

1 NEW YORK STATE SENATE

2  
3  
4 THE STENOGRAPHIC RECORD

5  
6  
7  
8  
9 ALBANY, NEW YORK

10 January 15, 2019

11 11:22 a.m.

12  
13  
14 REGULAR SESSION

15  
16  
17  
18 LIEUTENANT GOVERNOR KATHLEEN C. HOCHUL, President

19 ALEJANDRA N. PAULINO, ESQ., Secretary

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2 THE PRESIDENT: The Senate will  
3 come to order.

4 And I ask everyone present to please  
5 rise and repeat with me the Pledge of Allegiance.

6 (Whereupon, the assemblage recited  
7 the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.)

8 THE PRESIDENT: Our invocation  
9 today will be given by Rabbi Yael Rooks Rapport,  
10 from the Congregation Beit Simchat Torah, in  
11 New York City.

12 We look forward to hearing from you.  
13 And you are also from -- the Rabbi is also from  
14 Senator Hoylman's district. Rabbi.

15 RABBI RAPPORT: Members of the  
16 New York State Senate, good morning.

17 SENATORS: Good morning.

18 RABBI RAPPORT: I bring you  
19 greetings from Congregation Beit Simchat Torah,  
20 the world's largest LGBTQ synagogue, in New York  
21 City.

22 You gather here today as  
23 representation of something greater than  
24 yourself, one individual image which encompasses  
25 the dreams, the challenges, and the possibility

1 of each of your districts and the many  
2 constituents you represent.

3 In the Jewish tradition, we believe  
4 that each of us individually is one small spark,  
5 one unique reflection of the divine.

6 In the first chapter of Genesis, it  
7 is written that humanity was created {Hebrew}, in  
8 the image of God. It is the source of our belief  
9 that every individual brings to the world some  
10 unique relevance of God's image exactly as we  
11 are, exactly as we were created, that no one else  
12 could bring.

13 May we see in ourselves this beauty  
14 and wholeness. May we know that exactly the way  
15 we are made shines with holiness because our  
16 image is part of something much more expansive  
17 that requires our representation, because of our  
18 gender identification, because of our sexual  
19 orientation, because of our religious  
20 affiliation, our race, our ethnicity, our  
21 national origin.

22 May we strive to recognize this same  
23 holiness in others in moments when we feel alike,  
24 and in moments when we feel completely different.

25 May each of you, representations of

1 representation, continue to act as sources of  
2 blessing to all you serve, as only you can.

3 Let us say together, amen.

4 THE PRESIDENT: Thank you very  
5 much, Rabbi Yael Rapport.

6 Reading of the Journal.

7 THE SECRETARY: In Senate, Monday,  
8 January 14, 2019, the Senate met pursuant to  
9 adjournment. The Journal of Sunday, January 13,  
10 2019, was read and approved. On motion, Senate  
11 adjourned.

12 THE PRESIDENT: Without objection,  
13 the Journal stands approved as read.

14 Presentation of petitions.

15 Messages from the Assembly.

16 Messages from the Governor.

17 Reports of standing committees.

18 Reports of -- may we have order.

19 Reports of standing committees.

20 Reports of select committees.

21 Communications and reports from  
22 state officers.

23 Motions and resolutions.

24 Senator Gianaris.

25 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,

1 good morning.

2 I now move to adopt the  
3 Resolution Calendar, with the exception of  
4 Resolutions 9 and 60.

5 THE PRESIDENT: All in favor of  
6 adopting the Resolution Calendar, with the  
7 exception of Resolutions 9 and 60, signify by  
8 saying aye.

9 (Response of "Aye.")

10 THE PRESIDENT: Opposed, nay.

11 (No response.)

12 THE PRESIDENT: The Resolution  
13 Calendar is adopted.

14 Senator Gianaris.

15 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,  
16 can you please call up Resolution Number 60, read  
17 that resolution in its entirety, and recognize  
18 Senator Stavisky to speak.

19 THE PRESIDENT: The Secretary will  
20 read.

21 THE SECRETARY: Legislative  
22 Resolution Number 60, commemorating the work of  
23 the Korean American Association of Greater  
24 New York and its President, Minsun Kim, for their  
25 historic work in advancing the interests and

1 well-being of the Korean American community of  
2 New York, and honoring their visit to the State  
3 Capitol of New York in Albany.

4 "WHEREAS, It is the custom of this  
5 Legislative Body to honor and commemorate those  
6 illustrious organizations and individuals of the  
7 State of New York whose focus and intent have had  
8 a substantial impact on the many, diverse  
9 residents of the State of New York; and

10 "WHEREAS, The Korean American  
11 Association of Greater New York was founded in  
12 1960 as a nonprofit to advocate for the welfare  
13 and rights of over half a million members of the  
14 Korean American community of Greater New York;  
15 and

16 "WHEREAS, Korean Americans, who form  
17 a large, vibrant community in New York, represent  
18 a long and storied part of the American fabric,  
19 having made numerous contributions to science,  
20 law, business, art, and many other fields; and

21 "WHEREAS, The Korean American  
22 Association of Greater New York acts as an  
23 umbrella organization for over 500 other  
24 Korean American groups that provide assistance  
25 and services in numerous areas, such as culture,

1 education, and community outreach, for people of  
2 all ages and socioeconomic status; and

3 "WHEREAS, Minsun Kim was elected to  
4 serve as the 34th President and the 35th  
5 President of the Korean American Association of  
6 Greater New York; as the first female leader of  
7 the organization, she has successfully led it  
8 towards achieving numerous goals of long-standing  
9 consequence; and

10 "WHEREAS, The Korean American  
11 Association of Greater New York and  
12 President Minsun Kim have endeavored to advance  
13 the causes of women's equality and the principles  
14 of democracy, and spearheaded efforts to  
15 recognize the historical legacy of Yu Gwan-sun  
16 and her importance in the March 1st movement; and

17 "WHEREAS, Yu Gwan-sun, introduced  
18 by Alice H. Sharp, a missionary sent from  
19 New York to Korea, attended the Ewha Women's  
20 School, Korea's first women's educational  
21 institute established by an American missionary,  
22 where she learned the American values of  
23 freedom, justice, equality and human rights, and  
24 became a national symbol of the human rights  
25 movement; and

1                   "WHEREAS, The Korean American  
2 Association of Greater New York and  
3 President Minsun Kim will be joined by a variety  
4 of organizations and their representatives in  
5 visiting the New York State Capitol in Albany on  
6 January 15, 2019; and

7                   "WHEREAS, Many Korean Americans in  
8 the State of New York maintain profound ties to  
9 other members of their community, both in  
10 America and around the world, and through their  
11 family and culture, this visit represents a  
12 momentous event for both them and countless  
13 other New Yorkers; and

14                  "WHEREAS, It is the sense of this  
15 Legislative Body to commemorate the historic  
16 occasion of the visit of the Korean American  
17 Association of Greater New York and President  
18 Minsun Kim; now, therefore, be it

19                  "RESOLVED, That this Legislative  
20 Body pause in its deliberations to commemorate  
21 March 1, 2019, as the Centennial of the March 1st  
22 Movement, and to honor the lasting impact of  
23 Yu Gwan-sun's legacy as one of the youngest  
24 female human rights movement leaders; and be it  
25 further



1                   "RESOLVED, That copies of this  
2 resolution, suitably engrossed, be transmitted to  
3 Moon Jae-in, President of South Korea;  
4 Minsun Kim, President of the Korean American  
5 Association of Greater New York; and the  
6 Korean American community of New York."

7                   THE PRESIDENT:   Senator Stavisky on  
8 the resolution.

9                   SENATOR STAVISKY:   Thank you,  
10 Madam President.

11                   We are delighted to welcome our  
12 friends from South Korea and from the Korean  
13 American community.

14                   We are joined not only by the  
15 Consul General, Hyo-Sung Park, but by members of  
16 the Korean National Assembly, which is the  
17 equivalent of our Congress. And we are happy to  
18 welcome Young Sun Park, Kyung Hyub Kim, Chang Won  
19 Pyo, Jin Gyu Hahm, and Dong Seob Lee.

20                   (Applause.)

21                   SENATOR STAVISKY:   And to them we  
22 say:   Annyeong haseyo.

23                   (Laughter; cheers.)

24                   SENATOR STAVISKY:   The resolution  
25 talks about how the Korean American Association

1 of Greater New York, KAAGNY, was founded almost  
2 60 years ago -- 58 years ago -- to speak for the  
3 new immigrants, to speak for the Korean Americans  
4 who have chosen to come to our country.

5 And it also talks about how,  
6 116 years ago, 102 Koreans left their home in  
7 Korea and came to the United States and they  
8 landed in Hawaii aboard the SS Gaelic on  
9 January 13, 1903.

10 And that is why we have the  
11 resolution on the floor today. People have asked  
12 me why these dates, and that's the answer. They  
13 came to our country on January 13th -- actually,  
14 to work in the sugar fields in Hawaii. And  
15 amongst the 103, interestingly, there were  
16 21 women. And we celebrate the inclusion of  
17 women in our chamber and Minsun Kim, her election  
18 as the first woman from KAAGNY. And that was the  
19 start of a migration to the United States.

20 They have been such an important  
21 part of our community over the years. We fought  
22 together in World War II, in the Korean conflict,  
23 in Vietnam, and today in the Middle East. They  
24 have become such an important part of the  
25 American fabric, particularly in economic ways,

1 social ways. Their cultural heritage is visible  
2 in New York City, and they are an important part  
3 of our society.

4 And in fact, Congress declared  
5 January 13th as Korean American Day. And we are  
6 doing the same thing in this chamber today, as  
7 the Assembly did earlier.

