

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

NEW YORK STATE SENATE

THE STENOGRAPHIC RECORD

ALBANY, NEW YORK

April 3, 2024

3:56 p.m.

REGULAR SESSION

SENATOR JEREMY A. COONEY, Acting President

ALEJANDRA N. PAULINO, ESQ., Secretary

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The  
3 Senate will come to order.

4 I ask everyone to please rise and  
5 recite the Pledge of Allegiance.

6 (Whereupon, the assemblage recited  
7 the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: In the  
9 absence of clergy, let us bow our heads in a  
10 moment of silent reflection or prayer.

11 (Whereupon, the assemblage respected  
12 a moment of silence.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Reading  
14 of the Journal.

15 THE SECRETARY: In Senate, Tuesday,  
16 April 2, 2024, the Senate met pursuant to  
17 adjournment. The Journal of Monday, April 1,  
18 2024, was read and approved. On motion, the  
19 Senate adjourned.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Without  
21 objection, the Journal stands approved as read.

22 Presentation of petitions.

23 Messages from the Assembly.

24 The Secretary will read.

25 THE SECRETARY: Senator Kennedy

1 moves to discharge, from the Committee on  
2 Transportation, Assembly Bill Number 4066B and  
3 substitute it for the identical Senate  
4 Bill 5085C, Third Reading Calendar 459.

5 Senator Krueger moves to discharge,  
6 from the Committee on Codes, Assembly Bill  
7 Number 4714 and substitute it for the identical  
8 Senate Bill 8744, Third Reading Calendar 736.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: So  
10 ordered.

11 Messages from the Governor.

12 Reports of standing committees.

13 Reports of select committees.

14 Communications and reports from  
15 state officers.

16 Motions and resolutions.

17 Senator Gianaris.

18 SENATOR GIANARIS: Good afternoon,  
19 Mr. President.

20 I move to adopt the  
21 Resolution Calendar.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: All those  
23 in favor of adopting the Resolution Calendar  
24 please signify by saying aye.

25 (Response of "Aye.")

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Opposed,  
2    nay.

3                   (No response.)

4                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    The  
5    Resolution Calendar is adopted.

6                   Senator Gianaris.

7                   SENATOR GIANARIS:    Can we now take  
8    up previously adopted Resolution 1974, by  
9    Senator Borrello, read its title and recognize  
10   Senator Borrello.

11                  ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    The  
12    Secretary will read.

13                  THE SECRETARY:    Resolution 1974, by  
14    Senator Borrello, mourning the untimely death and  
15    paying tribute to the life and heroic service of  
16    Sergeant Thomas A. Sanfratello, who died in the  
17    line of duty on March 10, 2024.

18                  SENATOR BORRELLO:    Thank you,  
19    Mr. President.

20                  Yes, I stand to honor the life of  
21    Sergeant Thomas Sanfratello, who died tragically  
22    in the line of duty on March 10th of this year.  
23    Sergeant Sanfratello was a decorated 32-year  
24    veteran of the Genesee County Sheriff's Office in  
25    my district.    Beginning as a dispatcher in

1 February of 1992, he rose through the ranks,  
2 becoming a deputy sheriff in 1996 and earning a  
3 promotion to sergeant in 2007.

4 For more than three decades, he  
5 dedicated himself to serving and protecting the  
6 people of Genesee County. The excellence and  
7 commitment he brought to his work was well known.  
8 He was twice honored as deputy of the Year. He  
9 was a devoted father to his three children --  
10 Ian, Kyla, and Alexis -- and loved spending time  
11 with his family.

12 He was also a town board member in  
13 the Town of Alexander. So in his spare time he  
14 still served the people of his town.

15 He was an avid sports fan. His  
16 favorite teams were the New York Yankees and the  
17 Buffalo Sabres.

18 In remembering Sergeant Sanfratello,  
19 Sheriff William Sheron said, "Tommy never said  
20 no. If you needed something, Tommy was there.  
21 It didn't matter who you were or what time of the  
22 day or night it was; if he could help you, he  
23 would help you."

24 Sergeant Sanfratello's sacrifice  
25 reminds us of the risk our law enforcement

1 officers take in order to keep us and our  
2 communities safe.

3           Sergeant Sanfratello's life was  
4 tragically cut short while he was on special  
5 assignment at Batavia Downs. Two individuals in  
6 the casino, a man and a woman, were creating a  
7 disturbance and asked to leave. As Sergeant  
8 Sanfratello tried to escort them out of the  
9 facility, they became violent. The man, who had  
10 a long criminal history, reportedly attacked  
11 Sergeant Sanfratello, who then became  
12 unresponsive and ultimately lost his life.

13           Just 54 years old, there is no  
14 question that Sergeant Sanfratello was taken too  
15 soon.

16           This tragic incident illustrates the  
17 dangers that our law enforcement personnel face  
18 so that we don't have to.

19           Just two weeks after Sergeant  
20 Sanfratello, another brave law enforcement  
21 officer lost his life in the line of duty. NYPD  
22 Officer Jonathan Diller died in Queens on  
23 March 25th, reportedly from a gunshot from a  
24 career criminal he stopped for a traffic  
25 violation.

1                   And just a few days ago, an  
2                   investigator with the Chemung County Sheriff's  
3                   Office was gravely injured by two suspects he was  
4                   attempting to apprehend and remains hospitalized  
5                   in critical condition.

