

1 NEW YORK STATE SENATE

2
3
4 THE STENOGRAPHIC RECORD

5
6
7
8
9 ALBANY, NEW YORK

10 April 9, 2017

11 6:11 p.m.

12
13
14 REGULAR SESSION

15
16
17
18 SENATOR JOSEPH GRIFFO, Acting President

19 FRANCIS W. PATIENCE, Secretary

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
3 Senate will come to order.

4 I ask everyone present to please
5 rise and join with me as we repeat the Pledge of
6 Allegiance to our Flag.

7 (Whereupon, the assemblage recited
8 the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: In the
10 absence of clergy, I ask all to bow our heads in
11 a moment of silent reflection as we extend our
12 best wishes for a blessed and happy Passover and
13 Easter and recall Matthew, Chapter 24: "But the
14 one who endures to the end will be saved."

15 (Laughter.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
17 DeFrancisco, we will begin with the reading of
18 the Journal.

19 THE SECRETARY: In Senate,
20 Saturday, April 8th, the Senate met pursuant to
21 adjournment. The Journal of Friday, April 7th,
22 was read and approved. On motion, Senate
23 adjourned.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Without
25 objection, the Journal will stand approved as

1 read.

2 Presentation of petitions.

3 Messages from the Assembly.

4 Messages from the Governor.

5 Reports of standing committees.

6 Reports of select committees.

7 Communications and reports of state
8 officers.

9 Motions and resolutions.

10 Senator DeFrancisco.

11 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Reverend
12 President, I'd like to call an immediate meeting
13 of the Finance Committee in Room 332.

14 And I would emphasize, many people
15 have said to me, Let's act efficiently today.
16 We can't start until everybody shows up at that
17 Finance Committee meeting.

18 Immediate meeting of Finance, 332.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There is
20 an immediate meeting of the Senate Finance
21 Committee in Room 332, an immediate meeting of
22 the Senate Finance Committee in Room 332.

23 The Senate is at ease.

24 (Whereupon, the Senate stood at
25 ease at 6:13 p.m.)

1 (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened
2 at 6:27 p.m.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
4 Senate will return to order.

5 Senator DeFrancisco.

6 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Do you have
7 a report from the Rules Committee -- excuse me,
8 the Finance Committee? The Finance Committee.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: We do
10 have a report from the Finance Committee at the
11 desk.

12 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: I move to
13 accept that report.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: All in
15 favor of accepting the Committee on -- let
16 the -- first, the clerk will read.

17 THE SECRETARY: Senator Young,
18 from the Committee on Finance, reports the
19 following bills direct to third reading:

20 Senate Print 2000D, Senate Budget
21 Bill, an act making appropriations for the
22 support of government: STATE OPERATIONS BUDGET;

23 Senate Print 2004D, Senate Budget
24 Bill, an act making appropriations for the
25 support of government: CAPITAL PROJECTS BUDGET;

1 Senate Print 2009C, Senate Budget
2 Bill, an act intentionally omitted (Part A);
3 intentionally omitted (Part B).

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: A motion
5 has been made by Senator DeFrancisco to accept
6 the Committee on Finance report. All in favor
7 signify by saying aye.

8 (Response of "Aye.")

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Opposed?
10 (No response.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
12 Committee on Finance report has been accepted and
13 is before the house.

14 Senator DeFrancisco, we are -- with
15 Senate Supplemental Calendar 33A, we are looking
16 for your indication as to how you would like us
17 to proceed.

18 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Well, I'm
19 giving a message to those people who are not in
20 chambers right now and who also want us to move
21 along and do this efficiently. Then we're going
22 to call up the revenue bill, 558. And I
23 understand there might be some amendments or
24 proposed amendments to that bill. If you'd come
25 in, we could start that process, or forever hold

1 your peace.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
3 DeFrancisco, we will request, at your request,
4 that all members please return to the chamber,
5 particularly those who may have business relative
6 to Calendar Number 558; that is, Print Number
7 2009C. We are asking everyone to please come
8 back to the chamber.

9 Senator DeFrancisco, we could
10 entertain the message, if you would so be
11 inclined.

12 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Yes. Is
13 there a message at the desk?

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There is
15 a message at the desk.

16 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Move to
17 accept.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: All in
19 favor of accepting the message of necessity
20 signify by saying aye.

21 (Response of "Aye.")

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Opposed?

23 (Response of "Nay.")

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
25 message is accepted on Print Number 2009C,

1 Calendar Number 558.

2 Senator DeFrancisco, without
3 objection, we can begin to at least make a sub
4 that is before the desk.

5 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: A sub? Yes,
6 go ahead.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
8 Secretary will read.

9 THE SECRETARY: Senator Young moves
10 to discharge, from the Committee on Finance,
11 Assembly Bill Number 30009C and substitute it for
12 the identical Senate Bill Number 2009C,
13 Third Reading Calendar 558.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
15 substitution is so ordered.

16 The Secretary will read.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 558, Budget Bill, Assembly Print 3009C, an act
19 intentionally omitted.

20 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Last section.

21 SENATOR GIANARIS: Lay it aside,
22 please.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: We'll
24 begin with the noncontroversial reading of Senate
25 Supplemental Calendar 33A. Again, it's Calendar

1 Number 558.

2 The bill was before the house as
3 read by the clerk, and it has been laid aside at
4 the request of Senator Gianaris.

5 So the Secretary will ring the bell.

6 The Secretary will read.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 558, Budget Bill, Assembly Print 3009C, an act
9 intentionally omitted (Part A); intentionally
10 omitted (Part B).

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
12 Gianaris, why do you rise?

13 SENATOR GIANARIS: Good evening,
14 Mr. President.

15 I believe there's an amendment at
16 the desk. I ask that the reading be waived and
17 that Senator Rivera be heard on the amendment.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Happy
19 Palm Sunday to you, Senator Gianaris.

20 SENATOR GIANARIS: To you as well.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There is
22 an amendment before the desk. Upon review of
23 that amendment, and in accordance with Rule VII,
24 I rule that the amendment before us is nongermane
25 and therefore out of order.

1 I will entertain your appeal and
2 call upon Senator Rivera to be heard.

3 SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
5 Rivera.

6 SENATOR RIVERA: Thank you,
7 Mr. President.

8 First of all, yes, a good Sunday to
9 you, Mr. President, and the rest of the folks in
10 the chamber.

11 This amendment is germane because
12 the revenue bill, which has basically everything
13 in it -- so if it already has everything in it,
14 why not throw something else in?

15 The amendment, what it would do is
16 it would enact the New York Health Act, which is
17 a long-time initiative that creates a
18 single-payer health system here in the State of
19 New York.

20 Under this proposal, all New Yorkers
21 will be provided health insurance coverage
22 regardless of their income, age, or employment
23 status. It would be entirely publicly funded,
24 but it actually would save money, ladies and
25 gentlemen. It would have no premiums,

1 deductibles, or copays charged to members, and
2 seniors' Medicare would not be affected by this
3 health plan.

4 And it would be funded by a mixture
5 of existing federal funding streams, such as
6 Medicaid, Medicare, Child Health Plus, and a new
7 income-based revenue.

8 Now, 98 percent of people -- and
9 that is 98 percent of the folks that are
10 currently covered, they would actually spend less
11 on healthcare, with most of those benefits going
12 to people that are working-class folks that make
13 less than \$75,000 a year. Certainly everyone in
14 my district -- most folks would benefit from
15 that.

16 Now, the proposal would save money
17 in the long run. And I know this is hard to
18 believe sometimes, but single-payer actually
19 would save money, not only because it would --
20 see, a Senator back there agrees with me. I'm
21 not going to say the name, but she agrees with
22 me. She knows this is the case.

23 Not only would it save money by
24 making sure that the coverage goes to everyone,
25 it would be funded by an income-based revenue

1 that would be progressive, so it would be
2 depending on your ability to pay.

3 And it would save money because it
4 would cut administrative costs. It would not be
5 considered a profit margin, which is one of the
6 reasons why insurance is sometimes so expensive,
7 and it would achieve savings through prescription
8 drug negotiations, which the state would be able
9 to do for the entire state.

10 The reality is that there's
11 uncertainty in Washington over what will happen
12 to healthcare, and we need to make sure that
13 New York State continues to be a leader in
14 ensuring that New Yorkers have access to
15 affordable and reliable healthcare.

16 The fact is that the actions,
17 Mr. President, of Washington, of the
18 administration, might mean that we might lose
19 somewhere in the neighborhood of 3.7 billion in
20 federal funding. That would mean that almost
21 3 million New Yorkers would lose their
22 healthcare.

23 And the fact is that we believe
24 that, folks that are supportive of this -- and I
25 ask my colleagues to support it -- we believe

1 that health should not be determined by your
2 wealth. Just because you are poor does not mean
3 that you should not have coverage.

4 The fact is that while many people
5 in New York State receive their health insurance
6 through their employer, more than 50 percent of
7 them do not receive healthcare through their
8 employer. That means that the majority of the
9 state's residents are relying on public insurance
10 plans, alternative arrangements, charity care or
11 something that they buy privately.

12 So ultimately this is a plan that
13 would cost us less money. It would mean that
14 more people would be covered. And ultimately you
15 have an idea whose time has come. Single-payer
16 is something that has been discussed for a while.
17 We believe that it should happen in the State of
18 New York, and it is why we brought this amendment
19 today, Mr. President.

20 And as I said, it is germane because
21 there's everything else in this bill, so why not
22 throw something else in there.

23 Thank you, Mr. President.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Thank
25 you, Senator Rivera.

1 The vote before the house is on the
2 procedures of the house. All in favor of
3 overruling the ruling of the chair signify by
4 saying aye.

5 SENATOR GIANARIS: Show of hands,
6 please.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: A show of
8 hands has been requested and is so ordered.

9 Announce the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 20.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
12 ruling of the chair is affirmed.

13 Senator Gianaris, why do you rise?

14 SENATOR GIANARIS: Hello again,
15 Mr. President.

16 I believe there is another amendment
17 at the desk. I ask that its reading be waived
18 and that Senator James Sanders be heard on the
19 amendment.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Thank
21 you, Senator Gianaris.

22 Upon review of the amendment that
23 has been presented before the desk, and in
24 accordance with Rule VII of the Senate, I rule
25 that the amendment is nongermane to the bill

1 before the house.

2 On request, Senator Sanders can be
3 heard on that appeal.

4 SENATOR SANDERS: Thank you,
5 Mr. President. Happy Palm Sunday to all my
6 colleagues here.

7 I am reminded of one of the great
8 Supreme Court jurists that we've ever had, Oliver
9 Wendell Holmes, who said that -- and I'm
10 paraphrasing here -- light is the best
11 disinfectant for corruption.

12 With that in mind, transparency is
13 one of the things that we should always strive
14 for in our dealings. I'm speaking about right
15 now the charter school movement and the need for
16 us to have an even playing field, with the same
17 ideas, the same standards that are used for the
18 public school are used for the charter schools.

19 And I'm speaking on this amendment
20 that we have before the desk where we're saying
21 that it will provide greater transparency. And
22 that's all we're really asking for, transparency
23 and accountability, which is something that all
24 of us want in this room.

25 Charter schools right now are

1 largely free from state and local regulations,
2 and they operate under different rules than the
3 traditional public schools. Charters are unique
4 in many different ways, in that they are allowed
5 to conduct their own fundraising efforts for
6 private funding in addition to receiving state
7 aid.

8 As of the 2016-2017 school year,
9 New York State has 267 operating charter schools
10 serving approximately 92,000 children.
11 Impressive.

12 Under these proposals, significant
13 funding will be diverted from the public school
14 system and redirected to privately operated
15 charter schools. Charter schools are already set
16 to receive \$54 million in aid starting April the
17 1st, April Fools Day, 2017. In addition to these
18 new proposals, this funding represents a
19 significant increase for the 2017-2018 school
20 year for charter schools -- schools that, as a
21 reminder, may also receive private funding.

22 Even at the federal level, charters
23 will be getting a boost in funding, as there are
24 plans to include a \$168 million increase for
25 charter school program grants, which provides

1 public dollars for the expansion of charter
2 schools.

3 The proposal before the desk will
4 modify the charter school tuition formula to
5 increase costs that local school districts will
6 be getting in the 2018-2019 school year. These
7 costs are not reimbursable by the state.

8 The proposal to increase facilities
9 aid payments for New York City charter schools
10 that are awarded private space would increase
11 costs to the city in the amount of at least
12 \$8 million in city fiscal year 2018.

13 While the proposal to increase the
14 supplemental basic tuition is reimbursable in the
15 following school year, districts still need to
16 front the costs starting next school year. This
17 takes away available funding for public school
18 students, including increases in the
19 Foundation Aid.

20 An increase to the supplemental
21 basic tuition means that every district in the
22 state is impacted, every district in the state is
23 impacted as a result, since this reimbursement
24 will take away from future school aid increases
25 for districts to cover charter funding.

1 All of these proposals will be
2 enacted without significant transparency and
3 oversight provision of charters -- which is
4 unfair, my friends. We need transparency.

5 Before considering such large
6 increases in funding and additional operating
7 freedoms, changes should be considered to ensure
8 that the charter school industry improves
9 transparency and equitable access to all
10 students.

11 One area where charter schools lack
12 transparency are the funds charters retain in
13 unrestricted reserves. Charter schools are not
14 subject to the same requirements as public school
15 districts and may retain millions of dollars in
16 unrestricted reserve funds.

17 As a matter of fact, a recent audit
18 has shown that charter schools held \$395 million
19 in cash and \$451 million in unrestricted net
20 assets at the close of 2015. Unrestricted net
21 assets, which can be used to fund programs or pay
22 rent, grew by \$93 million from 2013 to 2015. In
23 New York City, charters detailed unrestricted net
24 assets of \$323 million even after many of them
25 had paid rent on classroom space.

1 On the other hand, the public
2 schools are not held to the same standard. New
3 York State law limits the funds school districts
4 may place in reserve funds to just 4 percent of
5 the approaching year's budget.

6 So for these and for other reasons,
7 my friends, I suggest that we really look into
8 the question of transparency. And we have an
9 amendment at the table right here that can do all
10 of those things.

11 So I thank you for your indulgence,
12 and I look forward to you voting on this very
13 important issue of transparency, just
14 transparency and accountability.

15 Thank you very much. I look forward
16 to the vote.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Thank
18 you, Senator Sanders.

19 The vote before the house is one on
20 the procedures of the house. All in favor of
21 overruling the ruling of the chair signify by
22 saying aye.

23 SENATOR GIANARIS: Show of hands,
24 Mr. President.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator

1 Gianaris has requested a show of hands, and it is
2 so directed.

3 Announce the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 20.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
6 ruling of the chair is affirmed.

7 The bill is before the house.

8 Senator Squadron.

9 SENATOR SQUADRON: We're on the
10 bill in chief, Mr. President?

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: We are on
12 the bill in chief, Senator Squadron.

13 SENATOR SQUADRON: Thank you.
14 You're moving so quickly tonight. It's Sunday
15 night. I'm a little slow, you're a little quick.

16 If the sponsor would yield.

17 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
19 sponsor yields.

20 SENATOR SQUADRON: Thank you very
21 much. Nice to see you.

22 SENATOR YOUNG: Good to see you
23 too.

24 SENATOR SQUADRON: I wanted to ask
25 about -- I know this is a very, very big bill, a

1 big and some would say ugly bill. But I wanted
2 to ask about whether anywhere in this bill the
3 \$65 million that was swept from the MTA that we
4 discussed a few nights ago is restored.

5 SENATOR YOUNG: Through you,
6 Mr. President. No, it's not.

7 SENATOR SQUADRON: Thank you.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: I'm going
9 to ask the house to continue to remain in order.
10 I know that there are a lot of staff here and
11 members moving about. But if we can continue to
12 just keep the conversations outside the chamber,
13 unless it's essential, so that the members can
14 have an opportunity to hear themselves in the
15 exchange.

16 Senator Squadron, are you asking
17 Senator Young to continue to yield?

18 SENATOR SQUADRON: Yes, I am.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
20 Young, do you yield?

21 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: She does.

23 SENATOR SQUADRON: And I apologize
24 for jumping around a little bit, but I'll just
25 hit on a few different points.

1 In Part RRR, I notice that
2 design-build as a process is authorized. For
3 which agencies and/or projects is it authorized?

4 SENATOR YOUNG: Thank you. Through
5 you, Mr. President, the agencies that have
6 authorization are the five agencies that
7 currently have authorization, and those include
8 the Department of Transportation, the New York
9 State Thruway Authority, the Department of
10 Environmental Conservation, the Office of Parks,
11 Recreation and Historic Preservation, and the
12 New York State Bridge Authority.

13 SENATOR SQUADRON: If the sponsor
14 would continue to yield.

15 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
17 sponsor yields.

18 SENATOR SQUADRON: Just to clarify,
19 the Department of Transportation would be the
20 New York State Department of Transportation,
21 excluding the New York City Department of
22 Transportation and all other local and county
23 departments of transportation; is that accurate?

24 SENATOR YOUNG: That's correct.
25 These are all New York State agencies.

1 SENATOR SQUADRON: Thank you.

2 If the sponsor would continue to
3 yield.

4 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
6 sponsor yields.

7 SENATOR SQUADRON: And then
8 there's -- I believe, although please correct me,
9 that there's also a list of individual projects
10 authorized, provided that the costs are no less
11 than \$55 million. Is that correct? And if so,
12 what's that list?

13 SENATOR YOUNG: Through you,
14 Mr. President, that's correct. And I'm sorry,
15 it's hard to hear in here. Are you asking for a
16 listing?

17 SENATOR SQUADRON: Please.

18 SENATOR YOUNG: Okay. Thank you.

19 SENATOR SQUADRON: Thank you.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Again,
21 I'm going to ask that conversations be taken
22 outside the chamber to allow the members to be
23 able to hear during the exchange, please.

24 Senator Squadron.

25 SENATOR YOUNG: So through you,

1 Mr. President, I'd like to answer Senator
2 Squadron's question. It's Frontier Town, Life
3 Sciences Laboratory, White Face Transformative
4 Projects, Gore Transformative Projects, Belleayre
5 Transformative Projects, Mount Van Hoevenberg
6 Transformative Projects, the State Fair
7 Revitalization Projects, and finally, the State
8 Police Forensic Laboratory.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Thank
10 you. If the sponsor would continue to yield.

11 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
13 Senator yields.

14 SENATOR SQUADRON: I know a number
15 of those projects are important. I've in fact
16 enjoyed a number of these attractions throughout
17 the state, and they really are incredible. But
18 are any of them in the City of New York?

19 SENATOR YOUNG: Through you,
20 Mr. President, no, they're not.

21 And I would like to point out that
22 these are the Governor's projects. These are
23 projects that he outlined in his original budget
24 proposal, and we are just accepting those.

25 SENATOR SQUADRON: And if the

1 sponsor would continue to yield. And I don't
2 mean to belabor the point; this is my last
3 question on this issue. But --

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
5 Senator yields.

6 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

7 SENATOR SQUADRON: Thank you.

8 We had discussed a few nights ago
9 the Brooklyn Queens Expressway project and its
10 impact throughout the entire region, certainly
11 through the City of New York. And I know you've
12 listed the projects; I just want to
13 triple-confirm that it's not in any other part of
14 the bill. There is no authorization -- or let me
15 ask, is there any authorization for the BQE or
16 any project in New York City in this bill to use
17 design-build?

18 SENATOR YOUNG: Through you,
19 Mr. President, no, there's not. But those items
20 are continuing to be discussed.

21 SENATOR SQUADRON: Thank you.

22 If the sponsor would continue to
23 yield.

24 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The

1 Senator yields.

2 SENATOR SQUADRON: Thank you.

3 To jump around a little bit to
4 Part VVV, triple V, I just want to make sure --
5 and I will just go through them quickly, in the
6 interests of time. We've spoken about these
7 issues before. But the shift of the conditions,
8 the determinations of conditions of post-release
9 supervision and release from indeterminate
10 sentences from the boards of parole to the
11 Department of Correction and Community
12 Supervision, the reduction in the post-release
13 supervision, that whole provision in -- forgive
14 me, in Part E. I jumped around on you, so I
15 apologize.

16 SENATOR YOUNG: I was going to say
17 that I don't think that's correct.

18 SENATOR SQUADRON: Yes. In
19 fairness -- which -- forgive me, which were in
20 Part E of PPPG. Forgive me. I want to make sure
21 they didn't reappear in this bill somewhere.
22 They were in Part E of PPPG and omitted. I
23 wanted to make sure they didn't reappear here.
24 Forgive me.

25 SENATOR YOUNG: Thank you. Through

1 you, Mr. President, that bill has already been
2 passed. It was in the PPPG bill.

3 SENATOR SQUADRON: Thank you. And
4 I apologize to the sponsor for bouncing around
5 the bill a little bit.

6 SENATOR YOUNG: No, that's fine.

7 SENATOR SQUADRON: If the sponsor
8 would continue to yield.

9 SENATOR YOUNG: It's a big bill.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
11 Senator yields.

12 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

13 SENATOR SQUADRON: Similarly, the
14 component from Part B, the marijuana
15 decriminalization component that was in Part B of
16 PPPG does not reappear in this bill in any way;
17 is that correct?

18 SENATOR YOUNG: Through you,
19 Mr. President, that particular proposal is not in
20 this bill.

21 SENATOR SQUADRON: And then finally
22 in this area, the identity theft updating and
23 improvement in our identity theft laws that was
24 in Part C of PPPG does not reappear in this bill;
25 is that correct?

1 SENATOR YOUNG: No, it's not.

2 SENATOR SQUADRON: Thank you.

3 If the sponsor would continue to
4 yield.

5 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

6 SENATOR SQUADRON: We're going to
7 jump around now to Part TTT. There's a lot to
8 talk about with this, and my colleagues will
9 speak about this. They'll also speak
10 significantly about criminal justice and Raise
11 the Age, which of course is such an important
12 part of this budget and what we're voting on
13 today.

14 But I wanted to talk about a narrow
15 part of this 421-a authorization. And I'm in
16 paragraph 19, I believe, which essentially lays
17 out the definition of the, quote, unquote,
18 Brooklyn enhanced affordability area.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
20 Senator yields.

21 SENATOR YOUNG: What did -- well, I
22 don't -- I didn't hear --

23 SENATOR SQUADRON: I haven't asked
24 the question --

25 SENATOR YOUNG: I didn't hear a

1 question there.

2 SENATOR SQUADRON: -- I just -- I
3 wanted to let you get there.

4 SENATOR YOUNG: Okay. Thank you.
5 I think we have it here, Senator. So go ahead.

6 SENATOR SQUADRON: Great, thank
7 you.

8 So I notice that it's defined as --
9 well, let me ask, what is the purpose of the
10 Brooklyn enhanced affordability area? What does
11 it mean to be within it or outside of it?

12 SENATOR YOUNG: Thank you. Through
13 you, Mr. President, what this means is that the
14 Brooklyn waterfront as well as the Queens
15 waterfront would qualify for these enhanced
16 benefits.

17 SENATOR SQUADRON: If the sponsor
18 would continue to yield.

19 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

20 SENATOR SQUADRON: My understanding
21 is that within it, the prevailing wage would be
22 required, so within the zone delineated, and
23 outside of it, it wouldn't. So that there's a
24 wage requirement within Manhattan, I believe
25 south of 96th Street, and also a wage

1 requirement, sort of so-called, along the
2 Brooklyn and Queens waterfront, and this defines
3 the areas that cover that wage requirement and
4 that don't. Is that --

5 SENATOR YOUNG: Correct. That
6 those that take advantage of this particular
7 incentive would qualify for that.

8 SENATOR SQUADRON: Thank you. So
9 if the sponsor would continue to yield.

10 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

11 SENATOR SQUADRON: I notice that
12 it's defined as an area located entirely within
13 Community Boards 1 or 2 in Brooklyn or Queens.
14 Is this area -- well, this area is not the
15 entirety of those community boards. So I wanted
16 to ask the sponsor what the rationale is for this
17 area as defined.

18 SENATOR YOUNG: So through you,
19 Mr. President, this -- this basic definition are
20 the areas on the waterfront. And so that is
21 where this benefit would be able to be applied.

22 And it provides affordability
23 options for new residential construction, with
24 300 units or more, below 96th Street in Manhattan
25 and along portions of the waterfront in Brooklyn

1 and Queens. So that's how it's defined, Senator.

2 SENATOR SQUADRON: Thank you.

3 So if the sponsor would continue to
4 yield just --

5 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes, Mr. President.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
7 Senator yields.

8 SENATOR SQUADRON: I just sort of
9 wanted to understand what the purpose is of
10 having an area outside of Manhattan that has this
11 requirement that's defined as parts of four
12 community boards. What's the sort of policy
13 reason for that?

14 SENATOR YOUNG: So through you,
15 Mr. President, the policy is designed to provide
16 economic development and growth in affordable
17 housing in the City of New York.

18 SENATOR SQUADRON: Let me ask the
19 question a little bit -- if the sponsor would
20 continue to yield.

21 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

22 SENATOR SQUADRON: I'll ask the
23 question a little bit differently.

24 Is the purpose that outside of this
25 area, and the area of Manhattan below

1 96th Street, it would be less expensive to build
2 and within this area it would be more expensive
3 to build because there were better wages paid to
4 the workers that were doing the building?

5 SENATOR YOUNG: Through you,
6 Mr. President. Actually, other areas throughout
7 the City of New York can opt in if they choose to
8 try to apply for this program.

9 SENATOR SQUADRON: If the sponsor
10 would continue to yield.

11 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
13 sponsor yields.

14 SENATOR SQUADRON: So opt in or
15 not, it's fair to say, though, that the wage
16 rates and therefore the cost of building within
17 this enhanced affordability area will be higher
18 than outside of it for folks who want to take
19 advantage of the 421-a program?

20 SENATOR YOUNG: So through you,
21 Mr. President, this is actually the Governor's
22 proposal, and it's an agreed upon bill by the
23 Senate, the Assembly, and the Governor.

24 SENATOR SQUADRON: Thank you very
25 much.

1 On the bill, Mr. President.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
3 Squadron on the bill.

4 SENATOR SQUADRON: Thank you. And
5 I thank the sponsor for jumping around and
6 bearing with me and referring to sections in some
7 cases that were not in prior bills, and letting
8 us know a little bit of the thinking of what
9 we're looking at tonight.

10 I want to go through a number of
11 areas of this bill. And you know, this is a New
12 York State budget, so of course in a budget you
13 have a good, a bad, and a Big Ugly. And this is
14 the latter of the three, so I think we're all
15 going to be jumping around all night, and I know
16 the public will along with us.

