

1 NEW YORK STATE SENATE

2
3
4 THE STENOGRAPHIC RECORD

5
6
7
8
9 ALBANY, NEW YORK

10 April 17, 2024

11 11:14 a.m.

12
13
14 REGULAR SESSION

15
16
17
18 SENATOR SHELLEY B. MAYER, Acting President

19 ALEJANDRA N. PAULINO, ESQ., Secretary

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The Senate
3 will come to order.

4 I ask everyone to please rise and
5 recite the Pledge of Allegiance.

6 (Whereupon, the assemblage recited
7 the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: In the
9 absence of clergy, let us bow our heads in a
10 moment of silent reflection or prayer.

11 (Whereupon, the assemblage respected
12 a moment of silence.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
14 reading of the Journal.

15 THE SECRETARY: In Senate, Tuesday,
16 April 16, 2024, the Senate met pursuant to
17 adjournment. The Journal of Monday, April 15,
18 2024, was read and approved. On motion, the
19 Senate adjourned.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Without
21 objection, the Journal stands approved as read.

22 Presentation of petitions.

23 Messages from the Assembly.

24 The Secretary will read.

25 THE SECRETARY: Senator Hinchey

1 moves to discharge, from the Committee on
2 Investigations and Government Operations,
3 Assembly Bill Number 8622 and substitute it for
4 the identical Senate Bill 8334, Third Reading
5 Calendar 710.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: So
7 ordered.

8 Messages from the Governor.

9 Reports of standing committees.

10 Reports of select committees.

11 Communications and reports from
12 state officers.

13 Motions and resolutions.

14 Senator Gianaris.

15 SENATOR GIANARIS: Good morning,
16 Madam President.

17 We're going to begin with previously
18 adopted Resolution 2210, by Senator Webb. Please
19 read its title and recognize Senator Webb.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
21 Secretary will read.

22 THE SECRETARY: Senate Resolution
23 2210, by Senator Webb, mourning the death of
24 Billie D. Anderson, a dedicated mother, fierce
25 advocate for justice and civil rights, and

1 distinguished member of her community.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
3 Webb on the resolution.

4 SENATOR WEBB: Thank you,
5 Madam President.

6 I rise to lift up the passing of an
7 important leader, not just in my community in the
8 Senate district but also in our state, and that
9 is Billie D. Anderson.

10 I want to thank my colleagues and
11 also you, Madam President, and of course
12 Senate leadership for supporting this resolution
13 mourning the death of Ms. Anderson. She was a
14 dedicated mother, a very fierce and unapologetic
15 advocate for justice and civil rights. She was a
16 distinguished member of my community. She was a
17 member in the city of Binghamton and passed away
18 last year at the ripe young age of 91.

19 For 30 years, she worked with one of
20 our local organizations called Opportunities for
21 Broome that helps individuals, families, in
22 getting access to quality affordable housing.
23 She also, through that organization, worked with
24 their Head Start program to improve early
25 education opportunities and quality of life for

1 countless families in my community.

2 She was a trailblazer, a leader in
3 the civil rights movement. She organized bus
4 trips to Washington, D.C., to right here to the
5 Capitol here in Albany, to fight for equality.
6 She spoke out against racism and inequality in
7 employment, the criminal justice system,
8 education, housing, and so many other important
9 issues.

10 Over the course of her very
11 distinguished life she lifted up those who are
12 often rendered voiceless, those who are oppressed
13 and strive for a better world.

14 Ms. Anderson was a community leader
15 and her work was instrumental in vitalizing the
16 Broome Tioga NAACP. She was a woman of
17 indomitable faith, an active member of
18 Trinity AME Zion Church in Binghamton.

19 However, her greatest passion --
20 when she wasn't fighting the good fight -- was
21 being a mother to her six children, whom she
22 raised to always stand up for what they believed
23 in.

24 I am very proud to be voting in
25 favor of this resolution, and I hope my

1 colleagues will join me by voting aye.

2 Additionally, Madam President, I
3 rise on the occasion of this resolution to
4 welcome distinguished guests to the chamber. I
5 am honored that the family of Billie D. Anderson
6 is here in the gallery with us today. Some of
7 her family members include, but we have a few
8 that are here: Dr. Roxanne Graham, who's her
9 daughter, E. James Anderson, Carl Anderson,
10 Kison Anderson, Warren Carter.

11 And with that, Madam President, I
12 ask that you welcome the family of Billie D.
13 Anderson to our chamber.

14 (Applause.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
16 Senator Webb.

17 To the Anderson family, we welcome
18 you on behalf of the Senate. We extend to you
19 the privileges and courtesies of the house.

20 Please rise and be recognized.

21 (Standing ovation.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
23 Gianaris.

24 SENATOR GIANARIS: Next up is
25 previously adopted Resolution 2202, by

1 Senator Helming. Please read that resolution's
2 title and recognize Senator Helming.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
4 Secretary will read.

5 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 2202, by
6 Senator Helming, congratulating the Hobart Men's
7 Ice Hockey Team upon the occasion of capturing
8 their second consecutive NCAA Division III
9 Men's Ice Hockey Championship on March 23, 2024.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
11 Helming on the resolution.

12 SENATOR HELMING: Thank you,
13 Madam President.

14 It's my honor to welcome to the
15 chamber the Hobart Statesmen Men's Ice Hockey
16 Team, NCAA Division III National Champions for
17 the second year in a row. It was almost one year
18 ago to the day that we honored this team on their
19 2023 national championship. During my comments I
20 sort of issued a subtle challenge, saying "I
21 can't wait to see what the next season brings."
22 And here we are.

23 Three weeks ago the top-ranked
24 Statesmen defeated Trinity 2 to nothing. Goalie
25 Damon Beaver was on fire, stopping all 25 shots.

