NEW YORK STATE SENATE THE STENOGRAPHIC RECORD ALBANY, NEW YORK March 18, 2013 3:23 p.m. REGULAR SESSION SENATOR DAVID CARLUCCI, Acting President FRANCIS W. PATIENCE, Secretary

1 PROCEEDINGS 2 ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: The 3 Senate will come to order. 4 I ask everyone present to please 5 rise and repeat with me the Pledge of Allegiance. 6 7 (Whereupon, the assemblage recited 8 the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.) 9 ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: In the 10 absence of clergy, may we please bow our heads in a moment of silence. 11 12 (Whereupon, the assemblage respected a moment of silence.) 13 ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: 14 The 15 reading of the Journal. 16 THE SECRETARY: In Senate, Sunday, March 17th, the Senate met pursuant to 17 18 adjournment. The Journal of Saturday, 19 March 16th, was read and approved. On motion, 20 Senate adjourned. 21 ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: Without objection, the Journal stands approved 22 23 as read. Presentation of petitions. 24 25 Messages from the Assembly.

1	The Secretary will read.
2	THE SECRETARY: On page 11,
3	Senator Seward moves to discharge, from the
4	Committee on Insurance, Assembly Bill Number
5	5694 and substitute it for the identical Senate
6	Bill Number 3857, Third Reading Calendar 147.
7	ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: The
8	substitution is ordered.
9	Messages from the Governor.
10	Reports of standing committees.
11	Reports of select committees.
12	Communications and reports from
13	state officers.
14	Motions and resolutions.
15	Senator Libous.
16	SENATOR LIBOUS: Thank you,
17	Mr. President.
18	On behalf of Senator Gallivan, on
19	page 8 I offer the following amendments to
20	Calendar Number 74, Senate Print 583, and ask
21	that said bill retain its place on the
22	Third Reading Calendar.
23	ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: The
24	amendments are received, and the bill will
25	retain its place on the Third Reading Calendar.

1 Senator Libous. 2 SENATOR LIBOUS: Thank you, 3 Mr. President. 4 At this time, Mr. President, with 5 unanimous consent, I'd like to recognize my friend and colleague Senator LaValle to address 6 7 the body. ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: 8 9 Senator LaValle. 10 SENATOR LaVALLE: Thank you, Senator Libous. 11 We have some very special guests 12 today that I would like to introduce to this 13 14 body: A very prominent Italian who is the 15 rettore of the University of Palermo, the president of the University of Palermo, 16 Rettore Roberto Lagalla, and his wife, Maria 17 18 Paola Ferro. 19 Also we have Pasquale Assennato, 20 who is a professor at the university. And we have a dear friend that's with them who is also 21 a professor at the University of Palermo, 22 Professor Marcello Saija. 23 And also, from Stony Brook, the 24 25 director of the Center for Italian Studies --

and he has been here -- a very dear friend, 1 2 Professor Mario Mignone. 3 Rettore, your work in Sicily, in 4 Italy, the number of journals that you have 5 written in, the speeches on healthcare are well known. And this body recognizes you for your 6 7 work in healthcare and certainly being the president of a very important university in 8 Italy, the University of Palermo. 9 10 Congratulations on your good work, 11 and I hope you have a good stay here in the United States. 12 13 (Applause.) 14 ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: Thank 15 you, Rettore. Thank you, Senator LaValle. Senator Libous. 16 SENATOR LIBOUS: 17 Thank you, 18 Mr. President. 19 I believe there is a previously 20 adopted resolution by Senator Hassell-Thompson at 21 the desk; I believe it is Number 836. I ask that its title be read and call on the good Senator. 22 ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: The 23 Secretary will read. 24 25 THE SECRETARY: Legislative

Resolution Number 836, by Senator 1 2 Hassell-Thompson, commemorating the 50th Anniversary of the United States Supreme Court's 3 4 decision Gideon v. Wainwright holding the 5 14th Amendment to the Constitution requires states to provide counsel to indigent criminal 6 7 defendants. 8 ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: Senator 9 Hassell-Thompson. 10 SENATOR HASSELL-THOMPSON: Thank you, Mr. President. 11 Fifty years ago on March 18, 1963, 12 the Supreme Court unanimously ruled in Gideon v. 13 Wainwright that criminal defendants have a 14 15 constitutional right to a lawyer whether or not they can afford one. 16 Following this historic decision, a 17 18 new trial was ordered. And with a new lawyer appointed, Gideon was acquitted. 19 20 Clarence Earl Gideon is an unlikely 21 protagonist. He was a poor white male from Missouri with a track record for petty thievery. 22 He was first convicted of larceny at the age of 23 18 and over the course of his life served prison 24 25 sentences in four different states. He's

