

1 NEW YORK STATE SENATE

2
3
4 THE STENOGRAPHIC RECORD

5
6
7
8
9 ALBANY, NEW YORK

10 March 19, 2019

11 3:16 p.m.

12
13
14 REGULAR SESSION

15
16
17
18 SENATOR BRIAN A. BENJAMIN, Acting President

19 ALEJANDRA N. PAULINO, ESQ., Secretary

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The
3 Senate will come to order.

4 I ask everyone present to please
5 rise and repeat with me the Pledge of Allegiance.

6 (Whereupon, the assemblage recited
7 the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Bishop
9 Calvin Rice, of the New Jerusalem Worship Center
10 in Jamaica, will give today's invocation.

11 Bishop Rice.

12 BISHOP RICE: Good afternoon to
13 this august body, especially to the Queens and
14 Staten Island delegation, and especially to my
15 Senator, Senator Comrie, and Senator Sanders.

16 May we pray.

17 Dear Lord of heaven and earth, Maker
18 and Ruler of all things, we the benefactors of
19 Your grace, which is renewed each and every day,
20 humbly express our sincere and profound thanks
21 for all things nature has provided for us to
22 sustain life. We are grateful for the water we
23 drink, the air we breathe, and the food we eat.
24 Thank You for the intellect to produce manmade
25 comforts of clothing and shelter.

1 I pray this afternoon that You grant
2 this governing body divine wisdom to legislate
3 laws and ordinances that would enhance and
4 protect the lives of all of its people in every
5 district, every neighborhood throughout this
6 great state.

7 Give these men and women the spirit
8 of unity and purpose to make our state a light in
9 the world, the melting pot of culture and
10 diversity, working and living as one people, so
11 that our state mantra will truly become a
12 reality: Out of many, we are one.

13 We ask this in the name of God of
14 our faith. Amen.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The
16 reading of the Journal.

17 THE SECRETARY: In Senate,
18 March 18, 2019, the Senate met pursuant to
19 adjournment. The Journal of Sunday, March 17,
20 2019, was read and approved. On motion, Senate
21 adjourned.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Without
23 objection, the Journal stands approved as read.

24 Presentation of petitions.

25 Messages from the Assembly.

1 The Secretary will read.

2 THE SECRETARY: On page 17, Senator
3 Kaplan moves to discharge, from the Committee on
4 Investigations and Government Operations,
5 Assembly Bill Number 2221 and substitute it for
6 the identical Senate Bill 4116, Third Reading
7 Calendar 273.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The
9 substitution is so ordered.

10 Messages from the Governor.

11 Reports of standing committees.

12 Reports of select committees.

13 Communications and reports from
14 state officers.

15 Motions and resolutions.

16 Senator Gianaris.

17 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
18 on behalf of Senator Parker, on page 17 I offer
19 the following amendments to Calendar 274, Senate
20 Print 4049, and ask that said bill retain its
21 place on the Third Reading Calendar.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The
23 amendments are received, and the bill shall
24 retain its place on the Third Reading Calendar.

25 SENATOR GIANARIS: Can you call on

1 Senator Griffo, please.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
3 Griffo.

4 SENATOR GRIFFO: Thank you,
5 Mr. President.

6 I move, on behalf of Senator
7 Flanagan, the following bills be discharged from
8 their respective committees and be recommitted:
9 Senate Bills 885, 895, 910, 919, 923, 928, 931,
10 952, 1017, 1058, 1035. And I ask that they be
11 recommitted with instructions to strike the
12 enacting clause.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: It is
14 so ordered.

15 SENATOR GRIFFO: Also,
16 Mr. President, on behalf of Senator Ortt I move
17 the following bill, Senate Bill 4107, be
18 discharged from its respective committee and be
19 recommitted with instructions to strike the
20 enacting clause.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: It is
22 so ordered.

23 Senator Gianaris.

24 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President, I
25 now move to adopt the Resolution Calendar, with

1 the exception of Resolution 687.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: All in
3 favor of adopting the Resolution Calendar, with
4 the exception of Resolution 687, please signify
5 by saying aye.

6 (Response of "Aye.")

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:
8 Opposed, nay.

9 (No response.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The
11 Resolution Calendar is adopted.

12 SENATOR GIANARIS: Can we now take
13 up the reading of the calendar, please.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The
15 Secretary will read.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 47,
17 Senate Print 231, by Senator Kennedy, an act to
18 amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law and the Public
19 Officers Law.

20 SENATOR GRIFFO: Lay it aside.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Lay it
22 aside.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 67,
24 Senate Print 1130A, by Senator Benjamin, an act
25 to amend the Alcoholic Beverage Control Law.

1 SENATOR GRIFFO: Lay it aside.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Lay it
3 aside.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 236, Senate Print 3656, by Senator Kennedy, an
6 act to amend the Public Authorities Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read
8 the last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 9. This
10 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
11 shall have become a law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call
13 the roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
16 Kennedy to explain his vote.

17 SENATOR KENNEDY: Thank you,
18 Mr. President.

19 I rise to support this long-awaited
20 bill, a piece of legislation that would require
21 two additional appointments to transit authority
22 boards across New York State. Those two
23 appointments with voting rights would consist of
24 a transit-dependent rider and a
25 paratransit-dependent rider.

1 We're talking about people who use
2 and rely on these transportation systems each and
3 every day to get to work, to get to school, to
4 get to doctor's appointments, to pay bills, to
5 see family and friends. The reality is these
6 riders should have had this level of
7 participation years ago.

8 We're not asking for a lot. We're
9 simply asking for the people who use these
10 transportation networks to have a seat at the
11 table to have their voices heard and to be part
12 of the decision-making when these authorities are
13 implementing programs and making decisions that
14 have an impact not only on the economy in general
15 in the respective regions across the state, but
16 on the lives of the individuals who depend on
17 those systems.

18 They deserve to have that voice and
19 to have that voice represent the needs of the
20 larger community and their voices. And this
21 isn't just a push coming from this chamber. In
22 Western New York, the County of Erie, the City of
23 Buffalo, the City of Niagara Falls have all
24 passed regulations supporting our efforts.

25 In the various public hearings that

1 we've held with Chairman Leroy Comrie and I
2 across New York State -- on Long Island, in
3 Westchester, in Manhattan, in Buffalo and this
4 upcoming Friday, I assume we'll hear the same in
5 Syracuse -- time and time again we've heard from
6 the ridership that they want their voices heard,
7 they want a seat at the table, and they want a
8 voting position on these boards.

9 So in addition to the dozens of
10 individuals that we've heard from, the genesis of
11 this being a grassroots motivation and advocacy
12 from Day One, we advance this legislation.

13 I want to thank individuals from
14 across the State of New York that have spoken up
15 and spoken out to have their voices heard.
16 Particularly, I'd like to thank those individuals
17 with disabilities that have fought tirelessly to
18 get this bill passed -- individuals like Todd
19 Vaarwerk, of the Western New York Independent
20 Living Center. We want to thank Todd and his
21 organization for speaking so loudly, so
22 decisively and consistently on these measures.
23 Their efforts across this state have not gone
24 unnoticed. They have made a real difference in
25 the lives of New Yorkers and, in advancing this

1 bill, will have continued their efforts.

2 This is a bill that has an impact
3 all across this state. It's calling for stronger
4 transit partnerships, having individuals' voices
5 heard, and it will create a stronger economy and
6 workforce across the state.

7 And with that, I want to thank again
8 our leader, Senator Andrea Stewart-Cousins, and
9 all of those that helped to make this bill a
10 reality here today.

11 Mr. President, I vote aye.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
13 Kennedy to be recorded in the affirmative.

14 Announce the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The
17 bill is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 237, Senate Print 4331, by Senator Gounardes, an
20 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: There
22 is a home-rule message at the desk.

23 The Secretary will read the last
24 section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 8. This

1 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it
2 shall have become a law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call
4 the roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
7 Gounardes to explain his vote.

8 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Mr. President,
9 today is an incredibly important day. Today we
10 are doing more than just passing a bill to renew
11 and expand an initiative that will improve
12 pedestrian safety on our streets by installing
13 speed cameras in New York City school zones.

14 A program which began five years
15 ago, in 2014; a program which has proven to
16 reduce speeding by 63 percent on streets where
17 cameras are installed. And we know, based on
18 unimpeachable data, that the speed at which a car
19 hits another object, whether that is another car,
20 a cyclist, or a pedestrian, determines whether
21 someone gets to live or die, gets seriously
22 injured, or merely escapes with a few scrapes and
23 a possible fender-bender. A program in which
24 81 percent of people who get caught speeding do
25 not get caught again because they change their

1 behavior and slow down.

2 I don't know if all of my colleagues
3 fully grasp the importance of today. Today's
4 vote is about more than just renewing and
5 expanding this program. Today's vote is a
6 positive affirmative statement that New York City
7 streets must be safe for all, because no parent,
8 senior, or pedestrian of any age should live in
9 fear of crossing the street or walking down the
10 boulevard or strolling along the pathway because
11 of speeding traffic.

12 You see, Mr. President, today's vote
13 has been a long time in coming. The
14 authorization to renew the speed camera program
15 expired last year. And despite the herculean
16 efforts of the Department of Transportation, the
17 City of New York, transportation advocates,
18 families who lost loved ones to traffic violence,
19 and even some courageous elected officials, the
20 State Legislature was unable to come to an
21 agreement to keep this program operational.

22 Specifically, Mr. President, this
23 chamber turned its back on the people who walk
24 and travel the streets of New York City. In the
25 face of mountains and mountains of data and reams

1 and reams of reports and story after story after
2 story of personal testimonials, this chamber last
3 year turned a blind eye and a deaf ear to the
4 issue of traffic violence in New York City.

5 But not today, Mr. President. Not
6 today. Today we make good on our promise to
7 protect those who are entrusted to our care, and
8 we honor the memory of those who lost their
9 lives in traffic crashes. I'm a realist,
10 Mr. President. I know that in spite of our
11 biggest hopes and dreams there is pain in this
12 world, there's tragedy in this world, there is
13 sorrow in this world. And yet I'm also an
14 optimist. I know that we can turn pain into
15 purpose so that some good may come from the bad.

16 As the Greek poet Aeschylus so
17 beautifully tells us: Pain which cannot forget
18 falls drop by drop upon the heart until, in our
19 own despair, against our will, comes wisdom
20 through the awful grace of God.

21 Wisdom, Mr. President. Wisdom. The
22 wisdom to understand that despite our deepest
23 sorrows, tomorrow always dawns a new day. The
24 wisdom to accept the tragedy that can befall any
25 of us, and that we can lighten the burden of our

1 pain by ensuring that others don't have to suffer
2 the same fate. The wisdom to know that we can
3 honor the lives and the memories of those we love
4 and lost by doing good.

5 Today we are joined in this chamber
6 for this momentous vote by family members of
7 those who have died in traffic crashes. They,
8 more than any other experts, analysts or
9 advocates, have turned this cause from a debate
10 about facts and figures into a fight for people's
11 lives. It is on the wings of their fallen
12 angels that the cause of ending pedestrian deaths
13 has been uplifted.

14 When these families held a vigil in
15 memory of their loved ones during last year's
16 fight to renew this program, they were mocked by
17 staff members employed by this chamber. The
18 candles they placed on the streets to honor their
19 loved ones were kicked over and smashed.

20 Where some might consider defeat in
21 the face of such contempt, these brave families,
22 fortified by their spirits of their lost angels,
23 redoubled their commitment to the cause of ending
24 preventable deaths from speeding traffic.

25 From pain which cannot forget comes

1 wisdom through the grace of God, Mr. President.
2 What we are doing today is guided by wisdom.
3 Wisdom from those precious angels who sacrificed
4 made today possible. Today our actions are
5 guided by those angels. Today those angels are
6 with us as we cast our votes. Today we affirm
7 that those who perished did not die in vain, that
8 their loss has led us to a higher good. That
9 this is not just about a speed limit or a camera
10 or a school zone -- that today is about the
11 positive affirmation that our streets ought to be
12 safe for all and will be safe for all.

13 And so, Mr. President, in honor of
14 Vivian, the aunt that I never met, and in honor
15 of Sammy and Ida and Ally, Seth, Giovanni, Jamie,
16 and all those who have died in traffic crashes, I
17 proudly vote aye and I urge my colleagues to do
18 the same.

19 Thank you.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
21 Gounardes to be recorded in the affirmative.

22 Senator Kennedy to explain his vote.

23 SENATOR KENNEDY: Thank you,
24 Mr. President.

25 First of all, let me just start by

1 congratulating Senator Gounardes on passing this
2 legislation today.

3 You know, there are certain things
4 that are emblazoned in our memories down here in
5 the Senate. When I was a freshman Senator, one
6 of the first things I did is visited the then
7 Transportation Chairman Chuck Fuschillo and say
8 "It's so imperative that we pass a ban on texting
9 and driving." He said, We're going to get it
10 done and we're going to get it done this year,
11 and we did. That was back in 2011, driven by
12 Families Against Texting While Driving.

13 Another thing that was blazed into
14 my memory was this year, now as the chairman of
15 Transportation, on my first day in that role
16 Senator Gounardes approached me and said, "We
17 need to get this safety program implemented in
18 the City of New York to save children's lives.
19 It's been long-stalled, politics have gotten in
20 the way, and we cannot allow it to languish any
21 further."

22 And so, Senator Gounardes, I
23 congratulate you on this victory for the people
24 of the City of New York, for the children, for
25 the families that have fought so hard for this,

1 for the Families for Safe Streets that stepped up
2 and wouldn't take no for an answer. For parents
3 like Amy Cohen, who joined us today in memory of
4 her son who was killed in school zone, Sammy
5 Eckstein.

6 No lives should be lost that are
7 preventable, and we are taking steps today to
8 prevent lives being lost, injuries taking place.
9 And there's no question in my mind by passing
10 this legislation and legislation that we're going
11 to be coming back to that will keep kids safe in
12 the City of Buffalo that I have sponsored, we're
13 going to do just that.

14 I applaud you, Senator Gounardes.
15 Congratulations, and to all the families involved
16 in their advocacy.

17 With that, Mr. President, I vote
18 aye.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
20 Kennedy to be recorded in the affirmative.

21 Senator Hoylman to explain his vote.

22 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Thank you,
23 Mr. President.

24 I rise too to thank the sponsor,
25 Senator Gounardes, and the Transportation chair,

1 Senator Kennedy, for advancing this bill finally
2 to the floor for consideration.

3 I'm a parent of an 8-year-old at an
4 elementary school in Greenwich Village, where
5 there is no speed camera. And under this
6 legislation passing today, finally, there will be
7 a speed camera outside of P.S. 41 in
8 Greenwich Village, Manhattan.

9 And me and countless parents like
10 me, when we walk our children to school in the
11 morning and pick them up in the evening, we will
12 have peace of mind with the statistics showing
13 speed cameras reduce crashes, reduce fatalities,
14 and make our streets safer. So thank you.

15 And to the families who organized
16 and became activists after having lost loved
17 ones, I say thank you from my family to yours.
18 Because of your efforts, we're passing this
19 legislation today. And yes, there were many
20 years where you were frustrated and locked out of
21 the Senate chamber, where your voices were not
22 heard. But as Senator Gounardes said, that
23 changes today.

24 And to Amy Cohen and her mother Joan
25 Dean, a constituent of mine, I say thank you as

1 well. You lost a son and a grandson, but in the
2 process you started a movement, and today the
3 fruits of your labor are manifest.

4 I vote aye.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
6 Hoylman to be recorded in the affirmative.

7 Senator Sepúlveda to explain his
8 vote.

9 SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA: Thank you,
10 Mr. President, for allowing me to speak.

11 First of all, I want to send my love
12 and congratulations to the family members who
13 have lost children to this problem with speed
14 cameras throughout the city and the State of
15 New York. My heart goes out to each and every
16 one of you. You are primarily responsible for
17 making this happen today.

18 I want to thank our leader, Senator
19 Stewart-Cousins, Senator Kennedy, the
20 Transportation chair. And I want to especially
21 thank Senator Gounardes. It's so refreshing to
22 have a member from that district in this
23 community actually stand up for children and put
24 children first. You made a promise to the people
25 in your community, you fought for that promise,

1 and today you made it a reality. So
2 congratulations.

3 Today we have to make sure that this
4 legislation becomes the reality that it will. We
5 must protect our kids from all dangers.
6 According to the findings of the New York City
7 Department of Transportation, there's been a
8 60 percent drop in speeding infractions in
9 locations where speed safety cameras have been
10 installed.

11 Speed safety cameras can propel a
12 motorist to watch their speed limit if they do
13 not want a ticket by slowing down their speed in
14 school zones and preventing any further accidents
15 involving children.

16 The New York City Department of
17 Transportation also reports that the risk of
18 pedestrian deaths at a speed of 20 miles per hour
19 decreases to 45 percent from the speed of 30
20 miles per hour, which is a significant safety
21 measure and a significant safety improvement.

22 Currently only 7 percent of the
23 New York City schoolchildren go to school with a
24 speed safety camera nearby. It is adamant that
25 we expand this program so that more schools can

1 benefit from the enhanced safety that is
2 associated with having speed cameras nearby.

3 I vote in the affirmative. Thank
4 you.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
6 Sepúlveda to be recorded in the affirmative.

7 Senator Lanza to explain his vote.

8 SENATOR LANZA: Thank you,
9 Mr. President.

10 I'm not going to wax poetic, but I'm
11 going to talk a little turkey. Unfortunately, I
12 can't support this bill in its present form.

13 I wrote one of the first bills
14 dealing with speed cameras a number of years ago,
15 which we were not able to get through the
16 Assembly and which the city really was not happy
17 about because that bill would place cameras in
18 places where we actually knew there was a need
19 for it, where there were a history of injuries
20 and accidents.

21 And I know that this bill -- I wish
22 it were about safety, but I know it's not. I
23 hear about the mountains of data. The only
24 mountains this will create is the mountains of
25 cash that the city is looking to take from

1 people.

