

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

NEW YORK STATE SENATE

THE STENOGRAPHIC RECORD

ALBANY, NEW YORK

January 16, 2024

3:22 p.m.

REGULAR SESSION

SENATOR ROXANNE J. PERSAUD, Acting President

ALEJANDRA N. PAULINO, ESQ., Secretary

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
3 Senate will come to order.

4 I ask everyone present to please
5 rise and recite the Pledge of Allegiance.

6 (Whereupon, the assemblage recited
7 the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: In the
9 absence of clergy, let us bow our heads in a
10 moment of silent reflection or prayer.

11 (Whereupon, the assemblage respected
12 a moment of silence.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Reading
14 of the Journal.

15 THE SECRETARY: In Senate,
16 Saturday, January 13, 2024, the Senate met
17 pursuant to adjournment. The Journal of Friday,
18 January 12, 2024, was read and approved. On
19 motion, the Senate adjourned.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Without
21 objection, the Journal stands approved as read.

22 Presentation of petitions.

23 Messages from the Assembly.

24 Messages from the Governor.

25 Reports of standing committees.

1 Reports of select committees.

2 Communications and reports from
3 state officers.

4 Motions and resolutions.

5 Senator Gianaris.

6 SENATOR GIANARIS: Good afternoon,
7 Madam President.

8 Can we begin by taking up
9 Privileged Resolution 1667, read that
10 resolution's title only, and recognize
11 Leader Stewart-Cousins.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: There is
13 a privileged resolution at the desk.

14 The Secretary will read.

15 THE SECRETARY: Senate Resolution
16 1667, by Senator Stewart-Cousins, congratulating
17 the Pace University Women's Lacrosse Team upon
18 the occasion of capturing the 2023 NCAA
19 Division II Women's Lacrosse Championship on
20 May 21, 2023.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Leader
22 Stewart-Cousins on the resolution.

23 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: Thank
24 you, Madam President.

25 I am so honored to welcome the

1 Pace Women's Lacrosse Team, who are champions,
2 national champions in their sport.

3 (Applause.)

4 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: These
5 women started out, they ranked No. 3, and they
6 got to be No. 1. They are the first NCAA
7 collegiate team in Westchester County to win a
8 national championship. Good to know.

9 (Applause.)

10 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: And I
11 thought that it would be great to have them here,
12 because not only are they extraordinary -- and I
13 happen to be a double alum from Pace, and I
14 happen to represent them -- but they also, under
15 the leadership of their coach, Tricia Molfetta,
16 most of them are New Yorkers, most of them have
17 never been to our beautiful Capitol, and most of
18 them were -- certainly all of them were born
19 after the Title IX enactment which allowed for
20 the government to acknowledge women's ability to
21 play sports and to be funded the way that men's
22 teams were funded.

23 I grew up in a time where girls were
24 expected to be cheerleaders, stay on the
25 sidelines, and not really participate in serious

1 sports. It's important to know that government
2 works in many ways to level the playing field.
3 And when we level the playing field, we get to
4 see excellence from everyone.

5 So these young women, who proudly
6 took Westchester County and New York State into a
7 national arena in a very, very tough game --
8 lacrosse is not an easy -- easy sport, certainly
9 not for the faint of heart. But they emerged not
10 only champions, but representing a new level of
11 excellence for the people of our state, for
12 certainly the people of my county, and for women
13 everywhere.

14 So I want to congratulate our team.
15 And thank you for coming. You braved one of the
16 toughest days of the year to be here. But I hope
17 that you have found your trip here gratifying,
18 and know that we are inspired by your national
19 success.

20 Thank you so much.

21 (Applause.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
23 you, Madam Leader.

24 Senator Bailey on the resolution.

25 SENATOR BAILEY: Thank you,

1 Madam President.

2 Thank you, Madam Leader, for
3 introducing this resolution. Title IX -- you
4 made it from Title IX to national title. I think
5 that is an incredible accomplishment.

6 And if not for the recognition that
7 women are not just equal, but can exceed us as
8 men in sports. I look at Serena Williams, who is
9 the greatest athlete of all time, in my humble
10 opinion. To do what she's been able to do while
11 pregnant in a major, if you know the story, has
12 been nothing short of fantastic.

13 But nothing short of fantastic is --
14 is bringing a national championship home to Pace.
15 And I'm -- I start thinking about it because I'm
16 a huge sports fan, and so I think about the
17 levels that you had to go through, not just
18 during the games. Because during the games, yes,
19 you can be on. But the hours of practice that
20 nobody saw, the dedication that it took, the --
21 the -- it's not only because you're student
22 athletes, and the student is first. So you have
23 to make sure that you continue to keep your
24 minimum grade point average in order to be
25 eligible to play. And I'm sure that you're more

1 than eligible to play.

2 In order to do that, you had to
3 balance an incredibly challenging academic and
4 rigorous academic schedule, with a really
5 rigorous national championship level of play.

6 And so I just wanted to congratulate
7 you as -- as a resident -- excuse me, as a
8 representative of Westchester County and as a
9 father of two daughters who are athletically
10 inclined, well more so than their father --

11 (Laughter.)

12 SENATOR BAILEY: -- who hopefully,
13 I don't know if they're going to pick up
14 lacrosse. They -- they haven't done so as of
15 yet. They've both got a mean crossover and a
16 good jump shot, so maybe they'll be national
17 champions of their own.

18 But you should know that there are
19 legions of young girls that you don't know, that
20 you haven't met and you may not meet, that look
21 up to you, that idolize you, that appreciate you.

22 So understand that. Understand that
23 you are incredible, you are amazing, and you are
24 national champions.

25 Congratulations.

1 (Applause.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
3 Mayer on the resolution.

4 SENATOR MAYER: Thank you,
5 Madam President.

6 And thank you, Leader, for bringing
7 this important resolution to the floor.

8 And as someone who lives in
9 Westchester, and proud to represent Westchester,
10 I just could not be more thrilled than to see you
11 all up there with those beautiful smiles, really
12 taking in this day and this beautiful place.

13 I want to remind everybody that your
14 winning game was 19 to 9, the most goals ever
15 scored in a Division II women's lacrosse game.
16 And it is an incredible accomplishment.

17 The other thing I want to say is I
18 always say that people should engage in team
19 sports before they run for office, because you do
20 learn this lesson of teamwork. You do learn to
21 trust each other. You learn to put yourself not
22 always first. And you also put your faith in --
23 in your coach.

24 And I want to thank you, Coach,
25 Coach Molfetta for her leadership and obviously

1 her incredible talents in getting you there.

2 But if you all want to run for
3 office, some of us are getting old and live in
4 Westchester, so just come see me afterwards.

5 (Laughter.)

6 SENATOR MAYER: I look forward to
7 coaching you in the -- in the paths of -- of
8 politics. But you have all the skills you'll
9 need to succeed.

10 Congratulations.

11 (Applause.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
13 Weber on the resolution.

14 SENATOR WEBER: Thank you.

15 Thank you, Leader, for bringing this
16 resolution forward today. You know, I'm a
17 1991 proud alumni of Pace University in
18 Pleasantville, so we're proud to recognize you
19 here today.

20 You know, as -- as a lot of us here,
21 I have young daughters, two young daughters, one
22 who plays field hockey at RPI who played lacrosse
23 for Suffern. And, you know, Suffern grows great
24 girls lacrosse teams. Over the years she went
25 into field hockey. But I know the commitment

1 that it takes to really excel at that level.
2 And, you know, you did -- you did Pace proud, you
3 did -- you did New York proud. And I
4 congratulate you and thank you for being here
5 today.

6 And thank you, Leader, for bringing
7 this to the floor.

8 (Applause.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
10 Harckham on the resolution.

11 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Thank you,
12 Madam President.

13 Thank you, Madam Leader, for
14 bringing this resolution to the floor.

15 Congratulations. I stand because
16 until recently with redistricting, I used to
17 represent Pace. And I'm right -- right over the
18 line is the district line, and was proud to work
19 with the administration on the Student Veterans
20 Center, which is in the Student Center.

21 But I want to follow up on -- on
22 what -- what my colleagues were talking about
23 regarding Title IX and the development of young
24 women and leadership abilities. Because as was
25 mentioned, it's not just about sports. Yes, you

1 did an incredible thing, and you will remember
2 this for the rest of the -- your lives. But the
3 skills that you are learning -- teamwork, setting
4 goals, overcoming obstacles, overcoming
5 challenges -- these will serve you for the rest
6 of your life.

7 And -- and I -- I used to coach
8 youth soccer in -- in my town, just a town
9 league. But some of these -- these then young
10 girls, then young women, went on to play travel
11 and sports at a higher level. And there are
12 times when I'm -- I'll be in the grocery store
13 and just this remarkably polished and
14 accomplished young woman will come up to me:
15 "Coach Pete, Coach Pete!" And -- and it's
16 certainly nothing that I did. But the process
17 they were on. And doctors, academics, now in the
18 business community, and it's because of the
19 skills that they learned in athletics and being
20 part of team sports, as Senator Mayer mentioned.

