

1 NEW YORK STATE SENATE

2
3
4 THE STENOGRAPHIC RECORD

5
6
7
8
9 ALBANY, NEW YORK

10 June 20, 2018

11 12:28 p.m.

12
13
14 REGULAR SESSION

15
16
17
18 SENATOR JOSEPH GRIFFO, Acting President

19 FRANCIS W. PATIENCE, Secretary

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
3 Senate will come to order.

4 I ask all present to please rise and
5 join with me as we recite the Pledge of
6 Allegiance to our Flag.

7 (Whereupon, the assemblage recited
8 the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: In the
10 absence of clergy today, I ask that you bow your
11 heads in a moment of silent prayer and reflect on
12 Mark, Chapter 13: But about that end day or
13 hour, no one knows, not even the angels in
14 heaven, nor the Son, only the Father.

15 (Laughter.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
17 DeFrancisco.

18 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Would you
19 mind checking with the Father so we know what
20 time we're leaving tonight?

21 (Laughter.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
23 reading of the Journal.

24 THE SECRETARY: In Senate, Tuesday,
25 June 19th, the Senate met pursuant to

1 adjournment. The Journal of Monday, June 18th,
2 was read and approved. On motion, Senate
3 adjourned.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Without
5 objection, the Journal will stand approved as
6 read.

7 Presentation of petitions.

8 Messages from the Assembly.

9 The Secretary will read.

10 THE SECRETARY: On page 14,
11 Senator Ritchie moves to discharge, from the
12 Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill Number 3210A
13 and substitute it for the identical Senate
14 Bill 5860A, Third Reading Calendar 401.

15 On page 19, Senator Hannon moves to
16 discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
17 Assembly Bill Number 1647 and substitute it for
18 the identical Senate Bill 2273, Third Reading
19 Calendar 558.

20 On page 28, Senator Marcellino moves
21 to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
22 Assembly Bill Number 208E and substitute it for
23 the identical Senate Bill 2587E, Third Reading
24 Calendar 785.

25 On page 31, Senator Ritchie moves to

1 discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
2 Assembly Bill Number 10311B and substitute it for
3 the identical Senate Bill 7373C, Third Reading
4 Calendar 849.

5 On page 34, Senator Marchione moves
6 to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
7 Assembly Bill Number 11044 and substitute it for
8 the identical Senate Bill 7946, Third Reading
9 Calendar 947.

10 On page 40, Senator Ranzenhofer
11 moves to discharge, from the Committee on
12 Finance, Assembly Bill Number 2688B and
13 substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
14 3780B, Third Reading Calendar 1099.

15 On page 57, Senator Helming moves to
16 discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
17 Assembly Bill Number 10648 and substitute it for
18 the identical Senate Bill 8522A, Third Reading
19 Calendar 1426.

20 And on page 59, Senator Marcellino
21 moves to discharge, from the Committee on
22 Education, Assembly Bill Number 10472 and
23 substitute it for the identical Senate Bill 8331,
24 Third Reading Calendar 1463.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The

1 substitutions are so ordered as read and
2 presented.

3 Messages from the Governor.
4 Reports of standing committees.
5 Reports of select committees.
6 Communications and reports of state
7 officers.

8 Motions and resolutions.

9 Senator DeFrancisco.

10 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: I'd like to
11 call an immediate meeting of the Rules Committee
12 in Room 332.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There
14 will be an immediate meeting of the Rules
15 Committee in Room 332.

16 The Senate will stand at ease.

17 (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease
18 at 12:31 p.m.)

19 (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at
20 12:54 p.m.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
22 Senate will return to order.

23 Senator DeFrancisco.

24 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Yes, is there
25 a report of the Rules Committee at the desk?

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There is
2 a Committee on Rules report at the desk.

3 The Secretary will read.

4 THE SECRETARY: Senator Flanagan,
5 from the Committee on Rules, reports the
6 following bills:

7 Senate Print 321A, by Senator
8 Robach, an act to amend the Education Law;

9 Senate 710, by Senator Carlucci, an
10 act to amend the Mental Hygiene Law;

11 Senate 794A, by Senator Alcantara,
12 an act to amend the Education Law;

13 Senate 858, by Senator Young, an act
14 to amend the Executive Law;

15 Senate 994C, by Senator Bonacic, an
16 act to amend the General Municipal Law;

17 Senate 1036, by Senator Carlucci, an
18 act to amend the Tax Law;

19 Senate 1518A, by Senator Avella, an
20 act authorizing;

21 Senate 2356A, by Senator Parker, an
22 act to amend the Public Service Law;

23 Senate 2484, by Senator Golden, an
24 act to amend the Uniform Commercial Code;

25 Senate 2651, by Senator Klein, an

1 act to amend the General Business Law;
2 Senate 2932A, by Senator Dilan, an
3 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law;
4 Senate 3665, by Senator Klein, an
5 act to amend the Insurance Law;
6 Senate 3891, by Senator Funke, an
7 act to amend the Parks, Recreation and Historic
8 Preservation Law;
9 Senate 4207, by Senator Dilan, an
10 act to authorize;
11 Senate 5055, by Senator Kennedy, an
12 act to amend the Highway Law;
13 Senate 5096C, by Senator Young, an
14 act to amend the State Finance Law;
15 Senate 5481A, by Senator Murphy, an
16 act to direct;
17 Senate 5663, by Senator Parker, an
18 act to amend the Social Services Law;
19 Senate 5743A, by Senator Marcellino,
20 an act to grant;
21 Senate 5887A, by Senator Golden, an
22 act to amend the Tax Law;
23 Senate 5970, by Senator Klein, an
24 act to amend the Insurance Law;
25 Senate 6285, by Senator Golden, an

1 act to amend the Tax Law;
2 Senate 6325, by Senator Golden, an
3 act to amend the Tax Law;
4 Senate 6405, by Senator Bonacic, an
5 act to amend the Tax Law;
6 Senate 6603, by Senator Hannon, an
7 act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law;
8 Senate 6647B, by Senator Helming, an
9 act to amend the Tax Law;
10 Senate 6730B, by Senator Lanza, an
11 act granting;
12 Senate 6814B, by Senator Young, an
13 act to authorize;
14 Senate 6948A, by Senator Hannon, an
15 act to amend the Public Health Law;
16 Senate 7891, by Senator Little, an
17 act to amend the Executive Law;
18 Senate 7957A, by Senator Marchione,
19 an act to amend the Environmental Conservation
20 Law;
21 Senate 8207, by Senator Hannon, an
22 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law;
23 Senate 8225, by Senator Ranzenhofer,
24 an act to amend the Public Service Law;
25 Senate 8298, by Senator Gallivan, an

1 act to amend the Domestic Relations Law;
2 Senate 8375, by Senator Gallivan, an
3 act to amend the Tax Law;
4 Senate 8392A, by Senator Hannon, an
5 act to amend the Public Health Law;
6 Senate 8441B, by Senator Phillips,
7 an act to amend the Insurance Law;
8 Senate 8602A, by Senator Griffo, an
9 act to amend the Public Service Law;
10 Senate 8638, by Senator Gallivan, an
11 act to amend the Not-For-Profit Corporation Law;
12 Senate 8667, by Senator Amedore, an
13 act to amend the Racing, Pari-Mutuel Wagering and
14 Breeding Law;
15 Senate 8699, by Senator Gallivan, an
16 act to amend the Not-For-Profit Corporation Law;
17 Senate 8781, by Senator Phillips, an
18 act to amend the Education Law;
19 Senate 8808A, by Senator Tedisco, an
20 act to amend the Public Authorities Law;
21 Senate 8845A, by Senator Akshar, an
22 act creating;
23 Senate 8870A, by Senator Ritchie, an
24 act to amend the Executive Law;
25 Senate 8877, by Senator Tedisco, an

1 act to amend the Racing, Pari-Mutuel Wagering and
2 Breeding Law;

3 Senate 8878, by Senator LaValle, an
4 act in relation to;

5 Senate 8894, by Senator Little, an
6 act to amend the Executive Law;

7 Senate 8924, by Senator Seward, an
8 act to amend the Insurance Law;

9 Senate 8942, by Senator Hannon, an
10 act to amend Part B of Chapter 57 of the Laws of
11 2018;

12 Senate 8992, by Senator Flanagan, an
13 act to amend the Education Law;

14 Senate 9012, by Senator Persaud, an
15 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law;

16 Senate 9040, by Senator Gallivan, an
17 act to amend the Tax Law;

18 Senate 9049, by Senator Marchione,
19 an act to amend the Highway Law;

20 Senate 9050, by Senator Marchione,
21 an act to amend the Highway Law;

22 Senate 9051, by Senator Marchione,
23 an act to amend the Highway Law;

24 Senate 9073, by Senator Felder, an
25 act to amend the Education Law;

1 Senate 9103A, by Senator LaValle, an
2 act authorizing;

3 Senate 9104, by the Senate Committee
4 on Rules, an act to amend Chapter 88 of the Laws
5 of 2009;

6 And Senate 9105, by Senator Ortt, an
7 act to amend the General Business Law.

8 All bills reported direct to third
9 reading.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
11 DeFrancisco.

12 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Move to
13 accept the report of the Rules Committee.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: All in
15 favor of accepting the Committee on Rules report
16 say aye.

17 (Response of "Aye.")

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Opposed?

19 (No response.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
21 Rules Committee report is accepted and before the
22 house.

23 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Can we go
24 back to messages from the Assembly.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: We will

1 return to messages from the Assembly.

2 The Secretary will read.

3 THE SECRETARY: Senator Young moves
4 to discharge, from the Committee on Finance,
5 Assembly Bill Number 1789 and substitute it for
6 the identical Senate Bill 858, Third Reading
7 Calendar 2028.

8 Senator Lanza moves to discharge,
9 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill Number
10 8411B and substitute it for the identical
11 Senate Bill 6730B, Third Reading Calendar 2051.

12 Senator Parker moves to discharge,
13 from the Committee on Energy and
14 Telecommunications, Assembly Bill Number 2892A
15 and substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
16 2356A, Third Reading Calendar 2032.

17 Senator Murphy moves to discharge,
18 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
19 Number 7402A and substitute it for the identical
20 Senate Bill 5481A, Third Reading Calendar 2041.

21 Senator Little moves to discharge,
22 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
23 Number 9886 and substitute it for the identical
24 Senate Bill 7891, Third Reading Calendar 2054.

25 Senator Marchione moves to

1 discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
2 Assembly Bill Number 10070A and substitute it for
3 the identical Senate Bill 7957A, Third Reading
4 Calendar 2055.

5 Senator Ranzenhofer moves to
6 discharge, from the Committee on Corporations,
7 Authorities and Commissions, Assembly Bill
8 Number 7183A and substitute it for the identical
9 Senate Bill 8225, Third Reading Calendar 2057.

10 Senator Gallivan moves to discharge,
11 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
12 Number 10795 and substitute it for the identical
13 Senate Bill 8298, Third Reading Calendar 2058.

14 Senator Hannon moves to discharge,
15 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
16 Number 10675 and substitute it for the identical
17 Senate Bill 8392A, Third Reading Calendar 2060.

18 Senator Griffo moves to discharge,
19 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
20 Number 11099 and substitute it for the identical
21 Senate Bill 8602A, Third Reading Calendar 2062.

22 Senator Gallivan moves to discharge,
23 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
24 Number 10534 and substitute it for the identical
25 Senate Bill 8638, Third Reading Calendar 2063.

1 Senator Gallivan moves to discharge,
2 from the Committee on Corporations, Authorities
3 and Commissions, Assembly Bill Number 10336A and
4 substitute it for the identical Senate Bill 8699,
5 Third Reading Calendar 2065.

6 Senator Tedisco moves to discharge,
7 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
8 Number 10756A and substitute it for the identical
9 Senate Bill 8808A, Third Reading Calendar 2067.

10 Senator Akshar moves to discharge,
11 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
12 Number 10774A and substitute it for the identical
13 Senate Bill 8845A, Third Reading Calendar 2068.

14 Senator Ritchie moves to discharge,
15 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
16 Number 10744A and substitute it for the identical
17 Senate Bill 8870A, Third Reading Calendar 2069.

18 Senator Little moves to discharge,
19 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
20 Number 11128 and substitute it for the identical
21 Senate Bill 8894, Third Reading Calendar 2072.

22 Senator Seward moves to discharge,
23 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
24 Number 11043 and substitute it for the identical
25 Senate Bill 8924, Third Reading Calendar 2073.

1 Senator Persaud moves to discharge,
2 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
3 Number 2620A and substitute it for the identical
4 Senate Bill 9012, Third Reading Calendar 2076.

5 Senator Gallivan moves to discharge,
6 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
7 Number 11203 and substitute it for the identical
8 Senate Bill 9040, Third Reading Calendar 2077.

9 And Senator Marchione moves to
10 discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
11 Assembly Bill Number 11001A and substitute it for
12 the identical Senate Bill 9049, Third Reading
13 Calendar 2078.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
15 substitutions are so ordered as read and
16 presented before the house.

17 Senator DeFrancisco.

18 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Are you done?
19 (Laughter.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Yes.

21 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: All right.

22 In that case, since we're -- can we go back to
23 motions and resolutions.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: We will
25 return to motions and resolutions.

1 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Can we take
2 up, simultaneously, two previously adopted
3 resolutions by Senator Marchione, 5803 and 5786,
4 read the titles of both only, and call on
5 Senator Marchione to speak.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
7 Secretary will read both titles.

8 THE SECRETARY: Legislative
9 Resolution Number 5803, by Senator Marchione,
10 congratulating the Ichabod Crane Varsity Softball
11 Team and Head Coach Tracy Nytransky upon the
12 occasion of capturing the 2018 New York State
13 Public High School Athletic Association Softball
14 Class B Championship on June 9, 2018.

15 Legislative Resolution Number 5786,
16 by Senator Marchione, congratulating
17 scholar-athlete Ama Boham upon the capturing of
18 the New York State New York State Public High
19 School Athletic Association Girls Track and Field
20 Hurdles Championship on June 9, 2018.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Can I
22 have some order, please.

23 Senator Marchione.

24 SENATOR MARCHIONE: Thank you,
25 Mr. President.

1 I rise to honor the outstanding
2 effort by scholar-athlete Ama Boham for winning
3 the Girls Track and Field 100-Meter Hurdles
4 New York State Championship this year. In fact,
5 Ama broke her own school record, with a
6 blistering 14.69 time.

7 Ama, would you please rise?

8 Last year Ama became the first
9 female track athlete in school history to win a
10 New York State championship, and this year became
11 the only two-time winner.

12 In addition to being an outstanding
13 athlete, Ama is also an outstanding student who
14 maintains a 99 average. This dedication to
15 excellence is shared by her teammates on the
16 Girls Track Team, who have the highest scholastic
17 average of any sports team at the Ichabod Crane
18 School.

19 I want to congratulate Ama and ask
20 her to remain standing while I talk about the
21 Ichabod Crane Varsity Softball Team.

22 They had outstanding efforts this
23 year at the Ichabod Crane Varsity Softball Team,
24 and their coach Tracy Nytransky -- if she would
25 stand, please -- for capturing the second

1 Softball Class B New York State Championship.

2 I would also like to congratulate
3 all of the dedicated team members, and if you
4 would please stand -- their coach, Coach
5 Nytransky, and her assistants, if you would
6 stand, Bob Wheeler and Chris Saccento -- on a
7 successful season. Your 22 wins with only one
8 loss is a result of your hard work, your talent,
9 and your teamwork.

10 In addition to being dedicated to
11 the game you love, more importantly, you are
12 dedicated to each other as a team, and that's a
13 bond that will never be broken.

14 I'd like to just tell a little bit
15 about what happened at the last game. They were
16 coming down from the Town of Moreau, and at
17 Exit 12 they were met with people from the
18 fire company and the ambulance corps and the
19 police department from their area, with an escort
20 that escorted them home. It speaks so highly of
21 the place that they come from, from being able to
22 be so supported.

23 I said to them a little earlier when
24 I had an opportunity to meet them myself, that
25 I've never seen so many students come down with

1 so many parents. That success that these girls
2 have had is a direct result of their talent, of
3 course; their love for the game; but also for the
4 selfless dedication of wonderful parents.

5 So I congratulate all of you on a
6 great season. And again, I congratulate Ama
7 Boham. Congratulations to you.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Upon
9 behalf of the Senate --

10 (Standing ovation.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
12 Congratulations, Ama and the Ichabod Crane
13 Softball Team. Welcome and best of luck.

14 Senator DeFrancisco.

15 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Yes,
16 Mr. President. Could you please recognize
17 Senator Sanders for a very brief introduction.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
19 Sanders.

20 SENATOR SANDERS: Thank you,
21 Mr. President. That word is usually not used
22 with me, but I'm going to prove that it is true
23 today.

24 I have been blessed to have two
25 young interns who have been working,

1 international interns who have come to learn of
2 the American system, and they picked the best
3 office to learn of it. And I want to introduce
4 to this great body Andres Fuentes, from Chile,
5 and Ms. Katrin Yeung -- you can stand up -- from
6 that faraway country of Canada.

7 So I want this body just to
8 recognize them, and I want to thank you for
9 working hard to learn of this system and to do
10 wonderful things. Thank you for your hard work.

11 Mr. President, if the body would
12 recognize them, I'd appreciate it.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: We
14 recognize you and thank you for such an
15 outstanding stewardship under the great mentor
16 Senator Sanders. So we hope it was rewarding for
17 you, and we appreciate all the work you've done.

18 So let's give them a round of
19 applause.

20 (Standing ovation.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
22 DeFrancisco.

23 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Thank you,
24 Senator Sanders, for being true to your word.

25 Can we now take up the

1 noncontroversial reading of the active list.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
3 Secretary will read.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 185, by Senator Golden, Senate Print 2531, an act
6 to repeal Chapter 7 of Title 11 of the
7 Administrative Code of the City of New York.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 246, by Senator Golden, Senate Print 27, an act
20 to amend the Criminal Procedure Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
24 act shall take effect on the 90th day.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Announce
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
6 Calendar 246, those recorded in the negative are
7 Senators Comrie, Gianaris, Hoylman, Kavanagh,
8 Krueger, Montgomery, Parker, Peralta, Sanders and
9 Sepúlveda. Also Senator Alcantara in the
10 negative.

11 Ayes, 49. Nays, 11.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
13 is passed.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 378, by Senator Ritchie, Senate Print 7164A, an
16 act to amend the Education Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 8. This
20 act shall take effect immediately.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill

1 passes.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 401, substituted earlier by Member of the
4 Assembly Ortiz, Assembly Print 3210A, an act to
5 require.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
15 passes.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 558, substituted earlier by Member of the
18 Assembly Galef, Assembly Print 1647, an act to
19 amend the Real Property Tax Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
23 act shall take effect on the 90th day.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

3 Senator Akshar recorded in the negative.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 670, by Senator Alcantara, Senate Print 7348, an
8 act to amend the Agriculture and Markets Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
12 act shall take effect on the 180th day.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
17 Marchione to explain her vote.

18 SENATOR MARCHIONE: Yeah, I think
19 that this is a really good bill, except that I
20 think that if 25 percent of our food is being
21 disposed of and the supermarkets are being
22 required -- which is a really good thing -- to
23 help feed the poor, I also think that that bill
24 should have come with a tax credit so that the
25 supermarkets that are giving the food away, it

1 gets them benefits for the monies they've spent
2 on those foods that they're not able to sell and
3 that they're generous enough to give way.

4 So my vote on this is no just for
5 that reason. I think it should have been a
6 two-prong approach where the supermarkets could
7 get some benefit for the generosity that they
8 would have.

9 Thank you, Mr. President.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
11 Marchione to be recorded in the negative.

12 Announce the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58. Nays, 2.
14 Senators Helming and Marchione recorded in the
15 negative.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 785, substituted earlier by Member of the
20 Assembly Lupardo, Assembly Print 208E, an act to
21 amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
6 is passed.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 849, substituted earlier by Member of the
9 Assembly Wallace, Assembly Print 10311B, an act
10 directing.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
14 act shall take effect on the 90th day.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Announce
19 the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
21 Calendar 849, those recorded in the negative are
22 Senators Alcantara, Avella, Bailey, Benjamin,
23 Carlucci, Comrie, Dilan, Hamilton, Hoylman,
24 Kavanagh, Krueger, Mayer, Montgomery, Peralta,
25 Persaud, Savino, Sepúlveda, Serrano, Stavisky and

1 Stewart-Cousins. Also Senator Gianaris. Also
2 Senator Klein. Also Senator Breslin. Also
3 Senator Sanders.

4 Ayes, 36. Nays, 24.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
6 is passed.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 947, substituted earlier by the Assembly
9 Committee on Rules, Assembly Print 11044, an act
10 to amend the General Municipal Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
14 act shall take effect immediately.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
19 Calendar 947, those recorded in the negative are
20 Senators Avella, Comrie, Hoylman and Krueger.
21 Also Senator Gianaris.

22 Ayes, 55. Nays, 5.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
24 passes.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1099, substituted earlier by Member of the
2 Assembly Steck --

3 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Lay it aside
4 temporarily.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
6 will be laid aside temporarily.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 1426, substituted earlier by Member of the
9 Assembly Stirpe, Assembly Print 10648, an act to
10 amend the Education Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
14 act shall take effect January 1, 2020.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
20 passes.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1463, substituted earlier by Member of the
23 Assembly Lifton, Assembly Print 10472, an act to
24 amend Chapter 352 of the Laws of 2005.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1819, by Senator Golden, Senate Print 1760, an
12 act to amend the Penal Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
16 act shall take effect on the 90th day.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Announce
21 the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
23 Calendar 819, those recorded in the negative are
24 Senators Comrie, DeFrancisco, Kavanagh, Little
25 and Montgomery.

1 Ayes, 55. Nays, 5.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
3 passes.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 1822, by Senator Golden, Senate Print 2746, an
6 act to amend the Insurance Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.
15 Senator Seward recorded in the negative.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
17 passes.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 1863, by Senator Golden, Senate Print 7901, an
20 act to amend the Insurance Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
4 Calendar 1863, those recorded in the negative are
5 Senators Comrie, Hoylman, Krueger and Sepúlveda.
6 Also Senator Kavanagh. Also Senator Avella.
7 Also Senator Sanders.

8 Ayes, 53. Nays, 7.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
10 passes.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 1964, by Senator Murphy, Senate Print 8501B, an
13 act to amend the Arts and Cultural Affairs Law.

14 SENATOR KLEIN: Lay it aside.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Lay it
16 aside.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 1991, by Senator Hoylman, Senate Print 9039B, an
19 act to amend Chapter 592 of the Laws of 1998.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
4 passes.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 2024, by Senator O'Mara, Senate Print 9106, an
7 act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
17 passes.

18 Senator DeFrancisco, that concludes
19 the noncontroversial reading of the active list,
20 with one temporary lay-aside and one
21 lay-it-aside.

22 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Thank you,
23 Mr. President.

24 We also have another calendar,
25 Senate Supplemental Calendar 58A, from the Rules

1 Committee this morning. I would like to first
2 take one bill and read it noncontroversial, and
3 take that up first. And that's Calendar 2083,
4 Rules, Print Number 9104, which is on the last
5 page of the supplemental calendar.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: We will
7 refer the members to Senate Supplemental
8 Calendar 58A, which was the Rules report that was
9 reported earlier, to Calendar Number 2083.

10 And the Secretary will read.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 2083, by the Senate Committee on Rules --

13 SENATOR KLEIN: Lay it aside,
14 please.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Can I
16 just read it first.

17 THE SECRETARY: -- Senate Print
18 9104, an act to amend Chapter 88 of the Laws of
19 2009.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
21 is laid aside.

22 Senator DeFrancisco, that completes
23 the noncontroversial reading of the bill that you
24 have presented for the house from the
25 supplemental calendar.

1 (Pause.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
3 DeFrancisco.

4 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Yes,
5 Mr. President. That bill has been laid aside.

6 Now we'd like to go to the
7 noncontroversial reading of the entire Senate
8 Supplemental Calendar 58A.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Okay, the
10 Secretary will begin reading, noncontroversial,
11 Senate Supplemental Calendar 58A.

12 Read.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 2025, by Senator Robach, Senate Print 321A, an
15 act to amend the Education Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
19 act shall take effect immediately.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
25 passes.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 2026, by Senator Carlucci, Senate Print 710, an
3 act to amend the Mental Hygiene Law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
7 act shall take effect on the 120th day.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Roll
9 call.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.
12 Senator Krueger recorded in the negative.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
14 passes.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 2027, by Senator Alcantara, Senate Print 794A, an
17 act to amend the Education Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 THE SECRETARY: In relation to

1 Calendar 2027, those recorded in the negative are
2 Senators Akshar, Gallivan, Helming, Ortt and
3 Serino. Also Senator Murphy.

4 Ayes, 54. Nays, 6.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
6 is passed.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 2028, substituted earlier by Member of the
9 Assembly Peoples-Stokes, Assembly Print 1789, an
10 act to amend the Executive Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
14 act shall take effect immediately.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.
19 Senator Sanders recorded in the negative.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
21 passes.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 2029, by Senator Bonacic, Senate Print 994C, an
24 act to amend the General Municipal Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 10. This
3 act shall take effect on the 180th day.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 SENATOR KLEIN: Lay it aside.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Lay it
9 aside.

10 The Secretary will continue.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 2030, by Senator Carlucci, Senate Print 1036, an
13 act to amend the Tax Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
23 passes.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 2031, by Senator Avella, Senate Print 1518A, an

1 act authorizing.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
5 act shall take effect immediately.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
11 passes.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 2032, substituted earlier by Member of the
14 Assembly Dilan, Assembly Print 2892A, an act to
15 amend the Public Service Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
19 act shall take --

20 SENATOR KLEIN: Lay it aside for
21 the day.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Lay this
23 one aside for the day.

24 The Secretary will continue,
25 Calendar 2033.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 2033, by Senator Golden, Senate Print 2484, an
3 act to amend the Uniform Commercial Code.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
7 act shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
13 passes.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 2034, by Senator Klein, Senate Print 2651, an act
16 to amend the General Business Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
20 act shall take effect on the 60th day.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill

1 passes.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 2035, by Senator Dilan, Senate Print 2932A, an
4 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
8 act shall take effect January 1, 2019.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
14 passes.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 2036, by Senator Klein, Senate Print 3665, an act
17 to amend the Insurance Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 13. This
21 act shall take effect on the 180th day.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
2 passes.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 2037, by Senator Funke, Senate Print 3891, an act
5 to amend the Parks, Recreation and Historic
6 Preservation Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
10 act shall take effect on the 60th day.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
15 Calendar 2037, those recorded in the negative are
16 Senators Hoylman, Kavanagh and Krueger.

