| 1 | NEW YORK STATE SENATE |
|----|---|
| 2 | |
| 3 | |
| 4 | THE STENOGRAPHIC RECORD |
| 5 | |
| 6 | |
| 7 | |
| 8 | |
| 9 | ALBANY, NEW YORK |
| 10 | May 23, 2017 |
| 11 | 3:24 p.m. |
| 12 | |
| 13 | |
| 14 | REGULAR SESSION |
| 15 | |
| 16 | |
| 17 | |
| 18 | SENATOR JOSEPH GRIFFO, Acting President |
| 19 | FRANCIS W. PATIENCE, Secretary |
| 20 | |
| 21 | |
| 22 | |
| 23 | |
| 24 | |
| 25 | |

PROCEEDINGS 1 2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The Senate will come to order. 3 4 I ask all present to please rise 5 and join with me as we recite the Pledge of Allegiance to our Flag. 6 7 (Whereupon, the assemblage recited 8 the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.) 9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Today's 10 invocation will be offered by the Venerable Ru Yang, abbess of the International Buddhist 11 12 Progress Society-New York, in Flushing. 13 ABBESS RU YANG: A Prayer for Blessings on Our Nation, by Venerable Master 14 15 Hsing Yun, the founder of Fo Guang Shan Buddhist 16 Order. O great compassionate Buddha! 17 18 the greatest sincerity, we would like to express 19 our gratitude for your wisdom and guidance. 20 Please teach us to appreciate your blessings. Throughout our communities, may we strive to 21 22 make education equally available, raise the standard of living for all people, support the 23 advancement of science and technology, and 24 25 maintain freedom and democracy in our politics.

1 O great compassionate Buddha! 2 know that the road to success and happiness is often blocked by our greed, anger and ignorance. 3 4 We pray for your great support. May we grasp 5 the concept of cause and effect. May we develop hearts of patience and tolerance. May we learn 6 7 the path to clear and wise foresight and live 8 with compassion and loving kindness. 9 O great compassionate Buddha! Wе 10 pray for your blessings. May we create favorable causes and conditions to live together 11 12 in safety and peace. May our society be steadfast and prosperous and our bodies and 13 minds healthy and carefree. 14 15 O great compassionate Buddha, please accept this prayer for our country! 16 17 O great compassionate Buddha, 18 please accept this prayer for our country! 19 May Buddha bless everyone. Thank 20 you. 21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: I would 22 ask everyone to please remain standing, to pause in a moment of silence and solidarity with the 23 British people and for all those who lost their 24 25 lives in the despicable act of terror yesterday

```
in Manchester, England.
 1
 2
                  (Whereupon, the assemblage
 3
     respected a moment of silence.)
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
 5
     reading of the Journal.
 6
                  THE SECRETARY: In Senate, Monday,
 7
     May 22nd, the Senate met pursuant to
 8
     adjournment. The Journal of Sunday, May 21st,
 9
     was read and approved. On motion, Senate
10
     adjourned.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
11
                                              Without
12
     objection, the Journal will stand approved as
13
     read.
                  Presentation of petitions.
14
15
                  Messages from the Assembly.
16
                  Messages from the Governor.
17
                  Reports of standing committees.
18
                  Reports of select committees.
19
                  Communications and reports of state
20
     officers.
21
                  Motions and resolutions.
22
                  Senator DeFrancisco.
23
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Yes, on
     page 63 I offer the following amendments to
24
25
     Calendar 964, Senate Print 2139, by
```

```
Senator Serino, and ask that the bill retain its
 1
 2
     place on the Third Reading Calendar.
 3
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
     amendments are received, and the bill shall
 4
 5
     retain its place on third reading.
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: I now would
 6
 7
     like to move to adopt the Resolution Calendar,
 8
     with the exception of Resolution 2355.
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             All in
10
     favor of adopting the Resolution Calendar, with
     the exception of Resolution 2355, signify by
11
12
     saying aye.
13
                  (Response of "Aye.")
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
14
                                              Opposed?
15
                  (No response.)
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
     Resolution Calendar is adopted as indicated.
17
18
                  Let me ask for some -- we have a lot
     of guests here today, and a full chamber. So I
19
20
     would ask that we continue to keep silent so that
21
     we can conduct the business of the Senate and to
22
     allow the stenographer to be able to hear all
23
     that's taking place.
                  Senator DeFrancisco.
24
25
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Speaking of
```

```
1
     the packed chamber, we're visited by the Students
 2
     Inside Albany, and they're sponsored by the
     League of Women Voters. And I would ask that you
 3
 4
     please welcome them.
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              We would
     like to extend a warm welcome to the students who
 6
 7
     are visiting with members of the Senate today.
                  We congratulate you on being
 8
 9
     selected and your interest in state government.
10
     We extend the courtesies of the chamber to you.
11
     And we'd ask that you all rise or wave as you're
12
     recognized by the members of the Senate.
13
                  (Standing ovation.)
14
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
15
     DeFrancisco.
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO:
16
                                         Yes, can we
     take up previously adopted Resolution 1965, by
17
18
     Senator Gallivan, read the title only, and call
     on Senator Gallivan to speak.
19
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
21
     Secretary will read.
22
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Legislative
     Resolution Number 1965, by Senator Gallivan,
23
     memorializing Governor Andrew M. Cuomo to
24
25
     proclaim May 21-27, 2017, as Emergency Medical
```

Services Week in the State of New York, in 1 2 conjunction with the observance of National EMS 3 Week. 4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator 5 Gallivan. 6 SENATOR GALLIVAN: Thank you, 7 Mr. President. 8 We know that across our great state 9 from Buffalo to Albany, Watertown to New York 10 City, citizens receive lifesaving treatment every day from men and women who have dedicated 11 12 themselves to emergency medical services. More than 50,000 emergency medical service providers 13 14 respond to calls for help in communities across 15 New York State. 16 Some of these professionals from my district are with us today, and I'd like to 17 18 welcome them. They represent CHS Mobile 19 Integrated Health Care and AMR, American Medical 20 Response, in Monroe and Livingston counties. And we thank you for being here, and I ask everybody 21 22 to welcome them. 23 They are among the emergency medical 24 service personnel across the state who serve on 25 the front line of healthcare, providing emergency

care wherever needed, 24 hours a day, 365 days a 1 year. They help our fellow New Yorkers when they 2 3 need it most, when they or a loved one are sick 4 or injured. For some, emergency medical services 5 is a career. Others do it as volunteers. Nonetheless, all are highly trained and skilled 6 7 in answering the approximately 2.8 million calls made in New York State each year. 8 9 Because of their service and 10 sacrifice, it's appropriate that we recognize the 11 contribution of emergency medical service 12 professionals everywhere in the state by proclaiming this Emergency Medical Services Week 13 in the State of New York. 14 15 The theme of this year's celebration is "EMS strong, always in service." We thank 16 them for their dedication to keeping our 17 18 communities safe, and we thank you for always being in service. 19 20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Thank 21 you, Senator Gallivan. We extend a warm welcome to all 22 those from the emergency medical services 23 community who are with us today. We again extend 24 25 our grateful appreciation for the hard work that

```
you do on behalf of all of the residents of the
 1
 2
     State of New York and the communities across
 3
     New York.
 4
                  Please rise and be recognized.
 5
                  (Standing ovation.)
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 6
                                             Senator
 7
     DeFrancisco.
 8
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO:
                                         Yes, can we
 9
     now take up Resolution 2355, by Senator Parker,
10
     read the title only, and call on Senator Parker
     to speak.
11
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
     Secretary will read.
13
                  THE SECRETARY: Legislative
14
15
     Resolution Number 2355, by Senator Parker,
16
     mourning the death of Dr. Charles Davis, artistic
     director and founding elder of DanceAfrica,
17
18
     distinguished citizen and devoted member of his
19
     community.
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Senator
21
     Parker.
22
                  SENATOR PARKER:
                                    Thank you,
     Mr. President. On the resolution.
23
24
                  Ago!
                        Ame! Ago! Ame! Ago!
                                                Ame!
25
     is a traditional African call and response that's
```

used to get attention of people in the room.

This was the way that Baba Chuck Davis started every year at DanceAfrica. So anybody here who's ever been to DanceAfrica, which has been going on for around 40 years at BAM every Memorial Day weekend, you will be familiar with that call and response.

Last week the dance world and the African world lost a giant, Dr. Baba (Charles) Chuck Davis, born in 1937. He was the founding artistic director of DanceAfrica, the Brooklyn Academy of Music's longest-running series, which started in 1977. This is important, because the Brooklyn Academy of Music is the oldest opera house in the United States. So for this to be as long a series is quite an accomplishment.

He was one of the foremost teachers and choreographers of traditional African dance in America and traveled extensively through Africa to study with leading artists. Davis founded the Chuck Davis Dance Company in New York in 1968, and the African American Dance Ensemble in Durham, North Carolina, in 1983.

He was a panelist for several programs of the National Endowment for the Arts,

a recipient of the AARP certificate of

Excellence, the North Carolina Dance Alliance

Award, the 1990 North Carolina Artist Award, and
the North Carolina Order of the Long Leaf Pine.

He served on the boards of many art councils across the country and received many awards for his work around fine arts. In 1996, Davis and the African American Dance Ensemble were awarded a \$100,000 grant from the National Dance Residency Program, a three-year initiative launched in 1994 by the New York Foundation for the Arts and funded by the Pew Charitable Trusts.

In 1998, he received an honorary doctorate from Medgar Evers College -- part of the City University of New York, the only historically black college in the system -- among the many honorary doctorates he received over the years from various universities.

Baba Chuck and DanceAfrica were cited as one of America's Irreplaceable Dance Treasures: The First 100, by the Dance Heritage Coalition. And in 2014, he received the Bessie Award for Outstanding Service to the Field of Dance.

In 2016, BAM established the Chuck

1 Davis Emerging Choreographer Fellowship, an 2 annual award in his honor given to emerging choreographers to travel to Africa and study with 3 4 one or more experts in African dance. 5 We're going to miss Baba Chuck. To just read his bio and his accomplishments is not 6 7 nearly enough in terms of talking about the impact he had on not just the Brooklyn community 8 but the African dance community around not just 9 10 the country, but the world. 11 Each year, if you have not been to 12 DanceAfrica, they bring a dance ensemble from a different African country and feature that 13 country's dance in the performance. It is not 14 15 simply just performances during the weekend, but young people get to dance with these visiting 16 groups and also learn these traditional dances 17 18 from around the world. 19 His impact has been great, but his 20 loss no less so. And so we remember him, we ask him to rest well, and Godspeed. 21 22 Thank you, Mr. President. Thank ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: 23 you, Senator Parker. 24 25 The question is on the resolution

2851

```
before the house. All in favor signify by saying
 1
 2
     aye.
                  (Response of "Aye.")
 3
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Opposed?
 5
                  (No response.)
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 6
                                             The
 7
     resolution is adopted.
 8
                  Senator Parker has opened up the
     resolution for cosponsorship. Should you like to
 9
10
     be a cosponsor, please notify the desk.
                  Senator DeFrancisco.
11
12
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Can we now
     take up previously adopted Resolution 2174, by
13
14
     Senator Squadron, read the title only, and call
15
     on Senator Squadron to speak.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Resolution
     Number 2174, the Secretary will read.
17
18
                  THE SECRETARY: Legislative
     Resolution Number 2174, by Senator Squadron,
19
20
     commemorating the 30th anniversary of the
21
     Downtown Express newspaper.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
22
     Squadron on the resolution.
23
24
                  SENATOR SQUADRON:
                                      Thank you,
25
     Mr. President. On the resolution.
```

I rise to honor the Downtown Express newspaper on its 30th anniversary. In its 30 years, Downtown Express has documented Lower Manhattan's rise from a, quote, urban ghost town to the thriving mixed-use community that it is today.