1	commonly referred to as a drifter because of his
2	tendency to jump from home to home and wife to
3	wife.
4	Say what you might about him as a
5	man, but it is undeniable that Gideon had
6	gumption. After being convicted in 1961 of
7	felony theft, he stood in front of the Florida
8	State Court and, representing himself, refused to
9	plead guilty until the court appointed him a
10	counsel. Knowing nothing about the law, he
11	nevertheless had an unwavering belief that the
12	United States Constitution entitled him to a
13	lawyer and to have representation before the
14	court could throw him into jail.
15	Technically, Gideon was wrong.
16	Under the U.S. Supreme Court's case in Betts v.
17	Brady, decided 20 years earlier, the court had
18	ruled that no one has a universal right to
19	counsel in a criminal state trial unless that
20	denial could constitute a denial of fundamental
21	fairness.
22	But as Anthony Lewis wrote in his
23	famous book, Gideon's Trumpet, Gideon's argument
24	wasn't necessarily futile on the basis that it
25	was wrong.

1	As we have seen over the years under
2	different, more progressive leadership, the
3	United States Supreme Court would occasionally
4	change its mind. And 50 years ago, that's
5	exactly what it did, by overturning Gideon's
6	conviction and unanimously holding that the
7	14th Amendment requires states to provide counsel
8	to defendants in criminal cases whether or not
9	they're able to afford an attorney.
10	The point of this case is simple.
11	Everyone in our country deserves a fair trial
12	before going to jail, no matter who they are or
13	what they have done. Our justice system needs to
14	support the plight of poor people, not to
15	contribute to it.
16	It is a matter of common sense that
17	the administration of law must be unbiased. And
18	in order to administer equal and nonprejudicial
19	representation, every state needs to not only
20	develop a public defender system but it needs to
21	ensure that it creates laws and contributes
22	financially to ensure that that system truly
23	works.
24	This commemoration is bittersweet.
25	While the right to counsel in criminal cases has

been determined, the legal needs of many 1 2 defendants are still going unmet -- and therefore 3 the right often amounts to an empty one. 4 New York has no statewide system for 5 the provision of indigent defense but instead relies on our counties to administer this kind of 6 7 indigent defense services. As long as counties have to bear the public defense mandate, they 8 must be economically funded to provide quality 9 10 representation. 11 In 2009 I was proud to lead the 12 Senate Democratic majority in the creation of our Indigent Legal Services Board, which oversees the 13 14 Office of Indigent Legal Services, the first of 15 its kind to manage public defenders in the history of the State of New York. However, we 16 must ensure that these organizations are 17 18 adequately funded, or I fear that our incremental advances in the area of public defense will be 19 20 continuously thwarted. In 2009 historic legislation was 21 22 passed by our joint legislative houses and signed under Governor Paterson to establish new caseload 23 standards in the City of New York for public 24 25 defenders. However, to truly stabilize our

1 justice system, we must expand the law 2 statewide. Having the right to counsel means absolutely nothing if the lawyer is unable to 3 4 give adequate representation because he or she is 5 ill-prepared due to an insufferably burdensome caseload. 6 7 Therefore, it is absolutely 8 substantive interactive that we pass legislation this week that restores funding to the Indigent 9 10 Legal Services Office, and we must oppose the Executive's proposal to eliminate the \$4 million 11 12 appropriated for upstate case caps. 13 Just two months ago the United 14 States Supreme Court considered a case involving 15 indigent defense. The issue of Boyer v. 16 Louisiana was whether a state's failure to fund counsel for an indigent defendant for five years 17 18 should be weighed against the state for speedy 19 trial purposes. Louisiana disagreed and argued 20 even if the majority of the delay in bringing the 21 defendant to trial was caused by a funding 22 crisis, that it should not count against the 23 state. We do not need to wait for the 24 25 Supreme Court's answer. As a legislature, we can

1 decide that New York State will accept 2 responsibility for its indigent defense Today we must honor the dedication of 3 problems. those legal aid societies, public defenders, 18B 4 5 lawyers and pro bono defense counsels who 6 zealously represent the poor. At the same time, 7 we want to use this anniversary as an opportunity 8 for reflection and inspiration. 9 We have a responsibility as 10 lawmakers to exercise our power for the betterment of our citizens in all aspects of 11 12 their lives. Having adequate representation at a criminal trial demonstrates a person's true 13 freedom. 14 15 I urge my colleagues to join me in supporting an aggressive campaign of indigent 16 defense reform to ensure that we protect all 17 18 citizens and their freedoms with the kind of unbridled gumption that drove Gideon's passion 19 20 one half a century ago. 21 Thank you, Mr. President. ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: 22 Thank you, Senator Hassell-Thompson. 23 Are there any other Senators wishing 24 25 to be heard on the resolution?

