

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

NEW YORK STATE SENATE

THE STENOGRAPHIC RECORD

ALBANY, NEW YORK

March 20, 2024

3:45 p.m.

REGULAR SESSION

SENATOR ROXANNE J. PERSAUD, Acting President

ALEJANDRA N. PAULINO, ESQ., Secretary

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
3 Senate will come to order.

4 I ask everyone to please rise and
5 recite the Pledge of Allegiance.

6 (Whereupon, the assemblage recited
7 the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Imam
9 Muhammad Shahidullah, of Dawah USA Center in
10 Jamaica, Queens, will deliver today's invocation.

11 IMAM MUHAMMAD SHAHIDULLAH: Ramadan
12 Mubarak. Ramadan Kareem. Greeting of peace,
13 Asalamu Alaikum {in Arabic}. Peace be upon you.

14 {In Arabic.} The meaning of the
15 verse from the Holy Quran: The month of the
16 Ramadan, the God which was the month of the
17 Ramadan, the Rebuilder, the Holy Book, the Quran.
18 This Quran, the Holy Book, guidance for mankind
19 and very, very clear proof of the guidance.
20 Amen.

21 And Almighty God, the Most Gracious
22 and Most Merciful, guide us, our -- this chamber
23 of Senate. Grant us our leaders wisdom, justice,
24 and commitment to our common and good things.
25 And, God, bless our deliberations with

1 cooperation and respect, ensuring all voices are
2 heard. Inspire us to support the marginalized.

3 God, accept our all good deeds. And
4 uniting us under Your guidance, may Your effort
5 reflect Your love, mercy, fostering a community
6 of peace and prosperity. Amen.

7 Again, Ramadan Mubarak. God bless
8 us. God bless New York State. God bless the
9 United States of America and all mankind.

10 Amen.

11 (Response of "Amen.")

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Reading
13 of the Journal.

14 THE SECRETARY: In Senate, Tuesday,
15 March 19, 2024, the Senate met pursuant to
16 adjournment. The Journal of Monday, March 18,
17 2024, was read and approved. On motion, the
18 Senate adjourned.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Without
20 objection, the Journal stands approved as read.

21 Presentation of petitions.

22 Messages from the Assembly.

23 The Secretary will read.

24 THE SECRETARY: Senator Webb moves
25 to discharge, from the Committee on

1 Environmental Conservation, Assembly Bill
2 Number 8866 and substitute it for the identical
3 Senate Bill 8357, Third Reading Calendar 541.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: So
5 ordered.

6 Messages from the Governor.

7 Reports of standing committees.

8 Reports of select committees.

9 Communications and reports from
10 state officers.

11 Motions and resolutions.

12 Senator Gianaris.

13 SENATOR GIANARIS: Good afternoon,
14 Madam President.

15 We have a number of important guests
16 with us in the chamber today.

17 I want to initially point out that
18 Senate rules only allow one member to speak on an
19 introduction, so Senators Stavisky, Liu and
20 Sanders have graciously agreed to let
21 Senator Comrie introduce the group of students
22 who are with us.

23 So please recognize Senator Comrie
24 for an introduction.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator

1 Comrie for an introduction.

2 SENATOR COMRIE: Good afternoon,
3 Madam President.

4 I want to thank the leader and the
5 Senate admin for allowing me to introduce the
6 student government representatives from
7 School District 29 from Southeast Queens.

8 They are young people who are
9 already student leaders in their school from
10 30 different schools around the district. This
11 is the second year that they were brought to
12 Albany to understand how government works from
13 the Albany level, from the level that we're
14 honored to represent our districts today.

15 We have -- this is a new tradition
16 that was started by our superintendent,
17 Dr. Crystal Bonds, who's been doing a great job.
18 I want to thank her for her constant work to
19 deliver the highest-quality education to the
20 schools in her purview. And she's been
21 invaluable to the Southeast Queens community.

22 I also would be remiss if I didn't
23 thank and acknowledge the chaperones who have
24 taken time out, especially Ms. Cherise Parson,
25 who helped coordinate today's event.

1 I want to just let the young people
2 know that on both sides of the house, that you
3 are starting off as student leaders today in your
4 respective classes. You are going to continue to
5 be student leaders because the things that I
6 heard from you today -- the questions, the
7 inquiries, the ideas that you have -- will
8 definitely make sure that you are leaders of
9 tomorrow.

10 Keep doing what you're doing. Keep
11 being leaders. Don't be afraid to ask questions.
12 Don't be afraid to work with your teachers so
13 that you can be the people that you know you want
14 to be. Making sure that you push past the
15 negativity that's in this world, getting a great
16 education so that I can come sit in your offices
17 one day with a cup of tea and find out how well
18 you're doing.

19 (Laughter.)

20 SENATOR COMRIE: So again, thank
21 you for giving me this opportunity, giving my
22 colleagues Senator Stavisky, Senator Liu and
23 Senator Sanders an opportunity to meet with you
24 today and talk with you.

25 And I hope that you had a chance to

1 experience the Capitol, and I hope that you come
2 back often as you continue in your journey.

3 Thank you, Madam President. I would
4 like to extend the courtesies of the house to the
5 student leaders of District 29.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: To our
7 guests, the student leaders of District 29, I
8 welcome you on behalf of the Senate. We extend
9 to you the privileges and courtesies of this
10 house.

11 Please rise and be recognized.

12 (Extended standing ovation.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
14 Gianaris.

15 SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you,
16 Madam President.

17 Let's move on to previously adopted
18 Resolution 1908, by Senator Myrie, read that
19 resolution's title and recognize Senator Myrie.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
21 Secretary will read.

22 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1908, by
23 Senator Myrie, congratulating the Medgar Evers
24 College Men and Women's Indoor Track and Field
25 team upon the occasion of capturing the 2024

1 City University of New York Athletic Conference
2 Indoor Track and Field Championships on
3 February 18, 2024.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
5 Myrie on the resolution.

6 SENATOR MYRIE: Thank you,
7 Madam President.

8 We are in March Madness, where the
9 country's attention turns to college athletics --
10 more specifically, to college basketball. But
11 today we have the honor of recognizing the Men's
12 and Women's Indoor Track and Field team from my
13 district -- a storied institution, Medgar Evers
14 College -- the two teams that won the
15 championship for the 2023 and 2024 season.

16 Now, this is unprecedented in many
17 ways. First, the men's team won this
18 championship for the first time in the school's
19 history. And the women's team won the
20 championship for the first time for the past
21 20 years.

22 And I'd be remiss if I didn't
23 recognize that under the new leadership of
24 President Ramsey, who has joined us today, we now
25 have some championships under our belt. And for

1 track and field purposes, it is important to
2 recognize that the CUNY championships this year
3 were Medgar-made.

4 So I want to recognize the athletes
5 and the officials that have joined us today. Of
6 course the Director of Athletics Chetara Murphy;
7 Head Coach Hugh Reid; Assistant Coach O'Neil
8 Sandiford and Assistant Coach Aaron Dickens.

9 And from the Women's Indoor Track &
10 Field Team, the most valuable performer during
11 the championship, Aaliyah Bartholomew, who was
12 joined by her teammates Jada Clayton,
13 Sarah Vallon, Torey Richards, Desireth Ramirez,
14 Deja Davis, and Nia Butler.

15 From the Men's Indoor Track & Field
16 Team, the most valuable performer in the
17 championship, Rupert Luard-Charles, who's joined
18 by his teammates Crisnel Nicholas, Isaac
19 Akindipe, Jerome Hodges, Dontay Washington,
20 Joshua Adisa, Adeolu Adeyemi, Jahiem Johnson, and
21 Christopher Richards.

22 We are so proud of you, it is
23 important that you be recognized in the upper
24 house of the State Legislature.

25 And that, Madam President, if you

1 could please afford them all privileges and
2 courtesies of this house.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
4 you, Senator.

5 Senator Bailey on the resolution.

6 SENATOR BAILEY: Thank you,
7 Madam President.

8 Thank you, Senator Myrie, for
9 bringing these incredible student athletes up to
10 our State Capitol.

11 Senator Myrie said it all, so I
12 won't go over it again. But to be a student
13 athlete is incredibly impressive, because it
14 combines two very difficult things. To be a
15 student, as you know, is your full-time job. And
16 to be an athlete at this level of collegiate
17 participation is also another full-time job. So
18 you're working two unpaid full-time jobs on top
19 of probably having a job outside of school -- and
20 you're doing it at a championship level.

21 So let you -- you should be very
22 proud of the work that you've done in utilizing
23 track and field as a metaphor that no matter
24 what's happening in the world of life, in this
25 race of life, if you train and you practice, you

1 will continuously run ahead of your competition.

2 So thank you for doing what you do.

3 We are proud of you. We appreciate you.

4 Senator Myrie, thank you for
5 bringing these amazing young kings and queens up
6 here.

7 Madam President, I vote aye on the
8 resolution.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
10 you, Senator.

11 To our guests, the championship
12 teams from Medgar Evers College, I welcome you on
13 behalf of the Senate. We extend to you the
14 privileges and courtesies of this house.

15 Please rise and be recognized.

16 (Lengthy standing ovation.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
18 resolution was adopted on March 12th.

19 Senator Gianaris.

20 SENATOR GIANARIS: Next up,
21 Madam President, we're going to take up two
22 previously adopted resolutions together,
23 previously adopted Resolution 1616 and
24 previously adopted Resolution 1729, both by
25 Senator Sepúlveda. Please read those

1 resolutions' titles and recognize
2 Senator Sepúlveda.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
4 Secretary will read.

5 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1616, by
6 Senator Sepúlveda, honoring Dr. Julio A. Brache
7 Arzeno posthumously for his multifaceted
8 contributions and enduring impact in medicine,
9 business, philanthropy, and his commitment to
10 New York.

11 Resolution 1729, by
12 Senator Sepúlveda, commemorating the annual
13 Merit Student event hosted by Fundacion Rica Inc.
14 for over 20 years on August 31, 2023.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
16 Sepúlveda on the resolutions.

17 SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA: Thank you,
18 Madam President, for allowing me to speak on this
19 resolution.

20 Today is a day that I am filled with
21 honor and pride because today we gather to pay
22 tribute to an extraordinary individual, an
23 extraordinary man, an extraordinary person,
24 Dr. Julio A. Brache Arzeno, who sadly passed away
25 on January 1, 2024, at the age of 96.

1 As we reflect on his invaluable
2 contributions to medicine, business, philanthropy
3 and community engagement, it is with a profound
4 sense of loss and respect that we honor his
5 memory.

6 In this moment of remembrance, it is
7 my honor to acknowledge the presence of
8 Dr. Brache's beloved family who join us today,
9 beginning with his wonderful wife, Elsa Alvarez
10 Bonilla de Brache -- who, by the way, was an
11 Assemblywoman in the Dominican Republic several
12 years ago -- and their extraordinary children:
13 Pedro Brache, Julio Virgilio Brache, Braulio
14 Brache, Elsa Julia Brache Alvarez, and Carmen
15 Maria Brache de Rios.

