

1 NEW YORK STATE SENATE

2  
3  
4 THE STENOGRAPHIC RECORD

5  
6  
7  
8  
9 ALBANY, NEW YORK

10 June 18, 2019

11 1:56 p.m.

12  
13  
14 REGULAR SESSION

15  
16  
17  
18 SENATOR BRIAN A. BENJAMIN, Acting President

19 ALEJANDRA N. PAULINO, ESQ., Secretary

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
3 Senate will come to order.

4 I ask everyone present to please  
5 rise and recite the Pledge of Allegiance.

6 (Whereupon, the assemblage recited  
7 the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
9 Reverend Kirk D. Lyons, Sr., the pastor of  
10 Vanderveer Park United Methodist Church in  
11 Brooklyn, will deliver today's invocation.

12 Reverend Lyons.

13 REVEREND LYONS: Let us pray.

14 {In Hebrew.} Blessed are You,  
15 O Lord, and blessed is the day upon us, for this  
16 is the day that You have made, and we rejoice and  
17 are glad in it.

18 We pray for this legislative body,  
19 in whom the people's trust has been invested. We  
20 pray today for those who have said yes to the  
21 call to serve. We pray today for those who have  
22 committed to improving the quality of life for  
23 all New Yorkers. We pray today for those who  
24 sacrifice their own ambitions for the good of the  
25 people.

1                   May the trust that has been placed  
2     in this body be rewarded with integrity. May the  
3     trust that has been placed in this body be  
4     rewarded with honesty. May what is fair, what is  
5     just, and what is right be the fruit of that  
6     trust.

7                   May every corner, every crack and  
8     every crevice of these hallowed halls be purified  
9     by Your peace. May every gathering be garnished  
10    with grace. May every deliberation be tempered  
11    by a modicum of mercy.

12                  Crown Your servants with compassion  
13    for the poor, drape them with desire for  
14    equality, and anoint them with an appetite for  
15    truth. Bless them, O Lord. Bless their health,  
16    bless their families, bless their constituents,  
17    bless the communities they represent, and bless  
18    them to prosper in their good works.

19                  And finally, may this legislative  
20    body and ultimately this great state be a living,  
21    breathing example of what is possible when  
22    Your people, who are called by Your name, humble  
23    themselves in prayer and submit to Your will.

24                  In the name of the Father, in the  
25    name of the Son, and in the name of the blessed

1 Holy Spirit, amen.

2 (Response of "Amen.")

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Reading  
4 of the Journal.

5 THE SECRETARY: In Senate, Monday,  
6 June 17, 2019, the Senate met pursuant to  
7 adjournment. The Journal of Sunday, June 16,  
8 2019, was read and approved. On motion, Senate  
9 adjourned.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Without  
11 objection, the Journal stands approved as read.

12 Presentation of petitions.

13 Messages from the Assembly.

14 The Secretary will read.

15 THE SECRETARY: On page 9,  
16 Senator Ramos moves to discharge, from the  
17 Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill Number 364B and  
18 substitute it for the identical Senate Bill  
19 3344B, Third Reading Calendar 243.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
21 substitution is so ordered.

22 THE SECRETARY: On page 12,  
23 Senator Little moves to discharge, from the  
24 Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill Number 4474 and  
25 substitute it for the identical Senate Bill 1960,

1 Third Reading Calendar 401.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
3 substitution is so ordered.

4 THE SECRETARY: On page 21,  
5 Senator Kaplan moves to discharge, from the  
6 Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill Number 2317B  
7 and substitute it for the identical Senate Bill  
8 5481B, Third Reading Calendar 658.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
10 substitution is so ordered.

11 THE SECRETARY: On page 28,  
12 Senator Sanders moves to discharge, from the  
13 Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill Number 3235 and  
14 substitute it for the identical Senate Bill 3223,  
15 Third Reading Calendar 898.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
17 substitution is so ordered.

18 THE SECRETARY: On page 31,  
19 Senator Kaplan moves to discharge, from the  
20 Committee on Codes, Assembly Bill Number 2333 and  
21 substitute it for the identical Senate Bill 5078,  
22 Third Reading Calendar 982.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
24 substitution is so ordered.

25 THE SECRETARY: On page 31,

1 Senator Brooks moves to discharge, from the  
2 Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill Number 1093B  
3 and substitute it for the identical Senate Bill  
4 5285A, Third Reading Calendar 1022.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
6 substitution is so ordered.

7 Messages from the Governor.

8 Reports of standing committees.

9 Reports of select committees.

10 Communications and reports from  
11 state officers.

12 Motions and resolutions.

13 Senator Gianaris.

14 SENATOR GIANARIS: Please recognize  
15 Senator Griffo for a motion.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
17 Griffo.

18 SENATOR GRIFFO: Thank you,  
19 Mr. President.

20 I now wish to call up, on behalf of  
21 Senator Akshar, Senate Print Number 2461,  
22 recalled from the Assembly, which is now at the  
23 desk.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
25 Secretary will read.

1           THE SECRETARY:   Calendar Number  
2   1419, Senate Print 2461, by Senator Akshar, an  
3   act to amend Chapter 455 of the Laws of 2011.

4           SENATOR GRIFFO:   Mr. President, I  
5   move that we reconsider the vote by which this  
6   bill was passed and ask that it be restored to  
7   the order of third reading.

8           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   The  
9   Secretary will call the roll on reconsideration.

10           (The Secretary called the roll.)

11           THE SECRETARY:   Ayes, 55.

12           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   The  
13   bill is restored to its place on the  
14   Third Reading Calendar.

15           SENATOR GRIFFO:   Mr. President, I  
16   now move to discharge, from the Committee on  
17   Rules, Assembly Print 8140 and substitute it for  
18   the identical Senate bill.

19           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   The  
20   substitution is so ordered.

21           SENATOR GRIFFO:   The Senate bill on  
22   first passage was voted unanimously, and I now  
23   move that the substituted Assembly bill have its  
24   third reading at this time.

25           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   The

1 Secretary will read.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
3 1419, Assembly Bill Number 8140, by  
4 Assemblymember Woerner, an act to amend  
5 Chapter 455 of the Laws of 2011.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
7 the last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
11 the roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
14 Announce the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 55.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
17 bill is passed.

18 Senator Gianaris.

19 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,  
20 at this time can you please call an immediate  
21 meeting of the Committee on Higher Education in  
22 Room 332 -- I'm sorry, Room 124, Mr. President.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: There  
24 will be an immediate meeting of the  
25 Higher Education Committee in Room 124.



1 Senator Gianaris.

2 SENATOR GIANARIS: I move to adopt  
3 the Resolution Calendar, with the exception of  
4 Resolutions 1979 and 2103.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: All in  
6 favor of adopting the Resolution Calendar, with  
7 the exception of Resolutions 1979 and 2103,  
8 please signify by saying aye.

9 (Response of "Aye.")

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
11 Opposed, nay.

12 (No response.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
14 Resolution Calendar is adopted.

15 Senator Gianaris.

16 SENATOR GIANARIS: Can we now take  
17 up previously adopted Resolution 1117, by Senator  
18 Gianaris, read that resolution in its entirety,  
19 and recognize me on the resolution.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
21 Secretary will read.

22 THE SECRETARY: Senate Resolution  
23 1117, by Senator Gianaris, commemorating the  
24 50th Anniversary of the 1969 World Champion  
25 "Miracle Mets."

1               "WHEREAS, It is the sense of this  
2       Legislative Body to pay tribute to exemplary  
3       teams whose notable feats add to the fabric of  
4       New York State and inspire our citizenry; and

5               "WHEREAS, This Legislative Body is  
6       justly proud to congratulate the New York Mets  
7       upon the occasion of the 50th Anniversary of the  
8       team's 1969 World Championship season; and

9               "WHEREAS, In the first seven seasons  
10      of the team's history, the New York Mets had  
11      never achieved a winning record or finished above  
12      ninth place; and

13              "WHEREAS, Under the steadfast  
14      leadership of manager Gil Hodges, the 1969  
15      New York Mets accomplished one of the most  
16      dramatic turnarounds in Major League Baseball  
17      history, winning 38 of their final 49 games to  
18      surge past the Chicago Cubs and earn the National  
19      League East Division title with 100 wins; and

20              "WHEREAS, The New York Mets shocked  
21      the sports world by defeating the dominant  
22      Baltimore Orioles in five games to win the  
23      World Series, and the incredible upset earned the  
24      team the moniker 'the Miracle Mets'; and

25              "WHEREAS, The New York Mets'

1     thrilling and improbable championship victory was  
2     cause for pride and celebration in the Borough of  
3     Queens and throughout the state, and this  
4     legendary underdog team remains beloved by  
5     multiple generations of baseball fans in  
6     New York; and

7                 "WHEREAS, It is the custom of this  
8     Legislative Body to recognize exceptional  
9     athletes who distinguish themselves through  
10    outstanding achievements and thereby represent  
11    this great Empire State with exceptional pride  
12    and determination; and

13                "WHEREAS, The 1969 New York Mets  
14    will be honored at a 50th Anniversary celebration  
15    at Citi Field on June 29, 2019; and

16                "WHEREAS, This auspicious occasion  
17    presents a unique opportunity for this  
18    Legislative Body to pay tribute to the enduring  
19    contributions of the 1969 New York Mets; now,  
20    therefore, be it

21                "RESOLVED, That this Legislative  
22    Body pause in its deliberations to commemorate  
23    the 50th Anniversary of the 1969 World Champion  
24    'Miracle Met's; and be it further

25                "RESOLVED, That a copy of this

1 resolution, suitably engrossed, be transmitted to  
2 the New York Mets organization."

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
4 Gianaris on the resolution.

5 SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you,  
6 Mr. President.

7 As Mets fans, we've become  
8 accustomed to experiencing a championship once  
9 every 20 or 30 years, unfortunately. But when  
10 those teams come around, they are memorable and  
11 historic. And this represents the 50th year of  
12 the 1969 Miracle Mets, who won the World Series  
13 and turned New York City upside down in 1969. It  
14 is a team whose legacy lives on to this day.

15 And we are very fortunate to be  
16 joined by Art Shamsky, who was a member of that  
17 team. He's with us here in the chamber today to  
18 help us remember the great accomplishments of  
19 that team. In fact, he was reminding me that  
20 next weekend many of the surviving members of  
21 that team will be at Citi Field for a ceremony  
22 honoring their 50th anniversary celebration.

23 But just a couple of words about  
24 Mr. Shamsky, who is a distinguished New Yorker,  
25 lives in Manhattan, and was a very accomplished

1 member of that team -- in fact, I believe he  
2 batted cleanup for much of the playoff run  
3 leading up to the World Series -- and is also  
4 someone who is a member of the Jewish Sports Hall  
5 of Fame, which people have been making jokes  
6 about all day. But nonetheless, he is one of the  
7 more accomplished members of the Jewish faith who  
8 has been successful in athletics in the  
9 United States.

10 He is someone who gives of his time,  
11 who's philanthropic and appears at causes  
12 throughout New York. We appreciate him being  
13 with us today.

14 And I think, in addition, to all his  
15 amazing accomplishments, one thing that sticks  
16 out for me is that the dog in "Everybody Loves  
17 Raymond" was named after Art Shamsky.

18 (Laughter.)

19 SENATOR GIANARIS: So I don't know  
20 which of those things he appreciates more. But I  
21 think the World Series ring, which he's still  
22 wearing as he joins us today, is with him.

23 So, Mr. President, can you please  
24 welcome Mr. Shamsky to the Senate chambers, and  
25 may we all celebrate the great Mets team of 1969,

1 because I don't know if this year's team is going  
2 to make it.

3 (Laughter.)

4 SENATOR GIANARIS: You know,  
5 this -- I know, there's gasps, but as a Mets fan,  
6 we've got to look at things realistically. Maybe  
7 they'll turn it around. They did it in '15.

8 But, Mr. President, please recognize  
9 Mr. Shamsky and join us all in celebrating the  
10 1969 team's accomplishments.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
12 Bailey on the resolution.

13 SENATOR BAILEY: Thank you,  
14 Mr. President. Let's go, Mets!

15 (Reaction from members.)

16 SENATOR BAILEY: I know that may  
17 seem as a surprise that I would say something  
18 like that, considering that I wear my Bronx on my  
19 sleeve. But I became a Mets fan in the mid to  
20 late '80s because of the accomplishments of  
21 Dwight Gooden and Darryl Strawberry when the 1986  
22 New York Mets won their first and only  
23 championship in my lifetime.

24 But having grown up being a Met fan  
25 and learning about the accomplishments of Art

1 Shamsky and Tommie Agee -- and when you went to  
2 Shea Stadium and you sat in "Tommie's corner" all  
3 the way up in the bleachers, that meant a lot, as  
4 a kid who grew up in the Bronx with a father  
5 who's a Yankees fan. I don't know how that  
6 happened, Mr. President, how I became a Met fan.

7 But the Mets mean something to me in  
8 terms of the blue-collar nature, the hard work of  
9 the city. The Mets are -- and I have my orange  
10 and blue on, coincidentally, Mr. President. They  
11 mean a lot to me, and those Miracle Mets, those  
12 amazing Mets, whichever nickname that you want to  
13 use for them, they meant a lot to the city.

14 And I would join Senator Gianaris,  
15 my fellow Met fan, and the rest of the Mets  
16 caucus here that we have in the State Senate, in  
17 joining in the accomplishments of Mr. Shamsky and  
18 all that you've done for not just -- not just in  
19 baseball, but what you've done for the city and  
20 what you've done for the collective hope of us  
21 baseball fans.

22 And no matter what happens this  
23 year, there's always going to be a next year.  
24 Let's go, Mets, Mr. President.

25 (Scattered applause.)

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Senator  
2   Ramos on the resolution.

3                   SENATOR RAMOS:    Hi, Mr. Shamsky,  
4   thank you so much for giving us so many joys.  I  
5   have the utter honor, pleasure of being the State  
6   Senator for Citi Field and the New York Mets,  
7   which is a lifelong dream for anyone who cares to  
8   root for our home team.

9                   Being South American, of course,  
10   baseball isn't necessarily our first sport, but  
11   being the first American born in my country, it  
12   was certainly the way I was able to connect with  
13   many of my peers growing up.  And so going to  
14   Shea and now Citi Field very regularly, I have to  
15   say that the Mets despite, you know, forcing us  
16   to live a life of misery sometimes --  
17   {sighing} -- still keeps us believing.  Because  
18   you've gotta believe, right?

19                  We're hoping that things will pick  
20   up this season.  And let's go, Mets!

21                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Senator  
22   Little on the resolution.

23                  SENATOR LITTLE:    Thank you,  
24   Mr. President.

25                  I represent upstate New York, and I



1     probably have one of the most avid Mets fans in  
2     upstate New York in my fourth child, my son Tom.  
3     And he's a great sportsman, and he is the one and  
4     only Mets fan that I've met in upstate New York.

5                     (Laughter.)

6                     SENATOR LITTLE:     But on behalf of  
7     him, I'd just like to congratulate you and say  
8     thank you for being here.

9                     ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     Senator  
10    Antonacci on the resolution.

11                    SENATOR ANTONACCI:     Welcome to our  
12    guest.

13                    I represent the City of Syracuse and  
14    Onondaga County, and we have the AAA affiliate of  
15    the New York Mets, the new Syracuse Mets. We  
16    just changed our name. We were bought by Mets  
17    ownership. And I find myself occasionally  
18    rooting for a slight injury -- not anything  
19    serious -- so those great Met Major League  
20    ballplayers can come through and help us with  
21    attendance.

22                    But it's a great affiliation so far.  
23    We're really excited about it. And the better  
24    the Mets do in New York, the better the Mets will  
25    do in Syracuse.

1                   So welcome.

2                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    To Art  
3 Shamsky -- oh, Mets-ger.  Senator Metzger on the  
4 resolution.

5                   SENATOR METZGER:    Well.  Hey, watch  
6 it.

7                   (Laughter.)

8                   SENATOR METZGER:    So yes, it's not  
9 just the name Mets-ger, that's not the only  
10 reason I'm standing.  But also I'm originally  
11 from Queens and a lifelong Mets fan, and so happy  
12 to support this resolution.

13                   They say you can take the girl out  
14 of Queens, but you can't take the Queens out of  
15 the girl, and that's true with the Mets.

16                   So I'm very happy to support this  
17 resolution.  Thank you.

18                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Senator  
19 Seward on the resolution.

20                   SENATOR SEWARD:    Thank you very  
21 much, Mr. President.

22                   I'm very honored to be from the  
23 Cooperstown area, where the Baseball Hall of Fame  
24 is located.  And we're honoring the 1969 Mets,  
25 the amazing Mets today, and that milestone year

1 for them.

2 But I'm delighted that a number of  
3 Mets have made it into the Baseball Hall of Fame.  
4 And each year when the returning Hall of Famers  
5 come back to Cooperstown for Induction Weekend,  
6 I've had the opportunity to meet many of them and  
7 have greatly enjoyed that. So no question, as  
8 one of our New York teams in terms of baseball,  
9 the Mets have really done us proud over the  
10 years.

11 I know when my son was growing up,  
12 he was a big Mets fan, and once a year I'd take  
13 him down to the old Shea Stadium. We always  
14 enjoyed those days.

15 But I think this is a very, very  
16 special year, 1969. One of the reasons that's  
17 special, that's the year I graduated from high  
18 school. But also, of course, the World  
19 Championship on the part of the Mets.

20 You know, I carry a bill which I  
21 hope we will see before the end of the session  
22 that names baseball as the official sport in the  
23 New York State. And it passed last year, and we  
24 hope to get it passed again this year. And I  
25 think this might be a good time to bring that

1 bill out; we're all celebrating the Mets and  
2 baseball and what that means to New Yorkers.

3 And so I stand to congratulate all  
4 of you, and to proudly, proudly support this  
5 resolution.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: To Art  
7 Shamsky -- Senator Krueger on the resolution.

8 (Laughter.)

9 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you very  
10 much.

11 Welcome. People who know me here  
12 know I know almost nothing about sports. But I  
13 did want to get up and say apparently you're my  
14 constituents, so I'm delighted to have you here  
15 today. And I am very proud of New York's  
16 baseball teams, both of them -- that's how I  
17 avoid getting into any trouble.

18 Again, beyond that, you really  
19 shouldn't ask me anything about sports.

20 Thank you, Mr. President.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: To  
22 Art -- the third time is a charm. To Art  
23 Shamsky, I welcome you on behalf of the Senate.  
24 We extend to you all of the privileges and  
25 courtesies of this house.

1           Please rise and be recognized.

2           (Enthusiastic standing ovation.)

3           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
4 resolution was previously adopted on April 30th.  
5           Senator Gianaris.

6           SENATOR GIANARIS:    Mr. President,  
7 at this time we're going to simultaneously call a  
8 meeting of the Rules Committee and continue with  
9 our resolutions.  So please call a meeting of the  
10 Committee on Rules in Room 332.

11          ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    There  
12 will be an immediate meeting of the  
13 Rules Committee in Room 332.

14          Senator Gianaris.

15          SENATOR GIANARIS:    Before we get to  
16 the next resolution, please recognize Senator  
17 Krueger for a brief introduction.

18          ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Senator  
19 Krueger for an introduction.

20          SENATOR KRUEGER:    Thank you so  
21 much, Mr. President.

22                 I know the day is very busy and  
23 we're all running around, but I wanted to be able  
24 to recognize four guests we have with us today.  
25 They are all legislators from the great State of

1 Illinois. We have Kimberly Lightford, the  
2 Majority Leader of the Illinois State Senate. We  
3 have Sonya M. Harper, representative from the  
4 Illinois State House. We also have  
5 Representative Kelly Cassidy from the House, and  
6 Senator Heather Steans from the Senate.

7 All four women are here today, they  
8 all hail from the area of Chicago, from the great  
9 state of Illinois, where I lived for many years.  
10 I'm delighted to have them here.

11 And they're here speaking to many of  
12 us about the bill that Illinois just passed into  
13 law for legalized marijuana. So I appreciate  
14 their coming to New York to give us their wisdom  
15 and for taking time to trek to Albany.

16 And I just wanted to offer to you,  
17 Mr. President, to welcome them here.

18 (Applause.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
20 Gianaris.

21 SENATOR GIANARIS: Can you now  
22 recognize Senator Boyle for another introduction.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
24 Boyle for an introduction.

25 SENATOR BOYLE: Thank you,

1 Mr. President.

2 My colleagues, choking is the fourth  
3 leading cause of accidental death. We all read  
4 the stories, the tragic stories in our papers  
5 about an elderly person, perhaps in a restaurant;  
6 a disabled individual in a facility; God forbid,  
7 a child in a school, who chokes to death after  
8 the Heimlich was tried and did not work.

9 We are joined today by Arthur Lih, a  
10 brilliant inventor who came up with a complex but  
11 simple device called the LifeVac. It works to  
12 dislodge -- it's an airway clearance device.  
13 It's dislodges something from the throat after  
14 the Heimlich maneuver is tried and does not work.

15 He's from Massapequa, right here on  
16 Long Island, and he manufactures his device,  
17 LifeVac, in Brentwood, in Monica Martinez's  
18 district.

19 This is a live-saving device that's  
20 going to change the course of choking throughout  
21 the world. The device already has 25 saves, and  
22 it's going to have many more. I think this is  
23 something that should be -- or a similar  
24 airway-clearance device like LifeVac -- in our  
25 schools, in our restaurants.

1                   We want to congratulate him on the  
2                   great saves that he had. He recently had a save  
3                   of a one-year-old in the Midwest. And Arthur,  
4                   thank you so much.

5                   And please offer him the courtesies  
6                   of the house, Mr. President.

7                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: We  
8                   welcome you on behalf of the Senate. We extend  
9                   to you all of the privileges and courtesies of  
10                  this house. Let's recognize you at this time.

11                  (Standing ovation.)

12                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
13                  Bailey.

14                  SENATOR BAILEY: Please take up  
15                  Resolution 2103, by Senator Sanders, read that  
16                  resolution in its entirety, and recognize  
17                  Senator Sanders on the resolution.

18                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
19                  Secretary will read.

20                  THE SECRETARY: Senate Resolution  
21                  2103, by Senator Sanders, recognizing October 1,  
22                  2019, as China Day, and the first week of October  
23                  2019 as Chinese American Heritage Week, to  
24                  strengthen the friendship and bilateral  
25                  relationship between the State of New York and



1 Chinese Americans.

2 "WHEREAS, The United States  
3 officially normalized relations with the People's  
4 Republic of China in 1979 to sustain a close  
5 bilateral relationship and to advance mutual  
6 security and commercial interests between the  
7 U.S. and China; and

8 "WHEREAS, The United States and  
9 China share a long-term economic relationship,  
10 with \$659.8 billion in bilateral trade in 2018,  
11 making China the largest trading partner of the  
12 United States; and

13 "WHEREAS, The State of New York  
14 exported \$3.3 billion worth of products to China,  
15 making the 8th largest foreign market for the  
16 State of New York, and the bilateral trade and  
17 investment have created tens of thousands of jobs  
18 in the State of New York; and

19 "WHEREAS, Chinese Americans helped  
20 completed the Transcontinental Railroad, and one  
21 in five Chinese Americans enlisted to serve in  
22 World War II; and

23 "WHEREAS, The State of New York is  
24 home to thriving overseas ethnic Chinese  
25 communities that support the People's Republic of

1 China, including the America Chinese Development  
2 Center, Asian American Community Empowerment,  
3 American Chinese Commerce Association, and that  
4 have devoted themselves to the harmony and  
5 development of the community of the State of  
6 New York; now, therefore, be it

7 "RESOLVED, That this Legislative  
8 Body pause in its deliberations to recognize  
9 October 1, 2019, as China Day, and the first week  
10 of October 2019 as Chinese American Heritage  
11 Week, to strengthen the friendship and bilateral  
12 relationship between the State of New York and  
13 Chinese Americans; and be it further

14 "RESOLVED, That copies of this  
15 resolution, suitably engrossed, be transmitted to  
16 President Xi Jinping of the People's Republic of  
17 China and to Consul General Huang Ping of the  
18 Consulate General of the People's Republic of  
19 China in New York."

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
21 Sanders on the resolution.

22 SENATOR SANDERS: Thank you,  
23 Mr. President.

24 Today is indeed a great day that we  
25 have. This is a time that we find ourselves in

1 stormy waters politically, but this is a time  
2 when we need to really figure out how we can move  
3 forward.

4               So I am glad and I want to recognize  
5 and thank the Consul General Huang Ping, who is  
6 the Consul General of the People's Republic of  
7 China in New York, and his group, which is now in  
8 the Senate chamber.

9               This resolution that I am  
10 introducing today acknowledges, of course,  
11 October 1 is China Day and the first week of  
12 October 2019 is Chinese American Heritage Week  
13 for the purpose of strengthening the friendship  
14 and bilateral relations between the State of  
15 New York and Chinese Americans.

16              The State of New York and the nation  
17 are home to a thriving overseas Chinese  
18 community. Their presence is of course a  
19 positive contribution to our society. The  
20 history of America and China go a long way back.  
21 New York and China engaged in trade going back to  
22 the 18th century, and both nations were allies  
23 during World War II.

24              It has been nearly 40 years since  
25 the U.S. officially normalized relations with the

1     People's Republic of China in 1979. Since then,  
2     the U.S. and the People's Republic of China have  
3     had a constructive engagement through trade,  
4     tourism, academia, and cultural affairs. I hope  
5     that our two countries will continue this  
6     constructive engagement and promote peace and  
7     prosperity for the future.

8                 China is currently our largest  
9     goods-trading partner in two-way trade, and this  
10    we have to really remember. In terms of the  
11    Empire State, we export to China more than  
12    \$3,442 million in goods and services.

13                And there's so much that could be  
14    said, except that I want to say that the warmth  
15    that the delegation has shown to us is one that I  
16    personally wanted to note. The Consul General  
17    has done an amazing job in making sure that the  
18    people of New York know and understand their  
19    concerns, and he takes back our concerns.

20                So on behalf of the Consul General,  
21    who wanted to make sure that I said thank you to  
22    everyone in here, I want to thank him. And  
23    Mr. President, if you can welcome the Consul  
24    General and his party, thank you very much.

25                Thank you.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     Senator  
2     Carlucci on the resolution.

3                   SENATOR CARLUCCI:     Thank you,  
4     Mr. President.

5                   I want to thank Senator Sanders for  
6     putting forth this important resolution, and  
7     particularly want to thank Consul General Huang  
8     Ping and your whole delegation for visiting us  
9     here today and, more importantly, for what this  
10    resolution represents:   First, October 1st being  
11    China Day in the State of New York, and then the  
12    first week of October being Chinese Heritage Week  
13    in the State of New York.

14                  And as we all know, we've been  
15    blessed with so many Chinese Americans working in  
16    New York State, living, raising a family,  
17    contributing to our economy and almost every part  
18    of our society, whether it's cuisine, culture,  
19    medicine -- the list goes on and on.

20                  And as was said by Senator Sanders,  
21    that last year New York exported over  
22    \$3.4 billion worth of goods to China.   And it's  
23    important that we remember and recognize that  
24    regardless of what we see happening on the  
25    federal level, that we need to do our part to

1 maintain a relationship with China and we have to  
2 recognize that Consul General Huang Ping has been  
3 outgoing in making sure that that relationship  
4 continues and that Chinese people here in  
5 New York thrive with all New Yorkers. We thrive  
6 together.

7                   So I'm honored and privileged to be  
8 on this resolution and want to recognize that  
9 China day is also my youngest son's birthday, so  
10 we've got something else to celebrate as well.

11                   But thank you, Mr. President, and  
12 I'll be supporting the resolution.

13                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
14 question is on the resolution. All in favor  
15 signify by saying aye.

16                   (Response of "Aye.")

17                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
18 Opposed?

19                   (No response.)

20                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
21 resolution is adopted.

22                   To the Consul General of the  
23 People's Republic of China and his delegation, I  
24 welcome you on behalf of the Senate. We extend  
25 to you all of the privileges and courtesies of

1     this house. Please rise and be recognized.

2                     (Standing ovation.)

3                     ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
4     Bailey.

5                     SENATOR BAILEY: Please take up  
6     Resolution 1979, by Senator Ortt, read that  
7     resolution title only, and recognize Senator Ortt  
8     on the resolution.

9                     ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
10    Secretary will read.

11                    THE SECRETARY: Senate Resolution  
12    1979, by Senator Ortt, honoring United States  
13    Army Staff Sergeant David Bellavia upon the  
14    occasion of his designation as a recipient of the  
15    Medal of Honor.

16                    ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
17    Ortt on the resolution.

18                    SENATOR ORTT: Thank you,  
19    Mr. President.

20                    I rise today to recognize a  
21    constituent of mine and someone that is known to  
22    most of my colleagues in Western New York and who  
23    is probably or will be known now to the rest of  
24    the United States of America, because he is only  
25    one of 3,400 and now 69 Americans to ever receive

1 our nation's highest military honor. When you  
2 think about the millions who have served in the  
3 armed forces, that is pretty humbling and  
4 impressive, as it should be, for our highest  
5 award.

6 He's also the only living Iraq  
7 veteran to receive the Medal of Honor. Every  
8 other recipient from the conflict in Iraq died in  
9 the line of duty and received this award  
10 posthumously.

11 I wish we could have done this on a  
12 different day, a different week when we didn't  
13 have the end of session going on and we could  
14 have everyone here, because -- and I wish we had  
15 been able to have Staff Sergeant Bellavia here in  
16 the chamber. But because of the timing and all,  
17 and for a lot of other factors, he was unable to  
18 be here with us today.

19 But for those that don't know, Staff  
20 Sergeant Bellavia was born on November 10, 1975.  
21 He grew up in Orleans County, went to Lyndonville  
22 High School, attended the University of Buffalo,  
23 where he was a theater major, and ultimately  
24 joined the United States Army.

25 After the terror attacks on 9/11,



1 Staff Sergeant Bellavia felt his country needed  
2 him, and he chose to stay in the Army and  
3 continue to serve. That sense of duty had been  
4 ingrained in him since he was a child by his  
5 grandfather, Joseph Brunacini, who also served in  
6 the Army during the Normandy campaign in  
7 World War II. And of course we just a few weeks  
8 ago celebrated the 75th anniversary of D-Day, so  
9 I think that's a very nice linkage there.

10 In the summer of 2003, Staff  
11 Sergeant Bellavia's unit deployed to Kosovo for  
12 nine months before receiving orders to deploy  
13 directly to Iraq in support of Operation Iraqi  
14 Freedom. From February 2004 to February 2005,  
15 Staff Sergeant Bellavia and the 2nd Battalion,  
16 2nd Infantry Regiment, were stationed in the  
17 Diyala Province along the Iranian border.  
18 Throughout the year, his task force took part in  
19 the Battles of Najaf, Mosul, Baqubah, Muqdadiyah,  
20 and Fallujah, and it's here that I want to talk  
21 about his actions at the Battle of Fallujah.

22 Now, these actions are fairly  
23 graphic, but I think it's so important because  
24 very often today we do not really talk about what  
25 our soldiers go through in combat. We don't talk

1 about what they actually confront in order to  
2 keep us free, in order to protect our interests  
3 and our values and our way of life. All the  
4 parades and all the memorials and all of that is  
5 great, but I think it's important that we not  
6 sort of glance over what our soldiers, what our  
7 men and women -- who are sent because they want  
8 to serve, but they're also sent because people  
9 like us, in decisions and in positions like  
10 ourselves, make decisions that put them in harm's  
11 way. And sometimes those actions lead to this  
12 kind of recognition -- for Staff Sergeant  
13 Bellavia, a Medal of Honor. But I want you to  
14 understand why he's the only living Iraqi veteran  
15 to receive -- or the only living Medal of Honor  
16 recipient from the Iraq conflict.

17 November 10, 2004, Staff Sergeant  
18 David Bellavia was serving as a squad leader in  
19 support of Operation Phantom Fury in Fallujah.  
20 Staff Sergeant Bellavia and his unit were  
21 clearing a block of 12 houses. The first nine  
22 houses were cleared, until the tenth house, when  
23 his squad began to take fire. Because of a  
24 malfunction with a Bradley support vehicle that  
25 was shadowing and providing overwatch and

1 covering the fire for his squad, Staff Sergeant  
2 Bellavia and his squad would have to engage  
3 anti-Iraqi forces without it.

4 Two insurgents operating machine  
5 guns under a stairwell had been waiting for this  
6 squad with other anti-Iraqi forces opening fire  
7 from an above window. Staff Sergeant Bellavia's  
8 squad was trapped. Two soldiers were bleeding  
9 from shattered glass, and one additional soldier  
10 had been grazed by a bullet. At this point Staff  
11 Sergeant Bellavia exchanged his rifle, which had  
12 taken a bullet to the magazine, for an M249 squad  
13 automatic weapon, otherwise known as a SAW, and  
14 he entered into a room where two insurgents were  
15 under the stairwell waiting to engage him.

16 Bullets were hitting the wall behind  
17 him. This gave his soldiers time to escape the  
18 house and move onto the street, where a now  
19 operational Bradley vehicle was located. Staff  
20 Sergeant Bellavia called on the Bradley to fire  
21 on the building where the insurgents were  
22 located. After suppressive fire, Staff Sergeant  
23 Bellavia reentered the house to ensure that the  
24 house was cleared.

25 Upon reentering the house, he heard

1 two insurgents talking and engaged them. He was  
2 forced to find cover after receiving return fire.  
3 After the exchange of gunfire had stopped, he  
4 looked back into the room to see one insurgent  
5 loading a rocket-propelled grenade. He reengaged  
6 and eliminated this enemy, knowing the RPG would  
7 be devastating to his squad members outside.

8 He then turned his attention to the  
9 second insurgent and wounded him. The wounded  
10 insurgent retreated into the building's kitchen.

11 After this fire fight, Staff  
12 Sergeant Bellavia exchanged his SAW for an M4  
13 rifle and a shotgun. While clearing the  
14 remaining rooms, a third insurgent attacked him  
15 from the building's stairwell. He took cover  
16 along a wall in a bedroom and was then engaged by  
17 the previously wounded insurgent from the  
18 kitchen, who was blindly firing his AK-47.

19 After eliminating this threat, he  
20 was reengaged by the insurgent on the stairwell.  
21 Staff Sergeant Bellavia quickly eliminated this  
22 enemy combatant, his third kill.

23 Suddenly a fourth insurgent appeared  
24 from a wardrobe and began to fire upon Staff  
25 Sergeant Bellavia, who was able to take cover and

1 narrowly escape the flying bullets. Staff  
2 Sergeant Bellavia returned fire, injuring this  
3 insurgent. This insurgent, while falling to the  
4 floor from being hit, was able to respond with a  
5 burst of bullets from his weapon. He was then  
6 able to pick himself up and head up the stairs to  
7 the second floor.

8               Staff Sergeant Bellavia followed the  
9 blood trail from the wounded insurgent up the  
10 stairs, where he heard the insurgent writhing in  
11 pain. He tossed a grenade into the room where  
12 this insurgent was located. The force from the  
13 grenade blew the wounded insurgent out the second  
14 story window.

15               Wounded from the previous fire fight  
16 and shrapnel from the grenade, the insurgent  
17 attempted to alert his fellow combatants of Staff  
18 Sergeant Bellavia's location before he succumbed  
19 to his injuries.

20               Exhausted both physically and  
21 mentally, Staff Sergeant Bellavia took off his  
22 Kevlar helmet, set down his weapon, and had a  
23 cigarette while he waited for his fellow soldiers  
24 to arrive.

25               While waiting, a final insurgent

1     jumped from the third-story roof to the  
2     second-story balcony and landed just a few feet  
3     from where Staff Sergeant Bellavia was. The  
4     insurgent's knees buckled as he landed, and he  
5     dropped his weapon. This gave Staff Sergeant  
6     Bellavia just enough time to suppress him with  
7     his rifle. When the wounded insurgent attempted  
8     to raise his weapon again, Staff Sergeant  
9     Bellavia unloaded the rest of his magazine,  
10    causing the insurgent to fall off the roof into  
11    the garden below.

12                 Staff Sergeant Bellavia was then  
13    called back inside to move his unit out of the  
14    area due to an incoming close air support  
15    mission.

16                 That night, Staff Sergeant Bellavia  
17    single-handedly saved his entire squad and risked  
18    his own life for his fellow soldiers. He  
19    voluntarily entered and cleared an insurgent  
20    strong point, killing four and wounding a fifth.  
21    His actions stand as a testament to those who  
22    risked their lives for their squad mates on the  
23    battlefield.

24                 Pretty graphic stuff. But it is  
25    something that so many other soldiers who never

1 receive a Medal of Honor go through. And Staff  
2 Sergeant Bellavia's comments when he received the  
3 Medal of Honor, they were all about these other  
4 soldiers. They were all about those members of  
5 his squad who he protected. And as a squad  
6 ladder, that is one of your most coveted  
7 responsibilities, to accomplish your mission but  
8 to make sure that your men get back home. And he  
9 did that, under unbelievable conditions.

10 But I know he also talked about all  
11 of the soldiers that I know he knows that never  
12 came back home. Because in the military, the  
13 Army, you're always taught it's about team and  
14 it's about unit and it's about teamwork and  
15 working as an organization, as a team. And then  
16 you receive an award that's very much an  
17 individual award. A Medal of Honor is given to  
18 one person.

19 And it's got to be very hard to  
20 contrast that feeling that you're being  
21 individually honored and you're being  
22 individually hailed, but all you think about are  
23 the soldiers that didn't get back home. And  
24 that's true for every single soldier who comes  
25 back from combat, because we all know someone who

1     didn't make it back. And I know, because he's  
2     made comments to that effect, that Staff Sergeant  
3     Bellavia feels exactly the same way.

4                     And I will simply say that again  
5     it's my honor, along with my colleagues, to  
6     support this resolution, to bring this resolution  
7     to the floor. It is not every day -- we do  
8     resolutions every day, and they're all for  
9     various causes. And to the people who are being  
10    recognized or to the causes being outlined, I  
11    know it's important. But we don't get to honor a  
12    Medal of Honor recipient every day. We don't get  
13    to hear a story like this.

14                    So when you think you're having a  
15    bad day or when you think the week in Albany has  
16    gone on too long or when you're taking heat from  
17    your voters or constituents or you're pining over  
18    a hard decision, just think about Staff Sergeant  
19    Bellavia on this day, who made the right choice  
20    time and again to protect his -- members of his  
21    squad, to take out the enemy, and to accomplish  
22    the mission on behalf of all of us. On behalf of  
23    all of us.

24                    Because the flag and the freedoms  
25    and the Constitution and the rights that we have,



1 all these things we talk about here, it's not  
2 possible without actions like this. On some  
3 level, at some point, it is actions like those  
4 exemplified by Staff Sergeant Bellavia that make  
5 all of those things possible and make all of  
6 those things real.

7           And so it is a great honor for me to  
8 stand up not only as a veteran and the ranker on  
9 the Veterans and Military Affairs Committee here  
10 in the Senate, but as the Senator for this  
11 district, on behalf of my constituent, Staff  
12 Sergeant David Bellavia, as the 3,469th American  
13 to receive the Medal of Honor. It's an honor for  
14 me to represent people like David. It's an honor  
15 for me to be here and talk about the actions he  
16 took on that day and what kind of soldier and  
17 what kind of individual he is.

18           And I look forward to the ceremony  
19 on June 25th at the White House, which will be  
20 very humbling I know for him, as it should be for  
21 all of us.

22           So with that, Mr. President, I thank  
23 you for allowing me to speak on this resolution,  
24 and I encourage all of my colleagues to support  
25 and inscribe their names to this resolution.

1                   Thank you.

2                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     Senator  
3                   Gallivan on the resolution.

4                   SENATOR GALLIVAN:     Thank you,  
5                   Mr. President.

6                   I'd like to start by thanking  
7                   Senator Ortt, along with my colleagues Senator  
8                   Ranzenhofer and Senator Jacobs, for bringing this  
9                   resolution forward. I too am very proud to  
10                  cosponsor it.

11                  And I'd also like to thank  
12                  Senator Ortt for his comments, because he lends a  
13                  unique perspective that many of us never had. A  
14                  veteran with service in combat knows many of the  
15                  realities all too well. But I can't think of a  
16                  better person to describe Staff Sergeant  
17                  Bellavia's actions and his concerns that Staff  
18                  Sergeant Bellavia has articulated since this  
19                  award has been announced -- his concern for  
20                  others, his concern for the soldiers that he  
21                  served with, his concern for not just those in  
22                  his unit but the larger people that his actions  
23                  ultimately saved. Countless hundreds of  
24                  individuals were saved through his actions.

25                  And it's really interesting, when

1     you look at this Medal of Honor, nearly 3500  
2     people have received this in our nation's  
3     history, half of them in the Civil War. So  
4     that's only 1700 other people throughout our  
5     nation's history, out of the tens of millions  
6     that have served.

7                     And so we go back to David Bellavia,  
8     and we've heard some of his public comments  
9     afterwards. And the one that keeps ringing out  
10    in my mind that we hear in the local Buffalo  
11    media is -- and I quote -- him saying "I'm better  
12    for my service."

13                    So you think of his selfless actions  
14    and you think of him saying that look at what  
15    this has given me, the honor to serve my country,  
16    to make me better, to continue to serve my  
17    community, both in Western New York and serve  
18    veterans across the nation, I think lends insight  
19    to the type of individual that he is.

20                    Because Senator Ortt did such a  
21    great job of taking us through what earned Staff  
22    Sergeant Bellavia the medal, I'll keep my  
23    comments brief. But everyone ought to know that  
24    he wrote a book called "House to House."

