1	NEW YORK STATE SENATE
2	
3	
4	THE STENOGRAPHIC RECORD
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	ALBANY, NEW YORK
10	January 15, 2019
11	11:22 a.m.
12	
13	
14	REGULAR SESSION
15	
16	
17	
18	LIEUTENANT GOVERNOR KATHLEEN C. HOCHUL, President
19	ALEJANDRA N. PAULINO, ESQ., Secretary
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

1	PROCEEDINGS
2	THE PRESIDENT: The Senate will
3	come to order.
4	And I ask everyone present to please
5	rise and repeat with me the Pledge of Allegiance.
6	(Whereupon, the assemblage recited
7	the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.)
8	THE PRESIDENT: Our invocation
9	today will be given by Rabbi Yael Rooks Rapport,
10	from the Congregation Beit Simchat Torah, in
11	New York City.
12	We look forward to hearing from you.
13	And you are also from the Rabbi is also from
14	Senator Hoylman's district. Rabbi.
15	RABBI RAPPORT: Members of the
16	New York State Senate, good morning.
17	SENATORS: Good morning.
18	RABBI RAPPORT: I bring you
19	greetings from Congregation Beit Simchat Torah,
20	the world's largest LGBTQ synagogue, in New York
21	City.
22	You gather here today as
23	representation of something greater than
24	yourself, one individual image which encompasses
25	the dreams, the challenges, and the possibility

of each of your districts and the many constituents you represent.

In the Jewish tradition, we believe that each of us individually is one small spark, one unique reflection of the divine.

In the first chapter of Genesis, it is written that humanity was created {Hebrew}, in the image of God. It is the source of our belief that every individual brings to the world some unique relevance of God's image exactly as we are, exactly as we were created, that no one else could bring.

May we see in ourselves this beauty and wholeness. May we know that exactly the way we are made shines with holiness because our image is part of something much more expansive that requires our representation, because of our gender identification, because of our sexual orientation, because of our religious affiliation, our race, our ethnicity, our national origin.

May we strive to recognize this same holiness in others in moments when we feel alike, and in moments when we feel completely different.

May each of you, representations of

```
1
     representation, continue to act as sources of
 2
     blessing to all you serve, as only you can.
 3
                  Let us say together, amen.
 4
                  THE PRESIDENT:
                                    Thank you very
 5
     much, Rabbi Yael Rapport.
 6
                  Reading of the Journal.
 7
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                    In Senate, Monday,
 8
     January 14, 2019, the Senate met pursuant to
 9
     adjournment. The Journal of Sunday, January 13,
10
     2019, was read and approved. On motion, Senate
11
     adjourned.
12
                  THE PRESIDENT:
                                    Without objection,
     the Journal stands approved as read.
13
                  Presentation of petitions.
14
15
                  Messages from the Assembly.
16
                  Messages from the Governor.
                  Reports of standing committees.
17
18
                  Reports of -- may we have order.
19
                  Reports of standing committees.
20
                  Reports of select committees.
21
                  Communications and reports from
     state officers.
22
                  Motions and resolutions.
23
                  Senator Gianaris.
24
25
                  SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,
```

```
1
     good morning.
 2
                  I now move to adopt the
     Resolution Calendar, with the exception of
 3
     Resolutions 9 and 60.
 4
 5
                  THE PRESIDENT: All in favor of
     adopting the Resolution Calendar, with the
 6
 7
     exception of Resolutions 9 and 60, signify by
 8
     saying aye.
 9
                  (Response of "Aye.")
10
                  THE PRESIDENT:
                                   Opposed, nay.
11
                  (No response.)
12
                  THE PRESIDENT: The Resolution
     Calendar is adopted.
13
                  Senator Gianaris.
14
15
                  SENATOR GIANARIS:
                                      Madam President,
16
     can you please call up Resolution Number 60, read
     that resolution in its entirety, and recognize
17
18
     Senator Stavisky to speak.
19
                  THE PRESIDENT: The Secretary will
20
     read.
21
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Legislative
22
     Resolution Number 60, commemorating the work of
     the Korean American Association of Greater
23
     New York and its President, Minsun Kim, for their
24
25
     historic work in advancing the interests and
```

1 well-being of the Korean American community of 2 New York, and honoring their visit to the State 3 Capitol of New York in Albany. 4 "WHEREAS, It is the custom of this 5 Legislative Body to honor and commemorate those illustrious organizations and individuals of the 6 7 State of New York whose focus and intent have had a substantial impact on the many, diverse 8 residents of the State of New York; and 9 10 "WHEREAS, The Korean American Association of Greater New York was founded in 11 12 1960 as a nonprofit to advocate for the welfare and rights of over half a million members of the 13 14 Korean American community of Greater New York; 15 and 16 "WHEREAS, Korean Americans, who form 17 a large, vibrant community in New York, represent 18 a long and storied part of the American fabric, having made numerous contributions to science, 19

"WHEREAS, The Korean American
Association of Greater New York acts as an
umbrella organization for over 500 other
Korean American groups that provide assistance
and services in numerous areas, such as culture,

law, business, art, and many other fields; and

20

21

22

23

24

25

education, and community outreach, for people of 1 2 all ages and socioeconomic status; and "WHEREAS, Minsun Kim was elected to 3 serve as the 34th President and the 35th 4 5 President of the Korean American Association of Greater New York; as the first female leader of 6 7 the organization, she has successfully led it towards achieving numerous goals of long-standing 8 9 consequence; and 10 "WHEREAS, The Korean American Association of Greater New York and 11 President Minsun Kim have endeavored to advance 12 the causes of women's equality and the principles 13 14 of democracy, and spearheaded efforts to 15 recognize the historical legacy of Yu Gwan-sun and her importance in the March 1st movement; and 16 "WHEREAS, Yu Gwan-sun, introduced 17 18 by Alice H. Sharp, a missionary sent from 19 New York to Korea, attended the Ewha Women's 20 School, Korea's first women's educational 21 institute established by an American missionary, where she learned the American values of 22 freedom, justice, equality and human rights, and 23 became a national symbol of the human rights 24 25 movement; and

1 "WHEREAS, The Korean American 2 Association of Greater New York and President Minsun Kim will be joined by a variety 3 4 of organizations and their representatives in 5 visiting the New York State Capitol in Albany on January 15, 2019; and 6 7 "WHEREAS, Many Korean Americans in 8 the State of New York maintain profound ties to other members of their community, both in 9 10 America and around the world, and through their family and culture, this visit represents a 11 momentous event for both them and countless 12 other New Yorkers; and 13 "WHEREAS, It is the sense of this 14 15 Legislative Body to commemorate the historic occasion of the visit of the Korean American 16 Association of Greater New York and President 17 18 Minsun Kim; now, therefore, be it 19 "RESOLVED, That this Legislative 20 Body pause in its deliberations to commemorate 21 March 1, 2019, as the Centennial of the March 1st 22 Movement, and to honor the lasting impact of 23 Yu Gwan-sun's legacy as one of the youngest female human rights movement leaders; and be it 24 25 further

```
1
                  "RESOLVED, That copies of this
 2
     resolution, suitably engrossed, be transmitted to
     Moon Jae-in, President of South Korea;
 3
     Minsun Kim, President of the Korean American
 4
 5
     Association of Greater New York; and the
     Korean American community of New York."
 6
 7
                  THE PRESIDENT:
                                   Senator Stavisky on
 8
     the resolution.
 9
                  SENATOR STAVISKY:
                                       Thank you,
10
     Madam President.
                  We are delighted to welcome our
11
     friends from South Korea and from the Korean
12
     American community.
13
                  We are joined not only by the
14
15
     Consul General, Hyo-Sung Park, but by members of
16
     the Korean National Assembly, which is the
     equivalent of our Congress. And we are happy to
17
18
     welcome Young Sun Park, Kyung Hyub Kim, Chang Won
     Pyo, Jin Gyu Hahm, and Dong Seob Lee.
19
20
                  (Applause.)
                  SENATOR STAVISKY: And to them we
21
22
     say: Annyeong haseyo.
23
                  (Laughter; cheers.)
                  SENATOR STAVISKY:
                                      The resolution
24
     talks about how the Korean American Association
25
```

of Greater New York, KAAGNY, was founded almost

60 years ago -- 58 years ago -- to speak for the

new immigrants, to speak for the Korean Americans

who have chosen to come to our country.

And it also talks about how,

116 years ago, 102 Koreans left their home in

Korea and came to the United States and they

landed in Hawaii aboard the SS Gaelic on

January 13, 1903.

And that is why we have the resolution on the floor today. People have asked me why these dates, and that's the answer. They came to our country on January 13th -- actually, to work in the sugar fields in Hawaii. And amongst the 103, interestingly, there were 21 women. And we celebrate the inclusion of women in our chamber and Minsun Kim, her election as the first woman from KAAGNY. And that was the start of a migration to the United States.

They have been such an important part of our community over the years. We fought together in World War II, in the Korean conflict, in Vietnam, and today in the Middle East. They have become such an important part of the American fabric, particularly in economic ways,

social ways. Their cultural heritage is visible in New York City, and they are an important part of our society.

And in fact, Congress declared

January 13th as Korean American Day. And we are
doing the same thing in this chamber today, as
the Assembly did earlier.

There are 100,000 Korean Americans living in New York City, many in Queens County.