17 Ayes, 57. Nays, 3.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 2038, by Senator Dilan, Senate Print 4207, an act
22 to authorize.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This

1 act shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
6 Calendar 2038, those recorded in the negative are
7 Senators Akshar, Bonacic and O'Mara.

8 Ayes, 57. Nays, 3.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
10 passes.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 2039, by Senator Kennedy, Senate Print 5055, an
13 act to amend the Highway Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
23 passes.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 2040, by Senator Young, Senate Print 5096C, an

1 act to amend the State Finance Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
5 act shall take effect on the first of January.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
11 passes.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 2041, substituted earlier by Member of the
14 Assembly Pretlow, Assembly Print 7402A, an act to
15 direct.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
19 act shall take effect immediately.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
25 passes.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 2042, by Senator Parker, Senate Print 5663, an
3 act to amend the Social Services Law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
7 act shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
13 passes.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 2043, by Senator Marcellino --

16 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Lay it aside
17 temporarily.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Temporary
19 lay-aside.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 2044, by Senator Golden, Senate Print 5887A, an
22 act to amend the Tax Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 8. This

1 act shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 57. Nays, 3.
6 Senators Akshar, Krueger and Ortt recorded in the
7 negative.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
9 passes.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 2045, by Senator Klein, Senate Print 5970, an act
12 to amend the Insurance Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
16 act shall take effect on the 180th day.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
22 passes.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 2046, by Senator Golden, Senate Print 6285, an
25 act to amend the Tax Law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
2 last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
4 act shall take effect on the 180th day.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.
9 Senator Montgomery recorded in the negative.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 2047, by Senator Golden, Senate Print 6325, an
14 act to amend the Tax Law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
18 act shall take effect immediately.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
23 Calendar 2047, those recorded in the negative are
24 Senators Gianaris, Hoylman, Krueger, Montgomery
25 and Parker.

1 Ayes, 55. Nays, 5.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
3 passes.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 2048, by Senator Bonacic, Senate Print 6405, an
6 act to amend the Tax Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.
15 Senator Krueger recorded in the negative.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
17 passes.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 2049, by Senator Hannon, Senate Print 6603, an
20 act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

21 SENATOR O'MARA: Lay it aside.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: We'll do
23 a temporary lay-aside on the bill.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 2050, by Senator Helming, Senate Print 6647B, an

1 act to amend the Tax Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
5 act shall take effect immediately.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.
10 Senator Krueger recorded in the negative.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 2051, substituted earlier by Member of the
15 Assembly Castorina, Assembly Print 8411B, an act
16 granting.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
20 act shall take effect immediately.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill

1 passes.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 2052, by Senator Young, Senate Print 6814B, an
4 act to authorize.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
8 act shall take effect immediately.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 2053, by Senator Hannon, Senate Print 6948A, an
17 act to amend the Public Health Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
21 act shall take effect on the 90th day.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
2 is passed.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 2054, substituted earlier by Member of the
5 Assembly Bichotte, Assembly Print 9886, an act to
6 amend the Executive Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
10 act shall take effect on the 90th day.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
16 passes.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 2055, substituted earlier by Member of the
19 Assembly McDonald, Assembly Print 10070A, an act
20 to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 2056, by Senator Hannon, Senate Print 8207, an
8 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
12 act shall take effect immediately.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 2057, substituted earlier by Member of the
21 Assembly Zebrowski, Assembly Print 7183A, an act
22 to amend the Public Service Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This

1 act shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 2058, substituted earlier by Member of the
10 Assembly Paulin, Assembly Print 10795, an act to
11 amend the Domestic Relations Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
15 act shall take effect immediately.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58. Nays, 2.
20 Senators O'Mara and Ranzenhofer recorded in the
21 negative.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
23 passes.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 2059, by Senator Gallivan, Senate Print 8375, an

1 act to amend the Tax Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
5 act shall take effect on the first day of a
6 quarterly sales tax period.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
12 passes.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 2060, substituted earlier by Member of the
15 Assembly Gottfried, Assembly Print 10675, an act
16 to amend the Public Health Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
20 act shall take effect immediately.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill

1 is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 2061, by Senator Phillips, Senate Print 8441B, an
4 act to amend the Insurance Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 8. This
8 act shall take effect January 1, 2020.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
13 Phillips to explain her vote.

14 SENATOR PHILLIPS: Thank you,
15 Mr. President.

16 I rise today because I really
17 believe that this is landmark legislation for
18 families in New York State, and I'm truly honored
19 to have this measure before us.

20 You know, I met a family yesterday
21 with a 2-year-old little boy who literally, this
22 woman and this family -- she dropped out of
23 medical school and spent \$160,000 of her own
24 money to fulfill a dream that this family so
25 desperately wanted.

1 New York State employees have these
2 benefits. There is absolutely no reason why all
3 of New York State shouldn't have these benefits.

4 However, bills like this do not just
5 come before us, and this is legislation that has
6 taken years to come by. And I would be remiss
7 not giving Senator Savino a huge shout-out,
8 because this is legislation that she worked on
9 and graciously handed over to my office several
10 months ago.

11 So Senator Savino, thank you very
12 much for your hard work, because this wouldn't
13 have happened without you.

14 To my cosponsor Senator Little, I
15 know Senator Helming and many others in my
16 conference, thank you for hearing me out and
17 thank you for supporting families here in
18 New York State.

19 I'll be voting aye.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
21 Phillips in the affirmative.

22 Senator Savino to explain her vote.

23 SENATOR SAVINO: Thank you,
24 Mr. President.

25 I want to thank Senator Phillips

1 also for her work on this issue. As she pointed
2 out, it's a bill that I have carried, a similar
3 bill, but recognizing how important it is that we
4 bring New York State into the modern era when it
5 comes to fertility services for struggling
6 families.

7 Senator Phillips and I and others
8 have seen how families have come forward after
9 spending almost their entire life savings in an
10 effort to have a healthy child. And the only
11 thing standing in their way, oftentimes, is our
12 outdated insurance laws. So I want to thank her
13 for her work, and I know that we have more work
14 to do to get the Assembly to pass a companion
15 bill.

16 And one other point I would like to
17 make. What's lost oftentimes is young people who
18 suddenly find themselves facing a life
19 threatening illness -- and now, because of modern
20 science, they're able to preserve their
21 fertility, so a round of chemotherapy and
22 radiation doesn't rob them of the ability to have
23 a family. This bill also covers the ability to
24 preserve your fertility for the future.

25 It's not done yet. Senator

1 Phillips, I thank you for your work on it, but we
2 have more work to do. And hopefully we will get
3 it done for families all across New York State.

4 Thank you.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
6 Krueger.

7 SENATOR KRUEGER: I think Senator
8 Hoylman had his hand up first.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: I'm going
10 by what I was instructed from your desk.

11 I can call on Senator Hoylman. Go
12 ahead, Senator Krueger yields.

13 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Thank you. Thank
14 you, Senator Krueger. Thank you, Mr. President.

15 I'm rising to oppose this bill. I
16 appreciate the intentions of the sponsor. When
17 the sponsor talks about families, though, it
18 omits a particular kind of family, my family, an
19 LGBT family. In fact, I have knowledge that when
20 this bill was negotiated before us, the provision
21 that would provide nondiscrimination to LGBT
22 families was expressly struck.

23 And I find that, Mr. President,
24 unacceptable, and I vote nay.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator

1 Hoylman is to be recorded in the negative.

2 Senator Krueger now to explain her
3 vote.

4 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you,
5 Mr. President.

6 So this is a one-house bill. And I
7 think it's an imperfect bill. And I'm still not
8 sure how I'm voting. The reasons that I want to
9 make clear here today is it's a one-house bill,
10 so all the women who are hoping that we will
11 accomplish something for them before we leave
12 session, it isn't going to be possible.

13 But with all due respect about all
14 the good things in the bill, as Senator Hoylman
15 already highlighted, it requires you to first
16 have had intercourse for 12 months and not gotten
17 pregnant to be eligible for these services, so
18 that's pretty much writing off the LGBTQ
19 community right away. And New York State should
20 not be having discriminatory healthcare policy.

21 It also chooses to put a cap in,
22 which, if you follow the ACA law, it's not clear
23 we're supposed to provide caps for anything.
24 Lifetime caps are no longer allowed in insurance
25 for other things, so I have concern about putting

1 a lifetime cap in in this situation.

2 Particularly because if you talk to people, you
3 learn that \$50,000 in IVF may not go that far.

4 It also -- excuse me, Mr. President.

5 It also assumes that insurance companies can ask
6 you about a preexisting condition because they
7 can require you let them know your history of
8 infertility and treatments prior to receiving
9 this insurance, I assume to calculate your
10 lifetime cap. And I get that they would have to
11 ask that to calculate a lifetime cap. But then
12 we're walking into the territory of reviewing
13 someone's preexisting condition, and I know
14 that's not allowed in New York State law, even
15 before the ACA.

16 So I struggle because I so want us
17 to accomplish it. But I think that I will have
18 to be a no today, hoping that we can resolve all
19 these things with a good two-house bill in the
20 future.

21 Thank you, Mr. President.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
23 Krueger in the negative.

24 Senator Akshar to explain his vote.

25 SENATOR AKSHAR: I just want to

1 make a point very quickly if I can.

2 Sometimes one-house bills start a
3 conversation and foster compromise in bringing
4 people together. So I know Senator Krueger
5 raises a lot of points, a lot of issues that she
6 thinks need to be addressed, but nonetheless I
7 think we should still be advancing this
8 particular conversation.

9 I do just want to make one point
10 very clear, if I may. Senator LaValle, in 2002,
11 passed a very similar bill as well. So I think
12 there are a lot of people in this great house
13 over the course of time that have carried the
14 torch on this -- Senator Savino, Senator Phillips
15 and Senator LaValle.

16 So I vote aye.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
18 Akshar in the affirmative.

19 Senator Jacobs to explain his vote.

20 SENATOR JACOBS: Thank you,
21 Mr. President.

22 I want to thank the sponsor and
23 everybody that's worked on this. I also
24 appreciate the discussion of the issues that were
25 raised just now by Senator Hoylman and others.

1 As was mentioned, this bill is a
2 one-house bill, so it is more likely than not
3 that it will not be progressing into law at this
4 point in time. I also have introduced a bill
5 that was a narrower bill in regards to
6 individuals that are in cancer treatment and
7 their ability to preserve eggs for the ability in
8 the future to have children.

9 But I am listening -- with the
10 issues and concerns that were raised by
11 Mr. Hoylman, Senator Hoylman, I would say I'm
12 going to vote aye today, knowing that this is a
13 one-house bill, with hopes that we can work
14 together and make this more of an all-inclusive
15 bill to achieve the goal for anybody who wants to
16 have a child.

17 Thank you.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
19 Jacobs in the affirmative.

20 Announce the result.

21 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
22 Calendar 2061, those recorded in the negative are
23 Senators Amedore, DeFrancisco, Dilan, Gallivan,
24 Hoylman, Kavanagh, Krueger and Ortt. Also
25 Senator Kaminsky.

1 Ayes, 51. Nays, 9.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
3 passes.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 2062, substituted earlier by the Assembly
6 Committee on Rules, Senate Print 11099, an act to
7 amend the Public Service Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11 act shall take effect on the same date and in the
12 same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2018.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
18 passes.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 2063, substituted earlier by Member of the
21 Assembly Paulin, Assembly Print 10534, an act to
22 amend the Not-For-Profit Corporation Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This

1 act shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
7 passes.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 2064, by Senator Amedore, Senate Print 8667, an
10 act to amend the Racing, Pari-Mutuel Wagering and
11 Breeding Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
15 act shall take effect immediately.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
22 Calendar 2064, those recorded in the negative are
23 Senators Bonacic, Dilan, Hannon, Hoylman, Krueger
24 and Marcellino.

25 Ayes, 54. Nays, 6.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
2 passes.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 2065, substituted earlier by Member of the
5 Assembly Paulin, Assembly Print 10336A, an act to
6 amend the Not-For-Profit Corporation Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58. Nays, 2.
15 Senators Kaminsky and Ranzenhofer recorded in the
16 negative.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
18 passes.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 2066, by Senator Phillips, Senate Print 8781, an
21 act to amend the Education Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
6 passes.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 2067, substituted earlier by Member of the
9 Assembly Steck, Assembly Print 10756A, an act to
10 amend the Public Authorities Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
14 act shall take effect immediately.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
20 passes.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 2068, substituted earlier by Member of the
23 Assembly Lupardo, Assembly Print 10774A, an act
24 creating.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
9 passes.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 2069, substituted earlier by Member of the
12 Assembly Peoples-Stokes, Assembly Print 10744A,
13 an act to amend the Executive Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
23 passes.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 2070, by Senator Tedisco, Senate Print 8877, an

1 act to amend the Racing, Pari-Mutuel Wagering and
2 Breeding Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
12 passes.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 2071, by Senator LaValle, Senate Print 8878, an
15 act in relation to.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
19 act shall take effect immediately.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
25 passes.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 2072, substituted earlier by the Assembly
3 Committee on Rules, Assembly Print 11128, an act
4 to amend the Executive Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
8 act shall take effect immediately.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
14 passes.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 2073, substituted earlier by the Assembly
17 Committee on Rules, Assembly Print 11043, an act
18 to amend the Insurance Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
22 act shall take effect on the first of January.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
3 passes.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 2074, by Senator Hannon, Senate Print 8942, an
6 act to amend Part B of Chapter 57 of the Laws of
7 2018.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
17 passes.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 2075, by Senator Flanagan, Senate Print 8992, an
20 act to amend the Education Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 14. This
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
4 Kaminsky to explain his vote.

5 SENATOR KAMINSKY: So this is one
6 of the critical issues we've been dealing with.
7 I have about 13,000 public school teachers in my
8 district.

9 Teachers just want to be able to
10 teach again; we could all agree on that. They're
11 tired of their paperwork, they're tired of having
12 to teach to a test. The fun of their job and the
13 fun of our students learning has been taken out
14 of their classroom.

15 So why can't we just deal with that
16 today and get that done and not attach it to
17 anything else and hold it hostage to a political
18 process? We all want to make points, we all want
19 to get things done, but we've got like seven
20 hours to go and we're not going to resolve one of
21 these major issues.

22 So let's just cut this loose, let's
23 get APPR out of the way, let's let our teachers
24 teach again, and let's move on with it. I vote
25 in the negative.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
2 Kaminsky in the negative.

3 Announce the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
5 Calendar 2075, those recorded in the negative are
6 Senators Alcantara, Avella, Bailey, Benjamin,
7 Breslin, Brooks, Carlucci, Comrie, Dilan,
8 Gianaris, Hoylman, Kaminsky, Kavanagh, Kennedy,
9 Krueger, Mayer, Montgomery, Persaud, Sanders,
10 Sepúlveda, Serrano and Stavisky. Also
11 Senator Hamilton. Also Senator Peralta. Also
12 Senator Stewart-Cousins.

13 Ayes, 35. Nays, 25.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
15 passes.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 2076, substituted earlier by Member of the
18 Assembly Perry, Assembly Print 2620A, an act to
19 amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
4 passes.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 2077, substituted earlier by the Assembly
7 Committee on Rules, Assembly Print 11203, an act
8 to amend the Tax Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
12 act shall take effect on the first day of the
13 sales tax quarterly period.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 2078, substituted earlier by Member of the
22 Assembly Ashby, Assembly Print 11001A, an act to
23 amend the Highway Law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
25 last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
2 act shall take effect immediately.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
8 passes.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 2079, by Senator Marchione, Senate Print 9050, an
11 act to amend the Highway Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
15 act shall take effect immediately.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
21 passes.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 2080, by Senator Marchione, Senate Print 9051, an
24 act to amend the Highway Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
9 passes.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 2081, by Senator Felder, Senate Print 9073, an
12 act to amend the Education Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
16 act shall take effect immediately.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.
21 Senator Mayer recorded in the negative.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
23 passes.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 2082, by Senator LaValle, Senate Print 9103A, an

1 act authorizing.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 14. This
5 act shall take effect immediately.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Can I
10 have some order in the chamber to call the roll.

11 Senator Stavisky to explain her
12 vote.

13 SENATOR STAVISKY: Thank you,
14 Mr. President.

15 This bill was introduced Sunday, and
16 it's very similar to a bill that we considered in
17 the Higher Education Committee some weeks ago.
18 For some reason, a new bill was introduced
19 covering many of the same points.

20 And very briefly, I vote no because
21 I'm concerned with privatizing, through this
22 company Staffco, a public institution.

23 Secondly, I'm troubled by the
24 pitting of classified workers versus unclassified
25 workers, because it's very difficult to work --

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Excuse
2 me, Senator Stavisky.

3 Can I have some order in the house,
4 please.

5 Senator Stavisky.

6 SENATOR STAVISKY: -- because it's
7 very difficult to work side by side with people
8 in different job classifications.

9 I raised these issues in committee.
10 They have not been resolved in the new bill.
11 There is a ten-year period of time between the
12 date of enactment and the time period when this
13 has to be finalized, when the lease has to be
14 signed. We have 10 years to study this, not a
15 few days.

16 And for that reason, Mr. Speaker,
17 and my concerns with transparency, I vote no.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
19 Stavisky to be recorded in the negative.

20 Announce the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
22 Calendar 2082, those recorded in the negative are
23 Senators Alcantara, Avella, Benjamin, Comrie,
24 Krueger, Peralta, Sanders, Savino, Sepúlveda and
25 Stavisky.

1 Ayes, 50. Nays, 10.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 2084, by Senator Ortt, Senate Print 9105, an act
6 to amend the General Business Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
10 act shall take effect on the 180th day.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
18 Calendar 2084: Ayes, 59. Nays, 1. Senator
19 Krueger recorded in the negative.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
21 still passes.

22 Senator DeFrancisco, that concludes
23 the noncontroversial reading of today's Senate
24 Supplemental Calendar 58A.

25 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Thank you,

1 Mr. President.

2 Would you now recognize Senator
3 Flanagan for an introduction.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
5 Flanagan for the purposes of an introduction.

6 Again, we have a lot of guests in
7 the chamber and a lot of conversations taking
8 place, so I'd ask if you could take the
9 conversations outside the chamber and if we can
10 give our attention to the members as they're
11 speaking.

12 Senator Flanagan.

13 SENATOR FLANAGAN: Thank you,
14 Mr. President.

15 We have with us today, on the last
16 day of session, we have special guests, one of
17 whom is a gentleman I've known for many years who
18 always has a beaming smile; many of us know him
19 in this room. That's Mr. Bobby Kumar, who hails
20 from Nassau County.

21 We are also joined by Mr. Chendra
22 and Mr. Chatwal, who are honored guests here.
23 One of these gentlemen serves in an elected
24 capacity in India, and we are delighted to have
25 you with us here today, as you can see how we

1 deliberate. Based on how the day may unfold, we
2 may be seeking your guidance and your counsel in
3 terms of how to run this place.

4 But I know Senator Marcellino has
5 been kind enough to speak with you gentlemen.
6 And for our members, these gentleman are part of
7 an entity that does all kinds of work around the
8 world, but they happen to be working in
9 Sullivan County, I think in Monticello in
10 particular, in Senator Bonacic's district.

11 And they are wholly into a wide
12 variety of things, including healthcare and
13 something that I only know about in the abstract,
14 and that's yoga in particular. So they're
15 opening up a very large facility.

16 Mr. President, I want to just add my
17 voice and welcome these folks here to our Senate
18 chamber.

19 And if you would call on
20 Senator Bonacic.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
22 Bonacic.

23 SENATOR BONACIC: I would like to
24 join with Senator Flanagan to welcome you here
25 today to the chambers.

1 I know tomorrow is a very special
2 day. Tomorrow will be cutting the ribbon for a
3 resort that they have built in Sullivan County,
4 and there will be a visual from the prime
5 minister of India calling to congratulate these
6 people for the hotel that they've built. And
7 they've built hotels all over the world for
8 wellness, health. This would be a high-end
9 hotel. And they're coming to Sullivan County,
10 which is a great place.

11 And profit's not a dirty word, I
12 want you to know that, and we wish you much
13 success and good health. Thank you for being
14 here.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Thank
16 you, Senator Bonacic.

17 We want to express, to Mr. Kumar and
18 our guests that are here today, a very warm
19 welcome. We appreciate you joining us today and
20 extend our best wishes to all of you.

21 Let's recognize them, please.

22 (Standing ovation.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
24 DeFrancisco.

25 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Yes,

1 Mr. President, can we go back to the active list.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: We will
3 return to the active list.

4 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: And call up a
5 bill that was laid aside, Calendar 1964, by
6 Senator Murphy, and do the noncontroversial
7 reading.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: We will
9 do the controversial reading --

10 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Controversial
11 reading.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: -- of
13 Senator Murphy's bill, Senate Bill 8501B.

14 The Secretary will ring the bell.
15 And the Secretary will read.

16 And again, I know we want to get
17 some pictures and everything, but we're going to
18 have to have the members -- Senator Gianaris,
19 you're going to ask for an explanation? Oh,
20 okay. As soon as we find Senator Hoylman, then
21 we will begin the questioning, Senator Murphy.

22 I'm going to let the Secretary read
23 the bill, okay, as we're waiting. The Secretary
24 will please read.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1964, by Senator Murphy, Senate Print 8501B, an
2 act to amend the Arts and Cultural Affairs Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
4 Murphy, Senator Hoylman has asked for an
5 explanation. Or do you have questions?

6 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Just questions.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Just
8 questions.

9 Senator Murphy, do you yield to
10 Senator Hoylman?

11 SENATOR MURPHY: Yes,
12 Mr. President.

13 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Thank you,
14 Mr. President. Thank you to the sponsor.

15 Would the sponsor yield to a few
16 questions? I think the answer is yes. I wanted
17 to ask first -- as we know, the Pope visited
18 New York City in 2015 and made sure that tickets
19 were free. Why doesn't the sponsor's bill
20 address the issue of free tickets being sold on
21 the secondary market?

22 SENATOR MURPHY: Sure. Through
23 you, Mr. President.

24 Last year I sat here and let
25 everybody know that I would be doing an awful lot

1 of work to come back with something very
2 comprehensive. This piece of legislation is
3 probably the most comprehensive piece of
4 legislation that has come through Government
5 Operations and Investigations in probably the
6 past 10 years.

7 What this bill does is it addresses
8 speculative tickets, that has been agreed upon by
9 our Attorney General and the Assembly. It
10 addresses a little bit of the bots violation, if
11 there is one, and what kind of penalty would
12 happen. It also addresses disclosure -- prices,
13 fees and charges -- to make sure people know
14 exactly what they're paying for. It also
15 addresses the primary to secondary site transfer
16 and what you need to do to disclose to a consumer
17 that he or she is being redirected to a secondary
18 site.

19 It also addresses the URL fraud. So
20 if you go to someone's website -- let's use the
21 example of the Yankees -- you expect to be on the
22 official website of the New York Yankees. At
23 times right now, you are not, you are actually on
24 a secondary website.

25 This also addresses a 5 percent

1 paperless ballpark pass for people that would
2 like to be able to afford to go to a ball game,
3 with regards to a specific number of games that
4 would be addressed and to a capacity of 30,000
5 people or more for a venue.

6 It also -- it puts in a three-year
7 extender. Because the definition of insanity is
8 doing this thing over and over and over and
9 expecting different results, and that's all we've
10 been doing for the past few years, is one-year
11 extenders. So we put in a three-year extender.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
13 Hoylman.

14 SENATOR HOYLMAN: I don't think the
15 sponsor answered my question about why the
16 sponsor's bill does not address free tickets
17 being sold on the secondary market.

18 SENATOR MURPHY: So through you,
19 Mr. President, there was an awful lot of work
20 that has been put into this over the past year.
21 And between the Attorney General's office and the
22 Assembly and myself and any other person that has
23 come in, it was never addressed. It was never
24 brought up.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Perhaps,

1 Senator Hoylman, if you did it through a rap,
2 like Senator Squadron used to, we could --

3 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Don't tempt me.

4 SENATOR MURPHY: Through you,
5 Mr. President, I promise I won't be rapping.

6 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Would the sponsor
7 continue to yield?

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
9 sponsor yields.

10 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Does the sponsor
11 acknowledge that there is a problem with the sale
12 of free tickets, like to the Pope, on the
13 secondary market?

14 SENATOR MURPHY: Sure. Through
15 you, Mr. President, absolutely.

16 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Will the sponsor
17 continue to yield?

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
19 sponsor yields.

20 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Does the sponsor
21 recognize the issue that happened back in 2012
22 with the concert to benefit the victims of
23 Hurricane Sandy, where tickets were sold for
24 charity but resold on the open market, as much as
25 \$70,000 for a pair? My question is, why doesn't

1 the sponsor's bill address the issue of tickets
2 sold for charitable purposes on the secondary
3 market?

4 SENATOR MURPHY: Through you,
5 Mr. President. Between the Attorney General's
6 office, the Assembly and myself, it was never
7 brought to our attention.

8 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Will the sponsor
9 continue to yield?

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
11 sponsor yields.

12 SENATOR MURPHY: Of course.

13 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Through you,
14 Mr. President. Did the sponsor have any public
15 hearings on this legislation or any solicitation
16 of public feedback before the bill was drafted?

17 SENATOR MURPHY: Through you,
18 Mr. President. I would just like to, for the
19 record, let Senator Hoylman know that we've had
20 meetings, close to 20 different meetings, which
21 he's been invited to and has never shown up.

22 So I've met with Vivid Seats, we've
23 had a meeting with them. I've had a meeting with
24 StubHub. I've had a meeting with Ticketmaster.
25 I've had a meeting with Broadway.com. I've had a

1 meeting with the Yankees. I've had a meeting
2 with MSG. I've had a meeting with Broadway
3 League. I've had a meeting with All Shows. I've
4 had a meeting with producers. I've had a meeting
5 with brokers. I've had a meeting with
6 Tickets.net. I've had a meeting with Field
7 Entertainment.