6                   Assaults on our law enforcement  
7                   officers have increased dramatically. In  
8                   New York City alone, there has been a 20 percent  
9                   rise in assaults on cops. These are dangerous  
10                  days for New York State, and especially for our  
11                  law enforcement officials. Our members of law  
12                  enforcement and their families live with the  
13                  knowledge that when they say good-bye to head to  
14                  work, it may be the last time.

15                  As we mourn the loss of  
16                  Sergeant Sanfratello and send our condolences to  
17                  his family, we can't help but profoundly be  
18                  grateful and in awe of his legacy and his  
19                  devotion and his courage.

20                  May Sergeant Sanfratello rest in  
21                  peace, and may God bless and protect his brothers  
22                  and sisters in law enforcement.

23                  Thank you, Mr. President.

24                  ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank  
25                  you, Senator Borrello.

1                   The resolution was adopted on  
2     March 19th.

3                   Senator Gianaris.

4                   SENATOR GIANARIS:    I think  
5     Senator Borrello would like to open that  
6     resolution for cosponsorship.

7                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    The  
8     resolution is open for cosponsorship.  Should you  
9     choose not to be a cosponsor on the resolution,  
10    please notify the desk.

11                  Senator Gianaris.

12                  SENATOR GIANARIS:    Please take up  
13    the calendar.

14                  ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    The  
15    Secretary will read.

16                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
17    307, Senate Print 7342A, by Senator Parker, an  
18    act to amend the Real Property Tax Law.

19                  ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Read the  
20    last section.

21                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.  This  
22    act shall take effect immediately.

23                  ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Call the  
24    roll.

25                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Announce  
2   the results.

3                   THE SECRETARY:     In relation to  
4   Calendar 307, those Senators voting in the  
5   negative are Senators Borrello, Griffo, Helming,  
6   Lanza, Mattera, Murray, Skoufis and Weik.

7                   Ayes, 48.   Nays, 8.

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    The bill  
9   is passed.

10                  THE SECRETARY:     Calendar Number  
11   397, Senate Print 3249, by Senator Bailey, an act  
12   to amend the Executive Law.

13                  ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Read the  
14   last section.

15                  THE SECRETARY:     Section 6.   This  
16   act shall take effect on the 30th day after it  
17   shall have become a law.

18                  ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Call the  
19   roll.

20                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

21                  ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Announce  
22   the results.

23                  THE SECRETARY:     Ayes, 56.

24                  ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    The bill  
25   is passed.

1                   THE SECRETARY:     Calendar Number  
2     459, Assembly Bill Number 4066B, by  
3     Assemblymember Burgos, an act to amend the  
4     Vehicle and Traffic Law.

5                   SENATOR LANZA:     Lay it aside.

6                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:     Lay it  
7     aside.

8                   THE SECRETARY:     Calendar Number  
9     475, Senate Print 1737, by Senator Krueger, an  
10    act to amend the Public Authorities Law.

11                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:     Read the  
12    last section.

13                   THE SECRETARY:     Section 5. This  
14    act shall take effect on the 90th day after it  
15    shall have become a law.

16                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:     Call the  
17    roll.

18                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

19                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:     Announce  
20    the results.

21                   THE SECRETARY:     In relation to  
22    Calendar 475, those Senators voting in the  
23    negative are Senators Borrello,  
24    Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Griffo, Martins, Murray,  
25    O'Mara, Ortt, Rhoads and Weik.

1                   Ayes, 48. Nays, 9.

2                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    The bill  
3   is passed.

4                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
5   497, Senate Print 6383, by Senator Parker, an act  
6   to amend the Administrative Code of the City of  
7   New York.

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Read the  
9   last section.

10                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 2. This  
11   act shall take effect immediately.

12                  ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Call the  
13   roll.

14                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

15                  ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Announce  
16   the results.

17                  THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 58.

18                  ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    The bill  
19   is passed.

20                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
21   507, Senate Print 6335A, by Senator Mannion, an  
22   act to amend the Civil Service Law.

23                  ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Read the  
24   last section.

25                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 2. This

1 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it  
2 shall have become a law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the  
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce  
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill  
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
12 561, Senate Print 3472, by Senator Rivera, an act  
13 to amend the Public Health Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the  
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This  
17 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it  
18 shall have become a law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the  
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce  
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill

1 is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
3 568, Senate Print 5357, by Senator Webb, an act  
4 to amend the Alcoholic Beverage Control Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the  
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 8. This  
8 act shall take effect immediately.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the  
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce  
13 the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill  
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
18 639, Senate Print 4886, by Senator Gianaris, an  
19 act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the  
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the  
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce  
3 the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
5 Calendar 639, those Senators voting in the  
6 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello, Gallivan,  
7 Griffo, Helming, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt,  
8 Palumbo, Rolison, Stec and Tedisco.

9 Ayes, 48. Nays, 12.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill  
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
13 650, Senate Print 5302, by Senator Fernandez, an  
14 act to amend the Penal Law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the  
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
18 act shall take effect immediately.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the  
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce  
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill

1 is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
3 662, Senate Print 4922, by Senator Sepúlveda, an  
4 act to amend the Public Health Law.

5 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Lay it  
7 aside.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
9 667, Senate Print 5396, by Senator Harckham, an  
10 act to amend the Mental Hygiene Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the  
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
14 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it  
15 shall have become a law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the  
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce  
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill  
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
25 693, Senate Print Number 4674A, by

1 Senator Hoylman-Sigal, an act to amend the  
2 Public Health Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the  
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
6 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it  
7 shall have become a law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the  
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator  
12 Hoylman-Sigal to explain his vote.

13 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Thank you,  
14 Mr. President.

