

1 NEW YORK STATE SENATE

2

3

4 THE STENOGRAPHIC RECORD

5

6

7

8

9 ALBANY, NEW YORK

10

March 18, 2024

11

3:27 p.m.

12

13

14

REGULAR SESSION

15

16

17

18

SENATOR JAMAAL T. BAILEY, Acting President

19

ALEJANDRA N. PAULINO, ESQ., Secretary

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The  
3 Senate will come to order.

4 I ask everyone present to please  
5 rise and recite the Pledge of Allegiance.

6 (Whereupon, the assemblage recited  
7 the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: In the  
9 absence of clergy, let us bow our heads in a  
10 moment of silent reflection or prayer.

11 (Whereupon, the assemblage respected  
12 a moment of silence.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Reading  
14 of the Journal.

15 THE SECRETARY: In Senate, Sunday,  
16 March 17, 2024, the Senate met pursuant to  
17 adjournment. The Journal of Saturday, March 16,  
18 2024, was read and approved. On motion, the  
19 Senate adjourned.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Without  
21 objection, the Journal stands approved as read.

22 Presentation of petitions.

23 Messages from the Assembly.

24 Messages from the Governor.

25 Reports of standing committees.

1 Reports of select committees.

2 Communications and reports from  
3 state officers.

4 Motions and resolutions.

5 Senator Gianaris.

6 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,  
7 we're going to begin by recognizing  
8 Senator Scarcella-Spanton for an introduction.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator  
10 Scarcella-Spanton for the purposes of an  
11 introduction.

12 SENATOR SCARCELLA-SPANTON: Good  
13 afternoon, everybody.

14 I rise today with perfect timing, as  
15 she walks in, to pay tribute to an extraordinary  
16 young woman. Today I got the opportunity to  
17 acknowledge Kamora Freeland, who at the age of  
18 just 17 has made history by becoming the youngest  
19 African-American female licensed pilot. Yes, she  
20 deserves a little cheer.

21 (Applause.)

22 SENATOR SCARCELLA-SPANTON: Through  
23 a twist of fate, and with the encouragement of  
24 her mother, Kamora found her passion for flying  
25 airplanes in an aviation program for children

1 spearheaded by two NYC police officers.

2 In July 2022 Kamora received a  
3 scholarship from the United Youth Aviators,  
4 taking her first flight and discovering a  
5 profound connection to the skies, which fueled  
6 her to earn her student pilot license.

7 Kamora's leadership and  
8 determination extends well beyond the clouds.  
9 She is also dedicated to serving her community,  
10 volunteering at Little Leaders Learning Castle  
11 Preschool, Kids Corner Daycare, Black Pilots of  
12 America, and her community food pantry.

13 Kamora's dedication to service and  
14 leadership has earned her numerous accolades and  
15 invitations to prestigious events, including the  
16 National Youth Leadership Forum and the Congress  
17 of Future Medical Leaders Award of Excellence.

18 Her story is one of resilience,  
19 determination and endless potential. As she  
20 continues to take off to new horizons, may her  
21 achievement inspire all of us to soar toward our  
22 dreams without any turbulence. And truly she is  
23 such an impressive young woman, she just got a  
24 full scholarship to Spelman University.

25 (Applause.)

1                   SENATOR SCARCELLA-SPANTON:    And I  
2   am so excited to have her here.  We have some of  
3   the coolest constituents in the 23rd District.

4                   So thank you and your family, and to  
5   the Tuskegee group as well for joining us today.

6                   Thank you, Kamora, and  
7   congratulations on your achievement.

8                   MS. FREELAND:    (From gallery.)

9   Thank you.

10                   (Applause.)

11                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    To  
12   Ms. Freeland.  May you continue to aspire and  
13   rise well above all of us -- 50,000 feet up in  
14   the air.  May one of us get on your flight in the  
15   future.

16                   We extend to you all of the  
17   privileges and courtesies of this house.  Please  
18   rise and be recognized.

19                   (Standing ovation.)

20                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Senator  
21   Gianaris.

22                   SENATOR GIANARIS:    Mr. President,  
23   now let's recognize Senator Mayer for another  
24   introduction.

