

1 NEW YORK STATE SENATE

2  
3  
4 THE STENOGRAPHIC RECORD

5  
6  
7  
8 ALBANY, NEW YORK

9 April 9, 2019

10 4:10 p.m.

11  
12  
13  
14 REGULAR SESSION

15  
16  
17  
18 SENATOR BRIAN A. BENJAMIN, Acting President

19 ALEJANDRA N. PAULINO, ESQ., Secretary

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
3 Senate will come to order.

4 I ask everyone present to please  
5 rise and repeat with me the Pledge of Allegiance.

6 (Whereupon, the assemblage recited  
7 the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
9 Ahmadullah Kamal, the Imam of the Long Island  
10 Muslim Society in East Meadow, will deliver  
11 today's invocation.

12 Imam Kamal.

13 IMAM KAMAL: Asalamu Alaikum.  
14 Peace be upon you.

15 {In Arabic.} In the name of God,  
16 the most Gracious, the most Merciful. Dear Lord  
17 of the universe, we thank You for time and  
18 opportunity, peace and stability.

19 We have mountains of blessings  
20 showered upon us, from the smallest breath we  
21 take to the biggest steps we make. We  
22 acknowledge Your mercy and compassion and request  
23 to You, O Creator of the universe, we are weak  
24 and we are full of shortcomings. Without You,  
25 our dreams cannot be fulfilled. Without You, our

1 paths are clouded. Without You, our lives are  
2 incomplete.

3           Gathered among us today are people  
4 with diverse cultures, with languages and ways of  
5 life unique and limitless. O Compassionate One,  
6 guide us and inspire us. Allow us to understand  
7 and recognize one another as the people of this  
8 earth, united under Your banner.

9           O our Lord, guide our leaders. Give  
10 them strength so that they lead, support and help  
11 our nation.

12           May God accept our congregation  
13 today and be pleased with our efforts in  
14 acknowledging one another.

15           Amen.

16           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
17 reading of the Journal.

18           THE SECRETARY: In Senate, Monday,  
19 April 8, 2019, the Senate met pursuant to  
20 adjournment. The Journal of Sunday, April 7,  
21 2019, was read and approved. On motion, Senate  
22 adjourned.

23           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Without  
24 objection, the Journal stands approved as read.

25           Presentation of petitions.

1 Messages from the Assembly.

2 The Secretary will read.

3 THE SECRETARY: On page 7, Senator  
4 Kaminsky moves to discharge, from the Committee  
5 on Local Government, Assembly Bill Number 3002  
6 and substitute it for the identical Senate Bill  
7 Number 88, Third Reading Calendar 26.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
9 substitution is so ordered.

10 THE SECRETARY: On page 17,  
11 Senator Liu moves to discharge, from the  
12 Committee on Investigations and Government  
13 Operations, Assembly Bill Number 4204 and  
14 substitute it for the identical Senate Bill  
15 Number 4037, Third Reading Calendar 272.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
17 substitution is so ordered.

18 Messages from the Governor.

19 Reports of standing committees.

20 Reports of select committees.

21 Communications and reports from  
22 state officers.

23 Motions and resolutions.

24 Senator Gianaris.

25 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,

1 on behalf of Senator Breslin, on page 16 I offer  
2 the following amendments to Calendar 248, Senate  
3 3505, and ask that said bill retain its place on  
4 Third Reading Calendar.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
6 amendments are received, and the bill shall  
7 retain its place on the Third Reading Calendar.

8 SENATOR GIANARIS: Please call on  
9 Senator Griffo.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
11 Griffo.

12 SENATOR GRIFFO: Mr. President, on  
13 behalf of Senator Akshar I move that the  
14 following bill, Senate Bill 2464, be discharged  
15 from its respective committee and be recommitted  
16 with instructions to strike the enacting clause.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: It is  
18 so ordered.

19 Senator Gianaris.

20 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,  
21 I'm going to ask that you call an immediate  
22 meeting of the Rules Committee in Room 332 and  
23 then proceed from there with some previously  
24 adopted resolutions.

25 So if you'd like to call the

1 committee meeting first, and then I'll indicate  
2 which resolution.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: There  
4 will be an immediate meeting of the Rules  
5 Committee in Room 332.

6 SENATOR GIANARIS: Now can we take  
7 up previously adopted Resolutions 821 and 822,  
8 read 821 title only and 822 in its entirety, and  
9 call on Senator Thomas to speak on the  
10 resolutions.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
12 Secretary will read.

13 THE SECRETARY: Senate Resolution  
14 Number 821, by Senator Thomas, observing and  
15 celebrating May 6 through June 4, 2019, as  
16 Ramadan, the month of fasting for the Muslim  
17 community, in the State of New York.

18 Senate Resolution Number 822, by  
19 Senator Thomas, condemning the ruthless acts of  
20 terrorism in Christchurch, New Zealand, and  
21 mourning the tragic loss of life and injury to  
22 its Muslim community.

23 "WHEREAS, This Legislative Body is  
24 moved to condemn the ruthless acts of terrorism  
25 in Christchurch, New Zealand, and to mourn the

1 tragic loss of life and injury to its Muslim  
2 community; and

3 "WHEREAS, On Friday, March 15, 2019,  
4 an assailant opened fire and victimized people  
5 gathering for Friday prayer at the Linwood Mosque  
6 and Al Noor Mosque, located in Christchurch,  
7 New Zealand; and

8 "WHEREAS, During 36 minutes of  
9 terror, the gunman killed 50 innocent  
10 worshippers; in addition, 34 more victims are  
11 currently being treated for injuries sustained  
12 during the horrific attack; and

13 "WHEREAS, Two police officers, one  
14 of them armed with only a handgun, chased and  
15 arrested the gunman who had explosives in his car  
16 and was planning a third attack on that day; and

17 "WHEREAS, Many of the victims had  
18 moved to New Zealand to seek better lives in a  
19 country known for its beauty, friendliness and  
20 safety; among the victims were engineers,  
21 business owners, students, a child and a  
22 goalkeeper for the national futsal, or soccer,  
23 team; and

24 "WHEREAS, This Legislative Body,  
25 representing the people of the State of New York,

1 will never condone Islamophobia and/or any form  
2 of religious persecution or bigotry; and

3 "WHEREAS, This great Empire State is  
4 made up of thousands of citizens who identify  
5 themselves as Muslim, a community made up of  
6 many diverse beliefs and cultures, and both  
7 immigrants and native-born New Yorkers; and

8 "WHEREAS, New York has always  
9 provided a safe harbor for people fleeing  
10 persecution and threat; hateful and intolerant  
11 acts against Muslims, or those perceived to be  
12 Muslim, are contrary to New York State's values  
13 of acceptance, welcoming, and fellowship with  
14 those of all faiths, beliefs, and cultures; and

15 "WHEREAS, The people of the State of  
16 New York stand steadfast in their solidarity with  
17 the Christchurch Muslim community, the people of  
18 New Zealand, and resolute Prime Minister Jacinda  
19 Ardern, all of whom mourn this senseless act of  
20 terrorism, and vow to always keep the memories of  
21 their loved ones in their hearts; now, therefore,  
22 be it

23 "RESOLVED, That this Legislative  
24 Body pause in its deliberations to condemn the  
25 ruthless acts of terrorism in Christchurch,



1 New Zealand, and to mourn the tragic loss of life  
2 and injury to its Muslim community; and be it  
3 further

4 "RESOLVED, That copies of this  
5 resolution, suitably engrossed, be transmitted to  
6 Prime Minister Jacinda Ardern and the Muslim  
7 community of Christchurch, New Zealand."

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
9 Thomas on the resolutions.

10 SENATOR THOMAS: Thank you,  
11 Mr. President.

12 Less than 30 days ago, a terrorist  
13 attack took place in New Zealand, claiming the  
14 lives of more than 50 people and injuring  
15 countless others. The gunman attacked mosques  
16 because of his hatred for Muslims. This hatred  
17 and violence against those who practice Islam did  
18 not come overnight. This is just the latest  
19 example of rising hatred, intolerance, and  
20 Islamophobia around the world.

