

1 NEW YORK STATE SENATE

2
3
4 THE STENOGRAPHIC RECORD

5
6
7
8 ALBANY, NEW YORK

9
10 March 17, 2014

11 4:54 p.m.

12
13
14 REGULAR SESSION

15
16
17
18 SENATOR JOSEPH GRIFFO, Acting President

19 FRANCIS W. PATIENCE, Secretary

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
3 Senate will come to order.

4 I ask all present to please rise and
5 join with me as we recite the Pledge of
6 Allegiance to our Flag.

7 (Whereupon, the assemblage recited
8 the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: In the
10 absence of clergy, I ask all present to please
11 bow your head in a moment of silent reflection
12 and prayer.

13 (Whereupon, the assemblage respected
14 a moment of silence.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
16 reading of the Journal.

17 THE SECRETARY: In Senate, Sunday,
18 March 16th, the Senate met pursuant to
19 adjournment. The Journal of Saturday,
20 March 15th, was read and approved. On motion,
21 Senate adjourned.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Without
23 objection, the Journal stands approved as read.

24 Presentation of petitions.

25 Messages from the Assembly.

1 The Secretary will read.

2 THE SECRETARY: The Assembly sent
3 for concurrence the following bill. On motion by
4 Senator Skelos and Senator Klein, said bill
5 ordered to a third reading: Assembly Bill Number
6 2597A.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: So
8 ordered.

9 Messages from the Governor.
10 Reports of standing committees.
11 Reports of select committees.
12 Communications and reports of state
13 officers.

14 Motions and resolutions.

15 Senator Libous.

16 SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President, at
17 this time could we go to Assembly hand-down
18 A2597A.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
20 Secretary will read.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 288, by Member of the Assembly Moya, Assembly
23 Print Number 2597A, an act to amend the Education
24 Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the

1 last section.

2 SENATOR LIBOUS: Lay the bill
3 aside, please.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Lay the
5 bill aside.

6 The Secretary will ring the bell.
7 Senator Libous.

8 SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President, at
9 this time can we do the controversial reading of
10 Assembly 2597A, please.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Assembly
12 Bill Number 2597A is before the house.

13 The Secretary will read.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 288, by Member of the Assembly Moya, Assembly
16 Print Number 2597A, an act to amend the Education
17 Law.

18 SENATOR LIBOUS: Explanation.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: An
20 explanation has been requested.

21 Senator Klein.

22 SENATOR KLEIN: Mr. President, this
23 legislation would create the New York State DREAM
24 Act, which in turn creates the New York DREAM
25 Fund Commission and a New York DREAM Fund to

1 provide scholarships to college-bound children of
2 immigrants.

3 Students eligible for scholarships
4 from the New York DREAM Fund would be required to
5 have at least one parent or guardian who
6 emigrated to the United States, and to have
7 resided with a parent or guardian in New York
8 State while attending a public or private high
9 school for at least two years prior to receiving
10 a high school diploma or its equivalent.

11 This legislation also expands access
12 to state-funded financial aid programs and allows
13 immigrant families to better save for higher
14 education expenses by allowing individuals to
15 open up a New York State 529 family tuition
16 account under the New York State College Tuition
17 Savings Program.

18 If at a later time -- if Senator
19 Peralta would like to elaborate on that.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
21 Peralta.

22 SENATOR PERALTA: Thank you,
23 Senator Klein.

24 Mr. President, we have an
25 opportunity here to do something that the federal

1 government has not been able to do. We have an
2 opportunity to pass the New York State DREAM Act.

3 Year after year, election year after
4 nonelection year, we've been promised on a
5 national level that there's going to be some form
6 of immigration reform. And year after year,
7 election year after nonelection year, it has
8 failed.

9 New York has an opportunity to step
10 up to the plate and hit it out of the park and
11 help children of undocumented immigrant parents
12 live that American dream. These children have
13 come here by no fault of their own. They have no
14 choice in the matter, and they have come here at
15 a young age, some as young as a year old or
16 2 years old.

17 Passing the DREAM Act would make
18 New York the fifth state to offer state college
19 financial aid to the children of immigrants
20 regardless of status, behind Texas, New Mexico,
21 California and, just a few weeks ago, Washington
22 State. So let me be clear, this is not the same
23 as the federal DREAM Act. There is no path
24 towards citizenship.

25 But what we do here is we want to

1 provide immigrants on the same footing as other
2 New York students when it comes to accessing
3 higher education. This bill will follow the same
4 criteria as in-state tuition that has been
5 available in New York since 2002.

6 Now, my great friend and colleague
7 Senator Espaillat led the way in 2002 in the
8 Assembly while he was in the Assembly. And right
9 here in this very body, in-state tuition was
10 passed in 2002 by a vote of 41-20. So this bill
11 lays out the same criteria of in-state tuition so
12 that individuals can get a higher education.

13 In addition to that, in order to be
14 eligible, an undocumented student must also
15 submit an affidavit stating that he or she has
16 filed an application to legalize his or her
17 immigration status. So these individuals, the
18 children of the undocumented parents, will be
19 eligible for TAP, HEOP, EOP, C-STEP and other
20 programs.

21 This measure will also create a
22 DREAM Fund, a DREAM Fund committed to advancing
23 the educational goals of the children of
24 immigrants through privately funded scholarships,
25 and broaden access to the New York State College

1 Tuition Savings, the 529 program. The family
2 tuition accounts will be available to anyone,
3 anyone who provides a valid taxpayer ID number or
4 an ITN number.

5 My fellow colleagues, this is an
6 opportunity, an opportunity to do the right
7 thing. This is about improving our pool of
8 talented children that want to better themselves.
9 This is about an investment. We will get a huge
10 profitable return on our investment. This is
11 about making economic sense. This is about
12 maintaining our status as a progressive and
13 trail-blazing state. This is about being and
14 maintaining ourselves as the capital of the
15 world.

16 Let's do the right thing today.
17 Let's pass the DREAM Act. Let's make history,
18 and let's allow individuals who want to better
19 themselves become productive members of society.

20 Thank you.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
22 Klein.

23 SENATOR KLEIN: Thank you,
24 Mr. President.

25 The legislation before us poses a

1 very simple question: Do you believe that every
2 New Yorker should have a fair shot at a quality
3 college education?

4 There are those who would seek to
5 complicate this answer by actually complicating
6 the merits of the bill before us, by instilling
7 fear and manipulating the meaning of exactly what
8 this important piece of legislation is meant to
9 do.

10 So I wanted to make it very clear
11 what this bill does. It allows for every
12 New York student to have the same shot at a
13 quality college education, nothing more or
14 nothing less. This bill levels the playing field
15 for high school graduates across the state,
16 giving them access to tuition assistance
17 regardless of their ethnicity or household
18 financial situation.

19 Getting into a battle about
20 immigration policy may be the conversation some
21 would like to have, but to turn the DREAM Act
22 into an immigration debate really misses the
23 point. The point is this, that we have thousands
24 of children who were brought here at a young age,
25 have been educated here, and are just as much a

1 part of the next-generation workforce of the
2 state as any of our children.

3 So to say that we are just going to
4 cut them out of the system by denying them the
5 chance to further their education is not just bad
6 economic policy, in my opinion, but a blatant
7 denial of our own history and heritage.

8 As our former Governor and
9 President, the great Franklin Delano Roosevelt,
10 once said: "Remember, remember always that all
11 of us, and you and I especially, are descended
12 from immigrants."

13 You know, it's often that on the
14 floor of Senate I've spoken about my
15 grandparents, my grandparents on my dad's side of
16 Hungarian ancestry, and on my mom's side, Polish
17 ancestry. And I think it's worth talking about
18 the fact that somehow, just somehow we forget who
19 we are and where we came from.

20 Each and every one of us in this
21 chamber are descendants from immigrants.
22 Somewhere in our family there was someone who
23 came to this country who had the courage, the
24 determination to make a new life. We always have
25 to remember that. Either they came here through

1 steerage or in chains, but nonetheless they came
2 here for a better life.

3 We also have to ask the question,
4 what's the difference between the prior immigrant
5 generation and those who come here today? And
6 the answer is nothing. They're all the same.
7 They come to make America their home. They come
8 to make a better life for them and their family.

9 And the reason why immigrants have
10 succeeded for hundreds and hundreds of years in
11 our society is because of a very simple truth.
12 When you think of what makes an immigrant, it's
13 somebody who leaves their family and friends
14 behind, they leave the life that they know best
15 behind. They build up the courage to start anew.
16 And to start anew, it's always for a better life
17 for their family.

18 So I think we really have to wrap
19 our arms around the fact that maybe the names
20 have changed in the past from O'Leary and
21 Goldberg and Solano, and maybe now they're
22 Gonzalez and Chang and other names. But
23 nonetheless, they're still the ancestors, and
24 those are the people who were the giants that
25 came before us who still come here today.

1 The lessons and spirit that they
2 instilled in us are the words and actions that
3 are rooted in enduring truth, that in America
4 everyone gets a fair shot. In America, if you
5 treat others with respect, honesty and kindness,
6 and most importantly, if you work hard, you will
7 find success.

8 And I believe that the spirit of
9 America that my grandparents instilled in me and
10 everyone else in this chamber, an America of
11 integrity, hard work, opportunity and reward, has
12 always been the enduring spirit of America. So
13 let us remember that we are a country of
14 inclusion, not exclusion. America is not some
15 exclusive club, and educational advancement in
16 this country is not only meant for some, it is
17 meant for anyone on this soil who is willing to
18 learn and has the dedication and determination to
19 succeed.