8 There are 100,000 Korean Americans  
9 living in New York City, many in Queens County.

10 And March 1st is mentioned. We  
11 celebrate March 1st because it is the centennial  
12 of the March 1st Movement, the movement for  
13 Korean independence, which is so important. And  
14 Korea is such an important part of our world  
15 economy and our world democracy. Because we have  
16 very few democracies in that part of the world,  
17 and Korea is certainly one of them.

18 We talk about Yu Gwan-sun, the  
19 symbol of the March 1st Movement, the symbol for  
20 freedom and human rights.

21 So we welcome you all and we wish  
22 you a very happy and prosperous Lunar New Year,  
23 the Year of the Pig that's coming up. And  
24 "Saehae bog manhi badeuseyo," which is the -- I  
25 don't know why the Korean transliteration is so

1 long; it's "Happy New Year." Simple, and yet we  
2 appreciate your presence here today, and we  
3 welcome you.

4 Kamsamida.

5 (Applause.)

6 THE PRESIDENT: Thank you, Senator  
7 Stavisky.

8 Senator Liu on the resolution.

9 SENATOR LIU: Distinguished  
10 colleagues, I am proud and honored to join  
11 Senator Stavisky in welcoming this distinguished  
12 delegation led by Ambassador Park, Minsun Kim,  
13 our historic president of the Korean American  
14 Association of Greater New York, and this very  
15 venerable delegation of National Assembly members  
16 from the Republic of Korea.

17 Senator Stavisky has already  
18 mentioned the most salient points. I will say  
19 that this is a very historic day for this  
20 delegation to visit these chambers. It is the  
21 116th anniversary of the first Korean immigrants  
22 to the United States of America. And it is also  
23 a very important anniversary, 100 years since the  
24 unofficial founding of the Republic, with a  
25 heroine in the name of Yu Gwan-sun, to this day

1 100 years later remains a symbol of the national  
2 identity of the Republic of Korea.

3           It is very important that we  
4 recognize this in the State of New York because  
5 the Korean American community continues to be  
6 such a vital part of our state -- economically,  
7 culturally, educationally, and politically,  
8 especially as we have the first and still only  
9 Korean American legislator, in the name of  
10 Ron Kim, in the State Assembly.

11           This is a very special moment for me  
12 personally, because I grew up with the  
13 Korean American community my whole life. And so  
14 I want to say welcome to these distinguished  
15 visitors here. The Korean American community  
16 stands for a lot, not just small businesses, not  
17 just dry cleaners. Now the generation of  
18 Korean Americans are attorneys, physicians, other  
19 professionals.

20           And we're very proud of the American  
21 pop culture that we export throughout the rest of  
22 the world, but I've got to tell you, if you talk  
23 to a lot of our young people, Korean or not, they  
24 love Korean pop culture. They call it K-pop.  
25 And I know many Senators know the Gangnam dance.

1 (Laughter.)

2 SENATOR LIU: And so we are very  
3 happy to welcome our fellow brothers and sisters  
4 from halfway around the world to these humble  
5 chambers of the New York State Senate.

6 Thank you very much. Saehae bog  
7 manhi badeuseyo. Kamsamida.

8 (Applause.)

9 THE PRESIDENT: Thank you,  
10 Senator Liu. Thank you.

11 The question is on the resolution.  
12 All those in favor signify by saying aye.

13 (Response of "Aye.")

14 THE PRESIDENT: Opposed?

15 (No response.)

16 THE PRESIDENT: The resolution is  
17 adopted.

18 (Applause.)

19 THE PRESIDENT: Senator Gianaris.

20 SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you,  
21 Madam President.

22 Let me add my words of welcome as  
23 well to the Assembly members, the Consul General,  
24 and the Korean American Association.

25 At Senator Stavisky's request, this

1 resolution is open for cosponsorship. Should any  
2 member choose not to be a cosponsor, please  
3 notify the desk.

4 THE PRESIDENT: The resolution is  
5 open for cosponsorship. Should you not desire to  
6 be a cosponsor, please notify the desk.

7 Senator Gianaris.

8 SENATOR GIANARIS: Can we now  
9 please call up Resolution Number 9, read that  
10 resolution's title only, and recognize  
11 Senator Seward to speak.

12 THE PRESIDENT: The Secretary will  
13 read.

14 THE SECRETARY: Legislative  
15 Resolution Number 9, commending John D. Heller  
16 posthumously upon the occasion of his designation  
17 as recipient of a Liberty Medal, the highest  
18 honor bestowed upon an individual by the New York  
19 State Senate.

20 THE PRESIDENT: Senator Seward on  
21 the resolution.

22 SENATOR SEWARD: Thank you,  
23 Madam President. It's a great honor for me to  
24 stand today and recognize the life and heroism of  
25 John Heller.

1                   You know, John lost his life on  
2     December 29, 2018, during a fire at his Oneonta  
3     residence. While John was taken from us on that  
4     night, he made sure that others would live on.  
5     John was a former part-time Oneonta firefighter,  
6     and he acted heroically on that tragic night.

7                   His four young nephews were spending  
8     the night at his apartment, an apartment that he  
9     shared with his fiancée, Amber Roe. When the  
10    fire broke out, John did what all first  
11    responders do. He put the well-being of others  
12    first, and he rushed to that point of danger to  
13    help others.

14                  He was able to help his fiancée,  
15    Amber, and his four young nephews, Donovan,  
16    Maddox, Macall and Rawley Heller -- he got them  
17    to safety before perishing in the fire. John  
18    displayed great courage in saving the lives of  
19    five others, and he made the ultimate sacrifice.

20                  His final act here on earth was one  
21    of bravery, valor and heroism, and love of  
22    others. John's heroic actions embody the reason  
23    that the Senate Liberty Medal was created in the  
24    first place.

25                  I was able to present the Senate



1 Liberty Medal posthumously to John Heller, and I  
2 presented it to his fiancée, Amber Roe, and his  
3 parents, John and Gayle Heller, at a memorial  
4 service earlier this month in Oneonta. More than  
5 300 people were on hand to honor and remember  
6 John. It was an inspirational outpouring of love  
7 and respect from the entire community, and it  
8 spoke volumes about the type of person John was  
9 and how he lived his life and how he died.

10 So I'm honored this morning to take  
11 a moment to remember the life of John Heller and  
12 to ensure that his name and his heroism are a  
13 permanent part of our Senate records and New York  
14 State history. And I would greatly appreciate  
15 the support of this body in honoring the memory  
16 of John D. Heller.

17 THE PRESIDENT: Thank you, Senator.

18 The question is on the resolution.

19 All those in favor signify by saying aye.

20 (Response of "Aye.")

21 THE PRESIDENT: All those opposed,  
22 nay.

23 (No response.)

24 THE PRESIDENT: The resolution is  
25 adopted.

1 Senator Gianaris.

2 SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you,  
3 Madam President.

4 At the request of Senator Seward,  
5 this resolution is also open for cosponsorship.  
6 Should any member choose not to be a cosponsor,  
7 please notify the desk.

8 THE PRESIDENT: The resolution is  
9 open for cosponsorship. Should you not choose to  
10 be a cosponsor of the resolution, please notify  
11 the desk.

12 SENATOR GIANARIS: Can we now take  
13 up the noncontroversial reading of the calendar,  
14 but I would ask that we go out of order and take  
15 up Calendar Number 2 first.

16 THE PRESIDENT: The Secretary will  
17 read.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 2,  
19 by Senator Hoylman, Senate Print 1047, an act to  
20 amend the Executive Law, the Civil Rights Law,  
21 and the Education Law.

22 THE PRESIDENT: Read the last  
23 section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 25. This  
25 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it

1 shall have become a law.

2 THE PRESIDENT: Call the roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 THE PRESIDENT: Senator Hoylman to  
5 explain his vote.

6 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Thank you,  
7 Madam President.

8 And thank you to my colleagues.  
9 It's been a long road. But I was thinking about  
10 this bill, which is called, of course, the Gender  
11 Expression Non-Discrimination Act. But much more  
12 than an acronym, it is the transgender human  
13 rights law for the State of New York.

14 And I was thinking about it in terms  
15 of my daughter. And last summer my daughter and  
16 I were at a swimming pool with some other LGBTQ  
17 families. And we were paddling along in the  
18 ice-cold water, and this little girl swam up to  
19 Sylvia, my 7-year-old, and she said "Who's that?"  
20 And Sylvia said "That's my daddy." And without  
21 missing a beat, the other little girl said,  
22 "Well, then where's your other daddy?"

23 (Laughter.)

24 SENATOR HOYLMAN: And to me that's  
25 an example of the quantum leap forward that we've

1 taken as a chamber, thanks to the support of so  
2 many colleagues, and we've taken as a society,  
3 thanks to popular culture and leadership in this  
4 Capitol, including our Governor and our President  
5 and our Supreme Court.

6 But there was and remains unfinished  
7 business in the civil rights movement, in  
8 particular the LGBTQ civil rights movement, for  
9 the reason that the last 17 years, in our  
10 Human Rights Law, transgender people have been  
11 expressly excluded. That wasn't by accident.  
12 Back in 2002, when the Sexual Orientation  
13 Non-Discrimination Act was passed in this very  
14 chamber, there was a motion, there was a motion  
15 made by my esteemed predecessor, Senator Tom  
16 Duane, to include transgender and  
17 gender-nonconforming people in that bill.

18 But they were jettisoned. They were  
19 left on a desert island in the world of human  
20 rights. And we told them, We'll be back to get  
21 you. Our lifeboat will be coming back, don't  
22 worry. Well, it's taken 17 years.

23 So to them, that speck on the  
24 horizon is not a mirage, it is the State Senate  
25 finally coming back to pick you up and bring you

1     into civil society, with all rights and  
2     protections that New Yorkers deserve.