21 An attack on one faith is an attack  
22 on all our faiths. Here in America we are  
23 blessed to have people from all corners of the  
24 world, including our Muslim brothers and sisters.  
25 America's Muslims are as diverse as humanity

1     itself. They are white and brown and black and  
2     yellow, but together we are one American family.

3             And when any part of our family  
4     starts to feel like they are second-class  
5     citizens, it tears our society. And when any  
6     religious group is targeted, we all have a  
7     responsibility to speak up. The rise in  
8     Islamophobia is a challenge to our values, and  
9     that means we have a lot of work to do.

10            The terrorist attack in New Zealand  
11     is a moment when as Americans we have to speak up  
12     with facts about Islam. Fact one. For more than  
13     a thousand years, people have been drawn to  
14     Islam's message of peace. And like so many  
15     faiths, Islam is rooted in a commitment to  
16     compassion and mercy and justice and charity.  
17     Whoever wants to enter Paradise, the Prophet  
18     Muhammad -- peace be upon him -- thought, let him  
19     treat people the way he would love to be treated.  
20     For Christians like myself, I'm assuming that  
21     sounds familiar.

22            Fact Number 2. Muslims are doctors,  
23     lawyers, teachers, engineers, business owners and  
24     politicians like our very own Senator Robert  
25     Jackson here, the first Muslim American to be

1     elected New York State Senator. They're also our  
2     friends, neighbors, and colleagues.

3                 So we have to be consistent in  
4     condemning hateful rhetoric and violence against  
5     everyone. So none of us can be silent. We can't  
6     be bystanders to bigotry. And together we've got  
7     to show that New York truly protects all faiths.

8                 Next month is a special month for  
9     Muslims around the world with the start of  
10    Ramadan. It is time when Muslims look for inner  
11    reflection, devotion to God, and self-control,  
12    the three pillars. Let us all ask our Muslim  
13    brothers and sisters to pray for all of us to be  
14    more tolerant and less hateful towards each  
15    other.

16                On behalf of my Senate colleagues, I  
17    say thank you to my Muslim brothers and sisters  
18    for their contribution to New York. We are one.

19                (Applause from audience.)

20                SENATOR THOMAS: I'd like to  
21    recognize a number of organizations here that  
22    have come to join us on this resolution day. The  
23    Bangladeshi American Advocacy Group, Muslims for  
24    Progress, American Pakistani Public Affairs  
25    Council, Emgage Action, and the New York Muslim

1 Advocacy Coalition.

2 Thank you all.

3 (Applause from the audience.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
5 Kaminsky on the resolution.

6 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Thank you,  
7 Mr. President. And thank you, Senator Thomas.

8 I want to welcome our Muslim  
9 brothers and sisters here from all over.  
10 I want to give a special welcome to those from  
11 Long Island.

12 And the words in the resolution and  
13 the words echoed by Senator Thomas cannot ring  
14 more true. Islamophobia is real. It is a big  
15 problem. The lack of education, the ignorance,  
16 the bigotry is real. And frankly, our state's  
17 efforts are not commensurate with that challenge.  
18 There's much we need to do to step up to make  
19 sure that we are being as inclusive as we can and  
20 protecting all New Yorkers.

21 If New York stands for anything,  
22 it's that someone from anywhere, regardless of  
23 who they pray to or where they're from, can come  
24 together and, if he or she wants to work hard,  
25 can provide a life for their children better than

1 their own. When that is threatened, all our  
2 values are threatened.

3 So today I stand in the memory of  
4 the tragedy in Christchurch, I stand with our  
5 Muslim brothers and sisters from New York. I  
6 welcome the month of Ramadan on their behalf, and  
7 I hope we can all come together to meet the  
8 rising tide of Islamophobia and beat it back from  
9 it where it came from. Thank you.

10 (Applause from the audience.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: To our  
12 guests, we have a number of speakers. We will  
13 acknowledge you appropriately at the end. But if  
14 you could hold applause till we get through the  
15 speeches. Thank you.

16 Senator Sanders on the resolution.

17 SENATOR SANDERS: Thank you,  
18 Mr. President.

19 Mr. President, one does not have to  
20 be a Muslim to stand against bigotry and hatred.  
21 One doesn't have to be a Christian, a Hindu, a  
22 Buddhist. Or you can even be an atheist to stand  
23 against the sheer cowardly nature of the attack  
24 in Christchurch. It's an attack that would shame  
25 any decent person. And at a time like this, we

1 all need to stand up and say that type of madness  
2 should not be permitted in any society.

3 So I just wanted to take that  
4 moment, Mr. President, to say that and to welcome  
5 our visitors here and to wish everyone a happy  
6 Ramadan.

7 (Applause from the audience.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
9 Jackson -- please hold your applause to the end.  
10 We will appropriately recognize you. We want to  
11 get through the program. Sorry.

12 Senator Jackson on the resolution.

13 SENATOR JACKSON: Thank you,  
14 Mr. President.

15 My colleagues, I rise to speak on  
16 the two resolutions, one about celebrating  
17 Ramadan, the month of fasting and prayer, and the  
18 second one on the Christchurch resolution.

19 Ramadan is the holiest month that  
20 Muslims celebrate, a time for introspection and  
21 cleansing of one's spirit through fasting and  
22 prayer.

23 Ramadan is also families coming  
24 together across the world, from the streets of  
25 Cairo to Dar es Salaam, where my wife is from, to

1 the homes of Rochester, New York, or Bay Ridge,  
2 Brooklyn.

3 Muslims celebrate Ramadan together  
4 with predawn and post-sunset home cooked meals,  
5 Koranic recitations, nighttime street fairs, and  
6 some of the best soap operas you've ever seen.  
7 The diversity of celebrations speak to the  
8 diversity of Muslims themselves. Even within my  
9 own family, we all have our own ways of  
10 celebrating Ramadan.

11 I encourage everyone present today,  
12 regardless of your faith, to consider taking some  
13 time during Ramadan to treasure your loved ones,  
14 do some work on yourself and for yourself, and do  
15 good for others. And if you are fasting, I wish  
16 you an easy fast. And I look forward to wishing  
17 you all "Eid Mubarak" on the other side.

18 Regarding the Christchurch  
19 resolution, I rise to support this resolution.  
20 I've spent time this past month processing the  
21 white supremacist's Islamophobic terror attack in  
22 New Zealand on March 15th. Fridays, if you're  
23 not aware, are supposed to be a time for getting  
24 together for our prayer, a time for family and  
25 fellowship. Instead, that Friday became one of

1 violence.

2 And I was heartened to see so many  
3 expressions of support for the Christchurch  
4 Muslim community and for Muslims across New York  
5 State and throughout the world.

6 It's unacceptable for these hateful  
7 crimes that keep happening all over the world --  
8 to Muslims, to Jews, to Christians, to people  
9 based on their race, nationality, sexual  
10 orientation or gender. It's wrong, it's hateful,  
11 and it must cease.

12 I say to all of you today we need to  
13 fight for stronger gun control legislation and  
14 better mental health care, and we must redouble  
15 our efforts to promote education that fosters  
16 respect for other people and understanding of the  
17 differences.

18 Asalamu Alaikum. Peace be upon all  
19 of you.

20 (Applause from the audience.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
22 Sepúlveda on the resolution.

23 SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA: Thank you,  
24 Mr. President, for allowing me to speak on the  
25 resolutions.



1                   First of all, my heart goes out to  
2     all the families and the entire country of  
3     New Zealand for the senseless attack on people  
4     who were just doing nothing but practicing their  
5     faith.

6                   I have a very large and thriving  
7     Muslim community in my district, primarily  
8     Bangladeshi Americans and West Africans, and they  
9     are a vibrant part of our community. They are a  
10    very close community to my career in elected  
11    office. The Muslim community was one of the  
12    earliest communities to support me and embrace  
13    me, and for that I will always be grateful.

14                  We as a nation, as a state, must  
15    stand for the principle that people should be  
16    allowed to practice their faith without fear,  
17    without interference, and should be able to get  
18    support from us as residents and members of the  
19    human race.

20                  I want to thank all that are here  
21    today. I see a couple of members from my  
22    district and my community here. I want to  
23    welcome you here. Asalamu Alaikum, and may peace  
24    be with you every single day.

25                  Thank you.

1 (Applause from the audience.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
3 Gounardes on the resolution. Senator Gounardes.

