

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

NEW YORK STATE SENATE

THE STENOGRAPHIC RECORD

ALBANY, NEW YORK

December 22, 2022

12:30 p.m.

REGULAR SESSION

SENATOR JAMAAL T. BAILEY, Acting President

ALEJANDRA N. PAULINO, ESQ., Secretary

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
3 Senate will come to order.

4 I ask everyone present to please
5 rise and recite the Pledge of Allegiance.

6 SENATOR O'MARA: I call for a
7 quorum.

8 (Whereupon, the assemblage recited
9 the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
11 O'Mara.

12 SENATOR O'MARA: I call for a
13 quorum.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
15 Secretary shall read the names of the members
16 present to ascertain that a quorum exists.

17 Call the roll.

18 THE SECRETARY: Senator Addabbo.

19 SENATOR ADDABBO: Here.

20 THE SECRETARY: Senator Akshar,
21 excused.

22 Senator Bailey.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Present.

24 THE SECRETARY: Senator Biaggi.

25 SENATOR BIAGGI: Present.

1 THE SECRETARY: Senator Borrello.
2 (No response.)
3 THE SECRETARY: Senator Breslin.
4 SENATOR BRESLIN: Here.
5 THE SECRETARY: Senator Brisport.
6 SENATOR BRISPORT: Here.
7 THE SECRETARY: Senator Brooks.
8 SENATOR BROOKS: Here.
9 THE SECRETARY: Senator Brouk.
10 SENATOR BROUK: Here.
11 THE SECRETARY: Senator Cleare.
12 SENATOR CLEARE: Here.
13 THE SECRETARY: Senator Comrie.
14 SENATOR COMRIE: Here.
15 THE SECRETARY: Senator Cooney.
16 SENATOR COONEY: Present.
17 THE SECRETARY: Senator Felder.
18 (No response.)
19 THE SECRETARY: Senator Gallivan,
20 excused.
21 Senator Gaughran.
22 SENATOR GAUGHRAN: Here.
23 THE SECRETARY: Senator Gianaris.
24 SENATOR GIANARIS: Present.
25 THE SECRETARY: Senator Gounardes.

1 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Present.
2 THE SECRETARY: Senator Griffo.
3 (No response.)
4 THE SECRETARY: Senator Harckham.
5 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Here.
6 THE SECRETARY: Senator Helming.
7 (No response.)
8 THE SECRETARY: Senator Hinchey.
9 SENATOR HINCHEY: Here.
10 THE SECRETARY: Senator Hoylman.
11 (No response.)
12 THE SECRETARY: Senator Jackson.
13 SENATOR JACKSON: Here.
14 THE SECRETARY: Senator Jordan.
15 (No response.)
16 THE SECRETARY: Senator Kaplan,
17 excused.
18 Senator Kavanaugh.
19 (No response.)
20 THE SECRETARY: Senator Kennedy.
21 SENATOR KENNEDY: Here.
22 THE SECRETARY: Senator Krueger.
23 SENATOR KRUEGER: Here.
24 THE SECRETARY: Senator Lanza.
25 (No response.)

1 THE SECRETARY: Senator Liu.
2 SENATOR LIU: Here.
3 THE SECRETARY: Senator Mannion.
4 SENATOR MANNION: Here.
5 THE SECRETARY: Senator Martucci.
6 (No response.)
7 THE SECRETARY: Senator Mattera.
8 (No response.)
9 THE SECRETARY: Senator May.
10 SENATOR MAY: Here.
11 THE SECRETARY: Senator Mayer.
12 SENATOR MAYER: Here.
13 THE SECRETARY: Senator Myrie.
14 SENATOR MYRIE: Here.
15 THE SECRETARY: Senator Oberacker.
16 (No response.)
17 THE SECRETARY: Senator O'Mara.
18 SENATOR O'MARA: Present.
19 THE SECRETARY: Senator Ortt.
20 (No response.)
21 THE SECRETARY: Senator Palumbo.
22 (No response.)
23 THE SECRETARY: Senator Parker.
24 SENATOR PARKER: Present.
25 THE SECRETARY: Senator Persaud.

1 SENATOR PERSAUD: Present.

2 THE SECRETARY: Senator Ramos.

3 SENATOR RAMOS: Presente.

4 THE SECRETARY: Senator Rath.

5 (No response.)

6 THE SECRETARY: Senator

7 Reichlin-Melnick.

8 SENATOR REICHLIN-MELNICK: Present.

9 THE SECRETARY: Senator Ritchie,
10 excused.

11 Senator Rivera.

12 SENATOR RIVERA: Aquí.

13 THE SECRETARY: Senator Ryan.

14 SENATOR RYAN: Here.

15 THE SECRETARY: Senator Salazar.

16 SENATOR SALAZAR: Present.

17 THE SECRETARY: Senator Sanders.

18 SENATOR SANDERS: Present.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: A quorum
20 is present, and the Senate may proceed.

21 In the absence of clergy, let us bow
22 our heads in a moment of silent reflection or
23 prayer.

24 (Whereupon, the assemblage respected
25 a moment of silence.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
2 reading of the Journal.

3 THE SECRETARY: In Senate,
4 Wednesday, December 21, 2022, the Senate met
5 pursuant to adjournment. The Journal of Monday,
6 December 19, 2022, was read and approved. On
7 motion, the Senate adjourned.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Without
9 objection, the Journal stands approved as read.

10 Presentation of petitions.
11 Messages from the Assembly.
12 Messages from the Governor.
13 Reports of standing committees.
14 Reports of select committees.
15 Communications and reports from
16 state officers.

17 Motions and resolutions.

18 Senator Gianaris.

19 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President, I
20 move to adopt the Resolution Calendar.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: All in
22 favor of adopting the Resolution Calendar please
23 signify by saying aye.

24 (Response of "Aye.")

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Opposed,

1 nay.

2 (No response.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
4 Resolution Calendar is adopted.

5 Senator Gianaris.

6 SENATOR GIANARIS: At this time,
7 Mr. President, we will call an immediate meeting
8 of the Rules Committee in Room 332.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: There
10 will be an immediate meeting of the Rules
11 Committee in Room 332.

12 SENATOR GIANARIS: The Senate will
13 stand at ease.

14 THE SECRETARY: The Senate will
15 stand at ease.

16 (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease
17 at 12:34 p.m.)

18 (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at
19 12:40 p.m.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
21 Senate will return to order.

22 Senator Gianaris, I assume that was
23 not "Hip-Hop Parade"; I assume that you were
24 trying to get my attention.

25 SENATOR GIANARIS: (Laughing.)

1 Thank you, Mr. President.

2 I believe there's a report of the
3 Rules Committee at the desk. Can we take that
4 up, please.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
6 Secretary will read.

7 THE SECRETARY: Senator
8 Stewart-Cousins, from the Committee on Rules,
9 reports the following bill: Senate Print 9617,
10 by Senator Stewart-Cousins, an act to amend the
11 Legislative Law.

12 The bill reports direct to third
13 reading.

14 SENATOR GIANARIS: I move to accept
15 the report of the Rules Committee.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: All those
17 in favor of accepting the report of the Rules
18 Committee signify by saying aye.

19 (Response of "Aye.")

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Opposed,
21 nay.

22 (Response of "Nay.")

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
24 report of the Rules Committee is accepted.

25 Senator Gianaris.

1 SENATOR GIANARIS: Let's take up
2 the reading of the supplemental calendar, please.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
4 Secretary will read.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 1927, Senate --

7 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Lay it
9 aside.

10 That completes the reading of the
11 supplemental calendar.

12 SENATOR GIANARIS: Can we please
13 take up the reading of the controversial calendar
14 now.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
16 Secretary will ring the bell.

17 The Secretary will read.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 1927, Senate Print 9617, by
20 Senator Stewart-Cousins, an act to amend the
21 Legislative Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
23 Lanza, happy holidays. Merry Christmas, Happy
24 Hanukkah, Happy Kwanzaa. Why do you rise?

25 SENATOR LANZA: All the best to

1 you, Mr. President.

2 I rise because I believe,
3 Mr. President, that there is an amendment at the
4 desk. I waive the reading of that amendment and
5 I ask that you recognize Senator Helming to be
6 heard.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
8 you, Senator Lanza.

9 Upon review of this amendment, in
10 accordance with Rule 6, Section 4B, I rule it
11 nongermane and out of order at this time.

12 SENATOR LANZA: Accordingly,
13 Mr. President, I appeal the ruling of the chair
14 and ask that you recognize Senator Helming.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
16 appeal has been made and recognized, and
17 Senator Helming may be heard.

18 SENATOR HELMING: Thank you,
19 Mr. President. Happy holidays to you.

20 Mr. President, I rise to appeal the
21 ruling of the chair. The proposed amendment
22 before you is germane to the bill at hand because
23 the bill before this chamber today provides a pay
24 raise for members of the Legislature.

25 It has been widely reported that

1 legislative members in both chambers deserve a
2 pay raise due to their hard work and to address
3 the rising cost of living.