2 I know this from experience on
3 Staten Island. If you watch where they put the
4 cameras, we have some roads on Staten Island
5 which would be considered country roads
6 everywhere else in the state -- big, large roads
7 in sparsely populated areas. Where there aren't
8 a lot of accidents -- aren't any accidents. And
9 that's precisely where the cameras go.
10 Because -- oh, and by the way, a couple of years
11 ago somebody thought, hey, let's go from a
12 35-mile-an-hour speed limit on these roads, let's
13 make it 25 miles an hour. And these set up for
14 the perfect speed traps.

15 Remember those old movies where they
16 portrayed that sheriff down south hiding behind a
17 billboard? Well, that's what we have on Staten
18 Island, where cameras go precisely where they
19 know they can get money, not where they can
20 ensure safety.

21 And by the way, the city has already
22 come out with its estimate with respect to how
23 much money it's going to generate. So they're
24 counting on the money, they're not counting on
25 the safety. You do not generate the hundreds of

1 millions of dollars of revenues that the city is
2 counting on unless people are going to ignore the
3 cameras and speed through those locations. In
4 fact, we know the few cameras that are already
5 out there, they've already generated more than
6 \$200 million. Two hundred million dollars
7 generated because people said we're going to
8 continue to do what we do.

9 There are better ways to do it. If
10 we really cared about safety and protecting
11 people around schools, we would pass once again
12 the bill that I've carried for 10 years here. I
13 actually wrote the bill when I was in the City
14 Council. The then chairman of the Transportation
15 Committee, then-Councilman John Liu, now Senator
16 John Liu, supported it, as well as I think 47 of
17 my colleagues out of 51 people.

18 We passed it I think almost
19 unanimously in this chamber, bipartisan,
20 Democrat, Republican. The Assembly said no.
21 What it does is it creates a real school safety
22 zone. It says that we're going to put a stop
23 sign or a traffic signal at the four corners
24 surrounding every single school in our city.

25 You know why the city doesn't want

1 it? Because they know it's more effective than
2 cameras. They know stop signs slow people down
3 more effectively than a camera that no one knows
4 is there.

5 If this legislation was serious
6 about safety, you know what it would require? A
7 sign. A sign on the road that says there's a
8 speed camera coming up. It may mean less money
9 to the City of New York, but I'll tell you what
10 it does mean. People will see that sign, and
11 they'll stop, they'll slow down. If we really
12 cared about safety.

13 I'm going to wrap up, Mr. President.
14 I didn't want to lay the bill aside to prolong
15 things today, I wanted to explain my vote, so I'm
16 going to do that.

17 If we cared about safety, I think
18 Senator Kennedy mentioned it, the number-one
19 killer on our roads today is distracted driving.
20 Texting while driving is the number-one killer.
21 This bill does nothing to do that.

22 So I believe this bill does nothing
23 but create a false sense of security. I wish it
24 would save lives. I don't think it's going to.
25 There are better ways to do it. I think the

1 people I represent back home know that there's
2 nothing more -- this is about money and not about
3 safety.

4 Mr. President, I vote in the
5 negative.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
7 Lanza to be recorded in the negative.

8 Senator Krueger to explain her vote.

9 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you,
10 Mr. President.

11 I rise proudly to support this bill.
12 I certainly want to thank the lead sponsor,
13 Andrew Gounardes, for bringing it to us today and
14 for us passing it. And I'm glad that Buffalo is
15 trying the same thing.

16 There is nothing worse than seeing a
17 parent have to bury their child. It is the
18 opposite of everything we know about the cycle of
19 life when children bury their parents. Nothing
20 is worse than a child who dies for no reason
21 other than going school, being hit by a vehicle.

22 And this bill will save lives. It
23 has already saved lives with the existing
24 program. I just want to read some statistics
25 quickly and that might have already been said by

1 some of my colleagues.

2 Studies based on similar programs
3 worldwide show that speed cameras reduce
4 fatalities and crash injuries by 30 to
5 40 percent. And an analysis of the Federal
6 Highway Administration found that speed cameras
7 reduce the likelihood of a crash on urban
8 arterial roads by 54 percent. These are exactly
9 the kind of streets we have in Brooklyn, in
10 Queens, and almost every avenue and cross-town
11 street in my borough of Manhattan.

12 We know that this works because
13 we've already been doing it. And yet we let it
14 sunset without addressing what we should have
15 taken clear responsibility for last year. We
16 can't move forward quickly enough.

17 I don't know where other people who
18 are voting no live. I know Staten Island; I
19 don't necessarily know the communities other
20 legislators who are voting no live in. But I bet
21 every single one of you have been to my borough,
22 Manhattan. And you know what a crowded street
23 looks like. And you know what people standing at
24 the street corners and children running back and
25 forth, hopefully following the signs and the

1 instructions, are focused on. And you know that
2 tickets are a deterrence from behavior. And
3 that's what this bill is about.

4 Hopefully the City of New York won't
5 raise enormous amounts of revenue because people
6 will get one ticket or two tickets and then they
7 will slow down. And that's what this is about.
8 Because slowing down will save not just
9 children's lives, because these are in school
10 zones, but also senior citizens' lives. Because
11 guess what? They don't run out of the way as
12 fast as a lot of us can.

13 So even though it's designed for
14 school zones and protecting the lives of
15 children, it's protecting the lives of everyone.
16 I'm so glad that we are passing this today, I
17 believe in both houses, and it will become law.
18 It is very important legislation.

19 Thank you, Mr. President.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
21 Krueger to be recorded in the affirmative.

22 Senator Ramos to explain her vote.

23 SENATOR RAMOS: Thank you,
24 Mr. President.

25 Miguel Torres, Giovanni Ampuero,

1 Ovidio Jaramillo, Luis Bravo, Jahir Figueroa and
2 Noshat Nahian. Those are the six boys my
3 district has lost since 2012 along Northern
4 Boulevard, which is in desperate need of a
5 redesign.

6 Approximately 12,000 children go to
7 school on or off Northern Boulevard, and we have
8 three more schools coming. I want to point out
9 that the deaths of these children were not
10 accidents. And I don't appreciate the use of the
11 word "accidents" when in reality they are crashes
12 that could have been prevented. Most if not all
13 of these children died because drivers did not
14 yield to pedestrians when they have the right of
15 way.

16 And for us it's really important to
17 have these speed cameras at every single school
18 as a deterrent. My children attend P.S. 69 in
19 Jackson Heights; they're in kindergarten and
20 second grade. I often cross Northern Boulevard
21 with my boys to take them to piano lessons and
22 the like.

23 And I can't praise Senator
24 Gounardes's work enough and thank Senator Kennedy
25 for his leadership in the Transportation

1 Committee, and all my colleagues who are
2 supporting this. Because in reality, only
3 7 percent of children actually attend a school
4 with a speed camera right now, and we've actually
5 seen fewer crashes and fewer people speeding
6 outside of these schools.

7 So I just want to thank my
8 colleagues who will be voting, along with me, aye
9 in favor of this bill. Thank you.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
11 Ramos to be recorded in the affirmative.

12 Senator Stavisky to explain her
13 vote.

14 SENATOR STAVISKY: Thank you,
15 Mr. President.

16 But thank you to Senator Gounardes,
17 and especially to the work of the parents and the
18 advocates.

19 I was just amazed at what two of my
20 constituents and their families have been able to
21 do, and that's Amy Liao and H.P. Liao when their
22 daughter was hit by a taxi on Main Street in
23 downtown Flushing. It was their energy and their
24 commitment and their understanding of how hard it
25 was going to be. And we kept saying there will

1 be success.

2 And I remember a night, I think it
3 was last year, we were in session, and there was
4 Amy Liao in the T-shirt grabbing legislators and
5 explaining firsthand why we need the speed
6 cameras and the red light cameras.

7 So I thank the Liao family and I
8 thank my colleagues. This, I think, will go down
9 as a lifesaving measure.

10 Thank you, Mr. President. I vote
11 aye.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
13 Stavisky to be recorded in the affirmative.

14 Senator Liu to explain his vote.

15 SENATOR LIU: Thank you,
16 Mr. President.

17 I usually don't explain my vote on
18 what I consider no-brainers. But, you know, this
19 is important legislation. And my buddy Senator
20 Lanza decided to wax nostalgic about our City
21 Council days.

22 I do want to say that stop signs,
23 traffic lights and other traffic control devices
24 are effective. They work. They certainly slow
25 people down as well as control traffic

1 appropriately. And other signage also helped as
2 well. But they're not the only things. And
3 speed cameras slow drivers down, it is just
4 indisputable.

5 And so this legislation is
6 necessary. I think it was a shame that last year
7 this legislation was held up due to petty
8 politics. But I'm very happy, I'm very proud of
9 Senator Gounardes. You know, he could have taken
10 this bill and passed it immediately in our first
11 weeks in session, but he took the time -- while
12 the emergency order still authorized the speed
13 cameras to be in effect, he took the time,
14 working with Chair Kennedy, to put together
15 legislation that will factor in everybody's
16 concerns appropriately, while never losing sight
17 of the fact that we need this legislation in
18 order to save the lives of young children who are
19 doing nothing except going to school. That's
20 what they're doing, they're going to school.

21 I proudly vote yes for this
22 legislation.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
24 Liu to be recorded in the affirmative.

25 Senator Biaggi to explain her vote.

1 SENATOR BIAGGI: Thank you,
2 Mr. President.

3 I rise today with pride to vote aye
4 for this bill and commend Senator Gounardes for
5 his efforts to ensuring that what he promised
6 during his campaign came to fruition here in this
7 chamber today.

8 It goes without saying nothing
9 should ever stand in the way of the safety of our
10 children. And I echo my colleague Senator Liu's
11 sentiment that this is yet again another example
12 of how this conference is putting people over
13 politics to reduce deaths, increase safety, and
14 ensure that our communities' well-being is put
15 first.

16 In the effort to be intellectually
17 honest in this chamber, which I think we all
18 would agree is a really important value, if you
19 read the bill, here's what it actually does. So
20 it specifically requires the Department of
21 Transportation to use data analysis based on
22 traffic speed and traffic crashes. The existing
23 program has reduced speeding by 63 percent. And
24 moreover, this bill requires the Department of
25 Transportation to report how much money they make

1 from the program and how much they are
2 reinvesting into street safety and pedestrian
3 safety improvements.

4 That was not to bore people but just
5 to make sure that we're sticking to what the bill
6 says.

7 Again, Mr. President, I proudly vote
8 aye.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
10 Biaggi to be recorded in the affirmative.

11 Senator Jackson to explain his vote.

12 SENATOR JACKSON: Thank you,
13 Mr. President and my colleagues.

14 I rise in order to support my
15 colleague in this particular bill. And many of
16 you know that I was in the City Council of
17 New York and I chaired the Education Committee
18 for eight years. I was the president of a school
19 board. So I know about schools and I know about,
20 you know, children and how they play and how they
21 chase one another and how they run in the street.
22 And how people speed.

23 And I say to you and to any of my
24 colleagues that think this is about money for the
25 State of New York or the City of New York, that's

1 not what it's about. It's about saving lives and
2 not injuring children and killing children in
3 school districts.

4 So I wholeheartedly support this
5 legislation, knowing that we're going to be
6 saving children's lives as a result of this
7 particular action. And if I had my way, it would
8 be in front of every school in New York City, not
9 just 740. And in fact we need to deal with that.

10 And those people that say no, it's
11 going to be a cash cow for the City of New York,
12 my colleague Simcha Felder sitting next to me,
13 who we served in the City Council, we said that
14 the money should be put in a lockbox and be used
15 for safety and security around schools. And
16 that's what we need to do, that no one can use
17 the money for anything other than the safety and
18 security of the children that we represent.

19 So my colleague, I thank you for
20 putting this forward. To the families that have
21 lost someone, we know that your lives have
22 changed forever, but we're going to take action
23 in order to save other children's lives in this
24 process.

25 And I vote aye.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
2 Jackson to be recorded in the affirmative.

3 Senator Flanagan to explain his
4 vote.

5 SENATOR FLANAGAN: Thank you,
6 Mr. President.

7 I've listened with interest and keen
8 intent to everything that was just brought
9 forward by my colleagues. I don't agree with
10 everything that's been said. There probably is
11 no day where anyone will agree with everything
12 that's said anyway.

13 Having been involved in these
14 discussions at regular levels, at a little bit
15 higher levels, and at the highest levels, I'm
16 going to just say that I just know Senator Lanza
17 and the rest of my colleagues care very deeply
18 about the well-being and safety of children no
19 matter what the venue.

20 I'm the father of three children.
21 My kids are 30, 28 and 25. They're still my
22 children. My daughter is a maven in the New York
23 City transit system and subways and everything
24 else. There isn't a day that goes by when she's
25 walking or on a subway or on a bus where I'm not

1 worried to death. And it doesn't have anything
2 to do with the fact that she's in the City of
3 New York, because she loves it. And it's a
4 fabulous place.

5 I worry about my boys. So as a
6 parent, fundamentally, I think we all share the
7 same concerns.

8 And I do believe that these cameras
9 will be a deterrent. But I also very strongly
10 believe, very strongly believe and want to
11 associate myself with the remarks of Senator
12 Andrew Lanza. He and I have spent many, many,
13 many hours talking about issues just like this.
14 And all he cares about, for everyone in the state
15 and in the city, is what's the right thing to do.

16 Now, one of my new colleagues got up
17 and spoke eloquently, and I agree with him to an
18 extent. This is about safety, it is about
19 children, and it is about the well-being of
20 people all across the State of New York. But I'm
21 not dancing around this; this is also about
22 money.

23 There were comments made about
24 safety and security, and we're in the throes of a
25 budget right now where we're dealing with issues

1 with a prescription drug tax that's not dedicated
2 to anything involving treatment. We're in the
3 throes of talking about highways, roads and
4 bridges and transit and a dedicated box for that.

5 I don't know how we can advance
6 legislation like this, full well knowing that
7 it's going to generate hundreds of millions of
8 dollars to the City of New York. And they have
9 no requirement, none -- some lofty words,
10 perhaps, but no requirement whatsoever to
11 reinvest dollar for dollar.

12 If this were all even and everything
13 was being done the right way, in my opinion, the
14 money that would be generated from this program
15 should go directly to the things that we've
16 spoken about -- speed bumps, flashing lights,
17 beacons, whatever you want to call them.
18 Reinvest. And you can write that right into the
19 legislation. Don't give the City of New York the
20 latitude. They came here asking for support.
21 It's part of our obligation to keep their feet to
22 the fire, as we've talked about before.

23 I appreciate the efforts that have
24 been advanced here, but I'm voting no because
25 this is hundreds of millions of dollars that the

1 city has no obligation whatsoever to reinvest for
2 further safety and protection of New York City
3 residents.

4 Thank you, Mr. President.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
6 Flanagan to be recorded in the negative.

7 There is a substitution at the desk.

8 The Secretary will read.

9 THE SECRETARY: On page 15, Senator
10 Gounardes moves to discharge, from the Committee
11 on Transportation, Assembly Bill Number 6449 and
12 substitute it for the identical Senate Bill 4331,
13 Third Reading Calendar 237.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The
15 substitution is so ordered.

16 Announce the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
18 Calendar Number 237, those Senators recorded in
19 the negative are Senators Akshar, Amedore,
20 Antonacci, Felder, Flanagan, Funke, Gallivan,
21 Jacobs, Jordan, Lanza, LaValle, Ortt,
22 Ranzenhofer, Robach, Serino, Seward and Tedisco.
23 Also Senator Boyle.

24 Ayes, 43. Nays, 18.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The

1 bill is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 247, Senate Print 2848, by Senator Breslin, an
4 act to amend the Insurance Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read
6 the last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
8 act shall take effect immediately.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:
13 Announce the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The
16 bill is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 267, Senate Print 55, by Senator Hoylman, an act
19 to amend the Alcoholic Beverage Control Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read
21 the last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
23 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
24 shall have become a law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call

1 the roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
4 Hoylman to explain his vote.

5 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Thank you,
6 Mr. President.

7 And thanks to my colleagues for
8 their support of this legislation and our
9 colleague in the Assembly, Assemblywoman Deborah
10 Glick, for helping me advance this bill.

11 This legislation is very commonsense
12 because currently the Alcoholic Beverage Control
13 Law does not require the State Liquor Authority
14 to list specifics about licenses. All that you
15 are able to discover if you're a member of the
16 public is the name of the premises, the address,
17 the name of the principals who control the
18 license, the type of license it is, when the
19 license holder received the license and the dates
20 when it was last renewed and whether it is active
21 or inactive.

22 But key aspects of that license, key
23 aspects to members of my community and presumably
24 yours, such as the hours of operation, the size
25 of the premises and whether any special

1 conditions on the license holder have been
2 imposed are omitted.

3 So if you're a member of the public
4 in my community, which has a multitude of SLA
5 licenses, and you go to the public information
6 database, you have no information about whether
7 there is live music permitted or whether there is
8 an outdoor patio permitted. In order to get that
9 information, you actually have to file a Freedom
10 of Information Law request.

11 It shouldn't be that way. It
12 shouldn't be that difficult to find out whether
13 the noisy bar down the street is acting within
14 the parameters of the SLA license.

15 And worse, Mr. President, even our
16 local police precincts do not have access to that
17 information.

18 So this legislation, which I'm so
19 pleased is on the floor today, will require that
20 the public license query database include that
21 pertinent information of a license. So I vote
22 aye on behalf of my community.

23 Thank you, Mr. President.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
25 Hoylman to be recorded in the affirmative.

1 Announce the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
3 Calendar Number 267, those Senators recorded in
4 the negative are Senators Akshar, Antonacci,
5 Griffo, Jordan and Ortt. Also Senator Little,
6 Senator Ritchie, Senator Amedore, Senator Seward
7 and Senator Robach.

8 Ayes, 51. Nays, 10.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The
10 bill is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 273, Assembly Bill 2221, substituted earlier by
13 Assemblymember Schimminger, an act to amend
14 Chapter 396 of the Laws of 2010.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read
16 the last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
18 act shall take effect immediately.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call
20 the roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:
23 Announce the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The

1 bill is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 286, Senate Print 3444, by Senator Harckham, an
4 act to amend the Executive Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Read
6 the last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
8 act shall take effect immediately.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Call
10 the roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
13 Helming to explain her vote.