4 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Thank you,  
5 Mr. President. I rise to -- and I want to thank  
6 Senator Thomas for introducing and advancing  
7 these two resolutions. I represent -- Senator  
8 Jackson called my neighborhood out. I represent  
9 neighborhoods in southern Brooklyn that have very  
10 large Arabic and Muslim communities -- Bay Ridge,  
11 Dyker Heights, Bath Beach, Bensonhurst.

12 And what we saw happen in  
13 New Zealand was absolutely horrifying and  
14 terrifying to us all, but it wasn't new. And  
15 whether it rears its head as Islamophobia or it  
16 rears its head as antisemitism in Pittsburgh or  
17 it rears its head as white supremacy in  
18 Charlottesville or rears its head anywhere where  
19 we see these heinous attacks, we know that we're  
20 confronting hate, and that's hate. It's hate.

21 And we stand united against that  
22 divisiveness, we stand united against that  
23 ugliness, we stand united against that hate. And  
24 we say no, never again.

25 And so I think it's important that

1 we take this moment out to commemorate the  
2 victims and honor their memory, and that we hope  
3 that their loss is not in vain and that we are  
4 able, not just as a body, not just as a state,  
5 not just as a country, but as a world, a world  
6 community, to grow from this and learn from this  
7 and stand together to say that we will not  
8 tolerate this ever, ever again.

9                   And to our Muslim friends who are  
10 here today, thank you for being so courageous in  
11 the face of the ugliness that's hurled against  
12 you time and time and time again. I wish you all  
13 a Ramadan Mubarak, and thank you very much.

14                   (Appause from the audience.)

15                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Senator  
16 Bailey on the resolution.

17                   SENATOR BAILEY:    Thank you,  
18 Mr. President.

19                   Senator Thomas, thank you for  
20 sponsoring these very important pieces of the --  
21 these pieces of -- these resolutions to the  
22 floor. Piece of legislation, it should be  
23 legislation. Because what we should be  
24 legislating and teaching people via policy is not  
25 to hate. We should be instructing and having

1 people respect people based upon their religions  
2 and what they choose to observe.

3           You see, what happened in  
4 Charleston, South Carolina, when a hateful  
5 individual came into that church and shot people  
6 for worshiping their religion was in our country,  
7 and we still didn't do anything about it.

8           And in New Zealand, people were  
9 slaughtered and murdered for simply worshiping in  
10 their own religion. And what New Zealand did was  
11 remarkable, because they're actually taking steps  
12 to do something about it. They say if you -- or  
13 our conference leader knows if you need something  
14 done, put it in a woman's hands, and that's what  
15 they did in New Zealand. Immediately after that  
16 tragedy, they're changing things.

17           We as a country have to be more  
18 reflective in understanding that not only do we  
19 change things via policy, we have to change  
20 things socially. We have to understand and  
21 respect everybody's right to worship. I have  
22 visited mosques, and I've had amazing experiences  
23 there as a man of Christian faith. I was  
24 welcomed to Eid celebrations. This is what we  
25 have to do in our society.

1                   My first name is of Arabic descent.

2                   There are so many ties that bind us  
3 as opposed to things that divide us, and we have  
4 to make sure that we pay more attention to that  
5 than the negative.

6                   I salute you all for coming to  
7 Albany. Let this not be the last time you come  
8 to this great State Capitol. And Ramadan  
9 Mubarak.

10                   (Applause from the audience.)

11                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
12 Kaplan on the resolution.

13                   SENATOR KAPLAN: Thank you,  
14 Mr. President.

15                   I want to thank Senator Thomas for  
16 bringing this forth, and I want to acknowledge  
17 also the Bangladesh American Advocacy Group,  
18 Muslims for Progress, from my district, and the  
19 American Pakistani Public Affairs.

20                   I want to tell you that hate is a  
21 very strong feeling. And when we all stand  
22 together, united, to combat that, we're much  
23 stronger as a community, as a state. We would  
24 like you to know that we stand today with you and  
25 united with you. Ramadan Mubarak. And I'm

1 looking forward to coming and celebrating with  
2 you.

3 (Applause from the audience.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
5 Liu on the resolution.

6 SENATOR LIU: Thank you,  
7 Mr. President.

8 I unfortunately missed Senator  
9 Thomas's remarks because I had been called out  
10 for a vote in the Rules Committee. But  
11 nonetheless I wanted to join all my colleagues  
12 here in wishing everybody a happy Ramadan. Very  
13 important, especially in light of recent events,  
14 as has already been discussed.

15 Ramadan is really a terrific  
16 opportunity because the Muslim community every  
17 night gets together and holds iftar. And the  
18 importance of iftar cannot be overstated, because  
19 this is a nightly dinner where people of all  
20 faiths, all backgrounds, all races, all creeds  
21 are invited to come break bread together. And it  
22 is such a unifying event that takes place all  
23 throughout New York every single night. I  
24 encourage all the members of the Senate to take  
25 part in these iftars. If you don't get invited,

1 go ahead and invite yourself, because everyone is  
2 welcome.

3 Thank you, Mr. President.

4 (Applause from the audience.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
6 Mayer on the resolution.

7 SENATOR MAYER: Thank you,  
8 Mr. President.

9 I want to thank my Muslim brothers  
10 and sisters who are here today in support of this  
11 resolution. And thank you, Senator Thomas, for  
12 taking the lead in making sure that we publicly  
13 acknowledge what happened in New Zealand and that  
14 we commit ourselves as a community to embracing  
15 each other and embracing different faiths. This  
16 is the best of America, when we celebrate our  
17 differences and we pray together and celebrate  
18 together.

19 I have been so fortunate to have  
20 been part of the Muslim community in my district,  
21 and I have benefited by learning from you and  
22 sharing with you.

23 But let us not hide our eyes from  
24 the fact that fear and danger has been part of  
25 the Muslim American experience in our country,

1 and this was a sad reminder.

2 Today we reaffirm you are our  
3 neighbors, our friends, we are all one. And as  
4 Senator Thomas said, we are one today.

5 Thank you for being here.

6 (Applause from the audience.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
8 Stavisky on the resolution.

9 SENATOR STAVISKY: Thank you,  
10 Mr. President. I too want to welcome our  
11 brothers and sisters to Albany.

12 Just as the Muslim community came  
13 together during the terrible tragedy at that  
14 Pittsburgh synagogue, we too stand united in  
15 renouncing the hate that seems to be generated  
16 throughout our country. And we are here together  
17 in Albany. We look different, we are different,  
18 but we speak with that same one voice, and that's  
19 the voice of reason and the voice of progress and  
20 the voice of decency and denouncing the hatred  
21 that exists.

22 So we welcome you, and let's hope  
23 you come back again and again. And we'll  
24 celebrate together. Thank you.

25 (Applause from the audience.)



1                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Senator  
2 Boyle on the resolution.

3                   SENATOR BOYLE:    Thank you,  
4 Mr. President.

5                   I'd like to thank Senator Thomas for  
6 bringing this to the floor.

7                   The tragedy in New Zealand unites us  
8 all against hate. And I want to thank the Muslim  
9 community for being here and for those back in  
10 the district. I am very honored to represent a  
11 very large mosque in Bay Shore, New York, that  
12 I've been to many times. I can tell you that  
13 there are going to be some Ramadan celebrations,  
14 iftars. For those colleagues of mine that have  
15 not been to an iftar celebration at a mosque, go.  
16 As the Senator said, if you're not invited,  
17 invite yourself. Very welcoming community.

18                   Thank you for being here. We stand  
19 united against hate.

20                   Thank you.

21                   (Applause from the audience.)

22                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Senator  
23 Kennedy on the resolution.

24                   SENATOR KENNEDY:    Thank you,  
25 Mr. President.

1           First of all, let me thank and  
2     acknowledge our colleague Senator Thomas for  
3     bringing this resolution forward.

4           And also welcome to our friends and  
5     allies from all across the state and all across  
6     the globe, those of Arab descent and those from  
7     the Muslim community. We thank you for being  
8     here as we kick off Ramadan, but also as we  
9     recognize the tragedies that have occurred across  
10    the globe, in particular in New Zealand.

