1	NEW YORK STATE SENATE
2	
3	
4	THE STENOGRAPHIC RECORD
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	ALBANY, NEW YORK
10	June 20, 2013
11	11:35 a.m.
12	
13	
14	REGULAR SESSION
15	
16	
17	
18	SENATOR JOSEPH GRIFFO, Acting President
19	FRANCIS W. PATIENCE, Secretary
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

## PROCEEDINGS 1 2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The 3 Senate will come to order. 4 I ask all present to rise and join 5 with us as we recite the Pledge of Allegiance to 6 our Flag. 7 (Whereupon, the assemblage recited 8 the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.) 9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Today's 10 invocation will be offered by Pastor Fitz Moodie, of the New Life Pentecostal Church in 11 12 Spring Valley. 13 Pastor? PASTOR MOODIE: First I want to 14 15 say thank you to Senator David Carlucci for inviting us here this day. 16 I would like to ask if you will bow 17 18 your heads while I pray. Father and God, I'm so thankful 19 unto You for this opportunity, God, to stand 20 21 here in the midst of your people. God, thank You, O God, for the knowledge of the man that 22 invited us to come to pray. And, Lord, I'm 23 looking to You that You will hear us today. 24 25 This is a new day. We come to a

time, O God, actually the last moment when this Senate will sit. And, O God, You have taken it through days, months. God, You have appointed men and women for this task. God, men that You have placed on them the responsibility to look out for the people of this state.

But, Lord, more than just this state, because they go beyond New York but also this world. Men of integrity, men of strength, men that will make the way possible for the young people of this hour. Men and women that will see to it that this state is one of the best places that anyone will ever live.

Thank You, God, for these men.

Thank You, God, for these women. God, I look to You, Lord, that it's come to this stage of the Senate where it's possible they might take leave, Lord, to spend time with their family. I pray protection upon them. They might hear things and see things that will change, O God, their perspective. But, O God, I look to You that You give them strength, You give them knowledge, that they will stand to the call that You have given them.

God, they will never falter from

1 the responsibility that they have. But, O God, 2 because of their love for this state and the 3 love for the people in which they govern, God, 4 laws was made by them. Help them to make the 5 right ones. We are all here, Lord, looking to 6 7 You have chosen men before to lead us. God, You have chosen men like Moses, You have 8 chosen men like David. God, You have chosen men 9 10 like Solomon, and he said there is time for everything. There is a time and there are 11 moments in our life. 12 13 But as I ask You, Lord, for Your 14 covering upon these great men, that the 15 responsibility that lays upon their shoulders, God, from one end of the state to the other, 16 that they realize that there is so much ethnic 17 18 group that lies on their shoulders that united they will stand, and they will fight for each 19 20 and every person. And, O God, that their life will be 21 22 a light unto many. God, cover them under Your Make nothing come, O God, to allow them 23 to stray from the responsibility that you have 24 25 given them. They are not just mere men, but

```
1
     they are men that is appointed by You, for Your
 2
     purpose and for Your will. Thank You, O God, for
 3
            Help them that they will never want for
 4
     anything because You're going to be there for
 5
     them. And this state will never be the same
     because of them.
 6
                  Let the love of the people of this
 7
     state, O God, reach in every way. And let there
 8
     be respect, O God, to them as they will respect
 9
10
     us as Your people.
11
                  God, help every church, every
12
     organization spiritually that we will pray a
     prayer of victory over them. They are our
13
14
     leaders. You have given them to us to lead.
15
     Now, God, I pray, as I ask You to take over and
16
     lead them in the path, that this state will
     forever be New York State, a great place.
17
18
                  Thank you, O God. Bless them,
     O God.
             Because we ask all this blessing in Your
19
20
     precious name, Jesus Christ our Lord.
21
                  Amen.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
22
                                              The
     reading of the Journal.
23
                  THE SECRETARY:
24
                                   In Senate,
25
     Wednesday, June 19th, the Senate met pursuant to
```

```
1
     adjournment. The Journal of Tuesday, June 18th,
 2
     was read and approved. On motion, Senate
     adjourned.
 3
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Without
 5
     objection, the Journal stands approved as read.
                  Can I have some order in the
 6
 7
     chamber.
 8
                  Presentation of petitions.
 9
                  Messages from the Assembly.
10
                  The Secretary will read.
11
                  THE SECRETARY: On page 14, Senator
     Zeldin moves to discharge, from the Committee on
12
     Rules, Assembly Bill Number 7819 and substitute
13
     it for the identical Senate Bill Number 4218,
14
15
     Third Reading Calendar 448.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
     substitution is so ordered.
17
18
                  THE SECRETARY: On page 16, Senator
19
     Gallivan moves to discharge, from the Committee
20
     on Transportation, Assembly Bill Number 3598 and
21
     substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
22
     Number 97, Third Reading Calendar 498.
                                             The
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
     substitution is so ordered.
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY: On page 19, Senator
```

```
Zeldin moves to discharge, from the Committee on
 1
 2
     Rules, Assembly Bill Number 6378B and substitute
     it for the identical Senate Bill Number 5037B,
 3
 4
     Third Reading Calendar 622.
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
     substitution is so ordered.
 6
 7
                  THE SECRETARY: On page 20, Senator
     Gallivan moves to discharge, from the Committee
 8
     on Rules, Assembly Bill Number 7166 and
 9
10
     substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
     Number 352, Third Reading Calendar 665.
11
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
     substitution is so ordered.
13
14
                  THE SECRETARY: On page 23, Senator
15
     Martins moves to discharge, from the Committee on
     Local Government, Assembly Bill Number 7099 and
16
     substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
17
18
     Number 4972, Third Reading Calendar 757.
19
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
20
     substitution is so ordered.
                  THE SECRETARY: On page 23, Senator
21
22
     Stewart-Cousins moves to discharge, from the
     Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill Number 7328A
23
     and substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
24
25
     Number 5000A, Third Reading Calendar 758.
```

```
ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 1
                                              The
 2
     substitution is so ordered.
 3
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                  On page 23, Senator
 4
     Martins moves to discharge, from the Committee on
 5
     Rules, Assembly Bill Number 7207D and substitute
     it for the identical Senate Bill Number 5024C,
 6
 7
     Third Reading Calendar 759.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 8
                                              The
     substitution is so ordered.
 9
10
                  THE SECRETARY: On page 35, Senator
     Gallivan moves to discharge, from the Committee
11
12
     on Rules, Assembly Bill Number 7695 and
     substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
13
14
     Number 4378, Third Reading Calendar 976.
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
     substitution is so ordered.
16
17
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   On page 36, Senator
18
     Hannon moves to discharge, from the Committee on
19
     Finance, Assembly Bill Number 1286A and
20
     substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
     Number 2750A, Third Reading Calendar 997.
21
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
22
     substitution is so ordered.
23
24
                  THE SECRETARY: On page 38, Senator
25
     Carlucci moves to discharge, from the Committee
```

```
on Local Government, Assembly Bill Number 5677
 1
 2
     and substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
     Number 4973, Third Reading Calendar 1056.
 3
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
 5
     substitution is so ordered.
                  THE SECRETARY: On page 45, Senator
 6
 7
     Grisanti moves to discharge, from the Committee
     on Rules, Assembly Bill Number 1657E and
 8
     substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
 9
10
     Number 3537D, Third Reading Calendar 1251.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
11
                                              The
     substitution is so ordered.
12
13
                  THE SECRETARY: On page 45, Senator
14
     LaValle moves to discharge, from the Committee on
15
     Rules, Assembly Bill Number 4678A and substitute
     it for the identical Senate Bill Number 3643A,
16
     Third Reading Calendar 1255.
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
     substitution is so ordered.
19
                  THE SECRETARY: On page 45, Senator
20
21
     Ball moves to discharge, from the Committee on
     Rules, Assembly Bill Number 7408 and substitute
22
     it for the identical Senate Bill Number 4280,
23
     Third Reading Calendar 1276.
24
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
```

```
substitution is so ordered.
 1
 2
                  THE SECRETARY: On page 46, Senator
 3
     Libous moves to discharge, from the Committee on
 4
     Rules, Assembly Bill Number 7546A and substitute
 5
     it for the identical Senate Bill Number 5550,
     Third Reading Calendar 1365.
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
     substitution is so ordered.
 8
 9
                  Messages from the Governor.
10
                  Reports of standing committees.
                  Report of select committees.
11
12
                  Communications and reports of state
     officers.
13
                  Motions and resolutions.
14
15
                  Senator Libous.
16
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President,
     before we do motions and resolutions, I'm going
17
18
     to call an immediate meeting of the Judiciary
19
     Committee in Room 332. And then we'll go to
20
     motions. And I believe the members that have
21
     motions on the floor are not on Judiciary, so we
22
     can get those done.
                  So there will be an immediate
23
     meeting of the Judiciary Committee in Room 332.
24
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              There's
```

```
1
     an immediate meeting of the Judiciary Committee
 2
     in Room 332. All members of the committee should
 3
     report to 332.
 4
                  Senator Libous.
 5
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President, at
     this time I'd like to move to adopt the
 6
 7
     Resolution Calendar, with the exception of 2671,
 8
     2574, and 2656.
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             All in
10
     favor of adopting the Resolution Calendar, with
     the exception of Resolutions Number 2671, 2574,
11
12
     and 2656, indicate by saying aye.
13
                  (Response of "Aye.")
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
14
                                              Opposed?
15
                  (No response.)
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
     Resolution Calendar is adopted.
17
18
                  Senator Libous.
19
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President, I
     believe you have a resolution at the desk,
20
21
     Number 2598, which is on the Resolution
22
     Calendar. We're going to open it up for
23
     cosponsorship. If anybody wishes not to be on
     that resolution, if they could let the desk know,
24
25
     please.
```

1 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: 2 Resolution 2598 is open up for cosponsorship. 3 you do not want to be a sponsor, please notify the desk. 4 5 Senator Libous. SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President, I 6 7 believe there's a resolution by Senator Kennedy, Number 2671. Could we read it in its entirety 8 and call on Senator Kennedy, please. 9 10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The Secretary will read. 11 12 THE SECRETARY: Legislative Resolution Number 2671, by Senator Kennedy, 13 mourning the death of Joseph G. Reid, 14 15 distinguished citizen and devoted member of his 16 community. "WHEREAS, It is with great sorrow 17 18 and deep regret that this Legislative Body 19 records the passing of Joseph G. Reid, on Monday, June 17, 2013, at the age of 88, noting the 20 21 significance of his purposeful life and 22 accomplishments; and 23 "WHEREAS, A World War II veteran, Joseph G. Reid served his country as a member of 24 25 the United States Army with the 17th Airborne

```
Division; he served in the Battle of the Bulge,
 1
     and was the recipient of the Bronze Star and two
 2
 3
     Purple Hearts; and
 4
                  "WHEREAS, Joseph G. Reid
 5
     distinguished himself in his profession and by
     his sincere dedication and substantial
 6
 7
     contribution to the welfare of his community; and
                  "WHEREAS, He was a member of the
 8
     International Brotherhood of Union Carpenters for
 9
10
     36 years, and was a past president of The
     Blackthorn Club and the Bishop Timon Fathers
11
     Club; and
12
                  "WHEREAS, Joseph G. Reid was a man
13
14
     of values and commitment whose warm smile and
15
     true compassion were generously given for the
     benefit of his community as well as the quality
16
     of life in it; he received the Father of the Year
17
18
     Award from the Holy Name Society of St. Thomas
19
     Aquinas, and was a Goin' South Irishman of the
20
     Year honoree; and
                  "WHEREAS, Predeceased by his wife,
21
     Mary Catherine Conrad Reid, and nine siblings,
22
     Joseph G. Reid is survived by eight children,
23
     Kathryn (George) Gould, Michael (Louise) Reid,
24
25
     Raymond (Mary) Reid, Jack (Tracie) Reid, Patrick
```

```
1
     Reid, Mary Jo (Ed) Hardesty, Suzanne Reid, and
 2
     Timothy (Caryn) Reid; 20 grandchildren and
 3
     10 great-grandchildren; three sisters-in-law,
 4
     Dolores Reid, Freida Reid and Monica Conrad; and
 5
     many nieces and nephews; and
                  "WHEREAS, Armed with a humanistic
 6
 7
     spirit and imbued with a sense of compassion,
     Joseph G. Reid leaves behind a legacy which will
 8
     long endure the passage of time and will remain
 9
10
     as a comforting memory to all he served and
     befriended; now, therefore, be it
11
                  "RESOLVED, That this Legislative
12
     Body pause in its deliberations to celebrate the
13
14
     life and contributions of Joseph G. Reid, and to
15
     offer its sincere condolences to his family; and
     be it further
16
                  "RESOLVED, That a copy of this
17
18
     resolution, suitably engrossed, be transmitted to
     the family of Joseph G. Reid."
19
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
21
     Kennedy.
22
                  SENATOR KENNEDY:
                                      Thank you,
     Mr. President.
23
                  Mr. President, may I have some order
24
25
     in the chamber, please.
```

ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: 1 May we 2 have some order in the chamber. 3 SENATOR KENNEDY: Thank you, 4 Mr. President. 5 Today we pause to recognize the life 6 of Joseph Reid, a great, kind man who always put 7 his family first, who always looked out for his neighbors, and who truly cared about his 8 9 community. 10 Joe Reid died earlier this week following a brief illness at the age of 88. He 11 12 was the loving husband of the late Mary Catherine Reid and the father of Michael, Raymond, Jack, 13 Patrick, Suzanne and Timothy Reid, Kathryn Gould 14 15 and Mary Jo Hardesty. He is also survived by 20 grandchildren and 10 great grandchildren, as 16 well as many nieces and nephews and 17 18 sisters-in-law Dolores Reid, Freida Reid, and Monica Conrad. 19 20 Joe Reid had a big, big family, as you can hear and see. He loved it. He took 21 pride in being a father, a grandfather, and a 22 great-grandfather. He was what Buffalo is all 23 about: Family, friends and neighbors looking out 24 25 for each other. There's a reason we call Buffalo the City of Good Neighbors, and it's because of people like Joe Reid.

He was committed to his community, and he was a dedicated veteran who served his nation, our nation, valiantly. Joe was a World War II veteran with the United States Army 17th Airborne Division. He served bravely in the Battle of the Bulge, and because of his courageous fight he received the Bronze Star and two Purple Hearts.

After serving in the armed forces, he became a member of the International Brotherhood of Union Carpenters, working in the union for 36 years.

Joe loved his neighborhood and got involved. He was a past president of
The Blackthorn Club and the Bishop Timon Fathers
Club. He was proud to be honored with the Father of the Year Award from the Holy Name Society of
St. Thomas Aquinas Church. And Joe had the unique distinction of earning the Goin' South
Irishman of the Year Award.

Joseph Reid was the type of guy
Buffalo was known for, a hardworking man who
cared about his family more than anything else

```
and always worked to give back to his community,
 1
 2
     his state, and his nation.
 3
                  Our thoughts and prayers go out to
 4
     Joe Reid's family and friends. We thank the Reid
 5
     family for Joe's many contributions to our
 6
     community. May he rest in peace.
 7
                  And, Mr. President, I would ask that
     this resolution be opened up to cosponsorship by
 8
     this entire honorable body.
 9
10
                  Thank you, Mr. President.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
11
                                              The
12
     question is on the resolution. All in favor
     signify by saying aye.
13
                  (Response of "Aye.")
14
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Opposed?
16
                  (No response.)
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
17
                                              The
18
     resolution is adopted.
19
                  The sponsor has requested that it be
     opened for cosponsorship. If you choose not to
20
21
     be a cosponsor of the resolution, please notify
22
     the desk.
23
                  Senator Libous.
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President, I
24
25
     believe there's a resolution, Number 2574, at the
```

```
1
     desk by Senator Gipson. Could you read the title
 2
     and call on Senator Gipson.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 3
 4
     Secretary will read.
 5
                  THE SECRETARY: Legislative
     Resolution Number 2574, by Senator Gipson,
 6
 7
     commemorating the 225th Anniversary of New York
     State's ratification of the United States
 8
     Constitution.
 9
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
11
     Gipson.
12
                  SENATOR GIPSON:
                                    Thank you,
     Mr. President.
13
14
                  Two hundred twenty-five years ago,
15
     our United States Constitution was ratified in my
     district, at the Dutchess County Courthouse in
16
     the City of Poughkeepsie.
17
18
                  For over 225 years, the State of
     New York has been part of the great American
19
20
     experience. As New Yorkers, our motto is
     "Excelsior," meaning "ever upward." When we look
21
     at our state seal, we can see the center shield,
22
     which displays a masted ship, a sloop on the
23
     Hudson. These are symbols of commerce and
24
25
     economic activity. We can also see that Justice
```

is blindfolded, holding a sword and a scale, symbolizing impartiality and fairness.

As we celebrate 225 years of progress and achievement, we must honor the sacrifices of the brave New Yorkers who have paid the ultimate sacrifice to protect all of our freedoms. Approximately 54,000 New Yorkers lost their lives during the Civil War to protect our Union and end slavery. This year is the 150th anniversary of the Battle of Gettysburg, where thousands of brave New Yorkers fought. Another 52,000 New Yorkers lost their lives in the Spanish-American War, World War I, World War II, Korea, Vietnam, and the first Persian Gulf War. We've lost many brave men and women in Afghanistan and Iraq.

Thousands of our wounded warriors and their families have given so much of themselves to protect the values of our Constitution so that all of us can live our lives in freedom and in peace.

Our veterans have fought for us time and time again, but we need to do more to fight for them by pursuing greater economic opportunity that levels the playing field so that all

```
1
     New Yorkers can have a chance to pursue
 2
     prosperity and to realize their dreams.
 3
                  We can only accomplish this together
 4
     by rooting out public corruption and committing
 5
     ourselves to fiscal discipline that puts a
     priority on making smart investments for the
 6
 7
     future of New York State and our nation.
 8
     work must be done in our villages, our towns, our
     cities and our counties and also here in New York
 9
10
     State government.
                  As we celebrate the 225th
11
     anniversary of the Constitution, we remember the
12
     challenges that stood in the way of our progress
13
14
     towards the perfect Union. In the days to come,
15
     I hope that the Hudson Valley and all New Yorkers
16
     can be emboldened to turn the obstacles that
     presently lie before us into opportunities for
17
18
     our future success.
19
                  Thank you, Mr. President.
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Thank
21
     you, Senator Gipson.
                  The question is on the resolution.
22
     All in favor signify by saying aye.
23
                  (Response of "Aye.")
24
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Opposed?
```

1 (No response.) 2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The 3 resolution is adopted. 4 Senator Libous. 5 SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President, I believe that Resolution 2656 is at the desk, by 6 7 Senator Gipson. Would you read the title and 8 call on the Senator, please. 9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The 10 Secretary will read. legislative THE SECRETARY: 11 12 Resolution Number 2656, by Senator Gipson, commemorating August 26, 2013, as National Dog 13 14 Day. 15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator 16 Gipson. 17 SENATOR GIPSON: Thank you, 18 Mr. President. 19 This resolution aims to recognize 20 the thousands of dogs in New York who still need 21 homes, and those who serve our communities, and 22 those dogs that simply make our lives and our 23 families better. By dedicating this day to our beloved companions, we can bring awareness and 24 25 encourage the adoption of those dogs that need

1 loving owners and a good home. 2 I also want to recognize the dogs and their handlers who serve our police and armed 3 services and those that assist people with 4 5 disabilities, making their lives better and safer. 6 7 I have introduced a law that would 8 utilize facility dogs to allow for a more 9 efficient, effective and compassionate justice 10 system. Rosie's Law would allow judges the discretion to permit certain witnesses to testify 11 with the assistance of a facility dog. 12 13 This resolution, along with my bill, 14 is common-sense legislation that would continue 15 the age-old tradition of caring for man's best 16 friend while recognizing and utilizing their ability to improve our communities. 17 18 Thank you, Mr. President. ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: 19 The 20 question is on the resolution. All in favor 21 signify by saying aye. 22 (Response of "Aye.") 23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Opposed? 24 (No response.) 25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The

```
1
     resolution is adopted.
 2
                  Senator Libous.
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President, we
 3
 4
     will stand at ease pending the report of the
 5
     Judiciary Committee.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 6
                                              The
     Senate will stand at ease pending the report of
 7
 8
     the Committee on Judiciary.
 9
                  (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease
     at 11:57 a.m.)
10
                  (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at
11
12
     12:19 p.m.)
13
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
14
15
     Senate will come to order.
16
                  Senator Libous.
17
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President,
18
     there will be an immediate meeting of the
19
     Transportation Committee in Room 124.
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              There
21
     will be an immediate meeting of the
22
     Transportation Committee in Room 124.
23
                  SENATOR LIBOUS:
                                    And we'll stand at
     ease pending the report of the Judiciary
24
25
     Committee.
```

```
1
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
 2
     Senate will stand at ease pending the report of
     the Judiciary Committee.
 3
 4
                  (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease
 5
     at 12:20 p.m.)
 6
                  (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at
 7
     2:24 p.m.)
 8
                  SENATOR LIBOUS:
                                    Mr. President.
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
10
     Senate will come to order.
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President, we
11
     have an active list in front of us dated June 20,
12
     2013. Could we have the noncontroversial reading
13
     of the active list at this time.
14
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             We will
16
     begin the noncontroversial reading of the active
     list before the Senate.
17
18
                  The Secretary will read.
19
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Calendar Number 57,
20
     by Senator Marcellino, Senate Print 1501, an act
21
     to amend the Retirement and Social Security Law.
22
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Read the
     last section.
23
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 2.
                                               This
24
     act shall take effect on the 90th day.
25
```

```
1
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Call the
 2
     roll.
 3
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 4
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 57. Nays,
 5
     5. Senators Farley, Little, Marchione,
    Montgomery and O'Mara recorded in the negative.
 6
 7
     Also Senator Hassell-Thompson. Also Senator
 8
     Griffo.
 9
                  Ayes, 55. Nays, 7.
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is passed.
11
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12
13
     231, substituted earlier by Member of the
     Assembly Paulin, Assembly Print 2288A, an act in
14
15
     relation to authorizing.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
17
18
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                               This
     act shall take effect immediately.
19
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
21
     roll.
22
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
                                   Ayes, 61. Nays, 1.
23
                  THE SECRETARY:
     Senator Ball recorded in the negative.
24
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
```

```
1
     is passed.
 2
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 3
     355, by Senator Seward, Senate Print 2894A, an
     act to amend the Insurance Law.
 4
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
 6
 7
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
 8
     act shall take effect immediately.
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
10
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
11
12
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 62.
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is passed.
14
15
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16
     371, by Senator Golden, Senate Print 4088C, an
     act to amend the Election Law.
17
18
                  SENATOR GIANARIS: Lay it aside.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
19
                                             The bill
20
     is laid aside.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21
22
     434, by Senator Carlucci, Senate Print 3280A, an
23
     act to amend the Mental Hygiene Law.
                  SENATOR VALESKY: Lay it aside for
24
25
     the day.
```

```
ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Lay it
 1
 2
     aside for the day.
 3
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     448, substituted earlier by Member of the
 4
 5
    Assembly Morelle, Assembly Print 7819, an act to
     amend Chapter 656 of the Laws of 2002.
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
 8
     last section.
 9
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
10
     act shall take effect immediately.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
11
     roll.
12
13
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
14
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 62.
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
16
     is passed.
17
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Calendar Number
18
     457, by Senator Flanagan, Senate Print 4492A, an
     act to amend the Education Law.
19
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
21
     last section.
22
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 12.
                                                This
23
     act shall take effect immediately.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
24
25
     roll.
```

```
(The Secretary called the roll.)
 1
 2
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.
 3
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 4
     is passed.
 5
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     498, substituted earlier by Member of the
 6
 7
    Assembly Lupardo, Assembly Print Number 3598, an
 8
     act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
10
     last section.
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                               This
11
12
     act shall take effect on the 180th day.
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
14
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
15
16
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 62.
17
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
18
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19
     508, by Senator Marcellino, Senate Print 3718, an
20
21
     act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.
22
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
23
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 3.
                                               This
24
25
     act shall take effect on the 60th day.
```

```
ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 1
 2
     roll.
 3
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 4
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59. Nays,
 5
     3. Senators Ball, Marchione and Zeldin recorded
     in the negative.
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 8
     is passed.
 9
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10
     517, by Senator Libous, Senate Print 977, an act
     to amend the State Finance Law.
11
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
13
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
14
15
     act shall take effect on the 180th day.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
17
18
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
19
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 58. Nays,
20
     4. Senators Avella, Dilan, Perkins and Rivera
     recorded in the negative.
21
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
22
23
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24
25
     518, by Senator Libous, Senate Print 980, an act
```

```
1
     to amend the State Finance Law.
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
 3
     last section.
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 4.
 4
                                               This
 5
     act shall take effect on the 30th day.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 6
 7
     roll.
 8
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 9
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   In relation to
10
     Calendar 518, those recorded in the negative are
     Senators Avella, Gianaris, Kennedy, Krueger,
11
12
     Ranzenhofer, Rivera, Serrano and Squadron.
13
                  Ayes, 54. Nays, 8.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
14
15
     is passed.
16
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     542, by Senator Ranzenhofer, Senate Print 4359,
17
18
     an act to amend the Urban Economic Corporation
19
     Act.
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
21
     last section.
22
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
23
     act shall take effect immediately.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
24
25
     roll.
```

```
(The Secretary called the roll.)
 1
 2
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62.
 3
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is passed.
 4
 5
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     588, by Senator Marchione, Senate Print 4450B, an
 6
 7
     act authorizing.
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There is
     a home-rule message at the desk.
9
10
                  The Secretary will read the last
     section.
11
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
12
     act shall take effect immediately.
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
14
15
     roll.
16
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
17
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61. Nays, 1.
18
     Senator Ball recorded in the negative.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
19
20
     is passed.
21
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22
     601, by Senator Marcellino, Senate Print 1495, an
     act to amend the Penal Law.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
24
25
     last section.
```

```
1
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 3.
                                               This
 2
     act shall take effect on the first of November.
 3
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
 4
 5
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60. Nays,
 6
 7
     2. Senators Montgomery and Perkins recorded in
 8
     the negative.
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
10
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11
12
     622, substituted earlier by Member of the
     Assembly Dinowitz, Assembly Print 6378B, an act
13
     to amend the General Business Law.
14
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
16
     last section.
17
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 3.
                                               This
18
     act shall take effect on the first of November.
19
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
20
     roll.
21
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
22
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 62.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
     is passed.
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
```

```
665, substituted earlier by Member of the
 1
 2
     Assembly Schimminger, Assembly Print 7166, an act
     to amend the Alcoholic Beverage Control Law.
 3
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Read the
 5
     last section.
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                               This
 6
 7
     act shall take effect immediately.
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
9
     roll.
10
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60. Nays,
11
     2. Senators Avella and Diaz recorded in the
12
13
    negative.
14
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
15
     is passed.
16
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     757, substituted earlier by Member of the
17
18
     Assembly Magnarelli, Assembly Print 7099, an act
19
     to amend Chapter 719 of the Laws of 1980.
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
21
     last section.
22
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                               This
23
     act shall take effect immediately.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
24
25
     roll.
```

```
(The Secretary called the roll.)
 1
 2
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 62.
 3
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
 4
     is passed.
 5
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     758, substituted earlier by Member of the
 6
 7
     Assembly Mayer, Assembly Print Number 7328A, an
 8
     act to amend the General Municipal Law.
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             There is
10
     a home-rule message at the desk.
                  The Secretary will read the last
11
12
     section.
13
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 2.
                                                This
     act shall take effect immediately.
14
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
16
     roll.
17
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
18
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 62.
                                             The bill
19
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
20
     is passed.
21
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     759, substituted earlier by Member of the
22
23
     Assembly Ra, Assembly Print 7207D, an act in
     relation to allowing.
24
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Read the
```

```
last section.
 1
 2
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
 3
     act shall take effect immediately.
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 5
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 6
 7
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61. Nays, 1.
 8
     Senator O'Mara recorded in the negative.
9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
10
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11
12
     761, by Senator Klein, Senate Print 3567A, an act
     to amend the Civil Practice Law and Rules.
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
14
15
     last section.
16
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
     act shall take effect on the 30th day.
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
19
20
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
21
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62. Nays,
22
     1. Senator Ball recorded in the negative.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is passed.
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
```

```
783, by Senator Nozzolio, Senate Print 4928A, an
 1
 2
     act to amend the Criminal Procedure Law.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
 3
     last section.
 4
 5
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                               This
     act shall take effect January 1, 2014.
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 8
     roll.
9
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
10
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62. Nays,
11
     1. Senator Hassell-Thompson recorded in the
12
    negative.
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
14
     is passed.
15
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16
     805, by Senator Bonacic, Senate Print 1885B, an
     act to amend the Town Law.
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
19
20
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 7. This
21
     act shall take effect on the 90th day.
22
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
23
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
```

```
1
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 2
     is passed.
 3
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     833, by Senator Young, Senate Print 5124, an act
 4
 5
     to authorize.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There is
 6
 7
     a home-rule message at the desk.
 8
                  The Secretary will read the last
9
     section.
10
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 3. This
     act shall take effect immediately.
11
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
13
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
14
15
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62. Nays,
16
     1. Senator Ball recorded in the negative.
17
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
18
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19
20
     976, substituted earlier by Member of the
21
     Assembly O'Donnell, Assembly Print Number 7695,
22
     an act to amend the Correction Law.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                               This
```

```
act shall take effect immediately.
 1
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 3
     roll.
 4
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 5
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 6
 7
     is passed.
 8
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9
     983, by Senator Valesky, Senate Print 5277, an
10
     act to amend the Economic Development Law.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
11
     last section.
12
13
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 5.
                                               This
     act shall take effect on the first of January.
14
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Call the
16
     roll.
17
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
18
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
19
20
     is passed.
21
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22
     997, substituted earlier by Member of the
    Assembly Zebrowski, Assembly Print 1286A, an act
23
     to amend the Public Health Law.
24
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
```

```
last section.
 1
 2
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 3.
                                               This
     act shall take effect on the first of January.
 3
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Call the
 5
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 6
 7
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
9
     is passed.
10
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     1055, by Senator Gallivan, Senate Print 4770A, an
11
12
     act to amend the Real Property Tax Law.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
13
     last section.
14
15
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 3.
16
     act shall take effect immediately.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
17
18
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
19
20
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
21
22
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23
     1056, substituted earlier by Member of the
24
25
     Assembly Jaffee, Assembly Print Number 5677, an
```

```
1
     act in relation to authorizing.
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
 3
     last section.
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
 4
 5
     act shall take effect immediately.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 6
 7
     roll.
 8
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 9
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61. Nays,
     2. Senators Bonacic and O'Mara recorded in the
10
11
    negative.
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is passed.
13
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14
15
     1083, by Senator Gallivan, Senate Print 5403, an
16
     act to amend the Public Service Law.
17
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
18
     last section.
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
19
20
     act shall take effect immediately.
21
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
22
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
23
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62. Nays,
24
25
     1. Senator Espaillat recorded in the negative.
```

```
1
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
 2
     is passed.
 3
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 4
     1105, by Senator Lanza, Senate Print 3981B, an
 5
     act to amend the Not-For-Profit Corporation Law.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
 6
 7
     last section.
 8
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
9
     act shall take effect immediately.
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
11
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
12
13
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62. Nays,
     1. Senator Ball recorded in the negative.
14
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
16
     is passed.
17
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18
     1135, by Senator Carlucci, Senate Print 5224, an
19
     act to amend the Mental Hygiene Law.
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
21
     last section.
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
22
     act shall take effect immediately.
23
24
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
25
     roll.
```

```
(The Secretary called the roll.)
 1
 2
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
                                             The bill
 3
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 4
     is passed.
 5
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     1143, by Senator Libous, Senate Print 4835B, an
 6
 7
     act to amend the Education Law.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Read the
 8
     last section.
 9
10
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 4.
                                                This
     act shall take effect on the same date and in the
11
12
     same manner as Chapter 438 of the Laws of 2012.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
13
14
     roll.
15
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Announce
     the results.
17
18
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
19
     Calendar Number 1143, those recorded in the
     negative are Senators Ball, DeFrancisco,
20
21
     Espaillat, Gianaris, Gipson, Hannon,
     Hassell-Thompson, Kennedy, Krueger, Montgomery,
22
     Rivera, Sanders, Serrano and Zeldin. Also
23
     Senator Perkins and Ranzenhofer. Also Senators
24
25
     Hoylman, Tkaczyk and Squadron in the negative.
```

```
1
                  Ayes, 43. Nays, 19.
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 3
     is passed.
 4
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President.
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
 6
     Libous.
 7
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Could I ask the
 8
     members, so we can move things along here, that
 9
     when you call the roll, if you want to vote no,
10
     get your hands up then, not when he's announcing
     the roll call.
11
12
                  And I say that to everybody. You're
     in the chamber, you're paying attention.
13
     they say "Call the roll," if you want to vote no,
14
15
     get your hands up then, not when he's announcing
16
     the roll call. Because we want to keep things
     moving along.
17
18
                  Thank you.
19
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              So
20
     instructed.
21
                  The Secretary will announce the
22
     results.
23
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 43. Nays,
     19.
24
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
```

```
1
     is passed.
 2
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 3
     1148, by Senator Golden, Senate Print 3536C, an
 4
     act to amend the Election Law.
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
 6
 7
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 15.
                                                 This
 8
     act shall take effect immediately.
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
10
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
11
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
     Espaillat to explain his vote.
13
                  SENATOR ESPAILLAT: Yes, I want to
14
15
     commend the sponsor of this bill. This is a
16
     common-sense, smart approach to reform the Board
     of Elections, the New York State Board of
17
18
     Elections and the City's Board of Elections.
19
                  This bill will explicitly put into
20
     statute a requirement for police or peace
21
     officers to deliver a portable memory stick to
22
     the Board of Elections, guaranteeing a
23
     transparent and accurate count of an election,
     bringing the Board of Elections a little bit
24
25
     closer to the 21st century.
```

```
I will be voting in the affirmative.
 1
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 3
     Espaillat to be recorded in the affirmative.
 4
                  Announce the results.
 5
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
 6
 7
     is passed.
 8
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 9
     1154, by Senator Savino, Senate Print 3677A, an
10
     act to amend the Penal Law.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
11
     last section.
12
13
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 3.
                                                This
     act shall take effect on the 180th day.
14
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
16
     roll.
17
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Senator
19
     Savino to explain her vote.
20
                  SENATOR SAVINO:
                                    Thank you,
21
     Mr. President.
22
                  This particular piece of legislation
     that I refer to as Caroline's Law is very
23
     important not just to me, but to a family in
24
25
     Staten Island.
```

In March of 2009, Caroline Wimmer was a beautiful young 26-year-old woman who was brutally murdered in her apartment. She was missing for a few days before her family finally went over, and they got the super to open the door. They found her having been beaten to death, left there. And as you can imagine, the condition of her body was shocking enough.