3                     (Applause; cheers.)

4                     SENATOR HOYLMAN:     And I've been  
5     asked:   Why is this necessary?   Well, here are  
6     the facts.   Under New York State law, if you are  
7     transgender or gender-nonconforming, according to  
8     the statute you can be fired from your place of  
9     employment, you can be denied a lease for your  
10    apartment, you can be kicked out of a restaurant  
11    just because you are transgender or  
12    gender-nonconforming.

13                    In addition to that, while some of  
14    that has been covered by Executive Order -- not  
15    with the force of law, and always subject to  
16    change -- the one thing that has not been  
17    addressed is protections for transgender and  
18    gender-nonconforming people under our state Hate  
19    Crimes Law.

20                    And it's not lost on me or  
21    transgender activists, many of whom are here in  
22    the galleries, that transgender people are the  
23    number-one target of hate violence in these  
24    United States of America.   We have to do  
25    something to protect them.

1                   And the symbolism of us passing our  
2 transgender human rights law is profound. It's  
3 profound at every level of our society, among the  
4 very young and among the very old.

5                   Let me just share with you some  
6 results of the United States Transgender Survey.  
7 It found that 30 percent of transgender and  
8 gender-nonconforming people have been fired from  
9 their jobs because of their gender identity --  
10 30 percent. Twenty-three percent of those folks  
11 have been denied housing, 31 percent have been  
12 denied service in a place of public  
13 accommodation. And yes, that great American  
14 bathroom debate, which I'm glad we're not having  
15 today: 59 percent have avoided using public  
16 restrooms out of fear of being confronted.

17                   That's the reality for transgender  
18 and gender-nonconforming people in our society  
19 today.

20                   And I took the liberty of soliciting  
21 some thoughts from some of our transgender  
22 New Yorkers about how they felt about this  
23 historic day here in Albany.

24                   And a woman named Kristen Browde --  
25 she was recently elected as the board president

1 of the LGBT Bar Association in New York -- wrote  
2 to me. She said: "Your legislation means  
3 everything. We can now be assured that in public  
4 accommodation, in business and in every aspect of  
5 life, we'll be on the same footing as everyone  
6 else, that no longer we'll have to fear  
7 professional or personal repercussions when we  
8 come out or when our gender is revealed. And we  
9 will help erase some of the fear that every  
10 transgender person has about coming out."

11 "That fear," Kristen writes, "has  
12 led me not to come out publicly until I reached  
13 the age of 65."

14 "GENDA," she says, "will go a long  
15 way toward ending the fear of legalized  
16 discrimination, a fear that so many in this state  
17 rightly, though unfortunately, have lived with."

18 A fear, I have to add, colleagues,  
19 is compounded by decisions being made in  
20 Washington, D.C., to undermine the civil  
21 liberties that were put forward through  
22 Executive Order by President Obama and now are  
23 being decimated by President Trump.

24 Then there's Wendy Marie from  
25 Buffalo, who writes in to say: "I've been

1 refused medical appointments due to being trans.  
2 I've been turned down for employment and told  
3 outright that if I dress as a male, then there is  
4 an open position. I have been refused lodging  
5 and entrance to food establishments and openly  
6 ridiculed in public. Passing GENDA would show  
7 that our elected state representatives will no  
8 longer tolerate discrimination against any  
9 citizens regardless of their gender expression."

10 And finally, there's a constituent  
11 of mine named Sam, a young boy in my district  
12 who's 14 and lives in the East Village. I called  
13 his mom. She was so proud.

14 All of these New Yorkers have been  
15 waiting so long. They've been waiting too long.  
16 But we're going to fix that today.

17 So I just want to thank my  
18 colleagues who have pushed this issue forward.  
19 So many of us have our own experiences with the  
20 LGBT community. Senator Duane, who was the first  
21 openly LGBT member of this body.

22 Senator Squadron -- a straight ally,  
23 but a good guy nonetheless --

24 (Laughter.)

25 SENATOR HOYLMAN: -- who carried



1     this bill for so many years.

2                 Senators Skoufis and Stavisky, who  
3     moved these bills quickly through committee.

4                 My colleagues in the LGBT Caucus:  
5     Deborah Glick, Danny O'Donnell, Harry Bronson,  
6     Dick Gottfried -- who's not a caucus member, but  
7     is carrying GENDA in the other house -- and  
8     former Assemblymember Matthew Titone.

9                 And Senator Krueger, whose brother  
10    lived during the plague years.

11                Senator Savino, who gave that killer  
12    speech on marriage equality.

13                Senator Ramos, who understands that  
14    transgender women of color are now a political  
15    voting bloc and we should be listening to them.

16                Senator Benjamin, who said the other  
17    day, "Wow, we're dealing with democracy and human  
18    rights in the first two days of our legislative  
19    session. Can it get any more real than that?"

20                And Senator Gianaris, for pushing  
21    forward not just GENDA, but being the original  
22    coprime sponsor and in fact the originator of the  
23    bill to ban conversion therapy.

24                And finally, our leader, Andrea  
25    Stewart-Cousins. It's no coincidence that we're

1 addressing this issue in the first week of our  
2 legislating, because Andrea Stewart-Cousins wrote  
3 the human rights law in Westchester County. She  
4 knows what it's like to be discriminated against.  
5 She knows the value of standing up for our fellow  
6 citizens no matter what they look like, no matter  
7 what their gender identity or expression is, no  
8 matter who they love.

9                   So to my colleagues, thank you. Let  
10 us move forward. Let us all rise up and support  
11 civil liberties for everyone. Thank you.

12                   (Extended standing ovation.)

13                   THE PRESIDENT: Thank you,  
14 Senator Hoylman.

15                   To explain her vote, Senator Ramos.

16                   SENATOR RAMOS: Thank you,  
17 Madam President.

18                   It's true, I am the proud  
19 State Senator of the largest transgender Latinx  
20 community in this country. And I'm proud to be  
21 voting yes, because I'm here to ensure they're  
22 protected from hatred and discrimination. These  
23 communities have long faced an assault on their  
24 rights, and it's time New York State finally  
25 commits to protecting them.

1 (Cheers, applause from galleries.)

2 SENATOR RAMOS: But I do want to  
3 note that I believe we must go further. We must  
4 acknowledge that communities of color bear the  
5 brunt of the criminal justice system.

6 (Cheers, applause from galleries.)

7 SENATOR RAMOS: So after passing  
8 GENDA, we need to work to clarify this  
9 language -- and I know that this issue will be  
10 addressed -- so this historic bill cannot be  
11 weaponized against people of color.

12 Passing GENDA signifies monumental  
13 progress for our state, and we will continue to  
14 acknowledge how people of color in every  
15 community are disadvantaged as a result of  
16 systems meant to criminalize us. GENDA is a  
17 significant first step in committing ourselves to  
18 the betterment of all vulnerable communities, and  
19 must pave the way for equity and dignity for all  
20 New Yorkers.

21 Thank you.

22 (Enthusiastic applause.)

23 THE PRESIDENT: I need to remind  
24 the Senators as well as our guests here today  
25 that we will reserve all of our applause to the

1 conclusion and the passage of the bills, all  
2 right?

3 (Laughter.)

4 THE PRESIDENT: Senator Savino to  
5 explain your vote.

6 SENATOR SAVINO: Thank you,  
7 Madam President.

8 I want to rise first to acknowledge  
9 and thank our leader, Senator Stewart-Cousins,  
10 for moving this agenda so quickly.

11 I want to thank Senator Hoylman for  
12 that beautiful, passionate speech and for taking  
13 up this issue after Senator Squadron left, after  
14 Tom Duane. And I wanted to talk a bit about a  
15 moment nine years ago when this chamber, this  
16 body failed the LGBT community and particularly  
17 the transgender community.

18 When we took the majority in 2009,  
19 we had 32 elected Democrats, but we only had 24  
20 that were willing to vote to stand up for the  
21 LGBT community, whether it was marriage equality  
22 or GENDA. We tried to bring GENDA through the  
23 Judiciary Committee. And some of you in the  
24 community may have come to that Judiciary hearing  
25 on June 8th of 2010, where the bill went down in

1 defeat because Democrats didn't stand up for the  
2 LGBT community.

3           So I am so proud to be here today,  
4 nine years later -- but nine years too late for  
5 the community, in many respects -- to be able to  
6 correct that wrong that was done in the Senate  
7 Judiciary committee when we defeated GENDA,  
8 because today we have the votes.

9           And during that last nine years, we  
10 have seen counties in this state, 11 cities in  
11 this state, 11 counties adopt their own GENDA  
12 statute to protect the transgender community.  
13 But it's not enough. We saw the Governor  
14 introduce an Executive Order, but that's still  
15 not enough, because it doesn't have the force of  
16 law everywhere in every county in the state.

17           And what we're doing here today,  
18 Brad, what we're doing is saying regardless of  
19 where you live in New York State -- upstate,  
20 downstate, the East End to the West Side -- this  
21 state recognizes your civil rights and your  
22 humanity no matter who you are. And we're doing  
23 that today, and I am so proud to finally be able  
24 to help correct a wrong that was done the last  
25 time we held the majority.

1                   So congratulations to everyone, and  
2 especially to our leader for bringing this out in  
3 the first week and not making us wait until June.

4                   Thank you.

5                   (Applause.)

6                   THE PRESIDENT:   Thank you, Senator  
7 Savino.

8                   I have to repeat the request to  
9 restrain yourselves, despite the apparent  
10 excitement, with respect to the applause. We  
11 have business to attend to in the chambers today.