1 This resolution was previously 2 adopted on March 14th. 3 Senator Libous. 4 SENATOR LIBOUS: Yes, 5 Mr. President. I believe at this time we're going to take up the reading of the 6 7 noncontroversial calendar. 8 ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: The 9 Secretary will read. 10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 55, by Senator Seward, Senate Print 3066, an act to 11 amend the Insurance Law. 12 13 ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: Read the last section. 14 15 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This 16 act shall take effect immediately. 17 ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: Call 18 the roll. (The Secretary called the roll.) 19 20 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61. 21 ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: This 22 bill is passed. 23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 56, by Senator Seward, Senate Print 3539, an act to 24 25 amend the Insurance Law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: Read 2 the last section. 3 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect immediately. 4 5 ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: Call the roll. 6 7 (The Secretary called the roll.) 8 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61. 9 ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: The 10 bill is passed. THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 11 147, substituted earlier by Member of the 12 Assembly Skoufis, Assembly Print Number 5694, an 13 act to amend Chapter 630 of the Laws of 1988. 14 15 ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: Read 16 the last section. 17 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This 18 act shall take effect immediately. ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: 19 Call 20 the roll. 21 (The Secretary called the roll.) 22 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61. 23 ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: The bill is passed. 24 25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

175, by Senator Golden, Senate Print 3754, an act 1 2 to amend the Public Housing Law. ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: 3 Read the last section. 4 5 SENATOR MONTGOMERY: Lay it aside. ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: 6 Lay the 7 bill aside. 8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 9 176, by Senator Young, Senate Print 3843, an act 10 to amend the Private Housing Finance Law. ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: Read 11 the last section. 12 13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect immediately. 14 15 ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: Call 16 the roll. (The Secretary called the roll.) 17 18 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 61. ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: 19 The 20 bill is passed. 21 Senator Libous, that completes the noncontroversial reading of the calendar. 22 23 SENATOR LIBOUS: Thank you, Mr. President. 24 25 At this time could you ring the bell

1 and bring the members to the chamber, and we'll 2 very shortly get into the controversial reading 3 of the calendar. 4 ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: The 5 Secretary will ring the bell. SENATOR LIBOUS: Mr. President. б 7 ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: Senator 8 Libous. 9 SENATOR LIBOUS: Thank you, 10 Mr. President. Could we now have the reading of the 11 12 controversial calendar, please. 13 ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: The Secretary will read. 14 15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 16 175, by Senator Golden, Senate Print 3754, an act to amend the Public Housing Law. 17 18 ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: Senator 19 Montgomery. 20 SENATOR MONTGOMERY: Thank you, 21 Mr. President. I would like to speak on this 22 legislation. 23 ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: Senator Montgomery on the bill. 24 25 SENATOR MONTGOMERY: Yes. This is

1	a bill that Senator Golden is introducing, and it
2	would change the governing structure of the
3	New York City Housing Authority.
4	And I am opposed to this particular
5	version of the change in the structure of the
б	governing body for the following reasons. This
7	bill creates a new governing board that would now
8	serve entirely at the mayor's pleasure. This
9	indicates that Senator Golden would like to see
10	the New York City Housing Authority become a
11	mayoral agency. However, it would not have the
12	same accountability, as every other city agency
13	does, to the scrutiny of the City Council and the
14	public.
15	This bill also would allow the mayor
16	to eliminate any and all of the members of the
17	board without cause. So he we could wake up one
18	day and have a NYCHA board in place and the next
19	day, based on the mayor's political or otherwise
20	decisions or needs or pleasure, we would have a
21	different board.
22	And so the whole idea of continuity
23	and stability of this important agency, this
24	important authority, which is depended on by
25	hundreds of thousands of residents in the City of