1 Juniors Luka Aquaro and Matthew Iasenza scored
2 for Hobart, with junior Jonah Alexander adding an
3 assist. And Senior Austin Mourar was named the
4 tournament's Most Outstanding Player.

5 Congratulations to Coach Mark
6 Taylor, who continues to add to his reputation as
7 the most successful hockey coach in Hobart's
8 history. Coach Taylor has guided the Statesmen
9 to a 28-2-1 overall record. He has been named
10 the American Hockey Coaches Association
11 Division III Men's Coach of the Year for the
12 second time. He's been named the 2024
13 New England Hockey Conference's Coach of the Year
14 and is the 2024 Edward Jeremiah Award winner.

15 But having the opportunity to speak
16 with Coach Taylor, and knowing him, I imagine the
17 real honor for him is building and mentoring a
18 roster of young men who show great character and
19 are ethical, hardworking team players.

20 Coach Taylor and the team describe
21 their strength and their special chemistry as
22 Mudita, an extreme joy and pleasure that comes
23 from embracing and delighting in other people's
24 well-being and success.

25 I got to personally witness this

1 Mudita this morning when this wonderful team, led
2 by their coach, went over to the LOB to engage,
3 to recognize and to honor all of the Honor Flight
4 veterans who are here in the Capitol today. I
5 had chills. It was a wonderful experience for
6 all of those veterans. Thank you very much.

7 To Coach Taylor and the team,
8 I want you to know that you have made all of us
9 here in the state very, very proud because of
10 your accomplishments on the ice and off the ice.

11 But you know this. I get to feel it
12 every day back at home. The city of Geneva is
13 still buzzing with excitement because of
14 everything that you continue to do -- again, on
15 and off the ice.

16 And I'll wrap up with this. And
17 again, no pressure. But will I see you next
18 year?

19 (Laughter.)

20 SENATOR HELMING: Three-peat,
21 right?

22 (Laughter.)

23 SENATOR HELMING: Congratulations.

24 Madam President, I am honored to be
25 able to sponsor this resolution and to vote in

1 the affirmative. Thank you.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
3 Senator Helming.

4 Senator Cooney on the resolution.

5 SENATOR COONEY: Thank you,
6 Madam President.

7 And thank you, Senator Helming, for
8 bringing forth this resolution. I stand here
9 today as a very proud Hobart alum. And this is
10 just an overwhelming experience for me to be able
11 to stand here on the floor and look up and see
12 the best and brightest from Geneva, New York,
13 here with us today.

14 Of course let me add my
15 congratulations to the back-to-back NCAA
16 Division III National Hockey Champions. This is
17 just such huge news, not only for Hobart College
18 but for New York State. We should feel proud
19 that we are bringing this cup back to New York
20 year after year.

21 Of course, you know, I take special
22 pleasure in seeing the final game and making sure
23 that we beat Trinity College -- no offense to any
24 Trinity College alums who may be in the chamber.
25 But they worked hard all season long. And we saw

1 that culminate, culminate, after each -- each
2 game.

3 Thank you for your hard work, for
4 your commitment. It is very shared. And I'm
5 very confident that we can say that Hobart is the
6 team to beat going forward.

7 So Coach of the Year Mark Taylor,
8 thank you for your leadership. To all the
9 players and the staff and of course all the fans
10 home across the Finger Lakes region, I want to
11 say thank you and congratulations. We do look
12 forward -- I agree, Senator Helming -- to
13 welcoming you back next year as our
14 three-year-in-a-row champions.

15 And of course let me say this as a
16 proud Hobart alum: Hip Hobart! And Go,
17 Statesmen!

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
19 Senator Cooney.

20 To our guests, the national
21 ice hockey champions from the Hobart Men's
22 Ice Hockey Team, we welcome you to the Senate.
23 We extend to you the privileges and courtesies of
24 the house. Please rise and be recognized.

25 (Standing ovation.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
2 resolution was previously adopted -- both
3 resolutions were previously adopted on April 9th.
4 Senator Gianaris.

5 SENATOR GIANARIS: Please take up
6 previously adopted Resolution 1923, by
7 Senator Cleare, read its title, and recognize
8 Senator Cleare.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
10 Secretary will read.

11 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1923, by
12 Senator Cleare, memorializing Governor
13 Kathy Hochul to proclaim April 2024 as
14 Jazz Appreciation Month in the State of New York.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
16 Cleare on the resolution.

17 SENATOR CLEARE: Thank you.

18 As the Senator representing Harlem
19 and East Harlem, El Barrio, it is with a great
20 sense of pride that I rise to celebrate Jazz
21 Appreciation Month. Jazz is the quintessential
22 American-born improvisational art form that
23 speaks a universal language that gave singular,
24 resonant, clear and compelling voice to the lives
25 of Black people during the rise of the Harlem

1 Renaissance.

2 Jazz in many ways evolved from work
3 songs, Black spirituals, blues, brass band music
4 and ragtime, to create something new that was
5 greater than the sum of its parts.

6 I am proud to represent the 30th
7 Senatorial District where the absolute jazz
8 legends of the Harlem Renaissance lived or worked
9 and/or played, including Louis Armstrong,
10 Duke Ellington, Earl "Fatha" Hines, Cab Calloway,
11 Thelonius Monk, Dizzy Gillespie, Count Basie,
12 "Jelly Roll" Morton, Charlie Parker, Fats Waller,
13 Ella Fitzgerald, Bessie Smith, Ethel Waters,
14 Bill "Bojangles" Robinson, Lena Horne,
15 Billie Holiday, Josephine Baker, and so many
16 more.

17 These individuals created a
18 collective body of work that has inspired
19 billions of people, given hope, creativity and
20 inspiration to multiple generations, and left a
21 legacy beyond compare.