12                  Senator Sepúlveda to explain your  
13 vote.

14                  SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA:   Thank you.

15                  First I want to thank, again, the  
16 leader, who's pushed an agenda that's been  
17 necessary in this state for many years. I want  
18 to thank Brad. I also want to thank Tom Duane,  
19 and of course Mike Gianaris.

20                  To me this is important. In 1994 I  
21 lost my oldest brother to AIDS. He was a  
22 nonconforming transgender male who died and was a  
23 victim of a couple of attempts at hate crime. So  
24 this, to me, is something I'm very proud in his  
25 honor to be voting for.

1           There are moments that are shared in  
2     our American history that serve as inflection  
3     points along our long march towards justice, and  
4     this morning we've reached one of those proud  
5     moments. The GENDA act will add gender identity  
6     and expression as a protected class in our  
7     state's Human Rights and Hate Crime Laws. GENDA  
8     will prohibit discrimination in employment,  
9     housing, public accommodations and other areas.  
10    GENDA will also provide stronger penalties for  
11    crimes motivated by hatred. And again, I wish my  
12    brother was here to share this moment with me.

13           Today we recognize the T in LGBT.  
14    We are transgender and gender-nonconforming  
15    siblings. We recognize your full and equal place  
16    in the fabric of our community. We enter a  
17    covenant with both those harmed by society's lack  
18    of understanding and the millions of children who  
19    trust us to provide a just future. Our vote in  
20    this chamber is one of love, solidarity with the  
21    LGBT community. Thank you for the value you  
22    bring to this American family. We will do better  
23    by you, and we will continue to listen.

24           May this vote serve as the first of  
25    many civil rights reforms that serve to recognize

1 the inherent worth and dignity living inside  
2 every single person in this country and in this  
3 state.

4 Thank you.

5 THE PRESIDENT: Thank you, Senator.  
6 Senator Krueger to explain your  
7 vote.

8 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you,  
9 Madam President.

10 I also want to thank Senator Hoylman  
11 for his hard work to get us here, and all our  
12 other colleagues. I also do -- also don't want  
13 to point out that I served with Senator Tom Duane  
14 the years he was fighting so hard for this bill,  
15 and lived through the times we failed, we failed  
16 the T community.

17 And I even remember when we passed  
18 SONDA but we couldn't get GENDA added on as an  
19 amendment. And there were many at the time in  
20 the gay and lesbian community who weren't  
21 comfortable enough to actually fight for GENDA  
22 rights then. But look how far we've come.

23 And I distinctly remember some of my  
24 colleagues at those times, when we failed to get  
25 this done, saying to me: "Who are those



1 transgender?" I said, "They're people. They're  
2 people who just want equal rights with everyone  
3 else and who deserve equal rights with everyone  
4 else."

5 And not only am I so proud we're  
6 going to pass this on the floor today, but we're  
7 going to pass it with votes on both sides of the  
8 aisle. And I think that's another incredibly  
9 important message for those of us who fought so  
10 long and hard to have the opportunity to set the  
11 agenda of what comes to the floor of the Senate.  
12 Because I knew that this bill, like so many  
13 others we will be moving, would have support in  
14 both parties if we could just get the discussion  
15 rolling, the bills through committee to the  
16 floor.

17 I'm so proud to vote yes today. I'm  
18 so happy and proud for the State of New York that  
19 we are finally taking this long past-due step. I  
20 vote yes, Madam President. Thank you.

21 (Applause from gallery.)

22 THE PRESIDENT: Thank you, Senator  
23 Krueger.

24 Senator Kaplan to explain your vote.

25 SENATOR KAPLAN: Thank you,

1 Madam President.

2 Transgender people have faced  
3 injustice for far too long in this country. And  
4 in the past two years, the pace and intensity of  
5 these attacks on the rights and existence of  
6 trans people has exploded, leading to a dramatic  
7 increase of anti-transgender discrimination and  
8 violence.

9 We should be doing everything we can  
10 to stand up and say we reject hate and bias in  
11 New York, because no one should be subject to  
12 discrimination just for being their true  
13 authentic selves.

14 And today, by finally bringing GENDA  
15 to the floor, and passing it, we are sending a  
16 message to transgender people across this state  
17 that we want to make sure you are safe, affirmed,  
18 and protected. We are sending a message that  
19 we've got your back.

20 So that is why I am proud to stand  
21 here today as a cosponsor of this legislation and  
22 proudly cast my vote in the affirmative.

23 Thank you.

24 THE PRESIDENT: Thank you,  
25 Senator Kaplan.

1                   Senator Serrano to explain your  
2     vote.

3                   SENATOR SERRANO:     Thank you so  
4     much, Madam President.

5                   And I rise to congratulate my  
6     colleague and my friend Senator Hoylman for his  
7     steadfast leadership on this issue and the  
8     courageousness that you've put forth in all the  
9     items that you work on.

10                  And I want to thank the leadership  
11     of Andrea Stewart-Cousins, our leader, for  
12     bringing this to a vote today, and all of my  
13     colleagues in this chamber. And I hope that we  
14     see broad and universal support for something so  
15     important.

16                  This vote and this issue is so  
17     important now when you consider the years and  
18     legacy of violence against the transgender  
19     community and communities all across our nation.  
20     In East Harlem and the South Bronx, too many  
21     candlelight vigils for those who have been the  
22     victims of murder, of violence, simply because of  
23     their gender identity and expression. No more.  
24     We say no more.

25                  At a time when walls are being built

1 and policies are being implemented that make us  
2 less free, this bill does the complete opposite.  
3 It embraces the very essence of what freedom is,  
4 the very essence of what it is to be an American.  
5 That we say that we are all free and that we all  
6 should be protected by the laws and the rights  
7 that any others take for granted.

8               So again, it is just so amazing to  
9 be part of this historic day. I've been in the  
10 Senate for many years, but today feels so  
11 special. And again, when we think about the  
12 legacy of the work that we do, this day will be  
13 one that we remember for many, many years.

14              And again, referring back to my good  
15 friend Senator Hoylman, your legacy is so deep  
16 with the work that you've done, but none more  
17 important than the legacy to your two children  
18 and how this day will be impactful for  
19 generations to come.

20              So thank you.

21              THE PRESIDENT:   Senator Kennedy to  
22 explain your vote.

23              SENATOR KENNEDY:   Thank you,  
24 Madam President.

25              First of all, let me start by

1     thanking and congratulating once again this  
2     bill's sponsor, Senator Hoylman, for your  
3     steadfast attention and aggressive advocacy on  
4     this issue.

5             You know, it's fitting that we stood  
6     up and applauded Senator Hoylman. It's not very  
7     often that that happens on this floor. But this  
8     is that important of an issue, with such an  
9     overarching impact, not only on New York but on  
10    society. And not just in this country, but  
11    across the globe. Because we know how New York  
12    goes, so goes the rest of the nation and so goes  
13    the rest of the international community.

14            And New York has demonstrated that  
15    particularly as it pertains to LGBT issues. And  
16    if we go back and we think about where this body  
17    has come from -- one of the proudest moments I've  
18    ever had on this floor was voting for marriage  
19    equality. And that was eight years ago. I can't  
20    remember since then when we voted on another  
21    LGBTQ issue in this chamber.

22            It is so fitting that we move this  
23    today, because this is what the people of the  
24    State of New York need, this is what the people  
25    of this country need. We need to demonstrate

1     what New York is all about. It's standing up and  
2     fighting against those that want to commit hate  
3     crimes because someone is different. It's  
4     standing up and fighting against those that want  
5     to discriminate against anyone for any reason  
6     because they are different.

7                     But what this says today is that we  
8     are -- no one is different, we are all normal.  
9     We are all New Yorkers. We are all Americans.  
10    We all deserve the same rights and respect and  
11    dignity as anyone else, regardless of who we are,  
12    what we look like, what our sexual orientation  
13    is, where we come from, what our socioeconomic  
14    status is. That's what New York is all about.

15                    And by passing GENDA today, we are  
16    putting all New Yorkers in the same boat, moving  
17    forward and demonstrating to the rest of the  
18    nation that New York will lead on these human  
19    rights issues.

20                    I want to recognize some folks in  
21    this chamber today. From the Human Rights  
22    Campaign, Marty Rouse is here. From Buffalo we  
23    have, from the Stonewall Democrats, the  
24    president, Bryan Ball. And from the transgender  
25    community, and the vice president of Stonewall,

1 we have Ari Moore.

2 And from Buffalo to the tip of  
3 Long Island and everywhere in between, we can  
4 celebrate that New York cares about human rights  
5 today. I'm proud once again, as never before, to  
6 stand on this floor and vote in favor of this  
7 all-important, all-encompassing human rights  
8 bill.

9 I vote aye, Madam President. Thank  
10 you.

11 THE PRESIDENT: Thank you,  
12 Senator Kennedy.

13 Senator Sanders to explain your  
14 vote.

15 SENATOR SANDERS: Thank you,  
16 Madam President.

17 In a few days we'll celebrate Martin  
18 Luther King's birthday. I want to remind you  
19 that he said that injustice anywhere is a threat  
20 to justice everywhere.

21 (Applause from galleries.)

22 SENATOR SANDERS: This is how we  
23 need to look at this. We need to understand that  
24 it's not going to happen to just one group. If  
25 they come for the transgenders in the morning,

1 they're coming for others at night.

2           So with that understanding and the  
3 understanding that there has to be solidarity to  
4 beat back all of these folks who talk of hate and  
5 finding ways of closing people out all -- all of  
6 that stuff needs to be pushed back, and the best  
7 that we can do it with is solidarity and an  
8 understanding that we are one family, and that's  
9 the human family. And if we can just get that,  
10 we'd make some difference.

11           I'm honored to sit next to my  
12 esteemed Senator, who's got a rousing hand clap  
13 today. Probably may be your last, but that's all  
14 right.

