

# STATE OF NEW YORK

8230

## IN SENATE

January 16, 2024

Introduced by Sen. JACKSON -- read twice and ordered printed, and when printed to be committed to the Committee on Civil Service and Pensions

AN ACT to amend the civil service law, in relation to hearing procedures for certain public employees

The People of the State of New York, represented in Senate and Assembly, do enact as follows:

1 Section 1. Subdivision 2 and paragraph (a) of subdivision 2-a of  
2 section 75 of the civil service law, subdivision 2 as amended by chapter  
3 226 of the laws of 1994 and paragraph (a) of subdivision 2-a as added by  
4 chapter 674 of the laws of 2022, are amended and a new subdivision 2-b  
5 is added to read as follows:

6 2. Procedure; New York city employees. [~~An~~] For any employee in the  
7 service of the city of New York described in paragraph (a), (b), (c),  
8 (d), or (e) of subdivision one of this section, if such employee [~~who~~]

9 at the time of questioning appears to be a potential subject of disci-  
10 plinary action, he or she shall have a right to representation by his or  
11 her certified or recognized employee organization under article fourteen  
12 of this chapter and shall be notified in advance, in writing, of such  
13 right. [~~A state employee who is designated managerial or confidential~~  
14 ~~under article fourteen of this chapter, shall, at the time of question-~~  
15 ~~ing, where it appears that such employee is a potential subject of~~  
16 ~~disciplinary action, have a right to representation and shall be noti-~~  
17 ~~fied in advance, in writing, of such right.~~]

18 If representation is requested a reasonable period of time shall be afforded to obtain such  
19 representation. If the employee is unable to obtain representation with-  
20 in a reasonable period of time the employer has the right to then ques-  
21 tion the employee. A hearing officer under this section shall have the  
22 power to find that a reasonable period of time was or was not afforded.

23 In the event the hearing officer finds that a reasonable period of time  
24 was not afforded then any and all statements obtained from said ques-  
25 tioning as well as any evidence or information obtained as a result of  
26 said questioning shall be excluded, provided, however, that this subdi-  
27 vision shall not modify or replace any written collective agreement  
28 between a public employer and employee organization negotiated pursuant

EXPLANATION--Matter in italics (underscored) is new; matter in brackets  
[-] is old law to be omitted.

LBD03619-04-4

1 to article fourteen of this chapter. A person against whom removal or  
2 other disciplinary action is proposed shall have written notice thereof  
3 and of the reasons therefor, shall be furnished a copy of the charges  
4 preferred against him or her and shall be allowed at least eight days  
5 for answering the same in writing. The hearing upon such charges shall  
6 be held by the officer or body having the power to remove the person  
7 against whom such charges are preferred, or by a deputy or other person  
8 designated by such officer or body in writing for that purpose. In case  
9 a deputy or other person is so designated, he or she shall, for the  
10 purpose of such hearing, be vested with all the powers of such officer  
11 or body and shall make a record of such hearing which shall, with his or  
12 her recommendations, be referred to such officer or body for review and  
13 decision. The person or persons holding such hearing shall, upon the  
14 request of the person against whom charges are preferred, permit him or  
15 her to be represented by counsel, or by a representative of a recognized  
16 or certified employee organization, and shall allow him or her to summon  
17 witnesses in his or her behalf. The burden of proving incompetency or  
18 misconduct shall be upon the person alleging the same. Compliance with  
19 technical rules of evidence shall not be required.

20 (a) Notwithstanding any other provision of law to the contrary,  
21 including but not limited to subdivision four of section seventy-six of  
22 this title, any paid officer or member of an organized fire company or  
23 fire department of a city of less than one million population, or town,  
24 village or fire district who is represented by a certified or recognized  
25 employee organization pursuant to article fourteen of this chapter shall  
26 not be subjected to the penalty of dismissal from service or any other  
27 discipline if the hearing, upon such charge, has been conducted by some-  
28 one other than an independent hearing officer to be agreed to by the  
29 employer and the person against whom disciplinary action is proposed. If  
30 the parties are unable to agree upon a hearing officer, the hearing  
31 officer shall be selected from a list of seven names to be provided by  
32 the public employment relations board. The public employment relations  
33 board shall maintain a list of independent hearing officers for this  
34 purpose and for the purpose described in subdivision two-b of this  
35 section. The parties shall select the hearing officer by alternately  
36 striking names from the list of seven. The hearing officer shall be  
37 vested with all powers of the appointing authority, shall conduct and  
38 make a record of the hearing, and shall render a final decision. The  
39 cost incurred in obtaining such independent hearing officer shall be  
40 divided equally between the parties; provided that as may be determined  
41 upon the circumstances of the case, the hearing officer shall be author-  
42 ized to allocate such cost on the basis of the frivolous nature of any  
43 claim made or any defense interposed. In order to find a claim or  
44 defense to be frivolous, the hearing officer must find at least one of  
45 the following:

46 (i) the claim or defense was commenced, used or continued in bad  
47 faith, solely to delay or prolong the resolution of the action or to  
48 harass or maliciously injure another; or

49 (ii) the claim or defense was commenced or continued in bad faith  
50 without any reasonable basis in law or fact. If the claim or defense was  
51 promptly discontinued when the party learned or should have learned that  
52 the claim or defense lacked such reasonable basis, the hearing officer  
53 may find that the party did not act in bad faith. A person served with  
54 charges may then, however, elect in writing to proceed with a hearing  
55 pursuant to the procedures established in subdivision two of this  
56 section in lieu of the procedures set forth in this subdivision.

1 2-b. Procedure; non-New York city employees. For any employee  
2 described in paragraph (a), (b), (c), or (e) of subdivision one of this  
3 section not in the service of the city of New York, the following proce-  
4 cedure shall apply: An employee under this subdivision who at the time of  
5 questioning appears to be a potential subject of disciplinary action  
6 shall have a right to representation by his or her certified or recog-  
7 nized employee organization under article fourteen of this chapter and  
8 shall be notified in advance, in writing, of such right. A state employ-  
9 ee who is designated managerial or confidential under article fourteen  
10 of this chapter, shall, at the time of questioning, where it appears  
11 that such employee is a potential subject of disciplinary action, have a  
12 right to representation and shall be notified in advance, in writing, of  
13 such right. If representation is requested a reasonable period of time  
14 shall be afforded to obtain such representation. If the employee is  
15 unable to obtain representation within a reasonable period of time the  
16 employer has the right to then question the employee. A hearing officer  
17 under this section shall have the power to find that a reasonable period  
18 of time was or was not afforded. In the event the hearing officer finds  
19 that a reasonable period of time was not afforded then any and all  
20 statements obtained from said questioning as well as any evidence or  
21 information obtained as a result of said questioning shall be excluded,  
22 provided, however, that this subdivision shall not modify or replace any  
23 written collective agreement between a public employer and employee  
24 organization negotiated pursuant to article fourteen of this chapter. A  
25 person against whom removal or other disciplinary action is proposed  
26 shall have written notice thereof and of the reasons thereof, shall be  
27 furnished a copy of the charges preferred against him or her and shall  
28 be allowed at least eight days for answering the same in writing. The  
29 hearing upon such charges shall be held by a hearing officer who shall  
30 be selected by the mutual agreement of the person against whom discipli-  
31 nary action is proposed and of the employing officer or body. If such  
32 mutual agreement cannot be reached, then the hearing officer shall be  
33 selected from a list of seven names to be provided by the public employ-  
34 ment relations board pursuant to subdivision two-a of this section. The  
35 parties shall select the hearing officer by alternately striking names  
36 from the list of seven. Such hearing officer shall, for the purpose of  
37 such hearing, be vested with all the powers of such officer or body and  
38 shall make a record of such hearing which shall, with his or her recom-  
39 mendations and decision, be referred to such officer or body for imple-  
40 mentation. The hearing officer holding such hearing shall, upon the  
41 request of the person against whom charges are preferred, permit him or  
42 her to be represented by counsel, or by a representative of a recognized  
43 or certified employee organization, and shall allow him or her to summon  
44 witnesses on his or her behalf. The burden of proving incompetency or  
45 misconduct shall be upon the person alleging the same. Compliance with  
46 technical rules of evidence shall not be required. The cost incurred in  
47 obtaining the independent hearing officer shall be divided equally  
48 between the parties; provided that as may be determined upon the circum-  
49 stances of the case, the hearing officer shall be authorized to allocate  
50 such cost on the basis of the frivolous nature of any claim made or any  
51 defense interposed in the manner provided for in paragraph (a) of subdivi-  
52 vision two-a of this section. Provided, however, that the provisions of  
53 this subdivision shall not supersede or apply to an existing hearing  
54 officer policy and procedure that is the result of a collective bargain-  
55 ing agreement between an employer and a recognized or certified employee  
56 organization or any hearing officer policy and procedure currently

1 existing for state employees designated managerial or confidential which  
2 was in effect on the effective date of this subdivision.