16 They're all here with us, sitting
17 with us today, and we're all full of pride to
18 have them with us because they embody the
19 enduring spirit of Dr. Brache's life and work.
20 Each of them continues to uphold his visionary
21 contributions through their respective roles
22 within Grupo Rica and Fundacion Rica,
23 demonstrating the lasting impact of his
24 dedication to innovation and to serve the
25 community.

1 Dr. Brache's pioneering spirit in
2 founding Pasteurizadora Rica transformed the
3 Dominican agricultural landscape, setting a new
4 standard for corporate responsibility and social
5 engagement.

6 His philanthropic endeavors,
7 particularly through the Fundacion Rica, have
8 uplifted communities by addressing essential
9 needs in education, health, and societal
10 development. These efforts have significantly
11 enhanced the quality of life for countless
12 individuals, underscoring the transformative
13 power of committed philanthropy.

14 Moreover, Dr. Brache's profound
15 connection to New York, manifested in his support
16 for Dominican students, engagement in community
17 initiatives, and active participation in cultural
18 life, has strengthened the bonds between the
19 Dominican Republic and New York.

20 His collaborations with
21 organizations like CitiHope International and
22 Major League Baseball have highlighted his
23 commitment to leveraging influence for the
24 greater good, benefiting numerous individuals and
25 communities beyond geographic borders.

1 As we honor Dr. Brache Arzeno
2 posthumously today, we extend our deepest respect
3 and gratitude to his family and their personal
4 sacrifices and contributions that have allowed
5 Dr. Brache's vision and legacy to thrive. Their
6 presence here is a testament to the enduring
7 power of his life's work, inspiring us all to
8 pursue a path of service, leadership and
9 community engagement.

10 Let this moment inspire us to
11 continue Dr. Brache's remarkable legacy, ensuring
12 that his impact on the world will be felt beyond
13 generations to come.

14 I want to thank Junior Martinez,
15 Jasmine Garcia, Wenceslao Soto, Rusking Pimentel,
16 and Hennessy Reyes for participating in
17 organizing this historic event.

18 (Previous remarks in Spanish.)

19 Thank you.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
21 you.

22 Senator Jackson on the resolutions.

23 SENATOR JACKSON: Thank you,

24 Madam President. I rise regarding this
25 resolution.

1 In these hallowed halls we come
2 together to celebrate the extraordinary life of
3 Dr. Julio A. Brache Arzeno, a paragon of
4 philanthropy whose efforts have significantly
5 elevated the well-being of countless individuals
6 both within our state and internationally.

7 And Dr. Brache's commitment to
8 fostering sustainable growth and equitable
9 opportunities speak volumes of his character and
10 the depth of his compassion for humanity.

11 The founding of Fundacion Rica under
12 Dr. Brache's guidance was a milestone in
13 charitable work, emphasizing the critical areas
14 of education and health.

15 His vision has not only catalyzed
16 economic and agricultural development, but has
17 laid down the very foundation for a future where
18 community empowerment and mutual support are the
19 norm.

20 And today, as we are joined by
21 Dr. Brache's family, their presence reinforces
22 the narrative of sacrifice and unwavering
23 dedication that has been the hallmark of their
24 family's legacy.

25 It is a testament -- today as we're

1 joined by Dr. Brache's family their presence
2 reinforces the narrative of sacrifice and
3 unwavering dedication that has been the hallmark
4 of their family's legacy. It is a testament to
5 how Dr. Brache's work has integrally woven the
6 fabric of our communities closer, creating a
7 vibrant tapestry of cultural and social unity
8 between the Dominican Republic and New York.

9 And as we pay tribute to Dr. Brache,
10 let us all be inspired by his magnanimous spirit.
11 May we too strive to embody the virtues of
12 empathy, foresight, and a relentless commitment
13 to community service. Dr. Brache's legacy
14 challenges us to carry forward the torch for
15 philanthropy and renewed vigor and purpose.

16 I vote aye, Madam President.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
18 you, Senator.

19 Senator Comrie on the resolution.

20 SENATOR COMRIE: Thank you,
21 Madam President.

22 I also rise to support this
23 resolution and congratulate the Brache family for
24 continuing to honor the works of their father to
25 be a major philanthropist not just in their

1 country, but also working to extend their mission
2 into the United States also.

3 I want to thank you for continuing
4 that legacy, creating opportunities for minority
5 young people, opportunities for health,
6 opportunities for education and, even more so,
7 opportunities for entrepreneurship, to teach
8 people how to become investors and
9 businesspeople.

10 Thank you for coming to our chambers
11 today. We're honored by your presence. And
12 thank you for continuing your philanthropy of
13 service. Thank you.

14 Thank you, Madam President.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
16 Bailey on the resolutions.

17 SENATOR BAILEY: Thank you,
18 Madam President.

19 Thank you, Senator Sepúlveda, for
20 bringing the Brache family here.

21 So to the Brache family, thank you
22 for coming up to our State Capitol. And thank
23 you for continuing your legacy, as has been said
24 by many of my colleagues. It is really important
25 not just as legislators but as parents, right?

1 Like we want our children to continue the legacy
2 that we have set forth, whatever that is.

3 And when you're able to excel in the
4 fields of education, healthcare and social
5 development, that is a very strong legacy that
6 continues to build a bridge between the
7 Dominican Republic and the United States of
8 America, in New York specifically.

9 So I just want to say thank you for
10 the work that you do and the work that you
11 haven't done yet that will continue because of
12 the work that you've done now. I know that was a
13 lot, right? But it makes sense, I promise.

14 (Laughter.)

15 SENATOR BAILEY: But I just want to
16 say like the spirit of philanthropy is something
17 that we can all do, whether it's financial or
18 just giving of your time. And you, in continuing
19 that legacy, is a testament to all of us that we
20 can always do more for those in our community.

21 So I salute you. Mucho gusto un
22 placer.

23 Thank you, Madam President. I vote
24 aye.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator

1 Parker on the resolutions.

2 SENATOR PARKER: Thank you,
3 Madam President.

4 And thank you, Senator Sepúlveda,
5 for bringing these resolutions to the floor and
6 leading this important effort.

7 Today we convene in this august body
8 and this chamber to honor a man of profound
9 generosity and vision. And that's Dr. Julio A.
10 Brache Arzeno, who you've heard us mention.

11 Now, I had planned to give all of my
12 remarks in Spanish today, and I lost my notes.

13 (Laughter.)

14 SENATOR PARKER: But I'm glad that
15 Senator Sepúlveda found my notes --

16 (Laughter.)

17 SENATOR PARKER: -- and read them
18 word for word. So thank you, Senator Sepúlveda,
19 for delivering them. And thank you -- it's
20 already been said in the record, so I don't want
21 to hold us up with a lot of unnecessary rhetoric.

22 (Laughter.)

23 SENATOR PARKER: As you know -- you
24 know, the Brache family may not know this, but I
25 try to be brief and concise in my remarks on this

1 floor.

2 (Laughter.)

3 SENATOR PARKER: But in all
4 seriousness, we really want to honor Dr. Brache's
5 unparalleled philanthropic endeavors and really
6 just note how profoundly he has affected not just
7 his local community and his country, but really
8 communities across our great planet.

9 His legacy is a beacon of how
10 unwavering compassion and relentless pursuit of
11 societal betterment can transform our entire
12 world. Through his initiatives like the
13 Rica Foundation, Dr. Brache demonstrated
14 exemplary leadership, pioneering in sectors that
15 are vital for our collective progress, like
16 education, healthcare and societal welfare.

17 These efforts have not only
18 propelled advancements in the Dominican Republic,
19 but also have fostered and nurtured bonds between
20 New York and making our societies richer and also
21 more inclusive.

22 As we gather today with his family,
23 we are inspired by their enduring dedication.
24 And his loved ones have also shown up because
25 they also believe and have been involved in this

1 cause of human upliftment. Their collective
2 journey is a powerful reminder of the impact of
3 one's family commitment and how that can have an
4 important, you know, impact on the tapestry of
5 all of our communities.

6 And so in honoring Dr. Brache today,
7 let his life and legacy be a guidepost for all of
8 us. May we all aspire to reflect his
9 selflessness, his strategic foresight, and his
10 wont for a better society.

11 And we also want to just honor his
12 deep-rooted belief in the strength of community
13 bonds, because we understand that only together
14 can we make our communities as good as we want
15 them to be.

16 So today we rekindle our dedication
17 to the principles that he's brought us and his
18 family has demonstrated and he so eloquently
19 lived by -- and may we all live by these
20 important principles.

21 Thank you for being here, and
22 congratulations for all that you are doing.

23 Thank you.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
25 you, Senator.

1 To our guests, I welcome you on
2 behalf of the Senate. We extend to you the
3 privileges and courtesies of this house.

4 Please rise and be recognized.

5 (Standing ovation.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:

7 Resolution 1616 was adopted on January 17th, and
8 Resolution 1729 was adopted on January 30th.

9 Senator Gianaris.

10 SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you,
11 Madam President.

12 Now let's move on to previously
13 adopted Resolution 1980, by Senator Chu, read its
14 title and recognize Senator Chu on the
15 resolution.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
17 Secretary will read.

18 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1980, by
19 Senator Chu, memorializing Governor Kathy Hochul
20 to proclaim March 23, 2024, as Pakistan-American
21 Heritage Day in the State of New York.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
23 Chu on the resolution.

24 SENATOR CHU: Thank you,
25 Madam President, for this opportunity to speak on

1 this resolution and introduce the Consul General
2 of Pakistan to New York, Consul General Atozai,
3 on the floor today.

4 Pakistani-Americans make up the
5 seventh largest Asian-American ethnic group in
6 the United States. And I'm extremely proud to
7 carry this resolution that highlights and
8 celebrates the contributions of Pakistani
9 Americans in New York. It is a great pride for
10 the Pakistani-American community to pass down
11 their heritage to diversify New York.

12 Being a proud Pakistani-American
13 means uplifting values of family, faith and
14 community. During this time of Ramadan, many of
15 our Pakistani-American community members are
16 observing by fasting and giving back so much to
17 those in and around their neighborhoods and our
18 respective districts.

19 New York City is home to
20 approximately 200,000 Pakistani-Americans, and
21 their contributions to our state add to the
22 extreme diversity and richness throughout.

23 I'm proud to represent the
24 neighborhoods of Bensonhurst and Bath Beach.
25 They are home to a growing and proud Pakistani

1 community. Just going down the street you can
2 see stores with traditional Pakistani clothes,
3 community centers to engage and learn, mosques
4 for all to observe their faith.