15           (Laughter.)

16           SENATOR SANDERS: That's all right.  
17 You got it, and it still echoes.

18           We are going to ensure that this law  
19 does not further penalize and criminalize people  
20 of color. We're going to do some other things to  
21 make sure that we have a fair accounting of all  
22 of these things.

23           My friends, let's do one thing and  
24 understand this. By today's action we are saying  
25 New York State will not tolerate bullying or



1 violence against any of its residents, anyone.

2 No one will be left out this time around, any of  
3 its residents.

4 It also shows great things about the  
5 leadership of this conference. Is this the  
6 second day? It sounds like we moved a million  
7 things already. A million more to go. The  
8 leadership is doing some incredible things, and  
9 that should be pointed out.

10 And I'm glad to vote for this  
11 measure to ensure that, again, that everyone  
12 understands that a threat to justice anywhere is  
13 a threat to justice everywhere.

14 Thank you.

15 THE PRESIDENT: Thank you,  
16 Senator Sanders.

17 Senator Akshar to explain your vote.

18 SENATOR AKSHAR: Madam President,  
19 thank you.

20 Before I begin, allow me to  
21 congratulate my colleague on something that I  
22 know he's incredibly passionate about.

23 I think we can all agree that  
24 government exists to protect the rights and to  
25 protect the safety of all of its citizens. Let

1 me be clear about something. No one in our great  
2 state should be discriminated against because of  
3 their race, their religion, their sexual  
4 preference, their gender or their beliefs. And  
5 we should work every day, Republicans and  
6 Democrats, to ensure that our laws that we  
7 advance do so.

8 I agree with some of the provisions  
9 of this bill and have no doubt that in fact it is  
10 well-intentioned. But so often in government,  
11 well-intentioned actions have unintended  
12 consequences. The bill as currently authored has  
13 far too many unintended consequences for me to be  
14 able to support it. In my humble opinion, it  
15 goes too far and crosses over into the rights of  
16 the safety and privacy of other New Yorkers.

17 The vague language used in this bill  
18 leaves open the door for misuse and abuse by  
19 individuals that none of us in this body have any  
20 intention of protecting. And my fear is is that  
21 the broad scope of this bill will leave the door  
22 open for child predators and sexual predators to  
23 abuse and misuse the law for their own purposes.

24 (Vocal disagreement.)

25 THE PRESIDENT: Order. Maintain

1 order in the chambers.

2 SENATOR AKSHAR: Thank you,  
3 Madam President.

4 And for that, I cannot support this  
5 bill.

6 Let me be clear about something.  
7 And let us all agree that we are in fact all  
8 God's children. We all agree that no individual  
9 should ever be discriminated against or feel  
10 unsafe because of their sexual preference, their  
11 gender, the color of their skin or their religion  
12 or their beliefs.

13 But it frustrates me and disappoints  
14 me that a bill aimed at fighting discrimination  
15 itself includes the kind of broad, ill-defined  
16 and irresponsibly drafted language that could be  
17 used to target and discriminate {against} other  
18 New Yorkers. Well-intentioned, terribly  
19 executed. For that, I vote no.

20 THE PRESIDENT: Senator May to  
21 explain your vote.

22 SENATOR MAY: Thank you,  
23 Madam President.

24 I'm proud to cast my vote in favor  
25 of this bill, and I do it in honor and memory of

1 Marthe Reed. Marthe was an American poet and  
2 educator. She was my neighbor and friend. And  
3 she was the mother of a trans child, the loving  
4 mother of a trans child.

5 Martha was angry and passionate  
6 about a lot of forms of injustice, but GENDA was  
7 her particular concern. I think her passion may  
8 have taken her life last year; she died of a  
9 massive stroke during a political meeting. And I  
10 vowed to myself after that that if I got elected,  
11 that one of the first things I would do was push  
12 to pass GENDA.

13 So I'm very grateful to Senator  
14 Hoylman, to the Majority Leader, and to my  
15 colleagues for helping me keep that promise.

16 Thank you.

17 THE PRESIDENT: Thank you, Senator.  
18 Senator Salazar to explain your  
19 vote.

20 SENATOR SALAZAR: Thank you,  
21 Madam President.

22 I want to thank Senator Hoylman for  
23 his leadership on this. I'm thrilled for us to  
24 finally act to protect trans and  
25 gender-nonconforming New Yorkers from

1 gender-based discrimination.

2 I remain concerned about the hate  
3 crimes component of the bill. We know that due  
4 to racial bias in our criminal justice system,  
5 New Yorkers of color are disproportionately  
6 prosecuted for hate crimes, among other offenses,  
7 and subjected to enhanced sentencing.

8 This concern has been raised by  
9 advocates in my district, and I share their  
10 concern. I look forward to working with  
11 Senator Hoylman and with all of you to find a way  
12 to address this concern by fighting to eliminate  
13 racial bias as well as gender bias in our  
14 criminal justice system.

15 In this instance, as no new crimes  
16 and no new penalties are being created, I'm proud  
17 and honored to vote for GENDA and to support the  
18 human rights of all transgender and nonbinary  
19 New Yorkers.

20 Thank you.

21 THE PRESIDENT: Thank you, Senator.  
22 Senator Jackson to explain your  
23 vote.

24 SENATOR JACKSON: Thank you,  
25 Madam President.

1                   Good afternoon to my colleagues and  
2 people that are present here to witness this  
3 historic event in the Senate chambers.

4                   As I indicated to my colleagues  
5 yesterday, I represent Manhattan, all parts of  
6 it, all type of individuals -- young and old,  
7 straight and gay, transgender or not. The bottom  
8 line is that we are all brothers and sisters of  
9 this human race.

10                  And, you know, as an individual  
11 growing up in New York City, I've given blood.  
12 I've given, you know, my body; I've signed the  
13 back of my driver's license so if I'm brain-dead,  
14 I'm going to use myself to help other people  
15 live, and it doesn't matter what your race,  
16 color, creed, national origin or sexual  
17 orientation.

18                  I rise today also to let you know  
19 that on my Twitter account it says, besides who I  
20 am and that I'm a district leader, that I'm an  
21 advocate for education, I'm an advocate for  
22 affordable housing, I'm an advocate -- and the  
23 last thing I say, I'm an advocate for GENDA. And  
24 so if I did not stand up today to let you know  
25 that, then I'm not doing my job, I'm not

1     advocating for the people that I represent.

2                     And I say to all of you that members  
3     of my immediate family and extended family are  
4     part of the LGBTQT group. And not only that,  
5     I've had staff in the City Council, and currently  
6     in the State Senate. And I'm here to represent  
7     all of them, and I don't want anyone  
8     discriminating against them or anyone else.

9                     And I hear all the time in the news  
10    about people discriminating against blacks,  
11    against whites, against Jews, against Muslims.  
12    Enough of this hate stuff. And that's what this  
13    is about today: Giving people the right to say  
14    who they are, to be proud of who they are and be  
15    able to say that if in fact someone discriminates  
16    against me for my job or employment or any other  
17    type of expressions of hate, there's a penalty  
18    you're going to pay.

19                    But our job is to try to educate  
20    people about the differences of all of us in our  
21    community. And with that, Madam President, I ask  
22    those individuals that have been involved from  
23    day one, from 13 years ago, to be involved in  
24    this GENDA being passed today, and those that  
25    have worked on it, I ask you to raise your hand

1 if you're in the audience. I thank you for your  
2 advocacy on behalf of not only yourselves, but  
3 all of the people of out of great state.

4 I vote aye, Madam President.

5 THE PRESIDENT: Thank you, Senator.  
6 Senator Harckham to explain your  
7 vote.

8 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Thank you,  
9 Madam President.

10 And I want to congratulate Senator  
11 Hoylman for his great advocacy. And colleagues  
12 who have been here a while, much longer than I, I  
13 thank you for your efforts and your perseverance.

14 I just wanted to mention Kristen  
15 Browde, who Senator Hoylman referred to. She is  
16 a constituent and a friend -- and what a fierce  
17 advocate she is. I congratulate her on this day.

18 This, ladies and gentlemen, is just  
19 about basic human rights. We are talking about  
20 equal protection under the law for all  
21 New Yorkers. It's a simple concept, and yet it  
22 has not applied to all for far too long. I come  
23 out of the affordable housing world, and so many  
24 people have lost housing because they did not  
25 have a law like this to protect them from



1 discrimination because of their gender identity.  
2 Nobody should live in fear of losing an  
3 apartment, a house, a lease because of their  
4 gender identity.

5 And we heard about the violence  
6 against our trans brothers and sisters. Higher  
7 rates of suicide, higher rates of substance  
8 abuse, higher rates of homelessness.

9 So again, this is about basic human  
10 rights, equal protection under the law. I am  
11 proud to vote aye. Thank you.

12 THE PRESIDENT: Thank you, Senator.  
13 Senator Biaggi to explain your vote.

14 SENATOR BIAGGI: Thank you,  
15 Madam President.

16 Equal treatment is a core of a real  
17 democratic society. I am proud that in our first  
18 week of passing legislation that we are taking on  
19 the long-overdue task of expanding full rights  
20 and equal treatment to the LGBTQ community.

21 I applaud my colleague Senator  
22 Hoylman for your bravery, for your tenacity, for  
23 your perseverance. You represent what I hope to  
24 also have as a State Senator in this conference.

25 I'm proud to stand with this

1 conference. I am proud to vote yes. And I am  
2 dedicating my vote to my friend and a fierce  
3 advocate who is right up there, Kristen Browde.  
4 Thank you for all that you've done for all of us  
5 to get here today as well.

6 Thank you.

7 THE PRESIDENT: Thank you, Senator.  
8 Senator Skoufis to explain your  
9 vote.

10 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Thank you,  
11 Madam President.