Her mother and father immediately called 911. The police responded, EMTs and paramedics responded. And one of the paramedics that responded, a gentleman named Mark Musarella, decided to take out his cellphone and take pictures of Caroline's brutalized body for his own personal use, and post it on his Facebook page and on the Internet for his own personal entertainment and that of his friends.

You can imagine the shock and the horror of her family. You can imagine the disgust of Staten Islanders and the Richmond County district attorney, Danny Donovan, who sought to prosecute him and realized that our penal code had not yet caught up with the Internet. And so the only thing he could do was charge him with official misconduct, a slap on

the wrist, and 200 hours of community service.

Danny Donovan asked us to update the laws. He said we need to do more and send a message to our public servants that we are held to a higher standard and you cannot abuse your authority, particularly for your own entertainment. And over the past few years we have written this bill and we've amended it to adjust to just that.

The Police Department of the City of New York, the Fire Department asked us to wait.

And they said, Let us develop rules and procedures that we will implement in our department to address this. We don't want to make it a crime. We want to punish these individuals, but we don't want to see this as a crime.

And we gave them the chance to do that. And just this year, if you looked at the New York Post and you looked at the Daily News, you saw several instances of paramedics and other first responders doing this and worse. In fact, the commissioner of the New York City Fire Department, his own son was forced to resign from the fire department because of this kind of

```
behavior.
 1
 2
                  So we gave them a chance, they
     couldn't do it, we now need to make it the crime
 3
     that it is. Public servants have to be held to a
 4
 5
     higher standard. And we should never abuse our
     authority and the trust of the public,
 6
     particularly for our own entertainment. I urge
 7
 8
     everyone to vote in favor of Caroline's Law.
 9
                  Thank you, Mr. President.
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
     Savino to be recorded in the affirmative.
11
12
                  Announce the results.
13
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
14
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The bill
15
     is passed.
16
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   On page 43, Senator
     Hannon moves to discharge, from the Committee on
17
18
     Rules, Assembly Bill Number 1101B and substitute
     it for the identical Senate Bill Number 3944B,
19
20
     Third Reading Calendar 1165.
21
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
22
     substitution is so ordered.
23
                  The Secretary will read.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24
25
     1165, by Member of the Assembly Gunther, Assembly
```

```
1
     Print Number 1101B, an act to amend the Public
 2
    Health Law.
 3
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
 4
 5
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
     act shall take effect one year after it shall
 6
 7
    have become law.
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
9
    roll.
10
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
11
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is passed.
13
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14
15
     1168, by Senator Hannon, Senate Print 4528A, an
16
     act to amend the Public Health Law.
17
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
18
     last section.
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 7. This
19
20
     act shall take effect immediately.
21
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
22
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
23
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
24
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
```

```
1
     is passed.
 2
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 3
     1223, by Senator Marcellino, Senate Print 1486,
 4
     an act to amend the Education Law.
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
 6
 7
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                                This
 8
     act shall take effect immediately.
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
10
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
11
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
     Gipson to explain his vote.
13
14
                  SENATOR GIPSON:
                                    Thank you,
15
     Mr. President.
16
                  As I understand it, this bill is
     intended to help out the Board of Regents. I
17
18
     actually think that we do a lot to help out the
19
     Board of Regents already, and I would like to see
20
     the Board of Regents be more proactive in helping
21
     themselves without asking our local school boards
22
     to have to pony up more money with unfunded
23
     mandates.
                  You know, while this unfunded
24
25
     mandate is small, it is exactly the type of thing
```

```
1
     that I keep hearing over and over again from my
 2
     school boards, that it is the small unfunded
 3
     mandates that have added up to an enormous amount
 4
     of money that continues to cost them.
 5
                  So I will be voting no, and I would
     encourage my colleagues to do the same.
 6
 7
                  Thank you.
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Senator
9
     Gipson to be recorded in the negative.
10
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60. Nays,
11
     3. Senators Ball, Gipson and Kennedy recorded in
12
     the negative.
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
14
     is passed.
15
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16
     1227, by Senator Libous, Senate Print 1918, an
     act to amend the Education Law.
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
19
20
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 6.
                                               This
21
     act shall take effect on the 180th day.
22
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
23
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
24
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Announce
```

```
the results.
 1
 2
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   In relation to
 3
     Calendar Number 1227, those recorded in the
 4
     negative are Senators Adams, Avella, Ball,
 5
     Bonacic, Breslin, DeFrancisco, Dilan, Espaillat,
     Gallivan, Gianaris, Gipson, Hassell-Thompson,
 6
 7
     Hoylman, Kennedy, Krueger, Martins, Montgomery,
     O'Brien, Parker, Peralta, Perkins, Ranzenhofer,
 8
     Rivera, Sanders, Serrano, Squadron,
 9
10
     Stewart-Cousins and Tkaczyk.
11
                  Ayes, 35. Nays, 28.
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The bill
13
     is passed.
                                   Calendar Number
14
                  THE SECRETARY:
15
     1251, substituted earlier by Member of the
     Assembly Rosenthal, Assembly Print Number 1657E,
16
     an act to amend the Agriculture and Markets Law.
17
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
18
                                              Read the
     last section.
19
20
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 2.
                                                This
     act shall take effect immediately.
21
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
22
     roll.
23
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
```

```
The bill
 1
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 2
     is passed.
 3
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 4
     1255, substituted earlier by Member of the
 5
    Assembly Thiele, Assembly Print Number 4678A, an
     act in relation to a plan.
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There is
 8
     a home-rule message at the desk.
 9
                  The Secretary will read the last
10
     section.
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11
12
     act shall take effect immediately.
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
14
15
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
16
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
17
18
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19
20
     1260, by Senator Lanza, Senate Print 3774, an act
21
     to amend the Administrative Code of the City of
    New York.
22
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 3.
                                               This
```

```
act shall take effect immediately.
 1
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 3
     roll.
 4
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 5
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61. Nays,
     2. Senators Ball and Marchione recorded in the
 6
 7
    negative.
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
9
     is passed.
10
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     1276, substituted earlier by Member of the
11
     Assembly Englebright, Assembly Print Number 7408,
12
     an act to amend the Executive Law.
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
14
15
     last section.
16
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
     act shall take effect immediately.
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
19
20
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
21
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62. Nays, 1.
     Senator Griffo recorded in the negative.
22
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is passed.
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
```

```
1289, by Senator Carlucci, Senate Print 5250A, an
 1
     act to direct.
 2
 3
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
 4
 5
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
     act shall take effect immediately.
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 8
     roll.
9
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
10
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
11
     is passed.
12
13
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     1313, by Senator Griffo, Senate Print 1961B, an
14
15
     act to establish.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
17
     last section.
18
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 7. This
     act shall take effect immediately.
19
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
21
     roll.
22
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
23
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
24
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
25
     is passed.
```

```
1
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Calendar Number
 2
     1353, by Senator Carlucci, Senate Print 5058A, an
 3
     act to authorize.
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
 5
     last section.
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                               This
 6
 7
     act shall take effect immediately.
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
9
     roll.
10
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   In relation to
11
     Calendar Number 1353, those recorded in the
12
    negative are Senators Avella, Espaillat, Gipson,
13
14
    Krueger, Montgomery, O'Brien, Peralta, Perkins,
15
     Rivera, Sanders, Serrano and Stavisky.
16
                  Ayes, 51. Nays, 12.
17
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
18
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19
20
     1365, substituted earlier by Member of the
21
     Assembly Braunstein, Assembly Print Number 7546A,
22
     an act to amend the Insurance Law.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                               This
```

```
act shall take effect immediately.
 1
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 3
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 4
 5
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 62. Nays,
     1. Senator Gipson recorded in the negative.
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
 8
     is passed.
 9
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10
     1422, by Senator Grisanti, Senate Print 1591A, an
     act to amend the General Business Law.
11
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
13
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
14
     act shall take effect on the first of September.
15
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
17
18
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
19
                                             Senator
20
    Grisanti to explain his vote.
21
                  SENATOR GRISANTI: Yes, thank you,
    Mr. President.
22
                  My fellow colleagues, I'm sure
23
     everyone in this room has in their district heard
24
25
     the horror stories of individuals coming into
```

1 other individuals' homes who may be on vacation, 2 or breaking into some industrial facilities, and 3 basically stealing copper, stealing whatever they 4 can to turn for scrap. 5 So this particular piece of 6 legislation, because scrap is a very real and 7 ever-growing problem, basically sets up a registration system to prevent the scrap theft. 8 And in fact it was actually helped out by the 9 10 Institute of Scrap Recycling Industries 11 themselves. 12 We have to get to the root of this It costs tens of millions of dollars 13 problem. 14 yearly in New York State, not only for damage to 15 homeowners but also to industry across the state, where they're stealing anything from copper to 16 lead to brass, street signs, manhole covers. So 17 18 these are the items that we've got to prevent. It will be in a registration system. 19 20 I vote aye, Mr. President, and I 21 encourage my colleagues to do also. Thank you 22 very much. ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: 23 Senator Grisanti to be recorded in the affirmative. 24 25 Announce the results.

```
1
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61. Nays,
 2
     2. Senators Ball and Marchione recorded in the
 3
    negative.
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
 5
     is passed.
 6
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 7
     1440, by Senator Stewart-Cousins, Senate Print
 8
     4653B, an act to authorize.
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There is
10
     a home-rule message at the desk.
11
                  The Secretary will read the last
     section.
12
13
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 8. This
     act shall take effect immediately.
14
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
16
     roll.
17
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
18
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
19
20
     is passed.
21
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22
     1473, by Senator Farley, Senate Print 5805, an
     act to amend the Military Law.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
24
25
     last section.
```

```
1
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                    Section 2.
                                                This
 2
     act shall take effect immediately.
                                              Call the
 3
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
     roll.
 4
 5
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 6
                                              Senator
 7
     Farley to explain his vote.
 8
                  SENATOR FARLEY:
                                     Thank you,
 9
     Mr. President.
10
                  This is a rather significant piece
     of legislation that involves Lieutenant Colonel
11
12
     Todd Clark that we honored just the other day.
13
                  When a flag is flown over the State
     Capitol, it can never be used again.
14
                                            It actually
15
     has to be ceremonially destroyed.
16
                  The Clark family approached me that
     they wanted to get that flag that flew over the
17
18
     Capitol in honor of Lieutenant Colonel Todd
19
     Clark, yet they can't do that. As a matter of
20
     fact, they were told they had to pay $300 for
     another flag. Actually, they can get a free flag
21
22
     that's a smaller one and so forth, but that's not
23
     the point.
                  What this bill does, it says a flag
24
25
     that is flown over the State Capitol can be given
```

```
to the family of a slain military person without
 1
 2
     any charge. And this piece of legislation has
     been addressed in this Capital District at great
 3
 4
     length, and it's anxiously being received by the
 5
     family, and it looks like it's going to become
     law.
 6
 7
                  And it only makes sense.
                                             In my
 8
     judgment, it's a no-brainer not to be honoring a
     soldier or military person that has given their
 9
10
     life for their country that their family cannot
     get the flag that flew at half staff. I urge
11
12
     everybody to support this legislation.
13
                  Thank you, Mr. President.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
14
                                              Senator
15
     Farley to be recorded in the affirmative.
16
                  Announce the results.
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The bill
     is passed.
19
20
                  Senator Libous, that completes the
     noncontroversial reading of the active list of
21
22
     June 20th.
                  SENATOR LIBOUS:
23
                                     Thank you,
     Mr. President.
24
25
                  I believe if we go back to reports
```

```
of standing committees, there's a report of the
 1
 2
     Judiciary Committee at the desk.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 3
                                              We will
 4
     return reports of standing committees.
                                              There is
 5
     a report of the Judiciary Committee at the desk.
                  The Secretary will read.
 6
 7
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                    Senator Bonacic,
     from the Committee on Judiciary, reports the
 8
     following nominations:
 9
10
                  Roger S. Hayes, as justice of the
     Supreme Court of the First Judicial District.
11
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
     Bonacic.
13
14
                  SENATOR BONACIC:
                                      Thank you,
15
     Mr. President.
16
                  Pursuant to the provisions of
     Section 2 of Article 6 of the Constitution and
17
18
     Section 68 of the Judiciary Law, the Judiciary
19
     Committee has reported six nominations to the
20
     Senate floor.
21
                  And before we speak of any
     individual, I'd like to say collectively that the
22
     gentlemen that are before this body, they're
23
     experienced, they have the right temperament, and
24
25
     they have an exemplary judicial career.
                                               These
```

```
1
     are all reappointments.
 2
                  They've been sitting patiently since
 3
     quarter to 12:00 when we completed the Judiciary
 4
     Committee, with their guests. And we were
 5
     hopeful that we could get them passed earlier so
     they could go back to work. You know?
 6
 7
                  So let's start with, first of all,
 8
     we're going to go to Judge Hayes. Just stay with
     me a second, if I may.
 9
10
                  I think he's a great judge. I think
     we should confirm him.
11
12
                  (Laughter.)
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
     nomination has been moved.
14
15
                   The question is on the nomination
16
     of Roger S. Hayes for justice of the Supreme
     Court of the First Judicial district. All those
17
18
     in favor say aye.
19
                  (Response of "Aye.")
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Opposed?
21
                  (No response.)
22
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Roger S.
23
     Hayes has been confirmed as a justice of the
     Supreme Court of the First Judicial District.
24
25
                  Congratulations, Judge.
```

```
1
                  (Applause.)
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
 3
     Secretary will continue to read.
 4
                  THE SECRETARY: John G. Ingram, as
 5
     justice of the Supreme Court of the Second
     Judicial District.
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Senator
 8
     Bonacic.
 9
                  SENATOR BONACIC: Thank you,
10
     Mr. President.
                  Judge Ingram was a Court of Claims,
11
     he was an Acting Supreme Court in the Second
12
     Judicial District. And we're confirming him
13
     today to fill a term expiring on December 31,
14
15
     2013.
16
                  And he also is a terrific judge.
     All six of them are, with my preliminary
17
18
     remarks. I certainly recommend that he be
     confirmed.
19
20
                  Thank you, Mr. President. And I
21
     think Senator Golden would like to be recognized.
22
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Senator
23
     Golden.
24
                  SENATOR GOLDEN:
                                    Thank you,
25
     Mr. President.
```

I rise in voting aye for John
Ingram, a great jurist, a good friend, and a good
man. He has been a good friend to us in Brooklyn
and in Queens.

He suffered I believe immensely with the Sandy storm at Breezy Point, him and his father. His brother is the head of the coop for Breezy Point, which probably suffered some of the most dangerous damage that we've seen in the city.

So he was there every day making sure that we took care of the issues that concerned us as a community in need. And myself and Senator Smith and others worked with him throughout that process.

But as a jurist, he has been able to move cases like none other. He's done an outstanding job in Brooklyn. I don't have to tell you what the backlogs are in Kings County and how serious those court backlogs have been. And they brought those court backlogs down, and today Brooklyn is one of the models across this great nation.

And I thank you, Judge Ingram, for your great contributions and your contribution to

```
the military as well, serving as an admiral for
 1
 2
     so many years. We commend you and thank you,
     sir. Congratulations.
 3
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
 5
     question is on the nomination of John G. Ingram
     for justice of the Supreme Court of the Second
 6
     Judicial District. All in favor signify by
 7
 8
     saying aye.
 9
                  (Response of "Aye.")
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Opposed?
11
                  (No response.)
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Judge
     John G. Ingram has been confirmed as justice of
13
     the Supreme Court of the Second Judicial
14
15
     District.
16
                  Congratulations, Judge Ingram.
17
                  (Applause.)
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
18
                                              The
19
     Secretary will read.
20
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Thomas J. McNamara,
21
     as judge of the Court of Claims.
22
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
23
     Bonacic.
                  SENATOR BONACIC: Thank you,
24
25
     Mr. President.
```

Judge McNamara is a Court of Claims judge, and we're going to extend him a full term to January 22, 2022.

But being a good Irishman today, he brought his family and guests, and I'd like to introduce them for the record. He's with his bride, Mary Jane McNamara, who has joined him, his sons Matthew and Michael, his daughter-in-law Marcy McNamara, who's the granddaughter of former Majority Leader of the State of New York Senate Earl Brydges.

They brought their grandchildren,
Eleanor McNamara and Thomas McNamara. Eleanor is
a first-grade student, and Thomas is a
kindergarten student. And both finished school,
received excellent report cards. And Eleanor and
Thomas wanted to make sure their academic success
is in the minutes of the Senate.

And we don't want to leave the baby out, who was talking to us during the Judiciary Committee, a baby less than one year old, Ann McNamara.

And a tremendous family, a tremendous man, a continuing legacy. I would ask you to support this judge.

Thank you, Mr. President. 1 2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator 3 Farley. 4 SENATOR FARLEY: Yes, I'd like to 5 rise and second this nomination. You can see how important my election is -- that family, I depend 6 7 on them to get elected. 8 (Laughter.) 9 SENATOR FARLEY: Thomas McNamara 10 has been an excellent jurist for a lot of years, and a constituent, a graduate of Albany Law 11 12 School, and somebody who it just shows you there's nothing more important than family, and 13 he brings them all with him. 14 15 I do support his nomination, and I wish you well, Judge McNamara. 16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: 17 Senator 18 DeFrancisco. Yes, I just 19 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: 20 wanted to indicate how smart it was for Judge 21 McNamara to bring his grandchildren. Because the head count, before we saw them and learned of 22 them, his nomination was truly in jeopardy. 23 (Laughter.) 24 25 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: But the more

```
we learned about his family, the more we liked
 1
 2
           And as a result, he was approved
 3
     unanimously in the Judiciary Committee. And I
 4
     urge unanimous support in this house as well.
 5
                  Thank you.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 6
                                              Thank
 7
     you, Senator DeFrancisco.
 8
                  Senator Marchione.
 9
                  SENATOR MARCHIONE:
                                       Thank you,
10
     Mr. President. I rise to support his nomination
     as well.
11
12
                  Judge McNamara is a Saratoga Springs
     resident. And I've had the pleasure of working
13
14
     with his daughter-in-law Marcy. What a wonderful
15
     family they are. And in Saratoga Springs he
16
     certainly has a well-earned reputation for
     fairness, professionalism, and treating everyone
17
18
     who comes before him in the courtroom with
     decency and respect.
19
20
                  So it's my pleasure to vote aye on
21
     his nomination.
22
                  Thank you.
                                              Thank
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
23
     you, Senator Marchione.
24
25
                  Senator Bonacic.
```

```
1
                  SENATOR BONACIC:
                                      You know, when we
 2
     have a departing member, when they leave, they
     don't run anymore and they address the Senate and
 3
 4
     they always say "Our staff always made us look
 5
     better than we really were."
                  Well, there there's two other guests
 6
 7
     that Judge McNamara brought today, and that is
 8
     his law clerk, Robert Foley, and the secretary,
 9
     Patricia Waterbury. And we welcome them today
10
     also.
11
                  Thank you, Mr. President.
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Thank
     you, Senator Bonacic.
13
                  The question is on the nomination of
14
15
     Thomas J. McNamara as judge of the Court of
     Claims. All in favor signify by saying aye.
16
17
                  (Response of "Aye.")
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Opposed?
19
                  (No response.)
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Judge
21
     Thomas J. McNamara is hereby confirmed as a judge
22
     to the Court of Claims.
23
                  Congratulations, Judge.
24
                  (Applause.)
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
```

```
Secretary will read.
 1
 2
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   William I.
 3
     Mogulescu, as justice of the Supreme Court of the
     First Judicial District.
 4
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
     Bonacic.
 6
 7
                  SENATOR BONACIC:
                                     Thank you,
 8
     Mr. President.
                  Judge Mogulescu -- we've been
 9
10
     practicing that today -- with this confirmation,
11
     he'll become a Supreme Court of the First
     Judicial District, and his term will expire
12
13
     December 31, 2013.
                  Another great nomination by the
14
15
     Governor who's given us these six distinguished
16
     gentlemen. So I would ask that we confirm him.
17
                  Thank you, Mr. President.
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
19
     question is on the nomination of William I.
20
     Mogulescu for justice of the Supreme Court of the
21
     First Judicial District. All in favor signify by
22
     saying aye.
                  (Response of "Aye.")
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Opposed?
24
25
                  (No response.)
```

```
1
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Judge
 2
     William I. Mogulescu is hereby confirmed as a
     justice of the Supreme Court for the First
 3
     Judicial District.
 4
 5
                  Congratulations, judge.
 6
                  (Applause.)
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
 8
     Secretary will read.
 9
                  THE SECRETARY: Jeremiah J.
10
     Moriarty III as justice of the Supreme Court of
11
     the Eighth Judicial District.
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
     Bonacic.
13
14
                  SENATOR BONACIC:
                                      Thank you,
15
     Mr. President.
16
                  Judge Moriarty was with the Court of
     Claims, and now we're asking to promote him to
17
18
     the Supreme Court to fill a term expiring on
     December 31, 2013.
19
20
                  He has some guests joining him
21
     today: His fiancee, Toni Litzinger; family and
     friends Erick Laine, Marianne Laine, and Cindy
22
     Abbott Letro. We welcome them all.
23
                  And I ask this distinguished body to
24
25
     confirm this gentleman.
```

```
ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Thank
 1
 2
     you, Senator Bonacic.
 3
                  Senator Young.
 4
                  SENATOR YOUNG:
                                   Thank you,
 5
     Mr. President.
                  Mr. President, it truly is an honor
 6
 7
     and a privilege for me to rise today in support
     of my friend Jerry, Jeremiah J. Moriarty III, for
 8
     justice for Supreme Court of the Eighth Judicial
 9
10
     District.
                  Judge Moriarty is a native of
11
12
     Cattaraugus County, a town by the name of
     Franklinville, New York. And many of my
13
14
     colleagues will remember my predecessor, Senator
15
     Patricia McGee, had Franklinville as her
16
     hometown.
                  And, Jerry, I know if Pat were here
17
18
     today, she would be so thrilled and so proud of
     you and all of your accomplishments.
19
20
                  Judge Moriarty is a graduate of
     Ten Broeck School and Franklinville Central
21
     School. He also graduated from Georgetown
22
     University and SUNY Buffalo Law School.
23
                  He always has been in public service
24
25
     his entire adult life. He has volunteered,
```

```
working tirelessly for organizations such as the
 1
 2
     Youth Bureau, Olean General Hospital, Olean
 3
     General Hospital Foundation, Randolph Children's
 4
     Home, the Cattaraugus Region Community
 5
     Foundation, and the Boy Scouts.
                  And when I think of Judge Moriarty,
 6
 7
     I think of many words, but these are some that
     just came to mind today: A dedicated and
 8
 9
     distinguished public servant, intelligent,
10
     deliberative, conscientious, a hard worker,
11
     someone who always gives back to his community
12
     and his state, and someone you can always count
13
     on.
                  He's been a dear friend and a mentor
14
15
     to me, and I feel so fortunate to know the
     judge. So it truly is wonderful that he's here
16
     today. I especially want to commend Governor
17
18
     Cuomo for his excellent choice.
19
                  I wish you so much love, Godspeed,
20
     and congratulations.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
21
                                              Thank
22
     you, Senator Young.
                  Senator Maziarz.
23
24
                  SENATOR MAZIARZ: Thank you very
25
     much, Mr. President.
```

```
1
                  I too rise to join my colleagues
 2
     Senator Bonacic and Senator Young in seconding
     the nomination of Jerry Moriarty for the Supreme
 3
 4
     Court.
 5
                  Jerry has been an excellent citizen,
     as Senator Young pointed out, of the Southern
 6
 7
     Tier, of Western New York. I'm proud to have
 8
     known Jerry for many years. He did an excellent
     job on the Court of Claims and will do an
 9
10
     excellent job in the Supreme Court.
11
                  Congratulations, Jerry.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
12
                                              The
     question is on the nomination of Jeremiah J.
13
     Moriarty III for justice of the Supreme Court of
14
15
     the Eighth Judicial District. All in favor say
16
     aye.
17
                  (Response of "Aye.")
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Opposed?
19
                  (No response.)
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Jeremiah
     J. Moriarty III is hereby confirmed as a Supreme
21
22
     Court justice of the Eighth Judicial District.
                  Congratulations, Judge.
23
24
                  (Applause.)
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
```

```
Secretary will read.
 1
 2
                  THE SECRETARY: Richard E. Sise,
     judge of the Court of Claims.
 3
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Senator
 5
     Bonacic.
                  SENATOR BONACIC:
 6
                                     Thank you,
 7
     Mr. President. I'm getting my exercise today.
 8
                  First of all, Judge Sise is a Court
     of Claims judge. This nomination will be for a
9
10
     full nine-year term, second term, that would end
     January 22, 2022.
11
                  Judge Sise, like his colleagues
12
     before him, all are competent, experienced, good
13
14
     temperament.
15
                  And I would like to introduce his
     guests today. His bride is here, Connie. His
16
     son Michael is here today. His brother, who is a
17
18
     Supreme Court justice, Joseph Sise, is here. His
19
     law clerk, Betsy Sommers, and secretary, Mary
20
     Burch-Macherone. They're all here to enjoy and
     to celebrate his confirmation today.
21
22
                  And I would ask my colleagues to
     confirm him.
23
                  Thank you, Mr. President.
24
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Thank
```

you, Senator Bonacic. 1 2 Senator Farley. 3 SENATOR FARLEY: Yes, I rise to 4 second the nomination and just tell you a little 5 bit about Dick Sise and this remarkable family that he comes from. 6 7 I'll start off by saying, like so many of us, he married above himself with Connie 8 Cahill, a brilliant attorney and the sister of 9 10 John Cahill, the noted referee, national referee who does the Final Four and everything else, who 11 12 sat right over there where you are, Rebecca, for 13 many years. And Dick Sise is one of nine boys, 14 15 the son of Judge Sise, his father, who was the administrative judge, presiding judge. 16 Remarkable family. Every one of these Sise boys 17 18 have gone on to great things. 19 I think Joe Sise, who is up there, 20 was the youngest Supreme Court justice in the State of New York. And he just got reelected, 21 leading the ticket, as usual, for his second 22 14-year term. 23 24 The Sise family has been very, very 25 significant in their community. He has a

```
magnificent family, and I think his son Michael
 1
 2
     is here with him.
                  And Dick Sise is truly a resident
 3
 4
     and a leader in Niskayuna, where I come from, my
 5
     hometown. And they did come from the City of
     Amsterdam, and they're well known out there. And
 6
 7
     they have the Sise and Sise Law Firm, which
     contains his brothers and his father, I think
 8
     still practicing.
 9
10
                  Dick Sise is truly a great jurist
     and somebody that we should be very proud to
11
12
     reappoint. And, Mr. President, I urge all of my
     colleagues to recognize and vote for the
13
14
     reappointment of Richard Sise, judge
15
     extraordinaire.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
16
                                              Senator
     Breslin.
17
18
                  SENATOR BRESLIN:
                                     Thank you,
     Mr. President.
19
20
                  In the interest of time, I won't
21
     repeat everything that Senator Farley has
              Suffice it to say that Dick Sise has
22
     stated.
     been an exemplary chief judge of the Court of
23
24
     Claims, respected by Democrats, Republicans, and
25
     everyone else involved. He's exactly what we
```

1 want on the court. 2 And he comes from a wonderful 3 family, as Senator Farley said, devoted to public service. And Dick has devoted his entire life to 4 5 public service. And I'm delighted to second the 6 7 nomination of Dick Sise, my good friend. 8 Thank you, Mr. President. 9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator 10 DeFrancisco. SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: 11 Yes, at the 12 Judiciary Committee hearing I said some very nice things about this particular judge. That was 13 before I knew that John Cahill was his 14 15 brother-in-law. 16 (Laughter.) 17 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Several years 18 ago we brought the Syracuse University national 19 champions basketball team here, and John was 20 sitting as counsel. And I had indicated that 21 Syracuse that year lost seven games, five of 22 which were refereed by your brother-in-law. Which prompted Jim Boeheim to ask permission to 23 speak. And I forgot what he said, but it wasn't 24 25 good.

(Laughter.) 1 2 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: But despite 3 that fact -- and John, by the way, is a good 4 friend -- I just want to say that in addition to 5 his judicial duties, the administrative duties as chief judge are substantial, to put it mildly. 6 7 And he is respected by all the judges that he supervises, and he does just a wonderful job in 8 managing the Court of Claims. 9 10 So a great reappointment, and we're 11 very happy to support him, I'm certain 12 unanimously. ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: 13 Senator 14 Nozzolio. 15 SENATOR NOZZOLIO: Thank you, 16 Mr. President. I rise too as a fan of Syracuse 17 18 University basketball, but not to chastise our 19 nominee, but rather to praise him. 20 Senator DeFrancisco began the 21 commentary, but I think it's important that 22 everyone know that Judge Sise is certainly respected in the Capital District, as he should 23 be, but throughout the state. And particularly 24 25 the judges that he has had to administer, to say

```
yes to, once in a while to say no to, universally
 1
     have his respect, and the fact that they respect
 2
 3
     him. And that is a testament to his leadership,
 4
     not just his administrative ability, but his
 5
     understanding of the law, of the dynamics of
     courtrooms. And that he certainly is praised by
 6
 7
     his colleagues and the colleagues that he
 8
     manages.
 9
                  For that and many other reasons
10
     already stated, I rise in enthusiastic support of
     Judge Sise.
11
                  Before I sit down, though, I'd also
12
     like to congratulate Jerry Moriarty, who again is
13
14
     a treasure in Western New York. And that it's a
15
     very good day to see such quality members
     reappointed to the judiciary.
16
                  Thank you, Mr. President.
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Senator
     Larkin.
19
20
                  SENATOR LARKIN: Dick, I'm not an
21
     attorney, as you know. But one of your
22
     classmates, when I told him that you were going
     to be reupped again, he said: "Make sure you say
23
     something nice about my classmate."
24
25
                  So I will say this. From the first
```

```
time I ever met you with Billy, Bill always said,
 1
 2
     "You know, Dad, this guy is going to be a judge
     someday." He was a great student. He cared
 3
 4
     about people. He did things in a professional
 5
     manner so that everybody was proud of what was
     the end result.
 6
 7
                  So I'm here for your classmate, to
     say congratulations and it's good to see you
 8
 9
     again.
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Thank
     you, Senator Larkin.
11
                  The question is on the nomination of
12
     Richard E. Sise to the Court of Claims. All in
13
14
     favor signify by saying aye.
15
                  (Response of "Aye.")
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Opposed?
17
                  (No response.)
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Richard
     E. Sise is hereby confirmed as a judge to the
19
     Court of Claims.
20
21
                  Judge Sise, congratulations.
22
                  (Applause.)
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
     Libous, that completes the nominations of the
24
25
     Judiciary Committee before the house.
```

```
1
                                     Thank you,
                  SENATOR LIBOUS:
 2
     Mr. President.
 3
                  There will be an immediate meeting
 4
     of the Higher Education Committee in Room 332,
 5
     followed immediately by a Finance Committee
     meeting in Room 332.
 6
 7
                  And after you make that
 8
     announcement, I will then announce that the
 9
     Senate will stand at ease.
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              There
     will be an immediate meeting of the Higher
11
     Education Committee in Room 332, which will be
12
     followed shortly by the Finance Committee, also
13
     in Room 332.
14
15
                  Senator Libous.
16
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President, the
     Senate will stand at ease.
17
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
18
                                              The
     Senate will stand at ease.
19
20
                  (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease
21
     at 3:18 p.m.)
22
                  (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at
     4:24 p.m.)
23
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President.
24
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
```

```
Senate will come to order.
 1
 2
                  Senator Libous.
 3
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: If we can return
 4
     to reports of standing committees, I believe
 5
     there's a report of the Finance Committee at the
     desk.
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              There is
 8
     a report of the Finance Committee before the
9
     desk.
10
                  The Secretary will read.
                  THE SECRETARY:
11
                                    Senator
     DeFrancisco, from the Committee on Finance,
12
     reports the following nominations.
13
                  As commissioner of the Port
14
15
     Authority of New York and New Jersey, Basil A.
16
     Paterson, of New York.
17
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
18
     DeFrancisco.
19
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO:
                                          Thank you,
20
     Mr. President.
21
                  I rise proudly to move the
22
     nomination of Basil A. Paterson of New York for
     commissioner of the Port Authority of New York
23
     and New Jersey.
24
25
                  I'm sure there's no one who doesn't
```

```
know Mr. Paterson, knows of his outstanding
 1
 2
     career in public and private service. He's truly
 3
     a legend.
 4
                  And I proudly move the nomination
 5
     and am fortunate to have this opportunity to do
 6
     so, and I'm sure his nomination will be approved
 7
     unanimously.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Thank
 8
     you, Senator DeFrancisco.
9
10
                  The question is on the nomination of
     Basil A. Paterson as a commissioner of the Port
11
12
     Authority of New York and New Jersey. All in
     favor signify by saying aye.
13
                  (Response of "Aye.")
14
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Opposed?
16
                  (No response.)
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Basil A.
17
18
     Paterson is hereby confirmed as a commissioner of
     the Port Authority of New York and New Jersey.
19
20
                  Congratulations, Mr. Paterson.
21
                  (Applause.)
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
22
                                              The
     Secretary will read.
23
                  THE SECRETARY: As commissioner of
24
25
     the Port Authority of New York and New Jersey,
```

```
Kenneth Lipper, of New York.
 1
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
     DeFrancisco.
 3
 4
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Yes, I also
 5
     proudly move Mr. Lipper's nomination.
 6
                  Mr. Lipper is truly a renaissance
 7
     man --
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Can I
 9
     have some order in the chamber, please? Thank
10
     you.
                  Senator DeFrancisco.
11
12
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: He's truly a
     renaissance man. He's had an incredible career
13
14
     in government, as was stated most especially by
15
     Senator Diaz in the committee meeting. He
16
     has an incredible record in finance and private
     business. And he has a record in the arts,
17
18
     having written and produced his movie "City
     Hall."
19
20
                  He's going to increase his
21
     experience by being a member of the Port
22
     Authority of New York and New Jersey. And with
23
     that background, there's no question that that
     organization is in wonderful hands for the
24
25
     future.
```

```
1
                  So I move the nomination.
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 3
     question is on the nomination of Kenneth Lipper
 4
     as a commissioner of the Port Authority of
 5
     New York and New Jersey. All in favor signify by
 6
     saying aye.
 7
                  (Response of "Aye.")
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Opposed?
 9
                  (No response.)
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Kenneth
     Lipper is hereby confirmed as a commissioner of
11
     the Port Authority of New York and New Jersey.
12
13
                  Congratulations, Mr. Lipper.
14
                  (Applause.)
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
16
     Secretary will now read.
17
                  THE SECRETARY: As member of the
18
     Battery Park City Authority, Lester Petracca, of
     Manhasset.
19
20
                  As member of the State Council on
21
     the Arts, Deborah Ronnen, of Rochester.
22
                  As commissioner of the State
     Athletic Commission, John Signorile, of East
23
     Williston.
24
25
                  As member and chairman of the
```

```
1
     New York State Olympic Regional Development
 2
     Authority, J. Patrick Barrett, of Manlius.
                  As members of the New York State
 3
 4
     Olympic Regional Development Authority: Jill
 5
     Ruhm Broderick, of Chestertown, and Robert
     Francis Flacke, of Lake George.
 6
 7
                  As members of the Saratoga-Capital
     District State Park, Recreation and Historic
 8
     Preservation Commission: Karen Lee Bilowith, of
 9
10
     Saratoga Springs, and John McEneny, of Albany.
                  And as members of the Niagara
11
12
     Frontier Transportation Authority: LaVonne E.
     Ansari, Ph.D., of Buffalo; Anthony J. Baynes, of
13
14
     Williamsville; Peter G. Demakos, of East Amherst;
15
     Margo Dawn Downey, of Buffalo; Michael P. Hughes,
     of West Seneca; and Adam W. Perry, of Buffalo.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
17
                                              Senator
18
     DeFrancisco.
19
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: I move each
20
     of the nominations.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
21
                                              Senator
22
     Espaillat.
23
                  SENATOR ESPAILLAT:
                                       Thank you,
     Mr. President.
24
25
                  As we continue to take on many
```