21 So we're glad you're here.
22 Congratulations. Godspeed. And come back with
23 number two next year. Thank you.

24 (Applause.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator

1 Fernandez on the resolution.

2 SENATOR FERNANDEZ: Thank you,
3 Madam President.

4 I will be remiss as a fellow lady
5 legislator from Westchester that I do not stand
6 up and congratulate you amazing ladies for your
7 achievement. Nationals is a big deal. So we all
8 know, all over this country, many students such
9 as like yourself have done the -- the time, the
10 dedication, the training, the teamwork building
11 to get to this level. And you have done it.

12 You're making New York proud.
13 You're making us women proud. Congratulations
14 again and again and again. And I look forward to
15 seeing you again in No. 1 place.

16 Thank you.

17 (Applause.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: So
19 before I congratulate you on behalf of the
20 Senate, as a Pace University alum from New York
21 City multiple times over, congratulations,
22 ladies. It is great to see you doing great
23 things. Congratulations to all of you.

24 So to our guests, I welcome you on
25 behalf of the Senate. We extend to you the

1 privileges and courtesies of this house. Please
2 all stand and be recognized.

3 (Standing ovation.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
5 question is on the resolution. All in favor
6 signify by saying aye.

7 (Response of "Aye.")

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Opposed,
9 nay.

10 (No response.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
12 resolution is adopted.

13 Senator Gianaris.

14 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,
15 we have an additional privileged resolution at
16 the desk, Resolution 1668. Let's take that one
17 up next, read it in its entirety, and recognize
18 Leader Stewart-Cousins.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: There's
20 a privileged resolution at the desk.

21 The Secretary will read.

22 THE SECRETARY: Senate Resolution
23 1668, by Senator Stewart-Cousins, commemorating
24 the observance of the 39th Annual Martin Luther
25 King, Jr. Day in the State of New York, on

1 January 15, 2024.

2 "WHEREAS, From time to time we take
3 note of certain individuals whom we wish to
4 recognize for their valued contributions and to
5 publicly acknowledge their endeavors which have
6 enhanced the basic humanity among us all; and

7 "WHEREAS, Attendant to such concern,
8 and in full accord with its long-standing
9 traditions, it is the custom of this
10 Legislative Body to join the people of this great
11 Empire State in proudly observing the 39th Annual
12 Martin Luther King, Jr. Day in the State of
13 New York, on January 15, 2024, taking note of his
14 many accomplishments and contributions to
15 mankind; and

16 "WHEREAS, Dr. Martin Luther King,
17 Jr. was born the grandson of a slave into a
18 segregated society in Atlanta, Georgia, on
19 January 15, 1929, and was instrumental in
20 formulating a policy which ultimately destroyed
21 legal apartheid in the southern states of our
22 nation; and

23 "WHEREAS, In February of 1968,
24 Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. spoke about the
25 inevitability of his death and hoped that when we

1 spoke of his life, we would not concentrate on
2 his academic achievements: that he graduated from
3 Morehouse College, that he attended the Crozer
4 Theological Seminary and Boston University, where
5 he earned a doctorate in systematic theology; and

6 "WHEREAS, After returning from
7 Crozer, Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. delivered his
8 first sermon at Ebenezer Baptist Church in
9 Atlanta and became the church's co-pastor with
10 his father; and

11 "WHEREAS, Dr. Martin Luther King,
12 Jr., a truly humble man, also did not find it
13 important that we mention that he won the Nobel
14 Peace Prize and over 300 other awards; and

15 "WHEREAS, Dr. Martin Luther King,
16 Jr.'s finest legacy of greater social justice for
17 all Americans was truly reflected in his devotion
18 to serve and respect others, and in his steadfast
19 love for all humanity; and

20 "WHEREAS, Standing in a long line of
21 great American Black leaders, Dr. Martin Luther
22 King, Jr. represents the historical culmination
23 and the living embodiment of a spirit of united
24 purpose rooted in Black African culture and the
25 American dream; and

1 "WHEREAS, An apostle of peace,
2 Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. fought unrelentingly
3 for the civil rights of all Americans and taught
4 us that, through nonviolence, courage displaces
5 fear, love transforms hate, acceptance dissipates
6 prejudice and mutual regard cancels enmity; and

7 "WHEREAS, Dr. Martin Luther King,
8 Jr. manifestly contributed to the cause of
9 America's freedom, and his commitment to human
10 dignity is visibly mirrored in the spiritual,
11 economic and political dimensions of the civil
12 rights movement; and

13 "WHEREAS, In addition, Dr. Martin
14 Luther King, Jr.'s life was devoted to the
15 liberation of his people, and his courage
16 transcended the advocates of mindless
17 retrenchment; and

18 "WHEREAS, It is the sense of this
19 Legislative Body that the common and shared
20 responsibility of governance demands an
21 irrevocable commitment to the preservation and
22 enhancement of human dignity as exemplified by
23 Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr.; and

24 "WHEREAS, Upon the occasion of the
25 celebration of the birthday of Dr. Martin Luther

1 King, Jr., it is the practice of this
2 Legislative Body to commemorate the heroic
3 efforts of Dr. King, who loved and served
4 humanity, and who was a drum major for peace,
5 justice and righteousness; and

6 "WHEREAS, The 2024 Dr. Martin Luther
7 King, Jr. holiday observance marks the
8 95th anniversary of his birth, and the 39th
9 annual holiday celebrated in the State of
10 New York in his honor; now, therefore, be it

11 "RESOLVED, That this Legislative
12 Body pause in its deliberations to memorialize
13 and pay tribute to the legendary life and
14 achievements of Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr., upon
15 the occasion of the anniversary of his birth and
16 the celebration of Martin Luther King, Jr. Day in
17 the State of New York and throughout the nation;
18 and be it further

19 "RESOLVED, That a copy of this
20 resolution, suitably engrossed, be transmitted to
21 the Black, Puerto Rican, Hispanic and Asian
22 Legislative Caucus."

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Leader
24 Stewart-Cousins on the resolution.

25 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: Thank

1 you, Madam President.

2 Yesterday was the celebration of
3 Reverend Dr. Martin Luther King's birthday, and
4 it's one that I have the privilege to mark in my
5 district and beyond. Fortunately, there were
6 about five different events that I had the
7 privilege of attending. And I'm happy that there
8 were five different events because each event
9 reminds us of where we came from, where we are,
10 and where we have to go.

11 And as I think of this celebration
12 not only of our team, but now the recognition of
13 Reverend Dr. Martin Luther King, and how it is
14 also intertwined. Dr. King's struggle for the
15 American dream was deeply and still is deeply
16 rooted in our Constitution, and the Constitution
17 that says that all men are created equal.

18 And the expansion of what that means
19 through voting, through electing people who will
20 understand the magnitude of creating equal
21 justice for all, allows for the emergence of
22 legislation and policies that bring the talents
23 of all people to this great nation.

24 So back in 1965 when the Voting
25 Rights Act was signed, as a result of the

1 marches, the peaceful marches, the journey which
2 was not peaceful over the Edmund Pettus Bridge,
3 where people were hosed and -- and dogs set upon
4 them, beaten, was so that people could have the
5 right to vote, so that people would be brought
6 into these chambers and given an opportunity to
7 articulate legislatively the American dream.

8 The American dream that allows for
9 me to stand here as the leader of the Senate, for
10 you to be acting as presiding officer, and for
11 all of us, no matter where we came from, the
12 different shores that many of us traveled from,
13 to be in this chamber, to be able to create
14 policy that continues to bring forth the
15 Constitution that says all men are created equal.

16 That's what Dr. King stood for. And
17 that's why we continue to honor his legacy. Some
18 years you feel that everybody gets it and we're
19 all doing well, and the celebration of Dr. King
20 is perfunctory: Oh, Dr. King, we shall overcome.

21 My two-and-a-half-year-old twin
22 grandchildren sing a song about Dr. Martin Luther
23 King. They can barely figure out what they're
24 saying, but they do know how to say "No fighting,
25 no fighting." My 21-year-old grandson turned 21

1 on Dr. King's birthday. The difference in
2 understanding of my two and-a-half-year-olds and
3 my 21-year-old are quite profound. And I think
4 it represents a lot of us. Some of us never
5 understood the struggle, and some of us struggle
6 every single day. Some of us know the words but
7 not the music, and some of us just know the
8 music.

9 But I who had the privilege of being
10 alive when the civil rights struggle was at its
11 height, I who have stood in this chamber over and
12 over again talking about where my parents were
13 disenfranchised and, you know, my grandparents
14 before them, but stand here as a dream keeper
15 because of the life and legacy of Doctor --
16 Reverend Dr. Martin Luther King, who believed in
17 nonviolent protest, who believed that social
18 change could happen if we allowed our hearts and
19 our minds to be unified in the love for humanity.