And March 1st is mentioned. We celebrate March 1st because it is the centennial of the March 1st Movement, the movement for Korean independence, which is so important. And Korea is such an important part of our world economy and our world democracy. Because we have very few democracies in that part of the world, and Korea is certainly one of them.

We talk about Yu Gwan-sun, the symbol of the March 1st Movement, the symbol for freedom and human rights.

So we welcome you all and we wish you a very happy and prosperous Lunar New Year, the Year of the Pig that's coming up. And "Saehae bog manhi badeuseyo," which is the -- I don't know why the Korean transliteration is so

```
1
     long; it's "Happy New Year." Simple, and yet we
 2
     appreciate your presence here today, and we
 3
     welcome you.
 4
                  Kamsamida.
 5
                  (Applause.)
 6
                  THE PRESIDENT: Thank you, Senator
 7
     Stavisky.
 8
                  Senator Liu on the resolution.
                  SENATOR LIU: Distinguished
 9
10
     colleagues, I am proud and honored to join
     Senator Stavisky in welcoming this distinguished
11
12
     delegation led by Ambassador Park, Minsun Kim,
     our historic president of the Korean American
13
     Association of Greater New York, and this very
14
15
     venerable delegation of National Assembly members
     from the Republic of Korea.
16
                  Senator Stavisky has already
17
18
     mentioned the most salient points. I will say
19
     that this is a very historic day for this
20
     delegation to visit these chambers. It is the
21
     116th anniversary of the first Korean immigrants
     to the United States of America. And it is also
22
     a very important anniversary, 100 years since the
23
     unofficial founding of the Republic, with a
24
25
     heroine in the name of Yu Gwan-sun, to this day
```

100 years later remains a symbol of the national identity of the Republic of Korea.

It is very important that we recognize this in the State of New York because the Korean American community continues to be such a vital part of our state -- economically, culturally, educationally, and politically, especially as we have the first and still only Korean American legislator, in the name of Ron Kim, in the State Assembly.

This is a very special moment for me personally, because I grew up with the Korean American community my whole life. And so I want to say welcome to these distinguished visitors here. The Korean American community stands for a lot, not just small businesses, not just dry cleaners. Now the generation of Korean Americans are attorneys, physicians, other professionals.

And we're very proud of the American pop culture that we export throughout the rest of the world, but I've got to tell you, if you talk to a lot of our young people, Korean or not, they love Korean pop culture. They call it K-pop.

And I know many Senators know the Gangnam dance.

```
1
                  (Laughter.)
 2
                  SENATOR LIU: And so we are very
 3
     happy to welcome our fellow brothers and sisters
     from halfway around the world to these humble
 4
 5
     chambers of the New York State Senate.
                  Thank you very much. Saehae bog
 6
 7
     manhi badeuseyo. Kamsamida.
 8
                  (Applause.)
 9
                  THE PRESIDENT:
                                   Thank you,
10
     Senator Liu. Thank you.
                  The question is on the resolution.
11
     All those in favor signify by saying aye.
12
13
                  (Response of "Aye.")
                  THE PRESIDENT:
14
                                  Opposed?
15
                  (No response.)
16
                  THE PRESIDENT: The resolution is
     adopted.
17
18
                  (Applause.)
                                   Senator Gianaris.
19
                  THE PRESIDENT:
20
                  SENATOR GIANARIS:
                                       Thank you,
21
     Madam President.
22
                  Let me add my words of welcome as
23
     well to the Assembly members, the Consul General,
     and the Korean American Association.
24
25
                  At Senator Stavisky's request, this
```

```
resolution is open for cosponsorship. Should any
 1
 2
     member choose not to be a cosponsor, please
     notify the desk.
 3
 4
                  THE PRESIDENT:
                                   The resolution is
 5
     open for cosponsorship. Should you not desire to
 6
     be a cosponsor, please notify the desk.
 7
                  Senator Gianaris.
 8
                  SENATOR GIANARIS: Can we now
 9
     please call up Resolution Number 9, read that
10
     resolution's title only, and recognize
11
     Senator Seward to speak.
12
                  THE PRESIDENT:
                                   The Secretary will
13
     read.
14
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Legislative
15
     Resolution Number 9, commending John D. Heller
     posthumously upon the occasion of his designation
16
     as recipient of a Liberty Medal, the highest
17
18
     honor bestowed upon an individual by the New York
19
     State Senate.
                  THE PRESIDENT:
20
                                   Senator Seward on
21
     the resolution.
22
                  SENATOR SEWARD:
                                    Thank you,
23
     Madam President. It's a great honor for me to
     stand today and recognize the life and heroism of
24
25
     John Heller.
```

You know, John lost his life on December 29, 2018, during a fire at his Oneonta residence. While John was taken from us on that night, he made sure that others would live on. John was a former part-time Oneonta firefighter, and he acted heroically on that tragic night.

His four young nephews were spending the night at his apartment, an apartment that he shared with his fiancee, Amber Roe. When the fire broke out, John did what all first responders do. He put the well-being of others first, and he rushed to that point of danger to help others.

He was able to help his fiancee,

Amber, and his four young nephews, Donovan,

Maddox, Macall and Rawley Heller -- he got them

to safety before perishing in the fire. John

displayed great courage in saving the lives of

five others, and he made the ultimate sacrifice.

His final act here on earth was one of bravery, valor and heroism, and love of others. John's heroic actions embody the reason that the Senate Liberty Medal was created in the first place.

I was able to present the Senate

```
Liberty Medal posthumously to John Heller, and I
 1
 2
     presented it to his fiancee, Amber Roe, and his
     parents, John and Gayle Heller, at a memorial
 3
 4
     service earlier this month in Oneonta.
                                              More than
 5
     300 people were on hand to honor and remember
     John. It was an inspirational outpouring of love
 6
 7
     and respect from the entire community, and it
 8
     spoke volumes about the type of person John was
 9
     and how he lived his life and how he died.
10
                  So I'm honored this morning to take
     a moment to remember the life of John Heller and
11
     to ensure that his name and his heroism are a
12
     permanent part of our Senate records and New York
13
14
     State history. And I would greatly appreciate
15
     the support of this body in honoring the memory
16
     of John D. Heller.
                                   Thank you, Senator.
17
                  THE PRESIDENT:
18
                  The question is on the resolution.
     All those in favor signify by saying aye.
19
20
                  (Response of "Aye.")
21
                  THE PRESIDENT: All those opposed,
22
     nay.
23
                  (No response.)
                                   The resolution is
24
                  THE PRESIDENT:
25
     adopted.
```

```
Senator Gianaris.
 1
 2
                  SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you,
 3
     Madam President.
 4
                  At the request of Senator Seward,
 5
     this resolution is also open for cosponsorship.
     Should any member choose not to be a cosponsor,
 6
 7
     please notify the desk.
 8
                  THE PRESIDENT:
                                   The resolution is
     open for cosponsorship. Should you not choose to
 9
10
     be a cosponsor of the resolution, please notify
11
     the desk.
12
                  SENATOR GIANARIS: Can we now take
     up the noncontroversial reading of the calendar,
13
     but I would ask that we go out of order and take
14
15
     up Calendar Number 2 first.
16
                  THE PRESIDENT: The Secretary will
17
     read.
18
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 2,
     by Senator Hoylman, Senate Print 1047, an act to
19
20
     amend the Executive Law, the Civil Rights Law,
     and the Education Law.
21
22
                  THE PRESIDENT: Read the last
     section.
23
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 25.
24
                                                 This
25
     act shall take effect on the 30th day after it
```

```
shall have become a law.
 1
 2
                  THE PRESIDENT:
                                   Call the roll.
 3
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 4
                  THE PRESIDENT:
                                   Senator Hoylman to
 5
     explain his vote.
                  SENATOR HOYLMAN:
 6
                                     Thank you,
     Madam President.
 7
 8
                  And thank you to my colleagues.
 9
     It's been a long road. But I was thinking about
10
     this bill, which is called, of course, the Gender
     Expression Non-Discrimination Act. But much more
11
     than an acronym, it is the transgender human
12
     rights law for the State of New York.
13
                  And I was thinking about it in terms
14
15
     of my daughter. And last summer my daughter and
16
     I were at a swimming pool with some other LGBTQ
     families. And we were paddling along in the
17
18
     ice-cold water, and this little girl swam up to
19
     Sylvia, my 7-year-old, and she said "Who's that?"
20
     And Sylvia said "That's my daddy." And without
21
     missing a beat, the other little girl said,
22
     "Well, then where's your other daddy?"
23
                  (Laughter.)
                  SENATOR HOYLMAN:
                                     And to me that's
24
25
     an example of the quantum leap forward that we've
```

taken as a chamber, thanks to the support of so 1 many colleagues, and we've taken as a society, 2 3 thanks to popular culture and leadership in this 4 Capitol, including our Governor and our President 5 and our Supreme Court. But there was and remains unfinished 6 7 business in the civil rights movement, in particular the LGBTQ civil rights movement, for 8 the reason that the last 17 years, in our 9 10 Human Rights Law, transgender people have been 11 expressly excluded. That wasn't by accident. 12 Back in 2002, when the Sexual Orientation Non-Discrimination Act was passed in this very 13 14 chamber, there was a motion, there was a motion 15 made by my esteemed predecessor, Senator Tom Duane, to include transgender and 16 17 gender-nonconforming people in that bill. 18 But they were jettisoned. They were left on a desert island in the world of human 19 20 rights. And we told them, We'll be back to get you. Our lifeboat will be coming back, don't 21 worry. Well, it's taken 17 years. 22 So to them, that speck on the 23 horizon is not a mirage, it is the State Senate 24 25 finally coming back to pick you up and bring you

into civil society, with all rights and 1 2 protections that New Yorkers deserve. 3 (Applause; cheers.) 4 SENATOR HOYLMAN: And I've been 5 asked: Why is this necessary? Well, here are the facts. Under New York State law, if you are 6 7 transgender or gender-nonconforming, according to the statute you can be fired from your place of 8 9 employment, you can be denied a lease for your 10 apartment, you can be kicked out of a restaurant 11 just because you are transgender or 12 gender-nonconforming. 13 In addition to that, while some of 14 that has been covered by Executive Order -- not with the force of law, and always subject to 15 change -- the one thing that has not been 16 addressed is protections for transgender and 17 18 gender-nonconforming people under our state Hate Crimes Law. 19 20 And it's not lost on me or 21 transgender activists, many of whom are here in the galleries, that transgender people are the 22 number-one target of hate violence in these 23 United States of America. We have to do 24 25 something to protect them.

