, Martinez, Martins,
22 Mattera, Stec, Tedisco and Weber.

23 Ayes, 52. Nays, 9.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
25 is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 1899, Senate Print 9364B, by Senator Cooney, an
3 act to amend the State Finance Law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
7 act shall take effect two years after it shall
8 have become a law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
13 the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
16 is passed.

17 There's a substitution at the desk.

18 The Secretary will read.

19 THE SECRETARY: Senator
20 Scarcella-Spanton moves to discharge, from the
21 Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill Number 10189B
22 and substitute it for the identical Senate
23 Bill 9519A, Third Reading Calendar 1900.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:
25 Substitution so ordered.

1 The Secretary will read.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 1900, Assembly Bill Number 10189B, by
4 Assemblymember Gunther, an act to amend the
5 Public Health Law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
14 the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 1901, Senate Print 9631A, by Senator Skoufis, an
20 act in relation to authorizing Michael Winston
21 Hoard to file a new service retirement
22 application.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This

1 act shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
6 the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1902, Senate Print 9673A, by Senator Addabbo, an
12 act to amend the Racing, Pari-Mutuel Wagering and
13 Breeding Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
15 is high; it will be laid aside for the day.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 1903, Senate Print 9678B, by Senator Gonzalez, an
18 act to amend the Election Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
22 act shall take effect immediately.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
2 the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
4 Calendar 1903, those Senators voting in the
5 negative are Senators Mattera, Murray, Oberacker,
6 O'Mara, Ortt and Rhoads. Also Senator Helming.
7 Ayes, 54. Nays, 7.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1904, Senate Print 9766, by Senator Weber, an act
12 to amend the Town Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
16 act shall take effect immediately.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
21 the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
23 Calendar 1904, those Senators voting in the
24 negative are Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chu,
25 Harckham, Hinchey, Lanza, Mannion, Martinez,

1 O'Mara, Palumbo, Rhoads, Scarcella-Spanton,
2 Skoufis, Tedisco and Webb.

3 Ayes, 47. Nays, 14.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 1905, Senate Print 9826, by Senator Skoufis,
8 Concurrent Resolution of the Senate and Assembly
9 proposing amendments to Section 21 of Article 6,
10 Article 13, and Section 6 of Article 4 of the
11 Constitution.

12 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
14 will be laid aside.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 1906, Senate Print 9849, by Senator Comrie, an
17 act to amend the New York City Public Works
18 Investment Act.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
20 last section.

21 Calendar Item 1906 is high and will
22 be laid aside.

23 Senator Gianaris.

24 SENATOR GIANARIS: Let's move on to
25 the controversial calendar, starting with

1 Calendar 220.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
3 Secretary will ring the bell.

4 The Secretary will read.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 220, Assembly Bill Number 4098B, by
7 Assemblymember Cunningham, an act to amend the
8 General Business Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
10 Martins, why do you rise?

11 SENATOR MARTINS: Mr. President, I
12 was wondering if the sponsor would yield for a
13 couple of questions.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
15 sponsor yield?

16 SENATOR PARKER: Yes,
17 Mr. President, I yield.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
19 sponsor yields.

20 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,
21 Mr. President.

22 So this -- this bill, as I
23 understand it, would require that
24 telecommunications companies have to provide a
25 study with regard to each facility they have and

1 whether or not that facility is powered by
2 renewable energy. Is that right?

3 SENATOR PARKER: Through you,
4 Mr. President, yes.

5 SENATOR MARTINS: And so do these
6 facilities -- Mr. President, through you, if the
7 sponsor would continue to yield.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
9 sponsor yield?

10 SENATOR PARKER: Yes.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
12 sponsor yields.

13 SENATOR MARTINS: So do these
14 facilities have their own power source? Are they
15 tied to the grid? Do the -- is there a
16 distinction in this bill with regard to how they
17 receive energy and power a tower, for example,
18 that would be subject to this study?

19 SENATOR PARKER: Through you,
20 Mr. President. The bill does not distinguish the
21 difference. What it simply does is look at the
22 particular power sources to try to bring them
23 into compliance with the CLCPA to try to create
24 as much, you know, sustainable energy from towers
25 as possible.

1 SENATOR MARTINS: Through you,
2 Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
3 yield.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Does the
5 sponsor yield?

6 SENATOR PARKER: Yes.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
8 sponsor yields.

9 SENATOR MARTINS: So is it not a
10 priority of this state, and certainly of this
11 chamber, that we expand the access to faster
12 telecommunications, fiber optic, faster means of
13 telecommunications and access to information in
14 rural areas of the state? Has that not been one
15 of our priorities?

16 SENATOR PARKER: Through you,
17 Mr. President. Yes.

18 SENATOR MARTINS: Through you,
19 Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
20 yield.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Does the
22 sponsor yield?

23 SENATOR PARKER: Yes.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
25 sponsor yields.

1 SENATOR MARTINS: And so does this
2 not actually pose obstacles in the way of our
3 state's stated priority of expanding access to
4 fiber optic transmission or wireless services in
5 rural areas where they've been historically
6 underserved?

7 SENATOR PARKER: Through you,
8 Mr. President, not at all.

9 I think that you're creating
10 somewhat of a false dichotomy. We can
11 actually -- because they are building these
12 systems, they can build them and build them in a
13 sustainable manner.

14 This bill in particular is a study
15 to in fact -- to kind of look at the options and
16 try to figure out what are the best options and
17 the best direction forward so that we both can
18 expand access to telecommunications, particularly
19 in places that are underserved like rural
20 areas -- not the only places that are
21 underserved, because there's a lot of urban areas
22 that are underserved as well. But increasing
23 access in underserved areas, and simultaneously
24 doing it in a way in which it's sustainable.

25 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,

1 Mr. President. Thank you, Senator Parker.

2 On the bill.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
4 Martins on the bill.

5 SENATOR MARTINS: Mr. President, my
6 concern is exactly that, the concern that in our
7 rush to prioritize access to renewable energy
8 when we have not actually developed our grid and
9 our capacity for renewable energy to a point
10 where we can prioritize it, we're actually going
11 to slow down our efforts with regard to
12 connectivity in precisely the areas of this state
13 that we can least afford to be doing that.

14 And so, no, there is no dichotomy
15 here. What we are actually doing is prioritizing
16 something that we are working towards. And we
17 know it's aspirational; we all have talked about
18 the needs in our state for us to achieve
19 renewable energy in all four corners of the
20 state.

21 The reality is, and the concern that
22 we should all have is that as we do that, we are
23 now placing less of a priority on those
24 things that actually make us competitive as a
25 state, that allow us to catch up. Because the

1 reality is the rest of the world is actually well
2 ahead of us when it comes to advances in
3 technology, when it comes to connectivity.

4 And so we shouldn't allow our
5 aspirational goals of getting to 100 percent
6 renewables to stand in the way of progress that
7 is being made each and every day. We have the
8 option to do both. We do. Let both go forward,
9 but let's stop putting obstacles in the way of a
10 telecommunications industry that is committed to
11 getting faster technology into the more rural
12 areas of our state.

13 There are times when we need to
14 understand that progress in those areas comes
15 with connectivity. We've seen it time and time
16 again, whether it's people who just do not have
17 connections to our cellphones in certain rural
18 areas of the state, or whether it's they don't
19 have the ability to connect in doing business.
20 We're at a disadvantage, and it's precisely
21 because of efforts like this that we get there.

22 So Mr. President, I will be voting
23 no on this bill. Not because I don't want to see
24 renewable energy used with regard to
25 telecommunications. I'll be voting no because

1 I'm going to prioritize connectivity until we as
2 a state reach a point where we can actually
3 provide that renewal energy.

4 Because you know what,
5 Mr. President? I don't want to see and I don't
6 think anybody in this chamber wants to see
7 battery-powered anything in the middle of our
8 rural areas powering a tower. Or a gas-generated
9 anything in the middle generating power for a
10 tower, or diesel, or gasoline or anything else.
11 We have the opportunity to allow technology to
12 catch up and to move forward, and we should
13 prioritize that as well.

14 Mr. President, I'll be voting nay.

15 Thank you.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
17 you, Senator Martins.

18 Are there any other Senators wishing
19 to be heard?

20 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
21 closed.

22 The Secretary will ring the bell.

23 Senator Gianaris.

24 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
25 can we restore this bill to the noncontroversial

1 calendar by agreement, please.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
3 will be restored to the noncontroversial
4 calendar.

5 Read the last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
7 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
8 shall have become a law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
13 Parker to explain his vote.

14 SENATOR PARKER: Thank you,
15 Mr. President.

16 Let me just say this. In the State
17 of New York it is possible to walk and chew gum
18 at the same time. And our government, despite
19 some of its inability to do certain things, can
20 actually do some of these things at the same
21 time.