25                    They actually had a journalist

1 embedded with their unit that was keeping track  
2 of all the things that took place. So the award  
3 that he's gotten, the events described, are not  
4 Staff Sergeant Bellavia's recollection of it, it  
5 was actually memorialized and documented by a  
6 reporter who was by their side with film, with  
7 audio. And ultimately that is what told the  
8 story, a story that I'm thrilled to hear, that I  
9 wish all Americans could hear. Because Staff  
10 Sergeant Bellavia, while a hero, is indicative of  
11 all the men and women who have served us  
12 throughout the years and for which I certainly am  
13 grateful.

14 I do want to emphasize David  
15 Bellavia, while he is the one being acknowledged,  
16 he continues to say: This is about everybody, it  
17 is not just about me. And the people that he'll  
18 take to Washington with him are the living  
19 members of his unit that were there. There will  
20 be roughly 40 to 50 individuals that have served  
21 with him that he'll be accepting this in the name  
22 of.

23 It is an incredible honor. I'm very  
24 proud to call him a friend and very proud that we  
25 as a body are taking time to recognize his

1 service and those men and women who served by his  
2 side and, of course, in all of the conflicts,  
3 standing up for the things that we believe in and  
4 making the lives that we live possible.

5 Thank you, Mr. President.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
7 Ranzenhofer on the resolution.

8 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: Thank you,  
9 Mr. President.

10 It is a real privilege for me to  
11 stand today to rise and to speak on this  
12 resolution that was sponsored by -- it is  
13 sponsored by Senator Ortt. I'm very happy to be  
14 a cosponsor of this resolution.

15 One of the things about David  
16 Bellavia -- and I've known David Bellavia for  
17 over a decade now. He spent -- he lived in my  
18 district for a long time, in Batavia, New York,  
19 and is well known throughout the community.

20 But I think the description of the  
21 events and the heroism and the actions of  
22 Sergeant Bellavia, you know, almost seem like  
23 it's an action movie that, you know, we're  
24 watching in the movies or that we're watching on  
25 TV. This is where we are accustomed to seeing

1     these type of actions and activities.

2                   But the very graphic and the very  
3     real heroic acts as described by Senator Ortt,  
4     who knows all too well, as a veteran himself,  
5     make it just phenomenal that, you know, this is  
6     not something that happened in fantasy, this is  
7     not something that happened in the movies, but  
8     this happened in real life. And, amazingly, he  
9     is alive to talk about it and to tell about it.  
10    Because, as was mentioned earlier, many, many  
11    Medal of Honor winners and recipients are honored  
12    after they are dead. They're no longer alive.  
13    And he has the privilege to be able to speak  
14    about it.

15                   And this is the type of honor which  
16    will really change his life forever, because he  
17    is now going to be an ambassador for the  
18    military, for the Army, in talking about what he  
19    did. And when I say talking about what he did,  
20    as was very ably described by Senator Gallivan  
21    and Senator Ortt -- and the four of us, Senators  
22    Jacobs and Gallivan and Ortt and myself, had a  
23    conversation with Staff Sergeant Bellavia last  
24    week and we talked to him about this resolution.  
25    And very similar to his comments and his reaction

1 to receiving the Medal of Honor, it was really --  
2 it had nothing to do with him. Even though his  
3 actions are tremendously heroic, it was always  
4 about "we did this," "our squad did this," "our  
5 unit did this." And it couldn't be any clearer  
6 that he was really accepting this award on behalf  
7 of his entire unit.

8 Yes, he is cognizant of what he did  
9 and what his actions are and the lives that he  
10 saved on that day and how he protected our  
11 country on that day. But he is asking for no  
12 individual recognition, although that is what he  
13 will receive; he is really recognizing and  
14 accepting this Medal of Honor award on behalf of  
15 his entire unit.

16 So while I wish that Staff Sergeant  
17 Bellavia could have been with us on this day, and  
18 in light of what we are all doing here in closing  
19 out the business of the State Senate this week,  
20 in a couple of weeks -- or next week, I should  
21 say, is really going to be an extraordinary day  
22 not only for him, his family, his unit, but for  
23 the entire country. Because as was described  
24 earlier, he is the only, only living Iraq veteran  
25 to receive the Medal of Honor. There are no

1 others. There are no others.

2           So I want to just offer my sincere  
3 and heartfelt appreciation and thanks for what he  
4 did many years ago, not seeking any recognition,  
5 just acting based on his training and his  
6 instincts, to really honor his heroic deeds that  
7 day to make all of us a lot safer and to make  
8 this country much more peaceful than it could  
9 otherwise be.

10           So thank you, Mr. President, for  
11 allowing me to speak about Staff Sergeant  
12 Bellavia today.

13           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Senator  
14 Sanders on the resolution.

15           SENATOR SANDERS:    Thank you,  
16 Mr. President.

17           I would be quite remiss and I'd be  
18 less of a man and I wouldn't be true to the  
19 service if I did not stand up and speak of the  
20 incredible deeds of this Medal of Honor winner.

21           I want to thank Senator Ortt and  
22 others for bringing this before us. We must  
23 absolutely never forget what is really happening  
24 over there.

25           Now, the reason -- one of the



1 reasons why that there's only one Medal of Honor  
2 winner who's around is because most of the times  
3 you don't live to get your Medal of Honor. You  
4 simply don't live, you get it after the fact  
5 because you've done some amazing stuff for others  
6 and you simply don't live to talk of it.

7               Now, as a Marine grunt, as an  
8 infantryman, the most horrifying, terrifying  
9 thing that you could do is house-to-house. The  
10 only thing more dangerous, perhaps, is to be a  
11 tunnel rat. But that's a different story.

12              House-to-house is close quarters.  
13 You can't call the helicopters, you can't call  
14 the planes, the submarines. You can't call  
15 anything. All you hope for is the person right  
16 next to you. And you really get to know folk  
17 under those conditions, because if they move  
18 away, if somebody doesn't hold their end up,  
19 everybody dies. If one person breaks and runs,  
20 everybody goes.

21              And the most natural thing for you  
22 to do is to run. It's natural to have fear and  
23 to run. These are not supermen or superwomen,  
24 these are your sons and daughters just doing what  
25 they're supposed to do under those conditions.

1                   And you see amazing things happen.  
2   The best of America comes out in a time like  
3   that, where a person can stay there when  
4   everybody is fleeing and they're staying to make  
5   sure everybody gets out, then they're going  
6   further inside to make sure there's no danger to  
7   the others. If you stop and think of this,  
8   you're not going to do it. You're relying on  
9   muscle memory. You're relying on this is what  
10   you've been trained to do, this is right, this is  
11   what we're going to do.

12                  And America will be free as long as  
13   you produce people like the staff sergeant, as  
14   long as you can produce people who say, You know  
15   what, there are things more important than life.  
16   There are things more important than me getting  
17   hurt or crippled and all the rest of that stuff.  
18   There's things called honor and duty.

19                  And he did his honor, and as so many  
20   do theirs. We won't hear about the majority.  
21   And you know what? We're not supposed to.  
22   They're doing their job. At their best, they're  
23   not doing it because they want you to read about  
24   it. They don't want you to see a second Rambo or  
25   any of that other stuff. They just want -- this

1 is what they've been sent to do. This is what  
2 they do.

3 This is one of the reasons why we  
4 have to think twice before we put America's  
5 treasure into harm's way. But if we do it, if we  
6 say this is where it needs to go, then we need to  
7 support them. We need to give them everything  
8 they need to be successful, to bring home the  
9 victory.

10 So I again wouldn't have been much  
11 of a Marine if I didn't stand up and talk of a  
12 Medal of Honor winner. That's for us. That --  
13 you cleared a path for a person like that.  
14 You -- you know, you -- you're honored to go buy  
15 them a drink or to carry their bag or whatever.  
16 A medal of Honor winner is something that you  
17 really -- please understand what that means, that  
18 these folk -- I mean, that's almost like America  
19 walking.

20 Well, I could go on, but I'm  
21 touched. I'm really glad that you were kind  
22 enough, you guys were kind enough to say  
23 something about an incredible American. Please  
24 take my word to him. My hat's off -- if I had a  
25 hat, it would be off. Hardcore-er.

1                   Thank you. In English, thank you,  
2                   Mr. President.

3                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
4                   LaValle on the resolution.

5                   SENATOR LaVALLE: Thank you,  
6                   Mr. President.

7                   Sergeant Bellavia joins a very elite  
8                   group that will be recognized for serving our  
9                   nation with great courage and distinction.

10                  I wanted to just say, Senator Ortt,  
11                  your remarks -- I was kind of riveted as you were  
12                  speaking, and also Senator Sanders. It's great  
13                  to have colleagues here that understand, who have  
14                  served and understand the importance of what --  
15                  the person or people that we are honoring. You  
16                  did really great, both you and Senator Sanders.

17                  Thank you.

18                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
19                  Bailey.

20                  SENATOR BAILEY: Thank you,  
21                  Mr. President.

22                  Pardon the brief interruption. In  
23                  order to continue with the orderly flow of  
24                  business, we are calling an immediate meeting of  
25                  the Judiciary Committee in Room 124.

1                   And we will continue with the  
2 speakers' list. Thank you, Mr. President.

3                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: There  
4 will be an immediate meeting of the Judiciary  
5 Committee in Room 124.

6                   Senator Jackson on the resolution.

7                   SENATOR JACKSON: Thank you,  
8 Mr. President.

9                   I rise in order to support the  
10 resolution. But in listening to Senator Ortt  
11 describe his constituent and the details of it --  
12 I've never served in the military or any police  
13 department, but I've watched movies in which some  
14 of the details of that type of situation -- and I  
15 say to you that obviously, to me, we have an  
16 American hero in Sergeant David Bellavia.

17                   And so, Senator, I thank you for  
18 providing this to all of our attention so that we  
19 can collectively honor him. And as our  
20 colleagues, one of them said, so that we wish he  
21 were here to stand and applaud him for the work  
22 that he's done, not only for his team in Iraq but  
23 the entire country.

24                   Thank you, Senator. And I  
25 wholeheartedly support this resolution in

1 honoring Sergeant David Bellavia.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
3 Kennedy on the resolution.

4 SENATOR KENNEDY: Thank you,  
5 Mr. President.

6 I too rise to honor a true American  
7 hero, David Bellavia. Staff Sergeant Bellavia  
8 has demonstrated to us in Western New York, our  
9 great state, and our nation what true heroism is,  
10 and next week will be awarded the Medal of Honor,  
11 the highest military honor our nation can bestow  
12 on one of our heroes, the first living Iraq War  
13 veteran to receive this prestigious award from  
14 our nation.

15 Staff Sergeant Bellavia entered into  
16 service in 1999, twenty years ago -- it's hard to  
17 believe that was 20 years ago -- and then on  
18 November 10, 2004, as has already been mentioned,  
19 put his life at risk for the betterment of  
20 freedom, of democracy, and to protect his fellow  
21 platoon members as he ran into building after  
22 building, clearing them out, and all of a sudden  
23 was met by the insurgents who he bravely took on,  
24 sometimes in numbers and sometimes in  
25 hand-to-hand combat.

1                   There has only been a handful of  
2 individuals, proportionally, compared to those  
3 that have served in our nation's military, that  
4 have received this award. Many of them have  
5 gotten this award posthumously. Thankfully, by  
6 the grace of God, David Bellavia is still with  
7 us, still an active member of our community,  
8 still a leader, still leading, whether it is in  
9 sharing his views on the political climate and  
10 the nature of democracy that he fought for and  
11 nearly died for, or whether it's serving so  
12 graciously his fellow veterans, both domestically  
13 and across the globe, as he started the Vets for  
14 Freedom in 2005.

15                   And so it is such an honor to be  
16 able to stand here today as a Western New Yorker  
17 and as a member of this body. I thank our  
18 colleagues for bringing this forward. I thank  
19 all of our men and women who don the uniform of  
20 the United States military to fight for the  
21 freedom that we hold true and dear to our hearts  
22 and oftentimes, unfortunately, is taken for  
23 granted.

24                   And we call to mind all those today,  
25 once again, that have so bravely suffered and

1 those that have died and bled for the freedoms  
2 that we hold true as a nation.

3           Once again, Mr. President, it is my  
4 distinct honor and privilege to stand here and  
5 recognize one of our community's, one of our  
6 state's, and one of our nation's greatest ever, a  
7 true American hero, David Bellavia, as he  
8 receives the Medal of Honor next week.

9           Thank you very much.

10           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Senator  
11 Jacobs on the resolution.

12           SENATOR JACOBS:    Thank you,  
13 Mr. President.

14           I just briefly wanted to touch --  
15 not to detract from the wonderful things that  
16 have already been said, especially by  
17 Senator Ortt, but just to point out that in our  
18 country's history we've had about 57 million men  
19 and women who have worn the uniform, and only  
20 3,468 have received the Medal of Honor, and  
21 Mr. Bellavia will be the 3469th.

22           It is an incredibly rare honor, and  
23 we are very fortunate to know this individual who  
24 truly is a hero. And I -- as Senator Ortt and  
25 others mentioned, we would have loved to have had



1 him here today. Hopefully we can bring him up in  
2 the future to thank him and to acknowledge him in  
3 person.

4 And I just wanted to mention,  
5 knowing Mr. Bellavia and, as was mentioned, that  
6 he takes this award and recognition with humility  
7 and I know with some mixed feelings, because as a  
8 true person of service, he thinks not about  
9 himself but the others and those that did not  
10 make it through the conflict.

11 And I was heartened to hear, as  
12 Senator Gallivan mentioned, that when he goes to  
13 the White House he will have many of the members  
14 in his unit there with him. So I truly hope he  
15 can take that moment to reflect on the fact of  
16 all the people that are living and there with him  
17 on that day because of his acts of heroism.

18 I also look forward to the many good  
19 things he will do with this award and recognition  
20 as he continues to be a person of service for our  
21 country.

22 And again, it is an honor to be on  
23 this proclamation, resolution. And again,  
24 congratulations to Staff Sergeant David Bellavia  
25 and his entire family for this significant

1 recognition.

2 Thank you.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
4 Brooks on the resolution.

5 SENATOR BROOKS: Thank you,  
6 Mr. President.

7 I want to thank Senator Ortt for  
8 bringing this resolution forward, and the  
9 information he has provided us.

10 You know, everybody that's spoken so  
11 far has spoken about the significant contribution  
12 this Medal of Honor winner brings to us. We all  
13 have to take time not just to recognize this  
14 hero, but to recognize how blessed we are as a  
15 nation, that men and women in this nation, in  
16 some of the most difficult circumstances  
17 historically, have stood up and done for this  
18 country what we don't realize as even being  
19 possible.

20 We are very blessed that this hero  
21 is still with us, that we are in a situation  
22 where he can receive this great honor, knowing  
23 it's given to him, not posthumously. We are very  
24 fortunate and should take the time to just think  
25 about the fact that men and women in this country

1 give so much to this country, and at times under  
2 the worst of circumstances they rise up above,  
3 not only to perform magnificent feats, but to  
4 save and protect their fellow soldiers.

5 Thank you, Mr. President.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
7 Funke on the resolution.

8 SENATOR FUNKE: Thank you,  
9 Mr. President.

10 And I want to thank first Lieutenant  
11 Rob Ortt, who happens to be a Bronze Star winner  
12 for his efforts in Afghanistan, for bringing this  
13 resolution forward.

14 We're proud to have two Medal of  
15 Honor winners in Western New York now, with Staff  
16 Sergeant Bellavia and also Gary Beikirch, who  
17 lives in Greece, New York, Senator Robach's  
18 district, an Army medic who charged into harm's  
19 way while he was wounded and saved many of his  
20 colleagues in similar fashion. And now Sergeant  
21 David Bellavia.

22 You know, we talk a lot about heroes  
23 in our society, and oftentimes we're talking  
24 about the wrong people that we put in that  
25 category. We talk about athletes and actors and

1     singers. Sergeant David Bellavia and Gary  
2     Beikirch are the real heroes, humble and proud,  
3     willing to serve. And I'm proud that this body  
4     does all it can, day in and day out, for the  
5     veterans in our state.

6                 Thanks very much, Rob, for bringing  
7     this forward, and thanks for your service to our  
8     country too.

9                 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
10    Helming on the resolution.

11                SENATOR HELMING: Thank you,  
12    Mr. President.

13                I too want to thank Senator Ortt for  
14    bringing this resolution forward and to all the  
15    Senators who sponsored it.

16                David Bellavia, he is a true  
17    American hero. And we are doing the right thing  
18    today by honoring him and reminding everyone  
19    who's here how important our military members  
20    are.

21                Staff Sergeant David Bellavia, as  
22    we've heard, he's a very humble man, always  
23    giving credit to those who served alongside him.  
24    He's very inspiring to me. My son-in-law,  
25    Captain Charles Sauter, is deployed right now;

1 he's in Special Forces. He's been through  
2 situations somewhat similar.

3 And I'm glad to hear people again  
4 talk about how we need to honor and recognize our  
5 veterans. One of the things I want to use this  
6 opportunity to do is to remind us that some of  
7 these veterans, when they return, they need help.  
8 They've been impacted by their experiences. So I  
9 would remind those who have -- who are in the  
10 Majority and can make decisions to help our  
11 veterans, to do so, because that's not what I saw  
12 during this session.

13 We talked about taking down  
14 barriers. We heard how the Majority was going to  
15 knock down barriers at the start of the session,  
16 and our veterans --

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
18 Helming, please stay germane to the resolution.

19 SENATOR HELMING: I am germane to  
20 the resolution. I'm talking about veterans like  
21 Staff Sergeant David Bellavia who deserve and who  
22 have earned everything that we can possibly give  
23 to them, and that includes funding for veterans  
24 programs like the Rochester Veterans Outreach  
25 Center, the Warrior Salute program -- which I

1 wish Senator Kennedy was here to hear about that  
2 they serve our veterans from Western New York --

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
4 Gianaris.

5 SENATOR HELMING: So I am proud to  
6 support this resolution --

7 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President --

8 SENATOR HELMING: And thanks to  
9 Staff Sergeant Bellavia for his service.

10 Thank you.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
12 Gianaris.

13 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,  
14 let me remind my colleagues that for years we've  
15 been good about keeping resolutions to the  
16 subject of the resolution.

17 We're here to honor the people who  
18 are the subject of these resolutions, not to make  
19 policy speeches. We'll have plenty of time to do  
20 that on the bills that come before us. Let us  
21 not disrespect the people who are being honored  
22 in these resolutions by turning it into a policy  
23 debate. Thank you.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
25 question is on the resolution. All in favor

1 signify by saying aye.

2 (Response of "Aye.")

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:

4 Opposed?

5 (No response.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
7 resolution is adopted.

8 Senator Gianaris.

9 SENATOR GIANARIS: The resolutions  
10 considered today will be open for cosponsorship.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
12 resolutions are open for cosponsorship. Should  
13 you choose not to be a cosponsor of the  
14 resolutions, please notify the desk.

15 Senator Gianaris.

16 SENATOR GIANARIS: Can we return to  
17 reports of standing committees.

18 I believe there's a report of the  
19 Rules Committee at the desk.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: There  
21 is a report of the Rules Committee at the desk.

22 The Secretary will read.

23 THE SECRETARY: Senator  
24 Stewart-Cousins, from the Committee on Rules,  
25 reports the following bills:

1                   Senate Print 64, by Senator Robach,  
2     an act to amend the Domestic Relations Law and  
3     the Executive Law;

4                   Senate Print 123, by Senator Ortt,  
5     an act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law;

6                   Senate Print 215B, by Senator  
7     Benjamin, an act to amend the Executive Law;

8                   Senate Print 355, by Senator  
9     Gaughran, an act to amend the Navigation Law;

10                  Senate Print 398, by Senator Lanza,  
11     an act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law;

12                  Senate Print 1534, by Senator  
13     Kennedy, an act to amend the Education Law;

14                  Senate Print 1720, by Senator Ramos,  
15     an act to amend the Labor Law;

16                  Senate Print 1751, by Senator  
17     Sepúlveda, an act to amend the Real Property Law;

18                  Senate Print 1833, by Senator  
19     Gianaris, an act to amend the Election Law;

20                  Senate Print 2207, by Senator  
21     Bailey, an act to amend the Public Housing Law;

22                  Senate Print 2397, by  
23     Senator Comrie, an act to direct the New York  
24     State Department of Financial Services and the  
25     New York State Department of State's Consumer



1 Protection Division to conduct a study on  
2 consumer awareness and financial education;  
3 Senate Print 2482A, by Senator  
4 Sanders, an act to amend the Education Law;  
5 Senate Print 2493, by  
6 Senator Serrano, an act to amend the Parks,  
7 Recreation and Historic Preservation Law;  
8 Senate Print 2552, by  
9 Senator Stavisky, an act to amend the  
10 Real Property Tax Law;  
11 Senate Print 2612, by  
12 Senator Harckham, an act to amend the  
13 Real Property Tax Law;  
14 Senate Print 2622, by  
15 Senator Breslin, an act to amend the Tax Law;  
16 Senate Print 2708A, by  
17 Senator Kennedy, an act to amend the Tax Law;  
18 Senate Print 3318, by  
19 Senator Jackson, an act to amend the  
20 Administrative Code of the City of New York;  
21 Senate Print 3319, by  
22 Senator Jackson, an act to amend the  
23 Administrative Code of the City of New York;  
24 Senate Print 3352, by Senator Ramos,  
25 an act to amend the Tax Law;

1                   Senate Print 3435A, by Senator  
2     Addabbo, an act to establish a commission to be  
3     known as the "New York Seawall Study Commission";

4                   Senate Print 3698A, by Senator  
5     Gianaris, an act to amend the Public Health Law;

6                   Senate Print 3816, by  
7     Senator Harckham, an act to amend the Tax Law;

8                   Senate Print 3951, by  
9     Senator Montgomery, an act to amend the  
10    State Finance Law;

11                  Senate Print 3960, by  
12    Senator Rivera, an act to amend the  
13    Social Services Law and the Public Health Law;

14                  Senate Print 3972, by  
15    Senator Harckham, an act to amend the  
16    Real Property Tax Law;

17                  Senate Print 4045A, by Senator  
18    Jackson, an act to amend the Education Law;

19                  Senate Print 4066, by  
20    Senator Biaggi, an act to amend the Insurance Law  
21    and the Public Health Law;

22                  Senate Print 4074, by Senator  
23    Biaggi, an act to amend the Executive Law;

24                  Senate Print 4112, by Senator  
25    Carlucci, an act to amend the Village Law and the

1 Public Officers Law;

2 Senate Print 4223, by Senator  
3 Harckham, an act to amend the General Municipal  
4 Law;

5 Senate Print 4419, by Senator  
6 Seward, an act to amend the Tax Law;

7 Senate Print 4654, by  
8 Senator Metzger, an act to amend the Tax Law;

9 Senate Print 4717A, by  
10 Senator Metzger, an act to amend the Tax Law;

11 Senate Print 5139, by  
12 Senator Kavanagh, an act to amend the  
13 Civil Practice Law and Rules;

14 Senate Print 5146, by  
15 Senator Kavanagh, an act to amend the Penal Law;

16 Senate Print 5151, by  
17 Senator Addabbo, an act to amend the  
18 General Business Law;

19 Senate Print 5288, by  
20 Senator Thomas, an act to amend the Highway Law;

21 Senate Print 5328A, by  
22 Senator Breslin, an act to amend the  
23 Insurance Law;

24 Senate Print 5344, by  
25 Senator Seward, an act to amend the Tax Law;

1                   Senate Print 5451, by  
2   Senator Little, an act to amend the Tax Law;  
3                   Senate Print 5453, by  
4   Senator Skoufis, an act to amend the Tax Law;  
5                   Senate Print 5586, by  
6   Senator Carlucci, an act in relation to  
7   authorizing Bais Trany of Monsey, Inc., to file  
8   an application for certain real property tax  
9   exemptions;  
10                  Senate Print 5672, by Senator May,  
11   an act to amend the Tax Law;  
12                  Senate Print 5721A, by  
13   Senator Comrie, an act to amend the  
14   General Business Law;  
15                  Senate Print 5761, by  
16   Senator Amedore, an act to amend the Tax Law;  
17                  Senate Print 5946B, by Senator May,  
18   an act to amend the Education Law;  
19                  Senate Print 6042A, by Senator May,  
20   an act to amend the Education Law;  
21                  Senate Print 6073, by Senator  
22   Brooks, an act to amend the Public Health Law;  
23                  Senate Print 6076, by Senator  
24   Brooks, an act to amend the Public Health Law;  
25                  Senate Print 6254, by

1 Senator Metzger, an act to amend the Highway Law;

2 Senate Print 6257A, by

3 Senator Harckham, an act in relation to

4 authorizing the comptroller of the Town of

5 Mount Pleasant to refund fees, fines, penalties

6 and interest to certain real property taxpayers;

7 Senate Print 6270, by

8 Senator Addabbo, an act to amend Part 1 of

9 Chapter 61 of the Laws of 2017;

10 Senate Print 6304, by Senator Mayer,

11 an act to amend the Tax Law;

12 Senate Print 6337A, by Senator

13 Rivera, an act to amend the Public Health Law;

14 Senate Print 6347, by

15 Senator Bailey, an act to amend the

16 Criminal Procedure Law;

17 Senate Print 6362, by

18 Senator Griffo, an act to amend the Tax Law;

19 Senate Print 6375, by

20 Senator Gallivan, an act to amend the Tax Law;

21 Senate Print 6424A, by Senator

22 Martinez, an act to amend the General City Law;

23 Senate Print 6427A, by

24 Senator Montgomery, an act to amend the

25 Social Services Law;

1                   Senate Print 6465A, by  
2   Senator Amedore, an act to authorize the City of  
3   Amsterdam, in the County of Montgomery, to  
4   finance a certain deficit by the issuance of  
5   bonds;

6                   Senate Print 6470, by Senator Mayer,  
7   an act to amend the Executive Law;

8                   And Senate Print 6522, by  
9   Senator Bailey, an act to amend the Tax Law.

10                  All bills ordered direct to third  
11   reading.

12                  SENATOR GIANARIS:   Move to accept  
13   the report of the Committee on Rules.

14                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   All in  
15   favor of accepting the report of the  
16   Rules Committee signify by saying aye.

17                  (Response of "Aye.")

18                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
19   Opposed, nay.

20                  (No response.)

21                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   The  
22   Rules Committee report is accepted.

23                  Senator Gianaris.

24                  SENATOR GIANARIS:   Can we now take  
25   up the reading of the calendar, please.

1           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
2   Secretary will read.

3           THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
4   179, Senate Print 2827, by Senator May, an act to  
5   amend the Alcoholic Beverage Control Law.

6           SENATOR GIANARIS:   Lay it aside for  
7   the day, please.

8           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Lay it  
9   aside for the day.

10          THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
11   243, Assembly Print 364B, substituted earlier by  
12   Assemblymember Paulin, an act to amend the  
13   Public Health Law.

14          ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Read  
15   the last section.

16          THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.   This  
17   act shall take effect on the 90th day after it  
18   shall have become a law.

19          ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Call  
20   the roll.

21                 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22          ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
23   Announce the results.

24          THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

25          ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   The

1 bill is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
3 261, Senate Print 3215A, by Senator Comrie, an  
4 act to amend the Administrative Code of the City  
5 of New York.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: There  
7 is a home-rule message at the desk.

8 Read the last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
12 the roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
15 Announce the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
17 Calendar Number 261, voting in the negative:  
18 Senator Metzger.

19 Ayes, 61. Nays, 1.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
21 bill is passed.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
23 374, Senate Print 4866, by Senator Myrie, an act  
24 to amend the Election Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read



1 the last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This  
3 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it  
4 shall have become a law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
6 the roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
9 Announce the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
11 Calendar 374, those Senators voting in the  
12 negative are Senators Funke, Helming and Seward.  
13 Also Senator Griffio.

14 Ayes, 58. Nays, 4.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
16 bill is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
18 401, Assembly Print Number 4474, substituted  
19 earlier by Assemblymember Stec, an act to amend  
20 the Tax Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
22 the last section.

23 SENATOR GIANARIS: Lay it aside  
24 temporarily.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Lay it

1     aside temporarily.

2                   THE SECRETARY:     Calendar Number  
3     497, Senate Print 4008C, by Senator Mayer, an act  
4     to amend the Education Law.

5                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     Read  
6     the last section.

7                   THE SECRETARY:     Section 2.   This  
8     act shall take effect on the first of September.

9                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     Call  
10    the roll.

11                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

12                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
13    Announce the results.

14                   THE SECRETARY:     In relation to  
15    Calendar Number 497, voting in the negative:  
16    Senator Flanagan.

17                   Ayes, 61.   Nays, 1.

18                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     The  
19    bill is passed.

20                   THE SECRETARY:     Calendar Number  
21    542, Senate Print 4930A, by Senator Rivera, an  
22    act to amend the Public Health Law.

23                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     Read  
24    the last section.

25                   THE SECRETARY:     Section 3.   This

1 act shall take effect one year after it shall  
2 have become a law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
4 the roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
7 Announce the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
9 Calendar Number 542, those Senators voting in the  
10 negative are Senators Amedore, Antonacci, Funke,  
11 Gallivan, Gaughran, Griffo, Helming, Jacobs,  
12 Jordan, Lanza, Little, Martinez, Ortt,  
13 Ranzenhofer, Ritchie, Serino, Seward, Skoufis and  
14 Tedisco.

15 Ayes, 43. Nays, 19.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
17 bill is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
19 573, Senate Print 4766, by Senator Kaminsky, an  
20 act to amend the General Municipal Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
22 the last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call

1 the roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
4 Kaminsky to explain his vote.

5 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Mr. President,  
6 thank you.

7 IDAs are an important part of  
8 economic development in our state, but a  
9 loophole, I believe, has been exploited to the  
10 detriment of our school districts and our  
11 taxpaying residents, and that is the tourism  
12 loophole.

13 And what's happened is one business  
14 can move from literally across a county line to  
15 another county, say that they're attracting  
16 residents from the neighboring county, and say  
17 that it's tourism. We're talking about car  
18 dealerships, shopping malls, things that clearly  
19 are not meant to attract residents to the State  
20 of New York, which is what the original point of  
21 granting an IDA benefit for tourism is.

22 But of course we don't want to lose  
23 the benefits where they are rightly granted, so  
24 what this bill does is the following. If a  
25 county executive or a chief executive of an area,

1 along with that IDA, certifies that a project is  
2 regionally significant and will improve the  
3 region and the benefits will exceed the cost,  
4 they can continue using this exception.

5 But the days of giving tax breaks to  
6 the Toyota dealership, which results in taxpayers  
7 paying more and school districts getting less,  
8 should be over.

9 I vote in the affirmative.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
11 Kaminsky to be recorded in the affirmative.

12 Announce the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
14 Calendar Number 573, those Senators voting in the  
15 negative are Senators Amedore, Flanagan, Funke,  
16 Gallivan, Griffio, Jacobs, Jordan, Martinez, Ortt,  
17 Ranzenhofer, Ritchie, Serino, Seward and Tedisco.

18 Ayes, 48. Nays, 14.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
20 bill is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
22 583, Senate Print 3229A, by Senator Savino, an  
23 act to amend the Penal Law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
25 the last section.

1           THE SECRETARY:   Section 6.  This  
2   act shall take effect on the 60th day after it  
3   shall have become a law.

4           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Call  
5   the roll.

6                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

7           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
8   Announce the results.

9           THE SECRETARY:   In relation to  
10   Calendar Number 583, those Senators voting in the  
11   negative are Senators Montgomery and Salazar.

12                   Ayes, 60.  Nays, 2.

13           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   The  
14   bill is passed.

15           THE SECRETARY:   Calendar Number  
16   634, Senate Print 97B, by Senator Kaminsky, an  
17   act to amend the Public Officers Law and the  
18   Public Authorities Law.

19                   SENATOR GRIFFO:   Lay it aside.

20           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Lay it  
21   aside.

22           THE SECRETARY:   Calendar Number  
23   640, Senate Print 5090A, by Senator Parker, an  
24   act to amend the Workers' Compensation Law.

25           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Read

1 the last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This  
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
5 the roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
8 Announce the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
10 Calendar Number 640, those Senators voting in the  
11 negative are Senators Amedore, Gallivan, Griffo,  
12 Helming, Jordan, Lanza, Little, O'Mara, Ortt,  
13 Ranzenhofer, Ritchie, Seward and Tedisco.

14 Ayes, 49. Nays, 13.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
16 bill is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
18 658, Assembly Print Number 2317B, substituted  
19 earlier by Assemblymember Solages, an act to  
20 amend the Racing, Pari-Mutuel Wagering and  
21 Breeding Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
23 the last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Call  
2   the roll.

3                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

4                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Senator  
5   Kaplan to explain her vote.

6                   SENATOR KAPLAN:    Thank you,  
7   Mr. President.

8                   As Senator, my goal is always to be  
9   as responsive to the communities I represent as  
10   possible. And since I took office, I've spent a  
11   lot of time meeting with constituents to hear  
12   about their priorities. And the creation of a  
13   community advisory board for Belmont Park is a  
14   top priority of my residents in Elmont,  
15   Floral Park, and South Floral Park.

16                   Since this is the priority of my  
17   residents, it is my priority too. And I'm very  
18   proud today we will pass the bill and give my  
19   constituents the voice that they deserve.

20                   I also want to thank Assemblywoman  
21   Solages for passing this bill in the Assembly.  
22   And I am proud to cast my vote in the  
23   affirmative. Thank you.

24                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Senator  
25   Kaplan to be recorded in the affirmative.



1                   Announce the results.

2                   THE SECRETARY:   In relation to  
3   Calendar Number 658, those Senators voting in the  
4   negative are Senators Amedore, Antonacci,  
5   Flanagan, Funke, Griffo, Helming, Jacobs, Jordan,  
6   Lanza, O'Mara, Ortt, Ranzenhofer, Ritchie,  
7   Serino, Seward and Tedisco.

8                   Ayes, 46.   Nays, 16.

9                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   The  
10   bill is passed.

11                  THE SECRETARY:   Calendar Number  
12   728, Senate Print 4080C, by Senator Savino, an  
13   act to amend the Labor Law and the State Finance  
14   Law.

15                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Read  
16   the last section.

17                  THE SECRETARY:   Section 4.   This  
18   act shall take effect immediately.

19                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Call  
20   the roll.

21                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

22                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
23   Announce the results.

24                  THE SECRETARY:   Ayes, 62.

25                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   The

1 bill is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
3 766, Senate Print 5516B, by Senator Montgomery,  
4 an act to amend the Family Court Act and the  
5 Mental Hygiene Law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
7 the last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This  
9 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it  
10 shall have become a law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
12 the roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
15 Announce the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
17 Calendar Number 766, those Senators voting in the  
18 negative are Senators Griffo and Ranzenhofer.

19 Ayes, 60. Nays, 2.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
21 bill is passed.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
23 810, Senate Print 4202, by Senator Savino, an act  
24 to amend the Penal Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read

1 the last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This  
3 act shall take effect on the first of November.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
5 the roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
8 Lanza to explain his vote.

9 SENATOR LANZA: Thank you,  
10 Mr. President.

11 I'm going to be voting in the  
12 negative here. I understand the sponsor's intent  
13 with respect to protecting people, especially at  
14 transportation hubs with respect to undetectable  
15 weapons. But I believe the law is too vague in  
16 its -- in the provision which describes that it  
17 be commercially made as a weapon.

18 I think this leaves this legislation  
19 open to the types of plastic knives that you get  
20 at a fast food restaurant, you buy in the  
21 supermarket, and that we see used every single  
22 day here in Albany. And I don't think that's  
23 what the sponsor is intending, but certainly,  
24 given the way this bill is drafted, it is  
25 conceivable that someone could be arrested for

1 carrying one of those plastic knives that, you  
2 know, come in a Happy Meal.

3 For that reason, I'm going to be  
4 voting no.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
6 Lanza to be recorded in the negative.

7 Announce the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
9 Calendar Number 810, those Senators voting in the  
10 negative are Senators Amedore, Antonacci,  
11 Flanagan, Funke, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,  
12 Jacobs, Jordan, Lanza, Little, O'Mara, Ortt,  
13 Ranzenhofer, Ritchie, Serino, Seward and Tedisco.

14 Ayes, 44. Nays, 18.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
16 bill is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
18 831, Senate Print 5395, by Senator Jackson, an  
19 act to amend the Education Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
21 the last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This  
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
25 the roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:

3 Announce the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
5 Calendar Number 831, those Senators voting in the  
6 negative are Senators Amedore, Kennedy, Krueger,  
7 Martinez and Skoufis. Also Senators Tedisco,  
8 Ranzenhofer, Serino and Jordan.

9 Ayes, 53. Nays, 9.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
11 bill is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
13 888, Senate Print 5782A, by Senator Parker, an  
14 act to amend the Public Service Law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
16 the last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
18 act shall take effect immediately.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
20 the roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:

23 Announce the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
25 Calendar Number 888, those Senators voting in the

1 negative are Senators Amedore, Helming,  
2 Ranzenhofer and Seward.

3 Ayes, 58. Nays, 4.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
5 bill is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
7 898, Assembly Print Number 3235, substituted  
8 earlier by Assemblymember Dickens, an act to  
9 amend the Banking Law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
11 the last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
13 act shall take effect on the 120th day after it  
14 shall have become a law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
16 the roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
19 Announce the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
21 Calendar Number 898, those Senators voting in the  
22 negative are Senators Akshar, Amedore, Antonacci,  
23 Flanagan, Funke, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming,  
24 Jacobs, Jordan, Lanza, Little, Ortt, Ranzenhofer,  
25 Ritchie, Serino, Seward and Tedisco.

1                   Ayes, 44.   Nays, 18.

2                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
3 bill is passed.

4                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
5 902, Senate Print 5188, by Senator Mayer, an act  
6 to amend the Election Law.

7                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Read  
8 the last section.

9                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.   This  
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Call  
12 the roll.

13                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

14                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
15 Announce the results.

16                   THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

17                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
18 bill is passed.

19                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
20 970, Senate Print 5786, by Senator Kaminsky, an  
21 act to establish a task force to explore the  
22 effects of cyberbullying in New York State.

23                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Read  
24 the last section.

25                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 4.   This

1 act shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
3 the roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
6 Kaminsky to explain his vote.

7 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Thank you very  
8 much, Mr. President.

9 I think no matter where you live in  
10 this state, we could all agree that cyberbullying  
11 has become a tremendous problem. Recent reports  
12 show that nearly half the teens in our country  
13 have reported being cyberbullied.

14 And while we in the Legislature have  
15 taken pains to make sure our schools have  
16 procedures in place to deal with it, what happens  
17 after school? And what happens to regular adults  
18 who have to deal with cyberbullying and the  
19 horrors that it brings?

20 I have a constituent, Lisa-Michelle  
21 Kucharz, who really survived a terrible ordeal  
22 with a stalker who was cyberbullying her. And  
23 instead of cursing the darkness, she's chosen to  
24 light a candle and advocate very hard on this  
25 issue.



1                   So what this bill would do, it would  
2                   create a task force that would make  
3                   recommendations to schools about how to handle  
4                   cyberbullying that takes place outside of its  
5                   walls, and that leads generally to creation of  
6                   policies and procedures that would help deter  
7                   cyberbullying at all levels for all members of  
8                   our society. We need some good thinking and good  
9                   planning to go into this issue because it's time  
10                  we put an end to cyberbullying.

11                  Thank you, Mr. President. I vote in  
12                  the affirmative.

13                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
14                  Kaminsky to be recorded in the affirmative.

15                  Announce the results.

16                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
17                  Calendar Number 970, those Senators voting in the  
18                  negative are Senators Akshar, Flanagan and  
19                  Ranzenhofer.

20                  Ayes, 59. Nays, 3.

21                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
22                  bill is passed.

23                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
24                  982, Assembly Print Number 2333, substituted  
25                  earlier by Assemblymember Otis, an act to amend

1 the Criminal Procedure Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
3 the last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
5 act shall take effect immediately.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
7 the roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
10 Announce the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
12 Calendar Number 982, those Senators voting in the  
13 negative are Senators Akshar, Amedore, Flanagan,  
14 Funke, Griffo, Helming, Jacobs, Jordan, Lanza,  
15 Little, O'Mara, Ortt, Ranzenhofer, Ritchie,  
16 Robach, Serino, Seward and Tedisco.

17 Ayes, 44. Nays, 18.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
19 bill is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
21 1022, Assembly Print Number 1093B, substituted  
22 earlier by Assemblymember Paulin, an act to amend  
23 the Military Law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
25 the last section.

1           THE SECRETARY:   Section 2.   This  
2   act shall take effect on the 120th day after it  
3   shall have become a law.

4           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Call  
5   the roll.

6           (The Secretary called the roll.)

7           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
8   Announce the results.

9           THE SECRETARY:   Ayes, 62.

10          ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   The  
11   bill is passed.

12          THE SECRETARY:   Calendar Number  
13   1045, Senate Print 6084, by Senator Stavisky, an  
14   act to amend the Education Law.

15          ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Read  
16   the last section.

17          THE SECRETARY:   Section 3.   This  
18   act shall take effect immediately.

19          ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Call  
20   the roll.

21          (The Secretary called the roll.)

22          ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
23   Announce the results.

24          THE SECRETARY:   Ayes, 62.

25          ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   The

1 bill is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
3 1076, Senate Print 4580B, by Senator Kennedy, an  
4 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law and the  
5 Insurance Law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
7 the last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This  
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
11 the roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
14 Announce the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
16 Calendar Number 1076, voting in the negative:  
17 Senator Skoufis.

18 Ayes, 61. Nays, 1.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
20 bill is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
22 1080, Senate Print 5671A, by Senator Martinez, an  
23 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
25 the last section.