nominations yesterday and today, I think that 1 once we're done we will have taken up over 2 3 200 nominees given to us by Governor Cuomo. 4 Certainly many folks with great experiences from 5 across the State of New York, representing the diverse regions of state, with an array of 6 7 history in private, public, the arts, in different sectors of society. Really a wonderful 8 9 list of nominees that we have taken up, over 200 10 of them. We've done a tremendous job at 11 12 putting these names through, going through their 13 resumes and evaluating their qualifications. 14 I may say that, including the judges that were 15 nominated to date and the members of the Port Authority, all highly qualified. 16 17 However, Mr. President, I stand to raise a grave concern that out of 214 nominees, 18 there were only six -- equating to 3 percent of 19 20 them -- that were of Hispanic background. And this is a population that 21 22 comprises 18 percent of the New York State In fact, some folks believe that if 23 population. you take the undercount, it's really 20 percent 24 25 of the New York State population, one out of five

```
New Yorkers, are of Hispanic descent. And to
 1
 2
     have only 3 percent, six out of 214, is really a
     disservice to this state.
 3
 4
                  We all strive to make sure that
 5
     government is reflective of the composition of
     the State of New York. Imagine a government
 6
 7
     without women. Imagine a government without
     African-Americans.
                         Imagine a government without
 8
     folks from different regions, from the Western
 9
10
     part of New York, from Long Island, from Central
     New York, from the Hudson Valley, from the City
11
     of New York.
12
13
                  We must all do better to ensure that
14
     government continues to be reflective of the
15
     composition of the population. And we have, the
     Latino community has highly qualified potential
16
17
     appointees, and we are eager to serve.
18
                  So I would like to express my
     concern regarding this great flaw in this process
19
20
     of nomination.
21
                  Thank you, Mr. President.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
22
                                              Senator
     Diaz, why do you rise?
23
                  SENATOR DIAZ: Will Senator
24
25
     Espaillat yield for a question?
```

```
1
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
 2
     Diaz, we're actually just speaking on nominations
 3
     right now. So you can speak on the nominees if
 4
     you'd like.
 5
                  SENATOR DIAZ:
                                  I just want to ask
     Senator Espaillat some questions about the
 6
 7
     statement he was making.
                               If you allow me.
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                            It's not
 9
     germane at this point in time relative to the
10
     rules of order, Senator Diaz.
                  SENATOR DIAZ:
11
                                  Thank you.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
12
                                             The
     question is on the nominations as presented for
13
     the offices that have been specified. All those
14
15
     in favor signify by saying aye.
16
                  (Response of "Aye.")
17
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                            Opposed?
18
                  (No response.)
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
19
                                             The
20
     nominees are hereby confirmed.
21
                  Senator Libous.
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President,
22
23
     could you give me a second here?
                  (Pause.)
24
25
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President.
```

```
1
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
 2
     Libous.
 3
                  SENATOR LIBOUS:
                                     There will be an
 4
     immediate meeting of the Rules Committee in 332,
 5
     an immediate meeting of the Rules Committee in
     Room 332.
 6
 7
                  In the meantime, we'll stand at
 8
     ease.
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              There
10
     will be an immediate meeting of the Rules
     Committee in Room 332, an immediate meeting of
11
     the Rules Committee in 332.
12
13
                  The Senate stands at ease.
14
                  (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease
15
     at 4:33 p.m.)
16
                  (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at
     5:01 p.m.)
17
18
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President.
19
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
     Senate will come to order.
20
21
                  Senator Libous.
22
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: If you could call
23
     on Senator Gianaris and then come back to me,
24
     please.
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
```

```
Gianaris.
 1
 2
                  SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
 3
     there will be an immediate meeting of the
     Democratic Conference in the Democratic
 4
 5
     Conference Room.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 6
                                              There
 7
     will be an immediate meeting of the Democratic
 8
     Conference in the Democratic Conference Room.
 9
                  Senator Libous.
10
                  SENATOR LIBOUS:
                                     There will be an
     immediate Republican conference in Room 332, and
11
     then the Senate will stand at ease until the
12
13
     conferences are commenced.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
14
                                              There
15
     will be an immediate meeting also of the
16
     Republican Conference in Room 332.
17
                  The Senate will stand at ease until
18
     conferences have concluded. Senate at ease.
19
                  (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease
20
     at 5:02 p.m.)
21
                  (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at
22
     8:03 p.m.)
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
     Senate will come to order.
24
25
                  Senator Libous.
```

```
1
                  SENATOR LIBOUS:
                                     Mr. President, can
 2
     we go back to reports of standing committees. I
     believe there's a report of the Rules Committee
 3
 4
     at the desk.
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              We will
     return to reports of standing committees.
 6
 7
                  There is a report of the Rules
     Committee at the desk, and the Secretary will
 8
9
     read.
10
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                    Senator Skelos,
     from the Committee on Rules, reports the
11
     following bills:
12
13
                  Senate Print 129, by Senator
14
     Peralta, an act to amend the Penal Law;
15
                  Senate 259, by Senator Diaz, an act
16
     to amend the Banking Law;
                  Senate 383, by Senator Diaz, an act
17
18
     to amend the State Finance Law;
19
                  Senate 2342A, by Senator Breslin, an
20
     act to authorize;
                  Senate 2551, by Senator Hannon, an
21
     act to amend the Insurance Law;
22
                  Senate 3488A, by Senator
23
     Ranzenhofer, an act to amend the Criminal
24
25
     Procedure Law;
```

```
1
                  Senate 3886, by Senator Ball, an act
 2
     to amend the Penal Law;
 3
                  Senate 4310A, by Senator Marcellino,
 4
     an act to amend the Tax Law;
 5
                  Senate 4327A, by Senator Seward, an
     act to amend the Insurance Law;
 6
                  Senate 4329A, by Senator Seward, an
 7
     act to amend the Insurance Law;
 8
                  Senate 4361, by Senator Hannon, an
9
10
     act to amend the Public Health Law;
                  Senate 4493A, by Senator Hoylman, an
11
12
     act in relation to directing;
                  Senate 4584A, by Senator Farley, an
13
     act to allow;
14
15
                  Senate 4624A, by Senator Hannon, an
     act to amend the Public Authorities Law;
16
                  Senate 4762A, by Senator
17
18
     DeFrancisco, an act to amend the Labor Law;
19
                  Senate 4809, by Senator Little, an
20
     act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law;
                  Senate 4881A, by Senator Hoylman, an
21
     act to amend the Education Law;
22
                  Senate 4906, by Senator Golden, an
23
     act to amend Chapter 929 of the Laws of 1986;
24
25
                  Senate 5046A, by Senator Hannon, an
```

```
act to amend the Public Health Law;
 1
                  Senate 5053, by Senator Golden, an
 2
     act to amend the Retirement and Social Security
 3
 4
     Law;
 5
                  Senate 5060A, by Senator Hannon, an
     act to amend the Education Law;
 6
 7
                  Senate 5096, by Senator Golden, an
     act to amend the Social Services Law;
 8
9
                  Senate 5219, by Senator Libous, an
10
     act to amend the Tax Law;
                  Senate 5249, by Senator Carlucci, an
11
     act to amend the Social Services Law;
12
                  Senate 5267, by Senator LaValle, an
13
14
     act to authorize;
15
                  Senate 5275A, by Senator Marcellino,
     an act to amend the Public Buildings Law;
16
                  Senate 5541, by Senator Hannon, an
17
     act to amend Chapter 942 of the Laws of 1983;
18
19
                  Senate 5617, by Senator Griffo, an
20
     act to amend the Public Officers Law;
                  Senate 5695A, by Senator Robach, an
21
22
     act to amend Chapter 362 of the Laws of 2012;
                  5701, by Senator O'Mara, an act to
23
     amend the Criminal Procedure Law;
24
25
                  Senate 5704, by Senator Seward, an
```

```
act to amend Chapter 673 of the Laws of 2005;
 1
 2
                  Senate 5722, by Senator Zeldin, an
 3
     act to amend Chapter 121 of the Laws of 2012;
 4
                  Senate 5727, by Senator LaValle, an
 5
     act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law;
                  Senate 5739C, by Senator Little, an
 6
 7
     act to amend the Alcoholic Beverage Control Law;
                  Senate 5766, by Senator LaValle, an
 8
9
     act to authorize;
                  Senate 5771, by Senator Klein, an
10
     act to amend the Administrative Code of the City
11
12
     of New York;
                  Senate 5772, by Senator Klein, an
13
14
     act to amend the Real Property Tax Law;
15
                  Senate 5804, by Senator Seward, an
     act to amend the Insurance Law;
16
                  Senate 5808, by Senator Savino, an
17
18
     act implementing;
19
                  Senate 5812, by the Committee on
20
     Rules, an act to authorize;
                  Senate 5819, by Senator Zeldin, an
21
22
     act to amend Chapter 350 of the Laws of 2012;
                  Senate 5825, by Senator Martins, an
23
     act to amend the Executive Law;
24
25
                  Senate 5826, by Senator Fuschillo,
```

```
an act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law;
 1
 2
                  Senate 5827, by Senator Flanagan, an
     act to amend the Education Law;
 3
 4
                  Senate 5831, by Senator Farley, an
 5
     act to amend the Religious Corporations Law;
                  Senate 5838, by Senator Zeldin, an
 6
 7
     act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law;
 8
                  Senate 5840, by Senator Carlucci, an
9
     act to authorize;
10
                  Senate 5841, by Senator Robach, an
     act establishing;
11
12
                  And Senate 5858, by Senator Bonacic,
     an act to amend the Penal Law.
13
                  All bills reported direct to third
14
15
     reading.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
     Libous.
17
18
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: I move to accept
     the report of the Rules Committee.
19
                                             All in
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
21
     favor of accepting the Committee on Rules report
22
     signify by saying aye.
23
                  (Response of "Aye.")
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Opposed?
24
25
                  (No response.)
```

```
ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 1
                                             The
 2
     Committee on Rules report is accepted.
 3
                  Senator Libous.
 4
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: We have in front
 5
     of us Supplemental Calendar 56A, just passed
     out. I would like to have the noncontroversial
 6
 7
     reading of that calendar, please.
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 9
     Secretary will read Supplemental Senate Calendar
10
     56A.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11
12
     1474, by Senator Peralta, Senate Print 129, an
     act to amend the Penal Law.
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
14
15
     last section.
16
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 8.
     act shall take effect on the first of November.
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
19
20
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
21
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
22
23
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24
25
     1475, by Senator Diaz, Senate Print 259, an act
```

```
1
     to amend the Banking Law.
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
 3
     last section.
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
 4
 5
     act shall take effect immediately.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 6
 7
    roll.
 8
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
9
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is passed.
11
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12
     1476, by Senator Diaz, Senate Print 383, an act
13
     to amend the State Finance Law.
14
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
16
     last section.
17
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                               This
18
     act shall take effect on the 30th day.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
19
20
     roll.
21
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
22
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is passed.
24
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
25
```

```
Calendar Number 1477, Senator Breslin moves to
 1
 2
     discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
     Bill Number 4717A and substitute it for the
 3
 4
     identical Senate Bill Number 2342A, Third Reading
 5
     Calendar 1477.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 6
                                             The
 7
     substitution is so ordered, and there is a
 8
     home-rule message at the desk.
 9
                  The Secretary will read.
10
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Calendar Number
     1477, by Member of the Assembly Fahy, Assembly
11
     Print 4717A, an act to authorize.
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
13
     last section.
14
15
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 2.
16
     act shall take effect immediately.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
17
18
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
19
20
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 62. Nays,
     1. Senator Ball recorded in the negative.
21
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
22
23
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24
25
     1478, by Senator Hannon, Senate Print 2551, an
```

```
1
     act to amend the Insurance Law.
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
 3
     last section.
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 26. This
 4
 5
     act shall take effect January 1, 2014.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 6
 7
     roll.
 8
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: May I
10
    have some order in the house, please.
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62. Nays,
11
12
     1. Senator Seward recorded in the negative.
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
14
     is passed.
15
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16
     1479, by Senator Ranzenhofer, Senate Print 3488A,
     an act to amend the Criminal Procedure Law.
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
19
20
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
21
     act shall take effect on the 60th day.
22
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
23
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62. Nays,
```

```
1. Senator Ball recorded in the negative.
 1
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 3
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 4
 5
     1480, by Senator Ball, Senate Print 3886, an act
     to amend the Penal Law.
 6
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
 7
 8
     last section.
 9
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                               This
10
     act shall take effect on the first of November.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
11
     roll.
12
13
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
14
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
16
     is passed.
17
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   In relation to
18
     Calendar Number 1481, Senator Marcellino moves to
19
     discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
20
    Bill Number 5960A and substitute it for the
21
     identical Senate Bill Number 4310A, Third Reading
     Calendar 1481.
22
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
     substitution is so ordered.
24
25
                  The Secretary will read.
```

```
1
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 2
     1481, by Member of the Assembly Farrell, Assembly
 3
     Print Number 5960A, an act to amend the Tax Law.
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Read the
 5
     last section.
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                               This
 6
 7
     act shall take effect immediately.
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
9
     roll.
10
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
11
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is passed.
13
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
14
15
     Calendar Number 1482, Senator Seward moves to
16
     discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
     Bill Number 6918A and substitute it for the
17
18
     identical Senate Bill Number 4327A, Third Reading
     Calendar 1482.
19
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
21
     substitution is so ordered.
22
                  The Secretary will read.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23
     1482, by Member of the Assembly Steck, Assembly
24
25
     Print 6918A, an act to amend the Insurance Law.
```

```
1
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
 2
     last section.
 3
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 2.
 4
     act shall take effect immediately.
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
 6
 7
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 8
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
10
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
11
     Calendar Number 1483, Senator Seward moves to
12
13
    discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
     Bill Number 7807A and substitute it for the
14
15
     identical Senate Bill Number 4329A, Third Reading
16
     Calendar 1483.
17
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
18
     substitution is so ordered.
19
                  The Secretary will read.
20
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21
     1483, by Member of the Assembly Cahill, Assembly
22
     Print Number 7807A, an act to amend the Insurance
23
     Law.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
24
25
     last section.
```

```
1
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 2.
                                               This
 2
     act shall take effect immediately.
 3
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
 4
 5
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
                  THE SECRETARY:
 6
                                   Ayes, 63.
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
 8
     is passed.
 9
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
10
     Calendar Number 1484, Senator Hannon moves to
11
     discharge, from the Committee on Health, Assembly
     Bill Number 6121 and substitute it for the
12
13
     identical Senate Bill Number 4361, Third Reading
     Calendar 1484.
14
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
16
     substitution is so ordered.
17
                  The Secretary will read.
18
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     1484, by Member of the Assembly Gunther, Assembly
19
20
    Print 6121, an act to amend the Public Health
21
    Law.
22
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
23
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 2. This
24
25
     act shall take effect immediately.
```

```
1
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 2
     roll.
 3
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 4
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is passed.
 6
 7
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 8
     1485, by Senator Hoylman, Senate Print 4493A, an
 9
     act in relation to directing.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
10
     last section.
11
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
12
     act shall take effect immediately.
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
14
15
     roll.
16
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
17
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Senator
18
     Gianaris to explain his vote.
19
                  SENATOR GIANARIS: I was waiting
20
     for you to announce the results, Mr. President.
21
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
22
     results are being tabulated.
23
                  Senator Hoylman to explain his vote.
                  SENATOR HOYLMAN:
24
                                     Thank you,
25
     Mr. President.
```

I wanted to thank Senator Hannon for his leadership and guidance in helping me move this bill forward, along with my colleague in the other house, Assemblymember Gottfried.

The impetus for this bill,
Mr. President, was the closing of a hospital in
my district, St. Vincent's, that served the local
community for over 150 years. And in the wake of
the hospital closing, medical practices calling
themselves "urgent care centers" have sprung up
all over my district.

But these type of practices aren't required to be certified by the Health

Department, nor are clinics operating within pharmacies, miniclinics, or major physician practices, megaclinics, which are being created all across New York.

So, Mr. President, the impetus and the goal of this bill is to direct the Department of Health to study their impact as relating to the delivery, quality and cost of healthcare and report back to us as we, as policy makers, can better understand their role in the healthcare system.

I vote aye. Thank you,

```
Mr. President.
 1
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Senator
 3
    Hoylman to be recorded in the affirmative.
 4
                  Announce the results.
 5
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60. Nays,
     3. Senators Ball, Griffo and Marchione recorded
 6
 7
     in the negative.
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
9
     is passed.
10
                  Senator Gianaris.
                  SENATOR GIANARIS: And now,
11
12
    Mr. President, can we please congratulate Senator
    Hoylman on his first bill.
13
14
                  (Applause.)
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Calendar
16
    Number 1486. The Secretary will read.
17
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18
     1486, by Senator Farley, Senate Print 4584A, an
     act to allow.
19
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There is
21
     a home-rule message at the desk.
22
                  Read the last section.
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
23
     act shall take effect immediately.
24
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
```

```
roll.
 1
 2
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 3
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 5
     is passed.
 6
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
 7
     Calendar Number 1487, Senator Hannon moves to
 8
     discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
 9
     Bill Number 7993A and substitute it for the
10
     identical Senate Bill Number 4624A, Third Reading
     Calendar 1487.
11
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
     Substitution ordered.
13
                  The Secretary will read.
14
15
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16
     1487, by Member of the Assembly Hooper, Assembly
     Print Number 7993A, an act to amend the Public
17
18
     Authorities Law.
19
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
20
     last section.
21
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
22
     act shall take effect immediately.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
24
25
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
```

```
1
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 3
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 4
 5
     1488, by Senator DeFrancisco, Senate Print 4762A,
     an act to amend the Labor Law.
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
 8
     last section.
9
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
10
     act shall take effect immediately.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
11
     roll.
12
13
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
14
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62. Nays,
15
     1. Senator Ball recorded in the negative.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is passed.
17
18
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     1489, by Senator Little, Senate Print 4809, an
19
20
     act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.
21
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
22
     last section.
23
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
     act shall take effect on the same date and in the
24
25
     same manner as a Concurrent Resolution of the
```

```
Senate and Assembly.
 1
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 3
     roll.
 4
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
     Little to explain her vote.
 6
 7
                  SENATOR LITTLE:
                                     Thank you,
 8
     Mr. President. And thank you to all my
 9
     colleagues for passing this bill and supporting
10
     this bill.
                  This completes the journey that will
11
     bring us to a constitutional amendment which will
12
     appear on the ballots in November. And this
13
     constitutional amendment will solve and offer an
14
15
     opportunity for settlement of a land dispute
16
     between the State of New York and many, many
     private parties, many of them who live in your
17
18
     districts.
                  This is a second-home area.
19
                                                It's
20
     called Township 40. It's in the Town of
21
     Long Lake, in Hamilton County. And this has been
22
     a title problem for over 100 years.
                  So this gives a method and a way of
23
     doing it and replacing the land that is in
24
25
     question with double the amount of land going
```

```
1
     into the Forest Preserve. And the people will be
 2
     providing the funds for that. This is the
 3
     implementation language.
 4
                  And joining us tonight is one of the
 5
     women who really put her heart and soul into all
     of this, giving us the information, bringing back
 6
 7
     title searches and charts that were way too
 8
     complicated me for to understand. But Carolyn
     Gerdin is with us in the gallery. I want to
 9
10
     thank her and thank all of you for supporting
     this very important piece of legislation, and
11
12
     hopefully you will support it all in November.
13
                  It is sponsored and supported by the
     Adirondack Council and the Adirondack Mountain
14
15
     Club, two of the really preeminent environmental
     groups in our area.
16
17
                  So thank you very much.
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Thank
     you, Senator Little.
19
20
                  Senator Little will be recorded in
21
     the affirmative.
22
                  Announce the results.
23
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The bill
24
25
     is passed.
```

```
1
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Calendar Number
 2
     1490, by Senator Hoylman, Senate Print 4881A, an
     act to amend the Education Law.
 3
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Read the
 5
     last section.
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 4.
                                                This
 6
 7
     act shall take effect on the 90th day.
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Call the
9
     roll.
10
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
11
                                              Senator
12
     Hoylman to explain his vote.
13
                  SENATOR HOYLMAN: When it rains it
14
     pours, Mr. President.
15
                  (Laughter.)
16
                  SENATOR HOYLMAN:
                                     I just wanted to
     thank Senator Hannon, mostly Senator LaValle,
17
18
     Senator Zeldin, our leaders in all three
19
     conferences for their assistance in getting this
20
     bill forward.
21
                  This bill, Mr. President, will get
22
     the meningitis vaccination into pharmacies. You
23
     may not know, but there is an outbreak of
     meningococcal meningitis in New York City and a
24
25
     number of cities across the country. Twenty-two
```

```
1
     cases, seven gay men have died. And the best way
 2
     to prevent the meningitis illness is to get
     vaccinated.
 3
                  So we've seen with the flu
 4
 5
     vaccination that once it's in pharmacies, people
     get vaccinated. This bill will do that.
 6
 7
                  So thank you so much for your
 8
     support, Mr. President. I vote aye.
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
10
     Hoylman be recorded in the affirmative.
                  Announce the results.
11
                                   Ayes, 63.
12
                  THE SECRETARY:
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
     is passed.
14
15
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   In relation to
16
     Calendar Number 1491, Senator Golden moves to
     discharge, from the Committee on Investigations
17
18
     and Government Operations, Assembly Bill Number
     6868 and substitute it for the identical Senate
19
20
     Bill Number 4906, Third Reading Calendar 1491.
21
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
22
     substitution is so ordered.
23
                  The Secretary will read.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24
25
     1491, by Member of the Assembly Abbate, Assembly
```

```
Print Number 6868, an act to amend Chapter 929 of
 1
     the Laws of 1986.
 2
 3
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
 4
 5
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
     act shall take effect immediately.
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 8
     roll.
9
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
10
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
11
     is passed.
12
13
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     1492, by Senator Hannon, Senate Print 5046A, an
14
15
     act to amend the Public Health Law.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
17
18
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
     act shall take effect on the 60th day.
19
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
21
     roll.
22
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
23
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
24
25
     is passed.
```

```
1
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   In relation to
 2
     Calendar Number 1493, Senator Golden moves to
 3
     discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
     Bill Number --
 4
 5
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Lay it aside for
 6
     the day.
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Let us do
 8
     the substitution first, Senator Libous.
 9
                  The Secretary will continue.
10
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   In relation to
     Calendar Number 1493, Senator Golden moves to
11
12
     discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
     Bill Number 6942 and substitute it for the
13
     identical Senate Bill Number 5053, Third Reading
14
15
     Calendar 1493.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
     substitution is so ordered, and the bill will be
17
18
     laid aside for the day.
19
                  The Secretary will read Calendar
20
     Number 1494.
21
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     1494, by Senator Hannon, Senate Print 5060A, an
22
     act to amend the Education Law.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
24
25
     last section.
```

```
1
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 2.
                                                This
 2
     act shall take effect on the first of January.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Call the
 3
     roll.
 4
 5
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 6
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
 8
     is passed.
 9
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
10
     Calendar Number 1495, Senator Golden moves to
11
     discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
     Bill Number 7755 and substitute it for the
12
13
     identical Senate Bill Number 5096, Third Reading
     Calendar 1495.
14
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
16
     substitution is so ordered.
17
                  The Secretary will read.
18
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19
     1495, by Member of the Assembly Gottfried,
20
     Assembly Print 7755, an act to amend the Social
21
     Services Law.
22
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             May I
23
     have some order in the house, please.
                  Read the last section.
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 2.
                                                This
```

```
act shall take effect immediately.
 1
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 3
     roll.
 4
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 5
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 6
 7
     is passed.
 8
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
 9
     Calendar Number 1496, Senator Libous moves to
10
     discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
     Bill Number 7705 and substitute it for the
11
     identical Senate Bill Number 5219, Third Reading
12
13
     Calendar 1496.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
14
15
     substitution is so ordered.
16
                  The Secretary will read.
17
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Calendar Number
18
     1496, by Member of the Assembly Magee, Assembly
19
     Print Number 7705, an act to amend the Tax Law.
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
21
     last section.
22
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
23
     act shall take effect April 1, 2014.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
24
25
     roll.
```