17 And as I've said before, my
18 colleagues are going to talk about some critical
19 parts of this.

20 But let's talk about the MTA subway
21 system. This is where we're really going to
22 figure out what we're doing for our system's
23 future and therefore for the future of the most
24 important economic driver of the downstate region
25 and of the State of New York.

1 We know that the MTA loses
2 \$65 million in this budget and that that's not
3 restored here. We know that New York has its
4 greatest ridership today since the 1940s, and
5 there are nearly 2 million more passengers a day
6 than in the '90s, not too long ago. We know that
7 the average distance cars travel between
8 breakdowns is down to 120,000. It was 200,000
9 miles in 2010. So it's down -- that means that
10 the cars are likely to break down 80,000 miles
11 sooner than they were just seven years ago.
12 Think about that in terms of your own vehicles
13 and driving back and forth from the Capitol over
14 in the last two weeks -- a reduction of nearly
15 50 percent, of about 40 percent in how many miles
16 you can drive before you break down. That's
17 what, on average, the cars in the New York City
18 subway system are going through today, and the
19 riders therefore are going through.

20 Subway delays up to more than 70,000
21 a month -- this is pretty shocking -- more than
22 twice what they were in 2012. From only 28,000 a
23 month up to 70,000 delays a month.

24 Only 67 percent of subway trains
25 reach their final destination on schedule. That

1 means one out of three trains are going to be
2 late -- one out of three meetings, one out of
3 three commutes, you're going to be late. That's
4 no way to run a system, it's no way to run a
5 city.

6 That's what's happening with the
7 MTA. And that doesn't just affect those who
8 commute on it every day, like my constituents and
9 others in the five boroughs. It doesn't just
10 affect those in the Metro-North and Long Island
11 Railroad region who depend on it to get to and
12 from work over many miles. That impacts our
13 ability to do business in the City of New York,
14 our ability to have business in the State of
15 New York. And we're taking \$65 million from it,
16 and it's not being replaced.

17 I want to talk about design-build.
18 As you know, for all of us at the end of the day
19 this comes down to our districts. You know, it's
20 good news that there was some compromise on
21 design-build and that a number of projects around
22 the State of New York are going to be seeing
23 design-build. But the Brooklyn Queens Expressway
24 in the center of New York City, in the most
25 densely populated part of this state, will not

1 see it. That means two more years of
2 construction.

3 And you know, I know that this is an
4 issue where Senator Golden and Senator Lanza
5 actually agree with me, and we're advocating.
6 This one crosses aisles, but it doesn't actually
7 cross into the budget. And you know, that's a
8 big deal -- Senator Savino, too. That's a very
9 big deal because every one of those extra two
10 years, every one of those days for those extra
11 two years, 770 days, New Yorkers will know that
12 it was Albany's failure that made that
13 construction longer and more painful. It's
14 absolutely -- I mean, it boggles the mind that we
15 think this is a good thing to do but we don't
16 think it's a good thing to do for a city that has
17 a budget of, what, 65, 70 billion dollars a year,
18 at the same time that it is good for the State
19 Fair and Gore Mountain and Whiteface Mountain.
20 And God bless them for getting this, and those
21 are important parts of the state, but to do that
22 and cut out New York City really boggles the
23 mind. And to cut out the Brooklyn Queens
24 Expressway project.

25 Obviously, criminal justice reform

1 is a very important part of this budget, a very
2 important part of the discussion that's gotten us
3 here. And I know there's important progress in
4 this bill on raising the age of criminal
5 responsibility. I know that if we had Democratic
6 majorities functioning in this house and the
7 other house, we would see more progress than
8 we're seeing tonight. But it is important
9 progress that I'm excited to see happen in this
10 state.

11 But it's also true that on criminal
12 justice reform, we failed to decriminalize
13 possession of small amounts of marijuana, even
14 though black and Latino young men are vastly more
15 likely to be charged with that crime than anyone
16 else, despite the fact that folks use marijuana
17 across the spectrum geographically,
18 demographically, and otherwise. We're not seeing
19 sentencing reform in here. And we are not seeing
20 even -- and this is coming up in a later bill,
21 but we are not even seeing funding to try to work
22 on the speedy trial crisis in this state.

23 You know, a lot of folks talk about
24 the tragedy of Kalief Browder and the way in
25 which our state failed him. It failed him

1 because it treated him as an adult when he was a
2 child. It failed him because he spent over a
3 thousand days on Rikers Island without ever
4 seeing a trial, violating his speedy trial
5 protections, because New York State's law is
6 broken.

7 This budget takes funding out that
8 would help fix the speedy trial crisis. I hope
9 that in a bipartisan way we can do this
10 legislatively. But it's really a tragedy that we
11 can't do it in the context of the budget at the
12 same time that we are making real progress on
13 Raise the Age.

14 And finally, in terms of the subject
15 areas I'll talk about in this big and Big Ugly
16 bill, is 421-a. And again, there's many
17 components of it, and my colleagues will speak
18 about it. But, you know, this is another
19 issue -- it's a \$2.5 billion tax abatement. It's
20 got citywide implications despite the fact that
21 the city doesn't have any authority to modify it.
22 But, you know, it also really affects our
23 districts.

24 And I'm looking across the aisle
25 because I'm looking at colleagues of mine from

1 parts of the state far away from New York City.
2 And, you know, I would never draw a map in your
3 part of the state and say on one side of the map
4 we're going to make it a lot easier and a lot
5 cheaper to build, and on the other side of the
6 map we're going to make it a lot harder.

7 Here's the impact of this map.
8 Because of how it's drawn, it's not drawn around
9 property values, it's barely even drawn around
10 closeness to the water. Sure, the little circle
11 of enhanced affordability starts at the water,
12 but it heads way out, way inland, I think a mile.

13 What this map does is it creates a
14 line along Atlantic Avenue. Now, if you've been
15 in this house for a while you've heard me talk
16 about Atlantic Avenue before, because on Atlantic
17 Avenue is Long Island College Hospital, or the
18 former Long Island College Hospital, the site
19 that is now slated to be turned into out-of-scale
20 development housing without community
21 consultation or a community voice.

22 What this does is it makes it easier
23 for the developers who have thumbled their nose at
24 the community, who were given the LICH site in an
25 unacceptable deal, to build huge amounts of

1 housing and get a tax abatement for it. A tax
2 abatement that they wouldn't have been eligible
3 for before this bill passed, a tax abatement that
4 they wouldn't be eligible for without paying
5 their workers a decent wage if this map were
6 drawn differently, and a tax abatement even for
7 certain condos, depending on how they divide up
8 their project, that a whole lot of us think
9 shouldn't be eligible for this kind of 421-a
10 abatement.

11 So, you know, this huge Big Ugly
12 bill -- they're not just big ugly bills, they
13 have a big ugly impact in neighborhoods in our
14 districts. That's true in terms of the fact that
15 unless we fix it, this budget does nothing to
16 improve the BQE rehab and give a little relief to
17 communities that desperately need it, from Staten
18 Island to the Bronx and everywhere in between.
19 It's true in terms of the fact that this makes it
20 easier and cheaper to build out-of-context,
21 non-community-friendly development where we used
22 to have a hospital. It's true when it comes to
23 the fact that the MTA subway system, where now
24 you're one-out-of-three likelihood of having a
25 delayed train is having money taken from it in

1 this budget. And it's true that even on a day
2 when we're making progress on criminal justice
3 reform, critical progress, there's so much other
4 progress in criminal justice reform that isn't
5 happening.

6 So I thank the sponsor again, and I
7 thank you, Mr. President.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Thank
9 you, Senator Squadron.
10 Senator Stavisky.

11 SENATOR STAVISKY: Thank you,
12 Mr. President.

13 Would the sponsor yield for a
14 question on the STAR -- Part H, the STAR changes
15 as they apply to co-ops?

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
17 Young, do you yield?

18 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
20 senator yields.

21 SENATOR STAVISKY: This part of the
22 revenue bill talks -- it's Part H.

23 SENATOR YOUNG: Okay.

24 SENATOR STAVISKY: It talks about
25 assessing co-op units individually. The

1 Department of Taxation and Finance is given the
2 authority to -- or a requirement to make a
3 statement setting forth the taxable assessed
4 value attributable to each tenant stockholder in
5 a co-op.

6 Now, as you know, the tenants -- or
7 the residents do not own the property, they own
8 shares in the cooperative. How will the
9 Department of Taxation and Finance accomplish
10 this, assessing each unit separately?

11 SENATOR YOUNG: Thank you,
12 Mr. President, through you. It's actually based
13 on a proportional share. It's a proportional
14 share.

15 SENATOR STAVISKY: In other -- if
16 the Senator would yield.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
18 Senator yields.

19 SENATOR STAVISKY: In other words,
20 the building is assessed as a whole and the
21 shareholders will be assessed according to the
22 number of shares they own in the co-op?

23 SENATOR YOUNG: That's correct.

24 SENATOR STAVISKY: Thank you.

25 If the Senator would yield on a

1 number of questions involving higher education.

2 SENATOR YOUNG: Oh, sure.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
4 Senator yields.

5 SENATOR STAVISKY: The first area I
6 would like to discuss is the Excelsior program
7 for the middle-class tuition cut. Can you tell
8 us how many people would be eligible?

9 SENATOR YOUNG: Through you,
10 Mr. President, actually about 25,000 people in
11 the first year.

12 SENATOR STAVISKY: Will the Senator
13 continue to yield?

14 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
16 Senator yields.

17 SENATOR STAVISKY: The Governor, at
18 the Finance Committee budget hearing, testified
19 that there would be 940,000 people from SUNY
20 alone, plus the number of students from CUNY. So
21 even though it's phased in, that number seems to
22 be very low.

23 SENATOR YOUNG: Through you,
24 Mr. President, just to clarify, Senator Stavisky
25 is correct that the Governor stated that about

1 940,000 could be eligible to receive it
2 statewide. But actually, it looks like about
3 25,000 will probably be able to take advantage of
4 it this coming year. So it's out of a pool.

5 SENATOR STAVISKY: That -- if the
6 Senator would continue to yield.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
8 Senator yields.

9 SENATOR STAVISKY: That 940,000
10 number I believe was for SUNY alone.

11 SENATOR YOUNG: Through you,
12 Mr. President. Actually, no. The Governor was
13 referring to statewide, not just for SUNY.

14 SENATOR STAVISKY: If the Senator
15 would continue to yield.

16 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
18 Senator yields.

19 SENATOR STAVISKY: Are there any
20 additional budget lines to cover the increase in
21 the number of applicants or number of potential
22 students?

23 SENATOR YOUNG: Through you,
24 Mr. President, I was just looking that up. And
25 actually there's \$86.6 million in Excelsior and

1 another \$17 million in TAP. So there are two
2 separate lines.

3 SENATOR STAVISKY: If the Senator
4 would continue to yield.

5 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
7 Senator yields.

8 SENATOR STAVISKY: And what's going
9 to happen when that money runs out and you have
10 all of these students waiting to apply?

11 SENATOR YOUNG: Through you,
12 Mr. President. Actually, if there's an
13 oversubscription of people applying for the
14 benefits, HESC would jump in and they would
15 probably use a lottery.

16 SENATOR STAVISKY: If the Senator
17 will continue to yield.

18 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
20 Senator yields.

21 SENATOR STAVISKY: How will this
22 program be affected by any potential cuts in Pell
23 grants coming from Washington? I believe that
24 they have projected a massive cut in Pell grants,
25 or money for Pell grants, in the 2017 federal

1 budget.

2 SENATOR YOUNG: So through you,
3 Mr. President, anything that would potentially --
4 and I underscore potentially -- be lost in Pell,
5 the state would actually cover, because you have
6 to use your Pell grant to leverage the TAP
7 grants.

8 SENATOR STAVISKY: That's why I
9 asked the question.

10 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

11 SENATOR STAVISKY: If the Senator
12 would continue to yield.

13 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
15 Senator yields.

16 SENATOR STAVISKY: This bill and
17 the Article VII bill proposes an increase of \$200
18 in tuition per year for a five-year period, which
19 places, obviously, more burden on the students.
20 Is there any change in the out-of-state tuition
21 rates for students attending SUNY or CUNY?

22 SENATOR YOUNG: Through you,
23 Mr. President, I do not believe that there's any
24 change in out-of-state tuition.

25 SENATOR STAVISKY: If the Senator

1 would continue to yield.

2 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
4 Senator yields.

5 SENATOR STAVISKY: Assuming the
6 students use the Excelsior and their TAP grants,
7 what is the affect going to be on the college,
8 both SUNY and CUNY, that have to bear the burden
9 of an increasing gap between the TAP award and
10 the tuition award?

11 SENATOR YOUNG: Thank you. Through
12 you, Mr. President. Actually, the state would
13 reimburse the campuses for any lost revenue due
14 to this program. And we've set aside \$20 million
15 to cover those costs.

16 SENATOR STAVISKY: If the Senator
17 would continue to yield.

18 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
20 Senator yields.

21 SENATOR STAVISKY: They estimate
22 that the difference is \$50 million. And up until
23 this point, the individual colleges were picking
24 up the difference between the TAP and the
25 tuition.

1 SENATOR YOUNG: Through you,
2 Mr. President. Actually, the tuition revenues
3 will help offset that gap.

4 SENATOR STAVISKY: If the Senator
5 would continue to yield.

6 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
8 Senator yields.

9 SENATOR STAVISKY: Another proposal
10 is the enhanced tuition, the \$19 million for the
11 private colleges and universities.

12 How do you define private nonprofit
13 colleges? For example, would religious
14 institutions be included?

15 SENATOR YOUNG: Thank you. Through
16 you, Mr. President, the definition is an
17 independent not-for-profit degree-granting
18 school.

19 SENATOR STAVISKY: Okay. If the
20 Senator would continue to yield.

21 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
23 Senator yields.

24 SENATOR STAVISKY: If the college
25 has the opportunity to either opt in or opt out

1 of the program, what's going to happen to the
2 students if the college decides to opt out?

3 SENATOR YOUNG: Thank you. Through
4 you, Mr. President. Actually, the student -- if
5 the college decides to opt out and not
6 participate in the program, then the student
7 would not qualify for the additional TAP.
8 However, if the college did opt in, the student
9 could get the additional TAP. But if the student
10 were eligible for the basic TAP that already
11 exists, that student would get that award
12 regardless.

13 SENATOR STAVISKY: Would the
14 Senator continue to yield?

15 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

16 SENATOR STAVISKY: How -- let's
17 assume -- let me rephrase that. How would the --
18 if the student decided to transfer to a public
19 college, how would their TAP award be affected?

20 SENATOR YOUNG: So through you,
21 Mr. President, actually if -- so I think what the
22 Senator is asking would be if a student were at a
23 private college and was getting basic TAP -- and
24 the enhanced TAP?

25 SENATOR STAVISKY: (Nodding.)

1 SENATOR YOUNG: -- and they
2 transferred to a CUNY or SUNY institution, they
3 would have the same type of award in both cases.

4 SENATOR STAVISKY: Thank you.
5 On the bill. Thank you.

6 SENATOR YOUNG: Thank you.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
8 Stavisky on the bill.

9 SENATOR STAVISKY: Yeah. Obviously
10 I'm concerned about increasing tuition for the
11 students, because more and more of the cost of a
12 college education is falling on the student, and
13 we as a state should be doing more to avoid this
14 spiral effect.

15 However, so many of the SUNY and
16 CUNY college presidents have spoken to me about
17 the need for the tuition increase. But I think
18 we've got to be really careful in terms of
19 putting more and more burden on the students.

20 Secondly, what this revenue bill in
21 terms of higher education lacks is the DREAM Act
22 for undocumented students. Approximately
23 \$40 billion is the figure that's been cited on
24 what the undocumented individuals contribute to
25 the economy. Because obviously when a student

1 graduates from college with a degree, they're
2 going to have more income, they'll pay more in
3 taxes, they tend to buy locally and participate
4 in the community. There are a lot of benefits
5 for the DREAM Act, and unfortunately it is not in
6 this revenue bill.

7 There's also nothing in this revenue
8 bill that protects the immigrant community from
9 being turned over to -- whether it be ICE or one
10 of the federal agencies. I think we need
11 protections for the immigrant community, which I
12 represent. I represent parts of Queens where the
13 number of immigrants is astounding, and yet
14 they're such an important part of our community.
15 Many of them are here legally -- most of them are
16 here legally, and they face the deportation
17 problem that everybody else faces if they've been
18 convicted of any crimes or whatever.

19 CUNY and SUNY -- particularly
20 CUNY has decided not to provide information to
21 law enforcement officials so that their students
22 cannot be deported. And I think that's something
23 that should be a guarantee in our revenue bill.

24 And lastly, there's a \$10 million
25 appropriation for immigrant legal services. And

1 that sounds like a lot of money, but it is not.
2 There are more and more people facing deportation
3 who cannot afford legal services. And yes, the
4 state will provide the \$10 million, but that I
5 think in the long term will be inadequate.

6 But I thank you, Mr. President, and
7 I thank the chair of the Finance Committee for
8 answering questions. Thank you.

9 SENATOR YOUNG: Thank you.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
11 Hoylman.

12 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Thank you,
13 Mr. President. Would the sponsor yield to a few
14 questions?

15 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
17 sponsor yields.

18 SENATOR HOYLMAN: First I just
19 want -- thank you. I wanted to compliment the
20 sponsor, before I begin, for all of her hard
21 work. And it does not go unnoticed, even though
22 we don't always agree.

23 I wanted to ask the sponsor --
24 through you, Mr. President -- Part R of the
25 revenue bill, which maintains the current level

1 of taxation on high-income earners, the last time
2 the sponsor and I spoke about this she was
3 adamant in her position that the percentage
4 needed to be lowered in order to help stimulate
5 the economy, I think were the words she used.

6 Would the sponsor explain why she's
7 changed her opinion?

8 SENATOR YOUNG: Through you,
9 Mr. President, I haven't changed my opinion.
10 However, this is a three-way negotiated bill
11 between the Governor, the Senate, and the
12 Assembly, and this is the final product.

13 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Would the sponsor
14 continue to yield?

15 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
17 Senator yields.

18 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Thank you.

19 A second question is on Part TTT,
20 the Affordable New York Housing Program. I
21 wanted to ask the sponsor if she could tell me
22 what the expected cost of this program will be
23 between now and the date of expiration. Do you
24 have an estimate on the cost?

25 SENATOR YOUNG: Through you,

1 Mr. President. Actually, according to New York
2 City -- this is where we got this information --
3 the program currently costs about \$1.3 billion
4 annually in forgone property tax revenue. With
5 the changes made to the program as incorporated
6 in this bill, it would cost an additional
7 \$82 million per year for an extra 10 years of
8 benefits.

9 And I do want to point out that the
10 City of New York currently has a surplus of about
11 \$3.4 billion or \$3.6 billion.

12 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Through you,
13 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
14 yield?

15 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
17 Senator yields.

18 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Thank you.

19 I think the sponsor is aware that
20 there have been some discussions among advocacy
21 groups, financial experts, including the
22 Independent Budget Office of New York City, which
23 decry the program for its inefficiency. They've
24 said things like in the past 11 years the city
25 has wasted \$2.5 billion due to the 421-a

1 abatement program.

2 So given that there's a lot of
3 discussion about its effectiveness, its value for
4 the money for the taxpayers, why we as a
5 legislative body, why we as the State Senate
6 didn't have any hearings to discuss whether we
7 should renew 421-a or change it in any way?

8 SENATOR YOUNG: Through you,
9 Mr. President. Actually, I have some statistics
10 that I'd like to point out. And this is
11 according to the New York City Rent Guidelines
12 Board report on changes to rent-stabilized
13 housing stock in New York City in 2015. And this
14 report was released on May 26, 2016.

15 It stated: The 421-a program has a,
16 quote, unquote, significant impact on the
17 inventory of stabilized housing.

18 So for example, in 2015 there were
19 approximately 2,803 units that initially entered
20 the stabilization system -- excuse me, I have a
21 tickle in my throat -- 2,515 of those units were
22 due to the 421-a tax incentive program,
23 accounting for 90 percent of the additions.

24 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Oh, you're
25 finished. I'm sorry, I thought you were --

1 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

2 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Okay, thank you.

3 Thank you.

4 Would the sponsor continue to yield?

5 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
7 Senator yields.

8 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Through you,
9 Mr. President, thank you for that information.
10 But could you explain why we didn't have any
11 hearings on the broad outlines of this plan?

12 SENATOR YOUNG: Thank you. Through
13 you, Mr. President. Actually, I believe the
14 program has been expired for about a year and a
15 half. And there's been a lot of discussion out
16 there about renewal of the program. It's a
17 long-standing program -- it goes back to the
18 1970s, I believe -- and it's been very effective
19 in growing affordable housing. In fact, it's the
20 most effective tool available in New York City.
21 It's been proven over and over again just by the
22 statistics that I just quoted, for example.

23 So this entire proposal has been out
24 there for a long time. There's been the
25 opportunity for a lot of discussion about it.

1 And in fact there's been a lot of discussion
2 about the program. And so there wasn't any need
3 for additional hearings because the information
4 has been out in the public eye.

5 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Thank you.

6 Would the sponsor continue to yield?

7 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
9 Senator yields.

10 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Through you,
11 Mr. President.

12 Does this proposal require
13 developers accepting the benefits to subject
14 newly constructed rental units to rent
15 stabilization for the duration of receiving the
16 benefits?

17 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes. Through you,
18 Mr. President, I'd like to explain the program.

19 Actually, the enhanced benefit goes
20 for 35 years. But the stabilization exceeds the
21 number of years for the benefit, so it goes to 40
22 years they have to have the units stabilized.

23 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Would the sponsor
24 continue to yield, Mr. President?

25 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
2 Senator yields.

3 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Through you. But
4 I guess my real question is would the market rate
5 units have to be subject to rent stabilization
6 for the duration of receiving the benefits?

7 SENATOR YOUNG: So through you,
8 Mr. President. Actually, the market rate units
9 would be market rate. The rent-stabilized units
10 would remain rent-stabilized.

11 And I would like to point out this
12 is an issue of supply and demand. And what this
13 bill is getting at is increasing the supply of
14 affordable housing in New York City and actually
15 increasing the supply of housing in general. And
16 every economist will tell you, every time you
17 increase supply, the cost goes down.

18 And we have had so many barriers to
19 increasing the supply of affordable housing in
20 New York City. And many of those barriers still
21 are there, and even worse than ever before. The
22 cost of land, the high taxation on buildings --
23 all of those items, plus rent control and rent
24 stabilization, actually depress the amount of
25 affordable housing that's developed.

1 So we need to have economic
2 development tools to develop any affordable
3 housing. And 421-a is the main economic
4 development tool available. And as I previously
5 said, according to the report by the New York
6 City Rent Guidelines Board, 90 percent of the
7 rent-stabilized units, the affordable housing
8 being developed in New York City, actually comes
9 from the 421-a program. So it's been shown to be
10 very effective.

11 I totally agree we need more
12 affordable housing developed in New York City.
13 But the main issue is that we need to have an
14 increase in the supply. This bill is doing that.

15 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Mr. President,
16 would the sponsor continue to yield?

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
18 Senator yields.

19 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

20 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Thank you. Thank
21 you to the sponsor for her explanation.

22 I would like to speak to some of
23 those economists who say that increased supply
24 will result in more affordable housing. They
25 should come to my district. It seems to be just

1 the opposite.

2 Is there any control mechanism for
3 assessing the effectiveness of the 421-a program?

4 SENATOR YOUNG: Through you,
5 Mr. President. As I previously stated, the
6 New York City Rent Guidelines Board issues
7 reports periodically, and it has shown that
8 90 percent of all the affordable housing being
9 built in New York City is due to the 421-a
10 program.

11 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Would the sponsor
12 continue to yield?

13 SENATOR YOUNG: In addition -- I
14 would like to add to that -- the New York City
15 comptroller actually keeps a lot of these
16 statistics, as does the Housing Preservation and
17 Development -- HPD for New York City actually
18 keeps track of this also. So if the Senator
19 wanted to check, those would be good sources of
20 information.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
22 Young, Senator Hoylman has asked if you would
23 continue to yield.

24 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The

1 Senator yields.

2 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Thank you.

3 I just wanted to change gears to
4 vaping, the vapor product regulations section,
5 Part FF. There's not much there. It says
6 "intentionally omitted."

7 SENATOR YOUNG: Oh, okay. FF,
8 okay.

9 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Yes. Through
10 you, Mr. President. I wanted to ask why it was
11 intentionally omitted. It was -- there were
12 regulations in the initial Senate one-house. The
13 Assembly had regulations of its own. And the
14 Governor proposed an entire program. What
15 happened?

16 SENATOR YOUNG: Through you,
17 Mr. President, I would like to remind the Senator
18 that this is a three-way agreed-upon budget. For
19 whatever reason, that particular proposal fell
20 off the table, and so it's not included in the
21 final budget.

22 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Will the sponsor
23 continue to yield?

24 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The

1 Senator yields.

2 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Thank you.

3 But it would seem to me that all
4 parties agreed, just based on the fact that they
5 had all submitted similar proposals.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
7 Hoylman, do you have a question?

8 SENATOR HOYLMAN: I have a
9 question.

10 So there isn't any other detailed
11 explanation that I could have?

12 SENATOR YOUNG: That's the
13 explanation, Senator.

14 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Okay. Thank you.
15 On the bill, Mr. President.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
17 Hoylman on the bill.

18 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Thank you to the
19 sponsor again, and thanks for her hard work, and
20 everyone who's been seconded in this budget
21 process.

22 I am very concerned that the process
23 that we have established as a legislative body is
24 so broken it can only have a bad outcome for
25 taxpayers and for our constituents. We know

1 that, for example, in the 421-a negotiations,
2 they weren't conducted by the membership of the
3 State Senate, they weren't conducted in
4 connection with advocates or experts at public
5 hearings, they were done largely, unfortunately,
6 among private parties with a financial interest,
7 behind closed doors.

8 And I don't think we can expect, as
9 I said, an outcome that benefits my constituents,
10 particularly as it pertains to rent regulation.
11 And I appreciate the sponsor bringing up
12 statistics from the Rent Guidelines Board. I
13 would think that they are the sworn enemy of some
14 of my colleagues.

15 But the truth is that we have
16 decoupled the conversations around the rent
17 regulations in New York City with the 421-a
18 renewal plan, and that has put a lot of our
19 constituents in a significant bind and
20 disadvantage as we continue those discussions
21 forward.

