

1 NEW YORK STATE SENATE

2
3
4 THE STENOGRAPHIC RECORD

5
6
7
8
9 ALBANY, NEW YORK

10 June 13, 2018

11 4:29 p.m.

12
13
14 REGULAR SESSION

15
16
17
18 SENATOR JOSEPH GRIFFO, Acting President

19 FRANCIS W. PATIENCE, Secretary

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
3 Senate will come to order.

4 I ask everyone in the chamber to
5 please rise and join with me as we recite the
6 Pledge of Allegiance to our Flag.

7 (Whereupon, the assemblage recited
8 the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Today's
10 invocation will be offered by the Venerable
11 Ru Yang, Abbess, International Buddhist Progress
12 Society in Flushing, New York.

13 ABBESS RU YANG: Thank you for
14 inviting me here today.

15 As our founder, Venerable Master
16 Hsing Yun said: "A great leader is someone who
17 has compassion, wisdom, dedication,
18 consideration of others, and willingness to
19 serve others without regrets." We have seen how
20 our Senators and community leaders have worked
21 hard for the benefits of the people. Thus it is
22 my honor to be here to pray for our Senators and
23 community leaders.

24 Great compassionate Buddha! With
25 the utmost sincerity, I would like to pray for

1 our Senators, community leaders, and all the
2 commissioners, to give them the wisdom to govern
3 amid the conflicting interests and issues of our
4 times; to know the true sense of the welfare and
5 needs of the people in our community; to
6 understand the importance of justice by working
7 to understand the causes and conditions of those
8 suffering; to be confident in what is fair for
9 everyone; to have the ability to work together
10 in harmony even when there is honest
11 disagreement, and to find personal peace and joy
12 in their lives by helping others.

13 Great compassionate Buddha! May
14 they have your prajna wisdom to solve difficult
15 cases. May they have your great power to subdue
16 stubborn and dishonest criminals. May they have
17 your compassion and fellowship to guide all
18 beings that take the wrong path. May they have
19 your steadfast determination to maintain the
20 courage and wisdom to advance.

21 Furthermore, we pray to you to
22 bless and protect our society. May we all serve
23 the community together, to keep watch together
24 in mutual defense and collaborate closely with
25 each other. May we all uphold justice and

1 prevent crimes, and bring peace and safety to
2 all families. May we all be self-disciplined
3 and law-abiding to bring happiness to our lives
4 and prosperity and peace to our nation. May we
5 all firmly stand by our posts to contribute to
6 the community and to benefit our society.

7 Leadership requires courage. May
8 our leaders have that courage to lead our
9 community always.

10 Great compassionate Buddha, please
11 accept my sincerest prayer!

12 Thank you.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
14 reading of the Journal.

15 THE SECRETARY: In Senate,
16 Tuesday, June 12th, the Senate met pursuant to
17 adjournment. The Journal of Monday, June 11th,
18 was read and approved. On motion, Senate
19 adjourned.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Without
21 objection, the Journal stands approved as read.

22 Presentation of petitions.

23 Messages from the Assembly.

24 The Secretary will read.

25 THE SECRETARY: On page 4, Senator

1 Griffo moves to discharge, from the Committee on
2 Energy and Telecommunications, Assembly Bill
3 Number 8922 and substitute it for the identical
4 Senate Bill 7321, Third Reading Calendar 49.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
6 substitution is so ordered.

7 THE SECRETARY: On page 13,
8 Senator Bonacic moves to discharge, from the
9 Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill Number 7953A
10 and substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
11 6244A, Third Reading Calendar 333.

12 On page 38, Senator Golden moves to
13 discharge, from the Committee on Civil Service
14 and Pensions, Assembly Bill Number 3137 and
15 substitute it for the identical Senate Bill 4761,
16 Third Reading Calendar 895.

17 On page 42, Senator Lanza moves to
18 discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
19 Assembly Bill Number 10150 and substitute it for
20 the identical Senate Bill 8049, Third Reading
21 Calendar 979.

22 On page 42, Senator O'Mara moves to
23 discharge, from the Committee on Environmental
24 Conservation, Assembly Bill Number 10507 and
25 substitute it for the identical Senate Bill

1 7747A, Third Reading Calendar 985.

2 On page 45, Senator Lanza moves to
3 discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
4 Assembly Bill Number 6823C and substitute it for
5 the identical Senate Bill 5998B, Third Reading
6 Calendar 1065.

7 On page 48, Senator Golden moves to
8 discharge, from the Committee on Aging,
9 Assembly Bill Number 6026 and substitute it for
10 the identical Senate Bill 4555, Third Reading
11 Calendar 1117.

12 On page 55, Senator Marcellino moves
13 to discharge, from the Committee on Corporations,
14 Authorities and Commissions, Assembly Bill Number
15 10220A and substitute it for the identical Senate
16 Bill 8086A, Third Reading Calendar 1247.

17 On page 61, Senator Bonacic moves to
18 discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
19 Assembly Bill Number 10647 and substitute it for
20 the identical Senate Bill 8416, Third Reading
21 Calendar 1326.

22 On page 66, Senator Seward moves to
23 discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
24 Assembly Bill Number 10613 and substitute it for
25 the identical Senate Bill 8499, Third Reading

1 Calendar 1390.

2 On page 68, Senator LaValle moves to
3 discharge, from the Committee on Codes,
4 Assembly Bill Number 5200 and substitute it for
5 the identical Senate Bill 2755, Third Reading
6 Calendar 1409.

7 On page 70, Senator Golden moves to
8 discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
9 Assembly Bill Number 10676 and substitute it for
10 the identical Senate Bill 8557A, Third Reading
11 Calendar 1443.

12 On page 74, Senator Young moves to
13 discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
14 Assembly Bill Number 9837A and substitute it for
15 the identical Senate Bill 7630A, Third Reading
16 Calendar 1499.

17 And on page 75, Senator Seward moves
18 to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
19 Assembly Bill Number 10830 and substitute it for
20 the identical Senate Bill 8158A, Third Reading
21 Calendar 1501.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
23 substitutions are so ordered as presented.

24 Messages from the Governor.

25 Reports of standing committees.

1 Reports of select committees.
2 Communications and reports of state
3 officers.

4 Motions and resolutions.

5 Senator DeFrancisco.

6 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO:

7 Mr. President, I wish to call up Senator
8 Phillips' bill, Print 8798, recalled from the
9 Assembly, which is now at the desk.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
11 Secretary will read.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 1681, by Senator Phillips, Senate Print 8798, an
14 act to authorize.

15 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: I now move to
16 reconsider the vote by which the bill was passed.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
18 roll on reconsideration.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 56.

21 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: I now offer
22 the following amendments.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
24 amendments are received.

25 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: I now, on

1 page 78, offer the following amendments to
2 Calendar 1730, Senate Print 8304, by
3 Senator Phillips, and ask that the bill retain
4 its place on the Third Reading Calendar.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
6 amendments are received. The bill shall retain
7 its place on third reading.

8 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: On page 74, I
9 offer the following amendments to Calendar 1497,
10 Senate Print 7521, by Senator Hannon, and ask
11 that the bill retain its place on the
12 Third Reading Calendar.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
14 amendments are received. The bill shall retain
15 its place on third reading.

16 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: On page 66, I
17 offer the following amendments to Calendar 1394,
18 Senate Print 8485A, by Senator Golden, and that
19 the bill retain its place on the Third Reading
20 Calendar.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
22 amendments are received. The bill shall retain
23 its place on third reading.

24 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: And finally,
25 on page 71 I offer the following amendments to

1 Calendar 1455, Senate Print 6597A, and ask that
2 said bill retain its place on the Third Reading
3 Calendar. It's a bill by Senator Serino.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
5 amendments are received, and the bill shall
6 retain its place on third reading.

7 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Please
8 recognize Senator Klein.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
10 Klein.

11 SENATOR KLEIN: Thank you,
12 Mr. President.

13 On behalf of Senator Carlucci, on
14 page 76 I offer the following amendments to
15 Calendar Number 1547, Senate Print 8345, and ask
16 that said bill retain its place on Third Reading
17 Calendar.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
19 amendments are received. The bill shall retain
20 its place on third reading.

21 SENATOR KLEIN: On behalf of
22 Senator Avella, on page 28 I offer the following
23 amendments to Calendar Number 693, Senate Print
24 Number 7886, and ask that said bill retain its
25 place on Third Reading Calendar.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
2 amendments are received. The bill shall retain
3 its place on third reading.

4 SENATOR KLEIN: I move that the
5 following bill be discharged from its respective
6 committee and be recommitted with instructions to
7 strike the enacting clause, on behalf of Senator
8 Avella: Senate Bill Number 8988.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: It is so
10 ordered.

11 SENATOR KLEIN: I wish to call up
12 Senator Carlucci's bill, Print Number 1773,
13 recalled from the Assembly, which is now at the
14 desk.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
16 Secretary will read.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 266, by Senator Carlucci, Senate Print 1773, an
19 act to amend the Real Property Tax Law.

20 SENATOR KLEIN: Mr. President, I
21 now move to reconsider the vote by which this
22 bill was passed.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
24 Secretary will call the roll on reconsideration.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 56.

2 SENATOR KLEIN: Mr. President, I
3 now offer the following amendments.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
5 amendments are received.