Downtown Express was founded in 1987 as Battery News, focusing on Battery Park City, which today continues to be a thriving community, though one that has no community representation on its board, despite attempts to change that and passage of legislation through the Assembly that has thus far not gotten movement in the Senate, despite the fact that Battery Park City's residents have spoken with a unified voice that they would like representation on their board.

Renamed in 1990, Downtown Express expanded and grew as Lower Manhattan grew, to include TriBeCa, the Financial District,
City Hall, Chinatown, and the South Street
Seaport. It's a free community resource. It reaches nearly 100,000 people in the region.

And of course while Downtown Express is a great local newspaper and local resource because of the area it covers, it has often

covered and even broken national and global news. From the 1993 World Trade Center bombings to the September 11th terrorist attacks in 2001 and Hurricane Sandy more recently, it has brought a unique local perspective -- and often the first perspective -- to stories of enormous broad import. And in these emergencies it's been a vital resource for the local community, providing information like air quality, street closures, and other necessary information.

And when the national press has moved on from Lower Manhattan, Downtown Express has continued to stay in the community, tracking progress and delays in rebuilding and in resiliency. In fact, even today it is covering the fact that Lower Manhattan, now nearly five years after Hurricane Sandy, does not have the resiliency that it needs and that Sandy so vividly and tragically showed we need in Lower Manhattan.

Downtown Express, like so many newspapers -- local community newspapers, regional newspapers and national ones -- plays a vital role in our democracy. At a time when the press is under unrelenting attack, when the

```
reporting of facts get you labeled as "fake
 1
 2
     news," we are reminded of the critical role that
 3
     papers like Downtown Express play in informing
 4
     and empowering communities and individuals.
 5
                  Under publisher Jennifer Goodstein
     and editor Bill Egbert, Downtown Express
 6
 7
     continues to cover the community, enrich the
     community, and hold all of us -- including us
 8
     elected officials -- to account. For that, we
 9
10
     say thank you.
11
                  To Downtown Express: 30 is a great
     milestone. I look forward to celebrating the
12
     next 30 years of the vibrant free press at the
13
     local, regional and national level.
14
15
                  Thank you, Mr. President.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Thank
16
     you, Senator Squadron.
17
18
                  As noted, the resolution was
     previously adopted on May 16th of 2017.
19
20
                  Senator Squadron has opened the
     resolution for cosponsorship. Should you choose
21
     to be a cosponsor, please notify the desk.
22
                  Senator DeFrancisco.
23
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Yes, could
24
25
     you please recognize Senator Kaminsky to
```

introduce a student council.

ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: We will recognize Senator Kaminsky for purposes of an introduction.

SENATOR KAMINSKY: Thank you so much, Mr. President.

Above me today I'm so proud to have the students from the Robert Carbonaro Elementary School in Valley Stream, Long Island, here today.

I have to tell you, the highlight of last year for me professionally was going to their student debates. I had just come from a pretty nasty campaign where everything except substance was being discussed, and it could certainly get you down on our system. And then I went to Carbonaro and heard these marvelous students -- that if you look up, you can see represent a cross-section of our society -- give amazing, enlightening, inspiring speeches, each for why they should be the respective student government president, treasurer, et cetera.

And they were so optimistic. They each had good reasons why he or she should be elected. And it really reinvigorated my sense of why our government matters and what it's about.

So I invited them, Why don't you 1 2 come up to Albany this year and see how it 3 actually works, see what we actually do here, 4 because I think you would get a real kick out of 5 how this place works, and I think we could all use a little bit of that spark that you were able 6 7 to provide for me. So, Mr. President, not only would I 8 9 like you to welcome the student government here, 10 but I'm also really proud to have the superintendent, Dr. Fale, from the school 11 12 district, as well as the principal, Mr. Iacono. We have teachers Pam Fowler and Cathy Haufler 13 here, as well as school board members John Maier 14 15 and Armando Hernandez. 16 Valley Stream 24 is an amazing district. I think if Valley Stream 24 can 17 18 succeed, we all as a country can succeed together, and our future is sitting there right 19 20 above me in the gallery. So thank you, Mr. President, for 21 22 showing them the collegialities and cordialities of the house. 23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: 24 We extend 25 a warm welcome and the courtesies of the Senate

```
chamber to the administrators, the students, the
 1
 2
     teachers and members of the staff and families
     who are here from Robert Carbonaro School.
 3
                  Please stand and we'd like to
 4
 5
     recognize you.
                  (Standing ovation.)
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
 8
     DeFrancisco.
 9
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Can we take
10
     up previously adopted Resolution 380, by
     Senator Breslin, read the title only, and call on
11
     Senator Breslin to speak.
12
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
     Secretary will read.
14
15
                  THE SECRETARY: Legislative
16
     Resolution Number 380, by Senator Breslin,
     memorializing Governor Andrew M. Cuomo to
17
18
     proclaim April 9, 2017, as Yellow Ribbon Day in
     the State of New York.
19
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Senator
21
     Breslin.
22
                  SENATOR BRESLIN:
                                     Thank you,
     Mr. President.
23
                  Since 2006, April 9th has been
24
25
     recognized as Yellow Ribbon day here in New York
```

State. And it's to honor former members of the armed forces in this country.

Yellow Ribbon Day, since that time, has been championed by Carol Hotaling, who is with us today in the audience -- Carol, you want to wave to us? -- who began making yellow ribbons to donate to family members of troops deployed during Operation Desert Storm.

Early on, she was assisted by our great Senator, Senator Kathy Marchione, here today.

Ms. Hotaling chose the date of
April 9th in honor of Matt Maupin, a U.S. Army
staff sergeant who was captured while serving in
Iraq on that date in 2004. Staff Sergeant Maupin
was the first U.S. military member who went
missing in action during Iraqi Desert Storm.

American former prisoner-of-war heroes who serve our country will never, ever be forgotten, these brave men and women who fought for their country and endured cruelties beyond imagination.

With Carol today in the chamber is Beverly Czub, of Clifton Park, and Clifton Park Town Supervisor Phil Barrett.

```
Would you please stand and be
 1
 2
                  Thank you, Mr. President. If we
     recognized.
     would offer the courtesies of the house.
 3
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Thank
 5
     you, Senator Breslin.
                  As indicated, the resolution was
 6
 7
     previously adopted, on January 24th of 2017.
 8
                  Senator Breslin has opened up the
     resolution for cosponsorship. Should you choose
 9
10
     to be a cosponsor, please notify the desk.
                  We'd like to extend a very cordial
11
12
     welcome. We thank you for all of your efforts.
     To Carol and all the others who have joined her
13
     today, thanks for your good work on behalf of so
14
15
     many. Please rise again and be recognized.
                  (Standing ovation.)
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
17
                                              Senator
18
     DeFrancisco.
19
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO:
                                         Yes, can we
20
     now take up the privileged resolution by
     Senator Díaz, read it in its entirety, and call
21
22
     on Senator Díaz to speak, please.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
23
                                              The
     Secretary will read.
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY: Legislative
```

resolution by Senator Díaz, celebrating Taiwan 1 2 Heritage Day to strengthen the friendship and 3 bilateral relationship between the State of 4 New York and Taiwan. 5 "WHEREAS, The United States and the Republic of China (Taiwan) share common ideals 6 7 and a clear vision for the 21st century, where freedom and democracy are the foundation for 8 9 peace, prosperity, and progress; and 10 "WHEREAS, Taiwan has become a 11 multiparty democracy in which all citizens have 12 the right to participate freely in the political process, as evidenced by Taiwan's six democratic 13 14 presidential elections, which took place in 1996, 15 2000, 2004, 2008, 2012 and 2016; and "WHEREAS, The U.S. Congress passed 16 the landmark Taiwan Relations Act (TRA) in 1979 17 18 to sustain a close bilateral relationship and to advance mutual security and commercial interests 19 20 between the U.S. and Taiwan; the TRA, along with Six Assurances, have served as cornerstones of 21 22 U.S.-Taiwan relations and have helped to preserve peace and stability in the Taiwan Strait; and 23 "WHEREAS, The United States and 24 25 Taiwan share a long-term and close economic

```
relationship, including $65.4 billion in
 1
 2
     bilateral trade in 2016, making Taiwan the
 3
     10th largest trading partner of the United
 4
     States; and
 5
                  "WHEREAS, The United States assisted
     Taiwan in attaining participation in the assembly
 6
 7
     of the World Health Organization (WHO) since 2009
     and of the International Civil Aviation
 8
     Organization (ICAO) in 2013, and will continue
 9
10
     supporting Taiwan's meaningful participation in
     other organizations such as the United Nations
11
12
     Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC)
     and the International Criminal Police
13
14
     Organization (INTERPOL); and
15
                  "WHEREAS, In order to strengthen
16
     bilateral trade relations with the United States,
     the government of the Republic of China (Taiwan)
17
18
     has expressed its wish to sign a free trade
19
     agreement with the United states in the near
20
     future; and
21
                  "WHEREAS, The State of New York
     exported $637 million worth of products to Taiwan
22
23
     in 2016, making Taiwan the 16th largest foreign
     market for the State of New York; and
24
25
                  "WHEREAS, Many of the United States'
```

```
1
     top 500 companies headquartered in New York,
     including IBM, Pfizer, Corning, Citigroup, AIG,
 2
 3
     MetLife, JPMorgan Chase, and New York Life, have
 4
     invested in Taiwan, supporting the mutually
 5
     beneficial relationship for decades; and
                  "WHEREAS, There are more than 300
 6
 7
     Taiwanese companies that have invested in the
     State of New York in sectors such as computers,
 8
     finance, jewelry, sporting goods, and garments;
 9
10
     and
                  "WHEREAS, Taiwan supports New York
11
12
     State's economic initiatives by encouraging young
13
     entrepreneurs to join the START-UP NY program,
14
     as well as partner with New York research
15
     institutes, as Taiwan's TSMC did when it
     participated in the NY Global 450 Consortium
16
17
     program for the next-generation semiconductor
18
     technology; and
                  "WHEREAS, There were a total of
19
20
     12,760 jobs in 2016 supported by Taiwan in
     New York State, including 1,008 jobs supported by
21
22
     investment from Taiwan-affiliated companies,
     5,533 jobs supported by the export of goods to
23
     Taiwan, and 6,219 jobs supported by the export
24
25
     of services to Taiwan; and
```

"WHEREAS, The State of New York is 1 2 home to thriving overseas ethnic Chinese 3 communities that support the Republic of China 4 (Taiwan), including the Chinese Consolidated 5 Benevolent Association (CCBA), the Taiwanese Chamber of Commerce of New York, Inc., the 6 7 Chinese Chamber of Commerce of New York, Inc., 8 Buddha's Light International Association in New York, the Taiwan Center (Senior Center), 9 10 Taiwanese American Association of New York, the Union of Taiwan Universities and Colleges Alumni 11 12 Association and the National Women's League of the Republic of China (Taiwan), that devote 13 themselves to the harmony and development of the 14 15 community of the State of New York; and "WHEREAS, The New York State 16 Legislature held the 4th Taiwan Heritage Day 17 18 Celebration at the Legislative Office Building in 19 Albany in May 2016, to promote bilateral 20 relations between New York and Taiwan, and will 21 hold the 5th Taiwan Heritage Day Celebration in 22 2017; now, therefore, be it "RESOLVED, That this Legislative 23 24 Body pause in its deliberations to celebrate 25 Taiwan Heritage Day to strengthen the friendship

```
and bilateral relationship between the State of
 1
 2
     New York and Taiwan; and be it further
                  "RESOLVED, That a copy of this
 3
 4
     resolution, suitably engrossed, be transmitted to
 5
     President Tsai Ing-wen of the Republic of China
     (Taiwan), through the Taipei Economic and
 6
 7
     Cultural Office in New York."
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             I'm going
 9
     to ask for some quiet in the house. There are a
10
    number of conversations taking place. I would
     ask staff or members to please take the
11
     conversations outside the chamber.
12
                  Ni hao. Ni hao ma.
13
                            Ni hao. Ni hao ma.
14
                  GUESTS:
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Senator
     Díaz on the resolution.
16
                  SENATOR DÍAZ: What did you just
17
18
     say? Thank you, Mr. President. I don't know,
     were you trying to say what you just said?
19
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Welcome.
21
    Hello.
                  SENATOR DÍAZ: There you go.
22
23
    you go.
                  Thank you, Mr. President. Before I
24
25
     say anything about the resolution today, I want
```

1 to express my appreciation to Senator Flanagan 2 for allowing me to introduce this resolution, due to the fact that yesterday we had some kind of 3 4 problem but we achieved something great and 5 Senator Flanagan decided to allow me to introduce the resolution today. And for that, publicly, I 6 7 would like to thank him and express my 8 appreciation to him. 9 Now, ladies and gentlemen, you 10 should know that today we are being visited by members of the Taiwanese community. 11 My fellow Senators, ladies and 12 gentlemen, it has been my honor through the years 13 14 as the State Senator representing the 32nd 15 Senatorial District in Bronx County to bring many different cultures together. I have also been 16 instrumental in bringing these cultures to our 17 18 State Capitol, to this chamber, and to introduce 19 them to all of you.