11          And just echoing the sentiments of  
12    our colleagues here today we just must always be  
13    reminded of the humanity of it all, what we are  
14    each called to do on a daily basis -- not just in  
15    this chamber in our work as public servants,  
16    those of us that have the privilege to represent  
17    our communities in the Senate, and in the  
18    Legislature and in government, and be able to  
19    cast votes on behalf of our community, but all of  
20    us regardless of whether we are elected or not.

21          We have an obligation to work toward  
22    a better humanity, a better society, and create  
23    peace. And in many places across our  
24    communities, across our nation and, yes, across  
25    the world, that peace is elusive. And we in New

1 York State have acted as a beacon of hope,  
2 particularly as it pertains to those of all  
3 faiths.

4 And so today as we recognize those  
5 of the Muslim faith, I welcome you, once again,  
6 recognize you, as an individual who represents  
7 the largest Arab community outside of Deerfield,  
8 Michigan, in Lackawanna, New York, where I often  
9 pay visits to the mosque there in Lackawanna as  
10 well as on Connecticut Street in the City of  
11 Buffalo. We pay homage to the peace and the  
12 tranquility and the lessons that are taught  
13 through the Muslim faith.

14 And the peace that all of our  
15 families strive for sadly was shaken this past  
16 week when Baldradeen Mohamad Elwaseem was stolen  
17 from us at 12 years old when a stray bullet on  
18 William Street in Buffalo entered through his  
19 house as he was sitting watching television. And  
20 the Arab community, the Muslim community and the  
21 faith, but surrounded by all communities of all  
22 faiths put him to rest at the mosque just  
23 yesterday. He now rests peacefully with Allah.  
24 Peace be to all of you. Peace be unto us all.

25 (Applause from the audience.)

1           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
2 resolution was previously -- these resolutions, I  
3 apologize, were previously adopted on March 26th.

4           To our guests, I welcome you on  
5 behalf of the Senate. We extend to you all of  
6 the privileges and courtesies of this house.  
7 Please rise and be recognized.

8           (Standing ovation.)

9           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Senator  
10 Gianaris.

11          SENATOR GIANARIS:    Mr. President, I  
12 believe Senator Thomas would like to open both of  
13 those resolutions for cosponsorship.

14          ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    These  
15 resolutions are both open for cosponsorship.  
16 Should you choose not to be a cosponsor of these  
17 resolutions, please notify the desk.

18          Senator Gianaris.

19          SENATOR GIANARIS:    Can we now move  
20 to previously adopted Resolution 835, by  
21 Senator Brooks, read its title only, and call on  
22 Senator Brooks.

23          ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
24 Secretary will read.

25          THE SECRETARY:    Senate Resolution

1 Number 835, by Senator Brooks, memorializing  
2 Governor Andrew M. Cuomo to proclaim April 9,  
3 2019, as Yellow Ribbon Day in the State of  
4 New York.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
6 Brooks on the resolution.

7 SENATOR BROOKS: Thank you,  
8 Mr. President.

9 Since April 9, 2006, New York State  
10 has proclaimed today Yellow Ribbon Day to  
11 commemorate Staff Sergeant Matt Maupin, who was  
12 captured by Iraq insurgents in 2004 and became  
13 the first POW of the Iraq War.

14 Following his capture, his family  
15 made a practice of sending gifts and care boxes  
16 to the soldiers in the war zone, calling to their  
17 attention their missing son. That practice  
18 remains in place today by those who honor and  
19 recognize our active military.

20 Today is designated as an  
21 opportunity for us to honor all those individuals  
22 who are on active duty in our military for the  
23 sacrifice and service they provide to this  
24 nation.

25 We all recall that yellow ribbons

1 first became a symbol of support during the  
2 Iranian hostage crisis, where 52 Americans were  
3 held hostage for 444 days.

4 Mr. President, the State of New York  
5 recognizes and honors today the active members of  
6 our military. We as a nation are blessed by all  
7 of our citizens who have been willing to serve  
8 this nation through our military, and we pay  
9 great honor to those individuals today.

10 Thank you, Mr. President. And may  
11 God bless America.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
13 Jordan on the resolution.

14 SENATOR JORDAN: Mr. President and  
15 my colleagues, I rise to speak on Senator  
16 Brooks's resolution proclaiming today, April 9th,  
17 as Yellow Ribbon Day in New York State.

18 Yellow Ribbon Day is a very special  
19 occasion and a day of commemoration. On Yellow  
20 Ribbon Day, yellow ribbons are displayed proudly  
21 to show support and solidarity with those serving  
22 in America's armed forces and to also remember  
23 those who were prisoners of war or never came  
24 home to their loved ones.

25 Today, April 9th, is also observed

1 as National Former Prisoner of War Recognition  
2 Day, focusing on the 77th commemoration of the  
3 brutal beginning of the Bataan Death March, where  
4 10,000 American and Filipino prisoners lost their  
5 lives after being forced to march 61 miles.

6 This commemoration is a stark  
7 reminder of the sacrifices made by our military,  
8 and the yellow ribbons we post will remind us of  
9 these sacrifices. They also serve as enduring  
10 symbols of national unity and our strong support  
11 for and solidarity with members of our military.

12 During the Iranian hostage crisis,  
13 which saw 52 Americans taken captive for 444  
14 days, yellow ribbons were tied around trees as a  
15 symbol of remembrance. In the first Persian Gulf  
16 War, Americans tied yellow ribbons around trees  
17 and wore yellow ribbon lapel pins, standing in  
18 solidarity for our troops serving in harm's way.

19 Being from the Town of Halfmoon,  
20 Yellow Ribbon Day is very near and dear to my  
21 heart. Carol Hotaling, also known as the Yellow  
22 Ribbon Lady and the mother of one of my former  
23 Town Board colleagues, has championed the effort  
24 to establish Yellow Ribbon Day and has celebrated  
25 in our Town of Halfmoon each year.

1                   As reported on the news, Carol  
2     Hotaling has been putting together decorations  
3     for troops around the world since Operation  
4     Desert Storm in 1991. She's been tireless and  
5     tenacious in advocating for Yellow Ribbon Day to  
6     now be recognized as a national day of observance  
7     to salute the men and women of America's armed  
8     forces.

9                   Carol Hotaling and many American  
10    patriots have devoted countless hours  
11    distributing yellow ribbons to raise awareness of  
12    and express support for those who defend our  
13    country. Yellow Ribbon Day shows us that the  
14    freedom we cherish is not free; it has been paid  
15    for in the service and sacrifice of our armed  
16    forces. God bless the men and women of our  
17    military who safeguard our country and serve as a  
18    force for good in the world abroad.

19                  Thank you, Mr. President. And thank  
20    you, Senator Brooks, for the resolution.

21                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     Senator  
22    Sanders on the resolution.

23                  SENATOR SANDERS:     Thank you,  
24    Mr. President.

25                  I want to thank the sponsors for



1     this resolution. And I want to say that I wear  
2     my yellow ribbon on behalf of my nephew, Phinizee  
3     {ph}, who is serving now and has served two tours  
4     Iraq, one tour Afghanistan, one tour DMZ, one  
5     that he can't even tell me about, and is still  
6     going. So I wear it proudly, and I know its  
7     meaning.

8                     Thank you, sir.

9                     ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     Senator  
10     Ortt on the resolution.

11                    SENATOR ORTT:     Thank you,  
12     Mr. President.

13                    Like my colleagues, I want to echo  
14     their comments. I want to thank the sponsor,  
15     Senator Brooks, for bringing forth the  
16     resolution.

17                    And you know, it's wonderful to wear  
18     a yellow ribbon to remember our men and women in  
19     uniform wherever they might be, because you're  
20     remembering somebody's son, somebody's daughter,  
21     somebody's husband, somebody's brother,  
22     somebody's wife. And I think it's important at  
23     this time, when a lot of our country probably  
24     doesn't even remember that there's a conflict  
25     going on, they're so consumed with whatever is

1     happening on the nightly news or on Netflix or  
2     whatever reality show is going on. And that's  
3     all fine, because the truth is our men and women  
4     fight so that we can enjoy those things.

5                 But it's important to remember that  
6     underneath all of that there is real Americans  
7     who are fighting and defending our way of life.  
8     And all the things that we talk about in this  
9     chamber and in chambers all across this country,  
10    they only mean something because somebody  
11    somewhere puts on a uniform and raises their hand  
12    and says send me. And that's what gives these  
13    things -- that's what brings them into existence.