22 When I think about jazz in Harlem, I
23 picture all the classic spaces -- the Alhambra
24 Ballroom, The Cotton Club, Count Basie's Lounge,
25 The Lenox Lounge, The Renaissance Ballroom,

1 The Savoy, and Monette's Supper Club. Today the
2 fine tradition of jazz in the 30th is carried on
3 by formidable places like Bill's Place, Minton's
4 Playhouse, Jazz Mobile, Paris Blues, the
5 Apollo Theater, among so many others.

6 As a State Senator, I've been so
7 proud to help orchestrate annual events such as
8 our John Coltrane Jazz Festival. Due to a number
9 of factors, we were not able to bring a big band
10 that we planned to to Albany this year, but
11 fortunately Jazz Appreciation Month is an annual
12 tradition and one we will build on year after
13 year.

14 And in the words of the great
15 American trumpeter and composer Wynton Marsalis:
16 "Jazz music is America's past and its potential,
17 summed up and sanctified and accessible to anyone
18 who learns to listen to, feel, and understand it.
19 The music can connect us to our earlier selves
20 and to our better selves-to-come. It can remind
21 us where we fit on the timeline of human
22 achievement, an ultimate value of art."

23 Thank you, Madam President. Happy
24 Jazz Appreciation Month to one and all.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,

1 Senator Cleare.

2 Senator Serrano on the resolution.

3 SENATOR SERRANO: Thank you very
4 much, Madam President.

5 And I would like to take the
6 opportunity to thank my colleague Senator Cordell
7 Cleare for bringing forth this resolution
8 celebrating Jazz Appreciation Month.

9 I have the good fortune of being the
10 chair of the Committee on Arts and Culture, and
11 working with Senator Cleare on issues involving
12 arts and culture is truly a highlight of the work
13 that we do. Her district and my district border
14 one another. East Harlem and Harlem are some of
15 the -- a bit of the epicenter of our cultural
16 world as we know it in New York City.

17 And the arts and culture really are
18 what make New York New York, when you think about
19 the mecca for culture it has become and what that
20 has meant to the communities in which they are
21 represented.

22 And jazz in particular, such an
23 important art form that is as much entertainment
24 as it is education. And I think it is
25 intrinsically important that all generations

1 learn about the history of jazz and understand
2 the players and the instruments and the history
3 of jazz, because it is truly the history of
4 New York.

5 So again, immense gratitude to
6 Senator Cleare for this wonderful resolution, and
7 many thanks to all who support it.

8 Thank you.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
10 Senator Serrano.

11 Senator Ramos on the resolution.

12 SENATOR RAMOS: Thank you,
13 Madam President.

14 You know, we can't celebrate jazz
15 without talking about the Queens Jazz Trail. And
16 in my district we have a very rich history,
17 because in their heyday in Jackson Heights we had
18 Glenn Miller, Benny Goodman, Woody Herman living
19 there. And there was Dizzy Gillespie on
20 106th Street in Corona. Charlie Shavers lived on
21 101st Street in Corona. Junior Mance and
22 Jimmy Heath both lived in East Elmhurst.

23 And of course Satchmo himself,
24 Louis Armstrong, lived on 107th Street, where
25 today we have a beautiful museum and a brand-new

1 education center to welcome students and aspiring
2 musicians, including my favorite trumpet player,
3 my youngest son, Tomás.

4 So today this is -- being able to
5 celebrate jazz as one of the most quintessential
6 American sounds is really important, I think,
7 especially for people of color. Because whether
8 you're Black or Latino, and knowing that Machito
9 in El Barrio was planting the seeds towards what
10 would become a salsa movement, the Latino
11 response to the Beatles, was really about
12 building our character and our identity and our
13 history in New York City as a whole.

14 And I don't want to just talk about
15 jazz in the past, because jazz is very much a
16 part of the present. I of course want to
17 reiterate my invitation for folks to visit the
18 Louis Armstrong Museum on 107th Street in Corona.
19 But there's also Terraza 7 on Gleane Street in
20 Elmhurst in my district.

21 And shout-outs to the staff at the
22 Zinc Bar, Smalls, Mezzrow, Smoke and all of the
23 amazing jazz clubs that make New York City what
24 it is.

25 Thank you.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
2 Senator Ramos.

3 Senator Sanders on the resolution.

4 SENATOR SANDERS: Thank you,
5 Madam President.

6 I want to commend our Senator Cleare
7 for understanding that jazz has to be recognized.
8 It is a force of nature. It's beyond a music; it
9 has become part of the lifestyle, a world unto
10 itself.

11 You've heard many of the previous
12 speakers speak of jazz and its influence. Of
13 course, Senator Ramos was kind enough to say some
14 of where jazz ended up in Queens. I am still
15 researching my own particular area. It seems
16 that many of these folk made it to
17 Senator Comrie's area. I'm sure they were about
18 to come to mine over time, but --

19 (Laughter.)

20 SENATOR SANDERS: -- they enjoyed
21 his district so much that they didn't make it to
22 mine, to my knowledge. But we're still doing the
23 research.

24 But jazz is more than that. Jazz
25 is -- can be considered American classical music.

1 It's one of the only musics that have been made
2 in America. Every other music can trace its
3 roots to some other place in the world, but this
4 music was made in America and by Americans.

5 But jazz is more than that. Jazz is
6 part of a lifestyle. It's a culture. It's --
7 when you think of what's cool, you think of --
8 you start with jazz musicians for whatever
9 reason. When you try to be cool, the word "cool"
10 itself probably came out of the jazz, the bebop
11 era. It's part of a language. It's part of
12 everything. It's ingrained in the things that we
13 do.

14 And on my best days, when I'm
15 really -- especially when I'm sitting next to
16 Senator Liu, when I'm at my coolest moment is
17 because of the jazz that the Senator projects
18 into me. So I appreciate that.