1           THE SECRETARY:    Section 7.  This  
2   act shall take effect on the first of November.

3           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Call  
4   the roll.

5                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

6           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
7   Announce the results.

8           THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
9   Calendar Number 1080, voting in the negative:  
10   Senator Ranzenhofer.

11                   Ayes, 61.  Nays, 1.

12           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   The  
13   bill is passed.

14           THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
15   1088, Senate Print 6190B, by Senator Martinez, an  
16   act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law and the  
17   Administrative Code of the City of New York.

18           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Read  
19   the last section.

20           THE SECRETARY:    Section 3.  This  
21   act shall take effect on the 60th day after it  
22   shall have become a law.

23           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Call  
24   the roll.

25                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

1           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:

2   Announce the results.

3           THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

4           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
5   bill is passed.

6           THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
7   1181, Senate Print 2761, by Senator Comrie, an  
8   act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

9           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    There  
10   is a home-rule message at the desk.

11           Read the last section.

12           THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.   This  
13   act shall take effect immediately.

14           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Call  
15   the roll.

16           (The Secretary called the roll.)

17           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
18   Announce the results.

19           THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

20           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
21   bill is passed.

22           THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
23   1259, Senate Print 5739A, by Senator Kaminsky, an  
24   act to amend the Town Law and the Village Law.

25           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Read

1 the last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This  
3 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it  
4 shall have become a law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
6 the roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
9 Announce the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
11 Calendar 1259, those Senators voting in the  
12 negative are Senators Flanagan, Helming and Ortt.

13 Ayes, 59. Nays, 3.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
15 bill is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
17 1280, Senate Print 183B, by Senator Serrano, an  
18 act to amend the Parks, Recreation and Historic  
19 Preservation Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
21 the last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
25 the roll.

1                   (The Secretary called the roll.)  
2                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
3   Announce the results.  
4                   THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.  
5                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
6   bill is passed.  
7                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
8   1287, Senate Print 1925B, by Senator Krueger, an  
9   act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.  
10                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    There  
11   is a home-rule message at the desk.  
12                  Read the last section.  
13                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 3.   This  
14   act shall take effect immediately.  
15                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Call  
16   the roll.  
17                  (The Secretary called the roll.)  
18                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
19   Announce the results.  
20                  THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
21   Calendar Number 1287, those Senators voting in  
22   the negative are Senators Felder, Flanagan,  
23   Griffo and Lanza.  
24                  Ayes, 58.   Nays, 4.  
25                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The



1 bill is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
3 1298, Senate Print 3645A, by Senator Kennedy, an  
4 act to amend the Tax Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
6 the last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This  
8 act shall take effect immediately.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
10 the roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
13 Kennedy to explain his vote.

14 SENATOR KENNEDY: Thank you,  
15 Mr. President.

16 First of all, let me thank my  
17 colleagues for their support of this bill and  
18 Andrea Stewart-Cousins, our leader, for bringing  
19 this to the floor today.

20 This is an important piece of  
21 legislation that will help to continue to  
22 stimulate development efforts all throughout the  
23 State of New York, particularly in urban areas  
24 like the City of Buffalo and other urban areas  
25 all across New York State that are seeing

1 momentum and a resurgence from investors and  
2 developers that recognize that taking old  
3 historic structures, preserving them, investing  
4 in them, breathing new life into them, and  
5 ultimately getting them back on the tax rolls,  
6 filling these beautiful buildings with jobs and  
7 opportunities for people throughout the  
8 communities is a very positive thing.

9           And it is happening right before our  
10 very eyes. For those of you that haven't been  
11 out to Buffalo and Western New York in a while,  
12 we welcome you to come and see what has been  
13 transpiring.

14           This piece of legislation will  
15 expand the commercial historic tax credit for  
16 projects under \$5 million that will help to  
17 continue to spur growth and streamline the  
18 process for those who want to make an investment  
19 here in New York.

20           But this has, again, a very unique  
21 focus on those areas that are historic in nature  
22 and that developers are recognizing as a very  
23 unique place to make an investment and to help  
24 breathe new life into areas of the economy where  
25 it's needed the most.

1                   So with that, Mr. President, I vote  
2     aye.

3                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     Senator  
4     Kennedy to be recorded in the affirmative.

5                   Announce the results.

6                   THE SECRETARY:     Ayes, 62.

7                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     The  
8     bill is passed.

9                   There is a substitution at the desk.

10                  The Secretary will read.

11                  THE SECRETARY:     On page 36,  
12     Senator Kaplan moves to discharge, from the  
13     Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill Number 7540B  
14     and substitute it for the identical Senate Bill  
15     5815C, Third Reading Calendar 1349.

16                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     The  
17     substitution is so ordered.

18                  The Secretary will read.

19                  THE SECRETARY:     Calendar Number  
20     1349, Assembly Print Number 7540B, by  
21     Assemblymember McDonald, an act to amend the  
22     Executive Law.

23                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     Read  
24     the last section.

25                  THE SECRETARY:     Section 2.   This

1 act shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
3 the roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
6 Kaplan to explain her vote.

7 SENATOR KAPLAN: Thank you,  
8 Mr. President.

9 Regulations are necessary in  
10 ensuring the functionality of business and  
11 employment in our state. However, many  
12 regulations can be overly burdensome and have a  
13 devastating impact on our small businesses and  
14 economic development. It is our duty as  
15 lawmakers to cut through the red tape and make  
16 laws that support business growth, while still  
17 achieving the intended goals of responsible  
18 regulation.

19 This bill will offer small  
20 businesses an opportunity to avoid fines for the  
21 first time, regulatory violations, by giving them  
22 an opportunity to cure the violation.

23 I believe the opportunity to make it  
24 right is fair, and it will help our small  
25 business owners to learn from their mistakes

1 without jeopardizing their success.

2 I'm proud to be the sponsor of this  
3 legislation, and I cast my vote in the  
4 affirmative. Thank you.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
6 Kaplan to be recorded in the affirmative.

7 Senator Akshar to explain his vote.

8 SENATOR AKSHAR: You know, I've  
9 often said that it's not government's  
10 responsibility to create jobs, it's our  
11 responsibility to put forth good policy that  
12 creates a better business climate so businesses  
13 can thrive and prosper.

14 I want to thank the sponsor of this  
15 bill. We took a run at this last year, and the  
16 Governor vetoed it. My hope is that the changes  
17 that you and your staff have made will withstand  
18 the veto test of the Governor.

19 This is a step in the right  
20 direction because this bill does in fact create a  
21 better climate where businesses can thrive and  
22 prosper. It gives them a little bit of relief  
23 that we know that they're all seeking. So,  
24 Mr. President, I proudly vote aye.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator

1 Akshar to be recorded in the affirmative.

2 Senator Little to explain her vote.

3 SENATOR LITTLE: Thank you,  
4 Mr. President. I too would like to support  
5 Senator Kaplan's bill today.

6 Truthfully, a small business has  
7 difficulty keeping up with the rules and  
8 regulations that get thrown at them. And  
9 frequently they get fined for something that they  
10 didn't know about, only to be told that "It was  
11 on our website, you should have seen it."

12 Well, if you're operating a small  
13 businesses in today's workplace and day and age,  
14 you have enough on your plate to try to keep up  
15 with the bills that you already know about.

16 This is a great bill that will help  
17 them and give them a chance to, if they do miss a  
18 regulation, to be able to move on. So thank you  
19 very much.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
21 Little to be recorded in the affirmative.

22 Announce the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
25 bill is passed.

1                   THE SECRETARY:     Calendar Number  
2     1375, Senate Print 6429A, by Senator Carlucci, an  
3     act in relation to authorizing the Yeshiva Shaar  
4     Ephraim of Monsey to file an application for a  
5     retroactive real property tax exemption.

6                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     Read  
7     the last section.

8                   THE SECRETARY:     Section 2.     This  
9     act shall take effect immediately.

10                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     Call  
11     the roll.

12                             (The Secretary called the roll.)

13                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
14     Announce the results.

15                  THE SECRETARY:     In relation to  
16     Calendar 1375, those Senators voting in the  
17     negative are Senators Akshar and Antonacci.

18                             Ayes, 60.   Nays, 2.

19                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     The  
20     bill is passed.

21                             Senator Gianaris, that completes the  
22     reading of today's calendar.

23                  SENATOR GIANARIS:     Mr. President,  
24     there will be an immediate meeting of the  
25     Committee on Finance, please, in Room 332.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    There  
2   will be an immediate meeting of the  
3   Finance Committee in Room 332.

4                   SENATOR GIANARIS:    Can we now take  
5   up the reading of the supplemental calendar.

6                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
7   Secretary will read.

8                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
9   1415, Senate Print 64, by Senator Robach, an act  
10  to amend the Domestic Relations Law and the  
11  Executive Law.

12                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Read  
13  the last section.

14                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 3.   This  
15  act shall take effect immediately.

16                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Call  
17  the roll.

18                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

19                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
20  Announce the results.

21                  THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
22  Calendar Number 1415, voting in the negative:  
23  Senator Skoufis.

24                  Ayes, 61.   Nays, 1.

25                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The



1 bill is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
3 1468, Senate Print 123, by Senator Ortt, an act  
4 to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
6 the last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This  
8 act shall take effect on the 120th day after it  
9 shall have become a law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
11 the roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
14 Announce the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
17 bill is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
19 1469, Senate Print 215B, by Senator Benjamin, an  
20 act to amend the Executive Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
22 the last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call

1 the roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:

4 Announce the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
6 Calendar Number 1469, those Senators voting in  
7 the negative are Senators Akshar, Amedore,  
8 Flanagan, Funke, Griffio, Helming, Jordan, Lanza,  
9 Little, Ritchie, Ranzenhofer, Ortt and Tedisco.

10 Ayes, 49. Nays, 13.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
12 bill is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
14 1470, Senate Print 355, by Senator Gaughran, an  
15 act to amend the Navigation Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
17 the last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
19 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it  
20 shall have become a law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
22 the roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:

25 Announce the results.

1                   THE SECRETARY:   In relation to  
2   Calendar Number 1470, those Senators voting in  
3   the negative are Senators Amedore, Lanza, Ortt  
4   and Tedisco.

5                   Ayes, 58.   Nays, 4.

6                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   The  
7   bill is passed.

8                   THE SECRETARY:   Calendar Number  
9   1471, Senate Print 398, by Senator Lanza, an act  
10  to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

11                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Read  
12  the last section.

13                  THE SECRETARY:   Section 3.   This  
14  act shall take effect immediately.

15                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Call  
16  the roll.

17                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

18                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
19  Announce the results.

20                  THE SECRETARY:   Ayes, 62.

21                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   The  
22  bill is passed.

23                  THE SECRETARY:   Calendar Number  
24  1472, Senate Print 1534, by Senator Kennedy, an  
25  act to amend the Education Law.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Read  
2   the last section.

3                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.   This  
4   act shall take effect immediately.

5                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Call  
6   the roll.

7                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
9   Announce the results.

10                  THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

11                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
12   bill is passed.

13                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
14   1473, Senate Print 1720, by Senator Ramos, an act  
15   to amend the Labor Law.

16                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Read  
17   the last section.

18                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 3.   This  
19   act shall take effect on the 120th day after it  
20   shall have become a law.

21                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Call  
22   the roll.

23                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

24                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
25   Announce the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
3 bill is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
5 1474, Senate Print 1751, by Senator Sepúlveda, an  
6 act to amend the Real Property Tax Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
8 the last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This  
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
12 the roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
15 Announce the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
18 bill is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
20 1476, Senate Print 1833, by Senator Gianaris, an  
21 act to amend the Election Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
23 the last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Call  
2   the roll.

3                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

4                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
5   Announce the results.

6                   THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
7   Calendar Number 1476, those Senators voting in  
8   the negative are Senators Akshar, Amedore,  
9   Flanagan, Funke, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming,  
10   Jacobs, Jordan, Ortt, Ritchie, Ranzenhofer,  
11   Serino, Seward and Tedisco.

12                   Ayes, 47.   Nays, 15.

13                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
14   bill is passed.

15                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
16   1478, Senate Print 2207, by Senator Bailey, an  
17   act to amend the Public Housing Law.

18                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Read  
19   the last section.

20                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.   This  
21   act shall take effect on the 180th day after it  
22   shall have become a law.

23                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Call  
24   the roll.

25                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

1           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:

2   Announce the results.

3           THE SECRETARY:   In relation to  
4   Calendar Number 1478, those Senators voting in  
5   the negative are Senators Griffo, Little and  
6   Seward.

7           Ayes, 59.   Nays, 3.

8           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   The  
9   bill is passed.

10          THE SECRETARY:   Calendar Number  
11   1479, Senate Print 2397, by Senator Comrie, an  
12   act to direct the New York State Department of  
13   Financial Services and the New York State  
14   Department of State's Consumer Protection  
15   Division to conduct a study on consumer awareness  
16   and financial education.

17          ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Read  
18   the last section.

19          THE SECRETARY:   Section 3.   This  
20   act shall take effect on the 120th day after it  
21   shall have become a law.

22          ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Call  
23   the roll.

24               (The Secretary called the roll.)

25          ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:

1     Announce the results.

2                   THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

3                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
4     bill is passed.

5                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
6     1480, Senate Print 2482A, by Senator Sanders, an  
7     act to amend the Education Law.

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Read  
9     the last section.

10                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.  This  
11     act shall take effect immediately.

12                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Call  
13     the roll.

14                               (The Secretary called the roll.)

15                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
16     Announce the results.

17                  THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
18     Calendar Number 1480, voting in the negative:  
19     Senators Flanagan and Ranzenhofer.

20                               Ayes, 60.  Nays, 2.

21                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
22     bill is passed.

23                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
24     1481, Senate Print 2493, by Senator Serrano, an  
25     act to amend the Parks, Recreation and Historic



1       Preservation Law.

2                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     Read  
3       the last section.

4                   THE SECRETARY:     Section 2.   This  
5       act shall take effect on the 90th day after it  
6       shall have become a law.

7                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     Call  
8       the roll.

9                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

10                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
11       Announce the results.

12                  THE SECRETARY:     In relation to  
13       Calendar Number 1481, voting in the negative:  
14       Senators Amedore and Seward.

15                  Ayes, 60.   Nays, 2.

16                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     The  
17       bill is passed.

18                  THE SECRETARY:     Calendar Number  
19       1482, Senate Print 2552, by Senator Stavisky, an  
20       act to amend the Real Property Tax Law.

21                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     Read  
22       the last section.

23                  THE SECRETARY:     Section 2.   This  
24       act shall take effect on the first of January.

25                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     Call

1 the roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:

4 Announce the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
7 bill is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
9 1483, Senate Print 2612, by Senator Harckham, an  
10 act to amend the Real Property Tax Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
12 the last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
14 act shall take effect immediately.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
16 the roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:

19 Announce the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
21 Calendar Number 1483, those Senators voting in  
22 the negative are Senators Amedore, Antonacci,  
23 Funke, Helming, Jacobs, Jordan, Lanza, O'Mara,  
24 Ortt, Ranzenhofer, Serino, Seward and Tedisco.

25 Ayes, 49. Nays, 13.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
2 bill is passed.

3                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
4 1484, Senate Print 2622, by Senator Breslin, an  
5 act to amend the Tax Law.

6                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Read  
7 the last section.

8                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.   This  
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Call  
11 the roll.

12                                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

13                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
14 Announce the results.

15                  THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
16 Calendar Number 1484, those Senators voting in  
17 the negative are Senators Antonacci, Brooks,  
18 Gaughran, Harckham, Helming, Kaplan, Kennedy,  
19 Lanza, Martinez, Metzger, Ortt, Serino, Skoufis,  
20 Tedisco and Thomas.

21                               Ayes, 47.   Nays, 15.

22                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
23 bill is passed.

24                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
25 1485, Senate Print 2708A, by Senator Kennedy, an

1 act to amend the Tax Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
3 the last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
5 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it  
6 shall have become a law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
8 the roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
11 Kennedy to explain his vote.

12 SENATOR KENNEDY: Thank you,  
13 Mr. President.

14 First of all, again, let me thank  
15 our leader, Senator Andrea Stewart-Cousins, for  
16 bringing this bill to the floor, and to my  
17 colleagues for their support.

18 This is a very important bill all  
19 across New York State. The ash tree, the  
20 beautiful ash tree that is the canopy of our  
21 state -- by the billions, these trees exist in  
22 New York and across the nation, and unfortunately  
23 the emerald ash borer has infested many of those  
24 trees.

25 There is estimated devastation to

1 the canopy across the state in the next decade of  
2 20 to 30 percent that will be eradicated if we  
3 don't do something.

4 This is something that will help  
5 homeowners treat ash trees and if, under the  
6 unfortunate circumstances where they have to have  
7 them removed, oftentimes the cost gets into the  
8 thousands. This is a little bit of help to those  
9 hardworking men and women that are the residents  
10 and taxpayers of the State of New York as we  
11 fight the emerald ash borer.

12 So once again, Mr. President, I  
13 thank you and my colleagues for their indulgence,  
14 their support, and this important piece of  
15 legislation that will help the pocketbooks of the  
16 taxpayers.

17 Thank you so much.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
19 Kennedy to be recorded in the affirmative.

20 Senator May to explain her vote.

21 SENATOR MAY: Thank you,  
22 Mr. President.

23 And I want to thank Senator Kennedy  
24 for putting together this bill, because it truly  
25 is important.

1                   The ash tree is a keystone species  
2     in our natural forests but also in our urban  
3     forests. It is the tree -- the wood that's been  
4     used to make lacrosse sticks, for a thousand  
5     years or more by the Native Americans in this  
6     state. We use it to make baseball bats. It is  
7     an important wood in our culture.

8                   And it's a tree that's everywhere.  
9     I was walking in Washington Park yesterday  
10    admiring the stately old oak and gingko trees  
11    there, and I saw a whole copse of ash trees that  
12    are dying.

13                  Having these trees removed  
14    professionally or treated professionally is one  
15    of the ways to stem the rapid death of these  
16    trees across the state. And so making it  
17    possible for homeowners to do this is a very  
18    important thing to do. So I thank you, Senator  
19    Kennedy, for this bill.

20                  I vote aye.

21                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Senator  
22    May to be recorded in the affirmative.

23                  Senator Ranzenhofer to explain his  
24    vote.

25                  SENATOR RANZENHOFER:    Thank you,

1 Mr. President. I also rise in support of this  
2 legislation.

3           Years ago the State of New York  
4 provided assistance to municipalities all across  
5 the state to deal with this issue. But one of  
6 the things that the Legislature did not do is to  
7 help homeowners. And I can't tell you the number  
8 of people that -- it actually numbers into the  
9 hundreds of people that have contacted me and  
10 contacted my office, the fact that they have  
11 these dead trees on their property, they're a  
12 danger, they're a hazard, it costs them thousands  
13 of dollars to have to improve their property and  
14 make it more safe.

15           This will be a good financial tool  
16 for them to be able to use to absorb costs that  
17 they are going to have to undertake through no  
18 fault of their own. So I commend Senator Kennedy  
19 for this legislation. It's something that we've  
20 all heard this in our part of the state from all  
21 of our constituents. And if we can provide this  
22 small measure of relief to homeowners and  
23 taxpayers, it's a good thing.

24           I'll be voting yes.

25           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     Senator

1 Ranzenhofer to be recorded in the affirmative.

2 Announce the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
5 bill is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
7 1487, Senate Print 3318, by Senator Jackson, an  
8 act to amend the Administrative Code of the City  
9 of New York.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
11 the last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This  
13 act shall take effect immediately.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
15 the roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
18 Announce the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
20 Calendar Number 1487, those Senators voting in  
21 the negative are Senators Antonacci, Amedore,  
22 Flanagan, Gallivan, Gaughran, Griffio, Helming,  
23 Jacobs, Jordan, Lanza, LaValle, Little, Martinez,  
24 O'Mara, Ortt, Ranzenhofer, Ritchie, Robach,  
25 Serino, Seward and Tedisco.



1                   Ayes, 41.   Nays, 21.

2                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
3 bill is passed.

4                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
5 1488, Senate Print 3319, by Senator Jackson, an  
6 act to amend the Administrative Code of the City  
7 of New York.

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Read  
9 the last section.

10                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.   This  
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Call  
13 the roll.

14                         (The Secretary called the roll.)

15                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
16 Announce the results.

17                  THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
18 Calendar Number 1488, those Senators voting in  
19 the negative are Senators Antonacci, Amedore,  
20 Flanagan, Gallivan, Gaughran, Griffio, Helming,  
21 Jacobs, Jordan, Lanza, LaValle, Little, Martinez,  
22 O'Mara, Ortt, Ranzenhofer, Ritchie, Serino,  
23 Seward and Tedisco.   Also Senator Robach.

24                   Ayes, 41.   Nays, 21.

25                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The

1 bill is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
3 1489, Senate Print 3352, by Senator Ramos, an act  
4 to amend the Tax Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
6 the last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
8 act shall take effect immediately.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
10 the roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
13 Announce the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
16 bill is passed.

17 There is a substitution at the desk.

18 The Secretary will read.

19 THE SECRETARY: Senator Addabbo  
20 moves to discharge, from the Committee on  
21 Finance, Assembly Bill Number 2257A and  
22 substitute it for the identical Senate Bill  
23 Number 3435A, Third Reading Calendar 1490.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
25 substitution is so ordered.

1                   The Secretary will read.

2                   THE SECRETARY:   Calendar Number  
3   1490, Assembly Print Number 2257A, by  
4   Assemblymember Barnwell, an act to establish a  
5   commission to be known as the "New York Seawall  
6   Study Commission."

7                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Read  
8   the last section.

9                   THE SECRETARY:   Section 2.   This  
10   act shall take effect immediately.

11                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Call  
12   the roll.

13                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

14                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
15   Announce the results.

16                  THE SECRETARY:   Ayes, 62.

17                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   The  
18   bill is passed.

19                  THE SECRETARY:   Calendar Number  
20   1491, Senate Print 3698A, by Senator Gianaris, an  
21   act to amend the Public Health Law.

22                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Read  
23   the last section.

24                  THE SECRETARY:   Section 3.   This  
25   act shall take effect on the 90th day after it

1 shall have become a law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
3 the roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
6 Announce the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
8 Calendar Number 1491, those Senators voting in  
9 the negative are Senators Flanagan, Helming and  
10 Seward.

11 Ayes, 59. Nays, 3.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
13 bill is passed.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
15 1492, Senate Print 3816, by Senator Harckham, an  
16 act to amend the Tax Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
18 the last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
20 act shall take effect immediately.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
22 the roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
25 Announce the results.

1                   THE SECRETARY:   In relation to  
2   Calendar Number 1492, those Senators voting in  
3   the negative are Senators Antonacci, Brooks,  
4   Funke, Gaughran, Helming, Jacobs, Kaminsky,  
5   Kaplan, Kennedy, Lanza, Martinez, Metzger, Ortt,  
6   Serino, Skoufis, Tedisco, and Thomas.

7                   Ayes, 45.   Nays, 17.

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   The  
9   bill is passed.

10                  THE SECRETARY:   Calendar Number  
11   1493, Senate Print 3951, by Senator Montgomery,  
12   an act to amend the State Finance Law.

13                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Read  
14   the last section.

15                  THE SECRETARY:   Section 2.   This  
16   act shall take effect immediately.

17                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Call  
18   the roll.

19                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

20                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
21   Announce the results.

22                  THE SECRETARY:   In relation to  
23   Calendar 1493, those Senators voting in the  
24   negative are Senators Griffo, Jacobs and Ortt.

25                  Ayes, 59.   Nays, 3.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
2 bill is passed.

3                   There is a substitution at the desk.

4                   The Secretary will read.

5                   THE SECRETARY:    Senator Rivera  
6 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules  
7 Assembly Bill Number 2787 and substitute it for  
8 the identical Senate Bill Number 3960, Third  
9 Reading Calendar 1494.

10                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   The  
11 substitution is so ordered.

12                  The Secretary will read.

13                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
14 1494, Assembly Print Number 2787, by  
15 Assemblymember Gottfried, an act to amend the  
16 Social Services Law and the Public Health Law.

17                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Read  
18 the last section.

19                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.   This  
20 act shall take effect immediately.

21                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Call  
22 the roll.

23                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

24                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
25 Announce the results.

1                   THE SECRETARY:   In relation to  
2   Calendar Number 1494, those Senators voting in  
3   the negative are Senators Gallivan, Griffo,  
4   Jacobs and Ortt.   Also Senator Ranzenhofer.

5                   Ayes, 57.   Nays, 5.

6                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   The  
7   bill is passed.

8                   THE SECRETARY:   Calendar Number  
9   1495, Senate Print 3972, by Senator Harckham, an  
10  act to amend the Real Property Tax Law.

11                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Read  
12  the last section.

13                  THE SECRETARY:   Section 2.   This  
14  act shall take effect on the 60th day after it  
15  shall have become a law.

16                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Call  
17  the roll.

18                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

19                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
20  Announce the results.

21                  THE SECRETARY:   In relation to  
22  Calendar Number 1495, those Senators voting in  
23  the negative are Senators Amedore, Flanagan,  
24  Funke, Gallivan, Jacobs, Jordan, Lanza, O'Mara,  
25  Ortt, Ranzenhofer, Serino, Seward and Tedisco.

1 Also Senator Griffo.

2 Ayes, 48. Nays, 14.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
4 bill is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
6 1496, Senate Print 4045A, by Senator Jackson, an  
7 act to amend the Education Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
9 the last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
11 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it  
12 shall have become a law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
14 the roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
17 Jackson to explain his vote.

18 SENATOR JACKSON: Thank you,  
19 Mr. President.

20 My colleagues, I rise to explain,  
21 briefly explain my sponsorship of this bill. Law  
22 school is expensive these days, as many of you  
23 know, and my colleagues know from personal  
24 experiences and experiences of our staff. In  
25 particular, there's no relief for student loans



1 facing lawyers who decide to enter public service  
2 at the municipal level.

3 And so for example, there are about  
4 500 attorneys employed by the City of New York in  
5 agencies that provide these vital social and  
6 productive services or police services, such as  
7 the Administration for Children's Services, the  
8 Department of Social Services, the Department of  
9 Housing Preservation and Development, the  
10 Housing Authority, the Department of Health and  
11 Mental Hygiene, the Department of Youth and  
12 Community Development, and the Office of the  
13 Aging. Of these, about half have student loans,  
14 some in excess of \$100,000.

15 This bill helps us to attract  
16 attorneys to enter public service and retain  
17 experienced ones who have already made this noble  
18 choice. I hope you join me in voting aye on this  
19 particular bill.

20 Thank you, Mr. President.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
22 Jackson to be recorded in the affirmative.

23 Announce the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
25 Calendar Number 1496, those Senators voting in

1 the negative are Senators Helming, Ranzenhofer,  
2 Robach and Skoufis.

3 Ayes, 58. Nays, 4.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
5 bill is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
7 1497, Senate Print 4066, by Senator Biaggi, an  
8 act to amend the Insurance Law and the  
9 Public Health Law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
11 the last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 7. This  
13 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it  
14 shall have become a law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
16 the roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
19 Announce the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
22 bill is passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
24 1498, Senate Print 4074, by Senator Biaggi, an  
25 act to amend the Executive Law.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Read  
2   the last section.

3                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.   This  
4   act shall take effect immediately.

5                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Call  
6   the roll.

7                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
9   Announce the results.

10                  THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
11   Calendar Number 1498, those Senators voting in  
12   the negative are Senators Antonacci, Gallivan,  
13   Helming, Jacobs, Jordan, O'Mara, Ortt,  
14   Ranzenhofer, Serino and Tedisco.

15                  Ayes, 52.   Nays, 10.

16                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
17   bill is passed.

18                  There is a substitution at the desk.

19                  The Secretary will read.

20                  THE SECRETARY:    Senator Carlucci  
21   moves to discharge, from the Committee on Local  
22   Government, Assembly Bill Number 5955 and  
23   substitute it for the identical Senate Bill 4112,  
24   Third Reading Calendar 1499.

25                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The

1 substitution is so ordered.

2 The Secretary will read.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
4 1499, Assembly Number 5955, by  
5 Assemblymember Jaffee, an act to amend the  
6 Village Law and the Public Officers Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
8 the last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
12 the roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
15 Announce the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
18 bill is passed.

19 There is a substitution at the desk.

20 The Secretary will read.

21 THE SECRETARY: Senator Seward  
22 moves to discharge, from the Committee on  
23 Investigations and Government Operations,  
24 Assembly Bill Number 6548 and substitute it for  
25 the identical Senate Bill Number 4419, Third

1 Reading Calendar 1502.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
3 substitution is so ordered.

4 The Secretary will read.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
6 1502, Assembly Print Number 6548, by  
7 Assemblymember Crouch, an act to amend the  
8 Tax Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
10 the last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
12 act shall take effect immediately.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
14 the roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
17 Announce the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
19 Calendar Number 1502, those Senators voting in  
20 the negative are Senators Antonacci, Brooks,  
21 Gaughran, Harckham, Helming, Jacobs, Kaminsky,  
22 Kaplan, Kennedy, Lanza, Martinez, Metzger, Ortt,  
23 Skoufis and Thomas.

24 Ayes, 47. Nays, 15.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The

1 bill is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
3 1504, Senate Print 4654, by Senator Metzger, an  
4 act to amend the Tax Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
6 the last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
8 act shall take effect immediately.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
10 the roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
13 Announce the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
15 Calendar Number 1504, those Senators voting in  
16 the negative are Senators Antonacci, Brooks,  
17 Gaughran, Harckham, Helming, Jacobs, Kaminsky,  
18 Kaplan, Kennedy, Lanza, Martinez, Ortt,  
19 Ranzenhofer, Serino, Skoufis, Tedisco and Thomas.

20 Ayes, 45. Nays, 17.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
22 bill is passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
24 1505, Senate Print 4717A, by Senator Metzger, an  
25 act to amend the Tax Law.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Read  
2   the last section.

3                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.   This  
4   act shall take effect immediately.

5                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Call  
6   the roll.

7                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
9   Announce the results.

10                  THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
11   Calendar Number 1505, those Senators voting in  
12   the negative are Senators Antonacci, Brooks,  
13   Gaughran, Harckham, Helming, Jacobs, Kaminsky,  
14   Kaplan, Kennedy, Lanza, Martinez, Ortt,  
15   Ranzenhofer, Serino, Skoufis, Tedisco and Thomas.

16                  Ayes, 45.   Nays, 17.

17                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
18   bill is passed.

19                  There is a substitution at the desk.

20                  The Secretary will read.

21                  THE SECRETARY:    Senator Kavanagh  
22   moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,  
23   Assembly Bill Number 6240 and substitute it for  
24   the identical Senate Bill Number 5139, Third  
25   Reading Calendar 1506.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
2   substitution is so ordered.

3                   The Secretary will read.

4                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
5   1506, Assembly Print Number 6240, by  
6   Assemblymember Magnarelli, an act to amend the  
7   Civil Practice Law and Rules.

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Read  
9   the last section.

10                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.  This  
11   act shall take effect one year after it shall  
12   have become a law.

13                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Call  
14   the roll.

15                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

16                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
17   Announce the results.

18                  THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

19                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   The  
20   bill is passed.

21                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
22   1507, Senate Print 5146, by Senator Kavanagh, an  
23   act to amend the Penal Law.

24                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Read  
25   the last section.



1           THE SECRETARY:    Section 11.  This  
2   act shall take effect immediately.

3           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Call  
4   the roll.

5           (The Secretary called the roll.)

6           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
7   Announce the results.

8           THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

9           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   The  
10  bill is passed.

11          THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
12  1508, Senate Print 5151, by Senator Addabbo, an  
13  act to amend the General Business Law.

14          ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Read  
15  the last section.

16          THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.  This  
17  act shall take effect on the 30th day after it  
18  shall have become a law.

19          ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Call  
20  the roll.

21          (The Secretary called the roll.)

22          ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
23  Announce the results.

24          THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
25  Calendar 1508, those Senators voting in the

1 negative are Senators Antonacci, Amedore, Lanza  
2 and Skoufis.

3 Ayes, 58. Nays, 4.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
5 bill is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
7 1509, Senate Print 5328A, by Senator Breslin, an  
8 act to amend the Insurance Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
10 the last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
12 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it  
13 shall have become a law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
15 the roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
18 Breslin to explain his vote.

19 SENATOR BRESLIN: Thank you,  
20 Mr. President.

21 In healthcare, as more and more  
22 patients are being treated on an outpatient  
23 basis, we need to modernize prior authorization.  
24 By updating the prior authorization statute to  
25 allow providers to better serve the needs of

1     their patients in a timely fashion, we will  
2     greatly improve patient outcomes.

3             The legislation ensures that  
4     patients receive medically necessary services  
5     when they are in a compromised state -- in an  
6     emergency room, they may be under sedation, if  
7     the doctor finds something new that wasn't  
8     expected in that prior authorization, this bill  
9     will solve that problem.

10            And I applaud the plans and the  
11     hospitals for getting together and making this  
12     agreement, which will provide very much more  
13     up-to-date service under prior authorization.

14            Thank you, Mr. President. I vote  
15     aye.

16            ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     Senator  
17     Breslin to be recorded in the affirmative.

18            Announce the results.

19            THE SECRETARY:     Ayes, 62.

20            ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     The  
21     bill is passed.

22            There is a substitution at the desk.

23            The Secretary will read.

24            THE SECRETARY:     Senator Seward  
25     moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,

1 Assembly Bill Number 7390 and substitute it for  
2 the identical Senate Bill 5344, Third Reading  
3 Calendar 1510.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
5 substitution is so ordered.

6 The Secretary will read.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
8 1510, Assembly Print Number 7390, by  
9 Assemblymember Lifton, an act to amend the  
10 Tax Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
12 the last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
14 act shall take effect immediately.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
16 the roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
19 Announce the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
21 Calendar Number 1510, those Senators voting in  
22 the negative are Senators Antonacci, Brooks,  
23 Gaughran, Harckham, Helming, Kaminsky, Kaplan,  
24 Kennedy, Lanza, Martinez, Metzger, Ortt, Serino,  
25 Skoufis and Thomas. Also Senator Tedisco.

1                   Ayes, 46.   Nays, 16.

2                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
3 bill is passed.

4                   There is a substitution at the desk.

5                   The Secretary will read.

6                   THE SECRETARY:    Senator Little  
7 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,  
8 Assembly Bill Number 7450 and substitute it for  
9 the identical Senate Bill Number 5451, Third  
10 Reading Calendar 1511.

11                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
12 substitution is so ordered.

13                  The Secretary will read.

14                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
15 1511, Assembly Print Number 7450, by  
16 Assemblymember Stec, an act to amend the Tax Law.

17                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Read  
18 the last section.

19                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.   This  
20 act shall take effect January 1, 2020.

21                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Call  
22 the roll.

23                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

24                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
25 Announce the results.

1                   THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
2   Calendar Number 1511, those Senators voting in  
3   the negative are Senators Antonacci, Brooks,  
4   Gaughran, Harckham, Helming, Kaminsky, Kaplan,  
5   Kennedy, Lanza, Martinez, Metzger, Ortt, Serino,  
6   Skoufis, Tedisco and Thomas.

7                   Ayes, 46.   Nays, 16.

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
9   bill is passed.

10                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
11   1512, Senate Print 5453, by Senator Skoufis, an  
12   act to amend the Tax Law.

13                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Read  
14   the last section.

15                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.   This  
16   act shall take effect immediately.

17                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Call  
18   the roll.

19                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

20                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
21   Announce the results.

22                  THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
23   Calendar Number 1512, those Senators voting in  
24   the negative are Senators Antonacci, Brooks,  
25   Gaughran, Harckham, Helming, Jacobs, Kaminsky,

1 Kaplan, Kennedy, Lanza, Martinez, Metzger, Ortt,  
2 Ranzenhofer, Serino, Tedisco and Thomas.

3 Ayes, 45. Nays, 17.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
5 bill is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
7 1513, Senate Print 5586, by Senator Carlucci, an  
8 act in relation to authorizing Bais Trany of  
9 Monsey, Inc., to file an application for certain  
10 real property tax exemptions.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
12 the last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
14 act shall take effect immediately.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
16 the roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
19 Announce the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
21 Calendar Number 1513, those Senators voting in  
22 the negative are Senators Antonacci and O'Mara.

23 Ayes, 60. Nays, 2.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
25 bill is passed.

1                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
2   1514, Senate Print 5672, by Senator May, an act  
3   to amend the Tax Law.

4                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Read  
5   the last section.

6                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.   This  
7   act shall take effect immediately.

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Call  
9   the roll.

10                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

11                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
12   Announce the results.

13                   THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
14   Calendar Number 1514, those Senators voting in  
15   the negative are Senators Antonacci, Amedore,  
16   Brooks, Gaughran, Harckham, Helming, Jacobs,  
17   Jordan, Kaminsky, Kaplan, Kennedy, Lanza,  
18   Martinez, Metzger, Ortt, Serino, Skoufis, Tedisco  
19   and Thomas.

20                   Ayes, 43.   Nays, 19.

21                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   The  
22   bill is passed.

23                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
24   1515, Senate Print 5721A, by Senator Comrie, an  
25   act to amend the General Business Law.



1                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Read  
2   the last section.

3                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.   This  
4   act shall take effect on the 180th day after it  
5   shall have become a law.

6                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Call  
7   the roll.

8                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

9                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
10   Announce the results.

11                   THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
12   Calendar Number 1515, those Senators voting in  
13   the negative are Senators Antonacci, Amedore,  
14   Flanagan, Funke, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming,  
15   Jacobs, Jordan, Lanza, LaValle, Little, O'Mara,  
16   Ortt, Ranzenhofer, Serino, Seward and Tedisco.

17                   Ayes, 44.   Nays, 18.

18                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
19   bill is passed.

20                   There is a substitution at the desk.

21                   The Secretary will read.

22                   THE SECRETARY:    Senator Amedore  
23   moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,  
24   Assembly Bill Number 2198 and substitute it for  
25   the identical Senate Bill Number 5761, Third

1 Reading Calendar 1516.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
3 substitution is so ordered.

4 The Secretary will read.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
6 1516, Assembly Print Number 2198, by  
7 Assemblymember Steck, an act to amend the  
8 Tax Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
10 the last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
12 act shall take effect on the first month next  
13 succeeding the date on which it shall have become  
14 a law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
16 the roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
19 Announce the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
21 Calendar Number 1516, those Senators voting in  
22 the negative are Senators Antonacci, Brooks,  
23 Gaughran, Harckham, Helming, Kaminsky, Kaplan,  
24 Kennedy, Lanza, Martinez, Metzger, Serino,  
25 Skoufis and Thomas.

1                   Ayes, 48.   Nays, 14.

2                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
3 bill is passed.

4                   There is a substitution at the desk.

5                   The Secretary will read.

6                   THE SECRETARY:    Senator May moves  
7 to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,  
8 Assembly Bill Number 7924A and substitute it for  
9 the identical Senate Bill 6042A, Third Reading  
10 Calendar 1517.

11                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
12 substitution is so ordered.

13                  The Secretary will read.

14                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
15 1517, Assembly Print Number 7924A, by  
16 Assemblymember Magnarelli, an act to amend the  
17 Education Law.

18                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Read  
19 the last section.

20                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.   This  
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Call  
23 the roll.

24                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

25                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:

1     Announce the results.

2                 THE SECRETARY:     In relation to  
3     Calendar Number 1517, those Senators voting in  
4     the negative are Senators Antonacci, Flanagan,  
5     Funke, Griffo, LaValle, O'Mara and Ranzenhofer.

6                 Ayes, 55.   Nays, 7.

7                 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     The  
8     bill is passed.

9                 THE SECRETARY:     Calendar Number  
10     1518, Senate Print 6073, by Senator Brooks, an  
11     act to amend the Public Health Law.

12                 SENATOR GIANARIS:     Lay it aside for  
13     the day, please.

14                 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     Lay it  
15     aside for the day.

16                 THE SECRETARY:     Calendar Number  
17     1519, Senate Print 6076, by Senator Brooks, an  
18     act to amend the Public Health Law.

19                 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     Read  
20     the last section.

21                 THE SECRETARY:     Section 3.   This  
22     act shall take effect on the 90th day after it  
23     shall have become a law.

24                 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     Call  
25     the roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 SENATOR GIANARIS: Lay it aside for  
3 the day, please.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Lay it  
5 aside for the day.

6 There is a substitution at the desk.

7 The Secretary will read.

8 THE SECRETARY: Senator Metzger  
9 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,  
10 Assembly Bill Number 8011 and substitute it for  
11 the identical Senate Bill Number 6254, Third  
12 Reading Calendar 1522.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
14 substitution is so ordered.

15 The Secretary will read.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
17 1522, Assembly Print Number 8011, by  
18 Assemblymember Gunther, an act to amend the  
19 Highway Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
21 the last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
25 the roll.

1                   (The Secretary called the roll.)  
2                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
3   Announce the results.  
4                   THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.  
5                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
6   bill is passed.  
7                   There is a substitution at the desk.  
8                   The Secretary will read.  
9                   THE SECRETARY:    Senator Addabbo  
10   moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,  
11   Assembly Bill Number 7773 and substitute it for  
12   the identical Senate Bill 6270, Third Reading  
13   Calendar 1524.  
14                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
15   substitution is so ordered.  
16                  The Secretary will read.  
17                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
18   1524, Assembly Print Number 7773, by  
19   Assemblymember Buttenschon, an act to amend  
20   Part 1 of Chapter 61 of the Laws of 2017.  
21                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Read  
22   the last section.  
23                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.   This  
24   act shall take effect immediately.  
25                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Call

1 the roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:

4 Announce the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
7 bill is passed.

8 There is a substitution at the desk.

9 The Secretary will read.

10 THE SECRETARY: Senator Mayer moves  
11 to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,  
12 Assembly Bill Number 8088 and substitute it for  
13 the identical Senate Bill Number 6304, Third  
14 Reading Calendar 1525.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
16 substitution is so ordered.