20 I am so happy that I can stand in
21 this chamber today with colleagues who understand
22 what Dr. King's legacy means, whose shoulders we
23 all stand on, who can celebrate young people who
24 because of a vision of expansion and equality are
25 able to achieve national championships, and I

1 hope year after year the dream of Dr. King is
2 more manifest not only in these chambers but
3 beyond.

4 And again, thank you so much for
5 honoring this day.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
7 you, Madam Leader.

8 Senator Bailey on the resolution.

9 SENATOR BAILEY: Thank you,
10 Madam President.

11 As always, an incredibly difficult
12 act to follow. Madam Leader struck a chord
13 speaking music. And -- and it's -- something
14 resonates about music in this day for me.

15 It is always an honor to be able to
16 speak on this resolution on this floor because
17 it's the first thing that I spoke about as a
18 member of the New York State Senate. And in my
19 time here it's -- the meaning of it has changed,
20 because my children have gotten older and I see
21 life through the lens of my children. And each
22 year -- now, my fourth-grader and my
23 second-grader, they learn different things.
24 Their level of understanding about who Dr. King
25 was and what he did increases year by year.

1 And it's a really proud moment for
2 me to check in about what they're learning in
3 school about who he was, but most importantly
4 about what he has continued to do.

5 The leader spoke about music; I
6 thought about J. Cole's song Love Yourz when he
7 says there's "beauty in the struggle, ugliness in
8 the success." That that struggle was beautiful,
9 but that -- that success that he had, it's still
10 ugly. There's still rampant racism. There's
11 still redlining. There's still voter
12 suppression. There's still so many things --
13 economic injustice, the list goes on and on.
14 These things are still happening that Dr. King
15 fought for.

16 So it's important to separate who he
17 was and -- but what his message is. Dr. King was
18 a reverend first, and as a reverend he talked
19 about probably the Book of James. And the Book
20 of James says "Faith without works is dead." So
21 he wasn't just a dreamer, he was a doer. So just
22 to dream isn't enough. We must do.

23 And so I -- I was thinking about
24 some things that I was -- that were happening and
25 how much I love sneakers, Madam President. And

1 not just because I couldn't walk a mile in
2 Dr. King's shoes. None of us could. Not just
3 because of the miles that he marched.

4 I thought about sneakers and
5 sometimes you have sneakers and you have things
6 that you want to wait to wear. Right? And you
7 wait for the right time. And you're waiting for
8 that moment -- I don't know about today, I don't
9 know about tomorrow. But sometimes we got to
10 realize that we got to put those sneakers on
11 before they don't fit or, even worse, we run out
12 of steps.

13 In 39 years of life, the Reverend
14 Dr. Martin Luther King traveled over 6 million
15 miles, delivered over 2,500 speeches, wrote
16 five books -- and is the only person, the only
17 singular person to have a holiday named after
18 them. He made the most out of his time. He
19 squeezed every single bit of life into the
20 39 years that he had on this earth. And when we
21 read about him, when we speak about him, it still
22 seems unreal, it seems surreal that he was only
23 39 at the time of his passing. Yet he was.

24 You know, he had a phrase "live
25 together as brothers or perish as fools." And at

1 one of the MLK celebrations yesterday there was a
2 gentleman by the name of Dr. Durley who actually
3 walked with Dr. King. And so it's always
4 interesting when we hear like an interpretation:
5 This is what Dr. King would have said, this is
6 what Dr. King would have done. There was a
7 brother there who walked with the man.

8 And he had a medallion on, an "I
9 Have a Dream" medallion. In order to wear that
10 medallion publicly, you have to call someone who
11 marched with Dr. King. These are -- these are --
12 I was yesterday years old, as they say, when I
13 learned that.

14 There are things about the movement
15 that we're still learning, and there are things
16 that we still have yet to learn you know, he --
17 he said that everybody can be great because
18 anybody can serve. Those of us that serve in
19 government in this chamber, but who serve in
20 life, realize that.

21 You know, as I close I think about a
22 quote from John Greenleaf Whittier, a poem -- a
23 Quaker American poet in the 19th century who said
24 in his poem Maud Muller: "For of all sad words
25 of tongue or pen, the saddest are these: 'It

1 might have been!'"

2 We should make sure that we live out
3 Dr. King's dream, and not just his dream -- what
4 he did, and how to continue to further it.

5 Thank you, Madam President.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
7 you.

8 Senator Sanders on the resolution.

9 SENATOR SANDERS: Thank you,
10 Madam President.

11 The previous speakers have done so
12 well, so I won't go in -- in their direction I'll
13 take in a different direction.

14 I -- I thank our leader for bringing
15 this resolution. It is so important, especially
16 in this day and age of media disinformation,
17 where outside of the Bible I would argue that the
18 Reverend Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. is probably
19 the most misquoted, misdirected. People are
20 taking his conversations completely into areas
21 almost exactly opposite of what he is speaking
22 about.

23 Whether we speak about the Middle
24 East, affirmative action, Black Lives Matter, his
25 conversation has been taken and distorted by so

1 many people that -- that sometimes it's necessary
2 to drill down a little bit deeper and to try to
3 figure out what are some core concepts that he
4 believed in. And I will offer you three. And
5 I'm sure everyone in here, God willing, will have
6 their own three. But I'll give three to you.

7 I would argue that he is speaking of
8 a refusal to participate in injustice, first and
9 foremost. Not going to participate in injustice.

10 He's also saying that he believes in
11 the possible redemption of the human -- of the
12 human family. That whoever he is opposing at
13 that moment is not without redemption, that you
14 can -- that we can get to a higher place.

15 But he -- he tops it all off by
16 saying -- by bringing a commitment to putting his
17 body on the line, that he is going to personally
18 put his body on the line and say I'm not only
19 going to be against this injustice, I do believe
20 in the redemption, but I'm going to give the
21 people -- the person or the situation a chance to
22 redeem themselves by me putting my body here and
23 saying this injustice will not continue, you'll
24 have to come through me and the others. But we
25 want you to change. We want you to change in a

1 different way.

2 And he did this while rallying,
3 educating and rallying and growing the list of
4 the righteous, of those who are on the right side
5 of a cause, and offering everybody a chance to
6 get -- you're not stuck in your history, that you
7 can -- you can get out of that. You're not stuck
8 on stupid. That we can get to a greater place
9 and all of us can go forward.

10 So I would suggest to you again that
11 those are three concepts that I think are
12 important to understand when we speak of King.
13 And otherwise we're going to -- you know, the day
14 will descend into buy -- I mean buying stupid
15 things and a day of holiday without meaning.
16 Where we don't know why we're doing it or what
17 we're doing, we're just out there doing
18 something. We'll sing songs we have no idea what
19 they mean and don't -- probably don't agree with
20 the songs otherwise.

21 So having said that, again, I am
22 grateful for the opportunity, Madam Leader. I
23 think it's so important to bring this again and
24 again until finally we get there. Because we
25 can't all get to that beloved community that he

1 spoke of when we learn to turn to each other and
2 not on each other.

3 Thank you very much. Thank you,
4 Madam President.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
6 May on the resolution.

7 SENATOR MAY: Thank you,
8 Madam President.

9 And thank you, Madam Leader, for
10 bringing this resolution and for your powerful
11 words.

12 I was 7 years old when my family and
13 hundreds of thousands of white families all
14 around the country were shocked and horrified by
15 the images on our television of the brutality
16 that met Dr. King and John Lewis and the others
17 who made that first attempt to march across the
18 Edmund Pettus Bridge in Selma.

19 And we watched the interview with
20 Dr. King where he said he was planning to try
21 again, and he called on white allies around the
22 country to join him. My grandfather was one of
23 the allies who joined him. He left his
24 comfortable home in Los Angeles, took a short
25 leave from his job, and he went to Selma. And we

1 were terrified. We were afraid for his safety.

2 But we were also very proud.

3 Dr. King taught us a lot of lessons
4 with his words and with his actions. The one
5 that sticks with me the most is the lesson never
6 to be a bystander. And I think that's a lesson,
7 sadly, that we still carry today when it comes to
8 racial injustice.

9 I'm -- I was honored and grateful
10 that my committee was able to hold a hearing last
11 month about concentrated poverty in our smaller
12 cities. The city I represent and a number of
13 other cities along the Thruway are perennially
14 ranked among the worst for child poverty in the
15 entire country. And this is a legacy of racial
16 injustice which still shapes our cities today.

17 I'm grateful to Dr. King for the
18 lessons he taught, and -- and I try on a daily
19 basis not to be a bystander. But I think there
20 is an awful lot that we still need to do to make
21 his words ring true for us today. I was at an
22 event, a beautiful event in Auburn on Sunday
23 where young people read the words of Dr. King,
24 and I couldn't help but feel like the vision, the
25 beautiful vision that he had for a world of much

1 greater tolerance and -- and less racial
2 division, in -- in the world where I live, that's
3 not true today.