4 Mr. President, I agree that the cost
5 of living is skyrocketing. But what we need to
6 focus on and what we need to remember is that the
7 cost of daily living is squeezing everyone in
8 this state. This body should take immediate
9 action to provide some relief for our
10 constituents rather than prioritizing our own
11 incomes.

12 New Yorkers are struggling, we all
13 know this -- struggling to heat their homes, to
14 keep their lights on, and to feed their families.
15 They're trying to manage their budgets at this
16 time of year, trying to stretch them during the
17 holidays. Many are facing a new year filled with
18 concerns about job security and wage freezes.

19 Our small local businesses are still
20 suffering. They're suffering from the increasing
21 costs as well as still trying to recover from the
22 pandemic and mandated government closures.

23 And Mr. President, I sure hope we
24 can all agree our state is facing an
25 unprecedented affordability crisis. And if we're

1 being honest, we're also facing an unprecedented
2 crime crisis.

3 Calling a special session to vote on
4 a member pay increase makes it appear that many
5 in this chamber are out of touch and more
6 concerned with self-enrichment than providing
7 much-needed relief for our constituents and our
8 local employers.

9 Mr. President, rather than provide a
10 pay hike to the 213 elected officials in both
11 bodies, on behalf of our Republican Conference I
12 have proposed a five-point plan that prioritizes
13 and provides relief to millions -- millions of
14 New Yorkers.

15 The first part of my proposal,
16 Part A, deals with a state spending cap. This
17 part would statutorily establish a 2 percent cap
18 on state spending. It would increase the amount
19 that the state is authorized to deposit in the
20 state's rainy day reserve fund. This would
21 effectively limit out-of-control state spending
22 and tackle sky-high inflation.

23 The second part of our plan, Part B,
24 deals with reducing income taxes by indexing to
25 inflation. So many of us, we hear the reports

1 all the time -- the most recent one that I saw
2 was from WalletHub, and it reported New York is
3 the 2022 state with the most tax burden. Our
4 constituents are looking to us, their elected
5 leaders, for help to reverse this trend.

6 Part B would do this by providing
7 New York taxpayers with a roughly 300 million
8 annual tax break. Part B would prevent stealth
9 tax increases by adjusting tax brackets for
10 inflation, commonly known as indexing. Inflation
11 causes what is known as bracket creep, which
12 results in our taxpayers moving into higher tax
13 brackets. This results in taxpayers paying
14 higher taxes without any real increase to their
15 income.

16 During this period of rampant
17 inflation, taxpayers will face stealth tax
18 increases never approved for or voted on or
19 discussed by their elected lawmakers.

20 The third part of our plan, Part C,
21 would increase child tax credits, something that
22 we all hear is desperately needed. This part
23 would increase and expand the value of tax
24 credits, which would help to make childcare more
25 affordable for struggling New York families.

1 Currently the Empire State Child Credit only
2 applies to children above the age of 4. This
3 proposal would eliminate that threshold and make
4 it apply to all children.

5 Additionally, this proposal would
6 recouple New York's tax credit to the federal tax
7 credit, which would provide roughly 500 million
8 in aid to New York's parents. This change, I
9 believe, will also help us stabilize the
10 workforce shortages impacting every business
11 sector, from Main Street businesses to
12 manufacturing, from our schools and our medical
13 facilities to our nursing homes.

14 The fourth part of our plan, Part D,
15 would reduce the tax burden for seniors with
16 private pensions. I'm sure everyone in this
17 chamber, like me, has heard from concerned
18 seniors in their district. Inflation and rising
19 costs are forcing many of our seniors to make
20 difficult choices: Medications or groceries, gas
21 in the car or pay the utility bills.

22 Part D allows seniors to keep more
23 of their hard-earned retirement income by
24 increasing the value of private pensions and
25 annuities that are tax-free for people over the

1 age of 59½, from its current value of \$20,000.
2 The amount would be increased as follows. In
3 2023, it would go up to 25,000; in '24, 30,000;
4 in '25, 35,000; in '26 and beyond, to \$40,000.

5 The final part of our five-point
6 plan, Part E, is a fix to Unemployment Insurance
7 Fund issues by establishing set contribution
8 rates and a reserve fund. This part would
9 alleviate the billions of dollars in unemployment
10 insurance taxes and assessments on small business
11 as a result of the -- (pause for background noise
12 to subside). This part would alleviate the
13 billions in unemployment insurance taxes and
14 assessments on small businesses as a result of
15 pandemic-related job loss, failed state policy,
16 forced closures, and rampant fraud. On fraud
17 alone, the Comptroller's office recently
18 identified \$11 billion in improper unemployment
19 payments.

20 Part E would protect businesses from
21 these tax increases by reducing rates, paying
22 down the deficit, and creating an unemployment
23 insurance insolvency reserve fund.

24 So, Mr. President, with your support
25 and with the support of all of our colleagues in

1 this chamber, we can pass this amendment and show
2 our constituents and our local employers that
3 they are our top priority -- not our own
4 self-interest.

5 For all these reasons,
6 Mr. President, I strongly urge you to reconsider
7 your ruling.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
9 you, Senator Helming.

10 I would like to remind the house
11 that the vote is on the procedures of the house
12 and the ruling of the chair.

13 Those in favor of overruling the
14 chair, signify by saying aye.

15 SENATOR LANZA: Request a show of
16 hands.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: So
18 ordered.

19 Call the roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 16.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
23 ruling of the chair stands, and the bill-in-chief
24 is before the house.

25 The Secretary will ring the bell.

1 The Secretary will read.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 1927, Senate Print 9617, by
4 Senator Stewart-Cousins, an act to amend the
5 Legislative Law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
7 Borrello, why do you rise?

8 SENATOR BORRELLO: First of all, to
9 say Merry Christmas and Happy Holidays.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Merry
11 Christmas, Senator Borrello. Happy Holidays.

12 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you,
13 Mr. President.

14 Would the sponsor yield for some
15 questions -- for a question.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
17 sponsor yield?

18 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
19 Senator Krueger will be handling debate for the
20 Majority.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
22 you, Senator Gianaris.

23 Senator Krueger, do you yield?

24 SENATOR KRUEGER: I do, sir.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator

1 Krueger yields.

2 SENATOR BORRELLO: First of all,
3 Merry Christmas, Happy Holidays.

4 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you.

5 SENATOR BORRELLO: So just
6 curious -- and I'm sure a lot of New Yorkers are
7 curious -- we're here a couple of days before
8 Christmas. So why are we here right now at this
9 particular time to vote on this single bill?
10 What's the reason?

11 SENATOR KRUEGER: Because
12 technically you cannot vote for a salary raise
13 for the existing legislative session, only for
14 the next Legislature.

15 So come January 1, some of us won't
16 be here anymore because we are not returning, and
17 some new people on both sides will be here, and
18 this salary raise will apply to them. Now, when
19 I say "them," in your and my case, I think it
20 includes both of us as part of "them."

21 But that is why we're doing it now,
22 because otherwise any salary increase wouldn't go
23 into effect until January '25.

24 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you.

25 Mr. President, will the sponsor

1 continue to yield?

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
3 sponsor yield?

4 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
6 sponsor yields.

7 SENATOR BORRELLO: So we have a few
8 days left in the year, and that's an
9 understandable explanation as to why. But yet we
10 were -- we could have done this three months ago,
11 six months ago, before the election -- which
12 probably would have been a nice thing for the
13 people of New York to understand this was the
14 intent.

15 Why did we wait so long, until just
16 a few days before the end of the year?

17 SENATOR KRUEGER: Because for any
18 number of reasons -- and there are many -- there
19 have been whole sections of decades where we
20 didn't do increases in salary. And then we had a
21 commission and then we had a court case, and we
22 couldn't do any action during the court case.

23 And then you need a governor who's
24 going to actually sign this, because otherwise
25 what is the point. And we've had governors who

1 didn't want to sign this or governors who seemed
2 to think they could do trading deals on other
3 things the Legislature didn't support in
4 exchange.

5 So we do find ourselves in this rare
6 moment of the history that I have been part of
7 where we can vote for it for the next session, we
8 have justification for it. And sort of the stars
9 have aligned that we believe both houses will
10 pass this and a governor will sign it.

11 Now, I've been here since 2002, and
12 I believe this will only be the second raise the
13 Legislature has seen actually since 1998. So
14 it's not like we do this very often.

15 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you.

16 Mr. President, will the sponsor
17 continue to yield.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
19 sponsor yield?

20 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes, certainly.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
22 Krueger yields.

23 SENATOR BORRELLO: So I understand
24 the Legislature -- that there was some litigation
25 that was going on. But you bring up the

1 Governor. And it actually brought up a thought
2 in my head.

3 Now, let's just assume for a moment
4 that every Democrat here votes for this and every
5 Republican votes against it. You have a
6 supermajority, which is enough to override a
7 veto. Yet in the three years I've been here,
8 I've never seen you override a veto.