22 I think that we're going to see more
23 and more luxury development as a result of this
24 plan in my district. I think we're going to see
25 more and more luxury rentals. And, you know,

1 that might be good for the developers. That's
2 maybe not so good for my district, particularly
3 as it pertains to affordability.

4 And I think there are other programs
5 available. There are programs that we should be
6 more creative about in terms of supporting. I
7 know my colleagues here have a Mitchell-Lama
8 renewal plan. We could only look back 50 years
9 to see what Senators in this chamber proposed in
10 terms of direct subsidies for affordable housing.
11 It's far more efficient to directly support
12 affordable housing with tax dollars than to
13 provide a tax break for real estate developers
14 who don't build affordable housing. Those
15 developers have no expertise -- or very little
16 expertise -- in affordable housing. We should be
17 giving it directly to the developers who do.

18 I have experience in this. I worked
19 for the New York City Housing Partnership in my
20 career. And over the course of two decades, they
21 built over 30,000 units of affordable housing
22 through a direct subsidy program -- not through
23 some cockamamie tax break.

24 So, you know, we see again and again
25 in this budget bill items that have been removed,

1 deleted, modified, and we're not told why. We're
2 not told how. Worse than us not knowing really
3 is the public not knowing.

4 So, Mr. President, I think we have a
5 lot of work to do in making certain that while we
6 take strides forward with this budget, of course
7 in the area of criminal justice -- and thank you
8 to my colleagues for their hard work in that
9 regard -- I believe that we could do so much
10 better if we opened our process, if we had
11 regular public hearings, if we had time to
12 discuss what was on the table, if we didn't
13 shoehorn the good, the bad, and the ugly in one
14 bill.

15 And we call it the Big Ugly, but
16 it's become like -- it's become almost an
17 endearing term, and it shouldn't be. There's
18 nothing -- there's nothing funny about the fact
19 that we are voting on issues as disparate as
20 raising the age of criminal responsibility, real
21 estate tax breaks, and ending, you know, the
22 possibility for sensible regulations on
23 electronic cigarettes. These are all stand-alone
24 issues that deserve our time and attention, one
25 by one.

1 We shouldn't be forced to vote on an
2 omnibus piece of legislation that has such
3 different policy goals attached to it.

4 Thank you, Mr. President.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Thank
6 you, Senator Hoylman.

7 Senator Young.

8 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes, I wish Senator
9 Stavisky was in the chamber, because I have a
10 clarification on one of her questions. She asked
11 about how many people would qualify for the
12 enhanced college affordability program.

13 Actually, the statistic that the
14 Governor was referring to is the fact that there
15 are about 940,000 college-age people between the
16 ages of 18 and 23 who have graduated from high
17 school in this state whose families have incomes
18 of \$100,000 or less. So obviously not every
19 person is college-bound, so that's a total
20 number. And I just wanted to point that out. So
21 that's where the discrepancy came from.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Thank
23 you, Senator Young, for that clarification.

24 Senator Rivera.

25 SENATOR RIVERA: Thank you,

1 Mr. President. On the bill.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
3 Rivera on the bill.

4 SENATOR RIVERA: So here we are,
5 ladies and gentlemen, talking about what I will
6 not refer to as the Big Ugly, because it is far
7 bigger and uglier than that. I call it the Big
8 Abominable. And we can certainly call it many
9 other words.

10 I'm going to start where my
11 colleague ended, by talking a little bit about
12 the process. The fact is that we should not --
13 well, first of all, we're nine days removed from
14 when the budget was due. That's the first part
15 of it. And it is clear that the reason for that
16 was that there were so many things that were
17 pulled from other bills to stick into this one --
18 it is the reason, as a matter of fact -- part of
19 the reason why I voted no on every bill that has
20 come before us before this point, because many of
21 the things that are now on this in agreed-upon
22 version that we have in front of us, we couldn't
23 even look at a few days ago.

24 So here we are with this abominable
25 piece of legislation. What is in it, and what is

1 out of it? Now, for those that are watching --
2 and there are probably like five or 10 folks --
3 but for those that are watching or will watch in
4 the future, let's make clear what it is that
5 we're talking about. We have one piece of
6 legislation, one piece of legislation. And
7 within it, and I'm sure I'm going to miss a few
8 things, we're talking about Raise the Age, 421-a,
9 workers' compensation reform, the Excelsior
10 Scholarship, education funding, capital money for
11 essential health providers across the state, the
12 so-called Uber upstate -- so we're talking about
13 transportation networking companies -- indigent
14 legal defense, CUNY tuition, the personal income
15 surcharge, charter schools, \$200 million for
16 opioid addiction, powers for the Governor,
17 et cetera, et cetera, et cetera.

18 It is not good policy, ladies and
19 gentlemen, we should not expect for this to be
20 the case, for us to have to take one vote on all
21 of those issues. There's many things in here
22 that I can say, hey, you know what, I can get
23 down with. But there's many more that I think
24 deserve more thorough discussion. My colleagues
25 have spoken about some of them; I will do so as

1 well.

2 But the first thing is that we
3 should not be patting ourselves on the back for
4 putting this piece of legislation in front of us
5 that has everything and then some more. The
6 partridge in a pear tree, it's in there
7 somewhere, I am sure.

8 Now, what are some of the things
9 that it has in it -- now, I talked briefly
10 about -- and trust me, ladies and gentlemen, that
11 is briefly what is in it. What is not in it?
12 Ethics reform. Charter school transparency --
13 one of my colleagues brought that up. Mayoral
14 control, that didn't make it to the final bill.
15 Vaping products, as my colleague brought it up,
16 that is not in there. These are all things that
17 were at one point in the proposals and they just
18 didn't make it to the end.

19 And as my colleague pointed out, not
20 sure why, but here we are, we have to take one
21 vote on all of this stuff.

22 Then we have things that many of us
23 have been fighting for. As a matter of fact, it
24 was just a few weeks ago I stood here on this
25 floor and spoke about raising the age of criminal

1 responsibility. I mentioned then that one of the
2 reasons why it was so important, not only to me
3 but to many people across the state, that we
4 needed to get this done was one gentleman in
5 particular who was my constituent before he took
6 his own life -- Kalief Browder. Who was arrested
7 at 16, spent three years in prison -- I'm sorry,
8 apologies, three years in jail before the charges
9 were ultimately dropped, most of that in solitary
10 confinement.

11 It was, regardless of what the
12 comments have been in the public eye for the last
13 couple of weeks by some of my colleagues -- they
14 were unfortunate comments which were talking
15 about how we -- some of us care more about
16 protecting rapists and murderers. That is never
17 what this has been about. And I certainly thank
18 many folks. And certainly the first one I'll
19 point out, only because I know that he has always
20 been a straight shooter and I appreciate him,
21 Senator Patrick Gallivan, who on behalf of the
22 Senate Republican Conference, negotiated in good
23 faith and talked about how this was about not
24 those individuals, but young men and women like
25 Kalief Browder who had been caught up in a system

1 that has failed them.

2 I certainly -- I mean, I thank the
3 gentleman first, but certainly he's not going to
4 be the last one that I thank, because we have to
5 recognize that had it not been for Speaker Carl
6 Heastie in the Assembly, we would not be talking
7 about this issue during the budget. He staked
8 his reputation on it, and many of us thank him
9 for his bravery.

10 But certainly, above all, I want to
11 thank Senator Velmanette Montgomery. And had
12 Senator Velmanette Montgomery's version of this
13 issue had been dealt with -- which is why I would
14 really like to thank Senator Stewart-Cousins. If
15 she was the leader of this house, if she was the
16 majority leader of this house, we would have
17 started with Velmanette's version and not with
18 the watered-down version that we started with
19 that then had so much stuff added into it.

20 I want to -- certainly I think that
21 the version that ultimately we came up with
22 impacts the majority of kids that we're talking
23 about. And I certainly thank everyone involved
24 who in good faith negotiated to make sure that we
25 get some version in front of us.

1 I would warn, however, some of my
2 colleagues on this floor and others to not take a
3 victory lap too quickly, considering that had it
4 not been for certain folks that really pushed
5 things at the table, we would not have anything
6 at all.

7 But what we have in front of us,
8 whether it's the 10-year ceiling of records,
9 which ultimately made it onto this piece of
10 legislation without the -- the different versions
11 that were proposed at the table, whether we're
12 talking about adult sentencing for kids, or
13 whether we're talking about the placement of some
14 of these young people -- all of these issues are
15 certainly not perfect. This is a version that
16 could have been better, but it is what we have to
17 vote on. And because it will have an impact on
18 many people, many young men and women, I
19 certainly can be supportive of that.

20 As a matter of fact, had this been a
21 piece of legislation by itself, I would have
22 gotten up, like I'm doing right now, and talked
23 about some of the things that we could have done
24 better in it, but I still would have voted for
25 it.

1 But that is not what we are doing
2 today. We are asked to vote on one piece of
3 legislation that, again, has everything and the
4 kitchen sink in it.

5 Which brings me to the last issue I
6 want to talk about, 421-a. Some of my colleagues
7 have already gone down this road, but I want to
8 make sure that I tell you specifically why, to
9 me, this is so obscene.

10 The district that I represent, about
11 318,000 people -- and, after Senator Alcantara's
12 district, mine has the most amount of
13 rent-stabilized units in the entire state, about
14 70,000 of them. I live in one of them myself.
15 And as I've said many times on this floor, had it
16 not been for rent stabilization, I would not have
17 been able to live in the City of New York, much
18 less thrive there.

19 Now, regardless of the conversations
20 that we've had about salaries, compared to the
21 rest of the folks that live in my district, I am
22 living the big life. Twenty-seven thousand
23 dollars a year is the median income of the folks
24 that I represent. And so when you're talking
25 about rent stabilization and affordable housing,

1 the 318,000 people that I represent have to be in
2 the top of my mind.

3 And so when thinking about a tax
4 break, one has to be -- one has to look at all
5 the pros and the cons. There is a consideration
6 that has to be taken into how much revenue we're
7 actually losing as to how much we're gaining.
8 And the question here as far as what we're
9 supposed to be gaining has to be both about the
10 amount -- the total number of units that are
11 created and whether those units are truly
12 affordable.

13 And ladies and gentlemen, the plan
14 that we have before us, by any analysis, fails
15 those tests miserably. It costs us -- it would
16 cost us about \$2.4 billion a year. I shouldn't
17 say us. Only the City of New York. It would
18 cost the City of New York \$2.4 billion that it
19 would not have in its coffers for a host of other
20 things that it could do.

21 It extends it to 35 years -- that is
22 more than the 25 in the original program. Even
23 the folks that are supportive of this say that it
24 would create about 2500 units. That means that
25 each one of them would cost about \$600,000 each.

1 Right? The level of affordability is nowhere
2 near where the folks in my district could
3 actually afford these apartments.

4 And last but certainly not least,
5 the way that this program is written, the way
6 that the language that we have in front of us is,
7 units -- not the affordable units, but the
8 so-called market units that are created by this
9 tax break, that are made possible by this tax
10 break, would certainly be rent-stabilized at
11 their creation. But you could actually rent it
12 for \$2600 when you open the door, then somebody
13 moves on and all of a sudden, boom, that unit is
14 gone and no longer in the rent-stabilization
15 program.

16 So for all of these reasons, and
17 considering that affordable housing is one of the
18 most crucial things in the district that I
19 represent -- because these are folks that come
20 every day into my district office talking about
21 how they can barely afford the place where they
22 live now, so could I help them find a job? Or
23 could I help them stay in their apartment? Every
24 single day this happens.

25 You have to take all of this into

1 account. You have to take the fact that there's
2 27,000 different issues that are in here. You
3 have to take the fact that each one of them is
4 again a negotiated version that would have been
5 better negotiated had that lady been in front
6 of the -- at that table negotiating.

7 So let's be clear. This is
8 certainly a budget which can be called -- which
9 many people are going to call a victory. Many
10 people already have. And I would suggest that
11 there was more that we could do -- but you're
12 always going to hear that from us, right? We
13 could have always done more. In this case, it
14 could not be more true, particularly considering
15 that you have to stick so many things into one
16 bill and we have to make a decision, one
17 decision, on so much of it.

18 Ladies and gentlemen, I don't think
19 this is the way that we should legislate. I
20 don't think that this is the way we should do a
21 budget. I don't think that this is the way that
22 we should consider all these important issues,
23 each one of them deserving plenty of time on this
24 floor and in hearings and what have you.

25 So I will say, Mr. President, that I

1 find that this whole process has been abominable,
2 just like this bill in front of us. And even
3 though there's many things that I could be
4 supportive of, I will be voting in the negative.

5 Thank you, Mr. President.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
7 Montgomery.

8 SENATOR MONTGOMERY: Thank you,
9 Mr. President.

10 I want to start by thanking my
11 colleague, who acknowledged my involvement with
12 Raise the Age. Certainly I am happy to receive
13 your acknowledgment, but I certainly must say
14 that this legislation has a lot of people to
15 thank as it relates to the support over the years
16 of this idea.

17 And let me just say that, to start
18 thanking people, I want to just join Governor
19 Cuomo -- I'm looking at his press release, and
20 I'm assuming that this is how he means to
21 acknowledge the people who are involved with this
22 budget agreement. So he acknowledges --

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
24 Montgomery, are you on the bill?

25 SENATOR MONTGOMERY: Yes, on the

1 bill.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
3 Montgomery on the bill.

4 SENATOR MONTGOMERY: Thank you.

5 He acknowledges the Majority Leader,
6 Senator Flanagan, whom I certainly join him in
7 thanking, and he acknowledges the IDC,
8 Independent Democratic Conference Leader Jeffrey
9 Klein -- who we all thank you, Senator Klein.
10 And he acknowledges Assembly Speaker Carl
11 Heastie, who I can't thank -- but I do thank him,
12 because we know that he played a major role in
13 this process.

14 But let me just say, for the
15 Governor's sake, I know that he forgot to
16 acknowledge one of the leaders in this house.
17 I'm assuming that he did because she is not
18 invisible, I'm not invisible, and the members of
19 the majority Democratic Conference are not
20 invisible. So I'm just assuming that he forgot.

21 So I'm just reminding him that I
22 also want to acknowledge Democratic Conference
23 Leader Stewart-Cousins for your role in making
24 this happen. So I just want to make that --
25 start by doing that.

1 Now, I wanted to just say too,
2 Mr. President, that there were a number of people
3 when I was chair of the Committee on Children and
4 Families -- as you know, that was 15 minutes and
5 some time ago, but it did happen. So I met at
6 that time Judge Michael Corriero, who started to
7 talk about this issue and to let not only me but
8 a whole group of people who were also very
9 interested in what we did for young people in our
10 state.

11 So shortly after that Judge Lippman,
12 Jonathan Lippman, came up with some legislative
13 proposals, different -- a couple of different
14 versions that he offered us. Unfortunately, it
15 didn't happen at that moment. But that was the
16 beginning of an acknowledgment that New York
17 State was behind the eightball, as they say where
18 I come from, on this issue, and that we did not
19 have a justice system that served the best
20 interest of young people in our state.

21 So let's fast-forward to where we
22 are today. I want to say a specific thanks to
23 all of the people in our state, across the state,
24 judges and lawyers and advocates and public
25 defenders and clergy -- and just calling out a

1 name who was brought into this by our Leader
2 Stewart-Cousins, a friend of hers and a friend of
3 ours, Hazel Dukes, who put her back to the wheel
4 to reach out to clergy across the state to bring
5 them into this process.

6 So we have a lot of people to thank.
7 And I just want to acknowledge that this is not
8 nearly just about me, this is about all of us who
9 have made this moment possible. And I thank all
10 of them. And I know that the Governor does too.
11 He forgot Leader Cousins, that's what happened.

12 So let me just say I am happy to see
13 that we are now going to be -- all of the young
14 people, most of whom are part of this group who
15 come with misdemeanor charges, are now going to
16 go into Family Court. However, a number of young
17 people who also commit nonviolent offenses -- as
18 violations, some of them as little as violations,
19 will still be going into criminal court. So
20 that's a loophole. We hope to fix that, but that
21 is a problem.

22 The so-called violent felony cases
23 for young people who now have -- who are 16 and
24 17, who now have a new name and -- what is that?
25 They have a new name. I'll have to find it. So

1 they will be tried in criminal court, youth
2 part -- we have a youth part now. That's a good
3 thing, I'm very happy. But they will be tried,
4 sentenced as adults in that court, and they will
5 enter facilities, adult facilities in our state.
6 So they're now adolescent -- what are they
7 called? I'll find them.

8 So, Mr. President, we have not done
9 everything that I would like to have done, to
10 have seen, but at least we have changed the
11 direction. We just have to continue looking at
12 children as they're children, sentencing them,
13 having them go into Family Court as opposed to
14 going into criminal court. However, we do have a
15 youth part in criminal court where there will be
16 Family Court judges presiding. So that is a good
17 thing.

18 Let me just say what we don't have
19 in this bill. We still -- as I said, we still do
20 not have a youthful offender status extended to
21 19- and 20-year-olds, as I would have liked to
22 see. We now have -- this new name is an
23 adolescent offender. The adolescent offenders
24 who are 16- and 17-year-olds will still be
25 sentenced as adults, tried in the youth part of

1 criminal court, and they will be sent to adult
2 prisons.

3 We now have in this bill,
4 unfortunately, violations, some of them being
5 quality-of-life violations -- these are not even
6 misdemeanors -- as well as all traffic violations
7 still will be tried in criminal court.
8 Nonviolent felonies that should be automatically
9 going into Family Court now must go into criminal
10 court and be sent down to Family Court by virtue
11 of an agreement with the prosecutor.

12 A young person who has a problem at
13 16 now has to wait 10 years before they are
14 eligible to have their records sealed.

15 Parental notification -- arrests
16 could have included parental consent for
17 interrogation of minors, along with the
18 videotaping of such interrogations, but they are
19 not.

20 So, Mr. President, while we have
21 begun this -- and it has taken all of the State
22 of New York, every advocate of every region, with
23 all of their muscle, all of their excitement, and
24 including the leader of this movement in our
25 state, the Speaker of the Assembly, and with all

1 of us pushing and pushing and pushing, we have
2 pushed the boulder halfway up the mountain.

3 So with that, I am happy that we got
4 something in this case. And fortunately, because
5 we have so many young people, 18,000 or 20,000
6 young people that we're talking about annually
7 that this will help to make sure they don't end
8 up losing their lives forever for a mistake that
9 they make, I'm happy. Not always do I say this,
10 but in this case, something is better than
11 nothing.

12 So I thank you, and I thank my
13 colleagues in this house, I thank my colleagues
14 in the other house. And, Mr. President, I thank
15 you for giving me an opportunity to express to my
16 colleagues and to my community many, many thanks
17 on behalf of the young people that we represent.

18 Thank you.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
20 Comrie.

21 SENATOR COMRIE: Mr. President,
22 would the sponsor yield for some questions,
23 please?

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
25 Young, do you yield?

1 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

2 SENATOR ROBACH: No.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
4 Senator yields.

5 SENATOR COMRIE: Thanks, Joe.

6 A question on 421-a and the Tenant
7 Protection Unit. Was there any money put in the
8 budget this year to increase the ability of the
9 Tenant Protection Unit to deal with the issues of
10 the owners of rental buildings complying with
11 their rules and regulations?

12 SENATOR YOUNG: No.

13 SENATOR COMRIE: And was there any
14 money put into the Division of Housing and
15 Community Renewal to increase their ability to
16 maintain their recordkeeping?

17 SENATOR YOUNG: Through you,
18 Mr. President. Actually, what the Senator is
19 referring to is in the capital bill and not in
20 the bill before us.

21 SENATOR COMRIE: It's in the
22 capital bill? Okay. I thought there was a
23 reference in section -- I'm sorry. Okay, I
24 thought there was --

25 SENATOR YOUNG: Through you,

1 Mr. President, I'd just like to clarify. There's
2 money in the capital bill through the Division of
3 Housing and Community Renewal, if that's what
4 you're asking, but it's not specifically for that
5 purpose.

6 SENATOR COMRIE: Okay, thank you.

7 I'd like to ask the sponsor another
8 question, Mr. President.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Does the
10 Senator yield?

11 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
13 Senator yields.

14 SENATOR COMRIE: On MWBE, can you
15 explain what was funded in this year's MWBE
16 program? And how would that be -- what's the
17 intent of the legislation and the funding?

18 SENATOR YOUNG: Through you,
19 Mr. President. Actually, this is a very
20 important program. That's why it's extended for
21 one year, and it's pending the required disparity
22 report. Which actually I'd like to point out was
23 due in August of 2016. So we need that
24 information. And unfortunately, that has not
25 been issued yet.

1 SENATOR COMRIE: Through you,
2 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
3 yield?

4 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
6 Senator yields.

7 SENATOR COMRIE: Do you have any
8 information on why the disparity study has not
9 been delivered to the Legislature?

10 SENATOR YOUNG: Through you,
11 Mr. President, no. It's not the Senate's
12 responsibility. So we don't have any
13 information. We've asked for it, but
14 unfortunately that information apparently isn't
15 available at this point.

16 SENATOR COMRIE: Thank you.
17 Different category. Would the sponsor continue
18 to yield for some questions?

19 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
21 Senator yields.

22 SENATOR COMRIE: Thank you. On
23 health and hospitals, the hospital capital
24 program, Part FFF, I believe, there's been a
25 \$500 million program to support capital projects.

1 SENATOR YOUNG: Through you,
2 Mr. President, I'd be glad to answer that
3 question when the capital bill is before us.

4 SENATOR COMRIE: Is that capital
5 also? Sorry. Okay.

6 SENATOR YOUNG: But this is a
7 separate bill. This is the revenue bill,
8 Senator.

9 SENATOR COMRIE: I thought I was in
10 revenue. Sorry.

11 The just one last question on --

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
13 Senator yields.

14 SENATOR COMRIE: Oh, if the sponsor
15 would continue to yield.

16 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

17 SENATOR COMRIE: Is there anything
18 in the bill to deal with enhanced revenue for
19 enhanced summer jobs in the revenue bill?

20 SENATOR YOUNG: Through you,
21 Mr. President. It took a minute to look that up,
22 because there's a lot of lines that we had to go
23 through. But actually we extended the Youth
24 Employment Program, and it's \$2 million per
25 year -- I'm sorry, \$50 million. Excuse me,

1 \$50 million a year.

2 SENATOR COMRIE: Through you,
3 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
4 yield for a question?

5 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

6 SENATOR COMRIE: Would that
7 increase the number of slots, or would that just
8 be a cost adjustment increase?

9 SENATOR YOUNG: So through you,
10 Mr. President, actually the \$50 million is an
11 extender. But it could be for more jobs for more
12 youth, because obviously you cycle through the
13 program as you get older.

14 So these are opportunities that are
15 very important, and we're glad to see that that
16 money was agreed upon by the Senate, the
17 Assembly, and the Governor, because it is such an
18 important program to get people summer
19 employment, but also those job skills that they
20 need and that experience. I think it's a very
21 important program.

22 SENATOR COMRIE: I'm sorry,
23 Mr. President, I didn't quite hear with the noise
24 in the building. Did you say that there would be
25 more slots or just more opportunities?

1 SENATOR YOUNG: Well, that funding,
2 the \$50 million, will be used for job development
3 and jobs for youth. So obviously as youth cycle
4 through the program, some will graduate, for lack
5 of a better word, and new youth will be able to
6 take advantage of it and participate.

7 SENATOR COMRIE: Thank you. Thank
8 you. Mr. President, would the sponsor continue
9 to yield for actually a previous question?
10 Because my information tells me that Part FFF of
11 the revenue, originally Part K of HMM, does deal
12 with the hospital capital program.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
14 sponsor yields.

15 You want to direct your question,
16 Senator Comrie?

17 SENATOR YOUNG: Thank you.

18 SENATOR COMRIE: Yes, I just wanted
19 to know if there was any money in that program
20 for the growing and immediate problems with
21 Queens hospitals, where we have three hospitals
22 that are Tier 1 emergency hospitals that need to
23 get their trauma centers upgraded.

24 SENATOR YOUNG: Thank you. Through
25 you, Mr. President. Actually, that hospital

1 could be eligible to apply for the funding.

2 There aren't any specific hospitals, as far as I
3 know, lined out in the funding, but it's a major
4 pot. It's a big pot of money. And a lot of the
5 hospitals around the state, including that one,
6 would be able to apply for the funding.

7 SENATOR COMRIE: It's actually two,
8 thank you.

9 Just one last question. Can you
10 break --

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
12 Young, will you yield to the last question?

13 SENATOR YOUNG: Yes.

14 SENATOR COMRIE: Yes, I'm sorry.
15 Sorry.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: From
17 Senator Comrie.

18 SENATOR YOUNG: To Senator Comrie,
19 yes.

20 SENATOR COMRIE: Yes, I want to
21 thank you, Senator Young, for your excellent
22 experience and the time and hours that you put in
23 as Finance chair. I just want to ask you one
24 last question before I make a general statement.

25 Can you break down the maximum TAP

1 and TAP enhanced, what those numbers are going to
2 be?

3 SENATOR YOUNG: Sure. If you'd
4 just hold on one second while I find it.

5 SENATOR COMRIE: Sure.

6 SENATOR YOUNG: I have it right
7 here.

8 Through you, Mr. President.
9 Actually, we're not changing the basic TAP
10 program, but we're enhancing it. And so
11 scholarship awards would be provided to eligible
12 students attending SUNY and CUNY, and the maximum
13 award for a student under this proposal -- or
14 this actual bill that we're passing is \$5,500 per
15 year.

16 SENATOR COMRIE: Thank you.

17 On the bill, Mr. President.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
19 Comrie on the bill.

20 SENATOR COMRIE: Thank you.

21 I want to thank Senator Young again
22 for her chairmanship as Finance chair, and also
23 just acknowledge Senator Krueger, who is taking
24 care of family and could not be here, for her
25 excellent yeomanship as Finance chair {sic}.

1 I'm just very disappointed in many
2 things that are not in this budget that need to
3 be taken care of. I don't -- I've never tried to
4 do anything that was just singular or special. I
5 think that taking care of hospitals is not a
6 Democratic or a Republican issue, taking care of
7 needs for communities is not a Democratic or a
8 Republican issue.

9 I'm distressed to know that there
10 are many things that have not happened in this
11 budget that we really need to have for our
12 communities. And I'm just distressed also that
13 it's being put in partisan language and partisan
14 idealism that things that are really helping
15 constituents cannot get funded in this budget.
16 When we have a \$153 billion budget that could
17 serve the residents of this state equally and
18 fairly, that has not happened.

19 I'm very disappointed in a lack of
20 funding to the Tenant Protection Unit for DHCR.
21 I have developments in my district that need help
22 from DHCR to do the investigations necessary to
23 provide the adequate opportunities for them to
24 get their relief. And I know that that's
25 happening around this city and around this state.