15 I rise just to thank my colleagues  
16 for voting for this bill, which we passed last  
17 year unanimously.

18 It would direct the Department of  
19 Health to establish a statewide Parkinson's  
20 disease registry, requiring hospitals, medical  
21 facilities and physicians to report cases of  
22 Parkinson's to the Department of Health, allow  
23 patients to opt out of having their information  
24 collected, but also enable researchers to build  
25 on a lot of work that's already been done across

1 the country in addressing this very difficult  
2 neurological condition that affects 1 million  
3 Americans -- including, of course, the celebrated  
4 actor Michael J. Fox, whose foundation has helped  
5 us advance this legislation.

6           Tonight, as a matter of fact, the  
7 Michael J. Fox Foundation is attending a lighting  
8 of our State Capitol to advocate passage for this  
9 bill and to commemorate Parkinson's Disease  
10 Awareness Month. The color tonight will be  
11 orange.

12           I vote aye. Thank you.

13           ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator  
14 Hoylman-Sigal to be recorded in the affirmative.

15           Announce the results.

16           THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

17           ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill  
18 is passed.

19           THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
20 697, Senate Print 7093, by Senator Chu, an act to  
21 amend the Education Law.

22           ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the  
23 last section.

24           THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Call the  
2    roll.

3                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

4                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Senator  
5    May to explain her vote.

6                   SENATOR MAY:     Thank you,  
7    Mr. President.

8                   I rise to thank Senator Chu as our  
9    Libraries chair, and my colleagues for supporting  
10   this bill.

11                  In my district there are some  
12   beautiful libraries that have cafes and  
13   enchanted children's reading rooms and maker  
14   spaces with all kinds of resources, and beautiful  
15   outdoor seating. Those tend to be in the same  
16   districts where they can levy a property tax and  
17   raise millions of dollars a year to support the  
18   libraries.

19                  But then there are the neighborhoods  
20   where families really depend on the libraries  
21   for -- it may be the only place where kids can  
22   get reading materials or multimedia materials.  
23   It may be the only place where seniors can get  
24   tax help or where people can get internet  
25   connectivity or where people experiencing

1 homelessnes can use a bathroom or find a warm  
2 chair to sit in.

3 And these are the ones that really  
4 need the resources for capital repairs and  
5 improvements. And so I think this is a really  
6 smart way to allocate our funds.

7 And I just want to congratulate  
8 Senator Chu on this, and I vote aye.

9 Thank you.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator  
11 May to be recorded in the affirmative.

12 Announce the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill  
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
17 736, Assembly Bill Number 4714, by  
18 Assemblymember Lavine, an act to repeal  
19 Section 2255.17 of the Penal Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the  
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the  
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce  
3 the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
5 Calendar 736, those Senators voting in the  
6 negative are Senators Addabbo, Gallivan, Martinez  
7 and Tedisco.

8 Ayes, 57. Nays, 4.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill  
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
12 741, Senate Print 4557, by Senator Skoufis, an  
13 act in relation to permitting certain  
14 municipalities to receive reimbursement from the  
15 state.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the  
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
19 act shall take effect immediately.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the  
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce  
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: In relation to

1 Calendar 741, voting in the negative:

2 Senator Brisport.

3 Ayes, 60. Nays, 1.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill  
5 is passed.

6 Senator Gianaris, that completes the  
7 reading of today's calendar.

8 SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you,  
9 Mr. President.

10 On to the controversial calendar,  
11 please.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The  
13 Secretary will ring the bell.

14 The Secretary will read.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
16 459, Assembly Bill Number 4066B, by  
17 Assemblymember Burgos, an act to amend the  
18 Vehicle and Traffic Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator  
20 Borrello, why do you rise?

21 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you,  
22 Mr. President. Would the sponsor yield for a  
23 question?

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the  
25 sponsor yield?

1                   SENATOR KENNEDY:    Certainly,  
2   Mr. President.

3                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    The  
4   sponsor yields.

5                   SENATOR BORRELLO:    All right, thank  
6   you.   Through you, Mr. President.

7                   Senator Kennedy, I know this bill  
8   is -- the intent of this bill is to bring more  
9   money, potentially, to technicians.  In fact, you  
10  were quoted in a rally saying "When that money  
11  flows, we want to make sure that it gets to the  
12  working people that are on the job doing the work  
13  every single day."

14                  But after reviewing this bill, can  
15  you please point out to me where it specifically  
16  guarantees that the money that we pay to the  
17  dealers will actually translate into more pay for  
18  the technicians?

19                  SENATOR KENNEDY:    Thank you.

20                  Through you, Mr. President.  First  
21  of all, let me speak to the bill and I'm happy to  
22  answer my colleague's questions.

23                  This bill levels the playing field  
24  for workers across New York State and ensures  
25  that we are paying our workers a proper wage for

1 hours worked rather than nickel-and-diming them.

2 This is about the auto technicians,  
3 the workers that are doing the repairs and work  
4 that our vehicles need, whether they're under  
5 warranty or whether they're not under warranty.

6 However, unfortunately, the system  
7 that's set up as it is today pays those workers  
8 and compensates the dealerships that are  
9 performing the work in a two-tiered system --  
10 reimbursed at a level that is under warranty for  
11 a particular amount of hours, and reimbursed  
12 under nonwarranty under a different set of hours.

13 When one of us shows up to have our  
14 car repaired, regardless of its condition, if  
15 it's under warranty there is a certain set of  
16 criteria that the dealer and ultimately the  
17 technician follows and is reimbursed to that  
18 level.