22 And let me just be very also clear
23 that there's not a lot of places in the world
24 that are ahead of New York State when it comes to
25 technology, particularly energy and

1 telecommunications infrastructure. Right? We're
2 literally the communications capital of the
3 world, literally. Right? So this notion that
4 there are places that are doing so much more than
5 we are is just simply not true.

6 Are we doing everything we should be
7 doing and can be doing? No. But we continue to
8 work at that.

9 I'll make a couple of points about
10 this bill that I am voting for. First, there are
11 no memos of support against this bill from any
12 telecom company. So none of the
13 telecommunications companies think that this bill
14 is a hindrance to their operations or their
15 ability to provide telecommunications services in
16 any underserved areas, rural, urban or otherwise.

17 The second point that I wanted to
18 make that I think is really, really important
19 that we understand is that this is for very large
20 systems. This is not for like poles that you
21 see. This is for very, very large systems.

22 And so there are no -- you know, no
23 companies that are against it. It isn't
24 something that we have to do. We can walk and
25 chew gum at the same time. And I'm asking my

1 colleagues to vote for this and to vote for
2 progress, and to continue to fight for the things
3 that are important for our communities.

4 Thank you.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
6 Parker to be recorded in the affirmative.

7 Announce the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
9 Calendar 220, those Senators voting in the
10 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
11 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
12 Lanza, Martins, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Rhoads,
13 Stec, Tedisco, Weber and Weik.

14 Ayes, 45. Nays, 16.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
16 is passed.

17 Senator Gianaris.

18 SENATOR GIANARIS: Let's get back
19 to the controversial calendar, Mr. President.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
21 Secretary will ring the bell.

22 The Secretary will read.

23 SENATOR GIANARIS: Calendar 1883,
24 please.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The

1 Secretary will read.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 1883, Senate Print 4559C, by Senator Martinez, an
4 act to amend the General Business Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
6 Murray, why do you rise?

7 SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you,
8 Mr. President. Would the sponsor yield for a few
9 questions.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
11 sponsor yield?

12 SENATOR MARTINEZ: No.

13 (Laughter.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
15 sponsor will yield.

16 SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you,
17 Mr. President. Through you.

18 First let me say I think we all are
19 fine with making sure that our -- our security of
20 our schools are well-trained. But under this
21 bill, who is required to take this training?
22 Does it include people who are existing security
23 guards?

24 SENATOR MARTINEZ: Through you,
25 Mr. President, yes. Anyone who is in the school

1 setting will need to take the certification and
2 training.

3 SENATOR MURRAY: Mr. President,
4 would the sponsor continue to yield.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
6 sponsor yield?

7 SENATOR MARTINEZ: Yes.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
9 sponsor yields.

10 SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you.

11 Does that include current or retired
12 law enforcement?

13 SENATOR MARTINEZ: Through you,
14 Mr. President. It does not include active police
15 officers, but it does include retired officers of
16 five years or more.

17 SENATOR MURRAY: Will the sponsor
18 continue to yield.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
20 sponsor yield?

21 SENATOR MARTINEZ: Yes.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
23 sponsor yields.

24 SENATOR MURRAY: Who is -- who is
25 coming up with the training, and who is actually

1 conducting this training?

2 SENATOR MARTINEZ: Through you,
3 Mr. President. The certification and the
4 training would be through the Department of
5 State, in collaboration with the Division of
6 Criminal Justice Services, Division of Homeland
7 Security, State Police, and local law
8 enforcement.

9 SENATOR MURRAY: Will the sponsor
10 continue to yield.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
12 sponsor continue to yield?

13 SENATOR MARTINEZ: Yes.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
15 sponsor yields.

16 SENATOR MURRAY: Now, expanding on
17 that, but who exactly -- out of that, who would
18 be conducting the training itself? Would it be
19 an on-site training? Would it be a
20 classroom-type thing? How would it be conducted?

21 SENATOR MARTINEZ: Through you,
22 Mr. President. The Department of State would
23 decide when and where this training would take
24 place. So really everything is incumbent upon
25 the State Department to decide when and where.

1 SENATOR MURRAY: Would the sponsor
2 continue to yield.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
4 sponsor yield?

5 SENATOR MARTINEZ: Yes.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
7 sponsor yields.

8 SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you.

9 Through you, Mr. President. Does
10 this training also address the use of firearms?
11 As some schools are starting to hire armed guards
12 now. So would it include firearm training?

13 SENATOR MARTINEZ: Through you,
14 Mr. President. Though it's not explicit, while
15 the department -- the State Department, all the
16 other stakeholders, they can include that if they
17 see it necessary.

18 SENATOR MURRAY: Would the sponsor
19 continue to yield.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
21 sponsor yield?

22 SENATOR MARTINEZ: Yes.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
24 sponsor yields.

25 SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you.

1 Now, the big question is, have you
2 spoken to the school districts about how this may
3 affect recruitment and retention? I know some
4 school districts are having some problems in
5 adding additional security guards. Have you
6 spoken to them on how this may impact that?

7 SENATOR MARTINEZ: Through you,
8 Mr. President. This does have the support of the
9 New York State School Boards Association. This
10 also has the support of the Sachem School
11 District. Though not in my district, they did do
12 a resolution in support of this.

13 This bill is also written in
14 collaboration with a former law enforcement
15 official as well as a former school board
16 trustee.

17 SENATOR MURRAY: Will the sponsor
18 continue to yield.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
20 sponsor yield?

21 SENATOR MARTINEZ: Yes.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
23 sponsor yields.

24 SENATOR MURRAY: And do we have a
25 cost for this?

1 SENATOR MARTINEZ: Through you,
2 Mr. President. There is no cost to the school
3 districts. It would be incumbent upon the
4 individual who is obtaining this license to pay
5 for it, as it's already happening.

6 SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you.
7 On the bill.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
9 Murray on the bill.

10 SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you,
11 Senator Martinez.

12 As I said, I'm not against --
13 certainly not against additional training for our
14 security guards or our officers for our schools.
15 Just a little bit concerned about the details of
16 it a little bit more. Like, are we going to be
17 taking people off the job now to do this
18 training? How long is this training going to
19 be -- going to take? Have we -- do we have the
20 details of the training? That's my concern right
21 now.

22 I'd like to see a little bit more
23 because, again, I think this could have an impact
24 currently on the school districts with both
25 recruitment and retention. And maybe pulling

1 some of them off to actually do this training
2 might cause some hardship for the school
3 districts.

4 So while I do have these concerns, I
5 do support the idea of additional training, so I
6 will be supporting the bill.

7 Thank you.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
9 you, Senator Murray.

10 Are there any other Senators wishing
11 to be heard?

12 Sealing and hearing none, debate is
13 now closed.

14 The Secretary will ring the bell.

15 Senator Gianaris.

16 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
17 we've agreed to restore this, by agreement, to
18 the noncontroversial calendar, please.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
20 will be restored to the noncontroversial
21 calendar.

22 Read the last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
24 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
25 shall have become a law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
5 Martinez to explain her vote.

6 SENATOR MARTINEZ: Thank you,
7 Mr. President.

8 As a former educator and
9 administrator, this bill is obviously of utmost
10 importance. It reflects a proactive response to
11 the unfortunate reality our kids endure every
12 single day.

13 We can all agree that no child
14 should have the fear of a dangerous situation in
15 any learning environment. Their only focus
16 should be that of an enriching social and
17 academic experience.

18 The role of school security guards
19 has transformed, and this is our responsibility
20 to ensure that they are equipped with the
21 knowledge, the tools and training necessary to
22 act in any type of an emergency.

23 For these reasons, I strongly
24 believe -- and as a former educator, seeing the
25 work that our security guards do every single

1 day, this is a commonsense approach to making
2 sure that our guards are well-trained to learn
3 the holistic child, to know the signs of a child
4 when a child's in distress, when a child needs
5 help. And I would think that we would want our
6 security guards to have every single tool in
7 their toolbox to do the best job to their
8 ability.

9 So for that reason, Mr. President, I
10 vote aye.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
12 Martinez to be recorded in the affirmative.

13 Announce the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
15 Calendar 1883, voting in the negative are
16 Senators Borrello, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
17 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco
18 and Weber.

19 Ayes, 50. Nays, 11.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
21 is passed.

22 Senator Gianaris.

23 SENATOR GIANARIS: Next on the
24 controversial calendar, let's go to
25 Calendar 1905.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
2 Secretary will ring the bell.

3 The Secretary will read.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 1905, Senate Print 9826, by Senator Skoufis,
6 Concurrent Resolution of the Senate and Assembly
7 proposing amendments to Section 21 of Article 6,
8 Article 13, and Section 6 of Article 4 of the
9 Constitution.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
11 Rhoads, why do you rise?

12 SENATOR RHOADS: I would ask if the
13 sponsor would yield to a few questions.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
15 sponsor yield for a few questions?

16 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
18 sponsor yields.