20 The ideals that this country was
21 built on are timeless. They should not change
22 with the political tides or fade over time. We
23 are a nation built on the notion that opportunity
24 exists for all, and when we put a stone in
25 another's path, we are not being true to the

1 values of our state or the spirit of our country.

2 These young people are no more
3 responsible for the decision and actions of their
4 parents than you and I are responsible for the
5 choices our parents may have made. We are not
6 here to be gatekeepers, picking and choosing who
7 gets a shot to learn and grow and be a success.
8 That is not our job. Our job as public servants
9 is to make space, create channels and open doors
10 for New Yorkers so that they can live a strong
11 and prosperous life. No one in this chamber gets
12 the right to stand in the way of someone else's
13 education. It's not what we are about.

14 I believe, my colleagues, that this
15 is not even a Republican or a Democratic issue,
16 nor a liberal or conservative issue, nor an issue
17 of immigration or citizenship. Because I firmly
18 believe that this is a right to have a decent
19 education. Just because someone is undocumented
20 does not make them unworthy of an education.

21 I'm sure many of you, over the last
22 couple of years, have spoken to some of the
23 Dreamers. And you just have to sometimes I think
24 maybe put yourselves in their shoes. During
25 their formative years they know that their

1 parents' choice to come here illegally -- and I
2 can only imagine it wasn't easy to have had to
3 keep that secret buried deep inside while all the
4 while feeling just as American as those sitting
5 right next to them in class.

6 I made a promise that this bill
7 would come to the floor because I think it's
8 important that we get a vote on the DREAM Act.
9 Each and every one of you I think have a duty, my
10 colleagues, that every New Yorker has a fair shot
11 at a quality education. It is a yes or no
12 answer, and with your answer, your vote, you're
13 either standing up for these students to get
14 their shot or standing in the way.

15 I stand with these students and vote
16 yes, Mr. President.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
18 Espaillat.

19 SENATOR ESPAILLAT: Thank you,
20 Mr. President.

21 We see here today an important day
22 in the history of this body. As Washington
23 continues to gridlock, many states have had to
24 take piecemeal pieces of the immigration reform
25 that many across the nation wait for. Today it

1 is New York's turn.

2 And back in 2002, we were successful
3 in passing in-state tuition, with a Republican
4 Governor and a Republican Senate. And we were
5 able to pass that bill, and it benefited 8,000
6 students in the system, in the university system
7 across the State of New York, offering them an
8 opportunity to access higher education. But we
9 saw that many of them could not afford the cost
10 of college tuition and that many of them were not
11 able to enter college.

12 And this bill that comes before us
13 today has been approved by the Assembly. The
14 Governor has said that he will sign the bill if
15 it comes to his desk. It has gotten the support
16 of all the major newspapers in their editorial
17 boards -- the New York Post, the Daily News, the
18 New York Times, Newsday, AM New York and others.

19 This bill has the support of
20 Cardinal Dolan and the Catholic Conference of
21 Bishops. It has the support of labor. And many
22 in the business community see this as an
23 important piece of legislation. How could they
24 all be wrong?

25 This is an important piece of

1 legislation that would allow 8,000 undocumented
2 students -- many of them came here when they were
3 one year old. Many of them may have difficulty
4 speaking their native language. Many of them
5 don't have any relatives back home where they
6 came from. These are young people that graduated
7 from a New York State high school or got a
8 General Equivalency Diploma from the State
9 Department of Education. They deserve an
10 opportunity, they deserve a shot.

11 And many have estimated, including
12 the Fiscal Policy Institute, that college
13 graduates on an average pay \$3,900 more annually
14 than non-college graduates in taxes.

15 So this is an investment for our
16 state, for the future professionals of tomorrow
17 that will pay taxes and build the middle class.
18 We must continue to support their efforts. And
19 I'm happy to be here in support of this
20 particular bill.

21 In the past, many have used scare
22 tactics to make us think that they are adopting
23 policies in New York State that will drive others
24 out or that will hurt some of our own. Nothing
25 could be further from the truth.

1 This is a state that is a state of
2 immigrants. This is a body, the Legislature,
3 that should have open arms to all that come to us
4 in goodwill. And these young students definitely
5 are the best among us. They have faced adverse
6 conditions, in many cases, circumstances in their
7 lives, and yet they want to access higher
8 education. They want to make sure that they are
9 the professionals, the taxpaying professionals of
10 tomorrow.

11 Mr. President, I am happy to stand
12 here in support of this bill, and I congratulate
13 Senator Peralta, the leading sponsor of this
14 bill, for his efforts to bring it to the floor.
15 And I congratulate also Senator Jeff Klein for
16 bringing this bill to the floor.

17 Let us vote up or down on this. Let
18 us vote our conscience. This is a good bill for
19 New York State. This is a good bill for all of
20 us. It will make our state stronger. And I will
21 be voting in the positive, Mr. President.

22 Thank you so much.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
24 Diaz.

25 SENATOR DIAZ: Thank you,

1 Mr. President.

2 Ladies and gentlemen, life sometimes
3 brings surprises. For the past three years, I
4 have been angry, I have been upset, I have been
5 disappointed, I have written columns, I have
6 written columns criticizing many people. I have
7 asked my colleagues not to vote on the budget
8 until the DREAM Act comes to the floor. And for
9 the past years, I have been the only one voting
10 on every part of the budget no because of the
11 DREAM Act.

12 Today, today is the day that God has
13 made. Today is one of those days when you
14 realize that things are done according to God's
15 will, whenever He wants and through whoever He
16 chooses. And today He has chosen Jeff Klein and
17 Senator Dean Skelos to allow this bill to come to
18 the floor.

19 So we are very happy, we are very
20 honored that finally this bill is coming to the
21 floor, came to the floor. And as Senator
22 Espaillat said, Governor Cuomo said that he will
23 sign it if it passes.

24 Senator Klein, in my heart is a lot
25 of gratitude for you. You have proven to be a

1 leader, you have proven to be a person that we
2 could trust. You told me Saturday that it was
3 coming to the floor, and now you are saying and I
4 see it is so. Thank you very much, I appreciate
5 that, and to Senator Skelos.

6 So I tip my hat to you, and I hope
7 that today we're done with this. I hope today we
8 all do away with this and bring happiness to
9 8,000 students waiting for this to happen.

10 To my colleague Senator Peralta, you
11 have worked hard. You have worked hard, and
12 today you see your fruits come true.

13 Senator Espaillat, you have proven
14 to be also a person that fights hard.

15 And to Assemblyman Moya on the other
16 side, and to my former intern, Assemblymember
17 Marco Crespo -- he's been also all over fighting
18 and working. I remember Marco Crespo, the
19 Assemblyman Crespo, when he was my intern, he's
20 from Peru. Half Puerto Rican and half Peruvian.
21 And I know how happy he will feel today to see
22 this pass. Marco, congratulations. You've been
23 fighting too for this.

24 To all of you guys, thank you very
25 much. Whatever comes to be the end result, I am

1 very happy, very glad that Senator Jeff Klein and
2 Senator Skelos finally bring this to the floor
3 and that we have the opportunity to say yes or
4 no.

5 But this is the day that the Lord
6 has made. Rejoice, be happy, be content, praise
7 the Lord. This is the day. Now it's up to you
8 guys.

9 Thank you very much.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
11 Parker.

12 SENATOR PARKER: Thank you,
13 Mr. President. On the bill.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
15 Parker on the bill.

16 SENATOR PARKER: I rise to add my
17 voice to those congratulating the members of the
18 house for bringing this very important bill to
19 the floor.

20 I represent the 21st District in
21 Brooklyn, which is Flatbush and East Flatbush,
22 Midwood, Ditmas Park, Kensington, Windsor Terrace
23 and Park Slope. This is a district that is
24 predominantly Caribbean immigrants, many of which
25 will benefit from the result of this bill.

1 I'm very, very happy that we are
2 bring it to the floor. Let me say a particular
3 congratulations to Senator Peralta for this great
4 accomplishment.

5 There are many of us who have been
6 carrying the baton. I actually introduced this
7 bill back in 2003 and actually held it with now
8 Senator Espaillat but then Assemblyman Espaillat.
9 And when he passed it and we were not able to get
10 it to the floor -- I know it was a version of the
11 bill, not this bill. And Senator Perkins I know
12 had a version of this bill for a while, and he
13 carried the baton for a while.

14 And so, you know, this is a good
15 case study on what it takes and the amount of
16 fortitude that it takes to actually get important
17 legislation to the floor. But the important
18 thing is that we persevered, that this chamber
19 and the people of this state continued to move
20 forward in the right direction, in a progressive
21 direction, to make sure that we upheld our
22 values.

23 And we often say in this chamber
24 that there is more nothing more important than
25 education, and particularly education because not

1 only does it help you, you know, take the step to
2 get a better job and have access to better
3 economic opportunity and seek the American dream,
4 but we know that people with better educations
5 have better health outcomes, they have less
6 interaction with the criminal justice system,
7 they have higher rates of homeownership. And
8 their children also have better health outcomes,
9 better homeownership, and so on and so forth.

10 And so that this is something that
11 we're doing not just for those Dreamers today,
12 but we're doing this for the citizens of tomorrow
13 who will benefit from us having a better-educated
14 citizenry around the State of New York.