(The Secretary called the roll.) 1 2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator 3 Krueger to explain her vote. 4 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you, 5 Mr. President. So two problems with this bill. Of 6 7 course, one, we reduce the revenue to the state by I think a little over \$6 million annually if 8 this becomes law. 9 10 But much more disturbing to me, mom-and-pop stores all over the State of New York 11 12 depend on sales of small items -- candy, potato chips, cans of liquids, drinks -- that in fact 13 retail for less than a dollar-fifty. 14 If we don't 15 have sales tax on these products when they're in a vending machine but we do have sales tax at the 16 little grocery stores, at the little neighborhood 17 18 stores -- in my communities, we call them bodegas or little green stores on the corners -- that 19 20 means we are taking money out of businesses that have jobs in our communities because there's a 21 22 competitive unfairness here. The vending machines, there's no 23 sales tax. The stores who hire workers in 24 25 communities to sell those products, there is a

```
1
     sales tax. It's just wrong for small
 2
    businesses.
 3
                  I'm voting no. Thank you.
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Senator
 5
    Krueger to be recorded in the negative.
 6
                  Announce the results.
 7
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
 8
     Calendar Number 1496, those recorded in the
 9
    negative are Senators Avella, Espaillat,
10
     Gianaris, Hassell-Thompson, Hoylman, Krueger,
     Montgomery, Parker, Perkins, Rivera, Sanders,
11
12
     Squadron, Stavisky, Stewart-Cousins and Tkaczyk.
13
                  Ayes, 48. Nays, 15.
14
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
15
     is passed.
16
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     1497, by Senator Carlucci, Senate Print 5249, an
17
18
     act to amend the Social Services Law.
19
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
20
     last section.
21
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 3.
                                               This
22
     act shall take effect on the 180th day.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
24
25
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
```

```
1
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 3
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
 4
 5
     Calendar Number 1498, Senator LaValle moves to
    discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
 6
 7
     Bill Number 7396 and substitute it for the
 8
     identical Senate Bill Number 5267, Third Reading
 9
     Calendar 1498.
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
     substitution is so ordered.
11
                  The Secretary will read.
12
13
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     1498, by Member of the Assembly Thiele, Assembly
14
15
     Print 7396, an act to authorize.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
17
18
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                               This
     act shall take effect immediately.
19
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
21
     roll.
22
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
                                   Ayes, 62. Nays,
23
                  THE SECRETARY:
     1. Senator Bonacic recorded in the negative.
24
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
```

```
1
     is passed.
 2
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 3
     1499, by Senator Marcellino, Senate Print 5275A,
 4
     an act to amend the Public Buildings Law.
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
 6
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
 7
     act shall take effect one year after it shall
 8
    have become law.
9
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
11
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
12
13
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
     Calendar 1499, those recorded in the negative are
14
15
     Senators Ball, Griffo, Little and Zeldin. Also
16
     Senator Young. Also Senator Nozzolio. Also
     Senator Marchione.
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Announce
     the results.
19
20
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 56. Nays, 7.
21
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
22
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
23
     Calendar Number 1500, Senator Hannon moves to
24
25
     discharge, from the Committee on Children and
```

```
Families, Assembly Bill Number 7504 and
 1
 2
     substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
     Number 5541, Third Reading Calendar 1500.
 3
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
 5
     substitution is so ordered.
                  The Secretary will read.
 6
 7
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 8
     1500, by Member of the Assembly Millman, Assembly
 9
     Print 7504, an act to amend Chapter 942 of the
10
     Laws of 1983.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
11
     last section.
12
13
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                                This
     act shall take effect immediately.
14
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
16
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
17
18
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
19
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
20
     is passed.
21
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
     Calendar Number 1501, Senator Griffo moves to
22
23
     discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
     Bill Number 7556 and substitute it for the
24
25
     identical Senate Bill Number 5617, Third Reading
```

```
Calendar 1501.
 1
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
 3
     substitution is so ordered.
 4
                  The Secretary will read.
 5
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     1501, by Member of the Assembly Brindisi,
 6
 7
     Assembly Print Number 7556, an act to amend the
 8
     Public Officers Law.
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
10
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11
12
     act shall take effect immediately.
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
14
15
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
16
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
17
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
18
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
19
20
     Calendar Number 1502, Senator Robach moves to
21
    discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
22
     Bill Number 7735A and substitute it for the
     identical Senate Bill Number 5695A, Third Reading
23
    Calendar 1502.
24
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
```

```
substitution is so ordered.
 1
 2
                  The Secretary will read.
 3
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 4
     1502, by Member of the Assembly Morelle, Assembly
 5
    Print Number 7735A, an act to amend Chapter 362
     of the Laws of 2012.
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
 8
     last section.
9
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
10
     act shall take effect immediately.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
11
     roll.
12
13
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
14
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
16
     is passed.
17
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18
     1503, by Senator O'Mara, Senate Print 5701, an
     act to amend the Criminal Procedure Law.
19
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
21
     last section.
22
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
23
     act shall take effect on the 30th day.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
24
25
     roll.
```

```
1
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 2
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 62. Nays,
 3
     1. Senator Montgomery recorded in the negative.
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
 5
     is passed.
 6
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
 7
     Calendar Number 1504, Senator Seward moves to
 8
     discharge, from the Committee on Insurance,
 9
     Assembly Bill Number 7388 and substitute it for
10
     the identical Senate Bill Number 5704, Third
11
     Reading Calendar 1504.
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
     substitution is so ordered.
13
                  The Secretary will read.
14
15
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                  Calendar Number
16
     1504, by Member of the Assembly Cymbrowitz,
     Assembly Print Number 7388, an act to amend
17
18
     Chapter 673 of Laws of 2005.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
19
                                             Read the
20
     last section.
21
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                               This
22
     act shall take effect immediately.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61. Nays,
```

```
2. Senators Ball and Marchione recorded in the
 1
 2
    negative.
 3
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 4
     is passed.
 5
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     1505, by Senator Zeldin, Senate Print 5722, an
 6
 7
     act to amend Chapter 121 of the Laws of 2012.
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             There is
9
     a home-rule message at the desk.
10
                  Read the last section.
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11
12
     act shall take effect immediately.
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
14
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
15
16
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62. Nays,
     1. Senator Ball recorded in the negative.
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is passed.
19
20
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
21
     Calendar Number 1506, Senator LaValle moves to
22
     discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
     Bill Number 7905 and substitute it for the
23
     identical Senate Bill Number 5727, Third Reading
24
25
     Calendar 1506.
```

```
ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 1
                                             The
 2
     substitution is so ordered.
 3
                  The Secretary will read.
 4
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 5
     1506, by Member of the Assembly Sweeney, Assembly
     Print 7905, an act to amend the Environmental
 6
 7
     Conservation Law.
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
9
     last section.
10
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 5.
                                               This
     act shall take effect on the first of January.
11
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
13
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
14
15
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is passed.
17
18
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     1507, by Senator Little, Senate Print 5739C, an
19
20
     act --
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
21
22
     is high.
23
                  Calendar Number 1508.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24
25
     1508, by Senator LaValle, Senate Print 5766, an
```

```
1
     act to authorize.
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
 3
     last section.
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
 4
 5
     act shall take effect immediately.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 6
 7
     roll.
 8
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 9
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is passed.
11
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
12
     Calendar Number 1509, Senator Klein moves to
13
14
    discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
15
     Bill Number 7327A and substitute it for the
16
     identical Senate Bill Number 5771, Third Reading
     Calendar 1509.
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
     substitution is so ordered.
19
20
                  The Secretary will read.
21
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22
     1509, by Member of the Assembly Quart, Assembly
     Print Number 7327A, an act to amend the
23
     Administrative Code of the City of New York.
24
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Read the
```

```
last section.
 1
 2
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 2.
                                               This
 3
     act shall take effect on the 270th day.
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 5
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 6
 7
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
9
     is passed.
10
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
     Calendar Number 1510, Senator Klein moves to
11
     discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
12
13
     Bill Number 7314A and substitute it for the
     identical Senate Bill Number 5772, Third Reading
14
15
     Calendar 1510.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
     substitution is so ordered.
17
18
                  The Secretary will read.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19
20
     1510, by Member of the Assembly Quart, Assembly
21
     Print Number 7314A, an act to amend the Real
22
     Property Tax Law.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 3.
                                               This
```

```
act shall take effect July 1, 2014.
 1
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 3
     roll.
 4
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 5
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 6
 7
     is passed.
 8
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
 9
     Calendar Number 1511, Senator Seward moves to
10
     discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
     Bill Number 3107D and substitute it for the
11
     identical Senate Bill Number 5804, Third Reading
12
13
     Calendar 1511.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
14
15
     substitution is so ordered.
16
                  The Secretary will read.
17
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Calendar Number
18
     1511, by Member of the Assembly Morelle, Assembly
19
     Print 3107D, an act to amend the Insurance Law.
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
21
     last section.
22
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                                This
23
     act shall take effect on the 90th day.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
24
25
     roll.
```

```
(The Secretary called the roll.)
 1
 2
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 62. Nays,
 3
     1. Senator Ball recorded in the negative.
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
 5
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
 6
 7
     Calendar Number 1512, Senator Savino moves to
 8
    discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
 9
     Bill Number 8032 and substitute it for the
10
     identical Senate Bill Number 5808, Third Reading
     Calendar 1512.
11
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
     substitution is so ordered.
13
                  The Secretary will read.
14
15
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     1512, by Member of the Assembly Abbate, Assembly
16
     Print Number 8032, an act implementing.
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
19
20
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                               This
21
     act shall take effect immediately.
22
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
23
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62. Nays,
```

```
1. Senator Ball recorded in the negative. Also
 1
 2
     Senator Marchione.
 3
                  Ayes, 61. Nays, 2.
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
 5
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Senator Skelos
 6
 7
    moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
 8
     Assembly Bill Number 7973A and substitute it for
 9
     the identical Senate Bill Number 5812, Third
10
     Reading Calendar 1513.
11
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
     substitution is so ordered.
12
13
                  The Secretary will read.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14
15
     1513, by Member of the Assembly Solages, Assembly
16
     Print Number 7973A, an act to authorize.
17
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
18
     last section.
                                   Section 2. This
19
                  THE SECRETARY:
20
     act shall take effect immediately.
21
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
22
     roll.
23
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
24
                                             Senator
25
     Squadron to explain his vote.
```

```
1
                  SENATOR SQUADRON:
                                       This is a local
 2
     bill in nature, and like many local bills we see,
     except it is not sponsored by an elected member
 3
 4
     of this house or any member of this house, it's
 5
     sponsored by Senator Rules.
                  We shouldn't have such bills. I
 6
 7
     vote no, Mr. President.
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
     Squadron to be recorded in the negative.
9
10
                  Announce the results.
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   In relation to
11
     Calendar Number 1513, those recorded in the
12
     negative are Senators Ball, Bonacic, Larkin,
13
     O'Mara and Squadron.
14
15
                  Ayes, 58. Nays, 5.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The bill
     is passed.
17
18
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Calendar Number
     1514, by Senator Zeldin, Senate Print 5819, an
19
20
     act to amend Chapter 350 of the Laws of 2012.
21
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              There is
22
     a home-rule message at the desk.
23
                  The Secretary will read the last
     section.
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 2.
                                                This
```

```
act shall take effect immediately.
 1
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 3
     roll.
 4
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 5
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 6
 7
     is passed.
 8
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
 9
     Calendar Number 1515, Senator Martins moves to
10
     discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
     Bill Number 6221C and substitute it for the
11
12
     identical Senate Bill Number 5825, Third Reading
13
     Calendar 1515.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
14
15
     substitution is so ordered.
16
                  The Secretary will read.
17
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Calendar Number
18
     1515, by Member of the Assembly Schimel, Assembly
19
     Print 6221C, an act to amend the Executive Law.
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
21
     last section.
22
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                               This
23
     act shall take effect on the 30th day.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
24
25
     roll.
```

```
(The Secretary called the roll.)
 1
 2
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
 3
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 4
     is passed.
 5
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
     Calendar Number 1516, Senator Fuschillo moves to
 6
 7
    discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
 8
     Bill Number 7689A and substitute it for the
 9
     identical Senate Bill Number 5826, Third Reading
     Calendar 1516.
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
11
     substitution is so ordered.
12
13
                  The Secretary will read.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14
15
     1516, by Member of the Assembly Gantt, Assembly
     Print 7689A, an act to amend the Vehicle and
16
    Traffic Law.
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
19
20
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                               This
21
     act shall take effect on the 120th day.
22
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
23
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62. Nays,
```

```
1. Senator Ball recorded in the negative.
 1
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 3
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 4
 5
     1517, by Senator Flanagan, Senate Print 5827, an
     act to amend the Education Law.
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
 8
     last section.
 9
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 14. This
10
     act shall take effect on the 180th day.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
11
     roll.
12
13
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
14
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
16
     is passed.
17
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18
     1518, by Senator Farley, Senate Print 5831, an
19
     act to amend the Religious Corporations Law.
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
21
     last section.
22
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                               This
23
     act shall take effect on the 30th day.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
24
25
     roll.
```

```
(The Secretary called the roll.)
 1
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62. Nays, 1.
 2
 3
     Senator Felder recorded in the negative.
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
 5
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 6
 7
     1519, by Senator Zeldin, Senate Print 5838, an
 8
     act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
10
     last section.
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 6.
                                               This
11
12
     act shall take effect on the 30th day.
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
14
15
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
16
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62. Nays,
     1. Senator LaValle recorded in the negative.
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
     is passed.
19
20
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21
     1520, by Senator Carlucci, Senate Print 5840, an
22
     act to authorize.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There is
     a home-rule message at the desk.
24
25
                  The Secretary will read the last
```

```
1
     section.
 2
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This
 3
     act shall take effect immediately.
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 5
    roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 6
 7
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62. Nays,
 8
     1. Senator Ball recorded in the negative.
9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
10
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11
12
     1521, by Senator Robach, Senate Print 5841, an
     act establishing.
13
14
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
15
     last section.
16
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
     act shall take effect immediately.
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
19
20
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
21
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
22
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is passed.
23
                  Calendar Number 1522 is high.
24
25
                  Senator Libous, that will now
```

```
1
     complete the noncontroversial reading of Senate
 2
     Supplemental Calendar 56A.
 3
                  SENATOR LIBOUS:
                                     Thank you,
     Mr. President.
 4
 5
                  At this time if everybody would look
     on their desks, there's a supplemental active
 6
     list dated Thursday, June 20th. I'd like to have
 7
 8
     the noncontroversial reading of that.
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
10
     Secretary will begin.
                  Can we have some order in the
11
     chamber, please.
12
13
                  The Secretary will read.
14
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                  On page 7, Senator
15
     Gallivan moves to discharge, from the Committee
     on Rules, Assembly Bill Number 5832A and
16
     substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
17
18
     Number 3757A, Third Reading Calendar 182.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
19
                                              The
20
     substitution is so ordered.
21
                  The Secretary will read.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22
23
     182, by Member of the Assembly DiPietro, Assembly
     Print Number 5832A, an act to amend Chapter 326
24
25
     of the Laws of 2011.
```

```
Read the
 1
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 2
     last section.
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 2.
 3
 4
     act shall take effect immediately.
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
 6
 7
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 8
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62. Nays, 1.
9
     Senator Serrano recorded in the negative.
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
11
     is passed.
                  I would ask all the members to
12
     please cooperate. If we could take conversations
13
     outside the chamber with staff, please, because
14
15
     we're trying to get through a lot of bills and
     it's getting a little noisy for people to hear up
16
     here. So I would ask for your patience and
17
18
     please cooperate.
19
                  The Secretary will continue.
20
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   On page 7, Senator
21
     Seward moves to discharge, from the Committee on
     Insurance, Assembly Bill Number 2130A and
22
     substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
23
     Number 2890A, Third Reading Calendar 204.
24
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
```

```
substitution is so ordered.
 1
 2
                  The Secretary will read.
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Calendar Number
 3
 4
     204, by Member of the Assembly Simotas, Assembly
     Print 2130A, an act to amend the Insurance Law.
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
 6
 7
     last section.
 8
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
     act shall take effect immediately.
9
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
11
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
12
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60. Nays,
13
     3. Senators Ball, Marchione and Maziarz recorded
14
15
     in the negative.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is passed.
17
18
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     236, by Senator Zeldin, Senate Print 3816B, an
19
20
     act to amend Chapter 719 of the Laws of 1982.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There is
21
22
     a home-rule message at the desk.
23
                  The Secretary will read the last
     section.
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 3.
```

```
act shall take effect immediately.
 1
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 3
     roll.
 4
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 5
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 6
 7
     is passed.
 8
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9
     336, by Senator Rivera, Senate Print 2226A, an
10
     act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
11
     last section.
12
13
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 7. This
     act shall take effect one year after it shall
14
15
    have become law.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
17
18
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
19
                                             Senator
20
    Rivera to explain his vote.
21
                  SENATOR RIVERA: Thank you,
    Mr. President.
22
                  I want to take a second to certainly
23
     thank Senator Fuschillo from the Transportation
24
25
     Committee. And certainly I want to point out
```

```
1
     Senator Larkin, Colonel Larkin for his support on
 2
     this piece of legislation.
                  What this would do -- it's called
 3
     Vets Connect. And what this bill would do is it
 4
 5
     will enable veterans to receive benefits
     information --
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Excuse
     me, Senator Rivera. {Gaveling.}
 8
 9
                  Senator Rivera, you may continue.
10
                  SENATOR RIVERA:
                                    Thank you,
     Mr. President.
11
12
                  Again, the bill is called Vets
     Connect. And what it does is it enables veterans
13
     to receive benefits information upon applying for
14
15
     or renewing a driver's license.
16
                  Now, the fact is -- and we've talked
     about veterans on this floor many times in the
17
18
     last couple of weeks. And we know that these are
19
     men and women who have sometimes given their
20
     lives but sometimes given their limbs, and they
21
     all do so to make sure that we can -- they defend
     our freedom to make sure that we can be on this
22
     floor doing what we're doing right now.
23
                  So it is up to us to make sure that
24
25
     they have as much access as they can to
```

information about the benefits that are available 1 2 to them. But unfortunately, a recent Veterans Administration survey found that 59 percent of 3 4 veterans don't have access to the information 5 about the services that are available to them. So this bill would simply allow for 6 7 someone, when they are renewing their license, to be able to tell the DMV and therefore the 8 Veterans Administration, "I am a veteran," to 9 10 make sure that they receive access to -- they know the services that are available to them to 11 12 make sure that the veterans that deserve these services have access to them. It will make it 13 easier for all New Yorkers who are veterans to 14 15 gain access to this information. 16 I thank all my colleagues for voting in the affirmative. And again, Senator Fuschillo 17 18 and certainly Colonel Larkin, thank you for your 19 assistance in this. 20 Thank you, Mr. President. I'll be voting in the affirmative. 21 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: 22 Senator Rivera to be recorded in the affirmative. 23 Senator Libous. 24 25 SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President, I

```
want to apologize to Senator Rivera because
 1
 2
     there's a lot of noise in the chamber.
                  And you had just asked people, so
 3
 4
     I'm going to. If the staffs are in here and if
 5
     you have two, three, four of them, you don't need
     that much staff in here.
                               If you have
 6
 7
     conversations, take them outside of the chamber.
     We have too many people in here. And if you're
 8
     going to be in here, you're going to be quiet.
 9
10
     Because when the members get up and speak, they
11
     deserve respect.
12
                  Thank you, Mr. President.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
13
                                              Thank
14
     you, Senator Libous.
15
                  Point of order, Senator?
                  SENATOR HASSELL-THOMPSON:
16
                                               Yes.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
17
                                              What is
18
     your point of order, Senator Hassell-Thompson?
19
                  SENATOR HASSELL-THOMPSON:
20
     Mr. President, some of us are still trying to
21
     locate the document that we're working from. And
22
     so some of the noise that you hear is difficulty,
     because we have a great deal of paper on our
23
     desks and he is moving very rapidly. That may be
24
25
     to the benefit of some. But to the rest of us
```

```
1
     who are trying to keep up with the bills, we
 2
     would ask you to slow down and allow everybody
 3
     to be on the same page at the same time.
 4
                  Thank you, Mr. President.
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Senator
     Hassell-Thompson, we are moving in a deliberative
 6
 7
     manner. The documents are before you, but there
     are excessive staff and excessive conversation in
 8
     the chamber.
 9
10
                  I have asked and I will now insist
     that the members will take their conversations
11
     outside the chamber and staff will leave if there
12
     is too much staff in the chambers.
13
14
                  We will continue now. The Secretary
15
     will read.
16
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
     Calendar Number 336: Ayes, 63.
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is passed.
19
20
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     509, by Senator Seward, Senate Print 3765A, an
21
22
     act to amend the Highway Law.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
23
     last section.
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 3.
                                               This
```

```
act shall take effect immediately.
 1
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 3
     roll.
 4
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 5
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 6
 7
     is passed.
 8
                  THE SECRETARY: On page 20, Senator
 9
     Bonacic moves to discharge, from the Committee on
10
     Rules, Assembly Bill Number 8013 and substitute
     it for the identical Senate Bill Number 4042A,
11
     Third Reading Calendar 637.
12
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
     substitution is so ordered.
14
15
                  The Secretary will read.
16
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     637, by Member of the Assembly Gabryszak,
17
18
     Assembly Print 8013, an act to amend the
19
     Judiciary Law.
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
21
     last section.
22
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                               This
23
     act shall take effect immediately.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
24
25
     roll.
```

```
(The Secretary called the roll.)
 1
 2
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 3
 4
     is passed.
 5
                  THE SECRETARY: On page 22, Senator
     Martins moves to discharge, from the Committee on
 6
 7
     Energy and Telecommunications, Assembly Bill
     Number 5556 and substitute it for the identical
 8
 9
     Senate Bill Number 4925, Third Reading Calendar
10
     702.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
11
     substitution is so ordered.
12
13
                  The Secretary will read.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14
15
     702, by Member of the Assembly Buchwald, Assembly
     Print Number 5556, an act to amend the Public
16
     Service Law.
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
19
20
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                               This
     act shall take effect immediately.
21
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
22
     roll.
23
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
```

```
1
                                             The bill
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 2
     is passed.
 3
                  THE SECRETARY: On page 34, Senator
 4
    Golden moves to discharge, from the Committee on
 5
    Rules, Assembly Bill Number 6869 and substitute
     it for the identical Senate Bill Number 4909,
 6
 7
     Third Reading Calendar 940.
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
9
     substitution is so ordered.
10
                  The Secretary will read.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11
12
     940, by Member of the Assembly Abbate, Assembly
     Print Number 6869, an act to amend Chapter 695 of
13
     the Laws of 1994.
14
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
16
     last section.
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 2.
                                               This
17
18
     act shall take effect immediately.
19
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
20
     roll.
21
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
22
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is passed.
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
```

```
1048, by Senator DeFrancisco, Senate Print 3362A,
 1
 2
     an act to amend the General Municipal Law.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
 3
     last section.
 4
 5
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                               This
     act shall take effect immediately.
 6
 7
                  SENATOR GIANARIS: Lay it aside.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 8
                                             Lay the
9
    bill aside.
10
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   In relation to
     Calendar Number 1191, Senator LaValle moves to
11
12
     discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
     Bill Number 5939A and substitute it for the
13
     identical Senate Bill Number 4104A, Third Reading
14
     Calendar 1191.
15
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
     substitution is so ordered.
17
18
                  The Secretary will read.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19
     1191, by Member of the Assembly Thiele, Assembly
20
     Print Number 5939A, an act to amend the Town Law.
21
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
22
                                             Read the
     last section.
23
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
24
     act shall take effect immediately.
25
```

```
1
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 2
     roll.
 3
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 4
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is passed.
 6
 7
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 8
     1294, by Senator Marchione, Senate Print 5454B,
9
     an act to amend Chapter 486 of the Laws of 1964.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
10
                                             Read the
     last section.
11
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
12
     act shall take effect immediately.
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
14
15
     roll.
16
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
17
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is passed.
19
20
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21
     1445, by Senator Marcellino, Senate Print 4801A,
22
     an act to amend the Civil Rights Law.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 3.
                                               This
```

```
act shall take effect immediately.
 1
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 3
     roll.
 4
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
                                   Ayes, 63.
 5
                  THE SECRETARY:
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The bill
 6
 7
     is passed.
 8
                  Senator Libous, that completes the
 9
     noncontroversial reading of the supplemental
10
     active list for Thursday, June 20th.
                  SENATOR LIBOUS:
                                    Mr. President,
11
12
     we're going to call an immediate meeting of the
     Finance Committee. And Senator DeFrancisco and
13
14
     Senator Krueger said that it will be a quick
15
     meeting. Hopefully.
16
                  But anyway, there's an immediate
     meeting of the Finance Committee in Room 332.
17
18
     And we will stand at ease pending the quick
     return of the Finance Committee.
19
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              There is
21
     an immediate meeting of the Senate Finance
22
     Committee in Room 332.
                  Until such time as the Finance
23
     Committee returns, the Senate will stand at ease.
24
25
                  (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease
```

```
1
     at 8:45 p.m.)
 2
                  (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at
 3
     9:21 p.m.)
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
     Senate will come to order.
 5
                  Senator Libous.
 6
 7
                  SENATOR LIBOUS:
                                    Thank you,
 8
     Mr. President.
 9
                  Can we go to reports of standing
10
     committees. I believe there's a report of the
     Finance Committee at the desk.
11
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: We will
12
     return to reports of standing committees.
13
                  There is a report of the Finance
14
15
     Committee at the desk. The Secretary will read.
16
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Senator
     DeFrancisco, from the Committee on Finance,
17
18
     reports the following nominations.
                  As chairman and chief executive
19
20
     officer of the Metropolitan Transportation
21
     Authority, Thomas F. Prendergast, of Brewster.
22
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Senator
23
     DeFrancisco.
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Yes, I move
24
     the nomination of Thomas F. Prendergast as
25
```

1 chairman and CEO of the Metropolitan 2 Transportation Authority. I want to say this for him and the 3 other two nominees: The Governor did a wonderful 4 5 job in selecting good people, hardworking people for a very difficult job. And judging from the 6 7 positive comments of the Finance Committee in comparison to the comments of former nominees for 8 that top position, I think we're in for some good 9 10 government work by the MTA over the next several 11 years. 12 So I proudly move the nomination. ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: 13 Thank 14 you, Senator DeFrancisco. 15 Senator Fuschillo. SENATOR FUSCHILLO: Thank you very 16 much, Mr. President. 17 18 I rise to second the nomination. 19 And I want to thank Governor Cuomo for the 20 nomination of Tom Prendergast, who certainly has 21 the qualifications and experience to lead the 22 MTA. 23 The Transportation Committee met earlier today and unanimously approved the 24 25 nomination.

```
And, Tom, I want to congratulate you
 1
 2
     and wish you the best of luck.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 3
                                              Thank
 4
     you, Senator Fuschillo.
 5
                  Senator Krueger.
                  SENATOR KRUEGER: I also rise to
 6
     congratulate Governor Cuomo for finding such an
 7
 8
     excellent candidate.
 9
                  And I want to thank Mr. Prendergast
10
     for agreeing to serve in this very difficult
     position, but also to point out that if the
11
12
     Second Avenue Subway or East Side access are
     further delayed, you cannot use your day here as
13
14
     an excuse, even though we kept you here all day.
15
     So get back to work.
16
                  Thank you.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
17
                                              Thank
18
     you, Senator Krueger.
                  Senator Golden.
19
20
                  SENATOR GOLDEN:
                                     Thank you,
21
     Mr. President.
22
                  As a member of the Capital Review
     Board, I also stand in favor of this nomination.
23
     I've had the privilege of working with Tom
24
25
     Prendergast over the years. The MTA is in his
```

```
blood; he was born and bred to do this. I think
 1
 2
     he'll do a good job.
                  I'm looking forward to working with
 3
 4
     him and working with my colleagues here, Senator
 5
     Fuschillo in Transportation and our leader, to
     make sure that we get a good transportation
 6
 7
     system and a good leader that's going to stay and
     work and do a good job for the city and for the
 8
     surrounding counties.
 9
10
                  Thank you, sir. I vote yes.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
11
                                              Senator
     Marcellino.
12
13
                  SENATOR MARCELLINO:
                                         Thank you,
14
     Mr. President.
15
                  I too rise in support of this
                  I hope -- and it is a hope, because
16
     nomination.
     we've had that hope before and it's been dashed.
17
18
     It has not been brought to fruition -- that we
     have a candidate today who will commit to
19
20
     improving the service -- not just maintaining,
     but improving the service on the Long Island
21
     Railroad for the residents of Long Island that I
22
     represent, especially on the North Shore, where
23
     my district is located.
24
25
                  These people need good service.
```

```
1
     want them in the trains, we want them riding the
 2
     trains to and from work. We want them off the
     congested roads. We want our air quality
 3
 4
     improved. The more people that ride your trains,
 5
     the less people are in the gas guzzlers and the
     better our air quality.
 6
 7
                  So you have a great job ahead of
 8
     you. You have a tough job ahead of you, and
 9
     probably a thankless job. A lot of people are
10
     going to be yelling at you over the years. But
     hopefully we'll look and see at the end a very,
11
12
     very much improved system of transportation for
     the Long Island residents and the people of the
13
14
     metropolitan area that are so dependent upon this
15
     railroad.
16
                  Mr. President, I vote aye.
17
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
18
     question is on the nomination of Thomas F.
19
     Prendergast as chairman and CEO of the
20
     Metropolitan Transportation Authority. All in
21
     favor signify by saying aye.
22
                  (Response of "Aye.")
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Opposed,
24
     nay.
25
                  (No response.)
```

```
1
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Thomas F.
 2
     Prendergast has been confirmed as chairman and
     CEO of the Metropolitan Transportation
 3
 4
     Authority.
 5
                  Congratulations, Mr. Prendergast.
                  (Applause.)
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
 8
     Secretary will read.
 9
                  THE SECRETARY: As members of the
10
    Metropolitan Transportation Authority: Mitchell
     H. Pally, of Stony Brook, and John J. Molloy, of
11
12
     Wantagh.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
13
                                             Senator
14
     DeFrancisco.
15
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: I move the
16
    nominations.
17
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Senator
18
     Fuschillo.
19
                  SENATOR FUSCHILLO: Did you call
20
     them both? You did? Thank you. I couldn't hear
21
    you, Mr. President.
22
                  Let me thank John Molloy and
23
    Mitchell Pally for their willingness to serve.
                  The Transportation Committee had met
24
25
     earlier, unanimously approved them. And I want
```

```
to thank Governor Cuomo for the nominations.
 1
 2
                  Mitch Pally will be representing
     Suffolk County on the MTA board, and John Molloy
 3
 4
     will be representing Nassau County. Both have an
 5
     impeccable reputation in the private and public
 6
     sector.
 7
                  Mitch Pally will be reappointed.
     has served on the board with distinction. I look
 8
     forward to working with you, Mitch.
 9
10
                  And, John, I welcome you to the
             The Long Island Railroad is critically
11
     board.
     important to the residents that nine Senators
12
     represent. Over 300,000 people use it daily.
13
14
     need to continue to strengthen and improve
15
     service into Penn Station. Soon, in a couple of
     years -- Tom Prendergast is going to expedite the
16
     schedule for East Side access -- it will be going
17
18
     to Grand Central Station.
19
                  I congratulate both of you, and I
20
     second the nomination.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
21
                                              Thank
     you, Senator Fuschillo.
22
23
                  Senator Marcellino.
                  SENATOR MARCELLINO:
24
                                        Yes,
25
     Mr. President, thank you again.
```

```
I know both John Molloy and Mitch
 1
 2
             I've known them both for many years.
 3
     They're both hardworking people, they're both
 4
     good people. They do their jobs, they're well
 5
     thought of in their particular fields.
                  I hope and pray that they will work
 6
 7
     together with our new leader, Tom Prendergast, so
     that we will have much improved service on the
 8
     Long Island Railroad for the riders. I'm not
 9
     going to repeat myself again. They know where I
10
     stand on this issue, and they will be hearing
11
12
     from me over the years to come. Because I do
     want and do expect, on behalf of my constituents,
13
     improved service for the riders at a reasonable
14
15
     cost, and I stress the word "reasonable" cost.
16
                  Thank you, Mr. President.
                                              I vote
     aye on both gentlemen.
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Thank
     you, Senator Marcellino.
19
20
                  Senator Martins.
                  SENATOR MARTINS:
21
                                      Thank you,
22
     Mr. President.
23
                  I also rise to thank the Governor
     for these two very well qualified appointments to
24
     the MTA board.
25
```

```
1
                  First, of course, to Mitch Pally,
 2
     congratulations. Welcome back. A tireless
     advocate for the riders on the Long Island
 3
 4
     Railroad. And certainly it's good to have you
 5
     there.
                  John Molloy, a true professional, a
 6
 7
     person with the background and the expertise to
 8
     represent the interests of our Long Island
     commuters and our Long Island residents when it
 9
10
     comes to advocating for Long Island on the MTA
11
     board.
12
                  We're going through a critical
     period when it comes to the Long Island
13
     railroad. Certainly with the completion of East
14
15
     Side access and with upgrades in service, I'll
16
     echo my colleagues' statements that it is
     critically important that we have your two voices
17
18
     for Long Islanders, advocating for our Long
     Island Railroad and for our commuters.
19
20
                  It's great to have you on board.
21
                  Thank you, Mr. President.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
22
                                              Thank
     you, Senator Martins.
23
                  Senator LaValle.
24
25
                  SENATOR LaVALLE
                                     Thank you,
```

```
Mr. President.
 1
 2
                  I want to congratulate both
     gentlemen. Mr. Molloy I don't know, but I do
 3
 4
     know Mitch Pally, who served on the Senate
 5
     Transportation Committee as counsel and has been
     on the MTA board for a number of years,
 6
 7
     represents our county, the needs and the
 8
     viewpoints of our county, and has been very much
 9
     involved and hands-on. When we've had problems,
10
     he has attended meetings with us and our
     constituents, which I think is really great.
11
12
                  And, Mitch, once again,
     congratulations.
13
14
                  I vote aye.
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
16
     Nozzolio.
                  SENATOR NOZZOLIO: Thank you,
17
18
     Mr. President.
19
                  I congratulate each of the nominees
20
     and thank Governor Cuomo for putting good people
21
     on this very important board.
22
                  I'd just like to say a word about
23
     Mitch Pally. And it was over 30 years ago that I
     remember walking in, as a new Assemblyman, to
24
25
     what was Chuck Fuschillo's predecessor Senator
```

Levy's Commission on Critical Transportation Choices.

And here a young Assemblyman meeting a young counsel, very aggressive, very into the issues of the day, skilled way back then in transportation issues and transportation policy. And that knowledge base has only grown through the years.

So, Mitch, it's very good to see you again. It was an honor to work with you many, many years ago. But you bring an expertise to this board that's invaluable. And that it's certainly, I believe, second to none in terms of your knowledge base. Congratulations.

I'd also just like to ask, since we have a captive audience of three MTA board members, that there is a part of MTA that is upstate. And particularly on the kinds of things like purchasing subway cars, establishing call centers, making the upstate economy part of your game plan, is something that we very much appreciate having done in the past and we hope that it will only be expanded in the future.