19 SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you.

20 Through you, Mr. President. Good
21 evening -- or good morning, Senator Skoufis.

22 I notice that this legislation was
23 actually filed I believe on June 3rd, only a
24 couple of days ago. Why so late in the process?

25 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,

1 Mr. President. Good to see you, Senator Rhoads,
2 for Part 2 of the even-years-elections debate.

3 The reason why the bill was filed --
4 or the constitutional amendment, the bill was
5 filed more recently was to preserve the
6 possibility, which we are now discussing today,
7 tonight, that we may have to proceed with this
8 version of the constitutional amendment as
9 opposed to the version that had been around for a
10 bit longer.

11 SENATOR RHOADS: Would the sponsor
12 continue to yield?

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
14 sponsor yield?

15 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
17 sponsor yields.

18 SENATOR RHOADS: What changes were
19 made from the previous version to the one that's
20 before us today?

21 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
22 Mr. President. One change was made. The version
23 that is before us tonight does not include
24 New York City municipal elections. The previous
25 version did.

1 SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you.

2 Will the sponsor continue to yield.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
4 sponsor yield?

5 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
7 sponsor yields.

8 SENATOR RHOADS: Asking a -- just a
9 technical explanation, if you don't mind.

10 Turning to Section 10 of this
11 particular proposed constitutional amendment, it
12 states: "Notwithstanding any other provision of
13 this Constitution, the Legislature may enact laws
14 which provide for the election of an elective
15 officer of the state or any political subdivision
16 of the state to take place on the Tuesday
17 succeeding the first Monday in November in an
18 odd-numbered year for a term which will cause
19 such officer's term to expire at the end of an
20 even-numbered year."

21 Can you explain what that means?

22 SENATOR SKOUFIS: I apologize. Can
23 you just repeat what you're citing?

24 SENATOR RHOADS: Sure. It's page 2
25 of the bill, Section 10.

1 I'm sorry, it's Section 2,
2 subsection 10.

3 (Pause.)

4 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
5 Mr. President, I apologize for the delay.

6 My counsel explains that this
7 particular technical provision here allows us to
8 proceed with enacting what we're talking about.

9 SENATOR RHOADS: Okay. So my
10 understanding, and please -- would the sponsor
11 continue to yield.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
13 sponsor yield?

14 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
16 sponsor yields.

17 SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you.
18 Through you, Mr. President.

19 So am I correct in my understanding
20 that the provision "notwithstanding anything else
21 in the Constitution" would mean that any of the
22 terms for any of the elected officers that are
23 established either in law or by the Constitution
24 could be shortened or amended by the Legislature
25 at will?

1 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
2 Mr. President. This -- this mirrors what we did
3 last year. And for those elected officers who
4 are currently serving, it allowed them to
5 complete their terms. Yes.

6 SENATOR RHOADS: Would the sponsor
7 continue to yield.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
9 sponsor yield?

10 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
12 sponsor yields.

13 SENATOR RHOADS: Did we amend the
14 Constitution last year?

15 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
16 Mr. President, no.

17 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor
18 continue to yield.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
20 sponsor yield?

21 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
23 sponsor yields.

24 SENATOR RHOADS: So we did that
25 without a constitutional amendment. Yet in this

1 bill we are saying that that's required by
2 constitutional amendment.

3 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
4 Mr. President. The distinction is that the
5 offices that we statutorily spoke to last year
6 were not confined by constitutional constraints,
7 whereas the constitutional amendment that's
8 before us today speaks to particular offices that
9 do have constitutional constraints.

10 I'm happy to list them here. It's
11 all city offices outside of New York City -- DAs,
12 sheriffs, county clerks, a number of judicial
13 offices. I think that covers it. Oh, and
14 New York City's elected judges and district
15 attorneys that are technically county offices,
16 not city offices.

17 SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you,
18 Senator.

19 Will the sponsor continue to yield.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Does the
21 sponsor yield?

22 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
24 sponsor yields.

25 SENATOR RHOADS: Through you,

1 Mr. President. But the effect is still the same
2 between last year and this year. What this
3 proposed amendment is saying is that we have the
4 ability as the Legislature to now shorten the
5 terms of any elected officer in the State of
6 New York.

7 So for example, if we have a
8 district attorney or we have a sheriff that is in
9 the first or second year out of a multiyear term,
10 the Legislature can, at its own will, shorten
11 that term.

12 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
13 Mr. President. To be clear, we have not
14 prescribed shortened terms for anyone that is
15 currently in office. We are -- in order to sync
16 onto even-year election cycles, we prescribe
17 shortening a subsequent term by a year to get
18 them from an odd-year to an even-year cycle.

19 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor
20 continue to yield.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
22 sponsor yield?

23 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
25 sponsor yields.

1 SENATOR RHOADS: Can you point to
2 where in this bill it actually says that the
3 Legislature does not have the power to do that?
4 Because it seems pretty clear, from the language
5 that's in subsection 10, that we can.

6 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
7 Mr. President. So we legally can, but we chose
8 not to last year. And similarly, we have decided
9 the same this year in the constitutional
10 amendment before us.

11 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor
12 continue to yield.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
14 sponsor yield?

15 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
17 sponsor yields.

18 SENATOR RHOADS: However, it gives
19 the -- in the constitutional amendment it gives
20 the Legislature the ability to change that at any
21 time. So while we may not have elected to do it
22 in this particular bill, we have given the
23 authority to the Legislature to change that at
24 will in the future.

25 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,

1 Mr. President. All the offices that we changed
2 last year we already had the authority to do so.

3 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor
4 continue to yield.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
6 sponsor yield?

7 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
9 sponsor yields.

10 SENATOR RHOADS: I'm talking about
11 this particular bill right now.

12 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
13 Mr. President. So again, in an effort to align
14 what we did -- or align with what we did last
15 year, we are creating a similar paradigm. We are
16 not -- we have not chosen to shorten those terms,
17 but we are creating the same authority that
18 exists for those offices that we spoke to last
19 year.

20 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor
21 continue to yield.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
23 sponsor yield?

24 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The

1 sponsor yields.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: So am I
3 correct in my understanding that in this
4 legislation, in this proposed constitutional
5 amendment, while we have not changed the terms of
6 any existing officer, the Legislature has the
7 authority in the future to change those terms if
8 it so desires at that time.

9 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
10 Mr. President. Again, we align the authority
11 with what existed for the statutory offices last
12 year. So yes.

13 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor
14 continue to yield.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Does the
16 sponsor yield?

17 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
19 sponsor yields.

20 SENATOR RHOADS: So in theory, if
21 we had a Supreme Court justice that had been
22 elected to a 14-year term in 2021, we could
23 decide next year, if this constitutional
24 amendment were to pass, that we could limit that
25 to a five-year term so that that justice would

1 run for reelection in an even year.

2 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
3 Mr. President. Just as we have the authority to
4 do with the offices that we spoke to last year.

5 SENATOR RHOADS: And I notice
6 that -- will the sponsor continue to yield.
7 Sorry.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
9 sponsor yield?

10 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
12 sponsor yields.

13 SENATOR RHOADS: Now, is there any
14 provision in this constitutional amendment that
15 would restrict the Legislature's ability to do
16 that to individual judicial districts? Or does
17 it have to be done statewide?

18 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
19 Mr. President. We can't identify any provisions
20 that speak to district-specific changes. But
21 that's something that we can try and clarify
22 after digging into the question a little bit
23 more.

24 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor
25 continue to yield.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
2 sponsor yield?

3 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
5 sponsor yields.

6 SENATOR RHOADS: And what I mean by
7 that question is, if we decide -- if the
8 Legislature decides, for example, that we only
9 want to impact the races that are taking place in
10 the 10th Judicial District, is there any
11 restriction on the power of the Legislature to do
12 that? Or must this be a broad application across
13 the entire state?

14 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
15 Mr. President. We are silent on the issue that
16 you're -- or the bill is silent on the issue that
17 you're speaking of. Certainly the intent is not
18 to alter any terms on a district-by-district
19 basis.

20 And, you know, I would certainly
21 entertain legislation that would make it very
22 clear that that sort of action is prohibited.

23 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor
24 continue to yield.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the

1 sponsor yield?

2 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
4 sponsor yields.

5 SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you.

6 Through you, Mr. President. But
7 this is a constitutional amendment. We don't
8 have the ability to change this. Right? Am I
9 correct in my understanding that if we pass this
10 bill today, it has to be passed by a successive
11 Legislature, the exact same bill, and then it
12 will go on to the ballot for the voters to decide
13 whether or not they want to enact this.

14 So the idea that we have the ability
15 to follow up later and change it to make
16 clarifications so that there is a broad
17 application and the Legislature wouldn't be able
18 to cherry-pick, we really don't have the ability
19 to do that if this passes today, correct?

20 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
21 Mr. President. Certainly your evaluation of the
22 constitutional amending process is accurate.