19 When we are paying out of our own  
20 pocket, those numbers change when it is not under  
21 warranty, and the service technicians are paid  
22 based upon a set guideline that is put in place  
23 for the various dealerships and the various  
24 manufacturers, depending on the particular  
25 manufacturer.

1                   This legislation puts New York State  
2                   in line with 10 other states across the nation --  
3                   California, Wisconsin, Arkansas, Iowa,  
4                   Mississippi, South Carolina, Virginia, Tennessee,  
5                   Montana and Minnesota.

6                   I'm proud of this legislation that  
7                   has very strong bipartisan support, and the  
8                   legislation makes sure that dealers are  
9                   compensated from the manufacturers based upon a  
10                  reasonable number that is in the guidelines. And  
11                  that, then, funding is determined to go to those  
12                  that are doing the work, those auto tech workers.

13                  Now, there are those that are  
14                  covered through collective bargaining and there  
15                  are a certain set of guidelines there, and there  
16                  are those that are not under collective  
17                  bargaining. So both union and nonunion auto tech  
18                  workers would benefit from this.

19                  The auto tech workers that are  
20                  unionized will collectively bargain. Those that  
21                  are not will allow the market to ultimately  
22                  provide for an increased compensation when  
23                  they're doing the work.

24                  How do we know this? We know this  
25                  because this legislation has worked in other

1 states, as demonstrated by studies that have  
2 shown a very strong positive economic impact  
3 across the states that have done this and, most  
4 importantly, to the workforce that's performing  
5 the work.

6 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you.

7 Mr. President, will the sponsor  
8 continue to yield?

9 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the  
10 sponsor yield?

11 SENATOR KENNEDY: I will.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The  
13 sponsor yields.

14 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you for  
15 that.

16 But again, I don't see anything in  
17 the bill. Could you please point me to  
18 specifically in the bill where it guarantees that  
19 the extra money being paid to the dealers will  
20 guarantee more money to the workers.

21 SENATOR KENNEDY: Will my colleague  
22 answer a question, yield for a question?

23 SENATOR BORRELLO: I'm happy to,  
24 yes.

25 SENATOR KENNEDY: Great.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    You yield  
2                   (chuckling).

3                   SENATOR KENNEDY:    Senator Borrello,  
4                   if you were a auto tech worker and you were being  
5                   paid two-and-a-half hours for work and it took  
6                   you five hours to do the work, what would you  
7                   think about that?

8                   SENATOR BORRELLO:    Mr. President,  
9                   to answer the question.

10                  So there's a shortage of  
11                  technicians.  And if I was a technician -- and I  
12                  would think that that's a great skill for people  
13                  to have -- and I wasn't happy with how I was  
14                  being compensated, I would probably go down the  
15                  street and get a job at one of the many open  
16                  positions at another dealership.

17                  SENATOR KENNEDY:    Great.  Would my  
18                  colleague continue to yield.

19                  ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Will you  
20                  yield?

21                  SENATOR BORRELLO:    Sure.

22                  ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Senator  
23                  Borrello yields.

24                  SENATOR KENNEDY:    So, Senator  
25                  Borrello -- through you, Mr. President -- if you

1 weren't getting compensated what you thought you  
2 deserved, based upon the reimbursement from that  
3 particular dealership, you would go find  
4 employment somewhere else where you would get  
5 compensated properly.

6                   SENATOR BORRELLO: Yes. In fact,  
7 you probably know I'm a business owner. And, you  
8 know, we have to take good care of our employees.

9                   And we have a good chef, a good line  
10 cook -- you know, someone who works really hard  
11 for you -- and they don't feel they're being  
12 properly compensated, they come to you and they  
13 say -- they lay out the case as to why they feel  
14 they should be compensated better. And then the  
15 decision as a business owner is, do I feel this  
16 person is worth more money? And you make a  
17 decision based on that.

18                   So as a business owner, I can tell  
19 you that the smart move is to take good care of  
20 your good employees.

21                   SENATOR KENNEDY: Through you,  
22 Mr. President, will my colleague continue to  
23 yield.

24                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator  
25 Borrello, will you would continue to yield?

1                   SENATOR BORRELLO:     Sure.

2                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:     Senator  
3     Borrello yields.

4                   SENATOR KENNEDY:     As a businessman,  
5     if you were given a certain amount of money from  
6     those you're doing business with, but it was  
7     capped and you didn't have the resources to pay  
8     your employees a higher rate of pay and they had  
9     to leave to go find jobs elsewhere, and to fill  
10    those -- to backfill the positions that were now  
11    vacant, wouldn't you find it to be a problem?

12                  SENATOR BORRELLO:     You know,  
13    honestly, the problem as a business owner in  
14    New York State is pervasive everywhere, exactly  
15    what you described. I have to pay a lot in  
16    property taxes, employment taxes. I have to pay  
17    six figures in insurance. I have an unemployment  
18    bill now that is greater than it's ever been  
19    thanks to the mismanagement of the COVID funds by  
20    this body and by this Governor, so I now have to  
21    pay more money than I ever have.

22                  So no doubt about it, it's tough to  
23    do business in New York State.

24                  SENATOR KENNEDY:     Thank you,  
25    Mr. President. Through you.

1                   My colleague answered the question  
2 that was asked to me. In other words, the market  
3 sets the rate. If an individual --

4                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Senator  
5 Kennedy, are you on the bill?

6                   SENATOR KENNEDY:    I'm answering the  
7 question, but sure, on the bill.

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Senator  
9 Kennedy on the bill.