To that effect, I was the first

Senator to introduce the Dominican community and

its cultures in this Senate chamber and to have a

Dominican minister offer the invocation in

Spanish and in English.

20

21

22

23

24

25

I have honored, I have honored the

Garifuna community having one of their ministers as well offer the invocation in the Garifuna language.

I have been honored and privileged to present the Bangladesh community to be recognized by one of their imams offering the invocation in Bangla for the first time in this chamber.

You should also know, ladies and gentlemen, that today, for the eighth consecutive year, I am privileged to sponsor a Senate resolution celebrating the government and the people of Taiwan in order to recognize them for their wonderful, humanistic, generous and rich financial and cultural contributions to our country in America and to the State of New York.

On behalf of my constituents and the children of the South Bronx, I must thank and recognize the contributions of the Taiwanese government and its representatives to the needy children of the Bronx.

Ladies and gentlemen, as you know, I represent the South Bronx, one of the poorest areas and needy areas in the nation. Every year during Christmas celebrations, as the Three Kings

came to visit Jesus, the Taiwanese community
comes to the Bronx to visit and to help us in the
Bronx with all kinds of school supplies, bringing
backpacks filled with school supplies for the
black and Hispanic children in our community.

These school supplies, provided by
the Taiwanese government and its representatives,
not only give our children a boost of
encouragement to do their best in school during
the year, but these supplies also help relieve
some of the financial burden from their parents.

And what is equally important is that each year, as Taiwanese officials come to the South Bronx for our Three Kings celebration, the children and parents in attendance get to witness cultural and racial unity at its best.

Mr. President and ladies and gentlemen, it is important for you to know that Taiwan is one of the strongest democratic allies of the United States in Asia. We must never forget that Taiwan spares no effort to maintain peace and prosperity in East Asia.

Ladies and gentlemen and my fellow Senators, not only Taiwan is a strong defender of democracy, but Taiwan also provides much economic

activity, support to both the United States and the State of New York.

As you heard in the resolution,
Taiwan is the 10th largest trading partner of the
United States, and it is the 16th largest foreign
market for the State of New York. Many of the
United States' top 500 companies have headquarters
in New York and also have significant investments
in Taiwan.

Additionally, there are more than 300 Taiwanese companies that have invested in the State of New York. The relationships between the United States of America and Taiwan and New York State are very important and of mutual benefit. It is my fervent wish that these relationships continue and prosper, to the benefit of all our citizens.

Finally, Mr. President, today I have the honor and privilege to be joined in the Senate chamber by distinguished guests -- by Mr. Franklin Chen, deputy director general from the Taipei Economic and Cultural Office in New York; Mr. Ronnie Lu, head of political affairs from the Taipei Economic and Cultural Office in New York; Chairman Shu Man Wang, of the

```
1
     Taiwanese American Senior Center; President Yi
 2
     Hung Li, from the Buddha's Light International
 3
     Association, New York Chapter; Mr. Mark Paul Lo,
     from the Taiwanese Chamber of Commerce of
 4
 5
     New York; Mr. Paul Wang, who is an advisor for
     the Chinese Chamber of Commerce in New York; the
 6
 7
     Venerable Ru Yang, from the Fo Guang Buddhist
     Temple of New York, who gave the invocation; and
 8
     my director of communications, Ms. Ann Noonan,
 9
10
     together with other members of my staff like
     Leila Martinez and Angel Gaud.
11
                  Mr. President and ladies and
12
     gentlemen, thank you, thank you for being with
13
14
     us.
15
                  And also, Mr. President, more than
     100 Taiwanese people and members of the Buddha's
16
     Light International Association have joined us in
17
18
     the gallery. Look at how beautiful they are.
     Look at that. Look at how beautiful they are.
19
20
                  (Sustained applause.)
21
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              I have to
22
     also recognize that -- thank you very much. I
     also, Mr. President, recognize that these --
23
24
     together with Senator Marty Golden, who has also
25
     helped us obtain the permission to use
```

```
1
     The Well -- State Assemblymembers Marcos Crespo,
 2
     Luis Sepulveda, and Victor Pichardo, are part of
 3
     this event and part of the organization committed
 4
     to bring these different communities to Albany
 5
     and to this Legislature. So thank you, thank you
     very much.
 6
 7
                  Thank you, Mr. Chen, for allowing me
     to introduce you today. And thank you, all of
 8
     you. God bless you all. And let's have a good
 9
10
     day.
11
                  (Applause.)
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
13
     Stavisky.
14
                  SENATOR STAVISKY:
                                       Thank you,
15
     Mr. President. Da jia hao.
16
                  (Response; applause from gallery.)
                  SENATOR STAVISKY:
17
                                      And huanying da
18
     jia li Albany. Which, translated, means "Hello,
     and welcome to Albany."
19
20
                  Thank you, Senator Díaz, for
     sponsoring this group, so many of whom reside in
21
22
     my Senate district.
                  As I sat listening to the
23
     resolution, it hasn't always been easy for the
24
25
     Chinese-American community. There were times
```

when it was extremely difficult. But they played an important role in American history that we can't ignore, because it was because of the importation, really, of the Chinese workers in the 1860s to help complete the Transcontinental Railroad that we are grateful for making us one country, of uniting the country.

Whether it be in the 1860s, when they -- actually, they came in the 1840s for the Gold Rush and then were recruited to dig those terrible tunnels through the Sierra Nevadas in the snow and the problems that they faced, the starvation. And yet they managed to succeed, and for that we are grateful.

And it wasn't until after the Second World War when we started accepting Chinese immigrants. And we are that much richer for people having come to the United States. The immigration really picked up in the 1960s. But for a long period we had the Chinese Exclusionary Acts and the legislation coming out of Washington that banned people from China and the Republic of China coming to the United States, and that was a terrible situation.

But we have had such a wonderful

relationship with the Republic of China, which is 1 2 a fast-growing, prosperous country. And it was 3 in the 1970s that they started coming to Queens. 4 And I remember in the mid-'70s the stores in 5 Flushing, on Main Street, were boarded up. We 6 were becoming a ghost town. And then people from 7 Taiwan started coming to the United States, and especially to Queens County. And we are that 8 much richer for your coming. 9 10 It's interesting how involved the Taiwanese community has been in Queens County's 11 life. You take a walk down Main Street of 12 13 Flushing, and what you see is activity. You see construction. You see a lot of traffic --14 15 whether it be pedestrian or vehicular, a lot of traffic. And we are doing extremely well in 16 Flushing. And for that, we thank the people who 17 18 came from the Republic of China. The resolution mentioned some of the 19 organizations, and I'm not going to repeat them. 20 21 There are many, many more organizations that really must be mentioned. The fact that Flushing 22 is economically involved I think is due to two 23 organizations, the Flushing Chinese Business 24

Association, and the Business Improvement

25

District, and I think they ought to be mentioned.

We have so many cultural organizations. I really don't want to mention any of them in particular, but I do want to mention the fact that the people from Asia, particularly from the Republic of China and Korea, have become a part of the political life as well as the civic and social life. And that started with the election to the Assembly of a number of Assemblymembers. Some of you may remember Assemblymember Jimmy Meng, followed by Ellen Young, and followed in the Assembly by Grace Meng, who is now a member of Congress. And

So we are, in Queens, so grateful for the political involvement, and we work so closely together. I know they have folks representing Manhattan; I'm not going to mention the other borough. I'm sure Senator Squadron will. But they have made an impact.

she was succeeded by Ron Kim in the Assembly.

And it's interesting, because the standard of living in Taiwan is very high.

Interestingly, 98 percent, 98.5 percent of the male population over the age of 15 is literate.

And with women, it's 99.7 percent. I find that

amazing. The literacy rate of 98 percent in a country, that's something that we have to admire.

Their humanitarian efforts are well known. They have become really global citizens. They have helped countries from all over the world, particularly in the area of healthcare. And in the last eight years they have been participating in the World Health Assembly, which is part of the World Health Organization. And unfortunately, there is a conference going on right now in Geneva to which they were not invited. And we hope that in the future they will be again active participants in the World Health Organization, which I think is important.

I also want to mention the fact that religious life plays such an important role in the Chinese community, in the Taiwanese community. The International Buddhist Progress Association, the Venerable Ru Yang delivered the invocation today. I was at that temple about a month ago, and I've been there many times. It's on Barclay Avenue in downtown Flushing. And the last time I was there, they celebrated Buddha's birthday.

And I must tell you, it was a very

moving experience because not only did they celebrate Buddha's birthday, but the Three Acts of Goodness that people believe in, something we all believe in. And the three acts are -- and I think it's important in today's political climate -- say good words, do good deeds, think good thoughts. And I think that's a message from the Buddhist community that we should all adhere to.

We have had some additional changes to Flushing. When Grace Meng was in the Assembly, she introduced legislation to make the Lunar New Year a school holiday. And in fact we were passing it in both houses, the mayor decided it would be a good idea, and for the first time -- I think next year it goes into effect -- we're going to be celebrating the Lunar New Year as a school holiday.