23 And if you were looking to put in
24 place the protection you're describing within the
25 State Constitution, it would have to be a

1 separate constitutional amendment that also moves
2 through that process that you described.

3 I will say that, again, this
4 authority that we're -- this rabbit hole we're
5 diving down here, this authority already exists
6 for the offices that we changed from odd to even
7 years last year.

8 And in my 12 years as a legislator
9 up here in Albany, I don't recall seeing a bill
10 that ever sought to change the terms on a
11 district-by-district basis, or I think the terms
12 at all, for the offices that we already and long
13 have held the authority to do that we spoke to
14 last year.

15 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor
16 continue to yield.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
18 sponsor yield?

19 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
21 sponsor yields.

22 SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you.

23 But we've seen a lot of things in
24 this chamber that we've never seen before, from
25 time to time.

1 But you would agree that as
2 presently drafted, there is nothing that would
3 prohibit the Legislature, if this were to be
4 enacted by the voters, by constitutional
5 referendum, there's nothing that would prohibit
6 the Legislature from choosing selective offices
7 in particular jurisdictions that we want to
8 change the term.

9 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
10 Mr. President. Again, to be clear, this
11 constitutional amendment does not change the
12 issue -- not speak to, does not change at all the
13 issue that you are discussing.

14 And so while yes, there is not a
15 clear prohibition, there is also no authorization
16 to do what you're describing.

17 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor
18 continue to yield.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
20 sponsor yield?

21 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
23 sponsor yields.

24 SENATOR RHOADS: The question is
25 simply: As written, is it possible?

1 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
2 Mr. President, it's possible now, with or without
3 this constitutional amendment.

4 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor
5 continue to yield.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
7 sponsor yield?

8 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
10 sponsor yields.

11 SENATOR RHOADS: So there's nothing
12 in the Constitution presently that would prohibit
13 it.

14 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
15 Mr. President, that's my understanding.

16 And yes, nothing changes in that
17 regard with this constitutional amendment before
18 us.

19 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor
20 continue to yield.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
22 sponsor yield?

23 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
25 sponsor yields.

1 SENATOR RHOADS: And so with this
2 issue pertaining to this particular bill and the
3 authority of the Legislature to cherry-pick
4 particular locations where we're going to apply
5 the odd-even aspect of this legislation, of this
6 proposed constitutional amendment, you're saying
7 that in order to fix this, if it were to be
8 approved today, we would have to go to two
9 successive Legislatures, have another
10 constitutional amendment to fix that.

11 As opposed to simply amending this
12 now.

13 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
14 Mr. President. To the extent that this issue
15 needs to be fixed, it would need to be fixed with
16 or without this constitutional amendment before
17 us. That is a totally independent issue -- to
18 the extent it is an issue -- with or without this
19 bill that's before us.

20 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor
21 continue to yield.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
23 sponsor yield?

24 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The

1 sponsor yields.

2 SENATOR RHOADS: You would agree
3 with me, though, that the notion that we would be
4 able to change the sheriff's election in
5 Nassau County, for example, and not touch any
6 other sheriff's election in any other
7 jurisdiction in the State of New York, would seem
8 rather inappropriate.

9 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
10 Mr. President. The hypothetical that you just
11 described is certainly not my intent.

12 SENATOR RHOADS: Have you -- will
13 the sponsor continue to yield.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Does the
15 sponsor yield?

16 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
18 sponsor yields.

19 SENATOR RHOADS: Who actually
20 requested this change in the law?

21 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
22 Mr. President. What's before us here as a
23 concept was discussed at length in last year's
24 debate. And a number of colleagues in this
25 chamber -- perhaps you as well; I don't recall if

1 you did specifically, Mr. Rhoads -- but a number
2 of colleagues raised the issue of, well, what do
3 we do with the balance of offices that we were
4 not able to move to even years last year due to
5 constitutional constraints.

6 And I made it very clear that my
7 intention at that time was to introduce a
8 constitutional amendment.

9 And so I don't believe that this
10 should come as a surprise to anyone. This was
11 something that I made crystal clear in some way,
12 shape or form would be coming. It is now here.
13 And I look forward to the chamber adopting this
14 constitutional amendment.

15 Because absent adopting this
16 constitutional amendment, the cost savings that
17 you, Senator Rhoads, and many of your colleagues
18 were clamoring for in last year's debate will not
19 materialize unless we move the balance of offices
20 we could not move last year.

21 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor
22 continue to yield.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
24 sponsor yield?

25 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
2 sponsor yields.

3 SENATOR RHOADS: And what would
4 occur if there was a vacancy in the office?
5 Let's say a Supreme Court justice retires.

6 (Pause.)

7 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
8 Mr. President, apologies for the delay.

9 And so if there is a vacancy, that
10 vacancy would be temporarily filled until the
11 next even-year opportunity for an election,
12 towards a full term that is reset.

13 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor
14 continue to yield.

15 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
17 sponsor yields.

18 SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you.

19 Through you, Mr. President. If this
20 constitutional amendment were not to pass, I
21 would anticipate that we'll continue to have
22 odd-year elections?

23 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
24 Mr. President, if the constitutional amendment
25 either didn't pass in successive Legislatures or

1 failed via referendum, then yes, there would be a
2 handful of offices that would remain on an
3 odd-year cycle.

4 SENATOR RHOADS: And will the
5 sponsor continue to yield.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
7 sponsor yield?

8 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
10 sponsor yields.

11 SENATOR RHOADS: This is almost a
12 question from the last debate. But who exactly
13 has expressed concern -- not from within this
14 chamber, but are there any groups that have
15 expressed concern about odd/even elections?

16 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
17 Mr. President. There are quite a number of
18 groups that have long supported a move to
19 even-year cycles. Most of them are either
20 voting-rights groups or good-government groups
21 that support the dramatic increase that
22 materializes from moving from even-year -- or,
23 rather, odd-year cycles to even-year cycles.

24 But more importantly, in my opinion,
25 the people of New York State, when surveyed, very

1 clearly and unequivocally support this by -- or
2 with a very strong mandate, by -- last time this
3 was surveyed by Siena College, by an over
4 two-to-one margin.

5 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor
6 continue to yield.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
8 sponsor yield?

9 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
11 sponsor yields.

12 SENATOR RHOADS: While we're
13 speaking about public attitudes and opinions, I
14 think it's worth noting that since we're talking
15 about constitutional amendments, that this body
16 back in 2021 actually proposed three
17 election-related ballot measures. All three of
18 them failed, and failed dramatically.

19 Is there any concern on your part
20 that perhaps this body might not have its finger
21 on the pulse of what the public actually wants
22 with respect to elections?

23 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
24 Mr. President. I'm not going to speak to
25 nongermane constitutional amendments. I'm happy

1 to speak to the prospects of this constitutional
2 amendment.

3 And again, I think that there's very
4 clear -- by a large majority -- support for
5 moving to even-year cycles. And I have a high
6 level of confidence that voters, when this is put
7 on the ballot, will express their strong support.

8 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor
9 continue to yield.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
11 sponsor yield?

12 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
14 sponsor yields.

15 SENATOR RHOADS: Now, I'd like to
16 read something from a bill that you previously
17 sponsored, which was Senate Bill 5943, which
18 states: "In New York the current ballot order is
19 structured in a way that judicial candidates are
20 listed prior to congressional and state
21 candidates. Very few members of the public
22 actually know who the judicial candidates are,
23 and these candidates are often unopposed. When
24 the Board of Elections list the candidates in
25 this manner on the ballot and force candidates in

1 competitive races to the end of the ballot, it
2 results in drop-offs, when voters decide on the
3 president, for example, but leave blank all other
4 races on the ballot."

5 So I was wondering, Senator Skoufis,
6 if you could comment on -- to me as to how you
7 think this issue is addressed by making our
8 ballots even longer with the addition of judicial
9 candidates to ballots that already include county
10 offices, town offices, et cetera.

11 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
12 Mr. President. I appreciate the question.

13 The bill that you're referencing has
14 passed this chamber; I think for the first time
15 it has also passed the Assembly. I look forward
16 to hopefully it being enacted later this year.

17 But that bill speaks to the sorting
18 of offices on the ballot. And yes, certainly in
19 the bill's memo there is reference to drop-off.

20 Now, I will note that the further
21 along you go on the ballot, the drop-off is quite
22 marginal. Moving from odd-year cycles to
23 even-year cycles, there is a dramatic increase in
24 turnout as it pertains to the number of people
25 who weigh in on these local town and county and,

1 with this constitutional amendment, many city
2 elections.

3 And so even with some marginal
4 drop-off, the marginal drop-off will be coming
5 off from, in a presidential year, 70, 80 percent
6 turnout. And so maybe a few points brings the
7 80 percent turnout down to a 77, a 76, 75 percent
8 turnout. Yes, there's some drop-off, but it's
9 still a heck of a lot higher than 20, 30 percent
10 turnout, which is what we see in odd-year cycles.