14                And in fact just yesterday a  
15    New York City firefighter was killed in  
16    Afghanistan, along with two other Americans, by a  
17    roadside bomb. And so today I think of his  
18    family, which has now become a Gold Star family,  
19    a designation that no family ever wants. And we  
20    have -- we still have a lot of those happening  
21    across this country.

22                So this is great as a reminder of  
23    those who are serving, of those who served and  
24    gave the ultimate sacrifice. But I would just  
25    add one thing, Mr. President, and that's

1 words are great, but it's also important to  
2 remember to make good on those words with the  
3 laws we pass here, funding whatever it might  
4 be -- because words are great and ribbons are  
5 wonderful, but let's back that up with real  
6 action here in this chamber to show the men and  
7 women and the families of those men and women  
8 that we have their back and we stand with them  
9 and we actually don't forget them.

10 Thank you, Mr. President.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
12 resolution was previously adopted on March 26th.

13 Senator Gianaris.

14 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,  
15 on behalf of Senator Brooks, that resolution is  
16 open for cosponsorship.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
18 resolution is open for cosponsorship. Should you  
19 choose not to be a cosponsor of this resolution,  
20 please notify the desk.

21 Senator Gianaris.

22 SENATOR GIANARIS: Can we now move  
23 to previously adopted Resolution 602, by  
24 Senator Breslin, read its title only, and call on  
25 Senator Breslin.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     The  
2     Secretary will read.

3                   THE SECRETARY:     Senate Resolution  
4     602, by Senator Breslin, recognizing Friday,  
5     October 25, 2019, as Real Kids Wear Pink Day, and  
6     paying special tribute to Carli O'Hara, founder  
7     of this vital campaign.

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     Senator  
9     Breslin on the resolution.

10                  SENATOR BRESLIN:     Thank you very  
11     much, Mr. President.

12                  Back three years ago in a little  
13     city in my district, Cohoes, the home of not only  
14     Ron Canestrari, but John McDonald, Carli O'Hara's  
15     grandmother contracted cancer. It was Stage IV  
16     breast cancer. And you would think a  
17     sixth-grader at that time would have devolved  
18     into sadness -- which she did -- but she also  
19     thought about I don't want to ever have anyone  
20     else going through that news in a family.

21                  So she decided, with her friends --  
22     her friends Carissa Shanahan -- Carissa, you want  
23     to wave to us? Okay. And her other friend Ava  
24     Hotaling -- Ava -- to start a fund drive. That's  
25     three years ago, when she was a sixth-grader.

1                   Now it's three years later, she's  
2   raised thousands and thousands of dollars. Of  
3   course with the help of her own mother, Chantel  
4   Squires, who's in the gallery with a lot of their  
5   other fans. And I think it's a special lesson  
6   for all of us that pass legislation that  
7   hopefully makes New York State a better place and  
8   a richer place.

9                   But to think of -- I tried to  
10  imagine and think back to when I was in sixth  
11  grade, the thoughts I had, and whether those  
12  thoughts actually ever helped anyone else, and  
13  I've come to the conclusion they probably didn't.

14                  (Laughter.)

15                  SENATOR BRESLIN:    But when I look  
16  at these three young ladies, who are going to be  
17  successes in life because you have already  
18  achieved that success, and to have done what  
19  you've done and to continue to do it -- not  
20  looking for praise, not looking for adulation  
21  from others, but you do it because it's the right  
22  thing to do, participating in our wonderful  
23  society.

24                  So I salute you. I want you to  
25  continue to do what you do. I want to follow, as

1 I have for the last three years, your progress.  
2 You are going to become important people in our  
3 community. Hopefully one of you will be here as  
4 a Senator, after another 15 years -- but after  
5 that, possibly.

6 So I commend you and salute you on  
7 this wonderful tribute to you to continue your  
8 fundraising to make sure we wipe out all cancers.

9 Thank you, Mr. President.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
11 resolution was previously adopted on March 7th.

12 To our guests and parents, I welcome  
13 you on behalf of the Senate. We extend to you  
14 all the privileges and courtesies of this house.  
15 Please rise and be recognized.

16 (Standing ovation.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
18 Gianaris.

19 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,  
20 please open that resolution for cosponsorship.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
22 resolution is open for cosponsorship. Should you  
23 choose not to be a cosponsor of the resolution,  
24 please notify the desk.

25 Senator Gianaris.

1                   SENATOR GIANARIS:    Can we now move  
2   on to previously adopted Resolution 478, by  
3   Senator Akshar, read its title only, and call on  
4   Senator Akshar.

5                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
6   Secretary will read.

7                   THE SECRETARY:    Senate Resolution  
8   Number 478, by Senator Akshar, honoring Sergeant  
9   Shaun N. Carnevale upon the occasion of his  
10  retirement after 33 years of distinguished  
11  service to the Broome County Sheriff's Office.

12                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Senator  
13  Akshar on the resolution.

14                  SENATOR AKSHAR:    Mr. President,  
15  thank you very much for your indulgence. To my  
16  colleagues, thank you for allowing this  
17  resolution to the floor.

18                  I rise today because I think it is  
19  incredibly important for us as elected officials  
20  to recognize our community heroes. And these are  
21  individuals, through their chosen career, quite  
22  frankly that are heroes every single day.  
23  Because they are men and women who put their  
24  lives on the line in service to others, so that  
25  other people can go out and live their lives --

1 they can go to school, they can go to work, they  
2 can be with their families and they can do so and  
3 feel safe about it.

4 Today I rise to recognize a man  
5 who's been a community hero for 33 years in  
6 Broome County, somebody that I consider a great  
7 friend, Sergeant Shaun Carnevale. For 33 years  
8 he has put that uniform on for one particular  
9 reason, to serve others. To serve the community  
10 that he loves.

11 It's the same uniform that is woven  
12 into the fabric that holds communities across our  
13 great state together. Whether you're in  
14 Binghamton, you're in Brooklyn, you're in  
15 Ogdensburg, wherever you may be, it's that very  
16 same uniform that keeps communities together.

17 Sergeant Carnevale has had a very  
18 successful and an illustrious career. He has  
19 served in nearly ever capacity in the agency,  
20 part of the motor unit, the marine patrol, was a  
21 K9 handler, which is something that I know he  
22 loved very, very much, an academy instructor, a  
23 member of the SWAT team. For more than 20 years  
24 he was part of the local police memorial week  
25 team. He represented the sheriff's office in



1 Washington, D.C., during National Police Week.  
2 And at a time when this nation faced our greatest  
3 tragedy, after 9/11 he volunteered his time in  
4 Staten Island during the recovery operations.

5           So he's done it all, he's seen it  
6 all in his 33 years. But I would say this, that  
7 the foundation and the bedrock of all of those  
8 roles has been one very simple thing: Service to  
9 your community. And I think that speaks volumes  
10 about the person that you are. The bedrock and  
11 the foundation of your life and your family has  
12 been those things.

13           I say often that being a member of  
14 law enforcement is one of the most noblest  
15 professions in the world -- not because you get  
16 to chase bad guys, but because it's about  
17 building strong relationships with the people  
18 that you serve. And that was of utmost  
19 importance to you, and I know that. I know that  
20 and I say that with a great deal of certainty  
21 because I see how the community reacts to you  
22 because of the time that you've spent in the  
23 community.

24           So it's about helping families dig  
25 themselves out as they recover from devastating

1 floods, or it's finding a lost child in the woods  
2 for a worried family. And really it's living  
3 every single day as an example of the best in our  
4 community.

5           And that, my friends, is exactly how  
6 Sergeant Carnevale lived and conducted himself as  
7 a police officer, and is exactly the way you  
8 conduct yourself as a family man. Which I know,  
9 outside of everything, that is most important to  
10 you, your family.

11           So Mr. President, today it's my  
12 personal honor and privilege to recognize  
13 Sergeant Carnevale for his 33 years of service, a  
14 man that I certainly looked up to during my  
15 career. I don't care if I was a deputy or I was  
16 the undersheriff, I looked to the good sergeant  
17 for counsel. A man who taught me the right way  
18 to do the job. I heard this phrase often when I  
19 was a police officer: "Kid, you fly by the seat  
20 of your pants." He said that to me often when I  
21 was working as a member of law enforcement.  
22 Senator Lanza agrees.