And the symbolism of us passing our transgender human rights law is profound. It's profound at every level of our society, among the very young and among the very old.

results of the United States Transgender Survey. It found that 30 percent of transgender and gender-nonconforming people have been fired from their jobs because of their gender identity -- 30 percent. Twenty-three percent of those folks have been denied housing, 31 percent have been denied service in a place of public accommodation. And yes, that great American bathroom debate, which I'm glad we're not having today: 59 percent have avoided using public restrooms out of fear of being confronted.

That's the reality for transgender and gender-nonconforming people in our society today.

And I took the liberty of soliciting some thoughts from some of our transgender

New Yorkers about how they felt about this historic day here in Albany.

And a woman named Kristen Browde -- she was recently elected as the board president

```
1
     of the LGBT Bar Association in New York -- wrote
 2
             She said:
                        "Your legislation means
 3
     everything. We can now be assured that in public
 4
     accommodation, in business and in every aspect of
 5
     life, we'll be on the same footing as everyone
     else, that no longer we'll have to fear
 6
 7
     professional or personal repercussions when we
     come out or when our gender is revealed. And we
 8
     will help erase some of the fear that every
 9
10
     transgender person has about coming out."
                  "That fear," Kristen writes, "has
11
12
     led me not to come out publicly until I reached
     the age of 65."
13
14
                  "GENDA," she says, "will go a long
15
     way toward ending the fear of legalized
     discrimination, a fear that so many in this state
16
     rightly, though unfortunately, have lived with."
17
18
                  A fear, I have to add, colleagues,
     is compounded by decisions being made in
19
20
     Washington, D.C., to undermine the civil
     liberties that were put forward through
21
     Executive Order by President Obama and now are
22
     being decimated by President Trump.
23
                  Then there's Wendy Marie from
24
25
     Buffalo, who writes in to say: "I've been
```

```
1
     refused medical appointments due to being trans.
 2
     I've been turned down for employment and told
     outright that if I dress as a male, then there is
 3
 4
     an open position. I have been refused lodging
 5
     and entrance to food establishments and openly
     ridiculed in public. Passing GENDA would show
 6
 7
     that our elected state representatives will no
     longer tolerate discrimination against any
 8
     citizens regardless of their gender expression."
 9
10
                  And finally, there's a constituent
     of mine named Sam, a young boy in my district
11
12
     who's 14 and lives in the East Village. I called
     his mom. She was so proud.
13
                  All of these New Yorkers have been
14
15
     waiting so long. They've been waiting too long.
     But we're going to fix that today.
16
                  So I just want to thank my
17
18
     colleagues who have pushed this issue forward.
19
     So many of us have our own experiences with the
20
     LGBT community. Senator Duane, who was the first
     openly LGBT member of this body.
21
22
                  Senator Squadron -- a straight ally,
     but a good guy nonetheless --
23
                  (Laughter.)
24
25
                  SENATOR HOYLMAN:
                                     -- who carried
```

1 this bill for so many years. 2 Senators Skoufis and Stavisky, who 3 moved these bills quickly through committee. 4 My colleagues in the LGBT Caucus: 5 Deborah Glick, Danny O'Donnell, Harry Bronson, Dick Gottfried -- who's not a caucus member, but 6 7 is carrying GENDA in the other house -- and former Assemblymember Matthew Titone. 8 9 And Senator Krueger, whose brother 10 lived during the plague years. Senator Savino, who gave that killer 11 12 speech on marriage equality. 13 Senator Ramos, who understands that 14 transgender women of color are now a political 15 voting bloc and we should be listening to them. Senator Benjamin, who said the other 16 17 day, "Wow, we're dealing with democracy and human 18 rights in the first two days of our legislative session. Can it get any more real than that?" 19 20 And Senator Gianaris, for pushing forward not just GENDA, but being the original 21 coprime sponsor and in fact the originator of the 22 bill to ban conversion therapy. 23 And finally, our leader, Andrea 24 25 Stewart-Cousins. It's no coincidence that we're

addressing this issue in the first week of our 1 2 legislating, because Andrea Stewart-Cousins wrote the human rights law in Westchester County. 3 4 knows what it's like to be discriminated against. 5 She knows the value of standing up for our fellow citizens no matter what they look like, no matter 6 what their gender identity or expression is, no 7 8 matter who they love. 9 So to my colleagues, thank you. Let 10 us move forward. Let us all rise up and support civil liberties for everyone. 11 Thank you. 12 (Extended standing ovation.) 13 THE PRESIDENT: Thank you, 14 Senator Hoylman. 15 To explain her vote, Senator Ramos. 16 SENATOR RAMOS: Thank you, Madam President. 17 18 It's true, I am the proud 19 State Senator of the largest transgender Latinx 20 community in this country. And I'm proud to be 21 voting yes, because I'm here to ensure they're 22 protected from hatred and discrimination. 23 communities have long faced an assault on their rights, and it's time New York State finally 24 25 commits to protecting them.

```
(Cheers, applause from galleries.)
 1
 2
                  SENATOR RAMOS:
                                   But I do want to
     note that I believe we must go further. We must
 3
 4
     acknowledge that communities of color bear the
 5
     brunt of the criminal justice system.
                  (Cheers, applause from galleries.)
 6
 7
                  SENATOR RAMOS:
                                    So after passing
 8
     GENDA, we need to work to clarify this
 9
     language -- and I know that this issue will be
10
     addressed -- so this historic bill cannot be
11
     weaponized against people of color.
12
                  Passing GENDA signifies monumental
     progress for our state, and we will continue to
13
14
     acknowledge how people of color in every
15
     community are disadvantaged as a result of
     systems meant to criminalize us. GENDA is a
16
     significant first step in committing ourselves to
17
18
     the betterment of all vulnerable communities, and
19
     must pave the way for equity and dignity for all
20
     New Yorkers.
21
                  Thank you.
22
                  (Enthusiastic applause.)
                  THE PRESIDENT:
                                    I need to remind
23
     the Senators as well as our guests here today
24
25
     that we will reserve all of our applause to the
```

```
conclusion and the passage of the bills, all
 1
 2
     right?
 3
                  (Laughter.)
 4
                  THE PRESIDENT:
                                   Senator Savino to
 5
     explain your vote.
                  SENATOR SAVINO:
 6
                                    Thank you,
 7
     Madam President.
 8
                  I want to rise first to acknowledge
     and thank our leader, Senator Stewart-Cousins,
 9
10
     for moving this agenda so quickly.
                  I want to thank Senator Hoylman for
11
     that beautiful, passionate speech and for taking
12
     up this issue after Senator Squadron left, after
13
     Tom Duane. And I wanted to talk a bit about a
14
15
     moment nine years ago when this chamber, this
     body failed the LGBT community and particularly
16
     the transgender community.
17
18
                  When we took the majority in 2009,
     we had 32 elected Democrats, but we only had 24
19
20
     that were willing to vote to stand up for the
     LGBT community, whether it was marriage equality
21
22
     or GENDA. We tried to bring GENDA through the
     Judiciary Committee. And some of you in the
23
     community may have come to that Judiciary hearing
24
25
     on June 8th of 2010, where the bill went down in
```

defeat because Democrats didn't stand up for the LGBT community.

So I am so proud to be here today, nine years later -- but nine years too late for the community, in many respects -- to be able to correct that wrong that was done in the Senate Judiciary committee when we defeated GENDA, because today we have the votes.

And during that last nine years, we have seen counties in this state, 11 cities in this state, 11 counties adopt their own GENDA statute to protect the transgender community.

But it's not enough. We saw the Governor introduce an Executive Order, but that's still not enough, because it doesn't have the force of law everywhere in every county in the state.

And what we're doing here today,
Brad, what we're doing is saying regardless of
where you live in New York State -- upstate,
downstate, the East End to the West Side -- this
state recognizes your civil rights and your
humanity no matter who you are. And we're doing
that today, and I am so proud to finally be able
to help correct a wrong that was done the last
time we held the majority.

1 So congratulations to everyone, and 2 especially to our leader for bringing this out in the first week and not making us wait until June. 3 4 Thank you. 5 (Applause.) 6 THE PRESIDENT: Thank you, Senator 7 Savino. 8 I have to repeat the request to 9 restrain yourselves, despite the apparent 10 excitement, with respect to the applause. have business to attend to in the chambers today. 11 12 Senator Sepúlveda to explain your 13 vote. SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA: 14 Thank you. 15 First I want to thank, again, the 16 leader, who's pushed an agenda that's been necessary in this state for many years. 17 I want 18 to thank Brad. I also want to thank Tom Duane, and of course Mike Gianaris. 19 20 To me this is important. In 1994 I 21 lost my oldest brother to AIDS. He was a 22 nonconforming transgender male who died and was a victim of a couple of attempts at hate crime. 23 this, to me, is something I'm very proud in his 24 25 honor to be voting for.