11 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor
12 continue to yield.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
14 sponsor yield?

15 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
17 sponsor yields.

18 SENATOR RHOADS: Now, I know we're
19 talking about generalities, but do we have any
20 specific data that actually would forecast that
21 with an election ballot that includes potentially
22 the President, Vice President, Governor,
23 Lieutenant Governor, State Senate, State
24 Assembly, county executive, county legislature,
25 district attorney, county sheriff, town

1 supervisor, town council, Supreme Court justices,
2 county court justices, village court justices,
3 Surrogate's -- the list seems to be endless.

4 Are there -- is there any
5 statistical data as to how much the drop-off
6 would actually be if we have 30 or 40 or
7 theoretically even 50 races on a ballot?

8 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
9 Mr. President, I don't -- I don't believe that
10 there's any circumstance in which there's 40 or
11 50 races potentially on a ballot with this move
12 that we're discussing.

13 There are many cities in particular,
14 around the country, that have moved to even-year
15 cycles and have lengthy ballots that voters have
16 demonstrated have very little problem being able
17 to get through.

18 But I'll cite one statistic from
19 right here in New York, because occasionally we
20 do have local offices that, usually due to
21 vacancies, do get synced to an even-year cycle.
22 I'll mention one from my district. In 2020, a
23 presidential year, with a lot of races on the
24 ballot, there was a town justice election in the
25 town that I live in, the Town of Cornwall, and at

1 the very end of that ballot for town justice, the
2 turnout for that race was 83 percent.

3 In 2021, the next year, the odd
4 cycle, the town supervisor's race, the top of the
5 ticket, the turnout was 39 percent.

6 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor
7 continue to yield?

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
9 sponsor yield?

10 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
12 sponsor yields.

13 SENATOR RHOADS: Was there any
14 effort on the part of the sponsor to contact any
15 local municipalities, consult any judicial groups
16 to find out whether or not they thought this was
17 a good idea?

18 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
19 Mr. President. To answer your question, yes, I
20 have personally consulted, spoken with many
21 municipal leaders about moving elections from
22 odd-year to even-year cycles.

23 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor
24 continue to yield.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the

1 sponsor yield?

2 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
4 sponsor yields.

5 SENATOR SKOUFIS: In any of those
6 conversations, was anyone supportive of the idea?

7 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
8 Mr. President, yes.

9 SENATOR RHOADS: And will the
10 sponsor continue to yield.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
12 sponsor yield?

13 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
15 sponsor yields.

16 SENATOR RHOADS: Is it not a fact,
17 Senator Skoufis, that as a result of the actions
18 that were taken last year to move town and county
19 elections, that there have been lawsuits filed
20 against the State of New York, specifically as a
21 result of that move, by Rockland County, your
22 home county of Orange County, Onondaga County,
23 Nassau County, Suffolk County, Dutchess County,
24 Oneida County, Rensselaer County, the Town of
25 Hempstead, the Town of North Hempstead, the Town

1 of Brookhaven, Town of Islip, Town of Huntington,
2 Town of Smithtown -- in fact, the New York
3 Association of Counties came out against the
4 actions that were taken last year by this
5 Legislature. You're aware of that, right?

6 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
7 Mr. President. I am aware of most of that legal
8 action that you outlined.

9 I believe all of those lawsuits are
10 coming from Republican elected officials, if I am
11 not mistaken. It's unfortunate that this has
12 been made into a partisan issue.

13 And if I may editorialize a bit,
14 given my understanding of the legal basis of
15 these lawsuits, I also find it unfortunate that
16 these elected officials I believe may as well be
17 lighting taxpayer funds on fire. These are
18 frivolous lawsuits. I don't expect them to be
19 successful.

20 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor
21 continue to yield.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
23 sponsor yield?

24 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The

1 sponsor yields.

2 SENATOR RHOADS: Well, we'll allow
3 the courts to make that determination. And I
4 certainly disagree with your conclusion.

5 But let me ask specifically why the
6 City of New York was excluded from this
7 legislation. Why was there a change?

8 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
9 Mr. President. We have this version of the
10 constitutional amendment before us because there
11 was not consensus in our conference to advance
12 the version that included New York City.

13 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor
14 continue to yield.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
16 sponsor yield?

17 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
19 sponsor yields.

20 SENATOR RHOADS: By the lack of
21 consensus in your conference, you mean the
22 Democratic Conference couldn't agree to move the
23 city elections for political concerns, correct?

24 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
25 Mr. President, that's not what I said.

1 There are substantive nuances in
2 New York City that some of my colleagues have
3 concerns about, from ranked-choice voting to the
4 long and unfortunately storied and troubled
5 history of the New York City Board of Elections
6 being able to administer elections. There are a
7 variety of substantive issues that some of my
8 colleagues had.

9 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor
10 continue to yield.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
12 sponsor yield?

13 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
15 sponsor yields.

16 SENATOR RHOADS: You remember last
17 year's debate, I'm sure. And we spent quite a
18 bit of time discussing the fact that, you know,
19 it's good for thee but not for me. Right? That
20 we were changing all of the elections, county and
21 town elections, but we were not changing
22 elections in the City of New York. And your
23 response to that was that we need to do a
24 constitutional amendment in order to accomplish
25 that.

1 Here we are talking about the
2 constitutional amendment, and yet the City of
3 New York is not included in that, so that towns
4 and counties are being treated differently than
5 the City of New York. Doesn't that trouble you?

6 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
7 Mr. President. I think what my colleague is
8 getting at is if there is some sort of political
9 motive here for excluding New York City.

10 And as I remarked last year, there
11 were a number of Democratically held offices from
12 Westchester to Erie County that were affected by
13 last year's legislation.

14 And despite New York City not being
15 included in the constitutional amendment before
16 us, I will note that all other cities in New York
17 State, the vast majority of which are led by
18 Democratic officials, are included and are
19 proposed to be moved to even-year cycles.

20 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor
21 continue to yield.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
23 sponsor yield?

24 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The

1 sponsor yields.

2 SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you.

3 Through you, Mr. President. But the
4 idea behind this legislation, this constitutional
5 amendment, is that you want to increase voter
6 turnout, is that not true?

7 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
8 Mr. President, that is the primary motivation,
9 yes.

10 SENATOR RHOADS: Okay. So -- will
11 the sponsor continue to yield.

12 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

13 SENATOR RHOADS: So in
14 Onondaga County, for example, in last year's
15 election, voter turnout was 29 percent. In
16 Monroe County in last year's election,
17 voter turnout was 29 percent. In Erie County,
18 voter turnout was 32 percent.

19 I'm trying to go through stats on my
20 phone right now, so I apologize.

21 However, in the 2023 City Council
22 District 13 election, voter turnout was just
23 14 percent. In the District 43 election, voter
24 turnout was 13 percent, in comparison to
25 29 percent the year before. The 2023

1 City Council District 19 election, 21 percent
2 voter turnout. You're seeing voter turnouts of a
3 third of what you're getting in even-year
4 elections in city elections, yet city elections
5 aren't being changed here.

6 Is there an explanation as to why,
7 other than members from New York City decided not
8 to change elections in their own backyard, but
9 they're changing everybody else's elections?

10 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
11 Mr. President. I would argue that -- and I take
12 at face value that those are accurate statistics
13 that you just shared.

14 I would argue that none of those
15 levels of turnout ought to be acceptable, whether
16 they're in the high 20s or high teens.

17 Again, on presidential cycles, it is
18 common to see turnout that is north of 60, even
19 70, even sometimes 80 percent.

20 And so again, you know, I mentioned
21 a number of the unique nuances that exist in
22 New York City that led to some of my colleagues
23 having the concern for now that this transition
24 happen in their city of over 8 million people.

25 And look, I strongly support moving

1 all of our elections in New York from an odd-year
2 cycle to an even-year cycle, and it would not
3 surprise me that this continues to be a
4 conversation for New York City elections. And my
5 hope is that one day soon that we can have a
6 constitutional amendment that speaks to moving
7 New York's elections.

8 But for now, more socialization of
9 that idea is required in our conference. And
10 again, there are specific unique nuances that
11 exist in New York City, from ranked-choice voting
12 to ballots that can include languages, up to
13 three, four, five different languages on a
14 ballot, to the City Board of Elections' again
15 failure to sufficiently administer elections at
16 times.

17 And so these are issues that we have
18 to work through, or that some of my colleagues
19 feel that we have to work through. But I
20 certainly remain committed to moving all of our
21 elections in the state from odd to even-year
22 cycles.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
24 Rhoads, your time has elapsed, if you want to
25 wrap up your questions.

1 SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you,
2 Senator Skoufis.

3 I'll just speak on the bill, if
4 that's okay.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
6 Rhoads on the bill.

