NEW YORK STATE SENATE

THE STENOGRAPHIC RECORD

ALBANY, NEW YORK

March 1, 2023

11:32 a.m.

REGULAR SESSION

SENATOR JEREMY A. COONEY, Acting President

ALEJANDRA N. PAULINO, ESQ., Secretary

P R O C E E D I N G S

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The Senate will come to order.

I ask everyone present to please rise and recite the Pledge of Allegiance.

(Whereupon, the assemblage recited the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.)

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Reverend Kevin T. Taylor, pastor of Israel African Methodist Episcopal Church in Albany, New York, will deliver today's invocation.

Pastor.

PASTOR TAYLOR: Thank you.

Let us pray.

God, we thank You for this day, and we thank You for this opportunity.

We thank You, Lord, for allowing us to come together to do the work of the people of New York State.

We pray, Lord, right now for each and every Senator, for each and every staff member, for each and every family that is represented here today. And we are asking, God, that this time that we have allotted to do the people's work would be pleasing in Your sight.

Lord, as we begin this session, this budget season, Lord, we know that there are so many priorities on the calendar, Lord, from hunger to climate change, from healthcare to our children. And, God, we're just asking that as this body deliberates, that they would do their work, Lord, without being disagreeable, that they can disagree without being disagreeable, that they can disagree and commit to doing what is pleasing in Your sight.

We ask, God, right now that You would help them to come together to be able to work for Your glory.

And as we begin this Women's History Month, we thank You, God, for the many women who have served this institution well and are continuing to make history today and always.

It's in Jesus' name we pray. Amen.

(Response of "Amen.")

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank you, Pastor.

Reading of the Journal.

THE SECRETARY: In Senate, Tuesday, February 28, 2023, the Senate met pursuant to adjournment. The Journal of Monday, February 27,

2023, was read and approved. On motion, the Senate adjourned.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Without objection, the Journal stands approved as read.

Presentation of petitions.

Messages from the Assembly.

The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Senator Scarcella-Spanton moves to discharge, from the Committee on Investigations and Government Operations, Assembly Bill Number 2902 and substitute it for the identical Senate Bill 3364A, Third Reading Calendar 281.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: So ordered.

Messages from the Governor.

Reports of standing committees.

Reports of select committees.

Communications and reports from state officers.

Motions and resolutions.

Senator Gianaris.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Good morning, Mr. President.

Can we begin by taking up previously

adopted Resolution 478, have it read in its entirety, and recognize Senator Webb on the resolution.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Senate Resolution 478, by Senator Stewart-Cousins, memorializing Governor Kathy Hochul to proclaim March 2023 as Women's History Month in the State of New York.

"WHEREAS, March is Women's History Month; and

"WHEREAS, March 8th is International Women's Day; and

"WHEREAS, Each year New York State officially sets aside time to recognize the unique contributions that New York women have made to New York State and beyond; and

"WHEREAS, New York State has a distinguished history of monumental achievements in the area of women's rights; and

"WHEREAS, In 1826, New York State opened one of the first public high schools for girls, resulting in a future for women in which they were no longer confined to the home, a future in which they were educated and able to

use this education to better their social and economic status; and

"WHEREAS, In 1848 in New York, the first women's rights convention was held at Seneca Falls to secure for all women the right to vote; and

"WHEREAS, In 1903, The Women's Trade Union League of New York was formed to represent working women, later becoming the nucleus for the International Ladies' Garment Workers' Union; and

"WHEREAS, In 1917, New York guaranteed women the right to vote in all elections, and in the following year the first two women, Ida Sammis and Mary Lilly, were elected to the New York State Legislature and became the first women to then serve in 1919; and

"WHEREAS, In 1955, Bessie Buchanan was the first African-American woman to serve in the New York State Legislature; and

"WHEREAS, In 1967, Muriel Siebert became the first woman to own a seat on the New York Stock Exchange, opening the door for women to gain positions of greater economic power; and