12 For the past six legislative  
13 sessions, across the Capitol in the Assembly I  
14 have seen and participated in this debate. We  
15 have passed GENDA year after year after year only  
16 to see it die on arrival here in the State Senate  
17 for the past six years.

18 And I am so proud that on our third  
19 legislative day, our second day of legislative  
20 activity here in the State Senate, that we will  
21 now finally move this bill forward and get it  
22 enacted into law in the next two weeks.

23 Let me be clear. In the Assembly  
24 this was always the most, the most disheartening  
25 debate to listen to and, quite frankly, offensive

1 debate to listen to. Where year after year, I  
2 had to hear from opponents, and my colleagues who  
3 strongly believe that this bill is a matter of  
4 human rights and equality across the state, we  
5 had to listen to opponents talk about not the  
6 housing equality in this bill, not the education  
7 equality in this bill, not the employment  
8 equality that is in this bill, but talk about  
9 bathrooms and locker rooms.

10 And I had thought we were going to  
11 get through this debate without talking about  
12 bathrooms and locker rooms. And I'm so  
13 disappointed that we could not quite get through  
14 this debate without doing so.

15 Putting aside the bizarro  
16 circumstances, this bizarro world where people  
17 are dressing up as men and women to sneak into  
18 locker rooms and bathrooms -- that's just not  
19 happening, ladies and gentlemen. Putting that  
20 aside --

21 THE PRESIDENT: Order in the  
22 chamber.

23 SENATOR SKOUFIS: -- to my  
24 opponents who bring this up, are you more  
25 comfortable with someone who is dressed as a

1 woman and is a woman in a men's bathroom? That  
2 is crazy. Even if you don't believe, if even if  
3 you don't respect the gender identity of that  
4 person, are you more comfortable with someone who  
5 looks like a woman in a men's bathroom? Come on.

6 This is the right thing to do. I  
7 congratulate Senator Hoylman and all the  
8 advocates. This is a proud day.

9 THE PRESIDENT: Thank you, Senator.  
10 Senator Benjamin to explain your  
11 vote.

12 SENATOR BENJAMIN: Thank you,  
13 Madam President.

14 I don't want to repeat what's been  
15 said, but there's a couple of things I want to  
16 say.

17 First of all, I want to thank  
18 Senator Hoylman for his leadership, and those  
19 before him. I want to thank our leader, Senator  
20 Andrea Stewart-Cousins, for helping us bring this  
21 bill to the floor so soon.

22 I just want to thank all of the  
23 activists who are here. I cannot imagine what  
24 some have been through. I know my family has had  
25 a lot of division because some members of my

1 family were proud to stand forward and say "I am  
2 what I am, and everyone needs to accept it."

3 I know in all of our families we  
4 have had these issues. Some of us don't want to  
5 talk about it. But the bottom line is we as  
6 society have to be clear that every single human  
7 has the right to be who they are, they have the  
8 right to be respected, and they have the right to  
9 live God's true vision for themselves. Whatever  
10 it is that anyone wants to do in life, they  
11 should be able to do it and they should not feel  
12 ashamed of who they are, particularly within  
13 their own families.

14 I am honored today to vote for this  
15 bill. It's part of the reason why I am a part of  
16 this party, the Democratic Party -- not to get  
17 political, I apologize. I believe so strongly  
18 that when we stand here and vote for this bill,  
19 we are moving society forward in the right way.

20 And whether you support this bill or  
21 you don't support this bill, this will be one of  
22 the most historic moments of this New York State  
23 Senate, and I'm glad to be here and glad to be a  
24 public servant on this very day.

25 Thank you, Madam President.

1                   THE PRESIDENT:    Thank you, Senator.  
2                   Senator Gounardes to explain your  
3                   vote.

4                   SENATOR GOUNARDES:    Thank you,  
5                   Madam President.

6                   I went home yesterday after our long  
7                   marathon session and I thought to myself how  
8                   proud I was for all the votes that we took in  
9                   this chamber yesterday. And I thought, you know,  
10                  we have such an ambitious agenda, I'm going to  
11                  hopefully have many more nights like this where I  
12                  come home and I'm proud. But today will probably  
13                  take the cake for me in my legislative career in  
14                  this chamber, because today is an especially  
15                  proud moment for me.

16                  I teared listening to my colleague  
17                  Senator Hoylman give his incredibly beautiful  
18                  remarks. And I think back to my entry into  
19                  political activism. It was about seven years ago  
20                  in my neighborhood when I went to a rally in  
21                  support of marriage equality in front of my State  
22                  Senator's office. And the response that we were  
23                  met with at that rally was that "Constituents in  
24                  my district don't give a rat's behind about  
25                  marriage or about civil rights for individuals."

1                   What a difference, what a difference  
2                   today is. I'm proud to be a cosponsor of this  
3                   legislation. I'm proud that today on my second  
4                   day of legislative business, one of the first  
5                   votes I'm casting in this chamber is to reverse  
6                   that trend that we so long dealt with in our  
7                   state, and to stand here as an ally and to say  
8                   it's a new day in New York. It's a day when we  
9                   reaffirm the basic principle that it doesn't  
10                  matter who you are or who you love, you will be  
11                  treated with equal protection and dignity under  
12                  the law. How far we've come.

13                  Today is a proud day. Today is a  
14                  special day. And I'm so honored to cast my vote  
15                  in support of this legislation. Thank you.

16                  THE PRESIDENT: Thank you, Senator.  
17                  Senator Carlucci to explain your  
18                  vote.

19                  SENATOR CARLUCCI: Thank you,  
20                  Madam President.

21                  And I too want to lend my voice to  
22                  what we've spoken about today and thank  
23                  Senator Hoylman for his advocacy and all of the  
24                  advocates that are here in the chamber and so  
25                  many that I've met throughout the years.

1                   We're fortunate, we've got the  
2                   Rockland Pride Center that's here today and has  
3                   really been helping so many people in our  
4                   community.

5                   But today is about updating the  
6                   laws, about changing a flaw in the law. The fact  
7                   that we do not treat everyone equally in all the  
8                   protections of the laws under New York State is  
9                   so wrong.

10                  And I'm so proud to be here today,  
11                  part of this chamber, casting this vote to  
12                  finally have equal protections. Over the years  
13                  as a Senator and hearing the stories from  
14                  hundreds of people sharing their stories, having  
15                  that courage to talk about the situations of  
16                  harassment and discrimination and all of that  
17                  work, I'm so thankful to all of you for standing  
18                  up, for sharing your stories, to give us the  
19                  power to have this vote today.

20                  So I'm honored to cast my vote in  
21                  favor of this legislation. Thank you,  
22                  Madam President.

23                  THE PRESIDENT:    Thank you, Senator.

24                  Senator Mayer to explain your vote.

25                  SENATOR MAYER:    Thank you, Madam



1 Speaker.

2 I'm proudly casting my vote in the  
3 affirmative and want to give thanks to the  
4 sponsor and those who were here before him who  
5 have been fighting this battle for so long.

6 But I also want to give special  
7 thanks to those in all of our communities,  
8 including some of New York's conservative  
9 communities, who have stepped forward and entered  
10 into civic life, and through that process they  
11 have changed the minds of those who years before  
12 would never have considered supporting this  
13 legislation. They have shown extraordinary  
14 bravery by their presence, by their determination  
15 to make sure that they were seen as individuals  
16 deserving of respect.

17 One of those people is here from the  
18 great City of Yonkers, Angie Powinski. And there  
19 are so many others in every one of our  
20 communities. And they have changed the minds of  
21 others because they have been courageous, they  
22 have not hid in fear, and they have forced the  
23 rest of the world to recognize that they are our  
24 neighbors, our family, and our citizens. And we  
25 owe them this bill.

1                   And I'm so pleased to cast my vote  
2                   in the affirmative.

3                   THE PRESIDENT:    Thank you, Senator.  
4                   Senator Bailey to explain your vote.

5                   SENATOR BAILEY:   Thank you,  
6                   Madam President.

7                   I would echo the sentiments of all  
8                   of my colleagues in thanking our leader for  
9                   expeditiously bringing this important bill to the  
10                  floor.

11                  And Senator Hoylman, you are a  
12                  profile in courage, sir. Thank you for your  
13                  passionate and extremely emotional statements  
14                  today.

15                  I'll be very brief. Senator Sanders  
16                  invoked Martin Luther King, Jr., earlier and  
17                  today was his birthday. While it is observed  
18                  Monday, today, January 15th, is his birthday.  
19                  And to quote him again: The time is always right  
20                  to do what's right.

21                  Whether you come from a religious  
22                  family like me, where you've grown up in the  
23                  church and you heard nonsensical statements  
24                  thrown around which I won't repeat on this floor,  
25                  to going to law school and speaking to people of

1 the LGBTQ community and understanding how they  
2 live their lives. Understanding that it's not  
3 much different than a boy from the Bronx. We all  
4 want the same basic things. Respect and rights,  
5 that's what it comes down to.

6 And when we pass legislation like  
7 this, Madam President and my colleagues, the time  
8 is right to do what's right. I proudly vote aye,  
9 Madam President, and I salute my colleagues who  
10 do as well.

11 THE PRESIDENT: Thank you, Senator.  
12 Senator Stavisky to explain your  
13 vote.

14 SENATOR STAVISKY: Thank you,  
15 Madam President.

16 Somebody here earlier today said  
17 that one of their proudest moments was sitting on  
18 the floor and voting for marriage equality. I  
19 agree. And today we're going to pass the GENDA  
20 bill and hopefully the ban of conversion therapy.

21 These are monumental changes in  
22 attitudes. We discovered that the world didn't  
23 come to an end when we let people marry whomever  
24 they choose.