7 SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you,
8 Mr. President.

9 Thank you, Senator Skoufis, for your
10 explanations.

11 You know, I find it interesting that
12 the sponsor of the bill would indicate that the
13 lawsuits challenging -- and in fact I think I
14 listed at least 15 lawsuits from across the State
15 of New York challenging the actions last year of
16 really interfering with county and town
17 elections, forcing those elections down-ballot,
18 drowning out local county, local town and now, in
19 some areas, local city elections, judicial
20 elections, and issues that are raised, and having
21 them overwhelmed and overshadowed by the drama of
22 presidential elections, gubernatorial elections,
23 and elections for State Senate and for
24 State Assembly.

25 I'm concerned, though -- and we

1 highlighted this last year in the debate, that
2 this is a chamber that is saying that we'll have
3 one set of rules for the City of New York and one
4 set of rules for everyone else. And it is
5 difficult for me to believe that is not
6 politically motivated and has nothing to do with
7 voter turnout.

8 It has to do with the fact that in
9 many local county and town elections,
10 particularly elections on Long Island, the
11 Democratic Party is finding itself losing those
12 elections. And so changing the elections so that
13 it coincides with state and federal elections
14 specifically drowns out many of those local
15 issues and takes focus away from them.

16 Now we're just seeing a further
17 extension of that. After being promised that if
18 we were going to have one set of rules, we would
19 have one set of rules for the entire state, we
20 have a constitutional amendment before us. Not a
21 bill that we could simply change with the passage
22 of both houses and the stroke of a pen by the
23 Governor. Now we have a constitutional amendment
24 that has to be passed by two successive
25 Legislatures, has to be voted on by the public.

1 The notion that we're going to be
2 able to turn around and change this on a dime
3 simply isn't going to happen. And so we will now
4 have a perpetual system where, again, there's one
5 set of rules for the City of New York and one set
6 of rules for the rest of the state. A set of
7 rules for the rest of the state --

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator
9 Gianaris.

10 SENATOR GIANARIS: Sorry to
11 interrupt, but you gave Senator Rhoads a fair
12 warning that his 30 minutes are up. He seems to
13 be continuing.

14 If you want to finish your thoughts,
15 Senator Rhoads.

16 SENATOR RHOADS: -- that a
17 substantial part of the state does not agree
18 with.

19 I believe this is a mistake. I will
20 be voting against this, obviously, and I would
21 encourage my colleagues to do the same.

22 Thank you for the courtesy,
23 Senator Gianaris.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank
25 you, Senator Rhoads.

1 Senator Martins, why do you rise?

2 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,

3 Mr. President.

4 If the sponsor would yield for a few
5 questions.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
7 sponsor yield?

8 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Happily.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
10 sponsor yields.

11 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,

12 Senator Skoufis.

13 I was wondering if you could tell us
14 which counties you represent in your
15 Senate district.

16 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
17 Mr. President, Orange County.

18 SENATOR MARTINS: Any other
19 counties besides Orange County?

20 I'm sorry, Mr. President, through
21 you, if the sponsor would continue to yield.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
23 sponsor yield?

24 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The

1 sponsor yields.

2 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Since
3 redistricting, only Orange County.

4 SENATOR MARTINS: Mr. President,
5 through you, if the sponsor would continue to
6 yield.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Does the
8 sponsor yield?

9 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
11 sponsor yields.

12 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you.

13 I was wondering if you had had a
14 conversation with county officials in
15 Orange County -- county executive, maybe the
16 legislature -- with regard to their position on
17 your proposed bill moving their elections to even
18 years.

19 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
20 Mr. President, some. Yes.

21 SENATOR MARTINS: Mr. President,
22 through you, if the sponsor would continue to
23 yield.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
25 sponsor yield?

1 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
3 sponsor yields.

4 SENATOR MARTINS: Excellent.

5 Well, I was wondering if you could
6 tell us whether or not they are supportive of
7 your efforts to move their elections from odd
8 years to even years, or whether they have opposed
9 it and told you that it's a bad idea. I'm
10 curious what they told you in the county you
11 represent.

12 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
13 Mr. President. Since we've enacted the bill,
14 unfortunately, as I suggested before, this in
15 Orange County has become a partisan issue, and
16 the Republican caucus in the legislature has
17 opposed and the Democratic caucus in the
18 legislature has supported.

19 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you.

20 Mr. President, through you, if the
21 sponsor would continue to yield.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
23 sponsor yield?

24 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The

1 sponsor yields.

2 SENATOR MARTINS: So I was
3 wondering if you could tell us which counties --
4 excuse me, which towns within the county you also
5 represent.

6 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
7 Mr. President, I represent literally dozens. If
8 you'd like me to rattle off a few, I'm happy to.

9 SENATOR MARTINS: I would love for
10 you to rattle off a few, if you would.

11 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Sure. Through
12 you, Mr. President. The towns of Highlands,
13 Cornwall, Woodbury, Monroe, New Windsor, Chester,
14 Goshen, Waywayanda, Deerpark. I can go on if
15 you'd like.

16 SENATOR MARTINS: Mr. President,
17 through you, if the sponsor would continue to
18 yield.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
20 sponsor yield?

21 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
23 sponsor yields.

24 SENATOR MARTINS: I appreciate
25 that.

1 Would you tell us which ones, of
2 those towns, you have spoken to supervisors,
3 town council members you spoke to about this idea
4 of moving their elections to even years. Because
5 I think it's curious. Which one of them you
6 spoke to, and if any of them actually told you it
7 was a good idea. Or told you it was a bad idea.

8 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
9 Mr. President. I see what my colleague is trying
10 to do here, but I'm happy to respond.

11 Most recently, three that I've
12 spoken to that are supportive: The Town of
13 Cornwall supervisor, the Town of Chester
14 supervisor, and the City of Middletown mayor, who
15 would be impacted by the constitutional amendment
16 that's before us.

17 SENATOR MARTINS: Mr. President,
18 through you, if the sponsor would continue to
19 yield.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
21 sponsor yield?

22 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
24 sponsor yields.

25 SENATOR MARTINS: Of the literally

1 dozens you told us you represented, those are the
2 only three you can give us? Anything else?
3 Anyone else you spoke to -- because they're going
4 to be directly impacted -- that you can speak to
5 us about whether they opposed it? You told us
6 three had. Are we to assume that the other
7 dozens that you represent oppose it?

8 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
9 Mr. President, I truly appreciate my colleague's
10 interest in the body politic of Orange County.

11 As I said, those were the three most
12 recent that I've spoken to. Of course there are
13 a number of elected officials in some of the
14 towns that are not supportive. That goes without
15 saying.

16 But I would suggest that far more
17 important than where the political class stands
18 on this issue -- again, survey after survey,
19 including Republicans in those surveys, mind
20 you -- support what we're proposing here today.

21 SENATOR MARTINS: Mr. President,
22 through you, if the sponsor would continue to
23 yield.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
25 sponsor yield?

1 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
3 sponsor yields.

4 SENATOR MARTINS: So are there --
5 because we're now injecting, I guess,
6 partisanship into this discussion. Or you are.
7 Are there Democrats who are supervisors or
8 council members that you represent who have told
9 you that this is a bad idea and they oppose it?

10 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
11 Mr. President, none come to mind.

12 SENATOR MARTINS: Mr. President,
13 through you, if the sponsor would continue to
14 yield.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
16 sponsor yield?

17 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
19 sponsor yields.

20 SENATOR MARTINS: I'm curious,
21 would it surprise you if there are members of
22 county legislatures across New York State,
23 including those that Senator Rhoads referenced
24 earlier, who have supported litigation
25 overturning those -- the bills that we passed,

1 now laws, from last year? Not only Republicans,
2 but Democrats voted to support litigation against
3 the bills that we spent time last year debating.

4 Would that surprise you?

5 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
6 Mr. President. Again, the vast majority, if not
7 all of the lawsuits that have been brought
8 against last year's enacted bill have been driven
9 by Republican-controlled legislatures and bodies.

10 Would it surprise me that -- if
11 there are a very small handful of Democrats that
12 may have joined in some of those votes? It would
13 not surprise me.

14 SENATOR MARTINS: Mr. President,
15 through you, if the sponsor would continue to
16 yield.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
18 sponsor yield?

19 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
21 sponsor yields.

22 SENATOR MARTINS: You see, in my
23 district -- and I represent an awful lot of
24 Republicans and Democrats -- and many blanks. I
25 think we all do, and we can say that -- I don't

1 see the kind of overwhelming support for this
2 kind of change.

3 And I'm going to venture a guess,
4 since we couldn't get many specifics from you,
5 Senator Skoufis, that in your district there
6 isn't much support either.

7 So if there is little support in my
8 district, I'm guessing in yours, and you've
9 excluded New York City altogether, which by
10 itself almost accounts for half of the state's
11 population, where is this overwhelming support
12 that you claim exists throughout the state?
13 Maybe you could tell us where it is, because --
14 or who you've spoken to across the state where
15 that support is evident.