4 So we still have to make sure we are
5 not bystanders and that we continue to do the
6 hard work, sometimes the dangerous work,
7 sometimes the -- the truly difficult work of
8 trying to make his words the truth.

9 Thank you.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
11 Kennedy on the resolution.

12 SENATOR KENNEDY: Thank you,
13 Madam President.

14 I stand with an extraordinary honor
15 to recognize the Reverend Dr. Martin Luther King,
16 Jr. I want to thank our Majority Leader,
17 Andrea Stewart-Cousins, for bringing this
18 resolution to the floor. What a -- what a real
19 privilege it is to be able to stand on this floor
20 and honor such an extraordinary man, a true man
21 of honor, of integrity, of devotion -- someone
22 who I was not alive to see in action as I was
23 born eight years after his untimely death, but
24 that over the years I've learned more and more
25 about, including each and every day, each and

1 every year we celebrate and honor his legacy.

2 And it's a constant reminder as we
3 celebrate this individual who had such an
4 indelible mark on our democracy, on our nation,
5 on human rights across the world. And, you know,
6 you think about what he stood for, the greatest
7 of society needs he stood for and fought for --
8 human rights and civil rights and labor rights
9 and equality and justice -- each and every day of
10 his life.

11 And when I think about the legacy he
12 left behind, I think about the work that we do
13 here still today and all of the needs in society
14 that still remain, his work is yet to be done.
15 His vision is yet to be satisfied. We have an
16 obligation to see his vision through to reality.

17 This year marks the 60th anniversary
18 of the March on Washington. And you think about
19 how far our nation has come, and you think about
20 how far we still need to go. You think about the
21 dire poverty that still exists. You think about
22 the horrific statistics in healthcare
23 discrepancies between people of color and their
24 white counterparts. You think about the children
25 that go to school, even here in the great Empire

1 State of New York, that are distracted through
2 their education because they haven't had a meal
3 to start the day because of the conditions
4 they're coming from in poverty at home.

5 We've got so much work to do as
6 communities across New York, as a state, and as a
7 nation. But we have Dr. King's vision. We have
8 Dr. King's commitment to doing what is right. We
9 have his dream and his words and his actions that
10 we can follow.

11 And each and every time I have the
12 opportunity to learn more about him, it -- it to
13 me is an enlightening moment. For example, last
14 night as I was watching a documentary on his life
15 called I am MLK, Jr. -- if you haven't seen it,
16 it's worth a watch. And you had some of the
17 greatest civil rights leaders of all time that
18 stood by and with Dr. King, some of which still
19 are here today.

20 The great Reverend Jesse Jackson
21 that I and my family had the opportunity to meet
22 at Rosie O'Grady's. He was in for a bite to eat
23 with his family down in Manhattan as I was there
24 with my family. And I went up and I said, "Oh,
25 my God," I said, "Reverend Jackson, what an

1 opportunity, what an amazing honor it is to meet
2 you." You know what he did? He moved the table.
3 He said, "Come on, bring your family over, sit on
4 down." And he starts talking to us. You know
5 what his shirt said? Anybody? "Vote." V-O-T-E,
6 vote.

7 And then you hear him in this
8 documentary talk about the struggles that
9 Dr. King had and the despair that he had watching
10 the nation going in the wrong direction when it
11 pertained to civil rights, when it pertained to
12 the Vietnam War. What an incredible visionary
13 prophet Dr. King was.

14 And you look back, and hindsight's
15 20/20. And that includes in our nation's
16 history. And you see the vision of peace and
17 prosperity that the Reverend Martin Luther King,
18 Jr. had and drove forward as a national message.

19 So it is right that we honor him
20 here today on the Senate floor here in New York.
21 But it's right that we honor him through our
22 actions every day, whether we're here in this
23 chamber, governing and making laws, or whether
24 we're out it in the community, whether we're
25 elected or whether we're community leaders.

1 Thinking about his vision for America and
2 following in his footprints through our actions
3 is the greatest tribute we can ever have to that
4 extraordinary and wonderful man.

5 And I will say one last thing, that
6 one of his children posted last night that one
7 way that we can continue to honor Dr. King is
8 also by honoring his wife, Coretta Scott King.
9 And as I often say, behind every great man is an
10 even better woman. And she stood by him through
11 all the trials and tribulations and struggles,
12 and I think was the rock in his life behind his
13 great success and determination in transforming
14 the trajectory of this great nation.

15 And as one of his colleagues
16 mentioned in this documentary last night -- and
17 I'll end with this -- aside from the election of
18 President Abraham Lincoln and the
19 Emancipation Proclamation, the 12 years that the
20 Reverend Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. led the
21 Civil Rights Movement before his death in 1968
22 was the most transformational piece of history in
23 the entirety of the history of this great
24 United States of America.

25 Thank you, Dr. King.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
2 Webb on the resolution.

3 SENATOR WEBB: Thank you,
4 Madam President.

5 I want to thank our Majority Leader
6 for bringing this resolution forward to recognize
7 Dr. Martin Luther King and his legacy, who would
8 have been 95 years old this year.

9 You know, as we're here in the --
10 the Senate chamber remembering the legacy of
11 Dr. King, someone who was not only, as my
12 colleague Senator Kennedy just noted, one of the
13 most pivotal and greatest leaders for civil
14 rights here in this country but also the world --
15 I mean, he was a global leader on efforts around
16 humanitarianism. His efforts were designed to
17 really advance justice and liberation.

18 And so it is worth noting we all are
19 familiar with his speech that was given during
20 the March on Washington, the "I Have A Dream"
21 speech. And one of the things that I often like
22 to lift up is that after that time in reflecting
23 on the state of this nation during that time and
24 subsequently, Dr. King also realized the very
25 daunting challenge that we have of actualizing

1 that dream. And he talks about it in his book
2 Where Do We Go From Here: Chaos or Community?

3 And when you think about the climate
4 that we're in right now, that same idea of where
5 do we go from here, here in this chamber we have
6 an obligation and an opportunity to really create
7 community through equitable policies and
8 practices.

9 And so in looking at his legacy and
10 lifting up the importance of women, as we were
11 talking about earlier when we recognized the
12 lacrosse team breaking records, we also know
13 women played a very pivotal role in assisting and
14 guiding Dr. King in the legacy that he created.

15 His wife, Coretta Scott, a few days
16 after he was assassinated -- to be clear, he
17 didn't sacrifice his life, he was killed -- his
18 wife a few days later led the effort and kept
19 pushing until -- in working with a lot of
20 national leaders, to actually get his birthday
21 memorialized. And also establishing his legacy
22 center that's down in Georgia.

23 And so, you know, again, when we
24 talk about legacy and how we are leaving our
25 communities better than when we found them, it's

1 important that we lift up the voices that are
2 often marginalized and make sure that we are
3 being more intentional in lifting up the legacy
4 and living it through policies and practices of
5 Dr. King. Because he was most certainly
6 committed to eradicating racism, eradicating
7 poverty, and eradicating war.

8 And so it is with that legacy that,
9 as I said earlier, we have a responsibility to do
10 that. And we can do that in this chamber through
11 our policies.

12 When you think about some of the
13 stats that a lot of our families, working
14 families are dealing with still to this day --
15 and now we're in the budget, and so we're going
16 to have those conversations around where do we
17 make those investments, I think it is paramount,
18 especially on a day like today where we are
19 recalling this great man's legacy, that it is
20 imperative that we continue to work diligently to
21 center the voices and needs of those who are
22 often most forgotten.

23 And so as I, you know, close, I
24 would be remiss if I didn't lift up another
25 important woman in Dr. King's life, and that was

1 his daughter Dr. Bernice King, who also shared
2 yesterday that especially for folks like us who
3 are elected and other leaders, that when we
4 invoke the name of her father, it is paramount
5 that we tell the totality of his legacy and, more
6 importantly, beyond words but through actions,
7 policies and practices, that is how we honor him.

8 Again, I want to thank all of my
9 colleagues for your -- your remarks, and I look
10 forward to us doing the good work and continuing
11 to advance the legacy of Dr. Martin Luther King,
12 Jr.

13 Thank you so much.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
15 Ramos on the resolution.

16 SENATOR RAMOS: Thank you,
17 Madam President.

18 I too rise to celebrate one of the
19 greatest Americans to have ever lived, Dr. Martin
20 Luther King, Jr.

21 I want to celebrate the radical
22 King, the Dr. King who was an economic crusader
23 and a teacher to Americans, who reminded us that
24 although Black people weren't emancipated until
25 1863, less than 20 years before the American

1 government had enacted a sense of manifest
2 destiny, of westward expansion, where homesteads
3 and acres and acres of land were given, gifted,
4 to European immigrants, allowing them to have an
5 economic base, while Black people, recently
6 liberated Black people, were not.