Come to Flushing. We have the boat races in July and August in Flushing Meadow Park, the dragon boat races. It's a great experience. We have cultural exchange programs. I had an intern from the cross-cultural exchange program. A thousand students from all over Asia came to New York and participated in various economic and

```
1
     governmental programs. My intern -- I must tell
 2
     you, Angela Man is back in Hong Kong, but she was
     amazing, just amazing. She lived in the Flushing
 3
 4
     YMCA with the other students, and her work in my
 5
     district office was very, very interesting and
     substantial.
 6
 7
                  We have other groups here; I do want
 8
     to mention the Taiwan Center and the Chamber of
     Commerce and AAFNY and the Chinese-American
 9
10
     Planning Council. There are so many
     organizations -- CCBA. And we welcome everybody,
11
12
     because we are a welcoming community.
13
                  And I welcome Ambassador Chen,
14
     Ronnie Lu, and everybody else from TECO.
15
     stands for the Taipei Economic and Cultural
     Office. They have an office in downtown Flushing
16
     as well as Manhattan, and they are an important
17
18
     part of our community.
19
                  So again, I welcome our friends from
20
     the Republic of China, but they're really from
21
                They are New Yorkers who happen to be
     New York.
22
     from the Republic of China.
23
                  Again, thank you, Mr. President.
24
                  (Applause.)
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Thank
```

```
you, Senator Stavisky.
 1
 2
                  The question is on the resolution.
 3
     All in favor signify by saying aye.
                  (Response of "Aye.")
 4
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Opposed?
 6
                  (No response.)
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
 8
     resolution is adopted.
 9
                  The resolution, at the request of
10
     Senator Díaz, is open for cosponsorship. Should
     you choose to be a cosponsor, please notify the
11
     desk.
12
13
                  We would like to again extend our
14
     appreciation for the presence of Ambassador Chen,
15
     the Taiwanese delegation, the Taiwanese
16
     community. We extend the privileges and the
     courtesies of the Senate to you. And jiu ni hao
17
18
     ying.
19
                  (Standing ovation.)
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
21
     DeFrancisco.
22
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Could you
23
     call on Senator Rivera for a brief introduction.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
24
                                              Senator
25
     Rivera.
```

Thank you, 1 SENATOR RIVERA: 2 Mr. President. After all that pomp and 3 4 circumstance -- I certainly welcome our guests --5 there's actually a couple more folks that I wanted to recognize quickly. 6 7 I'm not sure if you've ever had the experience, colleagues, when you have someone 8 that you're either interviewing or somebody 9 10 that's coming to your office to talk to you, a 11 young person, and you get a spark off that 12 person, a sense that person has not only a lot to say but has a long way to go and has many things 13 to do in the future. 14 15 We are joined by just such an 16 individual today. I'd ask the two ladies to stand up. One of these ladies, her name is 17 18 Jackie Bourdett, she is the education director at 19 the Kips Bay Boys and Girls Club in the Bronx, and that is the lady on the right -- hello, 20 madam. But as awesome as she is, I want to talk 21 22 for a few minutes very briefly about the lady to her left. 23 You are looking at Margaret 24 25 Rodriguez, who is from the Bronx. This lady just

last night was awarded the 2017 Youth of the Year Award from the Boys and Girls Club. That is -- and you can applaud for that, because that is the statewide thing. I would applaud the lady.

(Applause.)

SENATOR RIVERA: But what I'd really like to underline is the fact that -- I did not know about the Youth of the Year Award. You'll be sad to know, colleagues, that the Youth of the Year button is much bigger than ours, and she is wearing it proudly on her lapel. But the Youth of the Year, as she explained, is someone who is a young person that can tell their story, that can share who they are and can communicate about the great things that the Boys and Girls Club did for them in their life.

She explained to me how, through thick and thin, with a lot of problems in her family, at 10 years of age she joined the Boys and Girls Club of Kips Bay. And during that period of time, she has not only been -- she was actually a -- I'm terribly unathletic, as most of you folks know. She was actually the captain of a field hockey team that was all boys. And she's actually a lady who is actually not only a member

of the team, but a captain of the team.

about how as a Latina girl in the Bronx, she felt that she had much to share about the difficulties that she went through but the possibilities that exist for her. I just met the lady today, but I was immensely impressed by her, and I wanted to make sure that she came by, and to tell you thank you for not only coming here today, but thank you for the work that you do every single day back in the Bronx.

I am hoping that you will continue to do it, continue to inspire other young people, particularly young ladies like yourself. And who knows, it is very likely that at some point in the future you might be just sitting in a chair down here, perhaps this one that I'm sitting in right now.

But I am glad to say, ladies and gentlemen, she lives in José Marco Serrano's district, so he is going to have to worry about that.

(Laughter.)

24 | SENATOR RIVERA: But again,

25 Ms. Rodriguez, somebody who has a lot of poise, a

```
1
     lot of purpose, and I know she has a bright
 2
     future ahead of her. Thank you for joining us,
 3
     and congratulations.
 4
                  Thank you, Mr. President.
 5
                  (Applause.)
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 6
                                              Thank
 7
     you, Senator Rivera.
 8
                  We welcome you and wish you the best
 9
     of luck.
10
                  Senator DeFrancisco.
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Yes, for the
11
12
     last introduction, please call on Senator Croci.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
13
                                              Senator
14
     Croci.
15
                  SENATOR CROCI:
                                    Thank you,
16
     Mr. President.
                  I'm very pleased today to be joined
17
18
     by a group of seniors, along with their
19
     principals and their teachers and their board
20
     members, all from the Patchogue-Medford School
21
     District on Long Island, New York.
22
                  Patchogue-Medford has many
23
     distinguished graduates, but none more famous
     than Lieutenant Michael Murphy, who many know
24
25
     from the book Lone Survivor, recipient of the
```

Congressional Medal of Honor for his bravery and 1 2 heroism. A tremendous district that produces that caliber of individuals. 3 4 And we're so proud to have them all 5 here today. Many -- almost all of them -- no, all of them are going off to college. They're 6 7 seniors and they're going to be going off to college in the beginning of the school year next 8 year. But there is one who's going into the 9 10 United States Coast Guard and will be serving our country in the Coast Guard. 11 12 So, Mr. President, on a very proud occasion to have these young men and women here, 13 14 I hope you will welcome them to the house. 15 And to the members of the Patchogue-Medford School District, please 16 take back to all of your administrators and to 17 18 your families how proud we are of you and your accomplishments. 19 20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Thank 21 you, Senator Croci. To the students, faculty, 22 administrators at Patchogue-Medford, 23 24 congratulations. Thanks for being here today. 25 Please stand and be recognized.

```
(Standing ovation.)
 1
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: We wish
 3
     you the best of luck.
 4
                  Senator DeFrancisco.
 5
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: I have a
     couple of motions.
 6
 7
                  On page 22, I offer the following
     amendments to Calendar 436, Senate Print 3567, by
 8
 9
     Senator Hannon, and ask that said bill retain its
10
     place on the Third Reading Calendar.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: We have
11
     returned to motions and resolutions.
12
                  The amendments have been received,
13
14
     and the bill shall retain its place on third
15
     Calendar.
16
                  Senator DeFrancisco.
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: On page 17, I
17
18
     offer the following amendments to Calendar 353,
19
     Senate Print 4084, by Senator Funke, and ask that
20
     said bill retain its place on the Third Reading
21
     Calendar.
22
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Those
23
     amendments are also received, and the bill shall
     retain its place on third reading.
24
25
                  Senator DeFrancisco.
```

```
1
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Could we now
 2
     take up the noncontroversial reading of the
 3
     calendar.
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
 5
     Secretary will read.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 51,
 6
 7
    by Senator Croci, Senate Print 959, an act to
 8
     amend the Real Property Tax Law.
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
10
     last section.
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
11
     act shall take effect on the first of January.
12
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
14
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
15
16
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.
17
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
18
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19
20
     306, by Senator Avella, Senate Print 1482, an act
21
     to amend the Public Housing Law.
22
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
23
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 3.
                                               This
24
25
     act shall take effect on the 120th day.
```

```
1
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 2
     roll.
 3
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 4
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 62.
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is passed.
 6
 7
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 8
     331, by Senator Lanza, Senate Print 3537, an act
9
     to amend the Real Property Law.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
10
     last section.
11
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
12
     act shall take effect immediately.
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
14
15
     roll.
16
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
17
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is passed.
19
20
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21
     422, by Senator Akshar, Senate Print 3571, an act
     to amend the Parks, Recreation and Historic
22
     Preservation Law.
23
24
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
25
     last section.
```

```
1
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
 2
     act shall take effect on the 120th day.
 3
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
 4
 5
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 8
     is passed.
 9
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10
     441, by Senator Peralta, Senate Print 592B, an
     act to amend the Public Health Law.
11
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
13
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
14
15
     act --
16
                  SENATOR GIANARIS: Lay it aside.
17
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Lay the
18
    bill aside.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19
20
     512, by Senator Hamilton, Senate Print 2424B, an
21
     act to amend the Executive Law.
22
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
23
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
24
25
     act shall take effect immediately.
```

```
1
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 2
     roll.
 3
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 4
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 62.
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is passed.
 6
 7
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 8
     516, by Senator Ranzenhofer, Senate Print 5158,
 9
     an act to amend the Private Housing Finance Law.
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Read the
     last section.
11
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
12
     act shall take effect on the 30th day.
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
14
15
     roll.
16
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
17
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is passed.
19
20
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21
     526, by Senator Ritchie, Senate Print 3016, an
22
     act in relation to authorizing.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                               This
```

```
act shall take effect immediately.
 1
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 3
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 4
 5
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 6
 7
     is passed.
 8
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9
     541, by Senator Jacobs, Senate Print 4464, an act
10
     to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
11
     last section.
12
13
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 12. This
     act shall take effect on the 90th day.
14
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
16
     roll.
17
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
18
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
19
20
     is passed.
21
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22
     562, by Senator Gallivan, Senate Print 2520A, an
23
     act to amend the Real Property Tax Law.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
24
25
     last section.
```

```
1
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
 2
     act shall take effect immediately.
 3
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
 4
 5
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 8
     is passed.
 9
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10
     563, by Senator Croci, Senate Print 5411, an act
     to amend the Real Property Tax Law.
11
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
13
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
14
15
     act shall take effect immediately.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
17
18
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
19
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
21
     is passed.
22
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     599, by Senator Seward, Senate Print 426, an act
23
     to amend the Insurance Law.
24
25
                  SENATOR GIANARIS: Lay it aside,
```

```
1
    please.
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 3
     is laid aside.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 4
 5
     605, by Senator Croci, Senate Print 936, an act
     to amend the Executive Law.
 6
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
 7
 8
     last section.
9
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
10
     act shall take effect immediately.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
11
     roll.
12
13
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
14
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
16
     is passed.
17
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18
     650, by Senator Hannon, Senate Print 5544, an act
19
     to amend a chapter of the Laws of 2017.
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
21
     last section.
22
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
     act shall take effect on the same date and in the
23
     same manner as Part E of a chapter of the Laws of
24
25
     2017.
```

```
1
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 2
     roll.
 3
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 4
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 62.
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 6
     is passed.
 7
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 8
     719, by Senator Young, Senate Print 3939, an act
9
     to amend the Public Health Law.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
10
     last section.
11
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
12
     act shall take effect immediately.
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
14
15
     roll.
16
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
17
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is passed.
19
20
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21
     734, by Senator Marchione, Senate Print 200, an
22
     act to amend the Executive Law.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                               This
```

```
act shall take effect immediately.
 1
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 3
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 4
 5
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 62.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 6
 7
     is passed.
 8
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9
     775, by Senator Murphy, Senate Print 2098B, an
10
     act to amend the Agriculture and Markets Law.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
11
     last section.
12
13
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 5.
                                               This
     act shall take effect two years after it shall
14
15
     have become a law.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
17
18
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
19
                                             Senator
20
     Hoylman to explain his vote.
21
                  SENATOR HOYLMAN: Thank you,
     Mr. President.
22
                  I just wanted to thank my colleague
23
     on the other side of the aisle for this
24
     forward-looking piece of legislation. I sponsor
25
```