14 SENATOR HELMING: Thank you,
15 Mr. President. I rise to explain my vote.

16 As the ranker on the Commerce,
17 Economic Development and Small Business Committee
18 and also the ranker on the Legislative Commission
19 on Rural Resources, I want to thank Senator
20 Harckham for advocating for our inland waterways.

21 Our inland lakes are economic
22 drivers for New York State. Many of these water
23 bodies, including the Finger Lakes, also provide
24 safe drinking water for hundreds of thousands of
25 residents, visitors and small businesses. We

1 must protect our lakes for their economic and
2 environmental impacts.

3 That's why I'm imploring the
4 Majority to bring to the floor and pass another
5 bill related to inland waterways: Senate Bill
6 Number 2270. This bill creates the Finger Lakes
7 Community Preservation Act. It will protect the
8 Finger Lakes from the potential pollution
9 associated with the construction of new trash
10 burners. This bill passed our house unanimously
11 last year, and it never got taken up by the
12 Assembly. But I'm proud to report that just last
13 week, the Assembly picked it up and passed it
14 unanimously.

15 So again, I'm urging the Majority to
16 protect our Finger Lakes as well, to pick up this
17 bill and let's get it passed, get it on the desk
18 of the Governor to get it signed sooner rather
19 than later.

20 I vote yes, Mr. President.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
22 Helming to be recorded in the affirmative.

23 Senator Harckham to explain his
24 vote.

25 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Thank you,

1 Mr. President.

2 First I'd like to thank Senator
3 Helming for her support of this and just say that
4 this may not rise to the level of life and death
5 as some of the bills we've discussed here today,
6 but it does impact the water quality for some
7 8 million residents in New York City and
8 Westchester County.

9 First, I want to thank
10 Senator Krueger for expediting this, and
11 certainly colleagues who have been here in the
12 past for establishing the inland waterways and
13 coastal waterways program. Many of you were
14 here, you established it, you continually have
15 added water bodies to it. And this is simply
16 adding three more.

17 There are three more in the Muscote
18 Watershed, which is in the Croton Watershed,
19 which is part of the New York City water supply.

20 The reason this is important is that
21 it allows them to access funding to address their
22 phosphorus reduction needs. They exceed their
23 total maximum daily load for phosphorus, which as
24 we know causes eutrophication, which is toxic to
25 drink and very expensive to clean up.

1 When people in my area talk about
2 unfunded mandates, this is the mother of all
3 unfunded mandates. When this TMDL came down as
4 part of the MS4, these small communities were
5 handed a \$500 million bill to remove phosphorus.
6 So that's an aside that we can talk about at
7 another time.

8 But this is crucial, this bill
9 today, to allow them to access the Environmental
10 Protection Fund, East of Hudson funds and others,
11 to help with the remediation efforts.

12 So I thank my colleagues and I vote
13 aye.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
15 Harckham to be recorded in the affirmative.

16 Announce the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The
19 bill is passed.

20 Senator Gianaris.

21 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
22 the bill that we just passed was Senator
23 Harckham's first in the State Senate.

24 (Standing ovation.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator

1 Gianaris, that completes the reading of today's
2 noncontroversial calendar.

3 SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you,
4 Mr. President.

5 Can we call on Senator Kaplan for an
6 introduction, please.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
8 Kaplan.

9 SENATOR KAPLAN: Thank you,
10 Mr. President.

11 It is my great privilege this
12 afternoon to welcome several distinguished guests
13 to the Senate chamber. Joining us today we have
14 several individuals who have traveled to Albany
15 to raise awareness of and give voice to those
16 touched by nephrotic syndrome, FSGS, and chronic
17 kidney disease.

18 Each year 8,000 Americans are
19 diagnosed with nephrotic syndrome, contributing
20 to the millions currently living with some form
21 of chronic kidney disease. Nephrotic syndrome
22 can be caused by a variety of forms of kidney
23 damage and can have lifelong consequences for the
24 person affected by it, including multiple
25 hospitalizations, a rigorous medical routine, the

1 need for a kidney transplant and, sadly, even
2 death.

3 Our guests are here today to share
4 their stories in order to raise awareness of this
5 devastating medical condition so that we all can
6 do more to direct needed attention and resources
7 toward finding better treatments and ultimately a
8 cure.

9 With that, please join me in
10 extending a warm welcome to Marlene, Anthony and
11 Jacqueline Botta; Chrissie, Kathy, Jamie and Ryan
12 Franceschini; Erika and Elijah Bonatti; Ray,
13 Karen, Ray Jr. and Kathrine Grech.

14 Thank you.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Thank
16 you, Senator Kaplan.

17 To our guests, we extend our welcome
18 and the privileges and courtesies of this house.
19 Please rise and be recognized.

20 (Standing ovation.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
22 Gianaris.

23 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
24 can we now return back to motions and resolutions
25 and begin with previously adopted Resolution 635,

1 by Senator Stavisky, read its title only, and
2 call on Senator Stavisky, please.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Motions
4 and resolutions.

5 The Secretary will read.

6 THE SECRETARY: Senate Resolution
7 Number 635, by Senator Stavisky, memorializing
8 Governor Andrew M. Cuomo to proclaim March 19,
9 2019, as Queens Day in the State of New York.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
11 Stavisky on the resolution.

12 SENATOR STAVISKY: Thank you,
13 Mr. President.

14 And we welcome some other colleagues
15 from Queens: The borough president of Queens,
16 Melinda Katz, former Assemblymember.

17 (Applause.)

18 SENATOR STAVISKY: And to her right
19 is the deputy borough president, Sharon Lee.

20 (Applause.)

21 SENATOR STAVISKY: And to her left
22 is the chairperson of the Queens Chamber of
23 Commerce, Thomas Santucci.

24 (Applause.)

25 SENATOR STAVISKY: And some of you

1 may remember him as a young man when his father,
2 John Santucci, served in this chamber from 1968
3 until 1976. Welcome back.

4 And to his left is Tom Grech, the
5 president and CEO of the Queens Chamber of
6 Commerce.

7 (Applause.)

8 SENATOR STAVISKY: Mr. President, I
9 am a Queens resident by choice, not by birth.

10 And Queens is absolutely the most
11 diverse, the most culturally different borough in
12 the City of New York. It is many things. It's a
13 city -- a town, rather, a county, whatever you
14 want to call it, of 2.3 million people. We speak
15 138 languages. We come from 150 different
16 countries. And it is the largest of the five
17 counties in the City of New York.

18 When you see somebody from Queens
19 and you say to them, Where are you from, they're
20 not going to say Queens. They're going to say
21 Long Island City, they're going to say Astoria,
22 they're going to say Maspeth, Jamaica, Flushing,
23 Forest Hills, whatever. And those are the post
24 office designations as well.

25 So we represent neighborhoods. We

1 are also the home to two of the three major
2 airports in the City of New York. So newcomers
3 come first to Queens, they land in Queens --
4 hopefully many of them will stay, and others will
5 go on to the other parts of our country.

6 We are a tourist destination where
7 they come to Queens to see our galleries, our
8 museums, they come for the sporting events, for
9 the New York Mets and for the U.S. Tennis matches
10 in the fall. They come to see our movie studios
11 and our TV studios. Kaufman Astoria Studios and
12 Silvercup film many of the movies but
13 particularly the television episodes for many of
14 the cable as well as other broadcast stations.

15 We in Queens can satisfy any
16 culinary desire. We have restaurants from all
17 over the world. Borough President Katz's
18 predecessor Helen Marshall used to say "Come to
19 Queens and see the world," and you can certainly
20 find something to eat to satisfy every taste.

21 We have institutions of higher
22 education: Queens College, Queensborough,
23 LaGuardia, York, St. John's. We have all kinds
24 of higher educational -- world-renowned
25 institutions of higher education.

1 And we have Resorts World, if you
2 have a little extra money to spend. We have
3 Aqueduct, if you want to come and watch the
4 horses. We have something to satisfy everybody's
5 taste.

6 But most importantly, we are a
7 borough of businesses, of local businesses. And
8 in fact two-thirds of the businesses employ
9 between one and four people, and 90 percent
10 employ 10 or fewer people. And that's why we as
11 a conference try to reduce taxes, because we want
12 business to stay. We are a welcoming community
13 for certainly businesses.

14 But the most important thing I can
15 say about Queens is that we are diverse, we come
16 from all over the world, but we speak with one
17 voice. We get along. If you notice, the Queens
18 delegation is very cohesive here. We work
19 together with our partners in the Assembly and
20 our partners in business.

21 And we welcome the Queens Chamber of
22 Commerce, and we invite to the Hart Lounge, 5:30
23 this evening. Between 5:30 and 7:30 we have over
24 50 businesses providing food -- businesses, I was
25 told and -- I think the word that was used was

1 distilleries. Whatever that means.

2 (Laughter.)

3 SENATOR STAVISKY: Come, enjoy, and
4 come again to visit.

5 Thank you, Mr. President.

6 (Applause.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
8 Gianaris on the resolution.

9 SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you,
10 Mr. President.

11 Unlike Senator Stavisky, I am a
12 Queens resident by birth as well as by choice.
13 And the choice was that that my parents made when
14 they emigrated to the United States. Like so
15 many other residents of Queens, they decided that
16 was the perfect place to make their home.

17 And now, decades later, they are
18 still there, as are so many immigrant families,
19 living out the American dream of a middle class,
20 a working class, a success story, where their
21 kids were able to go to school, get educated, and
22 now represent them in this esteemed body as well.

23 Senator Stavisky mentioned so many
24 of the things that make Queens special. She
25 forgot to mention the two airports, which is

1 where so many people see as the gateway both to
2 New York and the country, and they are both in
3 the process of actually being renovated to
4 present a better face for our city and our state
5 to those from all over the world who come to
6 visit.

7 And I could not be prouder to be
8 a resident and to represent a county that is
9 represented by our esteemed borough president,
10 Melinda Katz, who's with us today -- we welcome
11 her back to the State Capitol where she spent so
12 many years in public service -- and to represent
13 the type of people and the type of values, of
14 passing on to the next generation something
15 better than they had for themselves, because that
16 is what Queens represents to me.

17 In addition to the great food and
18 the great entertainment and the great sports and
19 everything else that happens there, the best
20 thing about Queens is that it is filled with
21 people that care more about others than they do
22 about themselves. And for that reason, I am
23 incredibly proud and honored.

24 And I do want to welcome all the
25 great Queensites who came up today. I met with a

1 group in my office earlier today. I know they've
2 been doing their good work telling us what's
3 important to them, for their communities, and we
4 do look forward to seeing them at the reception a
5 little bit later tonight.

6 Thank you, Mr. President.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
8 Addabbo on the resolution.

9 SENATOR ADDABBO: Thank you,
10 Mr. President. Good afternoon.

11 I want to thank Senator Stavisky for
12 introducing this resolution. I am also thankful
13 that I get to call Queens my home my whole life.
14 Thankful also that my parents wound up there,
15 like Senator Gianaris's parents wound up there --
16 my mom via Brooklyn, so a shout-out to my
17 Brooklyn friends.

18 But my dad -- in his whole life, my
19 dad moved five times his whole life, all within a
20 radius of one mile within Ozone Park, the town
21 within Queens. So he must have really loved
22 Queens. And I'm thankful for that, because I get
23 to raise my family there now as well.

24 But it's also the fact not only that
25 we live in Queens and we're part of it, but I'm

1 thankful that the people of my district gave me
2 the opportunity to serve the people of Queens.
3 And that through that opportunity I get a great
4 chance to work with great people who are sitting
5 in the gallery -- our borough president, the
6 Chamber and the businesses, our community
7 leaders, the community board, residents. A great
8 opportunity to really shape the borough going
9 forward. The most diverse borough in the world,
10 we get to work with everybody to make sure that
11 the future of our borough is bright. And that we
12 get to shape the direction in which we go as we
13 go forward.

14 I am grateful for that opportunity.
15 It's an honor and it's a privilege. So on this
16 Queens Day, I really wanted to say thank you to
17 the borough, the borough that I called home for
18 my whole life, the borough that I raised my
19 family in and has given me a great opportunity to
20 be a public servant there.

21 Hope to see you all later. Thank
22 you very much, Mr. President.

23 (Applause from gallery.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
25 Comrie on the resolution.

1 SENATOR COMRIE: Thank you,
2 Mr. President.

3 I rise to thank the Senate dean of
4 the Queens delegation, Senator Toby Stavisky, for
5 carrying this resolution and to speak on a
6 borough that I'm so proud to call home. My
7 parents also chose Queens. And I have been
8 fortunate that I have lived in the district that
9 I now represent my entire life.

10 I am also thankful to be the
11 representative for the 14th Senate District. I
12 am thankful to my constituents that called me
13 back into public service. As I had shared with
14 you before, I was in the City Council for
15 12 years with many of the members in this room.
16 And now that I'm here in Albany, working with all
17 of the Senators to try to make sure that we
18 deliver opportunities for people all over the
19 state. I can say that, you know, going around
20 the state with Senator Kennedy has been very
21 eye-opening and has been very illuminating. But
22 I'm proud to call Queens home.

23 You know, I'm proud to say that I'm
24 from Queens. I'm proud to be part of one of the
25 most diverse communities in the country if not

1 the world. I'm proud to have been -- to do the
2 things that I've done to be able to get to this
3 point and this time.

4 Today we're here to celebrate
5 Queens. We hope that you all come to the Hart
6 Lounge later to see the different venues that
7 have come, to see the distilleries, to see the
8 food, to see the vendors, but also to talk to our
9 Queens residents, many of whom are up here, about
10 their passions.

11 Queens is driven by small
12 businesses, people that are trying to make sure
13 that they can work, that they can support
14 Manhattan businesses and Manhattan institutions.
15 And they're concerned about how that cost and
16 that ability to access Manhattan is going to
17 affect them. And they're going to talk to you
18 about that today.

19 Queens businesses are also going to
20 talk to you about the need to make sure that they
21 have an opportunity to participate in all parts
22 of the State Budget, and I hope that you take the
23 chance to listen to them as well.

24 You know, Queens is truly not just
25 2.3 million residents and growing, Queens is, as

1 I say in my meetings many times, the best of the
2 better boroughs, the best of the other boroughs.
3 And I'm going to now get some -- a little bit of
4 push-back from my fellow colleagues but, you
5 know, Queens is truly the best borough in the
6 city. Because of the geographics that we have,
7 because of the ability of Queens to move into so
8 many different areas, because of the ability of
9 Queens to -- even though they claim hip-hop was
10 started in the Bronx, it was perfected in Queens.

11 (Laughter; applause.)

12 SENATOR COMRIE: I'm just starting
13 all kinds of trouble with my colleagues. So I'm
14 just having a little fun with my colleagues. I
15 know I'm going to catch it later. But, you know,
16 I can say that I'm very, very proud of my
17 borough --

18 SENATOR RIVERA: That's two
19 minutes, sir. Two minutes.

20 SENATOR COMRIE: My two minutes are
21 not up. And I'd put my crew up against your crew
22 any day.

23 (Laughter.)

24 SENATOR COMRIE: So -- but the
25 greatest attribute of the borough, though, is

1 that we stay united together in the tough times.
2 We work every day in the trenches to make sure
3 that our collective lives are better. Because we
4 truly have been fighting to make sure that we do
5 the things necessary to improve our
6 infrastructure, to build more schools, to have
7 better and diversify and improve our hospitals,
8 which are -- we have the lowest amount of
9 hospital beds for any borough in the city. And
10 that we need to get the transportation equity
11 that our members and our residents deserve.

12 So I'm here today to say that I'm
13 proud to be from Queens, I'm proud to represent a
14 borough that has such diversity, such talent and
15 such entrepreneurial spirit. And I want to thank
16 all of you that came up on the buses today. I
17 want to thank all of you that stopped by my
18 office. I want to thank all the Queens residents
19 that continually keep me on my point, keep me at
20 the top of my game so that I can be a good public
21 servant.

22 Thank you, Mr. President.

23 (Enthusiastic applause.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
25 Sanders on the resolution.

1 SENATOR SANDERS: Thank you,
2 Mr. President.

3 Mr. President, I want to commend
4 Senator Stavisky for this resolution. Such
5 apropos, such timeliness. It just shows her
6 great wisdom.

7 Mr. President, I felt good this
8 morning. I woke up with a better spring in my
9 step. It was warmer outside. And I was trying
10 to figure out what -- why do we feel so good?
11 Then it dawned on me: It was Queens Day up
12 here --

13 (Applause from galleries.)

14 SENATOR SANDERS: -- and it was
15 clear.

16 Having been born and raised in
17 Queens, what a blessing that I've had to serve in
18 many different places. I want to commend our
19 borough president, who is no stranger to these
20 chambers. In fact, I saw some of your carving in
21 one of these desks, Madam Borough President.

22 I want to commend the Chamber of
23 Commerce. I'm sure that we have some business
24 that we need to take care of up here, and I'm
25 clear that we need to bring some stuff home. But

1 I believe that you're getting a new opening, the
2 ear of these people, you're being heard.

3 You see, my friends, by the powers
4 vested in me, you are all, for one day, members
5 of Queens.

6 (Laughter.)

7 SENATOR SANDERS: One day. If you
8 want more than that, you'll have to move in.
9 You'll have to come.

10 But you can get a taste of that this
11 evening at 5 o'clock when you come. You can get
12 just a glimpse of the joy of living in Queens.
13 You see, in Queens you'll be treated like a king.

14 (Laughter.)

15 SENATOR SANDERS: Now, it's true
16 that the Bronx has their symbol, Manhattan has
17 Manhattan.

18 (Laughter.)

19 SENATOR SANDERS: I'm sure there's
20 a lot of things all over. We in Queens, the
21 chamber and the borough president, we have to
22 come up with our own symbol. Bronx has theirs.
23 We've been working on it. It's a work in
24 progress.

25 My friends, I am really glad to be

1 from Queens, and I'm glad all of you today are
2 from Queens. And we can prove it when you come
3 to Queens Day tonight, where you don't need a
4 passport, come on in. The borough president and
5 the chamber, it's on them tonight. How's that?
6 Drinks are on me.