9 In fact, we're coming here today
10 after the Governor vetoed several bills, some of
11 which that were really important to a lot of
12 people on -- my friends on the other side of the
13 aisle, that you could very easily override the
14 vote on. You've got things that would help folks
15 who are developmentally disabled, Senator
16 Mannion's bill; things to help working seniors,
17 Senator May's bill; dyslexia, climate change,
18 shoreline flooding. Yet this body has never
19 overridden a veto.

20 Why wouldn't you do that? And if
21 you were to -- if she were to veto this pay
22 increase, you could override that. Why do we
23 have to wait for a Governor that would actually,
24 you know, sign this, because clearly you don't
25 need that.

1 SENATOR KRUEGER: Well, I don't
2 know if that's actually true. Certainly evidence
3 is even when either party in this house has had a
4 supermajority, or the Assembly across the hall,
5 it's been extraordinarily rare, as you point out,
6 for people to actually pull off enough votes for
7 a veto of the Governor.

8 So I, standing here today, certainly
9 couldn't say in honesty that I imagined that we
10 could get 42 votes to override any specific veto,
11 nor that the Assembly could get the required
12 number that they have, 76 -- a hundred votes,
13 thank you. Oh, right, two-thirds, hello -- a
14 hundred votes to override a vote. I'm not sure
15 that that would be possible today either. I
16 guess we would have to explore that if the option
17 was before us.

18 But right now, we're hoping that we
19 have the votes to pass this bill. The Assembly,
20 we believe, is also intending to pass the bill; I
21 know they are going to the floor or have gone to
22 the floor today as well on the same bill. And I
23 believe that the Governor will sign this. I
24 don't know, but I believe.

25 So I don't think the supermajority

1 question comes into play today. But I think it
2 also highlights what I think we all know. Even
3 if you have a supermajority on any given day on
4 any given bill, it's statistically very rare that
5 100 percent of us, in the case of the Senate
6 Dems, would be in exact agreement and you could
7 get all of us to vote in a certain way. We have
8 differences in opinion in our conference as I am
9 sure you have differences of opinion in your
10 conference. That's what makes, you know, the
11 magic of democracy.

12 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you.

13 Mr. President, will the sponsor
14 continue to yield?

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
16 Krueger, do you yield?

17 SENATOR KRUEGER: I will,
18 Mr. President.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
20 Krueger yields.

21 SENATOR BORRELLO: So this salary
22 increase is \$32,000. Unprecedented. There are
23 certainly people that don't make that in a year,
24 and we're going to give this in one fell swoop.
25 Why that number? Why \$32,000?

1 SENATOR KRUEGER: So it is
2 factoring in where the commission was likely or
3 had recommended we go by 2021. And now we're
4 talking about '23, so we made some adjustments
5 going up from where '21 to '23 would bring us.

6 And we did factor in an inflation
7 rate. And as you pointed out -- or, excuse me,
8 as your colleague pointed out, we are living in a
9 time of very high inflation.

10 We're also, frankly, assuming that
11 we will go many, many years again before we
12 increase the salary, based on the statistics of
13 how infrequently we raise our salaries. And I
14 know that I have had constituents tell me they
15 don't understand how you would have a job that
16 didn't do any increases in salary for 18,
17 20 years at a time, how that is that possible.

18 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
19 will the sponsor continue to yield?

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
21 sponsor yield?

22 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes, I do.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
24 sponsor yields.

25 SENATOR BORRELLO: So you brought

1 up the salary commission. Which, yes, they had
2 recommended originally to go to 130,000 in '21.
3 So two years later, it's \$12,000 over two years
4 above their recommendation. That's -- even with
5 this high inflation we're experiencing now, it's
6 still well above the rate of inflation.

7 So, I guess, how do we justify
8 \$12,000 over the recommendation that would have
9 only gone into place last year? That's my
10 question.

11 SENATOR KRUEGER: So what we
12 actually attempted to do was to calculate what
13 the inflation impact would have been if we were
14 correctly adjusting our salary over time for --
15 over the last 20 years.

16 So if we had just done -- so forget
17 what the commission recommended. If we had just
18 done an inflationary adjustment from 79,500,
19 which it was 20 years ago, to today, we'd
20 actually be raising our salary to 145,000. So
21 we're actually raising it to below what inflation
22 would have put us at.

23 SENATOR BORRELLO: Will the sponsor
24 continue to yield?

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the

1 sponsor yield?

2 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes, I will.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
4 sponsor yields.

5 SENATOR BORRELLO: So it was
6 really, in essence, going against what the salary
7 commission has done, it was just a calculation
8 based on the inflation rate since the 79.5 when
9 there were also stipends to the -- were those
10 stipends included, like as an average? because
11 there were additional stipends given for -- my
12 understanding, I wasn't here -- for leadership
13 positions and chairs of committees and ranking
14 members and so forth. Which I'm understanding
15 most, except for the most junior members, did
16 receive.

17 So was that factored into your
18 salary calculation?

19 SENATOR KRUEGER: So the commission
20 did get rid of the vast majority of the stipends.
21 I think there's only -- (pause).

22 So there's a small number of
23 leadership stipends that are left in the law
24 since the commission made its determination.
25 We're not changing that.

1 And as far as historical stipends, I
2 think it's sort of moot at this point because
3 those are people who came and left, they were
4 different points in time in the Legislature.

5 I personally have always held the
6 philosophy that I didn't support stipends, so I
7 never took mine. And I don't take mine now.

8 And again, everyone can have their
9 own opinions on these. And I am perfectly
10 comfortable with -- if your colleagues who vote
11 no today don't want the increase in their salary,
12 I have learned it's very easy to give it back.
13 You just write a note to Tom DiNapoli, the
14 Comptroller, saying "Don't give me the extra
15 money," and he doesn't, and it stays in the
16 General Fund.

17 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
18 will the sponsor continue to yield.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
20 sponsor yield?

21 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
23 sponsor yields.

24 SENATOR BORRELLO: I am certain
25 that my colleagues, who all work very hard,

1 aren't going to want to take less than those that
2 perhaps don't work as hard at this job. So I
3 would say that that's probably a moot point. In
4 the private sector you get compensated for the
5 work that you do; not so here.

6 So that being said, my question is,
7 are you aware of what other legislatures make
8 across this nation? And this would obviously
9 make us the highest paid. Do you have any -- you
10 know, was there any comparison to what other
11 legislatures do?

12 I know you -- I know my friends on
13 the other side of the aisle love to keep up with
14 California. Well, you're going to surpass them
15 in this particular race.

16 So was there any thought given to
17 that?

18 SENATOR KRUEGER: We did do that
19 work.

20 I'd like to point out,
21 Mr. President, that I appreciate my colleague's
22 point that their members work very hard, so he
23 assumes that they will probably take the salary
24 increase. I think we are actually all in
25 agreement with that. We all work very hard. In

1 fact, I know few people who have job descriptions
2 that require pretty much 24/7 response to their
3 community -- that we come up here for six months
4 a year and we do the work on the floor of the
5 Legislature and in committees and in hearings, we
6 go home, and guess what, everyone needs us on the
7 weekends and on the evenings.

8 So I personally can happily stand
9 here and say I know that all 63 -- maybe there
10 are still 62 until January 1st, whatever -- 63 of
11 us work extremely hard on behalf of our
12 constituents. And I don't think anyone should
13 decide not to take the salary increase. But if
14 they feel so strongly about this issue, they
15 certainly have the ability not to take the salary
16 increase.

17 I think that you are correct, we
18 will now be the highest-paid state legislature in
19 the country. We're also, as also has been
20 pointed out earlier, one of the most expensive
21 countries -- excuse me, one of the most expensive
22 states in the country, where our cost of living
23 is significantly higher than most states. And
24 some of us live in a section of the state where
25 our cost of living is radically higher than most

1 of the State of New York or any of the other
2 49 states. Maybe not Hawaii; it's damn expensive
3 in Hawaii. But we did look at the other states.

4 But we also looked at local-election
5 governments. The City Council makes
6 significantly more than we in the State
7 Legislature. I believe that the Nassau and
8 Suffolk County legislatures make more. I think
9 there are other local governments around the
10 state where they make more.

11 And I think we'd still be making
12 less than pharmacies at -- the pharmacists,
13 excuse me -- at which pharmacies did we look up?
14 It was a report I read.

15 SENATOR BORRELLO: (Inaudible.)

16 SENATOR KRUEGER: So that -- pardon
17 me? I love pharmacists. We need them all, trust
18 me. But I'm not sure they work 24/7. And so we
19 can find many career paths in the State of
20 New York that would definitely be more lucrative
21 than the Legislature before or after this salary
22 increase.

23 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
24 will the sponsor continue to yield.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the

1 sponsor yield?

2 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
4 sponsor yields.

5 SENATOR BORRELLO: Do you happen to
6 know what the average family income is in
7 New York State?

8 SENATOR KRUEGER: We'll have to get
9 that for you. But you might know the answer and
10 tell me.

11 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
12 will the sponsor continue to yield?

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Would the
14 sponsor yield?