15 Congratulations to the members of
16 the Senate.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
18 Rivera.

19 SENATOR RIVERA: Thank you,
20 Mr. President.

21 It is not every day that I can stand
22 on the floor of the Senate and say that I am
23 going to be supportive of something that Senator
24 Diaz is supportive is, that the New York Post is
25 supportive is, that business owners are

1 supportive of. It is absolutely a great day,
2 just like a lot of my colleagues have said
3 already.

4 The fact is that this is something
5 that is very simple. We have students that are
6 here in our school systems that have been
7 successful, that have been successful all the way
8 to high school and then find themselves on the
9 way to college and without necessarily being able
10 to afford it.

11 These folks, as some of my
12 colleagues have said, were young people that came
13 here without necessarily wanting to. Their
14 parents brought them here. They brought them
15 here to make better lives for themselves, to make
16 a better life for them. And when they find
17 themselves right now at the cusp of being able to
18 access a higher education institution, one of our
19 wonderful colleges in either the CUNY or the SUNY
20 system, then they find themselves, if they can't
21 afford it, that they cannot go.

22 And what we're doing here today is
23 something very simple. We're providing them that
24 access. It's not guaranteed money, but what it
25 is is if a student is successful, if a student

1 can demonstrate that they are worthy of our
2 educational system, then they should be able to
3 continue it.

4 I have a been a proud supporter of
5 this bill for a very long time. I certainly
6 thank my colleague Senator Peralta,
7 Assemblymember Moya, Senator Espaillat, all of
8 which have been very strong advocates for it.
9 And I certainly thank Senator Klein for being
10 able to bring it to the floor today.

11 But again, I ask all my colleagues
12 on the other side of the aisle who might be on
13 the fence about this, as I stated last week, this
14 is a diminutive cost. It is about \$25 million at
15 most. And this is to guarantee access for
16 students who have already been successful in the
17 educational system, give them the opportunity to
18 continue to be successful.

19 That is all that we are asking for
20 here today. That is all that the Dreamers are
21 asking for us. And I'm very proud to say I vote
22 aye on this bill.

23 Thank you, Mr. President.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
25 Smith.

1 SENATOR SMITH: Thank you very
2 much, Mr. President. On the bill.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
4 Smith on the bill.

5 SENATOR SMITH: Colleagues, today
6 represents exactly what New York State, what this
7 country is all about.

8 You take a moment to think about it,
9 here we are, Senator Peralta, on the day they
10 consider to be the luck of the Irish, that you
11 are now going to pass the DREAM Act, which is
12 going to benefit a lot of our immigrants. A lot
13 of Irish immigrants themselves I'm quite sure
14 would consider this a very important day. So the
15 luck of the Irish we hope will be with us on this
16 day.

17 Senator Peralta rightly gave you all
18 the economic benefits as relates to the DREAM
19 Act, and he's correct. The Comptroller's office
20 made it very clear, somebody with an associate's
21 degree, over their lifetime, will probably pay an
22 additional \$25,000 in taxes. That's important to
23 New York State. Someone with a bachelor's degree
24 will probably pay an additional \$60,000 in their
25 lifetime in terms of New York taxes. That's

1 important to this state.

2 Senator Klein gave you all of the
3 sociopolitical, geopolitical, economic concepts
4 as well as historical benefits of a bill such as
5 this and what it would mean to the state, what it
6 would mean to so many people around this state,
7 in particular in communities in New York City.

8 Assemblyman Crespo, who has been
9 fighting for years for this, has made this a
10 personal, has made this a personal mission on his
11 part. One in which not only did he lobby his
12 colleagues but spent a lot of time at home just
13 sort of personalizing and digesting what this
14 would mean to so many people.

15 And I know that, Assemblyman Crespo.
16 While you may have held that in, I know how much
17 it means to you, your family, and to your heart.

18 So, colleagues, last week as we
19 talked about the one-house budget, I had the
20 opportunity to talk about a few good ideas that I
21 thought would be important to us. As you know,
22 history always dictates and history will continue
23 to dictate not only what a good idea is but what
24 are right ideas.

25 Back a couple of years ago, many of

1 you who had some second thoughts about it, our
2 President came up with a concept called
3 Obamacare. While many people thought that was a
4 challenge, Obamacare was and is a good idea. The
5 right idea was this body and our Governor putting
6 together a health exchange which now has over
7 500,000 people who are registered in it. That
8 became the right idea.

9 A good idea -- and I know this is
10 always a good idea, tax relief. There's no
11 question about it, we all believe in tax relief
12 and believe that individuals should have some tax
13 relief in their lifetime. The right idea is
14 whether or not we do a circuit breaker or we did
15 a tax cap, which we did last year and maybe we'll
16 do this year. There is always a right idea that
17 benefits from a good idea.

18 Good idea. Senator Klein, Senator
19 Skelos, Senator Libous, Jose Peralta, Brother
20 Crespo all decided and worked to make sure that
21 the DREAM Act came to the floor today. That is a
22 good idea. The day that it comes, again, is
23 St. Patrick's Day, luck of the Irish.

24 The right idea will not just be the
25 bill coming to the floor, the right idea will be

1 that we pass this bill and the Governor of this
2 state will sign this bill so that there are many
3 individuals who will have the right to a decent
4 education, will have the right, as you have had
5 and I have had, to raise a family, to try to do
6 all that you can, as the American dream says,
7 that you can reach the highest heights as long as
8 you have an opportunity to an education.

9 Ladies and gentlemen, the one thing,
10 the one thing that is driving me this session
11 more than anything else is the need to make sure
12 that the individuals of our state -- young,
13 middle-aged and old -- have the opportunity to
14 have an education, have an opportunity to fulfill
15 that dream which they were told they could have
16 if they came to this state.

17 This is the day that we have the
18 right idea. So when we finish this debate and
19 those who are speaking on the bill, let's make
20 sure that history continues to have that lineage
21 that continues so often, and that is when you
22 come up with a good idea, the actual yield that
23 comes from that is the right idea.

24 Mr. President, the right idea is
25 that we pass this bill today and send a message

1 to all those who came to this state, and to
2 across this country, that New York State still
3 stands by that creed. And that is if you come
4 here, we will make a path for you to have one of
5 the best lives that you can have, and for your
6 children.

7 Thank you, Mr. President.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
9 Dilan.

10 SENATOR DILAN: Thank you,
11 Mr. President. On the bill.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
13 Dilan on the bill.

14 SENATOR DILAN: I rise to support
15 this piece of legislation which will benefit many
16 of my constituents. Many of those that live in
17 New York City are in the melting pot of the
18 world. And if New York City is the melting pot
19 of the world, so is New York State.

20 I just want to say happy
21 St. Patrick's Day to all, and let's hope that we
22 draw a four-leaf clover today and that it will be
23 a lucky day for all those Dreamers that have been
24 looking towards this day.

25 First I want to thank all those

1 responsible for bringing this bill to the floor
2 and ask all my colleagues to consider this
3 generation, which is seeking this dream to live
4 the American dream and just be educated in the
5 place that they know as their home.

6 So I will be voting in favor of this
7 bill.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
9 Hassell-Thompson.

10 SENATOR HASSELL-THOMPSON: Thank
11 you, Mr. President.

12 Just briefly, you've heard me stand
13 on this floor and say that just in the City of
14 Mount Vernon, which is only 14 percent of my
15 district, over 92 different languages are spoken
16 every day, from South Central Latin America, from
17 Portugal to Brazil, every Caribbean island, every
18 community that calls itself Caribbean in the
19 Caribbean Sea, is represented in the City of
20 Mount Vernon.

21 Therefore it's incumbent on me to
22 stand here before you and tell you, on behalf of
23 all of those people, it is important that what we
24 do today impacts them very positively. Too often
25 I have stood here and condemned some of the bills

1 that we have passed that have been detrimental to
2 their safety and to their way of life. But today
3 we have an opportunity before us to do something
4 so important to our children.

5 Having spoken to many of the
6 children and to families who have been in this
7 country for many years and who have young
8 children who have never seen their homeland, they
9 only know America as their homeland. They only
10 know New York as the place of their friendships,
11 their relationships. And because of that,
12 they're also not going home, they are staying in
13 America, because this is home for them.

14 And if it is, then it's very
15 important for us to understand that we need to do
16 everything right by them to make it possible so
17 that the lives that they live are exemplary. And
18 to do this, offering them a college education is
19 a major step toward making that happen.

20 I would like to hope that no matter
21 what your political standing is that you will
22 understand clearly that this is not just about
23 children of color, but this is of every immigrant
24 group that comes to the United States looking for
25 and finding succor and shelter here in this

1 country.

2 Thank you, Mr. President. I will be
3 voting yes.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
5 Serrano.

6 SENATOR SERRANO: Thank you,
7 Mr. President. On the bill.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
9 Serrano on the bill.

10 SENATOR SERRANO: It really is such
11 an amazing feeling and opportunity to rise before
12 my colleagues to talk about such an important
13 bill.

14 And listening to my colleagues who
15 spoke before me, you can hear in their voices how
16 personal this is, how long they've fought for
17 this, and the stories of their own immigrant
18 families and how they have had to deal with so
19 many of the obstacles and challenges there are
20 before them in achieving the American dream.

21 And in many ways it's very fitting
22 that we're taking this vote on St. Patrick's Day.
23 My district that I represent, East Harlem and the
24 South Bronx predominantly, is home to wave after
25 wave of immigrant communities from all walks.

1 For years it was the Irish immigrants. And think
2 about the obstacles that the Irish had to
3 overcome -- the prejudice, the discrimination.