25 And I too congratulate

1 Senator Hoylman. You are absolutely a role  
2 model, not just for your two children but for the  
3 entire community, whether you be straight or gay.

4 And I was thinking, sitting here,  
5 what caused this breath of fresh air? It's as  
6 though a door opened and a rush of cold air came  
7 in. And I think a lot of it has to do with our  
8 new members. Because we are embarking on a new  
9 journey. It's going to be a great journey. The  
10 world's not going to come to an end when we  
11 support everybody, we don't exclude anybody.

12 So I vote aye very proudly. Thank  
13 you.

14 THE PRESIDENT: Thank you, Senator.  
15 Senator Thomas to explain your vote.

16 SENATOR THOMAS: Thank you,  
17 Madam President.

18 First and foremost, I want to thank  
19 the sponsor of the bill. And I want to thank the  
20 leadership in the Democratic Conference for  
21 pushing this forward on the second day here.

22 I also want everyone to remember  
23 something. We are all human beings, and we  
24 should treat each other with respect. I have  
25 listened to my Republican colleagues here, and I

1 completely disagree with their logic and why they  
2 oppose this bill.

3 The LGBTQ community, they are not  
4 asking for special rights. They are asking for  
5 the same rights that all of us have here in this  
6 country.

7 I also want to recognize David  
8 Kilmnick, the president of the LGBTQ Network of  
9 Long Island, for his leadership in pushing  
10 forward this bill.

11 And I vote yes on this bill as well.

12 THE PRESIDENT: Thank you, Senator.  
13 Senator Gianaris to explain your  
14 vote.

15 SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you,  
16 Madam President.

17 It was my first year as a member of  
18 this body when I got to cast a vote in favor of  
19 marriage equality, and it's one of my proudest.  
20 I actually replaced a member who had previously  
21 voted no, and so I felt a special pride in  
22 helping to make it a reality after the  
23 unsuccessful vote a few years prior. I know  
24 Tim Kennedy was in a similar circumstance at the  
25 time.

1                   But it's been eight long years since  
2 we've taken up anything relevant to the LGBTQ  
3 community since. And I can think of no better  
4 example of this new New York Senate, of this new  
5 Majority, than that we don't treat people like  
6 members of an interest group whose box we check  
7 and then tell them "Wait a few years till you get  
8 the next thing on your list."

9                   We do things here because it's the  
10 right thing to do, because we care about our  
11 neighbors and we oppose discrimination. That's  
12 what this bill is. It is a simple bill that says  
13 people should not be discriminated against. It  
14 should have happened a long time ago, but it's  
15 happening today. And we can take pride that our  
16 new leader, Andrea Stewart-Cousins, is leading  
17 the way in making sure that this and other bills  
18 can happen.

19                  The next bill is also a great bill,  
20 to ban conversion therapy. Another one that  
21 should be easy, that other states have done a lot  
22 more easily than us.

23                  And so I want to give special thanks  
24 to Brad Hoylman, someone who has been fighting  
25 this fight year after year and has been a

1       tremendous champion of this community and of this  
2       state.

3               And say that after eight years it's  
4       a great bookend. One of my first votes was one I  
5       was very proud of, to make sure that our brothers  
6       and sisters in the LGBT community are treated  
7       equally, and this vote today is doing the same  
8       thing.

9               It is such a momentous occasion,  
10       Madam President, I would also ask you as I  
11       conclude my remarks to welcome a great leader to  
12       this chamber. He's clean-shaven, so you may not  
13       recognize him --

14               (Laughter.)

15               SENATOR GIANARIS:    -- but the  
16       Speaker of the City Council, Corey Johnson, has  
17       joined us as well.

18               (Applause.)

19               SENATOR GIANARIS:    And I proudly  
20       cast my vote in the affirmative.

21               THE PRESIDENT:    Thank you, Senator.

22               Seeing and hearing no other Senator  
23       that wishes to explain their vote, I call on  
24       Majority Leader Andrea Stewart-Cousins to close.

25               SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS:    Thank

1     you, Madam President.

2                     So here we go again. I'm excited.  
3     I'm always excited. But it's just another day of  
4     tearing down barriers. So obviously there's  
5     great anticipation and there's great energy in  
6     this chamber, and it's for the right reasons.

7                     But as Senator Bailey said, I think  
8     of it as a great tribute to Dr. King on his  
9     birthday. He stood, as you know, for equality,  
10    and he wasn't thinking about how that could be  
11    packaged. He just understood that essentially it  
12    was not okay to say "this person is more equal  
13    than that person."

14                    And here we are at a moment on his  
15    birthday saying not only his words and respecting  
16    his memory, but doing what he would expect us to  
17    do.

18                    He always said "Darkness cannot  
19    drive out darkness. Light is the only thing that  
20    can do that. Hate can't drive out hate, only  
21    love does that."

22                    What we are doing today is bringing  
23    the light, we're bringing the love, and we're  
24    saying that New York State is a place for  
25    everyone.



1           It is, as Senator Gianaris said, a  
2   new New York Senate. It's a new day. And like  
3   he and many of us here in the chamber, we were  
4   proud when we were able to pass marriage equality  
5   eight years ago. None of us would have thought  
6   that it would take eight years to get to this  
7   place. But we're here. We are all here.

8           And I want to thank Senator Hoylman  
9   in particular, because you have been steadfast,  
10   you have been patient.

11           Every day that people -- in one way  
12   or another, by not addressing the LGBTQ  
13   community, you were being told maybe that you  
14   just weren't -- didn't matter. Today this  
15   chamber is saying that you matter. That we all  
16   matter. It is a great day when we can pass  
17   legislation that impacts people's lives, and that  
18   we can impact people's futures. We're doing that  
19   today.

20           So when we go out into our districts  
21   over the weekend, and I know we will, and we will  
22   be with community and we'll be invoking the  
23   memory of Dr. King and talking about the  
24   importance of his message, especially at a time  
25   like this, we can also say that we did something,

1       that that memory is alive in the New York State  
2       Senate.

3                       I vote aye.

4                       (Appause.)

5                       THE PRESIDENT:    Thank you,  
6       Majority Leader.

7                       Announce the results.

8                       THE SECRETARY:    Those recorded in  
9       the negative on Calendar Number 2 are  
10      Senators Akshar, Amedore, Antonacci, Felder,  
11      Funke, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Jordan,  
12      LaValle, O'Mara, Ortt, Ranzenhofer, Ritchie,  
13      Robach, Serino, Seward, Tedisco and Young.

14                      Ayes, 42.   Nays, 19.

15                      THE PRESIDENT:    The bill is passed.

16                      (Loud cheering; lengthy standing  
17      ovation.)

18                      THE PRESIDENT:    Senator Gianaris.

19                      SENATOR GIANARIS:    Okay.

20                      (Laughter.)

21                      SENATOR GIANARIS:    Madam President,  
22      as we take up the remainder of the  
23      noncontroversial reading of the calendar, I would  
24      remind my colleagues we do have the Governor's  
25      presentation to go to at 2 p.m., so I would

1 ask -- I know Senator Hoylman is speaking on this  
2 next bill, and any members that haven't had a  
3 chance to speak on the one we just passed should  
4 feel free to speak. But I would ask my remaining  
5 colleagues to please try and withhold your  
6 comments, if you just made some, so we can make  
7 it to the Governor's presentation.

8 THE PRESIDENT: The Secretary will  
9 read.

10 THE SECRETARY: Senator Hoylman  
11 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,  
12 Assembly Bill Number 576 and substitute it for  
13 the identical Senate Bill Number 1046, Third  
14 Reading Calendar 1.

15 THE PRESIDENT: The substitution is  
16 so ordered, and the Secretary will read.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 1,  
18 by Assemblymember Glick, Assembly Bill 576, an  
19 act to amend the Education Law.

20 THE PRESIDENT: Read the last  
21 section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This  
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 THE PRESIDENT: Call the roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1                   THE PRESIDENT:    Senator Metzger to  
2 explain your vote.

3                   SENATOR METZGER:   Thank you very  
4 much, Madam President.

5                   I want to thank Senator Hoylman and  
6 the leader and everyone for their work in the  
7 passage of both of these important bills. The  
8 fact that we are in the position of having to  
9 adopt this legislation, the fact that there is a  
10 need for this legislation, demonstrates that the  
11 passage of GENDA does not mark the end of our  
12 work by any means.

13                   We, all of us, have a lot of work to  
14 do in our communities, in our schools and in our  
15 institutions to model the values enshrined in  
16 that legislation and to educate and elevate  
17 awareness that discrimination in all forms is  
18 unacceptable and will not be tolerated.

19                   I proudly cosponsor both of these  
20 bills and am committed to doing this work.

21                   Thank you.

22                   THE PRESIDENT:    Thank you, Senator.

23                   Seeing and hearing no other Senators  
24 that wish to explain their vote, Senator Hoylman  
25 to close.

1                   SENATOR HOYLMAN:    Thank you,  
2   Madam President.

3                   I only have one epic speech in me  
4   per lifetime, so I'm going to be very brief, by  
5   just thanking my colleagues and in particular,  
6   again, Senator Gianaris who was the original  
7   prime cosponsor of this legislation.

8                   We held a forum back on May 14th of  
9   2014 with a number of advocates, one of whom is  
10   here today who I wish to recognize: Mathew  
11   Shurka, from the Born Perfect Campaign. Mathew  
12   has shared his story about the pernicious effect  
13   of so-called conversion therapy on him personally  
14   and on his family structure.

15                  Those personal stories,  
16   Madam President, have compelled us today to join  
17   other states in banning this practice of gay  
18   conversion therapy.