15 SENATOR KRUEGER: I will.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
17 sponsor yields.

18 SENATOR BORRELLO: Yes, the answer
19 to the question, according to the U.S. Census for
20 2021, was \$74,314. That's what the average
21 family income is in New York State.

22 So we're going to give individuals
23 in this chamber roughly double what the average
24 family in New York State makes. I realize -- I
25 agree with you, New York State is an expensive

1 place to live. Largely due to the actions that
2 happen in this chamber, unfortunately. But it is
3 still double what the average family income makes
4 in New York.

5 So with that being said, you know,
6 to have this big jump -- was there any
7 consideration given to just taking the salary we
8 have now and maybe indexing it to inflation so,
9 as you said, we don't have to come back and have
10 these debates and conversations and consternation
11 over?

12 Why not just peg it to inflation so
13 that if that salary was acceptable when you took
14 it, and you stayed here for whatever period of
15 time, it will still be essentially, in real
16 dollars -- or, excuse me, inflation-adjusted
17 dollars, the same salary? Why wouldn't we just
18 do that?

19 SENATOR KRUEGER: That was not the
20 agreement that was come to for this moment in
21 history.

22 It's an interesting proposal. I
23 always like inflation-adjusted programs. And
24 since as I previously explained, technically this
25 salary raise will still be below if we had just

1 done inflation for the last 20 years, you could
2 make the proposal in January, perhaps, that we
3 should pass a law that we are now also going to
4 do an inflation adjustment for future legislative
5 sessions, which will perhaps avoid this
6 conversation or this scene in any future
7 legislative years.

8 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you.

9 Mr. President, will the sponsor
10 continue to yield?

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
12 sponsor yield?

13 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
15 sponsor yields.

16 SENATOR BORRELLO: So state
17 legislatures across the nation, some are
18 part-time, some are full-time, but in California,
19 which is a much larger state than New York, they
20 make \$119,702 a year. We'll be more than that.
21 Much larger state, larger population.

22 The state of Florida, a much larger
23 population than New York State, \$29,697. Texas,
24 a larger state than New York: \$7,200 is what
25 they make per year. Somehow these guys

1 survive -- these men and women survive making
2 these salaries and still are legislators and
3 also, with the exception of California, have a
4 lower tax burden than New York State does.

5 So with that being said, you are now
6 elevating this to \$142,000 a year. We all agree
7 that we work hard. Is this now going to be a
8 full-time position? Since you're also limiting
9 outside income, which would make it a, by
10 definition --

11 SENATOR KRUEGER: We have limited
12 outside income. And we have not written into
13 this bill making it full-time, although I would
14 certainly be a supporter of that.

15 Or, as I often explain to people, I
16 have been here now 20, almost 21 years. I must
17 be doing it very badly; it takes me 24/7 after
18 21 years. So I do believe it is a full-time job
19 for myself, and I don't have another job. Other
20 people have figured out how to combine what they
21 do in the Legislature with outside income. My --
22 my hat goes off to them, because I just don't
23 even understand -- I sometimes don't get my
24 laundry done for X number of weeks because I'm so
25 busy. So it's amazing that people can pull all

1 of this off.

2 Having said that, we are changing
3 the rules so that the amount of outside income
4 will be limited and actually even less available
5 to you after a two-year period, because we
6 implement new rules to go in two years from now.

7 And to be honest, I think the
8 definition of part-time versus full-time may need
9 clarification in our current law. But I would
10 challenge any of my colleagues here with me today
11 to stand up and say, yeah, they think it's a
12 part-time job, they're really only doing it
13 part-time, because I just don't see that reality
14 in any of our districts anywhere in the State of
15 New York.

16 So I would be fine with changing the
17 definition to full-time.

18 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
19 will the sponsor continue to yield.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
21 sponsor yield?

22 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes, sir.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
24 sponsor yields.

25 SENATOR BORRELLO: So I believe

1 that that -- that definition may be tied to the
2 Constitution of this state of a part-time
3 position. And I think that was wise, because we
4 want citizen legislators, people who have skin in
5 the game in the success of New York State's
6 economy.

7 And those that are more insulated
8 from that by bad policy decisions -- which we
9 will now be that much more financially insulated
10 from that -- I think that was the reason why, and
11 probably should remain that way. That's why it
12 should be a part-time position, in my opinion.

13 But with that said, I'm not sure --
14 and if you can answer this -- can we limit
15 outside income when it is still, according to the
16 Constitution, a part-time position?

17 SENATOR KRUEGER: I'm advised by
18 counsel that yes, we can.

19 I suppose someone can litigate that
20 question once it is the language of the law,
21 since we all know everything can be litigated
22 here once it passes. But we are fairly
23 confident that the language in the law to be
24 passed today would withstand constitutional
25 scrutiny.

1 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
2 on the bill.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
4 Borrello on the bill.

5 SENATOR BORRELLO: Senator Krueger,
6 thank you very much. Our last exchange I think
7 in the literary world will be called
8 foreshadowing when it comes to future litigation,
9 potentially.

10 You know, the people of New York
11 State have suffered a lot, Mr. President.
12 They've suffered a lot unfortunately because of
13 the self-inflicted wounds that have happened
14 here. And they have asked us to come back and do
15 a special session -- I've heard it from my
16 constituents, I've heard it from pundits, I've
17 heard it from local elected officials: Go back
18 to Albany and fix the things that you've broken.
19 Number first and foremost, public safety, crime,
20 the so-called criminal justice reforms. Go back
21 and fix that. We're not doing that.

22 Go back and take care of the
23 Unemployment Insurance Fund, which is at its
24 highest level -- its lowest level, it's
25 practically bankrupt. And instead of refilling

1 that fund, and coming back to do that and using
2 funds that we have available to help fill that
3 crater that impacts every single business, every
4 small business owner -- anyone that writes a pay
5 check is being impacted by that. We're not
6 coming back to do that.

7 We're not coming back to address the
8 amendment that Senator Helming offered, all those
9 great ideas that would actually do things to
10 improve the lives of New Yorkers going into 2023.

11 We've come back here today, a couple
12 of days before Christmas, to raise our own
13 salary. That's what we're doing here today.
14 None of the other stuff that New Yorkers really
15 want. Because I don't think in a poll a majority
16 of New Yorkers -- not even close -- would say you
17 should go back to Albany in special session and
18 give yourselves a raise and pat yourselves on the
19 back. Because that's what we're doing today.

20 We're also talking about limiting
21 outside income. Sounds like a great idea. I'm
22 sure on the surface a lot of people would think
23 that's a good idea. The problem with that is it
24 further insulates us from the impact of the harm
25 that we do. I'm a small business owner, my wife

1 and I. Every day we deal with the impact of the
2 high taxes, of the overregulation. I bear the
3 scars every day when I walk into this chamber or
4 do my job back in the district of what it's like
5 to do business here, to operate a business. As
6 do others -- the farmers that we have in the
7 Legislature, people that are professionals. They
8 understand that.

9 And the less people like that in
10 this chamber, the less -- the more out of touch
11 this chamber will become.

12 Our founding fathers left tyranny
13 because they were ruled by people that weren't
14 impacted by their own decisions. They had lots
15 of money, they had lots of food, they had lots of
16 independence because they ruled the roost. And
17 that's why our founding fathers came here and
18 founded this nation. And they intended, in
19 Washington as well, for there to be citizen
20 legislators that had skin in the game in the
21 success of our nation and our state.

22 Today we take a big, giant step
23 backwards, a giant step backwards in ensuring
24 that we are in touch with the needs of the people
25 we represent. That's what this does today. You

1 can dress it up any way you want, but that's what
2 it does today. We're going to get paid double
3 what a family makes -- a family, an average
4 family in New York State makes. We're going to
5 get paid double that, each individual.

6 And you're not going to have to
7 worry about paying those rising gas bills, thanks
8 to the CLCPA and the CAC that just a couple of
9 days ago signed what the New York Post aptly
10 called the "green suicide pact" that's going to
11 raise the cost of everything in New York State --
12 and get zero impact, by the way, on greenhouse
13 gas emissions as we continue to import more power
14 from dirty, old-fashioned coal plants in places
15 like Homer City, Pennsylvania, to power New York
16 State. So it's going to make it more expensive,
17 and we're going to be that much more out of touch
18 with reality.

19 And that's the problem with this
20 bill. It is out of touch with what the average
21 New Yorker has to deal with.

22 So, Mr. President, I'll be voting
23 no. Thank you.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
25 you, Senator Borrello.

1 Are there any other Senators wishing
2 to be heard?

3 Senator Lanza.

4 SENATOR LANZA: Mr. President,
5 thank you. It's good to see you, all my
6 colleagues, although I wish I weren't here to see
7 you.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
9 Lanza, are you on the bill or are you asking the
10 sponsor to yield?

11 SENATOR LANZA: I'm on the bill,
12 Mr. President.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
14 Lanza on the bill.