1 similar legislation that would ban the use of 2 bullhooks. This legislation, of course, prohibits the use of elephants in entertainment 3 4 acts. 5 I think the point of this bill is so clear, which is to protect this very vulnerable 6 7 species. You know, every 15 minutes an African elephant is slaughtered. Every 15 minutes. 8 And we're likely to see this species completely 9 10 obliterated in the next couple of decades unless we do something quickly. 11 I'll mention to my colleagues that I 12 recently wrote to the CEO of Craigslist. 13 14 Craigslist you can actually go online and 15 purchase illegal ivory products. Unlike eBay or 16 other websites, Craigslist does not filter their search results to remove illegal ivory sales. 17 18 And in New York City, this is an issue because it 19 is the heart of the illegal ivory trade in the 20 world. In fact, last year the district attorney busted a local antiques dealer for a \$4 million 21 illegal ivory trade. 22 23 So I want to thank my colleague I'll be voting in the affirmative. 24 again. 25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator

```
Hoylman in the affirmative.
 1
 2
                  Announce the results.
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
 3
 4
     Calendar 775, those recorded in the negative are
 5
     Senators Comrie, Little, Ranzenhofer and Sanders.
     Also Senator Seward. Also Senator Ortt.
 6
 7
                  Ayes, 56. Nays, 6.
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
9
     is passed.
10
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     839, by Senator Rivera, Senate Print 1100, an act
11
     to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.
12
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
14
15
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 7. This
16
     act shall take effect one year after it shall
    have become a law.
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
19
20
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
21
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
22
23
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24
25
     849, by Senator Akshar, Senate Print 5635, an act
```

```
1
     to amend the Highway Law.
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
 3
     last section.
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
 4
 5
     act shall take effect immediately.
 6
                  SENATOR GIANARIS: Lay it aside.
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Lay the
    bill aside.
 8
9
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Lay it aside
10
     for the day.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Lay the
11
    bill aside for the day.
12
13
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     854, by Senator Ortt, Senate Print 693, an act to
14
15
     amend the Environmental Conservation Law.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
17
18
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
     act shall take effect immediately.
19
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
21
     roll.
22
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
23
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
24
25
     is passed.
```

```
1
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 2
     856, by Senator Bonacic, Senate Print 998, an act
 3
     to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
 5
     last section.
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                               This
 6
 7
     act shall take effect immediately.
 8
                  SENATOR GIANARIS: Lay it aside.
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Lay the
10
    bill aside.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11
12
     889, by Senator LaValle, Senate Print 2997A, an
     act to amend the Executive Law.
13
14
                  SENATOR GIANARIS:
                                      Lay it aside.
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Lay the
16
    bill aside.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17
18
     900, by Senator Marchione, Senate Print 5198, an
19
     act authorizing.
                                             There is
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
21
     a home-rule message at the desk.
22
                  The Secretary will read the last
     section.
23
                  SENATOR GIANARIS: Lay it aside.
24
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Lay the
```

```
bill aside.
 1
 2
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 3
     925, by Senator Robach, Senate Print 1013, an act
     to amend the Domestic Relations Law.
 4
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
 6
 7
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
 8
     act shall take effect immediately.
9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
10
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
11
12
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 62.
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is passed.
14
15
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16
     952, by Senator Ortt, Senate Print 5807, an act
     to amend the Mental Hygiene Law.
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
19
20
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
21
     act shall take effect on the first of April.
22
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
23
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.
```

```
1
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 2
     is passed.
 3
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     958, by Senator Marcellino, Senate Print 1181, an
 4
 5
     act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
 6
 7
     last section.
 8
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
9
     act shall take effect on the first of November.
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
11
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
12
13
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
14
15
     is passed.
16
                  Calendar Number 964 is high and
     ineligible for consideration.
17
18
                  The Secretary will read Calendar
     Number 989.
19
20
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21
     989, by Senator Ranzenhofer, Senate Print 3027,
22
     an act to amend the Correction Law.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                               This
```

```
act shall take effect immediately.
 1
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 3
     roll.
 4
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
     Hoylman to explain his vote.
 6
 7
                  SENATOR HOYLMAN:
                                      Thank you,
 8
     Mr. President. I rise to support my colleague's
9
     legislation.
10
                  Another sex offender bill, another
     day in the State Senate. This is our 17th this
11
12
     session.
13
                  I will reiterate my desire to see
     the Child Victims Act come to the floor of the
14
15
     State Senate, the bill that I think would address
16
     a big problem involving sex offenders, which is
     the inability of survivors to take them to court
17
18
     because our statute of limitations is so
     restrictive -- the worst in the nation -- that it
19
20
     cuts off civil and criminal claims at the age of
21
     23.
22
                  I'll be voting in the affirmative,
23
     sir, but I think we need to do more to address
     this problem.
24
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
```

Hoylman in the affirmative. 1 2 Senator Kennedy to explain his vote. 3 SENATOR KENNEDY: Thank you, Mr. President. 4 5 I rise today in support of this bill which would prohibit sex offenders from residing 6 7 in community residences run by OMH or OPWDD. This bill is badly needed. Just 8 last June, two Level 2 sex offenders were placed 9 10 in a North Buffalo facility regulated by the Office for People with Developmental 11 disabilities. One of these sex offenders was 12 convicted of crimes against two young boys, 13 14 actions that are shameful and absolutely 15 horrendous. 16 The families in the area were unaware that sex offenders were moving into an 17 18 OPWDD facility in their neighborhood. To make matters worse, the facility was within walking 19 20 distance of schools, a playground and a daycare 21 center. This was unacceptable, and so we 22 mobilized as a community against the placement of these sex offenders. 23 Ultimately, both sex offenders were 24 25 relocated to other residences, allowing residents

```
1
     to live in peace knowing that convicted offenders
 2
     were not living in their neighborhood -- and,
 3
     just as importantly, they weren't living
 4
     alongside some of the most vulnerable members of
 5
     our community and our society.
                  By passing this bill, the situation
 6
 7
     that occurred in North Buffalo last year will be
     prevented in the future. We're taking a step to
 8
     make all of the State of New York safer.
 9
10
                  We need to protect our families and
     our children, and we need to make sure registered
11
12
     sex offenders are not being placed in OPWDD or
     OMH facilities anywhere in our respective
13
     neighborhoods or districts statewide.
14
15
                  With that, Mr. President, I vote
16
     aye.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
17
                                              Senator
18
     Kennedy to be recorded in the affirmative.
19
                  Announce the results.
20
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   In relation to
21
     Calendar 989, those recorded in the negative are
22
     Senators Bailey, Comrie, Dilan, Hoylman,
     Montgomery, Parker, Persaud and Rivera. Also
23
     Senator Sanders.
24
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              All
```

```
1
     right, let's do this one more time. All those in
 2
     the negative please raise your hands.
 3
                  Announce the results.
                                   In relation to
 4
                  THE SECRETARY:
 5
     Calendar 989, those recorded in the negative are
     Senators Bailey, Comrie, Dilan, Montgomery,
 6
 7
     Parker, Persaud, Rivera and Sanders.
 8
                  Ayes, 54. Nays, 8.
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
10
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11
12
     1007, by Senator Carlucci, Senate Print 391A, an
     act to amend the Public Officers Law.
13
14
                  SENATOR GIANARIS:
                                      Lay it aside.
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Lay the
16
    bill aside.
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Calendar Number
17
18
     1022, by Senator Croci, Senate Print 927, an act
     to amend the Penal Law.
19
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
21
     last section.
22
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                               This
     act shall take effect on the 90th day.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
24
25
     roll.
```

```
1
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 2
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   In relation to
 3
     Calendar 1022, those recorded in the negative are
 4
     Senators Hoylman, Montgomery, Parker, Sanders and
 5
     Squadron.
 6
                  Ayes, 57. Nays, 5.
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 8
     is passed.
 9
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10
     1024, by Senator Croci, Senate Print 955, an act
     to amend the Penal Law.
11
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
13
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 3.
14
15
     act shall take effect immediately.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
17
18
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
19
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 60. Nays, 2.
20
     Senators Montgomery and Parker recorded in the
21
     negative.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
22
                                             Some
23
     order in the house, please.
                  The bill is passed.
24
25
                  Senator DeFrancisco, that concludes
```

```
1
     the noncontroversial reading of today's
     active-list calendar.
 2
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO:
                                          I'd like to
 3
 4
     first call up Senate Calendar Number 900, Senate
 5
     Print 5198, which is Senator Marchione's bill.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 6
                                              Can I
 7
     again have some order in the house, please.
 8
                  The Secretary will read.
 9
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10
     900, by Senator Marchione, Senate Print 5198, an
     act authorizing.
11
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              There is
13
     a home-rule message present at the desk.
14
                  The Secretary will read the last
15
     section.
16
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 5. This
     act shall take effect immediately.
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Again,
     I'm going to ask people to orderly leave the
19
20
     chamber. There's a lot of conversations going
21
     on.
                  We'll recognize Senator Sanders to
22
     explain his vote.
23
                  SENATOR SANDERS: Well, I actually
24
25
     have a couple of questions for the -- on this
```

```
issue, sir.
 1
 2
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Excuse me,
     can we withdraw the roll call.
 3
 4
                  And if you want to speak, make sure
 5
     the chair sees you standing up or raising your
     hand or something.
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Му
     understanding is we've gone back to a
 8
     noncontroversial reading of the bill, so you
 9
10
     cannot ask questions on the bill. But we'll
     allow flexibility if you want to explain the
11
12
     vote.
13
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO:
                                         No, no, no.
14
     No, that bill was laid aside. We didn't go back
15
     to the noncontroversial. I just called it out of
16
     order to accommodate a Senator.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
17
                                              Okay.
                                                     So
18
     we completed the noncontroversial reading. So
19
     are you asking now to go to the controversial
20
     reading, Senator DeFrancisco?
21
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO:
                                         I'm just
22
     asking you to --
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
     Secretary will ring the bell to ensure the
24
25
     members are in the chamber.
```

```
And the bill has been read, and we
 1
 2
     can recognize Senator Sanders.
 3
                  SENATOR SANDERS:
                                      Thank you,
 4
     Mr. President. I have a few questions to ask of
 5
     the sponsor. Will the sponsor yield for a
     question or two or three?
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
 8
     Marchione, would you yield to questions?
 9
                  SENATOR MARCHIONE:
                                        Yes.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
10
                                              The
11
     Senator would yield.
                  SENATOR SANDERS: We all are very
12
     concerned about what's happening with the water
13
14
     at Hoosick Falls and how we are going to take
15
     care of this, so we are very sympathetic.
     However, the method that we're going about it may
16
     not be one that I could agree to. So I have a
17
18
     couple of questions.
                  And I'll start with how will the
19
20
     Hoosick Falls Village recoup the cost of the
     damages, including the additional costs from the
21
     interest of the loan, if we were to agree to
22
23
     this?
24
                  SENATOR MARCHIONE:
                                        It's expected
25
     that Honeywell and Saint-Gobain, as they go
```

through the action and finalize, will end up paying for these costs, but of course negotiations are still ongoing.

There is a home-rule message at the desk, which means the village has requested that I carry this resolution for them. This will give them the flexibility to borrow up to \$1.5 million and have 10 years to be able to pay it back, which is helpful to the village. Otherwise, they only have a two-year period.

SENATOR SANDERS: I am aware that this has been very controversial inside that village and there have been many votes taken on these issues, and these votes are being debated inside. And I'm also aware that there's a large sentiment that they put all this off until a new election takes place for the mayor.

So through you, Mr. President, the loan amount needed to cover approximately a million-plus for extraordinary expenses -- operating and capital costs, reductions or elimination of contamination, issuance of notes -- how is this guaranteed that it will be paid back by this company if we were to do this?

SENATOR MARCHIONE: First of all,

through you, Mr. President, the election for the new mayor has already taken place. The new mayor is acting as the mayor now currently.

This request came through the previous mayor and now has come through the new mayor, so it is something that internally the new administration has asked for through a home-rule message. Paying back the loan is going to be paid back by the residents in the short term as the negotiations continue.

In addition, the EFC has contributed \$220,000 towards some of the legal fees as a grant. Those monies will be put towards these monies that are owed and will be paid back to the EFC once the negotiations have concluded.

SENATOR SANDERS: Through you,
Mr. President. I am sure that you've been
struggling with this one long and hard, just as
all of us have been made aware of this tragedy
that the people there are suffering.