Mr. President, congratulations to three excellent nominees. It's my honor to

```
1
     support their candidacies.
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
 3
     question is on the nominations of Mitchell H.
 4
     Pally and John J. Molloy as members of the
 5
     Metropolitan Transportation Authority. All in
     favor signify by saying aye.
 6
                  (Response of "Aye.")
 7
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Opposed?
 9
                  (No response.)
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Mitchell
     H. Pally and John J. Molloy have been confirmed
11
12
     as members of the Metropolitan Transportation
     Authority.
13
14
                  Congratulations.
15
                  (Applause.)
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
     Secretary will read.
17
18
                  THE SECRETARY: As trustee of the
19
     Cornell University Board of Trustees, Matthew L.
     Biben, of New York.
20
21
                  As trustee of the State University
22
     of New York Board of Trustees, Eric Corngold, of
23
     Brooklyn.
                  As member of the Behavioral Health
24
25
     Services Advisory Council, Susan A. Wheeler, of
```

```
1
     Whitney Point.
 2
                  As member of the Niagara Frontier
     State Park, Recreation and Historic Preservation
 3
 4
     Commission, Ida Massaro, of Niagara Falls.
 5
                  As member of the Veterans Affairs
     Commission, Bryan R. Mackey, of Clarence Center.
 6
 7
                  As member of the Minority Health
 8
     Council, Elizabeth Gross Cohn, of Sea Cliff.
 9
                  As member and chair of the Council
10
     on Human Blood and Transfusion Services, Donna
     Skerrett, M.D., of Mount Vernon.
11
                  As members of the Administrative
12
     Review Board for Professional Medical Conduct:
13
14
     John A. D'Anna, M.D., of Staten Island; Steven V.
15
     Grabiec, M.D., of Grand Island; Peter S. Koenig,
     Sr., of DeWitt; Richard D. Milone, M.D., of Rye;
16
     and Linda Prescott Wilson, of Laurelton.
17
18
                  And as members of the Council on
     Human Blood and Transfusion Services: Alicia
19
20
     Elena Gomensoro, M.D., of Staten Island; David M.
     Huskie, of Petersburg; and Philip L. McCarthy,
21
     M.D., of Williamsville.
22
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
23
                                              Senator
     DeFrancisco.
24
25
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO:
                                          Move the
```

```
1
     nominations.
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
 3
     question is on the nominations of the names as
     presented for the offices as indicated.
 4
                                             All
 5
     those in favor signify by saying aye.
                  (Response of "Aye.")
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Opposed?
 8
                  (No response.)
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
10
     nominees have hereby been confirmed.
                  Senator Libous.
11
12
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President,
13
     there will be an immediate meeting of the Rules
     Committee in Room 332. Immediate meeting of the
14
15
     Rules Committee in Room 332.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              There
     will be an immediate meeting of the Rules
17
18
     Committee in Room 332, an immediate meeting of
     the Rules Committee in Room 332.
19
20
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: The Senate will
21
     stand at ease.
22
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
23
     such time, the Senate shall stand at ease.
                  (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease
24
25
     at 9:33 p.m.)
```

```
(Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at
 1
 2
     9:57 p.m.)
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President, if
 3
 4
     we could return to reports of standing
 5
     committees, I believe there's a report of the
     Rules Committee at the desk.
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Reports
 8
     of standing committees.
 9
                  There is a report of the
10
     Rules Committee at the desk, and the Secretary
     will read.
11
12
                  THE SECRETARY: Senator Skelos,
     from the Committee on Rules, reports the
13
     following bills:
14
15
                  Senate Print 442, by Senator Diaz,
     an act to amend the Penal Law;
16
                  Senate 844, by Senator Parker, an
17
18
     act to amend the Domestic Relations Law;
19
                  Senate 847, by Senator Parker, an
20
     act to amend the Economic Development Law;
                  Senate 4186A, by Senator Dilan, an
21
22
     act to amend Retirement and Social Security Law;
                  Senate 4366A, by Senator Griffo, an
23
24
     act to amend the Banking Law;
25
                  Senate 4417A, by Senator Marcellino,
```

```
1
     Concurrent Resolution of the Senate and Assembly;
 2
                  Senate 4527A, by Senator Hannon, an
     act to amend the Public Health Law;
 3
 4
                  Senate 4610, by Senator Young, an
 5
     act to amend the General Business Law;
                  Senate 4761A, by Senator Golden, an
 6
 7
     act to amend the Retirement and Social Security
 8
     Law;
 9
                  Senate 5057A, by Senator Carlucci,
10
     an act authorizing;
                  Senate 5278A, by Senator
11
12
     Stewart-Cousins, an act in relation to
     authorizing;
13
14
                  Senate 5428A, by Senator Sanders, an
15
     act to amend the Social Services Law;
                  Senate 5483A, by Senator Hannon, an
16
     act to amend the Public Health Law;
17
18
                  Senate 5574, by Senator Boyle, an
     act to amend the General Municipal Law;
19
20
                  Senate 5690, by Senator Valesky, an
     act in relation to diagnosis;
21
                  Senate 5693, by Senator Zeldin, an
22
     act to amend the Real Property Law;
23
                  Senate 5714A, by Senator Breslin, an
24
25
     act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law;
```

```
Senate 5757, by Senator Hannon, an
 1
 2
     act to amend the Education Law;
                  Senate 5764A, by Senator Little, an
 3
 4
     act to amend the Public Health Law;
 5
                  Senate 5770, by Senator Golden, an
     act to amend Chapter 58 of the Laws of 2010;
 6
 7
                  Senate 5781, by Senator Hannon, an
     act to direct the commissioner;
 8
 9
                  Senate 5800A, by Senator
10
     DeFrancisco, an act to amend the Public
     Authorities Law;
11
12
                  Senate 5807, by Senator Ball, an act
     to amend the Retirement and Social Security Law;
13
14
                  Senate 5811, by Senator Hannon, an
15
     act to amend the Public Health Law;
                  Senate 5814, by Senator Lanza, an
16
     act to amend Chapter 56 of the Laws of 2013;
17
18
                  Senate 5815, by Senator Ball, an act
     to amend the Public Authorities Law;
19
20
                  Senate 5821, by Senator Robach, an
     act to amend the Family Court Act;
21
                  Senate 5834, by Senator Hannon, an
22
     act to amend the Public Health Law;
23
                  Senate 5845, by Senator Ranzenhofer,
24
25
     an act to amend the Executive Law;
```

```
1
                  And Senate 5849, by Senator Boyle,
 2
     an act to enact.
                  All bills reported direct to third
 3
 4
     reading.
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
     Libous.
 6
 7
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President, I
 8
     move to accept the report of the Rules Committee.
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              All in
10
     favor of accepting the Committee on Rules report
     signify by saying aye.
11
12
                  (Response of "Aye.")
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Opposed?
14
                  (No response.)
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The Rules
16
     report is accepted.
17
                  Senator Libous.
18
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President, so
19
     that we're all on the same page, we are going to
20
     go to Senate Supplemental Calendar 56B.
21
                  Could we have the noncontroversial
22
     reading, please.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
     Secretary will begin the noncontroversial reading
24
25
     of Senate Supplemental Calendar 56B.
```

```
1
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 2
     1523, by Senator Diaz, Senate Print 442, an act
 3
     to amend the Penal Law.
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
 5
     last section.
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 5.
                                               This
 6
 7
     act shall take effect on the first of November.
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
9
     roll.
10
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
                  THE SECRETARY:
11
                                   Ayes, 63.
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is passed.
13
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14
15
     1524, by Senator Parker, Senate Print 844, an act
16
     to amend the Domestic Relations Law.
17
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
18
     last section.
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This
19
20
     act shall take effect on the first of November.
21
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
22
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
23
                                   Ayes, 62. Nays,
                  THE SECRETARY:
24
25
     1. Senator Montgomery recorded in the negative.
```

```
ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
 1
 2
     is passed.
 3
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 4
     1525, by Senator Parker, Senate Print 847, an act
 5
     to amend the Economic Development Law.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
 6
 7
     last section.
 8
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 2.
                                               This
9
     act shall take effect on the 90th day.
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
11
12
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
13
                                   Ayes, 63.
                  THE SECRETARY:
14
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
15
     is passed.
16
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
     Calendar Number 1526, Senator Dilan moves to
17
18
     discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
     Bill Number 6578A and substitute it for the
19
20
     identical Senate Bill Number 4186A, Third Reading
21
     Calendar 1526.
22
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
     substitution is so ordered.
23
                  The Secretary will read.
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
```

```
1526, by Member of the Assembly Abbate, Assembly
 1
 2
     Print 6578A, an act to amend the Retirement and
     Social Security Law.
 3
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
 5
     last section.
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
 6
                                               This
 7
     act shall take effect immediately.
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
9
     roll.
10
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
                                   Ayes, 62. Nays,
11
                  THE SECRETARY:
12
     1. Senator Ball recorded in the negative.
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
14
     is passed.
15
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
16
     Calendar Number 1527, Senator Griffo moves to
     discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
17
18
     Bill Number 7213A and substitute it for the
19
     identical Senate Bill Number 4366A, Third Reading
20
     Calendar 1527.
21
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
22
     substitution is so ordered.
23
                  The Secretary will read.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24
25
     1527, by Member of the Assembly Robinson,
```

```
1
     Assembly Print Number 7213A, an act to amend the
 2
     Banking Law.
 3
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
 4
 5
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
     act shall take effect immediately.
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 8
     roll.
 9
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
10
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
11
12
     is passed.
13
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
     Calendar Number 1528, Senator Marcellino moves to
14
15
     discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
16
     Bill Number 7868 and substitute it for the
     identical Senate Bill Number 4417A, Third Reading
17
18
     Calendar 1528.
19
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
20
     substitution is so ordered.
21
                  The Secretary will read.
22
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23
     1528, by Member of the Assembly Galef, Assembly
     Print Number 7868, Concurrent Resolution of the
24
25
     Senate and Assembly.
```

```
1
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 2
     roll.
 3
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 4
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
 6
     resolution is adopted.
 7
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 8
     1529, by Senator Hannon, Senate Print 4527A, an
9
     act to amend the Public Health Law.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
10
     last section.
11
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 10. This
12
     act shall take effect immediately.
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
14
15
     roll.
16
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
17
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
19
     is passed.
20
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21
     1530, by Senator Young, Senate Print 4610, an act
22
     to amend the General Business Law.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 3.
                                               This
```

```
act shall take effect on the 120th day.
 1
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 3
     roll.
 4
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
                                   Ayes, 63.
 5
                  THE SECRETARY:
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 6
 7
     is passed.
 8
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
 9
     Calendar Number 1531, Senator Golden moves to
10
    discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
     Bill Number 4983A and substitute it for the
11
     identical Senate Bill Number 4761A, Third Reading
12
13
     Calendar 1531.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
14
15
     substitution is so ordered.
16
                  The Secretary will read.
17
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Calendar Number
18
     1531, by Member of the Assembly Abbate, Assembly
     Print Number 4983A, an act to amend the
19
20
    Retirement and Social Security Law.
21
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
22
23
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
     act shall take effect immediately.
24
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
```

```
roll.
 1
 2
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 3
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62. Nays,
 4
     1. Senator Ball recorded in the negative.
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 6
     is passed.
 7
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
 8
     Calendar Number 1532, Senator Carlucci moves to
 9
     discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
10
     Bill Number 7514 and substitute it for the
     identical Senate Bill Number 5057A, Third Reading
11
     Calendar 1532.
12
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
     substitution is so ordered.
14
15
                  The Secretary will read.
16
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     1532, by Member of the Assembly Jaffee, Assembly
17
18
     Print Number 7514, an act authorizing.
                                      Lay it aside.
19
                  SENATOR GIANARIS:
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Lay the
20
21
     bill aside.
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
22
     Calendar Number 1533, Senator Stewart-Cousins
23
     moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
24
25
     Assembly Bill Number 4086A and substitute it for
```

```
the identical Senate Bill Number 5278A, Third
 1
 2
     Reading Calendar 1533.
 3
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
     substitution is ordered.
 4
 5
                  The Secretary will read.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 6
 7
     1533, by Member of the Assembly Paulin, Assembly
 8
     Print Number 4086A, an act in relation to.
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
10
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11
12
     act shall take effect immediately.
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
14
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
15
16
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61. Nays,
     2. Senators Ball and Marchione recorded in the
17
18
    negative.
19
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
20
     is passed.
21
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     1534, by Senator Sanders, Senate Print 5428A, an
22
     act to amend the Social Services Law.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
24
25
     last section.
```

```
1
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 2.
                                               This
 2
     act shall take effect on the 90th day.
 3
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
 4
 5
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61. Nays,
 6
 7
     2. Senators Ball and Marchione recorded in the
 8
    negative.
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
10
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
11
     Calendar Number 1535, Senator Hannon moves to
12
13
    discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
     Bill Number 7665C and substitute it for the
14
15
     identical Senate Bill Number 5483A, Third Reading
16
     Calendar 1535.
17
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
18
     substitution is ordered.
19
                  The Secretary will read.
20
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21
     1535, by Member of the Assembly Gottfried,
22
     Assembly Print Number 7665C, an act to amend the
     Public Health Law.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
24
25
     last section.
```

```
1
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 2.
                                               This
 2
     act shall take effect immediately.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 3
     roll.
 4
 5
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
                  THE SECRETARY:
 6
                                   Ayes, 63.
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
 8
     is passed.
 9
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
10
     Calendar Number 1536, Senator Boyle moves
11
     discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
     Bill Number 1629 and substitute it for the
12
     identical Senate Bill Number 5574, Third Reading
13
     Calendar 1536.
14
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
16
     Substitution ordered.
17
                  The Secretary will read.
18
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Calendar Number
19
     1536, by Member of the Assembly Gunther, Assembly
20
     Print Number 1629, an act to amend the General
21
     Municipal Law.
22
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
23
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 2. This
24
     act shall take effect immediately.
25
```

```
ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 1
 2
     roll.
 3
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 4
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is passed.
 6
 7
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
 8
     Calendar Number 1537, Senator Valesky moves to
 9
     discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
10
     Bill Number 403A and substitute it for the
     identical Senate Bill Number 5690, Third Reading
11
     Calendar 1537.
12
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
     Substitution ordered.
14
15
                  The Secretary will read.
16
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Calendar Number
     1537, by Member of the Assembly Magnarelli,
17
18
     Assembly Print Number 403A --
19
                  SENATOR GIANARIS: Lay it aside.
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
21
     is laid aside.
22
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     1538, by Senator Zeldin, Senate Print 5693, an
23
     act to amend the Real Property Law.
24
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Read the
```

```
last section.
 1
 2
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 2. This
 3
     act shall take effect immediately.
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 5
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 6
 7
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
9
     is passed.
10
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     1539, by Senator Breslin, Senate Print 5714A, an
11
     act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.
12
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
14
15
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
16
     act shall take effect immediately.
17
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
18
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
19
20
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
21
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
22
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
23
     Calendar Number 1541, Senator Hannon moves to
24
     discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
25
```

```
Bill Number 7866 and substitute it for the
 1
 2
     identical Senate Bill Number 5757, Third Reading
 3
     Calendar 1541.
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 5
     Substitution ordered.
 6
                  The Secretary will read.
 7
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 8
     1541, by Member of the Assembly Glick, Assembly
9
    Print 7866, an act to amend the Education Law.
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
11
12
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
     act shall take effect January 1, 2015.
13
14
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
15
     roll.
16
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60. Nays,
17
18
     3. Senators Griffo, Marchione and Ritchie
     recorded in the negative.
19
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
21
     is passed.
22
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23
     1542, by Senator Little, Senate Print 5764A, an
     act to amend the Public Health Law.
24
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
```

```
last section.
 1
 2
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
 3
     act shall take effect immediately.
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 5
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 6
 7
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62. Nays,
 8
     1. Senator Ball recorded in the negative.
9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
10
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11
12
     1543, by Senator Golden, Senate Print 5770, an
     act to amend Chapter 58 of the Laws of 2010.
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
14
15
     last section.
16
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
     act shall take effect immediately.
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
19
20
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
21
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62. Nays, 1.
22
     Senator Marchione recorded in the negative.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is passed.
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
```

```
1544, by Senator Hannon, Senate Print 5781, an
 1
 2
     act to direct.
 3
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
 4
 5
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
     act shall take effect immediately.
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 8
     roll.
9
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
10
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
11
     is passed.
12
13
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     1545, by Senator DeFrancisco, Senate Print 5800A,
14
15
     an act to amend the Public Authorities Law.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
17
18
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
     act shall take effect on the 30th day.
19
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
21
     roll.
22
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62. Nays,
23
     1. Senator Ball recorded in the negative.
24
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
```

```
1
     is passed.
 2
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 3
     1546, by Senator Ball, Senate Print 5807, an act
     to amend the Retirement and Social Security Law.
 4
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
 6
 7
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
 8
     act shall take effect immediately.
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
10
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
11
12
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is passed.
14
15
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16
     1547, by Senator Hannon, Senate Print 5811, an
     act to amend the Public Health Law.
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
19
20
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 3.
                                               This
21
     act shall take effect on the 90th day.
22
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
23
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
```

```
1
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 2
     is passed.
 3
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 4
     1548, by Senator Lanza, Senate Print 5814, an act
 5
     to amend Chapter 56 of the Laws of 2013.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
 6
 7
     last section.
 8
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
9
     act shall take effect immediately.
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
11
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
12
13
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
14
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
15
     is passed.
16
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     1549, by Senator Ball, Senate Print 5815, an act
17
18
     to amend the Public Authorities Law.
19
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
20
     last section.
21
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
22
     act shall take effect immediately.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
24
25
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
```

```
THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62. Nays,
 1
 2
     1. Senator Martins recorded in the negative.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
 3
 4
     is passed.
 5
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
     Calendar Number 1550, Senator Robach moves to
 6
 7
    discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
 8
     Bill Number 7400 and substitute it for the
 9
     identical Senate Bill Number 5821, Third Reading
     Calendar 1550.
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
11
     Substitution ordered.
12
13
                  The Secretary will read.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14
15
     1550, by Member of the Assembly Weinstein,
16
    Assembly Print Number 7400, an act to amend the
     Family Court Act.
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
19
20
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
21
     act shall take effect immediately.
22
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
23
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
```

```
1
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 2
     is passed.
 3
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 4
     1551, by Senator Hannon, Senate Print 5834, an
 5
     act to amend the Public Health Law.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
 6
 7
     last section.
 8
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
9
     act shall take effect July 1, 2014.
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
11
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
12
13
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
14
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
15
     is passed.
16
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     1552, by Senator Ranzenhofer, Senate Print 5845,
17
18
     an act to amend the Executive Law.
19
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
20
     last section.
21
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 132. This
22
     act shall take effect July 1, 2014.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
24
25
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
```

```
1
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
 3
     is passed.
                  Calendar 1553, by Senator Boyle, is
 4
 5
     high, so it will be laid aside.
                  Senator Libous, that completes the
 6
 7
     noncontroversial reading of Senate Supplemental
 8
     Calendar 56B.
 9
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President.
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
     Libous.
11
12
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Could you go back
     to Calendar Number 1549, and could we withdraw
13
     the roll call and lay the bill aside. Number
14
15
     1549, by Senator Ball.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             We will
     return to Calendar Number 1549, by Senator Ball.
17
18
                  The Secretary will read.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19
20
     1549, by Senator Ball, Senate Print 5815, an act
     to amend the Public Authorities Law.
21
22
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll on reconsideration.
23
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
```

```
1
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President, lay
     the bill aside.
 2
 3
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Lay the
     bill aside.
 4
 5
                  That bill is laid aside for the day,
     Senator Libous?
 6
 7
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: No, not laid aside
 8
     for the day, it's just laid aside.
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Lay the
10
     bill aside temporarily.
                  SENATOR LIBOUS:
                                    Thank you.
11
12
                  Mr. President, can we go back to the
     original active list for Thursday, June 20th.
13
     It's this piece of paper (showing).
14
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             We will
16
     return to the original active list.
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President,
17
18
     we're going to have the controversial reading of
19
     this calendar. There were two bills that were
     laid aside. The first one would be the Golden
20
21
     bill, Number 371.
22
                  Hang on a second, everyone.
     Everybody pause. Deep breath.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
24
                                             We're
25
     going to ring the bell before we begin the
```

```
controversial reading to get members in the
 1
 2
     chamber.
 3
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President.
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Senator
 5
     Libous.
 6
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: I misspoke.
 7
     There's only one bill laid aside; the other one
 8
     was laid aside for the day. So we will take up
 9
     the controversial reading of Calendar Number 371.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
10
                                             Calendar
     371 is before the house. The bell has been
11
12
     rung.
13
                  The Secretary will read.
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President.
14
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Senator
16
     Libous.
17
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Hang on a second.
18
                  The Secretary will read.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
19
                                             The
20
     Secretary will read. We have a substitution.
21
                  THE SECRETARY: On page 11, Senator
22
     Golden moves to discharge, from the Committee on
     Rules, Assembly Bill Number 7832B and substitute
23
     it for the identical Senate Bill Number 4088C,
24
25
     Third Reading Calendar 371.
```

```
ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 1
                                             The
 2
     substitution is so ordered.
 3
                  The bill is before the house.
 4
                  Senator Gianaris, why do you rise?
 5
                  SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President, i
     believe there's an amendment at the desk.
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
     me, Senator Gianaris. We're going to read it,
 8
     and then I'll allow you to make your proposal.
9
10
                  SENATOR GIANARIS:
                                      Thank you.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
11
12
     Secretary will read.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13
14
     371, by Member of the Assembly Cusick, Assembly
15
     Print 7832B, an act to amend the Election Law.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
     Gianaris.
17
18
                  SENATOR GIANARIS:
                                      Thank you,
     Mr. President.
19
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             May I
21
     have some order in the house, please.
22
                  SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President, I
     believe there's an amendment at the desk. I ask
23
     that the reading of the amendment be waived and
24
25
     ask that Senator Rivera may be heard on the
```

1 amendment. 2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator 3 Gianaris, I am in receipt of the amendment and I 4 have reviewed the amendment and believe the bill 5 to be nongermane to the original object and purpose thereof. 6 7 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President, 8 I'd like to appeal the decision of the chair. 9 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The 10 decision of the chair is being appealed. All those in favor --11 12 SENATOR GIANARIS: And I would ask that Senator Rivera be heard on the appeal. 13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: 14 Senator 15 Rivera will be heard on the appeal. SENATOR RIVERA: 16 Thank you, 17 Mr. President. I know you probably want to get 18 through this as quickly as possible, but I'm going to take a little bit of time because I want 19 20 to argue on the germaneness of this particular 21 amendment. Now, as we know, the judgments that 22 you have to make on the germaneness of this 23 amendment has to do with whether it deals with 24 25 the same topic of law and the same -- if it tries to change the title of the original bill, the subject matter, or the topic. And this is an amendment that very much has to do with the topic and the subject matter at hand.

What we're trying to do here with this amendment, what it would do, the result of it, we would have a fairer, more transparent, more accountable and ultimately a more democratic system.

This amendment is a fundamental -yes. Yes, Senator Robach, I know you're watching
me, and I'm watching you right back.

What this amendment would do is create a system that would be ultimately more democratic and more accessible. We would have a public financing system, which would mean that we would have more access for folks trying to run and participate in the electoral system as candidates themselves.

We would have a lower contribution limit, which means that we would have more access and more participation from the public at hand.

We would have stronger enforcement mechanisms, so you would have -- those that are breaking the law and those that do not obey

campaign limitations, they would actually be held to a higher standard.

And we would have stronger disclosure guidelines, all of this having to do with changing election law.

Now, unfortunately, New York -- we are in many ways the progressive capital of the nation, but in many ways we are falling behind. And certainly when it deals with our electoral system and our campaign finance system, we are certainly lagging behind.

In New York State we are one of the most expensive states in the entire country.

Just in 2009, the cycle that happened in 2009 and 2010, \$87 million were spend on elections in New York State. But of those \$87 million that were raised during that period of time, 99 percent of New Yorkers didn't give a cent toward that \$87 million. Which means that the great majority of the people in this state don't participate in this area of our electoral system.

As a matter of fact, in the last couple of election cycles, going back to 2006, individuals that gave \$250 or less -- and certainly folks in my district can afford to give

much less than that, if they give at all -- we're talking about less than 7 percent of the total number of people that gave to any of us or any of the folks that ran on the other side of the hall.

Just going back to my race in 2010, I had to raise over \$400,000. And on Election Day, I was \$90,000 in debt.

We have a system that does not allow access for many New Yorkers, whether it's to give money, to participate in a way to support candidates, or to have candidates that are not wealthy or don't have the luck that I did to have many circumstances come together to be able to raise that sort of money to run. And I believe that that ultimately makes our system less democratic, it makes our system less transparent, less accountable and less fair.

Ultimately, Mr. President, this amendment, what it would do, by creating a system of public financing, a comprehensive system that would have lower contribution limits, stronger enforcement mechanisms, and stronger disclosure guidelines, what we're trying to say here with this -- what I'm trying to say here with this amendment, Mr. President, first of all, it is not

```
1
     a different topic or subject matter than the bill
 2
     at hand and ultimately would create a system that
     is more democratic. Because I believe that we
 3
 4
     should have -- this system would actually
 5
     encourage for us to have a healthy fear of the
     voters and not an unhealthy fear of lobbyists.
 6
 7
                  So, Mr. President, I argue for the
 8
     germaneness of this amendment and hopefully it
     will be considered by the house.
 9
10
                  Thank you so much.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Thank
11
12
     you, Senator Rivera.
13
                  Senator Gipson.
14
                  SENATOR GIPSON:
                                     Thank you,
15
     Mr. President. I'd like to speak briefly on
     Senator Rivera's amendment.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
17
                                              Proceed.
18
                  SENATOR GIPSON: I thank you for
     this opportunity.
19
20
                  Just to underline what Senator
21
     Rivera said, I do firmly believe that New York
22
     State is denying opportunities to the best and
     the brightest throughout our state, the
23
     opportunity to run for office. Whether you're
24
25
     rich or poor, you ought to have the chance to run
```

```
for any office you choose.
 1
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Senator
 3
     Libous, why do you rise?
 4
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: He's not speaking
 5
     on the amendment, he's speaking on ruling of the
     chair, Mr. President.
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Correct.
 8
     We're speaking on the process.
 9
                  Senator Gipson, you may continue.
10
                  SENATOR GIPSON:
                                    Thank you very
     much.
11
                  And I believe also that more
12
     transparency is needed. And I believe that if
13
     all of these things came to bear in terms of fair
14
15
     elections, campaign finance reform, that we
16
     wouldn't be here at 10:20 at night, during
     vampire hours, as we seem to be committed to
17
18
     doing here on out. And I hope you understand
19
     that I had to find a way to get in before the
20
     night was over.
21
                  (Laughter.)
22
                  SENATOR GIPSON: So I appreciate
23
     the opportunity here, but I do take this very
     seriously.
24
25
                  Thank you, Mr. President.
```

```
1
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
 2
     question before the house is on procedures. All
 3
     those in favor --
                  SENATOR GIANARIS: Show of hands,
 4
 5
    please.
 6
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Senator
 7
     Gianaris has asked for a show of hands. It is so
 8
     instructed.
 9
                  All those in favor of overruling the
10
     ruling of the chair please raise your hand.
                  Announce the results.
11
12
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 30.
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
     ruling of the chair stands.
14
15
                  On the bill, the Secretary will read
16
     the last section.
17
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
18
     act shall take effect immediately.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
19
20
     roll.
21
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
22
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
     Espaillat to explain his vote.
23
24
                  SENATOR ESPAILLAT: Thank you,
25
    Mr. President.
```

In addition to the fact that this so-called electoral reform does not include campaign finance, I may also add to it that there is no question that the New York City Board of Elections has repeatedly failed the voters it serves time and time again. Its endemic and persistent refusal to undertake needed reform has hurt New York City voters.

The consequences of the board's actions are not theoretical or abstract. It's poor organization, inadequate training, planning, lack of transparency that has resulted in many registered voters being turned away at their long-time polling sites, voting via frequently disqualified affidavit ballots, and other forms of disenfranchisement.

These problems have disproportionately impacted many minority groups, non-English-speaking groups, and infrequent and first-time voters, the very people we should be encouraging to come forward and participate in the political and civic process.

Instead, Mr. President, I will be voting against this bill. I believe that the Board of Elections needs to do some major

```
1
     reform.
              There is another bill that we took up
 2
     earlier, Senate Bill 3536, which leads in that
 3
     direction, in making sure that voters are
 4
     confident that when they deposit their vote, it
 5
     will be counted, that at the end of the day we
     have a very accurate and transparent count, and
 6
 7
     that democracy is strengthened through these
 8
     means.
 9
                  For these reasons, Mr. President, I
10
     will be voting against this bill.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
11
                                              Senator
12
     Espaillat to be recorded in the negative.
                  Senator Golden to explain his vote.
13
14
                  SENATOR GOLDEN:
                                     Thank you,
15
     Mr. President.
                  This bill that we're passing tonight
16
     is supported by the mayor of the City of New
17
18
     York, the Board of Elections, and it just passed
     the Assembly just very recently.
19
20
                  This would allow for lever machines
     to be used during the runoff and the primary this
21
22
     September, and then going to the electronic
     machines to be used in November.
23
                  The reason for that, if we have a
24
25
     runoff, which is very probable, that we would --
```

if the process were to be .5 of 1 percent, there would be a paper recount. That paper recount could not possibly be done in the two-week -- which we just moved it in this legislation to three weeks, but still not enough time to count a million pieces of paper.

This, however, bill will give the Board of Elections the ability to have this election by using the lever machines and therefore not requiring a paper recount. And an electronic machine will be placed at each election site for the handicapped so that they have access.

The reason for this bill is very simple. Had we to do a paper recount like we did this past year in a Senate race, it took them, to count 22,000 votes, paper votes, 72 days. I have no idea how long it would take us to count a million pieces of paper.

So this bill also puts forward a study to be done by the Board of Elections to come back to us by July 1 of 2014 to tell us how they will complete the races in the future without having to use the lever machines.

But these lever machines are

```
1
     necessary so that the Board of Elections can get
 2
     this done on time and that the City of New York
     can do a responsible race in a responsible period
 3
 4
     of time, getting a responsible count for that
 5
     evening so that we can know who won the election
     for mayor in the primary, who wins in the runoff,
 6
 7
     and then going to the electronic machines to find
     out who will be the mayor of the City of New York
 8
     in November.
 9
10
                  I vote aye, Mr. President.
                                               Thank
11
     you.
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
     Golden to be recorded in the affirmative.
13
                  Announce the results.
14
15
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                    In relation to
16
     Calendar 371, those recorded in the negative are
     Senators Espaillat, Gipson, Kennedy, Krueger,
17
18
     O'Brien, Parker, Rivera and Serrano. Also
19
     Senators Hoylman, Latimer, Squadron and Tkaczyk.
20
                  Ayes, 51. Nays, 12.
21
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The bill
     is passed.
22
23
                  Senator Libous, that completes the
     controversial reading of the original active list
24
     of June 20th.
25
```

```
1
                  SENATOR LIBOUS:
                                    Mr. President,
 2
     we're going to go to Supplemental Active List 1.
     It's a sheet of paper (showing).
 3
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
 5
     original supplemental active list of June 20th.
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: We'll take up
 6
 7
     Calendar Number 1048.
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Calendar
 9
     1048, by Senator DeFrancisco.
10
                  The Secretary will read.
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Calendar Number
11
12
     1048, by Senator DeFrancisco, Senate Print 3362A,
     an act to amend the General Municipal Law.
13
14
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                     Explanation,
15
     please.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
     explanation has been requested by Senator
17
18
     Krueger, Senator DeFrancisco.
19
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO:
                                         The State of
20
     New York is trailing economically just about
21
     every state. It's very difficult to start a
22
     business in New York. In fact, tomorrow we'll be
23
     dealing with a bill for some measures that the
     Governor has proposed to try to kickstart the
24
25
     economy.
```

```
1
                  We've got to cut back on paperwork.
 2
     We can't have busywork being required not only by
     the State of New York but also by separate
 3
 4
     municipalities. What this bill says, at least as
 5
     far as wage reporting, is that the state will set
     the rules by statute of when wage reporting has
 6
 7
     to be done. And it preempts local bills that
 8
     require more such wage reporting.
 9
                  There's an exception, however, if
10
     there's an investigation going on. Obviously,
     the investigators should be able to request
11
12
     whatever information they need no matter what the
     state law is. And it also accepts the prevailing
13
14
     wage and similar statutes dealing with Article 8
15
     of the Labor Law.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Thank you
     for your explanation.
17
18
                  Senator Krueger.
19
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                     Thank you.
20
                  Through you, Mr. President, if the
21
     sponsor would yield.
22
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO:
                                         Yes.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
23
     sponsor yields.
24
25
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                      Thank you.
```

```
1
                  Does the sponsor know how many
 2
     municipalities would be affected by his
 3
     legislation?
 4
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: I hope all of
 5
     them. Because all would be preempted.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 6
                                             Senator
 7
     Krueger.
 8
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                     Through you,
 9
     Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
10
     yield.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
11
12
     sponsor yields.
13
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO:
                                         Yes.
14
                  SENATOR KRUEGER: Does the sponsor
15
     know that New York City has adopted a wage
16
     notification law and that this law would be
     preempted by his bill?
17
18
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO:
                                         That's
     correct. You're talking about affordable
19
20
     housing, Senator?
21
                  SENATOR KRUEGER: Housing with
22
     government investment, yes.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Can I ask
     the members to please direct through the chair.
24
25
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO:
                                         Yes, I'm
```

1 familiar with that statute. And that brought my 2 attention to the potential problem. And that is 3 we have an extensive wage reporting bill that was 4 passed I think in 2009 or 2010. And then, 5 despite that, in 2012 New York City came up with another wage reporting bill that is quite 6 7 duplicative and quite frankly only dealt with one 8 industry. 9 And so this is what I'm trying to 10 prevent, so that someone trying to do business in the State of New York doesn't run into multiple 11 12 reporting requirements on this topic, and sometimes just individual industries being 13 required to provide more information. 14 15 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you, Mr. President, can the sponsor tell me how many 16 other municipalities have a wage law besides 17 18 New York City? 19 SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: I have no 20 idea. But New York City is an example of 21 duplicative efforts. And that's why we have federal 22 23 preemption of state laws, we have state preemption of local laws, so we have some kind of 24 25 consistency in certain areas. And there's got to

```
1
     be consistency in the regulatory system in the
 2
     State of New York if we expect to keep what
     businesses we have and attract new businesses.
 3
 4
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                      Through you,
 5
     Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
     yield.
 6
 7
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO:
                                         Yes, I will.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 8
                                              The
 9
     sponsor yields.
10
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                     Is the sponsor
     aware that the City of New York passed its law
11
12
     that specifically relates to construction of
13
     housing involving in some way government
14
     support -- tax exemptions, tax credits, direct
15
     grants or payments -- for affordable housing with
     government involvement after the federal
16
     Department of Labor had prepared multiple actions
17
18
     against such contractors and found millions of
19
     dollars in owed wages among several contractors
20
     and subcontractors in this field in New York
21
     City?
                                          I did not
22
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO:
     know that. But to me that's irrelevant, insofar
23
     as the state had already passed a law that would
24
25
     have provided the same information that the --
```

```
1
     well, similar, not exactly the same.
 2
     law was a duplicative effort to the bill that was
     passed in 2009, I believe sponsored by
 3
 4
     Senator Savino.
 5
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                     Through you,
 6
     Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
 7
     yield.
 8
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO:
                                          Yes.
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
10
     sponsor yields.
                  SENATOR KRUEGER: Would the sponsor
11
12
     agree with me that the law that was passed by
     Senator Savino involves providing the wage
13
14
     information to employees, and yet this city bill
15
     is to provide wage information to the government
     who's involved with providing funding and/or tax
16
     credits and exemptions for these construction
17
18
     jobs?
19
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO:
                                          Yes, I
20
     believe that's the case.
                  However, once again, there's the
21
22
     exception. You mentioned the potential problems
     that the federal government uncovered. However,
23
     "Nothing in this section shall limit the
24
25
     provision of employment and wage information
```

```
1
     pursuant to an investigation or enforcement of
 2
     alleged violations of the Labor Law or an
     investigation or enforcement by a law enforcement
 3
 4
     agency, " et cetera, et cetera.
 5
                  So this is covered, and it would not
     interrupt any such investigation.
 6
 7
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                      Through you,
     Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
 8
9
     yield.
10
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO:
                                          Yes, I would.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
11
12
     sponsor yields.
13
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                      Might we agree
     that there's a difference between trying to
14
15
     provide the information in order to track and
16
     document possible abuse versus having no ability
     to see patterns of abuse to then call in law
17
18
     enforcement to do investigations?
19
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO:
                                          That is
20
     correct.
21
                  But presently the investigators do
     have subpoena power. They do have the ability to
22
23
     get the information they choose if something is
     brought to their attention either by the Labor
24
25
     Department or a local entity or another employee.
```

```
On the bill,
 1
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
 2
     Mr. President.
 3
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
 4
     Krueger on the bill.
 5
                  SENATOR KRUEGER: I think the
     sponsor and I disagree in our understanding of
 6
 7
     the value of this information in a transparent
     form so that government can in fact track
 8
     relevant data to make sure illegal things aren't
 9
10
     going on. And there's a big difference between
11
     that and having to hope there's some expose or
12
     filing of complaints with investigation of
     illegal activity.
13
                  The example from New York City, by
14
15
     the way, which did pass Local Law 730 -- which
     this bill, if it became law would preempt -- that
16
     it was passed by unanimous vote of the City
17
18
     Council in July of 2012, requires residential
19
     housing development initiated, funded or
20
     participated in by the Department of Housing
21
     Preservation and Development, New York City's
22
     housing agency.
23
                  As part of the disclosure,
     contractors are required to disclose to the
24
25
     department wage information such as the names of
```

employees and their rate of pay and shifts and other wage information. The City of New York made a specific choice to go after contractors doing business with the department after there were exposes through the Department of Labor pursuing multiple actions with such contractors.

The legislation was introduced just one month after a department assistant commissioner and six developers were indicted for racketeering, conspiracy, bribery, extortion, wire fraud and money laundering in connection with corruption schemes that had netted defendants between \$1 million and \$2 million in kickbacks and bribes for looking the other way on wage exploitation, and the cost to the department of hundreds of thousands of dollars in overpayments to developers in these government-funded projects.

The legislation, if it passed today, would preempt a good-faith effort on the part of New York City to provide transparency in housing development projects subsidized through tax breaks and other initiatives.

Where there are taxpayers funding the projects, it seems only right that the

municipality should have the right to know whether employees are being paid a reasonable wage and in fact are being paid what is being filed with the government and often partially billed to the government. This is a fundamental public right to know how their taxpayer dollars are being used.

Not only would this bill preempt

New York City, but it would preempt any other

municipality that attempts to provide

transparency and disclosure of employee wages on

public projects.

The sponsor and I each don't know if there are other equivalent laws throughout the State of New York. I know of New York City's situation. I know that this law grew out of a recognition that there was corruption and that people were being cheated out of their wages.

And it is a mechanism, a quite simple mechanism simply providing the information to be kept in a database so that government can track what is being paid or what is supposed to be being paid to whom, to help them match up whether in fact the information being reported on various contracting and grant reports is in fact

consistent with what they know or don't know are the wages being paid. This is a simple, nonintrusive way for government to have transparency, for government to be able to watchdog its own spending in publicly funded housing projects and developments.

The legislation comes at the same time as some members of this body are attempting to repeal the wage notification provisions cited in the discussion earlier. And yet this legislation attempts to provide a justification that says we don't need the localities to have the right to collect the information because we have a state law that provides the information, except we're trying to repeal that state law perhaps in the exact same day or 24 hours from which this legislation is arguing the local law is duplicative.

I strongly urge my colleagues to vote no and to recognize that there are very good reasons for local governments to want to make sure that their funds are being properly spent, distributed in wages, and that in fact people are not, as we found in the City of New York, racketeering, committing bribery, extortion, wire

fraud and money laundering with government money, rather than having maximum utilization of taxpayers' money to build what is supposed to be built to provide the housing in our communities that is needed.

you.

I don't believe we need this law in New York State. And yet I'm very sure, at least for the City of New York, the local law is very important to have passed. I appreciate that my colleagues in the City Council worked so hard to get this law. I believe that New York City is now in a place where it can have more confidence in the information they have, the due diligence they can use, and in fact that investigations, if they take place, will be more targeted and more successful.

The local law is important. There is no reason for the State of New York to pass a law preventing them from continuing to have the local law. And in fact other localities in the state might do very well to pass their own local laws to do this kind of tracking for themselves.