7 And that had fundamentally sowed the
8 years of segregation, of prejudice, and of racism
9 that we continue to try to end today.

10 Dr. King talked about how
11 Black people and people of color -- because he
12 wasn't only a leader for Black people, but for
13 all working families, who talked about how people
14 had to work full time to get part-time income.

15 It's been 55 years since the
16 assassination of Dr. King, and I as chair of the
17 Labor Committee here in this legislative body
18 continue with our committee to crusade ourselves
19 towards greater income equality, which is so
20 sorely needed here in New York State where there
21 are so many working families who are constantly
22 on the brink of eviction, entire generations who
23 are saddled with student debt and who have been
24 unable to realize the American dream, which is
25 supposedly to buy a home.

1 In fact, it's been so dire, our
2 economic condition, that just last year in 2023
3 we saw nearly 500,000 workers across this country
4 engage in nearly 300 work stoppages. Because at
5 the end of the day, there is no greater
6 nonviolent collective action than the right to
7 strike. The right to be able as a worker to tell
8 your boss, No, I will not work for crumbs. Yes,
9 you will recognize my dignity. And dignity is
10 defined by the honest respect that every human
11 being has, the right that every human being has
12 to a living wage, to benefits, to time off. So
13 many of the things that we've been able to
14 champion precisely here in this Senate body.

15 It's incredible to see how his
16 dream -- and I -- I truly do believe that we
17 should redefine what we tend to think is the
18 American dream to actually make sure it matches
19 with Dr. King's dream, to judge a person by the
20 content of their character. Meaning by their
21 ability to be of service to others, meaning by
22 their ability to be able to provide for
23 themselves and their family, no matter where they
24 come from.

25 What matters is that we have a

1 shared mutuality and therefore we have a shared
2 destiny. That it is about where we are going
3 together.

4 And so with that, I just want to say
5 how proud I am that we are once again engaging in
6 this annual tradition of recognizing Dr. King and
7 his work. Because without him, I would not be
8 here, and neither would nearly every other
9 legislator of color in this body.

10 Many people don't recognize that in
11 1965 with the Voting Rights Act it wasn't just
12 about securing suffrage for Black people. It
13 took the Voting Rights Act for Latinos to be able
14 to vote in this country.

15 I would not be able to vote as a
16 New York Queens-born Colombiana if it wasn't for
17 Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. And if I couldn't
18 vote, I wouldn't be able to run for office and
19 stand before you here today.

20 And for that, all I want to say is
21 gracias, Dr. King, y Feliz Cumpleaños.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
23 Lanza on the resolution.

24 SENATOR LANZA: Thank you,
25 Madam President. It is an honor to rise to speak

1 on this resolution.

2 First, of course, I want to thank
3 Senator, Leader Andrea Stewart-Cousins for
4 bringing this to the floor.

5 You know, I enjoy listening to all
6 my colleagues. But I especially enjoy listening
7 to you, Leader, on this resolution. You speak
8 with such intelligence, tenderness and strength.
9 And I think that is so appropriate and fitting,
10 given who it is that you are speaking of.

11 You know, you all know I don't speak
12 on resolutions, it's not my "thing," as
13 Senator Bailey would say. But every year I make
14 an exception for this one.

15 And I do enjoy listening to my
16 colleagues. Because while we have our
17 differences, I think the words that you hear on
18 this day every year truly reflects our collective
19 aspirations and really describes why it is, from
20 whatever walk of life, from whatever side of the
21 aisle, from whatever our belief system is,
22 explains why we serve.

23 I think when we speak about
24 Dr. Martin Luther King, at its core we talk about
25 public service. And we talk about where we one

1 day hope to be.

2 You know, Senator Bailey talked
3 about this. You know, as a -- as a Christian
4 growing up, whenever you thought about making
5 sure you were doing the right thing, one of the
6 things you might ask is what would Jesus do, or
7 what would Jesus say. And you don't see that
8 anywhere else in our society, in our culture, at
9 least that I know of, except for when you talk
10 about MLK.

11 And people do say what would he have
12 said, what would he be doing. And I think that
13 speaks to the profound nature of what he
14 represented, who he was and who he is. The moral
15 certainty and certitude.

16 But as Senator Sanders said, this is
17 complicated. When you think about someone as
18 great as Dr. Martin Luther King, we all want to
19 make him our own. We all want to use his words
20 to prove that we are right. We sometimes want to
21 weaponize those words to say "You are wrong."
22 And that's what's complicated.

23 I'm not saying we shouldn't do that.
24 Because we need to, I think, dip into the well of
25 all that he gave us as guidance for what we've

1 tried to accomplish today. So I think it's
2 appropriate, but it's complicated.

3 And I think Abraham Lincoln said
4 this in one of the greatest inaugural addresses
5 ever, the second one. He alluded to this idea
6 when he said that -- about the Civil War that
7 both sides read the same Bible, both sides pray
8 to the same God, and both sides invoke his aid
9 against the other. And you see that with
10 Dr. Martin Luther King. So it's complicated.

11 So I'm not going to today speculate
12 as to what he would be saying right now. And the
13 great thing about his life and when he lived is
14 that we know what he said. We don't have to
15 guess.

16 So some of the things I think about,
17 that are as pertinent today as they ever were,
18 that he said was that hatred paralyzes and love
19 releases it. He warned -- and these are his
20 words -- that we should not love publicity, we
21 should love justice. And of course my favorite
22 is that he said hate cannot defeat hate, only
23 love can conquer hate.

24 So whatever you want to think about
25 what Dr. Martin Luther King would say today, we

1 have his words. And I can't think of any better
2 words for this time than those words and
3 many of the others that he spoke to me. It was
4 said, I agree, he was one of the greatest
5 Americans who ever lived, even though he was a
6 Republican.

7 (Laughter.)

8 SENATOR LANZA: You know, I think
9 Dr. Martin Luther King's story is America's
10 story. The struggle for freedom and liberty.
11 And yes, it's a struggle. Life is a struggle.
12 But I truly do believe that if we ever wipe
13 tyranny in all its wicked forms from this earth,
14 it was Dr. Martin Luther King who helped show the
15 way.

16 Thank you, Madam President.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
18 Helming on the resolution.

19 SENATOR HELMING: Thank you,
20 Madam President.

21 I too would like to thank
22 Majority Leader Andrea Stewart-Cousins for
23 continuing to bring this important resolution to
24 the floor.

25 And I want to join with everybody

1 who has offered so many profound words, if you
2 will, honoring the life and enduring legacy of
3 Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. Although I will say
4 right up front that my message is going to be
5 much simpler, much shorter, but I believe just as
6 important as what's already been said.

7 I think back to just a couple of
8 weeks ago on the opening day of this year's
9 legislative session. The Lieutenant Governor,
10 Antonio Delgado, presiding as Temporary President
11 of the Senate, standing in the same -- very same
12 spot you are, Madam President, encouraged us as
13 State Senators to be mindful of what Dr. King
14 referred to as unenforceable obligations.

15 I've been thinking about that a lot
16 since the LG brought it up. Dr. King said:
17 "These obligations are beyond the reach of the
18 laws of society. They concern inner attitudes,
19 genuine person-to-person relations, and
20 expressions of compassion that law books cannot
21 regulate and jails cannot rectify. Such
22 obligations are met by one's commitment to inner
23 laws, what's written on the heart."

24 Dr. King's words are a reminder to
25 me, and I imagine to every single person who's in

1 this chamber, of the profound responsibility we
2 carry as individuals and also as elected leaders
3 to look deep within our hearts about the choices
4 we make and how our words and actions impact
5 others.

6 We all can lead by example. We can
7 all treat others how we want to be treated. We
8 can show kindness and compassion to our
9 neighbors. We can be good Samaritans and serve
10 others. And although here on this Senate floor
11 we may not always agree, we can approach each
12 conversation and each debate with love and
13 respect in our hearts.

14 Thank you, Madam President.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
16 Harckham on the resolution.

17 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Thank you very
18 much, Madam President.

19 I -- I normally don't speak on this
20 resolution because I think it's more important
21 for me to listen and learn how I can better be of
22 service on this day.

23 But I was -- I was struck by
24 something that happened here today. The leader
25 was talking about -- and thank you,

1 Madam Majority Leader, for bringing this
2 resolution and for your continued leadership --
3 the issue of progress and challenges and the
4 dichotomy of both of those things, and the
5 example we had in this chamber today. We just
6 honored some national champions, some remarkable
7 young women who because of Title IX had the same
8 resources and the same opportunities as men and
9 became national champions.

10 The town that Pace University is
11 located in has just been filed in a lawsuit
12 brought under the John R. Lewis Voting Rights Act
13 because five Hispanic residents felt
14 disenfranchised because of the at-large voting
15 system.