15 SENATOR LANZA: On the bill.

16 So there are two parts to this
17 legislation, obviously. The one portion deals
18 with a very steep pay raise for legislators, both
19 here in the Senate and in the Assembly. And the
20 other portion deals with moving beyond and ending
21 the idea that a citizen legislature is best for
22 the people of New York. I'll take up the first
23 part.

24 So with respect to a pay raise, I --
25 you know, I think there are two valid theories

1 that I've often thought about with respect to the
2 salary of a member of this body. On the one
3 hand, I think, having come from the private
4 sector -- I had a business that developed
5 software, I worked to get my CPA at Peat Marwick
6 a hundred years ago. I was in the DA's office in
7 Manhattan -- not the private sector. But
8 nevertheless, I keep doing different things. So
9 I've seen a lot about -- I've seen a lot with
10 respect to, you know, what different jobs pay and
11 what they're worth.

12 And I think you can make a very good
13 argument that if you do this job right and you
14 devote yourself in the way that you ought to,
15 that if you were to try to sort of equate the
16 value of our service to what happens in the
17 private sector, I think you could make a very
18 good argument that the salary ought to be 162,
19 142, 175, 200, 225. I think you could make that
20 argument, Mr. President. And I would make that
21 argument.

22 I think there's another theory that
23 I thought -- think is valid if you believe in the
24 idea, as I do, in a citizen legislature, that
25 would suggest that perhaps the salaries -- don't

1 throw anything -- that the salary ought to be cut
2 dramatically.

3 The theory there -- and some states
4 do this, by the way. The theory there is that
5 you don't come here to make a living from the
6 taxpayer, you come from your community, from your
7 neighborhoods, from your jobs -- jobs like the
8 people who are your constituents have -- you come
9 here, you do the people's work, you do a budget,
10 you pass important legislation, and then you go
11 back to, quote, unquote -- I don't want to
12 disparage -- but your real job. Which keeps you
13 connected, as Senator Borrello suggested, keeps
14 you connected to I think what is important to the
15 people that we represent.

16 And so I think there are two sides
17 to the argument. We can debate those. And I
18 think there's some validity to both sides. I
19 fall on the, you know, pay-cut side. I think you
20 end up with a better legislature eventually.

21 But whichever side of the argument
22 you subscribe to or support, it is said that
23 timing is everything in life. And the really
24 serious problem I have with respect to the pay
25 raise is its timing. And I don't mean two days

1 before Christmas Eve. I don't mean in the
2 Hanukkah season. I don't mean in the season that
3 people are celebrating many different things. I
4 don't mean a couple of days before the year end
5 when we're going to have a new legislative
6 session in a week or two. I don't mean that
7 timing.

8 I mean the timing of what is
9 happening right now in New York State, what is
10 happening at this time in the lives of the people
11 we represent.

12 Thousands of New Yorkers are going
13 cry themselves to sleep tonight and every night
14 because they lost their son or their daughter or
15 their sister or their brother or their aunt or
16 their uncle or their mother or their father to
17 drug overdose deaths. Fentanyl, flooding into
18 the State of New York for a variety of reasons,
19 chief among them, in my opinion, because of bad
20 policies and bad messaging by elected officials
21 in this state. Because of things like sanctuary
22 states and we think we ought to be more
23 permissive when it comes to things that are
24 killing our children rather than less permissive.

25 At this time, right now, today,

1 New Yorkers are trying to figure out how in
2 you-know-what's name they're going to be able to
3 afford to put a meal on their holiday table. I
4 just saw, in the supermarket, iceberg lettuce.
5 That was the cheapest of all the most affordable
6 of all lettuce once upon a time. Nine dollars.
7 Nine dollars.

8 Gasoline, prohibitive. Diesel fuel,
9 prohibitive. The cost of groceries -- eggs and
10 everything else -- with inflation, making
11 people's lives miserable and not what they ought
12 to be in the greatest state in the union. Again,
13 because of what I believe to be bad policies in
14 this state.

15 Student loans. People trying to
16 figure out what they're going to do about that.
17 Again, I don't think any of us have ever really
18 addressed what to do about that in the proper
19 way, either party.

20 Taxes. Off the charts in New York.
21 Out of control in New York. If you work one job
22 or two jobs in New York, you take home less of
23 your money than just about anywhere on the
24 planet. Again, bad policies handed down by our
25 government.

1 Crime. Out of control. At this
2 time, on this day, in the State of New York.
3 Once upon a time I stood on this floor and said:
4 Hey, if you go forward with these policies, as a
5 former prosecutor I'll tell you that crime is
6 going to become out of control. I was called by
7 the Governor a fearmonger and a lot of other
8 things besides a child of God. I see
9 Senator Ramos shaking her head. Yup,
10 fearmongering.

11 Well, guess what? Unfortunately and
12 sadly -- and I said it that day, I hoped I would
13 be wrong. But I was not, and crime is out of
14 control.

15 I have constituents telling me,
16 based on what they see happening, that they're
17 afraid to stand on the subway platform, that
18 they're afraid to ride the subway. We've got
19 elected officials in New York City saying, Oh,
20 there's a perception of crime. We had the MTA
21 chairman say: Well, all these thousands of
22 crimes, we ought to be happy. If we were a city
23 of X amount of millions of riders or citizens,
24 this would be a low crime rate.

25 When we talk about crime, it's a

1 word that has an impact at this moment, at this
2 time, in the lives of all New Yorkers. More
3 people over the last several years were
4 burglarized, were robbed, were murdered, were
5 raped, and the list goes on. And you cannot deny
6 that that is the fact. We've had more victims of
7 crime, our neighbors have been victimized more in
8 the last several years than anything we've seen
9 before. Again, I will say, because of bad
10 policies here in New York.

11 So with all that going on, in this
12 moment, at this time, my colleagues across the
13 aisle, the Governor, the Democrats in the
14 Assembly, they have a gift. They have the
15 solution. They've had an epiphany. Let's hurry
16 up back, in the waning days of 2022, for a
17 special session because all this is going wrong
18 and our constituents and our citizens are
19 hurting. Here's what we're going to do about it.
20 We're going to give ourselves a big fat raise.
21 And we're going to hand the bill, we're going to
22 hand the bill to the people of New York, who are
23 burdened by everything I just discussed.

24 Hey, New Yorkers, you can't afford
25 to put a meal on your table for the holiday?

1 Here's what I'm going to do for you. I'm going
2 to raise your taxes by -- I didn't hear what the
3 fiscal impact -- 6 million, 7 million? Whatever
4 it is. Merry Christmas, Happy Hanukkah,
5 Happy Kwanzaa, happy everything you celebrate.
6 And in spite of everything you're going through,
7 here's another bill, here's another something
8 that you need to figure out how to pay for.

9 This timing is horrific. Two years
10 ago, four years ago -- I don't know. I know it's
11 never comfortable. It's never easy politically
12 to do these things. I get that. I was in the
13 majority too. We never did it. That's how hard
14 it is, I suppose.

15 But of all the times in all the
16 years that I've been living in New York State --
17 which is my entire life -- this is the worst
18 time, the worst time to tell our constituents,
19 Empty your pockets, tighten your belts even more,
20 because the Legislature is going to give itself a
21 big raise.

22 Oh, and by the way, it would be one
23 thing if they were being handed this bill and
24 some of those other things are being addressed in
25 this special session that we needed to be called

1 from our homes and our families, with a couple of
2 days left in New York, to address none of those
3 things. Not a single one of those things.
4 Tomorrow can any New Yorker wake up and say,
5 Well, at least while they gave themselves a
6 raise, at least I think next year there will be
7 fewer drug overdoses? Maybe next year there's
8 going to be less crime? Maybe next year the food
9 prices are going to go down? Maybe next year
10 I'll figure out how to pay for my kid's college?
11 None of that happens here. It's terrible timing.

12 Citizen legislature. People could
13 debate on both sides of the issue. I think it's
14 important. I think it is important that the
15 people who serve the people -- remember,
16 government of the people, by the people, for the
17 people -- that it's actually really people that
18 are serving the people who understand exactly how
19 their people live their lives. That the
20 decisions that are made here affect the people
21 who make them -- all of us -- in the same way
22 that they affect the people we represent.

23 I don't believe that legislators
24 ought to be immune from the decisions that they
25 make. I believe legislators should come from the

1 same places that the people they represent come
2 from. Otherwise, I believe what you end up with
3 is a permanent elite political class. That is my
4 fear, that whether it's a year from now or five
5 years from now or 10 years from now, we're going
6 to have a legislature comprised with people whose
7 only skill is getting elected. Because that will
8 be the only skill that matters in their lives,
9 how to get elected.