23           I would say this too, and I know  
24 that the good sergeant would agree with me here.  
25 That while we are honoring you today for your

1 33 years of service, as I stand on this beautiful  
2 floor, I also honor the work that the men and  
3 women of law enforcement do that work alongside  
4 of people like you and formerly me and all the  
5 other members of law enforcement.

6 I just want to take this opportunity  
7 to remind my colleagues, it's important for us to  
8 remember that behind each and every uniform is a  
9 living, breathing man or woman who is dedicated  
10 to making their community a better place each and  
11 every day. And while police officers are human,  
12 just like you and I, for every officer that makes  
13 a mistake or a wrong decision -- and I know those  
14 mistakes and wrong decisions drive a lot of what  
15 this house does in terms of legislation -- I want  
16 to remind you all that there are hundreds, tens  
17 of thousands of people just like Sergeant  
18 Carnevale that make the right decisions each and  
19 every day.

20 So while he may be retiring or he  
21 may be retired from the Broome County Sheriff's  
22 Office, you're going to continue to serve as a  
23 peace officer on the campus of SUNY Broome. On  
24 the night shift, might I add.

25 Before I end, let me say this. I

1 want to thank his family, who is with us as well.  
2 His beautiful wife Laura, who is with us. His  
3 daughter Jessica. His son Ryan, who is  
4 continuing to carry the torch as a member of law  
5 enforcement as well. His daughter-in-law Cassie.  
6 And Jessica's father-in-law Ed. Thank you for  
7 being with us.

8                   Otie, I would say this. Job well  
9 done. Job well done. And you are respected and  
10 admired by so many people. And Otie, I mean this  
11 with the utmost sincerity: You're a cop's cop.

12                   Mr. President, I would ask that you  
13 extend all the privileges and the courtesies of  
14 this great house to the good sergeant and his  
15 beautiful, loving family.

16                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
17 resolution was previously adopted on  
18 February 27th.

19                   To the sergeant and his family, I  
20 welcome you on behalf of the Senate. We extend  
21 to you all the privileges and courtesies of this  
22 house. Please rise and be recognized.

23                   (Standing ovation.)

24                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
25 Gianaris.

1                   SENATOR GIANARIS:    Mr. President, I  
2   believe Senator Akshar would like to open that  
3   resolution for cosponsorship.

4                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
5   resolution is open for cosponsorship.  Should you  
6   choose not to be a cosponsor of the resolution,  
7   please notify the desk.

8                   Senator Gianaris.

9                   SENATOR GIANARIS:    Can we now move  
10  to Resolution 928, by Senator Helming, read its  
11  title only, and call on Senator Helming.

12                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
13  Secretary will read.

14                  THE SECRETARY:    Senate Resolution  
15  928, by Senator Helming, memorializing Governor  
16  Andrew M. Cuomo to proclaim April 2019 as Child  
17  Abuse Prevention Month in the State of New York.

18                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Senator  
19  Helming on the resolution.

20                  SENATOR HELMING:    Thank you,  
21  Mr. President.

22                  I rise today in support of this  
23  resolution requesting Governor Cuomo to proclaim  
24  April 2019 as Child Abuse Prevention Month in  
25  New York State.

1 I'm sure every one of us in this  
2 room shudders when we hear phrases like "child  
3 abuse" or "child neglect," at the thought that  
4 someone could harm one of our most vulnerable  
5 populations, at the idea we are not giving our  
6 future generation the best possible lives.

7 Oftentimes it's all too easy to look  
8 the other way when we see or we hear about abuse.  
9 It's easy to let it become someone else's  
10 problem. We wait for law enforcement or an  
11 agency to take care of the issue. But we cannot  
12 pass the buck. In one capacity or another,  
13 whether it's as parents, as representatives of  
14 our community, or as members of this Legislature,  
15 we must all do what we can to prevent child  
16 abuse.

17 We must commit ourselves to  
18 legislation that is meaningful and helps prevent  
19 and crack down on child abuse. We must ensure  
20 strict penalties for those who abuse and neglect  
21 our children. We commit ourselves to funding the  
22 agencies and the programs across the entire state  
23 that help prevent child abuse and neglect.

24 At the very least, we must set aside  
25 a time to raise awareness of child abuse and the

1 issues around it, and that's what this resolution  
2 does. Over 65,000 children in New York State are  
3 abused or neglected each year. That's enough  
4 kids to fill Madison Square Garden three times.

5 No child deserves to be abused or  
6 mistreated in any way. All children deserve to  
7 grow up in a supportive environment where they're  
8 encouraged to aim for their highest potential.

9 Mr. President, child abuse is not a  
10 partisan issue, and I hope every member of this  
11 body will join me in supporting this resolution.

12 Thank you, Mr. President.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
14 question is on the resolution. All in favor  
15 signify by saying aye.

16 (Response of "Aye.")

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
18 Opposed?

19 (No response.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
21 resolution is adopted.

22 Senator Gianaris.

23 SENATOR GIANARIS: And on behalf of  
24 Senator Helming, we'd like to open that  
25 resolution for cosponsorship.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
2   resolution is open for cosponsorship.  Should you  
3   choose not to be a cosponsor of the resolution,  
4   please notify the desk.

5                   Senator Gianaris.

6                   SENATOR GIANARIS:    Mr. President, I  
7   have an extra motion here that I didn't have  
8   earlier.

9                   So on behalf of Senator Harckham, I  
10  move the following bill be discharged from its  
11  respective committee and be recommitted with  
12  instructions to strike the enacting clause:  
13  Senate Bill 5111.

14                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    It is  
15  so ordered.

16                  SENATOR GIANARIS:    Mr. President, I  
17  believe now there is a report of the Rules  
18  Committee at the desk.

19                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    There  
20  is a report of the Rules Committee at the desk.

21                  The Secretary will read.

22                  THE SECRETARY:    Senator  
23  Stewart-Cousins, from the Committee on Rules,  
24  reports the following bills:

25                  Senate Print 4426, by Senator Myrie,



1 an act to amend the Election Law;

2 Senate Print 4498A, by Senator  
3 Rivera, an act to amend the Public Health Law;

4 Senate Print 4940B, by Senator  
5 Mayer, an act to amend the Tax Law;

6 Senate Print 5052, by Senator  
7 Thomas, an act to amend the Public Authorities  
8 Law;

9 Senate Print 5069, by Senator  
10 Parker, an act to amend Chapter 403 of the Laws  
11 of 2018;

12 Senate Print 5070, by Senator  
13 Jackson, an act to amend Chapter 414 of the Laws  
14 of 2018;

15 Senate Print 1960, by Senator  
16 Little, an act to amend the Tax Law; and

17 Senate Print 4121, by Senator  
18 LaValle, an act to amend the Education Law.

19 All bills ordered direct to third  
20 reading.

21 SENATOR GIANARIS: Move to accept  
22 the Rules Committee report, Mr. President.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: All  
24 those in favor of accepting the report of the  
25 Rules Committee signify by saying aye.

1 (Response of "Aye.")

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:

3 Opposed?

4 (No response.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
6 report is accepted.

7 Senator Gianaris.

8 SENATOR GIANARIS: Can we now take  
9 up the reading of the supplemental calendar.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
11 Secretary will read.

12 THE SECRETARY: Senator Myrie moves  
13 to discharge, from the Committee on Elections,  
14 Assembly Bill Number 4081 and substitute it for  
15 the identical Senate Bill 4426, Third Reading  
16 Calendar 395.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
18 substitution is so ordered.

19 The Secretary will read.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
21 395, Assembly Print 4081, by Assemblymember  
22 D'Urso, an act to amend the Election Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
24 the last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This

1 act shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
3 the roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
6 Announce the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
9 bill is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Senator Rivera  
11 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Health,  
12 Assembly Bill Number 6962A and substitute it for  
13 the identical Senate Bill 4498A, Third Reading  
14 Calendar 396.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
16 substitution is so ordered.