19                  Groups such as the New York State  
20   Psychiatric Association, the New York State  
21   Psychological Association, the New York State  
22   Academy of Family Physicians have condemned  
23   conversion therapy. We've been helped, though,  
24   by organizations like HRC, Rise Out, Equality  
25   New York, the National Association of Social

1 Workers, Lambda Legal, the LGBT Bar, NYCLU, and  
2 the New York Transgender Advocacy Group.

3 The bottom line is our children are  
4 born perfect. That's the tag line of the  
5 campaign, and that's the message we are sending  
6 to families and children today.

7 I vote aye, Madam President.

8 THE PRESIDENT: Thank you, Senator.  
9 Announce the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: Those recorded in  
11 the negative on Calendar Number 1 are  
12 Senators Amedore, Felder, Gallivan and LaValle.

13 Ayes, 57. Nays, 4.

14 THE PRESIDENT: The bill is passed.  
15 (Cheers; applause.)

16 THE PRESIDENT: The Secretary will  
17 read.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 10,  
19 by Senator Bailey, Senate Print 1190, an act to  
20 amend the Judiciary Law.

21 THE PRESIDENT: Read the last  
22 section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This  
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 THE PRESIDENT: Call the roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 THE PRESIDENT: Announce the  
3 results.

4 THE SECRETARY: Those recorded in  
5 the negative on Calendar Number 10 are  
6 Senators Antonacci, Funke, Gallivan, Griffo,  
7 Helming, Jordan, Kaminsky, Little, O'Mara, Ortt,  
8 Ranzenhofer, Ritchie, Robach, Seward, Tedisco and  
9 Young.

10 Ayes, 45. Nays, 16.

11 THE PRESIDENT: The bill is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 11,  
13 by Senator Comrie, Senate Print 1191, an act to  
14 amend a chapter of the Laws of 2018.

15 THE PRESIDENT: Read the last  
16 section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This  
18 act shall take effect on the same date and in the  
19 same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2018.

20 THE PRESIDENT: Call the roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

23 THE PRESIDENT: The bill is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 12,  
25 by Senator Bailey, Senate Print 1192, an act to

1 amend the Economic Development Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Read  
3 the last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This  
5 act shall take effect immediately.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Call  
7 the roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: The  
11 bill is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 13,  
13 by Senator Stewart-Cousins, Senate Print 1193, an  
14 act to amend a chapter of the Laws of 2018.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Read  
16 the last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
18 act shall take effect on the same date and in the  
19 same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2018.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Call  
21 the roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:  
24 Announce the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.



1                   ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:    The  
2 bill is passed.

3                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number 14,  
4 by Senator Sanders, Senate Print 1194, an act to  
5 amend a chapter of the Laws of 2018.

6                   ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:    Read  
7 the last section.

8                   THE SECRETARY:    Section 2.  This  
9 act shall take effect on the same date and in the  
10 same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2018.

11                   ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:    Call  
12 the roll.

13                   (The Secretary called the roll.)

14                   ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:  
15 Announce the results.

16                   THE SECRETARY:    Those recorded in  
17 the negative on Calendar Number 14 are  
18 Senators Akshar, Ortt and Skoufis.

19                   Ayes, 58.  Nays, 3.

20                   ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:    The  
21 bill is passed.

22                   THE SECRETARY:    Calendar Number 15,  
23 by Senator Bailey, Senate Print 1195, an act to  
24 amend a chapter of the Laws of 2018.

25                   ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:    Read

1 the last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This  
3 act shall take effect on the same date and in the  
4 same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2018.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Call  
6 the roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:  
9 Announce the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: The  
12 bill is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 16,  
14 by Senator Breslin, Senate Print 1196, an act to  
15 amend the Insurance Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Read  
17 the last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This  
19 act shall take effect on the same date and in the  
20 same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2018.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Call  
22 the roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:  
25 Announce the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: The  
3 bill is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 17,  
5 by Senator Metzger, Senate Print 1263, an act to  
6 amend the Tax Law and the Alcoholic Beverage  
7 Control Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Read  
9 the last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This  
11 act shall take effect on the same date and in the  
12 same manner as Chapter 522 of the Laws of 2018.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Call  
14 the roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:  
17 Announce the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: The  
20 bill is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 18,  
22 by Senator Gianaris, Senate Print 1264, an act to  
23 amend the Civil Practice Law and Rules.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Hold  
25 on. Hold on.

1 Senator Gianaris.

2 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President, I  
3 mentioned yesterday we were going to be doing a  
4 lot of this. But let's pause and recognize that  
5 Senator Metzger just passed her first bill in the  
6 Senate.

7 (Applause.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: The  
9 Secretary will read.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 18,  
11 by Senator Gianaris, Senate Print 1264, an act to  
12 amend the Civil Practice Law and Rules.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Read  
14 the last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This  
16 act shall take effect on the same date and in the  
17 same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2018.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Call  
19 the roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:  
22 Announce the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: The  
25 bill is passed.

1           THE SECRETARY:   Calendar Number 19,  
2   by Senator Funke, Senate Print 1276, an act to  
3   amend the Education Law.

4           ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:   Read  
5   the last section.

6           THE SECRETARY:   Section 2.   This  
7   act shall take effect on the same date and in the  
8   same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2018.

9           ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:   Call  
10   the roll.

11           (The Secretary called the roll.)

12           ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:  
13   Announce the results.

14           THE SECRETARY:   Ayes, 61.

15           ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:   The  
16   bill is passed.

17           THE SECRETARY:   Calendar Number 20,  
18   by Senator Gounardes, Senate Print 1277, an act  
19   to amend the Tax Law.

20           ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:   Read  
21   the last section.

22           THE SECRETARY:   Section 4.   This  
23   act shall take effect on the same date and in the  
24   same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2018.

25           ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:   Call

1 the roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:

4 Announce the results. Oh, hold on.

5 Senator Ortt to speak.

6 SENATOR ORTT: Yes, thank you,  
7 Mr. President, I just want to explain my vote.

8 I actually applaud the fact that  
9 this bill speeds up the expiration of what I feel  
10 is an unbelievably massive giveaway of taxpayer  
11 dollars to an industry which also happens to  
12 overwhelmingly support the Governor and the  
13 Majority in this house, to the tune of about  
14 \$450 million.

15 So we're giving half a billion  
16 dollars away to an industry -- and I'm certain  
17 there's jobs that have been created, but I don't  
18 know if the return on investment and the jobs  
19 created even come close or that anyone has been  
20 able to tell me that it comes close to justifying  
21 the \$450 million giveaway that we have done in  
22 this state for several years.

23 I opposed it when it was carried by  
24 my colleague in this house, and I will continue  
25 to oppose it even though it is now carried by the

1 member of the Majority.

2           So I applaud that we're speeding up  
3 the expiration, but I would hope that we would  
4 just let it expire, let it die. Let's take that  
5 half a billion dollars and put it either to tax  
6 cuts, put it to infrastructure spending, or some  
7 other use that I think is much more in line with  
8 the needs of all New Yorkers.

9           I vote no, Mr. President.

10           ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:

11 Senator Sanders to explain his vote.

12           SENATOR SANDERS: Yes. The points  
13 that my colleague has raised are worthy points  
14 and should be looked into. We have an obligation  
15 to the people of New York. They are worthy.  
16 Every tax dollar that we do should return at  
17 least one, if not many more so. So we should  
18 look into the points that he has made.

19           I have been led to believe that this  
20 is a good thing for the state. I have other  
21 concerns on this. I toured one of the leading  
22 film studios, and I saw an incredible lack of  
23 diversity there. I did not see the State of  
24 New York reflected.

25           I have shared this with the industry

1 and look forward to continued dialogue with them  
2 to see what we can do, especially if we're using  
3 taxpayer dollars to ensure that they're hiring  
4 the people of New York and not just one group,  
5 the traditional group.

6 So I believe that they are going to  
7 look into this. I'm not opposed to looking into  
8 every part of this to make sure that it is doing  
9 what it's supposed to do. At this moment, I'm  
10 going to vote yes for this.

11 Thank you.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:

13 Announce the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: Those recorded in  
15 the negative on Calendar Number 20 are  
16 Senators Akshar, Antonacci, Boyle, Ortt,  
17 Ranzenhofer and Salazar.

18 Ayes, 55. Nays, 6.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: The  
20 bill is passed.

21 Recognize Senator Gianaris.

22 SENATOR GIANARIS: And that was  
23 Senator Gounardes's first bill passage in the  
24 Senate. Congratulations.

25 (Applause.)



1                   ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:

2       Congratulations, Senator.

3                   The bill is passed.

4                   SENATOR GIANARIS:    Mr. President,  
5       on behalf of Senator Andrea Stewart-Cousins, our  
6       leader, there are hand-ups related to conference  
7       memberships and committee assignments.  I ask  
8       that they be filed in the Journal.

9                   ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:    The  
10      hand-ups have been received and will be filed in  
11      the Journal.

12                  SENATOR GIANARIS:    And on behalf of  
13      Senator Flanagan, Leader Stewart-Cousins also  
14      hands up additional committee assignments and  
15      conference membership lists that I ask be filed  
16      in the Journal.

17                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:    The  
18      hand-up is received and will be filed in the  
19      Journal.

20                  SENATOR GIANARIS:    Mr. President,  
21      is there any further business at the desk?

22                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:    There  
23      is no further business at the desk.

24                  SENATOR GIANARIS:    That being the  
25      case, I move to adjourn until Tuesday,

1 January 22nd, at 2:00 p.m., intervening days  
2 being legislative days.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: On  
4 motion, the Senate stands adjourned until  
5 Tuesday, January 22nd, at 2:00 p.m., intervening  
6 days being legislative days.

7 (Whereupon, at 1:04 p.m., the Senate  
8 adjourned.)  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25