10                  SENATOR KENNEDY:    If the individual  
11 auto tech worker is getting compensated -- let's  
12 see here -- for, say, a water pump replacement  
13 under warranty, 2.6 hours that it is determined a  
14 manufacturer must pay a dealer for that work, but  
15 that a retail customer would pay for 7 hours,  
16 ultimately the customer's paying more than that  
17 manufacturer. Manufacturers which, by the way --  
18 record profits. Billions upon billions of  
19 dollars in record profits over the last decade.

20                  What we are saying with this bill is  
21 that there shouldn't be a two-tiered system.  
22 There shouldn't be a system under warranty versus  
23 nonwarranty when the dealers and ultimately those  
24 doing the work are being reimbursed for that  
25 hourly wage to do the work.

1                   And so ultimately, again, it's about  
2                   the auto repair techs, which across this nation  
3                   have seen a decrease in those that are actually  
4                   coming up in the ranks. There's, according to  
5                   the National Auto Dealers Association,  
6                   approximately 76,000 service techs that leave the  
7                   industry every year, with only 39,000 new service  
8                   workers graduating every year from tech colleges  
9                   and training programs.

10                   So what we're seeing now is, upon  
11                   the horizon, a bottoming out of these auto techs,  
12                   in large part, it could be argued -- and in large  
13                   part the auto techs and those doing the work are  
14                   arguing -- they're not being compensated to the  
15                   level that they deserve, based upon the work that  
16                   they're providing.

17                   What this bill does is it allows for  
18                   that to be rectified here in New York State like  
19                   they've done in 10 other states.

20                   SENATOR BORRELLO:    Mr. President,  
21                   will the sponsor yield?

22                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Will the  
23                   sponsor yield?

24                   SENATOR KENNEDY:    Of course.

25                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    The

1 sponsor yields.

2 SENATOR BORRELLO: So I appreciate  
3 the compliment that I answered your questions.  
4 But I still haven't heard an answer to my  
5 question.

6 Where in the bill does it guarantee  
7 that this money that will be paid to the dealers  
8 will translate into more money for techs?

9 SENATOR KENNEDY: Through you,  
10 Mr. President, I've answered that question in  
11 another way. The market will set the rate.

12 Those that are collectively  
13 bargained will see that wage negotiated. Those  
14 that aren't will allow the market to set the rate  
15 or they will find a job elsewhere if they're not  
16 being compensated to the level that they deserve  
17 at the appropriate dealership. The market will  
18 set the rate.

19 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,  
20 will the sponsor continue to yield?

21 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the  
22 sponsor continue to yield?

23 SENATOR KENNEDY: Yes.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The  
25 sponsor yields.

1                   SENATOR BORRELLO:    So I can assume  
2                   that when we're talking about the market, we're  
3                   not talking about this piece of legislation,  
4                   which does not actually guarantee that the  
5                   additional money being paid to dealers will  
6                   actually end up in the pockets of our  
7                   technicians.

8                   So with that being said, originally  
9                   a previous version of this bill had something  
10                  that other states have done.  It's actually  
11                  capped the amount.  Right now auto manufacturers  
12                  have time guides.  They make the cars, they study  
13                  very extensively how long the repairs take, and  
14                  then they set a time guide.

15                  Other states have set a limit of  
16                  150 percent of that manufacturer time study.  
17                  Illinois is one of those examples.  You had that  
18                  in the bill originally, but you removed that.  
19                  Which means that any time guide could be used.  
20                  If the George Borrello Time Guide came out, the  
21                  dealers could decide to use my time guide.

22                  Why did you remove that 150 percent?

23                  SENATOR KENNEDY:    Through you,  
24                  Mr. President, if the George Borrello Time Guide  
25                  came out, we would be very afraid.

1 (Laughter.)

2 SENATOR KENNEDY: Mr. President,  
3 the Legislature often does not get involved in  
4 issues involving collective bargaining. Passing  
5 this bill will allow the workers to ultimately  
6 bargain for themselves for what's rightfully  
7 theirs if the dealer does not pass those wages  
8 down.

9 And again, the market setting the  
10 rate will ultimately prove itself here, as it has  
11 in other states. And let me tell you, I have  
12 here from the State of Illinois Economic Policy  
13 Institute, Labor and Employment Relations, a  
14 study on the impacts of this precise legislation  
15 that we're passing here today in New York.

16 And when their law went into effect  
17 in 2022, this Economic Policy Institute released  
18 this study on how it affected the state. And it  
19 has been a very, very positive impact on the  
20 State of Illinois.

21 What it says is that worker wages  
22 were boosted between 3 and 7 percent, resulting  
23 in \$143 million annually for skilled mechanics.  
24 A reduction in employee turnover at auto dealers  
25 in that state by nearly 10 percent -- in a time

1 of labor shortages. Increased hours worked by  
2 auto dealers by 6 percent compared to other  
3 private industry workers.

4 The state's economy grew by  
5 \$302 million, a \$2-plus multiplier for every  
6 dollar in wage gains. And it generated tens of  
7 millions of dollars more in state tax revenues  
8 and local tax revenues per year.

9 Not only that, we know that this  
10 bill promotes safety and reliability by ensuring  
11 that the workers performing the work are taking  
12 the time necessary to do it in a fashion that is  
13 deserved to the consumer.

14 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,  
15 will the sponsor continue to yield?

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the  
17 sponsor yield?

18 SENATOR KENNEDY: Yes.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The  
20 Senator yields.

21 SENATOR BORRELLO: You mentioned  
22 the State of Illinois, which actually, as I just  
23 mentioned, capped that time study at 150 percent.  
24 So obviously they had some kind of guardrails  
25 that we don't have here in this bill.