17 The Secretary will read.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
19 396, Assembly Print 6962A, by Assemblymember  
20 Joyner, an act to amend the Public Health Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
22 the last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
24 act shall take effect six months after it shall  
25 have become a law.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Call  
2   the roll.

3                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

4                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
5   Announce the results.

6                   THE SECRETARY:    In relation to  
7   Calendar Number 396, those Senators voting in the  
8   negative are Senators Akshar, Amedore, Antonacci,  
9   Boyle, Flanagan, Funke, Griffo, Helming, Jordan,  
10   Lanza, LaValle, Little, O'Mara, Ortt,  
11   Ranzenhofer, Ritchie, Robach, Serino and Tedisco.  
12                   Ayes, 41.   Nays, 19.

13                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
14   bill is passed.

15                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
16   397, Senate Print 4940B, by Senator Mayer, an act  
17   to amend the Tax Law.

18                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Read  
19   the last section.

20                  THE SECRETARY:    Section 7.   This  
21   act shall take effect immediately.

22                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Call  
23   the roll.

24                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

25                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:

1 Announce the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
3 Calendar Number 397, those Senators voting in the  
4 negative are Senators Akshar, Amedore, Antonacci,  
5 Boyle, Brooks, Flanagan, Funke, Gaughran, Griffo,  
6 Harckham, Helming, Jacobs, Jordan, Kaplan, Lanza,  
7 LaValle, Little, Martinez, Metzger, O'Mara, Ortt,  
8 Ranzenhofer, Ritchie, Robach, Serino, Skoufis and  
9 Thomas. Also Senator Tedisco.

10 Ayes, 32. Nays, 28.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
12 bill is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
14 398, Senate Print 5052, by Senator Thomas, an act  
15 to amend the Public Authorities Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
17 the last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
19 act shall take effect on the same date and in the  
20 same manner as Chapter 355 of the Laws of 2018.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
22 the roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
25 Announce the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
3 bill is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
5 399, Senate Print 5069, by Senator Parker, an act  
6 to amend Chapter 403 of the Laws of 2018.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
8 the last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
12 the roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
15 Announce the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
17 Calendar 399, those Senators voting in the  
18 negative are Senators Akshar, Antonacci, Jordan,  
19 Jacobs, O'Mara, Ortt and Ranzenhofer.

20 Ayes, 53. Nays, 7.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
22 bill is passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
24 400, Senate Print 5070, by Senator Jackson, an  
25 act to amend Chapter 414 of the Laws of 2018.

1                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Read  
2   the last section.

3                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.   This  
4   act shall take effect immediately.

5                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Call  
6   the roll.

7                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

8                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
9   Announce the results.

10                  THE SECRETARY:    Ayes, 60.

11                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    The  
12   bill is passed.

13                  SENATOR GIANARIS:   Mr. President.

14                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Senator  
15   Gianaris.

16                  SENATOR GIANARIS:    Can we please  
17   recognize that was Senator Jackson's first bill  
18   to pass the Senate.

19                  (Standing ovation.)

20                  THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number  
21   401, Senate Print 1960, by Senator Little, an act  
22   to amend the Tax Law.

23                  SENATOR GIANARIS:    Lay it aside for  
24   the day, please.

25                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Lay it

1     aside for the day.

2                   THE SECRETARY:     Senator LaValle  
3     moves to discharge, from the Committee on Higher  
4     Education, Assembly Bill Number 5500 and  
5     substitute it for the identical Senate Bill 4121,  
6     Third Reading Calendar 402.

7                   ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     The  
8     substitution is so ordered.

9                   The Secretary will read.

10                  THE SECRETARY:     Calendar Number  
11     402, Assembly Print 5500, by Assemblymember  
12     Simon, an act to amend the Education Law.

13                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     Read  
14     the last section.

15                  THE SECRETARY:     Section 3.   This  
16     act shall take effect immediately.

17                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     Call  
18     the roll.

19                  (The Secretary called the roll.)

20                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
21     Announce the results.

22                  THE SECRETARY:     Ayes, 60.

23                  ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:     The  
24     bill is passed.

25                  Senator Gianaris, that completes the



1 reading of the supplemental calendar.

2 SENATOR GIANARIS: Can we now take  
3 up the reading of today's active list,  
4 Mr. President.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
6 Secretary will read.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 26,  
8 Assembly Print 3002, substituted earlier by  
9 Assemblymember Solages, an act to amend the  
10 General Municipal Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
12 the last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This  
14 act shall take effect on the first of January.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
16 the roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
19 Kaminsky to explain his vote.

20 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Thank you.

21 Mr. President, many New Yorkers have  
22 almost literally woke up astounded and astonished  
23 at what local IDAs have done without them  
24 knowing -- what they've done with their taxpayer  
25 money with very little oversight or

1 accountability. One, on Long Island, that cost  
2 school districts millions, there were literally  
3 no members of the public present at the hearing  
4 when that important vote took place.

5               So this measure is simply one of  
6 sunlight, of casting a public eye into the  
7 shadows of IDAs by mandating that where  
8 applicable, they livestream their hearings and  
9 their procedures so that all members of the  
10 public can see what's going on, can get involved  
11 in important decisions being made about their  
12 community with their tax dollars. It's just  
13 simply having these meetings take place on a  
14 website where members of the public can click and  
15 watch what's going on.

16               We know in our society the more  
17 public eyes that are able to see what's going on,  
18 the better the outcome, and it's time we do that  
19 with our IDAs. I vote in the affirmative.

20               Thank you, Mr. President.

21               ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
22 Kaminsky to be recorded in the affirmative.

23               Announce the results.

24               THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
25 Calendar Number 26, those Senators voting in the

1 negative are Senators Akshar, Amedore, Funke,  
2 Helming, Jacobs, Jordan, Ortt, Ranzenhofer,  
3 Ritchie and Tedisco.

4 Ayes, 50. Nays, 10.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
6 bill is passed.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
8 241, Senate Print 2698, by Senator Sepúlveda, an  
9 act to amend the Correction Law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
11 the last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
13 act shall take effect on the 120th day after it  
14 shall have become a law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
16 the roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
19 Sepúlveda to explain his vote.

20 SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA: Thank you,  
21 Mr. President, for allowing me to explain my  
22 vote.

23 I want to thank the leader for  
24 allowing this to come to the floor and my  
25 colleagues for supporting it.

1                   This bill codifies correctional  
2 facilities' current administrative practice of  
3 permitting inmates to have visitors. Research  
4 has found that visitation by family members is  
5 the single most important factor when it comes to  
6 recidivism. The National Institute of  
7 Corrections stated that having any visits at all  
8 was found to reduce recidivism by 13 to  
9 25 percent.

10                  The bill provides that prisons and  
11 jails must have reasonable visitation hours  
12 likely to accommodate visitors from distant parts  
13 of the state. The visits must also be long  
14 enough so that prisoners and their families can  
15 maintain relationship bonds.

16                  The innovations of this bill are  
17 that DOCCS and the jails must publish  
18 overcrowding policies so that visitors can know  
19 what to expect if they arrive and the visiting  
20 room is full.

21                  The provisions will also indicate  
22 that video visitation may supplement but may not  
23 take the place of in-person visits. This is  
24 important because some jails have tried to  
25 replace in-person visitation with video

1     visitation or have shortened their visitation  
2     hours because of the availability of video  
3     visits. Whew, that's a mouthful.

4                 While we support video visitation,  
5     the visits do not have the same quality as  
6     in-person visitation where family members can eat  
7     together, hold hands, play board games or go  
8     outside into facility yards and playgrounds.

9                 As a result of this sensible policy  
10    and the decrease in recidivism, I vote  
11    affirmatively. Thank you.

12                ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Senator  
13    Sepúlveda to be recorded in the affirmative.

14                Senator Helming to explain her vote.

15                SENATOR HELMING:    Thank you,  
16    Mr. President.

17                I'm voting no on this. I don't  
18    believe that we need this legislation.

19                But what we do need to help keep the  
20    incarcerated individuals, the families and the  
21    children who come to visit them, and the people  
22    who work in the prisons safer, is we need better  
23    contraband screening.