19 (Laughter.)

20 SENATOR SANDERS: So I close with
21 the words of that immortal philosopher
22 Miles Davis, who told us that if you understand
23 everything that I'm saying, then you'd be me.

24 (Laughter.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,

1 Senator Sanders.

2 Senator Comrie on the resolution.

3 SENATOR COMRIE: Thank you,
4 Madam President.

5 I want to compliment Senator Cleare
6 for bringing this resolution forward.

7 I wasn't going to speak, but since I
8 got mentioned. And my wonderful community,
9 Addisleigh Park, where back in 1923 Clarence
10 Williams was a producer and a pianist, purchased
11 a home in Addisleigh Park. And he convinced a
12 lot of the jazz figures to come. Big names like
13 Billie Holiday, Dizzy Gillespie, Ella Fitzgerald
14 and Count Basie all ended up living in
15 Addisleigh Park, as well as sports heroes as
16 well. Addisleigh Park today now is a historic
17 community as a result of all of the figures that
18 moved there.

19 So I want to thank Senator Cleare
20 for continuing this resolution, for reminding
21 people that jazz music is American-made music, an
22 American-made product. It had its heyday in the
23 jazz clubs in Harlem. And I hope that we can
24 continue to celebrate jazz and continue to have
25 venues in Harlem.

1 We don't have venues in Queens that
2 are at that level yet, but we're going to work on
3 that by the reconstruction of downtown Jamaica so
4 we can encourage people to come and listen to
5 music in our communities. We have Greater
6 Jamaica Development Corporation and
7 Jamaica Center for Arts and Culture, and I look
8 forward to jazz events happening there, as well
9 as continuing to make it to Harlem to attend the
10 events there.

11 As soon as Senator Cleare invites
12 us, we'll all be there to celebrate an event.

13 Thank you, Madam President.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
15 Senator Comrie.

16 The resolution was previously
17 adopted on March 12th.

18 Senator Gianaris.

19 SENATOR GIANARIS: Now on to
20 previously adopted Resolution 2254, by
21 Senator Salazar. Read its title and recognize
22 Senator Salazar, please.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
24 Secretary shall read.

25 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 2254, by

1 Senator Salazar, memorializing Governor Kathy
2 Hochul to proclaim April 21-27, 2024, as
3 Crime Victims' Rights Week in the State of
4 New York.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
6 Salazar on the resolution.

7 SENATOR SALAZAR: Thank you,
8 Madam President.

9 I rise to introduce this resolution
10 to proclaim next week, starting on April 21st, as
11 Crime Victims' Rights Week in the State of
12 New York. This moment also marks the observance
13 of National Crime Victims' Rights Week as well.

14 Crime victims and survivors do not
15 fit a stereotype or a single demographic.
16 Victims and survivors look like each and any one
17 of us in this chamber today, and are New Yorkers
18 from all walks of life.

19 Recognizing this week is an
20 opportunity to emphasize a comprehensive approach
21 to achieving justice and healing in our
22 communities, and in turn preventing further harm
23 in the first place.

24 Every single person who is
25 victimized by crime in this country deserves to

1 be treated with dignity and compassion. As
2 advocates for victims, particularly of violent
3 crime and gender-based violence, will rightly
4 remind us, there is no such thing as a perfect
5 victim.

6 I myself have also personally
7 survived violence in my life. Every year an
8 estimated 22 million Americans are directly
9 impacted by crime, and each incident further
10 affects family members, friends, neighbors, and
11 our communities. These experiences often leave
12 lasting physical, psychological, financial
13 impacts on New Yorkers of all ages, of all
14 abilities, of all economic racial and social
15 backgrounds.

16 In 1984 the federal Victims of Crime
17 Act established the Crime Victims Fund to seek to
18 provide a permanent source of support for
19 crime victim services and compensation. Today
20 thousands of victim assistance programs provide
21 help and support to child victims of violence and
22 sexual abuse, to stalking victims, survivors of
23 homicide, victims of drunk driving crashes,
24 victims of domestic violence, sexual violence,
25 other forms of harm.

1 Those who do the critical work of
2 victim assistance constantly face new challenges
3 in our efforts to serve all victims and
4 survivors, including people affected by newer
5 crimes such as cyber crimes.

6 Many survivors also have valid
7 reasons for not always trusting the criminal
8 legal system as a mechanism for justice, due
9 sometimes to a victim's marginalized identity.
10 This includes a victim's immigration status,
11 individuals who may be involved in the
12 sex industry, individuals who are LGBTQ or
13 gender-nonconforming, and New Yorkers who may
14 have been victims of violence by law enforcement
15 or public officers who have abused their trust.

16 Perhaps most difficult, yet very
17 important for our society to consider, is how
18 often those who have committed crimes were
19 previously victims of crime themselves. Indeed,
20 harm frequently begets further harm. If we are
21 serious about supporting crime victims and
22 protecting our communities, we must break these
23 cycles of violence and harm.

24 New frameworks and initiatives are
25 being developed to ensure the availability of

1 culturally relevant, trauma-informed and
2 restorative services and treatment to support
3 victims and survivors.

4 We need to continue to assist
5 communities in maintaining safety for all of us.
6 I'm grateful that my colleagues on the Senate's
7 Crime Victims, Crime and Corrections Committee
8 and colleagues in this chamber are committed to
9 this -- these innovative ways of ensuring that
10 all crime victims and survivors can be supported
11 and empowered to live freely and without fear.

12 Thank you, Madam President.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you
14 very much, Senator Salazar.

15 Senator Jackson on the resolution.

16 SENATOR JACKSON: Thank you,
17 Madam President.

18 My colleagues, I rise in support of
19 Senate Resolution J2254 -- and I compliment
20 Senator Salazar for bringing this forward --
21 which addresses the critical issue of
22 Crime Victims Week.