16 I don't see it on Long Island. I
17 doubt it's in the Hudson Valley. I know it's not
18 in upstate New York, in the rural areas of
19 upstate New York. And you've excluded New York
20 City. So where is it?

21 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
22 Mr. President. I'm sorry my colleague didn't
23 feel I provided specific examples in
24 Orange County during our questioning. I thought
25 I did.

1 But to answer your question, the
2 voters -- the individuals that support this are
3 the large majority of individuals that have voter
4 fatigue. And I'm not talking about adding a few
5 additional columns on a ballot kind of voter
6 fatigue. I'm talking about voter fatigue as it
7 pertains to having to go out and vote in a state
8 primary this year, a presidential primary, a
9 library board election, a school board election,
10 a village election, a November election. And
11 year after year after year after year. Fire
12 district elections. I think on Long Island, if
13 I'm not mistaken, you have water district
14 elections.

15 The folks that support a modest but
16 meaningful move like this to begin some
17 consolidation are the voters who look at that
18 political calendar and say, What the heck is
19 this? Why am I going out nine times to go and
20 vote for all of those different offices?

21 This is a modest beginning to some
22 consolidation.

23 SENATOR MARTINS: Mr. President,
24 through you, if the sponsor would continue to
25 yield.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
2 sponsor yield?

3 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
5 sponsor yields.

6 SENATOR MARTINS: You know, I'm
7 going to go back and visit some comment you made
8 to Senator Rhoads with regard to New York City.
9 You mentioned nuances in New York City, and you
10 mentioned things like ranked-choice voting and
11 the New York City Board of Elections.

12 Honestly, I don't understand what
13 ranked-choice voting has to do with changing an
14 election to an even year as opposed to an
15 odd-year election. I was wondering if you could
16 tell us, if you're going to conduct the election
17 in the same way, why is it that somehow
18 ranked-choice voting is going to prevent an
19 election from being held on an even year as
20 opposed to an odd year?

21 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
22 Mr. President. Administratively, it does not
23 prevent a consolidation from being able to occur.

24 But as you likely know, if this were
25 to occur, you would have some races on the

1 New York City ballot that were ranked-choice
2 voting and then some races on the ballot, or
3 perhaps a separate ballot, that would not be
4 ranked-choice voting.

5 And given that New York City has
6 only gone through one cycle of ranked-choice
7 voting, it's a brand-new concept, there was some
8 concern from some colleagues that we ought to
9 allow for some additional time for voter
10 education in New York City and an awareness
11 around ranked-choice voting before interjecting a
12 complicated distinction between you vote this way
13 on some races and you vote this way on other
14 races.

15 SENATOR MARTINS: Through you,
16 Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
17 yield.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the
19 sponsor yield?

20 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
22 sponsor yields.

23 SENATOR MARTINS: You mentioned
24 some concerns about the New York City Board of
25 Elections. Are there concerns about the Board of

1 Elections' capacity to be able to actually
2 oversee an election? Are your concerns about the
3 quality of the personnel at the New York City
4 Board of Elections, and their competence? Or is
5 it something else that would prevent them from
6 being able to conduct elections?

7 Because there doesn't seem to be
8 much concern with regard to your proposed
9 constitutional amendment for any other county or
10 any other city or any other jurisdiction in
11 New York State. Why are you singling out your
12 attention for New York City and their, I guess,
13 concern about their inability to not be able to
14 conduct an election?

15 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
16 Mr. President. Many of the possible concerns
17 that you outlined are, yes, concerns that are
18 shared by some of my colleagues.

19 SENATOR MARTINS: Through you,
20 Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
21 yield.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
23 continue to yield?

24 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The

1 sponsor yields.

2 SENATOR MARTINS: I was asking,
3 what concerns do you have? I didn't mention any.

4 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
5 Mr. President. While as you know I don't
6 represent New York City and can't speak to
7 firsthand experience in interacting with, as
8 either an elected official or as a candidate, the
9 New York City Board of Elections, I think it's
10 quite well known that the New York City Board of
11 Elections has had, to put it kindly, challenges
12 over the years.

13 SENATOR MARTINS: Mr. President,
14 through you, if the sponsor would continue to
15 yield.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
17 continue to yield?

18 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
20 Senator yields.

21 SENATOR MARTINS: Perhaps I'm not
22 aware of those challenges that you're
23 referencing, but you brought up New York City's
24 Board of Elections as a concern in being able to
25 move their elections to even years. Almost as an

1 excuse, frankly.

2 Because if there is going to be a
3 move to greater participation -- and we had this
4 discussion as part of our debate last year. If
5 there's going to be a move to greater
6 participation, the place in this state where
7 there is by far -- and it's not close, by far the
8 lowest percentage of participation in elections,
9 including in even-year elections, it's in
10 New York City. And to exclude that from this
11 discussion or this effort kind of begs the
12 question as to what the real motive is behind it.

13 So I'll ask you if you have any
14 concerns about the fact that you're moving
15 forward with a constitutional amendment and
16 excluding the very place in New York State that
17 should be the focal point of all of our efforts
18 if we're going to increase voter participation.

19 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
20 Mr. President. I would have had greater concern
21 with not doing anything than with exempting
22 New York City. Because not doing anything,
23 absent this constitutional amendment, we would
24 have a number of offices sort of straggling,
25 remaining on an odd-year cycle that

1 constitutionally we could not move last year.

2 And so I did not want to wait for a
3 future Legislature where hopefully consensus will
4 one day build to include New York City, and in
5 the meantime put a pause on moving the remainder
6 of the offices outside of the cities that we
7 moved last year.

8 Because absent moving those
9 additional -- those remaining offices, one, we
10 would see extremely low turnout. If you have a
11 DA's race and a county clerk's race and a couple
12 of judgeships remaining, exclusively, on an
13 odd-year ballot, I suspect you'd probably have
14 single-digit turnout with such few remaining
15 stragglings offices.

16 And two, as I think you and I
17 discussed last year, we would not be able to
18 materialize the cost savings on behalf of
19 taxpayers if we were not consolidating the
20 remainder of those offices we could not move last
21 year.

22 And I in particular recall during
23 our debate you were -- you were quite adamant on
24 that point in highlighting that absent this
25 constitutional amendment that's before us, we

1 would not materialize those savings. And so I
2 would actually hope that you support this
3 constitutional amendment to materialize those
4 savings that you were looking for just last year
5 during our previous debate.

6 SENATOR MARTINS: Madam President,
7 if the sponsor could would continue to yield.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
9 continue to yield?

10 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
12 sponsor yields.

13 SENATOR MARTINS: You know, I think
14 you've misconstrued my point. I haven't for a
15 second, once, believed that there would be any
16 savings with regard to your efforts and the
17 efforts of the majority in this house to move
18 this forward at all.

19 And that's been my concern. Because
20 I think we can all agree -- and I'll ask you if
21 you do -- that if this constitutional amendment
22 doesn't pass, and I don't believe it's going to
23 pass, that we're still going to have odd-year
24 elections in counties and in towns across or in
25 counties across New York State absent this

1 constitutional amendment. Wouldn't you agree?

2 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
3 Madam President. Absent this constitutional
4 amendment, there would remain odd-year elections,
5 these of straggler offices that we are talking
6 about. And thus, yes, we would not be able to
7 materialize the savings that I am referencing.

8 Which is why I would hope that
9 individuals like yourself, even if you objected
10 to last year's bill, would support this
11 constitutional amendment so that we don't have a
12 few small handful of offices remaining on an
13 odd-year cycle that prevent us from materializing
14 these savings we're talking about.

15 And as a final point, again,
16 I want to highlight that the public opinion
17 surveys that exist on this issue demonstrate
18 overwhelming support for this effort, including
19 among rank-and-file Republican voters.

20 SENATOR MARTINS: Madam President,
21 through you, if the sponsor would continue to
22 yield.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
24 continue to yield?

25 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
2 Senator yields.

3 SENATOR MARTINS: You see, that's
4 where we differ, Senator Skoufis. That's where
5 we differ. I will prioritize a fair election
6 where people have a choice and get to prioritize
7 the issues that are before them, and not
8 prioritize saving money.

9 And I think we told you last year,
10 but you didn't listen -- we told you last year
11 that you should try and pass this constitutional
12 amendment first so when the state rejects it --
13 the residents of this state will reject your
14 constitutional amendment -- then we won't have to
15 go through the trauma of actually moving the
16 elections to even-year elections and there would
17 not be any savings because this is all going to
18 be futile.

19 Now, I expect, Madam President, that
20 if this constitutional amendment doesn't pass, I
21 expect and I hope that there's a realization
22 by -- on the bill -- that there's a realization
23 that -- by the majority in this chamber --

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
25 Martins, are you on the bill now?