7 Thank you, Mr. President.

8 (Applause from galleries.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
10 Liu on the resolution.

11 SENATOR LIU: I guess everybody has
12 to speak on this.

13 I am proud to be from Queens. I
14 can't claim to be native-born like Senator
15 Sanders or Senator Addabbo or Senator Gianaris.
16 I'm an immigrant to Queens, like Senator Stavisky
17 and Senator Comrie, I being from Taiwan, Senator
18 Comrie being an immigrant Jamaica, and Senator
19 Stavisky hailing from the Bronx.

20 You can travel the world in Queens
21 without ever having to leave the borough. And so
22 I think that's the best part of it.

23 I want to take a moment to thank our
24 borough president, the Queen of Queens, Melinda
25 Katz. Thank you for joining us.

1 (Applause.)

2 SENATOR LIU: A shout-out also to
3 the Deputy Queen of Queens, Sharon Lee.

4 (Applause.)

5 SENATOR LIU: And with that, I
6 proudly support this resolution. See you at
7 Queens Day.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
9 Savino on the resolution.

10 SENATOR SAVINO: Thank you,
11 Mr. President.

12 So it's interesting, I'm a
13 representative from Staten Island and South
14 Brooklyn. I am an expat, though, when it comes
15 to Queens. I was born and raised in Queens. I'm
16 a Queens girl. Born and raised -- actually born
17 in what was Booth Memorial Hospital, raised in
18 Astoria, lived in Jackson Heights. And it broke
19 my heart to leave Astoria, but then it took me on
20 a journey to Staten Island, where I've been proud
21 to be a Staten Island resident for the past
22 18 years.

23 And I would say that Staten Island
24 is the Queens that I grew up in. And for those
25 of you who have spent some time in Staten Island

1 that are Queens natives, you know exactly what
2 I'm talking about. We are kindred boroughs. And
3 I believe it was my upbringing in Queens that
4 made me who I am and made me the commonsense
5 elected official that Staten Island demanded.

6 And so I love Queens so much that
7 even though none of the rest of my family is
8 there anymore -- my parents have passed away, my
9 grandparents have gone on, and my sister now
10 lives with me -- I feel compelled to go back as
11 often as I can. I go back to get my nails done
12 every two weeks in Queens, even though we have
13 enough places to go in Staten Island.

14 I go back to eat regularly. Because
15 you're right, Senator Stavisky and Senator
16 Comrie, you can't beat the food in Queens. We
17 have great pizza in Staten Island and great
18 Italian food, but we don't have the kind of Greek
19 food or Asian food or Latino food. We just don't
20 have it yet in Staten Island. And maybe one day
21 we'll get it there.

22 But Queens has so much to offer in
23 so many ways. And no matter how many years go
24 past, I will always be happy and proud to be a
25 girl from Queens.

1 Thank you, Mr. President.

2 (Applause.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
4 Bailey on the resolution.

5 (Reaction from Senators.)

6 SENATOR BAILEY: Well,
7 Mr. President -- Mr. President. I wasn't going
8 to say anything, but my esteemed colleague Leroy
9 Comrie had to open the door.

10 (Laughter.)

11 SENATOR BAILEY: KRS-One famously
12 said: Manhattan keeps on making it, Brooklyn
13 keeps on taking it, Bronx keeps creating it, and
14 Queens keeps on faking it.

15 (Boos, laughter, general uproar.)

16 SENATOR BAILEY: The bridge is
17 over, the bridge is over.

18 (Overtalk, cries of "Out of order.")

19 SENATOR BAILEY: I'm quoting the
20 great KRS-One.

21 But what Queens does not fake, in
22 all seriousness, is a great diversity,
23 Mr. President. Queens is an outstanding borough
24 full of amazing people, diverse culture, great
25 baseball teams, Mr. President. Yes, I said great

1 baseball teams.

2 (Laughter.)

3 SENATOR BAILEY: I love the
4 New York Mets. I love Queens. I met my wife in
5 Queens. So I owe a lot to Queens. I am
6 appreciative of the diversity and culture that we
7 have in this borough.

8 And anywhere you go in Queens, as
9 said by Senator Savino, you can get a great meal.
10 And I love food, Mr. President. You can tell by
11 the, well, sophomore 15 that I've gained. I do
12 love myself some good food. And I'm looking
13 forward to the Hart Lounge today, Senator
14 Stavisky, and I thank you for your leadership in
15 sponsoring this resolution.

16 And I thank all of my colleagues
17 from Queens. And no matter where you are from,
18 you know, it's important to make sure that -- we
19 laugh and we joke, but we're all one family. And
20 whether it be New York State, New York City,
21 we're all one family in this chamber. And I
22 wanted to start on a jovial note, but I wanted to
23 end on a positive one.

24 Madam Borough President, thank you
25 for your leadership in Queens. We appreciate

1 what you've done in steering the ship in a very
2 diverse borough.

3 And, you know, in the interests of
4 time and in the interests of the Bronx, I'll save
5 the rest of my hip-hop comments for Bronx Day.

6 (Laughter.)

7 SENATOR BAILEY: Thank you,
8 Mr. President.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
10 Rivera on the resolution.

11 SENATOR RIVERA: Thank you,
12 Mr. President.

13 Now, as our friend Senator Bailey
14 said, we were not going to say anything, but then
15 home boy over here had to bring it.

16 (Laughter.)

17 SENATOR RIVERA: Now, Queens is a
18 nice enough place. It is -- I've met many good
19 people from Queens. Some of my best friends are
20 from Queens.

21 But I do have to tell you, I am --
22 do you know how many Valentine Avenues there are
23 in the Bronx? One. Do you know how many
24 187th Streets there are in the Bronx? One.

25 (Laughter.)

1 SENATOR RIVERA: You have done a
2 very good job of having a magnificent place over
3 there in Queens. You've done a great thing to
4 have this place that you have over there. And
5 keeping us out of it is very easy, because when
6 we can't find our way between a Street, a Lane, a
7 Court, a Square, an Avenue -- am I missing
8 anything? I don't -- Boulevard, thank you, and
9 Drive. There you go.

10 (Laughter; overtalk.)

11 SENATOR RIVERA: So in all
12 seriousness -- in all seriousness, Mr. President,
13 I do celebrate Queens. I have been very happy to
14 get to know the borough a little bit better by
15 having my colleagues right next to me; I'm kind
16 of surrounded, by them over here, by Queens.

17 And it is, one, an incredibly
18 diverse place. I've had the honor of visiting
19 more than a couple of times to learn more about
20 Greek food. My good friend Mike Gianaris has
21 taught me a little bit about that. And I've
22 traveled down there to talk to Senator Liu when
23 he wasn't a Senator yet, when he was thinking
24 about doing that. And I've done a lot of
25 traveling around Queens, and I'm very happy to

1 celebrate it today.

2 But once again, you've done a great
3 job of keeping folks that just want -- I just
4 want to be -- I got one 187th Street, that's the
5 one I got. That's the one I'm gonna be on. But
6 y'all got the Squares, the Lanes and everything
7 else; y'all can keep them. I'm going to stay in
8 the Bronx. God bless Queens, but God bless the
9 Bronx as well.

10 Thank you, Mr. President.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
12 Ramos on the resolution.

13 SENATOR RAMOS: In what's probably
14 the first time that Mobb Deep has been quoted on
15 the Senate floor: "Queens is the realness and
16 foundation, and if I die, I couldn't choose a
17 better location."

18 (Laughter.)

19 SENATOR RAMOS: Look, everybody
20 praises our food and the diversity of our people.
21 And it's true, I represent the most diverse
22 district. I often say we speak more than 160
23 languages. We have people from all over the
24 world who love all different types of people, who
25 identify as different types of people. It's a

1 great thing.

2 And the reason we are able to enjoy
3 all of that diversity and all of our parades is
4 because we've actively worked to produce a
5 community that is welcoming of everybody. So if
6 other boroughs or other parts of this state are
7 interested in having that diversity, of enjoying
8 that diversity, it's about really building
9 community, talking to your neighbors and
10 realizing that we are much more the same than
11 different, that we have many more of the same
12 needs than not. That we're looking to thrive, no
13 matter who we are, and that we all do better when
14 we all do better. It's actually much more
15 productive to uplift each other than it is to
16 divide and keep everybody else down.

17 So I just want to say I'm very proud
18 to have been born in Elmhurst, raised in Astoria,
19 I've lived in Corona, in East Elmhurst and in
20 Jackson Heights today, in every single
21 neighborhood in my beautiful district. I
22 couldn't be prouder to be a Queens woman and to
23 be supporting this resolution.

24 Thank you.

25 (Applause from audience)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
2 Thomas on the resolution.

3 SENATOR THOMAS: Thank you,
4 Mr. President.

5 When I immigrated to this country, I
6 lived in Queens with my family -- Jamaica
7 Estates, specifically. And I went to public
8 school in Queens, went to Thomas Edison High
9 School, went to St. John's University. And I
10 love the diversity of Queens.

11 Queens, just like Senator Ramos
12 talked about, has over 160 different languages.
13 The food is great, the diversity is amazing, and
14 it's just an amazing place to be.

15 But since I am a Senator from
16 Long Island, I have to basically say Brooklyn and
17 Queens are on Long Island, so this is all about
18 Long Island.

19 (Laughter.)

20 SENATOR THOMAS: Happy Queens Day,
21 and I'm looking forward to all the great events
22 that we have for Long Island today.

23 (Laughter.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The
25 resolution was previously adopted on March 12th.

1 Madam Borough President, while my
2 parents live in Queens, and I love the Yankees,
3 we all know Manhattan is the best borough.

4 (Groans; boos; laughter.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: I'm
6 just saying. I'm just saying.

7 Senator Gianaris.

8 SENATOR GIANARIS: What the --
9 okay.

10 (Laughter.)

11 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
12 can we now take up Resolution 687, by
13 Senator May, take it up in its entirety, and call
14 on Senator May.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The
16 Secretary will read.

17 THE SECRETARY: Senate Resolution
18 Number 687, by Senator May, congratulating the
19 Syracuse Cougars Boys Ice Hockey Team upon the
20 occasion of capturing the 2019 Division 1
21 NYSPHSAA Ice Hockey Championship on March 10,
22 2019.

23 "WHEREAS, Individual and team
24 championships are highly sought after in high
25 school sports; this Legislative Body commends

1 rare athletic achievements and pays special
2 recognition to those who pursue such excellence
3 and become examples for the youth of this great
4 Empire State; and

5 "WHEREAS, Athletic competition helps
6 to enhance both the moral and physical
7 development of young athletes, preparing them for
8 the future by instilling in them the importance
9 of teamwork, encouraging a standard of healthy
10 living, and developing a sense of fair play and
11 competition; and

12 "WHEREAS, The Syracuse Cougars is a
13 team made up of players from the four Syracuse
14 City School District high schools, helping to
15 unite our community; and

16 "WHEREAS, This Legislative Body is
17 justly proud to congratulate the Syracuse Cougars
18 Boys Ice Hockey Team upon the occasion of
19 capturing the 2019 Division-1 NYSPHSAA Ice Hockey
20 Championship; to the praise and applause of their
21 excited fans, the Cougars defeated Suffern High
22 School in a decisive 4-2 victory to win the
23 championship on Sunday, March 10, 2019, at the
24 Harbor Center in Buffalo, New York; and

25 "WHEREAS, Proudly donning their

1 black uniforms, family, friends, and the
2 community at large loyally and enthusiastically
3 supported the Cougars throughout their journey as
4 they ended their season with an impressive
5 undefeated 12-0 record; and

6 "WHEREAS, In a sport such as ice
7 hockey, which demands athletic prowess, speed and
8 agility, Head Coach John Purcell and Assistant
9 Coaches Charlie May, Neal Purcell, Ron Scott, and
10 Walt Eccles worked hard to hone the skills of
11 this championship team, teaching these
12 outstanding athletes lessons which will prove
13 invaluable both on and off the ice; and

14 "WHEREAS, Head Coach John Purcell
15 and all of the outstanding athletes on the
16 Syracuse Cougars Boys Ice Hockey Team have
17 clearly utilized dedication, determination and
18 teamwork in providing a lasting contribution to
19 the spirit of excellence which is a tradition of
20 their schools; now, therefore, be it

21 "RESOLVED, That this Legislative
22 Body pause in its deliberations to congratulate
23 the members of the Syracuse Cougars Boys Ice
24 Hockey Team: Emmett Barry, Kaleb Benedict, Evan
25 Carter, Andrew Corning, Zach Delaney, Ryan

1 Durand, Ryan Eccles, Mack Etoll, Nathan Frye,
2 Aidan Griffin, Jack Grooms, Nelson Jones, Kyle
3 Lamson, CJ Malone, Stephan Matro, Alex Moreno,
4 Skariwate Papineau, Ethan Petty, Kiernan Proud,
5 Tommy Rioux, Shemar Thomas, Cameron Walsh, Wyatt
6 Weil, Hugh White III, Philip Zollo; Head Coach
7 John Purcell and Assistant Coaches Charlie May,
8 Neal Purcell, Ron Scott, and Walt Eccles on their
9 outstanding season and overall team record; and
10 be it further

11 "RESOLVED, That copies of this
12 resolution, suitably engrossed, be transmitted to
13 the members of the Syracuse Cougars Boys Ice
14 Hockey Team, Head Coach John Purcell and
15 Assistant Coaches Charlie May, Neal Purcell, Ron
16 Scott, and Walt Eccles."

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Order
18 in the chamber, please.

19 Senator May on the resolution.

20 SENATOR MAY: Thank you,
21 Mr. President.

22 Enough about Queens.

23 (Laughter.)

24 SENATOR MAY: I ask you to turn
25 your attention a few hundred miles to the

1 northwest and celebrate the Syracuse Cougars.

2 (Applause.)

3 SENATOR MAY: We have us with us
4 Alex Moreno, Nathan Frye, Shemar Thomas, and
5 Ethan Petty, along with the head coach, Neal
6 Purcell, who is in his first year as head coach.
7 And he guided them to a 24-1-1 record over the
8 year and their first-ever Division 1 Ice Hockey
9 Championship.

10 That impressive victory that won
11 them the championship -- is Senator Carlucci
12 here? It was over Suffern High School. And so I
13 just want to say to Senator Carlucci that we're
14 sorry, but Syracuse rules.

15 (Laughter.)

16 SENATOR MAY: These boys were
17 coached by an excellent group of coaches, not
18 only long-time Coach John Purcell, but his son
19 Neal, who was New York State Coach of the Year
20 this year, as well as Assistant Coaches Ron Scott
21 and Walt Eccles and Charlie May, who is sadly no
22 relation to me.

23 Those of us in the greater Syracuse
24 region are so proud of these players, who have
25 also sat very patiently through a long lesson in

1 civics today. We know how important
2 participation in athletics can be to a young
3 person's development. And the winning spirit
4 these young men have demonstrated in their season
5 speaks well of the time and energy they have put
6 into the game.

7 This is the first state title for
8 the combined program, based out of Corcoran High
9 School in Syracuse. And even though Coach
10 Purcell says he has nowhere to go but down from
11 here after winning the championship in his first
12 year as head coach, I have every confidence that
13 future generations of Cougars will take this
14 legacy and carry it forward and you'll have a
15 streak to be remembered.

16 That's why I'm proud to sponsor this
17 resolution to honor and congratulate these young
18 men in their victory.

19 Thank you.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
21 Antonacci on the resolution.

22 SENATOR ANTONACCI: Thank you,
23 Mr. President.

24 I would just like to let Senator
25 Comrie know that the Syracuse Mets are now the

1 AAA affiliate of the New York Mets, so we love
2 Queens in Syracuse just as much as you do.

3 (Laughter.)

4 SENATOR ANTONACCI: So we're
5 looking forward to a great season.

6 SENATOR COMRIE: (Inaudible.)

7 SENATOR ANTONACCI: Come on up any
8 time for a game.

9 I want to congratulate the Cougars,
10 24, 1 and 1. And I was with -- yesterday with
11 your superintendent, Jaime Alicea, and we were
12 talking about how proud we were of your team and
13 how proud we were of the camaraderie and the
14 togetherness of five or six different school
15 districts that came together to form one hockey
16 team. The entire city of Syracuse, the towns of
17 Marcellus, West Hill -- where my daughter is a
18 high school senior -- OCS and Lafayette. And I
19 think you showed the adults how to play together
20 and work towards a common goal.

21 I'm also proud of you, Mr. Purcell,
22 as I've seen you since you were a little kid.
23 And I also coached Little League baseball with
24 your dad, and I know how important it is for you
25 to be involved in these young men's lives and how

1 important it is to be called coach.

2 And I want to congratulate you and
3 everyone on a well-done season. And I want a
4 repeat, okay? Thank you.

5 Thank you, Mr. President.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The
7 question is on the resolution. All in favor
8 signify by saying aye.

9 (Response of "Aye.")

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN:

11 Opposed?

12 (No response.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The
14 resolution is adopted.

15 To our guests, I welcome you on
16 behalf of the Senate. We extend to you the
17 privileges and courtesies of this house. Please
18 rise and be recognized.

19 (Standing ovation.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
21 Biaggi.

22 SENATOR BIAGGI: Thank you,
23 Mr. President.

24 At the request of Senator May, the
25 resolution is open for cosponsorship.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The
2 resolution is open for cosponsorship. Should you
3 choose not to be a cosponsor of the resolution,
4 please notify the desk.

5 Senator Biaggi.

6 SENATOR BIAGGI: We will now take
7 up Resolution J621, by Senator Sepúlveda, read
8 the title, and please call on Senator Sepúlveda.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The
10 Secretary will read.

11 THE SECRETARY: Senate Resolution
12 Number 621, by Senator Sepúlveda, memorializing
13 Governor Andrew M. Cuomo to declare March 11,
14 2019 to April 12, 2019, as Garifuna-American
15 Heritage Month in the State of New York.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
17 Sepúlveda on the resolution.

18 SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA: Thank you,
19 Mr. President, for allowing me for speak on this
20 resolution.