Г

1	New York, it would totally be destabilized based
2	on one person's desire, decision, politically or
3	otherwise.
4	The mayor, although, adds one
5	additional this bill would add one additional
6	resident to the NYCHA board. That resident is
7	selected by the mayor. In addition, the bill is
8	blind to any standard of competence for any of
9	the board members. So we would not have the
10	benefit of people who have expertise in different
11	areas, i.e., finance, administration and
12	management, housing policy, workforce
13	development, and others.
14	So there is really no benefit that
15	is added to the New York City Housing Authority
16	by virtue of this legislation. And so it is a
17	very, very questionable way to be proposing to
18	change such an important city authority without
19	having a lot of public discussion, without having
20	been engaged in some dialogue with people who
21	depend on the housing authority, who work with
22	the housing authority, and for whom the housing
23	authority exists. So I am certainly opposing
24	this legislation.
25	And I want to say that we do have a

1 bill that was introduced by Senator Bill Perkins 2 and myself which would in fact not only add one 3 additional tenant representative to the board, 4 but we would add five tenant representatives. 5 And we would also increase the board, the voting board, to six members who would represent areas 6 7 of expertise; i.e., housing, finance, workforce development, management, administration, housing 8 policy, health and human services and community 9 10 development. We think that it is time that we 11 12 need to revisit the New York City Housing Authority board, but we do not believe that this 13 bill that Senator Golden has introduced does that 14 15 at all. The only thing that it actually does is creates a housing authority that is entirely 16 controlled by the mayor of the City of New York 17 18 and without any accountability to any other city agency or the public or taxpayers. 19 20 So I am opposing this, and I invite my colleagues to also join me in voting no on 21 22 this legislation. Thank you, Mr. President. 23 ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: 24 Thank 25 you, Senator Montgomery.

Are there other Senators wishing to 1 2 be heard on the bill? 3 Senator Krueger. 4 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you. On the bill. 5 I stand to share my colleague's 6 7 concerns with this bill and to express my reasons 8 for why I'll be voting no. 9 As my colleague already so 10 articulately explained, we need to do something about the governance in NYCHA. I think any of us 11 12 who are from New York City can tell our own stories about frustrations we have had, and lack 13 14 of response. 15 But if you're going to change the governance of a public authority, you need to 16 think through what's broken and what needs to be 17 18 fixed. For me, one of the huge issues is that 19 there is no transparency in their budget. They 20 don't report to anyone on their revenues, on 21 their expenditures, on their capital reserves, as 22 we've learned recently on where they are in their capital plans because they received quite a bit 23 of federal money to do preservation, expansion. 24 25 There are concerns about their leasing off

properties they own for private development. 1 2 There's endless questions, but no information 3 coming. 4 So it seems obvious to me that at 5 this point in history, governance improvements for the New York City Housing Authority would 6 7 require full disclosure, as this Legislature has done with its public authority reform bills for 8 state public authorities. 9 10 Now, granted, NYCHA is a city authority, but apparently they need to come to us 11 12 for a change in governance. So it seems obvious to me this house wants to make sure that that 13 14 governance change includes real reforms in the 15 information flow in authorities. Second, as my colleague pointed out, 16 while I can accept a change in how board members 17 18 are picked and how many they are and whether they're paid or on a per diem, I don't accept the 19 20 concept that we would have no standards for the qualifications of who they are or need to be. 21 22 And I'm very concerned about a model where simply at the decision of the mayor they could be 23 removed without cause at any moment in time. 24 25 Unfortunately, we in the City of

New York have seen a pattern where a -- I'm 1 2 sorry, Mr. President I'm having a little trouble hearing myself. 3 4 ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: Please 5 keep conversations to a minimum while Senator Krueger has the floor. 6 7 Continue, Senator Krueger. 8 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you. I 9 don't know if anyone else wanted to hear me, but 10 I wanted to hear myself. Thank you. Don't 11 answer. (Laughter.) 12 13 SENATOR KRUEGER: Thank you, Mr. President. 14 15 The concern that if you remove a board member or members without cause at any 16 17 moment, that you actually can simply, as whoever 18 the mayor is in New York City, be saying "I know 19 these board members don't agree with me on this, 20 I'm going to fire them all and replace them on a minute's notice." That's bad governance. 21 It's a 22 bad model of governance. And so I don't accept that it's a reform to move forward by 23 establishing that model. 24 25 I also, frankly, have spoken to