"WHEREAS, In 1968, New York State

Assemblywoman Shirley Chisholm became the first Black woman elected to Congress, and in 1972 she ran for President of the United States, another first for Black women; and

"WHEREAS, In 1970, New York City was the site of the first Women's Strike for Equality in which 50,000 people marched for equal rights; and

"WHEREAS, In 1978, Olga Mendez became the first Latina woman to serve in the New York State Legislature; and

"WHEREAS, In 1983, New York State women legislators established the Legislative Women's Caucus to improve the participation of women in all areas of government, support issues that benefit women, and provide a network of support for women in the State Legislature; and

"WHEREAS, In 2007, Ellen Young was the first Asian-American woman to serve in the New York State Legislature; and

"WHEREAS, In 2009, New Yorker Sonia Sotomayor became the first Hispanic Justice appointed to the United States Supreme Court; and

"WHEREAS, In 2015, New Yorker Loretta Elizabeth Lynch was appointed as

Attorney General of the United States, becoming the first African-American woman to serve in this esteemed position; and

"WHEREAS, New York has been the home of many extraordinary women who have led society to a better future: Elizabeth Cady Stanton and Susan B. Anthony led the campaign for women's suffrage; Sojourner Truth spoke out for the abolition of slavery and for suffrage for all women; and

"WHEREAS, Carrie Chapman Catt became the first president of the League of Women Voters; Emma Willard opened the first endowed institution for the education of women; Civil War surgeon Dr. Mary E. Walker was the only woman ever awarded the Congressional Medal of Honor; Harriet Tubman was an abolitionist who led slaves to freedom by way of the Underground Railroad in the 19th century; and

"WHEREAS, Elizabeth Blackwell and Belva Lockwood were the first women in the fields of medicine and law; pioneer birth control educator and advocate Margaret Sanger established a research center in New York City; and

"WHEREAS, Emma Goldman founded the

Free Speech League which led to the American Civil Liberties Union; humanitarian Eleanor Roosevelt served as United States Delegate to the United Nations; and

"WHEREAS, New Yorker Edith Windsor fought to expand marriage equality in the United States prior to the Marriage Equality Act of New York, which became law in 2011; and

"WHEREAS, Civil rights lawyer and New York State Senator Constance Baker Motley became the first Black woman to sit on the U.S. District Court in New York; and there have been so many more known and unknown women who championed rights and opportunity for all; and

"WHEREAS, New York State has hosted many conventions, campaigns and events of the Women's Rights Movement, from the 1848 convention at Seneca Falls to the 1999 Berkshire Conference of Women Historians, which was held to improve the status of women in history and in the historical professions; and

"WHEREAS, 50 percent of statewide elected officials are women, and for the first time a woman has been elected Attorney General in the State of New York; and

"WHEREAS, 2023 marks the 103rd anniversary of the 19th Amendment, which guaranteed women the right to vote in the United States; and

"WHEREAS, Today, 73 women serve in the New York State Legislature, making up 34 percent of the seats, holding leadership positions in both houses and bringing the diverse experiences of women into law and public policy; now, therefore, be it

"RESOLVED, That this Legislative Body pause in its deliberations to memorialize Governor Kathy Hochul to proclaim March 2023 as Women's History Month in the State of New York; and be it further

"RESOLVED, That copies of this resolution, suitably engrossed, be transmitted to the Honorable Kathy Hochul, Governor of the State of New York, and the Legislative Women's Caucus of New York State."

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator Webb on the resolution.

SENATOR WEBB: Thank you.

I rise to thank my Senate colleagues, and Mr. President, for supporting

this resolution memorializing Governor Kathy Hochul to proclaim the month of March as Women's History Month in the State of New York.

As we gather here today in the Senate chamber, we also are marking the end of Black History Month -- though we celebrate Black History Month every day in this chamber -- and also commemorate the beginning of Women's History Month. And as the Secretary read, we have such a rich legacy of women leaders right here in our State of New York.