6 Senator DeFrancisco.

7 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Yes, can we
8 now take up previously adopted Resolution 5583,
9 by Senator Stavisky, title only, and call on
10 Senator Stavisky to speak.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
12 Secretary will read.

13 THE SECRETARY: Legislative
14 Resolution Number 5583, by Senator Stavisky,
15 celebrating Taiwan Heritage Day to strengthen the
16 friendship and bilateral relationship between the
17 State of New York and Taiwan.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Da jia
19 hao.

20 Senator Stavisky.

21 SENATOR STAVISKY: Let me try it.
22 Da jia hao.

23 (Applause.)

24 SENATOR STAVISKY: First let me
25 commend Senator Griffo for his knowledge of

1 Mandarin. And let me also add: Huan ying lai
2 dao Albany.

3 (Applause.)

4 SENATOR STAVISKY: And what that
5 means is hello and welcome to Albany.

6 We're delighted to have the
7 distinguished Ambassador/Director General Lily
8 L.W. Hsu, from the Taipei Economic and Cultural
9 Office in New York, representing the government
10 of Taiwan and President Tsai Ing-wen.

11 The reason I mention President Tsai
12 is that for my colleagues on the other side of
13 the aisle, she is a graduate of the law school at
14 Cornell. And she's the second president from
15 Taiwan to attend Cornell. So there's a
16 relationship there, and certainly through
17 Ambassador Hsu.

18 The ambassador is the first woman
19 from --

20 (Applause.)

21 SENATOR STAVISKY: -- from Taiwan
22 to represent the government in New York, in the
23 New York region. Previously she served in
24 Washington, D.C., in the United Kingdom, and most
25 recently from Denmark, which is quite a

1 diplomatic resume. In fact, we met right after
2 she came to New York, at a dinner in Flushing;
3 she had just come from Denmark.

4 She is joined on the floor by the
5 political director of the Taipei Economic and
6 Cultural Office in New York, Ronnie Lu --

7 (Applause.)

8 SENATOR STAVISKY: -- and by Consul
9 Jenny Tzeng.

10 We've heard from the Venerable
11 Ru Yang, and we also recognize the chairman of
12 the Taiwan Center, the senior center, Gow-Chung
13 Chen.

14 (Applause.)

15 SENATOR STAVISKY: Buddha's Light
16 International Association President Li Yi Hung,
17 from Flushing. The temple is located on
18 Barclay Avenue and 154th Street in Flushing.

19 From the Capital Region, we have the
20 Taiwanese American Cultural Society, Secretary
21 Wes Yang and the former president, Chungchin
22 Chen.

23 (Applause.)

24 SENATOR STAVISKY: And from the
25 Capital District Taiwanese American Association

1 we have the vice president, Che-Hua Hsu.

2 (Applause.)

3 SENATOR STAVISKY: Let me be very
4 brief, but let me talk for a moment about Taiwan
5 Heritage Day.

6 Taiwan is the 21st largest economy
7 in the world, and it's the United States's 10th
8 largest trading partner. There are many Fortune
9 500 companies located in Taiwan, many Taiwanese
10 investments in the United States. They have a
11 remarkable, remarkable history. And it has one
12 of the highest standards of living in the world.
13 Ninety-seven percent literacy rate. Imagine
14 that, 97 percent literacy rate.

15 Their cultural programs in the
16 United States, the economic development efforts,
17 the construction that's going on, the business,
18 the vitality that they have brought with them
19 from Taiwan is remarkable.

20 I represent, as you know, Flushing.
21 And in the late 1970s, early 1980s, stores were
22 being boarded up, many businesses were going,
23 people were leaving. And people -- originally
24 from Taiwan, and then from other parts of the
25 world -- came to Flushing. And today, if you

1 walk through the streets of Flushing, you'll see
2 bustling vibrancy. You'll see a very active
3 library -- as Senator Ritchie knows, one of the
4 busiest in the country -- right in Flushing. And
5 it's because of what has happened as a result of
6 the arrival from China and from Taiwan of so many
7 immigrants.

8 And we are happy to have the
9 immigrants here in the United States. We are
10 proud of our democracy with our friends and the
11 special relationship that we have with the
12 Taiwanese community. It's a partnership based on
13 friendship.

14 And let me just add that I have gone
15 to the Buddha's Light Temple on many occasions,
16 and I was there last year and this year to
17 celebrate Buddha's birthday. And they have
18 something, a tradition called Three Acts of
19 Goodness. And let me conclude by naming the
20 three acts, which I think is appropriate for the
21 State Senate today. Buddha said "Say good words,
22 do good deeds, and think good thoughts."

23 And this is the message that we
24 should be sending to our constituents and to the
25 people throughout the United States and the

1 Republic of China and Taiwan.

2 So welcome, and we're happy to have
3 you. Thank you.

4 Thank you, Mr. President.

5 (Applause.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Thank
7 you, Senator Stavisky.

8 Senator Bailey.

9 SENATOR BAILEY: Thank you,
10 Mr. President.

11 At the urge of being repetitive,
12 this is the only phrase I know: Da jia hao.

13 (Laughter; applause.)

14 SENATOR BAILEY: I just wanted to
15 very briefly add my voice to the chorus of
16 individuals who are commending the Taiwanese
17 community. I wanted to thank you for coming up.

18 I had the pleasure of meeting many
19 of you earlier today in Room 711A at the
20 celebration with Senator Stavisky,
21 Assemblymembers Yuh-Line Niou and Ron Kim as
22 well, and we got to learn a lot about your
23 culture.

24 And one of the greatest things about
25 this job is when different cultures and different

1 people from different areas in our city and our
2 state come to the Capitol, and they recognize two
3 things. One, that this is your state capital,
4 and that this is open and available for you, not
5 just the members of this house. We work for the
6 people of this state, and you are the people of
7 the State of New York. Don't ever forget that.

8 And secondly, continue to teach us
9 lessons from your culture. Because Lord knows we
10 can all learn a lot about each other's cultures,
11 and it will make us all a lot better people in
12 this society, this state and this city.

13 So I wanted to thank you all for
14 coming today. I wanted to remind you to stay
15 active, stay involved.

16 And Toby, thank you for sponsoring
17 this resolution.

18 Thank you, Mr. President.

19 (Applause.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
21 DeFrancisco.

22 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Thank you.

23 I also want to welcome everyone here
24 on this Taiwanese Heritage Day. I've met many of
25 the guests that are on the floor in Syracuse when

1 we raise the Taiwanese flag on an annual basis in
2 front of City Hall.

3 This time of year in Albany, when
4 we're trying to get the final business done,
5 those three words of wisdom are very important
6 for us. Because sometimes we have a tendency not
7 to say good things, think good thoughts and do
8 good things. So that is a perfect remainder for
9 the last few days of session.

10 Lastly, because of it being the last
11 few days of session, so many things are going on,
12 and they're unavoidable. And I apologize for the
13 delay today. It certainly meant no disrespect
14 for anyone. It's just that we're trying to
15 organize everything to finish the business by the
16 middle of next week.

17 So thank you for being here, and we
18 appreciate the celebration that we're having
19 today for your country.

20 (Applause.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Thank
22 you, Senator DeFrancisco.

23 As noted, the resolution was
24 previously adopted on June 5th of this year.

25 The resolution, at the request of

1 Senator Stavisky, is open for cosponsorship.
2 Should you choose to be a cosponsor, please
3 notify the desk.

4 We would like to once again welcome
5 and acknowledge the presence of the ambassador,
6 of the distinguished officials, and also of the
7 many guests who have joined us today.

8 So please rise and be recognized.
9 Xiexie.

10 (Standing ovation.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
12 DeFrancisco.

13 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Now can we
14 take up previously adopted Resolution 5738, by
15 Senator Peralta, title only, and call on
16 Senator Peralta to speak, please.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
18 Secretary will read.

19 THE SECRETARY: Legislative
20 Resolution Number 5738, by Senator Peralta,
21 commemorating the 208th Anniversary of the
22 Mexican Declaration of Independence from Spain on
23 September 16, 2018.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
25 Peralta.

1 SENATOR PERALTA: Thank you,
2 Mr. President.

3 Mexico has enjoyed a rich and
4 developed culture for many, many years that
5 existed before the arrival of Hernan Cortes in
6 1521, including the Mayans and the Aztecs.

7 This year, Mexico and Mexican
8 Americans will be celebrating its 208th
9 anniversary of the Declaration of Independence
10 from Spain -- an independence declared on
11 September 16, 1810, by Father Miguel Hidalgo in
12 the City of Dolores, located in the Guanajuato.
13 It began with the "Grito de Dolores," the Cry of
14 the Dolores, which was also known as Father
15 Hidalgo's proclamation "End to bad government."

16 It was the beginning of a
17 decade-long war for independence. In 1811,
18 Father Hidalgo and his followers were captured
19 and executed in Chihuahua. Father Jose Maria
20 Morelos assumed Hidalgo's leadership, but in 1813
21 he also was captured and executed by the Spanish
22 crown. When the insurgency was about to
23 collapse, Spanish General Augustin de Iturbide
24 joined them. In 1821, the formerly Spanish
25 general and representatives of the Spanish crown

1 signed the Treaty of Cordoba, ending one of the
2 longest wars for independence in all of the
3 Americas and recognizing Mexico's independence.