There are moments that are shared in our American history that serve as inflection points along our long march towards justice, and this morning we've reached one of those proud moments. The GENDA act will add gender identity and expression as a protected class in our state's Human Rights and Hate Crime Laws. GENDA will prohibit discrimination in employment, housing, public accommodations and other areas. GENDA will also provide stronger penalties for crimes motivated by hatred. And again, I wish my brother was here to share this moment with me. Today we recognize the T in LGBT. We are transgender and gender-nonconforming siblings. We recognize your full and equal place in the fabric of our community. We enter a covenant with both those harmed by society's lack of understanding and the millions of children who

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

in the fabric of our community. We enter a covenant with both those harmed by society's lack of understanding and the millions of children who trust us to provide a just future. Our vote in this chamber is one of love, solidarity with the LGBT community. Thank you for the value you bring to this American family. We will do better by you, and we will continue to listen.

May this vote serve as the first of

many civil rights reforms that serve to recognize

```
1
     the inherent worth and dignity living inside
 2
     every single person in this country and in this
 3
     state.
 4
                  Thank you.
 5
                  THE PRESIDENT:
                                   Thank you, Senator.
 6
                  Senator Krueger to explain your
 7
     vote.
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
 8
                                      Thank you,
     Madam President.
 9
10
                  I also want to thank Senator Hoylman
11
     for his hard work to get us here, and all our
     other colleagues. I also do -- also don't want
12
     to point out that I served with Senator Tom Duane
13
14
     the years he was fighting so hard for this bill,
15
     and lived through the times we failed, we failed
16
     the T community.
                  And I even remember when we passed
17
18
     SONDA but we couldn't get GENDA added on as an
19
     amendment. And there were many at the time in
20
     the gay and lesbian community who weren't
     comfortable enough to actually fight for GENDA
21
22
     rights then. But look how far we've come.
                  And I distinctly remember some of my
23
     colleagues at those times, when we failed to get
24
25
     this done, saying to me: "Who are those
```

transgender?" I said, "They're people. They're 1 2 people who just want equal rights with everyone else and who deserve equal rights with everyone 3 else." 4 5 And not only am I so proud we're going to pass this on the floor today, but we're 6 7 going to pass it with votes on both sides of the aisle. And I think that's another incredibly 8 important message for those of us who fought so 9 10 long and hard to have the opportunity to set the agenda of what comes to the floor of the Senate. 11 Because I knew that this bill, like so many 12 others we will be moving, would have support in 13 14 both parties if we could just get the discussion 15 rolling, the bills through committee to the 16 floor. 17 I'm so proud to vote yes today. I'm 18 so happy and proud for the State of New York that we are finally taking this long past-due step. I 19 20 vote yes, Madam President. Thank you. 21 (Applause from gallery.) Thank you, Senator 22 THE PRESIDENT: 23 Krueger. 24 Senator Kaplan to explain your vote. 25 SENATOR KAPLAN: Thank you,

Madam President. Transgender people have faced injustice for far too long in this country. in the past two years, the pace and intensity of these attacks on the rights and existence of trans people has exploded, leading to a dramatic increase of anti-transgender discrimination and violence. We should be doing everything we can

We should be doing everything we can to stand up and say we reject hate and bias in New York, because no one should be subject to discrimination just for being their true authentic selves.

And today, by finally bringing GENDA to the floor, and passing it, we are sending a message to transgender people across this state that we want to make sure you are safe, affirmed, and protected. We are sending a message that we've got your back.

So that is why I am proud to stand here today as a cosponsor of this legislation and proudly cast my vote in the affirmative.

Thank you.

THE PRESIDENT: Thank you,

25 | Senator Kaplan.

Senator Serrano to explain your 1 2 vote. 3 SENATOR SERRANO: Thank you so 4 much, Madam President. 5 And I rise to congratulate my colleague and my friend Senator Hoylman for his 6 7 steadfast leadership on this issue and the courageousness that you've put forth in all the 8 items that you work on. 9 And I want to thank the leadership 10 of Andrea Stewart-Cousins, our leader, for 11 12 bringing this to a vote today, and all of my colleagues in this chamber. And I hope that we 13 14 see broad and universal support for something so 15 important. 16 This vote and this issue is so 17 important now when you consider the years and 18 legacy of violence against the transgender 19 community and communities all across our nation. 20 In East Harlem and the South Bronx, too many 21 candlelight vigils for those who have been the victims of murder, of violence, simply because of 22 their gender identity and expression. No more. 23 24 We say no more. 25 At a time when walls are being built

```
and policies are being implemented that make us
 1
 2
     less free, this bill does the complete opposite.
     It embraces the very essence of what freedom is,
 3
 4
     the very essence of what it is to be an American.
 5
     That we say that we are all free and that we all
     should be protected by the laws and the rights
 6
 7
     that any others take for granted.
 8
                  So again, it is just so amazing to
     be part of this historic day. I've been in the
 9
10
     Senate for many years, but today feels so
     special. And again, when we think about the
11
12
     legacy of the work that we do, this day will be
13
     one that we remember for many, many years.
14
                  And again, referring back to my good
15
     friend Senator Hoylman, your legacy is so deep
     with the work that you've done, but none more
16
     important than the legacy to your two children
17
18
     and how this day will be impactful for
19
     generations to come.
20
                  So thank you.
21
                  THE PRESIDENT:
                                    Senator Kennedy to
22
     explain your vote.
23
                  SENATOR KENNEDY:
                                      Thank you,
     Madam President.
24
25
                  First of all, let me start by
```

thanking and congratulating once again this bill's sponsor, Senator Hoylman, for your steadfast attention and aggressive advocacy on this issue.

You know, it's fitting that we stood up and applauded Senator Hoylman. It's not very often that that happens on this floor. But this is that important of an issue, with such an overarching impact, not only on New York but on society. And not just in this country, but across the globe. Because we know how New York goes, so goes the rest of the nation and so goes the rest of the international community.

And New York has demonstrated that particularly as it pertains to LGBT issues. And if we go back and we think about where this body has come from -- one of the proudest moments I've ever had on this floor was voting for marriage equality. And that was eight years ago. I can't remember since then when we voted on another LGBTQ issue in this chamber.

It is so fitting that we move this today, because this is what the people of the State of New York need, this is what the people of this country need. We need to demonstrate

what New York is all about. It's standing up and fighting against those that want to commit hate crimes because someone is different. It's standing up and fighting against those that want to discriminate against anyone for any reason because they are different.

But what this says today is that we are -- no one is different, we are all normal.

We are all New Yorkers. We are all Americans.

We all deserve the same rights and respect and dignity as anyone else, regardless of who we are, what we look like, what our sexual orientation is, where we come from, what our socioeconomic status is. That's what New York is all about.

And by passing GENDA today, we are putting all New Yorkers in the same boat, moving forward and demonstrating to the rest of the nation that New York will lead on these human rights issues.

I want to recognize some folks in this chamber today. From the Human Rights
Campaign, Marty Rouse is here. From Buffalo we have, from the Stonewall Democrats, the president, Bryan Ball. And from the transgender community, and the vice president of Stonewall,

```
1
     we have Ari Moore.
 2
                  And from Buffalo to the tip of
 3
     Long Island and everywhere in between, we can
 4
     celebrate that New York cares about human rights
 5
     today. I'm proud once again, as never before, to
     stand on this floor and vote in favor of this
 6
 7
     all-important, all-encompassing human rights
 8
     bill.
 9
                  I vote aye, Madam President.
                                                 Thank
10
     you.
                  THE PRESIDENT:
11
                                   Thank you,
12
     Senator Kennedy.
                  Senator Sanders to explain your
13
14
     vote.
15
                  SENATOR SANDERS:
                                     Thank you,
16
     Madam President.
17
                  In a few days we'll celebrate Martin
18
     Luther King's birthday. I want to remind you
19
     that he said that injustice anywhere is a threat
20
     to justice everywhere.
21
                  (Applause from galleries.)
22
                  SENATOR SANDERS:
                                     This is how we
     need to look at this. We need to understand that
23
     it's not going to happen to just one group. If
24
25
     they come for the transgenders in the morning,
```

they're coming for others at night.

So with that understanding and the understanding that there has to be solidarity to beat back all of these folks who talk of hate and finding ways of closing people out all -- all of that stuff needs to be pushed back, and the best that we can do it with is solidarity and an understanding that we are one family, and that's the human family. And if we can just get that, we'd make some difference.

I'm honored to sit next to my esteemed Senator, who's got a rousing hand clap today. Probably may be your last, but that's all right.

(Laughter.)

SENATOR SANDERS: That's all right.

You got it, and it still echoes.

We are going to ensure that this law does not further penalize and criminalize people of color. We're going to do some other things to make sure that we have a fair accounting of all of these things.