21 I want to thank Senator
22 Stewart-Cousins for allowing us to present a
23 resolution that honors -- the real pronunciation
24 is Garee-gu-na -- Garee-na-gu -- Garee-na-gu
25 culture. We know it as Garifuna. Today we are

1 passing a resolution that honors the
2 Garifuna-American Heritage Month.

3 Their rich culture and spirit lives
4 in our communities and in the Bronx, the greatest
5 county in the world to live. And I have to
6 remind everybody that's a sports fan that we have
7 the New York Yankees. Sorry, you guys in Queens
8 have the Mets.

9 It is significant this month to
10 celebrate and recognize the tragic history where
11 the Garifuna people suffered forcible deportation
12 by the British from St. Vincent and the
13 Grenadines in 1797. This resulted in permanent
14 separation of the Garifuna Family, leaving them
15 to settle along Central America's Caribbean coast
16 and eventually migrating during the 1930s to
17 several cities in the United States.

18 The Garifuna people are a mixed race
19 comprised of descendants of West Africans,
20 Central Africans, Island Caribs and the Arawak
21 people. Today most of them live in Honduras,
22 Belize, Guatemala, and Nicaragua.

23 However, outside of those countries,
24 New York City is home to the largest Garifuna
25 population in the world. And most of them live,

1 again, in the greatest county to live in the
2 world, in the Bronx.

3 And it's an honor for me to
4 commemorate a beautiful cultural heritage whose
5 traditions have inspired and transpired into our
6 streets with dance, music, food and amazing
7 storytelling.

8 Garifuna-American Heritage Month
9 provides an opportunity to celebrate the Garifuna
10 Family reunification and recognize the
11 significance of Garifuna contributions to the
12 quality and character of life in New York State.
13 Their story is one of resilience and survival.
14 So I say "Seremein" for allowing me to honor such
15 an amazing culture and people.

16 Thank you.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The
18 resolution was previously adopted on March 7th.

19 Senator Gianaris.

20 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
21 before we go back to the controversial calendar,
22 I do want to pause and welcome the Majority
23 Leader of the State Assembly, who's joined us.

24 (Applause.)

25 SENATOR GIANARIS: And can we now

1 go to the controversial calendar, please.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The
3 Secretary will ring the bell.

4 The Secretary will read.

5 THE SECRETARY: On page 5, Senator
6 Kennedy moves to discharge, from the Committee on
7 Transportation, Assembly Bill Number 951 and
8 substitute it for the identical Senate Bill 231,
9 Third Reading Calendar 47.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The
11 substitution is so ordered.

12 The Secretary will read.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 47,
14 Assembly Bill 951, by Assemblymember
15 Peoples-Stokes, an act to amend the Vehicle and
16 Traffic Law and the Public Officers Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Senator
18 Ranzenhofer.

19 SENATOR RANZENHOFER:
20 Mr. President, will the sponsor yield for a few
21 questions?

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Does
23 the sponsor yield?

24 SENATOR KENNEDY: Yes,
25 Mr. President, I'd be happy to yield.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The
2 sponsor yields.

3 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: Thank you,
4 Mr. President.

5 Through you, can the sponsor tell me
6 other than monetary fines, are there any other
7 penalties provided for in this proposed
8 legislation?

9 SENATOR KENNEDY: Thank you.
10 Through you, Mr. President, I want to thank my
11 colleague for that question and talk a little bit
12 about the bill, if I may, on the bill.

13 Our message here today is simple.
14 The absolute last place anyone should be speeding
15 is near a school where kids, parents, teachers
16 and neighbors are crossing the street. No
17 appointment is important so much so that one
18 needs to put the lives of children at risk to get
19 there one or two minutes earlier.

20 According to Safe Kids Worldwide, in
21 the United States there's been a 13 percent
22 increase in the pedestrian death rate for
23 12-to-19-year-olds since 2013, which is an
24 appalling number.

25 In the City of New York, the program

1 has proven to work. It has unquestionably saved
2 lives, and so much so that the City of Buffalo
3 has requested that this legislation be expanded
4 into our community.

5 And quite frankly, as the father of
6 three kids attending the Buffalo public schools,
7 I'd like to see it extended to protect my kids
8 and families like mine. But I will tell you,
9 I've seen firsthand the horrific instances of
10 cars that just blaze by these schools as if there
11 are not children around, as if there are not kids
12 crossing the street or crossing guards in the
13 way.

14 It's why, with Assembly Majority
15 Leader Crystal Peoples-Stokes, who has joined us
16 in the chamber here today, I have authored this
17 legislation that we're passing today that keeps
18 our kids safe in Buffalo just as we're keeping
19 kids safe in the City of New York. So we are
20 creating a pilot program in the City of Buffalo,
21 allowing up to 20 speed cameras in school zones
22 chosen by the city in concert with the Buffalo
23 public schools.

24 And in the meetings with the
25 district it's been made clear that there are a

1 number of schools in high-traffic areas that have
2 already seen near misses. We cannot act quickly
3 enough to prevent injury or potential deaths as
4 they have seen in other areas of the state
5 without these cameras.

6 So I'm proud to support this today,
7 and I'm happy to answer these questions from my
8 colleague.

9 SENATOR RANZENHOFER:
10 Mr. President, if the sponsor will yield for a
11 question.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: Does
13 the sponsor yield?

14 SENATOR KENNEDY: Of course.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BENJAMIN: The
16 sponsor yields.

17 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: And I would
18 like to join Senator Kennedy in welcoming my good
19 friend Crystal Peoples-Stokes, who I've served
20 with both here in Albany and in Erie County for
21 many, many years. Welcome to the chamber.

22 And I want to thank Senator Kennedy
23 for his comments. And just to echo on the
24 comments, I think everybody in this chamber is
25 very concerned about public safety, about school

1 safety, and in particular about safety for
2 children. As a matter of fact, as Senator
3 Jackson, Senator Flanagan and many, many people
4 have talked, as we were talking about the
5 New York City bill, about people slowing down and
6 Senator Kennedy just made a comment about, you
7 know, if you can get people to slow down, be in
8 not such a hurry for one or two minutes, we're
9 going to save lives.

10 So I'd like to just harken back to
11 the original question that I had posed to Senator
12 Kennedy and ask him if other than monetary fines,
13 are there any other penalties provided in this
14 proposed legislation for either motorists,
15 drivers of the vehicles or owners of the
16 vehicles?

17 SENATOR KENNEDY: Through you,
18 Mr. President, no.

19 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: Can -- if the
20 sponsor will continue to yield.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
22 sponsor yield for a question?

23 SENATOR KENNEDY: Yes.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
25 sponsor yields.

1 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: Can the
2 sponsor tell me what are the monetary penalties
3 for a first violation, second violation, third
4 violation of this proposed legislation?

5 SENATOR KENNEDY: Sure. So this
6 legislation will allow the City of Buffalo to
7 promulgate the rules and put in place -- again,
8 in concert with the City of Buffalo public school
9 system -- 20 different locations for these
10 cameras. Any liability is mailed to the owner of
11 the vehicle and counts as a parking violation,
12 not a moving violation.

13 The City of Buffalo will set this
14 program, they will set the fines up to \$50.

15 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: I'm sorry, up
16 to --

17 SENATOR KENNEDY: Up to \$50.

18 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: Okay. So,
19 Mr. President, if the sponsor will continue to
20 yield.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Does the
22 sponsor yield?

23 SENATOR KENNEDY: I will yield.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
25 sponsor yields.

1 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: So for the
2 owner of the vehicle, there is no penalty either
3 against his or her license or his or her
4 registration if there are multitude of
5 violations.

6 So in other words, if I'm the owner
7 of a car and I receive a tenth violation for
8 violating a speed -- going over the speed limit
9 in a school zone, nothing would happen to my
10 registration. Would that be an accurate reading
11 of the statute?

12 SENATOR KENNEDY: Through you,
13 Mr. President, that question on whether or not
14 there will be an impact on one's registration or
15 insurance, the answer is no.

16 However, if my colleague would like
17 to advance that legislation, we in the
18 Transportation Committee would certainly take a
19 look at it.

20 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: And,
21 Mr. President, if the sponsor will continue to
22 yield.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Does the
24 sponsor yield?

25 SENATOR KENNEDY: Yes.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
2 sponsor yields.

3 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: So I know
4 there was a lot of conversation today from many
5 members about deterrents and getting these
6 speeding drivers to slow down, getting these
7 speeding drivers off the road.

8 Is there any penalty in the statute
9 against the driver of the car?

10 SENATOR KENNEDY: Through you,
11 Mr. President, yes.

12 The driver of the car, if that
13 driver is the owner of the vehicle, will be fined
14 at a rate that the city will set. And if it is
15 not the owner of the vehicle that is driving the
16 car, then they have a right -- the owner has a
17 right to receive payment for any fees and fines
18 from the operator of that vehicle.

19 SENATOR RANZENHOFER:
20 Mr. President, if the Senator will continue to
21 yield.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Does the
23 sponsor yield?

24 SENATOR KENNEDY: Yes.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The

1 sponsor yields.

2 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: So can you
3 just describe the mechanism where the owner would
4 recoup money from the driver, in your statute? I
5 didn't quite see that.

6 SENATOR KENNEDY: Sure.

7 Mr. President, if someone was --
8 say, for instance, my colleague Senator
9 Ranzenhofer decided to borrow the car of
10 Senator Lanza and drive through one of these
11 school zones --

12 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: I just want
13 to let you know I would never speed.

14 SENATOR KENNEDY: -- and drive
15 through one of these school zones over 10 miles
16 an hour over the posted limit, to which there
17 will be signage depicting the fact that one is
18 entering that school zone, so blatantly ignoring
19 those signs during school session and potentially
20 an hour before and after school session is in
21 place, or other activities, that --

22 Mr. President, Senator Ranzenhofer would be in
23 violation of the law.

24 The speed camera would recognize
25 that that was Senator Lanza's vehicle, and

1 Senator Lanza would be given a fine to the extent
2 that the city so sets.

3 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: So,
4 Mr. President, if the sponsor will continue to
5 yield.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
7 sponsor yield?

8 SENATOR KENNEDY: Yes,
9 Mr. President, I will yield.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
11 sponsor yields.

12 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: So under the
13 proposed legislation does the City of Buffalo
14 have the right to go against the driver of the
15 car for speeding, or is it limited to just going
16 against the owner of the car?

17 SENATOR KENNEDY: Through you,
18 Mr. President, it is the vehicle registration
19 that will be recognized, and ultimately it will
20 be the owner of the vehicle that is fined. It
21 would then be up to the owner of the vehicle to
22 recoup those funds from whoever may have been
23 driving that vehicle.

24 SENATOR RANZENHOFER:
25 Mr. President, if the sponsor will continue to

1 yield.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
3 sponsor yield to a question?

4 SENATOR KENNEDY: Yes.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
6 sponsor yields.

7 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: So in the
8 proposed legislation is there a mechanism within
9 the legislation for the city to go after the
10 motorist that is speeding through the zone?

11 SENATOR KENNEDY: Through you,
12 Mr. President, this legislation will allow the
13 City of Buffalo to deter speeding in school
14 zones, to keep our children safe by setting up a
15 pilot program, identifying these school zones by
16 law passed through the City of Buffalo -- to
17 which they've asked for a home rule, mind you --
18 supported by the Buffalo Public Schools, the
19 parents' association, the AARP, and various other
20 organizations, to keep our communities safe.

21 There is no such plan in place
22 today. And this legislation is mirrored off of
23 what was put in place back in 2013, which has
24 become such a tremendous success that we have
25 advanced legislation expanding those school

1 safety zones today, and it was approved.

2 So this is the vehicle through which
3 the City of Buffalo will deter that speeding in
4 the school zones.

5 SENATOR RANZENHOFER:

6 Mr. President, if the sponsor will continue to
7 yield.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
9 sponsor yield?

10 SENATOR KENNEDY: Of course.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
12 sponsor yields.

13 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: Is there an
14 estimate of how much money the city is expected
15 to collect in its fiscal year through this
16 program?

17 SENATOR KENNEDY: Through you,
18 Mr. President, the -- my colleague Senator
19 Ranzenhofer can request that of the city, but
20 this is a City of Buffalo request, a system that
21 they have asked for.

22 As far as revenues produced, that is
23 something that the city would have to get to
24 Senator Ranzenhofer. This is about protecting
25 children and saving lives.

1 SENATOR RANZENHOFER:

2 Mr. President, if the sponsor will continue to
3 yield.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
5 sponsor yield to a question?

6 SENATOR KENNEDY: Of course.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
8 sponsor yields.

9 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: Is there any
10 provision in the legislation which requires that
11 these monies that are collected go for purposes
12 that were enunciated by Senator Jackson or
13 Senator Flanagan when we were discussing the
14 New York City bill, to make sure that these
15 moneys are designated for school safety, whether
16 they be speed bumps, signage, notices? Or is
17 this money that will just go to the General Fund
18 of the City of Buffalo?

19 SENATOR KENNEDY: Through you,
20 Mr. President, mirroring what the City of
21 New York successfully approved and implemented,
22 and that we again have endorsed through quite the
23 overwhelming support of both chambers today, the
24 City of Buffalo has this legislation that is
25 reflective of the New York City legislation.

1 And so the answer to my colleague's
2 question is that the funding will go to the City
3 of Buffalo General Fund, as it goes to the City
4 of New York General Fund.

5 SENATOR RANZENHOFER:
6 Mr. President, if the sponsor will continue to
7 yield.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will
9 sponsor yield?

10 SENATOR KENNEDY: Yes.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
12 sponsor yields.

13 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: Can the
14 sponsor explain what the mechanism would be for
15 collecting money from a vehicle which is
16 registered out of state?

17 SENATOR KENNEDY: Through you,
18 Mr. President, any ticket that is issued, if the
19 driver of that vehicle is speeding at 10 miles an
20 hour above the stated speed in a school zone, is
21 promulgated through the City of Buffalo
22 enforcement, law enforcement agencies. And like
23 any other ticket adjudication process -- for
24 example, a parking ticket -- that will go through
25 the city's enforcement agency.

1 SENATOR RANZENHOFER:

2 Mr. President, if the sponsor will continue to
3 yield.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
5 sponsor yield?

6 SENATOR KENNEDY: Yes.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
8 sponsor yields.

9 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: So does the
10 City of Buffalo right now have the mechanism to
11 collect money from a vehicle which is out of
12 state, registered out of state?

13 SENATOR KENNEDY: Through you,
14 Mr. President, I don't have that information
15 before me, but I'm assuming that they do.

16 SENATOR RANZENHOFER:
17 Mr. President, if the sponsor will continue to
18 yield.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
20 sponsor yield?

21 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: Can you
22 explain -- well, let me just back up a second.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
24 Kennedy, do you yield?

25 SENATOR KENNEDY: Yes.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
2 Kennedy yields.

3 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: Okay. So the
4 question that I have for the sponsor is if you
5 own a vehicle and you are not the driver or you
6 claim that you're not the driver, what is the
7 mechanism for you to contest that?

8 And the second part of the question
9 is, is it a defense if you go to the adjudication
10 bureau which you just described and you say that
11 "I was not driving that vehicle," are you still
12 responsible even if you are not the driver?

13 SENATOR KENNEDY: Through you,
14 Mr. President, the owner of the vehicle is
15 responsible.

16 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: And just a
17 couple more questions, if the sponsor will
18 continue to yield.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
20 sponsor yield?

21 SENATOR KENNEDY: Yes.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
23 sponsor yields.

24 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: So under our
25 current law, if you have a number of vehicle and

1 traffic violations, whether they be three speeds
2 within 18 months or too many points, there's a
3 mechanism for suspending licenses. Is there any
4 provision in this legislation where, if you are a
5 persistent violator of school safety and child
6 safety, that you will be penalized if your
7 vehicle is used over and over again to violate
8 this section of the law?

9 SENATOR KENNEDY: Through you,
10 Mr. President, no.

11 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: I have no
12 further questions. But on the bill.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
14 Ranzenhofer on the bill.

15 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: First of all,
16 I'd like to thank the sponsor for addressing
17 concerns that I have and answering the questions
18 that I have.

19 You know, listening to this debate
20 and then the earlier debate on New York City, I
21 think it was Senator Gounardes who said that
22 we're looking to change behavior and slow people
23 down. I think it was Senator Sepúlveda who said
24 that, you know, the whole idea behind this
25 legislation is for motorists to slow down because

1 they don't want a ticket. I think it was Senator
2 Krueger who talked about keeping vehicles slowing
3 down, and even Senator Kennedy who mentioned what
4 we really want to do is we want to keep people
5 from thinking that they don't have to worry about
6 speeding through a school zone, that we really
7 want them to pay attention and not try to save a
8 minute or two in order to get to their
9 destination.

10 So I applaud the intent behind this
11 legislation. I don't think there is a Senator in
12 this chamber, no matter where you live, whether
13 you live in Buffalo, Erie County, or Queens or
14 Brooklyn, that is not concerned about school
15 safety, is not concerned about people speeding
16 through school zones, which results in injury,
17 which results in death. Because even if you have
18 thousands of people speeding through a school
19 zone and there's one accident, that's one
20 accident too many.

21 But the issue that I have with this
22 legislation is that while the intention is good,
23 there are two concerns that I have. We've heard
24 a lot of speeches and a lot of comments about
25 saving lives and protecting children, but

1 whatever amount of money -- and listening to the
2 figures from New York City, where it's in the
3 hundreds of millions of dollars, and I imagine
4 that for the City of Buffalo it's in the millions
5 of dollars, or maybe even more -- there is
6 nothing in this legislation which says we are
7 going to take this money, we are going to put it
8 in a lockbox and we are going to use this money
9 to improve school safety and to keep kids safe
10 around schools.

11 Which I don't get it. If we're
12 concerned about that, if we're concerned about
13 the safety of children around schools and
14 speeding motorists, then the first thing that we
15 would want to do is we would want to make sure
16 that these funds go for that designated purpose,
17 to keep kids safe. I'm not an expert in the
18 area, but certainly speed bumps and other devices
19 which can be used to slow traffic down around
20 schools are in order.

21 The greatest concern that I have
22 after listening to all of my colleagues talking
23 about slowing drivers down and keeping kids safe
24 is there is absolutely nothing in this
25 legislation which goes to the driver of the car.