And so we also continue that legacy right here in the Senate chamber because we do this under the leadership of Majority Leader Andrea Stewart-Cousins, who is the first Black woman to lead the New York State Senate, and we do this also with a historic class of freshmen Senators. We made women's history when we were sworn in just two months ago -- though it feels like it's been longer -- as the first all-women class of incoming Senators in the 245-year history of the Senate.

I am inspired by the good work we have already done for our communities, and I am proud that we will pave the way for future

generations of women leaders.

And I also want to share a quote from one of my own personal sheroes and also a former great leader here in New York and in our country, Shirley Chisholm. And this particular quote speaks to why it's important to lift up historic months like this, because, as she said: "At present our country needs women's idealism and determination perhaps more in politics than anywhere else."

Mr. President, as the chair of the Women's Issues Committee, I would also like to take a moment, as we mark the beginning of Women's History Month here today, to applaud the critical work we are doing in this Senate chamber to protect the rights of women and ensure that our state remains a sanctuary for reproductive health in the wake of the Supreme Court's decision to overturn Roe v. Wade.

It is also important that we continue to work to improve outcomes from maternal health for all women, but especially for Black mothers and their babies, and also other historically marginalized groups, because we know that they experience the worst childbirth

outcomes in the United States, regardless of their socioeconomic status.

So again, as we mark the beginning of Women's History Month, I hope you will join me in reaffirming our commitment to equal rights, representation, and full access to reproductive health for all women and girls of New York.

I am very proud to be voting in favor of this resolution, and I hope you all will join me as colleagues in celebrating Women's History Month by voting aye.

Thank you.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank you, Senator Webb.

Senator May on the resolution.

SENATOR MAY: Thank you, Mr. President.

I want to thank Senator Webb for bringing this resolution, the Majority Leader, and all of my colleagues who are giving us this moment to recognize the importance of women's history in New York.

The City of Auburn is new to my district, and I have been trying to learn what I can about the history there. They call it

"History's Hometown." And one of the important historical sites is the home of the Seward family. William Henry Seward was a New York State Senator and Governor, and then the Secretary of State in the Lincoln administration, and he was renowned for his abolitionist tendencies and advocating the end of slavery.

But every time he waffled on this issue, every time he backtracked, his wife Frances was there, pushing and pushing and pushing. And the more I learn about her and her influence on her husband and on the -- what the Lincoln administration eventually did, the more I realize we -- there are a lot of unsung heroes among the women of this state.

And I'm very proud to represent the City of Auburn, and I hope everybody will come and visit the Seward House, because it's an amazing historical site here in New York State and, I think, a place we can really celebrate women's history, among many others in this state.

Thank you.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank you, Senator May.

Senator Cleare on the resolution.

SENATOR CLEARE: Thank you, Senator Webb, for introducing this important resolution.

And thank you to my colleagues for celebrating this important month.

As was mentioned, Constance Baker Motley was among the first, but she was among many firsts. And I just wanted to speak on her being the original author of the complaint in Brown v. Board of Education. And she was the first African-American Senator in New York State.

I walk in her footsteps. I am the second from my district. But every day I think about her, and because of her, there is me. And there are others.

So I am very proud of our achievements and our accomplishments, and I just want us to uplift women at all times and keep that door open.

So today I am very proud of Women's History Month, and I vote aye. Thank you.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank you, Senator Cleare.

The resolution was previously adopted on February 28th.

Senator Gianaris.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you, Mr. President.

Can we now move to previously adopted Resolution 313, by Senator Griffo, read that resolution's title, and recognize Senator Griffo.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Senate Resolution 313, by Senator Griffo, commemorating the 31st Anniversary of the Independence of Bosnia and Herzegovina on March 1, 2023.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator Griffo on the resolution.

SENATOR GRIFFO: Thank you, Mr. President.

