STATE OF NEW YORK

9054

IN SENATE

April 12, 2024

Introduced by Sens. MAYER, MANNION -- read twice and ordered printed, and when printed to be committed to the Committee on Education

AN ACT to amend the education law, in relation to annual professional performance reviews of teachers and principals; and to repeal section 3020-b of the education law relating to streamlined removal procedures for teachers rated ineffective

The People of the State of New York, represented in Senate and Assembly, do enact as follows:

Section 1. Paragraphs a and b of subdivision 1 of section 2-d of the education law, as added by section 1 of subpart L of part AA of chapter 56 of the laws of 2014, are amended to read as follows:

"Building principal" means a building principal subject to annual 5 performance evaluation review under the provisions of section three thousand twelve-c, section three thousand twelve-d, or section three thousand twelve-e of this chapter.

7 8

9

10

12

14

15

18

19

- b. "Classroom teacher" means a teacher subject to annual performance evaluation review under the provisions of section three thousand twelve-c, section three thousand twelve-d, or section three thousand 11 <u>twelve-e</u> of this chapter.
- § 2. Subparagraph ii of paragraph (a) of subdivision 1 and paragraph b 13 of subdivision 2 of section 2509 of the education law, as amended by chapter 201 of the laws of 2022, are amended to read as follows:
- ii. Notwithstanding any other provision of law or regulation to the 16 contrary, teachers and all other members of the teaching staff appointed 17 on or after July first, two thousand fifteen and authorized by section twenty-five hundred three of this article, shall be appointed by the board of education, upon the recommendation of the superintendent of 20 schools, for a probationary period of four years, except that in the 21 case of a teacher who has rendered satisfactory service as a regular 22 substitute for a period of up to two years [and, if a classroom teacher, 23 has received composite annual professional performance review ratings in 24 each of those years], or such teacher has rendered satisfactory service 25 as a seasonally licensed per session teacher of swimming in day schools 26 who has served in that capacity for a period of up to two years and has

EXPLANATION--Matter in italics (underscored) is new; matter in brackets [-] is old law to be omitted.

LBD15037-04-4

43

44

45

46

47

48

49

50 51

52

53

54

55

been appointed to teach the same subject in day schools on an annual salary, the teacher shall be appointed for a probationary period of $\underline{\mathbf{a}}$ 3 minimum of two years, depending upon the length of the regular substi-4 tute service that shall shorten the length of the probationary period; 5 provided, however, that in the case of a teacher who has been appointed on tenure in another school district within the state, the school 7 district where currently employed, or a board of cooperative educational 8 services, and who was not dismissed from such district or board as a 9 result of charges brought pursuant to subdivision one of section three 10 thousand twenty-a [or section three thousand twenty-b] of this chapter, the teacher shall be appointed for a probationary period of three 11 12 years[+ provided that the teacher demonstrates that he or she received an annual professional performance review rating pursuant to section 13 14 three thousand twelve-d or section three thousand twelve-d of this chap-15 ter in his or her final year of service in such other school district or board of cooperative educational services. Provided further, however, 16 17 that in the case of a teacher who has been appointed for a probationary period during the two thousand twenty--two thousand twenty-one, the two 18 thousand twenty-one--two thousand twenty-two or the two thousand twen-19 ty-two--two thousand twenty-three school year and who has been appointed 20 21 on tenure in another school district within the state, the school 22 district where currently employed, board of cooperative educational services or state school for the blind or deaf and who was not dismissed 23 from such district, board or state school for the blind or deaf as a 24 25 result of charges brought pursuant to subdivision one of section three thousand twenty-a or section three thousand twenty-b of this chapter, 26 27 such teacher shall be appointed for a probationary period of three years; provided that, in the case of a classroom teacher, such teacher 28 demonstrates that he or she received an annual professional performance 29 review rating pursuant to section three thousand twelve-c or section 30 31 three thousand twelve-d of this chapter in the two thousand seventeen-32 two thousand eighteen or two thousand eighteen two thousand nineteen 33 school year in such other school district, board of cooperative educa-34 tional services or state school for the blind or deaf]. The service of a person appointed to any of such positions may be discontinued at any 35 36 time during such probationary period, on the recommendation of the 37 superintendent of schools, by a majority vote of the board of education. Each person who is not to be recommended for appointment on tenure shall 38 be so notified by the superintendent of schools in writing not later 39 than sixty days immediately preceding the expiration of [his/her] such 40 41 person's probationary period. 42