The home values there are declining, and a tax increase at this point seems counterintuitive. I'm concerned that the people there won't be able to maintain their standard of living. Do you know the median income of Hoosick

```
Falls?
 1
 2
                  SENATOR MARCHIONE: I do not know
 3
     the median income offhand.
 4
                  I do know, though, that I spoke with
 5
     the mayor and the town supervisors in both
     communities -- Petersburgh, Hoosick Falls, the
 6
 7
     village and the town -- and asked if they were
     looking for property reduction through
 8
     legislation, and they all have said no.
 9
10
                  Excuse me, though; I want to
     clarify. I have not had that conversation with
11
12
     the new mayor yet. He has just taken office.
13
                  SENATOR SANDERS:
                                     Through you,
     Mr. President.
14
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
     Marchione, do you continue to yield?
16
                  SENATOR MARCHIONE:
17
                                       Yes, I do.
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
     Sanders, pose your question.
19
20
                  SENATOR SANDERS:
                                     Thank you, sir.
21
                  What are the long-term plans for the
22
     recovery of this area? Not simply the short-term
     dealing with the water, but -- they've got a host
23
     of problems there now. Are there any long-term
24
25
     plans that we can speak of?
```

SENATOR MARCHIONE: The water 1 2 system is back up and running, with tremendous water that's checked all the time. 3 The people 4 who have individual wells have POET systems, 5 which are filtration systems for each individual well, in place now. 6 7 They have a committee that has formed of businesspeople to try to get themselves 8 back having more businesses open up, which 9 10 they've really been kind of successful in seeking new business. 11 12 The community asked for some money, \$350,000, to expand a water district, which we 13 14 have been able to provide. The project is not 15 done, but we've helped them there. They've also asked to have a new 16 highway garage done so that they can refurbish 17 18 that -- \$1.1 million, which has been approved, that I've been able to help them with. 19 20 They've asked for \$975,000 for an ice skating rink, which they really look at where 21 it's located as economic development, which I 22 believe has also gotten approval. 23 We've given their fire district 24 25 \$56,000 to help fix their floor in the fire

department, and \$90,000 previous to do home tank repairs.

Previous to that, I was able to secure enough money for their fire departments to all get new pagers to help them.

On top of all of this, their nursing home has had serious issues, with 100 employees and 70 residents that may have to be displaced, that I have been working with them for over six months to make sure that that doesn't happen. Thanks to Senator Hannon and others who have assisted, we've been able to give them short-term monies as they change from the rehabilitation to a Vermont center.

So there's a lot of things
happening. The DEC and the DOH have really been
phenomenal through this entire process. And they
are looking, although the water is clean and
potable, probably some of the best in the state,
at this point they are looking for a new water
source to be able to get out of the source that
they're in. And they've been making improvements
as they have gone forward with that.

SENATOR SANDERS: Will the sponsor continue to yield, Mr. President?

SENATOR MARCHIONE: 1 Yes. 2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The sponsor yields. 3 I would ask individuals with mobile 4 5 devices to ensure that they're silent. Senator Sanders, you may continue. 6 7 SENATOR SANDERS: Thank you, sir. 8 The situation there was as dangerous as -- perhaps as dangerous as the infamous Flint, 9 10 Michigan, water that we spoke of, that the nation was speaking of. Sadly, this situation did not 11 get as much attention as Flint. This is as 12 problematic for our nation as any other area. 13 And I'm sure that there has been 14 15 consideration on how to do this. Has there been much consideration of why isn't the state giving 16 them a grant to deal with this issue instead of 17 18 saddling them with additional debt that they did 19 not deserve? They didn't bring this on 20 themselves. Have we considered requesting --21 have they considered, rather, requesting a grant 22 from the state in this sum or the necessary sum necessary to get them out of this hole that they 23 did not put themselves in and they don't deserve 24 25 to be in?

```
1
                  SENATOR MARCHIONE:
                                        Through you,
 2
     Mr. President, they have requested monies.
     That's where the $220,000 grant from the EFC has
 3
 4
     come from. So they have done what they can do,
 5
     we all have done what we can do to assist them as
     negotiations continue with Saint-Gobain and
 6
 7
     Honeywell.
 8
                  SENATOR SANDERS:
                                     Will the sponsor
     yield, Mr. President?
9
10
                  SENATOR MARCHIONE:
                                        Yes.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
11
                                              Senator
12
     Marchione yields.
13
                  SENATOR SANDERS:
                                     I'm understanding
     that the $200,000 that the state has put forward,
14
15
     they would have to pay back after all of these
16
     things.
                  It seems to me that we would really
17
18
     work on trying to get a proper settlement. I
19
     understand also that the company that put us all
20
     in this situation has allegedly low-balled their
21
     figure of restitution, and this is leading to the
22
     confusion, the slow movement here.
23
                  I'm very concerned that these folk
24
     may not be able to get their full money back,
     that if they can't make a fair settlement or
25
```

2914

```
1
     there's not a fair settlement by the company,
     then the people of New York and these people in
 2
     particular will be saddled with paying for what
 3
     is not theirs.
 4
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
 6
     Sanders, do you have a a question? Or are you on
 7
     the bill?
                  SENATOR SANDERS: Well, I guess I'm
 8
     on the bill then, sir.
9
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
     Sanders on the bill.
11
12
                  SENATOR SANDERS: I would say
13
     that -- thank you very much to the sponsor.
14
                  I would say that in Niagara Falls
15
     when there was a place of contamination, the
     federal government bought an entire neighborhood
16
     out. And I'm not saying that that is needed
17
18
     here, but I'm not saying it's not needed here.
                                                      Ι
19
     would need more information. But it's a model
20
     that we need to have where, if a community did
     not cause its problem, they should not be saddled
21
22
     with the responsibility of dealing with it.
                  All this shows is that we need a
23
     federal movement on this. We need a type of
24
25
     Marshall Plan to deal with the entire bad
```

```
1
     infrastructure that the U.S. has. This will not
 2
     be the only place -- Flint and Hoosick Falls will
 3
     not be the only places where we're going to have
 4
     this type of problem. We're going to have it all
 5
     over as our infrastructure continues to
     deteriorate.
 6
 7
                  So as much as I am in sympathy for
 8
     the people there, I'm going to be against this --
 9
     not because I don't think that there is a
10
     settlement or a needed settlement, but because I
     don't think that they deserve to have to pay for
11
12
     that settlement that they didn't put themselves
     in, and the company that did may not pay their
13
14
     fair share to get them out of this one.
15
                  Thank you very much, Mr. President.
     And thank you to the sponsor.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
17
                                              Thank
18
     you, Senator Sanders.
19
                  Senator Hoylman.
20
                  SENATOR HOYLMAN:
                                     Yes, thank you,
21
     Mr. President. Would the sponsor yield for a few
22
     questions?
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
23
                                              Senator
     Marchione, do you yield?
24
25
                  SENATOR MARCHIONE:
                                        Yes.
```

```
ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 1
                                             The
 2
     Senator yields.
 3
                  SENATOR HOYLMAN:
                                     Thank you.
     Through you, Mr. President.
 4
 5
                  As we know, the bill allows the
     village to issue bonds to pay for the water
 6
 7
     contamination issue. Would the bond money be
 8
     repaid if the companies are found to be liable?
 9
                  SENATOR MARCHIONE:
                                       The bond money
10
     will be paid back over a 10-year period of time.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
11
                                             Senator
12
     Hoylman.
13
                  SENATOR HOYLMAN: Will the sponsor
     continue to yield?
14
15
                  SENATOR MARCHIONE:
                                       Yes.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Senator
     Marchione yields.
17
18
                  SENATOR HOYLMAN:
                                     The bond money
     would be repaid to whom, is my question.
19
                                               Вy
20
     whom?
           Who would pay?
21
                  SENATOR MARCHIONE:
                                       The bond is
22
     going to be paid for by the residents of
23
     Hoosick Falls. That's why I'm bringing the
     legislation. If not bringing this legislation,
24
25
     they would need to pay that back within a
```

```
1
     two-year period. That's what finance law
 2
     determines.
                  With this legislation they will have
 3
 4
     10 years to pay it back, which is much better for
 5
     the community. That's why the village requested
     that I carry the legislation for them.
 6
                  SENATOR HOYLMAN: Will the sponsor
 7
 8
     continue to yield?
 9
                  SENATOR MARCHIONE:
                                       Yes.
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Senator
     Marchione yields.
11
12
                  SENATOR HOYLMAN:
                                     Could the sponsor
     explain what the financing mechanism to repay the
13
     bond is?
14
15
                  SENATOR MARCHIONE:
                                       All bonds were
16
     paid for through the community when I was a
     supervisor, and I can only speak with regard to
17
18
     that. It's over a certain period of time, with
     interest, you pay the bond back.
19
20
                  SENATOR HOYLMAN: Will the sponsor
21
     continue to yield?
22
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
23
     Marchione, do you yield?
                  SENATOR MARCHIONE:
24
                                       Yes.
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
```

```
1
     Senator yields.
 2
                  SENATOR HOYLMAN:
                                     Through you,
 3
    Mr. President. Does the legislation authorize
 4
     the imposition of a property tax?
 5
                  SENATOR MARCHIONE: I'm sorry, I
     didn't hear.
 6
 7
                  SENATOR HOYLMAN:
                                     Does the
 8
     legislation authorize the imposition of a
 9
    property tax to help pay the bond?
10
                  SENATOR MARCHIONE: I don't think
11
     the village needs authorization for a property
12
     tax. They need authorization to borrow the
     funds.
13
14
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Senator
15
    Hoylman.
16
                  SENATOR HOYLMAN: Will the sponsor
     continue to yield?
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Do you
     continue to yield?
19
20
                  SENATOR MARCHIONE:
                                       I do.
21
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Senator
22
    Marchione yields.
23
                  SENATOR HOYLMAN:
                                     In Section 3 of
     the bill it says that the village is authorized
24
25
     to levy an annual tax on the properties of the
```

```
village in an amount sufficient to pay the annual
 1
 2
    debt service on such serial bonds.
                  SENATOR MARCHIONE: Oh, it does say
 3
 4
     it. Yes, it does say it, then.
 5
                  SENATOR HOYLMAN: Will the sponsor
     continue to yield?
 6
 7
                  SENATOR MARCHIONE:
                                       I do.
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
9
     sponsor yields.
10
                  SENATOR HOYLMAN:
                                    Through you,
    Mr. President, what is the interest rate on these
11
    bonds?
12
13
                  SENATOR MARCHIONE: That will be
14
    negotiated, I'm sure, when they get the bonds.
15
     Interest rates change on a daily basis.
16
                  SENATOR HOYLMAN: Will the sponsor
     continue to yield?
17
18
                  SENATOR MARCHIONE:
                                       Yes.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
19
                                             The
20
     sponsor yields.
21
                  SENATOR HOYLMAN: Can the sponsor
    point to any direct money that the village
22
23
     received in this year's State Budget?
                  SENATOR MARCHIONE: There were some
24
25
    monies relative to the $220,000. Not all of that
```

```
came through EFC. The DEC commissioner has said
 1
 2
     there are additional funds in the budget.
                  I can tell you that I asked for
 3
 4
     $30 million, which is the long-term project to
 5
     fix all of the individual wells in Hoosick Falls,
     as part of the 2017-2018 project.
 6
 7
                  SENATOR HOYLMAN:
                                    Will the sponsor
     continue to yield?
 8
 9
                  SENATOR MARCHIONE:
                                        Yes.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
10
                                              The
     sponsor yields.
11
12
                  SENATOR HOYLMAN:
                                     Through you,
     Mr. President. All due respect, would the
13
14
     sponsor agree, though, that none of that money
15
     that she just mentioned is actually specifically
     named for the Village of Hoosick Falls?
16
                  SENATOR MARCHIONE:
17
                                        Through you,
18
     Mr. President. The bill that I've brought before
     us this afternoon is a bill to borrow funds for
19
20
     10 years, not to discuss -- it doesn't discuss
21
     additional funds, how the Hoosick Falls extra
22
     projects are going to take place.
                                        It is a
     home-rule message by the village. I'm assisting
23
     the community that asked me to in Hoosick Falls.
24
25
     They have been through a great deal. And to be
```

```
1
     asked to assist is exactly what I'm doing.
 2
                  SENATOR HOYLMAN: On the bill,
 3
     Mr. President.
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
 5
     Hoylman on the bill.
                  SENATOR HOYLMAN: I want to thank
 6
 7
     my colleague on the other side of the aisle and
 8
     my colleague on my side of the aisle for this
 9
     conversation.
10
                  I don't have an objection with the
     granting of the authority to take out bonds for
11
12
     this issue. What I object to is that we're not
     doing more.
13
                  What I object to is that there isn't
14
15
     anything specific directed for the Village of
16
     Hoosick Falls. What I object to is the fact that
     we're asking and authorizing the village to take
17
18
     out bonds to pay for an environmental catastrophe
19
     that wasn't of their own making.
20
                  What I object to is that we have
21
     hundreds of millions of dollars for worthy
22
     projects across the State of New York in this
23
     year's budget, but then we're asking the good
     folks of the village to borrow to pay for this
24
25
     dark chapter in New York State environmental
```

```
1
     history.
 2
                  I'll be voting in the affirmative,
     but I don't think we should be putting the
 3
 4
     liability on the taxpayers, many of the
 5
     taxpayers who are sick and worried sick, as my
     colleague knows, about the lingering effects of
 6
 7
     the PFOA crisis. I'll be voting in the positive.
 8
                  Thank you, Mr. President.
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Seeing
10
     and hearing no other Senator that wishes to be
     heard, the debate is closed.
11
                  The Secretary will ring the bell.
12
13
                  (Pause.)
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
14
                                              I would
15
     remind members that we have a number of bills on
16
     the controversial calendar, to please stay close
     to the chamber.
17
18
                  Read the last section.
19
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                    Section 5.
                                                This
20
     act shall take effect immediately.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Call the
21
22
     roll.
23
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
24
                                              I'm going
25
     to remind members to stay close to the chamber.
```

```
We have a number of other bills on the
 1
     controversial calendar.
 2
 3
                  Announce the results.
 4
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60. Nays, 2.
 5
     Senators Parker and Sanders recorded in the
 6
     negative.
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 8
     is passed.
 9
                  Senator DeFrancisco.
10
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Now could you
     take up, in order, the controversial reading of
11
     the calendar.
12
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              We'll
     continue the controversial reading of the
14
15
     calendar.
16
                  The Secretary will read.
17
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Calendar Number
18
     441, by Senator Peralta, Senate Print 592B, an
     act to amend the Public Health Law.
19
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
21
     Krueger.
22
                  SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you,
     Mr. President.
23
                  If the sponsor would please yield
24
25
     for some questions.
```

```
ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
 1
 2
     Peralta, do you yield?
 3
                  SENATOR PERALTA: Yes, I do,
     Mr. President.
 4
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
     Senator yields.
 6
 7
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                    Thank you.
 8
                  So this bill has gone through a
     number of prints. Could the sponsor please tell
 9
10
     me what this bill now mandates?
                  SENATOR PERALTA:
11
                                     Sure.
                                             Through
12
     you, Mr. President. This bill mandates that the
13
     city develop a letter grading system for street
14
     vendors selling food, but also gives the city
15
     lots of leeway in how to actually implement that
16
     program.
                  It talks about letter grades will be
17
18
     issued in accordance with the existing sanitary
19
     code and will be similar in nature to what
20
     actually happens now with restaurants. Mobile
21
     vendors are already inspected by the City
     Department of Health, as you know, but this will
22
     have the added benefit of informing consumers of
23
     how a particular vendor has scored on its
24
25
     inspection.
```