1 I'm also concerned about the issues
2 around TAP and the ability of people that cannot
3 do 30 credits a year because of their work
4 situation or their home and family and life
5 situation, and that the TAP and the Excelsior
6 Scholarship will not cover them. And that's many
7 people that are in this state that just cannot
8 afford to work or to take 30 hours of credits
9 because they have to work to pay their bills,
10 they have to work to maintain their children,
11 they have to work to be able to have a life in
12 this state.

13 I'm concerned also that design-build
14 is not being put in New York City where we have
15 major projects that are in imminent danger of
16 collapse, such as at BQE, such as many other
17 infrastructure projects around the city where
18 design-build has been proven -- even though it
19 has some issues with the ability to make sure
20 that there's checks and balances, it's been
21 proven around this country to be an effective
22 program.

23 I want to congratulate Senator
24 Montgomery and her efforts to try to make sure
25 that Raise the Age was addressed and addressed as

1 thoroughly as possible. I want to thank her for
2 continuing to fight the fight, and I know that
3 that fight is not over to protect young people.

4 I'm concerned also regarding where
5 the opportunity is to help the teachers and
6 faculty at CUNY and SUNY, even if we do get the
7 Excelsior program, to max out where are the
8 faculty and what's the help in maintenance of
9 effort to make sure that they can become -- be
10 able to keep up with maybe the explosion of
11 students that come into CUNY and SUNY.

12 I'm concerned also with summer job
13 slots. And I hope that this program and the
14 funding today will actually create opportunity
15 for more summer job slots, because they haven't
16 been raised in seven years.

17 And as I've said earlier on this
18 floor, I benefited from having a summer youth
19 employment job. It gave me an opportunity to
20 change my direction and change my focus, and we
21 need to do that for other young people. If we're
22 going to keep them off the streets, we need to
23 give them actual employment opportunities.

24 I would hope that we continue to
25 think about, as a body, what we need to do to

1 ensure that this body is respected. I'm
2 concerned about the lack of respect that has been
3 given to this body. I'm concerned about the lack
4 of respect that we will have to deal with if
5 there's a budget change with an \$850 million cap.
6 We should be the people that decide what happens
7 in a budget line, and we should not let that
8 happen to us.

9 This is a body that deserves to be
10 respected. It should not be put in a light
11 because of a few bad apples or things that
12 happened in the past. We need to make sure that
13 we demand our opportunities to have everyone at
14 the table, including our leader, Andrea
15 Stewart-Cousins, who I'm sure that if she had the
16 opportunity to be at the table, different things
17 would have happened in this budget.

18 I don't understand and I'm still
19 working to hope we change the focus on what
20 happens to get people to have real discussions
21 and real opportunities for debate, because I
22 think that with vigorous debate and real
23 discussion among people of positive minds and
24 people that are focused on getting things done
25 and articulating their opinion -- because there

1 are many people in this room on both sides of the
2 aisle that are unafraid to articulate their
3 opinion in a positive way and a strong manner to
4 make sure that things are heard -- that we could
5 resolve all these issues in a proper way, in a
6 way that would respect the history of this body
7 and in a way that would help make sure that the
8 residents of this state at least felt they were
9 heard.

10 Thank you, Mr. President.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
12 Persaud.

13 SENATOR PERSAUD: Thank you,
14 Mr. President. On the bill, Mr. President.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
16 Persaud on the bill.

17 SENATOR PERSAUD: In my offices at
18 the college I would have a sign on my wall that
19 said -- it's a variation; sometimes you would
20 hear it as the 7 Ps. But a variation says
21 "Proper planning prevents poor performance."

22 And sometimes I sit in this chamber
23 and I just remember that and I think, what are
24 our plans here in this chamber?

25 Our budget bill that we will be

1 voting on this evening, there's a lot to question
2 in that bill. There are many things that I would
3 address. I would look at what is missing for
4 college students, what is missing in our
5 healthcare system, and many others. But I just
6 want to touch on two things, and those two things
7 are Raise the Age and mayoral control of New York
8 City's public schools.

9 And first on Raise the Age. It's an
10 issue that many people across the state and even
11 across the country agree that it's important that
12 we do not treat 16- and 17-year-olds as adults.
13 We could have incorporated many of the bills --
14 of the issues that were addressed in the bill
15 introduced by Senator Montgomery. Senator
16 Montgomery, who has been a champion on Raise the
17 Age, an advocate on Raise the Age. Senator
18 Montgomery, who visited the prisons to understand
19 what it means for 16- and 17-year-olds to be in
20 those environs. Senator Montgomery, who
21 tirelessly continues to fight that good fight.

22 Senator Montgomery, I must applaud
23 you and urge you to keep up the good fight.

24 Senator Stewart-Cousins, she's also
25 there fighting. She was there fighting to ensure

1 that this budget included Raise the Age, because
2 we were left out of that discussion. We did not
3 know -- all we heard is from what we were hearing
4 on social media, and it was not good news. And
5 Senator Stewart-Cousins, to ensure that our
6 interests were taken care of, fought that fight
7 to ensure that Raise the Age was part of that
8 discussion.

9 So Senator Stewart-Cousins, thank
10 you very much.

11 Carl Heastie, for the herculean
12 efforts that he had to endure to get this to
13 where we are today, I must applaud him.

14 But our work is not done. Our work
15 on Raise the Age is not done. I'm happy that
16 New York is no longer going to be one of two
17 states that are prosecuting 16- and 17-year-olds
18 as adults. The strides we are taking today when
19 we vote on this bill will move us forward. But
20 that's not enough. We still must review what's
21 out there. We still must continue to say 16- and
22 17-year-olds, their brains are not fully formed.
23 Their thinking is not that of many of us who are
24 sitting in this chamber. If we do something, we
25 should be held accountable to that extent; at 16

1 and 17, they should not be held to the same
2 standards as some of us -- as us who are here.

3 And we have -- sometimes we do
4 things and we're saying, Well, we're not
5 accountable for what we've done, and we ask for
6 leniency. But 16- and 17-year-olds, we're
7 sitting here in this chamber denying them the
8 same leniency that we are asking when we do
9 things as adults. Is that right? That is not
10 right. That is not humane. When we think of 16-
11 and 17-year-olds, we must put it in its correct
12 context. They are still children. They are
13 still children and should be treated as such.

14 I ask my colleagues, tonight after
15 we have voted, this should not be the end of the
16 discussion on Raise the Age, not by any means.
17 We still have a lot to be done. As a legislative
18 body, I urge us all to continue this discussion.

19 You know, we've been saying it,
20 let's Raise the Age right. Let's Raise the Age
21 right. Think of it, when you are thinking of
22 placing 16- and 17-year-olds in prison for some
23 of the infractions that they're committing, think
24 of it as if it were your son, your daughter, your
25 nephew, your neighbor's child, your godchild.

1 Would you want them to be treated as an adult
2 because they've done something -- a traffic
3 infraction. Some of them -- many people I know
4 who are adults are still doing things that they
5 should not do. For example, they're smoking
6 marijuana. And they're asking for them not to be
7 prosecuted for it. But we will do that to a 16-
8 and 17-year-old.

9 So I think -- I ask my colleagues,
10 when you're thinking of prosecuting 16- and
11 17-year-olds, that you remember and you ask
12 yourself, when you were 16 and 17 and some of the
13 things you may have done, would you have wanted
14 to be treated in the way that we are treating 16-
15 and 17-year-olds currently? And if you can sleep
16 on the answer that you give yourself, then more
17 power to you. But I know, as human beings, we
18 should not try to do to others what we don't want
19 others to do to us. So remember, 16- and
20 17-year-olds, they are still children.

21 On mayoral control, why is it that
22 we're always having a conversation at the last
23 minute as to who should control New York City's
24 public schools? Why? Why are we penalizing the
25 children, the teachers, the administrators of the

1 New York City public schools? The communities,
2 why should there always be this uncertainty about
3 who should lead New York City's public schools?

4 Many of us sitting here don't
5 understand the complex school system of New York
6 City public schools. You don't have a quarter of
7 the number of students in your school districts.
8 Why are you penalizing New York City public
9 schools? Why are we playing devil's advocate
10 with the lives of New York City public school
11 students? Why are we politicizing who rules
12 New York City's public schools?

13 We should not do that. The
14 uncertainty is killing everything to do with our
15 children in New York City's public schools. We
16 should never politicize it. Education of our
17 children should not be a political game.

18 And when we decide not to include
19 mayoral control in our discussions and our budget
20 and someone says, Well, we can wait until June,
21 that is unfair to New York City. That is unfair
22 to New York City. I don't think any one of us in
23 here who would like it that we tell them they
24 can't do something until the last minute. You
25 cannot plan. And there again, if you fail to

1 plan, what will happen?

2 New York City's public schools,
3 they're waiting until -- they're at the whim of
4 this chamber. Why should that be? We're asking
5 you, again, when you sit in your deliberations
6 and you're thinking of what's best for New York
7 City's public schools, put yourselves in the
8 shoes of the people who are living in New York
9 City. Put yourselves in the shoes of the people
10 who have children attending New York City's
11 public schools. Ask yourself, could I tolerate
12 this suspense every single year? Is it fair to
13 the children of New York City?

14 That's the question we should all
15 ask ourselves when we're playing with the lives
16 of the New York City public school students. It
17 should not be. And I urge you, after we've
18 passed this budget and you go back and you're
19 talking about what's best for New York City's
20 public schools, really think about what is best
21 for New York City's public schools. Don't play
22 politics with the lives of New York City's public
23 school students. It is not fair, it is not just.
24 You should not do it.

25 So again, Mr. President, I thank you

1 for your indulgence. And I again implore my
2 colleagues to think about raising the age right
3 and what is best for New York City's public
4 schools in terms of mayoral control.

5 Thank you.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
7 Kennedy.

8 SENATOR KENNEDY: Thank you,
9 Mr. President.

10 First of all, I want to start by
11 thanking my colleagues on both sides of the
12 aisle, the leaders of --

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
14 Kennedy on the bill?

15 SENATOR KENNEDY: Yes, sir, on the
16 bill.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
18 Kennedy on the bill.

19 SENATOR KENNEDY: Mr. President, on
20 the bill.

21 First of all, let me start by
22 thanking my colleagues on both sides of the
23 aisle. Let me start also by recognizing the
24 chair of the Finance Committee, Senator Young;
25 the ranker, Senator Krueger, for their consistent

1 work throughout the course of the last several
2 months. To the leadership of the Senate --
3 Senator Flanagan, Senator Klein, Senator
4 Stewart-Cousins -- and also in the Assembly,
5 Assembly Speaker Carl Heastie, and to the
6 Governor's office, for working to put together a
7 budget that finally we're approving here, and not
8 a moment too soon.

9 This budget, I'm voting for it,
10 focuses on a number of issues that are important
11 to the community that I represent and the state
12 as a whole. I think it puts a strong commitment,
13 a continued strong commitment to the people of
14 Western New York with the continuation of the
15 Buffalo Billion, which I'll talk about later.
16 But we all know the momentum that's been created
17 with the initial Buffalo Billion. Now we're
18 seeing the second phase of that go into place.

19 The affordable college tuition plan,
20 which is going to enhance the ability for
21 individuals across the state to achieve higher
22 education; increased funds for direct care
23 professionals, those individuals that are taking
24 care of the most vulnerable in our communities,
25 individuals with disabilities; the Raise the Age

1 initiative; the continued and in some cases
2 enhanced resources for childcare -- there's much
3 to appreciate about this budget.

4 Of course, this budget isn't
5 perfect. And we all know that there are issues
6 in here that we all would like to see enhanced
7 and included -- again, no matter what part of the
8 state we're from and no matter what side of the
9 aisle we're on.

10 But this is a very strong bill. And
11 there's a particular piece of this bill that I'd
12 like to focus on that has a direct impact on the
13 economy in Buffalo and Western New York and
14 specifically upstate, but to the state as a
15 whole, and that's ride sharing.

16 As we've said many times, I'm
17 strongly in favor of enhancing ride sharing,
18 especially in upstate New York but across the
19 state. New York State, with the passage of this
20 bill, becomes the 38th state in the nation to
21 allow ride sharing statewide. We're looking to
22 create, according to industry estimates,
23 13,000 new jobs in upstate, 700 of which will be
24 in Western New York.

25 We're also getting with the times.

1 You know, when you travel in other areas of the
2 state -- namely, New York City -- and the nation
3 and you have access to ride-sharing services like
4 Uber and Lyft, and then you come to upstate
5 New York, whether we're here in Albany or in
6 Buffalo, Syracuse, Rochester or anywhere in
7 between, it's embarrassing that we don't have
8 ride-sharing services yet.

9 This bill changes that. This bill
10 brings our community, our entire state into the
11 21st century. It gives us enhanced
12 transportation alternatives, especially as we are
13 selling our state as a better place to do
14 business and a better place to come and visit.

15 And over the course of time, as
16 people have come into Western New York, Buffalo
17 and Niagara Falls, and seen all the extraordinary
18 places that we sell to the rest of the state, the
19 country, and the world as a tourist destination,
20 and they open up their phone and attempt to get
21 ride-sharing services, and it says because of the
22 lack of volition on the part of the New York
23 State Legislature, we don't have access to ride
24 sharing, that is unacceptable. That is
25 embarrassing.

1 Well, because of this bill today, we
2 are moving forward. We're moving past that. My
3 office has heard overwhelmingly from people in my
4 district that want to see ride-sharing services
5 put in place. Throughout the City of Buffalo and
6 the entire region, people are clamoring for ride
7 sharing.

8 This is an issue of fairness and
9 equity as well. When you go to the great City of
10 New York and you're able to access ride-sharing
11 services like Uber and Lyft, when you're able to
12 raise your hand and hail a cab -- and not just a
13 Yellow Cab, but a black livery cab -- or catch a
14 bus or go underground and catch a train, I often
15 say that the City of New York, much to their
16 credit and much to the credit of leaders in the
17 City of New York's history, the City of New York
18 has mastered the art of moving people.

19 Unfortunately, upstate hasn't met
20 their obligation. And this is a step in the
21 right direction. We still need to do things like
22 improve access to public transportation, enhance
23 public transportation throughout the entire
24 upstate region, focus in on transportation
25 efforts like high-speed rail to move people

1 throughout our state, to take advantage of the
2 extraordinary state that we all live in and love
3 and celebrate no matter, again, where we live.

4 But bringing ride-sharing services
5 is something that is so important and vital to
6 our entire economy across the state. Finally,
7 the people in Buffalo, Western New York, and in
8 upstate New York will have that access that
9 they've been looking forward to.

10 And with that, I'm proudly
11 supporting portion this of the bill,
12 Mr. President. Thank you very much.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Thank
14 you, Senator Kennedy.

15 Senator Parker.

16 SENATOR PARKER: Thank you,
17 Mr. President. On the bill.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
19 Parker on the bill.

20 SENATOR PARKER: First let me begin
21 by thanking all my colleagues in both houses of
22 the Legislature for the important work and of
23 course the staff. We have an incredible staff
24 here in the State of New York, particularly here
25 in the Senate, on both sides of the aisle, that

1 have really done yeoman's work in terms of
2 keeping up with everything and keeping us abreast
3 of all of the important changes and developments
4 kind of moment by moment. And so I certainly
5 want to acknowledge all the hard work that was
6 done on this budget.

7 You know, budgets are very, very
8 difficult because, you know, budgets are
9 ultimately about values, right? They're not
10 really about the numbers, right? It's not so
11 much about the \$160 billion that we are spending
12 here of the people's money, but really what are
13 the values that our various constituencies are
14 sending us to Albany to express? And this year I
15 think that a lot of the values were expressed not
16 so much in the numbers as it was in the policy
17 and programs that were put forth.

18 And I went back and forth on the
19 budget, and particularly this part of the budget
20 that we refer to as, you know, the Big Ugly. Or,
21 as my colleague Senator Rivera says, the Big
22 Abominable. I think I like it, but it doesn't
23 necessarily fall trippingly from the tongue.

24 And so, you know, this omnibus
25 budget bill has a lot to be desired. It forces

1 you to vote for everything or nothing. And
2 certainly that becomes a difficult thing when you
3 have this many various issues piled into one
4 bill.

5 Certainly this budget does a lot of
6 very, very good things, and you've heard some of
7 some of my colleagues talk about some of those
8 things. I'm particularly happy about the work
9 around Vital Brooklyn, which is going to put over
10 a billion dollars over the next two years into
11 Brooklyn neighborhoods, and particularly central
12 Brooklyn, that really needs the help a great
13 deal. I think the big piece of Vital Brooklyn is
14 the coordination that's going to happen around
15 housing and healthcare, education, youth
16 development, resiliency, healthy foods, open
17 spaces, antiviolence. All are going to be
18 coordinated in central Brooklyn.

19 And so I want to thank the Governor
20 for putting that forward, and I'm certainly
21 looking forward to working with his staff to
22 implement the Vital Brooklyn program.

23 We still have a lot to do as it
24 relates to hospitals in the largest county in the
25 state. You know, the One Brooklyn health system

1 is underway, but we certainly need to continue to
2 have maintenance of effort as relates to state
3 support in this safety-net hospital that has
4 collectively probably more indigent and
5 underinsured as well as Medicaid patients in the
6 entire country.

7 And certainly part of that is that
8 we certainly need to maintain our support for
9 Downstate Medical Center, which includes
10 University Hospital, which is woefully
11 underfunded. And I don't think that we do nearly
12 enough -- we do some in this budget, but not
13 nearly enough for that important hospital.

14 You know, we don't yet fund a burn
15 center for Brooklyn. Brooklyn, literally the
16 fourth-largest city in the country, does not have
17 a burn unit. I know you're all stunned too; I
18 can see your shocked faces. Brooklyn, the
19 fourth-largest city in the country, does not have
20 a burn unit. And if, God forbid, somebody is in
21 a fire, has a chemical burn, falls off a
22 motorcycle, you know, is in an industrial
23 accident, they have to travel almost an hour,
24 depending on the traffic, to get access to this
25 critical care. There's no reason for that, not

1 in a \$160 billion budget. And simply what we
2 needed was probably about \$10 million.

3 And so, you know, I went back and
4 forth about whether I was going to vote for this
5 proposal, in part because I really think that we
6 don't nearly do enough as it relates to Raise the
7 Age. And I know there's a -- I know people
8 worked very, very hard on this. But let's
9 understand the context for this, right, and
10 understand how I see this as we talk about the
11 values in the budget.

12 This is not simply about Raise the
13 Age. If you read this entire budget, right, what
14 you get is a narrative about what we think about
15 children. We get a narrative of what we think
16 about poor communities. We get a narrative about
17 what we care about black and Latino communities.
18 Because we're not just simply, essentially, given
19 half a loaf to Raise the Age, but there's a whole
20 narrative and a whole budget of kinda, wanna,
21 sorta do something for these communities, but not
22 really. But, like, we got to do it, but we
23 really, really don't want to do it. Right?

24 And so you're essentially pushing
25 forward a -- you know, a prison-industrial

1 complex by not in fact doing the things that you
2 can do to keep people out of crime and out of
3 prison. We know the things in this day and age
4 that keep people away from crime. We know what
5 they are. And we just say, yeah, we're not going
6 to do it.

7 And so you're either not doing it
8 because you refuse -- that you know but you
9 refuse to do it, or you don't care. And I know a
10 lot of people here, and I know -- I wouldn't
11 believe that they don't care. So maybe they just
12 don't know that we need to provide -- you know,
13 we're doing UPK education, and that's great. In
14 this budget we're providing more education per
15 pupil than any other state in the history of the
16 United States. That's great, but there's still
17 more money that needs to be put into the system.

18 We also have the largest public
19 education system in the country too. So we have
20 to have an apples-to-apples comparison. So it's
21 really difficult to compare to other places when
22 nobody else does what New York City does. That's
23 why we're New York. Right?

24 And so the CFE, right, the Campaign
25 for Fiscal Equity lawsuit, which was settled

1 20 years ago -- and, you know, the number that
2 the judge has said -- Kevin Parker is not making
3 this number up. I'm not even asking AQE to make
4 it up. I'm saying the judge said it's
5 \$7 billion. We haven't gotten to the number yet.
6 Where's the money? Put the money into the
7 budget. New York City is still owed over
8 \$4 billion in Campaign for Fiscal Equity money,
9 period. Put the money in.

10 And so when you don't put the money
11 in, that means children aren't receiving the
12 kinds of resources they need to compete in
13 schools. And so what happens? They drop out.
14 They join gangs. They commit petty crimes. And
15 then, you know, over the summer, they're looking
16 for other things to do, so you want summer youth
17 employment. Oh, but we don't have enough money
18 for summer youth employment. And so once again
19 you're coming up short for the young people
20 particularly in the urban areas of our city.

21 And you know what? And their
22 parents are trying to get things better, but
23 their parents can't get help. Why? Because
24 there's no voter reform, so the parents show up
25 to the voting booth and they can't vote because

1 they've been purged from the rolls. And half
2 their elected officials aren't doing the right
3 things, and we can't do anything about that.
4 Why? Because we've done no ethics reform in this
5 bill.

6 And then furthermore, these same
7 parents, many of them have come from, you know,
8 other places, and they're immigrants. And they
9 have grown-up children here. But you know what,
10 we can't help them envision the American dream.
11 Why? Because in this budget we do no DREAM Act.

12 And on top of that, they're sick,
13 and we have no single payer. They're going to be
14 sicker when the federal government cuts the ACA.

15 And so there's a whole narrative
16 here of half-measures, of not doing all of the
17 things that we need to do to look after
18 communities. And that's what's sad about this
19 budget.

20 And so this young person -- who's
21 had no DREAM Act, had no summer youth job, didn't
22 have enough money in the school to help him or
23 her provide an education, you know, in a
24 community that's underrepresented because there's
25 no ethics reform and no voter rights -- winds up

1 in the criminal justice system.

2 Where we haven't even considered any
3 of the important things that we need to do around
4 decriminalizing, you know, small amounts
5 marijuana. We haven't done anything on bail
6 reform. We haven't done anything on speedy
7 trials. We haven't done anything around, you
8 know, CFE. So God forbid somebody has a mental
9 health break and, you know, they call 911 and the
10 police show up. Now they're either dead or in
11 jail because they had a mental health break,
12 instead of us properly dealing with the mental
13 health needs and creating, you know, crisis
14 intervention teams across the state and
15 particularly in New York City.

16 And so when they now have come into
17 this -- they might even have done something small
18 like, I don't know, jumping a turnstile or, you
19 know, urinating on the street. Not that people
20 should do those things. But now, if they get
21 caught and get a violation, they're in front of a
22 criminal judge. What are we putting people in
23 front of a criminal judge over violations for?
24 That is absolutely absurd.

25 This was real simple, and we made it

1 complicated, as we do here in Albany many times,
2 Mr. President. We -- all we had to simply do was
3 say, we're going to take 16- and 17-year-olds and
4 we're going to treat them just like 15-year-olds.
5 That's all we had to do. Right? All we had to
6 do, and we messed that up. We had one job. We
7 had one job.

8 And so in this half-a-loaf Raise the
9 Age proposal, we're still, you know, not dealing
10 with the issue of the treatment of youthful
11 offenders. Right? We don't extend it to 19- or
12 20-year-olds. We are still doing a 10-year
13 lookback. If we are so concerned about the
14 future of these young people and keeping them out
15 of the criminal justice system long term, why
16 doing a 10-year lookback? This is going to
17 affect their ability to go to school, it's going
18 to affect their ability to get a job, it's going
19 to affect their ability around housing, around
20 credit, around -- essentially, their whole lives.
21 For 10 years.

22 And although I know my colleagues
23 like to come up with these, you know, absurd
24 examples about, you know, a drunk driver, a
25 16-year-old drunk driver, unfortunately, that's

1 not what the statistics say of who are the young
2 people who are entering our criminal justice
3 system as youthful offenders. That's not really
4 what it is. We're talking about, you know, 500
5 kids of probably the 40,000 kids that are
6 affected. Right?

7 The vast majority of the young
8 people affected are nonviolent, most of them
9 very, very low level crimes and violations. And
10 yet we decide to put all of them through the
11 criminal system to begin to have them get used to
12 being institutionalized. And this wouldn't be
13 quite as bad if there was fair application of the
14 law in the State of New York. It is not like,
15 you know, white kids get picked up and sent
16 through the system at the same rate as black and
17 Latino kids. And that's just a fact. That's not
18 even me. Again, check with your attorney
19 general. They keep the numbers on that.

20 Right? And so we have a system
21 that's already unfair and then continues that
22 inequity as we go forward. And we developed a
23 commission. And then half the things that the
24 commission said we should do, we just ignored.
25 And then you want to talk about, oh, we have a

1 state-of-the-art commission, but then we ignore
2 the actual things that the commission said we
3 should do, like having a rehabilitative and
4 transformative model for housing for young
5 people. So we're taking young people still and
6 we're putting them in DOCCS facilities,
7 Department of Corrections facilities. Why? Why?
8 Because we're trying to criminalize them.

9 Instead of all of the violations --
10 and this includes noncriminal offenses and all
11 misdemeanor offenses -- this proposal holds
12 criminally responsible kids who are charged with
13 violations and VTL crimes, but not those who are
14 charged with misdemeanors undefined by the Penal
15 Law.

16 So nonviolent felonies, you know,
17 should automatically start in Family Court. Why
18 aren't we just -- if it's a nonviolent crime, why
19 not just start it in Family Court? I mean, we're
20 wasting money and time and traumatizing young
21 people in ways that are unnecessary, with this
22 proposal.

23 This legislation further does not
24 support the family support centers. Right?
25 These centers certainly would have served to

1 create a respite for families and young people
2 before they got into crisis. In other words, we
3 don't create a dynamic where communities can
4 actually successfully raise young people and then
5 we don't want to provide the support at any level
6 to in fact make sure that these families don't
7 get into crisis and their children don't get into
8 crisis.

9 This is a tough one, because I've
10 heard many of my colleagues say that this is a
11 start, and I believe that it's a start. But I
12 think it was difficult and took almost an act of
13 God on Palm Sunday to bring this to the floor.
14 What is it going to take for us to bring Raise
15 the Age Two to the floor next time? Because
16 that's what we're looking at here. I mean,
17 everybody said, Yeah, it's a good first step.
18 But how many more steps do we have to take? And
19 how long is it going to take to take those steps?
20 That's my concern.

21 And more importantly, how many young
22 people are going to be chewed up in the meat
23 grinder of our criminal justice system and be
24 sacrificed on the altar of incrementalism as we
25 wait for Raise the Age Two?