8 Those are just some of the meetings
9 that we've had collaboratively with a bunch of
10 people that unfortunately I guess the Senator
11 never had time to come.

12 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Point of personal
13 privilege.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: What is
15 your point of privilege?

16 SENATOR HOYLMAN: For the record,
17 the Senator never invited me. And if he can
18 produce any record, email, invitation, transcript
19 to that effect, I'd be very eager to see that.

20 But would the sponsor continue to
21 yield?

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
23 Murphy, would you continue to yield?

24 SENATOR MURPHY: Yes,
25 Mr. President.

1 SENATOR HOYLMAN: The sponsor just
2 told us all the private interests with whom he
3 met, ranging from StubHub to Madison Square
4 Garden to the Yankees.

5 Did the sponsor meet with any
6 members of the public about a bill that is
7 supposed to protect consumers and fans?

8 SENATOR MURPHY: Meeting with the
9 public? I met with as many people as I can, like
10 I said I was going to do, Senator Hoylman.

11 This is the bill that we've been
12 working on for the past year. And to come in --
13 let's -- let's -- to get an email or let me say a
14 text message Friday morning at 11:27 from you
15 with regards to having a bill that you would like
16 to have introduced, I thought was just too much.

17 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Would the sponsor
18 continue to yield?

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
20 sponsor yields.

21 And I'll ask the gentlemen to
22 continue to stay focused on the bill-in-chief.

23 Senator Murphy yields. Do you want
24 to add something?

25 SENATOR MURPHY: Yeah, through you,

1 just that --

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
3 Hoylman, do you object?

4 SENATOR MURPHY: We've also
5 reviewed the AG's report that was -- that had a
6 lot of public complaints that were involved in it
7 too.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
9 Hoylman.

10 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Does the sponsor
11 think that a consumer should know the established
12 value of a ticket for which they are purposing --
13 for example, if you go onto StubHub, should a
14 consumer be able to tell what the face value of a
15 ticket is like a consumer can do in the United
16 Kingdom if they go on StubHub to, say, purchase
17 tickets for a concert?

18 SENATOR MURPHY: Through you,
19 Mr. President, I think that is -- I think that
20 addresses that in our bill with the disclosure.

21 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Would the sponsor
22 continue to yield?

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
24 sponsor yields.

25 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Can the sponsor

1 explain why we do not have, yet, paperless
2 ticketing in the State of New York but one
3 organization managed to get a provision that
4 would allow the sale of paperless membership
5 passes for certain sports venues?

6 SENATOR MURPHY: Oh, absolutely.
7 Through you, Mr. President. So this is such a
8 big issue that this is kind of a pilot program
9 that we're trying to do for the State of New
10 York. That's why we tried to narrow it in, to
11 make sure that as one lever goes forward, the
12 other levers are not going back. And that's why
13 it's written very specific, for 5 percent, venues
14 over 30,000 people.

15 SENATOR HOYLMAN: On the bill,
16 Mr. President.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
18 Hoylman on the bill.

19 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Thank you to the
20 sponsor, although I believe there was a
21 misrepresentation of the facts. We can discuss
22 that later.

23 I will say that the answers I
24 received today were more than insufficient, they
25 were confusing and didn't address the questions

1 at hand. For example, there is no requirement
2 that purchasers, consumers or fans see the face
3 value. I think the sponsor would have you
4 believe otherwise.

5 Yes, the provision does now permit
6 or require that sales taxes and other charges be
7 revealed, which is a positive step. But it does
8 not require the face value. So if you as a
9 consumer purchase a ticket on the secondary
10 market, you won't know what the original price
11 is. You could be being ripped off. If the event
12 is canceled, you don't know what you're going to
13 get in terms of a return. That's one of
14 many provisions.

15 And I think the problem,
16 Mr. President, was identified by the sponsor. He
17 met with the wrong people. He met with the
18 lobbyists and the industry. He met with the
19 people who have the most money at stake. But
20 we -- the consumers, the fans and everyday
21 New Yorkers -- I'm sorry to say were left out.

22 This is it. This is our big chance
23 at reform for the next three years. To finally
24 stand up for fans and everyday New Yorkers
25 against those big corporate interests.

1 I'm really disappointed we didn't do
2 more. Especially for giving the ticket industry
3 three years of status quo.

4 We should not throw away our shot at
5 fixing our ticket laws.

6 We should not throw away our shot!

7 Hey yo, for our music fans,

8 They're young, scrappy and hungry

9 And we should not throw away our
10 shot!

11 You shouldn't need a degree from
12 Kings College,

13 To understand our ticket laws, but
14 dag, I'm amazed and astonished,

15 The problem is we got too many
16 lobbyists we must acknowledge,

17 But what about the fans -- seems
18 they gotta holler

19 With every word, they could drop
20 knowledge!

21 But we had no hearings, or public
22 debate -- instead we left it to the back room,
23 the back room, which we hate,

24 The back room, that was shrouded,

25 There might not have been smoke but

1 it sure was cloudy!

2 So I'm not surprised the fans got
3 ripped, with all that money at the table they was
4 bound to be gypped,

5 When the language of our laws has to
6 be written by the people who profit, our system
7 is sickened!

8 So fans won't see face value in this
9 law of the land, fans won't get holdbacks or free
10 tickets banned,

11 So if you wanna see the Pope, you're
12 gonna pay a grand,

13 Hey'd you read about the Sandy
14 concert on the newsstand?

15 On the other hand --

16 Right, there's some good things in
17 the bill, stuff we had to do,

18 Oh yeah, we helped out the Yankees,
19 but what about you?

20 At the end of the day, this much
21 seems true: The lobbyists ate our lunch -- and
22 the fans' lunch, too!

23 Mr. President, we should not throw
24 away our shot. I vote no.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: I don't

1 know if you've made America's Got Talent, Senator
2 Hoylman.

3 (Laughter.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: But I
5 still like Squadron's rap.

6 Senator Lanza, then Senator Krueger.

7 SENATOR LANZA: Mr. President, on
8 the bill.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
10 Lanza on the bill.

11 SENATOR LANZA: Mr. President,
12 could I get a refund on that ticket for this
13 concert we just --

14 (Laughter.)

15 SENATOR LANZA: No, I thought it
16 was a great job, Senator Hoylman.

17 Mr. President, I've worked on this
18 issue for a number of years. I recall some of
19 the debates and conversations I had with my
20 colleague Senator Squadron and Senator Hoylman.

21 I want to thank Senator Murphy,
22 though. I think he really has given this an
23 exhaustive analysis. And you heard all the
24 entities and folks that he talked to -- who know
25 the business, who know the industry and how it

1 works.

2 And to suggest that there hasn't
3 been a public debate really couldn't be further
4 from the truth. This is an issue that has been
5 discussed in the public arena for more than a
6 decade. We've read about it, we've heard about
7 it, people have talked about it. And everyone
8 has been free, as part of our responsibility in
9 this body, to engage with whomever we thought can
10 help move the ball with respect to this issue.

11 Here's the bottom line. Senator
12 Murphy I don't think could have brought forward a
13 more clear and more robust piece of legislation
14 dealing with this issue. Senator Murphy, if I
15 didn't understand the issue before, I understand
16 it so much better thanks to your explanation.
17 And I think the people back home can begin to
18 understand.

19 There are some, in spite of what
20 they might say, who would like us to go back to
21 the time when I was growing up on Staten Island
22 when only the well-heeled, the well-connected,
23 the wealthy, someone who had a parent or an aunt
24 who worked in a corporation, could have access to
25 a Yankee game or to a concert. You know, the

1 truth of the matter is, without this legislation,
2 we're going back to the days when only the rich
3 can attend an event.

4 This legislation -- and granted,
5 this is a complicated issue, so there's no one
6 piece of legislation that could fully address all
7 the issues involved. But without this
8 legislation, you can be clear and certain of one
9 thing, that unless you're very wealthy or know
10 someone who's very wealthy or connected, you're
11 going to be shut out again. All across New York
12 City or all across the State of New York, you're
13 going to be shut out.

14 It's already tough for average folks
15 to be able to sit in a box seat at Yankee
16 Stadium. They can't afford it. But with the new
17 market, the way it works, and with legislation
18 like this, at least -- at least -- there will be
19 accessibility for average people across the
20 state. And that's the way it ought to work.

21 Senator Murphy, I thank you for your
22 work.

23 Mr. President, I'll be supporting
24 this legislation.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator

1 Krueger.

2 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you.

3 I also want to say congratulations
4 to my colleague Brad Hoylman for his improving
5 rap style. I thought you did very well today.
6 We still have some ringers in the conference, and
7 we could all take some more lessons from them --
8 Jamaal Bailey.

9 But I thought you did an excellent
10 job today, and I think you were better -- better
11 than Senator Squadron --

12 (Response from Senators.)

13 SENATOR KRUEGER: -- who's no
14 longer here to stand up and debate me. So
15 there's no one to go "Point of personal
16 privilege."

17 (Laughter.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
19 Krueger on the bill.

20 SENATOR KRUEGER: Here's why -- on
21 the bill, Mr. President.

22 It was not exhaustive, because as
23 was just pointed out, consumer groups weren't
24 talked to. The research couldn't have been
25 exhaustive, because apparently Senator Murphy

1 never even heard about the problems of free
2 tickets for charities being sold on secondary
3 markets for enormous amounts of money. So how
4 exhaustive could this research have been?

5 It wasn't exhaustive because we
6 still don't have the transparency that is
7 critical for this to work. I hear Senator
8 Lanza's concerns about wanting to make sure that
9 everybody has a chance. I agree. But that means
10 transparency. You will not be able to see the
11 face value of the ticket when you end up going
12 and buying it for perhaps four or five times the
13 face value on a secondary market.

14 Now, you might decide it's worth it
15 to you to want to pay four or five times, but you
16 should at least know what the face value is.
17 Because if for some reason you need to get a
18 return on that or they cancel, that's all you're
19 getting, the face value, not the four or five
20 times you paid for it.

21 And if we believe that we want to
22 make sure there's equitable opportunity for all
23 to get these tickets, we're not addressing the
24 fundamental problem that the primary venue
25 doesn't have to let you know what percent of the

1 tickets are actually going on sale to the public.

2 And the research by the AG's office,
3 which if -- hopefully Senator Murphy read this
4 detailed report -- shows that you can have up to
5 50 percent, 60 percent of the tickets being held
6 or distributed on presale bases, and so those are
7 never even open to the public to have an
8 opportunity to buy.

9 And so at least we ought to be
10 letting people know, when they are in search of a
11 ticket to a Justin Bieber concert or a -- I'm
12 just looking. Let's see, I'm neither a rapper or
13 that much of a concertgoer, but I have all the
14 names here -- anyone else's concerts that you
15 used to be able to know that actually only
16 30 percent of the seats are being made available
17 to you through the primary market, because
18 70 percent of them have disappeared some other
19 way, and so you'll only be able to buy those on a
20 more expensive secondary market.

21 So are there improvements in this
22 bill compared to what we've had? Yes. Have we
23 addressed the consumer protection problems that
24 we will continue to have in New York State? No.
25 Do I want to go backwards? No, I want to go

1 forward. This isn't getting us far enough
2 forward.

3 I'm voting no. I'm hoping that
4 another year, another opportunity for us to get
5 it right.

6 Thank you, Mr. President.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Seeing
8 and hearing no other Senator that wishes to be
9 heard, debate is closed. The Secretary will ring
10 the bell.

11 Senator DeFrancisco.

12 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: It's my
13 understanding the debate is complete?

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
15 debate is closed. The Secretary has rang the
16 bell.

17 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Well, stop
18 ringing the bell, because by unanimous consent
19 we're going to take this up on the
20 noncontroversial calendar for a vote.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: So
22 without objection, we will return to the
23 noncontroversial reading.

24 The Secretary will read the last
25 section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 11. This
2 act shall take effect immediately.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
7 Young to explain her vote.

8 SENATOR YOUNG: Thank you,
9 Mr. President.

10 I rise to commend Senator Murphy for
11 his diligence on this issue. He has spent hours
12 and hours of time coming up with a solution. And
13 everything that you need to know about this
14 legislation is included in the bill memo, which I
15 will read from.

16 "Everyday New Yorkers are denied
17 fair access to tickets by resellers who distort
18 the market, obscure information that allows for
19 better purchasing decisions, and gouge fans with
20 excessive prices and fees. In 2016, the Office
21 of New York State Attorney General released a
22 report exposing the unscrupulous practices of the
23 industry and making it clear that reforms are
24 critical to protect consumers. This bill reforms
25 the system to create a fairer and more

1 transparent marketplace. It allows New Yorkers a
2 fair shot at fairly priced tickets."

3 That's what this legislation does,
4 so let's be clear on that. And thank you,
5 Senator Murphy, for your leadership, for your
6 diligence, for your hard work in coming up with a
7 solution that benefits the fans.

8 I will be voting aye, Mr. President.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
10 Young in the affirmative.

11 Announce the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
13 Calendar 1964, those recorded in the negative are
14 Senators Dilan, Golden, Hoylman, Krueger,
15 Persaud, Sanders, Sepúlveda and Serrano --

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
17 Murphy to explain his vote.

18 SENATOR MURPHY: Oh, I just wanted
19 to say thank you. And thank you to my colleagues
20 for voting on this.

21 I'd like to also thank Assemblyman
22 O'Donnell, who I've worked with, and the
23 Attorney General's office, after going through
24 their report.

25 But I was not going to allow another

1 one-year extender to happen, because that
2 happened back in 2011, 2012, 2013, 2014, 2015.
3 My good buddy Senator Lanza here finally picked
4 the ball up and got bots done. We had another
5 extender last year, 2017, when I stood in front
6 of you all and I said I'm going to work
7 diligently on this and we're going to come up and
8 we're going to have a comprehensive bill. And
9 this is it.

10 This right here, this gives access
11 to the everyday people. It helps the everyday
12 person in order for them to try and get into a
13 play -- which I've talked to Broadway League and
14 Broadway.com. I've exhausted a number of
15 different avenues to make sure that we tried to
16 get this right.

17 It is very, very convoluted. This
18 is what we've gotten so far, and I'm very proud
19 of this bill. And I'd just like to thank my
20 colleagues for voting on this.

21 Thank you, Mr. President.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
23 Murphy in the affirmative.

24 Results.

25 THE SECRETARY: Also Senator Parker

1 in the negative.

2 Ayes, 51. Nays, 9.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
4 passes.

5 Senator DeFrancisco.

6 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Can we now go
7 to the Supplemental Calendar 58A and take up
8 previously laid aside Calendar Number 2083,
9 controversial.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
11 Secretary has rang the bell, and we will now read
12 2083.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 2083, by the Senate Committee on Rules,
15 Senate Print 9104, an act to amend Chapter 88 of
16 the Laws of 2009.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Seeing
18 and hearing no Senator that wishes to be heard,
19 debate is closed and the Secretary will ring the
20 bell.

21 Read the last section.

22 Senator DeFrancisco, this is on a
23 controversial reading. Do we have your request
24 to convert to noncontroversial?

25 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: No. No. I

1 would like it to be -- excuse me, I would like it
2 to be controversial. And I would like to answer
3 Senator Seward's request for an explanation.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Okay. So
5 we are on a controversial reading. The debate
6 has been closed.

7 The Secretary will read the last
8 section, and then members will have an
9 opportunity to explain their votes.

10 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: I would like
11 to give an explanation of the bill.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Debate
13 has been closed, but we'll reopen it, if that's
14 what you're requesting.

15 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: I think
16 that's what I said earlier.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Okay.
18 Senator Seward, what is your question?

19 SENATOR SEWARD: I would like an
20 explanation.

21 (Laughter.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
23 Seward would like an explanation.

24 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: You know,
25 this bill is very --

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
2 Rules, would you like to speak?

3 (Laughter.)

4 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: I wish
5 Senator Squadron was here, but -- he would have
6 given a better rap, and he would have brought
7 that up.

8 The reason I want to explain it is
9 apparently there's some negative votes that are
10 being contemplated. And what -- this bill is
11 extremely simple.

12 There are many tax bills that have
13 been in existence by various jurisdictions that
14 we keep re-upping every year and give another
15 year, another two years, whatever the number of
16 years are of the extender. And quite frankly,
17 it's ridiculous. If we've already authorized a
18 town or a county or a village or somebody to
19 raise sales tax, for example, or mortgage tax,
20 why do they have to keep coming back? And why do
21 we just give them a short length of time?

22 We should have a -- it should be
23 automatic. And they should only come back if
24 they want to reduce it, permission to reduce,
25 which they don't need.

1 And all this bill is is a bill that
2 allows for these extenders and some of the
3 municipalities -- New Rochelle, Rye, Yonkers,
4 Essex, Albany, Warren. And from a political
5 standpoint, these counties are very different as
6 far as the geographics and also different with
7 respect to their politics, whether they have
8 basically Republicans or Democrats leading their
9 counties.

10 And if we do not pass this bill,
11 monies that these municipalities have been
12 relying on for years, for years, will stop,
13 because we have not authorized those taxes to
14 continue.

15 So I would hope that those who are
16 considering possibly voting no consider what the
17 effects would be. And most importantly, there's
18 really no reason, no reason not to continue to
19 allow these extensions. And there are extenders
20 for -- that Democrats are requesting and
21 extenders that the GOP is requesting, and they go
22 all over the ballpark.

23 So the reason I want to explain it
24 is because I think it's important that we know
25 here and the general public knows here what we're

1 voting on and what a no vote would be.

2 Thank you, Mr. President.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Seeing
4 and hearing no other Senator that wishes to be
5 heard, debate is now closed.

6 The Secretary will ring the bell.

7 (Pause.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 24. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Some
16 order, please.

17 Senator Gianaris to explain his
18 vote.

19 SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you,
20 Mr. President.

21 Despite Senator DeFrancisco's
22 customary eloquence, I did want to point out a
23 couple of things about this bill.

24 Number one, it is a one-house bill
25 which does not have a companion in the Assembly,

1 which means its likelihood of actually resulting
2 in anything meaningful is minimal at best.

3 Number two, the majority picked and
4 chose which of the various provisions of law that
5 are expiring it wanted to include in this
6 legislation.

7 So this is little more, at the end
8 of the day, than just political posturing. I
9 will be voting no, together with many of my
10 colleagues, because if we want a real solution,
11 we should roll up our sleeves and actually get to
12 work on things that can pass both houses.

13 Thank you.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
15 Gianaris in the negative.

16 Senator DeFrancisco to explain his
17 vote.

18 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Yes, I just
19 want --

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Can I
21 have some order, please.

22 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: I just want
23 to explain briefly there's been many one-house
24 bills that have been passed in either house that
25 ultimately become law. And this is -- this could

1 be one of them.

2 And everybody knows the facts of
3 life, the things that go on in Albany, that this
4 bill is being used for leverage to get other
5 totally unrelated things done. And it has
6 nothing to do with it being one house or two
7 houses or three houses. What it has to do with
8 is leverage that the Assembly is trying to apply
9 to get the Senate to do something that should be
10 done on its own one way or the other.

11 And that's -- that's the real story
12 here. And I would hope that -- again, that the
13 Assembly would -- the Senators, the Democrat
14 Senators will reconsider. And I'm sure if this
15 bill passes, all extenders that they're concerned
16 about or they're interested in would happen as
17 well.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
19 DeFrancisco in the affirmative.

20 Senator Klein to explain his vote.

21 SENATOR KLEIN: Again,
22 Mr. President, I certainly understand that
23 there's a lot in this bill that affects various
24 regions -- tax extenders, mortgage recording
25 taxes that are expanded. But at the same time, I

1 think that was pointed out by Senator Gianaris,
2 this is certainly, at this late time in the
3 session, is not a same-as with the Assembly.

4 I do want to point out one specific
5 issue which is important to me and I think
6 everyone else in the City of New York, is the
7 speed camera program. I actually did the
8 original legislation which created the program,
9 thus also expanding the program. And I do want
10 to say the program has been up and running for
11 over four years and has saved thousands and
12 thousands of lives. We have seen, thank God, all
13 types of horror that used to occur near schools
14 go down dramatically.

15 So even though we're doing extenders
16 supposedly in this piece of legislation, the
17 speed camera legislation, which is going to
18 sunset any day now, is not in this legislation as
19 well.

20 So I stand by my previous vote and
21 vote no, Mr. President.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
23 Klein in the negative.

24 Senator Young to explain her vote.

25 SENATOR YOUNG: Thank you,

1 Mr. President.

2 We all know that local communities
3 that we represent need to have these local bills
4 done. And I just want to read a list of the
5 local communities that are affected by this,
6 because they apparently need the revenue in order
7 to operate their budgets.

8 So it's the occupancy tax in the
9 City of New Rochelle, it's also in the City of
10 Rye, and it's also relating to the City of
11 Yonkers. We have Senator Mayer, who's newly
12 elected, on the other side of the aisle. To me,
13 it would be shocking if she voted against her own
14 communities.

15 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
17 Gianaris, why do you rise?

18 SENATOR YOUNG: So --

19 SENATOR GIANARIS: We always take
20 great care not to single out individuals and
21 criticize them by name in this chamber, and I
22 would caution Senator Young not to do that right
23 now.

24 SENATOR YOUNG: -- the
25 representative from Yonkers, the City of Rye and

1 New Rochelle would vote against their own -- her
2 own community.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Announce
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
6 Calendar 2083, those recorded in the negative are
7 Senators Alcantara, Avella, Bailey, Benjamin,
8 Breslin, Brooks, Carlucci, Comrie, Dilan,
9 Gianaris, Hamilton, Hoylman, Kaminsky, Kavanagh,
10 Kennedy, Klein, Krueger, Mayer, Montgomery,
11 Parker, Peralta, Persaud, Sanders, Savino,
12 Sepúlveda, Serrano, Stavisky, Stewart-Cousins and
13 Valesky.

14 Ayes, 31. Nays, 29.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
16 fails.

17 Senator Flanagan.

18 SENATOR FLANAGAN: The Senate will
19 stand at ease.

20 There will be an immediate
21 Republican conference.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
23 Senate will stand temporarily at ease.

24 There's an immediate meeting of the
25 Republican Conference in Room 332.

1 The Senate is at ease.

2 (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease
3 at 2:41 p.m.)

4 (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at
5 4:14 p.m.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: And now a
7 word from our sponsor.

8 Senator DeFrancisco.

9 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: We're ready
10 to proceed. And if legislators from the Senate
11 are in the hearing of my voice, we'd love to see
12 you.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: I'd ask
14 all members to please report to the chamber.

15 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: All right, if
16 we can --

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
18 Senate will come to order.

19 Senator DeFrancisco.

20 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: The first
21 bill we want to take up is a hand-down for
22 Senator Akshar, who's on his way, I hope.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: We will
24 return to messages from the Assembly.

25 The Secretary will read.

1 THE SECRETARY: The Assembly sent
2 for concurrence the following bill. On motion of
3 Senator Flanagan, and by unanimous consent, the
4 rules were suspended and said bill ordered to a
5 third reading: Assembly 8057B.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: It is so
7 ordered.

8 The bill is before the house. The
9 Secretary will read.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 2085, by Member of the Assembly Abbate,
12 Assembly Print 8057B, an act to amend the
13 Civil Service Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
15 last section.

16 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Time out.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Time out.
18 Read the last section.

19 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Please wait.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Okay.

21 The Senate will stand temporarily at ease.

22 (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease
23 at 4:15 p.m.)

24 (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at
25 4:22 p.m.)

1 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO:

2 Mr. President, can we lay this bill aside
3 temporarily and go to the Supplemental Calendar
4 58A. We laid aside a Senator Marcellino bill
5 temporarily, 2043. Can we take that up now,
6 please.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
8 Senate will return to order.

9 The bill that was previously before
10 the house will be laid aside temporarily.

11 And the request is now to go to
12 Senate Supplemental 58A, and we will be looking
13 at Calendar Number 2043.

14 The Secretary will read.

15 THE SECRETARY: Senator Marcellino
16 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
17 Assembly Bill Number 6320A and substitute it for
18 the identical Senate Bill 5743A, Third Reading
19 Calendar 2043.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
21 substitution is so ordered.

22 There is a home-rule message present
23 at the desk.

24 The Secretary will read.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 2043, by Member of the Assembly Montesano,
2 Assembly Print 6320A, an act to grant.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
12 passes.

13 Senator DeFrancisco.

14 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Has that bill
15 been passed?

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: It has
17 been passed.

18 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: All right.
19 Can we now take up, off the original active list,
20 a bill that was temporarily laid aside, the
21 Ranzenhofer bill, Calendar 1099. Can we take up
22 that at this time.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
24 Secretary will read, from the original active
25 list, Calendar Number 1099.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 1099, by Member of the Assembly Steck,
3 Assembly Print 2688B, an act to amend the
4 Executive Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
8 act shall take effect on the 90th day.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
14 passes.

15 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: That
16 completes the active list. You can rip it up,
17 just like the president did.

18 All right. Now we're going back to
19 the Senate supplemental calendar. And the bill
20 that was laid aside on that calendar, 2029, by
21 Senator Bonacic, can we call that bill up,
22 please.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
24 Secretary will read.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 2029, by Senator Bonacic, Senate Print 994C, an
2 act to amend the General Municipal Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
4 Krueger.

5 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you. On
6 the bill, Mr. President. Can I?

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: So one
8 second -- yes. We were on a noncontroversial
9 reading. Are we going to a controversial
10 reading?

11 SENATOR KRUEGER: It had been laid
12 aside earlier.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Okay, the
14 bill has been -- correct, you are right,
15 Senator Krueger, the bill is laid aside.

16 SENATOR KRUEGER: So I assume --

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Let me
18 ring the bell.

19 And Senator Krueger, you may be
20 heard.

21 SENATOR KRUEGER: I wasn't going to
22 ask to debate, Mr. President, I was just going to
23 speak on the bill.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
25 Krueger on the bill.

1 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you.

2 So this bill continues a pattern in
3 this state of expanding gambling, perhaps without
4 thinking about the impact on the broader universe
5 of other gambling that we've passed. So we
6 regulate and we pass and we put a limit on
7 casinos, and we make agreements with, compacts
8 with Native American casinos. And we think about
9 and explore whether we're going to do sports
10 betting or not, whether we're going to do
11 Internet betting or not, what we're doing with
12 OTBs, on and on.