b. For persons appointed on or after July first, two thousand fifteen, at the expiration of the probationary term of any persons appointed for such term, or within six months prior thereto, the superintendent of schools shall make a written report to the board of education recommending for appointment on tenure those persons who have been found competent, efficient and satisfactory [and in the case of a classroom teacher or building principal, who have received annual professional performance review ratings pursuant to section three thousand twelve-c or section three thousand twelve-d of this chapter, of either effective or highly effective in at least three of the four preceding years, exclusive of any breaks in service; provided that, in the case of a classroom teacher or building principal appointed during the two thousand seventeen-two thousand eighteen or the two thousand twenty--two thousand twenty-one school year, who have received composite annual professional performance 56 review ratings pursuant to section three thousand twelve-c or section

three thousand twelve-d of this chapter, of either effective or highly 1 effective in at least one of the four preceding years, exclusive of any 2 3 breaks in service, and did not receive an ineffective rating in the 4 final year of his or her probationary period, or during the most recent school year where a rating was received, and would have been in the 5 superintendent of schools' discretion qualified for appointment on 6 7 tenure based upon performance, notwithstanding that his or her annual 8 professional performance review had not been completed and he or she had 9 not received an annual professional performance rating for the two thou-10 sand nineteen -- two thousand twenty, two thousand twenty -- two thousand twenty-one or the two thousand twenty-one-two thousand twenty-two 11 school year; provided that, in the case of a classroom teacher or build-12 ing principal appointed during the two thousand eighteen two thousand 13 nineteen or two thousand nineteen -- two thousand twenty school year, who 14 15 has not received composite annual professional performance review ratings pursuant to section three thousand twelve-c or section three 16 17 thousand twelve-d of this chapter, for three consecutive years, no ratings shall be required for the superintendent of schools to recommend 18 for appointment on tenure such teacher or building principal if the 19 teacher or principal would have been, in the superintendent of schools! 20 discretion, qualified for appointment on tenure based upon performance, 21 notwithstanding that his or her annual professional performance review 22 had not been completed and he or she had not received an annual profes-23 sional performance review rating for the two thousand nineteen -- two 24 thousand twenty, two thousand twenty--two thousand twenty-one and two 25 thousand twenty-one--two thousand twenty-two school years; provided that 26 27 in the case of a classroom teacher or building principal appointed during the two thousand twenty-one-two thousand twenty-two school year 28 who have received composite annual professional performance review 29 ratings pursuant to section three thousand twelve-c or section three 30 thousand twelve-d of this chapter of either effective or highly effec-31 32 tive in at least two of the four preceding years, exclusive of any 33 breaks in service, and did not receive an ineffective rating in the final year of his or her probationary period, or during the most recent 34 35 school year where a rating was received, and would have been in the superintendent of schools' discretion qualified for appointment on 36 tenure based upon performance, notwithstanding that his or her annual 37 professional performance review had not been completed and he or she had 38 not received an annual professional performance rating for the two thou-39 sand twenty--two thousand twenty-one or two thousand twenty-one--two 40 thousand twenty-two school year; provided further that, notwithstanding 41 42 any other provision of this section to the contrary, when a teacher or 43 principal receives an effective or highly effective rating in each year 44 of his or her probationary service except he or she receives an ineffec-45 tive rating in the final year of his or her probationary period, such teacher or principal shall not be eligible for tenure but the board of 46 47 education in its discretion, may extend the teacher's probationary peri-48 ed for an additional year; provided, however, that if such teacher or principal successfully appealed such ineffective rating, such teacher or 49 principal shall immediately be eligible for tenure if the rating result-50 51 ing from the appeal established that such individual has been effective 52 or highly effective in at least three of the preceding four years and was not ineffective in the final year]. By a majority vote, the board of 53 54 education may then appoint on tenure any or all of the persons recommended by the superintendent of schools. [At the expiration of the 55 56 probationary period, the classroom teacher or building principal shall