1 SENATOR MARTINS: On the bill.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
3 Martins on the bill.

4 SENATOR MARTINS: I expect and I
5 hope that there's a realization that this was all
6 a futile effort, that this has been a tremendous
7 waste of time, that the residents of the state do
8 not want even-year elections for their local
9 elections, and that there will be a bill placed
10 on the floor of this Senate changing all of this
11 so that people can go back to some level of
12 normalcy that will actually involve local
13 elections on odd years where they can focus on
14 local issues, and not have these ballots go on
15 ad infinitum.

16 You know, last year we talked about
17 the fact that these ballots can be up to
18 22 inches long. Up to 22 inches long. Yet a
19 little while ago, as we were discussing this, we
20 went through President, U.S. Senate, Congress,
21 Senate, Assembly, all of the judges, county
22 executive, legislators, town supervisor, council
23 members. Some villages that have elections in
24 November. And districts. And on and on and on.

25 And if anyone thinks that that is

1 the proper way to conduct an election, if anyone
2 in this house thinks that that makes sense and
3 actually provides a voter with the opportunity to
4 actively and properly and intelligently
5 participate in this process, think again.

6 Now, this may be okay for places --
7 urban areas of our state where you don't have
8 those layers of government. But you know what?
9 We have a diverse state. And where I come
10 from -- and where Senator Skoufis comes from --
11 we have towns, we have villages, we have
12 districts, we have county executives, we have
13 legislators, we have council members. We do.
14 That ballot's going to get awfully long.

15 So I know why I'm opposing this. I
16 have every, every indication from the people that
17 I represent, and from understanding local
18 government myself, why this is the wrong thing to
19 do.

20 So I have to ask, why would anyone
21 in this chamber want to do this? If you
22 represent areas in this state where this is going
23 to be more difficult for people to understand
24 those issues, why would you support it?

25 And if you haven't spoken to your

1 town supervisors, if you haven't spoken to your
2 county executives, if you haven't spoken to your
3 council members, if you haven't spoken to the
4 very people who are going to be impacted by this
5 in your communities -- and I don't know if you
6 have. But if you haven't, and you've got to go
7 back out there at some point and talk to them,
8 good luck explaining to them what you just did to
9 them, what you did to their communities and how
10 you've hurt them.

11 Madam President, this is a bad idea.
12 Changing the New York State Constitution this way
13 is a bad idea. It's bad government. Now, some
14 people may say it's good politics. I think it's
15 bad politics. It's not good for the people we
16 represent. It undermines their confidence in
17 government when you actually, blatantly and
18 obviously change the rules to benefit one party
19 over another.

20 And that's exactly what's happening
21 here today. Make no mistake. Make no mistake.
22 And we know it. We all do. We can sit here and
23 talk about this as a good government measure, but
24 everyone in this room, you know what's going on
25 here. You know it's wrong. You know you should

1 be voting against it. But you know what? That's
2 why we have elections. See you in November.

3 I vote no.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
5 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, why do you rise?

6 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK: On
7 the bill, Madam President.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
9 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick on the bill.

10 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK:
11 Thank you.

12 Due to the late hour, and since we
13 have gone through this very lengthy and robust
14 debate, I want to just point out a few things
15 that I would like to mention on this bill.

16 I do agree with a lot of what has
17 been said by Senator Martins and Senator Rhoads
18 about the fact that this is not a good bill for
19 jurisdictions like Nassau County, where we have
20 county elections with county leg, county
21 executives, town officials. Our ballot is going
22 to have upwards of 30 candidates.

23 And we did mention voter fatigue
24 here. And if there's anything that's going to
25 fatigue a voter, it's going to be filling in

1 36 boxes, and whosoever at the end is probably
2 going to be left off. Which is a shame, because
3 that's not what we're supposed to be doing.

4 And I know that we've mentioned it
5 multiple times that New York City is where we
6 have the lowest voter turnout, and we should be
7 doing something to correct that. And you know
8 one of the things I'm sure we all do is we look
9 at the votes that we have when we are elected to
10 office. And I have to tell you that in
11 Nassau County, where I -- in the Ninth Senate
12 District, where I was elected, approximately
13 110,000 votes were cast for my Senate seat. And
14 I'm in a district that's overwhelmingly
15 registered Democrat.

16 But in some of the city seats where
17 a Democrat was elected we had 30,000 votes cast
18 to elect a Senator. And that's a tremendous
19 difference, because every district is exactly the
20 same, in theory, by population: 330,000,
21 350,000. So in a district where we're electing a
22 Democrat and there's only 30,000 voters, that to
23 me is really troubling that we're not getting
24 voter turnout.

25 So the fact that New York City is

1 excluded from this bill is very troubling and
2 very telling.

3 I want to also point out that of the
4 ballot measures that we have had, 2021 had five
5 proposals on the ballot. Three of them were
6 election-driven. One was redistricting, and two
7 were elections -- election-based. All three of
8 those were defeated. Fifty-four percent of the
9 vote, 56 percent of the vote, 55 percent of the
10 vote. Pretty substantial. Not too close. Not
11 49 to 51.

12 The environmental one was approved
13 by 70 percent. And then there was another one
14 about increasing the jurisdiction of the
15 Civil Court. That passed by 64 percent.

16 So it's very interesting to me that
17 this is going to go on the ballot. And I know
18 Jack -- Senator Jack Martins just mentioned that
19 this is a -- there's a good chance that this
20 isn't even going to pass. And then we are going
21 to be stuck with elections every year, some in
22 the odd, some in the even, because we're going to
23 potentially have this constitutional amendment
24 fail and now we're really going to be losing out
25 on the potential economies that we were going to

1 hopefully experience by putting all of the
2 elections into one year.

3 I think it's extremely telling what
4 Senator Rhoads pointed out, about all the
5 jurisdictions that have challenged the bill that
6 we passed last year. That is very telling
7 because there are jurisdictions willing to spend
8 money and time to challenge what they think is
9 wrong. And that I believe is another factor that
10 we as a body should consider when we are putting
11 forth legislation.

12 I personally do think that this is a
13 partisan issue. I think this is designed to
14 disrupt the elections that we have and have had
15 for a long period of time. And I don't know that
16 anyone has asked for this to happen. I know
17 we've asked the question of the sponsor; I don't
18 know that we had a clear answer about has someone
19 really come to us and said, We want this bill, we
20 want this changed.

21 So I have some serious concerns.
22 And again, we've had a very thorough discussion.

23 And I will be voting no,
24 Mr. President, on this bill. Thank you.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank

1 you, Senator Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick.

2 Are there any other Senators wishing
3 to be heard?

4 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
5 now closed.

6 Senator Gianaris.

7 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
8 we've once again agreed to restore this bill to
9 the noncontroversial calendar.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
11 is restored to the noncontroversial calendar.

12 Call the roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
15 the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
17 Calendar 1905, those Senators voting in the
18 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
19 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Comrie, Gallivan, Griffo,
20 Helming, Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Murray,
21 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,
22 Rolison, Stec, Scarcella-Spanton, Tedisco, Weber
23 and Weik.

24 Ayes, 39. Nays, 22.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill

1 is passed.

2 Senator Gianaris.

3 SENATOR GIANARIS: On behalf of
4 Senator Webb, I wish to call up Senate Print
5 7846, which is now at the desk.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
7 Secretary will read.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 995, Senate Print 7846, by Senator Webb, an act
10 to amend the Public Health Law.

11 SENATOR GIANARIS: Move to
12 reconsider the vote by which the bill was passed,
13 and ask that the bill be restored to the order of
14 third reading.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
16 Secretary will call the roll on reconsideration.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill
20 is restored to its place on the Third Reading
21 Calendar.

22 SENATOR GIANARIS: I now move to
23 discharge, from the Committee on Health,
24 Assembly Print Number 7860 and substitute it for
25 this identical bill.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: So
2 ordered.

3 SENATOR GIANARIS: And I move that
4 the substituted Assembly bill have its third
5 reading at this time.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The
7 Secretary will read.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 995, Assembly Bill Number 7860, by
10 Assemblymember Sillitti, an act to amend the
11 Public Health Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
15 act shall take effect immediately.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
22 Calendar 995, voting in the negative:
23 Senator Stec.

24 Ayes, 60. Nays, 1.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill

1 is passed.

2 SENATOR GIANARIS: Is there any
3 further business at the desk?

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: There is
5 no further business at the desk.

6 SENATOR GIANARIS: I remind my
7 Majority colleagues we'll be having a conference
8 at 9:30 tomorrow morning.

9 With that, I move to adjourn until
10 tomorrow, Friday, June 7th, at 11:00 a.m.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: On
12 motion, the Senate will stand adjourned until
13 11:00 a.m.

14 (Whereupon, the Senate adjourned at
15 1:54 a.m.)

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25