13 And yet then we take a look at a
14 bill like this, which basically says we will
15 allow specific nonprofit facilities to become
16 casinos. Not a full-fledged casino, but slot
17 machines, which now are being called electronic
18 bell jars in this bill. And we've already
19 approved tax-free alcohol for these same
20 facilities.

21 So I'm just wondering what the State
22 of New York is thinking about when it's expanding
23 a secondary market of lower-taxed gambling
24 casinos with -- perhaps without the fancy lights.

25 And of course while they are

1 veterans organization facilities, you don't have
2 to be a veteran to go there. So it's not a
3 sublimated universe, it's the entire New York
4 public. Or I guess people from outside of
5 New York State could also come to our secondary
6 discounted-price casinos.

7 I think it's just bad policy for the
8 state, Mr. President. Even though I've heard
9 that these are organizations searching for more
10 charitable money, I don't think we're doing
11 ourselves a favor by doing this. And I think
12 we're also opening ourselves to all kinds of
13 questions people might ask later, when I think we
14 here in the Senate should have asked those
15 questions before we pass these laws.

16 And so I'm a no, Mr. President.
17 Thank you.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Seeing
19 and hearing no other Senator that wishes to be
20 heard -- Senator Bonacic.

21 SENATOR BONACIC: To explain my
22 vote.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: We're on
24 the bill -- you want to explain your vote later,
25 then, Senator Bonacic?

1 SENATOR BONACIC: Sure.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Okay. So
3 I will close debate.

4 The Secretary will ring the bell.

5 Read the last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 10. This
7 act shall take effect on the 180th day.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
9 Secretary will call the roll.

10 We are on a controversial vote, so
11 the members should enter the chamber, please.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Could you
14 withdraw the roll call and -- I think people are
15 getting jumpy at this point. And I'm trying not
16 to.

17 But by unanimous consent, I would
18 request that this be put back on the
19 noncontroversial calendar and a vote be taken in
20 that manner.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: So
22 without objection, we will return to the
23 noncontroversial reading.

24 There being no objection, the
25 Secretary will read the last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 10. This
2 act shall take effect on the 180th day.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
4 Secretary will call the roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
7 Bonacic to explain his vote.

8 SENATOR BONACIC: Yes. Thank you,
9 Mr. President.

10 First of all, this particular
11 machine that would go in benevolent
12 corporations -- and 59 percent of them are in
13 veteran halls. And the rest would be in the
14 Elks, it would be in the Moose Lodge, it would be
15 in the churches, and it would also -- and there's
16 about 1200 of them.

17 Since 1997, the revenue from these
18 organizations was \$66 million. Now it is down to
19 \$33 million. You know what's happened? Veterans
20 posts have closed. Veterans, you know, when they
21 can come home from the war, they don't talk to
22 people about their experiences. They need a
23 place to go and talk to other veterans if they're
24 inclined to talk at all.

25 So this is a -- this is -- what we

1 want to do is to give them a bell jar machine
2 that is not a gambling device. It's preprinted
3 in the machine, not a gambling device. I don't
4 know how many times I can say that. With the
5 hope, with the hope that maybe more of these
6 benevolent corporation members, and mainly
7 veterans, would go and play this machine.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Excuse
9 me, Senator Bonacic.

10 Can I have some order in the house.

11 Senator Bonacic, please continue.

12 SENATOR BONACIC: So that's why
13 we're putting this forward. We are one with the
14 Assembly on this. There's a same-as bill. In
15 fact, the Assembly passed this earlier in the
16 year and recalled it so we could have the same
17 language.

18 But that's what this bill does.

19 Thank you, Mr. President. I vote
20 yes.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
22 Bonacic in the affirmative.

23 Senator Ortt to explain his vote.

24 SENATOR ORTT: Thank you,
25 Mr. President.

1 I'd like to thank the sponsor. I
2 know he spent a lot of time on this bill.

3 You know, gaming bills, bills that
4 deal with any kind of gambling are always
5 somewhat controversial. There are those who
6 don't like them, there are those who support
7 them.

8 For me, this was mostly about trying
9 to find a way to help and provide an additional
10 revenue stream for community organizations that
11 play a huge role in most of our districts,
12 whether it's veterans organizations -- VFWs,
13 American Legions -- whether it's volunteer
14 firefighting companies, whether it is other
15 community organizations -- the Knights of
16 Columbus, that kind of a thing.

17 Now, keep in mind, my only concern
18 with this legislation, I represent a casino
19 that's on Native American territory. And I know
20 they have some concerns about the compact with
21 the state. But I believe that the sponsor has
22 tried to work very hard to make sure this bill is
23 not in violation of that compact.

24 And I think ultimately this bill
25 does more for -- more good for groups in our

1 community than it does harm. And so for that
2 reason, Mr. President, I vote aye.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
4 Ortt in the affirmative.

5 Senator Kennedy to explain his vote.

6 SENATOR KENNEDY: Thank you,
7 Mr. President.

8 First of all, I want to thank the
9 bills's sponsor. I know that he has worked very,
10 very hard on this bill and has communicated
11 appropriately.

12 The issue that we have with this
13 bill is that I have a memo of opposition from the
14 Seneca Nation of Indians President Todd Gates
15 opposing this bill, believing that the
16 legislation clearly violates the compact of 2002.
17 These are serious allegations, and these are
18 allegations that we need to take into
19 consideration as we're passing this bill.

20 We are basically affirming the
21 support for video gaming that in many ways will
22 help charitable organizations, yes. But if it
23 violates the compact, it ultimately goes against
24 the word of the State of New York from 2002, then
25 what in fact is the worth of the word of the

1 State of New York in any capacity to begin with?
2 Who would negotiate in good faith with the City
3 of New York in any capacity moving forward if in
4 fact New York State doesn't keep its word?

5 And if the bill that we are
6 supporting today violates the compact, and the
7 Seneca Nation is saying that they are going to
8 challenge this bill -- ultimately resulting, I'm
9 assuming, in litigation, and much like what
10 happened with Moxie Mania and the VLTs that were
11 put forward in the past that violated the compact
12 and were arbitrated and resulted in a long legal,
13 problematic, adjudicated issue -- in fact, we
14 should hit the pause button, get everyone to the
15 table, negotiate the bill with all parties
16 involved, including the Seneca Nation and other
17 nations that will be affected across the state as
18 it pertains to their own gaming compacts, and put
19 a bill in that works for everybody.

20 I know this is important to the
21 charitable organizations. And as I mentioned to
22 you earlier, I appreciate the sponsor's work on
23 this and recognize that conceptually we can all
24 agree to that. However, I believe that this is
25 in violation of the compact. I have grave

1 concerns about it.

2 With that, I'll be voting no, and I
3 ask my colleagues to do the same. And while this
4 is a C print of this bill, hopefully we can put
5 together another print that works.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
7 Kennedy, how do you vote?

8 SENATOR KENNEDY: Mr. President, I
9 vote in the negative. Thank you.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
11 Kennedy in the negative.

12 Senator Marchione to explain her
13 vote.

14 SENATOR MARCHIONE: Thank you,
15 Mr. President.

16 I also want to thank the sponsor,
17 Senator Bonacic, for this piece of legislation.

18 I had a lot of concerns about it, as
19 of course I come from an area that has a racino
20 that certainly is being squeezed and hasn't felt
21 the full effects of a casino that's very close to
22 it.

23 But I want to thank him very much
24 for listening to the concerns that we had for
25 adjusting the bill and for making it palatable

1 for those of us who are now able to support the
2 bill. And I just want to say that that's
3 indicative of Senator Bonacic, and I would like
4 to thank him for always trying to work with the
5 rest of us to make a bill better that we all can
6 support.

7 Thank you, Mr. President.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
9 Marchione in the affirmative.

10 Announce the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
12 Calendar 2029, those recorded in the negative are
13 Senators Bailey, Comrie, Gianaris, Kaminsky,
14 Kavanagh, Kennedy, Klein, Krueger, Peralta,
15 Persaud, Sanders, Sepúlveda and Stewart-Cousins.
16 Also Senators Benjamin and Stavisky. Also
17 Senator Alcantara.

18 Ayes, 44. Nays, 16.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
20 passes.

21 Senator DeFrancisco.

22 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO:

23 Mr. President, can we now stand at ease and await
24 a Democrat conference, a minority conference.

25 SENATOR KLEIN: Mr. President,

1 there will be an immediate Democratic conference
2 in the Democratic Conference Room.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There
4 will be an immediate meeting of the Democrat
5 Conference in the Democrat Conference Room.

6 The Senate will stand at ease.

7 (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease
8 at 4:38 p.m.)

9 (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at
10 4:54 p.m.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
12 Senate will return to order.

13 Senator Flanagan.

14 SENATOR FLANAGAN: Senator Griffo,
15 thank you. There will be a meeting of the
16 Judiciary Committee in 10 minutes, 10 minutes, in
17 Room 124.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There
19 will be a meeting of the Judiciary Committee in
20 10 minutes. The Judiciary Committee will meet in
21 Capitol Room 124 at 5:10. All members of
22 Judiciary should report to Room 124 at 5:10.

23 SENATOR FLANAGAN: Mr. President,
24 the Senate will stand at ease.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The

1 Senate will stand at ease.

2 (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease
3 at 4:54 p.m.)

4 (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at
5 7:12 p.m.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
7 Senate will return to order.

8 Senator DeFrancisco.

9 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Could we
10 please return to messages from the Assembly.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: We will
12 return to messages from the Assembly.

13 The Secretary will read.

14 THE SECRETARY: The Assembly sent
15 for concurrence the following bill. On motion of
16 Senator Flanagan, the rules were suspended and
17 said bill ordered to a third reading: Assembly
18 Bill 9537.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: So
20 ordered.

21 The Secretary will read.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 2098, by Member of the Assembly Pretlow,
24 Assembly Print 9537, an act to amend the
25 Local Finance Law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There is
2 a home-rule message at the desk.

3 The Secretary will read the last
4 section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
12 passes.

13 THE SECRETARY: The Assembly sent
14 for concurrence the following bill. On motion of
15 Senator Flanagan, the rules were suspended and
16 said bill ordered to a third reading: Assembly
17 Bill 10385.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: So
19 ordered.

20 The Secretary will read.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 2097, by Member of the Assembly Otis, Assembly
23 Print 10385, an act to amend Chapter 88 of the
24 Laws of 2009.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58. Nays, 2.
8 Senators Brooks and Kaminsky recorded in the
9 negative.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
11 passes.

12 The Secretary will read.

13 THE SECRETARY: The Assembly sent
14 for concurrence the following bill. On motion of
15 Senator Flanagan, the rules were suspended and
16 said bill ordered to a third reading: Assembly
17 Bill 10355.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: So
19 ordered.

20 The Secretary will read.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 2095, by Member of the Assembly Joyner, Assembly
23 Print 10355, an act to amend the General
24 Municipal Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 SENATOR KLEIN: Lay it aside.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Lay the
9 bill aside.

10 Senator DeFrancisco.

11 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Can we please
12 take up the controversial reading of the bill
13 that was just laid aside.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
15 Secretary will ring the bell.

16 The Secretary will read.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 2095, by Member of the Assembly Joyner, Assembly
19 Print 10355, an act to amend the General
20 Municipal Law.

21 SENATOR KLEIN: Explanation of the
22 bill, please.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: An
24 explanation has been requested on the bill.

25 Senator DeFrancisco.

1 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Yes, I'll
2 give you a brief explanation if we could have a
3 little order on the floor.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
5 DeFrancisco, as you begin the explanation, I want
6 to refer the members to that these are hand-downs
7 from the Assembly, so you should refer to the
8 iPads, look at the Assembly number, and that will
9 give you the information.

10 Senator DeFrancisco.

11 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: This is
12 simply a three-year extender, a bill passed by
13 the Assembly, that we're taking up now. The bill
14 would assist in the development of federally
15 financed housing of low income, elderly and
16 disabled persons by continuing to make such
17 developments eligible for expedited land use
18 review, under Section 2002 of the Supportive
19 Housing for the Elderly Program and Section 811
20 of the Supportive Housing for Persons with
21 Disabilities.

22 So it's basically an extender of an
23 excellent program that has already passed in the
24 Assembly.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Seeing

1 and hearing no other Senator that wishes to be
2 heard, debate is closed.

3 The Secretary will ring the bell.

4 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO:

5 Mr. President, by unanimous consent, we could
6 replace this on the noncontroversial reading and
7 take a vote.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Without
9 objection, so ordered.

10 The Secretary will read the last
11 section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
13 act shall take effect immediately.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: The Assembly sent
21 for concurrence the following bill. On motion of
22 Senator Flanagan, the rules were suspended and
23 said bill ordered to a third reading: Assembly
24 10479.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: It is so

1 ordered.

2 The Secretary will read.

3 SENATOR KLEIN: Lay it aside,
4 please.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Lay it
6 aside.

7 The Secretary will ring the bell.

8 The Secretary will read.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 2088, by Member of the Assembly Weinstein,
11 Assembly Print 10479, an act to amend the Local
12 Finance Law.

13 SENATOR KLEIN: Explanation,
14 please.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: An
16 explanation has been requested. (Pause.)

17 Senator Golden.

18 SENATOR GOLDEN: Mr. President,
19 10479 is an OMB number-one bill for an extender
20 to give them the ability to go out and to bring
21 their bonds to market and to give them the
22 ability to have a tremendous savings at the end
23 of the process.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Seeing
25 and hearing no other Senator that wishes to be

1 heard, debate is closed.

2 The Secretary will ring the bell.

3 Read the last section.

4 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Excuse me.

5 By unanimous consent, we could take this up in
6 noncontroversial --

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Without
8 objection, it is so ordered.

9 The Secretary will read the last
10 section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
12 act shall take effect immediately.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
18 is passed.

19 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Please read
20 the next bill, please.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
22 Secretary will read.

23 THE SECRETARY: The Assembly sent
24 for concurrence the following bill. On motion of
25 Senator Flanagan, the rules were suspended and

1 said bill ordered to a third reading: Assembly
2 Bill Number 10501.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: It is so
4 ordered.

5 The Secretary will read.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 2094, by Member of the Assembly Kim, Assembly
8 Print 10501, an act to amend Chapter 613 of the
9 Laws of 1996.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
11 last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
13 act shall take effect immediately.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
19 passes.

20 The Secretary will read.

21 THE SECRETARY: The Assembly sent
22 for concurrence the following bill. On motion of
23 Senator Flanagan, the rules were suspended and
24 said bill ordered to a third reading: Assembly
25 Bill Number 10502.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: So
2 ordered.

3 The Secretary will read.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 2093, by Member of the Assembly Dilan, Assembly
6 Bill 10502, an act to amend Chapter 84 of the
7 Laws of 1993.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
17 passes.

18 The Secretary will read.

19 THE SECRETARY: The Assembly sent
20 for concurrence the following bill. On motion of
21 Senator Flanagan, the rules were suspended and
22 said bill ordered to a third reading: Assembly
23 Bill Number 10559.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: It is so
25 ordered.

1 The Secretary will read.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 2091, by Member of the Assembly Niou, Assembly
4 Print 10559, an act to amend Chapter 449 of the
5 Laws of 1986.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
15 passes.

16 The Secretary will read.

17 THE SECRETARY: The Assembly sent
18 for concurrence the following bill. On motion of
19 Senator Flanagan, the rules were suspended and
20 said bill ordered to a third reading: Assembly
21 Bill Number 10560.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: It is so
23 ordered.

24 The Secretary will read.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 2090, by Member of the Assembly Walker,
2 Assembly Print 10560, an act to amend Chapter 253
3 of the Laws of 2004.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
7 act shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
13 passes.

14 The Secretary will read.

15 THE SECRETARY: The Assembly sent
16 for concurrence the following bill. On motion of
17 Senator Flanagan, the rules were suspended and
18 said bill ordered to a third reading: Assembly
19 Bill Number 10561.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: So
21 ordered.

22 The Secretary will read.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 2089, by Member of the Assembly Joyner, Assembly
25 Print 10561, an act to amend Chapter 375 of the

1 Laws of 1999.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
5 act shall take effect immediately.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
11 passes.

12 The Secretary will read.

13 THE SECRETARY: The Assembly sent
14 for concurrence the following bill. On motion of
15 Senator Flanagan, the rules were suspended and
16 said bill ordered to a third reading: Assembly
17 Bill Number 10605.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: It is so
19 ordered.

20 The Secretary will read.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 2092, by Member of the Assembly Epstein, Assembly
23 Print 10605, an act to amend Chapter 777 of the
24 Laws of 1986.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
9 passes.

10 The Secretary will read.

11 THE SECRETARY: The Assembly sent
12 for concurrence the following bill. On motion of
13 Senator Flanagan, the rules were suspended and
14 said bill ordered to a third reading: Assembly
15 Bill Number 11123.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: It is so
17 ordered.

18 The Secretary will read.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 2096, by the Assembly Committee on Rules,
21 Assembly Bill 11123, an act to amend the
22 Real Property Tax Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This

1 act shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
7 passes.

8 The Secretary will read.

9 THE SECRETARY: The Assembly sent
10 for concurrence the following bill. On motion of
11 Senator Flanagan, the rules were suspended and
12 said bill ordered to a third reading: Assembly
13 Bill Number 416A.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: It is so
15 ordered.

16 The Secretary will read.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 2099, by Member of the Assembly Magnarelli,
19 Assembly Print 416A, an act to amend the
20 Real Property Tax Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
4 DeFrancisco.

5 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Yes, we had
6 previously laid aside Calendar Number 2085 from
7 the --

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
9 DeFrancisco, we're on the bill right now. Did
10 you want to explain a vote on that, or no? It's
11 your bill.

12 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: I don't want
13 to explain anything.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Okay, the
15 desk is a little confused right now.

16 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Okay.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: So we
18 will continue. We read the last section and
19 called the roll --

20 SENATOR KLEIN: Lay it aside,
21 please.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Lay it
23 aside.

24 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Can we lay
25 that aside temporarily so we can try something

1 else.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: We're
3 going to lay it aside temporarily.

4 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: There was a
5 Senator Akshar bill, I believe it was on the
6 supplemental calendar, that was laid aside. It's
7 Calendar 2085.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
9 Secretary will read.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 2085, by Member of the Assembly Abbate,
12 Assembly Print 8057B, an act to amend the
13 Civil Service Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
17 act shall take effect on the 30th day.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Announce
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.
24 Senator Hannon recorded in the negative.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill

1 passes.

2 Senator DeFrancisco.

3 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Can we please
4 take up Senator Jacobs' bill, Calendar 1874,
5 please.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Calendar
7 1874. The Secretary will read.

8 THE SECRETARY: Senator Jacobs
9 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
10 Assembly Bill Number 10468B and substitute it for
11 the identical Senate Bill 8275B, Calendar Number
12 1874.

13 SENATOR KLEIN: Lay it aside.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
15 substitution is so ordered, and the bill is laid
16 aside.

17 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Could we
18 stand at ease, please.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
20 Senate will stand temporarily at ease.

21 (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease
22 at 7:30 p.m.)

23 (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at
24 7:36 p.m.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator

1 DeFrancisco.

2 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO:

3 Mr. President, can we do the noncontroversial --
4 excuse me, the controversial reading of the
5 Jacobs bill, please.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
7 Secretary will ring the bell.

8 The Secretary will read.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 1874, by Member of the Assembly Ryan,
11 Assembly Print 10468B, an act to amend the
12 Public Health Law.

13 SENATOR KLEIN: I'd like an
14 explanation, please.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: An
16 explanation has been requested by Senator Klein,
17 Senator Jacobs.

18 SENATOR JACOBS: Thank you,
19 Mr. President.

20 This legislation stems from a
21 situation coming from a particular individual
22 suffering from a disease, but the legislation
23 will actually deal with an issue and problems
24 that come up more broadly.

25 The situation is a young person who

1 is on a trial run of a certain type of drug to
2 deal with epilepsy. And the program is allowed
3 to be done before this drug is fully approved by
4 the FDA under an initiative called the
5 Compassionate Care Program, and that allows for a
6 trial to use a particular drug that has not been
7 fully approved, because of the severity of the
8 ailment.

9 What this legislation would do is it
10 is anticipated very soon that the FDA will
11 approve this drug, reclassify this drug so it can
12 be used more broadly, and that this particular
13 patient who has been in the trial -- and
14 others -- can continue to use this drug that is
15 having a profound impact on improving their
16 quality of life and this issue of epilepsy.

17 The issue at hand is that it is
18 likely that the FDA approval will happen within
19 the next number of weeks after we are out of
20 session. What this legislation does is empower
21 and allow the Commissioner of Health to
22 approve -- when it is reclassified at the federal
23 level, to in turn reclassify it and to allow it
24 to be legal at the state level.

25 This is one incident that is

1 happening with this particular drug, but it is
2 not uncommon for it to happen in other cases. We
3 want to make sure that the federal government,
4 after testing something, reclassifies it and
5 makes it legal, that we enable the Commissioner
6 of Health to in turn have the discretion to make
7 that decision, not have to wait for another six
8 or eight months until this body is back in
9 session.

10 Thank you.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
12 Klein.

13 SENATOR KLEIN: Mr. President, will
14 the sponsor yield for a couple of questions?

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
16 Jacobs, do you yield?

17 SENATOR JACOBS: Yes.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
19 Senator yields.

20 SENATOR KLEIN: Through you,
21 Mr. President. I heard the sponsor's
22 explanation, but can they actually state what
23 controlled substance they're actually
24 reclassifying?

25 SENATOR JACOBS: What controlled

1 substance -- hold on -- if you -- one moment,
2 please.

3 SENATOR KLEIN: I guess just to
4 restate, the title of the bill is "an act to
5 amend the Public Health Law in relation to
6 authorizing the reclassification of controlled
7 substances by regulation."

8 So this something that we're
9 changing as far as the federal analog bill and
10 reclassifying a controlled substance?

11 SENATOR JACOBS: Through you,
12 Mr. President, it's a new type of cannabinoid
13 oil.

14 SENATOR KLEIN: So when you say
15 it's a new type of cannabinoid oil --

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
17 Klein, please direct through the chair.

18 SENATOR KLEIN: Okay. Again,
19 through you, Mr. President. I guess how is it
20 different than the presently regulated substance
21 that I guess is illegal under the analog bill?

22 SENATOR JACOBS: This is -- again,
23 this is --

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
25 Jacobs, through the chair.

1 SENATOR JACOBS: Mr. President,
2 this is going through trial right now. But it is
3 a purer form of the oil, as opposed to what is
4 being used at this point in time.

5 SENATOR KLEIN: Again through you,
6 Mr. President. Again, when you're actually
7 dealing with reclassifying a controlled
8 substance, the way it usually works, it's always
9 dictated by the federal government. They keep
10 changing different changes to specific
11 substances, because sometimes the substance will
12 change and it mimics something that's already
13 illegal.

14 So I guess this is a change to what
15 would be known as cannabis. So how is this
16 different than what exists presently in the
17 analog bill that is now illegal?

18 SENATOR JACOBS: Through you,
19 Mr. President. Again, it will -- this would be
20 only upon the reclassification at the federal
21 level, that it would in turn allow the
22 Commissioner of Health to reclassify here at the
23 state level.

24 SENATOR KLEIN: So I guess --
25 through you, Mr. President, I guess my question

1 is if it's already going to be deemed legal on
2 the federal level, wouldn't it automatically be
3 legal now in the state as well?

4 SENATOR JACOBS: Through you,
5 Mr. President, no, it would not. A point that is
6 raised -- and this is the need for this
7 legislation -- it would not be legal just upon
8 the federal reclassification.

9 SENATOR KLEIN: Again through you,
10 Mr. President. When we do the reclassification,
11 what would -- I guess who would we actually be
12 treating with I guess, for want of a better word,
13 this new form of cannabis?

14 SENATOR JACOBS: Through you,
15 Mr. President, this is again stemming from a
16 specific case. But again, it will be applied and
17 able to be utilized because there are more
18 instances than this one case.

19 That this individual is part of a
20 trial through this Compassionate Care Program, a
21 federal program. This individual -- this strand
22 of the cannabis oil is being found to be
23 profoundly effective in this ailment, so this
24 individual would like to continue to use this and
25 be prescribed it by a physician on an ongoing

1 basis beyond the trial.

2 SENATOR KLEIN: Again through you,
3 Mr. President, I guess what I'm getting at,
4 again, there's treatment -- cannabis is used to
5 treat, you know, various ailments. What
6 specifically would be treated that we can't use I
7 guess what we would use now, which is readily
8 available under our medical marijuana program in
9 the State of New York? What would this specific
10 change in drug be able to treat that we can't
11 already treat with the existing cannabis we use?

12 SENATOR JACOBS: Through you,
13 Mr. President, it's a specific -- excuse me if I
14 don't have the actual name in front of me. It's
15 a specific type of epilepsy that this strand has
16 been shown, through this trial, to be effective,
17 and that other elements of medical marijuana have
18 not been.

19 SENATOR KLEIN: And through you,
20 Mr. President, again, I understand that this is a
21 specific type of epilepsy that would be treated.
22 But again, when someone is manufacturing a drug,
23 it usually has a much wider use. Are there any
24 other diseases or other types of ailments which
25 would be able to be treated through this new form

1 of cannabis?

2 SENATOR JACOBS: Through you,
3 Mr. President. At this point in time this trial
4 has been focused on this type of epilepsy. And
5 at this point in time that has been the only use.
6 At some point in time, with other trials, it may
7 be shown to have an impact beneficially on other
8 ailments, but at this time it is solely on this
9 strand of epilepsy.

10 SENATOR KLEIN: Thank you.

11 Through you, Mr. President, would
12 the sponsor agree to yield for another question?

13 SENATOR JACOBS: Yes.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
15 sponsor yields.

16 SENATOR KLEIN: Again, it says in
17 the bill memo that this legislation would also
18 limit the commissioner's reclassification powers
19 to not only being able to reclassify drugs to a
20 new division in the same numbered schedule.

21 Can you explain what powers we're
22 giving or taking away from the commissioner?

23 SENATOR JACOBS: Essentially --
24 Mr. President, through you. Essentially this is
25 allowing the commissioner to do at a state level

1 what is done at the federal level. So if there's
2 reclassification at the federal level, it's
3 within that scope allowing the commissioner to
4 reclassify it at the state level so they are
5 consistent.