1 And so I want to thank Senator
2 Montgomery for all her work on this issue. We
3 certainly wouldn't even have taken this first
4 small step if it wasn't for, you know, her
5 intrepid work toiling in the vineyards for the
6 better part of 30 years on issues around criminal
7 justice.

8 And certainly I want to thank our
9 leader Andrea Stewart-Cousins, who many of my
10 colleagues have made the point that had she been
11 in the room, as she should have been, as the
12 majority leader in this body, we certainly would
13 have saw not just a different outcome but a much
14 better outcome on the entire budget, let alone
15 Raise the Age. And maybe that's why, you know,
16 you're trying to keep her out. I don't know.
17 That's a question for -- between you and your
18 God.

19 But certainly I want to thank them
20 for the hard work that they have put forward on
21 behalf of the people of the State of New York,
22 and particularly on behalf of our children.

23 Mr. President, before I sit down,
24 the other issue that's really -- there's tons of
25 things, you know, that we could talk about

1 tonight. But certainly there is nothing more
2 important happening in our state other than the
3 issue around housing. And every place you go,
4 people are talking about housing and homelessness
5 in the City of New York.

6 And I know there's been lots of
7 attempts to do certain things. I know that the
8 Governor has put forward an affordable housing
9 plan around 421-a in this budget. And I'm not
10 against 421-a. I certainly think that an
11 incentive for developers to build affordable
12 housing is a commonsense approach to it.

13 However, if you look at the
14 statistics, you'll see that over the last two
15 years, when we didn't have 421-a, we actually
16 built the same number of units and we had the
17 same number of applications.

18 So -- and then, to put it quite
19 frankly, this 421-a plan is a boondoggle. It is
20 strictly a cash giveaway to developers, period.
21 And it's going to cost -- the old one cost the
22 City of New York \$1.2 billion. This one is going
23 to double that. So we're now talking about
24 around \$2.4 billion from the City of New York to
25 do this.

1 And the estimates say that for every
2 dollar that is spent on affordable housing under
3 421-a that the people and the taxpayers of the
4 City of New York are only receiving 11 cents in
5 affordable housing. And that's what you're
6 asking us to vote on today. And many of us are
7 going to be forced to vote yes because it's right
8 next to a bunch of things that we can't say no
9 to.

10 This -- earlier, when we talked
11 about this program, it was said that essentially
12 housing anywhere is good for housing everywhere
13 and that, you know, when we add more units,
14 right, that that's going to drive the cost of
15 housing down. Not really. It sounds good, and
16 it's basic economics. But this unfortunately is
17 not basic economics.

18 Under this current budget plan, many
19 units will come online around \$2600 a month --
20 \$2600 a month. Most of us couldn't afford that
21 as a mortgage, let alone as rent on a unit. And
22 certainly if my colleagues upstate had their
23 constituents trying to find housing under a plan
24 that would create new units that are supposed to
25 be affordable at \$2600 a unit per month, there

1 would be a rebellion in this body and in Albany.
2 You wouldn't go for it for a minute.

3 Yet here we are being asked to vote
4 on a plan that creates those kind of units. And
5 it's not like you're creating a bunch of them.
6 Right? You're only creating about 2500 units a
7 year. So we're talking about 2500 units a year
8 at \$2600 per unit. This does not help
9 affordability. And, you know, I'm not sure how
10 anybody else is calculating affordability. My
11 constituency -- and I don't represent a poor
12 community. I represent a very, very
13 working-class community, right, where people go
14 to work every single day and there is a fairly
15 high median income. And they could not afford
16 \$2600 a month for a unit.

17 And so here we are, with a half a
18 loaf on Raise the Age and with, you know, an
19 affordable housing unit that is neither
20 affordable nor does it create housing. And
21 furthermore, we are -- we are -- you know, we
22 still have no DREAM Act, we still have no single
23 payer health plan, we still have no ethics
24 reform. There's still no voter rights,
25 Mr. President, no summer youth employment, and

1 still no Campaign for Fiscal Equity money in for
2 education.

3 And so, you know, I'm very, very
4 disappointed at this budget. I think that we had
5 a lot of potential to do a lot more. There's
6 still, again, a great deal of things that I think
7 are good on this -- in this plan, but certainly
8 we have a lot more that we need to do as we go
9 forward.

10 Thank you.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
12 Bailey.

13 SENATOR BAILEY: Thank you,
14 Mr. President.

15 My first budget -- something else.
16 Quite an experience. The process could be much
17 better, and it should be much better. I demand
18 that we look at ourselves and we make it that
19 much better the next go-around. I hope I'll be
20 here for many more budgets, God willing, on this
21 wonderful Palm Sunday.

22 There is some good in this budget,
23 some great things in this budget. The Farm to
24 Food Bank that Senator Funke had produced, that's
25 an amazing thing for upstate and downstate.

1 Education aid, while it's not what we need, more
2 money for our children is an amazing thing.

3 But the things that are not in the
4 budget are problematic. No ethics reform. No
5 voting reform. We talk about -- I spoke about it
6 in a hostile amendment -- get out and vote. How?
7 How, when we suppressed the individuals? How do
8 we do that? How do we make that a reality?

9 But what I want to do is I want to
10 turn it around a little bit. I want to thank
11 everybody in this body, from Senator Young to
12 Senator Krueger, who's not here -- to everybody
13 that worked diligently. And most importantly, as
14 Senator Parker said, the staff who worked through
15 the night to make sure that we were prepared and
16 briefed on such a voluminous amount of paper.
17 And I thank you for that.

18 The vast bulk of my comments are
19 going to be today on Raise the Age. And I
20 indicated that I would not vote on anything,
21 whether it was an extender or a budget, without
22 Raise the Age, and I did not.

23 I want to thank Leader Andrea
24 Stewart-Cousins for guiding the ship. I want to
25 thank Senator Velmanette Montgomery, who was a

1 leader on this issue long before it was a
2 hashtag. And I want to thank Speaker Carl
3 Heastie for making sure that the Assembly took
4 care of their business and making sure that this
5 is what we got.

6 Mr. President, it was once said that
7 a journey of a thousand miles begins with but a
8 single step. And yes, this is a single step,
9 make no mistake about it. This is not a sprint;
10 we're running a marathon here. And we've taken a
11 single step today, raising the age of criminal
12 responsibility -- see, I was very lucky. I was
13 never in trouble as a kid, because I had family
14 to make sure that they guided me along the path.
15 Despite the neighborhood that I grew up in, I was
16 not allowed to be in the street past a
17 streetlight. My mother and my father, my
18 grandparents and my cousins made sure that I was
19 in the house paying attention to the books and
20 not what was outside. Everybody does not have
21 that luxury. This is why we fight.

22 There's so many people that did not
23 get the chance that I did as a child, and their
24 lives are derailed beyond repair. Do you know
25 how demoralizing it is when you come back home

1 from college and you wonder where somebody on
2 your block was, and they've gone away. And you
3 know that they're not about what that was. In
4 street parlance, they would say they're not about
5 that life. But they were forced by being dealt a
6 bad hand into committing these activities at 16
7 and 17 years old. And they got caught in the
8 hamster wheel. Round and around they go.

9 Make no mistake about it. This is
10 not about me or about taking a victory lap around
11 this. This is for the children. This is about
12 who we represent. My perspective is shaped by
13 who I am -- a young black man from the Bronx,
14 New York. Wouldn't have it any other way. But
15 also make no mistake about it, my friends, that
16 I've witnessed the deferral, I've witnessed
17 dreams deferred due to a draconian policy. Hoop
18 dreams halted. Many things in my life that I
19 have seen, people who were never heard from
20 again.

21 But in no way are we black and brown
22 folks the only ones that will benefit from this
23 landmark accomplishment. Let's make that clear,
24 Mr. President. The reality is that Raise the Age
25 was never about protecting those who commit

1 murders or rapes or the most heinous crimes. It
2 was never about that. Let's not confuse it.
3 What it was, it was about making sure that 16-
4 and 17-year-olds are treated like 16- and
5 17-year-olds.

6 You ever been to a high school
7 cafeteria? You going to tell me that those are
8 adults, that their brain development is on the
9 same level as ours? I say no.

10 Studies show, as Senator Persaud
11 alluded to, that time after time, brain
12 development shows that 16- and 17-year-olds do
13 not think the same way that adults do. But 16-
14 and 17-year-olds throughout the state are being
15 affected by something called the opioid crisis,
16 which I'm glad is being addressed in this budget.
17 And rightfully so. My colleagues on both sides
18 of the aisle have been making sure that this is
19 addressed.

20 But, you know, when I grew up, late
21 '80s, early '90s, they didn't call it the opioid
22 crisis. People weren't -- it wasn't a mental
23 health issue, which it rightfully is. They were
24 just called fiends and junkies, and they were
25 being arrested, instead of given the proper

1 mental health treatment that they deserved.

2 These 16-and-17-year-old children --
3 what's happening now in our state, opioid
4 addiction is rampant, and the users are getting
5 younger and younger. From Keene, New York, to
6 Kings County, from the Bronx to Broome County,
7 these are our children. And the reality is if
8 you're looking at the charge of criminal
9 possession of a controlled substance, some
10 heroin, it's a misdemeanor that goes to
11 Family Court. But if it's more weight or just a
12 transaction, if you give a friend some drugs,
13 that will be a nonviolent felony offense and it
14 could be removed from the youth part to
15 Family Court, absent extraordinary circumstances,
16 under this bill. But now, straight to criminal
17 court.

18 Furthermore, burglary and robbery in
19 the second degree are also included. Now, drug
20 addicts commit these crimes too, looking for
21 money to score their next high. So that make no
22 mistake about it, this affects everybody.

23 These children deserve a second
24 chance, Mr. President, whether you're on
25 Rikers Island or in Rochester. Just as much of a

1 chance as Kalief Browder deserved. We can do
2 more with this. And we have to do more, my
3 colleagues and I. We intend to do more. Not for
4 my district, not for your district, but just for
5 our state.

6 And while we're talking about Raise
7 the Age, as Senator Comrie and Kevin Parker,
8 let's talk about raising the wage of these
9 children. No summer youth employment? An idle
10 mind is the devil's playground, my friends. Give
11 a kid a check instead of a book and I'm sure
12 he'll do great things. Give them hope. Give
13 them a chance, the ability to get off of the food
14 stamps.

15 We have to make sure we're funding
16 more things like education and violence
17 interrupters and not just focusing on the
18 criminal justice system. Let's get them away
19 from the criminal justice system before they even
20 get there.

21 Now, Mr. President, I'm going to
22 cool it down a little bit. It's not lost on me,
23 as you said, that today is Palm Sunday. And it's
24 also not lost on my pastor, who I missed at
25 11 o'clock service. And I hope he's okay with me

1 today. But I'm doing the people's work, and
2 God's work, as some would say.

3 My favorite verse in the Bible is
4 Matthew, Verses 7:7-8: "Ask and you shall
5 receive, seek and you will find, knock and the
6 door shall be opened."

7 I want to thank people like Senator
8 Velmanette Montgomery, Andrea Stewart-Cousins,
9 Carl Heastie, and this body for making sure that
10 we asked the people of New York to do the right
11 thing. And today, in part, we have received
12 because we have sought justice. And one day in
13 the future, I'm hopeful we will find it, so that
14 our children will have a new day, enabling them
15 to knock on those doors instead of being locked
16 behind them.

17 I thank you for your time,
18 Mr. President.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Thank
20 you, Senator Bailey.

21 Senator Brooks.

22 SENATOR JACOBS: Thank you,
23 Mr. President. On the bill.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
25 Brooks on the bill.

1 SENATOR BROOKS: This is my first
2 budget here in the State Capitol, but I'm not new
3 to the budget process. I served for many years
4 as director of financial control at GEICO
5 Insurance, where I developed the budget and the
6 business plan for each year.

7 We had an outstanding budget process
8 that got into great detail with the budget and
9 addressed many of the issues we face as a
10 company. We identified opportunities in the
11 business plan and concerns in the business plan
12 which were always addressed in the budget.

13 Tonight we are considering a budget,
14 which I support, that addresses many critical
15 areas in this state and provides funding. I'm
16 happy to see that in terms of educational
17 funding, we've increased the budget by more than
18 a billion dollars, but I think we could have done
19 more. The budget includes \$2.5 billion for water
20 infrastructure improvements and water clarity.
21 We also have \$55 million to help fund some of the
22 day workers at the different institutions in the
23 state.

24 This budget misses some critical
25 problems that we have in this state. Our work is

1 not done after this budget is passed. All across
2 this state, homeowners are struggling because of
3 excessive property taxes.

4 We shouldn't have a situation in
5 this state where a couple who helped to build
6 their community and their home has to sell their
7 home when they retire because their taxes are too
8 high.

9 We shouldn't be in a situation where
10 a young couple looking to buy a home goes out to
11 see a home and comes back and says, We could
12 afford the house, we just couldn't afford the
13 taxes.

14 When this budget is done, we have
15 more work to do to address the tax burden that
16 has been placed on our homeowners across the
17 state.

18 We also failed in this budget to
19 address a problem that has been going on far too
20 long here in Albany, and that involves ethics.
21 It's important that before we end this session,
22 we provide tax relief to the homeowners in this
23 state. That problem has gone on for far too
24 long. I was on the school board in the '90s, and
25 we had that issue. It still hasn't been

1 resolved.

2 And we also have an obligation to
3 the citizens of this state to address ethics with
4 a real and meaningful reform bill.

5 Thank you, Mr. President. I'll be
6 voting aye on this budget.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Thank
8 you, Senator Brooks.

9 Reverend Senator Díaz.

10 SENATOR DÍAZ: Thank you,
11 Mr. President. On the bill.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
13 Díaz on the bill.

14 SENATOR DÍAZ: Before I speak on a
15 the bill, I would like to wish everyone today a
16 very, very happy Palm Day. Today is a day that
17 we Christians celebrate the grand entrance, the
18 day that Jesus went to Jerusalem.

19 But Mr. President and ladies and
20 gentlemen, last week I was an angry man. I was
21 angry last week. This week I'm happy. What?
22 You might say or you might ask, What made you
23 change from an angry person last week to a happy
24 person this week?

25 See, Mr. President and ladies and

1 gentlemen, last week and the week before last,
2 the only thing you heard about, the only thing
3 you heard was Raise the Age. You didn't hear
4 people talking about this and that, and here and
5 there. Everyone was concentrated on Raise the
6 Age.

7 The topic was so important, last
8 week and week before last, that all the
9 Democratic Conference made a commitment. The
10 Assembly made a commitment. The Assembly said,
11 We're not going to vote for anything if there is
12 no Raise the Age. The IDC, the Independent
13 Democratic Conference, said we are not going to
14 vote on anything if there is no Raise the Age.
15 Our conference, the regular Democratic
16 Conference, said we're not voting on anything if
17 there is no Raise the Age.

18 Two years ago, if I'm not mistaken,
19 we saw the same movie here. It was about the
20 DREAM Act: We are not going to vote on anything
21 if there is no DREAM Act. The Governor waited
22 two years ago and waited and waited, and
23 everybody was saying no DREAM Act, we will not
24 vote for anything. At the last minute, the
25 Governor waited till the end and he said, Are you

1 people willing to shut the government down?
2 Everybody said, two years ago, Oh, no, we cannot
3 shut the government.

4 But they were saying, No DREAM Act,
5 no vote. No ticket, no laundry. But when the
6 Governor said, Are you willing to shut the
7 government, everybody said, oh, because the
8 hospitals, oh, because the schools, oh, because
9 the workers. So we bought it, no DREAM Act. Two
10 years later, still no DREAM Act.

11 The people that were saying then, No
12 DREAM Act, no vote, they voted then. I kept my
13 word, and I voted no because there was no DREAM
14 Act.

15 Last week, the Governor used the
16 same methodology again. So all those that were
17 saying how important was the DREAM Act for them,
18 there's nothing -- if there is nothing on it,
19 we're not voting on anything, they changed their
20 mind and they voted.

21 So I was angry. I even didn't go to
22 church last Sunday. I stayed here, waiting and
23 waiting. And I voted no. I kept my word. I
24 kept my word, and I voted my soul. The Bronx
25 borough president on my back: Papi, what are you

1 doing?

2 (Laughter.)

3 SENATOR DÍAZ: Papi, I have been
4 working hard with the Governor, I have been
5 working hard with Jeff Klein, I have been working
6 hard with Carl Heastie, I have been working hard
7 with the leaders. There is something there for
8 the Bronx, even for your district, Papi. What
9 are you doing?

10 I said, "I gave my word because the
11 only thing that was happening here was no Raise
12 the Age, no vote."

13 I was waiting, thinking, making my
14 son, the Bronx borough president, Ruben Díaz,
15 Jr., angry. I was waiting and saying to myself,
16 What are you doing? But within me, I was saying,
17 I gave my word.

18 So today, everybody is
19 congratulating everybody else. I want to
20 congratulate one person: Myself.

21 (Laughter.)

22 SENATOR DÍAZ: I want to
23 congratulate myself, because I kept my word.

24 Today, tonight, I'm listening and
25 I'm hearing the same people, the same people,

1 that were saying how important it was for Raise
2 the Age, that was waiting and commit themselves
3 to vote nothing if no Raise the Age. Today,
4 they're voting no. Even though Raise the Age is
5 in it. Go figure it out. Go figure it out.

6 Today, Raise the Age is not
7 important. Oh, this is not in here, this is not
8 in there, this is not in there. They weren't
9 saying that last week. They weren't saying that
10 last week. They weren't saying that. They were
11 saying: No Raise the Age, no vote. They didn't
12 care about anything else.

13 And I commit myself to that. That's
14 why I'm congratulating myself.

15 Why from last week an angry man to a
16 happy man tonight? I am the ranking member in
17 the Aging Committee. There was language there
18 that was threatening to take away money from
19 Title XX and close 65 senior centers in the city
20 and affect 6,000 senior citizens. I knew that
21 was happening, but I commit myself because
22 everybody -- all the conference, all the
23 community leaders -- it was Raise the Age, Raise
24 the Age, Raise the Age. That was what happened.
25 That was the only thing that was happening last

1 week, Raise the Age, Raise the Age.

2 Tonight, 65 senior centers in the
3 City of New York are safe. The language has been
4 changed, the 6,000 senior citizens are protected.
5 So I'm happy. I'm a happy man. Thank you to all
6 of you, thank you to the Governor, thank you to
7 Jeff Klein, thank you to my conference leader,
8 Andrea Stewart-Cousins, thank you to everybody.
9 Thank you, all of you. What else is here that I
10 was willing to sacrifice because I gave my word?

11 And some have been working with the
12 Governor and with the leaders to get, in my
13 district -- in my district, the 32nd Senatorial
14 District -- \$1.8 billion, \$1.8 billion for
15 something called the Sheridan Expressway. The
16 Governor has said he's so interested in working
17 with my son and with the leaders to help the
18 Bronx, especially my district.

19 What else is here tonight that I was
20 willing, last week, because I gave my word --
21 look, I'm telling you, ladies and gentlemen, when
22 you give your word, look at what you will do.
23 Look what you have to do when you give your word.

24 There is also 1.8 million -- not
25 billion, \$1.8 million for Kingsbridge Armory in

1 the Bronx. My son been working with everybody,
2 fighting for that. But finally the Governor
3 commit himself with \$1.8 million for the
4 Kingsbridge Armory. Maybe the mayor of the City
5 of New York will not hand them the key, but
6 that's not the problem of the Governor and that's
7 not the problem of the ones working with my son.
8 That's a local issue. If the mayor doesn't want
9 to hand them the key, that's the mayor's problem
10 and another issue.

11 But here there are \$1.8 million for
12 Kingsbridge Armory. I gave my word last week --
13 I was nervous, I was angry. Ladies and
14 gentlemen, look, when you ask me to give my word
15 and when you leaders ask me to commit myself to
16 something, look at what you're doing. Don't ask
17 your members to commit themselves because then
18 you will violate the statement or the issue and
19 leave your members hanging out, putting the rope
20 on their neck. Because you want to be part of a
21 team, because you want to be part of a group, you
22 want to be part -- and keep your word.

23 My son. The borough -- no, no,
24 don't push me, I'm talking on the bill. Everyone
25 took that time, Mr. President. And I -- today

1 you know what I did today, today, Palm Day? I
2 preached today. I didn't preach last Sunday, I
3 was waiting here. Today I preach.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
5 Díaz, no one is pushing you. You may continue.

6 SENATOR DÍAZ: Thank you, sir. I
7 love you for that.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: I don't
9 know if we share that love, but --

10 (Laughter.)

11 SENATOR DÍAZ: But I ran from the
12 church. From church, I ran today here. Because
13 today also there is money for Orchard Beach in
14 the Bronx, Orchard Beach. So if anyone of you
15 has to be happy, it's me.

16 But I was willing to sacrifice,
17 because I gave my word last week. Tonight I'm a
18 happy man. And not only that, tonight we see the
19 Raise the Age. So if we got 65 senior centers
20 saved in the city, if we have \$1.8 billion for
21 the Sheridan Expressway in the 32nd Senatorial
22 District in the Bronx, if we have \$1.8 million
23 for Cambridge Armory, if we have money for
24 Orchard Beach in the Bronx, and we have Raise the
25 Age, I'm safe. I'm a happy man.

1 So to all of you, thank you very
2 much. To the Governor, my friend the Governor --
3 no, no, sir, we're not friends. No friend. But
4 to the Governor, thank you, Mr. Governor. Thank
5 you for the interest that you are taking in the
6 Bronx. Thank you for all the things that you
7 have been doing in the Bronx and helping the
8 borough president, the Bronx president, to better
9 the Bronx. I have to be grateful for that.

10 And I thank the Governor and I thank
11 all of you for all this -- that we don't know
12 where the money is? It's here. Where?
13 Somewhere. The money is here. So I've got to be
14 happy tonight because I am keeping my word. No
15 Raise the Age -- and I was willing, if there was
16 no Raise the Age, tonight I would be voting no.
17 Even with all those things for the Bronx. If
18 there would not be Raise the Age tonight, ladies
19 and gentlemen, I would be voting no, with all
20 these things for the Bronx for my district,
21 because I gave my word.

22 But there is Raise the Age here.
23 Thanks to God, thanks to all of you that
24 negotiated this budget, there are things that we
25 all desire to be there. There are more things

1 that we desire to be there, there are more things
2 that we would like to be there, but that was not
3 the point last week. The point last week was
4 Raise the Age.

5 People yelling in the hallway,
6 people yelling in the street, people picketing in
7 the offices, picketing in the city, people were
8 going there, the lobbyists, the everybody -- the
9 supporters, everybody was Raise the Age, Raise
10 the Age, Raise the Age. I don't want to -- I
11 will -- I don't want to hear anymore people
12 telling here, why we don't get what we want. You
13 got Raise the Age. That was -- that's what you
14 wanted. That's what we wanted. It's never the
15 way you want, it's never how much you want it.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
17 DeFrancisco, why do you rise?

18 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: I wonder
19 whether Senator Díaz would yield to a question.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
21 Díaz, do you yield for a question.

22 SENATOR DÍAZ: I don't want to
23 yield because of you. I don't want to --

24 (Laughter.)

25 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: It's going to

1 be a nice question.

2 SENATOR DÍAZ: I -- when I finish.

3 When I finish.

4 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: It's going to

5 be a --

6 SENATOR DÍAZ: When I finish. Let

7 me -- don't -- don't -- don't cut my inspiration.

8 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: But you've

9 repeated yourself at least 20 times --

10 SENATOR DÍAZ: Thank you. Thank

11 you.

12 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: And there's

13 others who would like to speak.

14 SENATOR DÍAZ: Thank you. And it

15 bothers you, right?

16 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: It bothers me

17 because there are other people that would like to

18 speak --

19 SENATOR DÍAZ: No.

20 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: -- and we

21 would appreciate your courtesy --

22 SENATOR DÍAZ: No, huh-unh.

23 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: -- appreciate

24 your courtesy.

25 SENATOR DÍAZ: Huh-unh. No

1 question. I have the floor, and because I have
2 the floor -- I know it bothers you. And I'm
3 repeating myself purposely. I'm doing it
4 purposely because you committed -- people that
5 commit themselves, they gave their word.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
7 Díaz, let's respect the decorum of the house.

8 SENATOR DÍAZ: I am decorum --

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: We've
10 given you ample opportunity. You actually have
11 exceeded the debate rule time right now. We're
12 exercising flexibility.

13 SENATOR DÍAZ: Oh.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: So be
15 conscientious.

16 SENATOR DÍAZ: Oh, now I've
17 violated the rules? Now I've violated --

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
19 Díaz, blessed are the peacemakers, for they shall
20 be called the children of God.

21 (Laughter.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Continue.

23 SENATOR DÍAZ: Thank you very much.
24 But today I'm a happy man. You made me -- you
25 kept me here last Sunday. You kept me here the

1 whole week for the Raise the Age. I'm going to
2 repeat myself. You kept me here. I didn't go to
3 church last week. And I ran today. You kept me
4 here.

5 So today, yeah, ho, ho, ho, ho.
6 Maybe you -- maybe -- maybe, Senator DeFrancisco,
7 maybe this will be the last time you hear me
8 here. Who knows? Maybe some other pastures.

9 But tonight, I want to express to
10 all of you -- and I'm going to repeat myself
11 again -- when you give your word, you keep your
12 word. And that's why, out there, people don't
13 trust politicians. That's why out there people
14 don't believe in us. That's why people out there
15 say that we are all liars, because we don't keep
16 our word. And I want to keep repeating and
17 repeating and repeating and repeating that I kept
18 my word. And I congratulate myself tonight.

19 Ladies and gentlemen, thank you very
20 much. Senator Jeff Klein, thank you for whatever
21 you did for this money. Senator Stewart-Cousins,
22 thank you for keeping our conference strong.
23 Thank you, Senator Flanagan, for whatever you did
24 in the budget. Thank you, all of you. And thank
25 you, myself. Thank you, Mr. President.

1 Ah, and Mr. President, thank you for
2 the cross that you gave me today. Thank you.
3 Today is the grand entrance, and I'm doing my
4 grand entrance here today.

5 Thank you very much. Maybe I'm
6 doing my grand exit. Who knows. Thank you very
7 much.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: God bless
9 you, Senator Díaz.

10 Senator Sanders.

11 SENATOR SANDERS: On the bill,
12 Mr. President.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
14 Sanders on the bill.

15 SENATOR SANDERS: It is Palm
16 Sunday, and I just want to put a serious note in,
17 a note that reflects the brevity -- the brevity,
18 hmm -- gravity that we need to have at a time
19 like this.