It's a pleasure to be joined today by a distinguished group of citizens from our community, the Bosnian community in the City of Utica.

As you know, that we in this chamber have traditionally celebrated and commemorated the fight for independence. I know on Monday it was Dominican Independence Day for the Dominican

Republic, and today we -- it's a pleasure to have so many people join us to commemorate and to celebrate Bosnian Independence Day.

With us today in the audience in the East Gallery are Hanka Grabovica, who is an educator with the Utica Academy of Science and also heads the Bosnian American Community Association of Utica. She is joined by a number of citizens, and I'll just identify a couple who are here from various sectors: Osman Ruznic, who is a distinguished businessman in the city of Utica; and Mirza Tihic, who is from academia, a professor at Syracuse University; and Investigator Dino Jukic, who is with the Utica Police Department, law enforcement.

Bosnia and Herzegovina became independent from the former Yugoslavia with a referendum held between February 29th and March 1st of 1992. That independence was officially declared on March 3rd, and Bosnia and Herzegovina was then admitted as a member state of the United Nations in May of 1992.

Unfortunately, as we all recall through history, there was a political upheaval that would eventually turn into a bloody and

brutal war, and there was no doubt that that war had a devastating effect on the country's population and no doubt that it's still felt to this day.

There were major efforts undertaken with refugee programs, and the United States and our communities here in New York benefited from receiving a number of individuals from Bosnia.

Studies have concluded that the death toll from that war unfortunately was over 100,000 individuals. More than 2 million were displaced during that conflict.

So today we're provided with an opportunity to remember and to reflect on all those who lost their lives in their quest for freedom, and to recognize the significance and the many contributions that Bosnians have made to communities throughout this state since their arrival here.

I see these contributions each and every day in my Senate district, especially in the City of Utica, where over 8,000 refugees from Bosnia and Herzegovina have been resettled. These individuals and their families have helped to rebuild our community, to reenergize our

community and the region. They are great examples of putting forth hard work, determination, and resolve, and they have done so much to improve the quality of life for the Mohawk Valley, Central New York, and New York State as a whole.

So it is my pleasure to have all these guests join us from the Bosnian community today. And I would ask, Mr. President, that we give to them all of the privileges and courtesies of this house, and thank them for their many contributions and recognize the significance of what this day means relative to commemorating and recognizing their independence.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank you, Senator Griffo.

To our guests, I welcome you on behalf of the Senate. We extend to you the privileges and courtesies of this house.

Please rise and be recognized.

(Standing ovation.)

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The resolution was previously adopted on January 31st.

Senator Gianaris.

SENATOR GIANARIS: And now can we move to previously adopted Resolution 459, by Senator Stec, read that resolution's title, and recognize Senator Stec, please.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Senate Resolution 459, by Senator Stec, mourning the death of Sue Montgomery Corey, distinguished citizen, caring family member and devoted member of her community.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator Stec on the resolution.

SENATOR STEC: Thank you very much for allowing me to briefly interrupt our proceedings to recognize and mourn the death of a great North Country citizen who passed away in January of this year: Sue Montgomery Corey.

I had the good fortune of knowing Sue since my entry into politics up north. And she was many things. She was certainly a mother and a grandmother and well thought of in her community.

But as we kick off the beginning of Women's History Month, I think it's important to

note and recognize that Sue Montgomery Corey was elected the first female town supervisor of the Town of Minerva in Essex County back in 2009.

She was a Democratic elections commissioner for Essex County. She spent a lot of time mentoring young people in the local schools.

She was born and raised in the North Country. It's amazing that she touches just about every corner of my Senate district. She was born in Potsdam. She attended Altona Central School and graduated from Northern Adirondack Central High School. She was educated at St. Lawrence University. She also got a degree from Rensselaer Polytechnic Institute.

But again, the first female supervisor of the Town of Minerva. A friend to everyone in Essex County. A hard worker. She spent the last eight years of her life in Indian Lake as the director of the Indian Lake Theater.