6 SENATOR KLEIN: Thank you,
7 Mr. President. I have no further questions.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Thank
9 you.

10 Seeing and hearing no other Senator
11 that wishes to be heard, debate is closed and the
12 Secretary will ring the bell.

13 Senator DeFrancisco.

14 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Yes, by
15 unanimous consent we're going to vote on this
16 bill -- send it back to the noncontroversial
17 calendar, please.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Without
19 objection, it is so ordered.

20 The Secretary will read the last
21 section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
4 passes.

5 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO:

6 Mr. President, there was one other bill, a
7 Magnarelli bill that was passed and sent back
8 here. Can we have the noncontroversial reading
9 of that bill.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Without
11 objection, it is so ordered to noncontroversial.

12 The Secretary will read.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 2099, by Member of the Assembly Magnarelli,
15 Assembly Print 416A, an act to amend the
16 Real Property Tax Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
20 act shall take effect immediately.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill

1 passes.

2 Senator DeFrancisco.

3 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Yes, I
4 believe there's an Assembly bill at the desk,
5 Number 10618.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: It's not
7 presently at the desk, Senator DeFrancisco.

8 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: All right.
9 And it's going to be there momentarily, is it?

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Yes. Do
11 you want to stand at ease temporarily?

12 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Yes -- no, we
13 don't have to if we can call on -- is there a
14 report from the Judiciary Committee?

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There is
16 a Judiciary Committee report at the desk.

17 The Secretary will read.

18 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Please read.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
20 DeFrancisco, before we take the Judiciary
21 Committee report, that material is now at the
22 desk. So with your concurrence, we will move on
23 that.

24 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Absolutely.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The

1 Secretary will read.

2 THE SECRETARY: Senator Kennedy
3 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
4 Assembly Bill Number 10618A and substitute it for
5 the identical Senate Bill 7346A, Third Reading
6 Calendar 943.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
8 substitution is so ordered.

9 The Secretary will read.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 943, by Member of the Assembly Peoples-Stokes,
12 Assembly Print 10618A, an act to amend the
13 Real Property Tax Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
22 Kennedy to explain his vote.

23 SENATOR KENNEDY: Thank you,
24 Mr. President.

25 And I want to thank my colleagues

1 for supporting this extremely important bill for
2 the City of Buffalo.

3 There has been year after year of
4 individuals who have come into the City of
5 Buffalo, bought properties and then taken
6 advantage of the community while not living in
7 these homes. They're collecting rent and
8 oftentimes allowing these properties to fall into
9 disrepair. And then when the housing code
10 violations or fire code violations pile up, these
11 same individuals, who we refer to as slumlords,
12 that have taken advantage of our community don't
13 pay those housing code violations.

14 What this legislation ultimately
15 does is it ensures that if these slumlords do not
16 pay those housing code violations, that they're
17 held accountable, that they ultimately have to
18 pay, because that fine will be put on their tax
19 roll at the end of the year.

20 With that, Mr. President, I vote
21 aye. I urge my colleagues to do the same. And I
22 thank my colleagues for their support on this
23 bill.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
25 Kennedy in the affirmative.

1 Senator DeFrancisco.

2 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: The last bill
3 that was passed is exactly like Senator Kennedy's
4 bill. In fact, it was around here for a while.
5 I sponsored the bill. And I just want to say one
6 thing to explain my vote here: Ditto.

7 (Laughter.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
9 DeFrancisco in the affirmative.

10 Announce the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
13 is passed.

14 Now we will have the Secretary's
15 reading of the Judiciary Committee report.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
17 Bonacic, from the Committee on Judiciary, offers
18 the following nominations for Interim Supreme
19 Court Judges:

20 Nicholas Iacovetta, Vincent
21 Martorana, and Michael Obus.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
23 Bonacic.

24 SENATOR BONACIC: Thank you,
25 Mr. President.

1 Let me start off by apologizing to
2 the nominees who came with their families, young
3 children. I knew you were here at 10:00 a.m.
4 But this is the last day of session. And
5 whenever you have the last day of session, things
6 get complicated. And we were not able to address
7 all of you sooner, so we apologize for the long
8 delay.

9 So let me start, I'm going to start
10 with the interim Supreme Court justices that have
11 been given to us by Governor Cuomo. There are
12 three. Then we'll do the eight Court of Claims,
13 okay?

14 So earlier today the Senate
15 Judiciary Committee met and considered the
16 appointment of three interim Supreme Court
17 judges. In addition, we considered the
18 nomination of eight new appointees to the Court
19 of Claims.

20 I want to thank Governor Cuomo for
21 putting forth an impressive list of nominees for
22 the court. The experienced jurists that are here
23 today have all been approved by the Judicial
24 Nominating Commission.

25 We always strive to put judges on

1 the bench who display exemplary temperament and
2 dedication to the bench. I am confident that the
3 nominees before the State Senate Judiciary
4 Committee today will hold themselves to such
5 standards.

6 Pursuant to the provisions of
7 Section 21 of Article VI of the Constitution and
8 pursuant to the provisions of Section 9 of
9 Article VI of the Constitution and the provisions
10 of Section 2 of the Court of Claims Act, the
11 Judiciary Committee has reported all of the
12 nominations to the floor for Senate confirmation,
13 and I might say unanimously.

14 I'm going to introduce the judges,
15 their friends and family in attendance today.

16 First, the interim Supreme Court
17 nominees. We're going to start with -- and when
18 I call your name, I'm going to ask you to stand
19 up. If you have family with you, which I'll
20 acknowledge, I would ask them to stand up also.

21 The Honorable Nicholas Iacovetta,
22 and he's here about his brother John.

23 The next gentleman is the Honorable
24 Vincent Martorana, and he's here with his bride,
25 Jane. Okay?

1 And the last gentleman is the
2 Honorable Michael Obus.

3 Mr. President, at this time I move
4 these three nominations to the floor and ask for
5 Senate confirmation and if you would recognize
6 any Senator who wishes to speak on any of these
7 three nominees.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Thank
9 you, Senator Bonacic.

10 Senator Klein.

11 SENATOR KLEIN: Thank you,
12 Mr. President.

13 While I rise to congratulate all of
14 the acting Supreme Court nominees, I want to
15 point out one very special judge, and that's
16 Judge Nicholas Iacovetta. He's my constituent
17 and a friend from the Country Club section of the
18 Bronx.

19 And if you would look at his resume,
20 he really was moved in the direction to really be
21 a Supreme Court judge. He spent many years in
22 the Bronx District Attorney's office. He was at
23 one time chief of the Criminal Court Bureau. He
24 was head of the Homicide Bureau; he served there
25 from 1974 to 1988. He then was appointed as

1 Criminal Court judge in Bronx County from '88 to
2 '93. And of course he was the acting Supreme
3 Court judge in the Criminal Part in Bronx County
4 as well.

5 He never really left the Bronx,
6 because he also attended Fordham as an undergrad,
7 Fordham Law School as well. And he's someone
8 that is eminently qualified. When Judge Nicholas
9 Iacovetta takes his rightful place as a Supreme
10 Court judge, all over the Bronx justice will
11 truly be done.

12 Congratulations to you and your
13 family.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
15 question before the house is on the names read
16 for the positions of interim Supreme Court judge
17 of the State of New York. All in favor say aye.

18 (Response of "Aye.")

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Opposed?

20 (No response.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
22 individuals that have been named and read are
23 hereby confirmed by the Senate as Interim Supreme
24 Court Judges.

25 Congratulations. Please rise and be

1 recognized.

2 (Standing ovation.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
4 Bonacic.

5 SENATOR BONACIC: Let us continue
6 now with the eight Court of Claims nominees.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
8 Bonacic, we're just going to read first and then
9 come to you, okay?

10 SENATOR BONACIC: Sure.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
12 Secretary will read.

13 THE SECRETARY: As Judges of the
14 Court of Claims: Joel Cohen; John Higgitt;
15 Francis Kahn III; Honorable Chris Ann Kelley;
16 David Lewis; James McCarty, Jr.; Michele Rodney;
17 and Honorable Lillian Wan.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
19 report is before the house.

20 Senator Bonacic.

21 SENATOR BONACIC: Thank you,
22 Mr. President.

23 Our first gentleman is Mr. Joel
24 Cohen. He's with his bride, Stacy, and children
25 Jake and Holly. So could you -- if you're all --

1 there they are, all four. Very good.

2 The next gentleman is Mr. John
3 Higgitt. He's with his bride, Sandra, and
4 children Jackson and Luke. Over there,
5 very good.

6 The next one is Mr. Francis Kahn
7 III, with his bride, Jodi. Okay.

8 A good-looking group up there, I
9 would say, as we continue.

10 Next is the Honorable Chris Ann
11 Kelley, with her spouse, Jacqueline, and
12 daughters Marina and Calla. Okay.

13 Next is Mr. James McCarty, Jr., with
14 his wife, Martha, and sons Matthew and Michael.

15 Next is Ms. Michele Rodney, parents
16 Karl and Faye, sister Karlisa.

17 And last but not least is the
18 Honorable Lillian Wan. She's with her husband,
19 Adam, as well as their children Sophia and
20 Nathan.

21 At this time, Mr. President, I move
22 all the nominations to the floor.

23 Do you have any Senators that wish
24 to speak on the nominees?

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: We will,

1 Senator Bonacic, one second.

2 SENATOR BONACIC: How could I miss
3 him? How could I miss our favorite one?

4 I'd like to put forth the name of
5 the Honorable David Lewis. David, there you are
6 in the background.

7 (Laughter.)

8 SENATOR BONACIC: Okay.

9 Mr. President, I move all the nominations to the
10 floor for Senate confirmation, and I ask you to
11 recognize any Senator who wishes to speak.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Thank
13 you, Senator Bonacic.

14 Senator Mayer.

15 SENATOR MAYER: Thank you very
16 much.

17 I rise to support the nomination of,
18 among all the others, James A. McCarty, Jr., who
19 lives in my district and has an extraordinary
20 history in the Westchester County District
21 Attorney's office.

22 Mr. McCarty was hired in 1980 by
23 Carl Vergari, for those of us old enough to
24 remember him, as a junior assistant district
25 attorney, and he has served since that time with

1 incredible distinction and been promoted
2 repeatedly in the office of the Westchester
3 County District Attorney. He currently serves as
4 chief assistant to District Attorney Anthony
5 Scarpino.

6 And during his career, Mr. McCarty
7 has handled thousands of cases and tried over
8 100 jury trials, including some of the most
9 significant in Westchester County. In 2016, he
10 was named the Acting District Attorney of
11 Westchester County when our former District
12 Attorney -- now Chief Judge DiFiore -- was named
13 to her position, and he served with incredible
14 distinction and character.

15 He's a graduate of the University of
16 Rochester and Albany Law School.

17 I just would like to add that having
18 dealt with him in the course of my service in
19 Westchester County, Mr. McCarty continues to
20 conduct himself with the utmost professionalism
21 and commitment to public service.

22 He will bring honor to the bench,
23 and I look forward to his confirmation.

24 Thank you, Mr. President.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Thank

1 you, Senator Mayer.

2 Senator Young.

3 SENATOR YOUNG: Thank you,
4 Mr. President.

5 I extend my sincere congratulations
6 to each and every one of the nominees and their
7 families. We are so proud of you today, and
8 we're very grateful that you want to give this
9 type of public service to the people of New York
10 State.

11 However, I do want to talk about one
12 of the nominees in particular, and that is our
13 friend David Lewis.

14 David is someone who is extremely
15 well qualified to become a judge. He has been
16 associated with the New York State Senate for
17 many years, starting in 1990, when he was named
18 special counsel to the New York State Senate
19 Select Committee on Arts and Cultural Affairs,
20 under the chair of someone that many of us knew
21 long ago, and that's former Senator Roy Goodman.

22 So for the past 28 years, he has
23 been associated with the Senate, has done
24 excellent work on behalf of the Senators here.
25 And his resume is extremely impressive. He has

1 an extensive resume in professional teaching and
2 training, but he's also known for his brilliant
3 legal mind. And because of his contributions,
4 the people of New York State have reaped the
5 benefits of his expertise in developing
6 meaningful policy, which in many cases has
7 literally changed people's lives for the better.

8 So make no mistake, having David
9 move on today is a loss for our institution that
10 we hold so dear. But we are also very happy and
11 thrilled that he is starting a new chapter in his
12 life. And we wish him all the best, much
13 success, and we can't wait to call you Judge.

14 Thank you, Mr. President.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Thank
16 you, Senator Young.

17 The nominees feel free to be seated.

18 I've got a whole list. Just bear
19 with me, all right? Thank you, nominees.

20 We're going to go to Senator Parker.

21 SENATOR PARKER: Thank you,
22 Mr. President.

23 First let me congratulate all of the
24 nominees to the New York State Court of Claims.
25 I specifically rise to congratulate and to second

1 the nomination of Michele S. Rodney, who although
2 not a constituent is a good personal friend for,
3 you know, probably over 20 years.

4 This St. John's University Law
5 School graduate has served with distinction for
6 almost 15 years in the Bronx DA's office, and has
7 had a very distinguished legal career and has
8 been a member of both the Westchester and the New
9 Rochelle bars.

10 She is somebody whose work is also
11 outside of the courtroom, has been in the
12 classroom, where she has helped other people in
13 their legal careers. And I'm sure she is going
14 to serve the courts with distinction and honor,
15 and certainly brings a much-needed perspective
16 and diversity to the courts.

17 I want to also congratulate her
18 mother and father, Karl and Faye Rodney, who are
19 institutions, you know, in the Caribbean
20 community and in the larger journalistic
21 community. And certainly the fruit doesn't fall
22 far from the tree when it talks about hard work,
23 character and integrity. And I also want to
24 congratulate her sister as well.

25 And I just wanted to say how proud I

1 know I am and the people of my district are of
2 Michele Rodney, and we just all want to wish her
3 Godspeed in her journey to the bench.

4 And while I still rise, let me
5 associate myself with Senator Young's comments
6 about David Lewis, who is somebody who, you know,
7 I think almost all of us have dealt with, with
8 dignity and respect. He's somebody whose
9 expertise I think this institution has counted on
10 for a number of decades, and certainly he's going
11 to be missed. And I want to wish him well and
12 his family all the best of luck.

13 Thank you, Mr. President.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
15 Hamilton.

16 SENATOR HAMILTON: Yes,
17 Mr. President, I rise to congratulate all the
18 nominees to the New York Court of Claims. In
19 particular, I'm rising on behalf of Lillian Wan.

20 On the personal side, I know her as
21 being a dynamic woman, a great mother of two
22 children, and a great wife. As an attorney in
23 surrogates court, she was well respected as a
24 great attorney, dealing with families during a
25 time of hardship.

1 She was in the top five of her class
2 at Albany Law School and was on Law Review. And
3 she now works in Family Court in Kings County.

4 Kings County has 2.6 million people,
5 and Family Court in Kings County has the highest
6 rate of people coming in in the country. It has
7 a calendar that's second to none in the United
8 States. And many times the judges in Family
9 Court, I call them angels, or gods -- not gods,
10 but people who are compassionate about the
11 constituents in Kings County. And Lillian Wan is
12 one of those people. Because an average judge
13 goes from 9:00 to 5:00, but when you're in Family
14 Court in Kings County, you may go from 9 o'clock
15 to 6 o'clock, 7 o'clock at night.

16 And Lillian Wan is someone who has
17 stayed the course, who has worked hard. And
18 she's also making history, history in this
19 chamber, history in this state, as being the
20 first Asian-American woman to the Court of
21 Claims.

22 So I rise to pay tribute to all the
23 people to the Court of Claims, but especially to
24 Lillian Wan on making history. And I know she'll
25 bring compassion to the court and will be an

1 excellent judge in the Court of Claims.

2 Thank you.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Thank
4 you, Senator Hamilton.

5 Senator Bailey.

6 SENATOR BAILEY: Thank you,
7 Mr. President.

8 I associate myself with all of the
9 comments of my esteemed colleagues in making sure
10 that we recognize such a talented group and
11 diverse group -- though we could do a little bit
12 better on the diversity -- of wonderful
13 judges-to-be. Their records are beyond reproach.

14 And I just want to make a comment
15 about former dean -- I can't call her "Dean"
16 anymore -- Michele Rodney. I'm very sad that I
17 won't be able to call her dean, but we gained a
18 great mind on the bench.

19 And Senator Parker spoke about her
20 legal background, but I can speak about working
21 with her at Monroe College and her understanding
22 and leaving her door literally open to anybody
23 who wanted to come talk to her about anything,
24 whether it was personal, whether it was
25 professional, in the classroom or out.

1 That is the kind of person that we
2 need as a judge, because as an practicing
3 attorney, I know there are some attorneys that
4 I've practiced with that I wouldn't want to see
5 on the bench. Not going to name any names.

6 But Dean Rodney is certainly
7 somebody that has the temperament in what is
8 often the forgotten branch of government. We
9 focus on the legislative branch here, and we talk
10 about the executive, but sometimes we forget how
11 important it is to have good and qualified judges
12 on the bench.

13 And Michele Rodney, you exemplify
14 that. And I am happy to second your nomination
15 as well, and I look forward to a long and storied
16 career for you on the bench.

17 Thank you, Mr. President.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Thank
19 you, Senator Bailey.

20 Senator Sepúlveda.

21 SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA: Thank you,
22 Mr. President.

23 I too rise to congratulate every
24 single individual that's been nominated in their
25 own right. They have impeccable resumes. They

1 are wonderful jurists. And I'm sure that they'll
2 make us proud on the bench.

3 I too want to associate myself with
4 the comments of Senator Bailey regarding
5 Michele Rodney. She had an illustrious 14-year
6 career with the DA. As an educator, a dean of
7 the School of Criminal Justice of Monroe College,
8 she has put other students on the path to become
9 members of the legal profession.

10 But I'd be remiss not to take this
11 opportunity to underscore the fact that there is
12 still a lack of diversity on the bench of the
13 State of New York, especially amongst Latinos.
14 There are many wonderful Latino attorneys,
15 wonderful Latino educators in the legal
16 profession that are still -- that are still not
17 feeling like they're part of the judicial
18 process. That has to change. It is our
19 responsibility.

20 These individuals can serve as role
21 models for the future, for future lawyers who
22 aspire to become judges, who aspire to go to the
23 Court of Appeals and maybe aspire to become part
24 of the United States Supreme Court.

25 But today I want to congratulate all

1 of the individuals today, and I want to thank
2 them for their service to the State of New York.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Thank
4 you, Senator Sepúlveda.

5 Senator Bonacic.

6 SENATOR BONACIC: Real brief, I
7 want to congratulate all 11 judges. I want to
8 single out David Lewis. I know his bride,
9 Mrs. Lewis, would have loved to be here today,
10 but yesterday she had brain surgery.

11 And I want you to know we wish her a
12 speedy recovery and that she be home soon to join
13 you in the next chapter of your life.

14 Thank you, Mr. President.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Thank
16 you, Senator Bonacic.

17 Senator Flanagan.

18 SENATOR FLANAGAN: Thank you,
19 Mr. President.

20 I want to concur with the remarks of
21 Senator Bonacic and take a moment to just say
22 thank you to Senator Bonacic in his capacity as
23 chair of the Judiciary Committee. Anyone who
24 serves on the committee knows that he takes that
25 obligation very seriously, does a significant

1 vetting of all the candidates before the
2 committee, prior to the committee, and he does
3 follow-up as well.

4 So sometimes people overlook the
5 fact that the role of confirmation and consent by
6 the Senate is a perfunctory exercise when many of
7 us know that's simply not the case. So to
8 Senator Bonacic, thank you for your diligence,
9 your patience, and your service.

10 To our honorees who are here today,
11 of course congratulations to all of you, and to
12 your families who have stuck it out throughout
13 the day.

14 To David Lewis, David, best of luck,
15 good luck, congratulations.

16 And to Judge Martorana, who hails
17 from Suffolk County -- Kenny LaValle knows him
18 quite well also -- you know, I know he's supposed
19 to have deference -- "Honorable," "Judge," all
20 these different things. To us, Vinny, you're
21 still Vinny. You've been a great practicing
22 lawyer for many years. You got, obviously,
23 elected to the bench. This appointment was a
24 capstone in your career.

25 I just want to wish you

1 congratulations. It's great that you have your
2 wife here with you today.

3 And I have a special final
4 introduction for Judge Kelley. Judge Kelley is a
5 sitting judge in Suffolk County, and she is now
6 obviously going to be elevated to the Court of
7 Claims. So I want to tell -- Senator Bonacic
8 said he felt kind of bad. You've been here all
9 day, had to wait around, you weren't sure what's
10 going to happen.

11 I don't really feel that bad.
12 Because we have to run for office every two
13 years, and every one of you who is going to the
14 Court of Claims just got a nine- or ten-year
15 term, so you don't have to run for office. So if
16 the worst thing you have to do is sit around all
17 day, with that kind of action, I'll take it any
18 single day.

19 But Judge Kelly, a number of our
20 colleagues spoke to the resume of the people who
21 are now being confirmed. I read a bunch of
22 things about Chris Kelley's resume.

23 Chris is here with her spouse,
24 Jackie. And Marina, Calla, I got a chance to
25 spend some quality time with today. And it's

1 great to see government through the eyes of young
2 children, and they were enthralled -- well,
3 Calla, is 20, so maybe a young woman. But for
4 them to see the chamber, the Capitol, they were
5 in awe as the day progressed.

6 Now, the most important thing I can
7 tell you about Judge Kelley, if I knew nothing
8 else -- and it's not going to appear on her
9 resume -- she's an FOM, Friend of Mom. Chris and
10 my mother worked together in the Family Court for
11 many, many years. So if I ever needed any
12 vindication or any affirmation of her skill sets
13 or her talents, my mother said she's a great
14 person, great judge.

15 Chris, to you, your family, and to
16 everyone, best of luck and congratulations. Do
17 us proud, and do great things for the State of
18 New York.

19 Mr. President, thank you.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Thank
21 you, Senator Flanagan.

22 The question before the house is on
23 the names read for the position of Court of
24 Claims Judge for the State of New York. All in
25 favor say aye.

1 (Response of "Aye.")

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Opposed?

3 (No response.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Those
5 individuals that have been named and read are
6 hereby confirmed by the Senate as Court of Claims
7 Judges for the State of New York.

8 Please rise and be recognized.
9 Congratulations and best wishes.

10 (Standing ovation.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Our
12 congratulations and best wishes.

13 Senator DeFrancisco.

14 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: We are going
15 to stand at ease temporarily.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
17 Senate will stand temporarily at ease.

18 (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease
19 at 8:13 p.m.)

20 (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at
21 8:33 p.m.)

22 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO:
23 Mr. President. Mr. President, please.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BONACIC: The
25 Senate will come to order while I take a picture

1 with Senator Stavisky.

2 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Excuse me.

3 (Laughter.)

4 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: John, could
5 you please kiss down on the -- downstairs?

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
7 DeFrancisco.

8 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Yes. There
9 will be a Rules Committee meeting in 332 at
10 9:00 p.m., and an immediate meeting of the
11 Finance Committee to deal with some nonpaid
12 appointments.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There's
14 an immediate meeting of the Finance Committee in
15 Room 332. That will be followed by a meeting at
16 9:00 p.m. of the Rules Committee, also in
17 Room 332.

18 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Thank you.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
20 Senate will stand at ease.

21 And the podium is available to take
22 pictures with Senator Bonacic.

23 (Laughter.)

24 (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease
25 at 8:34 p.m.)

1 (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at
2 9:02 p.m.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
4 Senate returns to order.

5 Senator DeFrancisco for an
6 announcement.

7 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Not for an
8 announcement. Do we have a Rules Committee
9 agenda yet? I mean a Finance Committee report.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: We do
11 have a Finance Committee report at the desk.

12 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Can we take
13 up the report, please.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
15 Secretary will read.

16 THE SECRETARY: Senator Young, from
17 the Committee on Finance, reports the following
18 nominations.

19 As a member of the Port of Oswego
20 Authority: Francis Enwright.

21 As members of the Ogdensburg Bridge
22 and Port Authority: David King and Joseph
23 Andriano.

24 As a nonvoting member of the
25 Rochester-Genesee Regional Transportation

1 Authority: Jacques Chapman.

2 As a member of the New York Job
3 Development Authority: Alfredo Vazquez Assad.

4 As a commissioner of the State
5 Insurance Fund: Dennis Kessler.

6 As members of the Niagara Frontier
7 State Park, Recreation and Historic Preservation
8 Commission: Thomas A. Chambers, Ph.D., and Susan
9 Swiatkowski.

10 As a member of the Waterfront
11 Commission of New York Harbor: Paul T.
12 Weinstein.

13 As a director of the New York State
14 Urban Development Corporation: Eric Gertler.

15 As a member of the Board of
16 Directors of the New York Convention Center
17 Operating Corporation: Brian O'Dwyer.

18 As a member of the Dormitory
19 Authority of the State of New York: Wellington
20 Z. Chen.

21 As a member of the Battery Park City
22 Authority: Anthony S. Kendall.

23 As members of the Board of Directors
24 of the New York Convention Center Operating
25 Corporation: Steven C. Koppel and Fred Wesley

1 Dixon.

2 As members of the Veterans' Affairs
3 Commission: Ken Rosenblum, Tanye D.
4 Nelson-Waller, Kent Eiler, and Eugene Di Giacomo.

5 As a member of the Board of Visitors
6 for the New York State Home for Veterans and
7 Their Dependents at Batavia: Daniel J. Burling.

8 As a member of the Board of Visitors
9 for the New York State Home for Veterans and
10 Their Dependents at Montrose: Susan P. Hayel.

11 As a member of the Board of Visitors
12 of the Richard H. Hutchins Psychiatric Center:
13 Mary K. Bartowski.

14 As a member of the Board of Visitors
15 of the Helen Hayes Hospital: Mary Eileen
16 O'Brian, Ph.D.

17 As members of the Justice Center
18 Advisory Council: Jeffery R. Savoy; Hanns
19 Meissner, Ph.D.; Jason Edward Hershberger, Ph.D.;
20 and Thomas McAlvanah.

21 As a member of the Board of Visitors
22 of the Western New York Developmental
23 Disabilities Services Office: Michael P. Rogers.