24                If you look at the rates of attacks  
25    on people in jails, whether it's the people who

1 are there serving time, whether it's the people  
2 who are working there, it has increased  
3 dramatically over the last few years. In fact,  
4 if you look at every measurable statistic there  
5 is, you're going to see that due to contraband --  
6 whether it's weapons, whether it's drugs, whether  
7 it's drones or cash -- every single thing is  
8 increasing and is creating more issues, safety  
9 issues for the folks in prisons.

10 I've been in the prisons. I've seen  
11 the children running around during the visitation  
12 times, and I worry about their safety. These  
13 rooms are crowded and we have one guard, one  
14 corrections officer at a time monitoring 50,  
15 60 prisoners and the families.

16 We need to do more to increase the  
17 contraband screening, and that's why I would urge  
18 this body to bring forth and pass Bill  
19 Number S162. It's a contraband screening bill.

20 Thank you, Mr. President.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
22 Helming to be recorded in the negative.

23 Announce the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
25 Calendar 241, those Senators voting in the

1 negative are Senators Akshar, Amedore, Antonacci,  
2 Flanagan, Funke, Griffo, Helming, Jacobs, Jordan,  
3 LaValle, Little, O'Mara, Ortt, Ranzenhofer,  
4 Ritchie, Robach, Serino and Tedisco. Also  
5 Senator Boyle.

6 Ayes, 41. Nays 19.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
8 bill is passed.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
10 259, Senate Print 3570, by Senator Serrano, an  
11 act to amend the Tax Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
13 the last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This  
15 act shall take effect immediately.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
17 the roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:  
20 Announce the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: In relation to  
22 Calendar 259, those Senators voting in the  
23 negative are Senators Antonacci and Ortt.

24 Ayes, 58. Nays, 2.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The

1 bill is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
3 272, Assembly Print Number 4204, substituted  
4 earlier by Assemblymember Weprin, an act to amend  
5 the Executive Law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read  
7 the last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
9 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it  
10 shall have become a law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call  
12 the roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
15 Liu to explain his vote.

16 SENATOR LIU: Thank you,  
17 Mr. President. I thank you for this opportunity  
18 to explain my vote on this bill.

19 I proudly sponsor this bill. This  
20 has been a problem that I have been personally  
21 privy to on a number of occasions for the last  
22 many, many years, particularly in the years after  
23 9/11.

24 And honestly, I wish this bill  
25 wouldn't be necessary. Because the fact is



1 religion -- or freedom from religious bias is  
2 already codified in our federal and state laws.

3           Nonetheless, we have had too many  
4 instances, time and time again, of people being  
5 discriminated against in their workplace because  
6 of their religious attire or appearance. And to  
7 this day and age, there are still some people out  
8 there who believe that a Sikh man wears a turban  
9 and his beard or a Muslim woman wears a hijab or  
10 a Jewish man wears a yarmulke because of personal  
11 preference, even some fashion sense, not  
12 understanding that these are fundamental items of  
13 their religious faith.

14           And so this bill becomes necessary.  
15 It's necessary to protect against discrimination.  
16 And ultimately it sends yet a strong message that  
17 bigotry and intolerance will not be tolerated.

18           Thank you, Mr. President.

19           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:    Senator  
20 Liu to be recorded in the affirmative.

21           Senator Thomas to explain his vote.

22           SENATOR THOMAS:    Thank you,  
23 Mr. President.

24           It's about time this bill got to the  
25 floor. It's about time.

1 I just spoke on my two resolutions.  
2 We talked about the rise of intolerance, the rise  
3 of hate. This is one step forward in making sure  
4 that we fix the intolerance, that we go in the  
5 right direction and allow these individuals who  
6 wear a turban, who wear a hijab, to be able to  
7 work, to be able to not be discriminated against.

8 And to Kevin Harrington, the MTA  
9 employee who wears a turban, this is for you.  
10 This bill is for you.

11 Thank you.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
13 Thomas to be recorded in the affirmative.

14 Announce the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
17 bill is passed.

18 (Applause from the audience.)

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number  
20 277, Senate Print 3971, by Senator Savino, an act  
21 creating a temporary state commission to study  
22 and investigate how to regulate artificial  
23 intelligence.

24 SENATOR GIANARIS: Lay it aside for  
25 the day.

1           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Lay it  
2   aside for the day.

3           THE SECRETARY:   Calendar Number  
4   278, Senate Print 4142, by Senator Savino, an act  
5   to amend the State Technology Law.

6           ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Read  
7   the last section.

8           THE SECRETARY:   Section 2.   This  
9   act shall take effect immediately.

10          ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Call  
11   the roll.

12                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

13          ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Senator  
14   Savino to explain her vote.

15          SENATOR SAVINO:   Thank you,  
16   Mr. President.

17                   I want to thank my colleagues for  
18   supporting --

19          ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:   Order  
20   in the chamber -- well, order in the gallery too,  
21   please.

22          SENATOR SAVINO:   I'd like to thank  
23   my colleagues for supporting this legislation.  
24   Blockchain technology, for those of you who are  
25   not aware of what it is, it's a new -- it's

1 actually -- it's not that new, but it is  
2 certainly a new way of doing business.

3           In 2000 the Electronic Signatures  
4 and Records Act recognized that signatures made  
5 via electronic means are legally binding for --  
6 they're as legally binding as handwritten  
7 signatures for all sorts of purposes, whether it  
8 be contracts, whether it be documents. And so  
9 what we are doing is we are updating the  
10 Electronic Signatures and Records Act by adding  
11 blockchain technology.

12           So what is blockchain technology?  
13 It is essentially a distributed database or a  
14 digital ledger existing on multiple computers at  
15 the same time. It is constantly growing as new  
16 sets of recordings or blocks are added to it.  
17 Each block contains a time stamp and a link to  
18 the previous block so they can actually form a  
19 chain. The database is not managed by any  
20 particular body, but instead everyone who is in  
21 the network gets a copy of the whole database.

22           Old blocks are preserved forever;  
23 new blocks are added to the ledger irreversibly,  
24 making it impossible to manipulate by faking  
25 documents, transactions and other information.

1 All the blocks are encrypted so  
2 everyone can have access to all the information,  
3 but only a user who owns a special cryptographic  
4 key is able to add a new record to a particular  
5 chain.

6 As you can imagine, this helps  
7 secure information particularly in contracting.  
8 By definition, blockchain is independent,  
9 transparent and secure. The benefits of  
10 blockchain technology: It leads to cost and risk  
11 reduction, data security, transparency,  
12 efficiency, trust, accountability and  
13 trackability.

14 The uses for blockchain are digital  
15 currency, tracking physical goods in a supply  
16 chain, which could be important in our marijuana  
17 industry in the seed-to-sale model, helping  
18 companies monitor their suppliers in realtime,  
19 protecting genuine and authentic products, things  
20 like olive oil and even designer goods, our  
21 voting systems, and most importantly, real estate  
22 transactions, particularly things like property  
23 deeds.

24 Blockchain can turn any contract  
25 into a program that will be executed only when

1 all contracting parties enter their keys. It is  
2 safe, secure, creates smart contracts, and it can  
3 be used for all sorts of transactions --  
4 financial, insurance, property rental, sales  
5 deeds, legal processes and state contracts.

6 I vote in the affirmative. Thank  
7 you, Mr. President.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator  
9 Savino to be recorded in the affirmative.

10 Announce the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
13 bill is passed.

14 Senator Gianaris, that completes the  
15 reading of today's calendar.

16 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,  
17 let us return to motions and resolutions. And I  
18 would move to adopt the Resolution Calendar at  
19 this time.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: We will  
21 return to motions and resolutions.

22 All in favor of adopting the  
23 Resolution Calendar please signify by saying aye.

24 (Response of "Aye.")

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:

1 Opposed, nay.

2 (No response.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The  
4 Resolution Calendar is adopted.

5 Senator Gianaris.

6 SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you,  
7 Mr. President.

8 Is there any further business at the  
9 desk?

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: There  
11 is no further business at the desk.

12 SENATOR GIANARIS: I move to  
13 adjourn until tomorrow, Wednesday, April 10th, at  
14 11:00 a.m.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: On  
16 motion, the Senate stands adjourned until  
17 Wednesday, April 10th, at 11:00 a.m.

18 (Whereupon, at 5:30 p.m., the Senate  
19 adjourned.)

20

21

22

23

24

25