My friends, let's do one thing and understand this. By today's action we are saying New York State will not tolerate bullying or

```
1
     violence against any of its residents, anyone.
 2
     No one will be left out this time around, any of
     its residents.
 3
 4
                  It also shows great things about the
 5
     leadership of this conference. Is this the
     second day? It sounds like we moved a million
 6
 7
     things already. A million more to go.
     leadership is doing some incredible things, and
 8
     that should be pointed out.
 9
10
                  And I'm glad to vote for this
     measure to ensure that, again, that everyone
11
12
     understands that a threat to justice anywhere is
     a threat to justice everywhere.
13
14
                  Thank you.
15
                  THE PRESIDENT:
                                    Thank you,
     Senator Sanders.
16
                  Senator Akshar to explain your vote.
17
18
                  SENATOR AKSHAR:
                                    Madam President,
     thank you.
19
20
                  Before I begin, allow me to
21
     congratulate my colleague on something that I
     know he's incredibly passionate about.
22
23
                  I think we can all agree that
     government exists to protect the rights and to
24
25
     protect the safety of all of its citizens. Let
```

me be clear about something. No one in our great state should be discriminated against because of their race, their religion, their sexual preference, their gender or their beliefs. And we should work every day, Republicans and Democrats, to ensure that our laws that we advance do so.

I agree with some of the provisions of this bill and have no doubt that in fact it is well-intentioned. But so often in government, well-intentioned actions have unintended consequences. The bill as currently authored has far too many unintended consequences for me to be able to support it. In my humble opinion, it goes too far and crosses over into the rights of the safety and privacy of other New Yorkers.

The vague language used in this bill leaves open the door for misuse and abuse by individuals that none of us in this body have any intention of protecting. And my fear is is that the broad scope of this bill will leave the door open for child predators and sexual predators to abuse and misuse the law for their own purposes.

(Vocal disagreement.)

THE PRESIDENT: Order. Maintain

```
order in the chambers.
 1
 2
                  SENATOR AKSHAR:
                                    Thank you,
     Madam President.
 3
 4
                  And for that, I cannot support this
 5
     bill.
                  Let me be clear about something.
 6
 7
     And let us all agree that we are in fact all
     God's children. We all agree that no individual
 8
     should ever be discriminated against or feel
 9
10
     unsafe because of their sexual preference, their
     gender, the color of their skin or their religion
11
     or their beliefs.
12
13
                  But it frustrates me and disappoints
     me that a bill aimed at fighting discrimination
14
15
     itself includes the kind of broad, ill-defined
     and irresponsibly drafted language that could be
16
     used to target and discriminate {against} other
17
18
     New Yorkers. Well-intentioned, terribly
     executed. For that, I vote no.
19
20
                  THE PRESIDENT:
                                   Senator May to
21
     explain your vote.
22
                  SENATOR MAY:
                                 Thank you,
     Madam President.
23
                  I'm proud to cast my vote in favor
24
25
     of this bill, and I do it in honor and memory of
```

1 Marthe Reed. Marthe was an American poet and 2 educator. She was my neighbor and friend. And she was the mother of a trans child, the loving 3 mother of a trans child. 4 5 Martha was angry and passionate about a lot of forms of injustice, but GENDA was 6 7 her particular concern. I think her passion may have taken her life last year; she died of a 8 massive stroke during a political meeting. And I 9 10 vowed to myself after that that if I got elected, that one of the first things I would do was push 11 12 to pass GENDA. 13 So I'm very grateful to Senator 14 Hoylman, to the Majority Leader, and to my 15 colleagues for helping me keep that promise. Thank you. 16 17 THE PRESIDENT: Thank you, Senator. 18 Senator Salazar to explain your 19 vote. 20 SENATOR SALAZAR: Thank you, 21 Madam President. 22 I want to thank Senator Hoylman for his leadership on this. I'm thrilled for us to 23 finally act to protect trans and 24 25 gender-nonconforming New Yorkers from

gender-based discrimination. 1 2 I remain concerned about the hate crimes component of the bill. We know that due 3 4 to racial bias in our criminal justice system, 5 New Yorkers of color are disproportionately prosecuted for hate crimes, among other offenses, 6 7 and subjected to enhanced sentencing. 8 This concern has been raised by advocates in my district, and I share their 9 10 concern. I look forward to working with Senator Hoylman and with all of you to find a way 11 12 to address this concern by fighting to eliminate racial bias as well as gender bias in our 13 criminal justice system. 14 15 In this instance, as no new crimes 16 and no new penalties are being created, I'm proud and honored to vote for GENDA and to support the 17 18 human rights of all transgender and nonbinary New Yorkers. 19 20 Thank you. 21 THE PRESIDENT: Thank you, Senator. 22 Senator Jackson to explain your 23 vote. SENATOR JACKSON: 24 Thank you, 25 Madam President.

Good afternoon to my colleagues and people that are present here to witness this historic event in the Senate chambers.

As I indicated to my colleagues
yesterday, I represent Manhattan, all parts of
it, all type of individuals -- young and old,
straight and gay, transgender or not. The bottom
line is that we are all brothers and sisters of
this human race.

And, you know, as an individual growing up in New York City, I've given blood.

I've given, you know, my body; I've signed the back of my driver's license so if I'm brain-dead,

I'm going to use myself to help other people live, and it doesn't matter what your race, color, creed, national origin or sexual orientation.

I rise today also to let you know that on my Twitter account it says, besides who I am and that I'm a district leader, that I'm an advocate for education, I'm an advocate for affordable housing, I'm an advocate -- and the last thing I say, I'm an advocate for GENDA. And so if I did not stand up today to let you know that, then I'm not doing my job, I'm not

advocating for the people that I represent.

And I say to all of you that members of my immediate family and extended family are part of the LGBTQT group. And not only that, I've had staff in the City Council, and currently in the State Senate. And I'm here to represent all of them, and I don't want anyone discriminating against them or anyone else.

And I hear all the time in the news about people discriminating against blacks, against whites, against Jews, against Muslims. Enough of this hate stuff. And that's what this is about today: Giving people the right to say who they are, to be proud of who they are and be able to say that if in fact someone discriminates against me for my job or employment or any other type of expressions of hate, there's a penalty you're going to pay.

But our job is to try to educate people about the differences of all of us in our community. And with that, Madam President, I ask those individuals that have been involved from day one, from 13 years ago, to be involved in this GENDA being passed today, and those that have worked on it, I ask you to raise your hand

```
1
     if you're in the audience. I thank you for your
     advocacy on behalf of not only yourselves, but
 2
     all of the people of out of great state.
 3
 4
                  I vote aye, Madam President.
 5
                  THE PRESIDENT:
                                   Thank you, Senator.
 6
                  Senator Harckham to explain your
 7
     vote.
                  SENATOR HARCKHAM:
 8
                                       Thank you,
     Madam President.
 9
10
                  And I want to congratulate Senator
11
     Hoylman for his great advocacy. And colleagues
12
     who have been here a while, much longer than I, I
     thank you for your efforts and your perseverance.
13
14
                  I just wanted to mention Kristen
15
     Browde, who Senator Hoylman referred to. She is
     a constituent and a friend -- and what a fierce
16
     advocate she is. I congratulate her on this day.
17
18
                  This, ladies and gentlemen, is just
     about basic human rights. We are talking about
19
20
     equal protection under the law for all
     New Yorkers. It's a simple concept, and yet it
21
22
     has not applied to all for far too long.
     out of the affordable housing world, and so many
23
     people have lost housing because they did not
24
25
     have a law like this to protect them from
```

```
1
     discrimination because of their gender identity.
 2
     Nobody should live in fear of losing an
 3
     apartment, a house, a lease because of their
 4
     gender identity.
 5
                  And we heard about the violence
     against our trans brothers and sisters. Higher
 6
 7
     rates of suicide, higher rates of substance
 8
     abuse, higher rates of homelessness.
 9
                  So again, this is about basic human
10
     rights, equal protection under the law. I am
     proud to vote aye. Thank you.
11
12
                  THE PRESIDENT:
                                   Thank you, Senator.
13
                  Senator Biaggi to explain your vote.
14
                  SENATOR BIAGGI:
                                     Thank you,
15
     Madam President.
16
                  Equal treatment is a core of a real
17
     democratic society. I am proud that in our first
18
     week of passing legislation that we are taking on
19
     the long-overdue task of expanding full rights
20
     and equal treatment to the LGBTQ community.
                  I applaud my colleague Senator
21
     Hoylman for your bravery, for your tenacity, for
22
     your perseverance. You represent what I hope to
23
     also have as a State Senator in this conference.
24
25
                  I'm proud to stand with this
```

```
conference. I am proud to vote yes. And I am
 1
 2
     dedicating my vote to my friend and a fierce
 3
     advocate who is right up there, Kristen Browde.
 4
     Thank you for all that you've done for all of us
 5
     to get here today as well.
 6
                  Thank you.
 7
                  THE PRESIDENT:
                                   Thank you, Senator.
                  Senator Skoufis to explain your
 8
9
     vote.
10
                  SENATOR SKOUFIS:
                                     Thank you,
     Madam President.
11
12
                  For the past six legislative
     sessions, across the Capitol in the Assembly I
13
14
     have seen and participated in this debate. We
15
     have passed GENDA year after year after year only
     to see it die on arrival here in the State Senate
16
17
     for the past six years.
18
                  And I am so proud that on our third
     legislative day, our second day of legislative
19
20
     activity here in the State Senate, that we will
     now finally move this bill forward and get it
21
     enacted into law in the next two weeks.
22
                  Let me be clear. In the Assembly
23
     this was always the most, the most disheartening
24
25
     debate to listen to and, quite frankly, offensive
```

```
1
     debate to listen to. Where year after year, I
 2
     had to hear from opponents, and my colleagues who
     strongly believe that this bill is a matter of
 3
 4
     human rights and equality across the state, we
 5
     had to listen to opponents talk about not the
     housing equality in this bill, not the education
 6
 7
     equality in this bill, not the employment
     equality that is in this bill, but talk about
 8
     bathrooms and locker rooms.
 9
10
                  And I had thought we were going to
     get through this debate without talking about
11
     bathrooms and locker rooms. And I'm so
12
     disappointed that we could not quite get through
13
14
     this debate without doing so.
15
                  Putting aside the bizarro
16
     circumstances, this bizarro world where people
     are dressing up as men and women to sneak into
17
18
     locker rooms and bathrooms -- that's just not
19
     happening, ladies and gentlemen. Putting that
20
     aside --
21
                  THE PRESIDENT: Order in the
22
     chamber.
23
                  SENATOR SKOUFIS:
                                     -- to my
24
     opponents who bring this up, are you more
     comfortable with someone who is dressed as a
25
```

```
1
     woman and is a woman in a men's bathroom?
 2
     is crazy. Even if you don't believe, if even if
 3
     you don't respect the gender identity of that
 4
     person, are you more comfortable with someone who
 5
     looks like a woman in a men's bathroom? Come on.
                  This is the right thing to do.
 6
 7
     congratulate Senator Hoylman and all the
 8
     advocates. This is a proud day.
 9
                  THE PRESIDENT:
                                   Thank you, Senator.
10
                  Senator Benjamin to explain your
11
     vote.
12
                  SENATOR BENJAMIN:
                                       Thank you,
     Madam President.
13
14
                  I don't want to repeat what's been
15
     said, but there's a couple of things I want to
16
     say.
                  First of all, I want to thank
17
18
     Senator Hoylman for his leadership, and those
19
     before him.
                  I want to thank our leader, Senator
20
     Andrea Stewart-Cousins, for helping us bring this
21
     bill to the floor so soon.
22
                  I just want to thank all of the
     activists who are here. I cannot imagine what
23
     some have been through. I know my family has had
24
25
     a lot of division because some members of my
```