20 In Egypt today a suicide bomber blew
21 himself up, killing 44 people who were in a
22 Christian church there. We need to remember that
23 we are in a whole world here, and we need to do
24 something about it.

25 When I think of this bill, I am --

1 there are good things in it, there are things
2 that need to be watched. And the 421-a plan, of
3 course, comes to mind immediately. The first
4 thing that you think of when you think of it is
5 who created this. And then when you realize who
6 has created it, you smile and you say, I see.

7 The 421-a plan, as we're about to
8 vote on, is a tragedy in the making. It's going
9 to cost \$2.4 billion in forgone taxes for
10 New York City. And what do we get for this, for
11 this affordable housing component? After
12 \$2.4 billion, we are going to get 2,400 new
13 affordable units per year. Many of these units
14 will come online only to go offline, meaning that
15 as soon as we purchase them, we -- we, the people
16 of New York, New York City in particular -- are
17 going to purchase these units and as soon as one
18 person moves out, many of them will no longer be
19 affordable because they're going to come in so
20 close to the age of where they lose their
21 affordability. So we can argue if that's a good
22 deal.

23 Yet let's look at it a different
24 way. Under the program, the cost for creating
25 these affordable apartments are approximately

1 \$600,000 a unit. My friends, \$600,000 a unit for
2 one apartment. We could buy two homes, good
3 homes, for people at that price. And forget all
4 the paperwork. Six hundred thousand dollars a
5 unit.

6 I have many concerns about this
7 budget. You can look into them. You can look to
8 how the Excelsior Scholarship works poorly for
9 poor students. The effects of the looming
10 federal cuts to the budget, we're not spending
11 enough time there. The lack of MWBE in this
12 budget. New York City needs design-build badly;
13 we're not going to have it. CUNY tuition is
14 going up here -- and SUNY, I believe. The lack
15 of ethics reforms. My friends, we cannot forget
16 these things. The lack of help for my local
17 hospitals.

18 Yet there is a -- perhaps a glimmer
19 of hope here. And that of course is the rage --
20 it should be rage -- the Raise the Age portion of
21 this bill, which seeks to address an egregious
22 wrong. And that wrong of course is that children
23 16 and 17 are put into prisons with adults.
24 Everyone knows that there's a lot of abuse taking
25 place with these children. We should name it and

1 say that some of these children are being raped.
2 And yet we're not going to do much about it --
3 until now.

4 Now that we say we're going to do
5 some things about it, we should remember some of
6 the people who -- at least one of the persons
7 who, I guess in his own way, had to die to make
8 us get to this point: Mr. Browder, who comes
9 from the Bronx, an example of why we should never
10 have had this policy in the first place.

11 This bill is not what it should have
12 been. And if the Senate Democrats had been in
13 the room -- that still three men in a room
14 business, it's going to cause us more trouble
15 than it's worth. If the Senate Democrats had
16 been in the room, we would have a far better bill
17 than we have now.

18 Yet success has a hundred fathers,
19 and failure is an orphan. Everyone is going to
20 claim success here for the few steps that we have
21 taken forward on here. I just want to thank
22 three folks here -- well, actually I'm going to
23 do four. I of course have to thank Senator
24 Velmanette, our Senator, a stalwart who just
25 fought and just would not let this go. Year

1 after year after year, wouldn't let it go, even
2 when everyone believed that it was ridiculous and
3 laughed. And year and year, hearing no but going
4 forward anyway. Hard core.

5 I want to of course thank Senator
6 Stewart-Cousins. It takes courage to sit where
7 you're sitting. It takes courage to say, You
8 know what, although we are not respected as we
9 should, this conference, we are going to carry
10 ourselves in a respectful fashion and move
11 forward. I thank your leadership.

12 Speaker Heastie bet the house on it.
13 Stated publicly three or four times, not going to
14 do it unless we have it in it. To his credit,
15 under a lot of obstacles, he saw it, he carried
16 it through.

17 But last but never least, I want to
18 thank everybody in this house. Many people had
19 to do -- made an incredible journey. Started out
20 at one place, ended up at another place. It's
21 called growth. Sometimes it's painful. They
22 made an incredible journey to say: You know
23 what, I can make some counterarguments, but at
24 the end of the day there's a certain amount of
25 truth in the argument that 16- and 17-year-olds

1 shouldn't be there -- and you know what, although
2 I have trepidation, I'm going to vote for it.

3 So I want to thank everyone in this
4 house for wherever you started to get us to where
5 we are now. Again, this bill is not perfect.
6 And indeed, this whole Big Ugly is not perfect.
7 However, it is something that the people of
8 New York can find, somewhere in there, something
9 good for their community.

10 And I thank you for that,
11 Mr. President.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Thank
13 you, Senator Sanders.

14 Senator Peralta.

15 SENATOR PERALTA: Thank you,
16 Mr. President.

17 Looking around this chamber today, I
18 can safely say that this year's budget has been a
19 long and difficult process. But the good news is
20 that we're here and we're almost done. I hope.

21 I want to take this opportunity to
22 thank Senator Klein for his efforts in making
23 this budget a reality. I also want to thank all
24 of the IDC staff for working around the clock for
25 making this happen. At the end of the day, I

1 believe that this is a budget that we should all
2 be proud of, even though we didn't get everything
3 we wanted out of it.

4 And I know although some of my
5 colleagues have picked the budget bills apart,
6 and even voted against some of them, I'm pretty
7 sure that even they will promote this budget in
8 their newsletters and their social media posts
9 and anywhere that they can take credit for
10 something that's good in this budget -- although
11 some have only been playing politics.

12 But this is a progressive budget. I
13 want to take talk about my priorities. Anyone
14 who knows me knows that my priority has always
15 been to protect and enrich immigrants and
16 immigrant lives across New York, whether it's
17 through social services, language services,
18 educational or legal services.

19 And from that comes my priority with
20 the DREAM Act. As you know, the DREAM Act is my
21 bill. It's my issue. And frankly, I get
22 insulted any time anyone suggests that it's not
23 my priority. That's why I was glad and thankful
24 to Senator Klein and my conference for working
25 with me to include the dream in the IDC's

1 one-house budget resolution this year, which was
2 brought to the floor for the first time in years.
3 We did that. The IDC did that. Even though some
4 were told not to vote for it.

5 And while I'm disappointed it's not
6 in the final budget, I have to stress the overall
7 priorities involved with helping immigrants
8 within this budget. I'm proud to say that the
9 IDC has secured \$10 million in funding for
10 immigrant legal defense services. Not one
11 million, not two million, but \$10 million which
12 will take this administration head-on in
13 preserving communities of immigrants that are at
14 the core, the fabric of New York State.

15 I want to thank Governor Cuomo for
16 acknowledging that Senator Klein and the IDC made
17 this a priority. Simply put, this funding will
18 protect people who are at risk of being
19 deporting, some for the simple reason of just
20 jumping a turnstile. This funding will keep
21 people here where they, with their families, no
22 matter what some may say to the contrary.

23 Because, my friends, there can be no
24 dream without dreamers. If Dreamers are getting
25 deported or if their parents are getting

1 deported, then what's the point?

2 My colleagues, we're also
3 establishing a real criminal justice reform by
4 finally passing the Raise the Age right in
5 New York State. There was some misinformation
6 that was given earlier today, and I pointed it
7 out to him. But the IDC has continued to push
8 for it, and now it will mean the end of 16- and
9 17-year-olds across the state having their lives
10 ruined by being prosecuted as an adult.

11 And again, I want to thank Governor
12 Cuomo for pointing out that the Raise the Age
13 would not have happened without the IDC and
14 Senator Jeff Klein.

15 We're also moving to make college
16 affordability a reality in New York State,
17 establishing the Excelsior Scholarship Program,
18 which means free tuition at SUNY and CUNY schools
19 across the state. This program will allow
20 household income eligibility to phase up to
21 \$125,000 within the next three years.

22 In this budget we're also refusing
23 to turn our backs on public education and our
24 school kids by providing money that's owed to
25 them. I'm glad that we're moving forward with

1 another IDC priority, adding \$700 million over
2 the last year's allocation for Foundation Aid,
3 for a total level of funding this year that
4 exceeds \$1.1 billion, as the first down payment
5 of what is owed to our kids through the Campaign
6 for Fiscal Equity.

7 Now, based on the millions that is
8 owed to my school districts alone, and assuming
9 that these funds are divided equally by the city,
10 this means that my school districts should
11 receive about \$18 million this fiscal year. Now,
12 that will go a long way to help the children that
13 I represent succeed during these tough and
14 unpredictable economic times.

15 My colleagues, this is real money,
16 real change for real school students who are
17 depending on us to ensure that they are receiving
18 the best education possible.

19 Again, I would like to thank Senator
20 Klein for his leadership throughout this process,
21 as well as all my colleagues in the IDC for their
22 hard work and determination.

23 In the end, there's much left for us
24 to do in the coming months, and I'm glad that
25 there are still several months left -- not just

1 so that we can pass the DREAM Act, but also to
2 create strong homelessness reform and protect
3 New Yorkers from ongoing wage theft. I know that
4 I'll be fighting hard to push for these issues,
5 and I know so will my IDC colleagues, regardless
6 of, to quote one of my colleagues in the
7 Assembly, the politricks that's been played in
8 this chamber by some of my Democratic colleagues.

9 I love the theater tonight, I really
10 do. Hostile amendments left and right, Planned
11 Parenthood, single payer, ethics reform. But
12 what's not being said is that you're not actually
13 voting on the substance, but you're actually on a
14 procedure. That's being left out.

15 I love the politics, and I love the
16 theater. But it's about making sure that we did
17 the right thing. And to Senator Díaz's point,
18 those who were standing in conference and said
19 that you wouldn't vote for anything that didn't
20 have Raise the Age, that's what you wanted --
21 well, here it is. I hope you keep your word.

22 Thank you, Mr. President.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
24 Hamilton.

25 SENATOR HAMILTON: Thank you,

1 Mr. President. On the bill.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
3 Hamilton on the bill.

4 SENATOR HAMILTON: Raise the Age
5 brings an end of a practice of traumatizing
6 children and calling that justice. We bring to
7 an end a time when our state permits
8 unscientific, uninformed, and unjust treatment of
9 our youth. We end a chapter of cruelty, and we
10 begin a chapter of compassion and common sense in
11 our justice system.

12 Cruelty because of the agony
13 inflicted on youth, their families, and New York
14 communities. A system that yields 36 times a
15 higher likelihood of suicide is cruel. A system
16 that puts children at high risk for rape and
17 brutalization by adults is cruel. A system that
18 leaves no room for redemption but accepts
19 recidivism is cruel.

20 Today we make way for more
21 compassion and common sense in our justice
22 system. Compassion becomes the truth about our
23 common humanity and our common frailty, and the
24 fact that young people -- really, all people --
25 make mistakes. We know young people with their

1 whole lives ahead of them can be put on a path to
2 being productive New Yorkers. That is common
3 sense.

4 I cast my vote for Lywan Reed, a
5 Brooklynite who bravely testified at our Raise
6 the Age hearing, sharing his personal story of
7 being impacted by this. I cast my vote for
8 Kalief Browder and the memories of those that
9 lost their lives. I cast my vote for the
10 30,000 New Yorkers each year who will have the
11 opportunity to atone for their mistakes and
12 pursue their dreams. I cast my vote for the 150
13 16- and 17-year-olds on Rikers Island who deserve
14 a home, not a cage.

15 Moving our youth off Rikers Island
16 in a year was my priority, and I'm proud to say
17 that this is getting done. I cast my vote for my
18 staffer who was incarcerated at the age of 16.
19 He persevered by receiving a master's degree from
20 Columbia University, and he is now working, with
21 my office staff, with ex-offenders coping with
22 mental issues.

23 Raise the Age is the beginning of a
24 chapter of increased compassion and common sense,
25 and not just a system. When 95 percent of the

1 people jailed on Rikers Island are black or
2 brown, confined because most cannot afford to
3 make bail, when nearly 20,000 16- and
4 17-year-olds are arrested for turnstile jumping,
5 there remains room for justice reform.

6 As policymakers, as advocates, as
7 New Yorkers, we must continue to strive for more
8 "just" in our justice system. That means ending
9 broken windows policies, repairing police
10 community relations where they have frayed, and
11 increasing confidence across communities in
12 New York and not just the system.

13 I cast my vote alongside my
14 colleagues who have worked for this day for
15 years. First and foremost, my fellow colleague
16 from Kings County, the largest county in the
17 State of New York, 2.6 million people, State
18 Senator Velmanette Montgomery, who has been a
19 tireless advocate for Raise the Age for over a
20 decade. God bless her for her insight, God bless
21 her for sticking to her morals, and God bless her
22 for sticking up for our children.

23 Thanks to Governor Cuomo, Senator
24 Flanagan, Senator Andrea Stewart-Cousins, Speaker
25 Heastie, and to Jeff Klein, who agreed to make

1 this a top priority this legislative session.
2 And thanks to my Independent Democratic
3 Conference colleagues, who have joined me in
4 prioritizing Raise the Age. Thanks to my
5 Brooklyn Assembly colleagues, Assemblyman Nick
6 Perry and Assemblywomen Diana Richardson, Latrice
7 Walker, and Rodneyse Bichotte. Thanks to all the
8 advocates and organizations who were critical in
9 making this vote possible, like the NAACP, the
10 Citizens' Committee for Children of New York, and
11 youth representatives in hundreds of groups
12 across the state who have been advocating for
13 Raise the Age for years. And thanks for many
14 activities, including Jim St. Germain, Tamika
15 Mallory, and countless more from around New York
16 and around the country.

17 As a new Senator, I readily vote for
18 the Big Ugly. I think certain issues should be
19 separated and voted on by themselves -- for
20 instance, 421-a. We're spending a lot of money
21 on 421-a, billions of dollars. But in my
22 community, I have the highest amount of evictions
23 rates in my district. We have 60,000 homeless
24 people in New York City, many of them children.

25 But let's not forget, 30 percent of

1 homeless people work every day. They get up,
2 they go to work, but they can't afford the rents.
3 So 421-a may be a good tool for construction, but
4 people in my community are seeing buildings being
5 built and when they apply for them, they can't
6 afford to live there. If you make minimum wage,
7 you only make \$2100 a month. The average rent
8 for a two-bedroom now is \$1800 a month. Shelters
9 should not be the new form of affordable housing.

10 In my community now, we're fighting,
11 we're protesting because the City of New York
12 spent \$43 million to build a shelter where a
13 three-bedroom apartment is only 750 square feet.
14 But with city-owned land, the Bedford Armory, we
15 could only get 7 percent truly affordable
16 housing. And so when we say affordable housing,
17 we always say affordable for whom?

18 I want to praise Governor Cuomo for
19 bringing \$1.4 billion into central Brooklyn for
20 Vital Brooklyn. It's similar to what we're doing
21 with the campus. My first year as a Senator, we
22 started the campus. Now we have 59
23 community-based organizations. And we look at
24 technology, coding, STEM. We have anti-gang
25 violence. We have a community as far as getting

1 jobs for people, and we have wellness, with
2 psychiatrists, psychologists, or social workers.
3 The number-two leading cause of death for people
4 15 to 35 years old is suicide, and we're not
5 addressing that.

6 Right now with the coding in our
7 schools, our young men and women are going to
8 their friends and saying, Hey, coding is cool. I
9 like coding. Their friends are going to their
10 schools and telling their teachers, Why can't we
11 code? Now teachers are telling their principals,
12 Why don't we have coding in our schools, or
13 technology? That's where the jobs are at. And
14 now principals are calling my office where they
15 said, We want coding in our schools.

16 You can make \$80,000 a year with a
17 high school diploma if you're certified in
18 coding. So why aren't our schools giving our
19 kids the skill sets to make that happen?

20 So I just want to say no bill is a
21 utopian bill. And the ceiling aspect of it, when
22 we conferenced with the Governor, Senators Lanza,
23 Cathy Young and Gallivan, I said, Why can't we
24 have an appeal process where if a person is
25 turning their life around, why are we waiting

1 10 years?

2 So I don't vote on the Big Ugly, and
3 I never have. But Raise the Age is going to
4 change many of our young New Yorkers' lives. And
5 so I have to say for the young man, Rysheen
6 Ervin, who was shot in front of me at our first
7 campus meeting -- and he didn't die because -- he
8 died because he didn't get the service that he
9 needed.

10 And so for all the young men and
11 women in Brownsville who are living in NYCHA
12 housing where I grew up at, I say there is hope.
13 We do have a future. Is this the best we can
14 offer? Maybe, maybe not. But it's a step in the
15 right direction.

16 Mr. President, I vote yes on this
17 bill.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Seeing
19 and hearing no other Senator that wishes to be
20 heard, debate is closed and the Secretary will
21 ring the bell.

22 The Secretary will read the last
23 section.

24 We will have explanation of votes,
25 so I will try to remind the members of the

1 chamber to try to exercise restraint and keep
2 within the two-minute rule that we have to
3 explain votes, please.

4 The Secretary will read.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
11 Alcantara to explain her vote.

12 SENATOR ALCANTARA: Thank you,
13 Mr. President. I will be voting in the
14 affirmative.

15 Like my colleague stated, this
16 budget is not perfect. 421-a doesn't address the
17 housing needs in poor communities, communities of
18 color in the City of New York. But in that --
19 421-a, after three years, we as elected officials
20 have an opportunity for the first time to take a
21 look before the bill -- before it expires to see
22 and study the amount of affordable housing that
23 has been created. And in that three-year period,
24 we have the opportunity of saying no, we cannot
25 continue 421-a.

1 But one thing that I'm really
2 excited about this bill is the \$10 million for
3 immigrant communities. A lot of us said it's not
4 enough. Tell that to Angela Fernandez, from the
5 Northern Manhattan Immigration Coalition, that
6 when she heard the news, she said, "This is a
7 life-saving opportunity." This is an
8 organization that normally has a \$300,000 budget.
9 Now they have a million dollars to handle cases
10 of immigrants.

11 I'm an immigrant from the Dominican
12 Republic; I represent Washington Heights. It has
13 one of the largest immigrant groups in this
14 neighborhood. And for a lot of people, this
15 isn't enough. For people in my neighborhood,
16 this is life-saving. For immigrants, the fact
17 that orders of protection are going to be
18 translated in the top three languages in whatever
19 county that it's spoken, this is something big.

20 For immigrants, the fact that
21 Latinos have the highest rate of suicide, and we
22 have money in the budget to do suicide prevention
23 in the Latino community, for us, this is a big
24 deal.

25 For families like one of -- my

1 director of operations, her husband is a police
2 officer and they have three kids. And this is
3 what she said to me: "I am not going to move out
4 of New York, because my kid is going to be able
5 to go to college for free." This is a police
6 officer, a public servant that puts his life on
7 the street every day.

8 And because of that, thousands of
9 New Yorkers, immigrants and nonimmigrants, will
10 be able to get a college education, and that's
11 why I'm voting for the bill.

12 Last and not least, safety net --
13 \$12 million for safety-net hospitals.
14 Hospitals -- let me remind everybody that both
15 the Assembly and the Senate passed the safety-net
16 bill, and it's our Governor who has not signed
17 it. For the first time, 1199, NYSUT, CWA are
18 happy, because at least we have \$12 million to
19 work with for our most vulnerable hospitals.

20 Last but not least, Raise the Age.
21 Tell that to the 30,000 black and brown kids who
22 are not going to be in Rikers by 2018, that this
23 is not good enough. Tell that to other
24 juveniles that are going to be going to Family
25 Court and getting mental health services, that

1 this is not good enough.

2 Last but not least, you know, I want
3 to thank Senator Montgomery and Senator Díaz, one
4 of the two people in here that have not played
5 politics with this.

6 Senator Lanza, thank you for all the
7 work you did and sat down in the lounge and
8 explained to us how this is going to work.
9 Senator Gallivan, thank you for your efforts, and
10 the rest of my colleagues.

11 But let's be honest, guys. There's
12 30-something Democrats. Alone, we could have not
13 done this. So we want to be the boogeyman and
14 stepping around. And I want to thank Jeff Klein.
15 I want to thank you because without you, this
16 would have not been done. And we as human beings
17 need to be learn to be grateful.

18 And I know that, you know, oh, my
19 God, why would you want to thank somebody in the
20 IDC.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
22 DeFrancisco --

23 SENATOR ALCANTARA: But please,
24 without Senator Klein and members of the IDC and,
25 yes, Carl Heastie --

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
2 DeFrancisco, why do you rise?

3 SENATOR ALCANTARA: -- this would
4 have never --

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
6 DeFrancisco, why do you rise?

7 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: I just wanted
8 to know if two minutes was up yet, that's all.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
10 Alcantara, could you please conclude.

11 SENATOR ALCANTARA: Yes, thank you.
12 I want to thank all my colleagues that worked
13 with all of us on this. I know this was not an
14 easy issue for some of my colleagues upstate, but
15 we are grateful.

16 And yet this is not a perfect
17 budget, but we still have time this year and the
18 rest of next year to put and work on the things
19 that we want to do. Thank you, all my
20 colleagues. Thank you, the staff of the IDC.
21 You guys are awesome. Until 3 o'clock in the
22 morning, working to help us get this done. Thank
23 you.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: How do
25 you vote? How do you vote?

1 SENATOR ALCANTARA: Sí, sí, sí.

2 Yes.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
4 Alcantara, sí.

5 Senator LaValle to explain his vote.

6 SENATOR LaVALLE: Thank you,
7 Mr. President.

8 This has been a year for higher
9 education. The Governor has used his megaphone
10 to say I'm putting some money on the table, and
11 higher education is important.

12 But each and every member here
13 should take great pride in knowing that college
14 affordability has been critically important to
15 this chamber. We have, depending on the number,
16 150,000, 180,000 students who are receiving an
17 affordable education.

18 One of the things that we did in
19 this budget is maintenance of effort, which means
20 for the first time we're putting money forward to
21 fund our higher education State University, City
22 University system.

23 And when the Governor offered his
24 program, he also offered a \$250 increase in
25 tuition at both the State University and the City

1 University. And I know the State University
2 lobbied very heavily for that additional tuition.
3 It started at \$250 for five years; we got it down
4 to \$200 for four years.

5 But one of the things that SUNY has
6 said to me for years is that just allow us,
7 whatever the tuition is, up to -- and, you know,
8 we won't necessarily go to that high tuition.
9 Leave it to us.

10 And so tonight, Mr. President, I
11 offer a challenge to the State University and the
12 City University to use their power to not go to
13 the 200. They can phase it in -- 50, 100, 175,
14 200 -- over four years. Or they can choose
15 whatever number over the four years, but under
16 \$200.

17 That is the challenge that I offer,
18 and I hope each member here will challenge them
19 to put their money where their mouth has been.

20 I vote aye.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
22 LaValle to be recorded in the affirmative.

23 Senator Dilan to explain his vote.

24 SENATOR DILAN: Mr. President, I
25 rise to explain my vote.

1 And colleagues, we all know that
2 this measure will pass today, and the good and
3 the bad components will become law. This bill
4 has ride sharing for upstate communities that
5 need and want it. However, there is no language
6 to address accessibility for the disabled.

7 And we missed the opportunity to
8 drive needed funds for upstate infrastructure.
9 Raise the Age is included, but it did not work
10 for true raising of the age. We make attending
11 college in New York more affordable, but we do
12 nothing to address growing student debt.

13 We have allocated \$2.5 billion for
14 clean water infrastructure, but there is no
15 details on New York City Housing Authority
16 funding, our largest housing infrastructure. I
17 have 22 New York City Housing Authority
18 developments within my district. This past
19 Sunday, 200 residents called for basic repairs.
20 They need roofs, elevators, mailboxes, windows
21 and other miscellaneous items fixed in their
22 developments. The feds are already cutting
23 funding, and yet we do nothing. One of every
24 four people in New York City resides in NYCHA
25 developments, and I cannot tell them help is on

1 its way in this bill.

2 There's money for transportation
3 infrastructure. I hear every day from
4 constituents about overcrowding, delays, track
5 failures -- and yet this budget sweeps
6 \$65 million from the MTA. I have already
7 expressed my thoughts with a 421-a resurrection
8 that lacks reforms.

9 Colleagues, we are being asked to
10 take an up-or-down vote on too many unrelated and
11 incredibly important issues. I am aware that
12 governance is about compromise, coming to an
13 agreement, but I cannot in good conscience vote
14 for this budget, so I vote no.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
16 Dilan to be recorded in the negative.

17 Senator Savino to explain her vote.

18 SENATOR SAVINO: Thank you,
19 Mr. President. I will try and be as brief as
20 possible and do it within the two minutes
21 allotted.

22 I plan on voting in the affirmative
23 on this bill for a lot of reasons. There's a lot
24 of very good things in this bill, and you've
25 heard many people talk about them tonight --

1 record education aid, finally recognizing the
2 value of our human service workforce, putting
3 real money behind that, money for immigrant legal
4 services, \$200 million for NYCHA. I could go on
5 and on. Foreclosure prevention services.
6 Runaway homeless youth, we're raising the age to
7 age 25. That's not the only raise the age.
8 There are so many good things.

9 But I would be remiss if I did not
10 say the reason I'm voting for this bill is
11 because of Raise the Age. Now, I think Senator
12 Sanders made mention earlier of one of my
13 favorite expressions in politics, that success
14 has many parents and failure is an orphan. That
15 is probably no more true than on this issue.

16 In 2009 and 2010 when Senator
17 Montgomery chaired the Children and Families
18 Committee, she focused on this issue, and in 2011
19 when I chaired the committee, I chaired the first
20 Senate hearing on this issue. And when I held
21 that hearing, she was the only one who sat next
22 to me. Nobody else cared enough to even attend
23 the hearing that we did together.

24 And here we are, five years later,
25 part of a national trend, actually. It didn't

1 start in New York, it happened across the
2 country. Thirty-two other states since then have
3 taken up the opportunity to raise the age of
4 criminal responsibility.

5 And for those who care enough to
6 actually do the research, if you want to compare
7 apples to apples, oranges to oranges, or bananas
8 to bananas, what we have done here in New York
9 State is better than any other state has done
10 forward -- done up until now. And we should be
11 proud of that.

12 We should be proud of the fact that
13 while we may have started this, others took up
14 the cause. We would not be here tonight had it
15 not been for, first, Governor Cuomo, who decided
16 to make this a budget issue, but most importantly
17 the leader of the IDC, who said this was a
18 priority for our conference, for Senator Jesse
19 Hamilton, who said it was a priority for him. As
20 a man, as a member of the Senate, he could not go
21 home without getting this passed.