4 The Italians, the Puerto Ricans, all
5 immigrants, migrants, people come from other
6 places, all understood that the key to overcoming
7 the obstacles was education. That education was
8 the great equalizer, that it would be the one
9 hope that the next generation had to doing better
10 than their parents were doing at that time.

11 And this is such an easy way to
12 ensure that the new immigrants achieve that
13 American dream that many immigrant families
14 before them were able to achieve. Education is
15 far more expensive now than it was in years past.
16 The obstacles are far greater in many ways.

17 And I think it's so important that
18 we take a very strong stand and understand that
19 the future of our society, the future of our
20 economy depends on a strong, well-educated
21 workforce. And the immigrant community, as we
22 know, will be a backbone of that workforce.

23 So I'm very happy to join my
24 colleagues in voting yes on this bill.

25 Thank you.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
2 Perkins.

3 SENATOR PERKINS: Thank you very
4 much. I want to speak on the bill.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
6 Perkins on the bill.

7 SENATOR PERKINS: I want to begin
8 by taking a moment to express my appreciation for
9 those who have been in this struggle on this
10 particular type of legislation before myself and
11 who have continued to keep the faith that this
12 day would come.

13 I myself was the lead sponsor of the
14 DREAM Act in this body. I am intimately familiar
15 with the moral and social imperative that this
16 act embodies.

17 I first heard these arguments
18 delivered with a personal and compelling
19 authenticity back in early 2011, when I sat down
20 with a group of inspiring young leaders from the
21 New York State Youth Leadership Council, also
22 known as YLC. To know something deep and
23 meaningful about the DREAM Act is to know the
24 tirelessly committed young women and men of the
25 YLC. Their dreams are without limit, and the

1 actions flowing from their dreams are equally
2 boundless.

3 The courageous members of the YLC
4 were singularly undeterred by past repeated
5 DREAM Act failures at the federal level and knew
6 that the fight for equality had to be taken to
7 the grassroots enclaves of state and local
8 government. The courage of the YLC members is
9 especially great due to the fact that they're
10 actually undocumented themselves. Their advocacy
11 was born of personal experience and gut-level
12 fortitude that belied the great personal risk
13 undertaken by each and every Dream member.

14 In short order, due to their intense
15 focus and personal investment, we rolled out the
16 cornerstone of the New York State DREAM Act,
17 comprehensive access to higher educational
18 opportunity programs for all undocumented youth.

19 This cornerstone was designed and
20 constructed by the YLC. No amount of cutting,
21 pasting or other sources will ever change the
22 bedrock truth: Their partnership fashioned the
23 very first version of the DREAM Act ever
24 introduced in the New York State Senate. And I
25 am honored today to be able to vote on this

1 particular bill.

2 Langston Hughes wrote a poem, "A
3 Dream Deferred." At that time he was talking
4 about another group of so-called immigrants who
5 actually were never immigrants. Those of us who
6 are African-American were never immigrants.
7 Nevertheless, today we are honored to be able to
8 see the opportunity for a dream come true.

9 Thank you very much. I vote aye on
10 this bill.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
12 Sanders.

13 SENATOR SANDERS: Thank you,
14 Mr. President. On the bill.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
16 Sanders on the bill.

17 SENATOR SANDERS: I represent the
18 simple and hardworking people of Springfield
19 Gardens, Rosedale, South Ozone Park, Richmond
20 Hill, the Rockaways and other parts of a great
21 city called New York City. And I've been
22 wrestling with this idea of this bill for a
23 little bit. And let me see if I understand it.

24 I'm understanding that youth,
25 sometimes infants, were brought by their parents

1 to a land unknown to themselves, and often
2 against their wishes. Hmm. As an
3 African-American, I certainly can appreciate
4 that. My own family fled a dictatorship, a harsh
5 place that they fled to get to a better life. We
6 of course fled the Jim Crow South for a better
7 life, in which education was the most important
8 thing that was preached to us from morning till
9 night.

10 My family was so simple in one sense
11 that, after a while, I could have held the book
12 upside down and they would not have known. But
13 they insisted that we get education by all means.

14 So I absolutely understand when
15 people say that there is a need for education,
16 especially in the 21st century that we find
17 ourselves in.

18 My friends, this one is not that
19 difficult once you start wrestling with it. Once
20 you look at the positives and the negatives, you
21 see something simple, something clear, something
22 American, if you wish. Something that says that
23 we will not close the doors. That Lady Liberty,
24 who still is out there in the water, will not be
25 by herself, that we in the State Senate will join

1 together with her on such a great day.

2 On one hand, we can celebrate
3 chasing away the snakes. And I think that
4 perhaps we need to chase away miseducation, that
5 we need to chase away backwardness. And one of
6 the best ways of doing that is to allow children
7 to become educated.

8 It is St. Patrick's Day, and I
9 congratulate all of those who share that fine
10 lineage. I will leave you with a Chinese saying.
11 I couldn't find a good Irish one with enough
12 time, so I will appropriate a Chinese saying. It
13 says that if you are preparing for one year, you
14 plant wheat. If you prepare for 10 years, you
15 plant trees. But if you prepare for a hundred
16 years, my friends, educate children.

17 Let's prepare for a hundred years.
18 I'm going to vote aye.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
20 Krueger.

21 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you,
22 Mr. President. On the bill.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
24 Krueger on the bill.

25 SENATOR KRUEGER: Well, my

1 colleagues are so convincing and they have been
2 so articulate about the reasons why we must vote
3 for this bill today.

4 And I just ask each of my colleagues
5 who might not have already realized that the
6 right answer is to vote yes to think of their own
7 family histories, to think of how their
8 grandparents or great-grandparents came to this
9 country and why.

10 My own escaped the pogroms of
11 eastern Europe. And I'm quite sure, because I've
12 checked, that most of my family, when escaping to
13 the U.S., didn't have paperwork. And they hoped
14 that they be welcomed in when they got here on
15 the ships, but they didn't know for sure. They
16 just knew that they couldn't go back, that they
17 didn't have a home country, and they wanted
18 better for themselves and their children and
19 their children's children.

20 And that is exactly the story of
21 each of these young people who are asking us
22 simply to let them go to school.

23 And each of my colleagues who have
24 told the story perhaps from their own generation
25 of this experience, if the rest of us just close

1 our eyes and think about the stories we heard in
2 childhood from our grandparents about why they
3 came here or about why their parents before them
4 came here, none of us will really have a
5 different story.

6 Not only is it the right thing to
7 do, it's the best thing to do. Why is this the
8 best country in the world? Because we opened our
9 arms to immigrants from throughout the world who
10 wanted to come here to help make it the best
11 country in the world.

12 Why is this the greatest state in
13 this country? Because we have been the entry
14 port for immigrants from throughout the world
15 generation after generation.

16 And what made each of these
17 generations of new New Yorkers, new Americans,
18 become the leaders of where this country was
19 going and is going? The fact that they were able
20 to get the education that they needed to help
21 make this country better, to help make sure that
22 their children accomplished better.

23 It's so simple. It's simply the
24 story of our nation and our country. That's all
25 we're being asked to do today, just allow the

1 next step for a few of the next generation.

2 I can't imagine anyone voting no,
3 Mr. President. I vote aye.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
5 Squadron.

6 SENATOR SQUADRON: Thank you,
7 Mr. President. On the bill.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
9 Squadron on the bill.

10 SENATOR SQUADRON: As many people
11 in this chamber know, I represent the Lower East
12 Side and Chinatown in Lower Manhattan, parts of
13 Brooklyn. Like so many others in this chamber, I
14 represent an area that doesn't just have the
15 current constituents but has so many who came
16 before.

17 How many people in this chamber had
18 their family's journey in this country start just
19 in that little part of the world? Whether German
20 or Irish, Jewish or Chinese immigrants, it is who
21 we are as a country.

22 And you know, my grandparents
23 started there too. And my father went to City
24 College and found a great life in this city. It
25 would have been unthinkable in that generation to

1 say if you work hard and you do your best and you
2 want to go to college, the government says no.
3 You work hard, you do your best, you want the
4 next generation to stand on your shoulders, but
5 the government says you're on your own. It would
6 have been unthinkable a couple of generations
7 ago.

8 And today, what message does it
9 send? We have lots and lots and lots, thousands
10 upon thousands of young people who are here, who
11 are here under tough circumstances, many of them
12 brought here without documentation when they were
13 kids, even very young kids. They're doing their
14 best despite all the challenges that that brings.
15 It wasn't their decision.

16 Now they want to go to college. And
17 we want the government to say no way? Well,
18 that's what's been happening in this state. And
19 that's what this bill can solve. It can say if
20 you do the things that you're supposed to, we
21 will support you in making sure the next
22 generation can stand on your shoulders. It's
23 very simple.

24 You know, also in my district is the
25 Statue of Liberty. And it's appropriate that it

1 sits there in New York Harbor surrounded by the
2 places in New York City that it does, surrounded
3 by the great state that all of us together
4 represent. And certainly it's an image that puts
5 an extra obligation on each of us, because we are
6 the place where so many -- not just across this
7 state, but across this country -- started.

8 And the fact that we would be the
9 fifth state to do this is disappointing. But
10 it's also appropriate that we would be among the
11 first states to do this, because we do stand
12 alone. We alone have that statue in the harbor
13 urging people to come here if and only if they're
14 going to do their best to better themselves and
15 their families.

16 And that's what bill is about. I'll
17 vote aye, and I hope that enough of my colleagues
18 will to give folks who want to a chance in this
19 country.