1                   But regardless, right now the  
2 estimates of what the annual cost will be -- on  
3 the low end, about \$250 million. But according  
4 to the UAW, \$900 million a year in additional  
5 cost if this is passed.

6                   So how do you think that might  
7 impact the cost of buying a car in New York  
8 State?

9                   SENATOR KENNEDY: Thank you.

10                  Through you, Mr. President. First  
11 of all, let me state a few things. The  
12 automakers that are a part and central to this  
13 conversation posted record revenues over the last  
14 10 years, including last year.

15                  GM posted \$171.8 billion of revenue  
16 and \$10.1 billion net revenue.

17                  Ford posted \$176 billion in revenue  
18 and \$4.3 billion in net revenue.

19                  Stellantis posted \$203 billion of  
20 net revenue with profits of \$26.1 billion.

21                  Our workers deserve to get paid a  
22 fair wage for the hours that they are working  
23 when consumers bring their car in for repairs.

24                  That also being said, when we talk  
25 about guardrails, we were very meticulous in

1 including in this legislation the word  
2 "reasonable" when we made the amendments to the  
3 original legislation: "Reasonable compensation  
4 shall be the reasonable labor time allowances  
5 defined by the retail labor time guide reasonably  
6 utilized by a franchise motor vehicle dealer for  
7 nonwarranty customer-paid labor operations."

8 Those words, Mr. President, will  
9 ensure that this legislation takes effect in a  
10 way where both the consumer is protected, the  
11 workers are getting paid fairly, and those that  
12 are making record profits are paying their fair  
13 share.

14 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,  
15 will the sponsor continue to yield?

16 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the  
17 sponsor yield?

18 SENATOR KENNEDY: Yes.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The  
20 sponsor yields.

21 SENATOR BORRELLO: At the very end  
22 you said that this bill will guarantee consumer  
23 protection. But I've seen nothing in this bill  
24 that actually protects consumers. And in fact,  
25 in speaking with manufacturers, this will be

1 passed on to consumers.

2 So what part of the bill is  
3 protecting consumers?

4 SENATOR KENNEDY: Through you,  
5 Mr. President. If the manufacturers that have  
6 seen billions of dollars in record profits make a  
7 decision to pass this cost on to consumers, I  
8 believe that is absolutely wrongheaded and  
9 un-American.

10 What should happen is that instead  
11 of passing these costs on, the automakers ought  
12 to pay their fair share to ensure that our  
13 economy isn't struggling, that people can get to  
14 work, that these repairs can get done in a timely  
15 fashion so teachers can get to school and doctors  
16 can get to hospitals and parents can get to work,  
17 and we're not waiting weeks or even months for  
18 car repair delays.

19 Again, Mr. President, this is  
20 legislation that has proven to work in other  
21 states. New York State is stepping up and doing  
22 our part to make sure we're taking care of the  
23 workforce performing the work admirably each and  
24 every day.

25 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,

1 will the sponsor continue to yield?

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Does the  
3 sponsor yield?

4 SENATOR KENNEDY: Yes.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The  
6 sponsor yields.

7 SENATOR BORRELLO: So what you're  
8 saying is there's really nothing in this bill  
9 that prohibits manufacturers from passing that  
10 along to the consumers, and we have higher prices  
11 and perhaps less incentives for dealerships and  
12 perhaps higher cost of an extended warranty,  
13 which has now become almost necessary to buy.

14 So there's nothing in this bill that  
15 would stop manufacturers from passing those costs  
16 along to the consumer.

17 SENATOR KENNEDY: Through you,  
18 Mr. President. Once again, this bill is about  
19 making sure workers are getting equal pay for an  
20 equal amount of work. That auto manufacturers  
21 ought to do the right thing and make sure that  
22 their workforce is getting paid appropriately.

23 We know that this government of the  
24 United States bailed out the auto manufacturers  
25 when they needed it the most about 15 years ago,

1 16 years ago, and has since seen the fruits of  
2 that bailout result in billions of dollars of  
3 record profit.

4 We also know that these same said  
5 auto manufacturers went through a very difficult  
6 time in the last year to two years over labor  
7 issues, ultimately a strike. But it resulted in  
8 fair compensation for the workforce across this  
9 great country.

10 What we are saying here and now in  
11 the State of New York is those auto tech workers  
12 that are doing the work each and every day ought  
13 to also be paid a fair wage for the work that  
14 they're doing.

15 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,  
16 on the bill.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator  
18 Borrello on the bill.

19 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you,  
20 Senator Kennedy.

21 I too would like to ensure that  
22 people are paid a fair wage for the time that  
23 they put in.

24 Senator Kennedy brought up the  
25 market, the market will determine. No, no, the

1 market will not determine. This bill will  
2 determine what is paid.

3           There are time studies that are done  
4 by the manufacturers. These time studies are  
5 very exhaustive and a dealer, let's say it's a  
6 Ford dealer, has technicians that are trained by  
7 the manufacturer on how to do those repairs.  
8 They pay based on that time study and the fact  
9 that they have trained those technicians.

10           There are other time studies out  
11 there that are really designed for those smaller  
12 mom-and-pop mechanic shops where they're working  
13 on all makes, all models, usually higher mileage,  
14 out-of-warranty vehicles.

15           It's obvious, it's logical that they  
16 would take more time to do a repair because they  
17 don't work on that car all the time. They  
18 haven't been trained by the manufacturer, in most  
19 cases, on how to do that repair. Those are the  
20 time studies out there that allocate more time.