family were proud to stand forward and say "I am what I am, and everyone needs to accept it."

I know in all of our families we have had these issues. Some of us don't want to talk about it. But the bottom line is we as society have to be clear that every single human has the right to be who they are, they have the right to be respected, and they have the right to live God's true vision for themselves. Whatever it is that anyone wants to do in life, they should be able to do it and they should not feel ashamed of who they are, particularly within their own families.

I am honored today to vote for this bill. It's part of the reason why I am a part of this party, the Democratic Party -- not to get political, I apologize. I believe so strongly that when we stand here and vote for this bill, we are moving society forward in the right way.

And whether you support this bill or you don't support this bill, this will be one of the most historic moments of this New York State Senate, and I'm glad to be here and glad to be a public servant on this very day.

Thank you, Madam President.

Thank you, Senator. 1 THE PRESIDENT: 2 Senator Gounardes to explain your 3 vote. 4 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Thank you, 5 Madam President. I went home yesterday after our long 6 7 marathon session and I thought to myself how proud I was for all the votes that we took in 8 this chamber yesterday. And I thought, you know, 9 10 we have such an ambitious agenda, I'm going to hopefully have many more nights like this where I 11 12 come home and I'm proud. But today will probably take the cake for me in my legislative career in 13 this chamber, because today is an especially 14 15 proud moment for me. 16 I teared listening to my colleague Senator Hoylman give his incredibly beautiful 17 18 remarks. And I think back to my entry into political activism. It was about seven years ago 19 20 in my neighborhood when I went to a rally in support of marriage equality in front of my State 21 Senator's office. And the response that we were 22 met with at that rally was that "Constituents in 23 my district don't give a rat's behind about 24 25 marriage or about civil rights for individuals."

What a difference, what a difference 1 2 today is. I'm proud to be a cosponsor of this 3 legislation. I'm proud that today on my second 4 day of legislative business, one of the first 5 votes I'm casting in this chamber is to reverse that trend that we so long dealt with in our 6 7 state, and to stand here as an ally and to say it's a new day in New York. It's a day when we 8 reaffirm the basic principle that it doesn't 9 10 matter who you are or who you love, you will be 11 treated with equal protection and dignity under the law. How far we've come. 12 13 Today is a proud day. Today is a 14 special day. And I'm so honored to cast my vote 15 in support of this legislation. Thank you. THE PRESIDENT: Thank you, Senator. 16 Senator Carlucci to explain your 17 18 vote. 19 SENATOR CARLUCCI: Thank you, 20 Madam President. 21 And I too want to lend my voice to 22 what we've spoken about today and thank 23 Senator Hoylman for his advocacy and all of the advocates that are here in the chamber and so 24 25 many that I've met throughout the years.

We're fortunate, we've got the 1 2 Rockland Pride Center that's here today and has really been helping so many people in our 3 4 community. 5 But today is about updating the laws, about changing a flaw in the law. The fact 6 7 that we do not treat everyone equally in all the protections of the laws under New York State is 8 9 so wrong. 10 And I'm so proud to be here today, part of this chamber, casting this vote to 11 12 finally have equal protections. Over the years as a Senator and hearing the stories from 13 14 hundreds of people sharing their stories, having 15 that courage to talk about the situations of harassment and discrimination and all of that 16 work, I'm so thankful to all of you for standing 17 18 up, for sharing your stories, to give us the power to have this vote today. 19 20 So I'm honored to cast my vote in favor of this legislation. Thank you, 21 22 Madam President. 23 THE PRESIDENT: Thank you, Senator. 24 Senator Mayer to explain your vote. 25 SENATOR MAYER: Thank you, Madam

Speaker.

I'm proudly casting my vote in the affirmative and want to give thanks to the sponsor and those who were here before him who have been fighting this battle for so long.

But I also want to give special thanks to those in all of our communities, including some of New York's conservative communities, who have stepped forward and entered into civic life, and through that process they have changed the minds of those who years before would never have considered supporting this legislation. They have shown extraordinary bravery by their presence, by their determination to make sure that they were seen as individuals deserving of respect.

One of those people is here from the great City of Yonkers, Angie Powinski. And there are so many others in every one of our communities. And they have changed the minds of others because they have been courageous, they have not hid in fear, and they have forced the rest of the world to recognize that they are our neighbors, our family, and our citizens. And we owe them this bill.

```
And I'm so pleased to cast my vote
 1
     in the affirmative.
 2
 3
                  THE PRESIDENT:
                                   Thank you, Senator.
 4
                  Senator Bailey to explain your vote.
 5
                  SENATOR BAILEY:
                                     Thank you,
     Madam President.
 6
 7
                  I would echo the sentiments of all
     of my colleagues in thanking our leader for
 8
     expeditiously bringing this important bill to the
 9
10
     floor.
11
                  And Senator Hoylman, you are a
     profile in courage, sir. Thank you for your
12
13
     passionate and extremely emotional statements
14
     today.
15
                  I'll be very brief. Senator Sanders
16
     invoked Martin Luther King, Jr., earlier and
     today was his birthday. While it is observed
17
18
     Monday, today, January 15th, is his birthday.
19
     And to quote him again: The time is always right
20
     to do what's right.
21
                  Whether you come from a religious
22
     family like me, where you've grown up in the
     church and you heard nonsensical statements
23
     thrown around which I won't repeat on this floor,
24
25
     to going to law school and speaking to people of
```

```
1
     the LGBTQ community and understanding how they
 2
     live their lives. Understanding that it's not
 3
     much different than a boy from the Bronx. We all
 4
     want the same basic things. Respect and rights,
 5
     that's what it comes down to.
                  And when we pass legislation like
 6
 7
     this, Madam President and my colleagues, the time
     is right to do what's right. I proudly vote aye,
 8
     Madam President, and I salute my colleagues who
 9
10
     do as well.
11
                  THE PRESIDENT:
                                   Thank you, Senator.
12
                  Senator Stavisky to explain your
13
     vote.
14
                  SENATOR STAVISKY:
                                       Thank you,
15
     Madam President.
                  Somebody here earlier today said
16
17
     that one of their proudest moments was sitting on
18
     the floor and voting for marriage equality. I
     agree. And today we're going to pass the GENDA
19
20
     bill and hopefully the ban of conversion therapy.
                  These are monumental changes in
21
     attitudes. We discovered that the world didn't
22
     come to an end when we let people marry whomever
23
     they choose.
24
25
                  And I too congratulate
```

Senator Hoylman. You are absolutely a role 1 model, not just for your two children but for the 2 3 entire community, whether you be straight or gay. 4 And I was thinking, sitting here, 5 what caused this breath of fresh air? It's as though a door opened and a rush of cold air came 6 7 in. And I think a lot of it has to do with our new members. Because we are embarking on a new 8 9 journey. It's going to be a great journey. 10 world's not going to come to an end when we 11 support everybody, we don't exclude anybody. 12 So I vote aye very proudly. 13 you. 14 THE PRESIDENT: Thank you, Senator. 15 Senator Thomas to explain your vote. SENATOR THOMAS: 16 Thank you, Madam President. 17 18 First and foremost, I want to thank the sponsor of the bill. And I want to thank the 19 20 leadership in the Democratic Conference for pushing this forward on the second day here. 21 22 I also want everyone to remember something. We are all human beings, and we 23 should treat each other with respect. I have 24 25 listened to my Republican colleagues here, and I

```
1
     completely disagree with their logic and why they
     oppose this bill.
 2
 3
                  The LGBTQ community, they are not
     asking for special rights. They are asking for
 4
 5
     the same rights that all of us have here in this
 6
     country.
 7
                  I also want to recognize David
 8
     Kilmnick, the president of the LGBTQ Network of
     Long Island, for his leadership in pushing
 9
10
     forward this bill.
                  And I vote yes on this bill as well.
11
12
                  THE PRESIDENT:
                                    Thank you, Senator.
13
                  Senator Gianaris to explain your
14
     vote.
15
                  SENATOR GIANARIS:
                                       Thank you,
16
     Madam President.
17
                  It was my first year as a member of
18
     this body when I got to cast a vote in favor of
19
     marriage equality, and it's one of my proudest.
20
     I actually replaced a member who had previously
21
     voted no, and so I felt a special pride in
22
     helping to make it a reality after the
     unsuccessful vote a few years prior. I know
23
     Tim Kennedy was in a similar circumstance at the
24
25
     time.
```

But it's been eight long years since we've taken up anything relevant to the LGBTQ community since. And I can think of no better example of this new New York Senate, of this new Majority, than that we don't treat people like members of an interest group whose box we check and then tell them "Wait a few years till you get the next thing on your list."