4 Mexicans and Mexican Americans have
5 contributed in every aspect of life, not only in
6 my district but across the state and the nation.
7 Many have made Queens and New York their home,
8 and it is only fitting that we thank them for
9 their efforts, work and their contribution. They
10 contribute to make Queens the most diverse
11 borough in the nation, especially my district,
12 the United Nations of all Senate districts.

13 We extend our best wishes to our
14 Mexican and Mexican American friends as they
15 celebrate their independence from Spain. Que
16 viva Mexico!

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
18 resolution was previously adopted on June 12th of
19 this year and is open for cosponsorship at the
20 request of Senator Peralta. If you choose to be
21 a cosponsor, please notify the desk.

22 Senator DeFrancisco.

23 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Yes, can we
24 now have the noncontroversial reading of the
25 active list, please.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
2 Secretary will read.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 49,
4 substituted earlier by Member of the Assembly
5 Rosenthal, Assembly Print 8922, an act to amend
6 the Public Authorities Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
10 act shall take effect on the same date and in the
11 same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2017.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
17 passes.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 70,
19 by Senator O'Mara, Senate Print 2837B, an act to
20 amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
5 passes.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 194, by Senator Phillips, Senate Print 4456A, an
8 act to amend the Civil Practice Law and Rules.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
12 act shall take effect immediately.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
18 passes.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 205, by Senator Avella, Senate Print 1682, an act
21 to amend the Public Authorities Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
25 act shall take effect one year after it shall

1 have become a law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 57. Nays, 1.
6 Senator DeFrancisco recorded in the negative.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
8 passes.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 283, by Senator Flanagan, Senate Print 6973A, an
11 act in relation to authorizing.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There is
13 a home-rule message present at the desk.

14 The Secretary will read the last
15 section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
23 passes.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 287, by Senator Avella, Senate Print 1271, an act

1 to amend the Executive Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
5 act shall take effect immediately.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
11 passes.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 314, by Senator Little, Senate Print 137, an act
14 to amend the Social Services Law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
18 act shall take effect on the first of January.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 57. Nays, 1.
23 Senator Hoylman recorded in the negative.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
25 passes.

1 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
2 Calendar 314, those recorded in the negative are
3 Senators Alcantara, Hoylman and Montgomery.

4 Ayes, 55. Nays, 3.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
6 is passed.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 333, substituted earlier by Member of the
9 Assembly Brindisi, Assembly Print 7953A, an act
10 to amend the Rural Electric Cooperative Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
14 act shall take effect on the first of January.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
20 passes.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 355, by Senator Klein, Senate Print 4712, an act
23 to amend the Real Property Law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
25 last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
2 act shall take effect immediately.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 57. Nays, 1.
7 Senator Sanders recorded in the negative.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
9 passes.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 527, by Senator Stavisky, Senate Print 7667, an
12 act to amend the Retirement and Social Security
13 Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
23 passes.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 676, by Senator Avella, Senate Print 1874A, an

1 act to amend the General Municipal Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 10. This
5 act shall take effect immediately.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
11 passes.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 766, by Senator Helming, Senate Print 6746A, an
14 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
18 act shall take effect on the 180th day.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 57. Nays, 1.
23 Senator Hoylman recorded in the negative.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
25 is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 769, by Senator Robach, Senate Print 7857, an act
3 to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
7 act shall take effect on the 180th day.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 56. Nays, 2.
12 Senators Avella and Hoylman recorded in the
13 negative.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 800, by Senator LaValle, Senate Print 7236, an
18 act to amend the State Finance Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
22 act shall take effect immediately.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 895, substituted earlier by Member of the
6 Assembly Abbate, Assembly Print 3137, an act to
7 amend the Retirement and Social Security Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 957, by Senator Robach, Senate Print 8243, an act
20 to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
24 act shall take effect --

25 SENATOR KRUEGER: Lay it aside,

1 please.

2 SENATOR KLEIN: Lay it aside.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Lay it
4 aside.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 960, by Senator Felder, Senate Print 2105A, an
7 act to direct.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
17 passes.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 971, by Senator Funke, Senate Print 7614, an act
20 to amend the Education Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
24 act shall take effect on the first of January.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
5 passes.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 979, substituted earlier by Member of the
8 Assembly Carroll, Assembly Print 10150, an act to
9 amend the Real Property Tax Law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
11 last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
13 act shall take effect immediately.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
19 passes.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 985, substituted earlier by Member of the
22 Assembly Pellegrino, Assembly Print 10507, an act
23 to amend Chapter 274 of the Laws of 2010.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
25 last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
2 act shall take effect immediately.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
8 passes.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 1065, substituted earlier by Member of the
11 Assembly Paulin, Assembly Print 6823C, an act to
12 amend the Penal Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 24. This
16 act shall take effect on the 90th day.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
22 passes.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 1109, by Senator LaValle, Senate Print 7259A, an
25 act to amend the Education Law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
2 last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
4 act shall take effect immediately.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
10 passes.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 1117, substituted earlier by Member of the
13 Assembly Lupardo, Assembly Print 6026, an act to
14 amend the Real Property Tax Law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
18 act shall take effect immediately.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
24 passes.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1135, by Senator Savino, Senate Print 3755 --

2 SENATOR KLEIN: Lay the bill aside
3 for the day, please.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Lay the
5 bill aside for the day.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 1232, by Senator Savino, Senate Print 4135A --

8 SENATOR KLEIN: Lay the bill aside
9 for the day, please.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Lay the
11 bill aside for the day.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 1247, substituted earlier by Member of the
14 Assembly Englebright, Assembly Print 10220A, an
15 act to amend the Business Corporation Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
19 act shall take effect immediately.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
25 is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 1301, by Senator Felder, Senate Print 7844, an
3 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
7 act shall take effect on the first of January.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
12 Calendar 1301, those recorded in the negative are
13 Senators Hoylman, Krueger and Ranzenhofer.

14 Ayes, 55. Nays, 3.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
16 passes.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 1326, substituted earlier by Member of the
19 Assembly Dinowitz, Assembly Print 10647, an act
20 to amend Chapter 237 of the Laws of 2015.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
5 passes.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 1361, by Senator Young, Senate Print 1107, an act
8 to amend the Penal Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
12 act shall take effect on the 180th day.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
17 Young to explain her vote.

18 SENATOR YOUNG: Thank you,
19 Mr. President. I'd like to explain my vote.

20 This legislation, also known as
21 Brittany's Law, was created in response to a
22 horrible double murder that occurred in 2009 when
23 12-year-old Brittany Passalacqua and her mother,
24 Helen Buchel, were murdered by John Edward Brown,
25 who was a violent felon who had been released

1 early from prison after only serving two and a
2 half years for assaulting his infant daughter in
3 2003 --

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Excuse
5 me, Senator Young.

6 Can I have some order in the house,
7 please.

8 SENATOR YOUNG: Thank you,
9 Mr. President.

10 Unfortunately, Helen was unaware of
11 the killer's dangerous past, and she started to
12 date Brown. Just a few months later, she was
13 murdered and Brittany was murdered.

14 And the passage today of this bill
15 is particularly poignant, Mr. President, because
16 today would have been Helen's 43rd birthday. We
17 have passed this law over and over again in the
18 New York State Senate. It's time for the
19 Assembly to act.

20 So I urge all of my colleagues to
21 vote yes to create this registry of violent
22 offenders so that people will have the knowledge
23 that they need to know if someone is dangerous or
24 not. And also I would urge the Assembly to
25 finally pass the bill and the Governor to sign it

1 into law.

2 Thank you, Mr. President.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
4 Young to be recorded in the affirmative.

5 Announce the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
7 Calendar 1361, those recorded in the negative are
8 Senators Alcantara, Bailey, Benjamin, Comrie,
9 Dilan, Gianaris, Hamilton, Hoylman, Kavanagh,
10 Krueger, Montgomery, Parker, Peralta, Sanders,
11 Serrano and Stavisky. Also Senator Rivera. Also
12 Senator Persaud.

13 Ayes, 42. Nays, 18.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
15 passes.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 1387, by Senator Seward, Senate Print 7940A, an
18 act to amend the Insurance Law.

19 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Lay it aside
20 for the day.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
22 is laid aside for the day.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 1390, by Member of the Assembly Cymbrowitz,
25 Assembly Print 10613, an act to amend Chapter 673

1 of the Laws of 2005.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
5 act shall take effect immediately.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
11 passes.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 1409, substituted earlier by Member of the
14 Assembly Weprin, Assembly Print 5200, an act to
15 amend the Penal Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
19 act shall take effect immediately.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

24 Senator Hamilton recorded in the negative.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill

1 passes.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 1443, substituted earlier by Member of the
4 Assembly Abbate, Assembly Print 10676, an act to
5 amend the Administrative Code of the City of
6 New York.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
16 passes.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 1499, substituted earlier by Member of the
19 Assembly Steck --

20 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Lay the bill
21 aside for the day, please.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Lay it
23 aside for the day.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 1501, substituted earlier by Member of the

1 Assembly Stern, Assembly Print 10830, an act to
2 amend Chapter 563 of the Laws of 2001.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
12 passes.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 1721, by Senator Marcellino, Senate Print 6634,
15 an act to authorize.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There is
17 a home-rule message present at the desk.