5 As an immigrant community, Pakistani
6 Americans are working to pass down their heritage
7 and traditions to their next generation. For
8 example, I have great {inaudible} organizations
9 on the ground in my district like APNA Community
10 Center that is filling this gap and providing
11 space for seniors and youth. Their work
12 exemplifies the core values of Pakistani heritage
13 and respect for the power of the community.

14 So I would like to take this
15 opportunity to introduce some very special guests
16 to this chamber: The Consul General of Pakistan
17 to New York, Consul General Atozai; and also
18 president and founder of the American Pakistani
19 Advocacy Group, Mr. Rashid, and also the fellow
20 members of APAG.

21 Madam President, if I may, please
22 welcome our guests and extend them the privileges
23 of the floor.

24 Thank you, Madam President.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank

1 you.

2 Senator Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick on the
3 resolution.

4 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK:

5 Thank you, Madam President.

6 Thank you, Senator Chu, for bringing
7 this resolution to the floor.

8 I rise today in recognition of our
9 honored guests, and I wanted just to let
10 everybody know that the Ninth Senate District is
11 proud of the diverse heritage that makes up our
12 community, specifically the Pakistani-American
13 population.

14 According to a recent survey, Nassau
15 County has the eighth-highest Pakistani
16 population in the nation outside of -- in
17 New York State, but outside of New York City.
18 And in solidarity with our Pakistani-American
19 neighbors who are such an integral part of our
20 community, our county executive, Bruce Blakeman,
21 led a relief effort to help the victims of severe
22 flooding that plagued Pakistan in 2022.

23 One thing I'm sure of is that people
24 of all backgrounds will be very excited about the
25 upcoming cricket teams coming to Nassau County.

1 And the featured matches will include matches
2 between India and Pakistan, which are both among
3 the top five teams in the world.

4 So thank you again, Senator Chu.

5 And I welcome our guests as well.

6 Thank you, Madam President.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
8 you, Senator.

9 Senator Comrie on the resolution.

10 SENATOR COMRIE: Thank you,
11 Madam President.

12 I also rise to support Senator Chu's
13 resolution today to invite and acknowledge the
14 Pakistani-Americans living in New York City.

15 I have many Pakistani-Americans
16 living in my district, in the 14th District.
17 They also are, as in the other districts, working
18 to become major participatory people in our
19 district -- not just in business, but in
20 government and education and also in philanthropy
21 as well.

22 I just want to thank the Consul
23 General for being here, and all of the members
24 that are here today. I want to continue to let
25 folks know that this is New York, which is a

1 dynamic state, a state that works to make sure
2 that multiculturalism is honored and respected,
3 that all groups that are here can make sure that
4 their history, their legacy, and the things that
5 they need to pass on to their children are
6 respected in our school system as well.

7 And I hope that we can make sure
8 that we continue to push multiculturalism in
9 school, and a tapestry in the school system that
10 that can have a program that can educate our
11 young people from birth to the 12th grade so that
12 they can understand that the beauty of this state
13 is all of the people that are working in this
14 state, living in this state, and contributing to
15 making sure that this state is a place where all
16 children can grow up and be respected.

17 I honor this resolution. Thank you,
18 Senator Chu, for bringing it today.

19 Thank you.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
21 Sanders on the resolution.

22 SENATOR SANDERS: Thank you,
23 Madam President.

24 Thank you for bringing this
25 resolution forward.

1 I was speaking to the great
2 delegation that has come before us, and we were
3 speaking of many of the issues. But I must admit
4 I enjoyed the conversation I had with the
5 Consul General. We were speaking of the
6 greatness of the two places of New York State and
7 Pakistan, and how though Pakistan finds itself in
8 a very difficult place in the world today -- the
9 very tough neighborhood that Pakistan finds
10 itself in -- that as long as they have good
11 citizens like the ones we have before us, they
12 will be well-represented in the U.S.

13 I don't see my friend Faran up
14 there. He missed his cue. He works with me in
15 the -- actually, I work for him, if the truth is
16 told.

17 So I look forward to working with
18 you further and having further discussions.
19 Perhaps we'll have it in Pakistan next time.

20 Thank you. Thank you. Thank you
21 again.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
23 you.

24 Senator Rhoads on the resolution.

25 SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you,

1 Madam President.

2 And thank you, Senator Chu, for
3 bringing forward this resolution.

4 And Pakistani-American Heritage Day
5 and the selection of March 23rd is not by
6 accident. It's actually known as Pakistan
7 Resolution Day, or Pakistan Day. And it's a
8 significant day in the history of Pakistan that
9 commemorates the adoption of the Lahore
10 Resolution on March 23rd of 1940. And that day
11 marks the beginning of the struggle for an
12 independent state, which ultimately led to the
13 creation of Pakistan on August 14th of 1947.

14 More importantly, it's a reminder of
15 the resilience, determination and unity that
16 define the Pakistani spirit. And every year on
17 Pakistan Day the entire nation comes together to
18 celebrate the spirit of independence and pay
19 homage to the great leaders like the
20 Quaid-e-Azam, who played a crucial role in the
21 formation of the country.

22 Pakistan Day is also a time to
23 reflect on the progress and achievements of the
24 country since its inception. From a struggling
25 newly formed nation to a nuclear power today, and

1 a developing economy, Pakistan has come a long
2 way in the last seven decades. They've become
3 leaders in various fields, including science and
4 technology, education, sports, business -- not
5 only in Pakistan but, for the over 600,000
6 Pakistani-Americans who call America now their
7 home, the incredible contributions that they have
8 made to this nation as well.

9 Let us find today, then, inspiration
10 in the timeless words of Muhammad Iqbal, the
11 great thinker in Pakistan who urged us to
12 envision a better tomorrow amidst today's
13 challenges. And let's use this as an opportunity
14 to reaffirm our commitment to democracy, growth,
15 tolerance and stability, realizing the vision of
16 the Quaid-e-Azam, one of the great founders of
17 Pakistan.

18 So to our guests here in the
19 chamber, to our Consul General, and to all
20 Pakistanis across New York State and in the
21 Fifth Senate District, I wish you a very happy
22 Pakistan Day and Pakistan-American Heritage Day
23 here in the great State of New York.

24 Thank you, Madam President.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank

1 you, Senator.

2 Senator Liu on the resolution.

3 SENATOR LIU: Thank you,
4 Madam President.

5 I want to thank Senator Chu for
6 bringing this important resolution. And I agree
7 with everything everybody has said already.

8 I also want to take an opportunity
9 to welcome our new Consul General from Pakistan
10 to New York. Welcome. You're going to see a
11 very vibrant Pakistani-American community here in
12 New York.

13 I want to say hello to my friends
14 from APAG. Ali, waiting for the day for Iftar.

15 And with that, I think not only has
16 this organization been completely intertwined
17 into the fabric of our communities -- during the
18 pandemic, they fed people, they had social
19 programs, they did so much for the growing
20 Pakistani community and beyond.

21 And of course they are also very
22 influential in political circles. Probably,
23 Madam President, we may see the first
24 Pakistani-American elected official within the
25 ranks of these individuals standing right there.

1 And, you know, I hope to see the
2 first Pakistani-American State Senator soon,
3 hopefully from Sanders' district.

4 (Laughter.)

5 SENATOR LIU: Thank you very much,
6 Madam President.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
8 you.

9 To our guests, the Consul General
10 and the members of the Pakistani delegation, I
11 welcome you on behalf of the Senate. We extend
12 to you the privileges and courtesies of this
13 house.

14 Please rise and be recognized.

15 (Standing ovation.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
17 resolution was adopted on March 19th.

18 Senator Gianaris.

19 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,
20 the various sponsors of today's resolutions would
21 like to open them for cosponsorship.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
23 resolutions are open for cosponsorship. Should
24 you choose not to be a cosponsor, please notify
25 the desk.

1 Senator Gianaris.

2 SENATOR GIANARIS: Please take up
3 the calendar.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
5 Secretary will read.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 122, Senate Print 1137A, by Senator Sanders, an
8 act to amend the Banking Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Hold on.
10 (Pause.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
12 Secretary will read.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 122, Senate Print 1137A, by Senator Sanders, an
15 act to amend the Banking Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
19 act shall take effect immediately.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
2 is passed.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 126, Senate Print 1179, by Senator Harckham, an
5 act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
14 the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
16 Calendar 126, voting in the negative are
17 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick and Weik.

18 Ayes, 59. Nays, 2.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 164, Senate Print 1001, by Senator Hoylman-Sigal,
23 an act to amend the Public Health Law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
25 last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This
2 act shall take effect on the first of January.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 319, Senate Print 6808, by Senator Mannion, an
13 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 13. This
17 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
18 shall have become a law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill

1 is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 346, Senate Print 151, by Senator Gianaris, an
4 act to amend the Criminal Procedure Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
8 act shall take effect immediately.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
13 the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
15 Calendar 346, those Senators voting in the
16 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
17 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Felder, Gallivan, Griffo,
18 Helming, Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Murray,
19 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,
20 Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Weber and Weik.

21 Ayes, 40. Nays, 21.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 394, Senate Print 622, by Senator Kavanagh, an

1 act to amend the Executive Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
5 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
6 shall have become a law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 427, Senate Print 2088, by Senator Kavanagh, an
17 act to amend the General Obligations Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
3 Calendar 427, those Senators voting in the
4 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
5 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
6 Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker,
7 O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Skoufis,
8 Stec, Tedisco, Weber and Weik.

9 Ayes, 40. Nays, 21.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 437, Senate Print 1974A, by Senator Ramos, an act
14 to amend the Workers' Compensation Law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
18 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it
19 shall have become a law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: In relation to

1 Calendar 437, voting in the negative:

2 Senator Lanza.

3 Ayes, 60. Nays, 1.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 467, Senate Print 1176, by Senator Harckham, an
8 act to amend Chapter 606 of the Laws of 2006.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
12 act shall take effect immediately.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 526, Senate Print 4342, by Senator Sepúlveda, an
23 act to amend the Surrogate's Court Procedure Act.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
25 last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
2 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it
3 shall have become a law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
8 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick to explain her vote.

9 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK:
10 Thank you, Madam President.

11 This bill allows someone
12 who's not related to a decedent to become the
13 administrator of an estate. And my concern is
14 that there's no guarantee that this person will
15 act in the best interests of that family.
16 There's no bond that is posted, and this person
17 could be completely unrelated.

18 We do have a public administrator in
19 every county. That is a person that -- a state
20 official that steps in to handle estates when
21 there is no family that is qualified.

22 So for those reasons, I am voting in
23 the negative. Thank you.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
25 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick to be recorded in the

1 negative.

2 Announce the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
4 Calendar 526, those Senators voting in the
5 negative are Senators Borrello,
6 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Griffo, Helming, Lanza,
7 Martins, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara,
8 Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco, Weber and
9 Weik.

10 Ayes, 44. Nays, 17.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 541, Assembly Bill Number 8866, by
15 Assemblymember Kelles, an act to amend the
16 Environmental Conservation Law.