16 So I -- I want to be careful not to
17 disparage the town of Mount Pleasant. They will
18 have their day in court. But the fact that
19 people today are still feeling disenfranchised
20 because of who they are, their race or their
21 origin, and the fact that we in this chamber, in
22 this case through the leadership of Senator Myrie
23 and the Majority Leader and others, have given
24 them an avenue of redress, is an important
25 example of the role that we continue to play

1 as -- as we try to advance Dr. King's -- his --
2 not only his life, but his legacy and the work
3 that we still need to do.

4 So I vote aye on this important
5 resolution.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
7 Thomas on the resolution.

8 SENATOR THOMAS: Thank you,
9 Madam President.

10 Thank you, Leader and other speakers
11 before me.

12 I owe a lot to Martin Luther King
13 and the civil rights movement. And just like we
14 heard from Senator Jessica Ramos about the Voting
15 Rights Act, if it wasn't for the civil rights
16 movement, immigration laws would not have
17 changed. People from the South Asian community
18 would not have been able to emigrate here decades
19 ago. I would not be able to go to the schools
20 that I went to if it wasn't for the civil rights
21 movement and Dr. Martin Luther King. My family
22 would not have been able to buy the home that
23 they live in if wasn't for the civil rights
24 movement. I owe a lot to Martin Luther King.

25 You know, all of us here in this

1 chamber have so much power to do good and to make
2 changes. But we don't have to be a Senator or an
3 elected official to do -- to do that. Martin
4 Luther King said it best: Be a bush if you can't
5 be a tree. If you can't be a highway, be a
6 trail. If you can't be the sun, be a little
7 star. Be the best of whatever you are.

8 I serve today as a Senator to help
9 others. Thank you, Dr. King, for leading the
10 way. I vote aye.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
12 Rolison on the resolution.

13 SENATOR ROLISON: Thank you,
14 Madam President.

15 I too, like my -- my friend and
16 colleague Senator Harckham, generally listen.
17 And -- but I -- I wanted to just briefly talk
18 about two services that I went to to celebrate
19 the life of Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr.

20 The first one was at Beulah Baptist
21 Church, and it's always the Sunday before. And a
22 friend of the leader -- Leader, thank you for
23 bringing this forward -- Bishop James Hassell
24 from the City of Yonkers was there.

25 And I've listened to a lot of

1 preachers at that church, and I will tell you
2 that was one of the most riveting acts of
3 preaching that I have ever heard. And I was
4 troubled when I left because what he talked about
5 was Dr. King's "I Have A Dream" speech, and how
6 he talked about dreams today are not like dreams
7 before. Dreams are deferred for lots of reasons.
8 It's almost like we're not allowed to dream.
9 Children growing up are exposed to so many things
10 which are deferring those dreams. How can you
11 dream when everything you see or hear can be
12 negative? And we all sat there with this look on
13 our face. He was speaking about something that
14 is so true.

15 And so when I left there that night,
16 I was troubled. I was upset. I said to myself,
17 maybe I'm not even dreaming anymore. Maybe I'm
18 worried about too much. Maybe I'm thinking about
19 too much.

20 So the next day, I went to
21 Springfield Baptist Church in the City of Beacon.
22 And we sang and we marched, and I felt good. And
23 we went back to the church for a service, but it
24 started out with song and reflective prayer. But
25 then there was an essay contest where the winners

1 from the Beacon City School District, from second
2 grade right up to senior, five of them, were
3 picked out of 23 essays from that school district
4 about Dr. King and what he stood for and what he
5 said.

6 And what I will tell you is dreams
7 were on display at Springfield Baptist Church.
8 And I felt good about that, because I learned
9 something, from the tiniest to the senior, about
10 the things that he said and what they thought
11 they meant. They were thinking. And they were
12 dreaming about things that he dreamed about.

13 So as my colleague and friend
14 Senator Kennedy said, we've done a lot, we've got
15 a lot to do. And together, Madam President, we
16 can do that.

17 And I proudly vote aye.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
19 question is on the resolution. All in favor
20 signify by saying aye.

21 (Response of "Aye.")

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Opposed,
23 nay.

24 (No response.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The

1 resolution is adopted.

2 Senator Gianaris.

3 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,
4 I know we've already voted on the resolution, but
5 just to correct the record. In all the wonderful
6 accolades about Martin Luther King, it was
7 slipped in there that he was a Republican. In
8 fact, that is absolutely untrue. Scholars will
9 tell you that that is something invented by
10 Trump supporters in the last several years to
11 advance their cause.

12 So let's just be very clear so
13 nobody thinks that was actually true.

14 (Laughter.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Oh, my
16 God.

17 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,
18 the sponsor of both resolutions we took up today
19 would like to open them up for cosponsorship.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
21 resolutions are open for cosponsorship. Should
22 you choose not to be a cosponsor of the
23 resolutions, please notify the desk.

24 Senator Gianaris.

25 SENATOR GIANARIS: Can we now take

1 up the reading of the calendar, please.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
3 Secretary will read.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 14,
5 Senate Print 8005, by Senator Mayer, an act to
6 amend the Public Health Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
10 act shall take effect on the same date and in the
11 same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2023.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 29,
21 Senate Print 8026, by Senator Webb, an act to
22 amend a chapter of the Laws of 2023.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This

1 act shall take effect on the same date and in the
2 same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2023.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Call the roll.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Sorry,
7 call the roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
10 Webb to explain her vote.

11 SENATOR WEBB: Thank you,
12 Madam President. I rise to explain my vote.

13 You know, again, last year I had the
14 honor of being before this chamber and lifting up
15 this important bill that in my remarks last year,
16 I lifted up the fact that BIPOC missing and
17 murdered women and girls is a growing epidemic
18 nationally, and most certainly we are seeing it
19 here in New York.

20 You know, as the numbers continue to
21 go up, unfortunately, we also learned that the
22 manner in which resources are allocated to
23 address this public safety issue is not the same
24 for BIPOC missing and murdered women and girls.

25 And so New York being a major

1 gateway state, for a variety of reasons -- our
2 location, we're a big state for tourism, and so
3 many other positive attributes -- and at the same
4 time we still have significant challenges around
5 human trafficking. And when it comes to this
6 issue, unfortunately BIPOC women and girls are
7 often mischaracterized as runaways and so they're
8 not given the same level of consideration.

9 We also saw in Rochester, for
10 instance, that when a young woman of color went
11 missing, an Amber Alert was not issued for her.
12 And so the stories continue to compile.

13 And so this legislation is taking a
14 long-overdue and important step to remedying this
15 issue here in our state by addressing the gap in
16 care and concern for BIPOC victims of abduction
17 and human trafficking.

18 And so again I want to thank my
19 colleagues for their support, unanimous support
20 for this legislation. It is imperative that with
21 this task force, which this legislation creates
22 and brings together state agencies along with
23 community advocates, we really have an
24 opportunity and an obligation to not only render
25 justice for BIPOC missing and murdered women and

1 girls, but also justice and supports for their
2 families so that they can -- can heal.

3 And so I want to thank the
4 Majority Leader for her support of this
5 legislation. Also, all of you, my colleagues.
6 Assemblymember Karines Reyes, who is the Assembly
7 sponsor on this important legislation. Also the
8 advocates, such as Girl Vow. You know, this type
9 of landmark legislation doesn't happen in a
10 vacuum. It takes many people to make it happen.
11 And so I want to thank everyone that's worked on
12 this.

13 I proudly vote aye for this, and I
14 encourage my colleagues to do the same.

15 Thank you so much, Madam President.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
17 Webb to be recorded in the affirmative.

18 Senator Ramos to explain her vote.

19 SENATOR RAMOS: Thank you,
20 Madam President.

21 I just wanted to very quickly
22 applaud Senator Webb for her persistence in
23 passing this bill, insisting that it become law
24 as soon as possible.

25 I represent Jackson Heights in

1 Queens, one of the places that has most welcomed
2 asylum seekers, who are many times seen as prime
3 targets precisely for human trafficking. Whether
4 it's for sex work, whether it's for nail salon
5 work or farm work, so many people, particularly
6 women and women of color, are targeted because
7 they are thought to be weak, because they are
8 desperate to improve their economic standing and
9 provide for their family.

10 And we have to be able to put forth
11 a much better way of life for immigrants and for
12 so many people so that they do not fall into
13 these traps and that law enforcement actually do
14 their job in ending so many different human
15 trafficking rings that exist across our city,
16 New York City and state.

17 I just want to say thank you. I
18 hope that this not only results in creating this
19 division in our criminal justice system, but that
20 it actually manifests an economic opportunity in
21 employment authorization documents, work permits,
22 for people to be able to provide for themselves
23 and their families properly.

24 Thank you.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator

1 Ramos to be recorded in the affirmative.

2 Announce the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
5 is passed.

6 There is a substitution at the desk.

7 The Secretary will read.

8 THE SECRETARY: Senator Gounardes
9 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
10 Assembly Bill Number 8507 and substitute it for
11 the identical Senate Bill 8029, Third Reading
12 Calendar 31.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD:
14 Substitution so ordered.