1 Nothing which goes to the driver of the car. In
2 the technology that we have today, where we can
3 pinpoint a person in the middle of Buffalo or
4 Manhattan, there is no reason why legislation --
5 if you want to get unsafe drivers off the street,
6 go after the person that's driving the car.

7 Under every statute that we have in
8 this state, if you speed too many times, you lose
9 your license. If you go through too many traffic
10 stop signs, you lose your license. If you go
11 through too many red lights, you lose your
12 license. You get too many points on your license
13 for whatever section of the vehicle law that you
14 violate, you lose your license.

15 Drivers here can drive through
16 school zones with impunity. There's nothing that
17 can be done to the driver who puts our kids at
18 risk.

19 Fact number two. There is nothing
20 done to the owner. So if you allow your
21 vehicle -- and whether you give it to your
22 neighbor or whether you give it to your kid or
23 whether you give it to your brother or your
24 sister, you can persistently, day after day after
25 day, just run through those school zones. It

1 doesn't matter. You're not going to lose your
2 license. You're not going to lose your
3 registration.

4 There's nothing here which deals
5 with driver behavior. There's nothing here which
6 deals with owner responsibility -- that your
7 registration could be at risk, your license could
8 be at risk.

9 So if we're trying to change
10 behavior, we're trying to slow people down, in my
11 estimation -- in my estimation, the bill needs to
12 address those issues. That's why I did not
13 support the New York City piece, I will not be
14 supporting this piece. Because while the intent
15 is good -- and I commend you, Senator Kennedy,
16 through you, Mr. President, for introducing a
17 concept which is good, which is the concept
18 of school safety --

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Excuse
20 me. Senator Krueger, why do you rise?

21 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: I'm just
22 about to wrap it up, Mr. President. I'm just
23 about to wrap it up.

24 Hey, you made me lose my train of
25 thought. Very good. Good move.

1 (Laughter.)

2 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: In
3 conclusion, there is -- there's just nothing here
4 that deals with owner or driver responsibility.

5 You know, if you're wealthy and
6 you're driving through the City of Buffalo and
7 you can pay whatever it is, the \$50 or whatever
8 that fine is, and you don't give a hoot about
9 kids -- that's not good, but there's no -- that's
10 the deterrence. That's the deterrence.

11 Lose your license, lose your
12 registration, get the dangerous person, driver or
13 owner, off the road. Don't let them continue to
14 haunt the City of Buffalo, any community.

15 So that's the concern I have.
16 Senator Kennedy, I will take you up on your offer
17 to consider legislation which actually, in my
18 estimation, gets to the heart of the matter to
19 remove dangerous drivers from the roads, drivers
20 that continually, with impunity, drive past
21 school zones exceeding the speed limit, time
22 after time after time.

23 I believe that we need to address
24 the persistent violator who is going to, time and
25 time again, violate these speed zones, putting

1 our kids at risk. And I'll be happy to work with
2 you on that resolution.

3 Thank you, Mr. President.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
5 Krueger.

6 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you. Would
7 Senator Ranzenhofer please allow me to ask him
8 some questions?

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
10 Ranzenhofer, do you yield?

11 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: Oh. My
12 colleagues are shouting no, but I'd be happy to
13 yield to a question.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
15 Senator yields.

16 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you.

17 So I was listening to your debate.
18 Are you suggesting that we somehow establish some
19 kind of biometric photos where we take pictures
20 of the drivers and send them tickets based on
21 taking a photo not just of the license plate, but
22 of the actual driver?

23 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: Well, first
24 of all -- through you, Mr. President -- I believe
25 that the technology exists to take a picture of a

1 person in a vehicle. The point that I was
2 making, Senator Krueger, is that there needs to
3 be responsibility primarily on the owner, with
4 the registration, but also the driver.

5 So if you own a vehicle and your
6 vehicle time after time after time is
7 accumulating violations of speeding through a
8 school zone, with there being nothing that can be
9 done to either adversely affect your license or
10 adversely affect your registration to get you off
11 the road, that that is -- I think that's really
12 at the heart of the matter. I think that's what
13 needs to be done to truly make our schools safe.

14 So that's my thought on the process.

15 SENATOR KRUEGER: And you said that
16 since nothing would stop them -- I'm just
17 curious, if your neighbor was --

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
19 Krueger, are you asking Senator Ranzenhofer to
20 yield?

21 SENATOR KRUEGER: Oh, through you,
22 Mr. President, if the Senator would continue to
23 yield.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
25 Ranzenhofer, do you yield?

1 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: I'd be happy
2 to yield.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
4 Ranzenhofer yields.

5 SENATOR KRUEGER: So I'm just
6 curious, if your neighbor kept taking your car,
7 driving through school zones and getting tickets,
8 would you continue to lend them your car?

9 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: No. Through
10 you, Mr. President. And through you,
11 Mr. President, I probably wouldn't have lent them
12 my car in the first place, but that's a side
13 issue.

14 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
15 Mr. President, if the Senator will continue to
16 yield.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
18 Ranzenhofer, do you yield?

19 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: Yes, I'd be
20 happy to.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
22 Senator yields.

23 SENATOR KRUEGER: If your teenager
24 was borrowing your car and getting these tickets,
25 would you allow them to continue to drive it or

1 would you not take them aside and have a serious
2 talk about their driving patterns?

3 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: Through you,
4 Mr. President, in answer to the second question,
5 I cannot comment on the type of disciplinary
6 action that would be taken in my household if I
7 had a child that was of driving age and doing
8 that. I don't know if a serious conversation
9 would be what I would do. I might do something a
10 little bit sterner than simply having a
11 heart-to-heart conversation with a teenager who
12 was accumulating speeding tickets through a
13 school zone.

14 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you. Thank
15 you for your answers.

16 Senator Kennedy, would you please be
17 willing to answer a couple of questions?

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
19 Kennedy, do you yield?

20 SENATOR KENNEDY: Let me consider
21 it, Mr. President.

22 (Laughter.)

23 SENATOR KENNEDY: Yes.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
25 Senator yields.

1 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you.

2 Senator Kennedy, is there anything
3 in your legislation that prevents the City of
4 Buffalo from allowing police officers to actually
5 give tickets to people speeding through school
6 zones that may include additional penalties
7 beyond what a camera ticket might do?

8 SENATOR KENNEDY: Through you,
9 Mr. President, no.

10 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
11 Mr. President, would the sponsor please accept
12 another question?

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
14 Kennedy, do you yield?

15 SENATOR KENNEDY: Yes.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
17 Kennedy yields.

18 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you.

19 Is it conceivable that if the City
20 of Buffalo had additional revenue from the speed
21 cameras that they might use it to increase the
22 police presence going after dangerous drivers?
23 Is there anything that would stop them from doing
24 that?

25 SENATOR KENNEDY: Through you,

1 Mr. President, there is nothing that would
2 prevent the City of Buffalo from doing that.

3 SENATOR KRUEGER: On the bill,
4 Mr. President.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
6 Krueger on the bill.

7 SENATOR KRUEGER: I want to thank
8 the sponsor for bringing us this bill today. It
9 is extremely similar to the one we already passed
10 for New York City, a city that I live in and have
11 experience with.

12 You know, I suppose in a perfect
13 world one might imagine a police officer on every
14 corner and on every block prepared to write a
15 ticket or stop a fast driver. But we don't live
16 in that world anyway, and I would argue many of
17 us really wouldn't want to live in a world where
18 we used a hundred percent of our local budgets to
19 have police officers block by block by block.

20 So in fact what we have found is
21 that cameras and tickets with cameras can change
22 behavior and can be complementary to, but not an
23 alternative to, the systems we already have in
24 place where localities do try to keep their
25 people safe and their streets safe, while

1 localities do use police officers and, at least
2 in the City of New York, others to provide
3 tickets to cars and drivers when they see them
4 violating our laws.

5 But we are using technology to
6 improve their opportunities and to educate people
7 through financial fines what they can do and
8 what they shouldn't do.

9 Now, my colleague Senator
10 Ranzenhofer suggested perhaps we ought to go
11 further and have some kind of biometric ID of the
12 people on camera for purposes of the kinds of
13 tickets that could impact their license. I would
14 argue that technology would probably allow us to
15 go that far, but we would want to think hard and
16 fast about the ramifications of actually starting
17 to pass driving laws that actually ID'd
18 photographs of people in their cars, because
19 there are all kinds of other questions that that
20 would open up that I'm not sure we're prepared to
21 go there.

22 But I do know that the model we are
23 talking about today, both in this bill by Senator
24 Kennedy for Buffalo and the previous bill for
25 New York City, ensure that a tried-and-true model

1 of discouraging behavior that can lead to the
2 deaths of pedestrians, adults and children, with
3 financial fines do change behavior, work very
4 well, do not prevent the police from continuing
5 any other kind of surveillance or ticketing of
6 people on our streets.

7 It's really a win/win. And I'm just
8 not sure why so many people find that hard to
9 understand.

10 I vote yes, Mr. President. Thank
11 you.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
13 you, Senator Krueger.

14 Senator Lanza.

15 SENATOR LANZA: Yes, Mr. President,
16 would the sponsor yield for a couple of
17 questions?

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
19 Kennedy, do you yield?

20 SENATOR KENNEDY: Yes.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
22 sponsor yields.

23 SENATOR LANZA: Through you,
24 Mr. President. I regret not having the
25 opportunity to ask questions on the bill applying

1 to New York City because it wasn't laid aside.
2 Since this is substantially the same bill, same
3 channel, different location, I have a couple of
4 questions for Senator Kennedy.

5 Senator Kennedy, will the cameras be
6 placed only at intersections where there is a
7 history of accident and injury resulting from
8 speeding?

9 SENATOR KENNEDY: Through you,
10 Mr. President, the City of Buffalo will install
11 these cameras, first of all, after passing a law
12 delineating where these cameras will be located
13 specifically. The city must install signs that
14 say the appropriate speed present within the
15 school zone, and signs that clearly denote those
16 school zone limits.

17 The City of Buffalo, in concert with
18 the school board, the City of Buffalo schools,
19 will figure out -- by virtue of the number of
20 crashes that were within those school zones, the
21 severity of those crashes, the number of
22 violations, the number of fines, all of these
23 things in the geometry surrounding the school
24 building itself, the school buildings
25 themselves -- where the appropriate place to put

1 these cameras are.

2 SENATOR LANZA: Would the sponsor
3 continue to yield.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Does the
5 sponsor yield?

6 SENATOR KENNEDY: Yes.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
8 sponsor yields.

9 SENATOR LANZA: Through you,
10 Mr. President. So Senator Kennedy, do you
11 believe that the cameras should only be placed at
12 intersections where there is a demonstrated
13 history of accidents and injuries due to
14 speeding?

15 SENATOR KENNEDY: Through you,
16 Mr. President, I believe that keeping Buffalo
17 schoolchildren safe and having the same
18 protections as they have in New York City is the
19 appropriate action for this body to take. And
20 hence we are implementing virtually the exact
21 same system that the City of New York implemented
22 successfully six years ago and, according to the
23 parents who have lost children, want this system
24 expanded in the city, to which this body took
25 action on today.

1 And furthermore, according to recent
2 reports in the Buffalo News, and quoting Will
3 Keresztes, the chief of intergovernmental
4 affairs, planning and community engagement in the
5 Buffalo schools: "We definitely have what I
6 would consider to be a crisis on hand." The
7 school district had four close calls in the City
8 of Buffalo in recent months. There's been a rise
9 in reckless driving during morning and afternoon
10 times. And quite frankly, from what we're
11 hearing locally, it's only a matter of time
12 before someone is killed.

13 We are not going to wait until there
14 is a child or a family member killed in the City
15 of Buffalo because of a lack of action of this
16 body, as has been the past practice, to implement
17 the same sort of lifesaving system that New York
18 City kids get.

19 SENATOR LANZA: Will the sponsor
20 continue to yield?

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Does the
22 sponsor yield.

23 SENATOR KENNEDY: Yes.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
25 sponsor yields.

1 SENATOR LANZA: Through you,
2 Mr. President, I agree. I think we should act
3 anytime our children, especially around schools,
4 are in danger. It's my contention that this
5 action is not going to be effective in actually
6 accomplishing that goal, which is why I'm asking
7 these questions.

8 So my last question was about where
9 these would be sited. And the reason I asked
10 that is through my experience in New York City --
11 and the bill that was passed earlier would
12 continue to allow this to be the policy -- they
13 put the cameras wherever they want to, not based
14 on whether or not there's a history of accidents
15 and injuries resulting from speeding.

16 And I would think that if we were
17 really concerned about speeding around schools,
18 that we would start with those locations if we
19 really want to effectuate the goal.

20 And so that's why I hope, you know,
21 as this plays out in Buffalo, that you'd heed
22 that experience and that you would actually do
23 the opposite of what New York City does, which is
24 to put the cameras where they're most needed.

25 Through you, Mr. President, will

1 there be a sign posted at these intersections
2 alerting motorists to the fact that there is a
3 speed camera at that site?

4 SENATOR KENNEDY: Through you,
5 Mr. President, yes.

6 SENATOR LANZA: Would the sponsor
7 continue to yield?

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Does the
9 sponsor yield?

10 SENATOR KENNEDY: Yes.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
12 sponsor yields.

13 SENATOR LANZA: Through you,
14 Mr. President. So Senator Kennedy, there will be
15 a sign that cites the limit, but it also say that
16 there is a speed camera present at the location?

17 SENATOR KENNEDY: Through you,
18 Mr. President, yes.

19 SENATOR LANZA: Would the sponsor
20 continue to yield?

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Does the
22 sponsor yield?

23 SENATOR KENNEDY: Yes.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
25 sponsor yields.

1 SENATOR LANZA: Through you,
2 Mr. President. Senator Kennedy, I think that's
3 great news for the people of Buffalo, because
4 that's not the case in New York City. The
5 cameras are going to go up and people aren't
6 going to know that they're there. I think it's
7 important to have signs.

8 I hope that's the case. I read the
9 bill; I don't see that. It suggests the
10 possibility for signage but it does not mandate
11 that it actually says that. I hope I missed it,
12 and I hope you're right, because I think that
13 would go even further than the cameras in slowing
14 motorists down. So that is the case?

15 SENATOR KENNEDY: Yes. Through
16 you, Mr. President, line 29 of the bill states:
17 The city shall install signs giving notice that a
18 photo speed violation monitoring system is in
19 use, to be mounted on advanced warning signs
20 notifying motor vehicle operators of such
21 upcoming school speed zone and/or on speed limit
22 signs applicable within such school speed zone,
23 in conformance with standards established in the
24 MUTCD.

25 SENATOR LANZA: Mr. President, will

1 the sponsor continue to yield?

2 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:

3 Certainly, Mr. Lanza. Oh, hold on. Mr. Kennedy,
4 do you --

5 SENATOR KENNEDY: Uh, well, no.

6 (Laughter.)

7 SENATOR KENNEDY: Yes, of course.

8 Of course. Of course.

9 (Laughter.)

10 SENATOR LANZA: And I thank the
11 sponsor.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: The
13 sponsor yields.

14 SENATOR LANZA: Through you,
15 Mr. President. So the lawyer in me, you know,
16 the hairs go up on the back of my neck when I
17 hear "and/or." So I'm not sure that
18 accomplishes that. I hope it does. I wish that
19 New York City did that, but it doesn't.

20 Through you, Mr. President, how much
21 revenue does the City of Buffalo expect to have
22 generated by these cameras?

23 SENATOR KENNEDY: Through you,
24 Mr. President, the City of Buffalo is to
25 determine that. I do not have that information

1 before me.

2 SENATOR LANZA: Would the sponsor
3 continue to yield?

4 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Will
5 the sponsor continue to yield?

6 SENATOR KENNEDY: Yes.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Yes.

8 SENATOR LANZA: Through you,
9 Mr. President. So, Senator Kennedy, has Buffalo
10 already done that? Are there estimates out there
11 already in terms of how much money this will
12 generate?

13 SENATOR KENNEDY: Through you,
14 Mr. President, they may have. I do not have that
15 information before me.

16 SENATOR LANZA: Will the sponsor
17 continue to yield?

18 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Will
19 you continue to yield?

20 SENATOR KENNEDY: Yes.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Yes.

22 SENATOR LANZA: Through you,
23 Mr. President. Senator Kennedy, where does the
24 money go that is generated by these speed
25 cameras?

1 SENATOR KENNEDY: Through you,
2 Mr. President, I hope everyone was listening,
3 because I'm repeating answers from earlier.
4 However, the money goes back to the city General
5 Fund.

6 SENATOR LANZA: Will the sponsor
7 continue to yield?

8 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Will
9 you continue to yield?

10 SENATOR KENNEDY: Yes.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Yes.

12 SENATOR LANZA: Through you,
13 Mr. President. I always listen. And I'm just
14 trying to understand the similarities or perhaps
15 differences between this and the City of
16 New York's bill.

17 So does any of the money, Senator
18 Kennedy, generated here go to the people who
19 provide the cameras, manufacture the cameras,
20 install the cameras? In other words, does any of
21 this money go to someone other than the
22 government of the City of Buffalo?

23 SENATOR KENNEDY: Through you,
24 Mr. President, I've been clear where the funding
25 goes. It goes to the city General Fund.

1 But this is not about bottom-line
2 revenues. As a matter of fact, to quote Amy
3 Cohen, the mother who lost her son Sammy
4 Eckstein, today at our press conference she said
5 specifically -- and she was not promoted to say
6 such a thing -- she came up to the microphone,
7 she said: "This is not a money grab, this is
8 about saving lives and protecting our children."

9 SENATOR LANZA: Would the sponsor
10 continue to yield?

11 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Will
12 the sponsor continue to yield.

13 SENATOR KENNEDY: Yes.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Yes.

15 SENATOR LANZA: Through you,
16 Mr. President, the reason why I asked that
17 question, Senator Kennedy, is because in New York
18 City the lion's share of the money goes to
19 private interests, lobbyists -- not lobbyists,
20 but interests that -- well-heeled folks up here
21 that have lobbied both houses seeking that these
22 cameras be installed. And the fact of the matter
23 is it's because they've made tens of millions of
24 dollars from those cameras already. Not the City
25 of New York, but these private entities that were

1 part of the manufacture, the installation, and a
2 whole host of other people that are just grabbing
3 onto the money.