10 The idea, in the citizen
11 legislature, is that we would have farmers, we
12 would have electricians and carpenters and bodega
13 owners and bagel shop owners and pizzeria owners
14 and lawyers and electricians and restaurateurs,
15 and the list goes on. Because when legislation
16 would be considered, someone would stand up and
17 say, Hey, as a lawyer I can tell you how this
18 affects my ability to represent the interests of
19 the client. Hey, as a farmer I can tell you why
20 this is going to make it more difficult for me to
21 produce. As this or that or the other thing, I
22 lived this. This is not words on a page. It's
23 not academic. It's life. I get it. This is how
24 it's going to affect the electricians in my
25 district, because I'm an electrician. This is

1 how it's going to affect the teachers in my
2 district and their ability to teach, because I'm
3 a teacher. I know it. It's not theory, it's my
4 life. And I understand it. And I bring that
5 expertise to the table.

6 But more than that, because
7 you'll -- there are smart people out there that
8 have expertise that won't have outside income,
9 but to have skin in the game means that you
10 really have to feel it and know it and understand
11 it. It's personal. And therefore, the interests
12 of your constituents becomes personal.

13 My fear is that with a political --
14 permanent political class only, and not a citizen
15 legislature, is that the legislature's interests
16 will become so separated, as Senator Borrello I
17 think said, from the people. And that if the
18 only income you have if you're here as a Senator
19 or an Assemblymember and you are dependent on
20 only your salary and the taxpayer paying it for
21 your livelihood -- because I've heard this notion
22 about who are you going to serve and how many are
23 you going to serve and all that kind of stuff.
24 Well, there will be only one thing left to serve,
25 and that is your reelection. Because that's all

1 you'll have.

2 For those of you -- for those of
3 us -- maybe, you know, at one point as this
4 progresses, maybe one day we'll only have
5 billionaires and bums. Forgive the pejorative, I
6 suppose on both ends. Billionaires and bums.

7 If you're a trust fund child, none
8 of this affects you, you don't care. But for the
9 overall majority of the people that I hope
10 continue to want to serve the people of the State
11 of New York, it won't only be people who live off
12 trust funds, it won't only be people who are
13 billionaires. It will be, you know, the people
14 who do the living and the dying and the breathing
15 and the bleeding and sweating in this state.

16 But what you'll end up with, I
17 believe, when you eliminate a citizen
18 legislature, is a political class whose only
19 mission, if this is all that you have, this is
20 all you depend on to provide for yourself and
21 your family, if that's all you have, then you
22 will only serve one interest, and that is to get
23 reelected. And we'll have less government, more
24 politics. I think there's already too much
25 politics in the game today. Everyone's at fault,

1 both parties. And you're going to have more of
2 it.

3 The idea of corruption, you've read
4 the stories -- I've been here long enough to know
5 that 98.9 percent -- I could give you all the
6 cases. I don't want to mention names. It's the
7 holiday season. It's not kind. It wouldn't be
8 civil. It's never outside income. It's people
9 selling -- selling their position. That's what
10 it's always been. You don't need outside income
11 to do that. We're replete, sadly, with cases of
12 that type of corruption. People sell their vote,
13 they sell their power. It has nothing to do with
14 outside income.

15 We've had corruption in the City of
16 New York with campaign finance, people running
17 just so they can take a taxpayer check and pay
18 themselves and their buddies and their
19 consultants, having no desire or interest to
20 actually serve or even win. That's coming to a
21 theater near you soon.

22 So this has nothing to do with that.
23 You know, that argument is out there. You look
24 at all the cases of, quote, unquote, corruption
25 and all the people that have been sort of

1 swallowed by those problems, and none of it has
2 to do with them.

3 And anyway, there are exceptions.
4 Right? So you could still have
5 multi-million-dollar real estate holdings --
6 right, commercial real estate in Manhattan or
7 wherever -- and receive millions of dollars in
8 rental income. I'm sure you could do that as an
9 absentee member of the Assembly -- of the Senate
10 somehow. Right? Manage all your properties,
11 make millions, that's okay.

12 I remember one of the reasons why we
13 needed to do this, it was suggested, was, well,
14 you look at the former governor, wrote a book.
15 You can still write a book. It's there, you can
16 write a book. Royalties.

17 Mr. President, there's an idea.
18 There's an idea. I've been here long enough.
19 I've seen a lot of interesting things. We could
20 all write a book. It would certainly be engaging
21 reading, if not disturbing. I've seen a lot.
22 Senator Savino's seen a lot. Those of us who
23 have been here have seen a lot. Write a book.
24 That was the evil we were going to cleanse
25 ourselves of: Oh, that governor, he wrote a

1 book, he made millions, evil. You can still
2 write a book.

3 So there are a lot of exceptions
4 even here. It's just there's exceptions for
5 certain people. I would argue that some of the
6 things you can still do would take far more time,
7 Senator Krueger, away from your responsibilities
8 and duties as a member of the Senate. It
9 probably takes a lot of work to write a book. It
10 probably takes a lot of work to manage your
11 commercial real estate portfolio. It probably
12 takes a lot of work.

13 You can still have -- and I agree
14 with this, you can still have capital gains. It
15 probably takes a lot of work and a lot of time to
16 manage your multi-million-dollar investment
17 portfolio. Right? If you were lucky enough to
18 be born rich or made it before you got here or
19 while you got here or whatever, you can still do
20 that.

21 There are people that are doing
22 that. They've made a lot of money off their
23 investments. It doesn't happen by accident,
24 you've got to manage it. You've got to go out
25 there, you've got to do work, you've got to do

1 things. There are pitfalls there, there are
2 temptations there, there are all sorts of things
3 that are talked about in terms of why that might
4 not be a good idea. It exists, with all these
5 exceptions.

6 But again, for me, the biggest issue
7 is that you will end up with a legislature one
8 day, God forbid, comprised of members that really
9 don't live the same kind of lives as the people
10 they represent, that really don't have the same
11 interests as the people they represent. And when
12 that happens, when that happens, you are not
13 going to have a legislature of the people. You
14 are not going to have a legislature that even
15 understands and appreciates what is the right
16 thing to do and what is the wrong thing to do.

17 And in spite of some of the
18 arguments by a few people out there that
19 really -- I don't know what their qualifications
20 are. I don't mean people in this body, I mean
21 out there, the busybodies, the critics, whose
22 only qualification seems to be able to send out
23 tweets and criticize everything and have no skill
24 of their own, but they do it.

25 At the end of the day, even the

1 thing they say that this will do will be so far
2 from the truth. And by then it will be too late.
3 You're not going to end up with -- here's another
4 prediction. I hope I'm wrong, I'll say it again.
5 You're not going to end up with less corruption,
6 Mr. President. You're going to end up with more
7 corruption. That is the nature of the way things
8 work.

9 And the final thing I'll say --
10 applause, that's an applause line.

11 (Pause; laughter.)

12 SENATOR LANZA: The final thing
13 I'll say, Mr. President, is the Constitution.
14 And it matters. It does matter. You know, we're
15 a state of laws, a land of laws. I believe, in
16 my humble opinion -- I said not too long ago, a
17 couple of months ago that there was a bill passed
18 here that the Governor signed that I believed, in
19 my legal opinion, was unconstitutional. I think
20 so far it seems to be trending that way in the
21 courts. I think ultimately it will end up that
22 way, there's no doubt in my mind.

23 I think there is a serious
24 constitutional issue here as well. I think this
25 redefines the qualifications to become a member

1 of the Assembly, to become a member of the
2 Senate. You know, it's analogous,
3 Senator Myrie -- like the Constitution of the
4 United States says that to be president -- you
5 should look into it -- it's 35, you have to be
6 35 years old, you have to be a citizen of this
7 country. If Congress were to propose a law that
8 said you can run for president at 22, it would be
9 unconstitutional because it would change the
10 qualifications.

11 I think if you read the New York
12 State Constitution, which establishes this body
13 and the Assembly -- my attorney friend
14 Senator Savino is shaking her head -- I believe
15 that this changes the qualification, this puts in
16 place a new qualification to become a member of
17 the Senate or a Member of the Assembly.

18 And therein lies, I believe, the
19 constitutional issue, which is yesterday you
20 needed to be a citizen, yesterday you needed to
21 be of a certain age, yesterday you needed to be a
22 resident of your district. And tomorrow,
23 metaphorically, you're going to also need to be a
24 person that does not have an outside job with
25 certain income.

1 And that, to me, means that you are
2 changing the qualifications to become a Senator
3 or a Member of the Assembly. And I believe
4 therefore that this means that this bill is in
5 violation of the Constitution. I know our
6 Governor had no problem signing the last
7 unconstitutional bill. I'm sure she'll sign this
8 bill as well.

9 But for all those reasons,
10 Mr. President, I believe this is bad public
11 policy. I think the timing of this raise is
12 horrific and it is really insulting to the people
13 who can't -- that we represent who are finding a
14 hard time making ends meet. The constitutional
15 issue. The loss of a citizen legislature. I
16 think those are all reasons why this is bad
17 public policy and why I'm going to, at the proper
18 time, vote in the negative, Mr. President.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
20 you, Senator Lanza.

21 Are there any other Senators wishing
22 to be heard?

23 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
24 closed.

25 The Secretary will ring the bell.

1 Read the last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 7. This
3 act shall take effect January 1, 2023.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
8 Tedisco to explain his vote.