18 The Secretary will read the last
19 section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
2 passes.

3 Calendar Number 1730 has been
4 amended. It's high and is laid aside for the
5 day.

6 Calendar Number 1740 is before the
7 house.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 1740, by Senator Golden, Senate Print 8929, an
10 act to amend the Executive Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
14 act shall take effect immediately.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
20 passes.

21 Senator DeFrancisco, that completes
22 the noncontroversial reading of today's
23 active-list calendar before the house.

24 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO:
25 Mr. President, I'd like to now call an immediate

1 meeting of the Rules Committee in Room 332.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There's
3 an immediate meeting of the Rules Committee in
4 Room 332.

5 The Senate will stand at ease.

6 (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease
7 at 5:07 p.m.)

8 (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at
9 5:21 p.m.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
11 Senate will come to order.

12 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Can we go
13 to --

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Motions
15 and resolutions we'll return to.

16 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: -- motions
17 and resolutions.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: And
19 reports of standing committees.

20 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Is there a
21 report of a standing committee at the desk?

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There is
23 a Rules Committee report, and the Secretary will
24 read.

25 THE SECRETARY: Senator Flanagan,

1 from the Committee on Rules, reports the
2 following bills:

3 Senate Print 48A, by Senator
4 Hoylman, an act to amend the Public Health Law;

5 Senate 465A, by Senator Robach, an
6 act to amend the Education Law;

7 Senate 806, by Senator Alcantara, an
8 act to amend the Public Health Law;

9 Senate 1033A, by Senator Carlucci,
10 an act to amend the Tax Law;

11 Senate 1198A, by Senator Persaud, an
12 act to amend the Tax Law;

13 Senate 1954, by Senator Klein, an
14 act to amend the Penal Law;

15 Senate 1994A, by Senator O'Mara, an
16 act to amend the Tax Law;

17 Senate 2084, by Senator Comrie, an
18 act relating to the establishment;

19 Senate 2477, by Senator Gianaris, an
20 act to amend the Correction Law;

21 Senate 2689, by Senator Breslin, an
22 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law;

23 Senate 3060, by Senator Addabbo, an
24 act to amend the Highway Law;

25 Senate 3370, by Senator Sanders, an

1 act to amend the Racing, Pari-Mutuel Wagering and
2 Breeding Law;

3 Senate 3457A, by Senator Serrano, an
4 act to amend the Parks, Recreation and Historic
5 Preservation Law;

6 Senate 3813, by Senator Sanders, an
7 act to amend the Education Law;

8 Senate 4019A, by Senator Hamilton,
9 an act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law;

10 Senate 4185, by Senator Dilan, an
11 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law;

12 Senate 4264A, by Senator Griffo, an
13 act to amend the Public Service Law;

14 Senate 4436, by Senator Montgomery,
15 an act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law;

16 Senate 5221A, by Senator Stavisky,
17 an act to amend the Public Health Law;

18 Senate 5890B, by Senator Seward, an
19 act to amend Chapter 440 of the Laws of 2012;

20 Senate 6201A, by Senator Lanza, an
21 act to amend the Judiciary Law;

22 Senate 6303A, by Senator Lanza, an
23 act to amend the Public Authorities Law;

24 Senate 6610, by Senator Lanza, an
25 act to amend the Executive Law;

1 Senate 6619, by Senator Lanza, an
2 act to amend the Education Law;

3 Senate 7351A, by Senator Valesky, an
4 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law;

5 Senate 7395D, by Senator Tedisco, an
6 act to amend the Agriculture and Markets Law;

7 Senate 7443, by Senator Little, an
8 act to amend the General Municipal Law;

9 Senate 7704, by Senator Golden, an
10 act to amend the Retirement and Social Security
11 Law;

12 Senate 7705, by Senator Golden, an
13 act to amend the Retirement and Social Security
14 Law;

15 Senate 7727, by Senator Young, an
16 act to ratify;

17 Senate 7730, by Senator Murphy, an
18 act to amend the Education Law;

19 Senate 7973A, by Senator Marchione,
20 an act to amend the Banking Law;

21 Senate 8018, by Senator Young, an
22 act to amend Chapter 98 of the Laws of 2009;

23 Senate 8141A, by Senator Benjamin,
24 an act to amend the Public Authorities Law;

25 Senate 8389B, by Senator Jacobs, an

1 act to amend the General Business Law;

2 Senate 8543, by Senator Serino, an

3 act to amend the Public Health Law;

4 Senate 8612, by Senator Hannon, an

5 act to amend the Not-For-Profit Corporation Law;

6 Senate 8727, by Senator LaValle, an

7 act to amend the Education Law;

8 Senate 8841, by Senator Helming, an

9 act to amend the Agriculture and Markets Law;

10 And Senate 8849, by Senator Larkin,

11 an act to amend Chapter 266 of the Laws of 1981.

12 All bills reported direct to third
13 reading.

14 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO:

15 Mr. President, I move to accept the report of the
16 Rules Committee.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: All in
18 favor of accepting the Committee on Rules report
19 signify by saying aye.

20 (Response of "Aye.")

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Opposed?

22 (No response.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The Rules
24 report is accepted and before the house.

25 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Could we now

1 go back to messages from the Assembly.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: We will
3 return to messages from the Assembly for
4 substitution purposes.

5 The Secretary will read.

6 THE SECRETARY: Senator Carlucci
7 moves to discharge, from the Committee on
8 Investigations and Government Operations,
9 Assembly Bill Number 5159B and substitute it for
10 the identical Senate Bill 1033A, Third Reading
11 Calendar 1744.

12 Senator Comrie moves to discharge,
13 from the Committee on Children and Families,
14 Assembly Bill Number 2449 and substitute it for
15 the identical Senate Bill 2084, Third Reading
16 Calendar 1747.

17 Senator Sanders moves to discharge,
18 from the Committee on Racing, Gaming and
19 Wagering, Assembly Bill Number 3076 and
20 substitute it for the identical Senate Bill 3370,
21 Third Reading Calendar 1751.

22 Senator Serrano moves to discharge,
23 from the Committee on Cultural Affairs, Assembly
24 Bill Number 2835A and substitute it for the
25 identical Senate Bill 3457A, Third Reading

1 Calendar 1752.

2 Senator Griffo moves to discharge,
3 from the Committee on Energy and
4 Telecommunications, Assembly Bill Number 467A and
5 substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
6 4264A, Third Reading Calendar 1756.

7 Senator Lanza moves to discharge,
8 from the Committee on Veterans, Homeland Security
9 and Military Affairs, Assembly Bill Number 1206
10 and substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
11 6610, Third Reading Calendar 1762.

12 Senator Golden moves to discharge,
13 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill Number
14 9910 and substitute it for the identical Senate
15 Bill 7704, Third Reading Calendar 1767.

16 Senator Golden moves to discharge,
17 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill Number
18 9909 and substitute it for the identical Senate
19 Bill 7705, Third Reading Calendar 1768.

20 Senator LaValle moves to discharge,
21 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill Number
22 10864 and substitute it for the identical Senate
23 Bill 8727, Third Reading Calendar 1777.

24 Senator Helming moves to discharge,
25 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill Number

1 10097 and substitute it for the identical Senate
2 Bill 8841, Third Reading Calendar 1778.

3 And Senator Larkin moves to
4 discharge, from the Committee on Veterans,
5 Homeland Security and Military Affairs,
6 Assembly Bill Number 9585 and substitute it for
7 the identical Senate Bill 8849, Third Reading
8 Calendar 1779.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
10 substitutions are so ordered as read and
11 presented.

12 Senator DeFrancisco.

13 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: We have
14 Supplemental Calendar 54A, which consists of the
15 bills that just came out of the Rules Committee.
16 May we have the noncontroversial reading of that
17 calendar.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
19 Secretary will read.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 1741, by Senator Hoylman, Senate Print 48A, an
22 act to amend the Public Health Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This

1 act shall take effect on the 180th day.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
7 passes.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 1742, by Senator Robach, Senate Print 465A, an
10 act to amend the Education Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
14 act shall take effect immediately.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.
19 Senator Hoylman recorded in the negative.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
21 passes.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 1743, by Senator Alcantara, Senate Print 806, an
24 act to amend the Public Health Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
9 passes.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1744, substituted earlier by Member of the
12 Assembly Titus, Assembly Print 5159B, an act to
13 amend the Tax Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
17 act shall take effect on the first of January.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Excuse
22 me. Senator Carlucci to explain his vote.

23 SENATOR CARLUCCI: Thank you,
24 Mr. President.

25 Right now in New York State

1 approximately 10,000 people are waiting for a
2 life-saving organ transplant. And fortunately,
3 with advancements in modern medicine, organ
4 transplants have become safer and more successful
5 than ever before. But unfortunately, right now
6 in New York we lag behind almost every other
7 state in the nation when it comes to eligible
8 people participating in the organ donor program.

9 And fortunately we've started to
10 make strides. In a few short years we've gone
11 from only 13 percent of eligible people enrolled
12 in the organ donor program to now 29 percent, and
13 that's thanks to policies that have come out of
14 this chamber and to so many advocates around the
15 state that have been making a difference.

16 One friend of mine in Nanuet,
17 Roxanne Watson, she received a heart transplant.
18 And since she's been well enough, she has signed
19 up over 11,000 people to become organ donors.

20 So we all play a part in this.
21 That's why this legislation is important, by
22 doing another policy that will help to encourage
23 people to become organ donors. I support this
24 legislation, want to thank my colleagues for
25 doing the same.