21           But we do want to make sure, because  
22 there is a shortage of technicians, that they are  
23 being fairly compensated, those technicians are  
24 being fairly compensated.

25           So what happens when we pass this

1 bill? Well, the cost of a warranty repair now,  
2 on average, is going to go up in New York State  
3 about \$1200 per car. That has to come from  
4 somewhere.

5 I know Senator Kennedy thinks it  
6 would be un-American that that to be passed along  
7 to the consumers, but that's probably what's  
8 going to happen.

9 Now, you might say, You know what,  
10 okay, people are going to make decisions based on  
11 that. Well, I happen to represent a district  
12 that borders the State of Pennsylvania. Car  
13 dealers in Pennsylvania have big billboards in my  
14 county, in my district, saying "Come to  
15 Pennsylvania, it's worth the trip." If this  
16 passes, it will be even more worth the trip.

17 Because I've spoken with these car  
18 manufacturers. They are going to have to pass  
19 this along in higher extended warranty costs.  
20 They're going to have to pass this along in less  
21 incentives to dealers. So that extra  
22 thousand dollars cash back that comes from the  
23 manufacturer, not from the dealer, may not be  
24 available in New York State.

25 People already cross the border a

1 lot into Pennsylvania to buy automobiles. This  
2 may create a situation where that's going to be  
3 an even bigger incentive to cross the border to  
4 buy a car.

5 I know we want to protect our  
6 workers, we want to pay them more. Let me be  
7 very clear. There is nothing in this bill that  
8 guarantees that the money that would be paid from  
9 the manufacturers to the car dealers will  
10 translate into more money for workers. It's not  
11 in there.

12 Now, yes, if they're paid more  
13 money, I would imagine that the -- particularly  
14 those that are unionized, the organized labor  
15 down -- mostly in the downstate area will  
16 certainly go back and certainly ask for more  
17 money. But I've negotiated contracts. As a  
18 business owner, I've bought and sold businesses.  
19 As a county executive, I negotiated labor  
20 contracts, multi-million-dollar contracts.  
21 Whenever you open up a negotiation, everything's  
22 open for negotiation.

23 So maybe we pay a little bit more  
24 money. But you know what, there's a shortage of  
25 technicians, we can't give you as many vacation

1 days. Maybe we pay a little more money, but you  
2 know what? We want you to go into a  
3 high-deductible health insurance plan now. Maybe  
4 we pay you a little bit more money, but you know  
5 what, maybe we're not going to contribute as much  
6 to your 401(k) or your pension.

7 It's a negotiation. You're asking  
8 more money to be paid to the dealers, and they in  
9 turn will renegotiate with their unions or with  
10 their employees. And that is what negotiation  
11 is. It's opening up opportunity.

12 I would hope that this would  
13 translate into more money for the workers, the  
14 techs. But the bottom line is if the market's  
15 going to decide, the market is already deciding.  
16 People -- there's a shortage of people with the  
17 skills and the training and, quite frankly, the  
18 desire to work as auto technicians. Okay? I  
19 come from a family of skilled workers. My  
20 father, my grandfather were plumbers. Try and  
21 get a plumber today. It's a tough, tough thing.  
22 Shortage of plumbers. Shortage of all skilled  
23 workers. The market will determine.

24 This bill is not letting the market  
25 determine. This bill is saying, Here are the

1 parameters by which New York now will become less  
2 business-friendly, more expensive -- more  
3 expensive to buy a car.

4 We talk about affordability. We in  
5 this chamber -- not me -- we in this chamber want  
6 to see everyone switch to electric cars, which  
7 are far more expensive, far more expensive to  
8 repair. So if we all switch to electric cars and  
9 we have an additional cost burden on the  
10 manufacturers, it's going to make it even less  
11 affordable for people who have that basic need of  
12 transportation.

13 So while I am hopeful that if this  
14 bill passes that perhaps there may be some  
15 guardrails put in place, like in the State of  
16 Illinois, where they've limited that time study  
17 to 150 percent of the manufacturers' time study.  
18 But that's not in this bill either. There's a  
19 lot of things that aren't in this bill that lead  
20 to a lot of uncertainty.

21 As a business owner, I can tell you,  
22 you can deal with a lot of things and you can  
23 take a calculated risk, but uncertain risk is a  
24 problem. So we are in fact sending a message, I  
25 think, that we continue to be a place that's more

1 difficult to do business here in New York State.

2           So I'm hopeful that perhaps some  
3 common sense could come into this, we find a way  
4 to compromise. But until I see that, I'm going  
5 to be a no on this bill.

6           Thank you, Mr. President.

7           ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank  
8 you, Senator Borrello.

9           Senator Martins, why do you rise?

10          SENATOR MARTINS: On the bill.

11          ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator  
12 Martins on the bill.

13          SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you.

14          Mr. President, I represent a  
15 district that has many car dealerships in it, and  
16 they provide many good-paying jobs. But the one  
17 drawback is when we talk about market conditions  
18 is that each one of those dealerships has a name  
19 on the side of it. They're tied to a car  
20 manufacturer. And so when that car manufacturer  
21 tells them that they're going to pay them at a  
22 certain rate for different types of work -- the  
23 same work, whether it's warranty or out of  
24 warranty -- there are concerns that I have with  
25 regard to how that gets passed on.

1                   Because they're not subject to  
2 market conditions. They have a dealership that  
3 represents a specific car manufacturer. And so I  
4 have concerns about the disparity between the car  
5 manufacturer being able to dictate to a  
6 dealership different rates for the same amount of  
7 work.