22 So there are a lot of parents on
23 this issue right now, but I would not be able to
24 stand here and say that this was a success
25 without the support of those people.

1 We are going to make profound change
2 in the lives of young people -- I know, Joe. We
3 are going to make profound change in the lives of
4 young people. And for those who don't think it
5 goes far enough, I will remind you, we are not
6 dropping off the end of the earth tonight. We
7 will be back here next month, we will be back
8 here next year. Laws are made to amend them. We
9 have a task force as part of this bill. We will
10 be able to look at what we're doing as we go
11 forward and make changes, make improvements.

12 So I am very proud to vote on what
13 has been called an abomination. I don't think
14 so. I think this is a great piece of
15 legislation. It reflects a real commitment to
16 the people of the State of New York.

17 I vote proudly in the affirmative,
18 Mr. President.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
20 Savino to be recorded in the affirmative.

21 Senator Jacobs to explain his vote
22 is.

23 SENATOR JACOBS: Thank you,
24 Mr. President.

25 I rise today to cast my first vote

1 for a New York State budget. I had great hope
2 that I would feel much more comfortable about
3 this vote tonight than I do.

4 First, I am elated that today we are
5 casting a vote and bringing ride sharing to the
6 entire State of New York, remedying an inequity
7 that we have had where New York City has had ride
8 sharing and the rest of the state has not.

9 But I am equally uncomfortable with
10 the major policies that have been put into this
11 budget that I don't believe should be in a budget
12 document, whether it be 421-a, Raise the Age, or
13 the Governor's free tuition proposal. I believe
14 that these are major policy items that should be
15 dealt with outside the budget and given the due
16 deliberation that they deserve.

17 Along the same lines of the
18 Governor's free tuition proposal, whether you are
19 in favor of this or not, I think most would agree
20 that this is a major new education initiative and
21 creating a new entitlement program for New York
22 State. As many have spoken about the uncertainty
23 of Medicaid funding from the federal
24 government -- the Governor noting this on many
25 occasions, and whether we should have a permanent

1 budget this year or wait until we know of that --
2 then I don't find it makes much sense to pass a
3 whole new, major new obligation in terms of this
4 new free tuition program.

5 To conclude, with all the
6 reservations that I have on this budget, I will
7 be voting for this budget because to vote against
8 this budget would put children in my public
9 schools in my district in a precarious position
10 because the school boards will be unable to make
11 responsible votes in terms of their budgeting and
12 would have to make major cuts in staffing.

13 I am going to vote for this budget
14 because it will be helping the developmentally
15 disabled community to pay appropriately the
16 workers who do those important jobs.

17 And I will vote for this budget so
18 additional funding will go towards combating the
19 heroin epidemic that is a scourge in our
20 communities throughout this state.

21 I will vote for all of these, but I
22 will vote with -- because these are the core. I
23 will vote for this budget because these are the
24 core and fundamental functions of government that
25 should be voted for within the context of the

1 budget. But I lament that I feel these core
2 government functions have been essentially held
3 hostage by these major new policies that have
4 been inserted and rammed into this program.

5 Since the Pataki v. Silver ruling
6 several years ago, we have seen a growing and
7 increasing abuse of the budget process to pass
8 major new policy items. I believe we need reform
9 so we do not have to endure what we had to endure
10 this time around in this budget.

11 Thank you. And I vote in the
12 affirmative.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
14 Jacobs to be recorded in the affirmative.

15 Senator Seward to explain his vote.

16 SENATOR SEWARD: Yes, thank you,
17 Mr. President.

18 While ride sharing has been
19 available for use all across the country and in
20 the City of New York for a number of years now,
21 the balance of New York State has been, in
22 effect, left standing at the curb. And that's
23 about to change in the legislation that we are
24 about to enact here this evening.

25 You know, by making ride sharing

1 available throughout the state, there's now going
2 to be more options than ever for New Yorkers to
3 secure safe, affordable, reliable transportation
4 services. And that will be true for residents
5 and visitors to our state alike. You know,
6 business executives, tourists, college students
7 and everyone in between, they all utilize ride
8 sharing when visiting cities and communities
9 across the country, and now they will be able to
10 do the same throughout the State of New York.
11 And in doing so, the balance of the state will be
12 able to realize the economic, the environmental
13 and public safety benefits of ride sharing.

14 You know, our Senate Insurance
15 Committee and this body as a whole has taken a
16 leadership role in bringing ride sharing to all
17 of New York State. Last June, this body passed
18 legislation to do exactly that. Earlier this
19 year, we did the same. And I'm delighted that we
20 have been able to include ride sharing in this
21 budget that we are enacting here tonight.

22 So, Mr. President, I vote aye.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
24 Seward to be recorded in the affirmative.

25 Senator Bonacic to explain his vote.

1 SENATOR BONACIC: Thank you,
2 Mr. President.

3 I stand to say several things. One,
4 I'm going to thank several of my colleagues who
5 worked very hard in critical areas to bring
6 closure to this budget. We've defeated all new
7 taxes; all new fees are not in this budget.

8 Senator LaValle, college
9 affordability, more money for TAP, both for the
10 independent and the private colleges as well as
11 the public colleges.

12 Senator Murphy, continuing to fight
13 on heroin addiction.

14 Senator Lanza, Senator Young,
15 Senator Gallivan that worked very hard on Raise
16 the Age. And, you know, we've heard -- this was
17 the dominating theme in bringing closure to this
18 budget.

19 And as -- you know, I didn't study
20 this subject much until it was raised to a higher
21 level. And an interesting statistic is worth
22 sharing. Since 2013, there were over 33,000
23 arrests for 16- and 17-year-olds, over 33,000.
24 You know how many went to jail? About 540.
25 That's 1.5 percent of all the 16- and

1 17-year-olds that were arrested.

2 And that's a tribute to our district
3 attorneys, to our probation, and to our judges,
4 who know that 16- and 17-year-olds, their brains
5 may not be fully formulated and they need another
6 chance. And they gave them another chance, those
7 98.5 percent since 2013. So I know as much as
8 you've been fighting for Raise the Age, keep that
9 statistic in mind.

10 Senator Hannon, who fought very hard
11 for the bond act for the clean water. And that
12 was -- it will be a crisis that I think will be
13 escalating, because we have a lot of old
14 infrastructure in the State of New York.

15 I vote aye. Thank you very much,
16 Mr. President.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
18 Bonacic to be recorded in the affirmative.

19 Senator DeFrancisco to conclude the
20 explanation of votes.

21 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Yes. I heard
22 many, many people on both sides of the aisle talk
23 about how this budget bill is a budget bill that
24 there's a lot of things you like and there's a
25 lot of things you don't like. And I certainly am

1 of the same opinion.

2 But I want to piggyback on something
3 Senator Jacobs said. This is his first budget
4 that he's going through. And that is this
5 process of having major issues being forced
6 through the budget process has got to stop. We
7 could probably have a budget in a month if it was
8 truly just a budget. But it's not only this
9 Governor, but every Governor before this
10 Governor, whether it's a good policy or a bad
11 policy -- and in my judgment, some of the
12 policies in this are not good. And it should be
13 debated separately, and it should be determined
14 separately.

15 What I hope we do is this. The
16 Pataki vs. Silver case that put a stamp of
17 approval on this process, that the Governor could
18 put a budget together no matter what's in it,
19 whether it's related to the budget or not, that
20 we should pass legislation calling for a
21 constitutional amendment -- because I guess the
22 case was based on constitutional grounds -- to
23 stop this practice. And if we pass it in both
24 houses and the Governor vetoes it, because it's
25 obviously not to his advantage -- oh, he can't

1 vote it because it's a resolution for a
2 constitutional amendment.

3 We should pass it in both houses in
4 successive legislatures and push at a -- during a
5 vote, a referendum vote, to have it become the
6 law of the land. Then we can truly say that
7 we're working on a budget, not on the policy of
8 the State of New York as the prime focus and a
9 budget as almost an add-on that has been
10 happening over the last several years.

11 With much reservation, I vote aye.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
13 DeFrancisco to be recorded in the affirmative.

14 Announce the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
16 Calendar 558, those recorded in the negative are
17 Senators Dilan, Rivera and Squadron.

18 Ayes, 54. Nays, 3.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Also Senator
22 Hoylman.

23 Ayes, 53. Nays, 4.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
25 is passed.

1 Senator DeFrancisco.

2 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Please take
3 up Calendar 557, Bill Print 2004D.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
5 Secretary will read.

6 THE SECRETARY: Senator Young moves
7 to discharge, from the Committee on Finance,
8 Assembly Bill Number 3004D and substitute it for
9 the identical Senate Bill 2004D, Third Reading
10 Calendar 557.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
12 substitution is so ordered.

13 Now I'm going to ask the Secretary
14 to read, then we're going to accept the message,
15 then we're going to have an appeal, I think, from
16 Senator Gianaris. Let's take it one at a time.

17 The Secretary will read.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 557, Budget Bill, Assembly Print 3004D, an act
20 making appropriations for the support of
21 government: CAPITAL PROJECTS BUDGET.

22 SENATOR GIANARIS: Lay it aside.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
24 DeFrancisco, there is a message at the desk.

25 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Move to

1 accept.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: All in
3 favor of accepting the message of necessity
4 signify by saying aye.

5 (Response of "Aye.")

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Opposed?

7 (Response of "Nay.")

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
9 message is accepted.

10 The bill is before the house.

11 Senator Gianaris.

12 SENATOR GIANARIS: Lay aside the
13 bill, please.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
15 will be laid aside.

16 The Secretary will ring the bell.

17 Senator Gianaris.

18 SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you,
19 Mr. President.

20 Actually, I just wanted to see if
21 you had any interesting biblical quotes for the
22 moment.

23 (Laughter.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: I may
25 have some topical humor for you, though.

1 (Laughter.)

2 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes. I believe
3 there's an amendment at the desk, Mr. President.
4 I ask that the reading be waived and that
5 Senator Hoylman be heard on the amendment.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Thank
7 you, Senator Gianaris.

8 Upon review of the amendment that
9 has been presented at the desk, in accordance
10 with Rule VII of the Senate, we rule that the
11 amendment that has been proposed is nongermane.

12 And I will recognize Senator Hoylman
13 to be heard on the appeal.

14 Senator Hoylman.

15 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Thank you,
16 Mr. President.

17 I'm shocked you're such a stickler
18 for items being germane, given this budget. But
19 I will -- I'd like to explain to you why I think
20 this is a germane item.

21 On June 12, 2016, a 29-year-old man
22 killed 49 people and wounded 53 others in a hate
23 crime and terror attack inside a gay nightclub in
24 Orlando called Pulse. It was the deadliest mass
25 shooting by a single individual, and the

1 deadliest incident of violence against LGBT
2 people in U.S. history. It was also the most
3 deadly terror attack in the United States since
4 September 11th.

5 The Governor, to his credit, had
6 proposed in his Executive Budget a \$1 million
7 allocation for a memorial to the victims of the
8 LGBT terror/hate crime in Orlando in my Senate
9 district. The Assembly agreed with that
10 allotment, but the Senate rejected it. And I
11 have to ask why that is the case.

12 It truly shocks the conscience that
13 this body would remove funding, \$1 million, which
14 is 6/10,000ths of a percent of the State Budget,
15 for a memorial to innocent victims -- men, women,
16 gay, straight, Latino, Caucasian,
17 African-American, all cut down in the prime of
18 their lives.

19 And especially when you consider,
20 Mr. President, that we have such an increase in
21 hate crimes in this state, in the City of
22 New York, and across the country. There has been
23 a 100 percent increase of hate crimes in the
24 United States; in New York City, a 123 percent
25 increase of anti-Semitic incidents, a 180 percent

1 increase in hate crimes against people of color.

2 This is a small allocation of the
3 state budget that speaks volumes about the values
4 of New Yorkers. For the State Senate to reject
5 it out of hand is malicious and cruel. I can
6 almost picture an individual in a cartoonish way
7 twizzling his mustache as he cut out the funding
8 for \$1 million for a memorial.

9 I would argue that we have an
10 obligation to New Yorkers, especially young
11 New Yorkers, who see the actions of this body as
12 representative of the values of our state. I
13 urge my colleagues to join me, with all due
14 respect, in rejecting the chair's decision.

15 Thank you.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Thank
17 you, Senator Hoylman.

18 The vote before the house is on the
19 procedures of the house. All those in favor of
20 overruling the rule of the chair, signify by
21 saying aye.

22 SENATOR GIANARIS: Show of hands,
23 please.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
25 Gianaris has requested a show of hands. It is so

1 ordered.

2 Announce the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 20.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
5 ruling of the chair is affirmed.

6 Senator Rivera, the bill is before
7 the house.

8 SENATOR RIVERA: To explain my
9 vote, Mr. President. Or on the bill.

10 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Do you want
11 to explain your vote, or do you want to speak on
12 the bill?

13 SENATOR RIVERA: On the bill, very
14 briefly.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Very
16 briefly on the bill.

17 SENATOR RIVERA: This bill is for
18 capital projects. There's one in particular that
19 Senator Díaz brought up earlier, and I wanted to
20 underline it. And that is the Kingsbridge
21 National Ice Center in my district -- as a matter
22 of fact, just a couple of blocks -- just a block
23 from my house. I can see it from my window,
24 actually.

25 It is a project that many of you

1 might have heard about. It is to transform the
2 Kingsbridge Armory, which is the largest armory
3 in the continental United States, into the
4 largest ice sports facility in the world.

5 Now, I've said this before on this
6 floor, I think. I'm from Puerto Rico. For me,
7 ice is something you put in a rum drink. I have
8 never ice skated in my life, and I do not
9 envision learning how to do it, even though this
10 thing is going to be a block from my house. Too
11 old -- I'll break my hip, et cetera.

12 But the reason I've always been
13 supportive of the project is because the
14 developer, even though it's an idea that I never
15 would have thought would have really taken any
16 hold of me, was because the developer in good
17 faith -- and certainly the thanks are due in
18 large part to the borough president, to
19 Ruben Díaz, Jr., in the Bronx, who brought a
20 developer to the table who in good faith
21 negotiated with the community to put together
22 what is known as a community benefits agreement.
23 It is a legally binding document that, once the
24 project goes into effect, will create all sorts
25 of great conditions in the community.

1 Whether we're talking about local
2 jobs, whether we're talking about every job more
3 than living wage, 50,000 square feet of community
4 space that could be utilized by the community,
5 whether we're talking about 1 percent of gross
6 revenue a year put into a community fund to be
7 used for community purposes, et cetera -- for all
8 these reasons, even though again I am not an ice
9 skater nor will I ever be an ice skater, I'm
10 supportive of this project.

11 And even though certainly there's a
12 lot of criticism that you can lob at this budget,
13 this particular bill -- because again, folks,
14 we're talking about bill by bill. In this
15 particular bill, and certainly as it relates to
16 this particular capital project, I certainly
17 thank the Governor as well as the borough
18 president for doing everything that he needed to
19 do to make sure that the money is there. Now I
20 call on everybody, meaning both the Empire State
21 Development Corporation as well as the Economic
22 Development Corporation in the City of New York,
23 to work collectively to make sure that this
24 project goes forward.

25 I am a believer in this project

1 because I think it would have an impact on the
2 community. It is not a boondoggle. Again, it is
3 a loan that this money is being allocated for.
4 And this development, again, will have a
5 tremendous impact on the community that I live
6 in, the community that I represent, and certainly
7 the Bronx at large, considering that in a couple
8 of years you might have a few Olympians from the
9 Bronx -- somebody maybe playing NHL hockey, or
10 somebody on the Winter Olympics that never had
11 the opportunity before and now will.

12 So it is why I am supportive of the
13 project, and it is why I am supportive of this
14 budget bill before us. I will be voting in the
15 affirmative.

16 Thank you, Mr. President.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
18 Kennedy.

19 SENATOR KENNEDY: Thank you,
20 Mr. President. On the bill.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
22 Kennedy on the bill.

23 SENATOR KENNEDY: I'd like to rise
24 in support of this portion of the bill, the
25 capital projects budget for, in large part, the

1 second round of the Buffalo Billion funding that
2 will be coming to our region out in Western
3 New York.

4 The first round of the Buffalo
5 Billion was like an adrenaline shot to our
6 community. And as Western New Yorkers have
7 witnessed over the course of not only years and
8 decades, but unfortunately for generations, we
9 have been left out of the mix of important
10 decisions that have been made here in the State
11 Capitol. And we're finally getting the attention
12 that we rightfully deserve as the second largest
13 city in the state.

14 And seeing that our economy is
15 moving in the right direction, this second round
16 of Buffalo Billion funding, hundreds of millions
17 of dollars that's going to go into projects like
18 continued expansion of the University of Buffalo,
19 expanding the DL&W rail terminal in downtown
20 Buffalo, continued investment into worker
21 training -- and, you know, we talk about
22 investing in the infrastructure of our roads and
23 bridges. The infrastructure of our people, in
24 giving individuals an opportunity, through worker
25 training programs, to enhance their lives and in

1 turn enhance the economy, is more important than
2 anything else.

3 What we're seeing now, following up
4 on the Governor's commitment to Buffalo, this
5 second round of funding from the Governor, who I
6 thank incredibly, as a Buffalonian, is funding
7 that's going to help revitalize our community
8 like never before.

9 And we talk about the psyche of
10 Buffalo changing just as the economy is changing.
11 And for years, people were leaving our community
12 by the tens of thousands. My generation left by
13 the tens of thousands between the years of 2000
14 and 2010.

15 And it was for that reason that I
16 decided to get involved in government to begin
17 with, the fact that our community was bleeding
18 not only jobs out of the region and out of the
19 state, but bleeding our youth -- the brain drain,
20 the future of our community.

21 Now we're seeing the millennials
22 coming back. We're seeing them stay, and people
23 that have left come back to our community. And
24 it's enlightening, but it's exciting, and we are
25 thrilled to support the Buffalo Billion Squared

1 in this capital projects portion of the budget.

2 A few weeks ago I stood with the
3 leadership from the Buffalo Niagara Medical
4 Campus, the NFTA, the Buffalo Niagara
5 Partnership, the University at Buffalo, and many
6 others, calling for this funding to be included
7 in the budget. I made a pledge and a commitment
8 that I wouldn't vote for this budget without the
9 inclusion of the second round of the Buffalo
10 Billion.

11 I am thrilled that I'm able to
12 support this portion of the budget and the budget
13 as a whole because this important funding is
14 going to help the City of Buffalo and Western
15 New York continue the transformation from decades
16 of decline to the wind at our back and momentum
17 on our side and jobs and economic development
18 being created.

19 With that, Mr. President, I'm proud
20 to support this. I vote aye.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
22 Díaz.

23 SENATOR DÍAZ: Thank you,
24 Mr. President. One more time I --

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator

1 Díaz on the bill.

2 SENATOR DÍAZ: On the bill.

3 One more time I take this
4 opportunity to express my appreciation to
5 Governor Cuomo for the interest and the
6 commitment that he has made to the Bronx, to the
7 Bronx borough president, Ruben Díaz, Jr., and to
8 all that have made this project, this bill, going
9 through.

10 The Kingsbridge Armory has been
11 there, a nice building, abandoned for many, many
12 years. There have been many projects, people
13 have been playing with the idea. And Governor
14 Cuomo decided to invest in the Bronx.

15 Some time ago the Bronx was the
16 borough and the county in the state with the
17 highest unemployment rate. The Governor decided
18 to open an office of employment in the Bronx.
19 His relationship with my son, the Bronx borough
20 president, has given fruit. Now the Bronx
21 unemployment rate is less than 6 percent.

22 So I join my colleague Senator
23 Rivera in thanking all of those involved in
24 making sure that the Kingsbridge Armory money is
25 there. I have been, for one, a heavy critic of

1 Governor Cuomo. I have been criticizing him for
2 many, many times. But tonight, in this budget
3 and in the one previously, I have to thank him
4 because he has been very instrumental again --
5 and I'm going to repeat myself again -- he has
6 been very instrumental in helping the Bronx
7 unemployment rate come down.

8 So thank you to all of you. Thank
9 you to all the conference. And I know that my
10 conference and the IDC has to get together and
11 make one, stronger. Meanwhile, I thank Senator
12 Klein, Senator Andrea Stewart-Cousins for all the
13 work and all the patience. One day, one day, we
14 shall overcome. One day, we shall overcome. I
15 don't know if I will be with you to see it
16 happen, but one day, we shall overcome.

17 Thank you very much, Mr. President.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Seeing
19 and hearing no other Senator that wishes to be
20 heard, debate is closed. The Secretary will ring
21 the bell.

22 Read the last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Is there
4 any Senator that wishes to explain their vote?

5 Senator Young to conclude
6 explanations.

7 SENATOR YOUNG: Thank you,
8 Mr. President.

9 And I was just going over some of my
10 emails that I've gotten tonight, and one of them
11 really stood out. And it was from one of my
12 constituents who had a question about whether
13 there was any SAFE Act funding included in this
14 budget.

15 So I have a fact sheet here on the
16 SAFE Act funding, and I just want to go over that
17 briefly because I want to clarify and give the
18 facts and the truth once and for all.

19 Funding for the implementation of
20 the SAFE Act was never -- and I underscore
21 never -- discretely lined out in any of the
22 enacted budgets since the creation of that
23 statute.

24 Staff from the Division of the
25 State Police, the Division of Criminal Justice

1 Services and the Office of Information Technology
2 Services worked to implement various state laws,
3 and the positions cannot be isolated to SAFE Act
4 functions.

5 The only funding that has ever been
6 identified as SAFE Act funding was an Office of
7 Information Technology Services capital
8 reappropriation, and this was confirmed in March
9 of 2015. The amount earmarked for the creation
10 of an ammunition database was cut, it was cut,
11 and has never been restored. To date, no
12 additional appropriations have been identified.

13 Under the Division of State
14 Police -- and I understand, Mr. President, that's
15 in the next bill, but I want to cover both at the
16 same time. The State Operations Budget includes
17 funding for the Division of State Police in
18 lump-sum appropriations to work on various
19 programs. There is no new funding, nor is any
20 funding for the SAFE Act discretely lined out.

21 There also have been comments that
22 the fiscal year 2018 budget allocated
23 \$3.2 million in personnel costs associated with
24 the SAFE Act. It does not.

25 And finally, in this bill -- and

1 this is very relevant -- there is a \$4.6 million
2 reappropriation. And the Division of Budget, in
3 response to a question that the Senate posed
4 earlier this year during the budget process, they
5 gave an explanation regarding that \$4.6 million
6 reappropriation amount. It says: "The Office
7 for Information Technology Services expects to
8 spend this \$4.6 million reappropriation on
9 identified IT initiatives, including the
10 enterprise, time and attendance, and data center
11 consolidation projects, by the end of this fiscal
12 current year." No SAFE Act funding.

13 Thank you, Mr. President.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
15 Young, how do you vote?

16 SENATOR YOUNG: I vote aye.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
18 Young to be recorded in the affirmative.

19 Announce the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 57.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
22 is passed.

23 Senator DeFrancisco.

24 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Could you
25 please take up Calendar 556, Bill Number 2000D.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
2 Secretary will read the substitution.

3 THE SECRETARY: Senator Young moves
4 to discharge, from the Committee on Finance,
5 Assembly Bill Number 3000D and substitute it for
6 the identical Senate Bill Number 2000D, Third
7 Reading Calendar 556.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
9 substitution is so ordered.

10 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Is there a
11 message at the desk?

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There is
13 a message at the desk.

14 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Move to
15 accept.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: All in
17 favor of accepting the message of necessity
18 signify by saying aye.

19 (Response of "Aye.")

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Opposed?

21 (Response of "Nay.")

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
23 message is accepted.

24 The Secretary will read.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 556, Budget Bill, Assembly Print 3000D, an act
2 making appropriations for the support of
3 government: STATE OPERATIONS BUDGET.

4 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: (Inaudible.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
6 last -- excuse me?

7 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Last section.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Last
9 section. I thought you said lay it aside.

10 (Laughter.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
14 act shall take effect immediately.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
19 Squadron to explain his vote.

20 SENATOR SQUADRON: Thank you,
21 Mr. President.

22 The hour is late, the budget is
23 coming to a close after quite an odyssey -- a
24 longer one than we've had in many years, over
25 many days -- and we've discussed the good and the

1 bad in this budget. And we started talking about
2 this issue, and I think it's appropriate that we
3 end talking about this issue.

4 In all of the budget bills we've
5 passed here -- 11, I believe -- 11?

6 SENATOR SAVINO: Eleven.

7 SENATOR SQUADRON: Thank you.

8 -- there was no significant ethics
9 reform. This is the state operations bill. It's
10 not just the last bill, it's also a bill that
11 talks about how we operate as a state. It funds
12 a lot of those operations, including some parts
13 of our own.

14 And the fact that we are continuing,
15 year after year, with business as usual. We saw
16 that with a budget process that was confusing,
17 cloaked in darkness, had some good outcomes and
18 some less good outcomes, but did not empower the
19 people of the State of New York, did not empower
20 their 62 representatives in this house or their
21 150 in the other house.

22 At a time when we continue to have
23 the drip, drip, drip of corruption and
24 accusations, we have an LLC loophole which you've
25 heard me talk about before that allows unlimited,

1 nearly anonymous contributions to flood our
2 political system. We have issues of conflicts of
3 interest and pay-to-play.

4 There are certainly some great
5 things in this budget, certainly some problematic
6 things in this budget. But the fact that ethics
7 simply didn't appear over the last 11 bills in
8 the last months is disappointing. The Governor
9 tried. He put it in. And frankly this house,
10 from its one-house to its final budget, said no
11 to ethics reform.

12 On this bill, I do say yes, but next
13 year let's do better.

14 Thank you, Mr. President.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
16 Squadron to be recorded in the affirmative.

17 Announce the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 57.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
20 is passed.

21 Senator DeFrancisco, that completes
22 all action on the Senate Supplemental Calendar
23 33A before the house.

24 SENATOR FLANAGAN: Senator Griffo.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator

1 Flanagan.

2 SENATOR FLANAGAN: Would you please
3 recognize Senator Stewart-Cousins.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Order in
5 the house, please. Order in the house.

6 Senator Stewart-Cousins.

7 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: Thank
8 you, Mr. President. Thank you, Mr. President.

9 First of all, I think, like
10 everyone, we want to thank the staff, who has
11 just been incredible during what has been a very,
12 very long and difficult budget season. Certainly
13 the staff on both sides of the aisle, you've done
14 incredible work, and we are extremely grateful.

15 I wanted to also just to acknowledge
16 my staff, my chief of staff, Suzy Ballantyne, and
17 my counsel, Shontell Smith, and my director of
18 finance, Felix Muniz; communications director,
19 Mike Murphy.