I vote no, Mr. President. Thank

25 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Hearing

```
and seeing no other Senator who wishes to be
 1
 2
     heard, debate is closed.
 3
                  The Secretary will ring the bell.
                  Read the last section.
 4
 5
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 2. This
     act shall take effect immediately.
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 8
     roll.
 9
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Announce
     the results.
11
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
12
13
     Calendar Number 1048, those recorded in the
     negative are Senators Adams, Addabbo, Avella,
14
15
     Diaz, Espaillat, Gianaris, Hassell-Thompson,
16
     Hoylman, Krueger, Montgomery, Parker, Peralta,
     Perkins, Rivera, Sanders, Serrano, Squadron,
17
18
     Stavisky and Stewart-Cousins.
19
                  Absent from voting: Senator
20
     Sampson.
21
                  Ayes, 43. Nays, 19.
22
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The bill
23
     is passed.
                  Senator Libous, that completes the
24
25
     controversial reading of the original
```

```
supplemental active list of June 20th.
 1
 2
                  SENATOR LIBOUS:
                                     Mr. President,
 3
     we're now on Supplemental Calendar 56B. We're
 4
     going in order on the lay-asides.
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The bell
     has been rung.
 6
 7
                  We're on the controversial reading
 8
     of Senate Supplemental Calendar 56B, and we'll
 9
     begin by the Secretary reading Calendar Number
10
     1532.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11
12
     1532, by Member of the Assembly Jaffee, Assembly
     Print 7514, an act authorizing.
13
14
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                      Explanation.
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
16
     explanation has been requested, Senator Carlucci,
     by Senator Krueger.
17
18
                  SENATOR CARLUCCI:
                                       Thank you,
     Mr. President.
19
20
                  This bill allows the East Ramapo
21
     Central School District to advance their
22
     September lottery aid payment from September to
23
     June.
                  This initiative has been supported
24
25
     by NYSUT, the School Boards Association, and the
```

```
1
     State Education Department.
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
 3
     Krueger.
 4
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                     Thank you.
 5
     Through you, Mr. President, if the sponsor would
     yield.
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Does the
 8
     sponsor yield?
 9
                  SENATOR CARLUCCI:
                                      Yes.
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
     sponsor yields.
11
12
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                    Why does
13
     East Ramapo need this money at this time?
                  SENATOR CARLUCCI:
14
                                      Thank you,
15
     Senator, for that question.
16
                  The East Ramapo School District has
17
     experienced some very dramatic changes over the
18
     past few years. In fact, they've had a student
19
     body increase of about 30 percent in just the
20
     last five years. And this year's budget, they
21
     had put in devastating cuts to the tune where
22
     they said that if they weren't able to get this
23
     funding, the $3.5 million that this will put into
     this --
24
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Can we
```

```
1
     have some order in the chamber? I'm sorry,
 2
     Senator Carlucci.
                  Can we have some order in the
 3
     chamber, please.
 4
 5
                  SENATOR CARLUCCI: -- to put into
     this year's school budget, they would have to cut
 6
 7
     programs that are really essential to developing
     quality students and the leaders of tomorrow.
 8
     Programs like sports, guidance counselors, health
 9
10
     services, sports programs.
11
                  This is really an urban school
12
     district in a suburban community and experiencing
     the growing pains of that. And this is an effort
13
14
     to make sure that these students get the best
15
     education possible. And we found this as a
     reasonable way to do that.
16
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
17
                                     Through you,
18
     Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
     yield.
19
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Does the
21
     sponsor yield?
22
                  SENATOR CARLUCCI:
                                       Yes.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
23
                                              The
     sponsor yields.
24
25
                  SENATOR KRUEGER: How much was the
```

```
1
     school budget cut over the last year or several
 2
     years, as the sponsor referenced? What's the
     dollar difference in the reduced budget?
 3
 4
                  SENATOR CARLUCCI:
                                      I don't have
     that number in front of me.
 5
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
 6
                                     Through you,
 7
     Mr. President, will the sponsor continue to
 8
     yield?
 9
                  SENATOR CARLUCCI:
                                      Yes.
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
     Carlucci yields.
11
12
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                     Does the sponsor
     know what percentage the budget was cut, if he
13
     doesn't know the dollar amount it was cut?
14
15
                  SENATOR CARLUCCI:
                                    Well, I do have
16
     the number.
                  The number, the cut, was $452,000.
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
17
                                     Through you,
18
     Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
19
     yield.
20
                  SENATOR CARLUCCI:
                                      Yes.
21
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
22
     sponsor yields.
23
                  SENATOR KRUEGER: Was the budget
     cut by $452,000 because there was a vote to
24
25
     reduce the school district funding or the school
```

```
1
     budgets?
 2
                  SENATOR CARLUCCI: Yes, there was a
 3
     school board budget.
                  This initial $3.5 million, they were
 4
     facing a $2.3 million shortfall. The district
 5
     had to find ways to plug that gap and try to
 6
 7
     still provide essential services to students.
 8
     When they had their meetings to develop that
 9
     budget, they had talked about the specific areas
10
     that would have to be cut if they were not able
     to find this $3.5 million.
11
12
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                     Through you,
     Mr. President, if the sponsor will continue to
13
14
     yield.
15
                  SENATOR CARLUCCI:
                                       Yes.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
     sponsor yields.
17
18
                  SENATOR KRUEGER: So there was a
     $2.3 million shortfall already. What explains
19
20
     that shortfall? What caused that shortfall?
21
                  SENATOR CARLUCCI:
                                      Well, there's
22
     many different things that caused that
     shortfall.
23
                  One of the big things is, again,
24
25
     this is really a district that's become an urban
```

```
1
     district in a suburban community. We have about
 2
     30,000 children in this school district, an
     increase of close to 30 percent just over the
 3
 4
     past five years. And those are some of the
 5
     things that have led to the shortfall and this
     budget gap.
 6
 7
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                     Through you,
     Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
 8
9
     yield.
10
                  SENATOR CARLUCCI:
                                      Yes.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
11
12
     sponsor yields.
13
                  SENATOR KRUEGER: I believe that
     this is the town that I have read many articles
14
15
     about that there is a serious corruption problem,
16
     that the school board members do not send their
     own children to the public school system and seem
17
18
     to have -- it appears intentionally --
     misdirected funds and made sure that there was
19
20
     not adequate funding to provide for the children
     who go to the school system.
21
22
                  Would the sponsor agree with me on
     that analysis?
23
                  SENATOR CARLUCCI:
                                      Well, Senator,
24
25
     what I would say -- and I thank you for bringing
```

```
1
     that to everyone's attention.
 2
                  What I've done with this bill is to
     put in strict oversight in terms of where that
 3
 4
     money could be spent. And working with the State
 5
     Education Department, we developed this
     legislation to make sure that that money is going
 6
 7
     where we intend it to go, to make sure it's going
     to after-school programs, to music programs, to
 8
     what we actually put exactly in the budget and
 9
10
     detail where that money will be spent.
11
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                      Through you,
12
     Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
     yield.
13
14
                  SENATOR CARLUCCI:
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
     sponsor yields.
16
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                      Can the sponsor
17
18
     cite the sections of the bill that make that
19
     explicit, that actually how the funds will be
20
     spent will not be controlled by the school board
     but rather by SED?
21
22
                  SENATOR CARLUCCI:
                                       Thank you,
     Mr. President.
23
                  Yes, to answer the Senator's
24
25
     question, it's Section 1, paragraph 2, in talking
```

```
about the specific programs and where the funding
 1
 2
     has to go. Yes, Section 1, paragraph 2.
 3
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                      Through you,
 4
     Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
 5
     yield.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 6
                                              Senator
 7
     Carlucci, do you yield?
 8
                  SENATOR CARLUCCI:
                                       Yes.
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
10
     sponsor yields.
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                      Thank you.
11
12
                  Is this not just standard language
     for all spin-up bills in education? Is there
13
14
     something different or unique in this oversight,
15
     as opposed to standard language that is used
     whenever school districts are asking for advance
16
     money or spin-up money, as we sometimes refer to
17
18
     it?
19
                  SENATOR CARLUCCI:
                                       Yes,
20
     Mr. President. And as the Senator had previously
     stated, the reasons for making this bill a little
21
22
     unique are to address the concerns that the
     Senator and many people have, is to make sure
23
     that that money is directed to those programs.
24
25
                  So it is using language that has
```

```
1
     been set by precedent in this body, in using
 2
     other piece of legislation from spin-up bills
     that have been done in the past. But it adds
 3
 4
     that strict oversight to make sure that that
 5
     funding is going to those programs that we want
     to make sure continue to help the children in
 6
 7
     that district.
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
 8
                                      Through you,
 9
     Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
10
     yield.
                  SENATOR CARLUCCI:
11
                                       Yes.
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
13
     sponsor yields.
14
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                      Is there anything
15
     in this bill that gives SED or the state the
     power to replace the superintendent and/or the
16
     school board, given the fact that they have
17
18
     mismanaged state money, and I don't see the
19
     advantage of giving more money to the same people
20
     who have done such a terrible job?
                  SENATOR CARLUCCI:
21
                                       Well,
22
     Mr. President, let me say we're not giving more
     money to the school district. This is not
23
24
     costing the state any additional funding or any
25
     of the taxpayers of the State of New York.
```

1 What we're doing is moving the 2 payment that they are expecting in September of 3 this year to June of this year, to get it into 4 their budget for this year so that they can fill 5 that budget gap. So that's what this bill is doing. It's not any increased funding. 6 7 It does have the oversight to go to 8 those key specific programs. And no, it doesn't add anything to allow the State Education 9 10 Department to remove the superintendent. 11 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you, 12 Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to yield. 13 14 SENATOR CARLUCCI: 15 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The sponsor yields. 16 17 SENATOR KRUEGER: Except that a 18 spin-up giving them \$3.2 million earlier does not 19 cost the state more. If they spend that money 20 now, how will that fit the \$3.2 million hole they 21 will have when they don't get this money from us 22 later? 23 SENATOR CARLUCCI: This funding they will receive every year. This will move it 24 25 up from September to June. They will still

```
receive a payment in September. It will be
 1
 2
     obviously much less than the payment in June.
     And that will be phased out over the coming years
 3
 4
     to eventually phase back in to receiving the full
 5
     payment in September.
 6
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                     Through you,
 7
     Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
 8
     yield.
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
10
     sponsor yields.
                  SENATOR KRUEGER: Would the sponsor
11
12
     agree that SED going in and replacing the
     leadership and taking control of the school
13
     district would be a better answer for the
14
15
     children of the Town of East Ramapo than simply
16
     advancing $3.2 million early to the same people
     who have created such a problem so far?
17
18
                  SENATOR CARLUCCI:
                                      Well, that's not
     the intent of this legislation.
19
20
                  I think that we need to have all
21
     options on the table in dealing with the East
22
     Ramapo School District. And I look forward to
23
     having SED, Dr. King, involved in the East Ramapo
     School District, for the reasons that I spoke
24
25
     about earlier.
```

We're going through some dramatic 1 2 I know every member in this body is experiencing issues with their school districts. 3 4 This district is very unique. It's the only type 5 of its kind in the State of New York where we have such a unique student body, where we're 6 7 growing in leaps and bounds in terms of adding about a thousand new students every year to the 8 private school while still serving a population 9 10 that has about 75 percent of our students on free or reduced lunch, a high homeless student 11 12 population. 13 And I would agree with the Senator 14 that we need all options. And I would engage the 15 Senator to work with me to help the students of East Ramapo and would look forward to that 16 17 partnership in working with the Senator. 18 SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you, Mr. President, on the bill. 19 20 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator 21 Krueger on the bill. SENATOR KRUEGER: I find it hard to 22 argue with my colleagues that they should vote to 23 refuse East Ramapo the money, because the schools 24 25 and the children desperately need it.

But when the sponsor talks about working to resolve the problems, first, it's not unique. There are many communities -- many communities in my own city -- that have high rates of immigrants, high rates of very poor students, rapid growth, and serious special needs among significant percentages of the population, populations of immigrants just like those in East Ramapo.

What is different in East Ramapo I believe is that there has been a gutting of public education funding inappropriately, that these children have been deprived of their right to a quality public education. Even though huge amounts of government funds are going into this town, they are not appropriately being used in their public school system.

I actually think that the right legislation for this house to be reviewing and passing tonight is a bill that would have SED take over the East Ramapo school system.

I recognize that this money is going with some strings attached. I do not believe the strings will be adequate. I do not believe this will in any way resolve the problems we are

seeing, we are reading about.

I think as recently perhaps as yesterday, there was a massive walkout of the school system by the young people, in desperate frustration over the fact that they have no realistic chance of the education they deserve in order for them to be able to graduate and become productive adults in our society, that they are being -- and it appears specifically by race, that they are being discriminated against in their own school system. That the school board is completely irresponsible when it comes to meeting the needs and the obligations and the legal commitment they should be making as school board members.

Are you saying "Excuse me" to me?

ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator

Krueger, you may continue.

SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you. I wasn't sure whether Senator Libous was trying to get my attention or your attention.

That this is an atrocity for the State of New York, that it requires much more aggressive action. That a \$3.2 million advance on lottery education funds cannot solve the

```
problem, and I worry that it will be spent badly
 1
 2
     the same way the current funding is being spent.
                  But I won't be voting no on this
 3
 4
            I will be urging the Senator who
 5
     represents this area, the sponsor of this bill,
     to rush forward with legislation and action that
 6
 7
     forces change in the East Ramapo school system
     before another year passes, another group of
 8
     children lose their fair and rightful opportunity
 9
10
     for quality education.
                  Thank you, Mr. President.
11
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
     Latimer.
13
14
                  SENATOR LATIMER:
                                      Thank you,
15
     Mr. President. On the bill.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
     Latimer on the bill.
17
18
                  SENATOR LATIMER: It's always been
     my sense that whenever any of our colleagues need
19
20
     something for one of their local communities,
     that we defer to their evaluation and we
21
22
     generally try to support it in almost every
23
     case.
                  And I really think tonight I feel
24
25
     very much for my friend the Senator from Rockland
```

County, because I think he and his Assembly colleague have been given a very bad hand to play. And I respect the fact that you're working hard on behalf of the kids in your community.

But I have to pick up where Senator Krueger left off. I think what we're facing in East Ramapo is a disgrace. It is a disgrace to public education, and I think all 63 of us know that it's a disgrace to public education.

As Senator Krueger said, and I echo her call, it is time for the State Education

Department to step in and to take over the responsibility for this district. We do in fact have districts all across our state that have needs. And when I hear any of my friends on either side of the aisle identify that they've got a rural or an urban district that has economic needs and we need to spin up -- and we know that's a radical step to take, but it makes sense if there are checks and balances in place that will try to help resolve the issue that's at hand.

All of our school districts, under the tax cap and under other pressures, are facing terrible financial problems. But where East

Ramapo is at is well beyond that point. We are 1 2 watching a systematic effort to wreck a public school system. And if it was my child or, worse 3 4 yet, me myself that sat in that district needing 5 public education and knowing that because of the political construct of the community that school 6 7 board members were being elected by a majority of the people specifically to undermine that task, 8 then some force from outside of that community 9 10 has got to step in. Why do we have a State Education 11 12 Department to monitor what's happening unless in 13 these extreme cases we step in? 14 Now, I can't say whether the 15 behavior is criminal or just a set of public policy. If I thought it was criminal, I'd call 16 for a Moreland Commission to get into this. 17 18 But this is exactly, Mr. President, where I think we have to draw a line at some 19 20 point in time. Again, I feel for Senator Carlucci. 21 22 I believe he is trying his best given the situation. If I'm not mistaken, this is the 23 second spin-up bill that we've dealt with in the 24 25 last couple of weeks. And when you see that

```
1
     happen and you don't see a real effort to
 2
     restructure what's happening there, then I think
 3
     the problem goes a lot deeper than just the fact
 4
     that they have a shortfall of money.
 5
                  And what we've read, Mr. President,
     we've all read, is that the students in the
 6
 7
     public school system and the parents in the
     public school system are beside themselves
 8
     because they're unable to effect a change.
 9
10
                  I'm not sure if I'm going to vote
11
     yes or no for this. I obviously want to think.
12
     And I am trying to be as sensitive as I can to my
     colleague and his needs. But I think at some
13
14
     point in time this state has to say what's
15
     happening in East Ramapo is dead wrong and we're
     not going to accept that, none of us. Not any of
16
17
     us.
          It's wrong what's happening in that district
18
     and we ought to stand up and say that as a
19
     unified body.
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
21
     Stavisky.
22
                  SENATOR STAVISKY:
                                       Thank you,
     Mr. President.
23
                  I would appreciate it if Senator
24
25
     Carlucci would clarify a couple of points that he
```

```
made. So if he would yield.
 1
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Are you
     asking Senator Carlucci to yield?
 3
 4
                  SENATOR STAVISKY:
                                      Yes.
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Senator
     Carlucci, do you yield?
 6
 7
                  SENATOR CARLUCCI: Yes, I'd be
 8
     happy to.
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
10
     sponsor yields.
11
                  SENATOR STAVISKY:
                                      In your opening
12
     you talked about some of the difficulties facing
     the Ramapo School District, and then you used the
13
     word "unique." What is the cause of these
14
15
     problems, the difficulties?
16
                  SENATOR CARLUCCI: And this is --
     just so we're clear, this is the East Ramapo
17
18
     School District.
                  And what we have here is an
19
20
     explosion in growth. We have a population of
21
     about 30,000 students, 70 percent of which are in
     the private schools. Meaning that I believe that
22
     the funding formula in state aid is not equitable
23
     to the students of East Ramapo, something I would
24
25
     love to work with my colleagues to address, the
```

previous speakers that spoke about this, because
I agree. We asked for the colleagues here to
help us to make sure that we deal with this
unprecedented issue.

That's what we have, an unprecedented issue. And we've been working hard -- myself, my colleagues in the Assembly -- to try to address these issues and do it in a body where maybe people aren't familiar with the issues that we're facing.

And I think there are many things that we can do. I think a first step and the right thing to do is pass this legislation tonight so that we can get on the right step. In this bill the goal is to get that funding, fill that budget hole, put in oversight in this bill where we say it has to go to these specific programs.

And also the district has to do a detailed plan that they have to submit on a monthly basis to SED to make sure that they are moving on the right track than we can avoid any impropriet -- any thought of money not going to the appropriate place.

SENATOR STAVISKY: If the sponsor

```
1
     would continue to yield.
 2
                  SENATOR CARLUCCI:
                                      Yes.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 3
 4
     sponsor yields.
 5
                  SENATOR STAVISKY: You said that in
     that school district about 70 percent of the
 6
 7
     children do not attend the public schools. You
 8
    did give the number, and was it -- how many
 9
     children are there in the East Ramapo School
10
    District?
                  SENATOR CARLUCCI:
                                      There are
11
12
     approximately 30,000 students in East Ramapo.
13
                  SENATOR STAVISKY:
                                      That's what I
     thought, 30,000 children in the East Ramapo
14
     School District. And of that 30,000, how many
15
16
     are children with special needs?
17
                  SENATOR CARLUCCI: I don't know. I
18
     don't have that number.
19
                  SENATOR STAVISKY: It's a very high
20
    percentage, is it not?
21
                  SENATOR CARLUCCI: I'm not sure
22
     what the percentage is, but there are many
     students out of the 30,000 that do need special
23
     services, absolutely.
24
25
                  SENATOR STAVISKY:
                                      If the sponsor
```

```
would just answer really one more question.
 1
 2
                  SENATOR CARLUCCI:
                                      Absolutely, yes.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 3
                                              The
 4
     sponsor continues to yield.
 5
                  SENATOR STAVISKY: Wouldn't you
     agree that it costs a lot more to educate a child
 6
 7
     with special needs and this is part of the
 8
     problem as well?
 9
                  SENATOR CARLUCCI:
                                      Well, it
10
     definitely costs more to educate a child with
     special needs.
11
12
                  SENATOR STAVISKY: And this is part
     of the problem as well.
13
                  SENATOR CARLUCCI: Well, it's part
14
15
     of the financial issue, yeah. All the issues
     with this is that with the private school,
16
     25 percent of the mandated costs in this district
17
18
     are going towards mandated costs in the private
19
     school system. So it's something that when we
20
     look at the school aid formula, it doesn't really
21
     take into equation.
22
                  And that's what we see on this new
23
     frontier of a district like this, that the way
     that we've governed and the way that we've funded
24
25
     our school districts for the past hundred years
```

4052

```
1
     really hasn't kept up with a changing society and
 2
     changing demographics that have changed so
     dramatically, like in the East Ramapo School
 3
     District.
 4
 5
                  So again, I think this is a step
     that we need to take. And I ask that my
 6
 7
     colleagues support this legislation so that we
 8
     can make sure that the children in the
     East Ramapo School District get the best
 9
10
     education possible.
                  SENATOR STAVISKY:
11
                                       Thank you,
12
     Mr. President. Thank you, Senator.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
13
                                              Thank
14
     you, Senator Stavisky.
15
                  Seeing and hearing no other Senator
16
     that wishes to be heard, debate is closed.
                  The Secretary will ring the bell.
17
18
                  Read the last section.
                                   Section 2. This
19
                  THE SECRETARY:
20
     act shall take effect immediately.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Call the
21
22
     roll.
23
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
24
                                              Senator
25
     Sanders to explain his vote.
```

```
1
                  SENATOR SANDERS:
                                      In response to
 2
     the urgent plea of my colleague Senator Carlucci,
     I am going to vote for this. But I am also
 3
 4
     joining the call that the State Ed Department,
 5
     the State Board of Ed, needs to step in and
     resolve this issue.
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              How do
 8
     you vote, Senator Sanders?
 9
                  SENATOR SANDERS:
                                      I am voting yes.
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
     Sanders to be recorded in the affirmative.
11
12
                  Senator Gipson to explain his vote.
13
                  SENATOR GIPSON:
                                     Thank you,
14
     Mr. Speaker.
15
                  This is a tough vote. You know, I
     feel for this school district. But I just don't
16
     think this is the way to go about solving this
17
18
     problem, so I am going to vote against it.
19
                  But I want to say this.
                                            There's a
20
     big building across the street that houses the
21
                            There are a lot more
     Education Department.
22
     people working over there than there are over
     here. And I think it's time that this body begin
23
     to ask a serious question about what exactly are
24
25
     they doing over there, and why have they allowed
```

```
1
     this school district to get to this point.
 2
                  Because I'm afraid it won't be very
     long before other school districts will be at
 3
 4
     this point as well. And we need to start holding
 5
     the State Education Department accountable for
     solving these problems before we get to this
 6
 7
     crisis point.
 8
                  Thank you. And I will be voting no.
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
10
     Gipson to be recorded in the negative.
11
                  Senator Diaz to explain his vote.
12
                  SENATOR DIAZ:
                                  Thank you,
     Mr. President. Also to wish your father a happy
13
14
     birthday.
15
                  Mr. President, you know, I know how
     it is, I know how it is when you really need help
16
17
     and you don't get it. I know how many times
18
     people in my district, in our community, need the
     kind of help that Senator Carlucci is asking us
19
20
     to help him. We haven't got it. And I know how
     it feels when you say "My children in my district
21
     need this help and, you know, I cannot get it."
22
                  For whatever reason, and because I
23
24
     sometimes don't get the help that I am asking and
25
     I know how it feels, I am supporting Senator
```

```
Carlucci in his cry for help for the children in
 1
 2
     his district. So even though I haven't got the
     help when I need it, Senator Carlucci, I'm here
 3
 4
     voting yes to be sure that you get the help that
 5
     you are asking for.
 6
                  I'm voting yes.
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
 8
     Diaz to be recorded in the affirmative.
 9
                  Senator Latimer to explain his vote.
10
                  SENATOR LATIMER:
                                     Thank you,
     Mr. President.
11
12
                  A very hard vote. I am going to
     vote yes, not because I believe that the school
13
     district deserves it, but because there are
14
15
     children that will most likely suffer and the
16
     state will be blamed for the lack of this spin-up
17
     revenue.
18
                  But I will repeat what I said in my
     longer speech earlier. I think that what's
19
20
     happening there is wrong, and I think this vote
21
     should be interpreted as the last time that this
     state is going to try to bail out a situation.
22
     The next action of this state should be tough and
23
24
     severe and strong.
25
                  But I will be in the affirmative on
```

1 this vote. 2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator 3 Latimer in the affirmative. 4 Senator Carlucci to explain his 5 vote. 6 SENATOR CARLUCCI: Thank you, 7 Mr. President. 8 I want to thank the colleagues in 9 the Senate for supporting this piece of 10 legislation. And it's good to see so many of my colleagues so concerned about the children in the 11 12 East Ramapo School District. 13 We need to get the State Education Department involved in finding solutions. 14 15 look forward to working with all of you in the 16 future towards solutions that we can try to help the children in this district. 17 18 Again, this is a first step. This is one of many solutions that need to be put 19 20 forward to address the problems in the East 21 Ramapo School District. And I am really uplifted 22 by the support in this chamber and the commitment 23 towards addressing the problems in the East Ramapo School District. I'm looking forward to 24 25 working with each and every one of you. So thank

```
1
     you.
 2
                  Thank you, Mr. President.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 3
                                              Senator
     Carlucci to be recorded in the affirmative.
 4
 5
                  Senator Flanagan to explain his
 6
     vote.
 7
                  SENATOR FLANAGAN:
                                       Thank you,
 8
     Mr. President.
 9
                  I rise and I'm going to vote in the
10
     affirmative on this bill.
                  And Senator Carlucci didn't really
11
     speak to something that I know he's been doing.
12
     All the things that everybody raised about the
13
     involvement of the State Education Department,
14
15
     he's way ahead of everybody. He's tried to
16
     interact with the State Education Department, and
     they do bear a fundamental responsibility. And
17
18
     they have some inherent power to get into a
19
     school district independent of any new
20
     legislation that maybe enacted.
21
                  But I also want to point out a
     couple of things. Senator Stavisky, you asked
22
     about funding. They receive approximately
23
     $52 million in state aid. They fluctuated
24
25
     between last year and this year about
```

\$2.5 million in special ed funding for public and private excess cost aid. So their number is not disproportionate. I think if you look within their population, it is a legitimate and fair concern in terms of the special ed population.

But also, too, everyone should understand that this is not without precedent. We have done this not last night or last week, but we've done this for Buffalo, Utica, Syracuse. And the fundamental distinction with Senator Carlucci's bill, all those other chapters said that they could use it for academic purposes. He highlighted areas where he knew there were specific problems and gave them a mandate and put more oversight and more regulation than any of those other previous pieces of legislation. So he put in safeguards that will be good for all of the students that everybody talked about.

And if we are focusing on the children of East Ramapo, this is not something we want to jump into every single time problems arise, but it is something that will benefit those children in particular.

I vote yes.

```
1
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
 2
     Flanagan will be recorded in the affirmative.
                  I would ask all those who are in the
 3
 4
     negative to please raise your hand again.
 5
                  Senator Stavisky, do you rise to
     explain your vote?
 6
 7
                  SENATOR STAVISKY: Very briefly.
 8
                  I too don't want to penalize the
 9
     children of the East Ramapo School District. But
10
     I think this is the last time we should be doing
11
     this.
12
                  Thank you.
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: How do
     you vote, Senator Stavisky?
14
15
                  SENATOR STAVISKY:
                                       I vote yes.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
     Stavisky to be recorded in the affirmative.
17
18
                  Senator Hassell-Thompson to explain
     her vote.
19
20
                  SENATOR HASSELL-THOMPSON:
                                               Thank
21
     you, Mr. President.
                  I rise to support this legislation
22
     and to support Senator Carlucci.
23
                  The City of Mount Vernon had similar
24
25
     issues, similar problems. We appealed as
```

parents, as community leaders, to SED to ask them to take over our school district. One of the things that SED said to us was that they had too many schools already that they had responsibility for and did not have the monitoring mechanism to take on another school.

Now, we do have an obligation to ensure that money when it goes into districts is properly spent. I have no doubt about that. But I also understand what the population of East Ramapo is, which is what nobody wants to talk about. And I could never stand here and vote against.

And I think Senator Fuschillo can attest to this, when we did for Roosevelt. I think that Senator Stewart-Cousins can attest to it when we did it for Yonkers. So all of us have had a time when we've sat in this same seat and been in this position and said "What do we do?"

Well, there are a lot of things that we can do. And I can appreciate and support his legislation. I've heard him say to everyone who has spoken: "I need your help. We'll work with you." And I think this is an opportunity for us to begin to look at each of these school

4061

```
districts and talk about how can we begin to
 1
 2
     reset the models for how school districts should
     be getting their funding and have the proper
 3
 4
     monitoring mechanisms to ensure that money is
 5
     being spent where it's supposed to be spent, and
     that is on the children.
 6
 7
                  So, Mr. President, tonight I will
 8
     support Senator Carlucci not only in voting on
 9
     this, but will agree to help him in an effort to
10
     help my own community to figure out what do we do
     to help all of our children.
11
12
                  Thank you, Mr. President.
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
14
     Hassell-Thompson to be recorded in the
15
     affirmative.
16
                  Announce the results.
17
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   In relation to
18
     Calendar Number 1532, those recorded in the
19
     negative are Senators Ball, Dilan, Montgomery,
20
     Parker, and Tkaczyk.
21
                  Ayes, 58. Nays, 5.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The bill
22
23
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Calendar Number
24
25
     1537, by Member of the Assembly Magnarelli,
```

```
Assembly Print Number 403A, an act in relation
 1
 2
     to.
 3
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                     Explanation.
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
 5
     Krueger has asked for an explanation, Senator
     Valesky.
 6
 7
                  SENATOR VALESKY:
                                     Thank you,
 8
     Mr. President.
 9
                  This bill is designed to provide
10
     legislative authority and direction to the
11
     Commissioner of the Health Department to be able
     to intervene and provide assistance to a small
12
     rural hospital in my Senate district that several
13
     years ago -- could I have a little order,
14
15
     please?
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Can we
     have some order in the house.
17
18
                  Senator Valesky.
19
                  SENATOR VALESKY: Thank you,
20
     Mr. President.
21
                  It directs the Commissioner of the
22
     Health Department to provide potential assistance
23
     to a small rural hospital in my Senate district
     that several years ago developed a highly
24
25
     successful orthopedic surgery program.
```

```
1
     program, the majority of patients participating
 2
     are receiving services paid for by commercial
                The rate that has been paid over
 3
     insurers.
 4
     several years has made it increasingly difficult
 5
     for the hospital to be financially successful.
                  And as I said earlier, this bill
 6
 7
     would provide legislative direction to the Health
 8
     Commissioner to be able to intervene and provide
 9
     necessary assistance.
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Thank
     you, Senator Valesky.
11
12
                  Senator Krueger.
13
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                     Through you,
     Mr. President, if the sponsor would yield.
14
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
     Valesky yields.
16
                  SENATOR VALESKY: Certainly.
17
18
                  SENATOR KRUEGER: How does this
19
     bill provide guidance to the Commissioner of
20
     Health to address this problem?
21
                  SENATOR VALESKY:
                                     Mr. President,
     through you, the bill would authorize,
22
     legislatively authorize the commissioner to
23
24
     intervene in negotiations between the hospital in
25
     question and the health insurer that serves the
```

```
1
     area, and to be able to provide that legislative
 2
     direction and guidance to in effect set a
 3
     different rate that would be more beneficial to
 4
     the hospital.
 5
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                     Through you,
     Mr. President, if the sponsor would yield.
 6
 7
                  SENATOR VALESKY
                                     Yes.
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
 9
     sponsor yields.
10
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                     So this
     legislation would authorize the commissioner to
11
     negotiate a different rate of payment with
12
     private insurance. Is that what he just said?
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
14
15
     Valesky.
16
                  SENATOR VALESKY:
                                     It would
     authorize the commissioner to do that for the
17
18
     period January 1, 2010, through December 31,
19
     2013.
            So retroactively.
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
20
                                     Through you,
21
     Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
22
     yield.
23
                  SENATOR VALESKY:
                                     Yes.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
24
                                              The
     sponsor yields.
25
```

```
Does the
 1
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
 2
     Department of Health now negotiate rates between
 3
     private insurance companies and hospitals for
 4
     anything prospective or retroactive?
 5
                  SENATOR VALESKY: Mr. President,
     through you, this is for a very specific
 6
 7
     procedure that we believe, in working with the
 8
     Health Department, that there would need to be
 9
     legislative clarification from us to authorize
     the Commissioner of Health to enter into that
10
11
     relationship.
12
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                      Through you,
     Mr. President, if the sponsor will continue to
13
14
     yield.
15
                  SENATOR VALESKY:
                                      Yes.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
     sponsor yields.
17
18
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                      Thank you.
19
                  Is this legislation just for
     negotiating with private insurance, or does it
20
21
     also encourage or require the State Department of
22
     Health to retroactively change the formula for
23
     Medicaid reimbursement for procedures at this
     hospital?
24
25
                  SENATOR VALESKY:
                                      Mr. President,
```

```
1
     this is for private health care carriers only.
     There is no Medicaid component to this
 2
 3
     legislation.
 4
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                      Through you,
 5
     Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
     yield.
 6
 7
                  SENATOR VALESKY:
                                      Yes.
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
 9
     sponsor yields.
10
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                      Thank you.
                  So again, this legislation gives the
11
12
     Department of Health Commissioner authority to
     negotiate between private health insurance plans
13
14
     and a private hospital. Why does he have the
15
     authority to do that now? Is it not a private
16
     company in negotiations with a private hospital?
     I'm confused about what his authority is and what
17
18
     authority we would be giving him with this
19
     legislation.
20
                  SENATOR VALESKY:
                                     Well,
21
     Mr. President, this legislation would authorize
22
     the commissioner to in effect serve as an
23
     arbitrator between this particular rural hospital
     in Central New York and the only insurance
24
25
     carrier that serves the region.
```

```
1
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                      Through you,
 2
     Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
 3
     yield.
 4
                  SENATOR VALESKY:
                                      Yes.
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
 6
     sponsor yields.
 7
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                      Thank you.
 8
                  I'm concerned about the precedent,
     Mr. President, and I'm --
 9
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
11
     Krueger, can you direct your question, please.
12
                  SENATOR KRUEGER: Yes, I'm getting
     there, Mr. President.
13
                  So I'm concerned about the
14
15
     precedent. This would be having the Commissioner
16
     of Health play a role of negotiator between
     private health insurance -- not government-funded
17
18
     health insurance -- private health insurance and
     a private hospital.
19
20
                  Would we be violating any other
21
     insurance laws? Because then conceivably why
     wouldn't each hospital who thinks it's not
22
     getting the right deal on insurance reimbursement
23
     also come to the State Department of Health and
24
25
     say, "Negotiate a better deal for me, too,
```

```
1
     please"? I'm very concerned about the
 2
     precedent.
 3
                  Could the sponsor answer the
 4
     question how, if we were to pass this, it doesn't
 5
     open up a whole new set of roles and
     responsibilities for the Commissioner of Health,
 6
 7
     a whole new set of roles and responsibilities for
 8
     the State of New York vis-a-vis setting rates of
 9
     private insurance companies?
10
                  SENATOR VALESKY:
                                      Well,
     Mr. President, I guess I can only answer that
11
12
     question through the fact that there has been no
     stated opposition from insurance companies,
13
     representatives of insurance companies, or anyone
14
15
     else, for that matter, to this piece of
16
     legislation.
17
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
18
     Krueger.
19
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                      Through you,
20
     Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
21
     yield.
22
                  SENATOR VALESKY:
                                      Yes.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
     sponsor yields.
24
25
                  SENATOR KRUEGER: Would this impact
```

```
1
     Medicaid reimbursement even though he says the
 2
     bill doesn't address Medicaid? Because if
 3
     insurance companies increase their payment for
 4
     these procedures, even retroactively, would there
 5
     be some expectation or assumption in the law that
     Medicaid would have to increase its reimbursement
 6
 7
     prospectively or retroactively for these
 8
     services?
 9
                  SENATOR VALESKY: Mr. President,
10
     no, it would not.
                  In fact, we have already addressed
11
12
     this issue.
                  This language was included in the
13
     Senate one-house budget that was approved by this
     house back in March. It was not included in the
14
15
     final budget that was adopted.
16
                  So this house, and working with the
17
     Assembly, my intent is to continue to pursue this
18
     legislative solution at this point in time.
                                                   The
19
     Assembly has already approved the bill, and I am
20
     hoping that my colleagues will join me in doing
21
     the same momentarily.
22
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                     Through you,
     Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
23
24
     yield.
25
                  SENATOR VALESKY:
                                      Yes.
```

```
1
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
 2
     sponsor yields.
 3
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                     I actually didn't
 4
     vote for that one-house budget bill, so I'm not
 5
     sure I agreed to it earlier.
                  Do we have an estimated cost of what
 6
 7
     the expected new revenue to the hospital would
 8
     be?
 9
                  SENATOR VALESKY:
                                     We do not.
10
                  SENATOR KRUEGER: Through you,
     Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
11
12
     yield.
13
                  SENATOR VALESKY:
                                     Yes.
14
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
15
     sponsor yields.
16
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                     What is the name
     of the insurance company that primarily provides
17
18
     insurance for the patients at this hospital
19
     receiving this care?
20
                  SENATOR VALESKY: Mr. President, I
21
     think it's typically the custom here -- and
22
     certainly the way the bill is written, the bill
23
     does not name the hospital that would be
     impacted.
24
25
                  But in the interest of expedited
```

```
debate here at this late hour, we'll indicate to
 1
     Senator Krueger that the Excellus Insurance
 2
 3
     Company is the insurance carrier in question.
 4
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                      Thank you.
 5
                  Through you, Mr. President, actually
     the hospital is named. It's the Community
 6
 7
     Memorial Hospital.
 8
                  But the sponsor had said earlier it
 9
     was a particular insurance company that the
10
     hospital worked with, so I did not think it was
11
     inappropriate to request the name of the
12
     insurance company.
13
                  Through you, Mr. President, if the
14
     sponsor would continue to yield.
15
                  SENATOR VALESKY:
                                      Yes.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
     sponsor yields.
17
18
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                      Since the earlier
     answer was there's no opposition, do we know if
19
20
     the Excellus Insurance Company thinks this is a
21
     good piece of legislation and supports it?
22
                  SENATOR VALESKY:
                                      Again,
23
     Mr. President, I have heard no opposition
     expressed from that particular insurance company.
24
25
                  And just to correct the record, the
```

```
bill that we're speaking about, Senate Bill 5690,
 1
 2
     there is no reference in this bill to the
     hospital in question. So I'm not sure, from
 3
 4
     Senator Krueger's previous statement, where she's
 5
     finding that, but I don't see that in the bill
 6
     we're speaking about.
 7
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                     Through you,
 8
     Mr. President, if I might answer.
                                        It's in the
 9
     official bill memo attached to the bill written I
10
     believe by Senator Valesky, the second to last
11
     paragraph of the bill memo. Actually, several
12
     times mentioned in the bill memo. So yes, it's
     not in the bill, it's in the bill memo.
13
14
                  Through you, Mr. President, on the
15
     bill.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
16
                                             Senator
     Krueger on the bill.
17
18
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
                                     There are so many
     hospitals in financial trouble in the State of
19
20
     New York: Small rural specialty hospitals -- as
21
     apparently this hospital, Community Memorial
22
     Hospital, is -- large hospitals such as the
     hospitals in Brooklyn that my colleagues have
23
     spent so much time over the last six, eight
24
25
     months trying to help make sure don't close
```

leaving large urban areas of Brooklyn without adequate hospital care.