1 It also mandates the City Department 2 of Health to notify each vendor of what their grade is based on the inspection. 3 4 It also gives the city permission to 5 implement rules relative to the geographic location of the street vendors, similar to what's 6 7 done in Los Angeles. And it also requires that if a vendor is to have their license suspended or 8 revoked for failing to file location information 9 10 eventually required by the city, that a hearing 11 will be provided the vendor prior to any 12 revocation. And lastly, the bill exempts soup 13 kitchen carts and any other charitable food 14 15 distribution carts. SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you, 16 17 Mr. President, if the sponsor would please yield. 18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The sponsor yields. 19 20 SENATOR PERALTA: Yes, I do. 21 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you. 22 So the sponsor just listed out what 23 the bill would do. My understanding is the city does inspect the carts already. So are there 24 25 further inspections called upon by this bill?

```
1
                  SENATOR PERALTA:
                                     There are no
 2
     further inspections called upon on this bill.
 3
     The city does -- you're right, Senator, the city
 4
     does currently inspect, but they don't provide a
 5
     letter grade similar to what the restaurants have
     currently in place.
 6
 7
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                     Through you,
     Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
 8
 9
     yield.
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
     sponsor yields.
11
12
                  SENATOR PERALTA: Yes.
13
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                    My understanding
14
     is the City Council is working on their own bill.
15
     Does this bill have a home-rule message from the
16
     City Council?
                  SENATOR PERALTA:
                                     The City Council
17
18
     has been working on a similar bill for many, many
19
     years. And in fact, I've been working on this
20
     bill for over five years. And who knows when the
     City Council is going to bring something up when
21
22
     it comes to this.
23
                  But I have been working with the
     City Department of Health, with the commissioner,
24
25
     and the city is very aware that this is
```

```
1
     happening. In fact, I've been working closely
 2
     with the city to make this a reality, and they
     are very supportive of this piece of legislation.
 3
 4
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                      Through you,
 5
     Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
     yield.
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
 8
     sponsor yields.
 9
                  SENATOR PERALTA:
                                     Yes.
10
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                     So based on news
11
     reports, while the City of New York has 4,250
12
     permits out for the food carts and food trucks,
     the common wisdom is that there may be as many as
13
     10,000 of these pushcarts and food trucks
14
15
     operating in the City of New York.
16
                  How will this bill address the
     illegal carts and trucks currently operating in
17
18
     the City of New York?
                                     Well, this is
19
                  SENATOR PERALTA:
20
     going to address -- through you, Mr. President,
21
     this is going to address the carts that are
     registered currently. And the idea here is to
22
23
     make sure that the consumers have a grade that
     they can look at and see if it's in their best
24
25
     interest to eat at that cart or that food truck.
```

```
1
     Similar to what restaurants have today.
 2
                  And we're all aware that one of the
     big items of coming to New York City and one of
 3
 4
     the big attractions is really to either have a
 5
     hot dog or have a pretzel or have something from
     a street vendor.
 6
 7
                  So the idea here is that if we have
     letter grades at these food carts, then the
 8
     consumer will understand and know what are the
 9
10
     best places to eat from.
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
11
                                      Through you,
12
     Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
     yield.
13
14
                  SENATOR PERALTA:
                                      Yes.
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
     sponsor yields.
16
17
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                     Thank you. Okay.
18
                  So this bill will give letter
19
     grades, it won't do anything to catch the illegal
20
     vendors who are currently running food carts and
21
     food trucks. Does this bill assist the
22
     Department of Health to enforce their system any
     better, and how?
23
                                     Well, that's the
24
                  SENATOR PERALTA:
25
     idea.
            I mean, an illegal vendor will not have a
```

letter grade, and that will inform the consumer
that therefore they shouldn't buy anything from
the vendor. Right?

If there is a letter grade that they
can look at and say, Hey, this is safe, I can eat
here, because there's an A or a B or whatever the
letter grade is, then it's important for them to
know. And if they don't have a grade, if they're
not showing a grade, then why would they purchase
anything at the street vendor?

In fact, we just released a report

today that's "Grades on the Go." We're talking about the eight worst street vendors in the City of New York. And last year there was a total of violations issued of 7,861. And in fact, 25 percent of those in 2016 were multiple violations. And if you like, I can even read to you which ones in whose district has the worst. Senator Hoylman has a few.

SENATOR KRUEGER: I don't think I want you to read the whole list, but thank you for offering.

The complaints I actually get in my district are about the --

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator

```
Krueger, are you on the bill.
 1
 2
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                      I'm sorry,
 3
     Mr. President. Through you, if the sponsor would
 4
     continue to yield.
 5
                  SENATOR PERALTA:
                                      Yes.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 6
                                              The
 7
     sponsor yields. Go ahead, Senator Krueger.
 8
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                      Thank you.
 9
                  So complaints that I've been getting
10
     in my district involve street trucks that set up
11
     and have propane tanks polluting the air, have
12
     engines running all day to run the cooking
     facility, the cooking stove on the truck.
13
                  Is there anything in this bill that
14
15
     addresses the problems being caused by trucks
     running all day, polluting propane tanks, and the
16
     noise of some of those vehicles parked in the
17
18
     same locations for hours and hours on end?
                                      Well, this bill
19
                  SENATOR PERALTA:
20
     will give the city an opportunity to look into
     that. And that's something that should be
21
     addressed, I agree with you.
22
                  In fact, according to the report
23
     that we just released, that I just released, I
24
25
     have a listing of the 10 most common
```

```
food-safety-related violations issued in 2016.
 1
 2
     And that's across the City of New York, within
 3
     all boroughs.
 4
                  But if specifically you're talking
 5
     about the propane gas, this is why it's important
     for the City of New York and the Department of
 6
 7
     Health to be able to inspect these food vendors,
     these food trucks. Because if there is no
 8
     inspection, then you're going to have problems
 9
10
     that are going to occur like the problems that
11
     are occurring in your district.
12
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                      Through you,
     Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
13
14
     yield.
15
                  SENATOR PERALTA:
                                      Yes.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
     sponsor yields.
17
18
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                      Thank you.
19
                  So again, yes, if they inspect they
20
     can find those things, although again, as the
21
     sponsor already answered my question, they do
     inspect. And this doesn't increase the number of
22
     inspections, it just offers letter grades upon
23
     inspection. So I'm not sure that it does expand
24
25
     inspection and discovery.
```

But there's a section of the bill 1 2 that describes electronic tracking of the trucks 3 and carts. Could the sponsor please explain to 4 me how that's going to work and why that will be 5 valuable? SENATOR PERALTA: 6 This happens in 7 Los Angeles. So basically it's the city gives permission -- the city -- we're giving the city 8 9 permission to implement rules relative to the 10 geographic location of street vendors. basically what this means is that they will give 11 the City Department of Health their routes so 12 that they can inspect the food carts. 13 Now, if we don't know or the city 14 15 doesn't know where the carts are, then they won't be able to inspect them. 16 And this, by the way, has been very 17 18 successful in Los Angeles. 19 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you, 20 Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to 21 yield. SENATOR PERALTA: 22 Yes. ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: 23 The sponsor yields. 24 25 SENATOR KRUEGER: Could the sponsor

```
just clarify to me the system that will be used
 1
 2
     to track? So are we going to microchip or put
     some kind of tracking device on each vehicle? I
 3
 4
     just don't quite understand.
 5
                  SENATOR PERALTA:
                                     No.
                                           The answer
     is no.
 6
 7
                  The city has actually asked for this
     provision. In fact, the mayor has asked for this
 8
     provision, the Department of Health has asked for
 9
10
     this provision.
11
                  And this is completely within the
12
     purview of the city in how they implement it.
     They can use the example of what's happening in
13
14
     Los Angeles, or they can use something else, as
15
     long as they have a route of where the inspectors
     can meet the street vendors or the food trucks so
16
17
     they can give them their inspections.
18
                  So we're not mandating anything.
     The only thing that we're doing is we're giving
19
20
     the city the opportunity to create a system.
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
21
                                     Through you,
     Mr. President, on the bill.
22
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
23
                                              Senator
24
     Krueger on the bill.
25
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                     I want to thank
```

the sponsor for his answers to my questions.