23 This resolution transcends mere
24 acknowledgment. It embodies a holistic
25 perspective encompassing the diverse needs of all

1 who have endured injustice.

2 I remember when my younger
3 brother -- we were called, and my mother and I
4 had to go to the hospital because he was the
5 victim of a crime, he got stabbed, and he got
6 stabbed to death. And I remember that so clear
7 even though that was, you know, like 45 years
8 ago. You never, never lose faith of that when
9 you experience anything like that.

10 So it's about recognizing that the
11 traditional narratives surrounding crime victims
12 often overlook marginalized communities,
13 including immigrants, BIPOC youth, sex workers,
14 LGBTQ+ individuals. These are individuals who
15 for valid reasons may have harbored distrust
16 towards the very systems meant to protect them.
17 And yes, this even includes those who have
18 experienced misconduct at the hands of
19 law enforcement.

20 Today we have the opportunity to
21 redefine the narrative. We can choose to stand
22 on the side of inclusivity, empathy and
23 understanding. And this resolution calls for
24 culturally relevant assistance, trauma-informed
25 care, and restorative justice options. It

1 acknowledges that healing cannot occur in a
2 vacuum; it requires a comprehensive approach that
3 takes into account the unique experiences and
4 needs of each individual.

5 Colleagues, this is not just about
6 words on a paper or passing legislation. It's
7 about sending a powerful message, one of
8 solidarity, compassion and hope. It's about
9 reaffirming our commitment to justice for all,
10 regardless of race, gender, sexual orientation or
11 socioeconomic status.

12 And as we move forward, let us
13 remember the voices that often go unheard, the
14 pain that is often overlooked, and the healing
15 that is long overdue. Let us be champions of
16 change, the advocates for those who have been
17 silenced, and the architects of a brighter, more
18 equitable future.

19 I proudly support Resolution J2254.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
21 Senator Jackson.

22 The resolution was previously
23 adopted on April 16th.

24 Senator Gianaris.

25 SENATOR GIANARIS: Next up is

1 previously adopted Resolution 2074, by
2 Senator Ashby. Please read its title and
3 recognize Senator Ashby.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
5 Secretary will read.

6 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 2074, by
7 Senator Ashby, commemorating the 2nd Annual
8 Honor Flight Day in the State of New York.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
10 Ashby on the resolution.

11 SENATOR ASHBY: Thank you,
12 Madam President.

13 I'm proud to stand today and
14 commemorate the Second Annual Honor Flight Day in
15 the State of New York. We hosted earlier today
16 veterans from World War II, the Korean War, the
17 Vietnam War.

18 And while the Honor Flights started
19 out as focusing on bringing our World War II
20 veterans down to our nation's capital to
21 experience the memorials and commemorate their
22 service, it's now expanded to other wars such as
23 the Korean War and the Vietnam War, which I think
24 are imperative to show our respect and resolve
25 for what we failed to do earlier on with our

1 Vietnam veterans.

2 And I can tell you firsthand that
3 this act has done amazing things for these
4 veterans and their families. Five thousand
5 veterans, over 5,000 veterans just alone from the
6 State of New York, have experienced this free of
7 charge. And for those who've served as escorts
8 on this, I can tell you that they get just as
9 much out of this experience serving as an escort,
10 helping and ushering our nation's heroes down to
11 our nation's capital -- who are welcomed as
12 heroes each step of the way.

13 So I'm very proud that we are
14 commemorating again the Second Annual
15 Honor Flight Day in the State of New York, and I
16 look forward to doing it again.

17 Thank you.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
19 Senator Ashby.

20 The resolution was previously
21 adopted on April 3rd.

22 Senator Gianaris.

23 SENATOR GIANARIS: Now on to the
24 highly anticipated previously adopted
25 Resolution 2121, by Senator Gounardes. Please

1 read that resolution's title and recognize
2 Senator Gounardes.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
4 Secretary will read.

5 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 2121, by
6 Senator Gounardes, memorializing Governor
7 Kathy Hochul to recognize April 20, 2024, in
8 honor of the 247th Anniversary of the adoption of
9 the first New York State Constitution.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
11 Gounardes on the resolution.

12 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Thank you,
13 Madam President.

14 My colleagues, this Saturday is
15 New York's 247th birthday. That's right: On
16 April 20, 1777, the State of New York ratified
17 our first constitution after we declared
18 independence in 1776.

19 And as I have for several years now,
20 I look forward to this day to talk about a
21 chapter of our state's constitutional history
22 that not only do I find interesting, but that is
23 relevant to the work that we do here in this
24 chamber. And this year is no different.

25 Now, we all know that one of

1 Albany's favorite parlor games is to shake our
2 fists at the clouds and lament how much power the
3 Governor has in the budget process. But did you
4 know that it was not always this way? It was not
5 until 1927 that the Constitution was amended to
6 include the Article VII budget process known as
7 the Executive Budget. Before that, before 1927,
8 the Legislature had the power of the purse.

9 So, ladies and gentlemen, gather
10 round and hear/the tale of how our state did
11 persevere./Through trials and tribulations we did
12 find/a way to reform our budget so refined.

13 Our story begins with the
14 Constitutional Convention of 1915, the zenith of
15 the reform movement that was taking hold across
16 the country in the wake of the Progressive Era
17 that defined American politics from the 1890s to
18 the 1920s. The goal of that convention was to
19 modernize state government and create the
20 architecture for the administrative state.

21 During the prior century the size
22 and scope of state government was relatively
23 small, so it didn't matter much if the
24 Legislature appropriated a thousand dollars for
25 this, \$2,000 for that -- which at that time was

1 still a lot of money. But as the state grew in
2 population and also in revenue, it became
3 painfully obvious that a better system was
4 necessary.