20 Thank you, Mr. President.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
22 Hoylman.

23 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Mr. President, on
24 the bill.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator

1 Hoylman on the bill.

2 SENATOR HOYLMAN: As our colleagues
3 have mentioned, Mr. President, it is appropriate
4 that we are discussing this important piece of
5 legislation today. And everyone is wearing their
6 green ties and lapel pins and scarves.
7 Mr. President, I should add that I think you have
8 the greenest tie of all today. So well done on
9 that.

10 I wanted to say that I think it's
11 rare for us to take a single vote, as we are
12 today, that will have such a potentially profound
13 impact on an individual's life. And that's
14 4500 lives a year, 4500 undocumented students
15 graduating from New York State public schools who
16 are being denied an education, the opportunity
17 for an education.

18 And I wanted to read from a recent
19 newspaper editorial which says "New York has an
20 opportunity to fix one of the most perverse
21 incentives of the failing status quo and help
22 some high school grads go to college. Few
23 New Yorkers would deny a child college aid on the
24 grounds of his father's crime. So even if you
25 think these student's parents were criminal for

1 coming here without a visa, why do it to them?"
2 And that's not the New York Times, that's not the
3 liberal Village Voice or The Nation, that's the
4 New York Post.

5 Immigration, Mr. President, is now a
6 bipartisan issue. It's a postpartisan issue for
7 a whole host of reasons. There's the justice and
8 equality aspect, but there's also -- and I think
9 my colleagues, our friends on the other side of
10 the aisle, recognize it -- an important economic
11 reason.

12 And to that point, Mr. President,
13 the State Comptroller released a report last
14 summer stating that the DREAM Act could provide
15 economic benefits at a very small cost. He
16 estimated that a person with an associate's
17 degree pays more than \$35,000 in additional state
18 taxes over their career than someone with only a
19 high school diploma, and a person with a
20 bachelor's degree pays \$60,000 in additional
21 state taxes.

22 So I'm proud to be standing here
23 supporting the DREAM Act, thanking my colleagues
24 for bringing it to the floor, thanking Senator
25 Peralta for his tireless effort in doing so, and

1 voting aye on this very important piece of
2 legislation for the future of New York State's
3 economy.

4 Thank you, Mr. President.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Are there
6 any other Senators wishing to speak?

7 Senator Peralta to close.

8 SENATOR PERALTA: Thank you,
9 Mr. President.

10 My fellow colleagues, it's not too
11 often that we come to decide a bill by a
12 razor-thin vote. And here's probably what's
13 going to happen. This will either pass or fail
14 by a razor-thin margin.

15 My colleagues, we have explained why
16 it's important, the moral issue, the moral
17 argument. But let me talk a little bit about
18 some of the facts that you may not know.

19 The DREAM Act has been in place for
20 three years in California. The DREAM Act has
21 been in place for five years in New Mexico. The
22 DREAM Act has been in place for over a decade in
23 Texas, signed by Governor Rick Perry.

24 Most of these individuals that we're
25 talking about will qualify under DACA, the

1 Deferred Action for Children Arrivals Act, signed
2 by executive order by the President of the
3 United States.

4 And some may question, Well, how
5 will they get jobs? Well, they can either become
6 independent contractors or they can own small
7 businesses. In fact, scholars have estimated
8 that as many as 8 to 10 percent of all
9 undocumented immigrants start up small
10 businesses.

11 And if some ask the question, Well,
12 why are we giving TAP or Opportunity Programs to
13 those individuals who are undocumented because
14 they don't pay taxes, well, let me tell you this.
15 In 2010, undocumented immigrants in this great
16 state of ours paid \$744,276,000 in taxes. And
17 when you look at the federal level, every single
18 year the Social Security Administration keeps
19 \$6 billion to \$7 billion in Social Security
20 contributions from W-2s that cannot be matched.
21 And the vast majority of that money comes from
22 the undocumented immigrants. In the United
23 States of America alone, undocumented paid
24 \$10.6 billion in state and local taxes.

25 We are not removing a single United

1 States citizen from receiving TAP with this piece
2 of legislation. That's something important to
3 keep in mind.

4 As you know, in 1982 the United
5 States Supreme Court ruled in Plyler v. Doe that
6 undocumented children and young adults have the
7 same right to attend public primary and secondary
8 schools as do United States citizens. So we've
9 been paying for education from K through 12 based
10 on that decision. Now these kids are going to
11 hit a ceiling, and what we're going to do is
12 create a permanent underclass if we don't vote
13 for this.

14 In that decision, Plyler v. Doe, a
15 quote from Justice Brennan: "Even if the state
16 found it expedient to control the conduct of
17 adults by acting against their kids, legislation
18 directing the onus of a parent's misconduct
19 against his kids does not comport with
20 fundamental conceptions of justice." In other
21 words, New York should not be a place that
22 punishes children for the actions of their
23 parents.

24 Do we really want to punish the
25 children for the actions of their parents? I

1 don't know any one of you that would punish your
2 children for the actions that you've taken. I
3 don't know any one of your constituents that
4 would punish their children for the actions that
5 they took.

6 But if that doesn't convince you,
7 let me read a quote from Governor Rick Perry:
8 "We must say, to every Texas child learning in a
9 Texas classroom, 'We don't care where you come
10 from, but where you're going, and we're going to
11 do everything we can to help you get there.' And
12 that vision must include the children of
13 undocumented workers. That's why Texas took the
14 national lead in allowing such deserving young
15 minds to attend a Texas college at a resident
16 rate. Those young minds are a part of a new
17 generation of leaders. The doors of higher
18 education must be open to them. The message is
19 simple: educacion es el futuro, y si se puede."

20 But let me go one closer. Mayor
21 Bloomberg: "We're not deporting you, but we're
22 not letting you succeed either, even though our
23 economy wants you and needs you. That's about as
24 dumb a policy as I can think of, and we must
25 change this."

1 Ladies and gentlemen, my fellow
2 colleagues, we have an opportunity here. And
3 some of your constituents may say: Vote no, vote
4 nay. But some of those same constituents that
5 are telling you to vote no own small businesses,
6 own restaurants, are contractors. And guess who
7 is the cook in those restaurants, guess who is
8 the valet driver in those restaurants, guess who
9 is the dishwasher in those restaurants, guess who
10 is the day laborer for that contractor?
11 Undocumented immigrants.

12 So it's okay for those small
13 businesses who are voters to say, Vote against
14 this, but yet I am living the American dream
15 through those undocumented individuals, through
16 the parents of those undocumented individuals,
17 but it's not okay to educate the children, their
18 children, who worked hard, who excelled, who want
19 to make difference.

20 All they're asking for is to meet
21 the criteria that's already in state law and to
22 get that higher education so that they can get
23 the jobs. They can either become independent
24 contractors or open up their small business, or
25 they qualify for DACA, which means that every two

1 years they will qualify to live here, work here,
2 and get a Social Security number.

3 So here we have an opportunity, my
4 colleagues. Not often do we get an opportunity
5 to make or break a certain piece of legislation.
6 This is one of those times.

7 I know in my heart of hearts that
8 some of you on the other side of the aisle would
9 like to vote for this. Here's your opportunity,
10 this one chance to make it happen. You've got to
11 ask yourself, are you going to be on the right
12 side of history or will you be on the wrong side
13 of history?

14 I'm going to be on the right side of
15 history, and I'm going to vote yes. Because we
16 need to send a loud message that not only this
17 country but this state became great because of
18 immigrants.

19 Let's not create a permanent
20 underclass. Let's ensure that these
21 individuals -- and we're only talking about 4500
22 or so -- these individuals that want to excel,
23 excel. It's up to you. We need a few votes.
24 Let's make it a reality.

25 I vote yea, Mr. President.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
2 debate is closed.

3 The Secretary will ring the bell.
4 Read the last section.

5 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
7 Gianaris, why do you rise?

8 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
9 we have five members requesting a slow roll call
10 on this vote, please.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
12 Gianaris, in accordance with Rule 9, seeing five
13 Senators rise, a slow roll call is so ordered.

14 Read the last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
16 act shall take effect immediately.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
18 Libous, why do you rise?

19 SENATOR LIBOUS: We certainly,
20 Mr. President, want to oblige the slow roll call.
21 But if I could ask that if you could call out of
22 order for Senator DeFrancisco, then
23 Senator Ritchie, then go back to the beginning of
24 the roll.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The Clerk

1 is so instructed.

2 The Secretary will call the roll.

3 THE SECRETARY: Senator

4 DeFrancisco.

5 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: No.

6 THE SECRETARY: Senator Ritchie.

7 SENATOR RITCHIE: No.

8 THE SECRETARY: Senator Addabbo.

9 SENATOR ADDABBO: Yes.

10 THE SECRETARY: Senator Avella.

11 SENATOR AVELLA: Yes.

12 THE SECRETARY: Senator Ball.

13 SENATOR BALL: No.

14 THE SECRETARY: Senator Bonacic.

15 SENATOR BONACIC: No.

16 THE SECRETARY: Senator Boyle,

17 excused.

18 Senator Breslin.

19 SENATOR BRESLIN: Yes.

20 THE SECRETARY: Senator Carlucci.

21 SENATOR CARLUCCI: Yes.

22 THE SECRETARY: Senator DeFrancisco

23 recorded in the negative.