1 Thank you, Mr. President.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
3 Carlucci to be recorded in the affirmative.

4 Announce the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
7 passes.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 1745, by Senator Persaud, Senate Print 1198A, an
10 act to amend the Tax Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
14 act shall take effect immediately.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
20 passes.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1746, by Senator Klein, Senate Print 1954, an act
23 to amend the Penal Law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
25 last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
2 act shall take effect on the first of November.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
8 passes.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 1747, substituted earlier by Member of the
11 Assembly Hyndman, Assembly Print 2449, an act
12 relating to the establishment.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
16 act shall take effect immediately.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
22 passes.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 1748, by Senator Gianaris, Senate Print 2477, an
25 act to amend the Correction Law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
2 last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 7. This
4 act shall take effect on the 120th day.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
10 passes.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 1749, by Senator Breslin, Senate Print 2689, an
13 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
17 act shall take effect on the 120th day.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
23 passes.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 1750, by Senator Addabbo, Senate Print 3060, an

1 act to amend the Highway Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
5 act shall take effect immediately.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
11 passes.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 1751, substituted earlier by Member of the
14 Assembly Cymbrowitz, Assembly Print 3076, an act
15 to amend the Racing, Pari-Mutuel Wagering and
16 Breeding Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
20 act shall take effect immediately.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58. Nays, 2.
25 Senators Griffo and Marchione recorded in the

1 negative.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
3 passes.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 1752, substituted earlier by Member of the
6 Assembly Englebright, Assembly Print 2835A, an
7 act to amend the Parks, Recreation and Historic
8 Preservation Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
12 act shall take effect immediately.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
18 passes.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 1753, by Senator Sanders, Senate Print 3813, an
21 act to amend the Education Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
6 passes.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 1754, by Senator Hamilton, Senate Print 4019A, an
9 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
11 last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
13 act shall take effect immediately.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
18 Hamilton to explain his vote.

19 SENATOR HAMILTON: I stand,
20 Mr. Chairman, to thank my colleagues for voting
21 for the distinctive license plate for the
22 Jamaican bobsledding team.

23 As you know, the Jamaican
24 bobsledding team was internationally known. And
25 my wife is from Jamaica. So I thank you all for

1 supporting the license plates for the Jamaican
2 bobsledding team. Irie, mon.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
4 Hamilton in the affirmative.

5 Senator Bailey to explain his vote.

6 SENATOR BAILEY: Thank you,
7 Mr. President.

8 Briefly, Cool Runnings was one of my
9 favorite movies growing up --

10 (Laughter.)

11 SENATOR BAILEY: -- and it was
12 about the Jamaican bobsled team.

13 But as the proud representative of
14 the 36th Senatorial District, which has a great
15 deal of Jamaicans, I applaud Senator Hamilton for
16 bringing this bill to the floor.

17 Thank you, Mr. President. I vote
18 aye.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
20 Bailey in the affirmative.

21 Senator DeFrancisco to explain his
22 vote.

23 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Yes. I'm
24 voting no, not for any disrespect for anyone.
25 The problem, however, is that we must have

1 50 license plate bills, and we don't have any
2 policy in the State of New York as to which ones
3 should be voted on and which ones should not be
4 voted on.

5 And clearly it was an exciting event
6 when the Jamaican bobsled team participated in
7 the Olympics, but there's a lot of other
8 incredible causes that have sought license
9 plates.

10 So with no disrespect, I just
11 believe we need a policy first before we do a
12 couple of different distinctive plates.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
14 DeFrancisco in the negative.

15 Announce the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
17 Calendar 1754, those recorded in the negative are
18 Senators Akshar, DeFrancisco, Funke, Gallivan,
19 Jacobs, Kaminsky, Little, Marchione, O'Mara,
20 Ortt, Ranzenhofer, Serino, Seward, Tedisco and
21 Young.

22 Ayes, 45. Nays, 15.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1755, by Senator Dilan, Senate Print 4185, an act
2 to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
6 act shall take effect on the 120th day.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
12 passes.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 1756, substituted earlier by Member of the
15 Assembly Paulin, Assembly Print 467A, an act to
16 amend the Public Service Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
20 act shall take effect on the 90th day.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill

1 passes.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 1757, by Senator Montgomery, Senate Print 4436,
4 an act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
8 act shall take effect on the 180th day.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
14 passes.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 1758, by Senator Stavisky, Senate Print 5221A, an
17 act to amend the Public Health Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
21 act shall take effect on the first of January.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
2 passes.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 1759, by Senator Seward, Senate Print 5890B, an
5 act to amend Chapter 440 of the Laws of 2012.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58. Nays, 2.
14 Senators Krueger and Sanders recorded in the
15 negative.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
17 passes.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 1760, by Senator Lanza, Senate Print 6201A, an
20 act to amend the Judiciary Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 1761, by Senator Lanza, Senate Print 6303A, an
8 act to amend the Public Authorities Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
12 act shall take effect immediately.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 57. Nays, 3.
17 Senators Dilan, Hoylman and Kavanagh recorded in
18 the negative.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1762, substituted earlier by Member of the
23 Assembly Cusick, Assembly Print 1206, an act to
24 amend the Executive Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
3 act shall take effect on the 90th day.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
9 passes.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1763, by Senator Lanza, Senate Print 6619, an act
12 to amend the Education Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
16 act shall take effect immediately.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
22 is passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 1764, by Senator Valesky, Senate Print 7351A, an
25 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
2 last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
4 act shall take effect on the 180th day.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
10 passes.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 1765, by Senator Tedisco, Senate Print 7395D, an
13 act to amend the Agriculture and Markets Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
23 passes.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 1766, by Senator Little, Senate Print 7443, an

1 act to amend the General Municipal Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
5 act shall take effect immediately.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
11 passes.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 1767, substituted earlier by Member of the
14 Assembly Abbate, Assembly Print 9910, an act to
15 amend the Retirement and Social Security Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
19 act shall take effect immediately.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
25 passes.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 1768, substituted earlier by Member of the
3 Assembly Abbate, Assembly Print 9909, an act to
4 amend the Retirement and Social Security Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
8 act shall take effect immediately.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
14 passes.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 1769, by Senator Young, Senate Print 7727, an act
17 to ratify.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
2 passes.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 1770, by Senator Murphy, Senate Print 7730, an
5 act to amend the Education Law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
15 passes.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 1771, by Senator Marchione, Senate Print 7973A,
18 an act to amend the Banking Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
22 act shall take effect immediately.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
3 passes.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 1772, by Senator Young, Senate Print 8018, an act
6 to amend Chapter 98 of the Laws of 2009.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
15 Calendar 1772, those recorded in the negative are
16 Senators Brooks, Kaminsky and Lanza.

17 Ayes, 57. Nays, 3.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 1773, by Senator Benjamin, Senate Print 8141A, an
22 act to amend the Public Authorities Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This

1 act shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
6 Benjamin to explain his vote.

7 SENATOR BENJAMIN: Thank you,
8 Mr. President.

9 I rise because on Monday, April 9th,
10 at the B/C train on 116th and Frederick Douglass,
11 which is in the heart of my district, the train
12 was closed. And we were told that it was closed
13 because there were renovations being done that
14 would take over six months to get accomplished.

15 Unfortunately, my entire community
16 was not notified ahead of time about this
17 closure. At this site, it serves three community
18 boards in my district -- one, CB7, knew, but the
19 others, 9 and 10, were not informed.

20 And so unfortunately this morning
21 myself and others were trying to instruct parents
22 of other options, letting them know that the
23 train was closed. We had kids on their way to
24 school. People's lives were being impacted
25 because of this.

1 Fortunately, thanks to our efforts
2 here today, there will now be a required public
3 hearing 30 days before any such closure. And
4 that would at least give parents and families and
5 friends, those who have to use public
6 transportation in New York City, the opportunity
7 to be aware that the train is actually going to
8 be closed and they have to find other means to
9 get to work or to school or to see their family.

10 So thank you, Mr. President. I just
11 wanted to sort of bring that to everyone's
12 attention. It's a good bill. Thank you.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
14 Benjamin to be recorded in the affirmative.

15 Announce the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
18 passes.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 1774, by Senator Jacobs, Senate Print 8389B, an
21 act to amend the General Business Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
25 act shall take effect on the 90th day.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
5 Jacobs to explain his vote.

6 Can I have some order, please, in
7 the house.

8 SENATOR JACOBS: Thank you,
9 Mr. President.

10 This bill is -- as of June 30th, the
11 rental vehicle protections expire for rental cars
12 in the state. This bill would renew that for
13 another five years. It would update many of the
14 provisions. It will provide greater consumer
15 protections. And it will institute a new
16 schedule in terms of optional vehicle protection.

17 One thing I did want to let this
18 body know is there was a letter, a memo of
19 opposition from the New York State Trial Lawyers
20 Association concerned about mandatory arbitration
21 on this. I just wanted to inform the body that
22 this memo was withdrawn because the association
23 was not aware that amendments that happened early
24 this month assured and clarified that there is
25 not mandatory arbitration in this piece of

1 legislation.

2 Thank you.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
4 Jacobs to be recorded in the affirmative.

5 Senator Kavanagh to explain his
6 vote.

7 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Just briefly.