15 The Secretary will read.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 31,
17 Assembly Bill Number 8507, by Assemblymember
18 Solages, an act to amend the Civil Service Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
22 act shall take effect on the same date and in the
23 same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2023.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
3 the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
6 is passed.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 36,
8 Senate Print 8036, by Senator Thomas, an act to
9 amend the General Business Law.

10 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Lay it
12 aside.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 46,
14 Senate Print 8057, by Senator Rivera, an act to
15 amend the Public Health Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
19 act shall take effect on the same date and in the
20 same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2023.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
25 the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
3 is passed.

4 There's a substitution at the desk.

5 The Secretary will read.

6 THE SECRETARY: Senator Jackson
7 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
8 Assembly Bill Number 8514 and substitute it for
9 the identical Senate Bill 8079, Third Reading
10 Calendar 61.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
12 substitution is so ordered.

13 The Secretary will read.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 61,
15 Assembly Number 8514, by Assemblymember Pheffer
16 Amato, an act to amend the Civil Service Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
20 act shall take effect on the same date and in the
21 same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2023.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 64,
6 Senate Print 8082, by Senator Sanders, an act to
7 amend the New York City Charter.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
11 act shall take effect on the same date and in the
12 same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2023.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
19 Calendar 64, those Senators voting in the
20 negative are Senators Gallivan, Helming, Rhoads,
21 Skoufis, Walczyk and Weik.

22 Ayes, 54. Nays, 6.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 66,

1 Senate Print 8086, by Senator Addabbo, an act to
2 amend the Racing, Pari-Mutuel Wagering and
3 Breeding Law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
7 act shall take effect on the same date and in the
8 same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2023.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
13 the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
15 Calendar 66, those Senators voting in the
16 negative are Senators Krueger, Skoufis and
17 Walczyk.

18 Ayes, 57. Nays, 3.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Excuse me. On that
22 last bill -- in relation to Calendar 66, voting
23 in the negative are Senators Krueger, Martinez,
24 Skoufis and Senator Walczyk.

25 Ayes, 56. Nays, 4.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
2 is passed.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 69,
4 Senate Print 8089, by Senator Hoylman-Sigal, an
5 act to amend a chapter of the Laws of 2023.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
14 Helming to explain her vote.

15 SENATOR HELMING: Thank you,
16 Madam President. I rise to explain my vote.

17 Dyslexia can impact a person's
18 mental health in a number of ways. In children,
19 it can cause them to experience symptoms of
20 depression, of anxiety, and make them feel like
21 they aren't smart or capable of learning.

22 So I support this bill, and I agree
23 that we need to develop better screening methods
24 for dyslexia and provide children with an
25 education that truly meets their needs.

1 But as we address this issue and
2 others like it, we need to also ensure that our
3 healthcare providers are empowered to provide the
4 services our children need.

5 I carry a bill, Senate Bill 4463,
6 that would grant diagnosing privileges to current
7 and future mental health counselors, family
8 therapists and psychoanalysts who complete
9 necessary training. This will allow families
10 greater access to much-needed services and ensure
11 that conditions are diagnosed and treatment
12 begins as soon as possible.

13 Again, I support this bill and
14 efforts to help our students with dyslexia
15 succeed in our education system. But we can do
16 more, we need to do more to help children and
17 families access the services they need. That's
18 why I'm voting yes and also encouraging the
19 Senate Majority to bring my bill, Senate Bill
20 4463, to the floor for a vote.

21 Thank you, Madam President.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
23 Helming to be recorded in the affirmative.

24 Announce the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
2 is -- (pause).

3 Senator Hoylman-Sigal to explain his
4 vote.

5 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: Thank you,
6 Madam President.

7 I rise to thank my colleagues for
8 their support of the underlying bill in this
9 chapter amendment, including Maria Morrissey and
10 Amanda Godkin for helping negotiate it.

11 You know, dyslexia affects a quarter
12 of a million students or more. In the State of
13 New York it's estimated about 10 percent of our
14 population struggles with dyslexia or dysgraphia.

15 The problem has been in our state
16 and in New York City and other municipalities,
17 students are not screened for dyslexia. Parents
18 have no idea that their kids can't read.

19 My husband and I have a 13-year-old
20 daughter. We did not learn of her dyslexia until
21 the end of her third grade. Which is far too
22 late for remediation.

23 And, you know, there are so many
24 incredibly creative people with dyslexia.
25 Because as the Apple slogan reads, dyslexia

1 forces you to think different. And there are
2 people like Steve Jobs, Albert Einstein, Thomas
3 Edison, and other great thinkers of centuries
4 past who have dyslexia.

5 There are countless, though, men and
6 women of color who never had the opportunity in
7 our educational system to pursue greatness as
8 those names I have mentioned, because again they
9 were never identified as such.

10 Our legislation will take the first
11 step forward in creating a task force to
12 establish best practices for all of those
13 schoolkids.

14 I want to thank Governor Hochul for
15 her insightful approach on going back to basics
16 in literacy, teaching phonics in our New York
17 school system. And certainly my colleagues
18 Senator Liu and Senator Mayer understand that
19 effort.

20 And this legislation was inspired by
21 my 13-year-old daughter Sylvia, who became a
22 bat mitzvah this past Saturday. And if you think
23 reading English is difficult for a child with
24 dyslexia, try Hebrew.

25 (Laughter.)

1 SENATOR HOYLMAN-SIGAL: But she
2 succeeded, as countless other children can and
3 will with dyslexia, hopefully with the assistance
4 of this new task force.

5 I vote aye.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
7 Hoylman-Sigal to be recorded in the affirmative.

8 Announce the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 70,
13 Senate Print 8090, by Senator Cleare, an act to
14 amend the State Technology Law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
18 act shall take effect immediately.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
25 Calendar Number 70, voting in the negative are

1 Senators Ortt and Walczyk. Also Senator O'Mara.

2 Ayes, 57. Nays, 3.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
4 is passed.

5 Senator Gianaris, that completes the
6 reading of today's calendar.

7 SENATOR GIANARIS: Can we now go to
8 the controversial calendar, please.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
10 Secretary will ring the bell.

11 The Secretary will read.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 36,
13 Senate Print 8036, by Senator Thomas, an act to
14 amend the General Business Law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
16 Lanza, why do you rise?

17 SENATOR LANZA: Madam President, I
18 believe there's an amendment at the desk. I
19 waive the reading of that amendment and ask that
20 you recognize Senator Martins to be heard.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
22 you, Senator Lanza.

23 Upon review of the amendment, in
24 accordance with Rule 6, Section 4B, I rule it
25 nongermane and out of order at this time.

1 SENATOR LANZA: Accordingly,
2 Madam President, I appeal the ruling of the chair
3 and ask that you recognize Senator Martins.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
5 appeal has been made and recognized, and
6 Senator Martins may be heard.

7 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,
8 Madam President.

9 I rise to appeal the ruling of the
10 chair. Madam President, the proposed amendment
11 is germane to the underlying bill because the
12 underlying bill relates to the security of
13 residential buildings and the proposed amendment
14 relates to ensuring the security of the community
15 by enhancing penalties for those who obstruct
16 traffic and access to buildings during protests.

17 The proposed amendment creates a new
18 offense of aggravated disorderly conduct. It
19 would make it a Class A misdemeanor to obstruct
20 traffic or access to any building as part of an
21 unpermitted protest or demonstration.

22 Frankly, Madam President, I think
23 we've all seen the effects of unpermitted
24 protests in our communities and the effects of
25 those protests on our residents, not only those

1 who are in residential buildings but those who
2 are going to work, those who are trying to cross
3 bridges and tunnels. We've all seen that impact.

4 The proposed amendment would also
5 allow for the offense to be charged as a hate
6 crime, elevating the penalty to an E felony where
7 individuals engage in this disruptive and
8 dangerous activity because of their hateful
9 attitudes towards another race, nationality,
10 ancestry or religion.

11 Madam President, it has been
12 102 days since Hamas committed the terrorist
13 attacks against Israel on October 7th. We have
14 seen terrorist sympathizers disruptively engaging
15 in protests, blocking traffic and access to
16 public buildings, including airports and train
17 stations. The actions of these hateful
18 antisemites have not only made for the Jewish
19 population to feel less safe, they have also put
20 every resident of these communities at risk by
21 preventing emergency services from getting to
22 people who need them.

23 This kind of conduct cannot be
24 tolerated, and there must be consequences when
25 someone creates this kind of danger.

1 So, Madam President, for these
2 reasons I strongly urge you to reconsider your
3 ruling.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
5 you, Senator.

6 I want to remind the house that the
7 vote is on the procedures of the house and the
8 ruling of the chair.

9 Those in favor of overruling the
10 chair, signify by saying aye.

11 (Response of "Aye.")