17 The Secretary will read.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
19 1525, Assembly Print Number 8088, by  
20 Assemblymember Pretlow, an act to amend the  
21 Tax Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
23 the last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Call  
2   the roll.

3                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

4                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
5   Announce the results.

6                   THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
7   Calendar Number 1525, those Senators voting in  
8   the negative are Senators Amedore, Antonacci,  
9   Brooks, Gaughran, Harckham, Helming, Jacobs,  
10   Kaminsky, Kaplan, Kennedy, Lanza, Martinez,  
11   Metzger, Ortt, Ranzenhofer, Serino, Skoufis,  
12   Tedisco and Thomas.

13                   Ayes, 43.   Nays, 19.

14                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
15   bill is passed.

16                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
17   1526, Senate Print 6337A, by Senator Rivera, an  
18   act to amend the Public Health Law.

19                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Read  
20   the last section.

21                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 3.   This  
22   act shall take effect immediately.

23                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Call  
24   the roll.

25                   (The Secretary called the roll.)



1                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:

2   Announce the results.

3                   THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

4                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
5   bill is passed.

6                   There is a substitution at the desk.

7                   The Secretary will read.

8                   THE SECRETARY:    Senator Bailey  
9   moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,  
10   Assembly Bill Number 7584 and substitute it for  
11   the identical Senate Bill Number 6347, Third  
12   Reading Calendar 1527.

13                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
14   substitution is so ordered.

15                  The Secretary will read.

16                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
17   1527, Assembly Print Number 7584, by  
18   Assemblymember Lentol, an act to amend the  
19   Criminal Procedure Law.

20                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Read  
21   the last section.

22                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.  This  
23   act shall take effect on the 90th day after it  
24   shall have become a law.

25                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Call

1 the roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:

4 Announce the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
6 Calendar Number 1527, voting in the negative:  
7 Senator Amedore.

8 Ayes, 61. Nays, 1.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
10 bill is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
12 1528, Senate Print 6362, by Senator Griffo, an  
13 act to amend the Tax Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
15 the last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This  
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
19 the roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:

22 Announce the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
24 Calendar 1528, those Senators voting in the  
25 negative are Senators Antonacci, Brooks,

1 Gaughran, Harckham, Helming, Kaminsky, Kaplan,  
2 Kennedy, Lanza, Martinez, Metzger, Serino,  
3 Skoufis and Thomas.

4 Ayes, 48. Nays, 14.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
6 bill is passed.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
8 1529, Senate Print 6375, by Senator Gallivan, an  
9 act to amend the Tax Law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
11 the last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
13 act shall take effect immediately.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
15 the roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
18 Announce the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
20 Calendar Number 1529, those Senators voting in  
21 the negative are Senators Amedore, Antonacci,  
22 Brooks, Gaughran, Harckham, Helming, Jordan,  
23 Kaminsky, Kaplan, Kennedy, Lanza, Martinez,  
24 Metzger, Serino, Skoufis, Tedisco and Thomas.

25 Ayes, 45. Nays, 17.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
2 bill is passed.

3                   There is a substitution at the desk.

4                   The Secretary will read.

5                   THE SECRETARY:    Senator Martinez  
6 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Cities,  
7 Assembly Bill Number 5505 and substitute it for  
8 the identical Senate Bill Number 6424A, Third  
9 Reading Calendar 1530.

10                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   The  
11 substitution is so ordered.

12                  The Secretary will read.

13                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
14 1530, Assembly Bill Number 5505, by  
15 Assemblymember Thiele, an act to amend the  
16 General City Law.

17                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Read  
18 the last section.

19                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.  This  
20 act shall take effect immediately.

21                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Call  
22 the roll.

23                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

24                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
25 Announce the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
3 bill is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
5 1531, Senate Print 6427A, by Senator Montgomery,  
6 an act to amend the Social Services Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
8 the last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 13. This  
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
12 the roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
15 Announce the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
17 Calendar Number 1531, those Senators voting in  
18 the negative are Senators Amedore, Antonacci,  
19 Flanagan, Griffo, Helming, Jacobs, Jordan,  
20 LaValle, O'Mara, Ortt, Ranzenhofer, Ritchie,  
21 Serino, Seward and Tedisco. Also Senator Lanza.  
22 Also Senator Skoufis and Senator Martinez.

23 Ayes, 44. Nays, 18.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
25 bill is passed.

1                   There is a substitution at the desk.

2                   The Secretary will read.

3                   THE SECRETARY:    Senator Mayer moves  
4 to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,  
5 Assembly Bill Number 8054 and substitute it for  
6 the identical Senate Bill Number 6470, Third  
7 Reading Calendar 1532.

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
9 substitution is so ordered.

10                  The Secretary will read.

11                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
12 1532, Assembly Print Number 8054, by  
13 Assemblymember Dilan, an act to amend the  
14 Executive Law.

15                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Read  
16 the last section.

17                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 2. This  
18 act shall take effect on the same date and in the  
19 same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2019.

20                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Call  
21 the roll.

22                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

23                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
24 Announce the results.

25                  THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
2 bill is passed.

3                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
4 1533, Senate Print 6522, by Senator Bailey, an  
5 act to amend the Tax Law.

6                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Read  
7 the last section.

8                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.   This  
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Call  
11 the roll.

12                                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

13                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
14 Announce the results.

15                  THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
16 Calendar 1533, those Senators voting in the  
17 negative are Senators Martinez and Skoufis.

18                                   Ayes, 60.   Nays, 2.

19                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
20 bill is passed.

21                                   There is a substitution at the desk.

22                                   The Secretary will read.

23                  THE SECRETARY:    Senator Thomas  
24 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,  
25 Assembly Bill Number 7497 and substitute it for

1 the identical Senate Bill Number 5288, Third  
2 Reading Calendar 1590.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
4 substitution is so ordered.

5 The Secretary will read.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
7 1590, Assembly Print Number 7497, by  
8 Assemblymember Raynor, an act to amend the  
9 Highway Law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
11 the last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
13 act shall take effect immediately.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
15 the roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
18 Announce the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
21 bill is passed.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
23 1591, Senate Print 5946B, by Senator May, an act  
24 to amend the Education Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read



1 the last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This  
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
5 the roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
8 May to explain her vote.

9 SENATOR MAY: Thank you,  
10 Mr. President.

11 I want to thank the Majority Leader  
12 for bringing this bill to the floor, but also for  
13 visiting with me the old Central High School  
14 building in Syracuse, which has been empty for  
15 decades. But it's a spectacular building with  
16 the best auditorium anywhere in the region, where  
17 opera singers would come and perform back when  
18 the school was in its heyday.

19 The City of Syracuse is plagued by  
20 some of the worst concentrated poverty and racial  
21 segregation in the whole country, and the school  
22 district has been struggling for a long time to  
23 raise up the students in the city, but kind of in  
24 isolation.

25 This STEAM school opportunity to

1 turn this old Central High School into a magnet  
2 school for STEM and the arts offers an  
3 opportunity to the City of Syracuse to attract  
4 students from the suburbs all around. Twelve  
5 schools have agreed to participate in this joint  
6 project and send their children to the City of  
7 Syracuse to study alongside the students from the  
8 school district. I think it's the first, best  
9 opportunity we've had in a long time to address  
10 some of the segregation and concentrated poverty  
11 that we have in the city and actually to open our  
12 whole region up so the kids with talents from  
13 within the city and all around the city can work  
14 together, learn together, and start to raise our  
15 whole region up so that it's not dragged down by  
16 the issues of poverty and segregation that have  
17 been holding us back for such a long time.

18 So I'm very excited that this is a  
19 step in making this project move forward, and I'm  
20 grateful to my colleagues for supporting it.

21 Thank you. I vote aye.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
23 May to be recorded in the affirmative.

24 Announce the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
2 bill is passed.

3                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
4 1592, Senate Print 6465A, by Senator Amedore, an  
5 act to authorize the City of Amsterdam, in the  
6 County of Montgomery, to finance a certain  
7 deficit by the issuance of bonds.

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    There  
9 is a home-rule message at the desk.

10                  Read the last section.

11                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 8.   This  
12 act shall take effect immediately.

13                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Call  
14 the roll.

15                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

16                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
17 Announce the results.

18                  THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

19                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
20 bill is passed.

21                  Senator Gianaris, that completes the  
22 reading of the supplemental calendar.

23                  SENATOR GIANARIS:    Mr. President,  
24 earlier we had laid aside Calendar 401, by  
25 Senator Little.   Can we remove that lay-aside and

1 take that bill up, please.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
3 Secretary will read.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
5 401, Assembly Print Number 4474, by  
6 Assemblymember Stec, an act to amend the Tax Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
8 the last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
12 the roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
15 Announce the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
17 Calendar Number 401, those Senators voting in the  
18 negative are Senators Amedore, Brooks, Gaughran,  
19 Harckham, Helming, Kaminsky, Kaplan, Kennedy,  
20 Lanza, Martinez, Metzger, Serino, Skoufis,  
21 Tedisco and Thomas.

22 Ayes, 47. Nays, 15.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
24 bill is passed.

25 Senator Gianaris, that completes the

1 reading of today's calendar.

2 SENATOR GIANARIS: Can we now take  
3 up the controversial calendar, please.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
5 Secretary will ring the bell.

6 The Secretary will read.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
8 634, Senate Print 97B, by Senator Kaminsky, an  
9 act to amend the Public Officers Law and the  
10 Public Authorities Law, in relation to  
11 prohibiting certain persons from receiving  
12 compensation for legal fees.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
14 O'Mara.

15 SENATOR O'MARA: Yes, would the  
16 sponsor provide an explanation, please.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Are you  
18 asking the sponsor to yield for an explanation?

19 SENATOR O'MARA: Through you,  
20 Mr. President.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Would  
22 the sponsor yield?

23 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Yes.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
25 sponsor yields.

1                   SENATOR O'MARA:     Senator, could you  
2     please provide an explanation and the purpose of  
3     this legislation?

4                   SENATOR KAMINSKY:     Sure.

5                   What this bill is intended to do is  
6     cut out some of the corruption that's surrounded  
7     Industrial Development Agencies where they hire  
8     as consultants their cronies, friends, family  
9     members, et cetera. There was a particular  
10    scandal on Long Island involving the indictment  
11    and conviction of a local elected official who  
12    was employed in one jurisdiction as an IDA  
13    counsel and served as an elected representative  
14    in another.

15                  And we obviously want our tax money  
16    that helps, you know, keep the IDA system going  
17    indirectly, and certainly the fees paid to IDAs  
18    to be used to get the best expert legal and other  
19    consulting advice to make the best economic  
20    decisions for the populace, not to help give  
21    contracts to politically connected people.

22                  So what this says is if you are an  
23    elected member of the Legislature, a state  
24    official, a party chair, you cannot derive a fee  
25    from an IDA.

1                   SENATOR O'MARA:    Through you,  
2   Mr. President, will the sponsor yield.

3                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Does  
4   the sponsor yield?

5                   SENATOR KAMINSKY:   Yes.

6                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   The  
7   sponsor yields.

8                   SENATOR O'MARA:    Now, I'm just a  
9   little unclear on the wording of this, where you  
10   say no statewide elected official, no state  
11   officer or employee, no member of the  
12   Legislature, no legislative employee or a  
13   political party chairman can be compensated for  
14   providing legal services or consulting services  
15   to a local authority such as an IDA or an LDC.

16                  SENATOR KAMINSKY:   Through you,  
17   Mr. President, that's correct, that's the text of  
18   the bill.

19                  SENATOR O'MARA:    Now, in  
20   speaking -- will the sponsor yield?

21                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Does  
22   the sponsor yield?

23                  SENATOR KAMINSKY:   Yes.

24                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   The  
25   sponsor yields.

1                   SENATOR O'MARA:    Now, in speaking  
2     with you about this bill -- and I realize you  
3     have revised this, amended it, based on our  
4     conversations -- that it would only apply to such  
5     a prohibited individual if they have more than a  
6     10 percent ownership share of the law firm?

7                   SENATOR KAMINSKY:   That's correct.  
8     Or a controlling share of the profits of that  
9     firm, yes.

10                  SENATOR O'MARA:    Will the sponsor  
11     yield?

12                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Does  
13     the sponsor yield?

14                  SENATOR KAMINSKY:   Yes.

15                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   The  
16     sponsor yields.

17                  SENATOR O'MARA:    Now, the  
18     legislation goes on to say -- so let's just use  
19     an example. We've got a lot of attorneys that  
20     work here in the Legislature as employees, a lot  
21     of them part-time and they practice in the real  
22     world, so to speak.

23                  Would that employee, would that  
24     legislative employee be precluded from doing and  
25     getting paid for legal services to an IDA or an



1 LDC where that individual was a sole proprietor  
2 of a law firm?

3 SENATOR KAMINSKY: So -- it  
4 depends. So if that individual, that  
5 representative, for example from the -- through  
6 you, Mr. President, from the -- if that, let's  
7 say, state legislator is not a controlling  
8 shareholder, meaning has under 10 percent  
9 ownership in that firm, then this law would not  
10 apply.

11 If the person does have 10 percent  
12 or over, the person cannot share in any of the  
13 fees derived from that work, although the firm  
14 could.

15 SENATOR O'MARA: Okay. Through  
16 you, Mr. President, will the sponsor yield?

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Will  
18 the sponsor yield?

19 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Yes.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
21 sponsor yields.

22 SENATOR O'MARA: So that  
23 legislative employee, if he's in sole practice,  
24 is precluded from doing that type of legal work?

25 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Through you,

1 Mr. President, yes.

2 SENATOR O'MARA: And through you,  
3 Mr. President, if the sponsor will yield.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Does  
5 the sponsor yield?

6 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Yes.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
8 sponsor yields.

9 SENATOR O'MARA: And then if --  
10 with 10 percent, so I'm assuming this applies to  
11 partnerships. So if you're in a partnership or  
12 an LLC or a professional LLC, a limited liability  
13 partnership, as a lot of law firms are formed,  
14 and that individual has less than a 10 percent  
15 ownership share, then that individual  
16 who's a legislative employee can perform legal  
17 work for an IDA or an LDC and be compensated for  
18 it?

19 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Through you,  
20 Mr. President, yes.

21 SENATOR O'MARA: I just want to be  
22 clear on that's what the intent --

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
24 O'Mara.

25 SENATOR O'MARA: Through you,

1 Mr. President.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Does  
3 the sponsor yield?

4 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Yes.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
6 sponsor yields.

7 SENATOR O'MARA: I just want to be  
8 clear on it. The intent of this legislation is  
9 not to preclude a member of the Legislature or  
10 any of these categories you've listed -- elected  
11 officials, employees or state officers,  
12 legislative employees, members of the  
13 Legislature, or political party chairmen -- that  
14 it's not intended to preclude those individuals  
15 from doing work for an IDA or an LDC if they own  
16 or have less than a 10 percent ownership share,  
17 controlling interest, in the partnership, LLC or  
18 firm?

19 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Through you,  
20 Mr. President, that's not only the intent of  
21 this, but it is also the express word in the law  
22 it is the intent. And if we find going forward  
23 that it's being abused and -- by allowing that  
24 way, we could revisit it. But yes, you're  
25 correct.

1                   SENATOR O'MARA: Through you,  
2 Mr. President, will the sponsor yield?

3                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Does  
4 the sponsor yield?

5                   SENATOR KAMINSKY: Yes.

6                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
7 sponsor yields.

8                   SENATOR O'MARA: You used the words  
9 "partnership," "limited liability company,"  
10 "corporation," but you also used the word "firm."  
11 Can you provide a definition of the word "firm"?

12                  SENATOR KAMINSKY: Through you,  
13 Mr. President, you're asking how to define  
14 "firm"?

15                  SENATOR O'MARA: Correct.

16                  SENATOR KAMINSKY: Through you,  
17 Mr. President, it's -- whatever the definition of  
18 "firm" in the Public Officers Law is, it's  
19 unchanged. This bill does not change that.

20                  SENATOR O'MARA: Through you,  
21 Mr. President --

22                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Does  
23 the sponsor yield? Sponsor, do you yield?

24                  SENATOR KAMINSKY: Yes.

25                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The

1 sponsor yields.

2 SENATOR O'MARA: Where in the  
3 Public Officers Law is "firm" defined? And can  
4 you read that definition?

5 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Through you,  
6 Mr. President, we're vigorously using the  
7 control-F function. One moment.

8 Through you, Mr. President, we're  
9 unable to locate it right now. But perhaps the  
10 Senator can elucidate us on what the issue is.  
11 "Firm" is a common definition of what it means to  
12 work in a firm. And if there's a particular  
13 circumstance that would involve some gray area of  
14 whether someone is in a firm or not, I could  
15 certainly try my best to make clear how the law  
16 would impact.

17 SENATOR O'MARA: Through you,  
18 Mr. President --

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Does  
20 the sponsor yield?

21 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Yes.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
23 sponsor yields.

24 SENATOR O'MARA: I'm just not aware  
25 of a definition of "firm" in the law. And

1     whether we're just going on a basic common  
2     definition of the word "firm" -- which I suppose  
3     would be an individual or a group of attorneys  
4     making up a firm -- how that is different or  
5     maybe defined differently than an LLC or a  
6     limited liability partnership or a regular  
7     partnership or a corporation.

8                     SENATOR KAMINSKY:     Through you,  
9     Mr. President, I can't offer any more  
10    clarification as to that.

11                    SENATOR O'MARA:     Through you,  
12    Mr. President, will the sponsor yield?

13                    ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     Does  
14    the sponsor yield?

15                    SENATOR KAMINSKY:     Yes.

16                    ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     The  
17    sponsor yields.

18                    SENATOR O'MARA:     In the second  
19    section of this legislation, the same language is  
20    repeated that we've been discussing on who's  
21    prohibited from this. But I take it that  
22    Section 2 isn't about being compensated for legal  
23    work, it is for actually serving on an IDA or an  
24    LDC or other local or state authority?

25                    SENATOR KAMINSKY:     Through you,

1 Mr. President, that's correct.

2 SENATOR O'MARA: So no member of  
3 the Legislature --

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
5 O'Mara. Senator O'Mara.

6 SENATOR O'MARA: Through you,  
7 Mr. President.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Does  
9 the sponsor yield?

10 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Yes.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
12 sponsor yields.

13 SENATOR O'MARA: So is it your  
14 intent that no member of the State Legislature or  
15 legislative employee or other state employee can  
16 serve on a local authority such as an IDA or an  
17 LDC?

18 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Through you,  
19 Mr. President, subject to the provisions it  
20 states in paragraph 2(1) about the amount of  
21 compensation that might be involved.

22 SENATOR O'MARA: Through you,  
23 Mr. President.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Does  
25 the sponsor yield?

1                   SENATOR KAMINSKY:    Yes.

2                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
3 sponsor yields.

4                   SENATOR O'MARA:    So that would be  
5 the same criteria of having less than 10 percent  
6 of ownership or control of the law firm.

7                   SENATOR KAMINSKY:    Through you,  
8 that's correct.

9                   SENATOR O'MARA:    Now, can you  
10 provide --

11                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Senator  
12 O'Mara.

13                   SENATOR O'MARA:    Through you,  
14 Mr. President.

15                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Does  
16 the sponsor yield?

17                   SENATOR O'MARA:    -- if the sponsor  
18 yields.

19                   SENATOR KAMINSKY:    Yes.

20                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
21 sponsor yields.

22                   SENATOR O'MARA:    In your sponsor's  
23 memo and in your initial explanation of the bill,  
24 you said that this legislation arises in response  
25 to an instance where a local elected official



1 collected hundreds of thousands of dollars in  
2 consulting fees from local Industrial Development  
3 Agencies and local Economic Assistance  
4 Corporations.

5 Can you give a little more facts on  
6 what that local situation was?

7 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Sure.  
8 Unfortunately, in this case, the memo remained  
9 unchanged despite the B print of the bill. But  
10 there's a case of a county legislator -- a  
11 county -- excuse me, a Town of Hempstead  
12 councilperson named Ed Ambrosino. Ed Ambrosino  
13 was also the Nassau County counsel to the Nassau  
14 County IDA.

15 So I happen to think it was a  
16 particularly bad arrangement to have an elected  
17 official, who obviously is very powerful in some  
18 area, being the counsel to the Nassau IDA.

19 I also have trouble believing, in  
20 the million or so people who live in  
21 Nassau County, or millions who work in the  
22 metropolitan area, the best lawyer with the best  
23 economic legal advice could have been someone who  
24 spends, you know, their time on the town council  
25 and, you know, happened to be a local elected

1 official. And I think it led to payments that  
2 resulted in a federal indictment and removal from  
3 office.

4 So that certainly raised the issue,  
5 and we're trying to address it now on the state  
6 level with state representatives and state  
7 officials and state party chairs, and possibly  
8 moving it to the local level at a future time.

9 SENATOR O'MARA: Through you,  
10 Mr. President.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Does  
12 the sponsor yield?

13 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Yes.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
15 sponsor yields.

16 SENATOR O'MARA: So as currently  
17 written, this bill does not preclude a county  
18 legislator from serving on a local authority.

19 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Through you,  
20 Mr. President, that's correct, no.

21 SENATOR O'MARA: Through you,  
22 Mr. President, if the sponsor will yield.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Does  
24 the sponsor yield?

25 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Yes.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
2   sponsor yields.

3                   SENATOR O'MARA:    So then the  
4   purpose of this legislation, for this specific  
5   example that you've talked about of a local  
6   incident, this law doesn't impact at all?

7                   SENATOR KAMINSKY:   Through you,  
8   Mr. President.  No, it does not.

9                   But it certainly inspired the law.  
10   And I feel that as a state government, it makes  
11   sense to deal with this on a state level with  
12   state officials.  And I think we should in the  
13   coming year determine whether we have the powers  
14   and wherewithal to do that on that level as well.

15                  SENATOR O'MARA:    Through you,  
16   Mr. President.

17                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Does  
18   the sponsor yield?

19                  SENATOR KAMINSKY:    Yes.

20                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   The  
21   sponsor yields.

22                  SENATOR O'MARA:    So at this point  
23   we're precluding us members of the Legislature,  
24   other statewide elected officials, state  
25   officers, any state employee, any employee of

1 legislative bodies here, the Assembly or the  
2 Senate, we're precluding them from undertaking  
3 this type of legal work or consulting if they  
4 happen to have a greater than 10 percent interest  
5 in the firm they work for.

6 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Through you,  
7 Mr. President, that's correct. But I would also  
8 add party -- high-ranking party officials to that  
9 list of people it would preclude.

10 SENATOR O'MARA: Through you,  
11 Mr. President.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Does  
13 the sponsor yield?

14 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Yes.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
16 sponsor yields.

17 SENATOR O'MARA: Yes, I left off  
18 the political party chairmen.

19 What level political party chairman  
20 is that? Is that at the county level or is that  
21 the state Republican chair or the state  
22 Democratic chair?

23 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Through you,  
24 Mr. President, it would be a county or state  
25 chair, and it would not have to be somebody

1 designated as chair. There's a definition in the  
2 Public Officers Law about controlling party  
3 functions and controlling day-to-day functions,  
4 and it would apply to that person too, whether he  
5 or she is actually called chairman or chairwoman.  
6 If they're effectively controlling the party, it  
7 would apply to him or her as well.

8 SENATOR O'MARA: Through you,  
9 Mr. President.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Does  
11 the sponsor yield?

12 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Yes.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
14 sponsor yields.

15 SENATOR O'MARA: So while this bill  
16 does not address local elected officials or  
17 county employees, town employees from --  
18 precluding them from this activity, it would  
19 preclude someone who's got political party  
20 control as defined.

21 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Through you,  
22 Mr. President, that's correct.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
24 O'Mara.

25 SENATOR O'MARA: Through you,

1 Mr. President.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Does  
3 the sponsor yield?

4 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Yes.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
6 sponsor yields.

7 SENATOR O'MARA: The instance that  
8 you're responding to here of the local official,  
9 was that individual a political chairman?

10 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Through you,  
11 Mr. President, no.

12 SENATOR O'MARA: Thank you,  
13 Mr. President. Thank you, Senator.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Are  
15 there any other Senators wishing to be heard?

16 Seeing and hearing none, debate is  
17 closed.

18 Senator Gianaris.

19 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,  
20 without objection, let's return this bill to the  
21 noncontroversial calendar, please.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Without  
23 objection, so ordered.

24 Read the last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This

1 act shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
3 the roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
6 Kaminsky to explain his vote. Senator Kaminsky  
7 to explain his vote.

8 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Thank you.

9 Mr. President, we want to have our  
10 IDAs, that are given public trust but have really  
11 failed to earn it, operating on the up-and-up and  
12 turning square corners.

13 When IDAs make decisions that impact  
14 the public, that actually cause their taxes to go  
15 up, people say, and they say loudly, who elected  
16 these people, and what is this IDA? And when we  
17 allow that system to get too big, we need to put  
18 checks and balances on that.

19 One of the things we've seen is IDAs  
20 have become patronage mills. That doesn't mean  
21 in every instance, or every person associated  
22 with it has a taint attached to him or her, but  
23 we want to know that the counsels being hired,  
24 that the consultants being hired are there  
25 because they're necessary and that they're giving

1 the best advice, period.

2 When we start mixing politics with  
3 that, we have a big problem. This will hopefully  
4 put an end to that.

5 I certainly take Senator O'Mara's  
6 criticism to heart that looking at how this  
7 operates on a local level would be worthwhile as  
8 well. That's something we could take up in the  
9 future if the Assembly does not pass this.

10 But I think we need to make sure  
11 that our IDAs are operating properly for the good  
12 of the public, not for the good of everyone's  
13 friends and cronies.

14 I vote in the affirmative.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
16 Kaminsky to be recorded in the affirmative.

17 Announce the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
19 Calendar Number 634, those Senators voting in the  
20 negative are Senators Amedore, Flanagan, Funke,  
21 Griffo, Jacobs, Jordan, O'Mara, Ranzenhofer and  
22 Tedisco.

23 Ayes, 53. Nays, 9.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
25 bill is passed.



1                   Senator Gianaris, that completes the  
2                   reading of today's calendar.

3                   SENATOR GIANARIS:    Can you  
4                   recognize Senator Griffo for an announcement,  
5                   please.

6                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Senator  
7                   Griffo for an announcement.

8                   SENATOR GRIFFO:    Thank you,  
9                   Mr. President.

10                  There will be an immediate meeting  
11                  of the Republican Conference in the Republican  
12                  Conference Room.

13                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    There  
14                  will be an immediate meeting of the Republican  
15                  Conference in the Republican Conference Room.

16                  Senator Gianaris.

17                  SENATOR GIANARIS:    The Senate will  
18                  stand at ease.

19                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
20                  Senate will stand at ease.

21                  (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease  
22                  at 4:53 p.m.)

23                  (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at  
24                  7:57 p.m.)

25                  ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:    Senator

1       Hoylman.

2                   SENATOR HOYLMAN:     Thank you,  
3       Mr. President.

4                   There will be an immediate meeting  
5       of the Senate Majority Conference in the  
6       Conference Room.

7                   The Senate will stand at ease.

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:     There  
9       will be an immediate meeting of the Senate  
10      Democratic Conference in the Senate Majority  
11      Conference Room.

12                   The Senate stands at ease.

13                   (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease  
14      at 7:57 p.m.)

15                   (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at  
16      9:57 p.m.)

17                   ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:     The  
18      Senate will come to order.

19                   Senator Gianaris.

20                   SENATOR GIANARIS:     Mr. President,  
21      there will be an immediate meeting of the  
22      Committee on Rules in Room 332.

23                   ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:     There  
24      will be an immediate meeting of the  
25      Rules Committee in Room 332.

1                   SENATOR GIANARIS:    The Senate will  
2 stand at ease.

3                   ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:    The  
4 Senate will stand at ease.

5                   (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease  
6 at 9:57 p.m.)

7                   (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at  
8 10:27 p.m.)

9                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
10 Senate will return to order.

11                   Senator Gianaris.

12                   SENATOR GIANARIS:    Can we return to  
13 reports of standing committees.

14                   I believe there's a report of the --  
15 I believe the second report of the Rules  
16 Committee is at the desk.

17                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
18 second report of the Rules Committee is at the  
19 desk.

20                   The Secretary will read.

21                   THE SECRETARY:    Senator  
22 Stewart-Cousins, from the Committee on Rules,  
23 reports the following bills:

24                   Senate Print 20, by Senator Parker,  
25 an act to amend the Public Service Law;

1                   Senate Print 301A, by Senator  
2   Hoylman, an act to amend the Public Health Law;  
3                   Senate Print 644A, by Senator Boyle,  
4   an act to validate certain acts of the  
5   Islip Union Free School District with regard to  
6   certain capital improvement projects;  
7                   Senate Print 1557, by  
8   Senator Serrano, an act to create a temporary  
9   state commission to study and make  
10   recommendations concerning the incidence of  
11   asthma in the Borough of the Bronx in  
12   New York City;  
13                  Senate Print 1803A, by Senator  
14   Rivera, an act to amend the Public Health Law;  
15                  Senate Print 2062, by Senator  
16   Serrano, an act to amend the Executive Law;  
17                  Senate Print 2279A, by  
18   Senator Hoylman, an act to amend the  
19   Public Health Law and the Executive Law;  
20                  Senate Print 3020, by Senator  
21   Kennedy, an act to amend the Transportation Law;  
22                  Senate Print 3133, by Senator Myrie,  
23   an act to amend the Election Law;  
24                  Senate Print 3254, by  
25   Senator Parker, an act to amend the

1 Not-For-Profit Corporation Law;

2 Senate Print 3571, by  
3 Senator Serrano, an act to amend the Parks,  
4 Recreation and Historic Preservation Law;

5 Senate Print 3735B, by Senator  
6 Flanagan, an act in relation to authorizing the  
7 East Northport Fire District to file an  
8 application for a real property tax exemption;

9 Senate Print 3907, by  
10 Senator Serrano, an act to amend the Tax Law;

11 Senate Print 4031B, by  
12 Senator Jackson, an act to establish a commission  
13 for the educational advancement of multilingual  
14 learners in New York;

15 Senate Print 4048A, by  
16 Senator Kennedy, an act to amend the Highway Law;

17 Senate Print 4106, by  
18 Senator Kaminsky, an act to authorize  
19 Joseph DelGiorno's eligibility to apply for  
20 military service credit in the New York State  
21 Teachers' Retirement System;

22 Senate Print 4135A, by  
23 Senator Skoufis, an act to authorize the City of  
24 Newburgh, in the County of Orange, to offer an  
25 optional twenty-year retirement plan to

1 Police Officer Samuel Kenan Jr.;

2 Senate Print 4189A, by Senator  
3 Kennedy, an act to amend the Transportation Law;

4 Senate Print 4389B, by  
5 Senator Kaminsky, an act to amend the  
6 Environmental Conservation Law;

7 Senate Print 4392, by  
8 Senator Akshar, an act to amend the County Law  
9 and the Tax Law;

10 Senate Print 4520, by  
11 Senator Harckham, an act to amend the  
12 Public Authorities Law;

13 Senate Print 4530, by  
14 Senator Parker, an act to amend the Tax Law;

15 Senate Print 4862B, by Senator  
16 Martinez, an act to amend the Education Law;

17 Senate Print 5035, by  
18 Senator Harckham, an act to amend the Vehicle and  
19 Traffic Law;

20 Senate Print 5157A, by Senator  
21 Breslin, an act to amend the Real Property Law;

22 Senate Print 5202A, by Senator  
23 Gounardes, an act directing a study on the impact  
24 of increased minimum wage on eligibility for  
25 income-based services, programs and subsidies;

1                   Senate Print 5312, by  
2   Senator Harckham, an act in relation to directing  
3   the State Board of Real Property Tax Services to  
4   conduct a study on real property tax saturation;

5                   Senate Print 5372, by Senator  
6   Comrie, an act to amend the Real Property Law;

7                   Senate Print 5439, by  
8   Senator Metzger, an act to amend the Energy Law;

9                   Senate Print 5570, by Senator  
10   Martinez, an act to amend the Executive Law;

11                   Senate Print 5579, by  
12   Senator Serrano, an act to amend the  
13   Environmental Conservation Law;

14                   Senate Print 5604A, by  
15   Senator Kennedy, an act to amend Chapter 5 of the  
16   Laws of 1997;

17                   Senate Print 5615, by Senator  
18   Benjamin, an act to amend the Environmental  
19   Conservation Law and the Public Health Law;

20                   Senate Print 5634, by  
21   Senator Carlucci, an act in relation to  
22   permitting the Village of Upper Nyack to file an  
23   application for a real property tax exemption;

24                   Senate Print 5649, by  
25   Senator Gallivan, an act to validate certain acts

1 of the Mount Morris Central School District with  
2 regard to certain capital improvement projects;

3 Senate Print 5653A, by Senator  
4 Metzger, an act to amend the Public Health Law;

5 Senate Print 5696, by Senator  
6 Metzger, an act to amend the Public Service Law;

7 Senate Print 5703, by  
8 Senator Sepúlveda, an act to amend the  
9 Mental Hygiene Law;

10 Senate Print 5706A, by Senator  
11 Flanagan, an act in relation to authorizing the  
12 assessor of the Town of Smithtown, County of  
13 Suffolk, to accept from the Monastery of the  
14 Glorious Ascension, Inc., an application for  
15 exemption from real property taxes;

16 Senate Print 5719, by Senator  
17 Jackson, an act to amend the Education Law;

18 Senate Print 5826, by Senator May,  
19 an act to amend the Environmental Conservation  
20 Law;

21 Senate Print 5829, by  
22 Senator Serino, an act to amend the  
23 Executive Law;

24 Senate Print 5863A, by Senator  
25 Jackson, an act to amend the Education Law;



1 Senate Print 5891, by  
2 Senator Biaggi, an act to amend the Elder Law;

3 Senate Print 5925, by Senator  
4 Kaminsky, an act to amend the Executive Law;

5 Senate Print 5955, by Senator May,  
6 an act to authorize the City of Syracuse, in the  
7 County of Onondaga, to offer an optional  
8 twenty-year retirement plan to Police Officer  
9 Thomas R. Nicolini;

10 Senate Print 5956, by Senator May,  
11 an act to authorize Morgan McDole, Baraaka J.  
12 Titus and David Dunlap to elect to participate in  
13 the optional twenty-year retirement plan for  
14 firefighters employed by the City of Syracuse  
15 Fire Department in the County of Onondaga;

16 Senate Print 6010A, by  
17 Senator Hoylman, an act relating to granting  
18 retroactive eligibility to apply for enhanced  
19 Tier 3 status to former New York City police  
20 officer Mark Rivera;

21 Senate Print 6023, by  
22 Senator Serrano, an act to amend the  
23 Social Services Law and the Executive Law;

24 Senate Print 6025, by  
25 Senator Gaughran, an act to amend the

1 Real Property Tax Law;

2 Senate Print 6027, by  
3 Senator Gaughran, an act to amend the  
4 Real Property Tax Law;

5 Senate Print 6036, by  
6 Senator Savino, an act directing the study of the  
7 use of blockchain technology to protect voter  
8 records and election results;

9 Senate Print 6202A, by  
10 Senator Savino, an act to amend the  
11 Agriculture and Markets Law;

12 Senate Print 6226, by Senator  
13 Felder, an act to amend the Public Health Law;

14 Senate Print 6277, by Senator  
15 Robach, an act to amend the Correction Law;

16 Senate Print 6360, by  
17 Senator Krueger, an act to amend the Penal Law;

18 Senate Print 6481, by  
19 Senator Kaplan, an act to amend Chapter 58 of the  
20 Laws of 2013;

21 Senate Print 6545, by  
22 Senator Jackson, an act to amend the  
23 Private Housing Finance Law;

24 Senate Print 6549, by  
25 Senator Carlucci, an act to amend the Labor Law;

1                   And Senate Print 6554, by  
2     Senator Metzger, an act to amend the  
3     Agriculture and Markets Law.

4                   All bills ordered direct to third  
5     reading.

6                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     Senator  
7     Gianaris.

8                   SENATOR GIANARIS:     Move to accept  
9     the report of the Rules Committee.

10                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     All in  
11     favor of accepting the report of the  
12     Rules Committee signify by saying aye.

13                  (Response of "Aye.")

14                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
15     Opposed, nay.

16                  (No response.)

17                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     The  
18     Rules Committee report is accepted.

19                  Senator Gianaris.

20                  SENATOR GIANARIS:     Can we now take  
21     up the third report of the Rules Committee,  
22     please. I believe that is at the desk.

23                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     There  
24     is a third report of the Rules Committee at the  
25     desk.