24 As a member of the Board of Visitors
25 of the Rochester Psychiatric Center: David

1 Mullen.

2 As a member of the Board of Visitors
3 of the Rockland Psychiatric Center: John Allen
4 Murphy.

5 As members of the Board of Visitors
6 of the Staten Island Developmental Disabilities
7 Services Office: Patricia Yandoli and Bernardo
8 Pace.

9 As a member of the Board of Visitors
10 of the Sunmount Developmental Disabilities
11 Services Office: Wayne P. Rogers.

12 As members of the Behavioral Health
13 Services Advisory Council: Susan Saionone and
14 Donna Mae Depola.

15 As a member of the Board of Visitors
16 of the Elmira Psychiatric Center: Richard Arthur
17 Hamling.

18 As members of the Board of Visitors
19 of the Central New York Developmental
20 Disabilities Services Office: James A. Yonai,
21 Ph.D., and Young Hee-Lee.

22 As a member of the Board of Visitors
23 of the Buffalo Psychiatric Center: Tadeusz S.
24 Pietrzak.

25 As members of the Board of Visitors

1 of the Manhattan Psychiatric Center: Peter G.
2 Holden, Sr., and Felton Jenkins.

3 As members of the Board of Visitors
4 of the Binghamton Psychiatric Center: Nancy Ann
5 Thomas and Joyce Gioia.

6 As a member of the Board of Visitors
7 of the Kingsboro Psychiatric Center: Marie G.
8 Delus.

9 As members of the Board of Visitors
10 of the Capital District Developmental
11 Disabilities Services Office: Patricia K. Wright
12 and Linda E. Sartoris.

13 As a member of the Board of Visitors
14 of the Bronx Psychiatric Center: Gerald M.
15 Friedman.

16 As a member of the Board of Visitors
17 of the Mohawk Valley Psychiatric Center: Ramona
18 Rossi.

19 As members of the Board of Visitors
20 of the Richard H. Hutchins Psychiatric Center:
21 Patricia M. Okoniewski and Robert Feldman, Ph.D.

22 As a member of the Board of Visitors
23 of the Hudson Valley Developmental Disabilities
24 Services Office: William Evans.

25 As a member of the Board of Visitors

1 of the New York City Children's Center: Pasquale
2 DePetrìs, Ph.D.

3 As a commissioner of the State
4 Liquor Authority: Lily M. Fan.

5 And as a member of the Public Health
6 and Health Planning Council: Hugh R. Thomas.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
8 DeFrancisco, I'll entertain a motion.

9 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Yes, I move
10 to accept the report of the Finance Committee.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: All in
12 favor of accepting the report of the Finance
13 Committee say aye.

14 (Response of "Aye.")

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Opposed?

16 (No response.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
18 Finance Committee report has been accepted and is
19 before the house.

20 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Would you now
21 take up the nominations.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
23 Young.

24 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes, Mr. President.
25 I'm very honored and privileged to advance the

1 names that were just read off to be confirmed.

2 Thank you.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
4 Kavanagh.

5 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Thank you,
6 Mr. President.

7 I rise to speak of the nomination of
8 Anthony Kendall to the Battery Park City
9 Authority Board.

10 Mr. Kendall is someone who's lived
11 and worked in Battery Park City for many years.
12 He's a very distinguished nominee. He has been
13 the CEO of a major accounting firm in our
14 community. He is the chair of the Binghamton
15 University Alumni Association, for the Binghamton
16 folks in the room.

17 But for our purposes tonight, it's
18 particularly noteworthy that he is the second
19 resident of Battery Park City who is being
20 appointed to the seven-person board. That is
21 pursuant to a piece of legislation that was
22 negotiated and passed in this chamber and signed
23 by the Governor in December, with a recent
24 amendment to make it effective.

25 So I just want to thank all those

1 who brought this nomination forward and, more
2 than that, the people of Battery Park City who
3 have fought very hard and very long to have real
4 representation on that board. And again, I'd
5 like to acknowledge the great work of my
6 predecessor, Daniel Squadron, who worked long and
7 hard to get this done.

8 So thank you, Mr. President. I'll
9 be voting in the affirmative.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
11 Robach.

12 SENATOR ROBACH: Yes,
13 Mr. President, just real quickly. I wanted to
14 rise -- I'm happy that we're finally getting to
15 Hugh Thomas on the Public Hospital Planning
16 Commission.

17 And I'll just say expeditiously --
18 his resume is in the package -- he's done great
19 things to advance healthcare in Rochester, and I
20 think he'll be a great member of this board as
21 well. He's a great member of our community, with
22 a lot of expertise, both legal and in healthcare,
23 and this is good.

24 I would be remiss if I didn't take
25 this chance, though, since he stuck it out to be

1 here, I don't know why it took the Governor
2 three and a half years to send us the nomination,
3 but I'm glad it's finally here. Better late than
4 never.

5 Thank you, Mr. Thomas, for your
6 willingness to serve not only in Rochester but
7 the greater State of New York.

8 Thank you, Mr. President.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Thank
10 you, Senator Robach.

11 Senator Funke.

12 SENATOR FUNKE: Thank you,
13 Mr. President.

14 I really wanted to support Dennis
15 Kessler as a commissioner of the State Insurance
16 Fund.

17 He is a Northwestern and Yale Law
18 grad, professor of entrepreneurship at the
19 University of Rochester Simon School of Business.
20 He has also taught at CCNY and St. John Fisher
21 College and at SUNY Brockport -- all this while
22 operating 69 Friendlys and Burger King
23 restaurants. All this while serving his
24 community in a wide range of ways. All this
25 while giving back philanthropically, with his

1 brother Larry, and providing funding for the
2 Kessler Burn Center in Rochester and the Kessler
3 Trauma Center and the Kessler Center for People
4 with Disabilities.

5 He is smart, he is diligent, he is a
6 man of utmost integrity. He will make an
7 outstanding commissioner at the State Insurance
8 Fund.

9 So I wholly support Dennis Kessler
10 for this position. And again, it took two and a
11 half years to get this done, and that is not a
12 good thing. We need to figure out a better way
13 to handle these appointments.

14 Thank you very much.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Thank
16 you, Senator Funke.

17 The question before the house is on
18 the nominations of the individuals that have been
19 named for the positions that were so designated.
20 All those in favor signify by saying aye.

21 (Response of "Aye.")

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Opposed?

23 (No response.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:

25 Accordingly, all those individuals who have been

1 read and named for the positions that were
2 designated are hereby confirmed by the Senate.

3 Congratulations. We appreciate your
4 willingness to serve. Best of luck to you.

5 Let's acknowledge those in
6 attendance.

7 (Appause.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
9 DeFrancisco.

10 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: We will now
11 stand at ease.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
13 Senate will stand at ease.

14 (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease
15 at 9:12 p.m.)

16 (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at
17 10:35 p.m.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
19 Senate will come to order.

20 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: I'd like to
21 call an immediate meeting of the Rules Committee
22 in Room 332.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There
24 will be an immediate meeting of the Rules
25 Committee in Room 332, an immediate meeting of

1 the Rules Committee in Room 332.

2 The Senate is at ease.

3 (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease
4 at 10:35 p.m.)

5 (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at
6 10:55 p.m.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
8 Senate will come to order.

9 Senator DeFrancisco.

10 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Yes. Is
11 there a report of the Rules Committee at the
12 desk?

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There is
14 a report of the Rules Committee at the desk.

15 The Secretary will read.

16 THE SECRETARY: Senator Flanagan,
17 from the Committee on Rules, reports the
18 following bills:

19 Senate Print 2281, by Senator
20 Griffo, an act to amend the State Finance Law;

21 Senate 2493A, by Senator Phillips,
22 an act to amend the Education Law;

23 Senate 3362A, by Senator Krueger, an
24 act to amend the New York State Urban Development
25 Corporation Act;

1 Senate 3512, by Senator Ranzenhofer,
2 an act to amend the Education Law;

3 Senate 3875, by Senator Ranzenhofer,
4 an act to amend the Education Law;

5 Senate 3905A, by Senator Griffo, an
6 act to amend the Tax Law;

7 Senate 1156C, by Senator Ortt, an
8 act to amend the Insurance Law;

9 Senate 7199A, by Senator Seward, an
10 act to amend the Penal Law;

11 Senate 7211, by Senator LaValle, an
12 act to amend Chapter 464 of the Laws of 2016;

13 Senate 7536, by Senator Breslin, an
14 act to amend Chapter 105 of the Laws of 2009;

15 Senate 7945, by Senator Funke, an
16 act to amend the Education Law;

17 Senate 7960, by Senator Ranzenhofer,
18 an act to amend the Public Authorities Law;

19 Senate 7997A, by Senator Boyle, an
20 act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law;

21 Senate 8073A, by Senator Montgomery,
22 an act to amend the Labor Law;

23 Senate 8122A, by Senator Kennedy, an
24 act to amend Chapter 108 of the Laws of 2016;

25 Senate 8168, by Senator Griffo, an

1 act to amend the Education Law;

2 Senate 8286, by Senator Ortt, an act
3 to require;

4 Senate 8292, by Senator Little, an
5 act to authorize;

6 Senate 8311A, by Senator Griffo, an
7 act to amend the Public Service Law;

8 Senate 8362A, by Senator Ritchie, an
9 act to amend the Agriculture and Markets Law;

10 Senate 8377, by Senator Mayer, an
11 act to amend Chapter 89 of the Laws of 2009;

12 Senate 8519, by Senator O'Mara, an
13 act in relation to;

14 Senate 8565, by Senator LaValle, an
15 act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law;

16 Senate 8570, by Senator LaValle, an
17 act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law;

18 Senate 8759, by Senator Amedore, an
19 act to amend the Executive Law;

20 Senate 8760, by Senator Amedore, an
21 act to amend the Civil Practice Law and Rules;

22 Senate 8817A, by Senator Marcellino,
23 an act to incorporate;

24 Senate 8846, by Senator Gallivan, an
25 act to authorize;

1 Senate 8847A, by Senator Felder, an
2 act redistributing;

3 Senate 8938, by Senator Funke, an
4 act to amend the Tax Law;

5 Senate 8946, by Senator Lanza, an
6 act to amend the Public Authorities Law;

7 Senate 8968, by Senator Helming, an
8 act to amend the Executive Law;

9 Senate 8980A, by Senator Jacobs, an
10 act to amend the Criminal Procedure Law;

11 Senate 8999B, by Senator Mayer, an
12 act to amend the Public Service Law;

13 Senate 9008, by Senator Flanagan, an
14 act to amend the Social Services Law;

15 Senate 9011B, by Senator Little, an
16 act to authorize;

17 Senate 9038, by Senator Ortt, an act
18 to amend the Public Service Law;

19 Senate 9044, by Senator Murphy, an
20 act to amend the Tax Law;

21 Senate 9071, by Senator Ortt, an act
22 to amend the Public Health Law;

23 Senate 8713, by Senator Gallivan, an
24 action granting;

25 Senate 9116, by Senator Hamilton, an

1 act to amend the Criminal Procedure Law;

2 Senate 8783, by Senator Golden, an

3 act to amend the Private Housing Finance Law;

4 Senate 9004, by Senator Boyle, an

5 act establishing;

6 Senate 7837, by Senator Kennedy, an

7 act to amend the Public Authorities Law;

8 Senate 8875, by Senator

9 Stewart-Cousins, an act to amend the Vehicle and
10 Traffic Law; and

11 Senate 9102, by Senator Savino, an

12 act to amend the Public Health Law.

13 All bills reported direct to third
14 reading.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
16 DeFrancisco.

17 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: I now move to
18 accept the report of the Rules Committee, please.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: All in
20 favor of accepting the Committee on Rules report
21 say aye.

22 (Response of "Aye.")

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Opposed?

24 (No response.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The

1 Rules Committee report is accepted and before the
2 house.

3 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Can we go
4 back to messages from the Assembly.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: We'll go
6 back to messages from the Assembly, and the
7 Secretary will read. (Pause.)

8 Senator DeFrancisco, it will take us
9 a couple of minutes. The desk is organizing the
10 subs right now as they've been brought to the
11 chamber.

12 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: That's quite
13 all right. We have nothing else to do.

14 (Pause.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Okay, we
16 are ready to read the subs from the sub report.

17 If I can have some order, please,
18 the Secretary will begin.

19 THE SECRETARY: Senator Krueger
20 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
21 Assembly Bill Number 8292A and substitute it for
22 the identical Senate Bill 3362A, Third Reading
23 Calendar 2102.

24 Senator Ortt moves to discharge,
25 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill

1 Number 3694C and substitute it for the identical
2 Senate Bill 1156C, Third Reading Calendar 2106.

3 Senator LaValle moves to discharge,
4 from the Committee on Environmental Conservation,
5 Assembly Bill Number 8747 and substitute it for
6 the identical Senate Bill 7211, Third Reading
7 Calendar 2108.

8 Senator Breslin moves to discharge,
9 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
10 Number 9622 and substitute it for the identical
11 Senate Bill 7536, Third Reading Calendar 2109.

12 Senator Boyle moves to discharge,
13 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
14 Number 11040 and substitute it for the identical
15 Senate Bill 7997A, Third Reading Calendar 2112.

16 Senator Kennedy moves to discharge,
17 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
18 Number 10298A and substitute it for the identical
19 Senate Bill 8122A, Third Reading Calendar 2114.

20 Senator Little moves to discharge,
21 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
22 Number 10492 and substitute it for the identical
23 Senate Bill 8292, Third Reading Calendar 2117.

24 Senator Griffo moves to discharge,
25 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill

1 Number 8010A and substitute it for the identical
2 Senate Bill 8311A, Third Reading Calendar 2118.

3 Senator Ritchie moves to discharge,
4 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
5 Number 10301B and substitute it for the identical
6 Senate Bill 8362A, Third Reading Calendar 2119.

7 Senator Mayer moves to discharge,
8 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
9 Number 10516 and substitute it for the identical
10 Senate Bill 8377, Third Reading Calendar 2120.

11 Senator LaValle moves to discharge,
12 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
13 Number 10682 and substitute it for the identical
14 Senate Bill 8565, Third Reading Calendar 2122.

15 Senator LaValle moves to discharge,
16 from the Committee on Environmental Conservation,
17 Assembly Bill Number 10506A and substitute it for
18 the identical Senate Bill 8570, Third Reading
19 Calendar 2123.

20 Senator Amedore moves to discharge,
21 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
22 Number 10403 and substitute it for the identical
23 Senate Bill 8760, Third Reading Calendar 2125.

24 Senator Marcellino moves to
25 discharge, from the Committee on Rules,

1 Assembly Bill Number 11115A and substitute it for
2 the identical Senate Bill 8817A, Third Reading
3 Calendar 2126.

4 Senator Felder moves to discharge,
5 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
6 Number 10971A and substitute it for the identical
7 Senate Bill 8847A, Third Reading Calendar 2128.

8 Senator Funke moves to discharge,
9 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
10 Number 4572A and substitute it for the identical
11 Senate Bill 8938, Third Reading Calendar 2129.

12 Senator Lanza moves to discharge,
13 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
14 Number 9805A and substitute it for the identical
15 Senate Bill 8946, Third Reading Calendar 2130.

16 Senator Helming moves to discharge,
17 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
18 Number 9981A and substitute it for the identical
19 Senate Bill 8968, Third Reading Calendar 2131.

20 Senator Mayer moves to discharge,
21 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
22 Number 11118C and substitute it for the identical
23 Senate Bill 8999B, Third Reading Calendar 2133.

24 Senator Flanagan moves to discharge,
25 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill

1 Number 10697 and substitute it for the identical
2 Senate Bill 9008, Third Reading Calendar 2134.

3 Senator Little moves to discharge,
4 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
5 Number 11193A and substitute it for the identical
6 Senate Bill 9011B, Third Reading Calendar 2135.

7 Senator Murphy moves to discharge,
8 from the Committee on Veterans, Homeland Security
9 and Military Affairs, Assembly Bill Number 3842A
10 and substitute it for the identical Senate
11 Bill 9044, Third Reading Calendar 2137.

12 Senator Gallivan moves to discharge,
13 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
14 Number 10770 and substitute it for the identical
15 Senate Bill 8713, Third Reading Calendar 2139.

16 Senator Hamilton moves to discharge,
17 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
18 Number 11185 and substitute it for the identical
19 Senate Bill 9116, Third Reading Calendar 2140.

20 Senator Golden moves to discharge,
21 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
22 Number 10828 and substitute it for the identical
23 Senate Bill 8783, Third Reading Calendar 2141.

24 Senator Kennedy moves to discharge,
25 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill

1 Number 10074 and substitute it for the identical
2 Senate Bill 7837, Third Reading Calendar 2143.

3 And Senator Stewart-Cousins moves
4 to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
5 Assembly Bill Number 10961A and substitute it
6 for the identical Senate Bill 8875,
7 Third Reading Calendar 2144.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
9 substitutions are so ordered as read and
10 presented to the house.

11 Senator DeFrancisco.

12 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO:
13 Mr. President, there is a supplemental active
14 list, starting with Calendar 46, by
15 Senator Griffio. I'd like to do the
16 noncontroversial reading of that bill.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
18 Secretary will read.

19 Senator DeFrancisco, before we begin
20 the calendar, we just received another batch of
21 messages from the Assembly for substitutions.
22 Can you allow us to go back to messages from the
23 Assembly to allow those subs to be put in?

24 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Excellent
25 idea.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Okay,
2 we'll return to messages from the Assembly, and
3 the Secretary will read.

4 THE SECRETARY: On page 4,
5 Senator Griffo moves to discharge, from the
6 Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill Number 8921A
7 and substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
8 7318A, Third Reading Calendar 46.

9 On page 20, Senator Savino moves to
10 discharge, from the Committee on Judiciary,
11 Assembly Bill Number 7899A and substitute it for
12 the identical Senate Bill 6217A, Third Reading
13 Calendar 595.

14 On page 29, Senator Bonacic moves to
15 discharge, from the Committee on Judiciary,
16 Assembly Bill Number 9564 and substitute it for
17 the identical Senate Bill 6179A, Third Reading
18 Calendar 811.

19 On page 36, Senator Croci moves to
20 discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
21 Assembly Bill Number 10859 and substitute it for
22 the identical Senate Bill 7907, Third Reading
23 Calendar 987.

24 On page 36, Senator O'Mara moves to
25 discharge, from the Committee on Rules,

1 Assembly Bill Number 10611 and substitute it for
2 the identical Senate Bill 7953, Third Reading
3 Calendar 991.

4 On page 46, Senator Murphy moves to
5 discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
6 Assembly Bill Number 9640A and substitute it for
7 the identical Senate Bill 7603A, Third Reading
8 Calendar 1237.

9 On page 57, Senator Golden moves to
10 discharge, from the Committee on Alcoholism and
11 Drug Abuse, Assembly Bill Number 8151 and
12 substitute it for the identical Senate Bill 8552,
13 Third Reading Calendar 1428.

14 On page 61, Senator Hannon moves to
15 discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
16 Assembly Bill Number 397B and substitute it for
17 the identical Senate Bill 7522A, Third Reading
18 Calendar 1498.

19 On page 62, Senator LaValle moves to
20 discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
21 Assembly Bill Number 10681A and substitute it for
22 the identical Senate Bill 8658A, Third Reading
23 Calendar 1617.

24 On page 65, Senator Ritchie moves to
25 discharge, from the Committee on Rules,

1 Assembly Bill Number 10803 and substitute it for
2 the identical Senate Bill 5309B, Third Reading
3 Calendar 1835.

4 On page 66, Senator Gallivan moves
5 to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
6 Assembly Bill Number 5539B and substitute it for
7 the identical Senate Bill 8272A, Third Reading
8 Calendar 1873.

9 On page 67, Senator Serino moves to
10 discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
11 Assembly Bill Number 10743A and substitute it for
12 the identical Senate Bill 8928, Third Reading
13 Calendar 1895.

14 And on page 68, Senator Golden moves
15 to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
16 Assembly Bill Number 11241 and substitute it for
17 the identical Senate Bill 8837A, Third Reading
18 Calendar 1976.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
20 substitutions are so ordered as read and
21 presented.

22 Senator DeFrancisco.

23 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Now can we
24 take up the supplemental active list, starting
25 with Calendar 46 by Senator Griffio.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: We will
2 begin the noncontroversial reading of the
3 supplemental active list with Calendar Number 46.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 46,
5 substituted earlier by Member of the Assembly
6 Paulin, Assembly Print 8921A, an act to amend the
7 Public Service Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
17 passes.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 595, substituted earlier by Member of the
20 Assembly Rozic, Assembly Print 7899A, an act to
21 amend the Surrogate's Court Procedure Act.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
5 Savino to explain her vote.

6 SENATOR SAVINO: Thank you,
7 Mr. President.

8 I want to thank all of my colleagues
9 for supporting this piece of legislation, which
10 may seem like an arcane change to the
11 Surrogate's Court Procedure Act, but in fact it
12 is very timely.

13 The Surrogate's Court Procedure Act
14 allows a parent or guardian to designate a
15 standby guardian in the event of their
16 incapacity, their debilitation or their death.
17 We are seeking to amend that to allow a parent to
18 add a standby guardian in the event of an
19 administrative separation between them and their
20 child.

21 As we speak, the country is
22 transfixed with what is happening at the border
23 and in detention centers, where parents and
24 children are being separated as a result of the
25 immigration status of the parents. This bill

1 will allow parents to designate a guardian that
2 they trust, that they know, that they may be
3 related to, who has status here in the
4 United States to protect those children.

5 As a former caseworker, I can tell
6 you I am still haunted by the experience of
7 separating children from their parents. It is a
8 traumatic experience for children that they never
9 get over. The ability to place them with someone
10 that they know and trust is so critically
11 important.

12 And I want to thank each and every
13 one of you for helping me with this. Senator
14 Golden, you were there; Senator Felder; and of
15 course our leader Senator Stewart-Cousins. And I
16 want to thank the staff for making sure this bill
17 made it on, the last bill of the night. It is
18 that important that we protect children when they
19 need it the most.

20 Thank you, Mr. President.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
22 Savino in the affirmative.

23 Announce the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill

1 passes.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 811, substituted earlier by Member of the
4 Assembly Dinowitz, Assembly Print 9564, an act to
5 amend the Uniform Commercial Code.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
15 passes.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 987, substituted earlier by Member of the
18 Assembly Pellegrino, Assembly Print 10859, an act
19 to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
3 Kaminsky to explain his vote.

4 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Thank you.

5 Although I would like to use this
6 time to speak of my love of scallops, I instead
7 want to speak of my affection for the sponsor of
8 the bill, Senator Croci. He's really been the
9 MVP of our conference over the last few weeks and
10 has really taken us --

11 (Laughter.)

12 SENATOR KAMINSKY: -- really taken
13 us farther than we really have ever been in a
14 long time, and I want to thank him. I never
15 really understood the phrase "less is more" until
16 the last few weeks.

17 And I wish him well. I actually do
18 appreciate his service.

19 But I vote in the affirmative.
20 Thank you.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Announce
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
24 Calendar 987, those recorded in the negative are
25 Senators Gallivan, Griffio, Ortt and Ritchie.

1 Also Senator Little. Also Senator Helming.

2 Ayes, 54. Nays, 6.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 991, substituted earlier by Member of the
7 Assembly Stern, Assembly Print 10611, an act to
8 amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
12 act shall take effect immediately.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
18 passes.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 1071, by Senator Ranzenhofer, Senate Print 3238,
21 an act to amend the Alcoholic Beverage Control
22 Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This

1 act shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Announce
6 the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
8 Calendar 1071, those recorded in the negative are
9 Senators Alcantara, Bailey, Benjamin, Breslin,
10 Comrie, Dilan, Gianaris, Hamilton, Hoylman,
11 Krueger, Montgomery, Peralta, Persaud, Sanders,
12 Sepúlveda and Serrano.

13 Ayes, 44. Nays, 16.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 1097, by Senator Tedisco, Senate Print 2883A, an
18 act to amend the Executive Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
22 act shall take effect on the 90th day.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
3 passes.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 1237, substituted earlier by Member of the
6 Assembly Galef, Assembly Print 9640A, an act to
7 amend the Executive Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
17 passes.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 1291, by Senator Murphy, Senate Print 7262A, an
20 act to amend the Public Service Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
5 passes.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 1300, by Senator DeFrancisco, Senate Print 7671,
8 an act to amend the Public Authorities Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 7. This
12 act shall take effect immediately.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
17 DeFrancisco to explain his vote.

18 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Yes. I voted
19 for the naming of the bridge, the Mario Cuomo
20 Bridge. And it wasn't until I started running
21 around the state seeking the Republican
22 nomination for governor that I realized the
23 historical significance of the name Tappan Zee.

24 Anytime I was in the Hudson Valley,
25 I heard from people saying this is a historic

1 name and has meaning, this is wrong. Many wanted
2 to remove the name Mario Cuomo from the bridge
3 and go back to Tappan Zee.

4 It seemed to me that a reasonable
5 compromise would be to name it the Mario Cuomo
6 Tappan Zee Bridge. And those thousands upon
7 thousands of people who signed petitions calling
8 for it to be changed were satisfied with that
9 compromise.

10 I want to make it clear this is no
11 disrespect to Mario Cuomo. His name will forever
12 be on the bridge. I served in the Senate for
13 two years under Mario Cuomo, and he was an
14 honorable individual who did a lot of things for
15 the state.

16 So this compromise I think respects
17 both history and the service of Mario Cuomo, and
18 that's why I brought the bill, that's why I'm
19 voting yes, and that's why I'm asking for support
20 of this body.

21 Thank you.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
23 DeFrancisco in the affirmative.

24 Announce the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: In relation to

1 Calendar 1300, those recorded in the negative are
2 Senators Alcantara, Bailey, Benjamin, Breslin,
3 Brooks, Dilan, Gianaris, Hamilton, Hoylman,
4 Kaminsky, Kavanagh, Kennedy, Klein, Peralta,
5 Sanders, Savino, Sepúlveda, and Serrano. Also
6 Senator Krueger. Also Senator Persaud.

7 Ayes, 40. Nays, 20.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
9 passes.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1428, substituted earlier by Member of the
12 Assembly Rosenthal, Assembly Print 8151, an act
13 to amend the Mental Hygiene Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
17 act shall take effect on the 180th day.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
23 passes.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 1434, by Senator Golden, Senate Print 1634B, an

1 act to amend the Administrative Code of the City
2 of New York.