And just wonderful to recognize her, especially today when we wanted to pause because I also know that there's a connection that she

has to this chamber, in that her daughter Emma works for one of our colleagues, Senator Skoufis. And I believe Senator Skoufis would like to also speak on the resolution.

But on behalf of myself and my Senate district and I'm sure the entire chamber here, we certainly mourn the loss of Sue Montgomery Corey's life, and we certainly extend our condolences and sympathies to her family and especially her daughter Emma, who works with us.

Thank you.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank you, Senator Stec.

Senator Skoufis on the resolution.

SENATOR SKOUFIS: Thanks very much, Mr. President.

And I first want to extend my gratitude to my colleague for his kind words for the family and for introducing this resolution.

Yes, Sue Montgomery Corey -- I've never met her, but by everything I've heard and everything I've read and certainly what we just heard on the floor, she was a remarkable woman in not just her specific community but the entire North Country region.

And she was taken from her family and her community at the far too early age of 64, after a long battle with cancer.

Everyone that knew her characterized her as a woman of immense kindness and wisdom. But in addition to being a loving and caring spouse and mother, she was also a dedicated professional. And usually at the core of that work was public service -- as we just heard, first as the first woman supervisor of Minerva, but also as an elections commissioner for her county, also as the director of the local community theater, and so many other roles.

She's survived by her husband, Mike; her son, Eben, who's here, along with her daughter -- who, as mentioned before, is my office's director of communications -- Emma.

And it is just so wonderful to know, as I'm sure it's wonderful for her family to know, that so many of the qualities that Sue possessed live on through her daughter Emma: The love for creativity and the arts, the intellect, the care, the thoughtfulness, and certainly the -- at the core of Emma's professionalism, and that's public service.

And so I want to thank the sponsor, my colleague. I want to thank you, Mr. President. And I want to thank the chamber for pausing to remember Sue Montgomery Corey.

And it's heartwarming for me to know that Sue's legacy and her memory lives on through her family, and especially Emma. May her memory indeed be a blessing.

Thank you.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank you, Senator Skoufis.

The resolution was previously adopted on February 28th.

Senator Gianaris.

SENATOR GIANARIS: At the request of the sponsors, all the resolutions we took up today are open for cosponsorship.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The resolutions are open for cosponsorship. Should you choose not to be a cosponsor of the resolutions, please notify the desk.

Senator Gianaris.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President, there's a privileged resolution at the desk. Can we please take that up, read its title, and

recognize Senator Mayer on the resolution.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: There is a privileged resolution at the desk.

The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Resolution 479, by Senator Mayer, Concurrent Resolution of the Senate and Assembly providing for the election of three Regents of the University of the State of New York.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator Mayer on the resolution.

SENATOR MAYER: Thank you, Mr. President.

It's my honor to rise in support of this resolution by which the Legislature is naming three members to the Board of Regents.

And everyone doesn't really understand the importance of the Board of Regents; they get it confused with the Regents, the exam. But the Board of Regents is 17 members who are elected by the State Legislature for five-year terms, and each comes from one of the state's 13 Judicial Districts, and four members who serve at large.

This group is responsible for the

vast majority of the education policy of New York State as well as many areas of professional responsibility that are handled by the State Education Department.

They are people who are not paid for their work, and yet their work impacts almost every -- certainly every student and many, many adults. It is one of the most important institutions of New York State government.

So I'm pleased that today we are voting to reappoint Judith Chin, who is the current Regent from the 11th Judicial District in Queens, and Aramina Vega Ferrer, who is currently the Regent from the 12th Judicial District in the Bronx; and one new Regent, Adrian Hale, from the Seventh Judicial District in Rochester.

And these three individuals will join the Board of Regents pursuant to this Concurrent Resolution adopted by the Assembly and the Senate. And under the direction of Chancellor Lester Young, who is the chair of the Board of Regents and Commissioner Betty Rosa, they will help determine probably one of the most important areas of state government, which is the state's education policy.