people who are involved in a coalition trying to 1 2 make improvements in the New York City Housing 3 Authority, and they support having tenant members 4 of the board, as I support having tenant 5 members. But they also say they have an entire leadership model throughout the different 6 7 authority projects and that they would like to recommend their tenant leaders for the board, not 8 being exclusively who the mayor decides ought to 9 10 believe the tenant members of the board. And I think that they need to play a role. 11 12 I have also been discussing the fact that the City Council of the City of New York, 13 14 who have a very personal relationship with NYCHA 15 because it is a city housing authority and they are the city legislature, that the New York City 16 Council should at least have some role in advice 17 18 and consent to who board members are, and that critically they need that same information about 19 20 revenue, expenditures, capital plans as we in the 21 State Legislature do. 22 So I strongly believe we need a governance bill for NYCHA. And I think we could 23 get one this year, but I don't believe this 24 25 should be the governance bill we pass. And I'll

be voting no, Mr. President. 1 2 Thank you. ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: 3 Thank 4 you, Senator Krueger. 5 Are there other Senators wishing to be heard on the bill? б 7 The Secretary will ring the bell. 8 Read the last section. 9 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This 10 act shall take effect on the 30th day. ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: Call 11 the roll. 12 13 (The Secretary called the roll.) 14 ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: Senator 15 Squadron. 16 SENATOR SQUADRON: Thank you, Mr. President. To explain my vote. 17 18 Look, there's no question that NYCHA 19 needs to be reformed, goodness knows. The 20 problem is this isn't the way to do it, it's not 21 the process by which we should be doing it. We 22 need to have an extensive conversation on this. 23 And also, I got to tell you, to change the structure without increasing the transparency, 24 25 without knowing more about what's happening,

1 without giving the City Council better oversight, 2 seems to be a solution that gets nowhere near solving the problem. 3 4 So I thank Senator Golden for his 5 commitment to NYCHA and to reforming it; it's very important. Unfortunately, I wish we were 6 7 doing it in the right way. I vote no, 8 Mr. President. 9 ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: Thank 10 you, Senator Squadron. Are there other Senators wishing to 11 12 explain their vote? 13 Senator Golden. 14 SENATOR GOLDEN: Thank you, 15 Mr. President. 16 I can understand my colleagues on the other side of the aisle looking for a better 17 18 bill. This is a good bill, and especially when you take a look at what's been going on over the 19 20 last many years. 21 When you take a look at the number of building complaints, building repairs as of 22 August were 338,000. There is currently, since 23 August, an increase of 84,000. There were 24 25 422,000 repair complaints at NYCHA. Think about

1	that.
2	Think about the pay that the members
3	that were there before were getting. The
4	chairman gets \$212,000 and the members get
5	\$186,000 each, for incompetence and for failure.
6	This new bill will allow it to go to
7	five members and to increase the ability for the
8	tenants to have a voice on that board, and will
9	also give the ability to get the commitment of
10	the mayor and the chairman and that board to get
11	those 400,000-plus units repaired in a timely
12	fashion over the course of this year.
13	So although I know my colleagues are
14	looking for a better bill, this is a bill that
15	will work. It is a bill that I believe is
16	something that is long due, and I believe it's a
17	bill that will get those repairs done by the end
18	of this year, and that's very, very important.
19	So I vote aye. Thank you.
20	ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: Thank
21	you, Senator Golden.
22	The Secretary will announce the
23	results.
24	THE SECRETARY: In relation to
25	Calendar Number 175, those recorded in the

negative are Senators Adams, Addabbo, Avella, 1 2 Ball, Breslin, Diaz, Dilan, Gianaris, Gipson, 3 Hassell-Thompson, Hoylman, Kennedy, Krueger, 4 Latimer, Montgomery, O'Brien, Peralta, Perkins, 5 Rivera, Sampson, Sanders, Serrano, Squadron, Stavisky, Stewart-Cousins and Tkaczyk. 6 7 Ayes, 36. Nays, 26. ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: 8 The bill is passed. 9 10 Senator Libous, this completes the controversial reading of the calendar. 11 12 SENATOR LIBOUS: Thank you, Mr. President. 13 14 Is there any further business at the 15 desk? 16 ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: There is no further business at the desk. 17 18 SENATOR LIBOUS: There being no further business, Mr. President, I move that we 19 adjourn until Tuesday, March 19th, at 3:00 p.m. 20 ACTING PRESIDENT CARLUCCI: 21 On motion, the Senate stands adjourned until 22 Tuesday, March 19th, at 3:00 p.m. 23 24 (Whereupon, at 3:53 p.m., the Senate 25 adjourned.)