5 Between 1885 and 1914 the
6 Legislature approved expenditures that increased
7 spending by 600 percent over that 30-year period,
8 while revenue only grew by 274 percent. During
9 the 1915 convention, a proposal was adopted to
10 centralize the budget process in the executive
11 branch and provide a framework for financial
12 planning.

13 As Henry Stimson, the future
14 Secretary of State and Secretary of War and the
15 chairman of the Constitutional Convention's
16 Committee on State Finances, Revenues and
17 Expenditures -- really a great committee --
18 explained: "The United States is substantially
19 the only civilized country where, in both its
20 national and state governments, a scientific
21 budget system is unknown.

22 "No financial plan is presented to
23 our legislature in public each year by men who
24 are responsible for the conduct of government.
25 No considered estimates of the future, no

1 material whatsoever for comparison with the past
2 is presented by our executives to the legislature
3 in such a way that the body and the public can
4 understand them and hold spenders of our public
5 money responsible.

6 "Instead, our appropriation and
7 revenue bills are made up in the comparative
8 secrecy of legislative committees and rushed
9 through the final days of a legislative session."

10 Now, there were six primary reasons
11 why reform was so needed and why the Legislature
12 was not the appropriate branch of government to
13 control the purse strings for the state.

14 First, there was no centralized
15 process to actually determine how much money each
16 department, division and office under state
17 government needed to carry out its work. There
18 was a state law passed in 1910 that required the
19 Comptroller to collect information from every
20 department about what they needed to operate, but
21 the Comptroller had no ability to evaluate or
22 revise what those proposals were.

23 In practice, what that meant was
24 every state government entity treated this
25 process as a way to compile their wish list for

1 more money, without even needing to justify what
2 they wanted to spend their money on.

3 Secondly, the Legislature as an
4 institution was simply not well structured to
5 control the state's financial planning. Our
6 purpose was to legislate. We had no
7 administrative control over the offices of state
8 government and therefore no ability to directly
9 manage the administrative state.

10 Additionally, as we all well know,
11 crafting a budget is a delicate balance of
12 advocating statewide spending priorities while
13 making sure that we can bring home enough bacon
14 for our local districts. The track record of the
15 Legislature up to that point showed that the
16 expenditures were approved based on the needs
17 solely of individual members rather than the
18 needs of the state as a whole.

19 Thirdly, there was no process laid
20 out anywhere, either in the Legislature or with
21 some outside authority, for a financial plan that
22 measured expenses against projected revenues.
23 This defect was incredibly problematic, as the
24 Legislature routinely authorized spending that
25 far exceeded the available budget to pay for it.

1 In fact, in 1914 the Legislature had to gavel
2 back into special session to consider authorizing
3 a tax of \$18 million, which at that time
4 represented 30 percent of the state's revenue for
5 that whole year, just to cover a structural
6 deficit.

7 Fourthly, the Legislature routinely
8 used the appropriations process to engage in
9 logrolling. You know, that trading favors back
10 and forth to try to buy people's votes and win
11 influence.

12 And to make matters worse, the
13 Legislature would frequently pass stand-alone
14 bills to appropriate money even outside of its
15 own internal appropriations process. In 1915
16 alone, the Legislature passed 17 -- I guess you'd
17 call them supplemental appropriations bills as
18 local favors for individual members -- a bridge
19 in Waterloo, a foot bridge in Seneca Falls, a
20 school in Potsdam, a canal bridge in Yorkville, a
21 new paved road in Lockport, and even the
22 reimbursement to a private citizen for a personal
23 expense he made to fix a local waterway -- just
24 to name a couple of examples.

25 Fifth, as the size of the budget

1 grew and grew, it became more difficult for the
2 Legislature even to pretend to manage its
3 finances responsibly. Partly out of complexity
4 of the size of the budget, but partly out of
5 political considerations, the Legislature would
6 authorize expenses that they knew were
7 ridiculously high but they expected the Governor
8 to use his discretion to administratively reduce
9 how much would actually be spent for any given
10 purpose.

11 This allowed individual legislators
12 to score a political win by securing passage of
13 an appropriation that benefited their own
14 parochial interests, all while knowing that the
15 money might never actually be spent. In some way
16 that's not unlike our own one-house budget
17 process, right, where we all put our biggest
18 budget hopes and dreams forward, only to see them
19 get whittled down by the end of the day.

20 And the last major defect of the
21 status quo was simply the lack of transparency.
22 The appropriations bills were drafted solely by
23 the respective financial chairpersons in each
24 chamber. As one delegate to the Constitutional
25 Convention complained, "At the present time the

1 work is carried on in quiet by the chairmen of
2 the two finance committees. The legislature
3 knows nothing about it, the people know nothing
4 about it, the press know nothing about it until
5 the report of the committee nears the close of
6 the session. Then there is scant time for
7 deliberation, and it's too late to criticize and
8 do it all over again."

9 Now, the 1915 convention proposed
10 replacing this chaotic system with something more
11 professional and orderly -- a centralized process
12 where financial estimates for the necessary
13 operation of the various departments of state
14 government were put together alongside a
15 financial plan that detailed the projected
16 incoming revenue the state could authorize to
17 spend.

18 Importantly, this centralized
19 authority was to be given to the Governor,
20 because the Governor had the constitutional duty
21 to enforce the laws of the state and,
22 functionally speaking, the expense of state funds
23 through various state departments was how a great
24 deal of those laws were to be put into effect.

25 Now, although the convention

1 ultimately adopted the Executive Budget
2 amendment, the debate was wild -- and believe you
3 me, I spent hours reading through these
4 transcripts, and it was wild -- and generated
5 strong opposition from delegates to the
6 convention who were also members of the
7 Legislature.