3 SENATOR KLEIN: Lay it aside,
4 please.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Lay it
6 aside.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 1498, substituted earlier by Member of the
9 Assembly Gunther, Assembly Print 397B, an act to
10 amend the Public Health Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
14 act shall take effect on the 90th day.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
20 passes.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1500, by Senator Hannon, Senate Print 8082A, an
23 act to amend the Public Health Law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
25 last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
2 act shall take effect January 1, 2019.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
8 passes.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 1617, substituted earlier by Member of the
11 Assembly Thiele, Assembly Print 10681A, an act
12 authorizing.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There is
14 a home-rule message present at the desk.

15 The Secretary will read the last
16 section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
18 act shall take effect immediately.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1815, by Senator Amedore, Senate Print 893, an
2 act to establish.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
12 passes.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 1817, by Senator Marcellino, Senate Print 1261,
15 an act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
19 act shall take effect on the 60th day.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.
24 Senator Marchione recorded in the negative.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill

1 passes.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 1829, by Senator Seward, Senate Print 4288, an
4 act to amend the State Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
8 act shall take effect immediately.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
13 Krueger to explain her vote.

14 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you.

15 I consulted with the state tree
16 frog, and he doesn't think we should have
17 baseball as our official sport. So I'm voting
18 no.

19 (Laughter.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
21 Krueger in the negative.

22 Announce the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
24 Calendar 1829, those recorded in the negative are
25 Senators Hoylman, Kavanagh, Krueger and

1 Sepúlveda.

2 Ayes, 56. Nays, 4.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
4 passes.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 1832, by Senator Helming, Senate Print 4536A, an
7 act to amend the Public Health Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 1835, substituted earlier by Member of the
20 Assembly Magee, Assembly Print 10803, an act to
21 amend the Agriculture and Markets Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 16. This
25 act shall take effect on the 120th day.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
6 is passed.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 1842, by Senator Ritchie, Senate Print 5897A, an
9 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
11 last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
13 act shall take effect on the first of November.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
19 passes.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 1873, substituted earlier by Member of the
22 Assembly Weprin, Assembly Print 5539B, an act to
23 amend the Municipal Home Rule Law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
25 last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
2 act shall take effect immediately.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
8 is passed.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 1895, substituted earlier by Member of the
11 Assembly Byrne, Assembly Print 10743A, an act to
12 amend the Town Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
16 act shall take effect immediately.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
22 passes.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 1976, substituted earlier by the Assembly
25 Committee on Rules, Assembly Print 11241, an act

1 to amend the Civil Service Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
5 act shall take effect immediately.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
11 passes.

12 And Senator DeFrancisco, that
13 completes the noncontroversial reading of the
14 active list currently before the house.

15 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: All right.
16 Can we now take up Calendar 1342, that's Senate
17 Print 6424A, by Senator Ritchie.

18 (Lengthy pause.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
20 Senate will return to order.

21 The Secretary will read.

22 THE SECRETARY: Senator Ritchie
23 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
24 Assembly Bill Number 7265A and substitute it for
25 the identical Senate Bill 6424A, Third Reading

1 Calendar 1342.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
3 substitution is so ordered, and the Secretary
4 will read.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 1342, by Member of the Assembly Abinanti,
7 Assembly Print 7265A, an act to amend the
8 State Finance Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
10 Secretary will read the last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
12 act shall take effect immediately.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
18 is passed.

19 The Secretary will continue.

20 THE SECRETARY: Senator Flanagan
21 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
22 Assembly Bill Number 10926 and substitute it for
23 the identical Senate Bill 8886, Third Reading
24 Calendar 1893.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The

1 substitution is so ordered, and the Secretary
2 will read.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 1893, by Member of the Assembly Englebright,
5 Assembly Print 10926, an act to authorize.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.
14 Senator Akshar recorded in the negative.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
16 passes.

17 Senator DeFrancisco, that now
18 completes the noncontroversial reading that we
19 had with those two subs that we had talked about
20 earlier on this current active list before the
21 house. There has been one lay-aside.

22 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO:
23 Mr. President, we have a Senate Supplemental
24 Calendar 58B, which is the bills that were just
25 dealt with in Rules most recently. May we have

1 the noncontroversial reading of that calendar.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
3 Secretary will begin the noncontroversial reading
4 of Senate Supplemental Calendar 58B,
5 noncontroversial.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 2100, by Senator Griffo, Senate Print 2281, an
8 act to amend the State Finance Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
12 act shall take effect immediately.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
18 passes.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 2101, by Senator Phillips, Senate Print 2493A, an
21 act to amend the Education Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Announce
5 the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
7 Calendar Number 2101, those recorded in the
8 negative are Senators Bailey, Comrie, Dilan,
9 Gianaris, Hoylman, Kavanagh, Krueger, Montgomery,
10 Peralta, Persaud, Sanders and Sepúlveda.

11 Ayes, 48. Nays, 12.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
13 passes.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 2102, substituted earlier by Member of the
16 Assembly Seawright, Assembly Print 8292A, an act
17 to amend the New York State Urban Development
18 Corporation Act.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
22 act shall take effect immediately.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
3 passes.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 2103, by Senator Ranzenhofer, Senate Print 3512,
6 an act to amend the Education Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
16 passes.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 2104, by Senator Ranzenhofer, Senate Print 3875,
19 an act to amend the Education Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
23 act shall take effect on the 120th day.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
4 passes.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 2105, by Senator Griffo, Senate Print 3905A, an
7 act to amend the Tax Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
17 passes.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 2106, substituted earlier by Member of the
20 Assembly Gunther, Assembly Print 3694C, an act to
21 amend the Insurance Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
25 act shall take effect on the 60th day.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
6 is passed.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 2107, by Senator Seward, Senate Print 7199A, an
9 act to amend the Penal Law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
11 last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
13 act shall take effect immediately.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
18 Calendar 2107, those recorded in the negative are
19 Senators Hoylman, Kavanaugh, Montgomery and
20 Sepúlveda.

21 Ayes, 56. Nays, 4.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 2108, substituted earlier by Member of the

1 Assembly Englebright, Assembly Print 8747, an act
2 to amend Chapter 464 of the Laws of 2016.

3 SENATOR O'MARA: Lay it aside.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
5 will be laid aside for the day.

6 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Nope.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: No? Just
8 lay it aside.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 2109, by Member of the Assembly McDonald,
11 Assembly Print 9622, an act to amend Chapter 105
12 of the Laws of 2009.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
16 act shall take effect immediately.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
21 Calendar Number 2109, those recorded in the
22 negative are Senators Brooks, Kaminsky and
23 Murphy. Also Senator Lanza.

24 Ayes, 56. Nays, 4.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill

1 is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 2110, by Senator Funke, Senate Print 7945, an act
4 to amend the Education Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
8 act shall take effect August 1, 2018.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
14 passes.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 2111, by Senator Ranzenhofer, Senate Print 7960,
17 an act to amend the Public Authorities Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
2 passes.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 2112, substituted earlier by the Assembly
5 Committee on Rules, Assembly Print 11040, an act
6 to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

7 SENATOR O'MARA: Lay it aside.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Lay it
9 aside.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 2113, by Senator Montgomery, Senate Print 8073A,
12 an act to amend the Labor Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
16 act shall take effect one year after it shall
17 have become a law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.
22 Senator Little recorded in the negative.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
24 passes.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 2114, substituted earlier by Member of the
2 Assembly Peoples-Stokes, Assembly Print 10298A,
3 an act to amend Chapter 108 of the Laws of 2016.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There is
5 a home-rule message present at the desk.

6 The Secretary will read the last
7 section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 2115, by Senator Griffo, Senate Print 8168, an
18 act to amend the Education Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
22 act shall take effect on the 180th day.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
3 passes.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 2116, by Senator Ortt, Senate Print 8286, an act
6 to require.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
16 passes.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 2117, substituted earlier by Member of the
19 Assembly Stec, Assembly Print 10492, an act to
20 authorize.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 2118, substituted earlier by Member of the
8 Assembly Dinowitz, Assembly Print 8010B, an act
9 to amend the Public Service Law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
11 last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
13 act shall take effect immediately.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
19 passes.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 2119, substituted earlier by Member of the
22 Assembly Barrett, Assembly Print 10301B, an act
23 to amend the Agriculture and Markets Law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
25 last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
2 act shall take effect on the 90th day.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
8 passes.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 2120, substituted earlier by Member of the
11 Assembly Otis, Assembly Print 10516, an act to
12 amend Chapter 89 of the Laws of 2009.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
16 act shall take effect immediately.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
21 Calendar 2120, those recorded in the negative are
22 Senators Brooks, Kaminsky, Lanza, Murphy and
23 Seward.

24 Ayes, 55. Nays, 5.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill

1 is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 2121, by Senator O'Mara, Senate Print 8519, an
4 act in relation to authorizing.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
8 act shall take effect immediately.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
14 passes.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 2122, substituted earlier by Member of the
17 Assembly Englebright, Assembly Print 10682, an
18 act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

19 SENATOR O'MARA: Lay it aside.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Lay it
21 aside.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 2123, substituted earlier by Member of the
24 Assembly Englebright, Assembly Print 10506A, an
25 act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

1 SENATOR O'MARA: Lay it aside.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Lay it
3 aside.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 2124, by Senator Amedore, Senate Print 8759, an
6 act to amend the Executive Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.
15 Senator Montgomery recorded in the negative.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
17 passes.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 2125, substituted earlier by Member of the
20 Assembly Fahy, Assembly Print 10403, an act to
21 amend the Civil Practice Law and Rules.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
6 is passed.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 2126, substituted earlier by the Assembly
9 Committee on Rules, Assembly Print 11115A, an act
10 to incorporate.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
14 act shall take effect immediately.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
20 passes.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 2127, by Senator Gallivan, Senate Print 8846, an
23 act to authorize.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There is
25 a home-rule message at the desk.

1 The Secretary will read the last
2 section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
4 act shall take effect immediately.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
10 passes.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 2128, substituted earlier by Member of the
13 Assembly Magnarelli, Assembly Print 10971A, an
14 act redistributing bond volume.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
18 act shall take effect immediately.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 2129, substituted earlier by Member of the
2 Assembly Magee, Assembly Print 4572A, an act to
3 amend the Tax Law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
7 act shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
13 is passed.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 2130, substituted earlier by Member of the
16 Assembly Abinanti, Assembly Print 9805A, an act
17 to amend the Public Authorities Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
21 act shall take effect on the 120th day.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
2 passes.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 2131, substituted earlier by Member of the
5 Assembly Wallace, Assembly Print 9981A, an act to
6 amend the Executive Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 2132, by Senator Jacobs, Senate Print 8980A, an
19 act to amend the Criminal Procedure Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Announce
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
6 Calendar 2132, those recorded in the negative are
7 Senators Alcantara, Comrie, Dilan, Gianaris,
8 Hoylman, Kavanagh, Krueger, Persaud, Sanders and
9 Sepúlveda. Also Senator Bailey.

10 Ayes, 49. Nays, 11.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 2133, substituted earlier by the Assembly
15 Committee on Rules, Assembly Print 11118C, an act
16 to amend the Public Service Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
20 act shall take effect immediately.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill

1 is passed.

2 The Secretary will continue.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 2134, substituted earlier by Member of the
5 Assembly Hevesi, Assembly Print 10697, an act to
6 amend the Social Services Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
15 Krueger to explain her vote.

16 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you,
17 Mr. President. I would have laid it aside for a
18 debate, but it's midnight.

19 (Scattered applause; laughter.)

20 SENATOR KRUEGER: And in fact,
21 federal law would not accept a waiver to take
22 SNAP money and use it for multivitamins as
23 opposed to food.

24 The fact is SNAP provides minimal
25 money for food already. In fact, it works out to

1 only \$1.40 a meal, on average. We can't afford
2 to take money away from poor people for food. We
3 should be expanding the program so that they can
4 afford more quality foods.

5 And the research shows that
6 multivitamins and other forms of food supplements
7 can be significantly more expensive than actual
8 food for people and be less effective as far as
9 nutrient intake. And many of these products are
10 not even tested correctly at any national
11 standards level.

12 So it's a mistake that hopefully the
13 federal government won't change their law and
14 give us that option. Right now we don't have
15 that option. And yet I'm still voting no.

16 Thank you, Mr. President.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
18 Krueger to be recorded in the negative.

19 Announce the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
21 Calendar 2134, those recorded in the negative are
22 Senators Hoylman, Krueger, Sanders and Sepúlveda.

23 Ayes, 56. Nays, 4.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
25 passes.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 2135, substituted earlier by the Assembly
3 Committee on Rules, Assembly Print 11193A, an act
4 to authorize.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
8 act shall take effect immediately.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There is
10 a home-rule message at the desk.

11 Read the last section.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 2136, by Senator Ortt, Senate Print 9038, an act
18 to amend the Public Service Law.

19 SENATOR KLEIN: Lay it aside,
20 please.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Lay it
22 aside.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 2137, substituted earlier by Member of the
25 Assembly Ortiz, Assembly Print 3842A, an act to

1 amend the Tax Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
5 act shall take effect immediately.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
11 passes.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 2138, by Senator Ortt, Senate Print 9071, an act
14 to amend the Public Health Law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
18 act shall take effect immediately.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 2139, substituted earlier by Member of the
2 Assembly Errigo, Assembly Print 10770, an act
3 granting.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
7 act shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
13 passes.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 2140, substituted earlier by the Assembly
16 Committee on Rules, Assembly Print 11185, an act
17 to amend the Criminal Procedure Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
3 Calendar 2140, those recorded in the negative are
4 Senators Bailey, Comrie, Dilan, Kavanagh,
5 Krueger, Montgomery, Sanders and Sepúlveda.

6 Ayes, 52. Nays, 8.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
8 is passed.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 2141, substituted earlier by Member of the
11 Assembly Cymbrowitz, Assembly Print 10828, an act
12 to amend the Private Housing Finance Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
16 act shall take effect immediately.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
22 passes.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 2142, by Senator Boyle, Senate Print 9004, an act
25 establishing.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
2 last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 7. This
4 act shall take effect immediately.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
9 Boyle to explain his vote.

10 SENATOR BOYLE: Yes, Mr. President,
11 to explain my vote.

12 This bill is being put forward in
13 memory of Jovani Ligurgo, a 2-year-old who was
14 recently killed in Virginia. He was abducted by
15 his father, the father's house was set ablaze,
16 and the father drove Jovani to Virginia, where he
17 killed the child and committed suicide.

18 For some reason, Suffolk County
19 police officials had contacted the State Police
20 to ask for an Amber Alert when the child went
21 missing -- a couple of times -- and the Amber
22 Alert was never issued. It could have saved
23 Jovani's life.

24 We want to guard against this ever
25 happening again. There's some reason -- the

1 criteria of an Amber Alert is that a child is in
2 danger. A 2-year-old abducted, a house set on
3 fire, and the perpetrator has a gun; that child
4 was in danger. We want to make sure that the
5 criteria is the best it can be to protect our
6 children, and this creates a temporary commission
7 to make recommendations. I vote in favor.

8 Thank you.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
10 Boyle in the affirmative.

11 Announce the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 2143, substituted earlier by Member of the
17 Assembly Peoples-Stokes, Assembly Print 10074, an
18 act to amend the Public Authorities Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There is
20 a home-rule message at the desk.

21 The Secretary will read the last
22 section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
5 passes.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 2144, substituted earlier by Member of the
8 Assembly Abinanti, Assembly Print 10961A, an act
9 to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There is
11 a home-rule message at the desk.

12 The Secretary will read the last
13 section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
15 act shall take effect immediately.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
21 passes.

22 Senator DeFrancisco, that completes
23 the noncontroversial reading of the bills before
24 the house in Senate Supplemental Calendar 58B.

25 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO:

1 Mr. President, pursuant to Rule 6, Section 2, I
2 move to remain in session past midnight.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: It is so
4 ordered. Without objection, so ordered.

5 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Now I'd like
6 to go back to the supplemental active list.
7 There was one bill laid aside, Senator Golden's
8 bill. Could we please have the controversial
9 reading, please.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
11 Secretary will ring the bell.

12 The Secretary will read.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 1434, by Senator Golden, Senate Print 1634B, an
15 act to amend the Administrative Code of the City
16 of New York.

17 SENATOR KLEIN: Explanation,
18 please.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: An
20 explanation has been requested by Senator Klein.

21 Senator Golden.

22 SENATOR GOLDEN: Thank you,
23 Mr. President.

24 This is a safety zone that would be
25 set up within the City of New York around

1 schools. There's present right now -- 50 schools
2 were added since 2014 to set up these safety
3 zones around the City of New York. What this
4 would do, it would add to that safety zone an
5 actual speed limit sign, the hours on the sign,
6 and blinking yellows that would be in the school
7 zones around the City of New York.

8 So if somebody is driving into a
9 school zone, they would see those blinking
10 yellows, they would see the speed limit and they
11 would see the hours of the speed limit. And that
12 would reduce accidents and reduce harm to our
13 children, and it would enhance public safety in
14 the City of New York.

15 We've been trying to get this bill
16 done for a number of years. The city has
17 declined to do it. I think it's long overdue.
18 And hopefully this conference here will see the
19 value of this bill for our kids and pass this.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
21 Klein.

22 SENATOR KLEIN: Mr. President,
23 would the sponsor yield for a couple of
24 questions.

25 SENATOR GOLDEN: Certainly.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
2 Golden, do you yield for a couple of questions?

3 SENATOR GOLDEN: Yes,
4 Mr. President.

5 SENATOR KLEIN: Through you,
6 Mr. President. Who would determine where the
7 speed zones are? As I think was pointed out,
8 there's only a percentage over the first couple
9 of years, and then it's increasing.

10 So who would determine where these
11 speed zones are?

12 SENATOR GOLDEN: The City of
13 New York would decide where those speed zones
14 are.

15 SENATOR KLEIN: Who within the City
16 of New York? Through you, Mr. President.

17 SENATOR GOLDEN: The Police
18 Department, working with the Department of
19 Education. And Transportation.

20 SENATOR KLEIN: Again,
21 Mr. President, would the sponsor agree to yield
22 for another question?

23 SENATOR GOLDEN: Yes,
24 Mr. President.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The

1 Senator yields.

2 SENATOR KLEIN: Through you,
3 Mr. President, would these speed zones be in the
4 same places presently where there are speed
5 cameras within the City of New York?

6 SENATOR GOLDEN: Mr. President,
7 they could be.

8 SENATOR KLEIN: Again through you
9 Mr. President, when we say could be, would we be
10 using the data that we're using now that's
11 supplied by DOT where they actually rate the most
12 dangerous schools as far as crossing is
13 concerned, and that's where disproportionately
14 the speed cameras are located? Would that be the
15 case with these speed zones?

16 SENATOR GOLDEN: Mr. President, the
17 people that are speeding in our streets don't
18 know where the speed cameras are. And there's
19 only 140 speed cameras out there presently. This
20 would add to, be able to enhance public safety
21 across our city and to give our children and our
22 parents the ability to have a safe journey to and
23 from school.

24 SENATOR KLEIN: On the bill,
25 Mr. President.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
2 Klein on the bill.

3 I'm going to remind the members that
4 we're discussing signage here, so I would ask
5 that members confine their comments to the
6 content of the bill.

7 Senator Klein on the bill.

8 SENATOR KLEIN: Sure. Well, on the
9 bill.

10 First of all, I want to thank
11 Senator Golden for putting this bill forward.

12 However, it certainly is something
13 that's half a loaf. You know, in a lot of
14 negotiation that took place in the original
15 Vision Zero program -- which actually lowered the
16 speed limits and also created an expanded speed
17 camera program. I think in Senator Golden's
18 present version of the bill, we make it a lot
19 easier for people to identify where these speed
20 zones are -- in essence, where are the speed
21 cameras -- flashing lights, signage, which I
22 think is a very, very good idea.

23 But what we're going to be doing
24 when we leave here tonight is effectively ending
25 the speed camera program in the City of New York.

1 It sunsets sometime at the end of July. I doubt
2 we'll be back. So not only will we not have the
3 over 140 speed cameras that presently exist at
4 schools all over the City of New York -- which,
5 by the way, since the program is implemented,
6 everyone would agree save lives. We've seen
7 fatalities go down year after year, day after
8 day.

9 And while I think that Marty
10 Golden's bill here would go a long way towards an
11 increase in the speed camera program, just this
12 alone is giving, I think, people a sense of
13 security that our streets are now going to be
14 safe, knowing that tonight -- or I should say at
15 the end of July -- we will no longer have a speed
16 camera program.

17 So I vote no on this. I don't think
18 this is something we should be passing now when
19 at the same time, when we leave here, we will no
20 longer have a speed camera program in the City of
21 New York. I vote no.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
23 Peralta.

24 SENATOR PERALTA: On the bill,
25 Mr. President.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
2 Peralta on the bill.

3 SENATOR PERALTA: Thank you,
4 Mr. President.

5 So tonight we're talking about
6 signage. Signage. We have a program of 140
7 speed cameras. We were talking about expanding
8 it 50 per year for the next three years, for a
9 total of 290. And the bill we have in front of
10 us is street signage.

11 The sponsor states that the purpose
12 of this bill is to protect schoolchildren. Well,
13 unfortunately, Mr. President I call BS on that,
14 because this is really not going to protect
15 schoolchildren. So what you have signs?

16 The sponsor doesn't provide data
17 that indicates the frequency of traffic-related
18 accidents. Well, since 2013, 63 percent of
19 people speeding in a school zone have declined --
20 there's been a 63 percent decline in speeding in
21 a school zone with these cameras. Eighty-one
22 percent of the people who have gotten a ticket
23 for the first time don't get another ticket. So
24 it changes behavior.

25 Now, all we were asking for was

1 150 more cameras. The cameras are going to go
2 away. Kids are going to die. We have
3 33 Senators that were sponsoring this bill, a
4 bipartisan measure, Democrats and Republicans.
5 We had a home-rule message from the City of
6 New York --

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
8 Peralta, I want to remind you again to stay
9 germane to the bill before the house.

10 SENATOR PERALTA: This is about
11 this bill.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: It is
13 not. You are -- the bill is -- it's discussing
14 signage.

15 SENATOR PERALTA: It's about
16 signage.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
18 Peralta, we're discussing signage --

19 SENATOR PERALTA: Yes, it is about
20 signage --

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: -- and
22 speed limits. Stay germane to the content of the
23 bill, please.

24 SENATOR PERALTA: It is about
25 signage. It is about signage. We're discussing

1 signage.

2 This is not enough. We could have
3 done something today. We could have passed speed
4 cameras and expanded it, but we didn't. We chose
5 politics over children's lives.

6 I want to thank the advocates who
7 came up here this week and the week before that.
8 Amy Cohen, whose child would have been 18 years
9 old tomorrow, and she lost her child when he was
10 9. Raul Ampuero lost his child just last
11 month -- not because of signage or lack thereof.
12 There was no speed cameras where these kids lost
13 their lives.

14 So here we have an opportunity to do
15 something, and we didn't do it. But yet tonight
16 we're passing a bill on signage. It's not
17 enough. We need to do something about this. We
18 need to come back, or we need to pass it tonight.
19 But this is not enough. Signage is not going to
20 protect the children's lives.

21 And the next time a child loses his
22 life in a school zone, I want you to remember
23 tonight. Because you chose, you chose, to pass a
24 bill on signage.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator

1 Lanza on the bill.

2 SENATOR LANZA: Thank you,
3 Mr. President.

4 You know, I rarely engage in
5 hyperbole on the floor of this august body. I in
6 fact detest it. I hate it back home too, when
7 people want to tell you that if you don't support
8 their legislation, someone's blood is going to be
9 on your hands. But we've heard it tonight.

10 You want to talk about politics over
11 safety? We in this body, back in the month of
12 May, passed a piece of legislation, 6212A,
13 germane to this legislation. It would require
14 that the City of New York place a stop sign or
15 traffic signal at the four corners surrounding
16 every school in the City of New York.

17 You know, a few years ago in my
18 district a young child was killed at an
19 intersection right outside a school, mowed down
20 by a motorist. There was no stop sign there. I
21 submit to you, my colleagues, that a hidden speed
22 camera would never have prevented that tragedy
23 from happening, but a stop sign probably would
24 have.

25 So some would say that we're putting

1 politics above safety. I would say that others
2 are putting money above the lives of children.
3 That legislation has not become law in the State
4 of New York for one simple reason, because the
5 City of New York, my good friend Mayor de Blasio
6 has opposed it and has asked the Assembly to
7 oppose it. The commissioner of DOT, a good
8 person and a great commissioner, opposes it and
9 has asked the Assembly to oppose it and not to
10 pass it.

11 So can speed cameras be part of the
12 equation? Could they provide some measure of
13 safety? Perhaps, as part of a comprehensive
14 plan. But I tell you all, nothing would do more
15 to slow a car down around a school in our city
16 than a red light or a stop sign.

17 So let's put all this nonsense
18 behind us. Let's get together, let's really do
19 what we say we mean, which is provide safety for
20 our children. Let's put a stop sign and a red
21 light around the four corners surrounding every
22 school in the City of New York, and you'll see
23 tragedies go down immediately.

24 Mr. President, I thank Senator
25 Golden for this legislation, which would

1 complement the legislation that I just spoke of
2 in a meaningful way and actually save lives.

3 Mr. President, I support Senator
4 Golden's legislation.

5 (Interruption from balcony.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:

7 (Gaveling.)

8 Seeing and hearing no other Senator
9 that wishes to be heard, debate is closed and the
10 Secretary will ring the bell.

11 The Secretary will read the last
12 section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
14 act shall take effect immediately.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Announce
19 the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
21 Calendar 1434, those recorded in the negative are
22 Senators Alcantara, Bailey, Benjamin, Breslin,
23 Brooks, Carlucci, Comrie, Dilan, Gianaris,
24 Hamilton, Hoylman, Kaminsky, Kavanagh, Kennedy,
25 Klein, Krueger, Mayer, Montgomery, Parker,

1 Peralta, Persaud, Sanders, Savino, Sepúlveda,
2 Serrano, Stavisky, Stewart-Cousins and Valesky.

3 Absent from voting: Senators Avella
4 and Bonacic.

5 Ayes, 30. Nays, 28.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
7 fails.

8 Senator Flanagan.

9 SENATOR FLANAGAN: Mr. President,
10 call up Calendar Number 2087, by Senator LaValle.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: We will
12 return to messages from the Assembly, and the
13 Secretary will read.