1                   The Secretary will read.

2                   THE SECRETARY:    Senator  
3   Stewart-Cousins, from the Committee on Rules,  
4   reports the following bills:

5                   Senate Print 1555, by Senator  
6   Serrano, an act to amend the Agriculture and  
7   Markets Law;

8                   Senate Print 1951, by  
9   Senator Bailey, an act to amend the New York City  
10   Civil Court Act;

11                  Senate Print 2162, by Senator  
12   Bailey, an act to amend the Public Housing Law;

13                  Senate Print 2184, by  
14   Senator Bailey, an act to amend the Economic  
15   Development Law;

16                  Senate Print 2701, by  
17   Senator Kennedy, an act to amend the  
18   Real Property Tax Law;

19                  Senate Print 3171A, by  
20   Senator Krueger, an act to amend the  
21   Financial Services Law;

22                  Senate Print 3561A, by  
23   Senator Kennedy, an act to amend the  
24   State Finance Law;

25                  Senate Print 4414A, by

1 Senator Kennedy, an act to amend the Highway Law;

2 Senate Print 4610, by

3 Senator Savino, an act to amend the

4 Religious Corporations Law;

5 Senate Print 4664, by

6 Senator Carlucci, an act to establish the

7 Toll Advisory Task Force, and providing for the

8 powers and duties thereof;

9 Senate Print 4711, by

10 Senator Parker, an act to amend the

11 Domestic Relations Law;

12 Senate Print 4790, by

13 Senator Ritchie, an act to authorize the City of

14 Oswego, in the County of Oswego, to offer an

15 optional twenty-year retirement plan to

16 police officer Zachary Quinones;

17 Senate Print 5023, by Senator

18 Parker, an act to amend the Education Law;

19 Senate Print 5152, by

20 Senator Ritchie, an act relating to legalizing,

21 validating, ratifying and confirming a

22 transportation contract of the Fulton City

23 School District;

24 Senate Print 5224B, by Senator

25 Kennedy, an act to amend the Education Law;

1                   Senate Print 5294A, by  
2   Senator Ramos, an act to amend the Vehicle and  
3   Traffic Law;

4                   Senate Print 5394A, by Senator  
5   Jackson, an act to amend the Education Law;

6                   Senate Print 5547, by  
7   Senator Skoufis, an act to amend the  
8   Environmental Conservation Law;

9                   Senate Print 5609, by  
10   Senator Martinez, an act to amend the General  
11   Municipal Law and the Public Authorities Law;

12                   Senate Print 5908, by Senator  
13   Rivera, an act to amend the Public Health Law;

14                   Senate Print 6000A, by Senator  
15   Rivera, an act to amend the Public Health Law;

16                   Senate Print 6048, by Senator  
17   Breslin, an act to amend the State Finance Law;

18                   Senate Print 6110A, by  
19   Senator Savino, an act to amend the Retirement  
20   and Social Security Law;

21                   Senate Print 6201, by  
22   Senator O'Mara, an act in relation to legalizing,  
23   validating, ratifying and confirming certain  
24   transportation contracts of the Corning City  
25   School District;

1                   Senate Print 6206B, by  
2     Senator LaValle, an act authorizing the  
3     alienation of certain parklands in the Town of  
4     Southampton, County of Suffolk;

5                   Senate Print 6228A, by  
6     Senator Stewart-Cousins, an act to authorize the  
7     Commissioner of General Services to transfer and  
8     convey certain state land to the City of  
9     New Rochelle;

10                  Senate Print 6250A, by  
11     Senator Ramos, an act to amend Chapter 450 of the  
12     Laws of 2017;

13                  Senate Print 6291, by  
14     Senator LaValle, an act authorizing the  
15     alienation of certain parklands in the Town of  
16     East Hampton, County of Suffolk;

17                  Senate Print 6292, by  
18     Senator LaValle, an act to authorize the Town of  
19     Brookhaven, County of Suffolk, to alienate  
20     certain parklands and to dedicate other lands as  
21     parklands;

22                  Senate Print 6293A, by  
23     Senator Comrie, an act to authorize, for certain  
24     public works undertaken pursuant to project labor  
25     agreements, use of the alternative delivery

1 method known as design-build contracts;

2 Senate Print 6312A, by  
3 Senator Kavanagh, an act to authorize the City of  
4 New York to discontinue the use as parkland of a  
5 portion of real property in the County of  
6 New York and to grant easements;

7 Senate Print 6340, by  
8 Senator O'Mara, an act to authorize the board of  
9 supervisors of Tompkins County to contract with  
10 certain entities for the development, maintenance  
11 or management of affordable housing;

12 Senate Print 6365, by  
13 Senator Gallivan, an act to legalize, validate,  
14 ratify and confirm the actions of the Panama  
15 Central School District;

16 Senate Print 6372A, by  
17 Senator Comrie, an act establishing the "Gateway  
18 Development Commission Act";

19 Senate Print 6382, by Senator  
20 Ranzenhofer, an act granting retroactive Tier III  
21 membership in the New York State and Local  
22 Employees' Retirement System to Steven R. Grice;

23 Senate Print 6394, by  
24 Senator Carlucci, an act to amend the  
25 Social Services Law;



1                   Senate Print 6398, by  
2   Senator Serrano, an act to implement a  
3   constitutional amendment authorizing the  
4   placement of public utility lines and bike paths  
5   in the Forest Preserve and establishing a health  
6   and safety land account;

7                   Senate Print 6402, by  
8   Senator Montgomery, an act to amend the Penal Law  
9   and the Criminal Procedure Law;

10                  Senate Print 6411A, by  
11   Senator Kavanagh, an act to amend the  
12   Public Authorities Law;

13                  Senate Print 6423, by  
14   Senator Montgomery, an act to amend the  
15   Family Court Act and the Domestic Relations Law;

16                  Senate Print 6437, by  
17   Senator Sepúlveda, an act to amend the New York  
18   City Charter, the Mental Hygiene Law and the  
19   Public Health Law;

20                  Senate Print 6438, by Senator  
21   Gianaris, an act to amend the Judiciary Law;

22                  Senate Print 6443, by Senator  
23   Persaud, an act to amend the Social Services Law;

24                  Senate Print 6451, by  
25   Senator Benjamin, an act to amend the Alcoholic

1 Beverage Control Law;

2 Senate Print 6457A, by Senator  
3 Gianaris, an act to amend the Election Law;

4 Senate Print 6460, by  
5 Senator Martinez, an act in relation to  
6 permitting the Unitarian Universalists  
7 Congregation of the Great South Bay Sayville to  
8 file an application for a real property tax  
9 exemption;

10 Senate Print 6462, by  
11 Senator Stewart-Cousins, an act to amend the  
12 Alcoholic Beverage Control Law;

13 Senate Print 6476, by  
14 Senator Benjamin, an act to amend Chapter 538 of  
15 the Laws of 2013;

16 Senate Print 6483, by  
17 Senator Brooks, an act to amend the Military Law;

18 Senate Print 6485, by  
19 Senator Rivera, an act to amend Chapter 2 of the  
20 Laws of 1988;

21 Senate Print 6486, by Senator Myrie,  
22 an act to amend the Mental Hygiene Law;

23 Senate Print 6492, by Senator  
24 Rivera, an act to amend the Public Health Law;

25 Senate Print 6493, by

1 Senator Stewart-Cousins, an act to amend the  
2 Vehicle and Traffic Law;

3 Senate Print 6494, by Senator Mayer,  
4 an act to amend Chapter 498 of the Laws of 2017;

5 Senate Print 6497A, by  
6 Senator Kavanagh, an act to amend the  
7 Real Property Tax Law;

8 Senate Print 6503, by  
9 Senator Martinez, an act in relation to  
10 authorizing Christian Worship Center Church of  
11 God to file an application for exemption from  
12 real property taxes for a certain assessment  
13 roll;

14 Senate Print 6504, by  
15 Senator Flanagan, an act authorizing the  
16 Saint Paraskevi Greek Orthodox Shrine Church to  
17 file an application for a real property tax  
18 exemption;

19 Senate Print 6517, by Senator  
20 Stavisky, an act to amend the Education Law;

21 Senate Print 6518, by  
22 Senator O'Mara, an act to amend the Highway Law;

23 Senate Print 6524, by Senator  
24 Gounardes, an act to amend the Civil Service Law;

25 Senate Print 6526A, by

1 Senator O'Mara, an act to amend the Highway Law;  
2 Senate Print 6528, by  
3 Senator O'Mara, an act to amend the Highway Law;  
4 Senate Print 6529, by Senator  
5 Rivera, an act to amend the Public Health Law;  
6 Senate Print 6532A, by  
7 Senator Kavanagh, an act to amend the  
8 Election Law;  
9 Senate Print 6544A, by  
10 Senator Krueger, an act to amend the  
11 Financial Services Law;  
12 Senate Print 6547, by Senator  
13 Breslin, an act to amend the Insurance Law;  
14 Senate Print 6557, by  
15 Senator Gallivan, an act to amend the  
16 Environmental Conservation Law;  
17 Senate Print 6560, by  
18 Senator Persaud, an act to amend the Family Court  
19 Act and the Domestic Relations Law;  
20 Senate Print 6571A, by  
21 Senator Kavanagh, an act to amend the  
22 Administrative Code of the City of New York;  
23 Senate Print 6573, by  
24 Senator Hoylman, an act to amend the Penal Law;  
25 Senate Print 6574, by Senator

1 Biaggi, an act to amend the Criminal Procedure  
2 Law and the Civil Practice Law and Rules;

3 Senate Print 6575, by Senator  
4 Sanders, an act to amend the Executive Law;

5 Senate Print 6576, by Senator  
6 Kavanagh, an act to amend a chapter of the Laws  
7 of 2019;

8 Senate Print 6577, by Senator  
9 Biaggi, an act to amend the Executive Law;

10 Senate Print 6578, by Senator Ramos,  
11 an act to amend the Labor Law;

12 Senate Print 6584, by  
13 Senator Sepúlveda, an act to amend the Vehicle  
14 and Traffic Law;

15 Senate Print 6597, by Senator Ramos,  
16 an act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law; and

17 Senate Print 6599, by Senator  
18 Kaminsky, an act to amend the Environmental  
19 Conservation Law.

20 All bills ordered direct to third  
21 reading.

22 SENATOR GIANARIS: Move to accept  
23 the report of the Rules Committee.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: All in  
25 favor of accepting the report of the

1 Rules Committee signify by saying aye.

2 (Response of "Aye.")

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:

4 Opposed, nay.

5 (No response.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
7 Rules Committee report is accepted.

8 Senator Gianaris.

9 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,  
10 can we move to Calendar 58C, Supplemental  
11 Calendar 58C. And we're going to -- give me one  
12 moment to find it -- we're going to begin -- just  
13 take up for the moment Calendar 1622, by  
14 Senator Kaminsky.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
16 Secretary will read.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
18 1622, Senate Print 6599, by Senator Kaminsky, an  
19 act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
21 Gianaris.

22 SENATOR GIANARIS: Is there a  
23 message of necessity at the desk, Mr. President?

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: There  
25 is a message of necessity at the desk.

1                   SENATOR GIANARIS:    Move to accept  
2   the message of necessity.

3                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   All in  
4   favor of accepting the message of necessity  
5   signify by saying aye.

6                   (Response of "Aye.")

7                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
8   Opposed?

9                   (Response of "Nay.")

10                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   The  
11   message is accepted, and the bill is before the  
12   house.

13                  Senator Gianaris.

14                  SENATOR GIANARIS:    Can you now take  
15   up the bill, please.

16                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   The  
17   Secretary will read.

18                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
19   1622, Senate Print 6599, by Senator Kaminsky, an  
20   act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

21                  SENATOR GRIFFO:    Lay it aside.

22                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Lay it  
23   aside.

24                  Senator Gianaris.

25                  SENATOR GIANARIS:    Mr. President,

1 can we now take that bill up on the controversial  
2 calendar, please.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
4 Secretary will ring the bell.

5 The Secretary will read.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
7 1622, Senate Print 6599, by Senator Kaminsky, an  
8 act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
10 Ortt.

11 SENATOR ORTT: Yes, through you,  
12 Mr. President, would the sponsor yield to a few  
13 questions?

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Does  
15 the sponsor yield?

16 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Yes.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
18 sponsor yields.

19 SENATOR ORTT: Can the sponsor --  
20 considering that we've been here all day, would  
21 the sponsor care to explain to me the need for  
22 this legislation and specifically what this  
23 legislation sets out and intends to do?

24 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Sure. Through  
25 you, Mr. President.



1                   We find ourselves at a pivotal  
2 moment both in our country and as citizens of  
3 this world. Right now there is more atmospheric  
4 carbon dioxide in the air than any other time  
5 since homo sapiens walked the Planet Earth.  
6 Right now we have over 400 parts per million of  
7 atmospheric CO2, far above levels at the time of  
8 the turn of the century.

9                   Since 1900, sea levels have risen  
10 about 8 inches, and almost half of that has  
11 occurred since 1993. Scientists tell us that the  
12 last time that the earth was at 2 degrees Celsius  
13 warmer than preindustrial temperatures, sea  
14 levels were 16 feet higher than they are now.  
15 And the intergovernmental -- well, the IPCC says  
16 that a 2 degree Celsius increase will create a  
17 tipping point from which we may not recover.

18                  But I'd like to cite an old Bob  
19 Dylan lyric that I find handy right now, which is  
20 "You don't need a weatherman to know which way  
21 the wind blows." You turn on TV, and California  
22 is on fire. Cars are driving up the highway with  
23 both sides on fire, like a scene out of The Road  
24 Warrior. Farmers in the Midwest are experiencing  
25 floods that their ancestors had never seen. And

1 I live in a community, like many of us here, that  
2 the ocean simply tore through in Hurricane Sandy.

3 So we have no choice but to address  
4 the climate crisis. The question is not why, the  
5 question is why not. We have no option but to go  
6 and do this now.

7 What this bill will do, this bill,  
8 the Climate Leadership and Community Protection  
9 Act -- the artist formerly known as the CCPA --  
10 this bill will create a roadmap to get us to  
11 having a society, a state, where we have a  
12 carbon-neutral economy, where our carbon  
13 reductions are slashed by 85 percent and the  
14 remainder is offset so that our state will not  
15 be, in the totality, emitting carbon. And that's  
16 an incredibly important point in a state with an  
17 economy as consequential as ours.

18 We need to be leading the way. Not  
19 only because we have no choice, not only because  
20 we want other states to follow and create  
21 important synergies, but because we want to be  
22 the ones creating the new jobs of a green economy  
23 that is to come and that is really here.

24 We don't want our citizens working  
25 in other states. We want companies to come and

1 invest here, to hire our workers, because we know  
2 how great they are. We want to be the ones who  
3 are first movers and that other states are  
4 sending their resources to because we're  
5 producing the energy that they need.

6 We also know that in the process of  
7 doing that, and being first movers in this green  
8 economy, that we could really lift all  
9 communities up and make sure that disadvantaged  
10 communities who have been dumped on for too long  
11 are going to be reaping the success of what we do  
12 here.

13 Doing this today and not waiting for  
14 next year is pivotal, because we have no time.  
15 We don't. The plan set forth here to get us to a  
16 vision 30 years from now is extremely aggressive.  
17 This is going to send a market signal that's  
18 going to lower the prices of energy, especially  
19 of energy that we want to employ. I'm sure  
20 you'll ask me about that in a second. It is  
21 going to create innovation. And that is the type  
22 of signal we need to set right away, because  
23 where we are from where we need to get to is a  
24 long way away. But I know we can do it.

25 And if we don't set the standard

1     today and set our goals today, as lofty and  
2     aggressive as they are, we will be failing the  
3     next generation.

4                   SENATOR ORTT:     Through you,  
5     Mr. President, does the sponsor continue to  
6     yield?

7                   SENATOR KAMINSKY:     Yes.

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     The  
9     sponsor yields.

10                  SENATOR ORTT:     Through you,  
11     Mr. President, the sponsor laid out some very, by  
12     his own admission, aggressive goals. Under the  
13     state's current environmental goals that the  
14     Governor has set and his executive agencies have  
15     set, we have actually been failing to meet many  
16     of those goals today.

17                  What reason, aside from optimism,  
18     does the sponsor have to believe that we will be  
19     able to meet any of these goals that have been  
20     laid out in this bill?

21                  SENATOR KAMINSKY:     Through you,  
22     Mr. President. So the point of doing this bill  
23     is to create that accountability and to create  
24     milestones along the way to make sure that we are  
25     on track. So this will start by creating a

1     scoping plan that is going to, with expertise in  
2     various sectors of the economy -- whether that's  
3     manufacturing, agriculture and forestry,  
4     transportation, et cetera -- provide expertise as  
5     to how we're going to get from here to there.

6                 But it also creates interim  
7     milestones in here, and by 2024 gives agencies  
8     the power to promulgate rules and regulations  
9     based on this scoping plan. This will be the law  
10    in the State of New York.

11                But I also think that it's clearly  
12    possible that we will be able to set forth a  
13    chain of events that will lead us to places that  
14    we don't even know exist right now, create new  
15    technologies, lower prices of existing  
16    technologies in ways that we haven't seen, and  
17    really unleash the innovative powers that we have  
18    here.

19                We just have to have a roadmap to do  
20    it, and we have to have the structure in place to  
21    foster that, and that's what this bill creates.

22                SENATOR ORTT: Through you,  
23    Mr. President, will the sponsor continue to  
24    yield?

25                SENATOR KAMINSKY: Yes.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     Does  
2     the sponsor yield?   The sponsor yields.

3                   SENATOR ORTT:     Through you,  
4     Mr. President, the sponsor talked about  
5     attracting jobs, this will be good for the  
6     economy of New York.

7                   There's no question that many of the  
8     goals and the potential roadmap that is laid out  
9     in this legislation will have a negative impact  
10    in the short term on several economies' energy  
11    production here in New York State.   As a matter  
12    of fact, for the last several years, while we've  
13    tried to improve our goals here in New York State  
14    as far as reducing emissions, what we've actually  
15    done is import dirtier energy from other states,  
16    which isn't counted under the Governor's  
17    scorecard.   So we've exported jobs, and we're  
18    importing energy.

19                  Is there anything laid out in this  
20    plan that addresses workers who are displaced,  
21    workers who are working in coal plants or working  
22    in any kind of fossil fuel energy sector that may  
23    be displaced or put out of work directly because  
24    of this legislation?   Is there anything that we  
25    do for them, concrete, that says we're going to

1 find transitional work for you or training to  
2 find transitional work for you?

3 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Through you,  
4 Mr. President, absolutely. This legislation  
5 creates a just transition working group. Every  
6 part of this bill is supposed to be done in  
7 tandem with this group, which is supposed to deal  
8 with workforce development, training, figuring  
9 out where we're going to need to direct our  
10 resources. And the scoping plan has to be made  
11 in conjunction with this working group.

12 So yes, having a just transition is  
13 absolutely a part of this, and ensuring that our  
14 workers are trained for the green economy is a  
15 critical part of this, and that's one of the main  
16 features of this bill. If we are to succeed, we  
17 clearly have to be training for a green economy,  
18 creating new jobs for workers who may be  
19 displaced, and having a -- instead of a  
20 haphazard, running from one crisis to another,  
21 have a comprehensive plan that's going to figure  
22 out where we are devoting our resources to and  
23 who's being impacted.

24 So I couldn't agree with that point  
25 more, and I think this bill addresses that

1 head on.

2 SENATOR ORTT: Through you,  
3 Mr. President, if the sponsor will continue to  
4 yield.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Does  
6 the sponsor yield?

7 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Yes.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
9 sponsor yields.

10 SENATOR ORTT: Is the sponsor aware  
11 that there are labor groups -- namely, the  
12 International Brotherhood of Electrical  
13 Workers -- that do not share his optimism or do  
14 not share his belief that this bill addresses  
15 those concerns?

16 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Through you,  
17 Mr. President. You know, we've had  
18 conversations, we will continue to work with that  
19 important component of our labor force. I  
20 certainly understand the fear, and I'm empathetic  
21 and sympathetic to that.

22 Being told that there's a roadmap,  
23 that the job you currently have today may not be  
24 there in 30 years, is scary. And we don't take  
25 that lightly. But it has to be -- you know, we



1     certainly don't want that worker to be in that  
2     position without a roadmap to get to the next  
3     step, and we certainly don't want that worker to  
4     have to move to Massachusetts if they are  
5     creating the jobs that do this.

6                     So we are trying to get that same  
7     worker to a better job a few years down the road  
8     in a planned, comprehensive way. And we will  
9     certainly work with our partners in labor to try  
10    to make that happen.

11                    SENATOR ORTT:     Through you,  
12    Mr. President, will the sponsor continue to  
13    yield?

14                    ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     Does  
15    the sponsor yield?

16                    SENATOR KAMINSKY:     Yes.

17                    ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     The  
18    sponsor yields.

19                    SENATOR ORTT:     Through you,  
20    Mr. President. It's my reading of this bill that  
21    there's a task force, which certainly Albany  
22    loves, that is created that will make  
23    recommendations. To your point on the roadmap,  
24    they'll make recommendations on how to get to  
25    these goals and recommendations on how we

1 achieve, you know, a hundred percent carbon-free  
2 emissions.

3 Those recommendations will go to  
4 the -- my understanding is the executive  
5 agencies, and those executive agencies then can  
6 act on that, of course with the force of law,  
7 absent any further action by the Legislature.

8 Is that -- am I reading the bill  
9 accurately, Mr. President?

10 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Through you,  
11 Mr. President. So first of all, the Legislature  
12 can act any time it wishes and take the  
13 recommendations of the scoping plan into account.

14 But yes, these -- first of all, we  
15 all will have appointments to this commission.  
16 They will be conducting meetings throughout the  
17 state before they promulgate anything, including  
18 having geographical diversity in terms of where  
19 they're holding these public meetings. So we  
20 tried to do as much transparency as we can in  
21 here. And they're going to be technical experts.  
22 And that's what we hope makes up not only not the  
23 Climate Action Council but also the working  
24 groups that feed information up.

25 So, you know, the agencies, we still

1 have oversight over them. We will continue to do  
2 that. We can continue to act where we deem  
3 necessary. But the agencies are supposed to be  
4 following the scoping plan, and with interim  
5 reports on how close they are to tracking their  
6 mandates.

7 SENATOR ORTT: Through you,  
8 Mr. President, on the bill.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
10 Ortt on the bill.

11 SENATOR ORTT: I want to thank the  
12 sponsor for his answers to some of my questions.  
13 This is the C print, as everyone here knows.  
14 It's gone through three versions, I think, since  
15 Sunday. And of course, like everyone else, it's  
16 an effort to try to keep up on just how bad the  
17 bill still is.

18 I don't think -- something I think  
19 gets lost in these debates on climate change,  
20 climate science, weather patterns, is this  
21 feeling that if you're for -- if you believe in  
22 climate change, whether there's changing climate  
23 that is impacting our communities, that you have  
24 to be for this bill. And it's not a binary  
25 choice. This is not the only answer.

1           I believe that many of my colleagues  
2 over here simply disagree with the solution that  
3 is often proposed to those problems. Because  
4 very often, certainly at the state level, when I  
5 look at these solutions I see a loss of jobs, I  
6 see increased energy rates, not decreased energy  
7 rates, as was mentioned. And I see further  
8 hampering of New York's economy without even any  
9 guarantee that we are meeting the goals that are  
10 being laid out to justify these kinds of  
11 policies.

12           I think these policies sound great  
13 to the advocates, but we already know we've had  
14 challenges meeting the goals under the Governor's  
15 administration. In fact, I shouldn't say we've  
16 had trouble -- we haven't met them.

17           And I represent the Town of  
18 Somerset. We have a coal plant in Niagara  
19 County. That coal plant will be closing next  
20 year, probably ahead of that. But by law, by the  
21 Governor's directive, it has to close in 2020.

22           Now, there's a lot of factors that  
23 go into that, but there's about 70 employees who  
24 work there, 70 families who depend on that  
25 income. And they were also told that there would

1 be transition. They were told by the Lieutenant  
2 Governor. She came to my district and said,  
3 "We're going to do worker transition."

4           They've heard that term so often,  
5 and yet they haven't seen it. They don't know  
6 what that really looks like. Right? It's been  
7 spoken about, but nothing has materialized. And  
8 as of today, if that plant were to go out of  
9 business tomorrow, I don't know that there's been  
10 anything provided to those employees in the way  
11 of transition or in the way of a new job.

12           And what I also say is true is that  
13 we have imported dirtier power from Pennsylvania,  
14 from New Jersey, that has lower standards than  
15 New York, and yet we've cost ourselves jobs and  
16 imported jobs in the energy sector to other  
17 states.

18           And I think this is going to be more  
19 of the same. I think we've abdicated our role.  
20 The Legislature could act, but I think -- and  
21 I've seen it in my five years here, both sides,  
22 guilty -- we have abdicated our responsibility to  
23 make hard decisions, and we're going to punt it  
24 to a bunch of unelected bureaucrats. Technical  
25 experts, no doubt, but people who don't answer to

1 the people who put us here.

2           So if gas prices -- if we're going  
3 to go to electric cars, we're going to increase  
4 taxes on fuel, on fossil fuels, that should be  
5 something that we answer to. That should be  
6 something we do, not unelected bureaucrats or  
7 technical experts.

8           I also happen to represent Lake  
9 Ontario, and I've seen what good-intentioned  
10 plans can do to communities. Because that plan,  
11 Plan 2014, was a well-intentioned plan that was  
12 supposed to be good for the environment and be  
13 good for habitat. And what it's doing is it's  
14 creating wetlands out of communities that I  
15 represent.

16           And so I think there's a lot of  
17 workers, people on the labor side, who simply  
18 don't -- it's little consolation, folks, when  
19 they don't know how they're going to pay for the  
20 next mortgage payment or put food on the table,  
21 but you're being told: But don't worry, you're  
22 saving the planet. China, India, South  
23 America -- but New York State's going to fix the  
24 climate all by herself. When all we're really  
25 going to be doing is putting hardworking people

1 out of work.

2 I think this plan goes way too far.  
3 It is very aggressive. This is going to be  
4 especially harmful to upstate New York yet again.  
5 Yet again.

6 And so I urge all of my colleagues  
7 to vote no on this legislation. This is a  
8 harmful bill passed in the wee hours of the  
9 evening. It's going to be bad for the economy.  
10 It's going to be bad for working men and women.  
11 And we're going to be living with the effects of  
12 that -- when many of us are gone, those technical  
13 experts, those unelected bureaucrats will be  
14 still making this roadmap as we move along trying  
15 to make New York State a hundred percent  
16 carbon-neutral or carbon-free. And there's a  
17 real, I think, doubt whether we ever get there.

18 And so for those reasons,  
19 Mr. President, I will be in the negative.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
21 Flanagan on the bill.

22 SENATOR FLANAGAN: Thank you,  
23 Mr. President.

24 As I was listening to Senator Ortt  
25 and Senator Kaminsky, I was also trying to read.

1 On a Rules agenda with a combined at least  
2 140 bills, even the most studious amongst us has  
3 to pick and choose what you're going to spend  
4 time reading or preparing for. And this bill  
5 happened to pique my interest.

6 And with all the things going on,  
7 and a variety of different bills that will come  
8 before us tonight, appointments tomorrow, more  
9 big pieces of legislation tomorrow, I think I've  
10 found myself in a position like a lot of people,  
11 including the members in this house and I'm sure  
12 in the Assembly.

13 I have a copy of an article that  
14 appeared today -- I have to flip it over to get  
15 to all the parts that are in here -- but it  
16 appeared today in the New York Times. And not to  
17 the fact that it's the New York Times, but the  
18 fact that I would have to rely on a media account  
19 to get some discernible information about a piece  
20 of legislation of this magnitude that is being  
21 described as -- let me quote -- the most  
22 aggressive climate change program in the  
23 United States of America, period. That's a quote  
24 by Governor Cuomo.

25 By the way, Senator Kaminsky, very



1 nice picture of you in the New York Times. I did  
2 see that as part of the article.

3 But I also read in here some facts  
4 that I think are daunting, to say the least. And  
5 part of it says, to dovetail on what Senator Ortt  
6 said, "the challenge of reaching such goals are  
7 daunting. New York has so far only managed to  
8 reduce its emissions 8 percent between 1990 and  
9 2015, according to the most recent state  
10 inventory."

11 Gavin Donohue, from the Independent  
12 Power Producers, said "New Yorkers are going to  
13 pay a lot for their electricity because of this  
14 bill, there's no doubt about that."

15 So I thought, let me take -- you  
16 know what, if I can't get to every component of  
17 the bill, let me at least start by reading the  
18 memo, which has general sections that are really  
19 applicable to all pieces of legislation -- the  
20 title of the bill, purpose of the bill, summary  
21 of the provisions, justification, and the  
22 effective date.

23 I've been here a while. So when I  
24 hear that this is one of the most epic pieces of  
25 legislation that we're going to consider, I

1     couldn't believe that I was looking at a memo  
2     that only slipped onto the back part of the first  
3     page because it mentioned the effective date.  
4     The justification is barely one paragraph. I  
5     repeat, barely one paragraph. And of course it  
6     blames the federal government, among other  
7     things.

8                     And I look at this and I think, we  
9     are putting ourselves in a very precarious  
10    position, in my opinion. And I'm very nervous  
11    about where are we going, particularly in light  
12    of a number of other pieces of legislation that  
13    have been considered and are being considered  
14    right now.

15                    In our conference, which just took  
16    place before we got out here, we tried in earnest  
17    to have a real discussion about what's contained  
18    in this legislation. And I'm a realist. I  
19    understand that sometimes things happen at the  
20    end, and they happen for a variety of reasons.  
21    But today is June 18th. And just to make sure I  
22    wasn't wrong, I looked at the bill, and the date  
23    on the bill was June 18th. So this bill was  
24    introduced today. And for some unknown reason,  
25    we have to have a message of necessity to pass

1     this bill today -- not tomorrow, not even the  
2     next day, but it's got to be done today.

3                 I don't think that's really working  
4     the way it should, because there are a lot of  
5     unanswered questions. And I see here some of the  
6     comments that say New York gets about 60 percent  
7     of its electricity from carbon-free sources, most  
8     of it from hydroelectric dams and nuclear power  
9     plants. And there's been a whole variety of  
10    things that have occurred under the Cuomo  
11    administration in terms of energy policy, and  
12    many of them just have flat out not worked,  
13    period.

14                So here we're talking about, you  
15    know, reducing our carbon footprint, going to  
16    zero emissions, going to 30 percent, going to  
17    50 percent, doing it by a date certain, getting  
18    to 85 percent and then getting to a hundred  
19    percent.

20                The Governor, some will laud him and  
21    give him credit for forcing the closure of a  
22    nuclear power plant -- that was carbon-free, zero  
23    emissions, and provided 2200 megawatts of  
24    power -- with no alternative, none.

25                Senator Ortt referred to the

1     hardworking families, and people are talking  
2     about workers and they're talking about  
3     protecting them and how they're on the front  
4     lines. And this bill -- actually, one of the few  
5     specific things in here is that there's going to  
6     be prevailing wage. That in and of itself can  
7     engender an hours-long debate. But I'm a little  
8     concerned that prevailing wage may become a moot  
9     point because you really can't have prevailing  
10    wage if you don't have a job. And if we don't  
11    have jobs in this sector of our economy, how are  
12    we going to deal with these issues?

13                 The real point that I want to focus  
14    on is this council or this committee. Now, I  
15    want to be clear, too. I don't doubt for one  
16    second the sponsor's intentions. Not at all.  
17    And there's a whole litany of sponsors in both  
18    houses on this legislation. But I chafe at the  
19    notion that we're going to appoint a council with  
20    22 members -- and yes, it has some legislative  
21    representatives. But they're getting all the  
22    power.

23                 Here we have had long debates about  
24    the equivalency and the prerogative and the  
25    stature of the legislative branch of government,

1 and now we're giving it away. We're giving it  
2 away to unelected bureaucrats. And I'll repeat  
3 that: Unelected bureaucrats. I don't care how  
4 talented they are, what kind of experience they  
5 have. They don't run for office the way we do.  
6 They don't have to be directly responsible to the  
7 public the way we do. They don't have to go back  
8 home to a Chamber of Commerce or a not-for-profit  
9 or a small business owner and say, Yeah, you  
10 know, God, I really -- I'm sorry that the DEC has  
11 said you can't have that kind of furnace anymore,  
12 that you can't use oil, that you have to use wind  
13 power or solar power. And if it costs four or  
14 five times more, you've just got to suck it up.

15 I think it's wrong to do something  
16 of this magnitude in such a short period of time,  
17 particularly when we're giving away our  
18 jurisdiction and our sovereignty as the  
19 legislative branch of government to these folks  
20 who are going to be making these decisions.

21 And it says they shall do this, that  
22 they have to promulgate regulations that force  
23 the recommendations of this unelected committee  
24 of state bureaucrats.

25 I don't want to go home and talk to

1 my constituents about this and say, This is the  
2 Climate Protection Act -- I forget the exact  
3 verbiage. But I'd rather go home and say the  
4 Legislature said, you know what, if you're going  
5 to invest in solar, because we believe in that,  
6 you're going get a \$2500 tax credit. If you're  
7 going to hire people and you're using green  
8 energy or you have a LEED-certified building,  
9 you're going to get a \$1500 credit per employee  
10 that you hire.

11 I don't see that. And there's some  
12 very talented people right in this room who have  
13 a lot of good ideas. At 11 o'clock at night, in  
14 the zeal and the desire to bring something  
15 forward, I think we're shortchanging this house,  
16 this Legislature, this government, and most  
17 importantly, the people that we represent.

18 Now, I happened to ask one of our  
19 staff, I need to see the bill, is it a long bill?  
20 He said yes, it's about 20 pages. To me,  
21 20 pages is really not a long bill, considering  
22 what we see here in this house. Now, don't get  
23 me wrong, I don't want to have a bill that's  
24 700 pages for us to consider on a moment's  
25 notice. But again, I think one of the reasons

1     this bill is relatively short is because they're  
2     saying all these people, they're all going to get  
3     appointed, they have this responsibility, then  
4     they tell somebody else what to do, and they'll  
5     do it and the world will be fine.

6                     I think we owe our constituents  
7     better. And God knows, I know there are going to  
8     be memos in support and people saying, Oh, this  
9     is it, we've made it. I can't in good conscience  
10    go back to the people I represent and say that  
11    this is going to be in their best interest. I  
12    don't want to have to go back to a homeowner, not  
13    even a business owner, and say, Yeah, this is not  
14    going to work out the way you want it. We had  
15    hoped -- you know, we were trying to get that  
16    100 percent emission reduction, or 85 percent,  
17    but since we only got 8 percent between 1990 and  
18    2015, you know, maybe we'll reach 24, 26 percent  
19    by 2050. Aspirational? Yes. Realistic? No.

20                    And I think the Legislature should  
21    take a much more prominent role in enacting  
22    specific legislation as opposed to delegating our  
23    authority and letting other people make those  
24    decisions.

25                    Again, well-intentioned by the

1 sponsor, I respect that. But I know that we can  
2 do better.

3 Thank you, Mr. President.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
5 Antonacci.

6 SENATOR ANTONACCI: Thank you,  
7 Mr. President. Will the sponsor yield for a  
8 couple of questions?

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Will  
10 the sponsor yield?

11 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Yes.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
13 sponsor yields.

14 SENATOR ANTONACCI: Thank you.  
15 Through you, Mr. President.

16 Does this bill envision any  
17 disposition or discontinuation of any nuclear  
18 power plants and how that will be handled?

19 SENATOR KAMINSKY: So through you,  
20 Mr. President, it does not.

21 But I think that warrants an  
22 opportunity to respond to some of the comments  
23 that were made a minute ago.

24 So let's just remember something.  
25 The CCPA had been around for years --



1                   SENATOR GRIFFO:     Mr. President,  
2 point of order.

3                   Mr. President, Senator Antonacci has  
4 the floor. He asked a question of the sponsor.  
5 I would ask the sponsor to address the question  
6 to the member that's asked that question, not to  
7 divert to a previous statement made by a  
8 different member.

9                   SENATOR KAMINSKY:   Through you,  
10 Mr. President, I'm happy to address my comments  
11 to Senator Antonacci.

12                  SENATOR ANTONACCI:   Thank you,  
13 Mr. President. I think I heard the sponsor's  
14 question {sic}. Can I ask another question of  
15 the sponsor?

16                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   I just  
17 want to respond to that.

18                  Senator Kaminsky can respond the way  
19 he chooses to respond to the question because he  
20 yielded. Senator Griffo --

21                  SENATOR GRIFFO:     I understand that,  
22 Mr. President. I was just saying that if he  
23 chose to have a colloquy on a former member that  
24 spoke -- a member who spoke formerly, then to do  
25 that later, rather than address Senator

1 Antonacci --

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
3 Gianaris.

4 SENATOR GIANARIS: Let's -- the  
5 hour is late. Let's just move on.

6 Earlier in the day we had members of  
7 the minority speaking on resolutions about bills  
8 that weren't even the subject of a resolution.  
9 Let's just try and move along and get on with the  
10 debate, please.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
12 Antonacci.

13 SENATOR ANTONACCI: Thank you,  
14 Mr. President.

15 As I understand the answer to my  
16 question, this plan does not address nuclear  
17 power, so I'd like to ask the sponsor to yield to  
18 another question.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Does  
20 the sponsor yield?

21 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Yes.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
23 sponsor yields.

24 SENATOR ANTONACCI: I've noted in  
25 many media accounts issues involving gas

1 pipelines, especially into the downstate  
2 Westchester area. Does this plan address gas  
3 pipelines in the mobilization of natural gas?

4 SENATOR KAMINSKY: No. Through  
5 you, Mr. President, no.

6 SENATOR ANTONACCI: Thank you,  
7 Mr. President. Will the sponsor yield for  
8 another question?

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Does  
10 the sponsor yield?

11 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Sure.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
13 sponsor yields.

14 SENATOR ANTONACCI: Does this plan  
15 or any language in the bill address our  
16 competition with other states? I note the State  
17 of Pennsylvania, for example, could be, for all I  
18 know, siphoning fracking gas right underneath us,  
19 underneath Binghamton.

20 How are we going to compete with  
21 other states if they don't follow along with this  
22 aggressive agenda?

23 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Through you,  
24 Mr. President. So leakage is something that is  
25 directly addressed here and will directly be

1 addressed by the Climate Council.

2           And of course we realize that we'll  
3 be in competition, but one of the important  
4 things to note is that there were four hearings  
5 held throughout the state on this particular  
6 issue and how we would be able to possibly meet  
7 the lofty goals that it envisioned. And we met  
8 with a lot of people in industry, some of the  
9 same industry that Senator Ortt referenced  
10 before. And it was really important to be able  
11 to have a state that both fosters a green economy  
12 and yet understands that if we make an  
13 uncompetitive atmosphere for our cement plants  
14 and our steel plants and the like, they could  
15 just go somewhere else.

16           And we wish Washington would do  
17 this. It would be so much more efficient if  
18 every state had to play by the same rules at the  
19 same time. But unfortunately, we're not anywhere  
20 close to that right now, and it's a shame.

21           So what we did in this bill,  
22 specifically for this reason, is build in some  
23 flexibility so that those high-intensive energy  
24 producers that have to compete not only with  
25 Pennsylvania but with countries around the world

1 will have a way to continue their operations,  
2 obviously try to be as green as they can be, but  
3 when they get to that point where they can't be  
4 anymore, this provides room for that.

5           And I want to read you a memo from  
6 the Business Council. And if you had asked me at  
7 the beginning of the year whether I would get a  
8 positive memo from the Business Council on this  
9 bill, I wouldn't have believed you. But I  
10 actually kind of did.

11           It's pretty cool. It says: The  
12 proposed transition will ensure that  
13 energy-intensive trade-exposed industries have a  
14 bridge until a global playing field is  
15 established that enables fair competition.  
16 Specifically, the amendments provide a glide path  
17 for manufacturing or energy-intensive  
18 trade-exposed facilities, including but not  
19 limited to glass, steel, cement, auto, metal  
20 casting, food, pulp, paper, aluminum, plastics,  
21 ceramics and chemicals, to a transition period to  
22 bridge toward a low-carbon economy.

23           And we do that by creating a certain  
24 amount of carbon offsets that allow them to make  
25 investments so that their carbon that they have

1 to emit is being captured in other ways. So we  
2 are -- we were certainly very sensitive to that.

3 And this didn't come from nowhere.  
4 This bill did not get written up and dropped on  
5 someone's desk out of the blue. The CCPA has  
6 been around quite a long time. There were  
7 important changes that were made to it, that is  
8 true, but the difference between this version and  
9 versions that were available for days were not  
10 really great at all.

11 The question is, what happened for  
12 10 years? And I really believe that a critical  
13 issue went unaddressed. It wasn't like a plan  
14 last year came really close and failed; there was  
15 no plan. And so we have to make up for lost  
16 time.

17 I wish we didn't have to be this  
18 aggressive, but we have no choice. And that's  
19 what this bill reflects.

20 SENATOR ANTONACCI: Thank you,  
21 Mr. President. Will the sponsor yield for  
22 another question?

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Will  
24 the sponsor yield?

25 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Yes.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
2   sponsor yields.

3                   SENATOR ANTONACCI:    Through you,  
4   Mr. President.  So as I understand the sponsor's  
5   comments, there's been some consideration of  
6   competition.

7                   Along those lines, has there been  
8   consideration of workers that may lose their jobs  
9   as this plan unfolds?  And can you tell me with  
10  specificity where that is in the bill?  Because I  
11  really couldn't find that.  If the sponsor  
12  wouldn't mind answering that.

13                  SENATOR KAMINSKY:    Yes.  Through  
14  you, Mr. President, I will point you to the "just  
15  transition workforce" language.  It's on page 7  
16  of the bill.  And it is on -- right at line --  
17  line 25 references the -- sorry, line 26  
18  references the Just Transition Working Group.  
19  It's paragraph 8.

20                  SENATOR ANTONACCI:    Will the  
21  sponsor continue to yield?

22                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Does  
23  the sponsor yield?

24                  SENATOR KAMINSKY:    Yes.

25                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   The

1 sponsor yields.

2 SENATOR ANTONACCI: Does the  
3 sponsor -- so that's the sponsor's consideration,  
4 that there will be some aid or assistance to  
5 workers that are displaced as this plan unfolds?

6 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Yes. If you  
7 look at the -- through you, Mr. President, if you  
8 look at the top of the page, there is an  
9 intensive energy and trade-exposed industries  
10 workgroup that is going to help make  
11 recommendations in the actual scoping plan. So  
12 they're going to be on the ground floor helping  
13 draft this. That's at about line 7 at the top of  
14 page 7. And so their contributions are not just  
15 an amorphous thing out there, they're going to be  
16 right on the ground floor helping determine what  
17 the goals are and how to ensure a just transition  
18 for the workers impacted.

19 SENATOR ANTONACCI: Mr. President,  
20 will the sponsor continue to yield?

21 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Yes.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Does  
23 the sponsor yield? The sponsor yields.

24 SENATOR ANTONACCI: I noticed  
25 there's some language regarding disadvantaged



1 communities. Have those communities been  
2 identified as of now? It's my understanding that  
3 those are communities that may have already  
4 suffered pollution or climate changes. Can you  
5 tell me if those have been identified yet?

6 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Through you,  
7 Mr. President, they have not. The criteria for  
8 what constitutes a disadvantaged community is  
9 listed in here, and the climate justice working  
10 group, which is also established on page 7, will  
11 make those determinations after looking at  
12 historic and present data concerning those areas.

13 SENATOR ANTONACCI: Thank you to  
14 the sponsor. Thank you, Mr. President.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
16 Serino.

17 SENATOR SERINO: Thank you,  
18 Mr. President.

19 I believe the science. I hail from  
20 the Hudson Valley --

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
22 Serino, are you on the bill or are you asking  
23 questions?

24 SENATOR SERINO: Oh, on the bill.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator

1 Serino on the bill.

2 SENATOR SERINO: Sorry. Sorry,  
3 Senator Kaminsky.

4 I hail from the Hudson Valley, where  
5 our natural resources play a major role in all of  
6 our communities. And I know we have a duty to do  
7 all that we can to preserve and protect them for  
8 future generations. I actually want to support  
9 this bill. I want to be able to endorse a plan  
10 that will work for our communities. But this  
11 bill was presented to me for review less than an  
12 hour ago, just like my colleague said.

13 I have faith in many of the groups  
14 that I know will be involved in this task force,  
15 like Riverkeeper and Scenic Hudson. They hail  
16 from the Hudson Valley, from my district. They  
17 do amazing and innovative work on this front.

18 However, the bill that was just  
19 presented to us leaves so many questions  
20 unanswered. And once again, this body has  
21 completely failed to engage the public on this  
22 final version of the bill by rushing it through  
23 the Legislature in the dark of night with no real  
24 warning. I have significant worries about the  
25 lack of checks and balances in this bill, and I

1 worry that it will have negative consequences for  
2 small businesses, workers, ratepayers and  
3 everyday New Yorkers, like Senator Ortt had  
4 talked about.

5 I govern by listening, and we have  
6 not had adequate time to hear from our own  
7 constituents on this critically important  
8 legislation. I don't think that's the right way  
9 to legislate on issues like this. And  
10 unfortunately, while I fully support its intent,  
11 I cannot support this piece of legislation right  
12 now, so I vote no. Thank you.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
14 Lanza.

15 SENATOR LANZA: Thank you,  
16 Mr. President.

17 Mr. President, would the sponsor  
18 yield for a question?

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Does  
20 the sponsor yield?

21 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Yes.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
23 sponsor yields.

24 SENATOR LANZA: Thank you. Through  
25 you, Mr. President. Does the sponsor believe

1     that if we eliminated all carbon emissions  
2     worldwide, let's say, that the climate would  
3     cease to change?

4                 SENATOR KAMINSKY:    Through you,  
5     Mr. President.  So look, clearly there would -- I  
6     don't know whether it would not change, but it  
7     clearly wouldn't change on the trajectory it's  
8     currently on.  And we have to do everything we  
9     can to head that off.

10                So yes, if we could replicate what  
11     we're doing here today worldwide, it would have  
12     obviously an exponentially more beneficial impact  
13     and would impact the climate positively, of  
14     course.  That's the whole point of doing it.