We do things here because it's the right thing to do, because we care about our neighbors and we oppose discrimination. That's what this bill is. It is a simple bill that says people should not be discriminated against. It should have happened a long time ago, but it's happening today. And we can take pride that our new leader, Andrea Stewart-Cousins, is leading the way in making sure that this and other bills can happen.

The next bill is also a great bill, to ban conversion therapy. Another one that should be easy, that other states have done a lot more easily than us.

And so I want to give special thanks to Brad Hoylman, someone who has been fighting this fight year after year and has been a

```
tremendous champion of this community and of this
 1
 2
     state.
                  And say that after eight years it's
 3
 4
     a great bookend. One of my first votes was one I
 5
     was very proud of, to make sure that our brothers
     and sisters in the LGBT community are treated
 6
 7
     equally, and this vote today is doing the same
 8
     thing.
 9
                  It is such a momentous occasion,
10
     Madam President, I would also ask you as I
11
     conclude my remarks to welcome a great leader to
12
     this chamber. He's clean-shaven, so you may not
     recognize him --
13
14
                  (Laughter.)
15
                  SENATOR GIANARIS: -- but the
     Speaker of the City Council, Corey Johnson, has
16
     joined us as well.
17
18
                  (Applause.)
19
                  SENATOR GIANARIS: And I proudly
20
     cast my vote in the affirmative.
21
                  THE PRESIDENT: Thank you, Senator.
22
                  Seeing and hearing no other Senator
23
     that wishes to explain their vote, I call on
     Majority Leader Andrea Stewart-Cousins to close.
24
25
                  SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS:
                                              Thank
```

you, Madam President.

So here we go again. I'm excited.

I'm always excited. But it's just another day of tearing down barriers. So obviously there's great anticipation and there's great energy in this chamber, and it's for the right reasons.

But as Senator Bailey said, I think of it as a great tribute to Dr. King on his birthday. He stood, as you know, for equality, and he wasn't thinking about how that could be packaged. He just understood that essentially it was not okay to say "this person is more equal that that person."

And here we are at a moment on his birthday saying not only his words and respecting his memory, but doing what he would expect us to do.

He always said "Darkness cannot drive out darkness. Light is the only thing that can do that. Hate can't drive out hate, only love does that."

What we are doing today is bringing the light, we're bringing the love, and we're saying that New York State is a place for everyone.

It is, as Senator Gianaris said, a new New York Senate. It's a new day. And like he and many of us here in the chamber, we were proud when we were able to pass marriage equality eight years ago. None of us would have thought that it would take eight years to get to this place. But we're here. We are all here.

And I want to thank Senator Hoylman in particular, because you have been steadfast, you have been patient.

Every day that people -- in one way or another, by not addressing the LGBTQ community, you were being told maybe that you just weren't -- didn't matter. Today this chamber is saying that you matter. That we all matter. It is a great day when we can pass legislation that impacts people's lives, and that we can impact people's futures. We're doing that today.

So when we go out into our districts over the weekend, and I know we will, and we will be with community and we'll be invoking the memory of Dr. King and talking about the importance of his message, especially at a time like this, we can also say that we did something,

```
1
     that that memory is alive in the New York State
 2
     Senate.
 3
                  I vote aye.
 4
                  (Applause.)
 5
                  THE PRESIDENT: Thank you,
     Majority Leader.
 6
 7
                  Announce the results.
 8
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                    Those recorded in
 9
     the negative on Calendar Number 2 are
10
     Senators Akshar, Amedore, Antonacci, Felder,
     Funke, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Jordan,
11
12
     LaValle, O'Mara, Ortt, Ranzenhofer, Ritchie,
     Robach, Serino, Seward, Tedisco and Young.
13
14
                  Ayes, 42. Nays, 19.
15
                  THE PRESIDENT:
                                    The bill is passed.
16
                  (Loud cheering; lengthy standing
     ovation.)
17
18
                  THE PRESIDENT:
                                    Senator Gianaris.
19
                  SENATOR GIANARIS:
                                       Okay.
20
                  (Laughter.)
21
                  SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,
22
     as we take up the remainder of the
     noncontroversial reading of the calendar, I would
23
     remind my colleagues we do have the Governor's
24
25
     presentation to go to at 2 p.m., so I would
```

```
ask -- I know Senator Hoylman is speaking on this
 1
 2
     next bill, and any members that haven't had a
 3
     chance to speak on the one we just passed should
 4
     feel free to speak. But I would ask my remaining
 5
     colleagues to please try and withhold your
     comments, if you just made some, so we can make
 6
 7
     it to the Governor's presentation.
                  THE PRESIDENT:
                                    The Secretary will
 8
9
     read.
10
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                    Senator Hoylman
     moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
11
12
     Assembly Bill Number 576 and substitute it for
     the identical Senate Bill Number 1046, Third
13
     Reading Calendar 1.
14
15
                  THE PRESIDENT:
                                    The substitution is
     so ordered, and the Secretary will read.
16
                                    Calendar Number 1,
                  THE SECRETARY:
17
18
     by Assemblymember Glick, Assembly Bill 576, an
     act to amend the Education Law.
19
20
                  THE PRESIDENT: Read the last
21
     section.
                  THE SECRETARY:
22
                                    Section 4.
                                                This
     act shall take effect immediately.
23
                                    Call the roll.
24
                  THE PRESIDENT:
25
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
```

```
1
                  THE PRESIDENT:
                                    Senator Metzger to
 2
     explain your vote.
 3
                  SENATOR METZGER:
                                      Thank you very
 4
     much, Madam President.
 5
                  I want to thank Senator Hoylman and
     the leader and everyone for their work in the
 6
 7
     passage of both of these important bills.
 8
     fact that we are in the position of having to
     adopt this legislation, the fact that there is a
 9
10
     need for this legislation, demonstrates that the
     passage of GENDA does not mark the end of our
11
12
     work by any means.
13
                  We, all of us, have a lot of work to
     do in our communities, in our schools and in our
14
15
     institutions to model the values enshrined in
16
     that legislation and to educate and elevate
     awareness that discrimination in all forms is
17
18
     unacceptable and will not be tolerated.
19
                  I proudly cosponsor both of these
20
     bills and am committed to doing this work.
21
                  Thank you.
22
                                    Thank you, Senator.
                  THE PRESIDENT:
23
                  Seeing and hearing no other Senators
     that wish to explain their vote, Senator Hoylman
24
25
     to close.
```