20 And I also wanted to thank Senator
21 Gianaris for your hard work and recognize the
22 work of the Finance Committee. I certainly take
23 my hat off to Cathy Young, and to my own ranker,
24 Liz Krueger, who is just unable to be here but
25 our thoughts and our prayers are with her and her

1 family.

2 Of course I want to thank Senator
3 Flanagan for communicating in -- as much as you
4 could, and certainly Senator Klein for, you know,
5 getting through what has been, again, as I said,
6 a very, very difficult budget process. And
7 obviously, you know, I want to thank the Governor
8 for, you know, moving things in this house.

9 I also have to thank Speaker
10 Heastie, certainly for all his hard work and for
11 that work on Raise the Age and drawing that line
12 in the sand.

13 And I especially want to thank all
14 of the members of my conference. We know how
15 difficult it is being in this situation, and yet,
16 every day, you do it with integrity, you do it
17 with dignity, you do it with a commitment to the
18 people who sent you here. You do it
19 relentlessly, you do it whether you're informed
20 or not informed -- because we inform everyone of
21 where we stand and where we want to see this body
22 go on behalf of the people of New York State.

23 And so although we have fulfilled
24 our constitutional responsibility of passing a
25 budget, we shouldn't be breaking out any

1 champagne. The budget is over a week late, and
2 we're still unable to achieve all of the policies
3 that New Yorkers deserve. While there are some
4 good things in this budget, there are too many
5 half measures and too many things completely left
6 out.

7 The budget for sure may show some
8 progress, but let's be clear. It's not
9 progressive. Progress is providing more school
10 aid, but a progressive budget would have
11 recognized our obligations to the CFE and fully
12 funded our public education system.

13 Progress is taking some steps to
14 help 16- and 17-year-olds who run afoul of the
15 law, but progressive would have been a more
16 comprehensive raising of the age.

17 Let me just give you an example.
18 And Senator Murphy, I'm looking at you because I
19 was looking at the local paper and I read the
20 story of a 17-year-old who was in a mall who
21 broke into a cookie kiosk, and he stole a cake.

22 SENATOR MURPHY: I didn't do it.

23 (Laughter.)

24 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: No, it
25 wasn't you, it was a 17-year-old. And the cookie

1 kiosk -- I know, you're 18; right? -- and he
2 stole this cake.

3 Under the old Raise the Age, that
4 kid would go to criminal court. Under the
5 so-called progressive Raise the Age, that kid is
6 going to criminal court. That's what we're
7 talking about.

8 What we're saying is that a more
9 progressive Raise the Age would have been
10 implemented immediately, it would have reduced
11 the time to seal records, it would have had the
12 majority of nonviolent and violations and those
13 kinds of things originating in Family Court.

14 I respect the work that's been done
15 and I know, you know, everybody did a lot. But
16 the reality is that a progressive budget would
17 have included the Raise the Age version that my
18 colleague Senator Velmanette Montgomery has been
19 fighting for for so many years.

20 And again, you know, I can't thank
21 you enough because this is a population that, but
22 for strong, relentless voices, would be
23 absolutely marginalized, forgotten, and put in a
24 system which would benefit lots of other people
25 but never them. So I thank you for that.

1 Let me go back to the progressive
2 budget, though. A truly progressive budget would
3 have addressed other crucial criminal justice
4 reforms, including ensuring a speedy trial and
5 reforming the bail system.

6 Progress is addressing college
7 affordability for both public and private
8 schools, but progressive would have been passing
9 the DREAM Act to help thousands of New Yorkers
10 who only want a fair shot at earning an education
11 and achieving the American dream.

12 Progress would have been codifying
13 our state's health exchange into law, which sadly
14 we didn't. But progressive would have been
15 implementing a single-payer insurance plan.

16 Progress is certainly investing in
17 our state's water infrastructure, but progressive
18 would have been us not stripping funds from RGGI,
19 which is used for our environmental protection.

20 Progress is allocating much-needed
21 development aid to upstate communities like
22 Buffalo. Progressive would have been directing
23 money and making sure that community schools were
24 resourced, and to help rebuild crumbling school
25 infrastructures like those in my hometown in

1 Yonkers.

2 Progress is ensuring more
3 development of housing. Progressive would have
4 made sure we created and maintained more truly
5 affordable housing.

6 Progress is taking care of direct
7 care workers, but progressive would have also
8 acted on long-deferred COLA increases for human
9 services workers in OPWDD, OMH, and OASAS.

10 Progress would actually have
11 recognized the ethics problem in Albany, and a
12 progressive budget would have passed strong
13 ethics reform to restore New Yorkers' trust in
14 government.

15 So, my colleagues, we've seen over
16 the past few months that New Yorkers are really
17 scared, they're concerned what's going to happen
18 as it comes down from Washington, and they're
19 engaged more than ever with what's happening
20 right here in Albany.

21 This budget offered state government
22 the chance to stand up for New Yorkers' rights
23 and send a clear message that we would adhere to
24 progressive values during these challenging
25 times.

1 While this budget failed to address
2 many critical issues, we have an opportunity to
3 address these issues in the months ahead. In
4 January, Democrats had an opportunity to unite
5 and provide a truly progressive budget blueprint.
6 That didn't happen.

7 So this budget may represent
8 progress, but certainly it isn't progressive.
9 The majority of New Yorkers, however, expect us
10 to do better, and I hope in the coming months and
11 years we will.

12 Thank you.

13 (Standing ovation.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Thank
15 you, Senator Stewart-Cousins.

16 Senator Klein.

17 SENATOR KLEIN: Thank you,
18 Mr. President. Thank you. I know the hour is
19 late, but this is, I think, a budget that each
20 and every one of us can be very proud of.

21 First I want to thank the Governor,
22 our chief executive, for really doing I think a
23 tremendous job in making sure this whole budget
24 came to fruition. I think -- he's our chief
25 executive, but I think he also became sort of our

1 chief mediator.

2 I also want to thank Senator Cousins
3 and most of all Senate Majority Leader John
4 Flanagan. Once again, I think the coalition with
5 the IDC and the Republicans proved, once again,
6 that we can come together, we can negotiate, we
7 can compromise and we come up with a budget that
8 I think is first-rate that we all can proudly
9 vote for.

10 First and foremost, I want to thank
11 also the members of the Independent Democratic
12 Conference. They have worked extremely hard. We
13 put our priorities forward, we fought for those
14 priorities, and we accomplished most of them in
15 this budget.

16 Back in January, the IDC put forth a
17 Change New York agenda. And that blueprint I
18 think is here today before us, and it's going to
19 change the lives of New Yorkers for the better.

20 Raise the Age, I heard a lot of the
21 debate, a lot of the discussion. But I only hope
22 that we would have had Senator Lanza get up and
23 actually explain what's actually in this bill.
24 And my recommendation to my colleagues on the
25 other side of the aisle -- on both sides,

1 actually -- is to say please read the bill.
2 Senator Cousins just put forth an example of a
3 17-year-old that stole a cake. That individual,
4 under this law, would be in Family Court, tried
5 with a misdemeanor, not in criminal court.

6 So I implore my colleagues once
7 again, read the bill.

8 I do want to say a very special
9 thank you to really Senator Gallivan, who did a
10 great job, Senator Akshar, who did a great job,
11 in really discussing and coming together on a
12 bill that I think we can be proud of.

13 You know, Jesse Hamilton said to me
14 earlier this year that this was an issue that was
15 extremely important to him. As a black man
16 representing a district in Brooklyn with a very
17 large African-American population, he understood
18 that we were forcing our young people to really
19 forgo their future -- let alone not be able to go
20 to college, not even be able to finish high
21 school -- but on a track to prison, actually
22 making sure that their future was bleak.

23 And I think under this piece of
24 legislation we send a very, very simple message,
25 that we are going to rehabilitate our young

1 people and not incarcerate them.

2 This is something that we should
3 have done a long time ago. Velmanette Montgomery
4 was right then, and she's right today. But I
5 think we did come together, and we got something
6 done.

7 Also in this Raise the Age
8 legislation is something else that the IDC fought
9 so hard for, and it deals with Rikers Island.
10 You know, we hear a lot about a young man, Kalief
11 Browder, who actually was arrested not far from
12 where I live. And we all know his very sad tale,
13 and his family has kind of led the way for Raise
14 the Age in memory of Kalief.

15 But you want to know something? The
16 horrors that took place with Kalief Browder
17 happened in a place, again, that I'm not proud of
18 that's in my district called Rikers Island. And
19 in this legislation today, we take a stand that
20 every 16- and 17-year-old will be off Rikers
21 Island in one year.

22 (Scattered applause.)

23 SENATOR KLEIN: That's what we owe
24 to Kalief Browder, that's what we owe to his
25 family, and that's what we're going to actually

1 do.

2 So this is the Raise the Age that I
3 envision. This is the Raise the Age that the IDC
4 supports. And this is the Raise the Age that is
5 actually going to be signed into law very, very
6 soon.

7 You know, early on, again, the
8 Independent Democratic Conference decided to take
9 a stand when we saw that certain immigrant
10 communities were being discriminated against,
11 when certain immigrant communities didn't
12 understand what their rights were. I think we
13 have to send a very simple message. Each and
14 every one of us, our ancestors came from
15 someplace else. They came for a very simple
16 reason. They came to America for a better life
17 and a better life for their family. And those
18 individuals are immigrants.

19 And you know something, if we think
20 about it for a moment, the reason why I think
21 immigrants are great is because they have
22 courage. These are individuals who left their
23 families behind, their friends, to start a new
24 life. You know, the names may have changed --
25 the names maybe were Goldberg and O'Leary and

1 Solano, and now they're Mohammad and Suarez and
2 other names. But you know something, it's the
3 same person. It's the same person with courage,
4 dedication. And they deserve our help, and they
5 deserve their rights.

6 And we said we were going to help
7 these individuals. And I'm very proud that the
8 IDC, in partnership with Governor Cuomo, is going
9 to start the first of its kind immigrant defense
10 fund, an immigrant defense fund of \$10 million --
11 the largest investment ever made in the State of
12 New York for immigrant rights, and the largest
13 investment ever made in the country.

14 And I think today we're sending a
15 very clear message, all are welcome here, your
16 rights will not be violated, you will all know
17 the information, we will help you through the
18 process, we will help you get a job, we will help
19 train you. And that's what it's all about.
20 Because that's not only what we're going to do
21 here in America, but that's what we're going to
22 do here in New York as well.

23 So again, I want to say a very
24 special thank you to Marisol Alcantara,
25 Senator Peralta, who really made this their

1 signature issue. And I'm proud to partner with
2 them and the Governor.

3 You know, again, when we talked
4 about college affordability, we talked about
5 college affordability for all. And while the
6 Governor's program, the Excelsior program, does
7 help SUNY and CUNY students, I think we also need
8 an alternative. And I'm very proud that I sat
9 down with Senator LaValle -- who probably knows
10 more about higher education than anyone in both
11 bodies of the Legislature -- figured like, hey,
12 if we're really going to give young people a
13 choice, it can't only be for SUNY and CUNY, it
14 has to be for private institutions as well.

15 And we actually developed a new TAP
16 program which actually is going to help those
17 young people be able to choose a college that's a
18 private college or, if they want to go to SUNY
19 and CUNY, that's all well and good.

20 But I think the most important thing
21 is we did a lot to help those young people. And
22 now anyone who makes between \$80,000 and \$125,000
23 a year that previous -- previously to this
24 legislation were getting no help at all, are now
25 going to get some help to be able to go to

1 college.

2 There was a lot of talk also about
3 421-a. We changed the name to Affordable
4 New York, but it still is a program that's
5 responsible for building thousands and thousands
6 of units of affordable housing. And a lot of
7 people here, again, I don't think read the
8 legislation, because if they did, they would have
9 seen that part of 421-a is a housing memorandum
10 of understanding -- \$200 million for the New York
11 City Housing Authority, \$100 million for
12 straight-out low-income affordable housing, and
13 something that I pushed for long and hard,
14 \$150 million for a middle-income tax credit which
15 will revitalize the Mitchell-Lama program that
16 was an outlet for so many individuals to be able
17 to live in their communities.

18 So all in all, I will say that this
19 is a budget that changed people's lives, and
20 certainly changed people's lives for the better.

21 I too want to thank our hardworking
22 staff. They really went the extra mile this
23 year. We always say we're somehow going to
24 change this archaic process, but they work hard,
25 they get no sleep, and they do it all for the

1 people we serve: My chief of staff, Dana
2 Carotenuto; my policy director, Gabe Paniza; my
3 director of legislation, Evan Sullivan; my
4 counsel, Shelley Andrews; director of finance,
5 Sarah Bangs; and my communication director,
6 Candice Giove.

7 Again, I think we deserve the break
8 we're now going to undertake, and I hope
9 everybody gets some rest. And we're going to
10 come back again and do the people's business.

11 Thank you, Mr. President.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Thank
13 you, Senator Klein.

14 (Standing ovation.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
16 Flanagan.

17 SENATOR FLANAGAN: Mr. President,
18 let me start off by thanking you.

19 I wasn't here for all of it, but I
20 did listen to a lot of it. And I guess in light
21 of the fact that it's Palm Sunday, there were a
22 number of biblical invocations throughout the
23 course of the day. So out of respect to
24 everyone's faith, let me express my gratitude and
25 appreciation for people being here so we could do

1 the people's business.

2 By extension, let me thank Senator
3 DeFrancisco in particular, and Senator Mike
4 Gianaris, for being gentlemen colleagues and
5 making sure that our operation here could run
6 smoothly. Because we all know there can be a lot
7 of bumps in the road, and when people are willing
8 to work together, we can get things done, even if
9 it takes extra time.

10 There are a number of things that
11 I'd like to talk about. I want to start with the
12 people who actually work here. I want to thank
13 Senator Stewart-Cousins for, as I say, always
14 being a good person to deal with and for
15 representing her conference ably and with passion
16 and dedication. And that's something I'll always
17 inherently respect.

18 Let me extend my deep appreciation
19 to Senator Klein for being a gentleman, for being
20 a leader, being a good colleague, and for being
21 someone who always, just when I think I know him,
22 comes up with something new. He'll never be
23 accused of, you know, sitting or resting on his
24 laurels in terms of what his advocacy is.

25 And by extension, while Jeff

1 mentioned all of his staff, I just want to single
2 out Dana as someone who's been extraordinarily
3 terrific to deal with.

4 Here in our own chamber, I want to
5 thank Lisa, I want to thank everyone at the desk
6 for also helping to make sure that things run
7 smoothly. You can tell we're getting to the end
8 of the -- the bottom of the hourglass when I call
9 Lisa like 35 times to find out what's going on,
10 who's speaking, and all those different things.

11 Speaker Heastie is a passionate
12 advocate for his district, for the people of the
13 State of New York, for his conference. And
14 golly, he's got a very diverse conference. You
15 all know that. When you have 107 members, even
16 if they were all the same -- imagine if there
17 were 107 Kevin Parkers, that would still be a
18 challenge.

19 (Laughter; inaudible comment.)

20 SENATOR FLANAGAN: All right, the
21 question is going to be 107 Parkers or 107
22 Riveras. That's the toss of the coin.

23 But he -- you know, Carl has proven
24 himself to be a gentleman. We don't agree -- we
25 don't agree on a lot of things, and that's fine.

1 And that's part of the process.

2 And I do want to thank all of those
3 individuals, but I also want to thank the
4 Governor for his stick-to-itiveness, among other
5 things. Senator Gallivan, Senator Young,
6 Senator Lanza can all attest to the fact of how
7 much time the Governor personally invested in
8 meeting with our members, in meeting with the
9 IDC, in meeting with the Assembly Democrats on an
10 issue that was very important to a lot of people
11 commonly known as Raise the Age.

12 And by the way, I'm just giving my
13 own opinion on this. Parenthetically, we'll
14 never get credit for this, and maybe we
15 shouldn't. But I just said to Senator Marcellino
16 if I went to a street corner in my district and
17 interviewed 100 people and said "What do you
18 think about Raise the Age," 98 or 99 of them are
19 not even going to know what it is. They just
20 don't. They don't. And yet the time and effort
21 and the investment in talking about a
22 16-year-old, I come at it from an angle that
23 always incorporates my -- and I'm going to never
24 apologize for this. It's an important public
25 policy issue. But I think, okay, what makes that

1 16-year-old go out and commit a crime? And what
2 if it's a heinous crime? Because the first thing
3 I think about is the victim. I'm never going to
4 walk away from the idea that I'm going to think
5 about the victim first and then the perpetrator
6 of the crime thereafter. And I'm not suggesting
7 that that makes me unique. But when we grapple
8 with these issues, that's part of the
9 deliberations that we get involved in. And
10 frankly, we should.

11 Senator Klein can attest to this.
12 About five months ago we were meeting in the
13 Governor's office in the city, at which time I
14 said that this would be an extraordinarily
15 contentious issue for the people in our
16 conference, but I gave my word that we would sit
17 down and try and work out some type of
18 compromise. And obviously that has happened in
19 the context of an overall budget. But that's --
20 ladies and gentlemen, that's one thing, one thing
21 in an entire budget.

22 So I want to thank the Governor on
23 that, Senators Akshar, DeFrancisco, Amedore and
24 Senator Hannon, all of whom had meetings with the
25 Governor on deeply important public policy issues

1 that the public will not understand. That we
2 actually go in and we sit down, hash things out
3 back and forth. Workers' compensation -- how do
4 you protect workers? How do you protect
5 employers so that they can actually have workers?
6 How do we advance a system that actually works
7 and inures to everyone's benefit?

8 So from our standpoint, I don't want
9 to have the dialogue start and end with Raise the
10 Age. I want to talk about jobs. And the notion
11 that we're preserving middle-class tax cuts, you
12 know, okay, I'm going to take credit for that.
13 But we shouldn't have to preserve anything. That
14 shouldn't even be a discussion. That's what the
15 law was already, and we're talking about the
16 middle class. We're not talking about people
17 who -- yes, pun intended -- who are Uber wealthy.
18 We're talking about real people.

19 So your advocacy and our advocacy in
20 that regard, frankly, is no different. Just how
21 do we get to the finish line?

22 So I want to talk about jobs, I want
23 to talk about economic development. I want to
24 follow on the lead of Senator Hannon and Senator
25 O'Mara on clean water. That's a really, really

1 good thing for the people of the State of
2 New York, and we got it done.

3 So when I look at the checklist of
4 things that got done -- workers' compensation,
5 yes. Uber, yes. College affordability, yes.
6 Chances to relieve property taxes at the local
7 level, yes. Clean water, yes. Rejecting
8 hundreds of millions in taxes and fees. All of
9 you are seasoned veterans. We could pass a
10 millionaire's tax and no one will know. But when
11 you tell somebody they have to pay another
12 50 bucks to get their title reissued at DMV,
13 that's what they remember.

14 So we rejected the Amazon tax,
15 because that works for our constituents. We
16 rejected all those excessive fees at DMV. And
17 that is hundreds of millions of dollars it saves,
18 taxpayers' money, across the State of New York.
19 So sometimes we do things that inure to the
20 benefit of our constituents affirmatively, and
21 sometimes we do things that help them by
22 rejecting things that are on the table.

23 I'm going to use Senator Golden as
24 an example. In a world of compromise, you
25 fashion things, you put them out there, you

1 fight, you negotiate, and at the end of the day
2 you try and come up with something that works for
3 real people. Senator Golden's leadership is the
4 reason we have a three-quarters disability for
5 police in the State of New York. And you know
6 what? That really matters.

7 We all watch the TV shows, I watch
8 them, I'm a freak for Blue Bloods and stuff like
9 that. But when a cop gets hurt in the line of
10 duty, what the hell are we having a debate for
11 about whether or not this person should get a
12 three-quarters disability? That's something that
13 should have been done a long time ago.

14 So props and kudos to my colleague.
15 And by the way, Senator Golden wanted other
16 things in the budget, and he didn't get them.
17 And I know you're all shocked by that, because I
18 know everyone else in the room got every single
19 thing that they wanted in the budget. But I look
20 at my new colleagues -- Senator Phillips, Senator
21 Helming, Senator Jacobs, Senator Tedisco -- all
22 of whom have diverse backgrounds. So when we
23 talk about shared services, which the public
24 doesn't understand, it's good to have a former
25 mayor, a former supervisor, a former clerk, and a

1 gentleman who has over 40 years of government
2 experience to help bring input and education and
3 knowledge to the process.

4 And I am repetitive on some of these
5 things because I want to have the public
6 understand the input that we get from our
7 members. I'm looking at my good friend and
8 colleague over there, George Amedore. I've said
9 it before, I'll say it again. He's a
10 businessman, he's a home builder, so if I'm going
11 to talk to somebody about workers' comp, you
12 know, that's where I'm going to go. Go to the
13 people who actually know.

14 Carl Marcellino, former teacher,
15 former school board member, now chair of the
16 Education Committee. There's going to be
17 criticism of our education budget. There's going
18 to be groups of people who say it's not enough.

19 We're putting over a billion dollars
20 of new money into education. And if we put in a
21 billion-eight and we walked in with cash, there
22 are still people who are going to complain. If
23 every other part of the budget got the same
24 amount of money that education did, they would be
25 euphoric, euphoric. If we said to the direct

1 care workers, I'm sorry, for the next five years
2 the only thing we could do is get you what we get
3 for elementary and secondary education, they'd be
4 dancing in the streets. You all know that.

5 So when we talk about what we do for
6 education, I don't care if you're a Democrat or a
7 Republican, a member of the IDC, Assembly or
8 Senate -- don't apologize. And I keep saying
9 that. Because we are making investments, and
10 this is not easy. All of you know that.

11 Property tax relief. We adhered to
12 a spending cap again, for the seventh year in a
13 row, which is good for the property taxpayers in
14 the State of New York. I wish we had a spending
15 cap statutorily enacted at the state level. And
16 with no disrespect to my colleagues from the City
17 of New York, I wish we had a property tax cap in
18 the City of New York, because it works all across
19 the rest of the state. There's no reason why it
20 can't work properly in the City of New York.
21 Senator Lanza has had that bill for a number of
22 years. But that's going to be part of our
23 ongoing debate.

24 So where do we go from here? To me,
25 when we talk about all these things -- you know,

1 we talk about Aid to Localities and ELFA and TED.
2 We have all these acronyms. And again, the
3 public doesn't understand what any of this stuff
4 is. It's our job to educate them. So to me, I'm
5 thinking, all right, what -- if we're talking
6 about healthcare, what does it mean to my mother?
7 If we're talking about education, what does it
8 mean to Terrence Murphy's kid? If we're talking
9 about higher education, what does it mean to
10 Andrew Lanza's daughter, who's now in college?
11 That's the prism that we look through, and that's
12 the prism that we should look through.

13 But I'm going to say Senator
14 Stewart-Cousins talked about being progressive,
15 and she talked about how the Democrats could have
16 been united. I'm going to suggest that the
17 Democrats are united. Because I watched every
18 vote on every budget bill that came before this
19 house, and virtually every person in this room
20 voted yes. So that must mean we're doing
21 something right. If we can get people of
22 disparate interests and backgrounds to support a
23 wide variety of things that they may not always
24 like, that suggests to me that people are united.

25 So when people talk about being

1 progressive, I want to be progressive by creating
2 jobs. I want to be progressive by making an
3 economic development structure, whether it's in
4 the Finger Lakes region or up in Saratoga or out
5 in Western New York or the Hudson Valley or out
6 in Gallivan's territory, which encompasses half
7 the world.

8 I'd like to make sure that we have a
9 regulatory environment where people can actually
10 create jobs. Progressive means creating jobs,
11 generating revenue for the State of New York so
12 that when people want to fund programs, that they
13 have the opportunity to do so.

14 So I'm going to close on this.
15 There are people here on all sides. Senator
16 Stewart-Cousins spoke about her staff, Senator
17 Klein spoke about his staff. I want to thank
18 everybody that works in government. I want to
19 thank everybody that works for the New York State
20 Senate and for the New York State Assembly,
21 regardless of your political persuasion.

22 I want to desperately thank the
23 people in my own office -- Peter Mooney standing
24 over there, Robin Mueller, Sydney Gross directly
25 in our office, because they have my back 24/7,

1 and that enables me to do things that gets some
2 of this stuff done here.

3 From, I don't know, Scott Reif, our
4 communications office; Joe Conway, who's over
5 here I'm sure hiding somewhere from -- he's
6 actually putting together the mailings on the
7 budget already, which will be going out quickly.

8 But we have a crack staff. I want
9 to thank Beth Garvey in our counsel's office.

10 And I'm going to give a final
11 shout-out to a guy who I've always respected and
12 have great affection for, and this is his first
13 real run-through -- and I'm going to close on
14 this, because I think this is representative of
15 the quality of work that can get done in the
16 State of New York. These people are exhausted
17 because they're doing public service and public
18 policy. And I just want to particularly thank
19 Shawn MacKinnon, as the secretary to the
20 Finance Committee. And he and his team, but he
21 in particular, did an outstanding, outstanding
22 job by properly negotiating, by being a person of
23 integrity, and by representing the people of the
24 State of New York.

25 And he was able to do so under the

1 guidance and tutelage of our expert, tireless
2 chairwoman of the Senate Finance Committee,
3 Senator Cathy Young.

4 Give her a round of applause, for
5 God's sakes.

6 (Applause.)

7 SENATOR FLANAGAN: On that note,
8 ladies and gentlemen, I know we -- the public has
9 this thing -- I'm just going to explain this.
10 The public has this thing that somehow we're all
11 going on international trips, I'm personally
12 going on a space trip out to the universe.

13 (Laughter.)

14 SENATOR FLANAGAN: I wish everyone
15 rest and respite and relaxation. But I know
16 this. While one person may not be in their
17 district, there are emails, there are phone
18 calls, there are mailers, there's different parts
19 of the budget you're going to be explaining to
20 everybody.

21 I congratulate all of you and thank
22 you for the fact that you are all public
23 servants.

24 Mr. President, thank you for your
25 time.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Thank
2 you, Senator Flanagan.

3 (Standing ovation.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
5 DeFrancisco.

6 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Is there any
7 further business at the desk?

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There is
9 no further business at the desk.

10 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Then I move
11 to adjourn until Monday, April 24th, at
12 3:00 p.m., intervening days being legislative
13 days.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: On
15 motion, the Senate will stand adjourned until
16 Monday, April 24th, at 3:00 p.m., intervening
17 days being legislative days.

18 The Senate stands adjourned.

19 (Whereupon, at 11:06 p.m., the
20 Senate adjourned.)

21

22

23

24

25