24 Senator Diaz.

25 SENATOR DIAZ: To explain my vote.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
2 Diaz to explain his vote.

3 SENATOR DIAZ: Thank you,
4 Mr. President.

5 As I said before, for the last three
6 years I have been asking my colleagues to vote no
7 on the budget because the DREAM Act was not
8 included. My colleague Senator Gustavo Rivera
9 says that he's amazed that he's voting, he finds
10 himself voting with me for something that I've
11 voted.

12 You know, this is something that
13 it's incredible. Because as a Democrat, I make
14 no second to no one. Only two issues I'm voting
15 against the Democrats, gay marriage and abortion.
16 But any other issue, Mr. President, and my
17 colleagues know, I'm the one fighting. I'm the
18 one fighting the Governor, I'm the one
19 criticizing people for not voting the way that
20 they're supposed to be voting to help our
21 community.

22 So yes, yes, I'm proud to vote yes.
23 I'm proud that Gustavo Rivera joins me today. I
24 am sorry he didn't join me three years ago or the
25 last three years when I asked him to vote no

1 because the DREAM Act was not there. But today
2 I'm honored that he's joining me in voting yes
3 today.

4 Thank you, Mr. President.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
6 Diaz to be recorded in the affirmative.

7 Continue the roll.

8 THE SECRETARY: Senator Dilan.

9 SENATOR DILAN: Yes.

10 THE SECRETARY: Senator Espaillet.

11 SENATOR ESPAILLET: Yes.

12 THE SECRETARY: Senator Farley.

13 SENATOR FARLEY: No.

14 THE SECRETARY: Senator Felder.

15 SENATOR FELDER: No.

16 THE SECRETARY: Senator Flanagan.

17 SENATOR FLANAGAN: No.

18 THE SECRETARY: Senator Gallivan.

19 SENATOR GALLIVAN: No.

20 THE SECRETARY: Senator Gianaris.

21 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

22 THE SECRETARY: Senator Gipson.

23 SENATOR GIPSON: Yes.

24 THE SECRETARY: Senator Golden.

25 SENATOR GOLDEN: No.

1 THE SECRETARY: Senator Griffo.

2 SENATOR GRIFFO: No.

3 THE SECRETARY: Senator Grisanti.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
5 Grisanti to explain his vote.

6 SENATOR GRISANTI: Thank you,
7 Mr. President.

8 My colleagues, it's going to come as
9 no surprise with regard to the DREAM Act, no
10 surprise to anybody that I vote no. And I've
11 been vocal on this ever since Speaker Silver
12 brought this to the floor.

13 This has nothing to do about
14 grandparents of anybody here in this room. Our
15 grandparents went through a naturalization
16 process and are here legally. So when you talk
17 about grandparents and they came through, yes, my
18 grandparents came here, they worked very hard, it
19 was very difficult for them, but they fought and
20 they went through a naturalization process where
21 they had to fill out forms and came here legally.

22 Now, I simply cannot vote for this
23 legislation because of spending tens of millions
24 of taxpayer dollars annually to pay tuition for
25 illegal immigrants when so many legal families

1 are struggling with the high cost of college
2 education right now.

3 Roughly 76 percent, 76 percent of
4 legal New York State college individuals going to
5 college right now are not eligible for TAP.
6 These are your constituents. They came here by
7 the proper channels, are legal citizens of this
8 great state of ours that don't have access to
9 TAP. Seventy-six percent.

10 We need to focus on what we did in
11 our one-house budget. We need to focus first on
12 increasing our TAP and increasing the
13 requirements for TAP so those that are here
14 legally and those who went through the proper
15 channels have access to TAP first and foremost.
16 That's what we need to do.

17 And recall that in 2010, prior to me
18 getting here, in 2010 the Senate Democrats, when
19 you guys were in power, you voted and took away
20 TAP for graduate students that are here legally.
21 You took away the TAP for graduate students.

22 When you did that, you then put
23 those legal students that are going to college in
24 financial peril in 2010. That was only four
25 years ago. You know what happened?

1 Unfortunately those kids in graduate school
2 couldn't go ahead and finish. That's what
3 happened.

4 And what is the federal government
5 doing about this? Well, nothing. Nothing.
6 Since 1994 the federal government has denied
7 Pell grants to illegal immigrants, a policy
8 upheld by both Democrat and Republican
9 presidents. Since 1994, no Pell.

10 Without action from the federal
11 government on the citizenship status of these
12 undocumented illegal individuals, the vast
13 majority would not even be able to hold a job
14 legally. They can't pay taxes legally, state and
15 federal. They cannot be hired legally or else
16 employers would be subject to severe penalties.

17 Enacting the DREAM Act does not
18 convey citizenship on an individual. Enacting
19 the DREAM Act does not convey citizenship. It
20 takes away TAP from the legal residents, those
21 76 percent that don't have the ability to afford
22 college either.

23 This proposal may be popular in
24 New York City, but the overwhelming majority of
25 my district in Western New York -- Buffalo,

1 Hamburg, Orchard Park, Tonawanda, Grand Island --
2 they do not support it. With the limited state
3 resources, we owe our citizens here in New York
4 State an education first and foremost, and that's
5 what we tried to do in our one-house budget.

6 I cannot support this legislation,
7 and those are my reasons. It has nothing to do
8 about my grandparents or anything else, it has to
9 do with the legal residents being taken care of
10 first in this great state of ours.

11 I vote no.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
13 Grisanti to be recorded in the negative.

14 Continue the roll.

15 THE SECRETARY: Senator Hannon.

16 (No response.)

17 THE SECRETARY: Senator
18 Hassell-Thompson.

19 SENATOR HASSELL-THOMPSON: Aye.

20 THE SECRETARY: Senator Hoylman.

21 SENATOR HOYLMAN: Yes.

22 THE SECRETARY: Senator Kennedy.

23 SENATOR KENNEDY: Yes.

24 THE SECRETARY: Senator Klein.

25 SENATOR KLEIN: Yes.

1 THE SECRETARY: Senator Krueger.
2 SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes.
3 THE SECRETARY: Senator Lanza.
4 SENATOR LANZA: No.
5 THE SECRETARY: Senator Larkin.
6 SENATOR LARKIN: No.
7 THE SECRETARY: Senator Latimer.
8 SENATOR LATIMER: Yes.
9 THE SECRETARY: Senator LaValle.
10 SENATOR LaVALLE: No.
11 THE SECRETARY: Senator Libous.
12 SENATOR LIBOUS: No.
13 THE SECRETARY: Senator Little.
14 SENATOR LITTLE: No.
15 THE SECRETARY: Senator Marcellino.
16 SENATOR MARCELLINO: No.
17 THE SECRETARY: Senator Marchione.
18 SENATOR MARCHIONE: No.
19 THE SECRETARY: Senator Martins.
20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
21 Martins to explain his vote.
22 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,
23 Mr. President.
24 You know, I stand on this bill --
25 first of all, let me make it clear, I will be

1 voting no.

2 As I have mentioned to many of our
3 colleagues when we've had discussions on this
4 bill over the years, this is a bill that
5 resonates. We are a country of immigrants. We
6 all understand that. Some of us are sons of
7 immigrants, grandchildren of immigrants. We've
8 heard examples throughout our conversations
9 today. And I want to thank my colleagues for
10 their eloquent pleas on behalf of this bill,
11 because it has been heard.

12 And if this bill was about providing
13 an opportunity for those children who arrived
14 here as infants with their parents and providing
15 them an opportunity, those same children who we
16 have educated and who we put through K through 12
17 and we have a commitment as a community to
18 support, we'd be having a different discussion.

19 But this bill doesn't do that.
20 Let's be frank, this isn't what that bill is
21 about. This bill opens the door far wider than
22 that which we're discussing here.

23 And this isn't about opportunity for
24 people to go to college. This great house and
25 this great state and the people of this great

1 state made that decision back in 2002 when they
2 allowed in-state tuition for every resident in
3 New York State, including undocumented
4 immigrants.

5 So let's get that straight. The
6 taxpayers of New York State today spend over
7 \$22,000 a year for every student in the SUNY
8 system, over \$22,000 a year. The in-state
9 tuition for SUNY is \$6,000. My dear colleagues,
10 the residents of my district, the residents of
11 your district, the taxpayers of this great state
12 are subsidizing every student in the SUNY system
13 right now to the tune of \$16,000 per student,
14 today, because of the actions of this house and
15 many of the people who are in this room today.

16 I have family that emigrated to this
17 country. I don't believe that that makes them an
18 underclass. Personally, I think we're beyond
19 that. When they came here, they came looking for
20 opportunities for their children and a better
21 life. That's what this is about.

22 This state is the most generous
23 state in the country, bar none. We take care of
24 our own. And to the extent that we have already,
25 and to the extent that this bill goes well beyond

1 what we talked about in many of the examples that
2 we heard here today, I will be voting no.

3 You know, someone said just because
4 someone is undocumented does not make them
5 unworthy of an education. I agree. I agree.
6 And this state agrees, and the taxpayers of this
7 state agree, and the residents of this state
8 agree. That's why we have allowed for in-state
9 tuition for everybody. For everybody. But this
10 bill goes well beyond that, far beyond that.

11 And so until we are able to provide
12 every student in this state with a free
13 education -- graduate, undergraduate --
14 Mr. President, I'll be voting no.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
16 Martins in the negative.

17 Continue the roll.

18 THE SECRETARY: Senator Maziarz.

19 SENATOR MAZIARZ: No.

20 THE SECRETARY: Senator Montgomery.

21 SENATOR MONTGOMERY: Yes.

22 THE SECRETARY: Senator Nozzolio.

23 SENATOR NOZZOLIO: No.

24 THE SECRETARY: Senator O'Brien.

25 SENATOR O'BRIEN: No.

1 THE SECRETARY: Senator O'Mara.

2 SENATOR O'MARA: No.

3 THE SECRETARY: Senator Parker.

4 SENATOR PARKER: To explain my
5 vote, Mr. President.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
7 Parker to explain his vote.