1 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Thank you, 2 Madam President. 3 I only have one epic speech in me 4 per lifetime, so I'm going to be very brief, by 5 just thanking my colleagues and in particular, again, Senator Gianaris who was the original 6 7 prime cosponsor of this legislation. We held a forum back on May 14th of 8 2014 with a number of advocates, one of whom is 9 10 here today who I wish to recognize: Mathew Shurka, from the Born Perfect Campaign. Mathew 11 12 has shared his story about the pernicious effect of so-called conversion therapy on him personally 13 14 and on his family structure. 15 Those personal stories, Madam President, have compelled us today to join 16 other states in banning this practice of gay 17 18 conversion therapy. 19 Groups such as the New York State 20 Psychiatric Association, the New York State Psychological Association, the New York State 21 22 Academy of Family Physicians have condemned conversion therapy. We've been helped, though, 23 by organizations like HRC, Rise Out, Equality 24 25 New York, the National Association of Social

```
Workers, Lambda Legal, the LGBT Bar, NYCLU, and
 1
 2
     the New York Transgender Advocacy Group.
                  The bottom line is our children are
 3
 4
     born perfect. That's the tag line of the
 5
     campaign, and that's the message we are sending
     to families and children today.
 6
 7
                  I vote aye, Madam President.
 8
                  THE PRESIDENT:
                                    Thank you, Senator.
 9
                  Announce the results.
10
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Those recorded in
     the negative on Calendar Number 1 are
11
12
     Senators Amedore, Felder, Gallivan and LaValle.
13
                  Ayes, 57. Nays, 4.
14
                  THE PRESIDENT:
                                   The bill is passed.
15
                  (Cheers; applause.)
16
                  THE PRESIDENT:
                                   The Secretary will
17
     read.
18
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 10,
     by Senator Bailey, Senate Print 1190, an act to
19
20
     amend the Judiciary Law.
                  THE PRESIDENT: Read the last
21
     section.
22
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 4.
                                                This
23
     act shall take effect immediately.
24
25
                  THE PRESIDENT:
                                   Call the roll.
```

```
(The Secretary called the roll.)
 1
 2
                  THE PRESIDENT:
                                    Announce the
     results.
 3
 4
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                    Those recorded in
 5
     the negative on Calendar Number 10 are
     Senators Antonacci, Funke, Gallivan, Griffo,
 6
 7
     Helming, Jordan, Kaminsky, Little, O'Mara, Ortt,
     Ranzenhofer, Ritchie, Robach, Seward, Tedisco and
 8
9
     Young.
10
                  Ayes, 45. Nays, 16.
                  THE PRESIDENT:
                                    The bill is passed.
11
12
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 11,
     by Senator Comrie, Senate Print 1191, an act to
13
14
     amend a chapter of the Laws of 2018.
15
                  THE PRESIDENT:
                                    Read the last
16
     section.
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                    Section 5.
                                                This
17
18
     act shall take effect on the same date and in the
     same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2018.
19
20
                  THE PRESIDENT:
                                    Call the roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
21
22
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                    Ayes, 61.
                  THE PRESIDENT: The bill is passed.
23
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 12,
24
25
     by Senator Bailey, Senate Print 1192, an act to
```

```
1
     amend the Economic Development Law.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
 2
 3
     the last section.
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 3.
 4
                                                This
 5
     act shall take effect immediately.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
                                                 Call
 6
 7
     the roll.
 8
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 9
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 61.
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
                                                 The
     bill is passed.
11
12
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 13,
     by Senator Stewart-Cousins, Senate Print 1193, an
13
     act to amend a chapter of the Laws of 2018.
14
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
                                               Read
16
     the last section.
17
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                                This
18
     act shall take effect on the same date and in the
19
     same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2018.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Call
20
21
     the roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
22
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
23
     Announce the results.
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.
```

```
ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
                                                 The
 1
 2
     bill is passed.
 3
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 14,
 4
     by Senator Sanders, Senate Print 1194, an act to
 5
     amend a chapter of the Laws of 2018.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
 6
                                                Read
 7
     the last section.
 8
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                               This
9
     act shall take effect on the same date and in the
10
     same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2018.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Call
11
     the roll.
12
13
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
14
15
     Announce the results.
16
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Those recorded in
     the negative on Calendar Number 14 are
17
18
     Senators Akshar, Ortt and Skoufis.
19
                  Ayes, 58. Nays, 3.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
20
                                                 The
21
     bill is passed.
22
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 15,
     by Senator Bailey, Senate Print 1195, an act to
23
     amend a chapter of the Laws of 2018.
24
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
25
                                                 Read
```

```
the last section.
 1
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
 2
 3
     act shall take effect on the same date and in the
     same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2018.
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Call
 5
     the roll.
 6
 7
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
9
     Announce the results.
10
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
                                                 The
11
     bill is passed.
12
13
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 16,
     by Senator Breslin, Senate Print 1196, an act to
14
15
     amend the Insurance Law.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Read
16
     the last section.
17
18
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                               This
     act shall take effect on the same date and in the
19
20
     same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2018.
21
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Call
22
     the roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
24
25
     Announce the results.
```

```
1
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
 3
     bill is passed.
 4
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 17,
 5
     by Senator Metzger, Senate Print 1263, an act to
     amend the Tax Law and the Alcoholic Beverage
 6
 7
     Control Law.
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
                                                Read
9
     the last section.
10
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 4.
                                               This
     act shall take effect on the same date and in the
11
     same manner as Chapter 522 of the Laws of 2018.
12
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Call
     the roll.
14
15
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
16
17
     Announce the results.
18
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
19
                                                The
20
     bill is passed.
21
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 18,
22
     by Senator Gianaris, Senate Print 1264, an act to
     amend the Civil Practice Law and Rules.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
                                                Hold
24
25
     on. Hold on.
```

```
Senator Gianaris.
 1
 2
                  SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President, I
 3
     mentioned yesterday we were going to be doing a
     lot of this. But let's pause and recognize that
 4
 5
     Senator Metzger just passed her first bill in the
     Senate.
 6
 7
                  (Applause.)
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
                                                 The
9
     Secretary will read.
10
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 18,
     by Senator Gianaris, Senate Print 1264, an act to
11
     amend the Civil Practice Law and Rules.
12
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
                                                 Read
     the last section.
14
15
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 3.
16
     act shall take effect on the same date and in the
     same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2018.
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
                                               Call
     the roll.
19
20
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
21
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
     Announce the results.
22
23
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 61.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
24
                                                 The
25
     bill is passed.
```

```
1
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Calendar Number 19,
 2
     by Senator Funke, Senate Print 1276, an act to
 3
     amend the Education Law.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
 4
                                                 Read
 5
     the last section.
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                                This
 6
     act shall take effect on the same date and in the
 7
 8
     same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2018.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: Call
 9
10
     the roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
11
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
12
13
     Announce the results.
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61.
14
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
                                                 The
16
     bill is passed.
17
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 20,
18
     by Senator Gounardes, Senate Print 1277, an act
     to amend the Tax Law.
19
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
20
                                                 Read
21
     the last section.
22
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 4.
                                                This
     act shall take effect on the same date and in the
23
     same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2018.
24
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
25
```

```
the roll.
 1
 2
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
 3
     Announce the results. Oh, hold on.
 4
 5
                  Senator Ortt to speak.
 6
                  SENATOR ORTT: Yes, thank you,
 7
     Mr. President, I just want to explain my vote.
 8
                  I actually applaud the fact that
     this bill speeds up the expiration of what I feel
 9
10
     is an unbelievably massive giveaway of taxpayer
     dollars to an industry which also happens to
11
12
     overwhelmingly support the Governor and the
     Majority in this house, to the tune of about
13
     $450 million.
14
15
                  So we're giving half a billion
     dollars away to an industry -- and I'm certain
16
     there's jobs that have been created, but I don't
17
18
     know if the return on investment and the jobs
19
     created even come close or that anyone has been
20
     able to tell me that it comes close to justifying
     the $450 million giveaway that we have done in
21
     this state for several years.
22
                  I opposed it when it was carried by
23
     my colleague in this house, and I will continue
24
25
     to oppose it even though it is now carried by the
```

member of the Majority.

So I applaud that we're speeding up the expiration, but I would hope that we would just let it expire, let it die. Let's take that half a billion dollars and put it either to tax cuts, put it to infrastructure spending, or some other use that I think is much more in line with the needs of all New Yorkers.

I vote no, Mr. President.

ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:

Senator Sanders to explain his vote.

SENATOR SANDERS: Yes. The points that my colleague has raised are worthy points and should be looked into. We have an obligation to the people of New York. They are worthy. Every tax dollar that we do should return at least one, if not many more so. So we should look into the points that he has made.

I have been led to believe that this is a good thing for the state. I have other concerns on this. I toured one of the leading film studios, and I saw an incredible lack of diversity there. I did not see the State of New York reflected.

I have shared this with the industry

```
and look forward to continued dialogue with them
 1
 2
     to see what we can do, especially if we're using
     taxpayer dollars to ensure that they're hiring
 3
 4
     the people of New York and not just one group,
 5
     the traditional group.
                  So I believe that they are going to
 6
 7
     look into this. I'm not opposed to looking into
     every part of this to make sure that it is doing
 8
     what it's supposed to do. At this moment, I'm
 9
10
     going to vote yes for this.
                  Thank you.
11
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
12
     Announce the results.
13
                  THE SECRETARY: Those recorded in
14
15
     the negative on Calendar Number 20 are
16
     Senators Akshar, Antonacci, Boyle, Ortt,
     Ranzenhofer and Salazar.
17
18
                  Ayes, 55. Nays, 6.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
19
                                                 The
20
     bill is passed.
21
                  Recognize Senator Gianaris.
22
                  SENATOR GIANARIS: And that was
23
     Senator Gounardes's first bill passage in the
     Senate. Congratulations.
24
25
                  (Applause.)
```

1	ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
2	Congratulations, Senator.
3	The bill is passed.
4	SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
5	on behalf of Senator Andrea Stewart-Cousins, our
6	leader, there are hand-ups related to conference
7	memberships and committee assignments. I ask
8	that they be filed in the Journal.
9	ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: The
10	hand-ups have been received and will be filed in
11	the Journal.
12	SENATOR GIANARIS: And on behalf of
13	Senator Flanagan, Leader Stewart-Cousins also
14	hands up additional committee assignments and
15	conference membership lists that I ask be filed
16	in the Journal.
17	ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: The
18	hand-up is received and will be filed in the
19	Journal.
20	SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
21	is there any further business at the desk?
22	ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA: There
23	is no further business at the desk.
24	SENATOR GIANARIS: That being the
25	case, I move to adjourn until Tuesday,

```
January 22nd, at 2:00 p.m., intervening days
 1
 2
     being legislative days.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT SEPÚLVEDA:
 3
                                                  On
     motion, the Senate stands adjourned until
 4
     Tuesday, January 22nd, at 2:00 p.m., intervening
 5
     days being legislative days.
 6
 7
                   (Whereupon, at 1:04 p.m., the Senate
 8
     adjourned.)
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```