8 One delegate, who we can confidently
9 say deserves an award for legislative hyperbole,
10 asserted: "The legislature is being destroyed.
11 And if it is being destroyed, I want to be the
12 old Cato that calls attention to it, that stern
13 old Cato that calls attention to the fact that
14 the power of the direct representatives of the
15 people of the state is being gradually taken away
16 and is being tucked off down in the corner of the
17 second story of the building here." As we all
18 know, our second floor.

19 Nevertheless, led by the leader of
20 the Progressive Reform Movement, Assemblymember
21 and future Governor Al Smith, the convention
22 passed the amendment and sent the proposal to the
23 people for a public referendum, along with
24 several other proposed amendments. And then the
25 public voted against it.

1 So although the amendment failed to
2 garner public ratification, the push for budget
3 reform continued. In 1916, Governor Charles
4 Whitman sought to consolidate all of the budget
5 requests from state agencies and then held a
6 series of public hearings around the state about
7 the budget before submitting a tentative spending
8 plan for the Legislature's consideration.

9 And although this effort won him
10 considerable praise from the press and New York's
11 reform leaders, the Legislature was simply not
12 impressed, arguing that the Governor's actions
13 would only confuse the public, who were
14 accustomed to the Legislature having direct
15 control of the budget.

16 However, in a sign of how the tide
17 was starting to turn, the Legislature that year
18 managed to adopt a budget which, as it turned
19 out, was very similar to what Governor Whitman
20 originally proposed.

21 The following year, our Legislature
22 adopted the Sage-Meyer Act, which proposed some
23 modest budget reforms but cemented the authority
24 for the budget process firmly with the
25 legislative branch. The Sage-Meyer Act gave

1 clear responsibility to the financial committees
2 in each chamber to lead the budget drafting
3 process, allowed each committee to hire full-time
4 budget staff for the first time, and importantly
5 authorized the Governor to submit to the
6 Legislature a suggested budget for the
7 Legislature's consideration.

8 Despite this progress, by 1920 that
9 process fell apart and the Legislature went back
10 to routinely ignoring the Sage-Meyer Act, the
11 very law that they passed themselves, and
12 disregarding the Governor's input.

13 With the election of Governor
14 Al Smith, however, the reform effort took on new
15 life, and Smith committed himself to see through
16 the reforms that he helped propose a decade
17 earlier.

18 Finally, in 1927, under the threat
19 of Smith calling the Legislature into special
20 session every day until they acquiesced to budget
21 reform, the Legislature approved a constitutional
22 amendment formalizing the Executive Budget
23 process, along with legislation to hire full-time
24 executive staff to manage the state's finances,
25 which created the Division of Budget.

1 The amendment was ratified by the
2 public a year later. And in 1929, New York State
3 adopted its first Executive Budget. With the
4 adoption of Article VII to the Constitution,
5 New York became one of the first states -- and
6 still to this day one of only a handful of
7 states -- to enshrine a formal budget process in
8 its state constitution.

9 Now, throughout the years,
10 Article VII has been modified slightly, but at
11 its core it remains the same -- a process for the
12 financial management of the state's affairs that
13 is anchored firmly in the executive branch.

14 And so, my colleagues, as we sit
15 here today waiting to finish this year's budget,
16 just know that things used to be very, very
17 different. And arguably, from the Governor's
18 perspective, maybe a little worse. The State
19 Budget was anything but an actual budget, and it
20 took years and years before the winds of change
21 brought about actual reform.

22 Now, you might be wondering -- I
23 haven't even touched on *Silver v. Pataki*, which I
24 know brings often more ire from those of us in
25 this chamber at the budget process. But that

1 will have to wait for another Constitution Day.

2 So with that, Madam President, I say
3 Happy Birthday, New York. Happy Constitution
4 Day. And I vote aye.

5 Thank you.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
7 Senator Gounardes.

8 Senator Krueger.

9 (Applause.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
11 Krueger on the resolution.

12 SENATOR KRUEGER: I just want to
13 thank Senator Gounardes for his tutorial on the
14 history of New York and the importance of the
15 Constitution and what gets done or not done when
16 we have the right and wrong things in our
17 Constitution.

18 I've also been thinking about the
19 fact that in three years it will be the
20 250th anniversary of our great state, and clearly
21 we need to do something momentous in celebration
22 of the 250th anniversary. So maybe we need to
23 change our Constitution specific to budget powers
24 in honor of the 250th anniversary. And it's
25 really about time we start on that, because it

1 takes about three years minimum to bring a vote
2 to the public about constitutional changes.

3 So it's not necessarily an amendment
4 to his resolution, but I think it's an excellent
5 discussion for those of us interested in this to
6 start focusing on.

7 I'm delighted to be added to the
8 this resolution, if he will allow me to add my
9 name at some point.

10 Thank you very much.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
12 Senator Krueger.

13 Senator Borrello on the resolution.

14 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you,
15 Madam President.

16 As usual, I was riveted by the words
17 of Senator Gounardes on his Constitution Day
18 speech.

19 But I was particularly interested to
20 hear about the history of more than 100 years ago
21 where the politicians asked for more than they
22 thought was realistic, where there were deals
23 made behind closed doors and it was a
24 non-transparent, completely opaque process.

25 I'm so glad that here in 2024 we

1 don't live in a state like that anymore.

2 So Happy Constitution Day.

3 Thank you.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
5 Senator Borrello.

6 Senator Fernandez on the resolution.

7 SENATOR FERNANDEZ: Thank you,
8 Madam President.

9 And yes, Happy Constitution Day.

10 Thank you, Senator Gounardes, for that very --
11 very, very good, comprehensive history lesson.

12 And to Senator Krueger, I agree, we
13 do need to do something. And we can do
14 something, because I have a bill for that.