8 SENATOR PARKER: I rise to vote yes
9 on this bill. But I think it's important for us
10 to get the record straight on a few things.

11 We shouldn't think about the money
12 that we are putting into education to advance our
13 citizenry as a subsidy. It is an investment.
14 It's an investment. For years, you know, and
15 Simcha Felder can back me up on this, we
16 represented the same district in Borough Park.
17 In Jewish culture the first thing that you build
18 when you go into a community is a shul, a school.
19 It's the first thing that you do. Before you
20 build a temple, before you do anything else, you
21 build a school. Because education has to be the
22 prime thing that we do.

23 And I think that I'm disheartened by
24 the number of no votes that I'm hearing here, and
25 I think that we don't understand how important it

1 is to educate our citizenry no matter what the
2 circumstances are in which they come here.

3 But as we come and talk about the
4 circumstances in which our folks have come here,
5 we should be clear that what people's
6 grandparents and great-grandparents did in order
7 to become naturalized, let's not act like it's
8 the same process, because it's not. Right?
9 Because what people are doing now to become
10 citizens is very, very different than writing
11 your name as you got off a boat. That's
12 different. Right?

13 Now people are getting background
14 checks and all kinds of things that just
15 literally did not exist a hundred years ago when
16 people's grandparents got here. So let's not
17 pretend like there was some rigorous process that
18 anybody went through and they got pledged and all
19 that. Because it wasn't that. So let's be very
20 clear about that.

21 Also, as we talk about TAP in 2010
22 and the vote that was taken, that vote that was
23 taken was not a vote on TAP for graduate
24 students, it was actually a vote on an extender
25 to extend government in which the Governor then

1 put other things in the extender and advanced the
2 budget. It was a horrible vote. It was horrible
3 that our budget process was in that state of
4 disrepair in 2010. But that's what it was. And
5 so we should have the record straight that there
6 was not a vote by Democrats to vote against
7 graduate TAP.

8 However, there was an opportunity
9 just last week for the majority party to put
10 graduate TAP in their resolution, and I did not
11 see that in their resolution. So correct me if
12 I'm wrong, but I didn't see us putting graduate
13 TAP back in the budget resolution. Nor did I see
14 us, you know, extending it for part-time students
15 in a way that people could really access it.

16 So again, if we want to do those
17 things, I'm happy to work with all of my
18 colleagues in this body to see those things get
19 done. As both a graduate student myself and as a
20 college professor, again, I think that stuff is
21 absolutely critical for us to advance all of our
22 citizenry and make sure that education becomes
23 the primary value of this body.

24 Thank you very much. I vote aye.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator

1 Parker is recorded in the affirmative.

2 I want to remind all members that in
3 accordance with the rules -- we have been
4 somewhat flexible with all members, but let's
5 exercise the two-minute explanation in voting and
6 explaining your votes.

7 The Secretary will continue the
8 roll.

9 THE SECRETARY: Senator Peralta.

10 SENATOR PERALTA: To explain my
11 vote.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
13 Peralta to explain his vote.

14 SENATOR PERALTA: Thank you,
15 Mr. President.

16 Interesting points that were just
17 recently made. I don't know if some of my
18 colleagues were in the room when I was speaking,
19 but I think all of you were. But the points that
20 were made were they don't pay taxes.

21 Well, let me reiterate. In 2010,
22 undocumented immigrants contributed an estimated
23 \$744,276,000 in taxes in New York State.
24 Overall, in the country, \$6 billion to \$7 billion
25 in Social Security contributions without W-2

1 forms. The vast majority of that money comes
2 from undocumented immigrants.

3 They can't work here. Okay, let me
4 reiterate. A lot of them will qualify for DACA.
5 Many of them could be independent contractors.
6 And most of them will be small business owners,
7 which don't need paperwork, in terms of this
8 issue, to move forward.

9 Let's see. It's not about young
10 children, it's about -- it's not about young
11 children and it's not about opportunity. Well,
12 it is about young children because many of these
13 children have come here at a very young age, very
14 young age. And they qualify for DACA. For those
15 of you who don't know, DACA, you have to be here
16 before the age of 16. Many of those children did
17 not make a decision on their own to come here,
18 their parents brought them here.

19 Opportunity that will open the doors
20 to illegals, to the undocumented. Well, let me
21 tell you this. According to the Comptroller, the
22 undocumented have decreased since 2004. So
23 there's not this mass opening of the floodgates.

24 Actions that were taken by this very
25 body in 2002, in-state tuition. Well, let me

1 tell you this. Sixteen Republicans voted for
2 in-state tuition in 2002, including Senator
3 Hannon and Senator Skelos. So the action that
4 you're referring to in 2002 was passed by this
5 very body when the Republicans were in control.

6 Another point, taxes. It was very
7 well-articulated by my colleagues that, according
8 to a DiNapoli report, if you graduate with an
9 associate's degree, if you graduate with an
10 associate's degree, that individual will pay over
11 \$30,000 in their lifetime in taxes. If you
12 graduate with a bachelor's degree, that
13 individual will pay over \$60,000 in their
14 lifetime. They will continue to pay taxes just
15 like they're currently paying taxes.

16 Let's be clear. Let's not muffle or
17 spin the issue. Because I was very clear when I
18 spoke in terms of taxes and when I spoke about
19 the 2002 vote. So please, let's be very clear in
20 terms of what these individuals are doing to
21 promote the betterment of New York State.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
23 Peralta --

24 SENATOR PERALTA: Thank you,
25 Mr. President. I vote in the affirmative.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
2 Peralta to be recorded in the affirmative.
3 Continue the roll.
4 THE SECRETARY: Senator Perkins.
5 SENATOR PERKINS: Aye.
6 THE SECRETARY: Senator
7 Ranzenhofer.
8 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: No.
9 THE SECRETARY: Senator Ritchie in
10 the negative.
11 Senator Rivera.
12 SENATOR RIVERA: Sí.
13 THE SECRETARY: Senator Robach.
14 SENATOR ROBACH: No.
15 THE SECRETARY: Senator Sampson.
16 SENATOR SAMPSON: Aye.
17 THE SECRETARY: Senator Sanders.
18 SENATOR SANDERS: Emphatically yes.
19 THE SECRETARY: Senator Savino.
20 SENATOR SAVINO: Yes.
21 THE SECRETARY: Senator Serrano.
22 SENATOR SERRANO: To explain my
23 vote.
24 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
25 Serrano to explain his vote.

1 SENATOR SERRANO: I just want to
2 make clear, I believe and so many people believe
3 wholeheartedly that this is not a handout, this
4 is an opportunity for people to show their
5 strength, which is so much of what the American
6 dream is all about. This is not a handout, this
7 is an opportunity to let people shine.

8 And the business community, the
9 employers should really get behind this, because
10 the DREAM Act can mean a better workforce for
11 people who can go out there and actually do a
12 better job building this economy.

13 I vote yes.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
15 Serrano to be recorded in the affirmative.

16 Continue the roll.

17 THE SECRETARY: Senator Seward.

18 SENATOR SEWARD: No.

19 THE SECRETARY: Senator Skelos in
20 the negative.

21 Senator Smith.

22 SENATOR SMITH: Yes.

23 THE SECRETARY: Senator Squadron.

24 SENATOR SQUADRON: Yes.

25 THE SECRETARY: Senator Stavisky.

1 SENATOR STAVISKY: To explain my
2 vote.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
4 Stavisky to explain her vote.

5 SENATOR STAVISKY: When my mother's
6 family came to the United States in the 1840s, we
7 were looking for immigrants.

8 Secondly, let me clear up a couple
9 of misconceptions. We in the past 50 years or so
10 have had a totally different immigration policy
11 than that which existed at that time. We have
12 highly restrictive immigration laws. We have
13 quotas. We have the McCarran-Walter Act. So
14 it's a totally different concept.

15 Secondly, TAP will not take away --
16 the DREAM Act will not take away TAP from the
17 existing students. And in fact the students are
18 not being subsidized, so to speak, in the sense
19 that they pay a tremendous amount of the cost of
20 their education. And that amount leaves many
21 students with tremendous student debt when they
22 graduate.

23 And lastly, on behalf of the
24 180,000 immigrants in my Senate district, from
25 Elmhurst and Woodside to Flushing to Bayside and

1 Forest Hills, for their future I vote yes.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
3 Stavisky to be recorded in the affirmative.

4 Continue the roll.

5 THE SECRETARY: Senator
6 Stewart-Cousins.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
8 Stewart-Cousins to explain her vote.

9 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: Yes,
10 thank you. And thank you, Mr. President.

11 I rise, frankly, to thank my
12 colleagues who have worked so hard on this issue
13 for so long. Certainly Senator Peralta and
14 Senator Espaillat and Senator Parker and
15 Senator Diaz, who fights the good fight, and
16 Senator Rivera, and all of -- all of the people
17 who are standing and explaining and proclaiming
18 and reminding us of our responsibility.

19 And even my colleagues on the other
20 side who talked about free tuition. There was a
21 time when there was free tuition.