9 SENATOR TEDISCO: Thank you,
10 Mr. President and my colleagues.

11 All of us here today went through a
12 process that I defined a while back as a savage
13 attack on representative democracy. It was
14 called the New York redistricting process. And
15 it went through several different permutations.
16 It finally got to the Court of Appeals, and the
17 Court of Appeals basically validated that and
18 said it was totally unconstitutional.

19 And then we went through a process
20 to get new districts, and we all have new
21 districts, changed a little bit. And I'll tell
22 you, my 49th Senatorial District which I have
23 right now is a wonderful district. When I move
24 into the 44th next year, it's a wonderful
25 district. They're kind, they're caring people.

1 They're going to go through some very holy
2 holidays coming up and celebrate that. But
3 they're also going to join their families and
4 provide gifts for their families. And that's
5 always a challenge for them: What do I get for
6 my dad, what do I get for my brother?

7 As they contact me as their
8 representative, they have a very important gift
9 that they'd like me to say that we could give to
10 you, and it is the best possible hearing aids
11 that New York has to offer. Because they think,
12 and I believe they're right, you're totally
13 tone-deaf. You're not hearing.

14 I read three papers a day, and
15 apparently you don't read the papers or listen to
16 the media, because we're facing some of the worst
17 inflation in more than 30 years. And in the
18 worst inflation in 30 years, shortly the New York
19 State Thruway, faceless bureaucrats, those who
20 are not elected, those who said at one point it
21 would be totally free to have a Thruway, our main
22 construction system -- totally free -- it's going
23 to provide a 75 percent increase to our
24 impoverished population, the people who least can
25 afford to put \$30, \$50, \$80 inside an account and

1 let it languish there.

2 Where they spent 60 cents to bring
3 their sons or daughters to the doctor's on the
4 Thruway, they're going to get a bill for \$2.60,
5 because they're not E-ZPass users and it's a
6 75 percent increase. That's what's happening out
7 there in the community.

8 Shortly, in a week and a half, you
9 know this, you're going to add 16 cents on a
10 gallon of gasoline for the 19.5 million people in
11 New York State. For those who have to fill up
12 their tank that may be \$3 or \$4, you're going to
13 add 16 cents -- in the midst of a time where
14 we're paying close to 1¾ or close to twice the
15 amount they usually pay for gasoline.

16 And to pour some salt in the wound
17 at this time, you brought us back here -- and I
18 don't know if you know this or researched it,
19 because I looked at it, I talked to the
20 professionals, from our constituents who are
21 leaving -- you're using thirty or more thousand
22 dollars, thirty to \$35,000 to get in this room
23 today, to bring us all back. Now, I would think
24 using \$35,000 of my constituents' and constituents
25 across the state's money to do some good things

1 here that would affect their quality of life,
2 that might --

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
4 Tedisco, in the spirit of the holidays, I'm going
5 to give you 30 more seconds. But you're past
6 your two minutes to explain your vote.

7 SENATOR TEDISCO: Okay.

8 You might have taken care of the
9 Thruway system, you might have eliminated the
10 gasoline tax, but you didn't do that. You came
11 here for one reason, aggrandize yourself and make
12 you the highest paid in salary group of
13 legislators in the United States of America. If
14 that's not tone-deaf and shameful, I don't know
15 what is.

16 You gave yourself a tremendous bonus
17 for the holidays. You know what you gave your
18 constituents? The largest lump of coal that
19 anybody has ever received. Even the Grinch, who
20 you probably conferenced with before you came out
21 here and gave you some direction --

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
23 Tedisco --

24 SENATOR TEDISCO: -- couldn't get
25 that lump of coal --

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
2 Tedisco, how do you vote?

3 SENATOR TEDISCO: -- down the top
4 of the chimneys.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
6 Tedisco --

7 SENATOR TEDISCO: That's how bad
8 this is.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
10 Tedisco, how do you vote?

11 SENATOR TEDISCO: I'm going to vote
12 no.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
14 Tedisco in the negative.

15 Thank you, Senator Tedisco.

16 Senator Rath to explain his vote.

17 SENATOR RATH: Thank you,
18 Mr. President.

19 First of all, hello to all my
20 colleagues, and happy holidays.

21 While many New Yorkers are working
22 hard to make ends meet this holiday season, and
23 many are living paycheck to paycheck, today this
24 New York State Legislature is absolutely
25 tone-deaf to their financial plight. The work we

1 are proposing here today is nothing short of
2 shameful.

3 Instead of the transparent and
4 accountable government that New Yorkers want,
5 what our great state residents are settling for
6 and what they're winding up with out of this
7 state legislature is a legislature that is
8 laser-focused, and I mean laser-focused, on
9 lining their pockets with a 29 percent pay
10 increase. Amazingly, this \$32,000 increase in
11 pay, just weeks after Election Day, is all for a
12 part-time job. This raise would make New York
13 State legislators the highest-paid in our nation,
14 further contributing to our highest-in-the-nation
15 tax status.

16 It is particularly frustrating to me
17 that after months of political campaigns and
18 hearing about pressing taxpayer issues such as
19 public safety concerns and runaway inflation,
20 New York Democrats have shown through their
21 actions today that their top priority is a pay
22 increase. This is absolutely unacceptable, and
23 it is a complete betrayal of the voters' trust.

24 Making matters worse, we are called
25 to a special session right here today on the eve

1 of a historic storm sweeping across our state,
2 and in the middle of the holiday season, to make
3 this vote. If this Majority and my colleagues on
4 the other side of the aisle truly believe that
5 this is warranted, they should have had the guts
6 to express this six months ago in front of the
7 voters or during a regular State Senate session.

8 Unfortunately, once again we are
9 reminded today, once again we are reminded how
10 truly out of touch this New York State government
11 has become. I must ask this to my colleagues:
12 How on earth do you justify this action here
13 today?

14 So for these reasons, Mr. President,
15 I will be voting in the negative, and I urge all
16 of my colleagues to do the same.

17 Thank you.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
19 Rath to be recorded in the negative.

20 Senator Jordan to explain her vote.

21 SENATOR JORDAN: Thank you,
22 Mr. President.

23 There are two points I will make,
24 and they have been made but I will reiterate them
25 so that everyone is sure to hear and pay

1 attention.

2 First, how dare the Majority put a
3 pay raise through for legislators just because
4 you can? Because you can in this state, where
5 one party rules. How extremely selfish and how
6 boorish to do this to the people who pay your
7 salaries, the already overburdened taxpayers who
8 are struggling to pay for their needs. I'm not
9 talking their wants, I'm talking needs, like heat
10 for their homes, gas for their cars so that they
11 can drive to their jobs, food for their families.

12 Every person in here knew what this
13 job paid when you ran for election. If the job
14 didn't pay enough for you, then you should have
15 found employment elsewhere. Unless, unless this
16 pay raise was something that you planned all
17 along. Did any of you bring this issue up during
18 the campaigns? Of course not. Why? Because you
19 know the voters, our constituents, our employers,
20 wouldn't go for it. Not in these times of
21 inflation, in a state that is already costing
22 everyone way too much to live here.

23 The second point I have to make is
24 that this bill also carries the proviso limiting
25 outside income for state legislators. By

1 limiting outside income while serving, you are
2 redefining who may serve and excluding those with
3 incomes more than \$35,000, which I find is rather
4 ironic in this world where inclusivity is
5 stressed ad nauseam.

6 You are carving out a job
7 description of professional legislator. In this
8 bill there is no room for the citizen legislator,
9 and that will result in Albany politicians being
10 further disconnected from the real world and the
11 true state of New York State's economy. How
12 ludicrous and harmful that would be to the people
13 we serve.

14 We look to our members, who are
15 restaurateurs, builders, pharmacists, lawyers,
16 store owners, chiropractors, real estate agents,
17 farmers, food scientists, school bus operators,
18 business owners to fill us in on the nitty-gritty
19 of what hurts and what helps them. This gives us
20 a true picture of what should or should not be
21 acted upon.

22 If we want to redefine who should be
23 a legislator, maybe we should turn today's bill
24 totally around and say that a legislator must
25 have a family, must be in business or have

1 another profession, must own property that they
2 pay taxes for, because then the legislator would
3 truly understand which legislation would harm or
4 help society. What do you think of that?

5 For all of --

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
7 Jordan, we're approaching three minutes. If you
8 can conclude, please.

9 SENATOR JORDAN: I will just say
10 that I will vote a commonsense no, and I would
11 wish that some of my colleagues across the aisle
12 would change their votes to no as well.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
14 Jordan to be recorded in the negative.

15 Senator Martucci to explain his
16 vote.

17 SENATOR MARTUCCI: Thank you,
18 Mr. President.

19 I've only been here in this room
20 with all of you for two years. And while my time
21 here is short, I'll start by saying I'm blessed
22 to have made friendships that I know will last me
23 a lifetime.