4 And I was just wondering if that was
5 going to be the case in the City of Buffalo, or
6 would all the money be going to the City of
7 Buffalo?

8 SENATOR KENNEDY: Through you,
9 Mr. President, the fines that the City of Buffalo
10 sets, at their request for this legislation, will
11 go to the city General Fund to be utilized how
12 the city so chooses.

13 SENATOR LANZA: Would the sponsor
14 continue to yield?

15 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Will
16 you continue to yield?

17 SENATOR KENNEDY: Yes.

18 SENATOR LANZA: Through you,
19 Mr. President. Senator Kennedy, I wish you had
20 written the New York City law, because that's
21 very encouraging. I think that's where the money
22 ought to go.

23 Through you, Mr. President, would
24 this bill require that a stop sign be placed at
25 the four corners surrounding every single school

1 in the City of Buffalo?

2 SENATOR KENNEDY: Through you,
3 Mr. President, no.

4 SENATOR LANZA: Would the sponsor
5 continue to yield?

6 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Will
7 the sponsor continue to yield?

8 SENATOR KENNEDY: Yes.

9 SENATOR LANZA: Through you,
10 Mr. President. Senator Kennedy, which do you
11 believe would be more effective in slowing
12 motorists down around schools, a stop sign or a
13 speed camera that they may or may not know is
14 there?

15 SENATOR KENNEDY: Through you,
16 Mr. President, if a driver is paying attention,
17 as they so should, they will recognize,
18 number one, that the zone they are entering,
19 based upon the signage delineated, is a school
20 zone with children crossing and that they should
21 slow down during this time. There should not be
22 a problem.

23 The problem is that there have been
24 too many drivers that have been driving
25 recklessly, carelessly, not thinking about

1 anybody but themselves, and have put our children
2 and our children's families in harm's way.

3 It has been noted by the Buffalo
4 public school leadership that there have been at
5 least four close calls this year alone, and that
6 there has been an increase in reckless driving.
7 And again, I will quote from the Buffalo News,
8 from Buffalo Public Schools' Will Keresztes, that
9 a motorist drove through a red light at high
10 speed. Other incidents included missing crossing
11 guards, which left families on their own trying
12 to get kids safely across the street.

13 And, quote, "Those tragedies were
14 only avoided with an awful lot of luck and God's
15 presence, really, on behalf of children and
16 parents that could have been victims of some
17 terrible catastrophes."

18 I believe in God, I believe in the
19 power of prayer. I also believe in the law. And
20 the law should be reflective, in Buffalo and
21 Western New York, as it is in the City of
22 New York, in keeping our children safe. And we
23 shouldn't have to depend on luck to get our
24 kids to and from school safely.

25 SENATOR LANZA: Mr. President,

1 would the sponsor continue to yield?

2 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Will
3 the sponsor continue to yield?

4 SENATOR KENNEDY: Yes.

5 SENATOR LANZA: Through you,
6 Mr. President. Senator Kennedy, in New York City
7 these cameras are triggered when a motorist is
8 traveling 10 miles more than the speed limit. Is
9 that also the case with respect to the program in
10 Buffalo?

11 SENATOR KENNEDY: Through you,
12 Mr. President, yes.

13 SENATOR LANZA: Would the sponsor
14 continue to yield?

15 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Will
16 the sponsor continue to yield?

17 SENATOR KENNEDY: Yes.

18 SENATOR LANZA: Through you,
19 Mr. President. Senator Kennedy, why not 5 miles
20 more than the speed limit?

21 SENATOR KENNEDY: Through you,
22 Mr. President. Because mirroring what the City
23 of New York had implemented back in 2013 as a
24 pilot and then expanded, and then expanded
25 further today, that is the number that has proven

1 to be effective.

2 SENATOR LANZA: Would the sponsor
3 continue to yield?

4 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Will
5 the sponsor continue to yield?

6 SENATOR KENNEDY: Yes.

7 SENATOR LANZA: Through you,
8 Mr. President. Senator Kennedy, if the idea is
9 to slow people down and not have them speed
10 through school zones, wouldn't it be even more
11 effective to make sure that people get a ticket
12 when they exceed the speed limit by even one mile
13 an hour and not 10 miles an hour?

14 SENATOR KENNEDY: Through you,
15 Mr. President. If my colleague Senator Lanza
16 would like to advance legislation to that effect,
17 we in the Transportation Committee would
18 certainly consider that.

19 SENATOR LANZA: Would the sponsor
20 continue to yield?

21 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Will
22 the sponsor continue to yield?

23 SENATOR KENNEDY: Yes.

24 SENATOR LANZA: Through you,
25 Mr. President. It's not my bill. I didn't write

1 it. But the bill is written that it would allow
2 motorists to exceed the speed limit by 10 miles
3 an hour before they get a ticket. And I just
4 wonder why that is. I understand that's the case
5 in New York City.

6 SENATOR KENNEDY: Would the Senator
7 yield for a question?

8 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Will
9 the Senator yield for a question?

10 SENATOR LANZA: Oh, of course, yes.

11 SENATOR KENNEDY: What speed limit
12 would you suggest?

13 SENATOR LANZA: Through you,
14 Mr. President. Well, I'm just trying to get my
15 mind around this whole concept. So the idea that
16 is being floated is that if anyone exceeds the
17 speed limit in a school zone that this might lead
18 to tragedy and that we don't want people speeding
19 in the speed zones. So as we read the law,
20 because the law is important, it's been pointed
21 out a number of times, as soon as you're driving
22 one mile past the speed limit, you are speeding.

23 And so, you know, I could suggest a
24 lot of things, but the bill before us would allow
25 you to go 10 miles above the speed limit before

1 you receive a ticket.

2 I'm sorry, does that answer your
3 question, Senator Kennedy?

4 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
5 Senator Lanza, please go through the chair.

6 SENATOR LANZA: Through you,
7 Mr. President, would you ask Senator Kennedy if
8 I've answered his question?

9 (Laughter.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
11 Senator Kennedy, has he answered your question?

12 SENATOR KENNEDY: In part. It
13 answers my question in part.

14 SENATOR LANZA: Would the sponsor
15 continue to yield?

16 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Will
17 the sponsor continue to yield?

18 SENATOR KENNEDY: Yes.

19 SENATOR LANZA: Through you,
20 Mr. President. So does the sponsor believe that
21 a motorist, as he described, the hypothetical
22 one -- or even the real one -- that is so craven,
23 so uncaring of the safety of children around
24 schools, that would speed through a school zone,
25 given all that, does the sponsor believe that the

1 threat of a \$50 fine would prevent this craven
2 individual who doesn't care about kids to change
3 their behavior and actually not speed through a
4 speed zone?

5 SENATOR KENNEDY: Through you,
6 Mr. President, yes. And we have data to prove
7 it. Nearly 80 percent -- over 80 percent of
8 individuals who had received a ticket in the
9 New York City school camera zones were not repeat
10 offenders.

11 SENATOR LANZA: Mr. President, on
12 the bill.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: On the
14 bill.

15 SENATOR LANZA: Mr. President,
16 first, I would like to thank Senator Kennedy to
17 allow me to ask questions on the Buffalo bill
18 when in actuality I had some questions about the
19 New York City bill. And he was a good sport.
20 But they are very similar bills, they do the same
21 thing. And let me tell you the trouble I have.

22 First, I agree that in the right
23 place at the right time, as part of a more broad
24 policy, speed cameras have their place. I just
25 don't understand why this is what we are leading

1 with when clearly -- I mean, we can go back and
2 forth, but I don't think there's anyone in this
3 chamber who doesn't agree with the fact that a
4 stop sign would do more to slow a motorist down
5 at an intersection than a camera that they may or
6 may not know is there. In New York City, clearly
7 they won't know it's there, because the city
8 doesn't want to put up a sign. Hopefully Buffalo
9 will do it differently. It sounds like there's a
10 chance they will.

11 But honestly, we've put a bill --
12 I've put a bill I've authored on this floor,
13 we've all voted for it. It would do just that.
14 I've heard this idea that we shouldn't put
15 politics over safety. I agree. We shouldn't put
16 money over safety either. It's probably worse.

17 Let's put my bill back on the floor
18 or someone pick up the bill. Here's what that
19 bill does. It says that at every corner around
20 every school, we ought to put a stop sign. Let
21 me tell you why I know -- I keep hearing about
22 how this is proven and we've got demonstrated
23 data to show that this is effective. Let me tell
24 you how I know that works.

25 In my district there's a school, a

1 lot of people were speeding and there were a few
2 accidents. And every year I asked the New York
3 City DOT if they would consider putting a stop
4 sign there, even before we would get this bill.
5 And they would tell me, Yeah, I support your
6 bill, Senator Lanza, it sounds great. We'd pass
7 it here. They'd run over to the other chamber
8 and they'd lobby hard to make sure that it didn't
9 get passed, that bill.

10 Year after year I asked for a stop
11 sign to be placed there. And year after year the
12 city gave me every reason why it was not only
13 possible, but that they didn't want to do it.
14 They gave me police reports, they talked about
15 road geometry, they said they couldn't do it,
16 doesn't work.

17 So I'm a good listener around here,
18 I pay attention to the way people do things. And
19 I took a page out of their book. I used some
20 hyperbole -- because I heard in this argument
21 over the years on speed cameras if you don't
22 support this legislation, there's going to be
23 blood on your hands and we're going to be outside
24 your office, we're going to be outside your
25 house. And I've heard some activists say the

1 same thing. Shouldn't do it, but I did it.
2 Stood out there at that corner and I said, You
3 know, we're getting close. As Senator Kennedy
4 said, there are a lot of close calls out there
5 around schools. So we're getting real close, and
6 my message to the City of New York is, God forbid
7 something happens here, it's on you.

8 You know, about a month later there
9 was a stop sign there. It's still there. And
10 the funny thing about that stop sign is that they
11 took away the speed camera that was there now.
12 You know why? Because it's not ringing up the
13 register anymore. That's a fact. They took away
14 the speed camera because the stop sign had this
15 very strange effect on people. Not only did they
16 slow down, they stopped.

17 And the reason why I dispute some of
18 this -- by the way, if I could, Mr. President --
19 Senator Krueger, I'd like to know the street in
20 Manhattan that you could speed on. I want to see
21 it. Because I've spent a good part of my life
22 commuting, going to school, to Manhattan. I
23 haven't seen that street.

24 You know, on Staten Island there are
25 a lot of streets that are large that there aren't

1 a lot of cars there and there aren't a lot of
2 accidents, either. And it seems that that's
3 where the city wants to do it. I hope that
4 doesn't happen in Buffalo.

5 But I think the proof that this is
6 not the most effective way to go, at least not
7 the most effective first step to take -- because
8 I agree -- and by the way, I know Senator Kennedy
9 is doing this to help ensure the safety of
10 children. So I don't want that to be lost in my
11 remarks. But I don't understand why this is the
12 first step here and in New York City.

13 The reason why I know this is not
14 the best first step is because the speed cameras
15 in New York City that have been there, they
16 are -- they are ringing like cash registers.
17 Which means people keep speeding. It's the only
18 reason why they're generating millions upon
19 millions of dollars.

20 And I heard the theory with the
21 speed cameras is -- and I agree it makes a lot of
22 sense -- is that once you are issued a ticket
23 because you've gone through this -- you've sped
24 through this zone, you're going to receive a
25 ticket -- and it does make sense. I've heard

1 Senator Kennedy say it, Senator Krueger say it.
2 It does make sense that this might alter your
3 behavior and that the first time, once it's
4 issued, you might not do it again, that it
5 dramatically decreases that person from going
6 through or speeding through the zone.

7 The problem I have with that is that
8 since we know these cameras just keep ringing up
9 the dollars, which means that people keep
10 speeding through -- perhaps the majority of them
11 are first-time speeders through the zone. But
12 here's the problem with that. What if the first
13 time, Mr. President, that someone speeds through
14 this school zone, the first time they do it, they
15 God forbid hit a kid. The only thing that's
16 going happen as a result of this legislation is
17 that they're going to get a ticket and they're
18 going to pay a fine. And that kid will have
19 still been hit by that motorist.

20 That is why I don't believe that
21 this really does what everyone is saying it will
22 do. And I really, truly believe that it is going
23 to do nothing more than provide a false sense of
24 security for all of us parents -- I'm one too --
25 and fool people into believing that it's now safe

1 around schools.

2 As I've said, I don't want to
3 completely discount the benefit that may be
4 provided in terms of safety by cameras, but let's
5 not lead first. Again, I'm suspicious by nature.
6 It just leads me to believe, given the experience
7 in New York City -- not by the sponsor, not by
8 any member here, but by the governments back home
9 in New York City and Buffalo -- that really what
10 they're after here is the dollars. Because there
11 are better ways to ensure safety around schools.
12 And not once, not once have I heard from them
13 here in Albany advocating any of those measures.

14 So unfortunately, when it comes time
15 to vote, Mr. President, I'm going to be in the
16 negative.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
18 Senator Jacobs.

19 SENATOR JACOBS: Thank you,
20 Mr. President. On the bill.

21 As a former Buffalo school board
22 member, I want to commend Senator Kennedy for
23 offering this legislation, and Assemblywoman
24 Peoples as well. And it is my great hope that
25 the statistics that have been referenced, we will

1 see similar statistics about this being a
2 deterrent in terms of dangerous activity around
3 our schools and driving.

4 It's my hope on a piece of
5 legislation, if the intent is to keep children
6 safe, that everything is done within that piece
7 of legislation possible to do that. And the one
8 element of this legislation I do lament was
9 referenced in some of the questions that the
10 revenue that is going to be generated by this
11 ticket writing is just going into the General
12 Fund of the city, with a hope that the city will
13 spend this on investments around these schools to
14 do other things, like stop signs. To do other
15 things like speed bumps or crosswalk bump-outs.
16 Those things that would help in terms of
17 additionally beyond the cameras to assure --
18 lighting. Actually fixing potholes. Because we
19 have situations where people erratically drive to
20 avoid a pothole, and you don't want that around a
21 school zone.

22 In particular as a school board
23 member, I would encourage that these funds go to
24 pay for something I think is very effective, bus
25 aides. Which are not aidable by state law. Bus

1 aides which ride along on every bus and come out
2 and escort the children out as they leave the
3 buses. When I was on the school board, we were
4 fortunate to have a bus aide on every single one
5 of our buses. That has lapsed due to the
6 financial stress the Buffalo schools have
7 experienced.

8 And I would be remiss, putting my
9 advocate as a school board member back on --
10 unfortunately, the City of Buffalo gives the
11 lowest amount on a percentage basis to their
12 school district of any city in the State of
13 New York, only about 10 percent. So this is a
14 golden opportunity for more money to go directly
15 to a significant need, which usually is not
16 aidable by the state, security measures in and
17 around the schools.

18 So I support this legislation. I'm
19 glad it's done. I just hope perhaps in another
20 piece of legislation or at the level of the City
21 of Buffalo City Council, they would take it upon
22 themselves to put this into a lockbox, to a
23 dedicated fund, to enhance this bill to make sure
24 that we're doing beyond just the cameras, but
25 every measure possible with these new resources

1 to assure that every child is safe.

2 Thank you, Mr. President.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Is
4 there any other Senator wishing to be heard?

5 Hearing none, the debate is closed.

6 The Secretary will ring the bell.

7 Senator Serrano.

8 SENATOR SERRANO: Thank you,
9 Mr. President.

10 By unanimous consent, I ask that the
11 bill that we have before the house be restored to
12 the noncontroversial reading of the calendar.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
14 Without objection, so ordered.

15 SENATOR SERRANO: Thank you.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: There
17 is a home-rule message at the desk.

18 The Secretary will read the last
19 section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 14. This
21 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it
22 shall have become a law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Call
24 the roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:

2 Senator Kennedy to explain his vote.

3 SENATOR KENNEDY: Thank you,
4 Mr. President.

5 First of all, let me thank our
6 conference leader, Senator Andrea
7 Stewart-Cousins, for bringing this bill to the
8 floor so expeditiously as we are also passing the
9 lifesaving measures in the City of New York.

10 I want to thank my colleagues on the
11 Transportation Committee for their support in
12 advancing this forward.

13 I want to thank my colleagues on the
14 other side of the aisle for the robust debate.
15 But I've got to tell you, seeing all those hands
16 go up is extremely disheartening. The fact that
17 we can approve these lifesaving measures in the
18 City of New York and then, when a bill comes up
19 for the City of Buffalo, there is tremendous
20 opposition to this from the other side is rather
21 unconscionable.

22 And the fact of the matter is that
23 our kids in the City of Buffalo deserve the same
24 protections as the kids do in the City of
25 New York. That's what this is all about,

1 providing safety for our children. And doing it
2 in a way where it is equitable and there is
3 parity. We've been talking about those words
4 quite a bit through this budget process. And now
5 we have a chance to create equitable safety
6 measures in the state for our kids, and there's
7 opposition, greater opposition. So that is
8 rather unfortunate.

9 But to the bill, the fact is that
10 this is something that our children deserve in
11 the City of Buffalo, this is something that our
12 families deserve in the City of Buffalo.
13 Supported, again, not only by the mayor of the
14 city and the common council, via home rule
15 resolution, but the Buffalo Public Schools, the
16 District Parent Coordinating council of the
17 Buffalo Public Schools, the New York League of
18 Conservation Voters, the New York State
19 Conference of Mayors, AARP -- the list goes on
20 and on and on of support for this bill.

21 Allowing the City of Buffalo to put
22 in safety measures around our schools where
23 they're desperately needed, where the leaders in
24 the City of Buffalo are saying that there's an
25 increase in reckless driving, an increase of

1 drivers that are ignoring stop signs or red
2 lights or school crossing guards that are jumping
3 out of the way. By putting this legislation
4 forward, we're simply doing the right thing.

5 And as I said earlier, we shouldn't
6 wait for a child to be struck or a family member
7 taking that child to school to be struck and
8 killed before the City of Buffalo does the right
9 thing.