17 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Lay it
19 aside.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 551, Senate Print Number 7374, by
22 Senator Scarcella-Spanton, an act to amend the
23 Executive Law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
25 last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
2 act shall take effect immediately.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 557, Senate Print 1478, by Senator Hinchey, an
13 act in relation to directing the Commissioner of
14 Health to conduct a study of the delivery of
15 services to individuals with traumatic brain
16 injury.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
20 act shall take effect immediately.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
25 the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 570, Senate Print 1468, by Senator Breslin, an
6 act to amend the Insurance Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
15 the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 636, Senate Print 1918, by Senator May, an act to
21 amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
5 the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
7 Calendar 636, those Senators voting in the
8 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
9 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Griffio, Helming, Lanza,
10 Martins, Mattera, Murray, O'Mara, Rhoads,
11 Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Weber and Weik.

12 Ayes, 45. Nays, 16.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 654, Senate Print 1863, by Senator Brouk, an act
17 to amend the Education Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
21 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
22 shall have become a law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
2 Brouk to explain her vote.

3 SENATOR BROUK: Thank you,
4 Madam President.

5 I wanted to share with everyone,
6 because the way we came to this bill today is
7 really representative of how we do work here in
8 Albany. Oftentimes we have advocacy groups, we
9 have youth groups come to Albany, learn about the
10 Legislature, see how we do everything here. And
11 one of those groups is a really big group of
12 foster youth who often come.

13 And one of the things I learned in
14 conversations with some of these young people is
15 that a large percentage of young people who go
16 through the foster system -- in fact, 63 percent
17 of them -- do wish to go to college but don't
18 believe that there are resources in place for
19 them to be able to do that.

20 And for those who actually do enroll
21 in these schools, only 3 to 11 percent actually
22 end up graduating with their degree.

23 Now, part of the reason this
24 happens is because they're not aware of the
25 actually ample resources that we in New York

1 State have for young people who have gone through
2 the foster system or the child welfare system.

3 So this bill is actually simple in
4 nature. The idea is that we want to make sure
5 more young people and administrators at both SUNY
6 and CUNY have this information and that it's
7 conspicuously displayed so that more of these
8 young people who want to obtain their degrees,
9 who want to enter the workforce and who need
10 these resources can actually master them.

11 So thank you to the Senate; this has
12 passed before. And I am excited that it's being
13 passed again today, and I proudly vote aye.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
15 Brouk to be recorded in the affirmative.

16 Announce the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 655, Senate Print 2208, by Senator Liu, an act to
22 amend the Education Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This

1 act shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
6 the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
9 is passed.

10 Senator Gianaris, that completes the
11 reading of the -- today's calendar.

12 SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you,
13 Madam President.

14 Before we move to the controversial
15 calendar, there's a report of the
16 Finance Committee at the desk with some
17 nominations.

18 Can we please take that up now.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
20 Secretary will read.

21 THE SECRETARY: Senator Krueger,
22 from the Committee on Finance, reports the
23 following nominations.

24 As members of the Metropolitan
25 Transportation Authority: Samuel Chu,

1 Meera Joshi, Daniel Garodnick, Marc W. Herbst;
2 and Michael Fleischer.

3 As a member of the Niagara Frontier
4 Transportation Authority: Treneeka Cusack
5 Fields.

6 As a member of the Rochester-Genesee
7 Regional Transportation Authority: John A.
8 Trott.

9 As a member of the Capital District
10 Transportation Authority: Jacqueline McDonough.

11 SENATOR GIANARIS: I move to accept
12 the report of the Finance Committee and ask that
13 you recognize Senator Krueger.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: All
15 those in favor of accepting the report of the
16 Finance Committee signify by saying aye.

17 (Response of "Aye.")

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Opposed,
19 nay.

20 (No response.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
22 report of the Finance Committee is accepted.

23 Senator Krueger on the nominations.

24 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you,
25 Madam President.

1 So yesterday we had three committees
2 meet together -- the Corporations and
3 Authorities Committee, chaired by Senator Comrie;
4 the Transportation Committee, chaired by
5 Senator Kennedy; and the Finance Committee,
6 chaired by myself. So we did three committee
7 meetings in one.

8 We had extensive questioning of the
9 five MTA candidates. We did not have the three
10 other authority candidates come in person. The
11 questions were extensive, important, and we felt
12 that all of the candidates submitted by the
13 Governor were absolutely qualified to take their
14 place -- in the first case, for the first five --
15 for the Metropolitan Transportation Authority,
16 the 12-county MTA, and as well for the three
17 nominees representing three upstate
18 transportation authorities.

19 I don't think anyone has any doubts
20 how important public transportation is to
21 everyone here in New York State, and how
22 important it is to have excellent representatives
23 on the boards doing their best for us all.

24 So I'm very glad that we're able to
25 bring them here today and certainly urge all of

1 my colleagues to vote yes for them.

2 Thank you, Madam President.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
4 Skoufis.

5 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Thank you very
6 much, Madam President.

7 While I have no objection to the
8 three nominees for authorities that are not the
9 MTA, there is only one vote we're allowed to cast
10 here as a package, and so I will on their
11 nominations regrettably be voting no because of
12 my opposition to the five MTA board nominees.

13 And as Senator Krueger noted, we had
14 three hours -- I think over three hours of
15 questions and answers from these nominees. It
16 was a good and robust meeting. But I was
17 disappointed that all five of the nominees that
18 came before us and that are before us here today
19 were unabashed in their answers to my questions
20 and concerns related to congestion pricing.

21 And specifically -- there was some
22 agreement. Whether we like or dislike congestion
23 pricing, we at least all agreed that the goal of
24 congestion pricing was to shift people away from
25 their vehicles and onto MTA mass transit. Now,

1 that works well and fine in many places within
2 the MTA region, but it does not work if there is
3 no MTA mass transit.

4 Where I am in Orange County, there
5 is, I think objectively speaking, sorely
6 inadequate service. And I raised this with a
7 number of nominees.

8 The final two, the last two trains
9 available at the Harriman Train Station -- which
10 is the most heavily trafficked station in
11 Orange County, just down the road from
12 Woodbury Common -- the final two stops each and
13 every day from Orange County to New Jersey where
14 you have to transfer to get into Manhattan, are
15 3:57 p.m. and then 10:30 p.m. There's a 6 hour
16 and 33 minute gap between trains to travel from
17 Orange County eventually, with a transfer, to
18 Penn Station in Manhattan.

19 And I'd raised the question, if you
20 want to get into Manhattan within those six and a
21 half hours and there's no train, what do you do?
22 You have to drive. And so how is it fair that my
23 constituents, with no alternative available to
24 them, must pay \$30, 15 on the George Washington
25 Bridge, 15 in the congestion pricing zone, not to

1 mention probably around \$20 in gas round trip,
2 and there'd be no accommodation in the MTA -- or
3 in the recommendations to the MTA for congestion
4 pricing.

5 Each and every one of these nominees
6 quite frankly simply did not care. They, in my
7 characterization, were happy to sacrifice, at the
8 altar of congestion pricing, Orange County and my
9 constituents.

10 And so I'll be voting no on all of
11 them. I continue to implore the MTA to do the
12 right thing, amend these recommendations. And
13 for all the transit deserts in the region,
14 provide reasonable accommodations.

15 Thank you.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
17 you.

18 Senator Martinez on the nominations.

19 SENATOR MARTINEZ: Thank you,
20 Madam President.

21 I also rise today in opposition to
22 the slate of nominees to the MTA board.
23 Specifically, one of the individuals being
24 confirmed today is from Long Island and supported
25 congestion pricing.

1 Congestion pricing, as we know, will
2 have a detrimental effect on my constituents that
3 I represent on Long Island, particularly those
4 that travel daily from Suffolk County into
5 Manhattan, including our first responders, our
6 teachers, our healthcare providers, and our union
7 workers. Congestion pricing imposes an
8 additional financial burden on our hardworking
9 individuals who rely on affordable
10 transportation.

11 Additionally, though, I would like
12 to acknowledge one of the nominees who was not on
13 the MTA board when this vote took place. And I
14 appreciate his efforts on Long Island, and that
15 is Marc Herbst. He is the head of the
16 Long Island Contractors' Association. His
17 leadership in the transportation industry has
18 made such great improvements in Suffolk County
19 alone. It is commendable what he has done. I
20 truly respect him. It's unfortunate that we have
21 to vote on a slate of nominees and not
22 individually, because Marc Herbst would have had
23 my complete support.

24 But I in good conscience cannot vote
25 for a slate of nominees who support congestion

1 pricing, who at the end of the day will hurt my
2 constituencies.

3 For that reason, Madam President, I
4 vote in the negative.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
6 Martinez in the negative.

7 Senator Comrie on the nominations.

8 SENATOR COMRIE: Thank you,
9 Madam President.

10 I rise today to thank all of my
11 colleagues on both sides of the aisle for the
12 debate and questioning of the candidates that
13 were brought before us to serve on the MTA board
14 and the other regional authorities.

15 I support all of the candidates for
16 service. I think their records individually are
17 extensive and are impressive. I think they have
18 an ability to bring a new direction to the MTA,
19 facing the difficulties that we have to face. I
20 won't go into all of the details, but everything
21 from electrification at the northern end of
22 Long Island to taking care of the West of the
23 Hudson that Senator Skoufis so passionately spoke
24 about. Dealing with this congestion pricing that
25 we have to figure out and get right.

1 I think that we have a group of
2 nominees that can do the job. They heard from
3 members yesterday from both sides of the aisle
4 about these issues. They understand that they
5 have to do something about it. The nominees all
6 have extensive history in construction, and they
7 all moved to talk about the need for
8 transparency, ensuring that the system can work
9 better, that we can lower construction costs,
10 which are the highest anywhere in the nation.
11 That we can also make sure that we have an
12 opportunity to improve transportation, to do
13 through-running through the most important
14 station in the country, Penn Station, so a person
15 could ride from the Hamptons to Buffalo or to
16 Albany, which is important for our economy.

17 I have concerns and will continue to
18 raise concerns about transparency and the ability
19 of the MTA to ensure that the ridership is safe,
20 that the ridership can be better, that we can
21 have a fair fare system that would make it easier
22 for everyone. And I hope that we can continue to
23 work on both sides to make sure that we have an
24 MTA that can service our communities.

25 But these five candidates for the

1 MTA all have an extensive background and create
2 opportunities to lift the MTA to better heights.

3 I vote aye, Madam President.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
5 Comrie to be recorded in the affirmative.

6 Senator Weber to explain his vote.

7 SENATOR WEBER: Thank you,
8 Madam President.

9 Congestion pricing is a dumpster
10 fire. Let's be honest. The residents of
11 Rockland County have been shortchanged by the MTA
12 for generations. We don't have a one-seat ride
13 into the city. A lot of our residents have to
14 drive into the city.