8                   So under those circumstances,  
9 Mr. President, I'll be voting aye.

10                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank  
11 you, Senator Martins.

12                   Are there any other Senators wishing  
13 to be heard?

14                   Seeing and hearing none --  
15 Senator Helming, why do you rise?

16                   SENATOR HELMING: Thank you,  
17 Mr. President. To explain my vote.

18                   I support our automotive repair  
19 technicians and our local car dealers, and that's  
20 why I will be voting in the affirmative on this  
21 bill.

22                   However, it is my hope that the bill  
23 sponsor will consider amending the bill language  
24 to ensure that technicians are truly paid fairly  
25 and that our local dealerships are appropriately

1 reimbursed by the manufacturers.

2           There was a lot of discussion during  
3 the debate about fair compensation, fair pay for  
4 people. But there is a reason why the bill  
5 sponsor avoided pointing to the language in the  
6 bill that ensures repair techs are fairly  
7 compensated. And that is simply because that  
8 language doesn't exist, something that I hope all  
9 repair technicians will take note of.

10           Thank you, Mr. President.

11           ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator  
12 Helming to be recorded in the negative {sic}.

13           Any other Senators wishing to be  
14 heard?

15           Seeing and hearing none, debate is  
16 closed. The Secretary will ring the bell.

17           Read the last section.

18           THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
19 act shall take effect immediately.

20           ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the  
21 roll.

22           (The Secretary called the roll.)

23           ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the  
24 roll.

25           (The Secretary called the roll.)

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Announce  
2   the results.

3                   THE SECRETARY:     In relation to  
4   Calendar 459, those Senators voting in the  
5   negative are Senators Borrello and Breslin.

6                   Ayes, 59.   Nays, 2.

7                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    The bill  
8   is passed.

9                   THE SECRETARY:     Calendar Number  
10   662, Senate Print 4922, by Senator Sepúlveda, an  
11   act to amend the Public Health Law.

12                  ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Senator  
13   Lanza, why do you rise?

14                  SENATOR LANZA:     Mr. President, I  
15   believe there's an amendment at the desk.  I  
16   waive the reading of that amendment and ask that  
17   you recognize Senator Helming.

18                  ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Thank  
19   you, Senator Lanza.

20                  Upon review of the amendment, in  
21   accordance with Rule 6, Section 4B, I rule it  
22   nongermane and out of order at this time.

23                  SENATOR LANZA:     Accordingly,  
24   Mr. President, I appeal the ruling of the chair  
25   and ask that you recognize Senator Helming to be

1 heard on that appeal.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The  
3 appeal has been made and recognized, and  
4 Senator Helming may be heard.

5 SENATOR HELMING: Thank you,  
6 Mr. President.

7 I rise to appeal the ruling of the  
8 chair. This amendment is clearly germane to the  
9 bill before us, because both pertain to health  
10 insurance coverage for the kids of our state.

11 During the COVID-19 pandemic,  
12 New Yorkers receiving Medicaid were granted  
13 continuous eligibility. This allowed Medicaid  
14 recipients to continue to receive benefits  
15 without confirming eligibility. This, in turn,  
16 ensured that vulnerable individuals and families  
17 remained covered during the pandemic.

18 However, in July of 2023 New York  
19 began a process of Medicaid redetermination  
20 following the federal guidance to renew benefits  
21 and disenroll those ineligible for Medicaid. As  
22 a result, more than 1.1 million New Yorkers, many  
23 of them children, have been determined ineligible  
24 for Medicaid and will be losing coverage.

25 My proposed amendment, the bill

1 that's before everyone in this chamber, would  
2 ensure continuity of coverage for our state's  
3 children by doing two simple things: First,  
4 implementing a six-month grace period for  
5 children determined ineligible for coverage.  
6 Second, this amendment would fully delay  
7 disenrollment for children until the end of the  
8 July 2024 redetermination unwinding period.

9           These measures will give parents a  
10 critical buffer and provide a time that they can  
11 find new coverage. We must take the necessary  
12 steps to ensure that children in our state do not  
13 experience lapses in coverage and continue to  
14 have access to the healthcare that they need.

15           For these reasons, Mr. President, I  
16 strongly urge you to reconsider your ruling.

17           ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank  
18 you, Senator Helming.

19           I want to remind the house that the  
20 vote is on the procedures of the house and the  
21 ruling of the chair.

22           Those in favor of overruling the  
23 chair, signify by saying aye.

24           (Response of "Aye.")

25           SENATOR LANZA: Show of hands.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    A show of  
2 hands has been requested and so ordered.

3                   Announce the results.

4                   THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 20.

5                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    The  
6 ruling of the chair stands, and the bill-in-chief  
7 is before the house.

8                   Read the last section.

9                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.  This  
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Call the  
12 roll.

13                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

14                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    Announce  
15 the results.

16                   THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
17 Calendar 662, those Senators voting in the  
18 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,  
19 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,  
20 Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Murray, O'Mara, Ortt,  
21 Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco and Weik.

22                   Ayes, 43.  Nays, 18.

23                   ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY:    The bill  
24 is passed.

25                   Senator Gianaris, that completes the

1 reading of today's calendar.

2 SENATOR GIANARIS: Is there any  
3 further business at the desk?

4 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: There is  
5 no further business at the desk.

6 SENATOR GIANARIS: Move to adjourn  
7 until tomorrow, Thursday, April 4th, 11:00 a.m.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: On  
9 motion, the Senate stands adjourned until  
10 Thursday, April 4th, at 11:00 a.m.

11 (Whereupon, at 4:44 p.m., the Senate  
12 adjourned.)

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25