15                SENATOR LANZA:    Would the sponsor  
16     yield?

17                SENATOR KAMINSKY:   Yes.

18                ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   The  
19     sponsor yields.

20                SENATOR LANZA:    Through you,  
21     Mr. President.  So given that the intent clearly  
22     here is to reduce greenhouse emissions, what is  
23     the exact percentage of greenhouse gases should  
24     there be in our atmosphere in order to stave off  
25     or stop climate change?

1                   SENATOR KAMINSKY:    Through you,  
2   Mr. President.   So we know that at the time of  
3   the Industrial Revolution there was 280 parts per  
4   million of atmospheric CO2.   Right now we're over  
5   400.

6                   So I don't know what the exact right  
7   number is, but we're certainly headed in the  
8   wrong direction.   And if our temperature keeps  
9   going up, scientists far smarter than anyone in  
10   this room who go to universities that are pretty  
11   impressive, work at universities that are pretty  
12   impressive, are telling us that it will set off a  
13   chain reaction that will throw us into climate  
14   chaos.

15                  So I can't answer that specifically,  
16   but I clearly know we need to turn the ship  
17   around.

18                  SENATOR LANZA:    Thank you,  
19   Mr. President.   On the bill.

20                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Senator  
21   Lanza on the bill.

22                  SENATOR LANZA:    I want to thank the  
23   sponsor for attempting to address a real issue.  
24   The problem I have with this bill is that I don't  
25   know what I'm voting for.

1                   You know, I love when I hear a  
2   30-year-old or a 50-year-old or a 90-year-old  
3   say, you know, I've never seen it rain this much  
4   in my life. You know, 70 years out of the  
5   billions of years that this planet has been in  
6   existence is irrelevant. And I agree with the  
7   sponsor that the scientists know some things.  
8   And I want to talk about a few facts that are  
9   beyond scientific question.

10                  So the climate -- I -- you know, to  
11   hear people today talk with such surprise and  
12   shock about climate change makes me think about  
13   what the first group of people on earth thought  
14   about and how they acted when someone told them  
15   that the earth was round. You know, for  
16   thousands of years people on earth thought it was  
17   flat. And then one day someone said it was  
18   round. And I'm sure people were just amazed by  
19   that and perhaps in disbelief ran around telling  
20   their neighbors and -- just beside themselves.  
21   And that's funny because the earth was always  
22   round, it's just that people didn't know it.

23                  So the climate scientists will tell  
24   you the climate has always been changing. So for  
25   people to act like we're the first enlightened,

1 intelligent, superior group of people that have  
2 figured this out, well, that's wonderful. You  
3 now know it, but it's always been happening.

4           And how do we know that? So  
5 scientists have proven that there have been at  
6 least five major ice ages over the last few  
7 millennia. In fact, they'll tell you that we are  
8 currently in an ice age, but that we are in an  
9 interglacial warming period that began  
10 11,000 years ago. Yes, it's been warming on this  
11 planet for 11,000 years. Proven science.

12           The sponsor said scientists tell us  
13 that the last time there were this many -- there  
14 was this much greenhouse gas in the environment,  
15 the ocean levels were 14 or 16 feet higher.  
16 Which means there was a last time.

17           We also know that by virtue of the  
18 fact that there are many -- and every year that  
19 goes by, we discover more ancient  
20 civilizations -- cities -- that are underwater  
21 right now, some off the coast of India that are  
22 400 feet below sea level. These cities weren't  
23 built underwater, they were aboveground when they  
24 were built, and the water over time has risen.

25           So again, we should not act as if

1 this is an all-of-a-sudden phenomenon. These are  
2 proven facts. We know even by human migration  
3 throughout the last at least 15,000 years, we see  
4 that humanity has moved from place to place and  
5 has been pushed out of areas -- whether in  
6 South America, in Europe, in Asia, in Africa,  
7 North America -- running away from climate  
8 change.

9                   And I think the interesting thing  
10 about the fact that we've been warming for  
11 11,000 years is that the combustion engine has  
12 not been around for 11,000 years. So we can't  
13 blame completely what it is that we as people are  
14 doing. It's not the car; they weren't driving  
15 cars 5,000 years ago, and yet climate was  
16 changing 5,000 years ago. The earth has been  
17 warming for 11,000 years.

18                   Now, is it true that the more  
19 greenhouse gas you have in the environment the  
20 warmer it gets? Yeah. Is what we are doing on  
21 earth exacerbating or quickening the warming  
22 trend? It makes plenty of sense that that is  
23 possible and that that is what is happening. But  
24 scientists will tell you that the climate change,  
25 the global climate change, these warming and ice



1     ages that have occurred for millennia have more  
2     to do with variations in the earth's orbit, have  
3     more to do with what is known as the earth's  
4     precession.

5             The earth, as we know, rotates  
6     off-axis. That's why we have seasons. The  
7     earth, as we know, also wobbles in 26,000-year  
8     periods. And scientists have now proven that it  
9     is those -- it is the precession, it is the  
10    variation of our orbit, and that it is the  
11    tectonics and the movement of our continental  
12    plates that have more to do with these trends  
13    than anything else.

14            And yes, one of the manifestations  
15    of these climate changes is you see changes in  
16    the greenhouse gas in our atmosphere.

17            Scientists will also tell you that  
18    not too long ago, right here where we are  
19    standing, was covered by two miles straight up of  
20    ice. That ice is not here anymore, it melted  
21    away because it got warmer. And it didn't get  
22    warmer because people were driving cars.

23            I'm not being facetious. I'm not  
24    trying to make light of this. I'm just trying to  
25    say there's a lot more involved than just raising

1 the taxes on what people pay to put gas in their  
2 cars.

3 And I fear the unknown here, because  
4 there is a real issue that we must confront. If  
5 history is any indication, there's going to be  
6 another ice age. That poses more of an  
7 existential threat to humanity than does a  
8 warming trend. The way humanity has avoided the  
9 warming changes in the climate is that they have  
10 moved. I'm not suggesting that people ought not  
11 move. I wish the climate would stay exactly the  
12 way it is. Not this week -- it rains a lot  
13 recently.

14 But I wish it wasn't going to  
15 change. But it is, because it always has. And  
16 that's the next real threat. And if history is  
17 an indication, the history of the climate change  
18 of earth is any indication, we are heading toward  
19 the next ice age. And we know that because the  
20 sponsor is right, the warming has increased. And  
21 that is always what happens. As scientists have  
22 told us, the ice age, the cooling period, lasts  
23 anywhere between 100,000 and a million years.  
24 The warming then takes about 11,000 to  
25 15,000 years. And at the very end of that

1 warming cycle, the warming increases very  
2 quickly. Which is what we are seeing, I'm not  
3 denying that.

4                   What I don't like -- I like the idea  
5 of studying this. We ought to look at what's  
6 happening, why it's happening, how it's  
7 happening. Because I believe, like the sponsor  
8 believes, that the solution is going to be  
9 technology. There's going to be a cost to us,  
10 it's going to be a certain percentage of the GDP  
11 in the next 20, 30, 40, 50 years. I'm not afraid  
12 of spending money. We're going to need to devote  
13 a certain portion of that as we address these  
14 changes.

15                   But I always hear from the left that  
16 the solution is a tax. That's just not going to  
17 do it. And I can't vote for a piece of  
18 legislation that is more mystery than solution.

19                   What's that?

20                   SENATOR RIVERA: A timer. Nine  
21 minutes, 36 seconds.

22                   SENATOR LANZA: Thank you.

23                   Is anyone else speaking,  
24 Mr. President? Has anybody else indicated --  
25 there are? Because I want to defer to them and

1 have the respect. Thank you, Senator Rivera, I  
2 appreciate that.

3           So we don't know what this group is  
4 going to come back and say. I don't think we  
5 should allow anyone to have the unilateral power  
6 to address this problem by telling us you can't  
7 use propane to heat your homes, or oil. We're  
8 going to have a \$10 gas tax, we're going to -- I  
9 mean, I just don't know what they're going to do,  
10 Mr. President.

11           And that's a problem. And I don't  
12 think that's the way we ought to address this  
13 problem of climate change, to give unilateral  
14 power to some group of bureaucrats that could do  
15 whatever they want, right or wrong, to address  
16 this problem. And as we know, and what we read  
17 in the paper, their solution is going to be to  
18 make it more expensive to live in the State of  
19 New York.

20           So again, I want to thank the  
21 sponsor for giving serious thought and attention  
22 to a real problem. I just don't think this  
23 legislation is a solution, because I don't know  
24 what solution this legislation is going to  
25 propose.

1                   Thanks, Mr. President.

2                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     Senator  
3                   Krueger on the bill.

4                   SENATOR KRUEGER:     Thank you,  
5                   Mr. President.

6                   Wow.   Okay, we're not smart enough  
7                   to have this conversation on the floor of the  
8                   Senate, when I just listened to what I just  
9                   listened to.   No, sir, this is not just the  
10                  pattern of history going back and forth and back  
11                  and forth.   Climate scientists universally,  
12                  across the entire globe, have told us that we are  
13                  in a moment of epic crisis for the planet.

14                  So we can pretend we would know what  
15                  to do if we took another 50, 60, 70, 80, 90 years  
16                  to discuss things on this floor, but we don't  
17                  have enough time to go to school to learn all the  
18                  things they already know.

19                  So with all due respect, this is the  
20                  worst drivel I've ever heard on this floor, as we  
21                  are in a crisis.   You can bury your heads in the  
22                  sand, you can say, I don't know if I like the  
23                  bill, I don't want to give away our power to  
24                  scientists or bureaucrats.   I need somebody to  
25                  come up with the answers before you all die and

1 your children die and your grandchildren die.

2           So no, I don't care, we have to act  
3 now. This bill isn't saying exactly what we're  
4 going to do between now and 2050. This bill is  
5 saying we'd better damn well start doing  
6 something fast, something serious fast. Your  
7 island will be underwater as one of the first  
8 things that happens.

9           So yes, you can talk about the  
10 history of the world and cities went underwater.  
11 But how well do you swim? Because it's going to  
12 happen in your lifetime.

13           And we can say but what will happen  
14 for people if their coal plants get closed? We'd  
15 better figure out what to do. I agree, we might  
16 not have figured it out, but you know what? A  
17 green economy might be the best promise for  
18 upstate New York. Because clearly, listening to  
19 you all year after year after year, what we've  
20 been doing has clearly not been working for  
21 upstate New York. And we are putting our entire  
22 planet at risk if we fail to address what we need  
23 to address.

24           And the argument that we need to be  
25 accountable to the people who put us here --

1 well, when the planet dies, who is going to be  
2 accountable to the children and the grandchildren  
3 who won't make it because we were supposed to be  
4 accountable to saying we don't want to make you  
5 have to change anything or do something harder?

6 I don't know if this bill is the  
7 perfect answer. I'm sure it's not. But you know  
8 what this bill does? It allows us to get a  
9 jump-start finally on doing what we need to do.  
10 It says, let's have targets, let's use  
11 responsible people to coordinate and work  
12 together. There are plans to address issues for  
13 the agricultural sector, for the energy sector,  
14 for every sector, because that's what we have to  
15 do. It's all hands on deck. We need to change  
16 what we've been doing.

17 And yes, this bill includes large  
18 segments of information about the commitments to  
19 making sure there are alternative jobs and that  
20 there are investments in the communities who face  
21 the most harm and who will face hard times ahead.  
22 But you know what? We have to pull together and  
23 come up with the answers so that maybe we have  
24 some hard times, but at least we have times. And  
25 at least we have a future. Because if we don't,

1 it doesn't matter anything else we're doing in  
2 this house tonight, anything we've done all year,  
3 anything we do next year. Because if we haven't  
4 saved our planet, the rest is moot,  
5 Mr. President.

6 I say it is time for us to get out  
7 of the way and get the people who know what  
8 they're doing in charge to make sure what needs  
9 to happen happens. I vote yes, Mr. President.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
11 Ranzenhofer.

12 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: Thank you,  
13 Mr. President. If the sponsor will yield for a  
14 couple of questions.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Does  
16 the sponsor yield?

17 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Yes.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
19 sponsor yields.

20 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: I also want  
21 to thank the sponsor for bringing this bill and  
22 this subject matter to the floor of the Senate.  
23 Obviously there's a diversity of opinion, and  
24 it's very interesting to hear a lot of the things  
25 that have already been said.



1                   So when I go back home, you know,  
2 people are going to talk to me about zero  
3 emissions and net zero emissions and what are we  
4 doing in 2030 and what are we doing in 2050. But  
5 they're also going to ask me, from a very  
6 practical point of view, what can I do to help?  
7 What is the state doing for me so that I can  
8 help?

9                   So specifically I wanted to ask you,  
10 is there anything in the bill for either  
11 businesses or individuals that want to purchase  
12 electric vehicles so they can do their part? Is  
13 there anything in this bill for them to give them  
14 any sort of tax credit or any sort of benefit so  
15 they can do their part?

16                  SENATOR KAMINSKY: Through you,  
17 Mr. President. So to be clear, first of all, I  
18 really appreciate the sponsor's question. And  
19 I -- we all need to take those very questions  
20 back to our districts.

21                  SENATOR RANZENHOFER: I couldn't  
22 hear a word he said.

23                  SENATOR KAMINSKY: I appreciate the  
24 sponsor's comments and his sentiments. I think  
25 we should all go back to our districts, trying to

1 have that practical information for the people  
2 that want to do their parts. And that's really  
3 what this is all about.

4 No doubt this legislation is going  
5 to ask people to make sacrifices, and our goal is  
6 to make that as easy as possible. So this bill  
7 directs promulgations for incentives and rebates  
8 for programs just like this, but it does not  
9 itself say what those are or how much they are or  
10 when they'll be offered. But clearly that's  
11 envisioned as part of this.

12 Now right now, whether it's NYSERDA  
13 or other agencies, there are rebate programs  
14 available and there are benefits available that  
15 we could obviously do our best to synthesize into  
16 one place for all of us to use, which I think  
17 would be helpful. But this bill envisions that  
18 on a much larger scale and mandates that very  
19 thing you're speaking of.

20 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: If the  
21 sponsor will continue to yield.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Does  
23 the sponsor yield?

24 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Yes.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The

1 sponsor yields.

2 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: Are those  
3 type of programs that you envision, are those  
4 going to be done by the councils that you  
5 envision in this bill, or will that be a matter  
6 that will come back to the Legislature?

7 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Through you,  
8 Mr. President. This envisions the plan to be set  
9 forth by the council and the agencies to  
10 promulgate regulations to effect the intent of  
11 the council's plan.

12 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: Okay. So  
13 right now there's nothing in the bill --

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
15 Ranzenhofer, do you want the sponsor to yield?

16 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: If the  
17 sponsor would continue to yield.

18 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Yes.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
20 sponsor yields.

21 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: So I  
22 understand that right now in this bill that is a  
23 responsibility that we are delegating at some  
24 future time to one of these councils, rather than  
25 just putting language in the bill that says

1 obviously, you know, we're not doing it -- your  
2 judgment is that whether this administration or  
3 the past administration at the state level has  
4 not done enough, emissions are not down enough.  
5 But there's nothing that we are doing as a  
6 legislative body to jump-start that for  
7 individuals or businesses that say, okay, right  
8 now this is the way it is, but we want to get  
9 things going.

10 To Senator Krueger's point, we can't  
11 wait, so we're going to -- you know, whatever  
12 NYSERDA is doing, we're doing, we're going to  
13 give you double in terms of this type of  
14 incentive to purchase an electric vehicle or some  
15 other thing that could be helpful to the  
16 environment.

17 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Through you,  
18 Mr. President. So to be clear, you know, a lot  
19 of these programs are happening now. There's no  
20 reason why in between now and the time, for  
21 example, the scoping plan is out there several  
22 years from now, that those plans cannot be  
23 created or we cannot create them. Senator  
24 Parker, for instance, has a number of important  
25 bills that create programs for people that have

1 easier access to home solar and other forms of  
2 renewable energy.

3           So we can continue to do those  
4 things. There's nothing that stops it. But what  
5 I want to make clear is this is not just figuring  
6 out how to get solar panels on our roofs, this is  
7 much wider than that. I mean, this is supposed  
8 to encourage, you know, 6 gigawatts of solar, 9  
9 of wind, 185 trillion BTUs of energy efficiency,  
10 3 gigawatts of storage.

11           So we have to be -- you know, if  
12 this is going to start figuring out how we're  
13 getting in all sectors of the economy, all of  
14 this would be a far different document. And we  
15 want this to be done comprehensively with  
16 experts, figuring out how to get there. It  
17 certainly will not be easy, but it doesn't  
18 preclude what you're speaking of in the interim.

19           SENATOR RANZENHOFER: If the  
20 sponsor will continue to yield for --

21           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Does  
22 the sponsor yield?

23           SENATOR KAMINSKY: Yes.

24           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
25 sponsor yields.

1                   SENATOR RANZENHOFER:    I appreciate  
2   the sponsor's answers.  And again, you know, we  
3   have very, very commonsense folks in my district  
4   when I go back home.  I want to know if there's  
5   anything in the bill that will give any sort of  
6   credit or tax incentive for car manufacturers.  
7   We have General Motors, we have Ford in our area.  
8   Is there anything in this for them to encourage  
9   them to retool their plants, to make electric  
10  cars as opposed to cars run with either diesel or  
11  combustion engines?

12                  SENATOR KAMINSKY:    Through you,  
13  Mr. President, there is not.

14                  But make no mistake.  If you're a  
15  car manufacturer looking to sell cars to  
16  New Yorkers or someone looking to bring any type  
17  of green, you know, renewable energy or  
18  carbon-free energy to New York, you wake up  
19  tomorrow morning, this sends a pretty powerful  
20  signal that there's going to be a marketplace for  
21  you.

22                  So we do expect this to have a  
23  serious impact.  But in the meantime, there's  
24  nothing that we can't do that's not complementary  
25  to this or that agencies themselves can't do in

1 order to make it easier. And believe me, there  
2 are very real red-tape challenges right now for  
3 homeowners to have access to solar, simple things  
4 like having it on your energy bill instead of  
5 getting two bills, one from a solar company, one  
6 is your power company. We could do that. We  
7 could do that as -- you know, we're still the  
8 Legislature.

9 But create a scoping plan as to how  
10 to get to a carbon-free economy by 2050 does not  
11 have, in this paragraph F, you can get \$200 off  
12 an electric car. It's just a -- at a kind of a  
13 different level than that. But we can still work  
14 on that stuff.

15 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: If the  
16 sponsor will continue to yield.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Does  
18 the sponsor yield?

19 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Yes.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
21 sponsor yields.

22 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: And I  
23 appreciate the more global level. But, you know,  
24 when people -- when we run a town hall meeting or  
25 we run into people on the street or wherever we

1 are, you know, those are not the type of  
2 conversations that they're going to be asking me  
3 about -- you know, can we get to this level?  
4 It's going to be, number one, what can I do to  
5 help, or how can it help me?

6               So for instance, to your point about  
7 solar, obviously there are programs in the State  
8 of New York, but is there anything specific in  
9 this legislation that would be helpful to either  
10 businesses or homeowners to -- that we can  
11 encourage them to, you know, use a -- you know,  
12 have a green roof, have a solar roof, to  
13 encourage wind power, geothermal?

14              Again, I understand, you know, the  
15 global incentive. But, you know, when I run into  
16 somebody at the supermarket, they're not going to  
17 ask me about parts per thousand, they're going to  
18 say, What can I do to help? You know, what type  
19 of incentive is there for me to help? So I'm  
20 trying to put the very practical and very  
21 specific in -- you know, in conjunction with the  
22 more global.

23              So again, you know, is there  
24 anything specific in this bill for New York State  
25 residents to be helpful to this overall plan so



1     they can retool their house or their business  
2     with, you know, green roofs? I know about the  
3     different LEED programs and stuff like that. But  
4     anything here that's going to be specifically  
5     helpful to them?

6                     SENATOR KAMINSKY: Through you,  
7     Mr. President, I would love to shop at the  
8     supermarkets you are at and have my constituents  
9     come up to me and say, How can I help? I get a  
10    little bit more edgy comments when I'm in -- you  
11    must have that Wegmans that Senator Funke was  
12    speaking about.

13                    (Laughter.)

14                    SENATOR KAMINSKY: Look, I -- this  
15    bill envisions we'll have six hearings, including  
16    three upstate. People will certainly be able to  
17    contribute to how their everyday lives are  
18    impacted by this. But what you are envisioning  
19    is important, it's helpful, we could do it other  
20    ways. But that's not what this bill does.

21                    You are a step ahead of where this  
22    bill is. This bill is going to create a global  
23    program for how to do this in every sector.  
24    Right? So there's going to be a transportation  
25    working group that's going to figure out the best

1 way to have New Yorkers driving electric cars as  
2 soon as possible. You know, they're going to  
3 have economic expertise, they're going to know  
4 the industry, they're going to understand which  
5 communities are impacted, and they will help  
6 promulgate a global theory, instead of us sitting  
7 here in the Legislature figuring out what the  
8 best mechanism is to do that.

9                   So while I appreciate what you're  
10 saying, that's not what this is supposed to do or  
11 meant to do.

12                   SENATOR RANZENHOFER: If the  
13 sponsor will continue to yield.

14                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Will  
15 the sponsor yield?

16                   SENATOR KAMINSKY: Yes.

17                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
18 sponsor yields.

19                   SENATOR RANZENHOFER: And to follow  
20 up on that point, I know one of the things that  
21 the Governor has been trying to do for a number  
22 of years, when you talk about the experts -- and  
23 he has, you know, a lot of experts that work for  
24 him. You know, I know he's tried to implement a  
25 program of charging stations so somebody that has

1 an electric car can actually drive it across  
2 state from Buffalo to Albany or from New York to  
3 Albany. They can't do that right now.

4 So, you know, if you're going to be  
5 divesting the Legislature of this type of  
6 responsibility and putting it into these working  
7 groups run through the administration -- you  
8 know, the administration really, at least in my  
9 tenure and the Governor's tenure, at least on the  
10 promise of, you know, charging stations  
11 throughout the state, so if somebody wanted to  
12 have an electric car, you know, they could drive  
13 it -- you know, I don't have that confidence that  
14 this working group is going to be able to do  
15 anything differently than the Governor has done  
16 over the last 10 years.

17 So what gives you the comfort that  
18 where the Governor has really not accomplished  
19 that result of charging stations so you can drive  
20 across the state in an electric car, what gives  
21 you the confidence that all of a sudden, under  
22 the same administration, that anything would  
23 change on that regard?

24 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Through you,  
25 Mr. President. So with due respect, I find the

1     comments to be a little meretricious because, you  
2     know, the Governor had been trying to set  
3     executive -- through executive order, without  
4     help from one legislative branch, to come up with  
5     a comprehensive solution, it's obviously going to  
6     be a little harder.

7                 But the Governor's goals in respect  
8     to this area were -- are pretty far out ahead of  
9     a lot of other states in this country. We have a  
10    long way to go. This is going to codify those  
11    milestones that are far out, but include interim  
12    ones as well. Right? So we have to be hitting  
13    these targets.

14                And the sky's the limit. We could  
15    have charging stations exponentially more than we  
16    have now. We could have wind turbines up and  
17    down the East Coast of the United States with  
18    their locus feeding into New York. You know, we  
19    are known in this area -- I learned this in one  
20    of the hearings we held -- as the Saudi Arabia of  
21    wind. Who knew? And if we harness that power,  
22    it could do a lot for us.

23                So we just have to, through the  
24    setting of those aggressive goals and the interim  
25    targets and putting our stamp today on the

1 importance of doing this, get there. But if we  
2 don't all agree that this is important and  
3 necessary to do, it's going to be a lot harder.  
4 We all have to have that spirit of urgency.

5 And I was going to wait for my final  
6 comment to wax a little poetic about this, but we  
7 have to take that leap. We have to know that we  
8 have no choice but to get there, whether we can  
9 talk about John F. Kennedy and the moon or the  
10 Marshall Plan or gearing up for World War II --  
11 whatever analogy we want to make or parallel we  
12 want to set -- that's what we have to do here.

13 And this starts that out. And I  
14 agree that we may have fallen short in some  
15 areas, but we can't going forward.

16 SENATOR RANZENHOFER:  
17 Mr. President, one more question for the sponsor,  
18 if he will.

19 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Yes.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
21 sponsor yields.

22 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: How many  
23 different councils or working groups are there in  
24 this legislation? Is there one or are there  
25 multiples?

1                   SENATOR KAMINSKY:    There's a bunch.  
2   Four.

3                   SENATOR RANZENHOFER:   Can you just  
4   tell me what the four working groups or councils  
5   are?

6                   SENATOR KAMINSKY:    Yes.  There's  
7   the Climate Action Council.  There is the Climate  
8   Justice Working Group.  There is the  
9   Environmental Justice Group that's created in a  
10  bill we'll take up in a little bit by  
11  Senator Parker.  And there's the Just Transition  
12  Working Group.

13                  SENATOR RANZENHOFER:  
14  Mr. President, through you, thank you to the  
15  sponsor for addressing those, thank you.

16                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Senator  
17  Jacobs.

18                  SENATOR JACOBS:    On the bill.

19                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Senator  
20  Jacobs on the bill.

21                  SENATOR JACOBS:    Thank you very  
22  much, Mr. President.

23                  You know, when -- growing up in the  
24  Buffalo area, I often remember talking with my  
25  parents about what it was like when they were

1 growing up in the Buffalo area. Usually people  
2 tell stories about their childhood, they say how  
3 great things were, in some ways maybe the good  
4 old days. But actually when my parents used to  
5 talk about the environment, it was not the good  
6 old days, it was the bad old days.

7                Things were a lot worse, actually,  
8 when they grew up in my area, grew up in the  
9 summers on Lake Erie. And they told stories  
10 about how many times when the Bethlehem Steel  
11 plant was fully operational, that the sky was  
12 dark from the soot of 50,000, 60,000, 70,000  
13 workers every day working there. That the lake  
14 was something you often didn't want to swim in.  
15 That when they were children, it was declared  
16 basically a dead lake.

17              Fast forward to today. Our lake is  
18 vibrant, it is beautiful in the summertime. It  
19 is very active, in that people are swimming, they  
20 are boating and doing many things. Even our  
21 Buffalo River, which was so very toxic, is now  
22 clean again and vibrant again.

23              So we have in many environmental  
24 ways made so many gains. And we have actually  
25 made a lot of gains in terms of the discussions

1     that we're talking about here tonight in terms of  
2     energy. We have decreased our CO2 footprint in  
3     terms of energy production in New York State by  
4     40 percent, I believe, one statistic I heard,  
5     since 1990. We are decommissioning or  
6     transitioning coal-fired plants. That's  
7     actually -- many would point to regulations; it's  
8     really more towards the market that has done that  
9     in terms of conversion to natural gas.

10                 So we have made a lot of gains. But  
11     we have a long way to go, as has been mentioned.  
12     But we right now, in terms of renewables and in  
13     terms of power generation, are around 23 percent,  
14     but most of that is hydro, most of that thanks to  
15     the power plant in Senator Ortt's district that's  
16     generating that hydro. We are probably the  
17     greenest area in the state. And  
18     carbon-neutral -- beyond carbon-neutral, because  
19     we're helping others do it.

20                 But we're only around 2 percent  
21     solar and 3 percent wind. And when we're talking  
22     about trying to achieve a goal of getting to  
23     65 percent in 10 years or 11 years, I think we  
24     have to keep that in perspective.

25                 So I want to be optimistic. I want



1 to strive to do better. I want to strive to make  
2 sure that my children are in a better place than  
3 I was environmentally. But I also want to do it  
4 in a realistic way, a way that does not  
5 completely tip over this economy, an economy in  
6 upstate New York that is fragile.

7           So I think that -- the idea of  
8 discussion of a roadmap I think is an excellent  
9 one. But I think the roadmap should be done, we  
10 should gain and garner the information of the  
11 experts, and they should come back to this body  
12 and we talk about the implementation.

13           The other thing I think that roadmap  
14 should be doing is we talked about that we're not  
15 smart enough in this room to devise the roadmap.  
16 Well, I don't know if we're smart enough in the  
17 room to devise the goals. And in this  
18 legislation we're establishing goals here. We're  
19 saying 65 percent by 2030 and 100 percent --  
20 where do we get that from? So I think that  
21 should be part of that roadmap too that comes  
22 back to us. I think that, Mr. President, is the  
23 responsible way.

24           But I look forward to working on  
25 this, because I think it is the issue of our day

1 and we owe that to our children and our  
2 grandchildren. But I believe we need to do it  
3 the right and responsible way.

4 Thank you, Mr. President.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Are  
6 there any other Senators wishing to be heard?

7 Seeing and hearing none, the debate  
8 is closed.

9 The Secretary will ring the bell.

10 Read the last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 14. This  
12 act shall take effect on the same date and in the  
13 same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2019.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
15 the roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
18 May to explain her vote.

19 SENATOR MAY: Thank you,  
20 Mr. President.

21 Human civilization developed over  
22 thousands of years of a stable climate, when the  
23 concentration of carbon dioxide in the atmosphere  
24 fluctuated between about 260 and 280 parts per  
25 million. This allowed the atmosphere to trap

1 enough heat to facilitate the development of  
2 agriculture and to create a climate through the  
3 temperate regions of the world that would support  
4 a vast number of species.

5               Senator Lanza described fluctuations  
6 and ice ages, and he is right. About every  
7 hundred thousand years, and back through  
8 geological time, you can trace ice ages and  
9 peaks. The peaks reached up to almost 300 parts  
10 per million and went down to about 180 parts per  
11 million.

12               But the first time we ever broke  
13 300 parts per million was in 1950. And since  
14 then, we have reached 415 parts per million of  
15 carbon dioxide in the atmosphere.

16               That's 50 percent above what it was  
17 during the entire length of the development of  
18 human civilization and human agriculture. Fifty  
19 percent.

20               This is not normal. This is not  
21 some kind of normal fluctuation, as Senator Lanza  
22 described. This is extraordinary, extreme, and  
23 catastrophic. Scientists, farmers, fishermen,  
24 coastal residents, people who depend on glacial  
25 meltwater for their fresh water, they have all

1     been sounding the alarm for decades. And more  
2     recently, young people have been clamoring for  
3     change, for us to do something. We've had  
4     storms, fires, droughts, floods, invasions of  
5     destructive pests -- and all of this has already  
6     cost us trillions of dollars. We cannot pretend  
7     that business as usual will fix this problem.

8                 The election of 2018 was an  
9     ultimatum from voters in this state and across  
10    the country. No longer will we allow fossil fuel  
11    barons to use their obscene profits to buy  
12    politicians' silence or buy their denial about  
13    global climate catastrophe.

14                This bill recognizes that the great  
15    State of New York is ready to take real action to  
16    lead the nation in changing business as usual.

17                ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Senator  
18    May.

19                SENATOR MAY:    I'll be quick. My  
20    Republican colleagues want to delay, they want to  
21    talk about how much it will cost. I get that.  
22    I've watched politicians cave to that fear and  
23    delay and delay for years and years.

24                The truth is the cost of not  
25    addressing climate disruption is far, far

1 greater. It is the cost of agriculture as we  
2 know it, oceans and shorelines as we know them,  
3 seasons as we know them. It is the cost of our  
4 children's future. And you who have blocked  
5 legislation on this issue for years have made  
6 this much harder, much costlier, and much more  
7 dangerous.

8 I vote aye on behalf of my daughter  
9 and her whole generation and all the generations  
10 to come. And I thank Senator Kaminsky for this  
11 bill.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
13 May to be recorded in the affirmative.

14 Senator Gianaris.

15 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President, I  
16 just want to remind my colleagues, the hour is  
17 late. We have a lot more bills to go after this  
18 one. We do intend to enforce the two-minute rule  
19 on vote explanations for the rest of the evening.  
20 So everyone be aware. Nothing personal, but  
21 we're moving on. Thank you.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
23 Sanders on the resolution -- I'm sorry, on the  
24 bill. To explain his vote.

25 SENATOR SANDERS: I'm glad that my

1 leadership spoke in such a fashion.

2 I'm gladly voting for this bill.

3 First, globally -- after that is such an easy way  
4 to say we need to get rid of speeches and we need  
5 to do the right thing here. And the right thing  
6 is to realize that goal warming is real, that  
7 we're in a process that New York has to lead the  
8 way. And I'm so glad that Senator Kaminsky led  
9 this debate.

10 And if anyone wants to read a very,  
11 very good speech on this issue, I encourage you  
12 to come over here now, because I have it.

13 (Laughter.)

14 SENATOR SANDERS: Mr. President,  
15 you owe me a minute. Thank you very much.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
17 Sanders to be recorded in the affirmative.

18 Senator Hoylman to explain his vote.

19 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Thank you,  
20 Mr. President.

21 I just wanted to also commend the  
22 sponsor and Leader Stewart-Cousins and our  
23 colleagues on both sides of the aisle for finally  
24 recognizing the reality of the science behind the  
25 climate crisis that is underway.

1           Let me just say that it's sad,  
2    though, and I think we should reflect on how long  
3    it has taken us to actually act on this. Years  
4    of debate, years of discussion. Most of the  
5    debate, though, not on this floor. In fact,  
6    Mr. President, I will remind my colleagues that  
7    in 2014, on Earth Day, we had a resolution that  
8    did not even mention the word climate change,  
9    climate emergency, or climate crisis. And we had  
10   a day of bills that consisted of hunting and  
11   fishing in schools, repealing safety tags for  
12   hunters, repealing fees for hunting licenses,  
13   permitting live restraint cables for the capture  
14   of wild animals, and extending striped-bass  
15   fishing season.

16           You would have thought Elmer Fudd  
17    would have come up with that active list, not  
18    someone interested in climate change and making  
19    amends for our misdeeds as a human race.

20           So I commend the sponsor. I proudly  
21    vote aye.

22           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Senator  
23    Hoylman to be recorded in the affirmative.

24           Senator Sepúlveda to explain his  
25    vote.

1                   SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA:    Thank you,  
2   Mr. President, for allowing me to explain my  
3   vote.

4                   Due to pollution and decades of  
5   environmental injustice indifference, the  
6   South Bronx is one of the worst areas in the  
7   nation, the highest rates of poverty, asthma,  
8   diabetes, crumbling infrastructure, and  
9   vulnerabilities to the extreme temperatures and  
10  other environmental threats.  Its waterfront  
11  areas, like much of the rest of the city, are  
12  also increasingly vulnerable to flooding and  
13  storm surges.

14                  But with the CLCPA, there's reason  
15  for hope.  Its holistic approach will invest in  
16  things like workforce training, new energy  
17  efficiencies, innovative infrastructure  
18  development, and incentivizing new behaviors that  
19  are less wasteful and more sustainable.

20                  This is an environmental need that  
21  the Bronx has had for many, many years.  Many of  
22  our children are going to school with asthma and  
23  suffering from all kinds of diseases related to  
24  the environment.

25                  And I commend the sponsor, and I



1     thank the leader for allowing this to come to the  
2     floor, because in areas like the Bronx, this is  
3     extremely necessary.

4                     I vote affirmatively.

5                     ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     Senator  
6     Sepúlveda to be recorded in the affirmative.

7                     Senator Jackson to explain his vote.

8                     SENATOR JACKSON:     Thank you,  
9     Mr. President.

10                    It's now Wednesday morning, and I  
11     say to all of you that the time is now and we  
12     can't wait. Again, the time is now and we can't  
13     wait.

14                    Since before I took office in  
15     January, I long supported the more robust version  
16     of this bill, known as the Climate and Community  
17     Protection Act. A broad coalition of advocates  
18     have come together to draft the boldest climate  
19     legislation in the entire country, if not the  
20     world. In the past several months I have been  
21     proud to champion the racial and economic justice  
22     elements of the CCPA that could ensure our just  
23     transition away from fossil fuels and towards a  
24     green economy for New York State, the Empire  
25     State. That's the name of our state.

1           This bill before us is not that  
2 bill. It's a partial victory. I've said before  
3 you hope for a whole loaf of bread, but if you  
4 can't get the whole loaf, then get half a loaf.  
5 At least you'll eat now in order to have strength  
6 to get that other half.

7           This bill does reduce emissions  
8 significantly to 85 percent, and it promises to  
9 provide some ill-defined benefits to  
10 disadvantaged communities. But these provisions  
11 of racial and economic justice are watered down  
12 in ways that will leave the most vulnerable among  
13 us behind.

14           I hope we can come back together in  
15 January 2020, next year, ready to fill these  
16 gaps. And we must get to zero emissions by 2050,  
17 if not sooner.

18           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Senator  
19 Jackson, how do you vote?

20           SENATOR JACKSON:    May I have 30  
21 more seconds, sir?

22           UNIDENTIFIED SENATOR:    No.

23           (Laughter.)

24           SENATOR JACKSON:    I vote in favor  
25 of this bill. But we must mandate stronger labor

1 standards and job training programs that will  
2 help us accomplish the transition --

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
4 Jackson -- Senator Jackson --

5 SENATOR JACKSON: -- and just and  
6 equitable --

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
8 Jackson to be recorded in the affirmative.

9 SENATOR JACKSON: Thank you.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
11 Ramos to explain her vote.

12 SENATOR RAMOS: Thank you,  
13 Mr. President.

14 I'm voting in the affirmative  
15 because at least 4,000 people die every day in  
16 New York from illnesses related to pollution, and  
17 my district is no exception. Because we have a  
18 facility that spews fossil fuels into our air,  
19 because I have LaGuardia Airport with a bunch of  
20 airplanes whose jet fuel also pollutes our air,  
21 our asthma rates in my district are much higher  
22 than our borough-wide average, which is quite  
23 embarrassing. So for a front-line environmental  
24 justice community like mine, passing this bill is  
25 quite pivotal.

1                   Now, I too have some questions. I  
2 wonder how we'll enforce language on the equity  
3 investments, I wonder how we'll define labor  
4 standards for the transitional jobs that we're  
5 supporting here. And I'd like to have a clearer  
6 timeline to reach that 100 percent reduction in  
7 emissions. And that's something that I think as  
8 a body we'll be working towards.

9                   But what's important is that this  
10 version of this bill, though not as robust as I  
11 would like, lays a real foundation for us to  
12 begin the work of reversing this manmade  
13 disaster.

14                  Thank you.

15                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Senator  
16 Ramos to be recorded in the affirmative.

17                  Senator Ortt to explain his vote.

18                  SENATOR ORTT:    Mr. President, as I  
19 already mentioned, I'll be voting in the  
20 negative. I wanted to just rise real quick,  
21 maybe add a little bit of levity.

22                  I know this is a very serious issue,  
23 and you can hear the passion on both sides, and I  
24 think legitimate on both sides. But earlier  
25 Senator Krueger referred to Senator Lanza's

1 speech or talk as some of the worst drivels she's  
2 heard. Now, I've known Senator Lanza for several  
3 years. That is definitely not the worst drivels  
4 I've heard from him.

5 (Laughter.)

6 SENATOR ORTT: And in fact -- and  
7 in fairness -- I've heard equally bad drivels even  
8 from members in your conference. So in respect,  
9 let's be respectful of all the drivels that comes  
10 out of Albany when we're having this discussion.

11 So, Mr. President, I vote in the  
12 negative.

13 (Laughter.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
15 Ortt to be recorded in the negative.

16 Senator Liu to explain his vote.

17 SENATOR LIU: I wasn't going to  
18 speak, but since everybody seems to be speaking,  
19 I have to say something about this very important  
20 bill.

21 First let me say that from now on I  
22 propose, after midnight, we cut it down to a  
23 one-minute rule.

24 (Reaction from audience.)

25 SENATOR LIU: Start with me.

1           This is our planet. We only have  
2 one chance to keep it. And all the naysayers to  
3 this bill will have said the same things 10 years  
4 ago, 20 years ago, 50 years ago, a hundred years  
5 ago when people started warning what was  
6 happening to our planet.

7           We can do better. This bill doesn't  
8 do everything, but it gets us a long way towards  
9 the goal of leaving this planet a better place  
10 than we got it in the first place.

11           Thank you, Mr. President.

12           Less than one minute. I'm trying to  
13 set a trend here.

14           (Laughter.)

15           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
16 Liu to be recorded in the affirmative.

17           Senator Bailey to explain his vote.

18           SENATOR BAILEY: Thank you,  
19 Mr. President.

20           Senator Kaminsky, thank you for  
21 introducing this legislation. The concept of  
22 this bill is the antithesis of meretricious,  
23 Senator Kaminsky.

24           (Laughter.)

25           SENATOR BAILEY: It's not just

1 South Bronx, Senator Sepúlveda. The North Bronx  
2 as well. The entire borough is the 62nd county  
3 out of 62 counties in so many health metrics,  
4 based upon the studies of the Robert Wood Johnson  
5 Foundation. We're tired of the Bronx being,  
6 except for those folks who are Yankee fans for  
7 some reason, being the worst in everything -- you  
8 know, the worst in everything good and the best  
9 in everything bad. Like we're tired of those  
10 things.

11               Recent reports about the effects of  
12 climate change in the South Bronx and the  
13 North Bronx are very real, Mr. President.  
14 Pollution and air quality are so much lower in  
15 communities of color. And we have to find a way  
16 to make communities of color understand that  
17 climate change is real, that environmental racism  
18 has been happening and it will continue to happen  
19 unless we put a stop to it. And I think this  
20 bill is going to start those necessary  
21 conversations and components of it.

22               You know, I remember, growing up,  
23 watching a cartoon called Captain Planet. And  
24 they said: "Captain Planet, he's our hero, going  
25 to take pollution down to zero." When I was

1 growing up, there were different things about  
2 this planet that still existed and we just aren't  
3 seeing anymore. Captain Planet just can't be a  
4 conversation that we have, it can't just be a  
5 TV show, it has to be something that we live by.