15 So we have to vote on one slate of
16 candidates, and I'm going to speak for one voice
17 of the residents of Rockland County by voting no
18 on this slate of candidates because we need to
19 send a message.

20 This body voted for congestion
21 pricing before I got here. I would have voted no
22 if I were here. This body has the opportunity to
23 get rid of congestion pricing. I guess we choose
24 not to as a body. I hope we will consider doing
25 that before the end of the session.

1 I vote no.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
3 Weber to be recorded in the negative.

4 Senator Borrello.

5 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you,
6 Madam President.

7 You know, again, I have to voice my
8 concern with having to group all these important
9 positions into one vote. I will remind everyone
10 last year I brought up the fact that when the DEC
11 wants to protect a species of fish, we have to
12 vote on each individual species of fish as a
13 different bill. But yet we are going to continue
14 to group these important nominees.

15 So I'll be forced to vote no even
16 though there are some I think that are qualified.
17 But I want to speak a moment on the MTA.

18 You know, New York State taxpayers,
19 even ones that never use the MTA, ever in their
20 entire life, subsidize the MTA to the tune of a
21 billion dollars every year just for operating
22 expenses. That doesn't include the billions for
23 capital expenses that New York State taxpayers
24 also subsidize.

25 And what does that billion dollars

1 actually go towards? Well, 700 million of it
2 this year is going to go towards fare evasion,
3 people that dodge fares. And there's really no
4 appetite to do anything about that. We're not
5 going to, you know, provide a criminal penalty to
6 someone that isn't going to pay the fare. That's
7 number one. Seven hundred million dollars this
8 year alone.

9 Then there's hundreds of millions of
10 dollars a year for no-show positions where the
11 MTA admits there are possibly thousands of
12 positions that they can't prove somebody actually
13 shows up to work for every day, but yet still
14 draws a paycheck.

15 Then of course there's all the
16 overtime fraud that we've seen through the MTA.

17 So the money that the New York State
18 taxpayers supply to the MTA goes almost
19 exclusively to cover fraud -- waste, fraud and
20 abuse. That's what the money that New York State
21 taxpayers supply it to the MTA for. It's a mess.
22 It needs to be fixed. And I don't know if these
23 folks are up to the task or not -- I hope they
24 are. But at this moment, dumpster fire is
25 probably a good way to describe the entire MTA.

1 So I'll be voting no. Thank you.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
3 Borrello to be recorded in the negative.

4 Senator Scarcella-Spanton.

5 SENATOR SCARCELLA-SPANTON: Thank
6 you, Madam Chair.

7 I also am rising today to voice my
8 opposition to the slate of candidates for the
9 MTA board.

10 Unfortunately, congestion pricing
11 not only is going to hurt the pockets of my
12 constituents, but their own federal environmental
13 impact studies show that the pollutants are going
14 to rise significantly, both in portions of
15 Staten Island and in portions of the Bronx as
16 well. So not only is this bad for them
17 financially, but it's also bad for their health.

18 We already have some of the highest
19 asthma rates on Staten Island. We have one of
20 the highest childhood cancer rates on
21 Staten Island.

22 And I cannot in good faith support
23 these candidates, so I vote no.

24 Thank you.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator

1 Scarcella-Spanton to be recorded in the negative.

2 Senator Martins.

3 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,
4 Madam President.

5 You know, to borrow a phrase from
6 Senator Weber, congestion pricing is a dumpster
7 fire. You know, but that isn't our task here
8 today, right? We're not here to substitute our
9 opinions for those of others. These are
10 appointments, and our job I believe is to
11 determine whether or not people are qualified.

12 If they are qualified to occupy
13 those positions, there's a certain amount of
14 deference that this body has historically given
15 to those people who are making those
16 appointments.

17 So I hear people standing up today
18 using this vote as a referendum on congestion
19 pricing -- the very same people who were here in
20 2019 and actually voted for congestion pricing,
21 Madam President.

22 Which is shocking to me, because
23 rather than taking it out on nominees who were
24 appointed by people, whether it's county
25 executives or the Governor herself, we're dealing

1 with an issue by not holding ourselves to that
2 same standard. Which, again, everyone can
3 actually make that decision for themselves. But
4 there are people who have stood up here and said
5 they're going to cast a negative vote for people
6 who are possibly qualified, but not because of
7 their qualifications, because of an issue that
8 they themselves put in harm's way and put our
9 constituents in harm's way.

10 So, Madam President, if this vote is
11 about congestion pricing, then I vote no.
12 Because if that is the standard that we're going
13 to use today, then I will vote no on these
14 nominees if that's the standard that we're going
15 to use in this chamber. Historically, it hasn't
16 been.

17 But because that's the standard that
18 has been placed before us today, Madam President,
19 I vote no.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
21 Martins to be recorded in the negative.

22 Senator Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick.

23 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK:
24 Thank you, Madam President. I rise to explain my
25 vote against this -- these nominations as well.

1 I'm disappointed to hear that
2 despite a hearing was held with three committees,
3 that some of the nominees didn't take the time to
4 appear and be interviewed. I think that's
5 troubling.

6 I do think, though, that the MTA has
7 failed in many ways to my constituents, the
8 constituents of Nassau County. They've failed to
9 answer pleas by my mayors and my local government
10 to be a good neighbor to clean up after
11 themselves. There's constant mismanagement. And
12 I'm told repeatedly that there's just not enough
13 funding to do the things that they should do to
14 be good neighbors -- put up fences, clean up
15 garbage, put up safety fences because they back
16 onto schoolyards where small children play.

17 And I'm frustrated that the MTA
18 doesn't have the money for these things, and now
19 we're putting in congestion pricing under the
20 guise of trying to have a cleaner environment --
21 but really, it's about the money. And of course
22 it's about the money, because the MTA put into
23 their budget a billion dollars that they're going
24 to gain from congestion pricing, banking on the
25 fact that there's so many people from both

1 Rockland County, Nassau County, that will have to
2 drive.

3 So I'm frustrated to hear that all
4 of the candidates are absolutely in favor of
5 congestion pricing and don't come up with an
6 alternative to the financial crisis that the MTA
7 is currently in.

8 So for those reasons,
9 Madam President, I'll be a nay.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
11 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick to be recorded in the
12 negative.

13 Senator Lanza.

14 SENATOR LANZA: Thank you,
15 Madam President.

16 And I vote -- I rise in opposition
17 to this -- to these nominations.

18 Congestion pricing from its
19 inception has been a lie. It is why I have
20 opposed it. It's why I debated against it on
21 this floor. And it's why I voted against it.

22 First, it was about traffic. That's
23 how it all started, traffic in one area of
24 New York City. Doesn't matter that it takes a
25 half-hour to go five blocks in the Bronx or seven

1 blocks in Staten Island or even longer to drive a
2 few blocks in Brooklyn. It doesn't care, and the
3 people who support it don't care that it will
4 actually cause more congestion everywhere but the
5 congestion pricing district.

6 Some of the supporters and advocates
7 for it realized that people were onto them. How
8 could they argue that it was about traffic or
9 congestion when in fact traffic would increase
10 everywhere else? So they changed it. They said
11 it was about pollution, that somehow congestion
12 pricing, which is nothing more than a punitive
13 tax, was going to reduce pollution.

14 As my colleague and good friend from
15 Staten Island just stated, the MTA's own study
16 has concluded that congestion pricing will
17 increase pollution. It will just push it to the
18 Bronx and to Staten Island and to parts of
19 New Jersey.

20 So again, they're lying. Where the
21 MTA chairman, president, a few weeks ago talked
22 about the fact that crime is only a perception
23 that people have about the MTA and the subway
24 system. It's really not real. It's not that
25 bad. We have 4 million riders. If we were a

1 city, it would be a very good, safe city.

2 Three weeks later, the Governor sent
3 the Guard, the State Police, and God knows who
4 else is going to be needed to address not a
5 perception, but a travesty.

6 And congestion pricing is no more
7 insulting to any other place in the State of
8 New York than it is to the people of
9 Staten Island that Senator Scarcella-Spanton and
10 myself represent. Here we are, part of New York
11 City. We pay New York City taxes. When I
12 listened to Senator Skoufis, I thought for a
13 moment he had moved to Staten Island and was
14 representing Staten Island. His plight is our
15 plight. I was with him until he said that
16 there's a five-hour gap between the train and
17 that you get -- a six-hour -- I got you beat. A
18 six-hour beat between one train and the other
19 train to get to Manhattan.

20 There is a never-ending gap on
21 Staten Island. We -- you cannot get on a train
22 on Staten Island and find yourself in Manhattan.
23 Nowhere has the MTA failed in its mission than it
24 has to the people of Staten Island, 550,000
25 people. Nowhere.

1 And yet because of their failures,
2 where as a Staten Islander you must, you must
3 choose to get in a car to go to market, to get
4 your kids to school, to go to work. Maybe once
5 in a while go into Manhattan. After all, it's
6 our city. And then after putting us in our cars,
7 they tell us you can't take it into Manhattan,
8 your city.

9 Forget about what this does to
10 businesses. Forget about what this does to
11 families all across the city. I'll let my
12 colleagues talk about outside the city. But this
13 is really -- this is an insult. It's an outrage.
14 It's a crime. It's a lie.

15 I can't vote for anyone that has
16 anything to do with the MTA. And I will not,
17 until -- until we figure out a way to go from the
18 top down and the bottom up and rework what is
19 happening in the MTA. Because there are things
20 we agree about in this body. There are things we
21 disagree about. But I can tell you there's one
22 thing that unites us all. Our residents, in
23 every district we represent, believe the MTA is
24 doing a terrible job in the State of New York.

25 I vote no, Madam President.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
2 Lanza to be recorded in the negative.

3 Senator Rhoads.

4 SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you,
5 Madam President.

6 You know, I've said it on this floor
7 before and I've said it publicly numerous times.
8 To me, the MTA stands for "Money Thrown Away."
9 Because that's what we do. Every single year we
10 have a budget. Every single year the MTA runs
11 deficits. It's just differing amounts.

12 And every year the one thing that we
13 need to do, to try and figure out where that
14 money is going, conducting a forensic audit of
15 the MTA, forcing them to open their books and
16 disclose where it is this money is going and
17 why -- year after year after year there continues
18 to be a shortfall of hundreds of millions,
19 billions of dollars, and that doesn't happen.

20 Instead, we get congestion pricing.
21 And I know that these nominees are not about
22 congestion pricing. But you know what? It
23 really is.

24 And for somebody who just had the
25 honor of coming to the State Senate last year,

1 didn't have an opportunity to debate congestion
2 pricing in 2019 as many in this chamber did have
3 the opportunity to do, it's my opportunity to
4 talk about what an outrage it is. Because this
5 was never a conversation about the environment.
6 This was never a conversation about trying to
7 reduce congestion. Because the starting point
8 for this was an amount of money.