I don't know one healthcare provider who has not come to me to tell me of their problems with rate reductions by the state, with squeezing by insurance companies, by confusion over where we all might be going in health insurance in the future.

We have gone through Medicaid redesign, we are attempting to implement the American Care Act. We are literally at a moment in time where everything is changing in healthcare hospitals and healthcare reimbursement. And there's a lot of problems. And I'm sure this is a real problem for this hospital. I do not intend in any way to minimize my understanding of the difficulties they are having. And I would even say I would like the state to be able to help all the hospitals that are in trouble in our state.

What I can't support and why I can't vote for this bill is I don't actually understand how empowering or ordering our State Commissioner of Health to negotiate between a private health insurance company and a specific hospital is a

good precedent for the state.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

I have to believe, if they're not successful, somehow it's the State Department of Health Commissioner's fault. And, if he is successful, why every single hospital and healthcare provider in the State of New York wouldn't be lining up in front of his office the immediate next day saying "Now negotiate for us." Because why wouldn't we do that?

9

We seem to be struggling ourselves to establish rates of payment through government-funded health insurance that we can justify asking for taxpayer assistance with, balancing our budget while trying to meet our needs of public health costs and public health insurance reimbursement rates. Which have also been reduced, causing great pain to hospitals with a higher rate of Medicaid use than apparently this hospital has, at least according to the sponsor's memo.

And so it's very possible no one has said "No," in a memo, "this is a bad idea." And yes, apparently the Assembly passed it 6/18, two days ago.

But I have to believe it's not good

```
public policy for the State of New York.
 1
 2
     that the concept of saying our Commissioner of
 3
     Health is supposed to go in and negotiate rates
 4
     between individual hospitals and individual
 5
     insurance companies isn't the right way to
     approach the problems and the growing pains and
 6
 7
     the real issues we are facing between hospitals
     and payment of healthcare all over the state.
 8
 9
                  So I cannot vote for this bill,
10
     Mr. President. Thank you.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
11
                                              Seeing
12
     and hearing no other Senator wishing to be
     heard -- Senator Hannon.
13
14
                  SENATOR HANNON:
                                    Mr. President, I
15
     just want to comment on this bill.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
16
                                              Senator
     Hannon on the bill.
17
18
                  SENATOR HANNON: First of all, in
     regard to whether this is some type of
19
20
     extraordinary intervention, let me point out that
     the state, by budget, change.
21
                                    The way we set
22
     rates for all hospitals.
                               In the case of the
     situation described here, which is orthopedic
23
     cases, they changed what they call the DRG, the
24
25
     diagnostic related group, and lowered the price.
```

1 This little hospital suffered a severe drop in reimbursement. There was one 2 other hospital like that, but that was the 3 4 hospital for Special Surgery, which may or may 5 not be in Senator Krueger's district, but it's real close. But they had a decent way of 6 7 negotiating because of their very valued name. 8 This little hospital did not. 9 So the question would be, how do you 10 rectify that? So for a certain specific situation it talks about having an intervention, 11 12 like an arbitration, to try to rectify what we in the Legislature did by changing the diagnostic 13 14 related groups. 15 Questions of hospitals in trouble, we have any number of different things we're 16 trying to do, will do, have done. We've done two 17 18 just in the last calendar, one for the hospital 19 up in Lake Placid, one for a hospital in my 20 district, one for a hospital in Westchester. It's actually three bills. 21 So looking at these on a specific 22 basis, trying to save something that ought to be 23 saved, this is what this bill is doing. 24

I congratulate Senator Valesky, and

```
1
     I would urge its approval.
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Are there
 3
     any other Senators who wish to be heard?
 4
                  Seeing and hearing none, the debate
 5
     is closed. The Secretary will ring the bell.
                  Read the last section.
 6
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
 7
 8
     act shall take effect immediately.
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
10
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
11
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Senator
     Valesky to explain his vote.
13
14
                  SENATOR VALESKY:
                                     Thank you,
15
     Mr. President. I just want to take one
16
     moment --
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Can I
17
18
     have some order in the house, please.
19
                  Senator Valesky.
20
                  SENATOR VALESKY: -- just take a
21
     moment to thank all of my constituents for
     helping to solve an important issue and provide
22
     critical healthcare in the rural part of the
23
     state in Central New York.
24
25
                  And I also want to thank the
```

```
1
     chairman of the Health Committee, Senator Hannon,
 2
     for putting this narrow issue in a broader
 3
     context. Thank you, Senator.
 4
                  Thank you, members of the Senate,
 5
     for supporting this bill. I vote in the
     affirmative.
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
 8
     Valesky to be recorded in the affirmative.
 9
                  Announce the results.
10
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
     Calendar 1537, those recorded in the negative are
11
12
     Senators Krueger, Rivera, Sanders and Serrano.
13
                  Ayes, 59. Nays, 4.
14
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
15
     is passed.
16
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     1549, by Senator Ball, Senate Print 5815, an act
17
18
     to amend the Public Authorities Law.
19
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Lay it aside for
20
     the day.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
21
                                             The bill
22
     is laid aside for the day.
23
                  Senator Libous, that would complete
     the controversial reading of Senate Supplemental
24
     Calendar 56B.
25
```

```
SENATOR LIBOUS:
                                    Thank you,
 1
     Mr. President.
 2
 3
                  Could we return to motions, please.
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             We will
 5
     return to motions and resolutions.
                  Senator Libous.
 6
 7
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: On behalf of
     Senator Ranzenhofer, I wish to call up his bill,
 8
     Senate Print 5845, which is now at the desk.
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
10
                                             The
     Secretary will read.
11
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12
     1552, by Senator Ranzenhofer, Senate Print 5845,
13
     an act to amend the Executive Law.
14
15
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: I now move to
     reconsider the vote by which this bill was
16
17
     passed.
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll on reconsideration.
19
20
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
21
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
22
     is restored to third reading.
23
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President,
24
25
     pursuant to Rule 6, Section 2, the Senate will
```

```
convene after midnight. We will remain in
 1
 2
     session after midnight.
 3
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: All in
 4
     favor signify say aye.
 5
                  (Response of "Aye.")
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Opposed?
 6
 7
                  (No response.)
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             We shall
 9
     continue.
10
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President, we
     didn't have to take it to a vote, but it's nice
11
     that it was unanimous.
12
13
                  (Laughter.)
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President, if
14
15
     you could call on Senator Serrano.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator
     Serrano.
17
18
                  SENATOR SERRANO: Mr. President
19
     there will be an immediate meeting of the Senate
20
     Democratic Conference in Room 315.
21
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             There
22
     will be an immediate meeting of the Senate
     Democratic Conference in Room 315.
23
                  Senator Libous.
24
25
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President,
```

```
before the Democrats run off to conference, we'll
 1
 2
     have a Rules meeting at 12:15 in Room 332. We
 3
     could then report those bills out, come back to
 4
     the floor, and I think we could get out of here
 5
     rather quickly after that.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 6
                                              There
 7
     will be a Rules Committee meeting at 12:15 in
 8
     Room 332.
 9
                  The Senate stands temporarily at
10
     ease.
                  (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease
11
12
     at 11:48 p.m.)
13
                  (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at
     12:50 a.m.)
14
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
16
     Senate will come to order.
17
                  Senator Libous.
18
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: If we can return
     to reports of standing committees, I believe
19
20
     there's a report of the Rules Committee at the
21
     desk. I ask that it be read at this time.
22
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
23
     of standing committees.
                  There is a report of the Rules
24
25
     Committee at the desk. The Secretary will read.
```

```
1
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                    Senator Skelos,
 2
     from the Committee on Rules, reports the
     following bills:
 3
 4
                  Senate Print 1561C, by Senator
 5
     LaValle, an act to amend the Education Law;
                  Senate 2089, by Senator Griffo, an
 6
 7
     act to amend the Banking Law;
                  Senate 3131A, by Senator Martins, an
 8
     act to amend the Workers' Compensation Law;
9
10
                  Senate 3590, by Senator Griffo, an
11
     act to amend the General Municipal Law;
12
                  Senate 3652, by Senator Stavisky, an
     act to amend the Criminal Procedure Law;
13
14
                  Senate 4358A, by Senator Little, an
15
     act to amend the Parks, Recreation and Historic
     Preservation Law;
16
                  Senate 4526B, by Senator Hannon, an
17
18
     act to amend the Insurance Law;
19
                  Senate 4907, by Senator Golden, an
20
     act to amend the State Finance Law;
                  Senate 5102A, by Senator Carlucci,
21
22
     an act to amend the Mental Hygiene Law;
                  Senate 5376A, by Senator Seward, an
23
     act to amend the Workers' Compensation Law;
24
25
                  Senate 5414A, by Senator Klein, an
```

```
act to amend the Social Services Law;
 1
 2
                  Senate 5669, by the Committee on
     Rules, an act to amend the Retirement and Social
 3
 4
     Security Law;
 5
                  Senate 5670A, by the Committee on
     Rules, an act to amend the Retirement and Social
 6
 7
     Security Law;
                  Senate 5743, by Senator Grisanti, an
 8
     act to amend the Social Services Law;
9
                  Senate 5767, by Senator Golden, an
10
11
     act in relation to authorizing;
12
                  Senate 5865, by Senator Martins, an
     act to amend the State Finance Law;
13
14
                  Senate 5867, by Senator Savino, an
15
     act to amend the Labor Law;
                  Senate 4090, by Senator Savino, an
16
     act to amend the Workers' Compensation Law;
17
18
                  Senate 4674, by Senator Carlucci, an
     act authorizing;
19
20
                  Senate 5218, by Senator Seward, an
21
     act to amend the Insurance Law;
                  Senate 5842A, by Senator Felder, an
22
     act to amend the Education Law;
23
                  And Senate Print 5844, by the
24
25
     Committee on Rules, an act to amend the Public
```

```
Service Law.
 1
 2
                  All bills reported direct to third
 3
     reading.
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
 5
     Libous.
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President, I
 6
 7
     move to accept the report of the Rules Committee.
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              All in
9
     favor of accepting the Committee on Rules report
10
     signify by saying aye.
11
                  (Response of "Aye.")
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Opposed?
13
                  (No response.)
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
14
                                              The
15
     Committee on Rules report is accepted.
16
                  Senator Libous.
17
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Okay,
18
     Mr. President, I just want to be clear with
19
     everybody. You have two supplemental active
20
     lists on your desks. They're labeled Active List
     2 and Active List 3. We will take up Active List
21
     2 first.
22
                  And at this time if we could have
23
     the noncontroversial reading of Supplemental
24
25
     Active List 2.
```

```
1
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Senator
 2
     Rivera, why do you rise? As a point of
 3
     information?
                  SENATOR RIVERA: Point of
 4
     clarification, Mr. President. Are we on Active
 5
    List 3 or Active List 2?
 6
 7
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Supplemental
 8
     Active List 2 will be the first one we'll take
9
     up.
10
                  SENATOR RIVERA:
                                    Thank you.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
11
12
     Supplemental Active List 2. The Secretary will
13
     read.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14
15
     232, by Senator Martins --
16
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Lay it aside for
     the day.
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Lay the
19
    bill aside for the day.
20
                  THE SECRETARY: On page 9, Senator
21
    DeFrancisco moves to discharge, from the
22
     Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill Number 246 and
     substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
23
    Number 2953, Third Reading Calendar 308.
24
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
```

```
substitution is so ordered.
 1
 2
                  The Secretary will read.
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Calendar Number
 3
 4
     308, by Member of the Assembly Farrell, Assembly
 5
     Print 246, an act in relation to establishing.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 6
                                             Read the
 7
     last section.
 8
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 2.
                                               This
     act shall take effect immediately.
 9
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
11
12
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
     DeFrancisco to explain his vote.
14
15
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Yes, this is
     a very important bill. We all praised the
16
     nomination of Kristin Proud yesterday, I think.
17
18
     I can't remember. But in any event, one of the
19
     things that was mentioned was that she was taking
20
     a pay cut to become the commissioner because the
21
     supervisors have not been getting pay raises, and
22
     that permeates the entire state system.
23
                  So this just provides for a
     commission just like the Judicial Commission to
24
25
     discuss pay raises for the management/
```

```
confidential employees, and I'd appreciate
 1
 2
     everyone's support. Thank you.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Announce
 3
 4
     the results.
 5
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62. Nays,
     1. Senator Ball recorded in the negative.
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is passed.
 8
9
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10
     314, by Senator Marcellino, Senate --
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Lay it aside for
11
12
     the day.
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Lay the
    bill aside for the day.
14
15
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16
     393, by Senator Golden, Senate Print 4444A, an
     act to amend the Civil Practice Law and Rules.
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
19
20
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 8. This
21
     act shall take effect on the first of January.
22
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
23
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
```

```
Calendar Number 393, those recorded in the
 1
 2
    negative are Senators Espaillat,
    Hassell-Thompson, Hoylman, Montgomery and
 3
 4
     Perkins. Also Senators Parker and Peralta.
 5
                  Ayes, 56. Nays, 7.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 6
 7
     is passed.
 8
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9
     400, by Senator Ranzenhofer, Senate Print 3483,
10
     an act to amend the Alcoholic Beverage Control
11
     Law.
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
13
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
14
15
     act shall take effect on the 90th day.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
17
18
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
19
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 61. Nays,
20
     2. Senators Ball and Hassell-Thompson recorded
     in the negative.
21
22
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
23
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: On page 13, Senator
24
25
    Robach moves to discharge, from the Committee on
```

```
Rules, Assembly Bill Number 5715A and substitute
 1
 2
     it for the identical Senate Bill Number 4180B,
 3
     Third Reading Calendar 419.
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
     substitution is so ordered.
 5
 6
                  The Secretary will read.
 7
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 8
     419, by Member of the Assembly DenDekker,
 9
     Assembly Print 5715A, an act to amend the
10
     Education Law.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
11
     last section.
12
13
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                               This
     act shall take effect immediately
14
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
16
     roll.
17
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Announce
     the results.
19
20
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
21
     Calendar 419, those recorded in the negative are
22
     Senators Ball, DeFrancisco, Farley, Griffo,
     Marchione, Maziarz and Seward.
23
                  Ayes, 56. Nays, 7.
24
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
```

```
1
     is passed.
 2
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 3
     436, by Senator Golden, Senate Print 3851B, an
 4
     act to amend the Real Property Tax Law.
 5
                  SENATOR GIANARIS: Lay it aside.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Lay the
 6
 7
    bill aside.
 8
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9
     469, by Senator Young, Senate Print 4396, an act
10
     to amend the Soil and Water Conservation
11
    Districts Law.
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
13
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
14
15
     act shall take effect immediately.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
17
18
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
19
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
21
     is passed.
22
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     483, by Senator Marcellino, Senate Print 3812, an
23
     act to amend the Tax Law.
24
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
```

```
last section.
 1
 2
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 37. This
 3
     act shall take effect December 1, 2014.
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 5
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 6
 7
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62. Nays,
 8
     1. Senator Ball recorded in the negative.
9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
10
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11
12
     516, by Senator Larkin, Senate Print 273A, an act
     to amend the Tax Law.
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
14
15
     last section.
16
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
     act shall take effect April 1, 2014.
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
19
20
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
21
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Announce
22
     the results.
23
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
     Calendar Number 516, those recorded in the
24
25
    negative are Senators Adams, Addabbo, Avella,
```

```
Diaz, Espaillat, Gianaris, Hassell-Thompson,
 1
 2
    Hoylman, Krueger, Latimer, Montgomery, Parker,
     Peralta, Perkins, Rivera, Sanders, Serrano,
 3
 4
     Squadron, Stavisky, Stewart-Cousins and Tkaczyk.
 5
                  Ayes, 42. Nays, 21.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 6
 7
     is passed.
 8
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9
     547, by Senator Stavisky, Senate Print 1303, an
10
     act to amend the Abandoned Property Law.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
11
     last section.
12
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 3.
                                               This
13
     act shall take effect on the 60th day.
14
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
16
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
17
18
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61. Nays 2.
     Senators Ball and Marchione in the negative.
19
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
21
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22
     606, by Senator Golden, Senate Print 3074, an act
23
     to amend the Criminal Procedure Law.
24
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Read the
```

```
last section.
 1
 2
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 5. This
 3
     act shall take effect immediately.
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 5
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Announce
 8
     the results.
 9
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
10
     Calendar 606, those recorded in the negative are
     Senators Espaillat, Hassell-Thompson, Hoylman,
11
12
    Krueger, Montgomery, Parker, Peralta, Perkins,
     Rivera, Sanders, Serrano, Squadron and Stavisky.
13
14
                  Ayes, 50. Nays, 13.
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
16
     is passed.
17
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Calendar Number
18
     626, by Senator Peralta, Senate Print 40, an act
     to amend the Penal Law.
19
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
21
     last section.
22
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 2.
                                               This
     act shall take effect on the first of November.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
24
25
     roll.
```

```
(The Secretary called the roll.)
 1
 2
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
                                             The bill
 3
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 4
     is passed.
 5
                  THE SECRETARY: On page 20, Senator
     Felder moves to discharge, from the Committee on
 6
     Rules, Assembly Bill Number 6881A and substitute
 7
     it for the identical Senate Bill Number 4880A,
 8
     Third Reading Calendar 644.
 9
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
     substitution is so ordered.
11
12
                  The Secretary will read.
13
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14
     644, by Member of the Assembly Benedetto,
15
     Assembly Print 6881A, an act to amend the
16
     Education Law.
17
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
18
     last section.
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
19
                                               This
20
     act shall take effect immediately.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
21
22
     roll.
23
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   In relation to
24
25
     Calendar Number 644, those recorded in the
```

```
1
     negative are Senators Hassell-Thompson,
 2
     Montgomery, Nozzolio and Perkins.
 3
                  Ayes, 59. Nays, 4.
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 5
     is passed.
 6
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 7
     681, by Senator Carlucci, Senate Print 1639A, an
 8
     act to amend the Navigation Law.
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
10
                  SENATOR STAVISKY: Section 7. This
11
     act shall take effect on the first of May.
12
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
14
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
15
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Announce
     the results.
17
18
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
     Calendar Number 681, those recorded in the
19
20
     negative are Senators Ball, Farley, Griffo,
21
     Lanza, Libous, Little, Marchione, Nozzolio,
22
     Ranzenhofer, Ritchie, Robach, Seward and Young.
23
                  Ayes, 50. Nays, 13.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
24
25
     is still passed.
```

```
1
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   On page 22, Senator
 2
     Lanza moves to discharge, from the Committee on
     Cities, Assembly Bill Number 7058 and substitute
 3
 4
     it for the identical Senate Bill Number 4802,
 5
     Third Reading Calendar 699.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 6
                                              The
 7
     substitution is so ordered.
 8
                  The Secretary will read.
 9
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10
     699, by Member of the Assembly Rosa, Assembly
     Print Number 7058, an act to amend the Real
11
12
     Property Tax Law.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
13
     last section.
14
15
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 2.
     act shall take effect immediately.
16
                                              Call the
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
17
18
     roll.
19
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
20
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
21
                                              The bill
     is passed.
22
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   On page 24, Senator
23
     Little moves to discharge, from the Committee on
24
25
     Rules, Assembly Bill Number 5503 and substitute
```

```
it for the identical Senate Bill Number 2644,
 1
 2
     Third Reading Calendar 791.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 3
     Substitution so ordered.
 4
 5
                  The Secretary will read.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 6
 7
     791, by Member of the Assembly Galef, Assembly
 8
     Print Number 5503, an act to amend the Real
 9
     Property Tax Law.
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
11
12
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 4.
                                               This
     act shall take effect on the first of January.
13
14
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Call the
15
     roll.
16
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
17
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Announce
18
     the results.
19
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
20
     Calendar Number 791, those recorded in the
21
     negative are Senators Avella, Espaillat, Gipson,
22
     Hassell-Thompson, Hoylman, Krueger, Marchione,
     Perkins, Rivera, Sanders and Squadron. Also
23
     Senator Robach.
24
25
                  Ayes, 51. Nays, 12.
```

```
The bill
 1
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 2
     is passed.
 3
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     825, by Senator LaValle, Senate Print 2007, an
 4
 5
     act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
 6
 7
     last section.
 8
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 3.
                                               This
     act shall take effect immediately.
9
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
11
12
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
13
                                             Announce
14
     the results.
15
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
16
     Calendar 825, those recorded in the negative are
     Senators Ball, Bonacic, DeFrancisco, Farley,
17
18
     Gallivan, Gipson, Griffo, Kennedy, Lanza, Little,
19
     Marchione, Maziarz, Nozzolio, O'Mara, Peralta,
20
    Ranzenhofer, Ritchie, Robach, Young and Zeldin.
21
                  Ayes, 43. Nays, 20.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
22
     is passed.
23
                  THE SECRETARY: Also in the
24
25
    negative: Senator Seward.
```

```
1
                  Ayes, 42. Nays, 21.
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 3
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 4
 5
     927, by Senator Young, Senate Print 5247, an act
     to amend the Local Law.
 6
 7
                  SENATOR GIANARIS: Lay it aside,
 8
    please.
9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Lay the
10
    bill aside.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11
     960, by Senator Gianaris, Senate Print 595A, an
12
13
     act to amend the Education Law.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
14
15
     last section.
16
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
     act shall take effect on the 30th day.
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
19
20
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
21
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Announce
22
     the results.
23
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
24
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
25
     is passed.
```

```
1
                  THE SECRETARY: On page 38, Senator
 2
     Savino moves to discharge, from the Committee on
    Rules, Assembly Bill Number 7736 and substitute
 3
 4
     it for the identical Senate Bill Number 5397A,
 5
     Third Reading Calendar 1042.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 6
                                             The
 7
     substitution is so ordered.
 8
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Lay it aside for
9
     the day.
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is laid aside for the day.
11
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12
     1075, by Senator Gipson, Senate Print 5411A, an
13
14
     act to amend the Town Law.
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
16
     last section.
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 3.
                                               This
17
18
     act shall take effect immediately.
19
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
20
     roll.
21
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
22
                                             Senator
    DeFrancisco to explain his vote.
23
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO: Yes, before I
24
25
    decide whether to vote, I just want to make sure
```

```
Senator Gipson is not offended by the lateness of
 1
 2
     the hour in which this bill is passed.
 3
                  (Laughter.)
 4
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO:
                                          Since
 5
     apparently he's not offended, I vote aye.
 6
                  (Laughter.)
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
 8
     DeFrancisco to be recorded in the affirmative.
 9
                  Announce the results.
10
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The bill
11
     is passed.
12
13
                  Senator Gianaris, why do you rise?
                  SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
14
15
     Senator DeFrancisco stole my laugh line. I was
16
     going to point out the appropriateness that
     Senator Gipson's very first bill is a vampire
17
18
     bill.
19
                  (Applause; laughter.)
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
21
     Congratulations, Count Gipson.
22
                  (Laughter.)
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
     Secretary will continue.
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
```

```
1097, by Senator Felder, Senate Print 5068A, an
 1
 2
     act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
 3
     last section.
 4
 5
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                               This
     act shall take effect on the 90th day.
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 8
     roll.
 9
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
10
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
11
12
     is passed.
13
                  THE SECRETARY: On page 46, Senator
     Little moves to discharge, from the Committee on
14
15
     Civil Service and Pensions, Assembly Bill Number
     5012 and substitute it for the identical Senate
16
     Bill Number 3181, Third Reading Calendar 1325.
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
     substitution is ordered.
19
20
                  The Secretary will read.
21
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     1325, by Member of the Assembly Stec, Assembly
22
     Print 5012, an act to authorize.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
24
25
     last section.
```

```
1
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 2. This
 2
     act shall take effect immediately.
 3
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
 4
 5
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 6
                                             Announce
 7
     the results.
 8
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59. Nays,
     4. Senators Ball, Hassell-Thompson, Peralta and
9
10
     Sanders recorded in the negative.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
11
12
     is passed.
13
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14
     1359, by Senator Seward, Senate Print 5165, an
15
     act to amend the Retirement and Social Security
16
    Law.
17
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
18
     last section.
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
19
20
     act shall take effect immediately.
21
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
22
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
23
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 60. Nays,
24
25
     3. Senators Ball, Gipson and Savino recorded in
```

```
1
     the negative.
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 3
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 4
 5
     1404, by Senator Farley, Senate Print 5678, an
     act to amend the Religious Corporations Law.
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
 8
     last section.
 9
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                               This
10
     act shall take effect on the 30th day.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
11
     roll.
12
13
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
14
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
16
     is passed.
17
                  Senator Libous, that completes the
18
     noncontroversial reading of Supplemental Active
     List Number 2.
19
20
                  SENATOR LIBOUS:
                                    Thank you,
21
     Mr. President.
22
                  We're now going to go to the
     Supplemental Active List Number 3, and that list
23
     starts with Calendar Number 349. If we could
24
25
     please do the noncontroversial reading.
```

```
1
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             We will
 2
     have the noncontroversial reading of Supplemental
 3
     Active List 3, beginning with Calendar 349.
 4
                  The Secretary will read.
 5
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     349, by Senator Grisanti, Senate Print 717, an
 6
 7
     act to amend the Civil Service Law.
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
9
     last section.
10
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 2.
                                               This
     act shall take effect immediately.
11
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
13
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
14
15
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
     is passed.
17
18
                  THE SECRETARY: On page 14, Senator
19
     Grisanti moves to discharge, from the Committee
20
     on Rules, Assembly Bill Number 740A and
21
     substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
22
     Number 3753A, Third Reading Calendar 455.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
     substitution is so ordered.
24
25
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Lay it aside for
```

```
the day, Mr. President.
 1
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 3
     is laid aside for the day.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 4
 5
     933, by Senator Latimer, Senate Print 4848, an
     act to amend the Education Law.
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
 8
     last section.
9
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
10
     act shall take effect immediately.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
11
     roll.
12
13
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
14
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
16
     is passed.
17
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18
     942, by Senator Golden, Senate Print 5070, an act
     to amend the Civil Service Law.
19
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
21
22
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
23
     act shall take effect immediately.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
24
25
     roll.
```

```
(The Secretary called the roll.)
 1
 2
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
 3
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is passed.
 4
 5
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     998, by Senator DeFrancisco, Senate Print 3035,
 6
 7
     an act to amend the Tax Law.
 8
                  SENATOR GIANARIS: Lay it aside.
9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Lay the
10
    bill aside.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11
     1203, by Senator Bonacic, Senate Print 4763, an
12
     act to amend the Civil Practice Law and Rules.
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
14
15
     last section.
16
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
     act shall take effect immediately.
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
19
20
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
21
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61. Nays,
22
     2. Senators Ball and Hannon recorded in the
23
    negative.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
24
25
     is passed.
```

```
Senator Libous, that completes the
 1
 2
    noncontroversial reading of Supplemental Active
 3
     List 3.
 4
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President, can
 5
     I have unanimous consent to take up the
    noncontroversial reading of Calendar Number 998
 6
 7
     again.
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Without
9
     objection, the Secretary will read.
10
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     998, by Senator DeFrancisco, Senate Print 3035,
11
     an act to amend the Tax Law.
12
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
14
15
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
16
     act shall take effect immediately.
17
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
18
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
19
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Senator
21
    Krueger to explain your vote.
                  SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you,
22
    Mr. President.
23
                  This is a bill that would decrease
24
25
     the estate tax for a relatively tiny number of
```

```
estates in the State of New York. It would have
 1
 2
     minimal impact on any family farms or
     businesses. And yet when fully enacted, it would
 3
 4
     leave a $350 million hole in our budget.
 5
                  In previous days we have all
     discussed how we don't want to do unfunded
 6
 7
     mandates, we don't want to leave ourselves with
 8
     unbalanced budgets, we want to cap our budgets.
 9
     But these kinds of bills that leave such enormous
10
     holes -- $350 million in lost revenue for the
11
     State of New York -- this is not a justifiable
     bill.
12
13
                  I vote no.
                              Thank you.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
14
                                              Senator
15
     Krueger to be recorded in the negative.
16
                  Announce the results.
17
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   In relation to
18
     Calendar Number 998, those recorded in the
19
     negative are Senators Avella, Gianaris,
20
     Hassell-Thompson, Hoylman, Krueger, Montgomery,
21
     Peralta, Perkins, Rivera, Sanders, Serrano,
22
     Squadron and Stavisky. Also Senator Dilan.
23
                  Ayes, 49. Nays, 14.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
24
25
     is passed.
```

```
Senator Libous, that completes the
 1
 2
    noncontroversial reading of Senate Supplemental
 3
     Active List 3.
 4
                  SENATOR LIBOUS:
                                    Mr. President,
 5
    we're going to go to this Senate Supplemental
     Calendar Number 56C. So if everybody would go to
 6
 7
     56C. It says C, 56C. If you have a calendar
 8
     that says 56D, I want it back.
 9
                  (Laughter.)
10
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: At this time we'll
     the noncontroversial reading of Supplemental
11
     Calendar 56C.
12
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             We will
    begin the noncontroversial reading of Senate
14
15
     Supplemental Calendar 56C.
16
                  The Secretary will read.
17
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Calendar Number
18
     1540, by Senator LaValle, Senate Print 1561C, an
     act to amend the Education Law.
19
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
21
     last section.
22
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                               This
23
     act shall take effect immediately.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
24
25
     roll.
```

```
(The Secretary called the roll.)
 1
 2
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62. Nays,
 3
     1. Senator Ball recorded in the negative.
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
 5
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 6
 7
     1554, by Senator Griffo, Senate Print 2089, an
 8
     act to amend the Banking Law.
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
10
     last section.
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 6.
                                               This
11
12
     act shall take effect on the 90th day.
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
14
     roll.
15
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                            Announce
     the results.
17
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59. Nays,
18
     4. Senators Bonacic, Fuschillo, Little and
19
20
    Ranzenhofer recorded in the negative.
21
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
22
     is passed.
23
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
     Calendar Number 1555, Senator Martins moves to
24
25
     discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
```

```
Bill Number 5940C and substitute it for the
 1
 2
     identical Senate Bill Number 3131A, Third Reading
 3
     Calendar 1555.
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
     substitution is so ordered.
 5
 6
                  The Secretary will read.
 7
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 8
     1555, by Member of the Assembly Bronson, Assembly
 9
     Print Number 5940C, an act to amend the Workers'
10
     Compensation Law.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
11
     last section.
12
13
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 3.
                                               This
     act shall take effect on the 180th day.
14
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
16
     roll.
17
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
18
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61. Nays,
     2. Senators Ball and Maziarz recorded in the
19
20
    negative. Also Senator Gipson.
21
                  Ayes, 60. Nays, 3.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
22
23
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
24
25
     Calendar Number 1556, Senator Griffo moves to
```

```
discharge, from the Committee on Local
 1
 2
     Government, Assembly Bill Number 400 and
     substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
 3
     Number 3590, Third Reading Calendar 1556.
 4
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The
     substitution is so ordered.
 6
 7
                  The Secretary will read.
 8
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9
     1556, by Member of the Assembly Magnarelli,
10
     Assembly Print 400, an act to amend the General
     Municipal Law.
11
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
13
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
14
15
     act shall take effect immediately.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
17
18
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
19
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
21
     is passed.
22
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23
     1557, by Senator Stavisky, Senate Print 3652, an
     act to amend the Criminal Procedure Law.
24
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Read the
```

```
last section.
 1
 2
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
 3
     act shall take effect immediately.
 4
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
 5
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
 6
 7
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
9
     is passed.
10
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
     1558, by Senator Little, Senate Print 4358A, an
11
     act to amend the Parks, Recreation and Historic
12
    Preservation Law.
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
14
15
     last section.
16
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
     act shall take effect immediately.
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
19
20
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
21
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62. Nays,
22
     1. Senator Avella recorded in the negative.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is passed.
24
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
25
```

```
Calendar Number 1559, Senator Hannon moves to
 1
 2
     discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
     Bill Number 6519B and substitute it for the
 3
 4
     identical Senate Bill Number 4526B, Third Reading
 5
     Calendar 1559.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 6
                                              The
 7
     substitution is so ordered.
 8
                  The Secretary will read.
 9
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10
     1559, by Member of the Assembly Silver, Assembly
     Print 6519B, an act to amend the Insurance Law.
11
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
13
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
14
15
     act shall take effect immediately.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
17
18
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
19
                                              Senator
20
     Krueger to explain her vote.
                  SENATOR KRUEGER:
21
                                     Thank you,
     Mr. President. I rise to explain why I must vote
22
     no on this bill.
23
                  It's actually very unusual to find
24
25
     yourself in a situation where you have the
```

Chambers of Commerce, Business Council,
healthcare advocates, health insurance companies
all in agreement that we shouldn't do this bill.