14 THE SECRETARY: The Assembly sent
15 for concurrence the following bill. On motion of
16 Senator Flanagan, the rules were suspended and
17 said bill ordered to a third reading: Assembly
18 Bill Number 11227.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: So
20 ordered.

21 The Secretary will read.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 2087, by the Assembly Committee on Rules,
24 Assembly Print 11227, an act implementing.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
9 is passed.

10 Senator DeFrancisco.

11 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Yes, on the
12 Senate Supplemental Calendar 58B, there was a
13 bill laid aside, the Senator Ortt bill, 2136.
14 Could we call that up controversial.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Okay.
16 We're returning to Senate Supplemental
17 Calendar 58B.

18 And Calendar Number 2136, the
19 Secretary will ring the bell and the Secretary
20 will read.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 2136, by Senator Ortt, Senate Print 9038, an act
23 to amend the Public Service Law.

24 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Read the last
25 section.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
2 last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 11. This
4 act shall take effect immediately.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
9 Ortt to explain his vote.

10 SENATOR ORTT: Well, thank you,
11 Mr. President.

12 I realize this is a futile exercise,
13 explaining my vote on a bill that may seem
14 destined to fail here. But I think it's
15 important to explain what the bill would actually
16 do for those out there who care.

17 This bill would actually enact
18 provisions for the protection of the health,
19 safety and employment rights of people losing
20 their employment as a result of the closure of
21 coal plants across our state.

22 There is a direct result of the
23 Governor's policy, which is to close all coal
24 plants by 2020. We just had a great debate the
25 other day by my colleague Senator Murphy. He has

1 a nuclear facility, obviously, Indian Point,
2 which will be closing in 2021, and then there's a
3 whole decommissioning process.

4 These plants, I believe there's two
5 left in New York -- one's in my district -- will
6 be closed by 2020. And there's been a lot of lip
7 service to the men and women who work there, some
8 of whom will be getting up in just a few hours.
9 But there's been no real policy or anything
10 enacted to actually provide these employees with
11 any type of transitional work to different energy
12 production or any other kind of additional work
13 to make sure these people are still employed
14 after 2020.

15 It would create a one-year advanced
16 notice to all workers at a coal generation
17 facility, mandatory extensive health screenings
18 for all employees, contractors and subcontractors
19 working in a facility on the date of issuance,
20 and worker retraining programs for all employees,
21 contractors and subcontractors, to be conducted
22 at the facility during the one-year advance
23 notice period, to include training for things
24 like biomass or natural gas plant operating
25 skills.

1 As long as the policies continue on
2 the energy side to get rid of coal, to get rid of
3 nuclear, to prevent natural gas, to even kill
4 pipelines that carry natural gas, I believe
5 myself and many of my colleagues will continue to
6 put forth legislation like this, because it's
7 important to our communities and it's important
8 to working men and women who work at these
9 plants. They deserve a lot more than lip
10 service; they deserve actual policies to help
11 them transition in their own lives, and for our
12 communities.

13 Mr. President, I vote aye.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
15 Ortt to be recorded in the affirmative.

16 The Secretary will announce the
17 results.

18 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
19 Calendar 2136, those recorded in the negative are
20 Senators Alcantara, Bailey, Benjamin, Breslin,
21 Brooks, Carlucci, Comrie, Dilan, Gianaris,
22 Hamilton, Hoylman, Kaminsky, Kavanagh, Kennedy,
23 Klein, Krueger, Mayer, Montgomery, Parker,
24 Peralta, Persaud, Sanders, Savino, Sepúlveda,
25 Serrano, Stavisky, Stewart-Cousins and Valesky.

1 Absent from voting: Senators Avella
2 and Bonacic.

3 Ayes, 30. Nays, 28.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
5 fails.

6 SENATOR FLANAGAN: Mr. President,
7 there will be an immediate Republican conference.

8 The Senate will stand at ease.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There
10 will be an immediate Republican conference in
11 Room 332, and the Senate will stand at ease.

12 (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease
13 at 12:21 a.m.)

14 (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at
15 1:19 a.m.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
17 Senate will return to order.

18 Senator DeFrancisco.

19 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO:
20 Mr. President, there are I believe four remaining
21 bills that were laid aside from the various
22 calendars that we dealt with this evening. I
23 move to lay aside those bills for the day.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Those
25 bills will be laid aside for the day.

1 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: I understand
2 we have three hand-downs from the Assembly. I'd
3 like to call up, first, Calendar Number 2147,
4 Assembly 11175.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: We will
6 return to messages from the Assembly.

7 The Secretary will read.

8 THE SECRETARY: The Assembly sent
9 for concurrence the following bill. On motion of
10 Senator Flanagan, the rules were suspended and
11 said bill ordered to third reading: Assembly
12 Bill Number 11175.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: It is so
14 ordered.

15 The Secretary will read.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 2147, by the Assembly Committee on Rules,
18 Assembly Print 11175, an act to validate.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
22 act shall take effect immediately.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
3 passes.

4 Senator DeFrancisco.

5 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: I believe
6 there's another hand-down on our calendar, 2146.
7 Could we take that up.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
9 Secretary will read.

10 THE SECRETARY: The Assembly sent
11 for concurrence the following bill. On motion of
12 Senator Flanagan, the rules were suspended and
13 said bill ordered to third reading: Assembly
14 Bill Number 11174.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: So
16 ordered.

17 The Secretary will read.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 2146, by the Assembly Committee on Rules,
20 Assembly Print 11174, an act to validate.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
5 passes.

6 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Could we now
7 take up a hand-down which is our Calendar Bill
8 2086, Assembly 11158.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
10 Secretary will read.

11 THE SECRETARY: The Assembly sent
12 for concurrence the following bill. On motion of
13 Senator Flanagan, the rules were suspended and
14 said bill ordered to third reading: Assembly
15 Bill Number 11158.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: It is so
17 ordered.

18 The Secretary will read.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 2086, by the Assembly Committee on Rules,
21 Assembly Print 11158, an act to amend the
22 Transportation Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This

1 act shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Announce
6 the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
8 Calendar 2086, those recorded in the negative are
9 Senators Comrie, Dilan, Hoylman, Kavanagh,
10 Krueger, Robach, Sanders and Sepúlveda.

11 Ayes, 52. Nays, 8.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
13 is passed.

14 Senator DeFrancisco.

15 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: We have the
16 vote on that?

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: We had
18 the vote; the bill passed.

19 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Okay.
20 There's one other bill, a Senator Murphy bill,
21 5587. I think it's on the calendar. Can we call
22 that up.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
24 Secretary will read.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1370, by Senator Murphy, Senate Print 5587, an
2 act to amend the Executive Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
11 Murphy to explain his vote.

12 SENATOR MURPHY: Yes, thank you,
13 Mr. President.

14 This bill here is the Medal of
15 Honor. Putnam County is the first county in
16 New York State that is the representative of the
17 Medal of Honor. And tonight we have our great
18 friend who's been in here for a number of years,
19 our wonderful buddy, Senator Bill Larkin, in
20 honor of this bill.

21 Mr. President, we can go on and on
22 and on tonight, but I would just like to thank
23 Senator Larkin for your service, not only to our
24 state but to our great country, for all you have
25 done.

1 Tonight I know is your last night in
2 our wonderful chamber here, and I can't thank you
3 enough for having the honor of being able to meet
4 you and to serve with you in the State
5 Legislature. This is a fitting end to your
6 career and an honor of us being able to do the
7 Medal of Honor in your honor for the last night
8 here.

9 Senator, thank you very much for all
10 you have done for your service to our country,
11 for your service to the state.

12 Mr. President, I'll be voting aye.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
14 Murphy in the affirmative.

15 Announce the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
18 passes.

19 (Extended standing ovation.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
21 DeFrancisco.

22 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Can we go
23 back to motions and whatever it is.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: We will
25 return to motions and resolutions.

1 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Yes,
2 Mr. President, I wish to call up Calendar Numbers
3 982, 1499, 2032, 2108, 2112, 2122, 2123, with
4 their corresponding Assembly Print Numbers 7108,
5 9837A, 2892A, 8747, 11040, 10682, and 10506A.

6 I now move to reconsider the vote by
7 which these Assembly bills were substituted.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
9 Secretary will read the titles of the bills.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 982, by Member of the Assembly Gottfried,
12 Assembly Print 7108, an act to amend the Public
13 Health Law.

14 Calendar Number 1499, by Member of
15 the Assembly Steck, Assembly Print 9837A, an act
16 to amend the Public Health Law.

17 Calendar Number 2032, by Member of
18 the Assembly Dilan, Assembly Print 2892A, an act
19 to amend the Public Service Law.

20 Calendar Number 2108, by Member of
21 the Assembly Englebright, Assembly Print 8747, an
22 act to amend Chapter 464 of the Laws of 2016.

23 Calendar Number 2112, by the
24 Assembly Committee on Rules, Assembly
25 Print 11040, an act to amend the Environmental

1 Conservation Law.

2 Calendar Number 2122, by Member of
3 the Assembly Englebright, Assembly Print 10682,
4 an act to amend the Environmental Conservation
5 Law.

6 And Calendar Number 2123, by Member
7 of the Assembly Englebright, Assembly Print
8 10506A, an act to amend the Environmental
9 Conservation Law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
11 Secretary will now call the roll on
12 reconsideration.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
16 DeFrancisco, I'll entertain a motion to move that
17 these bills be recommitted to the calendar on
18 Rules and restored to the order of third reading.

19 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: I now move
20 that all Assembly bills be recommitted to the
21 Committee on Rules, and all Senate bills be
22 restored to the order of third reading.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: All in
24 favor say aye.

25 (Response of "Aye.")

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Opposed?

2 (No response.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: They are
4 recommitted.

5 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Now I move to
6 recommit the calendar with the following
7 exceptions: Calendar 1516, by Rules; 1577, by
8 Senator DeFrancisco; 1518, by Senator
9 DeFrancisco; 1519, by Senator DeFrancisco; 1520,
10 by Senator DeFrancisco; 1521, by Senator
11 DeFrancisco; and 1522, by Senator DeFrancisco.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: It is so
13 ordered.

14 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Would you
15 please call on Senator Stewart-Cousins for
16 closing remarks.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
18 Stewart-Cousins.

19 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: Thank
20 you, Mr. President.

21 And I know the hour is late, so I
22 won't spend -- everybody is happy, right -- I
23 won't spend a lot of time doing anything but
24 doing what we should do, which is thank the staff
25 on both sides of the aisle who have really, you

1 know, done an incredible job of making sure that
2 as difficult as these days can be, we still
3 managed to get through the business of the day
4 and the work that the people have sent us here to
5 do.

6 And certainly I want to thank my
7 personal staff. I want to thank my counsel,
8 Shontell Smith -- where is Shontell? She's not
9 here? There you are.

10 (Applause.)

11 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: And of
12 course my communications director, Mike Murphy.
13 Hey, Mike.

14 (Applause.)

15 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: My
16 finance director, Felix Muniz. Felix?

17 (Applause.)

18 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: And of
19 course Suzy Ballantyne, who keeps all the trains
20 going. Suzy, where are you?

21 (Applause.)

22 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: And
23 again, I know that Senator Flanagan will be
24 thanking so many individually.

25 And I do want to thank Senator

1 Flanagan. It has not been an easy couple of
2 months for a lot of -- we'll just say for a lot
3 of reasons. We had an opportunity to spend more
4 time together than I think we ever thought we
5 would, good times and bad. But, you know, I
6 think that under these very difficult
7 circumstances we were able to again, you know, do
8 some of what people sent us here to do.
9 Obviously there is unfinished business, and as I
10 said, I'm not going to go through that.

11 But I do want to thank you,
12 Senator Flanagan, for being available, for being
13 cordial, for, you know, doing the things that you
14 did in order to keep us on track. So I thank
15 you.

16 And for my colleagues here, you
17 know, we've stood here at the end of session and
18 we had been divided for so long, and we're not.
19 And I am eternally grateful for what is a unified
20 Democratic Conference. I am very, very happy
21 that not only are we unified but, again, the
22 level of integrity, the level of passion, the
23 expertise, the professionalism that you bring to
24 every single issue and every single opportunity.

25 We are certainly stronger and better

1 together, and I am humbled and honored to be able
2 to serve as the leader of this great unified
3 conference. So I thank each and every one of
4 you.

5 And to my colleagues across the
6 aisle, like I said, we're always going to agree
7 on probably the majority of things, but there are
8 obviously things that we will disagree on. But
9 we have managed, I think, to disagree in mostly
10 agreeable ways. And I am sure that, again, we
11 will continue to be able to ultimately serve the
12 people that we are sent here to serve.

13 As far as the members who are
14 leaving, I wanted to, you know, wish you all the
15 best. That we will miss you, Senator Marchione.
16 You know, you're getting our count of women down,
17 you're not supposed to. But I hope that you
18 enjoy your time that -- with your family.

19 And I know -- I have said goodbye to
20 Senator Bonacic before, and we've spoken of
21 Senator Croci. But clearly, Senator DeFrancisco,
22 you have such a flavor to you.

23 (Laughter.)

24 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Thank you
25 very much.

1 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: You're
2 welcome.

3 (Laughter.)

4 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Can I ask
5 what flavor?

6 (Laughter.)

7 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: Yeah,
8 don't get me to start telling you which flavor,
9 but --

10 (Laughter.)

11 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: I know,
12 everybody's got a flavor, but we're not going --
13 but we are going to miss you.

14 Obviously the work that you've done
15 as Finance first, you know, when you really
16 started being in our lives day to day, and
17 certainly as floor leader, it has been, you know,
18 a pleasure, really, and much more fun than I
19 thought that it would be.

20 So again, I wish you the very, very
21 best. And thank you for the time that you've
22 spent here in service and, you know, certainly
23 cultivating our friendship. And also for the
24 spaghetti dinner that you did with Liz, which was
25 really cute.

1 And of course Colonel, Senator, aah,
2 I'm sorry to see you go. And I will always
3 remember your friendship. And how, you know, no
4 matter what you were always somebody who tried to
5 keep to the high ground and remind us all that
6 whatever we're doing is inconsequential unless we
7 are doing it for the service of others.

8 You have never stopped being a
9 fabulous role model, a friend, and somebody who
10 each and every person in this chamber and beyond
11 has the utmost respect for and only wishes you
12 the best. And really, really we are grateful for
13 the life that you have shared with us.

14 So Godspeed. And, you know, I hope
15 you have good health and a lot of fun with Pat
16 and the children and the grandchildren. Thank
17 you so much.

18 So with that, everyone, I know it's
19 going to be interesting over the next few months,
20 but I wish everyone success in their elections
21 and their endeavors, and I'm looking forward to
22 seeing everybody back in January. So thank you
23 so very much.

24 (Standing ovation.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Thank

1 you, Senator Stewart-Cousins.

2 Senator Flanagan.

3 SENATOR FLANAGAN: Thank you,
4 Mr. President.

5 You know, I'm reminding myself that
6 some of the funnest times that you can possibly
7 have are out here on the floor. And I want to
8 thank whomever is in charge of the microphones.
9 If DeFrancisco had had a hot mike all the time,
10 we'd all be in big trouble.

11 (Laughter.)

12 SENATOR FLANAGAN: So I see him --
13 let me start, I see him standing over right by
14 his office -- I don't want to say in the corner,
15 because nobody puts Frank Patience in a corner.

16 (Laughter.)

17 SENATOR FLANAGAN: But Frank, to
18 you and to your staff, and by extension all the
19 Senate staff -- you know, Frank and his team are
20 the people that keep the lights on, keep the
21 place running, make sure that everything runs
22 smoothly. It's not easy. It's not easy.

23 But when you just take a step back
24 and look at the splendor we have around us and
25 how lucky we are to be here, it doesn't happen by

1 mistake. So we have a lot of good people who are
2 strongly involved in those types of issues. And
3 for that, I know I'm appreciative, and I think I
4 can take the liberty of speaking for our members.

5 I want to join the voice of Senator
6 Stewart-Cousins in recognizing staff generally.
7 Because we all know that when we look good, it's
8 in large part -- you know, every now and then
9 it's something we may think of, but a lot of the
10 people around us and who support us really help
11 us keep going and get good things done. And
12 sometimes they actually protect us from
13 ourselves, which is oftentimes perhaps more
14 helpful.

15 But, you know, for our side I look
16 and think of all the people who are here on the
17 floor -- Colleen, Lisa, all the folks at the
18 desk. Again, the same thing. This place runs
19 like a nice, you know, Swiss watch on 99 percent
20 of the occasions, and we are lucky to have the
21 people here that we do.

22 Senator Griffo. You have done an
23 outstanding job. I know periodically people step
24 in --

25 (Standing ovation.)

1 SENATOR FLANAGAN: Joe, it's good
2 to see you smile.

3 (Laughter.)

4 SENATOR FLANAGAN: And also to --
5 I'm not sure exactly where they are, the tall guy
6 in the back, pretty quiet, even-tempered, but
7 Shawn MacKinnon has done an outstanding job as
8 secretary to the Finance Committee, comports
9 himself as a gentleman on all occasions, and has
10 an incredible depth of knowledge that inures to
11 the benefit of everybody, because he's collegial,
12 he knows how to work with people. And by
13 extension, all the people on his staff deserve
14 credit as well.

15 I see Scott Reif, Scott Reif and our
16 communications team. I heard Mr. Murphy's name
17 mentioned before. They go over the top to try
18 and help us get our message out. And yes,
19 periodically they protect us from ourselves as
20 well. So to Scott and his team, thank you for
21 all the work that you do.

22 And only physically to his left, not
23 politically to his left, is Joe Conway, from our
24 member services office, who's a quiet gentleman
25 but does fantastic work in dealing with our

1 members.

2 I'm not sure -- he may be hiding
3 here somewhere, but Dave Previte -- Dave Previte,
4 in our counsel's office, I see James Curran up
5 there, Jon Federman. You know, the skinny guy.
6 Right? The closer. He's quiet, he doesn't say
7 much. But how about a round of applause for Joe
8 Messina, who walks around --

9 (Enthusiastic applause.)

10 SENATOR FLANAGAN: You know, and
11 Joe is a good indication, he's never a person
12 that looks for any kind of accolades. But thank
13 goodness we have people like him serving with us.

14 James has done a terrific, terrific
15 job in helping run our place here, but I
16 really -- Dave Previte has been fantastic to our
17 members and I think to the service of the Senate.
18 And again, to his staff, I really want to express
19 our thanks.

20 Here on the floor, to all of our
21 floor folks who work on both sides of the aisle,
22 Jeff Klein, Mike Gianaris, certainly Senator
23 Stewart-Cousins and John DeFrancisco. You know,
24 if you look back, remember January? We all came
25 in, you know, bright-eyed and bushy-tailed. If

1 everyone ever prognosticated in January what
2 would happen between January and June, no one,
3 even the most jaded amongst us, would have ever
4 believed that we could have seen what we've seen.

5 But you know what? We got it done.
6 Maybe not everything, but we got it done.

7 So when I look around the room, I
8 see our senior members -- Senator Montgomery,
9 longest-serving member of the Democratic
10 Conference who, you know, is a very, very good
11 Senator, has wisdom and knowledge that is helpful
12 to your members and to us as well. By extension,
13 you have a similar colleague here, Ken LaValle,
14 who is not only the dean of our conference but
15 the dean of the Senate, now finishing up his
16 42nd year of service in the Senate.

17 Kenny, Senator Montgomery, thank you
18 for staying around and being with us. You really
19 make all of us better legislators as a result.

20 And, you know, I could single out so
21 many different people. I'm looking at Senator
22 Bailey, I'm looking at our new members, Senator
23 Phillips, Senator Helming, Senator Jacobs. There
24 are a lot of good people here. We have a lot of
25 good people here. And it's not always

1 recognized.

2 And you know I keep saying this, and
3 I'm not going to get tired of saying it. Be
4 proud of who you are, be proud of the fact that
5 you're a public servant, an elected official, a
6 New York State Senator who is doing the people's
7 business. And we have done a tremendous amount
8 of business.

9 Now, to our colleagues. I was
10 trying to figure out what would be an appropriate
11 order. So I want to started with the lady from
12 Saratoga.

13 Now, why is Kathy Marchione leaving?
14 She's leaving because of her family. And what
15 could possibly be wrong with that? She wants to
16 spend more time with her family and her
17 grandchildren. And a little-known fact,
18 virtually the entire family lives within a
19 hundred yards of each other.

20 (Laughter.)

21 SENATOR FLANAGAN: And they still
22 like each other, believe it or not.

23 (Laughter.)

24 SENATOR FLANAGAN: But Senator
25 Marchione is petite, she is quiet. But don't

1 make any mistakes, she is tenacious and
2 passionate and unrelenting on behalf of her
3 constituents. Unrelenting is a good word. If
4 you don't believe me, just ask the people in
5 Hoosick Falls. You don't believe me, go up to
6 Saratoga and look at how she's worked on behalf
7 of the people up in Saratoga for racing and all
8 those types of issues in the State of New York.
9 And she represents the best of what all of our
10 colleagues are, a very good local politician.
11 And politician in this sense is a great word. I
12 embrace the word politician.

13 And Senator Marchione, I will miss
14 you. Our colleagues will miss you. And the
15 State of New York will miss you for your service.
16 So thank you for being amongst us.

17 Now, my colleague and friend who
18 started in service with my father; I had the
19 pleasure of serving with him in the Assembly and
20 now in the Senate. There are so many things that
21 have been said, properly so, about Senator
22 Larkin. He is unbelievably loyal. Unbelievably
23 dedicated, unbelievably passionate about the
24 things that he believes in.

25 And most important, he loves, loves

1 this country. Loves this country with every
2 fiber of his being. And if I've learned nothing
3 else from him -- God, I'm like every time I see
4 him, he's got all the pins and everything else.
5 I walk around, I'm proud to be an American just
6 because I'm standing next to him.

7 So Bill, thank you for an
8 incredible, incredible amount of service. And
9 you know, when you look at Senator Marchione,
10 Senator DeFrancisco, Senator Bonacic and
11 Senator Larkin, that's about 200 years of
12 service. No lie. DeFran's trying to think, what
13 is he talking about? But, you know, a lot of
14 people served in different capacities before they
15 came here, and that made them better legislators
16 when they came here.

17 So Senator Larkin, to you, thank you
18 very much.

19 John Bonacic. Bonacic is not here.
20 Come on, who -- who -- everybody loves Bonacic,
21 right? Hail fellow well met, dapper, he's got
22 that \$10 million smile, he's got a little pep in
23 his step, he's always bobbing and weaving,
24 talking to everybody. I'm not sure anyone else
25 could have done what he did today. He got up on

1 that roster when Griffo wasn't there, and
2 everybody went up -- I'm taking a picture with
3 Bonacic, I love Bonacic, I want to get my photo
4 with Bonacic. We had to stop session because
5 everybody was taking a picture with John.

6 But you know what, I think too -- I
7 have known John Bonacic for 28 years. And I've
8 been blessed to know his family. I actually went
9 to his daughter's wedding. His family was up
10 here this week. The love of his life, the love
11 of his life is his bride of 51 years. And he
12 talks about her with the deepest affection that
13 we should all really emulate whenever we can.

14 So Senator Marchione left because of
15 her family. Senator Larkin left because of his
16 family -- and if he didn't leave, they were going
17 to come and get him and take him away.

18 (Laughter.)

19 SENATOR FLANAGAN: He told us that
20 a bunch of times.

21 Senator Bonacic left because of his
22 family.

23 And then there's John DeFrancisco.

24 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: I left in
25 spite of them.

1 SENATOR FLANAGAN: He left because
2 he doesn't like anybody.

3 (Laughter.)

4 SENATOR FLANAGAN: I don't hear
5 anyone disagreeing.

6 (Laughter.)

7 SENATOR FLANAGAN: John DeFrancisco
8 is one of the most talented individuals I've met
9 in my entire life. A very successful career on
10 so many different levels. Wickedly smart,
11 dedicated, loyal. A skutch on many occasions,
12 which worked to his benefit, but frankly it made
13 all of us better, I think, by extension.

14 And, you know, I'm really going to
15 miss him and my colleagues. You don't sometimes
16 realize the imprimatur or the effect that people
17 have on you until they're not around. So maybe
18 it's a good way for us to take stock of who we
19 are, appreciate each other on a daily basis, and
20 recognize that having someone like John go to be
21 with his family, enjoy other things outside of
22 this Legislature -- you know what, from the
23 bottom of my heart to you, thank you for your
24 friendship, for your leadership, and for your
25 service.

1 I'm a better person because I know
2 all these people. When I speak this way, I have
3 the privilege of getting up to speak. Any one of
4 us could have gotten up and said similar type
5 things. It could have been Mike Gianaris, it
6 could have been Neil Breslin, it could have been
7 Senator Peralta. Everyone can extol the virtues
8 of the people who serve here.

9 So on that note, I want to thank
10 Senator Stewart-Cousins for our good, solid,
11 strong working relationship. Yeah, a couple of
12 bumps in the road, but that's life. That's life
13 and that's politics. But I'm still amazed at how
14 many things that we've actually gotten done for
15 the people of the State of New York.

16 So thank you to all of you. I
17 appreciate the indulgence of allowing me to make
18 these comments. I hope everyone travels safely,
19 gets enough rest so that you're bright-eyed and
20 bushy-tailed to do your own petitions over the
21 next couple of weeks. And as we get into the
22 summer season, I hope everyone enjoys what a
23 great, beautiful, wonderful state we live in.

24 Mr. President, thank you very much.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Thank

1 you, Senator Flanagan.

2 (Extended standing ovation.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
4 DeFrancisco.

5 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Is there any
6 further business at the desk?

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There is
8 no further business before the desk.

9 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: There being
10 no further business, I move we adjourn at the
11 call of the Temporary President, intervening days
12 being legislative days.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: On
14 motion, the Senate will stand adjourned until the
15 call of the Temporary President, intervening days
16 being legislative days.

17 The Senate is adjourned.

18 (Whereupon, at 1:49 a.m., the Senate
19 adjourned.)

20

21

22

23

24

25