6           You know, growing up, recycling was  
7 new to people. People didn't want to recycle,  
8 when I remember -- like, "Why do we have to put  
9 this damn blue bin out? This is crazy. Why are  
10 we doing this?" But it worked out. Get  
11 comfortable being uncomfortable.

12           I vote in the affirmative,  
13 Mr. President.

14           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
15 Bailey to be recorded in the affirmative.

16           Senator Gounardes to explain his  
17 vote.

18           SENATOR GOUNARDES: Thank you,  
19 Mr. President.

20           You know, hearing this debate I was  
21 a bit stupefied. Because, sure, we can point to  
22 the tens of millions of years of Earth's history  
23 and see the cycles and the flows. But we only  
24 have one shot at this ourselves. And if we don't  
25 act now, there is no tomorrow for the future of



1     humanity.

2                   And those of us who represent  
3     coastal communities know this incredibly well.  
4     Hurricane Sandy, Hurricane Irene, the list goes  
5     on. And what has happened, the catastrophic  
6     effects of climate change on our coastal  
7     neighborhoods -- half of the district that I  
8     represent was wiped out seven years ago by  
9     Hurricane Sandy.

10                   Rising seas, escalating  
11     temperatures -- the threats are real. The  
12     reality is here. We have to act now. This is  
13     the most far-reaching climate change legislation  
14     in the country, dare I say the world, short of  
15     the Paris accords.

16                   And I'm incredibly, incredibly proud  
17     to vote in the affirmative for this legislation,  
18     and I thank Senator Kaminsky for helping to see  
19     this to the finish line.

20                   Thank you.

21                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     Senator  
22     Gounardes to be recorded in the affirmative.

23                   Senator Comrie to explain his vote.

24                   SENATOR COMRIE:     Thank you,  
25     Mr. President, for allowing me to explain my

1 vote.

2 I represent Queens and a district  
3 that's bordered by the Grand Central Parkway, the  
4 Van Wyck Expressway, the Belt Parkway, the  
5 Cross-Island Parkway, that deals with traffic  
6 from Kennedy Airport and the LaGuardia Airport.  
7 We have one of the highest levels of asthma and  
8 bronchitis and other airborne diseases in the  
9 state. Therefore, I'm going to thank Senator  
10 Kaminsky for moving the ball forward, for  
11 creating an opportunity first to have real  
12 discussions, for understanding that this is the  
13 basis for a lot of work that has to be done for  
14 us to be environmentally friendly and for us to  
15 relieve the scourge of airborne diseases in our  
16 community.

17 The environmental justice aspect of  
18 this bill is what has me excited the most. I  
19 hope to see the numbers improve on that as well,  
20 but it's a start.

21 The opportunity to listen to experts  
22 and move around the state is important as well to  
23 make sure that we finally have a bill that can  
24 move the football forward and create an  
25 opportunity to create justice for all, to stop

1 the environmental scourge in our communities, to  
2 make sure that we can fix the asthma problems in  
3 our area, the health problems in our area that's  
4 related to environmental injustice.

5 I also have waste transfer stations  
6 in my district, every negative impact that is  
7 happening in my community. So I vote aye for  
8 this bill. I want to thank the leader for making  
9 sure that this happened. I want to thank Senator  
10 Kaminsky and the working group and all my  
11 colleagues for voting on this today.

12 I vote aye.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
14 Comrie to be recorded in the affirmative.

15 Senator Kavanagh to explain his  
16 vote.

17 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Thank you,  
18 Mr. President.

19 I'll try to adhere to the Liu  
20 post-midnight rule.

21 But I would be remiss if I didn't  
22 join all of those who have just taken a moment to  
23 acknowledge the extraordinary thing we're doing  
24 tonight. It is very rare that you can stand up  
25 and say you are literally changing the trajectory

1 of the climate of the planet. We are literally  
2 taking steps to make sure that our planet is  
3 sustainably habitable into the long term.

4 This has been a long time coming,  
5 tremendous advocacy from many quarters. I spent  
6 a lot of years in the Assembly, you know, pushing  
7 for this and sending it over to this house and,  
8 you know, seeing it not get done.

9 I want to particularly, you know,  
10 honor the great work of our Environmental  
11 Conservation chair, Todd Kaminsky, and our leader  
12 for bringing this together, and all that made it  
13 possible. And I vote aye.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
15 Kavanagh to be recorded in the affirmative.

16 Senator Lanza to explain his vote.

17 SENATOR LANZA: Thank you,  
18 Mr. President.

19 You know, the founders described  
20 something that they feared as a threat to  
21 liberty. They called it the tyranny of the  
22 majority. Let me tell you what it sounds like.  
23 I know, oh, my God, I gotcha. It sounds like  
24 this. "If you don't agree with me, you're not as  
25 smart as I am. If I don't like what you're

1 saying, I'll call it drivel. I don't even want  
2 to listen to you."

3 That's what I heard tonight. It was  
4 a personal attack, and it's exactly what the  
5 tyranny of the majority sounds like.

6 And I'm not going to be lectured  
7 from a Manhattan elected official about  
8 pollution. Because one of the worst  
9 environmental crimes in the history of the state  
10 was committed by Manhattan elected officials when  
11 they took one of the most pristine, most  
12 beautiful, environmentally sensitive areas in the  
13 state -- brackish waters, freshwater estuaries,  
14 wetlands, upland forests -- and they decide to  
15 create an unpermitted, unlined dump where they  
16 deposited their toxic waste. That's what  
17 happened on Staten Island. It was called the  
18 Fresh Kills Landfill.

19 I don't want to be lectured about  
20 the environment. I'll put my environmental  
21 record up against anyone. Since the moment I've  
22 been here, I have advanced alternative energy,  
23 green roofs, solar energy, tax credits for  
24 cleaner energy.

25 I want to compliment the sponsor of

1     this bill. He's sincere, he's earnest. The  
2     problem is real. Senator Ramos is right, we've  
3     got to do all we can to keep our air and water  
4     clean. We're all about making sure we don't  
5     pollute. And I think this is an intelligent and  
6     thoughtful approach to bring people together to  
7     study and understand. Because you're right,  
8     we're not smart enough to figure this out, and we  
9     need the experts.

10                     But there is a lot going on here,  
11     and we ought to get it right and really  
12     understand it and not just walk off with some  
13     talking points --

14                     ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     Senator  
15     Lanza.

16                     SENATOR LANZA:     -- about this is  
17     the problem or that's the problem.

18                     The only objection I have, Senator  
19     Kaminsky, to this legislation is not that you're  
20     going to have experts studying the problem, we  
21     need that, but that they don't report to us with  
22     respect to their findings. I don't want to see  
23     them have the power that is vested here in the  
24     legislative body.

25                     ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     Senator

1 Lanza, how do you vote?

2 SENATOR LANZA: But I appreciate  
3 your efforts.

4 And I vote no.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
6 Lanza to be recorded in the negative.

7 Senator Carlucci to explain his  
8 vote.

9 SENATOR CARLUCCI: Thank you,  
10 Mr. President.

11 I want to thank my colleagues for  
12 supporting this very important legislation.  
13 Climate change is the most important issue of our  
14 time. And our residents have elected us here to  
15 take on the big issues. I'm so proud of this  
16 body for putting forth this legislation that will  
17 really blaze a pathway forward for the rest of  
18 the nation to follow.

19 There's that old adage that I think  
20 is really fitting here tonight, and that's that  
21 discipline weighs ounces, regret weighs tons.  
22 Let's make sure that we're putting the discipline  
23 in now so that we can bestow this reward of our  
24 environment and taking advantage of all the  
25 blessings that Mother Nature has bestowed to us.

1 Let's make sure that we leave that legacy, we  
2 leave those gifts to all the residents of New  
3 York State and all of our children.

4 I'm excited to be voting for this  
5 legislation. I want to thank Senator Kaminsky  
6 for putting it forward, and of course Leader  
7 Andrea Stewart-Cousins for having the leadership  
8 to put this important legislation forward.

9 And let's blaze that pathway  
10 forward. I believe we'll see other states follow  
11 through and truly make a difference in climate  
12 change in this nation and obviously around the  
13 world.

14 Thank you, Mr. President.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
16 Carlucci to be recorded in the affirmative.

17 Senator Kennedy to explain his vote.

18 SENATOR KENNEDY: Thank you,  
19 Mr. President.

20 I rise to support the Climate  
21 Leadership and Community Protection Act.

22 I want to recognize the sponsor of  
23 this bill, Senator Kaminsky, for his diligent,  
24 constant and consistent work in making this  
25 legislation happen. This is far-reaching



1 legislation that is setting the bar, and it's  
2 setting it high. And it's aggressive, yes, but  
3 it is planting a flag for future generations.  
4 It's setting a mark for our country to follow.

5           And quite frankly, as we are moving  
6 forward in ensuring that future generations have  
7 environmental protections that they can count on,  
8 it is ensuring that our children and our  
9 grandchildren have a state that is actually  
10 paying attention to their needs and the needs of  
11 the future.

12           I want to recognize the  
13 environmental advocates that are here, as well as  
14 our leader, Senator Andrea Stewart-Cousins, for  
15 bringing this to the floor.

16           With that, Mr. President, I vote  
17 aye.

18           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
19 Kennedy to be recorded in the affirmative.

20           Are there any other Senators wishing  
21 to be heard?

22           Senator Metzger to explain her vote.

23           SENATOR METZGER: So I think there  
24 is a consensus here that we -- well, mostly a  
25 consensus, I should say. We are -- climate

1 change presents -- it's the greatest crisis  
2 facing our time, and it is the greatest challenge  
3 facing humanity. The entire global economy runs  
4 on fossil fuels.

5           And it can seem incredibly daunting,  
6 the amount of change that we have to make, and we  
7 have to make in a fairly short amount of time. I  
8 mean, we've known about this problem for decades.  
9 And as Senator Kaminsky said, we have not been  
10 doing what we need -- what we've needed to do.

11           But we have to embrace this  
12 challenge, and we are embracing this challenge  
13 today in New York State. And we have to see the  
14 opportunities that it presents, the opportunities  
15 to create, to build a truly clean, healthy,  
16 sustainable economy right here in New York. We  
17 have an opportunity to encourage new investments  
18 in our rural communities that desperately need  
19 new investments, new infusions of capital. We  
20 have the opportunity to create thousands of  
21 good-paying jobs. We have the opportunity to  
22 create real energy security and end our  
23 dependence on fossil fuel imports. There are a  
24 lot of opportunities.

25           But we can't realize those

1 opportunities unless we have a plan. And we have  
2 not had a plan. So this legislation is -- it's  
3 historic. It sets in motion a plan that we have  
4 desperately needed to get us to where we need to  
5 be. It's personally very meaningful, having  
6 worked on this issue for now nearly 30 years.  
7 And I'm really thrilled to be able to go home and  
8 tell my kids that New York State is going to do  
9 something about this crisis.

10 I vote aye.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
12 Metzger to be recorded in the affirmative.

13 Senator Biaggi to explain her vote.

14 SENATOR BIAGGI: Thank you,  
15 Mr. President.

16 Without an addressing of this issue,  
17 none of the other issues that we deal with in  
18 this house -- or in any house, to be quite  
19 honest -- matter. Because without a planet that  
20 is healthy and that can sustain the test of time,  
21 rent laws and other issues that we take up won't  
22 even be relevant because we won't even have clean  
23 air to breathe.

24 I represent a community that spans  
25 from the South Bronx all the way up to

1 Westchester County in Pelham. And when you drive  
2 from Hunts Point to Pelham, the air is different.  
3 The air is cleaner in Pelham, the air is cooler  
4 in Pelham. And in Hunts Point, the air is  
5 dirtier, the air creates so many problems for the  
6 people who live in that community.

7 And I am so proud to be taking such  
8 a bold step forward with all of my colleagues  
9 here today. I commend and am in awe of Senator  
10 Kaminsky and all the work that he's done here.  
11 It is remarkable what we are doing. This is a  
12 giant step forward, and I proudly vote aye.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
14 Biaggi to be recorded in the affirmative.

15 Any other Senators wishing to be  
16 heard?

17 Sealing and hearing none, Senator  
18 Kaminsky, followed by Majority Leader Andrea  
19 Stewart-Cousins to close.

20 Senator Kaminsky.

21 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Thank you,  
22 Mr. President.

23 We're only here today because of  
24 Senator Andrea Stewart-Cousins. And she made  
25 clear from day one that this was an awesome

1 priority, that this Senate was not going to fail  
2 having to undertake this task. She presented me  
3 with this responsibility as chair of this  
4 committee, and entrusted me with this  
5 legislation, and it was quite a daunting task.  
6 Because to be honest with you, when I considered  
7 the full breadth of the legislation in my new  
8 role, I was not sure whether it could be done.

9           And I tried to talk to as many  
10 people as I can who had studied this as their  
11 careers, who are experts in this field. We had  
12 hearings throughout the state where we heard from  
13 factory workers and farmers, from teenagers and  
14 senior citizens and everyone in between. And  
15 many people in our body had far more experience  
16 than I did in this -- Senators Hoylman and  
17 Kavanagh and Krueger had been environmental  
18 champions for decades, and there are many members  
19 in our conference, like Senators Metzger and May  
20 and Salazar and Ramos, who had worked hard in  
21 this area.

22           See, Senator Flanagan, I can name  
23 check as good as anyone.

24           But I -- when I was given this  
25 responsibility, I searched as hard as I could and

1 after hearing and studying as hard as I could and  
2 having these hearings, I was left with the  
3 conclusion that we could absolutely do it and  
4 that we had no choice but to. And so getting  
5 this legislation done was the top priority,  
6 because we could not afford not to do it.

7           And taking this leap that we are  
8 taking tonight is placing faith in the people of  
9 the State of New York, and placing our faith in  
10 doing what must be done, because we cannot go  
11 back. Our air has suffered, our climate has  
12 suffered, and our future will suffer immeasurably  
13 if we don't do something.

14           And so I found myself last weekend,  
15 the owner of a new home, walking out on my street  
16 at night to take out the garbage -- which when  
17 I'm home I definitely have to do -- and I could  
18 hear the ocean. I'm privileged to live in the  
19 community where I grew up, and I'm a block from  
20 the beach. You could hear it roar, I didn't know  
21 that, from where I was. And I turned around and  
22 looked at my house, where my two boys were  
23 sleeping, and it's nice to be near the ocean, but  
24 it's really close when you consider Hurricane  
25 Sandy and other things.

1                   And I then looked at the New York  
2 Times shortly thereafter, and there's a picture  
3 of an Arctic dog sled team -- except the dogs  
4 aren't running on the ice, they're running on  
5 water because the ice is gone.

6                   So when I consider what it means for  
7 our communities and for our world, taking action  
8 is critical, it's necessary, and I'm so proud to  
9 sponsor this legislation and set a bar for the  
10 rest of the country tonight. We can't go back,  
11 we can only move forward.

12                  To the staff that helped put this  
13 together, and this amazing conference, who are  
14 all on the same page with needing to get this  
15 done, to the Assembly and to the Governor and  
16 everyone that makes this happen, this is the  
17 beginning. It's not the end. It's the beginning  
18 of something very important. Let's resolve to  
19 begin today and not look back.

20                  I vote in the affirmative.

21                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Senator  
22 Kaminsky to be recorded in the affirmative.

23                  Majority Leader Stewart-Cousins to  
24 explain her vote.

25                  SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS:    Thank

1     you, Mr. President.

2                     It is really extraordinary being  
3     here. And as we finish off this session, as I  
4     said to so many reporters who asked, "What are  
5     you going to do?", I said "Just stay tuned."

6                     We are doing things that no one  
7     would have thought would be done in this chamber  
8     with the type of attention and intelligence and  
9     dedication that really brings forward results.  
10    And part of that is making sure that the right  
11    people are doing the right things. And tonight  
12    is no different. Tonight we are making, I  
13    believe, once again, a historic move.

14                    It's not as emotional, although I  
15    guess my environmental advocates are probably  
16    like, okay, you know, I got it, I got it. But  
17    you see, they're subtle. You know, it's not like  
18    the cheering and the chanting and the tears.

19                    But as everyone has said, what's  
20    happening here tonight is far and away one of the  
21    most critical things that we have done in this  
22    chamber. Because we are saying what we know:  
23    That we don't know enough to fix it, but for the  
24    sake of your children, Senator Kaminsky, and all  
25    of our children and grandchildren, we have to do



1 something.

2           When I grew up, I grew up in  
3 projects that burnt, you know, garbage because  
4 that's what they did. You've got garbage, you  
5 burn it. You breathe it, you wheeze. What's  
6 wrong? We lived by the river, the Hudson River.  
7 We put sewage treatment plants and garbage and  
8 jails and -- because why do we care about that?

9           And here we are. A bit enlightened,  
10 but still not enlightened enough to face the  
11 crisis that if we don't do something about will  
12 make everything we're doing here moot.

13           That's why, Senator Kaminsky, what  
14 you've done is so important. And that's why when  
15 everybody was checking off lists of everything  
16 that had to be done and forgetting to say  
17 "climate," you would say, What about that? You  
18 never let it go.

19           And the work groups, which is so  
20 much a part of what happens in our conference,  
21 along with you and your leadership -- as you  
22 said, going around the state, hearing from  
23 experts, never relenting -- is what's brought us  
24 here today.

25           And we know that this is not only a

1 first step, but it is a giant step. It's a  
2 leadership step. It's a national step. It is  
3 the step that we begin today with the commitment  
4 to save our planet, to save our future, to save  
5 our children, so that everything we do in this  
6 chamber that is meant to help the people of  
7 New York and beyond will be enjoyed for years,  
8 thousands of years, on a healthy planet.

9 Thank you for your leadership,  
10 Senator. Thank you for again, like everyone  
11 else, not letting us down because we understand  
12 the importance of the work we do.

13 Congratulations.

14 And yes, I vote aye.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:

16 Majority Leader Stewart-Cousins to be recorded in  
17 the affirmative.

18 Announce the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
20 Calendar 1622, those Senators voting in the  
21 negative are Senators Akshar, Amedore, Antonacci,  
22 Felder, Flanagan, Funke, Gallivan, Griffio,  
23 Helming, Jacobs, Jordan, Lanza, Little, O'Mara,  
24 Ortt, Ranzenhofer, Ritchie, Robach, Serino,  
25 Seward and Tedisco.

1                   Ayes, 41.   Nays, 21.

2                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
3 bill is passed.

4                   (Extended standing ovation.)

5                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Senator  
6 Gianaris.

7                   SENATOR GIANARIS:    Mr. President,  
8 pursuant to Rule 5, Section 2, I move that we  
9 remain in session past midnight.

10                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Without  
11 objection, so ordered.

12                  SENATOR GIANARIS:    As it is past  
13 midnight, I should point out that it is now  
14 Senator Serrano's birthday.

15                  (Cheers; applause; singing of  
16 opening bars of "Happy Birthday.")

17                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   All  
18 right, we got it.

19                  Senator Gianaris.

20                  SENATOR GIANARIS:    Mr. President,  
21 can we now proceed to the reading of Supplemental  
22 Calendar 5B.

23                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   The  
24 Secretary will read.

25                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number

1 1475, Senate Print 20, by Senator Parker, an act  
2 to amend the Public Service Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
13 Calendar 1475, those Senators voting in the  
14 negative are Senators Akshar, Amedore, Antonacci,  
15 Boyle, Flanagan, Funke, Gallivan, Griffio,  
16 Helming, Jacobs, Jordan, LaValle, Little, Ortt,  
17 Ranzenhofer, Serino, Seward and Tedisco. Also  
18 Senator Robach. Also Senator Ritchie.

19 Ayes, 42. Nays, 20.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
21 is passed.

22 There is a substitution at the desk.

23 The Secretary will read.

24 THE SECRETARY: Senator Hoylman  
25 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,

1 Assembly Bill Number 481A and substitute it for  
2 the identical Senate Bill 301A, Third Reading  
3 Calendar 1486.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
5 substitution is so ordered.

6 The Secretary will read.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
8 1486, Assembly Print Number 481A, by  
9 Assemblymember Rosenthal, an act to amend the  
10 Public Health Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
14 act shall take effect immediately.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator  
19 Hoylman to explain his vote.

20 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Very briefly,  
21 Madam President.

22 This legislation would expand the  
23 New York State Department of Health's Tobacco  
24 Use, Prevention and Control Program to include  
25 e-cigarettes and liquid nicotine.

1                   We know, Madam President, there's an  
2 epidemic of high school youths using  
3 e-cigarettes. We need to combat the use of these  
4 e-cigarettes such as JUUL and stop a whole  
5 generation of children from becoming addicted to  
6 nicotine.

7                   I vote aye.

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Senator  
9 Hoylman to be recorded in the affirmative.

10                  Announce the results.

11                  THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
12 Calendar Number 1486, voting in the negative:  
13 Senator Ranzenhofer.

14                  Ayes, 61.   Nays, 1.

15                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
16 is passed.

17                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
18 1503, Senate Print 644A, by Senator Boyle, an act  
19 to validate certain acts of the Islip Union Free  
20 School District with regard to certain capital  
21 improvement projects.

22                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Read the  
23 last section.

24                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 4.   This  
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
2   roll.

3                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

4                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Announce  
5   the results.

6                   THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

7                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
8   is passed.

9                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
10   1520, Senate Print 1557, by Senator Serrano, an  
11   act to create a temporary state commission to  
12   study and make recommendations concerning the  
13   incidence of asthma in the borough of the Bronx  
14   in New York City.

15                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Read the  
16   last section.

17                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 6.  This  
18   act shall take effect immediately.

19                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
20   roll.

21                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

22                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Announce  
23   the results.

24                   THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
25   Calendar Number 1520, voting in the negative:

1 Senator Akshar.

2 Ayes, 61. Nays, 1.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
6 1534, Senate Print 1803A, by Senator Rivera, an  
7 act to amend the Public Health Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 30. This  
11 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it  
12 shall have become a law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
22 1535, Senate Print 2062, by Senator Serrano, an  
23 act to amend the Executive Law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
25 last section.



1           THE SECRETARY:   Section 2.  This  
2   act shall take effect on the 90th day after it  
3   shall have become a law.

4           ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Call the  
5   roll.

6           (The Secretary called the roll.)

7           ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Announce  
8   the results.

9           THE SECRETARY:   In relation to  
10   Calendar Number 1535, voting in the negative:  
11   Senator Akshar.

12           Ayes, 61.  Nays, 1.

13           ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   The bill  
14   is passed.

15           There is a substitution at the desk.

16           The Secretary will read.

17           THE SECRETARY:   Senator Hoylman  
18   moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,  
19   Assembly Bill Number 1204A and substitute it for  
20   the identical Senate Bill 2279A, Third Reading  
21   Calendar 1536.

22           ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   The  
23   substitution is so ordered.

24           The Secretary will read.

25           THE SECRETARY:   Calendar Number

1 1536, Assembly Print Number 1204A, by  
2 Assemblymember Peoples-Stokes, an act to amend  
3 the Public Health Law and the Executive Law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
7 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it  
8 shall have become a law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
13 the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
15 Calendar 1536, those Senators voting in the  
16 negative are Senators Gallivan, Jacobs and Ortt.

17 Ayes, 59. Nays, 3.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
21 1537, Senate Print 3020, by Senator Kennedy, an  
22 act to amend the Transportation Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This

1 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it  
2 shall have become a law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
10 is passed.

11 There is a substitution at the desk.

12 The Secretary will read.

13 THE SECRETARY: Senator Myrie moves  
14 to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,  
15 Assembly Bill Number 120 and substitute it for  
16 the identical Senate Bill 3133, Third Reading  
17 Calendar 1538.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
19 substitution is so ordered.

20 The Secretary will read.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
22 1538, Assembly Print Number 120, by  
23 Assemblymember Buchwald, an act to amend the  
24 Election Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
3 act shall take effect on the 15th of December.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
10 Calendar Number 1538, those Senators voting in  
11 the negative are Senators Akshar, Amedore, Boyle,  
12 Flanagan, Funke, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming,  
13 Jacobs, Jordan, Lanza, LaValle, Little, O'Mara,  
14 Ortt, Ranzenhofer, Ritchie, Robach, Serino and  
15 Seward.

16 Ayes, 42. Nays, 20.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
20 1539, Senate Print 3254, by Senator Parker, an  
21 act to amend Not-For-Profit Corporation Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
25 act shall take effect November 11, 2020.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
2   roll.

3                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

4                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Announce  
5   the results.

6                   THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

7                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
8   is passed.

9                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
10   1540, Senate Print 3571, by Senator Serrano, an  
11   act to amend the Parks, Recreation and Historic  
12   Preservation Law.

13                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Read the  
14   last section.

15                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.  This  
16   act shall take effect on the 180th day after it  
17   shall have become a law.

18                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
19   roll.

20                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

21                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Announce  
22   the results.

23                  THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
24   Calendar Number 1540, those Senators voting in  
25   the negative are Senators Akshar, Amedore,

1 Gallivan, O'Mara, Ortt and Ranzenhofer.

2 Ayes, 56. Nays, 6.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
4 is passed.

5 There is a substitution at the desk.

6 The Secretary will read.

7 THE SECRETARY: Senator Flanagan  
8 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,  
9 Assembly Bill Number 5769A and substitute it for  
10 the identical Senate Bill Number 3735B, Third  
11 Reading Calendar 1541.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
13 substitution is so ordered.

14 The Secretary will read.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
16 1541, Assembly Print Number 5769A, by  
17 Assemblymember Raia, an act in relation to  
18 authorizing the East Northport Fire District to  
19 file an application for a real property tax  
20 exemption.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
6 Calendar 1541, those Senators voting in the  
7 negative are Senators Akshar, Antonacci and  
8 O'Mara.

9 Ayes, 59. Nays, 3.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
13 1542, Senate Print 3907, by Senator Serrano, an  
14 act to amend the Tax Law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This  
18 act shall take effect immediately.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
25 Calendar Number 1542, those Senators voting in

1 the negative are Senators Amedore, Antonacci,  
2 Flanagan, Funke, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming,  
3 Jacobs, Jordan, LaValle, Little, O'Mara, Ortt,  
4 Ranzenhofer, Robach, Serino, Seward, Skoufis and  
5 Tedisco.

6 Ayes, 43. Nays, 19.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
8 is passed.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
10 1543, Senate Print 4031B, by Senator Jackson, an  
11 act to establish a commission for the educational  
12 advancement of multilingual learners in New York.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This  
16 act shall take effect April 1, 2020.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
21 the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
23 Calendar Number 1543, those Senators voting in  
24 the negative are Senators Akshar, LaValle, Little  
25 and Tedisco.



1                   Ayes, 58.   Nays, 4.

2                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
3   is passed.

4                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
5   1544, Senate Print 4048A, by Senator Kennedy, an  
6   act to amend the Highway Law.

7                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Read the  
8   last section.

9                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 3.   This  
10   act shall take effect on the first of April.

11                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
12   roll.

13                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

14                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Announce  
15   the results.

16                   THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

17                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
18   is passed.

19                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
20   1545, Senate Print 4106, by Senator Kaminsky, an  
21   act to authorize Joseph DelGiorno's eligibility  
22   to apply for military service credit in the  
23   New York State Teachers' Retirement System.

24                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Read the  
25   last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This  
2 act shall take effect immediately.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
12 1546, Senate Print Number 4135A, by  
13 Senator Skoufis, an act to authorize the City of  
14 Newburgh, in the County of Orange, to offer an  
15 optional twenty-year retirement plan to  
16 police officer Samuel Kenan Jr.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: There is a  
18 home-rule message at the desk.

19 Read the last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This  
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
6 1547, Senate Print 4189A, by Senator Kennedy, an  
7 act to amend the Transportation Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Calendar  
9 Number 1547 is high and will be laid aside for  
10 the day.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
12 1548, Senate Print 4389A, by Senator Kaminsky, an  
13 act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This  
17 act shall take effect December 31, 2022.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
24 Calendar Number 1548, voting in the negative:  
25 Senator Amedore.

1                   Ayes, 61.   Nays, 1.

2                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
3   is passed.

4                   There is a substitution at the desk.

5                   The Secretary will read.

6                   THE SECRETARY:    Senator Akshar  
7   moves to discharge, from the Committee on  
8   Local Government, Assembly Bill Number 6546 and  
9   substitute it for the identical Senate Bill 4392,  
10   Third Reading Calendar 1549.

11                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The  
12   substitution is so ordered.

13                  The Secretary will read.

14                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
15   1549, Assembly Print Number 6546, by  
16   Assemblymember Lupardo, an act to amend the  
17   County Law and the Tax Law.

18                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Read the  
19   last section.

20                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.   This  
21   act shall take effect immediately.

22                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
23   roll.

24                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

25                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
3 Calendar 1549, those Senators voting in the  
4 negative are Senators Antonacci, Helming, Jacobs,  
5 Jordan, Kaminsky, Lanza, Ortt, Serino and  
6 Tedisco.

7 Ayes, 53. Nays, 9.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
11 1550, Senate Print 4520, by Senator Harckham, an  
12 act to amend the Public Authorities Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
16 act shall take effect immediately.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
21 the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1551, Senate Print 4530, by Senator Parker, an  
2 act to amend the Tax Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
6 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it  
7 shall have become a law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
17 1552, Senate Print 4862B, by Senator Martinez, an  
18 act to amend the Education Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 12. This  
22 act shall take effect immediately.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Announce  
2   the results.

3                   THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
4   Calendar Number 1552, those Senators voting in  
5   the negative are Senators Akshar, Amedore, Funke,  
6   Gallivan, Griffio, Jacobs, Jordan, Little, O'Mara,  
7   Ortt, Ranzenhofer, Ritchie, Seward and Tedisco.

8                   Ayes, 48.   Nays, 14.

9                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
10  is passed.

11                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
12  1553, Senate Print 5035, by Senator Harckham, an  
13  act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

14                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Read the  
15  last section.

16                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 3.   This  
17  act shall take effect on the 120th day after it  
18  shall have become a law.

19                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
20  roll.

21                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

22                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Announce  
23  the results.

24                  THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
25  Calendar Number 1553, those Senators voting in

1 the negative are Senators Akshar, Amedore,  
2 Antonacci, Flanagan, Funke, Gallivan, Griffo,  
3 Helming, Jacobs, Jordan, Lanza, LaValle, Little,  
4 Martinez, Metzger, O'Mara, Ortt, Ritchie, Robach,  
5 Serino, Skoufis and Tedisco.

6 Ayes, 40. Nays, 22.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
8 is passed.

9 Calendar Number 1554 is high and  
10 will be laid aside for the day.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
12 1555, Senate Print 5202A, by Senator Gounardes,  
13 an act directing a study on the impact of  
14 increased minimum wage on eligibility for  
15 income-based services.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This  
19 act shall take effect one year after it shall  
20 have become a law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
25 the results.



1                   THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
2   Calendar Number 1555, those Senators voting in  
3   the negative are Senators Amedore, Antonacci,  
4   Flanagan, Funke, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming,  
5   Jacobs, Jordan, Lanza, O'Mara, Ortt, Ranzenhofer,  
6   Ritchie, Robach, Serino, Seward and Tedisco.

7                   Ayes, 44.   Nays, 18.

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
9   is passed.

10                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
11   1556, Senate Print 5312, by Senator Harckham, an  
12   act in relation to directing the State Board of  
13   Real Property Tax Services to conduct a study on  
14   real property tax saturation.

15                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Read the  
16   last section.

17                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 4.   This  
18   act shall take effect immediately.

19                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
20   roll.

21                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

22                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Announce  
23   the results.

24                  THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
25   Calendar Number 1556, those Senators voting in

1 the negative are Senators Akshar, Antonacci and  
2 Flanagan.

3 Ayes, 59. Nays, 3.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
7 1557, Senate Print 5372, by Senator Comrie, an  
8 act to amend the Real Property Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
12 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it  
13 shall have become a law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
18 the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
20 Calendar Number 1557, those Senators voting in  
21 the negative are Senators Akshar, Amedore,  
22 Antonacci, Flanagan, Funke, Gallivan, Griffio,  
23 Helming, Jordan, LaValle, Little, O'Mara, Ortt,  
24 Ranzenhofer, Ritchie, Robach, Serino, Seward and  
25 Tedisco.

1                   Ayes, 43.   Nays, 19.

2                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
3   is passed.

4                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
5   1558, Senate Print 5439, by Senator Metzger, an  
6   act to amend the Energy Law.

7                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Read the  
8   last section.

9                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.   This  
10   act shall take effect immediately.

11                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
12   roll.

13                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

14                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Senator  
15   Metzger to explain her vote.

16                   SENATOR METZGER:    Since this bill  
17   is right on topic tonight, I just want to briefly  
18   say this legislation directs the NYSERDA chair,  
19   in consultation with OGS, to develop a plan to  
20   convert the state's passenger fleet to electric,  
21   hybrid or zero-emissions vehicles by 2030.

22                   The state has approximately 7,800  
23   passenger cars in its fleet.   It's important that  
24   New York State lead the way, lead by example.  
25   Carbon emissions from the transportation

1 sector -- it's about a third of our total carbon  
2 emissions, so it's an important sector to lead  
3 on.

4 Thank you very much, and I vote aye.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator  
6 Metzger to be recorded in the affirmative.

7 Senator Ortt to explain his vote.

8 SENATOR ORTT: Yes, real briefly.

9 I'm going to be voting in the  
10 negative because I'm going to await the  
11 recommendations of the councils from the last  
12 bill.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator  
14 Ortt to be recorded in the negative.

15 Announce the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
17 Calendar Number 1558, those Senators voting in  
18 the negative are Senators Akshar, Amedore, Funke,  
19 Gallivan, O'Mara, Ortt and Ritchie.

20 Ayes, 55. Nays, 7.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
22 is passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
24 1559, Senate Print 5570, by Senator Martinez, an  
25 act to amend the Executive Law.

1           ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Read the  
2   last section.

3           THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.  This  
4   act shall take effect immediately.

5           ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
6   roll.

7           (The Secretary called the roll.)

8           ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Announce  
9   the results.

10          THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

11          ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
12   is passed.

13          THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
14   1560, Senate Print 5579, by Senator Serrano, an  
15   act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

16          ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Read the  
17   last section.

18          THE SECRETARY:    Section 7.  This  
19   act shall take effect on the 120th day after it  
20   shall have become a law.

21          ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
22   roll.

23          (The Secretary called the roll.)

24          ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Announce  
25   the results.

1           THE SECRETARY:   In relation to  
2   Calendar Number 1560, those Senators voting in  
3   the negative are Senators Gallivan, Helming and  
4   O'Mara.   Also Senator Ortt.

5           Ayes, 58.   Nays, 4.

6           ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   The bill  
7   is passed.

8           There is a substitution at the desk.

9           The Secretary will read.

10          THE SECRETARY:   Senator Kennedy  
11   moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,  
12   Assembly Bill Number 7496A and substitute it for  
13   the identical Senate Bill Number 5604A, Third  
14   Reading Calendar 1561.

15          ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   The  
16   substitution is so ordered.

17          The Secretary will read.

18          THE SECRETARY:   Calendar Number  
19   1561, Assembly Print Number 7496A, by  
20   Assemblymember Peoples-Stokes, an act to amend  
21   Chapter 5 of the Laws of 1997.

22          ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Read the  
23   last section.

24          THE SECRETARY:   Section 2.   This  
25   act shall take effect immediately.

1           ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
2   roll.

3           (The Secretary called the roll.)

4           ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Announce  
5   the results.

6           THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

7           ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
8   is passed.

9           THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
10   1562, Senate Print 5615, by Senator Benjamin, an  
11   act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

12          ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Read the  
13   last section.

14          THE SECRETARY:    Section 4.   This  
15   act shall take effect on the 90th day after it  
16   shall have become a law.

17          ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
18   roll.

19          (The Secretary called the roll.)

20          ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Announce  
21   the results.

22          THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

23          ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
24   is passed.

25          There is a substitution at the desk.

1                   The Secretary will read.

2                   THE SECRETARY:    Senator Carlucci  
3 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,  
4 Assembly Bill Number 7433 and substitute it for  
5 the identical Senate Bill Number 5634, Third  
6 Reading Calendar 1563.

7                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The  
8 substitution is so ordered.

9                   The Secretary will read.

10                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
11 1586, Assembly Print Number 7433, by  
12 Assemblymember Zebrowski, an act in relation to  
13 permitting the Village of Upper Nyack to file an  
14 application for a real property tax exemption.

15                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Read the  
16 last section.

17                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.  This  
18 act shall take effect immediately.

19                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
20 roll.

21                         (The Secretary called the roll.)

22                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Announce  
23 the results.

24                  THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
25 Calendar Number 1563, those Senators voting in



1 the negative are Senators Akshar, Antonacci,  
2 O'Mara and Tedisco.

3 Ayes, 58. Nays, 4.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
7 1564, Senate Print 5649, by Senator Gallivan, an  
8 act to validate certain acts of the Mount Morris  
9 Central School District with regard to certain  
10 capital improvement projects.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This  
14 act shall take effect immediately.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
19 the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
22 is passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
24 1565, Senate Print 5653A, by Senator Metzger, an  
25 act to amend the Public Health Law.

1           ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Read the  
2   last section.

3           THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.  This  
4   act shall take effect immediately.

5           ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
6   roll.

7                               (The Secretary called the roll.)

8           ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Announce  
9   the results.

10          THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

11          ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
12   is passed.

13          THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
14   1566, Senate Print 5696, by Senator Metzger, an  
15   act to amend the Public Service Law.

16          ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Read the  
17   last section.

18          SENATOR GIANARIS:   Lay it aside for  
19   the day, please.

20          ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
21   is laid aside for the day.

22                               There is a substitution at the desk.

23                               The Secretary will read.

24          THE SECRETARY:    Senator Sepúlveda  
25   moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,

1 Assembly Bill Number 591 and substitute it for  
2 the identical Senate Bill Number 5703, Third  
3 Reading Calendar 1567.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
5 substitution is so ordered.

6 The Secretary will read.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
8 1567, Assembly Print Number 591, by  
9 Assemblymember Rosenthal, an act to amend the  
10 Mental Hygiene Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
14 act shall take effect immediately.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
19 the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
21 Calendar Number 1567, those Senators voting in  
22 the negative are Senators Akshar, Antonacci,  
23 Flanagan, Funke, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming,  
24 Jordan, Little, Ortt, Ranzenhofer, Ritchie,  
25 Robach and Seward.

1                   Ayes, 48.   Nays, 14.

2                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
3   is passed.

4                   There is a substitution at the desk.

5                   The Secretary will read.

6                   THE SECRETARY:    Senator Flanagan  
7   moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,  
8   Assembly Bill Number 7560B and substitute it for  
9   the identical Senate Bill Number 5706A, Third  
10   Reading Calendar 1568.

11                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The  
12   substitution is so ordered.

13                  The Secretary will read.

14                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
15   1568, Assembly Print Number 7560B, by  
16   Assemblymember Fitzpatrick, an act in relation to  
17   authorizing the assessor of the Town of  
18   Smithtown, County of Suffolk, to accept from the  
19   Monastery of the Glorious Ascension, Inc., an  
20   application for exemption from real property  
21   taxes.

22                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Read the  
23   last section.

24                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.   This  
25   act shall take effect immediately.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
2   roll.

3                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

4                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Announce  
5   the results.

6                   THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
7   Calendar Number 1568, those Senators voting in  
8   the negative are Senators Akshar, Antonacci and  
9   O'Mara.

10                  Ayes, 59.   Nays, 3.

11                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
12   is passed.

13                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
14   1569, Senate Print 5719, by Senator Jackson, an  
15   act to amend the Education Law.

16                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Read the  
17   last section.

18                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.   This  
19   act shall take effect immediately.

20                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
21   roll.

22                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

23                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Announce  
24   the results.

25                  THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
2   is passed.

3                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
4   1570, Senate Print 5826, by Senator May, an act  
5   to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

6                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Read the  
7   last section.

8                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 3.   This  
9   act shall take effect immediately.

10                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Call the  
11   roll.

12                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

13                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Announce  
14   the results.

15                  THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
16   Calendar Number 1570, those Senators voting in  
17   the negative are Senators Akshar, Amedore,  
18   Jacobs, Jordan, O'Mara and Ranzenhofer.

19                  Ayes, 56.   Nays, 6.

20                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   The bill  
21   is passed.

22                  There is a substitution at the desk.

23                  The Secretary will read.

24                  THE SECRETARY:    Senator Serino  
25   moves to discharge, from the Committee on

1 Finance, Assembly Bill Number 4775 and substitute  
2 it for the identical Senate Bill Number 5829,  
3 Third Reading Calendar 1571.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
5 substitution is so ordered.

6 The Secretary will read.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
8 1571, Assembly Print Number 4775, by  
9 Assemblymember Galef, an act to amend the  
10 Executive Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
14 act shall take effect immediately.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
19 the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
22 is passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
24 1572, Senate Print 5863A, by Senator Jackson, an  
25 act to amend the Education Law.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Read the  
2   last section.

3                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.   This  
4   act shall take effect immediately.

5                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
6   roll.

7                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Announce  
9   the results.

10                  THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
11   Calendar Number 1572, those Senators voting in  
12   the negative are Senators Akshar, Antonacci,  
13   Flanagan, Griffo, Little, Martinez, Ranzenhofer  
14   and Seward.

15                  Ayes, 54.   Nays, 8.

16                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
17   is passed.

18                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
19   1573, Senate Print 5891, by Senator Biaggi, an  
20   act to amend the Elder Law.

21                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Read the  
22   last section.

23                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.   This  
24   act shall take effect on the 90th day after it  
25   shall have become a law.



1           ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
2 roll.

3           (The Secretary called the roll.)