9 And the single greatest thing to me
10 that demonstrates that this had nothing to do
11 with the environment or reducing congestion is
12 the fact that while we're talking about making it
13 more expensive for people to go to work, for
14 people to conduct business, for people to go to
15 visit family, for people to go to visit their
16 doctor -- while we're talking about making it
17 more expensive to drive anywhere south of
18 60th Street, what did they do? If we wanted to
19 encourage people to actually take mass transit,
20 to actually help solve the problem, they made it
21 more expensive to take the bus, more expensive to
22 take the Long Island Rail Road, more expensive to
23 take the subways, raising the fares on each. So
24 this was entirely about money.

25 And the notion that the MTA is now

1 having their public comment period which just
2 ended, so that the public could finally be heard
3 about congestion pricing, while all of the
4 charging units are already up -- it's a sham.
5 It's been a sham from day one.

6 And I cannot support the
7 continuation of this sham. And that's why I'll
8 be voting no on these nominees as a block.

9 Thank you, Madam President.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
11 Rhoads to be recorded in the negative.

12 Senator Gianaris to close.

13 SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you,
14 Madam President.

15 I just want to read an excerpt from
16 the Staten Island Advance. "Insisting that the
17 plan is the borough's best hope of getting
18 substantial money for more mass transit,
19 State Senator Lanza told the Advance yesterday he
20 is endorsing the ambitious controversial
21 proposal."

22 It goes on to say, and I quote from
23 my good colleague here if I can find the right
24 place in this article -- here it is. This is the
25 first -- quote, "This is the first real hope that

1 I think we've seen over the last 25 years for
2 real money. It would be irresponsible to ignore
3 this most valuable option I've seen for bringing
4 these monies and these improvements for
5 Staten Island."

6 I vote yes, Madam President.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
8 Gianaris to be recorded --

9 SENATOR LANZA: Madam President.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
11 Gianaris to be recorded in the affirmative.

12 Senator Lanza, why do you rise?

13 SENATOR LANZA: Point of privilege.
14 Senator Gianaris mentioned me.

15 Madam President, I do not support
16 congestion pricing. I voted against congestion
17 pricing on this floor. I debated congestion
18 pricing on this floor. I have opposed it from
19 its inception.

20 That quote in no way, shape or form
21 reflects where I've been and am on congestion
22 pricing. There was a proposal -- there was a
23 proposal. Mike Bloomberg at the time wanted to
24 put out the idea of congestion pricing. Mike
25 Bloomberg at the time said and was fashioning a

1 bill that would hold Staten Island completely
2 harmless, zero charge. And in addition, if, he
3 promised congestion pricing were ever to come to
4 pass, that not only would Staten Island be held
5 harmless -- no charge, no payment -- but he would
6 take some of the money and he would give it to
7 Staten Island, who he acknowledged had been left
8 in the dust and had been abandoned by the rest of
9 the city and the MTA.

10 So what that is talking about is not
11 congestion pricing as we are talking about it
12 today.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
14 Lanza in the negative.

15 Call the roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
18 the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: In relation to the
20 nominations, those Senators voting in the
21 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,
22 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
23 Lanza, Martinez, Martins, Mattera, Murray,
24 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,
25 Rolison, Scarcella-Spanton, Skoufis, Stec,

1 Tedisco, Weber and Weik.

2 Ayes, 39. Nays, 23.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
4 nominations have been confirmed.

5 Senator Gianaris.

6 SENATOR GIANARIS: Congratulations
7 to the nominees, Madam President.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:
9 Congratulations to the nominees.

10 (Laughter.)

11 SENATOR GIANARIS: Lets move on to
12 the controversial calendar, please.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
14 Secretary will ring the bell.

15 The Secretary will read.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 541, Assembly Bill 8866, by
18 Assemblymember Kelles, an act to amend the
19 Environmental Conservation Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
21 Borrello, why do you rise?

22 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
23 would the sponsor yield for a question?

24 SENATOR WEBB: Through you,
25 Madam President, I will yield.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
2 sponsor yields.

3 SENATOR BORRELLO: Through you,
4 Madam President, first of all, Senator Webb,
5 excuse my back as I speak into the microphone for
6 my questions.

7 SENATOR WEBB: We're still friends.
8 (Laughter.)

9 SENATOR WEBB: For now.
10 (Laughter.)

11 SENATOR BORRELLO: So this bill
12 obviously would ban a new potential type of
13 hydraulic fracturing to extract gas from the
14 earth, from the land. Can you explain how this
15 process of extracting gas with CO2 is done?

16 SENATOR WEBB: So through you,
17 Madam President, this currently is not a practice
18 that is being done. It's being proposed.

19 And one of the things that we do
20 know is that supercritical CO2 has many hazards
21 associated with it. And so what this law -- what
22 this bill will do, rather, is to close the
23 loophole on the existing law that we have which
24 bans hydrofracking.

25 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,

1 will the sponsor continue to yield.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
3 sponsor yield?

4 SENATOR WEBB: I will yield.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
6 sponsor yields.

7 SENATOR BORRELLO: So you're saying
8 there are hazards with using CO2 to extract
9 natural gas from shale. Is that correct?

10 SENATOR WEBB: That is correct.
11 Through you, Madam President. That there are
12 hazards associated with supercritical CO2 as an
13 agent with regards to extraction.

14 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
15 will the sponsor continue to yield?

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
17 sponsor yield?

18 SENATOR WEBB: Yes, I yield.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
20 sponsor yields.

21 SENATOR BORRELLO: Has the DEC
22 weighed in on those hazards? Do we have any
23 information from DEC?

24 SENATOR WEBB: So through you,
25 Madam President, there is limited data with

1 regards to this issue.

2 And in fact when this issue was
3 brought to my attention in my district, we
4 reached out to the DEC to find out if in fact
5 they had been contacted by Southern Tier
6 Solutions with regards to their proposed plans
7 around CO2 fracking. And up until this week they
8 have yet to receive any requests or any queries
9 by this company.

10 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
11 does the sponsor continue to yield?

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
13 sponsor yield?

14 SENATOR WEBB: Yes, I do.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
16 sponsor yields.

17 SENATOR BORRELLO: So if I'm doing
18 something that's not currently regulated by the
19 DEC, why would I contact them and ask them for
20 their advice?

21 SENATOR WEBB: Through you,
22 Madam President. For anything related to the
23 environment, it is my understanding that our
24 state authorities, this is part of their job.
25 And so any new company or existing company would

1 have to contact the proper authorities.

2 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
3 Will the sponsor continue to yield?

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
5 sponsor yield?

6 SENATOR WEBB: Yes, I will.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
8 Senator yields.

9 SENATOR BORRELLO: So can you tell
10 me the difference between using CO2 for hydraulic
11 fracturing and the traditional form of hydraulic
12 fracturing, also known as fracking? Can you tell
13 me the difference between those two processes?

14 SENATOR WEBB: I'm sorry, can you
15 repeat your question?

16 SENATOR BORRELLO: All right,
17 sorry. Can you explain to me what the difference
18 is between using CO2 to extract gas versus using
19 traditional forms of hydraulic fracturing using
20 water and chemicals?

21 SENATOR WEBB: (Pause.) So through
22 you, Madam President, it is a similar process but
23 it's a different substance that is proposed to be
24 used, supercritical CO2. But the process is very
25 similar.

1 And again, this is a practice that
2 we have already banned here in New York State.
3 And as I've said earlier, this bill is proposed
4 to actually close a loophole on a practice that
5 already is banned in our state. And that also
6 has very proven research records that demonstrate
7 the not only environmental hazards but public
8 health impacts, negatively speaking, with regards
9 to this practice.

10 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
11 will the sponsor continue to yield?

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
13 sponsor yield?

14 SENATOR WEBB: Yes, I'll continue
15 to yield.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
17 sponsor yields.

18 SENATOR BORRELLO: You're saying
19 that it -- traditional fracking has hazards,
20 documented hazards. But there's no documented
21 hazards with this form of fracking because it
22 hasn't been done, isn't that correct?

23 SENATOR WEBB: So through you,
24 Madam President, what we do know about
25 supercritical CO2 is that it is a volatile

1 substance. This type of practice, utilizing this
2 particular material, will lead to issues with
3 respect to corrosive -- it's corrosive in nature.
4 It is also something that is very volatile.

5 And so again, as I've said earlier,
6 that it is important that we close the loophole
7 with respect to this proposed practice before any
8 further issues ensue.

9 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
10 will the sponsor continue to yield.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
12 sponsor yield?

13 SENATOR WEBB: Yes, I do.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
15 sponsor yields.

16 SENATOR BORRELLO: So you're
17 maintaining, then, that CO2 is a volatile
18 chemical. So you're saying we don't use any
19 volatile chemicals when we do anything? Whether
20 it's, you know, mining or exploration or any
21 other type of drilling, there's no corrosive or
22 volatile chemicals that are being used? Is that
23 what you're claiming, what this would be?

24 SENATOR WEBB: (Pause.) Through
25 you, Madam President. Fracking, as we know, has

1 significant not only issues as pertains to water
2 pollution but also air pollution. And so this
3 company that is proposing this practice has not
4 proposed any environmental mitigation plans of
5 the sort with regards to their proposed plans for
6 CO2 fracking.

7 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
8 will the sponsor continue to yield?

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
10 sponsor yield?

11 SENATOR WEBB: Yes, I do.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
13 Senator yields.

14 SENATOR BORRELLO: With all due
15 respect, you're proposing to ban the whole
16 process, so why would they have to offer
17 anything? The DEC would have to come and
18 promulgate regulations if they were given the
19 opportunity to oversee the testing of this, which
20 is really what this, you know, Southern Tier CO2
21 Clean Energy Solutions is looking to do. They're
22 actually looking to use this as a pilot program.

23 So how can they be offering anything
24 as far as safety recommendations when, you know,
25 the only thing that's been offered from the State

1 of New York so far is a ban?

2 SENATOR WEBB: (Pause.) So through
3 you, Madam President. We know from when
4 fracking, hydrofracking was proposed 10 years
5 ago, research and studies have been done to show
6 that there are environmental and health hazards.

7 And that even with this proposed CO2
8 fracking, we do know that supercritical CO2 --
9 again, as I said earlier -- is a highly volatile
10 substance. It is also a substance that is
11 corrosive. When it hits the water, it most
12 certainly creates issues as it pertains to
13 environmental toxins and other issues.

14 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
15 will the sponsor continue to yield?

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
17 sponsor yield?

18 SENATOR WEBB: Yes, I will.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
20 sponsor yields.

21 SENATOR BORRELLO: Well, we use a
22 lot of volatile substances in many processes, in
23 many manufacturing processes. Drilling,
24 exploration for all kinds of things. So without
25 having the DEC actually weigh in, how will we

1 know that this is going to be potentially
2 hazardous? It's a closed-loop system that
3 they're using.