8 This is an expansive bill, but I
9 just want to note one provision, which is
10 something we've tried to pass for a long time and
11 I'm glad to see in the bill. This bill, among
12 other things, bans geographic discrimination by
13 rental car companies.

14 They've had a number of instances
15 where they would charge you differentially based
16 on where your residence is, not where you're
17 renting the car. So if you're a Brooklyn
18 resident, even if you're renting in some other
19 place, you might be charged more just by virtue
20 of being from Brooklyn.

21 I wasn't previously from Brooklyn,
22 but now I represent Brooklyn. And this is a bill
23 we passed for many years in the Assembly, and I'm
24 glad to see this house take that provision up.

25 And I'll be voting in the

1 affirmative.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
3 Kavanagh to be recorded in the affirmative.

4 I need to see a show of hands again.

5 I need to have some order in the
6 house.

7 And Senator Klein to explain his
8 vote.

9 SENATOR KLEIN: Thank you,
10 Mr. President.

11 I want to thank the sponsor for
12 moving this bill forward. This is an issue that
13 I've a long history with. When I was in the
14 Assembly, I did the original collision damage
15 waiver bill with the late Senator Libous.

16 And what this did was really
17 transform the industry. There was a time where
18 no one wanted to rent cars any longer in
19 New York. You didn't have a large selection of
20 cars. The prices were very, very high.

21 What we've seen since the passage of
22 the original legislation and now the continuation
23 is rental car rates going down dramatically, the
24 types of cars people can rent has expanded
25 greatly, and I think it's been a win for the

1 automobile industry and really everyone else in
2 between.

3 So I of course vote yes, and again I
4 thank Senator Jacobs for bringing this bill
5 forward.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
7 Klein in the affirmative.

8 Can I have a show of hands again,
9 anybody voting in the negative.

10 Announce the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
13 passes.

14 The Secretary will continue.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 1775, by Senator Serino, Senate Print 8543, an
17 act to amend the Public Health Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
21 act shall take effect on the 120th day.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
2 passes.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 1776, by Senator Hannon, Senate Print 8612, an
5 act to amend the Not-For-Profit Corporation Law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
15 passes.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 1777, substituted earlier by Member of the
18 Assembly Hyndman, Assembly Print 10864, an act to
19 amend the Education Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
4 passes.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 1778, substituted earlier by Member of the
7 Assembly Woerner, Assembly Print 10097, an act to
8 amend the Agriculture and Markets Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
12 act shall take effect immediately.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
18 passes.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 1779, substituted earlier by Member of the
21 Assembly Hunter, Assembly Print 9585, an act to
22 amend Chapter 266 of the Laws of 1981.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This

1 act shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
6 Hoylman to explain his vote.

7 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Thank you,
8 Mr. President.

9 I want to commend the sponsor for
10 this common-sense bill that extends the revival
11 window by two years for members of the armed
12 services serving in Vietnam who were exposed to
13 Agent Orange.

14 You know, revival windows are
15 important to individuals who seek justice, yet
16 some are outside of the statute of limitations.
17 And at the same time, the harm that is caused
18 them only is evident years after the statute of
19 limitations closes.

20 That's what happens in this bill,
21 and that's what we could do for survivors of
22 child sexual abuse by passing the Child Victims
23 Act that has passed the Assembly already.

24 I'll be voting aye. Thank you,
25 Mr. President.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
2 Hoylman in the affirmative.

3 Announce the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
6 passes.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 1780, by Senator O'Mara, Senate Print 1994A, an
9 act to amend the Tax Law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
11 last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 10. This
13 act shall take effect immediately.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
19 is passed.

20 Senator DeFrancisco, that concludes
21 the noncontroversial reading of today's Senate
22 Supplemental Calendar 54A -- with good work, good
23 deeds and good thoughts abounding.

24 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: That is
25 correct. That is correct. She is invited back

1 for the prayer tomorrow morning as well.

2 There is a supplemental active list
3 at the desk that consists of six bills, starting
4 with a Robach bill, ending with a Mayer bill. If
5 you can't find it on your desk, there's one at
6 the table up here. I'd like to ask you to do the
7 noncontroversial reading of that calendar,
8 please.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
10 Secretary will begin the noncontroversial
11 supplemental active-list calendar with Calendar
12 Number 610.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 610, by Senator Robach, Senate Print 7664, an act
15 to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
19 act shall take effect immediately.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
25 passes.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 1272, by Senator O'Mara, Senate Print 2123, an
3 act to amend the Penal Law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This
7 act shall take effect on the first of November.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Announce
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
14 Calendar 1272, those recorded in the negative are
15 Senators Alcantara, Bailey, Comrie, Hoylman,
16 Kavanagh, Krueger, Montgomery and Serrano. Also
17 Senator Rivera.

18 Ayes, 51. Nays, 9.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
20 passes.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1452, by Senator Seward, Senate Print 3970, an
23 act to amend the Education Law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
25 last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
2 act shall take effect immediately.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
8 passes.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 1509, by Senator Hannon, Senate Print 8785, an
11 act to amend the Public Health Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
15 act shall take effect immediately.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
21 passes.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 1651, by Senator Ortt, Senate Print 8210, an act
24 to amend the Executive Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
9 passes.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1739, by Senator Mayer, Senate Print 8857, an act
12 to amend Chapter 725 of the Laws of 1984.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There is
14 a home-rule message present at the desk.

15 The Secretary will read the last
16 section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
18 act shall take effect on the same date and in the
19 same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2017.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
25 is passed.

1 Senator DeFrancisco, that completes
2 the noncontroversial reading of the supplemental
3 active-list calendar at the desk.

4 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Can we go
5 back to the original active list. I believe
6 there's one bill that's been laid aside, a Robach
7 bill. Can we have the noncontroversial reading
8 of that bill.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: We will
10 return to the original active list for Calendar
11 Number 957.

12 The Secretary will ring the bell,
13 and the Secretary will read. Noncontroversial?

14 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO:
15 Controversial, I'm sorry.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
17 Secretary will ring the bell.

18 The Secretary will read.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 957, by Senator Robach, Senate Print 8243, an act
21 to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

22 SENATOR KRUEGER: Explanation.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Order,
24 please, in the chamber.

25 Senator Krueger has requested an

1 explanation.

2 SENATOR ROBACH: Yes,
3 Mr. President.

4 This bill, which we have taken up --
5 well, a different version of this bill before,
6 would amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law in
7 allowing to change what I believe is an archaic
8 part of our law that would have to have one hand
9 on the steering wheel even when you have auto
10 park and auto assist -- which you physically
11 can't have your hands on that wheel -- as well as
12 other features that are added to enhance cars and
13 make them more safe.

14 Just for the record, because I know
15 Senator Krueger and I have discussed this bill
16 before, there's been a little bit of a revision
17 to say only when those safety features are in
18 place would that be intact. And we've also
19 changed sponsors in the other house to
20 Assemblyman Morelle.

21 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
22 Mr. President, if the sponsor would please yield.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
24 Robach, do you yield?

25 SENATOR ROBACH: Certainly.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
2 sponsor yields.

3 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you.

4 So in your explanation you talked
5 specifically about a certain list of automation
6 changes, but in your legislation it says all
7 automation.

8 SENATOR ROBACH: There's only three
9 allowed now by federal law anywhere: Lane
10 identification, emergency braking, and auto
11 parking. So it would affect those three.

12 But the one I would say that I
13 personally am the most concerned with -- and I
14 think this is important for members to know both
15 from a standpoint of violating the law as well as
16 from a civil standpoint -- if we do not change
17 this law, you could actually own the vehicle
18 yourself and if you were to be parking your car
19 or using any of those safety features as
20 instructed to operate safely, you could then be
21 both liable or be given a ticket for not doing it
22 under existing law.

23 If we don't change this, I think
24 it's making scofflaws out of law-abiding
25 citizens. In people who have been surveyed,

1 84 percent want to use these safety features,
2 which we know make vehicles safe safer and less
3 likely to be involved in an accident.

4 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
5 Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
6 yield.

7 SENATOR ROBACH: Certainly.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
9 sponsor yields.

10 SENATOR KRUEGER: I want to thank
11 the sponsor for his explanation and also to go on
12 record that ultimately I'm not necessarily
13 opposed to autonomous vehicles, but our job here
14 is to make sure we do protect the safety of the
15 nearly 20 million New Yorkers.

16 So in the semiautonomous vehicles
17 that you would like us to be able to use with no
18 hand on the steering wheel, what happens if
19 there's a hardware malfunction but our hands
20 aren't on the steering wheel?

21 SENATOR ROBACH: So you're really
22 talking about two completely different things. A
23 fully autonomous vehicle -- which they have
24 prototypes, and I have driven -- would be very
25 different than the cars we have available today,

1 which are a limited amount of autonomous
2 features.

3 So I can only speak to, in all
4 reality, what's on the marketplace right now. So
5 if you're driving your Buick Regal with
6 auto-assist brake, what would happen is you would
7 hit the button for that to park your car, and it
8 instructs you to let go of the steering wheel.
9 Which you would do, because if you have your hand
10 on it, it can't turn by itself.

11 That's all it would do. So if -- I
12 assume if your car broke down or had something
13 else, you would have to manage that with a
14 different way.

15 If you are talking about a fully
16 autonomous vehicle, it would depend what features
17 that had and what technology was in that car,
18 which are not available in the marketplace today.