4           ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Announce  
5 the results.

6           THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

7           ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
8 is passed.

9           THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
10 1574, Senate Print 5925, by Senator Kaminsky, an  
11 act to amend the Executive Law.

12          ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Read the  
13 last section.

14          THE SECRETARY:    Section 3.  This  
15 act shall take effect immediately.

16          ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
17 roll.

18          (The Secretary called the roll.)

19          ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Announce  
20 the results.

21          THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

22          ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
23 is passed.

24          THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
25 1575, Senate Print 5955, by Senator May, an act

1 to authorize the City of Syracuse, in the County  
2 of Onondaga, to offer an optional twenty-year  
3 retirement plan to police officer Thomas R.  
4 Nicolini.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: There is a  
6 home-rule message at the desk.

7 Read the last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This  
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
14 the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
19 1576, Senate Print 5956, by Senator May, an act  
20 to authorize Morgan McDole, Baraaka J. Titus and  
21 David Dunlap to elect to participate in the  
22 optional twenty-year retirement plan for  
23 firefighters.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: There is a  
25 home-rule message at the desk.

1 Read the last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This  
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
13 1577, Senate Print 6010A, by Senator Hoylman, an  
14 act relating to granting retroactive eligibility  
15 to apply for enhanced Tier 3 status to former  
16 New York City police officer Mark Rivera.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: There is a  
18 home-rule message at the desk.

19 Read the last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This  
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
6 1578, Senate Print 6023, by Senator Serrano, an  
7 act to amend the Social Services Law and the  
8 Executive Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This  
12 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it  
13 shall have become a law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
18 the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
21 is passed.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
23 1579, Senate Print 6025, by Senator Gaughran, an  
24 act to amend the Real Property Tax Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
3 act shall take effect April 1, 2020.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
10 Calendar Number 1579, those Senators voting in  
11 the negative are Senators Akshar, Amedore, Funke,  
12 Gallivan, Griffio, Helming, Jacobs, Jordan, Lanza,  
13 Little, O'Mara, Ortt, Serino, Seward and Tedisco.  
14 Also Senator Ranzenhofer.

15 Ayes, 46. Nays, 16.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
19 1580, Senate Print 6027, by Senator Gaughran, an  
20 act to amend the Real Property Tax Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
24 act shall take effect April 1, 2020.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
6 Calendar Number 1580, those Senators voting in  
7 the negative are Senators Akshar, Amedore, Funke,  
8 Gallivan, Griffio, Helming, Jacobs, Jordan, Lanza,  
9 Little, Ortt, Ranzenhofer, Serino, Seward and  
10 Tedisco.

11 Ayes, 47. Nays, 15.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
13 is passed.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
15 1581, Senate Print 6036, by Senator Savino, an  
16 act directing the study of the use of blockchain  
17 technology to protect voter records and election  
18 results.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This  
22 act shall take effect immediately.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Announce  
2   the results.

3                   THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

4                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
5   is passed.

6                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
7   1582, Senate Print 6202A, by Senator Savino, an  
8   act to amend the Agriculture and Markets Law.

9                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Read the  
10  last section.

11                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 6.  This  
12  act shall take effect immediately.

13                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
14  roll.

15                                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

16                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Announce  
17  the results.

18                  THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
19  Calendar Number 1582, those Senators voting in  
20  the negative are Senators Akshar, Amedore,  
21  Flanagan, Griffo, Jacobs, Lanza, LaValle, Little,  
22  Ranzenhofer, Robach, Serino, Seward and Tedisco.

23                                   Ayes, 49.  Nays, 13.

24                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
25  is passed.

1                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
2   1583, Senate Print 6226, by Senator Felder, an  
3   act to amend the Public Health Law.

4                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Read the  
5   last section.

6                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.   This  
7   act shall take effect on the 180th day after it  
8   shall have become a law.

9                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Call the  
10   roll.

11                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

12                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Announce  
13   the results.

14                   THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

15                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   The bill  
16   is passed.

17                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
18   1584, Senate Print 6277, by Senator Robach, an  
19   act to amend the Correction Law.

20                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Read the  
21   last section.

22                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 3.   This  
23   act shall take effect immediately.

24                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Call the  
25   roll.



1 (The Secretary called the roll.)  
2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
3 the results.  
4 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.  
5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
6 is passed.  
7 There is a substitution at the desk.  
8 The Secretary will read.  
9 THE SECRETARY: Senator Krueger  
10 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,  
11 Assembly Bill Number 8174 and substitute it for  
12 the identical Senate Bill 6360, Third Reading  
13 Calendar 1585.  
14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
15 substitution is so ordered.  
16 The Secretary will read.  
17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
18 1585, Assembly Bill 8174, by Assemblymember  
19 Buttenschon, an act to amend the Penal Law.  
20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
21 last section.  
22 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
23 act shall take effect on the same date and in the  
24 same manner as a Chapter of the Laws of 2019.  
25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator  
4 Ortt to explain his vote.

5 SENATOR ORTT: Thank you,  
6 Madam President.

7 I'm going to support this bill  
8 because I think it addresses a real concern that  
9 I've heard from my constituents, from school  
10 districts in my Senate district that have  
11 shooting teams, rifle teams.

12 It doesn't do anything to change the  
13 rest of this original legislation that I voted  
14 against and that I feel was a bad bill and  
15 presented real constitutional concerns, which I  
16 outlined in my initial debate with the sponsor.

17 However, this bill, as a stand-alone  
18 bill, is a good bill. It increases access to  
19 guns for young people who are on teams, and to  
20 have access to them, and I think in that regard  
21 it is a good bill. And for those reasons, I will  
22 be supporting this legislation.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator  
24 Ortt to be recorded in the affirmative.

25 Announce the results.

1                   THE SECRETARY:   In relation to  
2   Calendar Number 1585, voting in the negative:  
3   Senator Martinez.

4                   Ayes, 61.   Nays, 1.

5                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   The bill  
6   is passed.

7                   There is a substitution at the desk.

8                   The Secretary will read.

9                   THE SECRETARY:   Senator Kaplan  
10   moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,  
11   Assembly Bill Number 7557 and substitute it for  
12   the identical Senate Bill 6481, Third Reading  
13   Calendar 1586.

14                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Read the  
15   last section.

16                  THE SECRETARY:   Calendar Number  
17   1586, Assembly Print Number 7557, by  
18   Assemblymember D'Urso, an act to amend Chapter 58  
19   of the Laws of 2013.

20                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Call the  
21   roll.

22                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

23                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Announce  
24   the results.

25                  THE SECRETARY:   Ayes, 62.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
2   is passed.

3                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
4   1587, Senate Print 6545, by Senator Jackson, an  
5   act to amend the Private Housing Finance Law.

6                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Read the  
7   last section.

8                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.   This  
9   act shall take effect immediately.

10                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
11   roll.

12                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

13                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Announce  
14   the results.

15                  THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

16                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
17   is passed.

18                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
19   1588, Senate Print 6549, by Senator Carlucci, an  
20   act to amend the Labor Law.

21                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Read the  
22   last section.

23                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.   This  
24   act shall take effect on the 180th day after it  
25   shall have become a law.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
2 roll.

3                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

4                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Senator  
5 Carlucci to explain his vote.

6                   SENATOR CARLUCCI:     Madam President,  
7 thank you.  I just want to explain my vote  
8 quickly.

9                   Right now in New York State women  
10 make up over half of the workforce, but yet are  
11 still paid less than men for the same work, for  
12 the same job.  In fact, on average across the  
13 nation, women make 80 cents to every dollar that  
14 a man brings home.  For women of color, those  
15 numbers are even worse.

16                   This legislation will ban the salary  
17 history question, and it will be one of the  
18 greatest things that we can do to close the wage  
19 gap that currently exists in New York State.

20                   There's a lot of things that we need  
21 to do.  This will be a giant step forward.  Let's  
22 allow New Yorkers to spend more time talking  
23 about their qualities, their experience, their  
24 education, the value that they'll bring to the  
25 company, to the organization.  Let's end the wage

1 gap that exists in New York. This legislation  
2 will help us do it.

3 I vote in the affirmative and want  
4 to thank my colleagues for doing the same.

5 Thank you, Madam President.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator  
7 Carlucci to be recorded in the affirmative.

8 Announce the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
10 Calendar Number 1588, those Senators voting in  
11 the negative are Senators Akshar, Amedore,  
12 Flanagan, Funke, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,  
13 Jordan, Lanza, LaValle, O'Mara, Ortt,  
14 Ranzenhofer, Ritchie, Robach, Savino, Serino,  
15 Seward and Tedisco.

16 Ayes, 43. Nays, 19.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
20 1589 is high and will be laid aside for the day.

21 Senator Gianaris, that completes the  
22 reading of today's Supplemental Calendar B.

23 SENATOR GIANARIS: Can we now move  
24 to the reading of Supplemental Calendar 58C.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The

1 Secretary will read.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
3 1593, Senate Print 1555, by Senator Serrano, an  
4 act to amend the Agriculture and Markets Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This  
8 act shall take effect on the first of January.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
13 the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
15 Calendar Number 1593, those Senators voting in  
16 the negative are Senators Amedore, Gallivan,  
17 Helming, Jacobs, Jordan, O'Mara, Ortt, Ritchie,  
18 Robach, Serino and Tedisco.

19 Ayes, 51. Nays, 11.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
21 is passed.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
23 1594, Senate Print 1951, by Senator Bailey, an  
24 act to amend the New York City Civil Court Act.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
3 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it  
4 shall have become a law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
9 the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
11 Calendar Number 1594, voting in the negative:  
12 Senator Akshar.

13 Ayes, 61. Nays, 1.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
17 1595, Senate Print 2162, by Senator Bailey, an  
18 act to amend the Public Housing Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
22 act shall take effect immediately.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)



1                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Announce  
2   the results.

3                   THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

4                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
5   is passed.

6                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
7   1596, Senate Print 2184, by Senator Bailey, an  
8   act to amend Economic Development Law.

9                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Read the  
10   last section.

11                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 8.   This  
12   act shall take effect immediately.

13                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
14   roll.

15                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

16                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Senator  
17   Bailey to explain his vote.

18                   SENATOR BAILEY:    Thank you, Madam  
19   President.  I know that the hour is late, but I  
20   just wanted to thank the leader for bringing this  
21   to the floor.

22                   I've been a proponent of  
23   worker-owned businesses since my time in law  
24   school, and I am a true believer that employee  
25   ownership is the wave of economic development in

1 the future. Employee ownership leads to higher  
2 wages, more motivated employees, and is just  
3 something that I believe can be a tool in our  
4 economic development in our state, upstate and  
5 downstate.

6           Creating an employee ownership  
7 center in the State of New York is something that  
8 many other states have done. Ohio has an  
9 employee ownership center, Vermont has an  
10 employee ownership center, and Colorado is in the  
11 midst of creating one. I think with the new  
12 businesses that we are hoping to create in this  
13 state going forward, I think that it's important  
14 for us to invest in our workers. And when we  
15 invest in our workers, we invest in ourselves.

16           Organizations such as BCDI, Green  
17 Worker Co-op, and so many other worker  
18 cooperative organizations -- NYC NOWC, the  
19 New York City Network of Worker Cooperatives, the  
20 CUNY School of Law, where I received my legal  
21 training about worker cooperatives and my  
22 professor, Carmen Huertas, who helped me make  
23 this a reality -- I'm trying to get under two  
24 minutes, Madam President.

25           I am very excited about the

1 opportunity for this bill to pass. I had a  
2 chance to go to Spain and study worker  
3 cooperatives in Mondragon, Spain, and you got to  
4 see how an entire ecosystem of economic change  
5 can happen due to worker ownership.

6 I am glad my colleagues are  
7 supporting this, and I proudly vote aye,  
8 Madam President.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator  
10 Bailey to be quickly recorded in the affirmative.

11 Announce the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
13 Calendar Number 1596, voting in the negative:  
14 Senator LaValle.

15 Ayes, 61. Nays, 1.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
19 1597, Senate Print 2701, by Senator Kennedy, an  
20 act to amend the Real Property Tax Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
24 act shall take effect immediately on the 30th day  
25 after it shall have become a law.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
2   roll.

3                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

4                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Announce  
5   the results.

6                   THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

7                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
8   is passed.

9                   There is a substitution at the desk.

10                  The Secretary will read.

11                  THE SECRETARY:    Senator Krueger  
12   moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,  
13   Assembly Bill Number 264B and substitute it for  
14   the identical Senate Bill Number 3171A, Third  
15   Reading Calendar 1598.

16                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The  
17   substitution is so ordered.

18                  The Secretary will read.

19                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
20   1598, Assembly Bill Number 264B, by  
21   Assemblymember Cahill, an act to amend the  
22   Finance Services Law.

23                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Read the  
24   last section.

25                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.  This

1 act shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator  
6 Harckham to explain his vote.

7 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Thank you,  
8 Madam President.

9 I just want to quickly thank  
10 Senator Krueger for her deft handling of this,  
11 Senator Rivera for his involvement. And  
12 certainly I would to thank our leader, Senator  
13 Andrea Stewart-Cousins, for interceding.

14 This was a really challenging  
15 confluence of events and competing stakeholders  
16 that were colliding over a major medical center  
17 in Westchester County. And through the personal  
18 intervention of the Majority Leader and, as I  
19 said, the deft handling by the sponsor and  
20 several other Senators to bring the stakeholders  
21 together to negotiate a settlement that all  
22 parties could live with and work with and yet was  
23 still good for patients and consumers in the long  
24 run, this was, I think, a model of how  
25 legislators should be working together.

1                   So I'm pleased to vote aye.

2                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Senator,  
3   uh, Harckham to be recorded in the affirmative.  
4   I'm sorry, I'm getting tired, I apologize.

5                   Announce the results.

6                   THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

7                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
8   is passed.

9                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
10   1599, Senate Print 3561A, by Senator Kennedy, an  
11   act to amend the State Finance Law.

12                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Read the  
13   last section.

14                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 4.  This  
15   act shall take effect immediately.

16                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
17   roll.

18                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

19                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Announce  
20   the results.

21                   THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

22                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
23   is passed.

24                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
25   1600, Senate Print 4414A, by Senator Kennedy, an

1 act to amend the Highway Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
5 act shall take effect one year after it shall  
6 have become a law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
16 1601, Senate Print 4610, by Senator Savino, an  
17 act to amend the Religious Corporations Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
21 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it  
22 shall have become a law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:     Senator  
2     Savino to explain her vote.

3                   SENATOR SAVINO:     Thank you,  
4     Madam President.

5                   I rise in support of this piece of  
6     legislation.  It's actually been -- I've  
7     introduced this in the past.  It's been kicking  
8     around for several years, for a particular  
9     reason.

10                  The religious nonprofit cemeteries  
11     are not supposed to be in the business of selling  
12     monuments.  We highly regulate the industry of  
13     cemeteries and monument sales and plots because  
14     we want to make sure that people are not taken  
15     advantage of at the most vulnerable point in  
16     their life.

17                  Nonprofit entities can set up  
18     for-profit entities to sell monuments.  For  
19     whatever reason, the archdiocese around the state  
20     has decided not to do that.  They have routinely  
21     violated an agreement that they made with the  
22     State of New York that they would not sell  
23     monuments.

24                  Monuments are sold by small  
25     businesses in this state.  They are highly



1 regulated. There are 400 of them.

2 And so what we've said to the  
3 Catholic Conference and to the Archdiocese and  
4 the Buffalo Diocese: Do what you said you were  
5 going to do years ago when you said you wanted no  
6 part of this industry. If you want to be in this  
7 industry, set up a for-profit arm, like other  
8 nonprofits have, pay the sales tax to the State  
9 of New York. But they have refused to do so, and  
10 that's why we need to pass this piece of  
11 legislation.

12 And I proudly vote in favor of this  
13 legislation, as a Catholic, in spite of being  
14 told by the Archdiocese that they're not happy  
15 with my legislation. What they're doing is not  
16 right, and what we're trying to do tonight is  
17 correct a wrong.

18 Thank you, Madam President.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator  
20 Savino to be recorded in the affirmative.

21 Announce the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
23 Calendar Number 1601, those Senators voting in  
24 the negative are Senators Akshar, Amedore,  
25 Antonacci, Brooks, Flanagan, Funke, Gaughran,

1     Griffo, Harckham, Jacobs, Jordan, Krueger, Lanza,  
2     LaValle, Martinez, O'Mara, Ortt, Ranzenhofer,  
3     Ritchie, Robach, Serino, Seward and Tedisco.

4                     Ayes, 39.   Nays, 23.

5                     ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
6     is passed.

7                     THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
8     1602, Senate Print 4664, by Senator Carlucci, an  
9     act to establish the Toll Advisory Task Force,  
10    and providing for the powers and duties thereof.

11                    ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Read the  
12    last section.

13                    THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.   This  
14    act shall take effect immediately.

15                    ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
16    roll.

17                    (The Secretary called the roll.)

18                    ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Announce  
19    the results.

20                    THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
21    Calendar Number 1602, those Senators voting in  
22    the negative are Senators Antonacci, Flanagan,  
23    Funke, Griffo, Helming, Jacobs, LaValle, Little,  
24    O'Mara, Ortt, Ranzenhofer and Seward.   Also  
25    Senator Serino and Senator Jordan.

1                   Ayes, 48.   Nays, 14.

2                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
3   is passed.

4                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
5   1603, Senate Print 4711, by Senator Parker, an  
6   act to amend the Domestic Relations Law.

7                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Read the  
8   last section.

9                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 6.   This  
10   act shall take effect on the first of November.

11                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
12   roll.

13                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

14                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Announce  
15   the results.

16                   THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

17                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
18   is passed.

19                   There is a substitution at the desk.

20                   The Secretary will read.

21                   THE SECRETARY:    Senator Ritchie  
22   moves to discharge, from the Committee on Civil  
23   Service and Pensions, Assembly Bill Number 6913  
24   and substitute it for the identical Senate Bill  
25   Number 4790, Third Reading Calendar 1604.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The  
2   substitution is so ordered.

3                   The Secretary will read.

4                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
5   1604, Assembly Print Number 6913, by  
6   Assemblymember Barclay, an act to authorize the  
7   City of Oswego, in the County of Oswego, to offer  
8   an optional twenty-year retirement plan to police  
9   officer Zackary Quinones.

10                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   There is a  
11   home-rule message at the desk.

12                  Read the last section.

13                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.  This  
14   act shall take effect immediately.

15                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Call the  
16   roll.

17                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

18                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Announce  
19   the results.

20                  THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

21                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   The bill  
22   is passed.

23                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
24   1605, Senate Print 5023, by Senator Parker, an  
25   act to amend the Education Law.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Read the  
2   last section.

3                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 3.  This  
4   act shall take effect December 1, 2019.

5                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
6   roll.

7                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Announce  
9   the results.

10                  THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

11                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
12   is passed.

13                  There is a substitution at the desk.

14                  The Secretary will read.

15                  THE SECRETARY:    Senator Ritchie  
16   moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,  
17   Assembly Bill Number 7228 and substitute it for  
18   the identical Senate Bill Number 5152, Third  
19   Reading Calendar 1606.

20                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The  
21   substitution is so ordered.

22                  The Secretary will read.

23                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
24   1606, Assembly Print Number 7228, by  
25   Assemblymember Barclay, an act relating to

1     legalizing, validating, ratifying and confirming  
2     a transportation contract of the Fulton City  
3     School District.

4                 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:     Read the  
5     last section.

6                 THE SECRETARY:     Section 2.   This  
7     act shall take effect immediately.

8                 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:     Call the  
9     roll.

10                (The Secretary called the roll.)

11                ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:     Announce  
12     the results.

13                THE SECRETARY:     Ayes, 62.

14                ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:     The bill  
15     is passed.

16                THE SECRETARY:     Calendar Number  
17     1608, Senate Print 5394A, by Senator Jackson, an  
18     act to amend the Education Law.

19                ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:     Read the  
20     last section.

21                THE SECRETARY:     Section 2.   This  
22     act shall take effect on the first of July.

23                ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:     Call the  
24     roll.

25                (The Secretary called the roll.)

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:     Senator  
2 Jackson to explain his vote.

3                   SENATOR JACKSON:     Thank you,  
4 Madam President.

5                   My colleagues, I rise in order to  
6 communicate with you my sponsorship of this bill.

7                   Parents have a right to opt their  
8 children out of state testing. But few parents  
9 know about it, and that's not -- and that's by  
10 design.

11                  The point of this bill is that we  
12 should never be afraid of informing people about  
13 their rights, especially as a forward-thinking  
14 state. New York has not kept pace as a  
15 progressive leader on this issue. Ten states,  
16 including North Carolina and Utah, already have  
17 laws affirming parents' rights to opt their  
18 children out of state tests. I would like  
19 New York to be number 11.

20                  My office has received calls and  
21 emails from parents all over the state telling us  
22 that their children have been intimidated with  
23 undue pressure from school administrators, as  
24 these well-meaning administrators try to keep  
25 their participation rate above the fabled

1 95 percent rate. My chief of staff even fielded  
2 one of these calls today.

3 These stories are heartbreaking  
4 because the students most commonly pressured by  
5 administrators against opting out are those with  
6 special needs and English language learners whose  
7 parents end up frustrated and confused about  
8 their rights.

9 This bill mandates that schools  
10 communicate to parents and guardians in neutral  
11 language their right to opt children out of the  
12 math and ELA tests for grades 3 and 8.

13 This bill is not anti-testing.  
14 Plenty of literature supports the use of testing  
15 as a helpful mechanism for understanding our  
16 students' learning. This bill is about codifying  
17 rights and making sure that parents and guardians  
18 who have those rights are informed about them.  
19 It's insidious that these rights are out there  
20 for us, and the powers that be are hiding them.

21 I want to thank the advocates who  
22 have fought back and informed parents and  
23 guardians of their rights, opt-out grassroots  
24 groups across the state, advocates of all  
25 stripes, and even the New York State



1 United Teachers.

2 I hope that you can hear the call  
3 and support this bill with your vote. I hope  
4 you'll join me in voting aye.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator  
6 Jackson to be recorded in the affirmative.

7 Announce the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
9 Calendar Number 1608, those Senators voting in  
10 the negative are Senators Funke, Little, Martinez  
11 and Montgomery.

12 Ayes, 58. Nays, 4.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
14 is passed.

15 There is a substitution at the desk.

16 The Secretary will read.

17 THE SECRETARY: Senator Skoufis  
18 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,  
19 Assembly Bill Number 2050 and substitute it for  
20 the identical Senate Bill 5547, Third Reading  
21 Calendar 1609.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
23 substitution is so ordered.

24 The Secretary will read.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1609, Assembly Print Number 2050, by  
2 Assemblymember Gunther, an act to amend the  
3 Environmental Conservation Law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
7 act shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
14 Calendar Number 1609, voting in the negative:  
15 Senator Martinez.

16 Ayes, 61. Nays, 1.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
18 is passed.

19 There is a substitution at the desk.

20 The Secretary will read.

21 THE SECRETARY: Senator Martinez  
22 moves to discharge, from the Committee on  
23 Local Government, Assembly Bill Number 1606 and  
24 substitute it for the identical Senate Bill 5609,  
25 Third Reading Calendar 1610.

1           ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The  
2       substitution is so ordered.

3           The Secretary will read.

4           THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
5       1610, Assembly Print 1606, by Assemblymember  
6       Hunter, an act to amend the General Municipal Law  
7       and the Public Authorities Law.

8           ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Read the  
9       last section.

10          THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.  This  
11       act shall take effect immediately.

12          ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
13       roll.

14          (The Secretary called the roll.)

15          ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Announce  
16       the results.

17          THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

18          ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
19       is passed.

20          THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
21       1611, Senate Print 6000A, by Senator Rivera, an  
22       act to amend the Public Health Law.

23          ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Read the  
24       last section.

25          THE SECRETARY:    Section 5.  This

1 act shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
6 the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
8 Calendar Number 1611, voting in the negative:  
9 Senator Lanza.

10 Ayes, 61. Nays, 1.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
14 1612, Senate Print 6048, by Senator Breslin, an  
15 act to amend the State Finance Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This  
19 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it  
20 shall have become a law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
25 the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
5 1613, Senate Print 6110A, by Senator Savino, an  
6 act to amend the Retirement and Social Security  
7 Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This  
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
21 1614, Senate Print 6201, by Senator O'Mara, an  
22 act in relation to legalizing, validating,  
23 ratifying and confirming certain transportation  
24 contracts of the Corning City School District.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This  
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
13 1615, Senate Print 6206B, by Senator LaValle, an  
14 act authorizing the alienation of certain  
15 parklands in the Town of Southampton, County of  
16 Suffolk.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: There is a  
18 home-rule message at the desk.

19 Read the last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 7. This  
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
2   is passed.

3                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
4   1616, Senate Print Number 6228A, by Senator  
5   Stewart-Cousins, an act to authorize the  
6   Commissioner of General Services to transfer and  
7   convey certain state land to the City of  
8   New Rochelle.

9                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    There is a  
10  home-rule message at the desk.

11                   Read the last section.

12                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 6.  This  
13  act shall take effect immediately.

14                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
15  roll.

16                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

17                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Announce  
18  the results.

19                   THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
20  Calendar Number 1616, voting in the negative:  
21  Senator O'Mara.

22                   Ayes, 61.  Nays, 1.

23                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
24  is passed.

25                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number

1 1617, Senate Print 6250A, by Senator Ramos, an  
2 act to amend Chapter 450 of the Laws of 2017.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: There is a  
4 home-rule message at the desk.

5 Read the last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This  
7 act shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
17 1618, Senate Print 6291, by Senator LaValle, an  
18 act authorizing the alienation of certain  
19 parklands in the Town of East Hampton, County of  
20 Suffolk.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: There is a  
22 home-rule message at the desk.

23 Read the last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This  
25 act shall take effect immediately.



1                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
2   roll.

3                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

4                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Announce  
5   the results.

6                   THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

7                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
8   is passed.

9                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
10   1619, Senate Print 6292, by Senator LaValle, an  
11   act to authorize the Town of Brookhaven, County  
12   of Suffolk, to alienate certain parklands and to  
13   dedicate other lands as parklands.

14                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    There is a  
15   home-rule message at the desk.

16                   Read the last section.

17                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 7.  This  
18   act shall take effect immediately.

19                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
20   roll.

21                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

22                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Announce  
23   the results.

24                   THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

25                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill

1 is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
3 1620, Senate Print Number 6312A, by  
4 Senator Kavanaugh, an act to authorize the City of  
5 New York to discontinue the use as parkland of a  
6 portion of real property in the County of  
7 New York.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: There is a  
9 home-rule message at the desk.

10 Read the last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 7. This  
12 act shall take effect immediately.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
22 1621, Senate Print 6340, by Senator O'Mara, an  
23 act to authorize the board of supervisors of  
24 Tompkins County to contract with certain entities  
25 for the development, maintenance or management of

1 affordable housing.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
5 act shall take effect immediately.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
10 the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
13 is passed.

14 There is a substitution at the desk.

15 The Secretary will read.

16 THE SECRETARY: Senator Gallivan  
17 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,  
18 Assembly Bill Number 5442 and substitute it for  
19 the identical Senate Bill 6365, Third Reading  
20 Calendar 1623.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
22 substitution is so ordered.

23 The Secretary will read.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
25 1623, Assembly Print Number 5442, by

1 Assemblymember Goodell, an act to legalize,  
2 validate, ratify and confirm the actions of the  
3 Panama Central School District.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
7 act shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
17 1625, Senate Print 6382, by Senator Ranzenhofer,  
18 an act granting retroactive Tier 3 membership in  
19 the New York State and Local Employees' Retirement  
20 System to Steven R. Grice.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: There is a  
22 home-rule message at the desk.

23 Read the last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This  
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
2   roll.

3                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

4                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Announce  
5   the results.

6                   THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

7                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
8   is passed.

9                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
10   1626, Senate Print 6394, by Senator Carlucci, an  
11   act to amend the Social Services Law.

12                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Read the  
13   last section.

14                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 3.  This  
15   act shall take effect immediately.

16                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
17   roll.

18                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

19                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Announce  
20   the results.

21                   THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

22                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
23   is passed.

24                   There is a substitution at the desk.

25                   The Secretary will read.

1                   THE SECRETARY:    Senator Serrano  
2   moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,  
3   Assembly Bill Number 8136 and substitute it for  
4   the identical Senate Bill Number 6398, Third  
5   Reading Calendar 1627.

6                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The  
7   substitution is so ordered.

8                   The Secretary will read.

9                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
10   1627, Assembly Print Number 8136, by  
11   Assemblymember Englebright, an act to implement a  
12   constitutional amendment authorizing the  
13   placement of public utility lines and bike paths  
14   in the Forest Preserve and establishing a health  
15   and safety land account.

16                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Read the  
17   last section.

18                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.   This  
19   act shall take effect immediately.

20                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Call the  
21   roll.

22                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

23                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Announce  
24   the results.

25                  THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
2   is passed.

3                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
4   1628, Senate Print 6402, by Senator Montgomery,  
5   an act to amend the Penal Law and the Criminal  
6   Procedure Law.

7                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Read the  
8   last section.

9                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 5.  This  
10  act shall take effect immediately.

11                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Call the  
12  roll.

13                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

14                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Announce  
15  the results.

16                  THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

17                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   The bill  
18  is passed.

19                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
20  1630, Senate Print 6423, by Senator Montgomery,  
21  an act to amend the Family Court Act and the  
22  Domestic Relations Law.

23                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Read the  
24  last section.

25                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 6.  This

1 act shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
6 the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
11 1631, Senate Print 6437, by Senator Sepúlveda, an  
12 act to amend the New York City Charter, the  
13 Mental Hygiene Law, and the Public Health Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This  
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
25 is passed.



1                   THE SECRETARY:   Calendar Number  
2   1632, Senate Print 6438, by Senator Gianaris, an  
3   act to amend the Judiciary Law.

4                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Read the  
5   last section.

6                   THE SECRETARY:   Section 2.   This  
7   act shall take effect January 1, 2020.

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Call the  
9   roll.

10                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

11                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Announce  
12   the results.

13                   THE SECRETARY:   Ayes, 62.

14                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   The bill  
15   is passed.

16                   There is a substitution at the desk.

17                   The Secretary will read.

18                   THE SECRETARY:   Senator Persaud  
19   moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,  
20   Assembly Bill Number 6753A and substitute it for  
21   the identical Senate Bill Number 6443, Third  
22   Reading Calendar 1633.

23                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   The  
24   substitution is so ordered.

25                   The Secretary will read.

1                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
2   1633, Assembly Print Number 6753A, by  
3   Assemblymember Eichenstein, an act to amend the  
4   Social Services Law.

5                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Read the  
6   last section.

7                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.   This  
8   act shall take effect immediately.

9                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Call the  
10   roll.

11                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

12                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Announce  
13   the results.

14                   THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

15                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   The bill  
16   is passed.

17                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
18   1634, Senate Print 6451, by Senator Benjamin, an  
19   act to amend the Alcoholic Beverage Control Law.

20                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Read the  
21   last section.

22                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 4.   This  
23   act shall take effect immediately.

24                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Call the  
25   roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
3 the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
5 Calendar Number 1634, voting in the negative:  
6 Senator LaValle.

7 Ayes, 61. Nays, 1.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
9 is passed.

10 There is a substitution at the desk.

11 The Secretary will read.

12 THE SECRETARY: Senator Martinez  
13 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,  
14 Assembly Bill Number 4912 and substitute it for  
15 the identical Senate Bill 6460, Third Reading  
16 Calendar 1636.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
18 substitution is so ordered.

19 The Secretary will read.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
21 1636, Assembly Print Number 4912, by  
22 Assemblymember Garbarino, an act in relation to  
23 permitting the Unitarian Universalist  
24 Congregation of the Great South Bay Sayville to  
25 file an application for a real property tax

1 exemption.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
5 act shall take effect immediately.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
10 the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
12 Calendar Number 1636, voting in the negative:  
13 Senator Antonacci.

14 Ayes, 61. Nays, 1.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
18 1637, Senate Print 6462, by Senator  
19 Stewart-Cousins, an act to amend the Alcoholic  
20 Beverage Control Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
6 Calendar Number 1637, voting in the negative:  
7 Senator LaValle.

8 Ayes, 61. Nays, 1.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
12 1638, Senate Print 6476, by Senator Benjamin, an  
13 act to amend Chapter 538 of the Laws of 2013.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
25 is passed.

1                   THE SECRETARY:   Calendar Number  
2   1639, Senate Print 6483, by Senator Brooks, an  
3   act to amend the Military Law.

4                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Read the  
5   last section.

6                   THE SECRETARY:   Section 2.  This  
7   act shall take effect immediately.

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Call the  
9   roll.

10                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

11                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Announce  
12   the results.

13                   THE SECRETARY:   Ayes, 62.

14                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   The bill  
15   is passed.

16                   There is a substitution at the desk.

17                   The Secretary will read.

18                   THE SECRETARY:   Senator Rivera  
19   moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,  
20   Assembly Bill Number 8053 and substitute it for  
21   the identical Senate Bill Number 6485, Third  
22   Reading Calendar 1640.

23                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   The  
24   substitution is so ordered.

25                   The Secretary will read.

1                   THE SECRETARY:   Calendar Number  
2   1640, Assembly Print Number 8053, by  
3   Assemblymember Reyes, an act to amend Chapter 2  
4   of the Laws of 1998.

5                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Read the  
6   last section.

7                   THE SECRETARY:   Section 2.  This  
8   act shall take effect immediately.

9                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Call the  
10  roll.

11                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

12                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Announce  
13  the results.

14                   THE SECRETARY:   Ayes, 62.

15                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   The bill  
16  is passed.

17                   There is a substitution at the desk.

18                   The Secretary will read.

19                   THE SECRETARY:   Senator Myrie moves  
20  to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,  
21  Assembly Bill Number 8014 and substitute it for  
22  the identical Senate Bill Number 6486, Third  
23  Reading Calendar 1641.

24                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   The  
25  substitution is so ordered.

1                   The Secretary will read.

2                   THE SECRETARY:   Calendar Number  
3   1641, Assembly Print Number 8014, by  
4   Assemblymember Richardson, an act to amend the  
5   Mental Hygiene Law.

6                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Read the  
7   last section.

8                   THE SECRETARY:   Section 2.  This  
9   act shall take effect immediately.

10                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Call the  
11   roll.

12                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

13                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Announce  
14   the results.

15                  THE SECRETARY:   Ayes, 62.

16                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   The bill  
17   is passed.

18                  THE SECRETARY:   Calendar Number  
19   1642, Senate Print 6492, by Senator Rivera, an  
20   act to amend the Public Health Law.

21                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Read the  
22   last section.

23                  THE SECRETARY:   Section 5.  This  
24   act shall take effect immediately.

25                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Call the



1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
9 1643, Senate Print Number 6493, by Senator  
10 Stewart-Cousins, an act to amend the Vehicle and  
11 Traffic Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: There is a  
13 home-rule message at the desk.

14 Read the last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 9. This  
16 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it  
17 shall have become a law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
25 is passed.

1                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
2   1644, Senate Print 6494, by Senator Mayer, an act  
3   to amend Chapter 498 of the Laws of 2017.

4                   SENATOR GIANARIS:   Lay it aside for  
5   the day.

6                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   The bill  
7   is laid aside for the day.

8                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
9   1645, Senate Print 6497A, by Senator Kavanaugh, an  
10  act to amend the Real Property Tax Law.

11                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Read the  
12  last section.

13                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 4.   This  
14  act shall take effect immediately.

15                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Call the  
16  roll.

17                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

18                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Announce  
19  the results.

20                   THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

21                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   The bill  
22  is passed.

23                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
24  1646, Senate Print 6503, by Senator Martinez, an  
25  act in relation to authorizing Christian Worship

1 Center Church of God to file an application for  
2 exemption from real property taxes for a certain  
3 assessment roll.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
7 act shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
14 Calendar Number 1646, voting in the negative:  
15 Senator Antonacci.

16 Ayes, 61. Nays, 1.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
20 1647, Senate Print 6504, by Senator Flanagan, an  
21 act authorizing the Saint Paraskevi Greek  
22 Orthodox Shrine Church to file an application for  
23 a real property tax exemption.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
25 last section.

1           THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.  This  
2   act shall take effect immediately.

3           ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Call the  
4   roll.

5           (The Secretary called the roll.)

6           ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Announce  
7   the results.

8           THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
9   Calendar Number 1647, voting in the negative:  
10   Senator Antonacci.

11           Ayes, 61.  Nays, 1.

12           ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   The bill  
13   is passed.

14           THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
15   1648, Senate Print 6517, by Senator Stavisky, an  
16   act to amend the Education Law.

17           ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Read the  
18   last section.

19           THE SECRETARY:    Section 4.  This  
20   act shall take effect 18 months after it shall  
21   have become a law.

22           ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Call the  
23   roll.

24           (The Secretary called the roll.)

25           ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
6 1649, Senate Print 6518, by Senator O'Mara, an  
7 act to amend the Highway Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This  
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
19 is passed.

20 There is a substitution at the desk.

21 The Secretary will read.

22 THE SECRETARY: Senator O'Mara  
23 moves to discharge, from the Committee on  
24 Transportation, Assembly Bill Number 5563 and  
25 substitute it for the identical Senate Bill

1 Number 6528, Third Reading Calendar 1652.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
3 substitution is so ordered.

4 The Secretary will read.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
6 1652, Assembly Print Number 5563, by  
7 Assemblymember Goodell, an act to amend the  
8 Highway Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
12 act shall take effect immediately.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
22 1653, Senate Print 6529, by Senator Rivera, an  
23 act to amend the Public Health Law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
25 last section.

1           THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.  This  
2   act shall take effect on the same date and in the  
3   same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2019.

4           ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Call the  
5   roll.

6           (The Secretary called the roll.)

7           ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Announce  
8   the results.

9           THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

10          ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   The bill  
11   is passed.

12          THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
13   1655, Senate Print 6547, by Senator Breslin, an  
14   act to amend the Insurance Law.

15          ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Read the  
16   last section.

17          THE SECRETARY:    Section 3.  This  
18   act shall take effect immediately.

19          ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Call the  
20   roll.

21          (The Secretary called the roll.)

22          ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   Announce  
23   the results.

24          THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

25          ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:   The bill

1 is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
3 1672, Senate Print 5908, by Senator Rivera, an  
4 act to amend the Public Health Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the  
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This  
8 act shall take effect on the 120th day after it  
9 shall have become a law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the  
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce  
14 the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
17 is passed.

18 Senator Gianaris, that completes the  
19 reading of today's Supplemental Calendar C.

20 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,  
21 I have a few motions before we wrap up.

22 On behalf of Senator Benjamin, I  
23 wish to call up Senate Print 1130A, recalled from  
24 the Assembly, which is now at the desk.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The



1 Secretary will read.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 67,  
3 Senate Print 1130A, by Senator Benjamin, an act  
4 to amend the Alcoholic Beverage Control Law.

5 SENATOR GIANARIS: Move to  
6 reconsider the vote by which the bill was passed.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
8 Secretary will call the roll on reconsideration.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill  
12 is restored to its place on the Third Reading  
13 Calendar.

14 SENATOR GIANARIS: On behalf of  
15 Senator Carlucci, I wish to call up Senate 4467A,  
16 recalled from the Assembly, which is now at the  
17 desk.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The  
19 Secretary will read.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
21 300, Senate Print 4467A, by Senator Carlucci, an  
22 act to establish a Black Youth Suicide Prevention  
23 Task Force.

24 SENATOR GIANARIS: Move to  
25 reconsider the vote by which the bill was passed.

1           ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The  
2   Secretary will call the roll on reconsideration.

3                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

4           THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 62.

5           ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The bill  
6   is restored to its place on the Third Reading  
7   Calendar.

8           SENATOR GIANARIS:    I offer the  
9   following amendments.

10          ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The  
11   amendments are received.

12          SENATOR GIANARIS:    On behalf of  
13   Senator Bailey, I offer the following amendments  
14   to Calendar Number 628, Senate Print 4980, and  
15   ask that said bill retain its place on the Third  
16   Reading Calendar.

17          ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The  
18   amendments are received, and the bill will retain  
19   its place on the Third Reading Calendar.

20          SENATOR GIANARIS:    On behalf of  
21   Senator Benjamin, I move to recommit Senate Print  
22   1130A, Calendar Number 67 on the order of third  
23   reading, to the Committee on Environmental  
24   Conservation, with instructions to said committee  
25   to strike the enacting clause.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    It is so  
2   ordered.

3                   SENATOR GIANARIS:    Please recognize  
4   Senator Griffo.

5                   ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    Senator  
6   Griffo.

7                   SENATOR GRIFFO:    Madam President,  
8   on behalf of Senator Lanza, I move to recommit  
9   Senate Print 2643A, Calendar 322 on order of  
10   third reading, to the Committee on Investigations  
11   and Government Operations, with instructions to  
12   said committee to strike the enacting clause.

13                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    It is so  
14   ordered.

15                  SENATOR GIANARIS:    Madam President,  
16   Leader Stewart-Cousins hands up the following  
17   committee assignments.

18                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    The  
19   hand-ups are received and filed.

20                  SENATOR GIANARIS:    Is there any  
21   further business at the desk?

22                  ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:    There is  
23   no further business at the desk.

24                  SENATOR GIANARIS:    I move to  
25   adjourn until today --

1 (Laughter.)

2 SENATOR GIANARIS: -- Wednesday,  
3 June 19th, at 11:00 a.m.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: On motion,  
5 the Senate stands adjourned until today,  
6 Wednesday, June 19th, at 11:00 a.m.

7 (Whereupon, at 1:56 a.m., the Senate  
8 adjourned.)

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25