3 § 2. Subdivision 3 of section 75 of the civil service law, as amended  
4 by chapter 710 of the laws of 1984, is amended to read as follows:

5 3. Suspension pending determination of charges; penalties; New York  
6 city employees. [~~Pending~~] For any employee in the service of the city of  
7 New York described in paragraph (a), (b), (c), (d), or (e) of subdivi-  
8 vision one of this section, pending the hearing and determination of  
9 charges of incompetency or misconduct, the officer or employee against  
10 whom such charges have been preferred may be suspended without pay for a  
11 period not exceeding thirty days. If such officer or employee is found  
12 guilty of the charges, the penalty or punishment may consist of a reprimand,  
13 a fine not to exceed one hundred dollars to be deducted from the  
14 salary or wages of such officer or employee, suspension without pay for  
15 a period not exceeding two months, demotion in grade and title, or  
16 dismissal from the service; provided, however, that the time during  
17 which an officer or employee is suspended without pay may be considered  
18 as part of the penalty. If he or she is acquitted, he or she shall be  
19 restored to his or her position with full pay for the period of suspension less the amount of any unemployment insurance benefits he or she  
20 may have received during such period. If such officer or employee is  
21 found guilty, a copy of the charges, his or her written answer thereto,  
22 a transcript of the hearing, and the determination shall be filed in the  
23 office of the department or agency in which he or she has been employed,  
24 and a copy thereof shall be filed with the civil service commission  
25 having jurisdiction over such position. A copy of the transcript of the  
26 hearing shall, upon request of the officer or employee affected, be  
27 furnished to him or her without charge.

29 § 3. Subdivision 3-a of section 75 of the civil service law, as added  
30 by chapter 753 of the laws of 1990, is amended and a new subdivision 3-b  
31 is added to read as follows:

32 3-a. Suspension pending determination of charges and penalties relating to police officers of the police department of the city of New York.  
33 [~~Pending~~] Notwithstanding the provisions of subdivision three of this  
34 section, pending the hearing and determination of charges of incompetency or misconduct, a police officer employed by the police department of  
35 the city of New York may be suspended without pay for a period not  
36 exceeding thirty days. If such officer is found guilty of the charges,  
37 the police commissioner of such department may punish the police officer  
38 pursuant to the provisions of sections 14-115 and 14-123 of the administrative code of the city of New York.

42 3-b. Suspension pending determination of charges; penalties; non-New  
43 York city employees. For any employee described in paragraph (a), (b),  
44 (c), or (e) of subdivision one of this section not in the service of  
45 the city of New York, pending the hearing and determination of charges  
46 of incompetency or misconduct, the officer or employee against whom such  
47 charges have been preferred may be suspended for a period not exceeding  
48 thirty days. The suspension shall be with pay. If such officer or  
49 employee is found guilty of the charges, the penalty or punishment may  
50 consist of a reprimand, a fine not to exceed one hundred dollars to be  
51 deducted from the salary or wages of such officer or employee, suspension  
52 without pay for a period not exceeding two months, demotion in  
53 grade and title, or dismissal from the service. If he or she is acquitted,  
54 he or she shall be restored to his or her position. If such officer  
55 or employee is found guilty, a copy of the charges, his or her written  
56 answer thereto, a transcript of the hearing, and the determination shall

1 be filed in the office of the department or agency in which he or she  
2 has been employed, and a copy thereof shall be filed with the civil  
3 service commission having jurisdiction over such position. A copy of the  
4 transcript of the hearing shall, upon request of the officer or employee  
5 affected, be furnished to him or her without charge.

6 § 4. This act shall take effect immediately.