So I encourage all my colleagues to vote in support of these three very fine members who will join the Board of Regents and help us move New York State forward.

I vote aye and encourage all my colleagues to do the same.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank you, Senator Mayer.

Senator Stavisky on the resolution.

SENATOR STAVISKY: Yes, thank you, Mr. Chairman.

And I too rise in support of the three candidates, two for reelection and one new candidate.

I've spoken many times, both here and when we were in the Assembly chamber with the Concurrent Resolution, about the long history of the Regents in New York State. It goes back to the colonial period. And I used to enjoy reading about former Regent Alexander Hamilton.

And I say to the three Regents -- in fact, to the entire board -- you are continuing a tradition that is unique to New York State. Very few states elect their chief education officers the way we do, by concurrent resolution or a

joint resolution of the Legislature.

I particularly want to mention Regent Chin, because she is a resident of my new district. I've known her for many years, since her days as superintendent in Community School District 25. And she went on to other supervisory positions.

And to Chancellor Lester Young, who's also a constituent.

And I commend the entire Board of Regents for volunteering, for doing the people's work and continuing the tradition started by our colonial leaders during the federal period.

Thank you, Mr. President. I vote aye.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank you, Senator Stavisky.

Senator Murray on the resolution.

SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you very much.

I'd like to echo some of the sentiments here about the importance of what we're doing, of voting on the Regents, and the service they provide.

I spent time in the Assembly, and in

my time there I sat in on all of the interviews, the entire interview process. It was long, but it was -- it was very good. It was a good process. They've done it again this time, weeding through and picking out the best candidates.

So why are we lumping them together in one vote? These are three individual candidates, individual resumes. There have been individual interviews conducted. And yet we're voting, one vote, three different candidates. There may be one that we think is fantastic, one maybe we could have chosen better. But our choice today is up or down, yes or no on all three.

I think it's ridiculous. We should have the opportunity to vote on each individual one, on their merits. And that would be the best process to get the best people.

So I will not be supporting this.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank you, Senator Murray.

The question is on the resolution. The Secretary will call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Resolution 479, those Senators voting in the negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Murray, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Senator Weik.

Ayes, 41. Nays, 19.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The resolution is adopted.

Senator Gianaris.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Can we take up the reading of the calendar, please.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 183, Senate Print 201, by Senator Cleare, an act to amend the Insurance Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect on the first of January.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the

roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator Cleare.

SENATOR CLEARE: Thank you.

Mr. President, when a woman is pregnant, the ability to not only access but receive comprehensive healthcare is vital -- not only for the mother, but for the entire life trajectory of the child upon birth.

New York wisely added pregnancy to the special enrollment period in 2016, allowing pregnant women to apply for insurance in an expedient manner. However, this cannot be done as easily as it should be, and applying is not the same thing is receiving. It requires a medical visit to certify the pregnancy, which can mean fees, bills and charges. Then you have to navigate the marketplace and find a plan, and many plans charge premiums or require contributions.

On top of these premiums, health insurers have the discretion to charge fees to pregnant women who exercise the special enrollment period option.

Women have shared with us that fees and impediments exist, and we believe them. Given that the law does not prohibit fees in this instance and no health plan denies the right to do so, preventive measures are required.

Accordingly, today we have the foresight to remove one more barrier to care. I urge my colleagues to support this legislation and join me in voting aye.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator Cleare to be recorded in the affirmative.

Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 196, Senate Print 1733, by Senator Mayer, an act to amend the Education Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect on the first of July.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar Number 196, those Senators voting in the negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Murray, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

Ayes, 42. Nays, 18.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 234, Senate Print 2623, by Senator Parker, an act to direct the Department of State and the Public Service Commission to jointly study consumer credit reporting.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar Number 234, voting in the negative: Senator Ortt.

Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 246, Senate Print 1451, by Senator Sanders, an act to amend the Public Health Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 248, Senate Print 1867, by Senator Brouk, an act to amend the Public Health Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the

last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This act shall take effect six months after it shall have become a law.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator Brouk to explain her vote.

SENATOR BROUK: Thank you, Mr. President.

I wanted to speak on this because I wanted to make sure that we all understood the importance of it, because sometimes in this chamber we do really, really big things that change the course of history, like passing the Equal Rights Amendment consecutively in two legislative sessions. And sometimes we do things that are quite small, incremental changes that maybe affect a few hundred people in a town or a village in New York.

And then sometimes we do things that seem small but that will actually have huge implications for people in the State of New York. And that's what I think this directory bill will

do.

But to understand the importance of this bill is also to understand what is a doula. And doulas are nonclinical professionals who provide informational, emotional and physical support to birthing people before they give birth, during the birthing process, and in the postpartum time.

And when you look at the statistics of what a doula can mean for someone, they make it so that they decrease the overall Cesarean rate, which can be dangerous procedures, by 50 percent. They can decrease the length of labor by 25 percent. Anyone who's been in labor knows that 25 percent is a real, real positive.

And when you think about where we live in New York State and in this country, this is the worst place in the developed world to give birth to a child. Black women are five times more likely in New York State to die in childbirth, or thereafter. In New York City, they're nine times more likely. And so when you think about doula care, it truly is lifesaving care.

The reason why this directory is so

important is that it will actually make sure this information is out there, because you can't have doula care without making sure it's accessible to those who need it.

But the truth is, our work is not done with this bill. We must also act in this budget session to actually make a Medicaid reimbursement rate for doula care so that the women and birthing people who need this care the most -- and who often don't have two, three, four thousand dollars to spend on it -- are able to use doula care and to also, eventually, save their own lives or their babies' lives.

With that, I want to say thank you to this chamber. Thank you to leadership for seeing the importance of doula care and for pushing this legislation forward.

I'm proud to vote aye.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank you, Senator Brouk. You will be recorded in the affirmative.

Senator Scarcella-Spanton.

SENATOR SCARCELLA-SPANTON: Thank you, Mr. President.

Thank you to my colleague and

fellow mother, Senator Brouk, for this important piece of legislation, another step closer to making New York a safer place to give birth.

As we focus on ways to ensure that we prioritize maternal health, the option of utilizing a doula is a critical piece. New York has made great strides in maternal health, as we see certain legislation being pushed forward.

But I wanted to point out that a doula is different than a midwife. A doula supports your emotional growth in labor. A midwife is a medical professional. I highlight this because they both serve very vital but very different roles in the birth process. While doulas are nonmedical, they can be there for women in ways that a midwife or a doctor may traditionally not be able to.

As we start to highlight the importance of maternal health, and as public awareness increases, the demand for these services will increase as well. Having community doula directories for doulas serving Medicaid patients will streamline the information process for those who are looking to have a safer birth experience that is covered by their insurance.

I proudly vote aye for this legislation, and again I thank my colleague for her work on this.

Thank you.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator Scarcella-Spanton to be recorded in the affirmative.

Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 281, Assembly Print Number 2902, by Assemblymember Cunningham, an act to amend the Alcoholic Beverage Control Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect on the 30th day after it shall have become a law.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator Scarcella-Spanton to explain her vote.

SENATOR SCARCELLA-SPANTON: Thank you, Mr. President.

As our businesses continue to recover from the initial restrictions that were put in place during the pandemic, now more than ever we need to do all we can to support our local establishments with common-sense legislation to make their operations easier.

There is no good reason that we don't allow businesses to sell premixed drinks, and I'm happy to see this bill being put forward today. It's a simple fix that cuts some of the red tape that our small businesses have to go through, and something I hope we can all agree on.

I urge my colleagues to vote aye, and I of course vote aye as well.