4 SENATOR WEBB: So through you,
5 Madam President, DEC did weigh in on this issue
6 10 years ago. And what they found is that there
7 are no mitigation processes that will be able to
8 address the negative impacts of hydrofracking.

9 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
10 will the sponsor continue to yield?

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
12 sponsor yield?

13 SENATOR WEBB: Yes, I do.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
15 sponsor yields.

16 SENATOR BORRELLO: Well, again,
17 they weighed in on traditional hydrofracking.
18 But also -- it was also banned, by the way, you
19 know, by the governor under executive order.
20 There was no actual due diligence by the DEC.
21 There was no scientific evaluations whatsoever.

22 So how can you compare this, which
23 is using a completely different process, using a
24 completely different chemical -- how could you
25 compare that to what we've already banned.

1 SENATOR WEBB: So through you,
2 Madam President, the DEC actually provided an
3 environmental impact statement back in 2015 with
4 regards to issues associated with hydrofracking.

5 And again, when we banned
6 hydrofracking years ago, this particular method
7 was not on the table pertaining to CO2,
8 supercritical CO2. And like with any
9 developments and with any legislation that we
10 most certainly pass, we intend for it to be
11 comprehensive. And in this case, like other
12 laws, we must most certainly close loopholes.

13 And so the DEC has again, as I said
14 earlier, made it very clear in their
15 environmental impact statement that hydrofracking
16 in any form or fashion, there are no mitigation
17 methods that can address the impacts to our
18 environment and most certainly to public health.

19 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
20 will the sponsor continue to yield?

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
22 sponsor yield?

23 SENATOR WEBB: Yes, I do.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
25 sponsor yields.

1 SENATOR BORRELLO: If I'm reading
2 correctly the bill, you address the fact that
3 essentially this is about extracting natural gas
4 to be burned in power plants. And you're opposed
5 to that as a part of this ban. Is that correct?
6 Are you opposed to using natural gas as a form of
7 fuel here in New York State?

8 SENATOR WEBB: Through you,
9 Madam President, this bill only pertains to the
10 proposal for CO2 hydrofracking.

11 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
12 on the bill.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
14 Borrello on the bill.

15 SENATOR BORRELLO: Senator Webb,
16 thank you for the engagement today.

17 You know, I represent portions of
18 the Southern Tier, as does Senator Webb,
19 Senator O'Mara. The Southern Tier runs along the
20 border of the State of Pennsylvania. The State
21 of Pennsylvania has actually been hydrofracking
22 for years. It has been an economic boon that the
23 Southern Tier of New York has not been able to
24 participate in because of the ban.

25 We talk about negative health

1 impacts and so forth. But it's literally being
2 done literally feet away from New York State --
3 in some cases, literally right on the border of
4 New York State. And yet, you know, we haven't
5 seen those health impacts, nothing documented
6 that I'm aware of.

7 But yet if there were any negative
8 impacts, we would be suffering those impacts
9 without any of the economic benefit of that
10 fracking.

11 Now, we heard during the last debate
12 about fracking that there were these supersecret
13 chemical cocktails that were used to extricate
14 natural gas from shale, and they were going to be
15 dangerous and hazardous, so on and so forth.

16 So now we have a company that's come
17 forward with a process to use CO2 -- CO2 that
18 will be pumped into the ground, and extract the
19 gas. Forced into the ground, the gas comes out.

20 CO2 is essentially a natural
21 product. And that's the why -- and certainly
22 much cleaner. Without those proprietary secret
23 chemical cocktails that we heard about before.

24 For those of you that are concerned
25 about the impacts of CO2, let me remind you.

1 When you go to a fast food restaurant and they
2 hand you a cup, you go over to the fountain, you
3 push the thing -- that's COs being forced through
4 a liquid into your cup, and then you're drinking
5 it. That's what CO2 is. Everybody has done
6 that.

7 But now we're going to say, without
8 any scientific evidence, without any due
9 diligence, without any studying, we're going to
10 shut down once again the opportunity for the
11 people of the Southern Tier to be able to extract
12 gas -- in this case, potentially without any
13 harmful impacts, without any of those secret
14 chemical cocktails, and we're going to deny those
15 landowners that opportunity. And we're going to
16 say it's because we're concerned about the
17 potential public health impacts.

18 Well, that's really kind of
19 hypocritical. Because I have heard a lot of
20 potential -- not potential but real public health
21 impacts from renewable energy projects. Public
22 health impacts from wind turbines. Public health
23 impacts from runoff from solar panels. Public
24 health impacts in several other areas -- the
25 environment, we're killing off endangered

1 species. We're actually allowing American bald
2 eagles to be beheaded by the thousands across
3 this country because we're saving the planet with
4 renewable energy.

5 So it's okay to do all that -- it's
6 okay to contaminate water supplies, it's okay to
7 have a negative impact on people's health with
8 things like infrasound. It's okay because we're
9 saving the planet here.

10 Now we have an opportunity to do
11 something without any evidence that there
12 actually is a negative health impact, but we
13 don't like that. We don't like natural gas now,
14 so we're going to ban it. And we're going to ban
15 the ability to actually extract it safely,
16 potentially even cheaper, and giving the
17 opportunity to all those folks in the
18 Southern Tier that lost out on those job
19 opportunities when we abandoned it years ago.

20 So we're not going to do that.
21 We're going to shut our eyes, listen to the most
22 extreme advocates, and say this is bad, we're
23 going to ban it. That's not fair to the people
24 of the Southern Tier, my constituents, the people
25 that lost out in the past. They have an

1 opportunity again, and now it's going to be
2 yanked away from them for political reasons.

3 So I'll be voting no on this bill.

4 Thank you.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Are
6 there any other Senators wishing to be heard?

7 Senator O'Mara.

8 SENATOR O'MARA: Yes. Thank you,
9 Madam President. Just on the bill briefly --

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
11 O'Mara on the bill.

12 SENATOR O'MARA: -- following
13 Senator Borrello's comments.

14 And the district that I represent
15 largely runs across the Pennsylvania border, the
16 Southern Tier. There are vast reserves of
17 natural gas throughout the Marcellus and Utica
18 shale across New York State. Across the counties
19 of Steuben, Chemung, Tioga, Broome, Delaware.
20 The same reserves that are just south of the
21 border in the northern tier of Pennsylvania,
22 where those citizens have gained immensely from
23 the production and recovery of natural gas.

24 Natural gas that, while half of this
25 room -- more than half -- doesn't think we're

1 going to use, natural gas is going to be a part
2 of our lives, of our energy, of our manufacturing
3 in this country for the rest of our lives, like
4 it or not.

5 We can't continue to overlook the
6 better because we want the perfect. And that's
7 what we're doing with this. That's what we're
8 doing with the CLCPA and the Climate Action
9 Council goals that have come out with no plan.
10 We've seen the result of planning in energy and
11 emissions of these majorities with the closing of
12 Indian Point nuclear plant that has resulted,
13 since its closing, in an increase of carbon
14 emissions by over 40 percent. Right into the
15 environmental justice communities that you all
16 stand up and argue and fight for every day in
17 this chamber.

18 It makes no sense. And yet we're
19 not allowed to pursue cleaner-burning, more
20 efficient natural gas that we have a wealth of
21 under our feet in the Southern Tier. Farmers,
22 landowners in the northern tier of Pennsylvania
23 have obtained immense wealth from the recovery of
24 natural gas. Our farmers, our landowners in the
25 Southern Tier of New York have been denied that

1 time and time again.

2 Now we have another opportunity
3 here. It's not hydrofracking. You're not
4 injecting some unknown chemicals, as was
5 mentioned before, that was the real reason for
6 banning hydrofracking, and the impact to the
7 aquifer with that. This is not the case. In
8 fact, there was an added benefit with this of
9 actually sequestering carbon -- carbon dioxide, a
10 greenhouse gas, underground by injecting it in
11 and getting out the natural gas that we need for
12 our everyday lives.

13 That industry, to grow and thrive in
14 New York State, is going to need low-cost energy
15 for manufacturing, which is critically important.
16 This is just one more block to doing things
17 better because we want to get to perfect.

18 Well, this utopian approach is a
19 train wreck coming down the tracks. It's going
20 to crush New York State. It's going to crush
21 communities across New York State, economically
22 devastating. And doing this on this today, with
23 absolutely no scientific review at all -- you're
24 all now the experts on whether this is feasible,
25 safe or not? It hasn't even been looked into.

1 And an opportunity to sequester a greenhouse gas.

2 This is just so shortsighted and so
3 emblematic of the whole energy plan that this
4 state thinks they have.

5 Thank you, Madam President. I vote
6 no.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
8 Stec.

9 SENATOR STEC: Thank you,
10 Madam President. On the bill.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
12 Stec on the bill.

13 SENATOR STEC: This is not
14 hydrofracking. This is a completely different
15 process. This is using carbon dioxide -- I have
16 a degree in chemical engineering. I've done some
17 work in engineering in my life around energy.

18 This bill is about turning our nose
19 up at natural gas, period. This bill is not
20 about the safety of this process or environmental
21 impacts. This is night and day. This isn't even
22 apples and oranges, this is acorns and coconuts.
23 The difference between what's been proposed and
24 the ban on hydrofracking.

25 If we want to follow the science --

1 maybe there's somebody in this room that knows
2 more about chemistry than I do, but DEC has
3 people that will do this. To deny DEC the
4 opportunity to review this and come up with a
5 permitting process because we don't like natural
6 gas is arrogant and shortsighted.

7 I'm opposed to this bill.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
9 you.

10 Are there any other Senators wishing
11 to be heard?

12 Seeing and hearing none, the debate
13 is closed. The Secretary will ring the bell.

14 Senator Gianaris.

15 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,
16 we've agreed to restore this bill to the
17 noncontroversial calendar.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Okay.
19 The bill has been restored to the
20 noncontroversial calendar.

21 Read the last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
3 Harckham to explain his vote.

4 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Thank you very
5 much, Madam President.

6 First I'd like to thank Senator Webb
7 for this legislation. I want to thank the
8 Majority Leader, Andrea Stewart-Cousins, for
9 bringing it to the floor so rapidly.

10 I fully support this bill. I want
11 to just share a few comments based on what we
12 heard during the debate from our colleagues
13 across the aisle, that fracking is somehow a boon
14 in Pennsylvania. But there are extensive
15 research studies talking about the harsh
16 environmental and public health consequences
17 fracking has had on the people of the State of
18 Pennsylvania.

19 We heard about the polluted
20 aquifers. We've heard about low birth weights
21 documented in studies. Lung disease, asthma
22 disease. So fracking has had adverse impacts --
23 the trucking, the pipelines. This has certainly
24 not been a boon to the public health of
25 Pennsylvania -- certainly not to the environment

1 in terms of water quality and other issues.