12 SENATOR LANZA: Request a show of
13 hands.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: A show
15 of hands has been requested and so ordered.

16 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 20.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
18 ruling of the chair stands, and the bill-in-chief
19 is before the house.

20 Read the last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
22 act shall take effect on the same date and in the
23 same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2023.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
25 Borrello.

1 SENATOR BORRELLO: Would the
2 sponsor yield for some questions.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
4 Thomas, do you yield?

5 SENATOR THOMAS: Yes, I yield to --

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
7 sponsor yields.

8 SENATOR THOMAS: -- Senator
9 Borrello, to my first debate of my last session.
10 Let's go.

11 SENATOR BORRELLO: All right. With
12 that being said, through you, Madam President.

13 So I supported this bill, I believe,
14 previously. And -- but there are some questions
15 after reading the bill a little more closely.

16 You mentioned in your sponsor's
17 memo, and I think the Governor also referenced
18 it, that this only applies to third parties that
19 will be installing these keyless entry systems.

20 So can you ensure that that only
21 still applies to -- in this bill? Because I
22 don't see anything in the bill language that said
23 it only applies strictly to third parties
24 installing one of these keyless entry systems.

25 SENATOR THOMAS: Through you,

1 Madam President. This is a chapter amendment,
2 and there are three specific revisions that we
3 made to this bill that passed unanimously last
4 year during session.

5 With third parties, we didn't change
6 anything on that specific definition.

7 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
8 will the sponsor continue to yield?

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
10 sponsor yield?

11 SENATOR THOMAS: Yes.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
13 sponsor yields.

14 SENATOR BORRELLO: Yes, so this is
15 some -- just some concerns on the language,
16 because it doesn't specifically spell out only --
17 it would only apply to third parties. So that's
18 the concern.

19 So with that being said, if a -- if
20 the owner of a property installed one of these
21 keyless security entry systems, you know, would
22 they -- would they be subject to the consequences
23 of this bill, and not just a third party?

24 SENATOR THOMAS: So through you,
25 Madam President, it says here in the bill,

1 Section 390-e: "Unauthorized installation of
2 certain security devices prohibited. No person,
3 firm, partnership, association or corporation
4 shall install any keyless security device used to
5 control and secure access to the common areas of
6 a residential building without the express
7 written consent of the owner, board of managers,
8 board of directors, or authorized party of such
9 property."

10 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
11 will the sponsor continue to yield.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
13 sponsor yield?

14 SENATOR THOMAS: Yes.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
16 sponsor yields.

17 SENATOR BORRELLO: So the property
18 owner, then, would not be impacted by this
19 legislation, is that correct?

20 SENATOR THOMAS: Through you,
21 Madam President, can you specify "property
22 owner"? Like --

23 SENATOR BORRELLO: Sure. May I
24 answer the question? Okay, through you,
25 Madam President.

1 So the issue is is that the
2 understanding was this was only to apply to a
3 third party like Amazon installing a keyless
4 entry system. Unless I'm misreading this, that's
5 the -- this -- this is now saying that the
6 property owner is -- you're saying without the
7 express permission of the property owner. But
8 what if it is the property owner that's
9 installing it?

10 SENATOR THOMAS: Through you,
11 Madam President, these are specific for
12 residential buildings with more than one or two
13 occupied tenants. So if anyone wants to install
14 such a device, they have to get -- they have to
15 put a notice and permission from those that are
16 living there.

17 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
18 will the sponsor continue to yield?

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
20 sponsor yield?

21 SENATOR THOMAS: Yes.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
23 sponsor yields.

24 SENATOR BORRELLO: There's some
25 language in the bill that says that property

1 owners would not be able to raise the rent if one
2 of these systems is installed. Is that -- but it
3 seems rather vague. Is that indefinite?

4 In other words, if you install a
5 keyless entry system you can never raise the
6 rent, ever, you know, during the term of the -- I
7 realize that that makes you smile. But the
8 reality is if it's not spelled out, that could
9 certainly be interpreted that way, potentially.
10 Legally.

11 SENATOR THOMAS: Through you,
12 Madam President, let me read the section.

13 "In no event shall the installation
14 of such a system be considered a service nor be
15 considered a reason for any purpose to increase
16 rent."

17 So this reading is basically saying
18 it is not an improvement to the property that
19 would lead a landlord to increase the rent.

20 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
21 will the sponsor continue to yield?

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
23 sponsor yield?

24 SENATOR THOMAS: Yes.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: the

1 sponsor yields.

2 SENATOR BORRELLO: So -- but that's
3 not spelled out that way. If you were to say
4 that a keyless entry system should not be
5 considered a -- you know, a capital improvement,
6 therefore leading to a potential increase in
7 rent, that would be a better way to say this.

8 Because the way it reads now is
9 basically saying that if you install a keyless
10 entry system -- some of which, by the way, you
11 can get, you know, at a hardware store for
12 \$100 -- that you would not be able to, you know,
13 raise the rent. And I'm just worried that that
14 would be interpreted by someone as you can't
15 raise the rent because you have a keyless entry
16 system on your -- on your property.

17 SENATOR THOMAS: Through you,
18 Madam President. I mean, just the reading of
19 this, it says the installation of such a system
20 shall not be considered an improvement. So it
21 specifically says that system.

22 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
23 will the sponsor continue to yield?

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
25 sponsor yield?

1 SENATOR THOMAS: Yes.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
3 sponsor yields.

4 SENATOR BORRELLO: So, you know, so
5 it's your definition -- and I realize it's --
6 you're reading the language here, but that this
7 would not preclude them from raising the rent.

8 But what would be the period of
9 time, then, before they would be able to raise
10 the rent if they put in a keyless entry system?

11 SENATOR THOMAS: Through you,
12 Madam President. This chapter amendment is
13 specific for this -- this installation of a
14 device, which they are not considering as
15 improving anything within the structure.

16 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
17 will the sponsor continue to yield?

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
19 sponsor yield?

20 SENATOR THOMAS: Yes.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
22 sponsor yields.

23 SENATOR BORRELLO: So I think my
24 last question here. You know, this certainly
25 makes a little bit more sense if you are in a --

1 like a long-term lease, a one-year lease or
2 whatever, that this wouldn't be considered a
3 capital improvement.

4 But let's say would this apply to,
5 you know, someone who does a short-term rental, a
6 vacation rental? You know, I know a lot of
7 people in that business, and they put a keyless
8 entry system and change the code for every weekly
9 rental. Would that -- how would that be -- how
10 would they be impacted by that?

11 SENATOR THOMAS: Through -- through
12 you, Madam President, it does say, one of the
13 last revisions here says it cannot adversely
14 impact the way anyone uses that property. So,
15 you know, we already have that spelled out in the
16 chapter amendment.

17 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
18 on the bill.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
20 Borrello on the bill.

21 SENATOR BORRELLO: First of all,
22 Senator Thomas, thank you again for your kicking
23 off your session with a debate on this.

24 I think that -- you know, lookit. I
25 didn't stand up here today to ask questions just

1 to hear myself talk, although I'm sure some of
2 you think that's the case --

3 (Laughter.)

4 SENATOR BORRELLO: It's because
5 there are serious questions about this. And it
6 seems like a rather innocuous bill that maybe
7 would help some folks out.

8 I just -- I fear that the way the
9 language is in the bill, that it could be
10 misinterpreted just to mean that if you put a
11 keyless entry system on your piece of property,
12 you can't raise the rent.

13 Now, we might all sit around here as
14 very practical people and say, Oh, no, that's not
15 the case. But, you know, there's a lot of folks
16 out there that are in the business of getting
17 paid for legal services that might disagree.

18 So that concerns me. I have
19 supported this in the past, but due to the
20 questions here, I'm going to be a no.

21 So thank you, Madam President.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
23 you.

24 Are there any other Senators wishing
25 to be heard?

1 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
2 closed. The Secretary will ring the bell.

3 Read the last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
5 act shall take effect on the same date and in the
6 same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2023.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
8 Gianaris.

9 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,
10 we've agreed to restore this bill to the
11 noncontroversial calendar, please, and take it up
12 that way.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Okay.
14 Read the last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
16 act shall take effect on the same date and in the
17 same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2023.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
24 Calendar 36, those Senators voting in the
25 negative are Senators Borrello, Murray, O'Mara

1 and Walczyk.

2 Ayes, 56. Nays, 4.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
4 is passed.

5 Senator Gianaris, that completes the
6 reading of today's calendar.

7 SENATOR GIANARIS: Is there any
8 further business at the desk?

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: There is
10 no further business at the desk.

11 SENATOR GIANARIS: I move to
12 adjourn until tomorrow, Wednesday, January 17th,
13 at 11:00 a.m.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: On
15 motion, the Senate stands adjourned until
16 Wednesday, January 17th, at 11:00 a.m.

17 (Whereupon, the Senate adjourned at
18 4:57 p.m.)

19
20
21
22
23
24
25