Thank you.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator Scarcella-Spanton to be recorded in the affirmative.

Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 335, Senate Print 2076, by Senator Addabbo, an act to amend the Racing, Pari-Mutuel Wagering and Breeding Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 338, Senate Print 3219, by Senator Cleare, an act to amend the Public Health Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect on the 180th day after it shall have become a law.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the

roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 339, Senate Print 3609A, by Senator Webb, an act to amend the Public Health Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect on the same date and in the same manner as Chapter 137 of the Laws of 2022.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar Number 339, those Senators voting in the negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Felder, Griffo, Gallivan, Helming, Lanza, Mattera, Murray, Ortt, Palumbo,

Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik. Also Senator Martins.

Ayes, 40. Nays, 20.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 374, Senate Print 2208, by Senator Liu, an act to amend the Education Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 381, Senate Print 2125, by Senator Rivera, an act to amend the Social Services Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 387, Senate Print 3605, by Senator Webb, an act to amend the Executive Law.

SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Lay it aside.

Senator Gianaris, that completes the reading of today's calendar.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Can we now move to the reading of the controversial calendar, please.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 387, Senate Print 3605, by Senator Webb, an act

to amend the Executive Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The Secretary will ring the bell.

Senator Murray.

SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you.

Through you, Mr. President, would the sponsor yield for a few questions?

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Will the sponsor yield?

SENATOR WEBB: I will yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you very much. Through you, Mr. President.

Can you tell us today -- we're amending the annual report regarding MWBE, and you're offering up some amendments and more information. Can you tell us what amendments and what additional information we're adding?

SENATOR WEBB: Through you, Mr. President. What my bill is proposing to do with regards to data collected, it looks at several things, points, including the total number of MWBEs per year, categorized by minority group and any gender; whether an MWBE contract is

for goods or for services; whether each MWBE contract was awarded to a minority-owned business or a woman-owned business, and which minority group the business is reporting; the names and business addresses of any prime contractors and subcontractors providing services under each MWBE contract; and the dollar value of each MWBE contract.

SENATOR MURRAY: Through you, Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Does the sponsor yield?

SENATOR WEBB: I will yield.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The sponsor yields.

SENATOR MURRAY: Is there anything in here that we're adding to address the certification and in fact, more importantly, the recertification process?

SENATOR WEBB: Through you, Mr. President, the bill as it currently stands does not have that language explicitly.

However, it is the intent with this legislation to create a much more expanded scope

related to data collection, and most certainly that is something that could be considered at a separate time.

SENATOR MURRAY: Very good.

On the bill, Mr. President.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator Murray on the bill.

SENATOR MURRAY: And thank you, Senator.

That is an issue that I've heard quite a bit. And in speaking to the sponsor off to the side, we agree that that -- the recertification process is a difficult process and at times is a bit ambiguous.

And I think adding that information, the recertification numbers, so that we can track to see if there is a falling off of -- from the certification to recertification, and maybe track why, that would be very important.

So I appreciate your willingness to work on this together. I'll be voting aye.

Thank you.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Thank you, Senator Murray.

Are there any other Senators wishing

to be heard?

Seeing and hearing none, the debate is closed. The Secretary will ring the bell.

Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Senator Gianaris.

SENATOR GIANARIS: We have agreed to restore this bill to the noncontroversial calendar. So if we could do that and take it up that way, please.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill is restored to the noncontroversial calendar.

Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: Announce

the results.

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: The bill is passed.

Senator Gianaris, that completes the reading of the calendar.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Is there any further business at the desk?

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: There is no further business at the desk.

SENATOR GIANARIS: I move to adjourn until Wednesday, March 8th, at 3:00 p.m., intervening days being legislative days.

ACTING PRESIDENT COONEY: On motion, the Senate stands adjourned until Wednesday, March 8th, at 3:00 p.m., with the intervening days being legislative days.

(Whereupon, at 12:18 p.m., the Senate adjourned.)