25                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Senator

1 Mayer for the purposes of an introduction.

2 SENATOR MAYER: Thank you,  
3 Mr. President.

4 I rise to introduce Ronen and Orna  
5 Neutra, residents of Plainview, Long Island, who  
6 are here with us today in their efforts to have  
7 their son, Omer Neutra, an American citizen, and  
8 all of the other hostages immediately released.

9 Omer was kidnapped by Hamas 164 days  
10 ago, and we are here today in solidarity with  
11 their efforts to bring him and the other hostages  
12 home.

13 Personally, I stand here in awe of  
14 their bravery and strength in their efforts to  
15 get their son home. But as a parent and  
16 grandparent, like all of us -- so many of us -- I  
17 find this so difficult.

18 Omer was 21 when he was taken  
19 hostage and is now 22. He grew up in Plainview,  
20 Long Island, was a leader in his school, captain  
21 on his basketball, volleyball and soccer team,  
22 and a leader in his Jewish youth group, the  
23 United Synagogue Youth.

24 After high school, though admitted  
25 to attend Binghamton University, he decided to

1 spend a gap year in Israel.

2 Today I heard his mother and his  
3 father talk about him as a leader, a convener, an  
4 empathetic and caring person who chose to do what  
5 he believed was right and encourage others to do  
6 the same. Hearing this makes this so very  
7 painful.

8 As Americans and New Yorkers, Ronen  
9 and Orna deserve that their government do  
10 everything possible to ensure his safety and  
11 immediate release. It is only fitting that we as  
12 state leaders meet with them and hear that story.  
13 Many of us have done that today.

14 I believe we need our government to  
15 do more. This is not about being Jewish or not  
16 being Jewish. I speak proudly as an American  
17 Jew, but this is about being human, about lifting  
18 up this family and this effort. The Neutra  
19 family's fight to bring Omer home needs to be all  
20 of our fights.

21 This is not the place for the  
22 dispute about the politics of the Middle East.  
23 This is simply about making release of the  
24 hostages front and center in this moment, to  
25 ensure their loved ones know about their

1 condition and, sadly, to bring the bodies of  
2 those who died home to their families.

3 But even so, as an American citizen,  
4 a New Yorker -- someone who we would celebrate  
5 and honor -- it is especially important. In this  
6 chamber we speak on many important issues, but  
7 this one is different. It's bipartisan. It's  
8 personal. It's emotional, and so critical.

9 I'm proud to be standing for Omer  
10 and all the other hostages to insist that they be  
11 released and returned to their loved ones. I'm  
12 honored to acknowledge Ronen and Orna and their  
13 courage. Let us pray for the immediate release  
14 of Omer and others to all those who love them.

15 Thank you to my colleague  
16 Assemblywoman Nily Rozic, who arranged this  
17 visit.

18 Mr. President, please acknowledge  
19 them, pray with them, and ensure that we give  
20 them all the respect of this house.

21 Thank you.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: To the  
23 Neutra family, we applaud you and we thank you  
24 for your courage. (In Hebrew.) We are together  
25 with you. (In Hebrew.)

1                   Please rise and be recognized and  
2 receive all of the privileges and courtesies of  
3 this house, and the prayers of this house.

4                   (Standing ovation.)

5                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:     Senator  
6 Gianaris.

7                   SENATOR GIANARIS:     Thank you,  
8 Mr. President.

9                   Let me also add my words of welcome  
10 to the Neutra family and let them know that we're  
11 all praying for the safe return of their son.

12                   I have two motions, Mr. President.

13                   Amendments are offered to the  
14 following Third Reading Calendar bills:

15                   By Senator Skoufis, page 18,  
16 Calendar 332, Senate Print 5500;

17                   By Senator Rivera, page 28, Calendar  
18 454, Senate Print 8470.

19                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:     The  
20 amendments are received, and the bills will  
21 retain their place on the Third Reading Calendar.

22                   Senator Gianaris.

23                   SENATOR GIANARIS:     Please take up  
24 the reading of the calendar.

25                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:     The

1 Secretary will read.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
3 223, Senate Print 346, by Senator Gounardes, an  
4 act to amend the Labor Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
8 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it  
9 shall have become a law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
14 the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
16 Calendar 223, those Senators voting in the  
17 negative are Senators Borrello, Gallivan,  
18 Helming, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Rhoads  
19 and Tedisco.