19 I really do feel they're two
20 completely different things but somewhat related.

21 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes, they're two
22 different things, somewhat related.

23 If we pass your bill, we have
24 established in the law of the State of New York
25 that if we move into expanded categories of fully

1 autonomous vehicles, we've already removed the
2 requirement to have your hands on the wheel. So
3 this is both for current and for future; correct?

4 SENATOR ROBACH: In all due
5 respect, this would actually -- those features --
6 you can't have an autonomous vehicle. By
7 definition, it means it can drive without manual
8 control. But we're not there yet.

9 SENATOR KRUEGER: I understand.
10 But this -- I'm sorry, through you,
11 Mr. President. Hello.

12 If we pass this law, it applies to
13 the future expectation of fully autonomous
14 vehicles as well as the current reality of
15 semiautonomous vehicles; correct?

16 SENATOR ROBACH: I don't think so.
17 I think this only affects the things that are
18 listed on here, which I can read to you. Right
19 now we're amending the section of the law that
20 would say "automatic emergency braking, adaptive
21 cruise control, self-parking technology or lane
22 assist."

23 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
24 Mr. President, if the sponsor will continue to
25 yield.

1 SENATOR ROBACH: Sure.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
3 Senator yields.

4 SENATOR KRUEGER: My understanding
5 of the law is it covers -- as defined in SAE
6 J3016 industry standards, which are broader than
7 just the semiautonomous vehicles we're discussing
8 today.

9 SENATOR ROBACH: Well, the whole
10 industry is looking at standards of what might
11 happen in the future, no question. And SAE,
12 which you brought up -- the Society of Automotive
13 Engineers are the brain trust, I mean, evolving
14 from Thomas Edison and Henry Ford to today, the
15 top-notch people on automotive safety in doing
16 that. So yes, I think they're always looking at
17 what the standards are and how they can revise
18 that.

19 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
20 Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
21 yield.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
23 sponsor yields.

24 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you.
25 So let's stick with the

1 semiautonomous vehicles, and we'll use the
2 example the sponsor already raised, you have a
3 car that is self-parking. And in theory, you
4 pull up to a spot and it parks itself. And then
5 if we pass this law, you don't have to have your
6 hands on the wheel, you'll probably be less --
7 correct, neither hand will have to be on the
8 wheel?

9 SENATOR ROBACH: When that feature
10 is engaged only.

11 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yup, only when
12 that feature is engaged for the parking. And
13 good chance when your hand's not on the wheel at
14 all and it's self-parking or doing something else
15 for itself, you're not as focused on what's going
16 on in your mirrors.

17 The car malfunctions. It doesn't
18 stop when somebody darts between where it is and
19 the parking space, and the car hits the person
20 who is cutting through the parking space. But
21 your hands aren't on the wheel, and you're not
22 focused on the responsibility, and you may not
23 even be looking in the mirrors, rear-view or
24 front, because you're checking something because
25 you don't have any responsibility for that

1 vehicle at that time.

2 Don't you think that should be a
3 concern for us?

4 SENATOR ROBACH: Actually, that's a
5 perfect point why we need to have this.

6 So if you had the technology, and
7 let's say you had all of it, not only would that
8 park your car without banging or denting anybody
9 probably better than humans can, according to
10 SAE, but also if you had the automatic braking
11 feature, it might stop that too, even though you
12 might be looking in the mirror or might not be.

13 But I almost just want to turn it a
14 around a minute, even given your scenario. So
15 now let's say somebody is driving their own
16 vehicle, comes around the corner while you're on
17 auto assist and runs into the back of your
18 vehicle, and the feature can't stop the accident
19 occurring. Do you think that person who's using
20 the technology should either be financially
21 liable or be written a ticket because they don't
22 have their hands on the steering wheel, whether
23 it's my mother, somebody's grandmother who's
24 doing exactly what they're supposed to do with
25 the vehicle?

1 We're the only state in the nation
2 that has this, and we're no safer than anybody
3 else.

4 So I really, really feel the time is
5 long overdue. We've addressed all the concerns.
6 If you want to be opposed to autonomous vehicles,
7 you certainly have that opinion. But for
8 technology that's already in cars that people are
9 paying extra money to have -- the SAE, who you
10 brought up, is saying it makes us almost
11 90 percent safer by having those features -- I
12 don't think we should make scofflaws out of
13 people here in New York. I think they should be
14 treated like the rest of the country and be able
15 to use those features, be safer and move on.
16 Because that's what will happen if we don't do
17 the bill, Senator Krueger.

18 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
19 Mr. President, let me see if I have any more
20 questions before I speak on the bill. No, I'll
21 be on the bill.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
23 Krueger on the bill.

24 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you.

25 So the sponsor seems to believe I'm

1 opposed to autonomous vehicles. I am not. I
2 want to make sure they're safe before we let them
3 on our roads. And I want to make sure we think,
4 as a legislature, about the responsibilities we
5 need to take on when we're move into a world of
6 autonomous vehicles. And there are many things
7 for us to think about that we have not done or
8 acted on yet.

9 And he closed with exactly one of
10 the points I was trying to make. We have not
11 addressed the questions of liability in a world
12 of autonomous vehicles. So when the vehicle is
13 driving itself and you're just sitting there --
14 and yes, we're not there yet, but in fact the
15 definitions applied in the report of the --
16 sorry, this is not something that rolls off my
17 tongue -- as defined in the SAE J3016,
18 definitions and standards for autonomous vehicles
19 for the country, it covers fully autonomous as
20 well as the three examples we're using today.

21 So when we're passing a law today,
22 it would apply to any and all semiautonomous
23 efforts or fully autonomous vehicles. So we're
24 making a decision today that impacts the future
25 of autonomous vehicles, now and in the future.

1 We haven't dealt with liability
2 questions or insurance questions. So if there's
3 a hardware malfunction and someone gets hurt and
4 you don't have your hands on the wheel so you
5 can't jump to respond and take over control, it's
6 an excellent question who is liable and who is
7 responsible if someone else is hurt or killed by
8 the vehicle parking itself, adjusting itself, or
9 driving itself. We haven't dealt with that in
10 our insurance and our liability laws.

11 If there's a software malfunction,
12 there's this great question out there in this
13 industry, is it going to be the car manufacturer
14 that's responsible when something goes wrong? Is
15 it the software company that sold the system to
16 the car manufacturer to install? Or is it just
17 you, because you own the car? But your hands
18 aren't on the vehicle. You're not even being
19 expected to be focused on what's going on around
20 you because you're no longer technically the
21 driver, except that you're sitting up front.

22 What if somebody hacks the software,
23 a third-party hacking of the software that
24 results in dangerous outcomes and even the death
25 of people? What's the liability and the

1 protection then? Are we doing anything to ensure
2 the security of these systems not being able to
3 be hacked?

4 I met with some professors who
5 specialize in tort liability law and automobile
6 insurance and federal safety regulations. One
7 from NYU, Mark Geistfeld, has written I think the
8 definitive research paper on it, and he points
9 out that states are going to have to confront all
10 of these questions for themselves, and that most
11 have not. And New York has not. Because this is
12 frankly the only bill I'm seeing related to
13 autonomous vehicles, and simply saying you can
14 take your hand off the wheel and everything else
15 will be fine is not actually the right answer,
16 Mr. President.

17 And I also learned from talking to
18 people that safety -- excuse me, Mr. President.
19 It's a little noisy.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Can I
21 have some order, please.

22 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you,
23 Mr. President.

24 So the safety research by the
25 Federal Transportation Commission over the years

1 has shown that drivers who don't drive very often
2 are actually the worst drivers and have the worst
3 responses to emergency situations. And think
4 about it. That would make sense. If you don't
5 drive a lot, you're probably not a great driver.
6 If you don't drive a lot, when something untold
7 happens and you have to have an emergency
8 reaction, your reactions probably aren't as good
9 because you're not driving very often.

10 The dilemma with autonomous vehicles
11 is everybody will be a bad driver because
12 everybody will just be sitting there letting the
13 car do its thing, thinking it's not my problem,
14 it's not my responsibility.

15 Meanwhile, the autonomous vehicle
16 designers assume that you will jump in and
17 respond. They all specifically talk about making
18 sure that the driver will have to take
19 responsibility when something happens at the last
20 second.

21 So we're setting ourselves up for
22 what can be a much better future with autonomous
23 vehicles -- and I even accept that when you look
24 at research, if designed correctly and handled
25 correctly, autonomous vehicles probably will

1 result in overall better safety outcomes because
2 most vehicle accidents are human error, not
3 vehicle error. I think we probably agree on
4 that.

5 But I think we really need to think
6 this through. And we need to deal with the
7 insurance questions for the State of New York,
8 the liability questions, and just the
9 common-sense questions of shouldn't you always
10 have at least one hand on the wheel and be
11 focused on needing to have an emergency reaction
12 to something unexpected that happens even in an
13 autonomous vehicle.

14 I don't think requiring one hand on
15 the wheel prevents anyone from going forward with
16 efforts to expand this modern technology. But I
17 think it's just a common-sense safety approach to
18 say, no, keep a hand on the wheel, because no one
19 should believe that the future of autonomous
20 vehicles means they will have no responsibility
21 for what happens when they're driving that car.