15 So if you'd like to see this
16 momentum pick up, as I would too -- and I hope
17 that my other colleagues do as well -- know that
18 we have a bill, S2062, Protecting the People's
19 Budget, and that momentum can start today. So
20 let me know.

21 But thank you so much. Happy
22 Constitution Day. Happy Birthday, New York. And
23 let's go, New York!

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
25 resolution was previously adopted on April 9th.

1 Senator Gianaris.

2 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,
3 the various resolution sponsors, and especially
4 Senator Gounardes, want to open these up for
5 cosponsorship.

6 (Laughter.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
8 resolutions are open for cosponsorship. Should
9 you choose not to be a cosponsor, please notify
10 the desk.

11 Senator Gianaris.

12 SENATOR GIANARIS: Please take up
13 the calendar.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
15 Secretary will read.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 214, Senate Print 1199B, by Senator Parker, an
18 act to amend the Public Service Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
22 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it
23 shall have become a law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
3 the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
6 is passed.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 275, Senate Print 791A, by Senator Comrie, an act
9 to amend the New York State Urban Development
10 Corporation Act.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
14 act shall take effect immediately.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
19 the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
21 Calendar 275, those Senators voting in the
22 negative are Senators Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt,
23 Palumbo, Stec and Weik.

24 Ayes, 53. Nays, 6.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill

1 is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 365, Senate Print 308, by Senator Salazar, an act
4 to amend the Correction Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
8 act shall take effect immediately.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
13 the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
15 Calendar 365, those Senators voting in the
16 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
17 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Griffo, Helming, Lanza,
18 Martins, Mattera, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt,
19 Palumbo, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco, Weber and Weik.

20 Ayes, 42. Nays, 17.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
22 is passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 471, Senate Print 8576, by Senator Martinez, an
25 act in relation to authorizing the Church of the

1 Living God Pillar & Ground to file an application
2 for exemption from real property taxes.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
13 Calendar 471, voting in the negative:
14 Senator O'Mara.

15 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 520, Senate Print 280, by Senator Gounardes, an
20 act to amend the Executive Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 522, Senate Print 3260, by Senator Hoylman-Sigal,
10 an act to amend the Estates, Powers and Trusts
11 Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
15 act shall take effect immediately.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
22 Calendar 522, those Senators voting in the
23 negative are Senators Martins, Rhoads and Weik.

24 Ayes, 56. Nays, 3.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill

1 is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 580, Senate Print 4036, by Senator Mannion, an
4 act to amend the General Business Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
8 act shall take effect immediately.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
13 the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 702, Senate Print 6646, by Senator Ramos, an act
19 to amend the Labor Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
3 Ramos to explain her vote.

4 SENATOR RAMOS: Thank you,
5 Madam President.

6 You know, in Gothamist this past
7 Monday we learned that Cornell University's
8 School of Industrial and Labor Relations designed
9 a new tool called the Wage Atlas Tool that tracks
10 the cost of living and the depth of poverty in
11 New York State. The tool actually showed that
12 only half of New Yorkers right now are earning a
13 living wage.

14 And as you might recall, last year
15 we raised and indexed the minimum wage. And we
16 know it didn't go far enough to end the scourge
17 of poverty in New York State that's pushing
18 families out of our state and compromising our
19 safety.

20 Yearly rises in inflation have
21 decreased the value of the minimum wage over
22 time, meaning that the value of a paycheck can't
23 stretch to cover the basics the way it should.

24 Factor in the sheer scale of
25 wage theft in our state that's estimated at about

1 \$3.2 billion -- and \$50 billion nationwide -- and
2 we begin to understand the scale of that problem.

3 We raised the minimum -- I'm sorry,
4 we saw the minimum wage go up to \$15 a few years
5 ago, and New York City actually saw a sharp
6 decline in crime rates. So instead of finding
7 new ways to punish and criminalize poor people,
8 we can make ourselves safer by lifting from the
9 bottom.

10 With the current budget that we're
11 trying to negotiate, our Governor seems to be
12 much more concerned with punishing people who
13 have been driven to desperation by poverty rather
14 than the thieves at the top who keep people poor.

15 As a Legislature, we need to see the
16 numbers, and that's what this bill is about.
17 With this bill the cost of living is going to be
18 measured and analyzed utilizing many available
19 cost-of-living measures, and the data will be
20 disaggregated by race, ethnicity, gender, age,
21 disability status, household size, and education
22 level for each of the four regions in our state.

23 The state has an obligation to
24 ensure that the Legislature has access to
25 accurate data on the cost of living and the

1 adequacy of the current minimum wage. This bill
2 is going to ensure that we actually fulfill that
3 obligation, and I vote aye.

4 Thank you.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
6 Ramos to be recorded in the affirmative.

7 Announce the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
9 Calendar 702, those Senators voting in the
10 negative are Senators Borrello,
11 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Griffo, Helming,
12 Oberacker, O'Mara, Rhoads, Stec, Weber and Weik.

13 Ayes, 49. Nays, 10.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 710, Assembly Print Number 8622, by
18 Assemblymember Barrett, an act to amend the
19 Public Officers Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
3 the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
6 is passed.

7 Senator Gianaris, that completes the
8 reading of today's calendar.

9 SENATOR GIANARIS: Is there any
10 further business at the desk?

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: There is
12 no further business at the desk.

13 SENATOR GIANARIS: Let me remind my
14 Majority colleagues we are moving immediately to
15 a continuation of conference.

16 And with that, I move to adjourn
17 until tomorrow, April 18th, at 11:00 a.m.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: On motion,
19 the Senate stands adjourned until April 18th at
20 11:00 a.m.

21 (Whereupon, at 12:08 p.m., the
22 Senate adjourned.)

23

24

25