20 Ayes, 46. Nays, 9.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
22 is passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
24 309, Senate Print 101A, by Senator Ryan, an act  
25 to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Read the  
2   last section.

3                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 9.  This  
4   act shall take effect one year after it shall  
5   have become a law.

6                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Call the  
7   roll.

8                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

9                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Announce  
10  the results.

11                   THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 55.

12                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    The bill  
13  is passed.

14                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
15  354, Senate Print 965, by Senator Bailey, an act  
16  authorizing and directing the Commissioner of  
17  Education to conduct a study on the number of  
18  children who are caregivers.

19                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Read the  
20  last section.

21                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 3.  This  
22  act shall take effect immediately.

23                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Call the  
24  roll.

25                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Announce  
2   the results.

3                   THE SECRETARY:     Ayes, 55.

4                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    The bill  
5   is passed.

6                   THE SECRETARY:     Calendar Number  
7   358, Senate Print 540, by Senator Thomas, an act  
8   to amend the General Business Law.

9                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Read the  
10  last section.

11                  THE SECRETARY:     Section 3.  This  
12  act shall take effect immediately.

13                  ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Call the  
14  roll.

15                                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

16                  ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Announce  
17  the results.

18                  THE SECRETARY:     Ayes, 55.

19                  ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    The bill  
20  is passed.

21                  THE SECRETARY:     Calendar Number  
22  359, Senate Print 682, by Senator Comrie, an act  
23  to amend the General Business Law.

24                  SENATOR GIANARIS:    Lay it aside for  
25  the day.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    The bill  
2 will be laid aside for the day.

3                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
4 420, Senate Print 14, by Senator Gounardes, an  
5 act to amend the General Obligations Law.

6                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Read the  
7 last section.

8                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 2. This  
9 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it  
10 shall have become a law.

11                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Call the  
12 roll.

13                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

14                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Announce  
15 the results.

16                   THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
17 Calendar 420, those Senators voting in the  
18 negative are Senators Borrello,  
19 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,  
20 Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker,  
21 O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec,  
22 Tedisco, Weber and Weik.

23                   Ayes, 37. Nays, 19.

24                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    The bill  
25 is passed.

1                   THE SECRETARY:     Calendar Number  
2     423, Senate Print 1610, by Senator Hoylman-Sigal,  
3     an act to amend the Real Property Law.

4                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:     Read the  
5     last section.

6                   THE SECRETARY:     Section 4. This  
7     act shall take effect on the 60th day after it  
8     shall have become a law.

9                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:     Call the  
10    roll.

11                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

12                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:     Announce  
13    the results.

14                   THE SECRETARY:     In relation to  
15    Calendar 423, those Senators voting in the  
16    negative are Senators Borrello,  
17    Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,  
18    Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker,  
19    O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec,  
20    Tedisco, Weber and Weik.

21                   Ayes, 37. Nays, 19.

22                   SENATOR O'MARA:     The bill is  
23    passed.

24                   THE SECRETARY:     Calendar Number  
25    473, Senate Print 147A, by Senator Gianaris, an

1 act to amend the Public Health Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
5 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it  
6 shall have become a law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce  
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 56.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
16 485, Senate Print 5007B, by Senator Gonzalez, an  
17 act to amend the State Technology Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This  
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 56.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
6 517, Senate Print 1160, by Senator Skoufis, an  
7 act to amend the Education Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the  
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
11 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it  
12 shall have become a law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the  
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill  
17 is passed.

18 Senator Gianaris, that completes the  
19 reading of today's calendar.

20 SENATOR GIANARIS: Is there any  
21 further business at the desk?

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: There is  
23 no further business at the desk.

24 SENATOR GIANARIS: Move to adjourn  
25 until tomorrow, Tuesday, March 19th, at 3:00 p.m.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    On  
2                   motion, the Senate stands adjourned until  
3                   Tuesday, March 19th, at 3:00 p.m.

4                                 (Whereupon, at 3:41 p.m., the Senate  
5                   adjourned.)

6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25