22 And we understand that education is
23 opportunity. When I stood here as the conference
24 leader, I talked about that education and how
25 that made the only difference. In addition,

1 obviously, to the grounding of my parents in
2 faith. But the education made the difference.
3 It allowed me to stand here. And it will allow
4 generations of children and their children to be
5 able to stand in these chambers and so many other
6 places, because we understood in progressive
7 New York what a difference this makes.

8 And today we are saying that we
9 still are not ready in a bipartisan fashion to
10 say "Go ahead, you have our blessings, you have
11 an opportunity just to get a little extra aid."
12 We want everyone to do that. I wish it was in
13 the budgets, our one-house budget that said yes,
14 we can do that, because we know how important it
15 is. But we didn't do that.

16 And once again, the Democrats have
17 the lion's share of what would have been the safe
18 passage of the DREAM Act, but it is not enough.
19 Because like so many issues, we do need
20 bipartisan support.

21 I am happy on some level that the
22 galleries are not filled. Because I guess if we
23 had thought this was passing, we would have had
24 the Dreamers here so that when we finally passed
25 this opportunity for them, they would have been

1 able to applaud, and we would have told them
2 "Shhh, not allowed" while we quietly experienced
3 the thrill of yet another door being opened. But
4 that's not going to be here today.

5 I stand here to vote yes. And I
6 stand here hoping that sooner than later we'll
7 have the galleries filled, we'll have the support
8 that we need on both sides of the aisle, and we
9 will say yes to young people who could be
10 valedictorians but are unable to have employment
11 opportunities and education opportunities because
12 we weren't ready just now to say yes.

13 But we will. Dream on.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
15 Stewart-Cousins to be recorded in the
16 affirmative.

17 Continue the roll.

18 THE SECRETARY: Senator Tkaczyk.

19 SENATOR TKACZYK: Yes.

20 THE SECRETARY: Senator Valesky.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
22 Valesky to explain his vote.

23 SENATOR VALESKY: To explain my
24 vote briefly, Mr. President.

25 I'm voting yes on this bill. I do

1 believe this is a matter of educational
2 opportunity for all New Yorkers.

3 But I'm also voting yes today for
4 the strength of this Majority Coalition. And
5 Senator Klein and Senator Skelos -- no disrespect
6 to a number of members in this chamber who have
7 put a lot of work in and time in on this issue,
8 but the two individuals who are most responsible
9 for this bill being on the floor of the Senate
10 today, with no preordained outcome before the
11 bill came to the floor, clearly a very, very
12 controversial issue -- Senator Klein and Senator
13 Skelos showing perhaps the strongest day of this
14 coalition yet. That this is a coalition that
15 works, it's a coalition that works for the people
16 of the State of New York, and it's a coalition
17 that's going to continue to work for the State of
18 New York.

19 I vote yes.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
21 Valesky to be recorded in the affirmative.

22 Continue the roll.

23 THE SECRETARY: Senator Young.

24 SENATOR YOUNG: No.

25 THE SECRETARY: Senator Zeldin.

1 SENATOR ZELDIN: No.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Announce
3 the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 30. Nays,
5 29.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
7 is lost.

8 Senator Libous, that completes the
9 controversial reading.

10 SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President,
11 could we go back to motions and resolutions,
12 please.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: We will
14 return to motions and resolutions.

15 SENATOR LIBOUS: On behalf of
16 Senator Ritchie, Mr. President --

17 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Could I
18 have some order in the chamber, please.

19 Senator Libous.

20 SENATOR LIBOUS: On behalf of
21 Senator Ritchie, on page 21 I offer the following
22 amendments to Calendar Number 252, Senate Print
23 6693, and ask that said bill retain its place on
24 the Third Reading Calendar.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The

1 amendments are received, and the bill shall
2 retain its place on third reading.

3 SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President, if
4 you could get some order.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
6 Libous.

7 SENATOR LIBOUS: Thank you,
8 Mr. President.

9 I believe that there's a previously
10 adopted resolution by Senator Montgomery. It's
11 Number 3328, it is at the desk. Could you please
12 read the title and call on Senator Montgomery.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
14 Secretary will read.

15 THE SECRETARY: Legislative
16 Resolution Number 3328, by Senator Montgomery,
17 commending Rear Admiral Wendi Carpenter, United
18 States Navy, Retired, upon the occasion of being
19 honored in conjunction with Women's History Month
20 2014 in the State of New York.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
22 Montgomery.

23 SENATOR MONTGOMERY: Yes, thank
24 you, Mr. President.

25 I rise to recognize another woman in

1 our state who has made a very significant and
2 important contribution to citizens, especially
3 young people, but to all of us in America. It's
4 Rear Admiral Wendi Carpenter, USN, who's now
5 retired.

6 Rear Admiral Carpenter was among the
7 pioneers of women in naval aviation. She was the
8 31st woman to be designated a naval aviator and
9 was the Navy's first woman aviator to attain the
10 rank of rear admiral.

11 She deployed throughout the Pacific,
12 the western U.S. and Alaska in support of the
13 nation's strategic nuclear mission, flying the
14 EC-130 Hercules. She also operated VIP aircraft
15 in support of numerous high-level officers and
16 dignitaries, accumulating more than 3500 military
17 flight hours.

18 She was promoted to Flag rank in
19 March 2005. Her Flag assignments were widely
20 varied: Naval base and regional facilities
21 management, including crisis planning and
22 incident response; development of cyber
23 information and physical security plans while
24 assigned to the chief of naval operations staff;
25 deployment of plans and operational procedures

1 and processes for joint development staff; and
2 development of concepts, policies and procedures
3 for operational command and control by Navy
4 forces.

5 And most recently, Rear Admiral
6 Carpenter became the tenth president of the State
7 University of New York Maritime College, in
8 August 2011, following her appointment by the
9 SUNY Board of Trustees.

10 Admiral Carpenter has received
11 numerous military and civilian awards, which
12 include the Navy Distinguished Service Medal,
13 Defense Superior Service Medal, Legion of Merit,
14 Meritorious Service Medal, Navy Commendation
15 Medal, Navy and Marine Corps Achievement Medal,
16 and various unit awards.

17 She is a recipient of the Lifetime
18 Community Service Award from the Federal Law
19 Enforcement Foundation, as well as the Woman of
20 Distinction Award from the Bronx Chamber of
21 Commerce and the 2013 Women's Leadership Award
22 presented by Congressman Joe Crowley.

23 Rear Admiral Carpenter is most proud
24 of the Team Award received under her command when
25 the 75-member Fleet Readiness and Logistics Staff

1 shared the 2001 Department of the Navy Chief of
2 Information Award for E-business in Government
3 for the rapid prototype and deployment of the
4 Navy staff's first web portal.

5 I am especially pleased to be able
6 to stand and recognize a woman from the New York
7 State military who has performed admirably for
8 the state, for the U.S., and especially as
9 president of the SUNY Maritime College as part of
10 the State University of New York. I am pleased
11 to honor her today in honor of Women's History
12 Month.

13 Thank you, Mr. President.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Thank
15 you, Senator Montgomery.

16 As noted, the resolution was adopted
17 on February 4th of 2014.

18 Senator Libous.

19 SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President, at
20 this time could we go to the reading of the
21 noncontroversial calendar.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The
23 Secretary will read.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 22,
25 by Senator Marcellino, Senate Print 3046C, an act

1 to amend the Legislative Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
5 act shall take effect on the 120th day.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 128, by Senator LaValle, Senate Print 6495, an
14 act in relation to permitting.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
18 act shall take effect immediately.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 190, by Senator Marcellino, Senate Print 1516A,
2 an act to amend the Education Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
13 Calendar Number 190, those recorded in the
14 negative are Senators Dilan, Hassell-Thompson,
15 Krueger, Montgomery, Parker, Sanders, Serrano and
16 Stewart-Cousins. Also Senator Hoylman.

17 Ayes, 51. Nays, 9.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
19 is passed.

20 Reannounce the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
22 Calendar Number 190, those recorded in the
23 negative are Senators Dilan, Espaillat,
24 Hassell-Thompson, Hoylman, Krueger, Montgomery,
25 Parker, Perkins, Rivera, Sanders, Serrano and

1 Stewart-Cousins.

2 Ayes, 48. Nays, 12.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 195, by Senator Ranzenhofer, Senate Print 1437,
7 an act to amend the Correction Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11 act shall take effect on the first of November.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Announce
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
18 Calendar Number 195, those recorded in the
19 negative are Senators Dilan, Hassell-Thompson,
20 Hoylman, Krueger, Montgomery, Parker, Perkins,
21 Rivera, Serrano and Sanders.

22 Ayes, 50. Nays, 10.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 225, by Senator Carlucci, Senate Print 6513, an
2 act in relation to authorizing.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 57. Nays, 3.
13 Senators Hoylman, Krueger and
14 Stavisky recorded in the negative.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
16 is passed.

17 Senator Libous, that completes the
18 noncontroversial reading of the calendar.

19 SENATOR LIBOUS: Thank you,
20 Mr. President.

21 At this time we have a hand-up from
22 Senator Klein and Senator Skelos.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Received
24 and filed in the Journal.

25 Senator Libous.

1 SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President, is
2 there any further business at the desk?

3 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There is
4 no further business before the desk.

5 SENATOR LIBOUS: There being no
6 further business, I move that the Senate adjourn
7 until Tuesday, March 18th, at 3:00 p.m.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: On
9 motion, the Senate stands adjourned until
10 Tuesday, March 18th, at 3:00 p.m.

11 Senate adjourned.

12 (Whereupon, at 6:30 p.m., the Senate
13 adjourned.)

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25