22 Which is why I'm asking this house
23 not to rush forward with this bill, but rather to
24 wait to see an entire package of federal
25 standards and protections and a robust discussion

1 around insurance changes, liability, and
2 responsibility before we rush forward to expand
3 these vehicles in our state.

4 I vote no, Mr. President. Thank
5 you.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
7 Kaminsky.

8 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Would the
9 sponsor yield for several questions, please.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
11 Robach, do you yield to a question?

12 SENATOR ROBACH: I certainly will.

13 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Through you,
14 Mr. President, I obviously thank the sponsor
15 for --

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
17 chamber is getting a little noisy again. I'd
18 ask, if you're having conversations, please take
19 it outside the chamber.

20 Senator Kaminsky, continue.

21 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Thank you,
22 Mr. President.

23 I thank the sponsor for taking the
24 lead on so many important transportation issues,
25 especially this one, where I think he's trying to

1 have New York lead the way in important
2 technology. I just want to ask him some process
3 questions about this.

4 Can the sponsor please tell us
5 whether there were any public hearings about this
6 issue where experts or anyone related to
7 understanding of this issue gave testimony about
8 the implications of this bill?

9 SENATOR ROBACH: Certainly. So I
10 would almost make the argument this way, and I
11 probably should have said this in my response to
12 Senator Krueger. All these features have to be
13 vetted federally before they can even be sold in
14 New York or any other state.

15 So there has been a lot of research,
16 a lot of dialogue, a lot of talk, a lot of
17 testing, a lot of things on safety features in
18 cars since the beginning of time. I think these
19 are no different. And I think the question that
20 we can't ask, no matter how much testing there
21 is -- which is valid, just like you have to go
22 get your car inspected, but if your brakes fail,
23 you know, you have to negotiate it and manage it
24 regardless of what that feature is. I don't
25 think that's any different now in the process of

1 that.

2 And I would just end my remarks
3 with, again, the ultimate test, once it's been
4 deemed safe, is the marketplace if people want
5 those features. And I would say that, you know,
6 84 percent of people say they would buy these
7 cars for those safety features that they want to
8 be able to operate like the rest of the country.
9 Which now in New York you can, but technically
10 for that one feature, you're in violation of our
11 law -- which made all the sense in the world when
12 that safety feature is not engaged.

13 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Will the sponsor
14 continue to yield?

15 SENATOR ROBACH: Sure.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
17 sponsor yields.

18 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Thank you,
19 Mr. President, the sponsor just referenced
20 discussion, debate about this issue. Has any of
21 that taken place publicly within this building on
22 this issue?

23 SENATOR ROBACH: Well, outside of
24 the -- we've certainly had it in the
25 Transportation Committee. We've had tests, we've

1 had driving things, we've had things in the
2 Concourse, open to the public for people to drive
3 and test vehicles, different things like that.

4 If you're asking me did we have a
5 specific public hearing on what the federal
6 government said was okay in a safety feature, I
7 did not.

8 SENATOR KAMINSKY: Okay. On the
9 bill, Mr. President.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
11 Kaminsky on the bill.

12 SENATOR KAMINSKY: So fellow
13 colleagues, my issue is not with the bill or the
14 sponsor's good-hearted efforts to improve our
15 access to technology in the state, it's how we
16 function as a legislature. This is a really
17 complex technical part of law where you cannot
18 expect legislators to understand the benefits,
19 the costs of autonomous vehicles, how they might
20 work, interact with the VTL.

21 There's a bill that's put in over
22 the break in April, it's on transportation, eight
23 days later it hits the floor and we're supposed
24 to make complex decisions about a very important
25 part of law that impacts our economy. The bill

1 memo says "Fiscal impact to be determined." I
2 don't know what the AAA thinks about this.

3 There's a lot of important issues
4 here, and I just don't think we're functioning
5 properly as a legislature. When was the last
6 time we marked up a bill in committee? When was
7 the last time we brought in experts and had a
8 hearing about, you know, maybe not the top two or
9 three issues being talked about in our state, but
10 regular mundane legislative issues that help us
11 sift through the facts about what we're supposed
12 to be doing here?

13 So I'm left looking at this bill
14 trying to figure out, you know, complex issues
15 about technology. I understand the sponsor
16 probably doesn't think they're all complex,
17 because this is his area of expertise. But for
18 the rest of us, I just don't think we're doing
19 the people's work with the diligence that we
20 should.

21 And by the way, it only gets worse
22 over the next few days. We're going to be voting
23 on 200, 300 things a day. I dare you to go back
24 and try to remember what you voted on and what
25 those votes were for.

1 This is not how we should be
2 operating. And on a technically difficult bill
3 like this, we should have had the benefit of a
4 hearing on transportation, we should have had the
5 benefit of having more experts, understanding
6 this a little more, just putting a little more
7 thought and elbow grease into such an important
8 area.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Seeing
10 and hearing no other Senator that wishes --
11 Senator Hoylman.

12 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Thank you. I
13 rise also to comment on the fact that --

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
15 Hoylman on the bill?

16 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Yes,
17 Mr. President, on the bill.

18 I rise to point out that you had
19 certainly big business weighing in on this bill.
20 You had Volkswagen and General Motors and Toyota.
21 You had a demonstration on the Concourse
22 obviously sponsored by an automobile company.
23 You had a sign out here outside of the Senate
24 chamber that said "Accelerating the world to
25 sustainable energy." It was like a paid

1 advertisement by Tesla.

2 First of all, I don't even know if
3 that's permissible, but it's certainly not
4 acceptable for us to do the business of industry
5 without allowing consumers, people, our
6 constituents to understand the implications for
7 our neighborhoods.

8 So I'll be voting in the negative.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Seeing
10 and hearing no other Senator that wishes to be
11 heard, debate is closed. The Secretary will ring
12 the bell.

13 Senator DeFrancisco, why do you
14 rise?

15 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: By unanimous
16 consent, I'd request that we go back to the
17 noncontroversial reading of that bill.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Without
19 objection, we will revert back to the
20 noncontroversial reading of the bill, and the
21 Secretary will read the last section.

22 Before we do that, I want to extend
23 a very happy birthday to one of our colleagues
24 today, Senator Kathy Marchione, and extend her
25 our best wishes.

1 (Applause.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
3 Secretary will read the last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
5 act shall take effect on the first of November.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
10 Lanza to explain his vote.

11 SENATOR LANZA: Thank you,
12 Mr. President, to explain my vote.

13 You know, I listened to the debate;
14 I want to thank the sponsor, Senator Robach, for
15 bringing this legislation to the floor to bring
16 New York State into this century. It's sad. I
17 can't believe that we are the last state in the
18 union to embrace technology. That should not be
19 the way of the Empire State.

20 And listening to my colleagues and
21 all their great concern about the safety of these
22 vehicles, I'm sure they're all aware that there
23 are dealerships in Manhattan for years selling
24 these cars and promoting these cars, and that
25 they're being bought by our constituents around

1 the state every day of the year, not just this
2 year but last year and the year before.

3 If there was such great concern for
4 the safety of these vehicles -- I checked with my
5 staff, I asked if there was any member of this
6 body that has submitted legislation to prohibit
7 the sale of these vehicles in the State of
8 New York. Shockingly, the answer is no, not one.
9 Not one member from across the aisle or this side
10 of the aisle has put in legislation that would
11 say, Hey, these cars are dangerous, we have these
12 grave concerns, we'd like to have hearings. And
13 in the meantime, we shouldn't allow our citizens
14 to buy these cars. But not a bill like that,
15 because I think this is more posturing than
16 anything else.

17 Senator Robach, thank you for
18 allowing New York State to embrace technology
19 that is going to make -- that is going to make
20 the drivers in this state safer, not less safe.

21 I vote aye.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
23 Lanza in the affirmative.

24 Senator Krueger to explain her vote.

25 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you,

1 Mr. President.

2 I think I've already explained why
3 I'm voting no. I just wanted to clarify, given
4 my colleague's response. I said nothing about
5 outlawing the cars that are being sold in the
6 state now. I said nothing about putting limits
7 on other cars that might be showing up any
8 minute. I said keep one hand on the steering
9 wheel. We have a lot of things to figure out.
10 Nothing about anyone not being allowed to
11 purchase cars that are legally allowed to be sold
12 in New York.

13 And we're not the last state, there
14 are several other states that still have a
15 hand-on-the-steering-wheel policy.

16 Thank you, Mr. President. I remain
17 no.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
19 Krueger in the negative.

20 Announce the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
22 Calendar 957, those recorded in the negative are
23 Senators Avella, Hoylman, Kavanagh, Krueger,
24 Rivera, Sanders and Serrano.

25 Ayes, 53. Nays, 7.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
2 is passed.

3 Senator DeFrancisco, that completes
4 the controversial -- now not-controversial
5 reading of the remaining bills on the active
6 list.

7 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: It's the
8 noncontroversial reading of the controversial
9 calendar, is that what you said?

10 (Laughter.)

11 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: In any event,
12 is there any further business at the desk?

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Nothing
14 but goodwill and good cheer.

15 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Good. In
16 that case, I move to adjourn until Thursday,
17 June 14th, at 11:00 a.m.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: On
19 motion, the Senate will stand adjourned until
20 Thursday, June 14th, at 11:00 a.m.

21 The Senate is adjourned.

22 (Whereupon, at 6:19 p.m., the Senate
23 adjourned.)

24

25