2 But to me, fracking was a bad policy
3 when the governor, former governor first by
4 executive order stopped fracking, when we then
5 subsequently banned it by legislation. And it
6 doesn't make sense to me to be pumping CO2 into
7 the ground only to extract something that is
8 80 times more harmful to heating the planet,
9 which is the methane in natural gas.

10 Remember, methane is 80 times --
11 percent more potent of a greenhouse gas warming
12 device or warming element than CO2 is. So this
13 does not make sense to me.

14 And finally, we talk about
15 economically. The point I go back to time and
16 time and time again, a kilowatt of clean energy
17 coming from solar or wind is cheaper for the
18 consumers in our districts. We want to talk
19 about economic boons, economic benefits. Solar
20 and wind are cheaper than carbon-based fuels.

21 So --

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
23 Harckham, how do you vote?

24 SENATOR HARCKHAM: I vote aye.

25 Thank you.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
2 Harckham to be recorded in the affirmative.

3 Senator May to explain her vote.

4 SENATOR MAY: Thank you,
5 Madam President.

6 I will start by endorsing everything
7 that my colleague Senator Harckham said on the
8 environmental and health problems associated with
9 hydrofracking.

10 But I also want to talk about the
11 quality-of-life issues. Because when New York
12 was considering fracking, I went down to
13 Pennsylvania to see what it did to communities
14 there. And I visited rural communities that had
15 once been bucolic and quiet and lovely places and
16 now had, 24/7, big trucks just coming through,
17 bringing the fracking liquids in and then
18 carrying the materials out at the same time.

19 Every little tiny bridge was just a
20 nightmare of traffic congestion. The noise was
21 unbelievable. And the companies that had leased
22 the land had no restrictions -- they would build
23 their derricks right next to people's front
24 doors. And the people who owned the land had no
25 say in what the companies were doing.

1 So fracking is not just an
2 environmental nightmare, but it is a
3 quality-of-life nightmare. And I am very
4 grateful to Senator Webb for bringing this bill,
5 and I vote aye.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
7 May to be recorded in the affirmative.

8 Senator Hinchey to explain her vote.

9 SENATOR HINCHEY: Thank you,
10 Madam President.

11 One of my first jobs out of college
12 was as a grassroots canvasser to actually ban
13 fracking in the State of New York before the
14 moratorium was put in place. And so while most
15 people in their early twenties are making friends
16 in their businesses and having, you know,
17 interesting conversations, every time I met with
18 a new person we were talking about hydrofracking.

19 And, you know, just to frame what
20 fracking is, it is the process of drilling down
21 into the earth and then drilling horizontally for
22 miles. And then in the case of hydrofracking, it
23 was pumping hundreds of gallons of water at
24 lightning speed through these tiny tunnels,
25 fracturing the bedrock, destabilizing the earth,

1 and often causing earthquakes.

2 I have stood with people from the
3 Southern Tier. I went to school out in Ithaca
4 when this was happening 10 years ago, 15 years
5 ago. I've stood with people who sold their
6 mineral rights on their property and then saw
7 their land completely devalued. I saw their
8 lives upended after they were sold a dream of a
9 quick way to make better cash.

10 We rightfully in the State of
11 New York banned the practice of hydrofracking.
12 And now we hear today in this chamber that the
13 same practice that we know to be dangerous, but
14 switching it with CO2 -- supercritical CO2, not
15 atmospheric CO2. Those are different things.
16 The concept of putting supercritical CO2 at high
17 velocities through these tiny tunnels to fracture
18 the bedrock again to extract more gas is somehow
19 going to be safe. We know that's just not true.
20 It's not the CO2 that's in the bottle machine.
21 It is a completely different compound.

22 And so I am incredibly proud that
23 this body is bringing this bill to the floor to a
24 vote. I thank our colleagues in the Assembly for
25 passing it. And I thank my colleagues Senator

1 Webb and Senator Krueger for spearheading this
2 initiative.

3 And I'm incredibly proud to vote aye
4 on this bill. Thank you very much.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
6 Hinchey to be recorded in the affirmative.

7 Senator Borrello to explain his
8 vote.

9 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you,
10 Madam President.

11 I just want to address some of the
12 comments made about how these communities were
13 transformed negatively by fracking in their
14 areas. I would just debate that in general.

15 But I would also invite my
16 colleagues to come to some places in my district
17 that are experiencing the negative impacts of
18 industrial wind turbines. The community of
19 Arkwright that was sold a bill of goods, the
20 streets were going to be paved with gold because
21 of all the money they were going to make off of
22 wind turbines. And now they tell me that 24/7 it
23 sounds like a jet that never lands over their
24 house constantly. They can't sleep at night.
25 People have had issues with sleeping. I've had

1 Farmers tell me that chickens are not laying eggs
2 anymore because of the infrasound.

3 So it's hypocritical to say that
4 we're going to ban something that we have no idea
5 about when we're not even willing to admit that
6 there are problems with industrial wind turbines
7 and solar panels.

8 So once again, I vote no. Thank
9 you.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
11 Borrello to be recorded in the negative.

12 Senator Krueger to explain her vote.

13 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you very
14 much, Madam President.

15 I was in and out during the debate,
16 and so I don't want to be repeating anything
17 that's already been said.

18 So I just want to proudly vote yes
19 and explain the science is clear. People that
20 have their disagreements of other things going on
21 in their communities and other things going on,
22 frankly, with an energy -- we had extensive
23 debate about energy yesterday. This isn't about
24 energy. This is a model that, if it was allowed
25 to go forward, would be killing people,

1 destroying land, killing agriculture.

2 We know from our fights 10 years ago
3 the insurance industry immediately said we're not
4 going to insure any land that fracking goes on
5 underneath because we know how toxic it will be
6 to everyone involved.

7 And this is so much more dangerous,
8 as I'm sure many people explained today. It's
9 inconceivable that this would be allowed. And so
10 I'm very glad that with our action today --
11 because I'm quite sure the Governor will sign
12 this bill -- we will ensure the protection of
13 New Yorkers from yet another extremely, extremely
14 dangerous process that we have no business
15 allowing in any part of New York.

16 I vote yes, Madam President.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
18 Krueger to be recorded in the affirmative.

19 Senator Hoylman-Sigal to explain his
20 vote.

21 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Thank you,
22 Madam President.

23 I just want to rise and join my
24 colleagues in support of this bill, and want to
25 thank Senator Webb particularly for her

1 leadership.

2 Just to point out that today there's
3 been some evidence of climate change denialism on
4 this floor. Earlier you heard members opposing
5 board members to the MTA because they are opposed
6 wholesale to congestion pricing. And now you
7 hear our friends across the aisle opposing this
8 new method of extracting fossil fuels.

9 Our own State Department of
10 Environmental Conservation has determined that by
11 the 2030s we will have sea level rise in parts of
12 New York, including my district, up 13 inches.
13 Thirteen inches will mean that parts of my
14 district will disappear.

15 So we must do everything in our
16 power to combat the use of fossil fuels. I
17 strongly vote aye. Thank you, Senator Webb.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
19 Hoylman-Sigal to be recorded in the affirmative.

20 Senator Webb to explain her vote and
21 to close.

22 SENATOR WEBB: Thank you,
23 Madam President.

24 So I appreciate, you know,
25 colleagues', you know, comments and most

1 certainly the debate. But I want to level-set a
2 little bit here.

3 I was well-involved on this issue
4 way before coming into the Senate. And as
5 someone who was born and raised in the
6 Southern Tier when hydrofracking started in our
7 neighboring State of Pennsylvania, I met with
8 residents and leaders there. And I will tell you
9 that those issues with regards to health outcomes
10 are very real.

11 When you talk about exposure, the
12 environmental hazards that lead to very real
13 health implications and changes, as a
14 representative of the Southern Tier but, more
15 importantly, as a concerned citizen, I refuse to
16 have my district or, quite frankly, any resident
17 in the State of New York to be a guinea pig for a
18 practice to have a pilot that we know that
19 CO2 mining is quite simply hydrofracking but just
20 called by a different name.

21 We know, as evidence has
22 demonstrated over many years of research, that
23 this isn't an extreme approach with regards to
24 the ban on hydrofracking. This is fueled by
25 science, by research, and by real people's

1 stories with regards to the impacts on their
2 lives.

3 In my opinion, there is no dollar
4 sign or no amount of money that can cover the
5 cost of long-term healthcare implications for
6 these type of practices. And let's talk about
7 what some of those health conditions are:
8 Cardiovascular disease, COPD. For people who are
9 suffering from asthma due to environmental toxins
10 and things that they had no control over, what
11 amount of money is good enough for them? And the
12 answer is there is none.

13 It is our responsibility as public
14 officials to do all that we can not only to
15 protect the environment but to protect the health
16 and well-being of our residents here in the State
17 of New York.

18 Now, one of my colleagues pointed
19 out with regards to CO2 that we need to have more
20 opportunities to study. And one of the things
21 that we do know with regards to CO2 is that once
22 it hits -- and I want to make sure I quote this
23 properly, that CO2 converts to carbonic acid in
24 the presence of moisture, making it
25 corrosion-prone.

1 Now, you don't need to be a
2 scientist to know that corrosive materials are
3 bad.

4 And so when you talk about the
5 impacts and the implications of this new proposed
6 practice -- again, hydrofracking just being
7 called by a different name -- it is our
8 responsibility to do all that we can to ensure
9 not only the safety of our environment and the
10 health of our residents now, but also for the
11 future.

12 Madam President, I proudly vote aye,
13 and I thank all of my colleagues --
14 Senator Krueger, for also helping to lead this
15 fight for many years, and also Senator Harckham,
16 our Senate Majority Leader, and of course the
17 bill sponsors in the Assembly,
18 Assemblymember Kelles and Assemblymember Lupardo.

19 Thank you, Madam President.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
21 Webb to be recorded in the affirmative.

22 Announce the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
24 Calendar 541, those Senators voting in the
25 negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello,

1 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
2 Lanza, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt,
3 Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco, Weber and Weik.

4 Ayes, 45. Nays, 17.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
6 is passed.

7 Senator -- (throwing hands up).

8 (Laughter.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
10 Serrano, that completes the reading of the
11 calendar.

12 SENATOR SERRANO: Thank you,
13 Madam President.

14 On page 15 I offer the following
15 amendments to Calendar Number 269, by
16 Senator Mannion, Senate Print Number 3141. I ask
17 that the said bill retain its place on Third
18 Reading Calendar.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
20 amendments are received, and the bill will retain
21 its place on the Third Reading Calendar.

22 Senator Serrano.

23 SENATOR SERRANO: Is there any
24 further business at the desk?

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: There is

1 no further business at the desk.

2 SENATOR SERRANO: I move to adjourn
3 until tomorrow, Thursday, March 21st, at
4 11:00 a.m.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: On
6 motion, the Senate stands adjourned until
7 Thursday, March 21st, at 11:00 a.m.

8 (Whereupon, at 5:40 p.m., the Senate
9 adjourned.)

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25