I have to say I've been advised the City Council intends to move their own legislation very soon. And I think this is the type of bill that is more appropriately done at the local level.

Having said that, I'm not sure that I actually have opposition to the concept of a grading system for the food carts. I just don't think there's enough meat in this bill to actually accomplish any real change.

As the sponsor answered, it will allow consumers to see a letter grade, A, B, C, so to some degree it offers a -- you know, the equivalent of a food review, so to speak. But I don't believe it goes far enough in ensuring that the carts and the trucks on the streets of New York City are in fact licensed at all. I don't think that it offers any penalties if you violate not having the license but you're out on the streets of New York City.

I'm concerned that it doesn't seem to include penalties if you are violating food safety standards and also air quality, noise, and overutilization of parking place standards --

another complaint in my district, that the trucks
set up and they stay there forever, and there
might be three or four of them all together
staying there forever on a particular block.

So I have to say I think there is a problem, that increased regulation and food safety and air quality and environmental standards and licensing actually are important and should be promulgated. I'm just not convinced that this bill will actually get me any of the things that I think we need to have in New York.

Having said that, I also understand the way this bill is written it sort of gives a roadmap for the city to then decide what kinds of promulgating rules and regs it might apply, what kind of tracking, I guess geographic, GPS tracking it might do. And perhaps ultimately the City of New York, the City Council, and the Legislature will come up with a plan that actually does make a difference. So I appreciate that the sponsor has some of the similar concerns as I hear from the people of my district.

I don't think this bill in its current form is going to get us where we need to

2936

```
go, but I actually don't see it doing harm
 1
 2
     either. And perhaps the City Council will
     quickly move a bill that goes further,
 3
 4
     supersedes.
 5
                  So I don't have a reason for people
     to vote no, now that I understand what the bill
 6
    does and doesn't do. I just wish it actually did
 7
 8
    more than offer a grade.
 9
                  So I'll vote yes, Mr. President.
10
     Thank you.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
11
                                             Senator
12
    Hoylman.
13
                  SENATOR HOYLMAN: Would the sponsor
    yield for a few questions?
14
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Or as
16
     Senator Díaz would say, Holy-man.
17
                  SENATOR HOYLMAN: Yes.
                                           I'm not a
18
    holy man. He's the holy man. I'm the Hoylman.
19
                  (Laughter.)
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Senator
21
    Hoylman on the bill?
22
                  SENATOR HOYLMAN: No. Would the
23
     sponsor yield to a couple of questions?
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
24
                                             Sponsor,
25
     will you yield?
```

```
1
                  SENATOR PERALTA:
                                     Yes.
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Okay.
 3
     Senator Hoylman.
 4
                  SENATOR HOYLMAN:
                                      I only rise
 5
     because the sponsor mentioned that a report was
     issued -- what was it, today?
 6
 7
                  SENATOR PERALTA:
                                     Yes.
 8
                  SENATOR HOYLMAN:
                                    And would the
9
     sponsor continue to yield?
                  SENATOR PERALTA:
10
                                     Yes.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
11
12
     sponsor yields.
13
                  SENATOR HOYLMAN:
                                     Through you,
14
     Mr. President, you mentioned my district in
15
     particular. Could you tell me what your report
16
     says? I'm sincerely curious.
17
                  SENATOR PERALTA:
                                     Sure.
18
                  There are -- so that you're aware,
19
     there are three locations in your district that
20
     have a score of 39 or higher in terms of health
21
     inspection violations. There's one at 115
22
     Central Park West, there's one at 101 West 35th
23
     Street, another one on 1293 Broadway. And they
     would have received a letter grade of C if they
24
25
     were to have gotten an actual letter grade.
```

So I mean the idea here is that if 1 2 they receive a letter grade, and now they receive potentially a letter grade of C or lower, the 3 4 street vendor would want to improve his or her 5 letter grade, so that way your constituents and all the tourists that pass by your district will 6 7 be more than happy to purchase food at those 8 street vendors. 9 SENATOR HOYLMAN: On the bill, 10 Mr. President. ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: 11 Senator 12 Hoylman on the bill. 13 SENATOR HOYLMAN: I thank the 14 sponsor for his answers. And I appreciate the 15 fact that a report was done. I would urge us to hit the pause 16 17 button. I mean, the report was just issued. We 18 need time to digest the results, no pun intended. In terms of which level of 19 20 government is better suited, I think this is an 21 example of why we have the city, in its wisdom, the City Council, in its wisdom, examine this 22 23 issue. While there was a report issued just today, we're voting on this bill just today. 24 25 We've had no hearings. The report has not been

```
shared with the entire Senate -- certainly not me
 1
 2
     or my office.
                  And I would think that the City
 3
 4
     Council, which is on the verge of addressing this
 5
     issue itself, would do a better job.
                  So I would urge the sponsor to
 6
 7
     consider working in collaboration with our
 8
     colleagues at the city level. The intentions, of
     course, I think we all support, but the
 9
10
     mechanism -- the way this was rolled out, the
11
     fact that we're getting a report the same day
     that a bill is introduced -- I think is not the
12
     most effective way, with all due respect, to
13
14
     legislate New York City's local laws hundreds of
15
     miles away here in Albany.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
17
     Stavisky.
18
                  SENATOR STAVISKY: On the bill,
     Mr. President.
19
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
21
     Stavisky on the bill.
                                      Yeah, I just
22
                  SENATOR STAVISKY:
     want to point out the fact that the City Council
23
     reported the bill out of committee today and it's
24
25
     on the calendar tomorrow at their stated meeting.
```

So the City Council is going to act very promptly 1 2 on this legislation. 3 Secondly, I haven't heard any reason 4 why the City Council bill is preferable to this 5 bill {sic}. And I think it's going to be a lot easier -- if there are going to be changes made 6 7 to the local law passed by the City Council, it's going to be a lot easier to change it than to get 8 9 a chapter and change it up here. 10 There is no home rule message from the city on this legislation. And I'm inclined 11 12 to vote against it for these reasons, that the City Council is taking care of the problem. 13 14 have other things that are perhaps even more 15 important that affect our state. 16 Thank you, Mr. President. ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: 17 Senator 18 Comrie. 19 SENATOR COMRIE: On the bill. 20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator 21 Comrie on the bill. SENATOR COMRIE: Mr. President, I'm 22 very concerned about this bill because it would 23 create an opportunity to make even more --24 25 legitimize these food vendors that are becoming a scourge in many parts of the city. They line up next to businesses and stay there all day and actually take away business from people that are paying taxes, that are employing people, that are legitimately trying to make a small business work in the city.

I'm afraid that this bill will not address any of those issues but will legitimize vendors that should not be located in these places. We had many hearings when I was in the City Council about the fact that these vendors put themselves anywhere they want to be in the city, and it has not been addressed by any part of government as of yet.

I'm concerned that this bill would also continue to create opportunities for these vendors to just be anywhere that they would like to be in the city, hurting supermarkets, hurting people that are paying their fair share and also providing jobs in the city that can be accounted for, that can be tallied, and that can be -- that people can relate to.

While the food vendors are a cultural icon and some of them do well, some of them are even famous in what they do, there are

2942

```
1
     far too many of them that put themselves in
 2
     places that are hurting legitimate businesses.
 3
                  So I'm very concerned about this
 4
     bill. The City Council is voting on it tomorrow.
 5
     I hope that they do the things necessary to
     ensure that these vendors are located in places
 6
 7
     that are not hurting small businesses in the
 8
     city.
 9
                  I'll be voting no on this bill,
10
     Mr. President.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
11
                                              Thank
12
     you, Senator Comrie.
                  Senator Peralta.
13
14
                  SENATOR PERALTA:
                                     Thank you,
15
     Mr. President. On the bill.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
     Peralta on the bill.
17
18
                  SENATOR PERALTA: I respect all of
     the concerns that are being brought up.
19
20
                  And I do know that the City Council
21
     is trying to introduce or trying to pass
     something tomorrow. I've been working on this
22
     bill now for five years with the City of
23
     New York.
24
25
                  And unfortunately, with the city's
```

bill for tomorrow, it doesn't address the whole
issue of routes. And the Councilwoman Koslowitz
bill does not give the authority to the
Department of Health to find a street vendor so
that they can get the letter grade. And that's
why the City Department of Health has worked with
us on this piece of legislation.

So that's why the mayor is supportive, that's why the City Department of Health is supportive, because it's taken so long for this to move in the city. And not to mention that this particular bill tomorrow does not allow the City Health Department to find out the routes of the yendors.

So with that, I also appreciate some of the concerns that were mentioned and also want to say that there were some of the members who have concerns who were actually on the bill previously. So I appreciate their support in years past.

Thank you.

ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Seeing and hearing no other Senator that wishes to be heard, the debate is closed.

The Secretary will ring the bell.

```
Senator DeFrancisco.
 1
 2
                  May I have some order, please.
 3
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: If anyone is
 4
     within the hearing of my voice and they're not in
 5
     chambers, please have the courtesy to come down
     so that we can vote on this bill and continue to
 6
 7
     do some work. We're going to wait about 30 more
 8
     seconds.
 9
                  Thank you.
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
     Secretary will read the last section.
11
                                   Section 2. This
12
                  THE SECRETARY:
     act shall take effect one year after it shall
13
     have become a law.
14
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
16
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Announce
     the results.
19
20
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
21
     Calendar 441, those recorded in the negative are
22
     Senators Comrie, DeFrancisco, Murphy, O'Mara and
23
     Tedisco.
                  Ayes, 57. Nays, 5.
24
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The bill
```

```
is passed.
 1
 2
                  Senator DeFrancisco.
 3
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Yes, could we
 4
     return to motions and resolutions, please.
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              We will
     return to motions and resolutions.
 6
 7
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: On page 19 I
     offer the following amendments to Calendar 394,
 8
     Senate Print 3651, by Senator Felder, and ask
 9
10
     that said bill retain its place on the Third
     Reading Calendar.
11
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
     amendments are received, and the bill shall
13
     retain its place on third reading.
14
15
                  Senator DeFrancisco.
16
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO:
     Mr. President, could you please lay aside the
17
18
     balance of the bills that are on the calendar for
19
     the day.
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
     balance of the bills that were on the
21
22
     controversial reading of the active list have
     been laid aside for the day.
23
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Is there any
24
25
     further business at the desk?
```

```
1
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Senator
 2
     DeFrancisco.
 3
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Is there any
     further business at the desk?
 4
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             There is
     no further business currently at the desk.
 6
 7
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: I think he
     ran out, but it's Senator Ortt's birthday today.
 8
9
     You can clap for him when you see him next.
10
                  (Applause.)
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
11
                                             Wе
12
     extend our best wishes to Senator Ortt on his
     birthday.
13
14
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: And it's not
15
     my birthday.
16
                  All right, no further business
     before the Senate?
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: At your
     age you don't want any more birthdays, right,
19
20
     Senator DeFrancisco?
21
                  (Reaction from floor.)
22
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Oh, I don't
23
     know.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: He's a
24
25
     very spry young man.
```

```
SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: I understand
 1
 2
     that there's no further business at the desk.
 3
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              There is
     no further business before the desk.
 4
 5
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: In that case,
 6
     I move to adjourn until Wednesday, May 24th, at
 7
     11:00 a.m.
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
9
     motion, the Senate will stand adjourned until
10
     Wednesday, May 24th, at 11:00 a.m.
                  The Senate is adjourned.
11
                  (Whereupon, at 5:26 p.m., the Senate
12
13
     adjourned.)
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```