24 And I've come here to fight every
25 single day on behalf of the people back at home,

1 even when, on days like today, the outcome was a
2 foregone conclusion even before making my trip
3 here. And all of us in this room have made a
4 difference in our districts, a significant
5 difference. And I'm proud to have worked with
6 all of you, not only on this side of the aisle
7 but also the other side of the aisle, for my
8 constituents back home. And I thank all of you
9 for your help in helping me do my job better. It
10 really is a team effort. And that's an effort
11 that I personally, Mr. President, will never
12 forget.

13 In short, what I'm saying is that
14 I've seen the best in all of my colleagues. I've
15 seen my colleagues, both Democrats and
16 Republicans, put the needs of their constituents
17 before the needs of themselves. And not just
18 once, but day after day, again and again. After
19 all, that's why most of us are here, right?

20 That's why I'm saddened today that
21 many of my colleagues on the other side of the
22 aisle will be voting for this pay raise. During
23 this time of year we should be renewing ourself
24 and our focus to care for each other, care for
25 one another, and in particular in this job, to

1 make sure that we're caring for our constituents.
2 And voting yourself a \$32,000 pay raise is not
3 caring for your constituents, Mr. President.
4 It's downright disrespectful.

5 There are many things that we could
6 be doing here today. We could be addressing
7 public safety. We could be passing a tax cut.
8 We could be protecting our brave men and women in
9 the fire service by passing Billy's Law. But
10 today we're doing none of that. Today we're here
11 and you're writing yourselves a big fat check on
12 the backs of the people that you say you come
13 here to fight for. Frankly, it's beneath this
14 body. It's beneath the dignity and camaraderie
15 of this chamber. And again, for that I'm sad.

16 Mr. President, I'm obviously voting
17 no on this bill. I urge all of my colleagues,
18 both Democrats and Republicans, to join me,
19 because our constituents deserve better. I know
20 that we're capable of better, because I've seen
21 it myself. And I'm sad that this will be my last
22 memory in the Senate.

23 And despite my affection for all of
24 you, I will be voting strongly in the negative
25 and urge my colleagues to do the same.

1 Thank you, Mr. President.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
3 Martucci to be recorded in the negative.

4 Senator Krueger to close.

5 SENATOR KRUEGER: (Inaudible) --
6 colleagues. I'm a little shocked at some of the
7 things that have been said.

8 I'm going to go to the concept of a
9 citizen legislator and what that has meant in our
10 history. That's what our founding fathers said.
11 Guess what? They all needed to be white men who
12 owned property. Not women, not people of color,
13 not people who had actual other family
14 responsibilities. Because if you were a
15 property-owning member of the original Congress,
16 you were a wealthy person.

17 Then I've heard attacks on wealthy
18 people who might want to be here. I've heard
19 attacks on people who don't have jobs who want to
20 be here.

21 The only thing that matters to be
22 here is that you care about this state, you are a
23 citizen, and you can convince people that they
24 ought to vote for you to represent them. Each of
25 us in this room has met those standards, and yet

1 so much more.

2 But what I'm particularly concerned
3 about is the statement that if we raise our
4 salaries, we are somehow doing a disservice to
5 our constituents. If we don't get the best and
6 brightest to want to run for office, to be
7 willing to put in the time and the hours on
8 behalf of our constituents, who are willing to
9 fight out the very hard fights -- and many of you
10 listed critical issues to you and to us. And I'm
11 not going to spend my time today saying, Well,
12 actually we did a lot of good things in the
13 previous session that I'm very proud of on behalf
14 of our constituents, and the voters put us back
15 to do more in the next two years. And they
16 decided, even though some of these were political
17 speeches, that they would actually reelect a
18 Democratic majority to continue to work on their
19 behalf with our Republican colleagues.

20 But the assignment today is to make
21 sure that the people can both do these jobs with
22 honor and integrity, not corruption, and also be
23 able to pay their rent and feed their children
24 and take care of themselves, and I believe
25 hopefully to not have to do a second job that

1 might take them away from their responsibilities
2 as a Senator.

3 And I'm not worried that people who
4 have no skin in the game will be the ones rushing
5 forward into the Legislature. Because with all
6 due respect, if the only thing you can imagine
7 doing to make money is to join the New York State
8 Senate, you don't have much vision or much
9 talent.

10 (Laughter.)

11 SENATOR KRUEGER: We're here for
12 the right reasons. You should want us to
13 actually not be in panic about our paychecks, and
14 you should want us focusing our jobs for our
15 constituents. And I'm confident, looking around
16 this room, that that's exactly what we'll be
17 doing the minute we get back here when the
18 holidays and the New Year are over.

19 I also just want to highlight,
20 again, the reference to in Texas they make \$7,000
21 a year. Well, guess what? In Texas they're all
22 rich white men who have property. So they
23 haven't even learned a lesson from the original
24 rep --

25 SENATOR SAVINO: Are any of them

1 single?

2 SENATOR KRUEGER: Excuse me?

3 SENATOR SAVINO: Any of them

4 single?

5 (Laughter.)

6 SENATOR KRUEGER: I was going to
7 say I was going to miss Diane Savino and many of
8 my colleagues who aren't coming back, but she
9 completely threw me off my cadence at a really
10 important point. Shame on you.

11 I am proud that we are doing this.
12 This is not the wrong thing to do, it is actually
13 the right thing to do -- not just for ourselves,
14 but for the people coming in, for the people we
15 hope will come in after them. And the people who
16 are thinking about whether they should decide to
17 run for the Legislature, whichever party,
18 whichever district, I don't want them saying, I
19 can't do this, as much as I'm passionate to do
20 it, because I might not actually be able to meet
21 my bills.

22 And I, yes, understand that it is
23 more than the average salary or the median salary
24 for New York State. It's not an average job
25 either. It doesn't even require an average

1 person. It requires a person prepared to be
2 extraordinarily overcommitted to the public good.
3 Because anyone who's here for any other reason
4 shouldn't be here, and it has nothing to do with
5 salary.

6 And I again encourage each person
7 who said it was an outrage or an embarrassment or
8 shame on us -- I can give you the address for
9 Tom DiNapoli's office. You can send him a letter
10 explaining you don't wish the salary raise, and
11 you won't get it. And you can go home and
12 explain to your constituents why your passion
13 about this was so strong you turned down the
14 increase in your salary. I will not be sending
15 that letter.

16 Thank you, Mr. President. I vote
17 aye.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
19 Krueger to be recorded in the affirmative.

20 Senator Serino to explain her vote.

21 SENATOR SERINO: Thank you,
22 Mr. President. I thought they had saw me raise
23 my hand before, so I apologize.

24 But, you know, I can't think of a
25 more selfish reason that we're here today. Quite

1 frankly, it's despicable. It just shows, once
2 again, how tone-deaf and uncaring this Majority
3 is.

4 How do you guys go home and talk to
5 the single parent or Mr. and Mrs. Senior that are
6 struggling and they're saying, Gosh, I don't know
7 how I'm going to pay for my gas, for my fuel
8 oil -- let alone buy gifts for their families,
9 right? It's the holiday season. It's supposed
10 to be the season of giving. Right? Instead,
11 it's the season of taking. Once again, the
12 picture is going to be greedy politicians
13 sticking your hands in the pockets of the people
14 who quite frankly don't have any more to take.
15 How do you do that?

16 You know, they said it's going to be
17 over \$6 million a year. Think about what that
18 \$6 million could do for HEAP, right, for people
19 for heating oil, for the utilities right now,
20 that are really, really struggling.

21 You know, if you really think that
22 this is a great idea and you think that the
23 public is going to say that you're deserving of
24 this, then why don't you put it out to the public
25 for a vote? I actually had a bill that would do

1 that. Right? If the pay commission said that
2 you should get the pay raise, then it should go
3 out to the public for a vote. That's only fair.

4 So I will proudly vote no,
5 Mr. President. Thank you.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
7 Serino to be recorded in the negative.

8 Announce the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
10 Calendar 1927, those Senators voting in the
11 negative are Senators Borrello, Brooks, Gaughran,
12 Griffo, Helming, Jordan, Kennedy, Lanza, Liu,
13 Mannion, Martucci, Mattera, Oberacker, O'Mara,
14 Ortt, Palumbo, Rath, Reichlin-Melnick, Serino,
15 Skoufis, Stec, Tedisco and Weik.

16 Ayes, 33. Nays, 23.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
18 is passed.

19 Senator Gianaris, that completes the
20 reading of the controversial calendar.

21 SENATOR GIANARIS: Is there any
22 further business at the desk?

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: There is
24 no further business at the desk.

25 SENATOR GIANARIS: In that case,

1 let me wish all my colleagues a Merry Christmas
2 for those celebrating, a happy holiday season, a
3 wonderful New Year, and we will see you in
4 January.

5 I move to adjourn to a date and time
6 at the call of the Temporary President of the
7 Senate, intervening days being legislative days.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Happy
9 holidays to all, Senator Gianaris.

10 And on motion, the Senate stands
11 adjourned until the call of the Temporary
12 President, intervening days being legislative.

13 (Whereupon, at 2:00 p.m., the Senate
14 adjourned.)

15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25