Now, the Freelancers Program was started at a time before we had other options.

And it was an important option to make available to freelancers who could find insurance nowhere else in the system. And so I certainly supported them in the past.

But we are now in a world of a healthcare exchange implementation, the American Care Act, and it turns out that allowing the freelancers to continue, as this program does -- excuse me, allowing this insurance program to continue, as this bill does, we are actually setting up an unfair situation between many other types of health insurance and the healthcare exchange.

And we actually leave people in a program that it turns out may very well be a lesser program for them than other options available. I understand it's just a one-year extender. In my opinion, it would be a disaster if we went any further. But frankly, this bill should also be amended to ensure that it is not

```
1
     opening the book on new enrollees for only a
 2
     one-year period. It should require that all
     current enrollees get full notice of the New York
 3
 4
     Health Benefit Exchange options and the
 5
     possibility that they could be eligible right now
     for financial assistance to purchase that
 6
 7
     coverage thanks to federal dollars.
                  And the bill should be further
 8
     amended to include consumer protections similar
 9
10
     to HMO protections for those who remain in the
     freelancers coverage, if they face any inadequacy
11
12
     in network coverage for their specialized health
     needs, because unfortunately this health
13
14
     insurance package has not been rated very highly
15
     by the state.
16
                  So I wish that there was time to
17
     amend the bill, because that would be the right
18
     answer. We don't have that, so I'll be voting
19
     no.
20
                  Thank you, Mr. President.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
21
                                              Senator
22
     Krueger to be recorded in the negative.
                  Senator Hannon to explain his vote.
23
24
                  SENATOR HANNON:
                                    As sponsor of this
25
     bill, I just want to correct a few factual
```

mistakes that have been proffered.

First of all, as I understand it, the healthcare plans have withdrawn any objection to this. They know that this is an extension just for one year, so this very unique system of giving insurance that we have in this state to freelancers can continue.

Second, what we do is not that dissimilar -- in fact, it's almost identical to what we did in the budget when we protected what's called a PEO, which is a professional employee organization. And those professional employee organizations are basically the aggregate of individuals, either very, very small businesses or individual businesses. So we are just extending the same protection. This is not that unique.

Thirdly, they can take new people during the one year that we extend, but each of those people who enter are given notice that it's only for one year. After we put the notice in the bill, it was then suggested, well, maybe you shouldn't allow them in at all. But frankly that was an afterthought by some of the people objecting.

1 And lastly, the reason that the 2 Chambers of Commerce have voiced opposition is not that they're opposed per se to this system, 3 4 but rather they wanted to do the same thing. 5 So -- you know, and they were left out. But I will tell you personally I had 6 7 told the folks who represent the chambers they should be speaking up, and I told them that two 8 years ago when this Senate had a roundtable on 9 10 how to implement the Affordable Care Act. So I think this is a reasonable 11 12 compromise. We have something very unique in our workforce in the metropolitan area, the freelance 13 14 industry, whether it be artisan or whether it be 15 programmers, it can go in any number of different 16 directions. I think we should move forward. We 17 18 have the Affordable Care Act, which will only start coverage on January 1, 2014. This will 19 20 give the freelancers one year within that, they either sink or they swim. 21 22 So I would recommend that we support this measure. 23 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: 24 Senator Hannon to be recorded in the affirmative.

```
Announce the results.
 1
 2
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   In relation to
 3
     Calendar 1559, those recorded in the negative are
 4
     Senators Ball, DeFrancisco, Krueger, Nozzolio,
 5
     Ranzenhofer, Rivera, Sanders, Seward and Zeldin.
                  Ayes, 54. Nays, 9.
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 8
     is passed.
 9
                  THE SECRETARY: Also Senator Lanza
10
     in the negative.
                  Ayes, 53. Nays, 10.
11
12
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is passed.
13
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
14
15
     Calendar Number 1560, Senator Golden moves to
16
     discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
     Bill Number 6867 and substitute it for the
17
18
     identical Senate Bill Number 4907, Third Reading
     Calendar 1560.
19
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
21
     substitution is so ordered.
22
                  There is a home-rule message at the
23
     desk.
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Lay it aside for
24
25
     the day.
```

```
1
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             And the
 2
     bill will be laid aside for the day.
 3
                  The Secretary will read Calendar
     Number 1561.
 4
 5
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
     Calendar Number 1561, Senator Carlucci moves to
 6
 7
     discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
 8
     Bill Number 7313A and substitute it for the
 9
     identical Senate Bill Number 5102A, Third Reading
10
     Calendar 1561.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
11
     substitution is ordered.
12
13
                  The Secretary will read.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14
15
     1561, by Member of the Assembly Abinanti,
16
     Assembly Print 7313A, an act to amend the Mental
     Hygiene Law.
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
19
20
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                               This
21
     act shall take effect on the 180th day.
22
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
23
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 62. Nays,
```

```
1. Senator Marchione recorded in the negative.
 1
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
 3
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 4
 5
     1562, by Senator Seward, Senate Print 5376A, an
     act to amend the Workers' Compensation Law.
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
 8
     last section.
9
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
10
     act shall take effect immediately.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
11
     roll.
12
13
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
14
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
16
     is passed.
17
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18
     1563, by Senator Klein, Senate Print 5414A, an
     act to amend the Social Services Law.
19
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
21
     last section.
22
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
     act shall take effect on the first of January.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
24
25
     roll.
```

(The Secretary called the roll.) 1 2 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator 3 Klein to explain his vote. 4 SENATOR KLEIN: Thank you, 5 Mr. President. This legislation would require that 6 7 daycare providers post their most recent inspection results in a prominent place. 8 9 This came after a study that was 10 conducted by the Independent Democratic Conference, a citywide study and a statewide 11 12 study, which showed that our daycare centers, places where we entrust our children to day after 13 14 day, are not sanitary or safe. 15 This I think would add transparency to the process, which right now is very 16 cumbersome if a parent wants to find out if a 17 18 daycare center is safe and secure. This would 19 merely require that every daycare post those 20 inspection results. 21 We require that of restaurants in 22 New York and other places. I think our children deserve the same type of transparency and be able 23 to find out how safe and secure those daycares 24 25 are and give our parents peace of mind.

```
1
                  I vote yes, Mr. President.
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Senator
 3
     Klein in the affirmative.
                  Announce the results.
 4
 5
                  THE SECRETARY: Those recorded in
     the negative are Senators Ball, DeFrancisco,
 6
 7
     Little and Seward.
 8
                  Ayes, 59. Nays, 4.
9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
10
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11
12
     1564, by the Committee on Rules, Senate Print
     5669, an act to amend the Retirement and Social
13
     Security Law.
14
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There is
16
     a home-rule message at the desk.
17
                  The Secretary will read the last
18
     section.
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
19
20
     act shall take effect immediately.
21
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
22
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
23
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
24
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
```

```
1
     is passed.
 2
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
 3
     Calendar Number 1565, Senator Skelos moves to
     discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
 4
     Bill Number 7630A and substitute it for the
 5
     identical Senate Bill Number 5670A, Third Reading
 6
 7
     Calendar 1565.
 8
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
9
     substitution is ordered.
10
                  The Secretary will read.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11
12
     1565, by Member of the Assembly Abbate, Assembly
     Print 7630A, an act to amend the Retirement and
13
     Social Security Law.
14
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
16
     last section.
17
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                               This
18
     act shall take effect immediately.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
19
20
     roll.
21
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
22
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Ayes, 63.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
     is passed.
24
25
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
```

```
Calendar Number 1566, Senator Grisanti moves to
 1
 2
     discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
     Bill Number 3498A and substitute it for the
 3
 4
     identical Senate Bill Number 5743, Third Reading
 5
     Calendar 1566.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 6
                                              The
 7
     substitution is so ordered.
 8
                  The Secretary will read.
 9
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10
     1566, by Member of the Assembly Peoples-Stokes,
     Assembly Print 3498A, an act to amend the Social
11
     Services Law.
12
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
     last section.
14
15
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 2.
16
     act shall take effect on the first of January.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
17
18
     roll.
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
19
20
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
21
     Grisanti to explain his vote.
22
                  SENATOR GRISANTI: Yes, thank you,
     Mr. President.
23
                  First of all, I want to thank
24
25
     Senator Montgomery, because apparently a
```

situation like this happened in her district on 1 2 the other side of the state from Buffalo. 3 What it basically is, this 4 particular piece of legislation is wherever there 5 is a change or cuts to a program that helps parents with childcare subsidies -- whenever 6 7 there's a change in the program, they would tell the parents, Well, you have ten days and you're 8 going to be terminated from the program. 9 10 families that were relying on that childcare 11 subsidy so they can go to work only have 10 days to find other alternatives. 12 13 So what this legislation basically 14 does, it actually extends the time period 15 significantly, so this way nobody is in jeopardy. 16 And I want to thank Senator 17 18 Montgomery and her staff and my staff for working 19 on this to get rid of this loophole that was a 20 serious detriment to people all across New York State that rely heavily on this program so they 21 22 can go to work. 23 I vote aye, Mr. President. ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: 24 Senator

Grisanti to be recorded in the affirmative.

```
Announce the results.
 1
 2
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 3
 4
     is passed.
 5
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
     Calendar Number 1567, Senator Golden moves to
 6
 7
    discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
 8
     Bill Number 7586 and substitute it for the
 9
     identical Senate Bill Number 5767, Third Reading
10
     Calendar 1567.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
11
     substitution is so ordered.
12
13
                  The Secretary will read.
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14
15
     1567, by Member of the Assembly Abbate, Assembly
     Print 7586, an act in relation to authorizing.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Read the
17
18
     last section.
19
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 7. This
20
     act shall take effect in 30 days.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
21
22
     roll.
23
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
                                   Ayes, 61. Nays,
24
                  THE SECRETARY:
25
     2.
         Senators Ball and Hassell-Thompson recorded
```

```
1
     in the negative.
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
 3
     is passed.
                  Calendar Number 1568 and 1569 are
 4
 5
    high. The Secretary will go to Calendar 1570.
 6
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 7
     1570, by Senator Savino, Senate Print 4090, an
 8
     act to amend the Workers' Compensation Law.
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
10
     last section.
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2.
                                               This
11
12
     act shall take effect on the 60th day.
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
14
15
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
16
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
17
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
18
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
19
20
     Calendar Number 1571, Senator Carlucci moves to
21
    discharge, from the Committee on Local
22
     Government, Assembly Bill Number 6758 and
     substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
23
    Number 4674, Third Reading Calendar 1571.
24
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             There is
```

```
1
     a home-rule message at the desk.
 2
                  The substitution is so ordered.
                  The Secretary will read.
 3
 4
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 5
     1571, by Member of the Assembly Jaffee, Assembly
     Print Number 6758, an act authorizing.
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
 8
     last section.
 9
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
10
     act shall take effect immediately.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
11
     roll.
12
13
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
14
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60. Nays,
15
     3. Senators Ball, Carlucci and Marchione
     recorded in the negative.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
17
18
     is passed.
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
19
20
     Calendar Number 1572, Senator Seward moves to
21
     discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
22
     Bill Number 7882 and substitute it for the
     identical Senate Bill Number 5218, Third Reading
23
     Calendar 1572.
24
25
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The
```

```
substitution is so ordered.
 1
 2
                  The Secretary will read.
 3
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Calendar Number
 4
     1572, by Member of the Assembly Cahill, Assembly
 5
     Print 7882, an act to amend the Insurance Law.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
 6
 7
     last section.
 8
                  THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
9
     act shall take effect immediately.
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
11
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
12
13
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
14
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
15
     is passed.
16
                  Calendar Number 1573 is high. We
     will now go to Calendar Number 1574.
17
18
                  THE SECRETARY: In relation to
19
     Calendar Number 1574, Senator Skelos moves to
20
    discharge, from the Committee on Rules, Assembly
21
     Bill Number 8073 and substitute it for the
22
     identical Senate Bill Number 5844, Third Reading
     Calendar 1574.
23
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
24
                                             The
25
     substitution is so ordered.
```

```
1
                  The Secretary will read.
 2
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
 3
     1574, by Member of the Assembly Sweeney, Assembly
 4
     Print 8073, an act to amend the Public Service
 5
     Law.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
 6
 7
     last section.
 8
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 17.
                                                This
     act shall take effect January 1, 2014.
9
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
     roll.
11
12
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Senator
     LaValle to explain his vote.
14
15
                  SENATOR LaVALLE: Thank you,
16
     Mr. President.
17
                  This is a very important piece of
18
     legislation for Long Island. It's the Long
19
     Island Power Authority reorganization and
20
     refinancing plan.
21
                  LIPA has had a 15-member board, and
22
     the board members have worked very, very hard in
23
     trying to put together plans to operate the
     utility. But what has happened, with lack of
24
25
     leadership and the board reacting somewhat late
```

in meeting their obligations to both the ratepayers and keeping the system, the transmission and delivery system up and meeting certain standards -- two storms, Irene and Sandy really demonstrated that the utility did not have the proper planning in place, technology in place to meet ratepayers' needs in doing something very simple, keeping the lights on and keeping the system operating.

This legislation begins a restructuring that transfers LIPA's control of utility operations to the PSE&G. LIPA's role will be limited greatly. It will basically be a holding company and owning Long Island's transfer and delivery system. The staff will be greatly reduced because PSE&G will really be responsible for the operations.

One of the things that -- the members, along with the Governor, have been working very, very hard since January to put before this house this legislation. And one of the basic concerns was what kind of oversight would we have. So in this legislation we establish an office from the Public Service Commission that will be staffed to make sure that

we are reviewing the various recommendations that are being made and also reviewing the plans that are needed to keep the lights on.

The second part of this plan, beside the oversight that is given, is a refinancing of the LIPA debt. The LIPA debt is \$6.7 billion, and we will be refinancing \$3 billion. And so this refinancing will save the ratepayers \$30 million each year.

So we've put together something where the responsibility for the operation is very clear. When the lights are off, PSE&G is responsible to make sure that the ratepayer will have proper service.

And lastly, Mr. President, this legislation I believe will ensure that technology and the kind of manpower that we need and the kind of leadership that we need to keep the lights on will be very important.

And lastly, as part of the contractual agreement with PSE&G, there is hope -- and this is something that the Executive has talked about -- that the rates will be frozen for a three-year period of time, not including, of course, any pass-through with the energy, the

4135

```
fuel that is needed and will fluctuate low, high,
 1
 2
     and so forth.
                  So this is a bill that has had a lot
 3
 4
     of time put into it by the Executive, by members
 5
     in both houses of the Legislature from
 6
     Long Island. I vote aye.
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
 8
     LaValle to be recorded in the affirmative.
 9
                  Announce the results.
10
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
11
                                             Senator
12
     Sanders, do you want to explain your vote? I'll
13
     allow it.
14
                  SENATOR SANDERS:
                                     I'll pass.
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Okay.
                                                     So
16
     announce the results.
17
                  THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 63.
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             The bill
     is passed.
19
20
                  Senator Libous, that completes the
21
     noncontroversial reading of Senate Supplemental
22
     Calendar Number 56C.
23
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Yes, it does,
     Mr. President. Can we return to messages from
24
25
     the Assembly.
```

```
1
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             We will
 2
     return to messages from the Assembly.
 3
                  The Secretary will read.
 4
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   The Assembly sent
 5
     for concurrence the following bill: On motion by
     Senator Skelos and Senator Klein, said bill
 6
 7
     ordered direct to third reading. Assembly Bill
 8
     Number 6356A.
 9
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bill
10
     is ordered direct to third reading.
                  The Secretary will read.
11
                  THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12
     1575, by Member of the Assembly Lentol, Assembly
13
     Print 6356A, an act to amend the Penal Law.
14
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Read the
16
     last section.
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   Section 2.
                                               This
17
18
     act shall take effect immediately.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Call the
19
20
     roll.
21
                  (The Secretary called the roll.)
22
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Senator
23
     Zeldin to explain his vote.
                  SENATOR ZELDIN: My parents were
24
25
    divorced and remarried when I was a child, and I
```

actually grew up with two law enforcement
households. My stepfather was a retired state
trooper; my stepmother is a retired Nassau County
probation officer.

And I have a tremendous amount of respect for our law enforcement community, for the men and women who serve and are willing to sacrifice so much for our public safety. It is deeply respected, admired and appreciated by me and our entire family.

With that being said, my constituents know I have and continue to be opposed to the SAFE Act.

I said in my official statement during the original January vote on the SAFE Act: In our Constitution are certain rights which provide the foundation of America's greatness. Its Second Amendment in no uncertain terms guarantees the right of law-abiding citizens to keep and bear arms, and I firmly believe that it should be respected and adhered to still today.

Carving out such exemptions for only certain groups, no matter how well qualified that group may be, does not restore Second Amendment

```
rights for all. And tonight I ask, what about
 1
 2
     all of the other law-abiding gun owners?
 3
                  I'm proud to cosponsor Senator
 4
     Marchione's bill for a full repeal, and I commend
     her efforts.
 5
                  In order to do right by my
 6
 7
     constituents and my values, after deep reflection
     I cannot support this bill. I would appreciate
 8
     the understanding of the law enforcement
 9
10
     community, my colleagues, and my constituents
     that it's difficult or should I say impossible
11
12
     for me to back one group of great law-abiding
     citizens over another group of great law-abiding
13
     citizens when it comes to fundamental
14
15
     constitutional rights.
                  Therefore, I'm casting my vote in
16
     the negative.
17
18
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
     Zeldin to be recorded in the negative.
19
20
                  Senator Marchione to explain her
21
     vote.
22
                  SENATOR MARCHIONE:
                                        Thank you,
     Mr. President.
23
                  I rise to explain my vote today.
24
25
     And I'm sure that that's no surprise to anyone on
```

this floor. I'm voting no on this amendment
because it will legitimize a bad law, an
unconstitutional law, a law that has criminalized
millions of New Yorkers.

The fact we are passing this amendment, much like the SAFE Act was passed, late at night with no opportunity for citizens to be heard, proves an old saying: Those who don't learn from history are doomed to repeat it. And tonight we're repeating history.

On January 14th the Second Amendment freedoms of all New Yorkers were weakened when the SAFE Act was enacted in this chamber. The SAFE Act was rammed through with a message of necessity without a single public hearing or opportunity for citizens to be heard. That is not democracy.

I believe millions of New Yorkers believe the SAFE Act is wholly unconstitutional. This restrictive gun control law turned law-abiding New Yorkers into criminals virtually overnight, and has caused unimaginable chaos, confusion and concern.

The Second Amendment is perfectly clear: The right of people to keep and bear arms

```
1
     shall not be infringed. My online petition
 2
     received nearly 130,000 signatures, the vast
 3
     majority of which came from New York, supporting
 4
     the repeal of the SAFE Act. Every county except
 5
     one in upstate has passed resolutions opposing
     the SAFE Act.
 6
 7
                  Passing an amendment that grants an
 8
     exemption for retired law enforcement is window
     dressing for an unconstitutional law. When it
 9
10
     comes to the SAFE Act, we shouldn't amend it, we
     should repeal it. We should end it. New Yorkers
11
12
     demand and deserve a full and complete repeal.
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
     Marchione --
14
15
                  SENATOR MARCHIONE:
                                        Yes, sir.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              I must
17
     remind everyone that we're on a two-minute
18
     explanation, and your time is about to expire.
     So if you could please wrap up.
19
20
                  SENATOR MARCHIONE: I certainly
     will.
21
22
                  Instead of debating amendments, we
     should be debating my SAFE Act repeal bills.
23
                  I am a strong, proud supporter of
24
25
     law enforcement, but allowing an exemption that
```

```
1
     legitimizes this unconstitutional law is
 2
     something I will be voting no on. I may be new
     to the chambers, but I believe we should not be
 3
 4
     passing Laws at 10 minutes to 2:00. And I don't
 5
     mean to sound like my colleague on the other
     side, but when --
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
 8
     Marchione, how do you vote?
 9
                  SENATOR MARCHIONE:
                                        I vote no.
10
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
     Marchione to be recorded in the negative.
11
                  Senator Gallivan.
12
13
                  SENATOR GALLIVAN:
                                      Thank you,
     Mr. President.
14
15
                  I opposed the SAFE Act. I voted
16
     against it.
                  I continue to oppose it and support
     its full repeal.
17
18
                  I feel an obligation, though, that
     while we are pursuing its full repeal, when we
19
20
     have an opportunity to minimize its impact on
21
     law-abiding citizens and have a chance to do
     something so that the SAFE Act affects as few
22
23
     people as possible, there's an obligation to do
     it.
24
25
                  Tonight we are talking about police
```

officers. Police officers are different. Our laws treat them different, we charge them with different things. They have the power to take away people's liberties, the power of search and seizure, among other things. And there's enhanced penalties when they are victims of crimes.

They of course have specialized training that doesn't go away when they retire. Whether they're on duty or off duty, they have the obligation to act and people look to them to act. When they retire, the community still looks to them to act. They don't look at them as a retired police officer, they look at them as somebody who has helped the community and who is there to continue to protect the community.

The federal government has
recognized retired police officers with HR 218,
their ability to carry weapons across state
lines. We just this year, following the SAFE
Act, have recognized retired police officers,
first in the budget, where we allowed for a
waiver exemption for school resource officers who
are former police officers. And just last week,
with 57 votes, we passed legislation that would

```
1
     grant peace officer status to retired police
 2
     officers who are school resource officers.
                  Police officers are unique. Retired
 3
 4
     police officers are unique. They continue to
 5
     contribute to our society, to public safety. And
     I think that we have an obligation to continue to
 6
 7
     work on chipping away at this law until we --
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
 8
                                              Senator
     Gallivan, how do you vote?
9
10
                  SENATOR GALLIVAN: -- till we
     achieve its full repeal.
11
                  I vote aye, Mr. President.
12
13
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
     Gallivan to be recorded in the affirmative.
14
15
                  Senator Young to explain her vote.
                  SENATOR YOUNG:
                                   Thank you,
16
     Mr. President, to explain my vote.
17
18
                  I have nothing but the deepest
     admiration for our law enforcement. I always
19
20
     support them, and I support them actually to be
21
     able to regain some of their Second Amendment
22
     rights.
23
                  But the reason I'm voting no on this
     particular piece of legislation, Mr. President,
24
25
     is because this should be a full repeal of the
```

```
SAFE Act. And until we have everyone who is a
 1
     law-abiding citizen regaining their
 2
 3
     constitutional rights, I can't support this.
 4
                  So I will be voting no.
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                             Senator
     Young to be recorded in the negative.
 6
 7
                  Senator DeFrancisco to explain his
 8
     vote.
 9
                  SENATOR DeFRANCISCO:
                                         Yes, I just
10
     can't quite understand why a legislative body, no
     matter who the class is, can separate one
11
12
     law-abiding citizen from another.
13
                  Now, these are retired police
                These aren't active-duty police
14
     officers.
15
     officers. They happen to have chosen a specific
                  There's military people that choose
16
     profession.
     a profession that save us and protect us from
17
18
     overseas problems. They're trained with guns.
19
     They know what they're doing. Why are they
20
     excluded?
21
                  But every time you have a special
22
     class, there's always an equally -- a class that
     should have those same rights. It doesn't make
23
24
     any sense. You can't parse it along as far as
25
     specific groups.
                       That's wrong.
```

So for that reason, I'm going to 1 2 vote no on this bill. And I would believe that the full repeal is obviously the most sensible 3 4 solution, having voted no on the specific bill. 5 But law-abiding citizens are law-abiding citizens no matter what their former profession was and no 6 7 matter what their current profession was. So this is not a good idea, and I 8 also vote no. 9 10 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: Senator DeFrancisco to be recorded in the negative. 11 12 Senator Ranzenhofer to explain his 13 vote. 14 SENATOR RANZENHOFER: Thank you, 15 Mr. President. 16 I'd also like to associate my comments with those of Senator Zeldin and some of 17 18 the others who have spoken against this piece of 19 legislation.

I too share their sentiment that I also have the utmost respect for those retired police officers who have served their community very, very well. But I think we're walking down the wrong roadway when we carve out a special exception for certain individuals, whether they

20

21

22

23

24

25

be for retired police officers, whether they be 1 2 for military. 3 Because what you are really saying 4 is by granting somebody special privileges, you 5 are by inference saying that the others are less worthy of having that particular right. 6 7 I don't believe that that's a fair distinction. I share the belief of others that 8 this bill should be repealed. But on this very 9 10 specific piece of legislation, I think we are 11 moving in the wrong direction to carve out that 12 special class for two law-abiding groups of citizens, one who have previously served in law 13 enforcement and those who have not. 14 15 So I'll be casting my vote in the negative. Thank you, Mr. President. 16 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: 17 Senator 18 Ranzenhofer to be recorded in the negative. 19 Senator Golden to explain his vote. 20 SENATOR GOLDEN: Thank you, Mr. President. 21 22 I rise to say to my colleagues I know this is a tough vote for some of them, and 23

it's a tough vote for a lot of people in this

24

25

room.

But it's the right thing to do.

This bill is not the dark of night, this bill was put in on April 8th and amended on May 6th, and it was passed in the Assembly.

I was a police officer. I pulled into a gas station with my family. I seen somebody looking at me, and I was looking at him. And I had put him in jail for a long period of time, but he was free at this moment.

Now, I had the privilege of stepping on the gas and leaving that gas station. I don't know what would have happened. But many officers encounter, after working 20 years or 30 years in a police department or as a peace officer or as a federal officer, they encounter people when they are with their families and in their communities. And they act appropriately and properly.

They're not a separate class of people, ladies and gentlemen, but they are an experienced class of people that have been out there for 20, 30 years protecting us, protecting our children and our families. They know what the criminal element is. They know how to deal with the criminal element.

1 So if anybody deserves to have a ten 2 round magazine, it is something somebody that has 3 the experience to use it and to use it in the 4 right way. 5 So I want to thank my colleagues on both sides of this issue. But this is definitely 6 7 the right thing, by giving over 200,000 people in this State of New York 10-round magazines that 8 have been out there working for the past 20, 9 10 30 years, protecting our families and our communities. 11 12 And I vote aye. Thank you, Mr. President. 13 ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: 14 Senator 15 Golden to be recorded in the affirmative. 16 Senator Ball to explain his vote. SENATOR BALL: So just to clarify 17 18 I mean, first, my mom used to work things. She used to clean up all night long at 19 nights. 20 Harlem Valley Psychiatric Center. I have nothing wrong with working your tail off. 21 But there's a difference between 22 working through the night and this crap. 23 ridiculous. Why are we doing this at 2 o'clock 24 25 in the morning? We're doing this at 2 o'clock in the morning, just like we did the un-SAFE Act, because we don't want people to find out what we're doing.

Not all of us, some of us -- and I'm sad to say it's on my side of the aisle -- who don't want the public to know because God forbid we would get public input. I'm glad that Senator Golden could protect his family. How about the victim of domestic violence in her home, who now doesn't have a home exemption?

One of my previous colleagues said that we should fight for a full repeal. Maybe we passed medical marijuana that I don't know about. Full repeal would require this Governor overturning his own piece of legislation.

As legislators, the only responsibility, the only leverage we have was to work with the law enforcement community, to then also get private security in there, critically important to homeland security, and to get a home exemption for law-abiding citizens in this state to be able to protect their families.

We have now lost that. We've done it at 2 o'clock in the morning hoping that nobody cares.

```
I care. And you know what?
                                               I like
 1
 2
     you guys -- men and women. On a personal level,
     it doesn't make me feel good to say this. I know
 3
 4
     you -- I see it in your eyes today. Maybe it
 5
     should be easier just to -- you know, just to go
 6
     along to get along. I can't.
 7
                  There was a better way to do the
 8
     SAFE Act. And congratulations to the Governor
     for dividing this conference. And you're going
 9
10
     to have this conference be ripped apart.
     be should be a lot of smiles over there.
11
                                               There
12
     was a better way to handle this from the very
13
     beginning. I'm deeply disappointed.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
14
                                             Senator
15
     Ball, how do you vote?
                  SENATOR BALL:
                                  I'm voting no.
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
17
                                             Senator
18
     Ball to be recorded in the negative.
19
                  Senator Maziarz to explain his vote.
20
                  SENATOR MAZIARZ:
                                     I'll be voting in
21
     the negative, Mr. Chair.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
22
                                             Senator
     Maziarz to be recorded in the negative.
23
24
                  Senator Boyle to explain his vote.
25
                  SENATOR BOYLE:
                                   The day after we
```

```
1
     passed the SAFE Act I introduced legislation to
 2
     do exactly what Senator Golden's bill does, to
     exempt retired law enforcement. Not because I
 3
     think retired law enforcement are a better class
 4
 5
     of people, but I do think that they are there to
     protect people, like on the Long Island Railroad,
 6
 7
     the tragedy we had years ago.
 8
                  We need to make sure that all of us
 9
     have the proper ammunition to defend our homes.
10
     That's another bill I have, the Defend Our Homes
     Act, which would give everyone in their house the
11
     right to have 10 rounds.
12
13
                  I do not believe this is the end of
14
     the exemptions, this is the beginning.
     intend to vote in the affirmative.
15
16
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
     Boyle, how do you vote?
17
18
                  SENATOR BOYLE:
                                   In the affirmative.
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
19
                                              Senator
20
     Boyle to be recorded in the affirmative.
21
                  Senator O'Mara to explain his vote.
22
                  SENATOR O'MARA:
                                     Thank you,
     Mr. President.
23
                  I rise this evening to say that I
24
25
     support our law enforcement community. I want
```

them to be able to carry their weapons to protect our society, to have the fully loaded clip of 10 rounds of ammunition in their clip, because they will do a good job of continuing to protect us while they are in society and carrying out their daily lives, those retired law enforcement officers.

But I cannot stand here this evening and separate one law-abiding class of citizens into two separate groups, those that have and those that have not.

And we deal with a lot of legislation in this house about equality and treating people the same. And while law enforcement have these training qualifications and guidelines that they follow, I have many law-abiding gun owners in my district and across New York State that have the same skills, aptitude, and capabilities and are entitled to the same Second Amendment right that we all have in this country.

And to break this down at 2 o'clock in the morning is ridiculous. This is a sham on the Second Amendment in this state, and it's wrong. We should be fully repealing the SAFE Act

```
and treating all of our citizens equally here
 1
 2
     with their Second Amendment right.
                  Thank you, Mr. President. I vote in
 3
 4
     the negative.
 5
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              Senator
     O'Mara to be recorded in the negative.
 6
 7
                  Announce the results.
 8
                  THE SECRETARY:
                                   In relation to
 9
     Calendar Number 1575, those recorded in the
10
     negative are Senators Ball, DeFrancisco, Farley,
     Griffo, Libous, Marchione, Maziarz, Nozzolio,
11
12
     O'Mara, Ranzenhofer, Ritchie, Seward, Young and
     Zeldin.
13
14
                  Ayes, 49. Nays, 14.
15
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO:
                                              The bill
     is passed.
16
                  Senator Libous.
17
18
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President, we
     have a couple of bills on the calendar that I
19
20
     want to lay aside for the day.
                  On Supplemental Active Calendar
21
     Number 2, Number 436, lay it aside for the day.
22
     And on the same calendar, Number 927, lay it
23
     aside for the day.
24
25
                  Is there any further business at the
```

```
desk?
 1
 2
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: There is
 3
     no further business before the desk.
                  SENATOR LIBOUS: If there's no
 4
     further business, the Senate will adjourn until
 5
     this morning at 10:00 a.m.
 6
 7
                  ACTING PRESIDENT GRIFFO: The bills
 8
     are laid aside for the day.
                  On motion, the Senate stands
9
10
     adjourned until 10:00 a.m., Friday, June 21st.
                  The Senate stands adjourned.
11
                  (Whereupon, at 2:04 a.m., the Senate
12
13
     adjourned.)
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```