10 I want to thank my colleague
11 Majority Leader Assemblywoman Crystal
12 Peoples-Stokes for advancing and passing this
13 bill overwhelmingly in the Assembly.

14 You know, one of the greatest things
15 that I do, one of my most favorite things that I
16 do on a very personal level when I am home, and
17 it is a reminder to me that I am home, is taking
18 my son to school and crossing two streets. On
19 Abbott Road -- we cross Narragansett, and then we
20 cross Abbott Road. And I know, because I'm one
21 of them, the drivers each and every day are in a
22 hurry to go to work or take their children to
23 school or some other place, and I am just as much
24 in a hurry. But as I come upon the school,
25 there's a crossing guard there, there is children

1 and families moving around, on and off of the
2 sidewalk. And there is an incredible amount of
3 traffic. Just down the road, there's Lorraine
4 Elementary, there's Southside Elementary, where
5 one of those close calls occurred. And across
6 the City of Buffalo, there are thoroughfares
7 where this reckless driving is happening each and
8 every day.

9 We hope to deter that. Data will
10 prove that these drivers will recognize they're
11 entering a school zone with these families, as
12 their minds are occupied about getting to work or
13 other places in the community. It will calm
14 traffic, and it will keep our children and
15 families safe. That is the bottom line.

16 There is nothing in this legislation
17 that prevents the City of Buffalo from adding
18 stop signs or speed bumps or other delineations.
19 This is simply another tool to keep our families
20 safe.

21 And as I'm hearing from my
22 colleagues different measures that they could put
23 forward, this bill has been moving and moving
24 quickly through committee. None of these items
25 were raised through the process, both privately

1 and publicly. None of this information came to
2 my attention.

3 So here we are. And I would submit
4 to you, Mr. President and colleagues, if
5 individuals have other ways to keep our children
6 safe, we will absolutely consider them in the
7 Transportation Committee. We are aggressive in
8 advancing pieces of legislation that are
9 technologically advanced and accomplish that
10 goal, and this bill does all of the above.

11 I'm proud to support it. And with
12 that, Mr. President, I vote aye.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
14 Senator Kennedy votes affirmatively.

15 Senator Ranzenhofer.

16 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: Thank you,
17 Mr. President.

18 First of all, I'd like to thank
19 those members who are actively involved. And I
20 think the amount of time that we have spent on
21 this bill really reflects the fact that it's a
22 very important piece of legislation and the fact
23 that I think every member in this chamber is
24 concerned about the issue. So there's no
25 difference on either side of the aisle in terms

1 of people thinking that this is an important
2 issue, people being committed to school safety,
3 to traffic safety.

4 And I would like just to make one
5 comment, is that, you know, these are not new
6 concerns or new issues that were raised for the
7 first time today. I remember being on the floor
8 a year ago and listening to these very same
9 comments that were made today as were made then.

10 So Senator Kennedy and Senator
11 Krueger, Senator Lanza, you know, I think by the
12 comments that were made, I don't think there's a
13 person in this chamber who doesn't feel that
14 there is a way of accomplishing what needs to be
15 done, and that is making sure that kids are safe.

16 And I'll just digress for a short
17 second, is that we have a state highway in the
18 Town of Amherst, between Senator Jacobs's
19 district and my district, State Route 62, Niagara
20 Falls Boulevard. There, instead of -- as Senator
21 Kennedy said, you know, we don't want to wait
22 around and see if something happens. On that
23 particular highway, six people have been killed
24 in the last couple of years. And the state has
25 done nothing on that issue.

1 And I know Senator Jacobs, myself,
2 and everybody is very concerned. And I wouldn't
3 even be so bold to say that, you know, the
4 Governor or the state is not concerned, that they
5 want kids killed. But, you know, it doesn't have
6 the type of priority that it really deserves.

7 So going back to this particular
8 bill, I think what everybody is saying and
9 agreeing upon -- and I think there is more
10 consensus and there is more agreement -- that
11 people are concerned about school safety, people
12 want kids to be safe, but there is healthy
13 discussion and healthy dialogue about what is
14 really the best way to protect kids.

15 And I'm so glad and so heartened
16 that Senator Kennedy agreed, you know, in the
17 debate that he would, you know, help -- he would
18 consider these and help pass additional
19 legislation to actually accomplish some of the
20 goals. Which, you know, do we know whether or
21 not it's going to work, yes or no. But I think
22 there is pretty strong support that there are
23 other means of getting the job done.

24 I just want to harken back to a
25 point that I made. Again, I was so glad to hear

1 Senator Kennedy enthusiastically say that this is
2 a good idea. But really getting to the heart of
3 the matter, and that is dealing with the people
4 that are creating mayhem. The drivers, the
5 owners that allow their vehicles to be in
6 constant violation of the law.

7 You know, a \$50 fine, I'm glad that
8 there would be consideration to actually doing
9 something which might get these unsafe drivers
10 off the roadway.

11 So again, you know, I think the
12 theory and the heartfelt belief behind this
13 legislation is good. I think we have a long way
14 to go to actually make sure and provide better
15 assurances to the motoring public, to parents, to
16 teachers, to people that are around school areas
17 that we in the State Legislature can do a better
18 job than we are starting with today in making
19 sure that their kids are safe.

20 So again, I like the concept of the
21 bill. It doesn't do what I think needs to be
22 done, and that is going after the offenders,
23 really making sure that kids are safe around
24 school. So I'll be casting a vote today in the
25 negative, Mr. President. Thank you very much.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:

2 Senator Ranzenhofer in the negative.

3 Announce the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
5 Calendar Number 47, those Senators recorded in
6 the negative are Senators Akshar, Amedore,
7 Antonacci, Boyle, Flanagan, Funke, Jordan, Lanza,
8 LaValle, Ortt, Ranzenhofer, Robach, Serino,
9 Seward and Tedisco.

10 Ayes, 46. Nays, 15.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: The
12 bill is passed.

13 The Secretary will read.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 67,
15 Senate Print 1130A, by Senator Benjamin, an act
16 to amend the Alcoholic Beverage Control Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
18 Senator Robach.

19 SENATOR ROBACH: Yes,
20 Mr. President, would the former president of the
21 Senate yield for a few questions?

22 (Laughter.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Will
24 you yield, Senator Benjamin?

25 SENATOR BENJAMIN: Yes.

1 SENATOR ROBACH: Don't demote him.
2 Please, don't demote him.

3 SENATOR BENJAMIN: Thank you.

4 SENATOR ROBACH: Yeah, I just have
5 a quick question. And I know it's late, but this
6 is important to me for a number of reasons.

7 Senator Benjamin, this bill
8 originally was only for New York City and then
9 got amended for the rest of the state. Could you
10 tell me what the reason was for that, please?

11 SENATOR BENJAMIN: Sure. Through
12 you, Mr. President, the reason for extending it
13 to the entire state is because we want to make
14 sure that in the State of New York, if a liquor
15 store actually gets a liquor license, that the
16 community knows about it. And so that should
17 apply whether it's in New York City or upstate.

18 And so just -- it's important to
19 note that when you get a liquor license for a bar
20 or a restaurant, you are required to notify the
21 community in New York City. I used to be chair
22 of a community board, and whenever a bar or
23 restaurant would seek a liquor license, they had
24 to notify the community. The community board had
25 to know about it, and they had to publish

1 something in the newspaper.

2 It doesn't make sense to me that
3 liquor stores are able to not have to do the same
4 process.

5 And so this says in the entire State
6 of New York, if you are a liquor store and you
7 want a liquor license, before you get that
8 license you need to notify the State Liquor
9 Authority. But before you do that, the community
10 where you're looking to put your liquor store
11 should know about it and should have a chance to
12 comment.

13 I think that's a very simple bill.
14 It has no cost to the state. I don't want anyone
15 to worry about any cost to the state. There's no
16 cost to the state. There's some cost to the
17 liquor store owner, because they have to notify
18 the community about it. But that is really the
19 heart of this bill.

20 SENATOR ROBACH: Through you,
21 Mr. President. Actually, this is good, maybe I'm
22 a little bit --

23 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Are
24 you asking the Senator to yield?

25 SENATOR ROBACH: Would he yield?

1 I thought this would also apply
2 for -- and the main reason for this was, from
3 your memo --

4 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Are
5 you -- are you asking the sponsor to continue to
6 yield?

7 SENATOR ROBACH: Yes, I just said
8 that.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Do you
10 continue to yield?

11 SENATOR BENJAMIN: Of course.

12 SENATOR ROBACH: Try to be as sharp
13 as that president. No, I'm only kidding.

14 (Laughter.)

15 SENATOR ROBACH: I thought this
16 would also apply to -- let's say there's an
17 existing liquor store, a craft brewery, a
18 off-premise establishment that just sells beer,
19 and they change the case or change their space
20 around inside of their business, they would then
21 have to go through a notification process. And,
22 which I already think is excessive, State Liquor
23 Authority law, you already have to apply to the
24 state. Now you're going to put another
25 requirement on them even if they were changing a

1 display case.

2 Would your bill apply to that
3 situation, Senator Benjamin?

4 SENATOR BENJAMIN: So only if
5 they're changing the store itself,
6 Senator Robach, would that be required. And if
7 it's a renewal of the license or if there's a
8 substantial corporate change. So for example, if
9 you have a new owner of the liquor store, the
10 community should know about that. We might
11 approve of one owner but not approve of another.
12 I mean, those are fair things.

13 But if you change a display case,
14 Senator Robach, that does not require you to go
15 through this process. But if you change the
16 store, that should be notified to the community.

17 SENATOR ROBACH: Through you,
18 Mr. President. I think this would be the last
19 question before I go on the bill.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Does
21 the sponsor continue to yield?

22 SENATOR ROBACH: Would the
23 sponsor --

24 SENATOR BENJAMIN: I'll be happy to
25 yield.

1 SENATOR ROBACH: What would be the
2 cost to make that application? And what would be
3 the fine if somebody didn't do that or there was
4 a discrepancy on what you say isn't altering the
5 store, but yet the Liquor Authority said it was,
6 simply for something that most people would
7 normally do in their business? I'm just curious
8 what the cost to businesses would be.

9 SENATOR BENJAMIN: Well, first of
10 all, this is pre you getting the license,
11 correct?

12 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Please
13 direct your responses through the president.

14 SENATOR BENJAMIN: Oh, through you,
15 Mr. President.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Thank
17 you.

18 SENATOR BENJAMIN: I'm just so
19 excited to get to him.

20 (Laughter.)

21 SENATOR BENJAMIN: But through you,
22 Mr. President, in the case of a new application,
23 before you actually get the license, you have to
24 articulate what your plans are. And so that
25 would have to occur in advance of you getting the

1 license, and obviously you'd go through this
2 process.

3 SENATOR ROBACH: Okay. I could ask
4 more -- I'll go on the bill, Mr. President.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: On the
6 bill.

7 SENATOR ROBACH: I don't believe
8 that -- I understand the intent. I believe the
9 bill does much more than what's being said here.

10 And I'm going to say, off of this
11 bill, this will be no secret to my colleagues who
12 paid attention, I think the State Liquor
13 Authority does a terrible job of how long they
14 take to serve businesses, the requirements they
15 make. It's kind of ironic that we're in New York
16 where we're letting shooters, murderers,
17 pedophiles out of jail earlier, but if you want
18 to have a business that sells liquor, you're
19 guilty till proven innocent, even to get your
20 license in the first place.

21 I believe this bill would go above
22 and beyond that and now say to anybody -- and I'm
23 very concerned about craft brewing. I'll give
24 you one where we've loosened the regulations and
25 the taxes and the business is booming, yet if

1 you're a liquor store, a craft brewery, sell
2 off-premise, or even trying to get a liquor
3 license for a tavern, a bar or a restaurant, it's
4 very, very onerous and still takes months.

5 Shocking to me, the Liquor Authority
6 will say, well, we've got the wait down in
7 upstate New York from 12 months to 10 months, but
8 you have to own the building to apply, be paying
9 rent and do all those things.

10 So I would suggest -- I don't think
11 it's a big problem. I think local control is
12 better, does some of those things. But I think
13 for existing businesses, this is going to be very
14 onerous, unnecessary. And I would say if you're
15 out of the five boroughs of Manhattan {sic}, you
16 should be against this bill. This is a problem
17 or a -- I think really not a problem where we
18 live. I've never had -- I was going to ask you
19 that, Senator Benjamin. I've never had anybody
20 come up to me and say they feel like this is a
21 problem or it's jeopardizing them.

22 I have had many, many businesses or
23 people even go out of business or run out of
24 money waiting for licenses or the overzealous
25 Liquor Authority, with no complaints from the

1 public, wreaking havoc on people trying to make a
2 living in New York State.

3 So I'm going to vote no. And I
4 would suggest that other people -- unless it
5 really is that much of a necessity, is the
6 original bill inside the five boroughs of
7 Manhattan -- vote no also.

8 Thank you, Mr. President.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
10 Senator Robach votes negatively.

11 Are there any other Senators wishing
12 to be heard?

13 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
14 closed. The Secretary will ring the bell.

15 Senator Serrano.

16 SENATOR SERRANO: Thank you,
17 Mr. President. I'd ask at this time, by
18 unanimous consent, that we restore this bill to
19 the noncontroversial calendar.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
21 Without objection, so ordered.

22 SENATOR SERRANO: Thank you,
23 Mr. President.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Read
25 the last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
2 act shall take effect immediately.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Call
4 the roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: The
7 former presiding officer, Senator Benjamin, to
8 explain his vote.

9 (Laughter.)

10 SENATOR BENJAMIN: Thank you,
11 Mr. Chair.

12 I rise because I want to make it
13 clear to the body that in certain communities in
14 the State of New York, there are oversaturation
15 of liquor stores. There are certain communities
16 where on every single block there is a liquor
17 store, and in some cases there's more than one on
18 a block.

19 And all this bill is saying is that
20 if you are looking to open a liquor store, before
21 you are granted the right to do so, the community
22 must be notified and have a chance to opine on
23 the matter to the SLA and to make their voices
24 heard.

25 Community boards, where there's a

1 local city clerk or a town -- communities need to
2 know the purveyance of liquor in their
3 communities. As the father of a new baby girl, I
4 would like to know when liquor stores are being
5 opened in proximity to my daughter.

6 I also would think if you send your
7 children to school, you would like to know how
8 close a liquor store might or might not be to
9 your children.

10 So this is not onerous. We're not,
11 you know, cutting off anyone's arm. All we're
12 saying is that if you're going to open a liquor
13 store or you want to open a liquor store, you
14 need to provide notification to the community by
15 two ways: One, in the newspaper or the local
16 newspaper, you let the community know; and, two,
17 that you let the local community board or
18 whatever your equivalent is in your town know.

19 I think this is a good bill. It
20 moves New York forward. And I encourage all of
21 my colleagues to vote aye.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
23 Senator Hoylman.

24 SENATOR HOYLMAN: I just wanted to
25 rise and support this legislation and commend my

1 colleague Senator Benjamin.

2 What we're talking about here is
3 more community input for something that is as
4 controversial in some neighborhoods as a liquor
5 store. We shouldn't be afraid of hearing from
6 our local neighbors about their opinion, whether
7 it be in Binghamton or Brooklyn.

8 So I'm very grateful to Senator
9 Benjamin for advancing a bill that not only
10 provides more public input but helps us as
11 legislators represent our communities better.
12 And I vote in the affirmative.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
14 Senator Hoylman votes affirmatively.

15 Senator Benjamin, who I hope will be
16 here real soon, also votes affirmatively.

17 Senator Little.

18 SENATOR LITTLE: Yes, I would just
19 like to speak very quickly and explain my vote.

20 And my vote is a no vote. Because I
21 represent a very large area of this state; it's
22 bigger than the State of Connecticut. And for
23 someone to open a liquor store or a bar in my
24 area, there are numerous steps where you notify
25 the town and then you deal with the State Liquor

1 Authority, and it takes a long time. It's
2 constant, constant, we're hearing, you know, how
3 much longer is this going take.

4 We have enough restrictions.
5 Putting more restrictions and more expense on
6 small businesses in New York State is certainly
7 not what I'm here for. So I vote no.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
9 Senator Little votes negatively.

10 Announce the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
12 Calendar Number 67, those Senators voting in the
13 negative are Senators Amedore, Antonacci,
14 Flanagan, Funke, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming,
15 Jacobs, Jordan, LaValle, Little, Ortt,
16 Ranzenhofer, Ritchie, Robach, Serino, Seward and
17 Tedisco.

18 Ayes, 43. Nays, 18.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: The
20 bill is passed.

21 Senator Serrano, that completes the
22 reading of the controversial calendar.

23 SENATOR SERRANO: Mr. President,
24 thank you.

25 Can you call on Senator Griffo for

1 motions.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:

3 Motions and resolutions. Senator Griffo.

4 SENATOR GRIFFO: Mr. President, on
5 behalf of Senator Flanagan, I would move that the
6 following bills be discharged from their
7 respective committees and be recommitted with
8 instructions to strike the enacting clause:
9 Senate Bill 867, 888, 920, 954, 970, 1006, 1043,
10 1020.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: It is
12 so ordered.

13 Senator Griffo.

14 SENATOR GRIFFO: Mr. President, I
15 also move that the following bills, on behalf of
16 Senator Flanagan, be discharged from their
17 respective committees and be recommitted with
18 instructions to strike the enacting clause:
19 Senate Bills 882, 887, 898, 974, 991, 992, 998,
20 999, 1001, 1041, 1042, and 1045.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: It is
22 so ordered.

23 Senator Serrano.

24 SENATOR SERRANO: Thank you,
25 Mr. President.

1 Is there any further business at the
2 desk?

3 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: There
4 is no further business at the desk.

5 SENATOR SERRANO: Okay, thank you,
6 Mr. President. That being the case, I move that
7 we adjourn until Wednesday, March 20th, at
8 11:00 a.m.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: On
10 motion, the Senate stands adjourned until
11 tomorrow, March 20th, at 11:00 a.m.

12 SENATOR SERRANO: Thank you,
13 Mr. President.

14 (Whereupon, at 6:10 p.m., the Senate
15 adjourned.)

16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25