3

4 5

6

7

8

9 10

11

13 14

15

16 17

18

19

20 21

23 24

25

26

27

28

29

remain in probationary status until the end of the school year in which such teacher or principal has received such ratings of effective or highly effective for at least three of the four preceding school years exclusive of any breaks in service and subject to the terms hereof, during which time a board of education shall consider whether to grant tenure for those classroom teachers or building principals who otherwise have been found competent, efficient and satisfactory. Provided, however, that the board of education may grant tenure contingent upon a classroom teacher's or building principal's receipt of a minimum rating in the final year of the probationary period, pursuant to the requirements of this section, and if such contingency is not met after all 12 appeals have been exhausted, the grant of tenure shall be void and unenforceable and the teacher's or principal's probationary period may be extended in accordance with this subdivision. Such persons who have been recommended for tenure and all others employed in the teaching service of the schools of such school district who have served the full probationary period as extended pursuant to this subdivision] Any person who has acquired tenure shall, upon such person's effective tenure date, hold their [respective positions] position during good behavior and efficient and competent service, and shall not be removable except for cause after a hearing as provided by section three thousand twenty and section three thousand twenty-a [or section three thousand twenty-b] of this chapter. Failure to maintain certification as required by this chapter and the regulations of the commissioner shall constitute cause for removal.

- § 3. Subparagraphs i and ii of paragraph (a) of subdivision 1 of section 2573 of the education law, subparagraph i as amended by section 3 of subpart D of part EE of chapter 56 of the laws of 2015, and subparagraph ii as amended by chapter 201 of the laws of 2022, are amended to read as follows:
- 30 31 i. Teachers and all other members of the teaching staff, appointed 32 prior to July first, two thousand fifteen and authorized by section twenty-five hundred fifty-four of this article, shall be appointed by 34 the board of education, upon the recommendation of the superintendent of 35 schools, for a probationary period of three years, except that in the 36 case of a teacher who has rendered satisfactory service as a regular 37 substitute for a period of two years or as a seasonally licensed per session teacher of swimming in day schools who has served in that capac-39 ity for a period of two years and has been appointed to teach the same subject in day schools on an annual salary, the probationary period 40 shall be limited to one year; provided, however, that in the case of a 41 42 teacher who has been appointed on tenure in another school district 43 within the state, the school district where currently employed, or a 44 board of cooperative educational services, and who was not dismissed 45 from such district or board as a result of charges brought pursuant to 46 subdivision one of section three thousand twenty-a [or section three 47 thousand twenty b] of this chapter, the probationary period shall not 48 exceed two years; provided, however, that in cities with a population of one million or more, a teacher appointed under a newly created license, 49 for teachers of reading and of the emotionally handicapped, to a posi-50 tion which the teacher has held for at least two years prior to such 51 appointment while serving on tenure in another license area who was not 52 53 dismissed as a result of charges brought pursuant to subdivision one of section three thousand twenty-a [or section three thousand twenty-b] of this chapter, the probationary period shall be one year. The service of 55 56 a person appointed to any of such positions may be discontinued at any

19 20

21

23 24

25

26 27

28

29 30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38 39

40

41 42

43

44 45

46

47

48

49

50 51

52

53

54

55

time during such probationary period, on the recommendation of the superintendent of schools, by a majority vote of the board of education. Each person who is not to be recommended for appointment on tenure shall be so notified by the superintendent of schools in writing not later 5 than sixty days immediately preceding the expiration of [his or her] such person's probationary period. In city school districts having a population of four hundred thousand or more, persons with licenses 7 obtained as a result of examinations announced subsequent to the twen-9 ty-second day of May, nineteen hundred sixty-nine appointed upon condi-10 tions that all announced requirements for the position be fulfilled 11 within a specified period of time, shall not acquire tenure unless and 12 until such requirements have been completed within the time specified for the fulfillment of such requirements, notwithstanding the expiration 13 14 of any probationary period. In all other city school districts subject 15 to the provisions of this article, failure to maintain certification as 16 required by this article and by the regulations of the commissioner 17 shall be cause for removal within the meaning of subdivision five of 18 this section.

ii. Teachers and all other members of the teaching staff appointed on after July first, two thousand fifteen and authorized by section twenty-five hundred fifty-four of this article, shall be appointed by the board of education, upon the recommendation of the superintendent of schools, for a probationary period of four years, except that in the case of a teacher who has rendered satisfactory service as a regular substitute for a period of up to two years [and, if a classroom teacher, has received annual professional performance review ratings in each of those years], or such teacher has rendered satisfactory service as a seasonally licensed per session teacher of swimming in day schools who has served in that capacity for a period of $\underline{\mathtt{up}}\ \mathtt{to}$ two years and has been appointed to teach the same subject in day schools on an annual salary, the teacher shall be appointed for a probationary period of a minimum of two years, depending upon the length of the regular substitute service that shall shorten the length of the probationary period; provided, however, that in the case of a teacher who has been appointed on tenure in another school district within the state, the school district where currently employed, or a board of cooperative educational services, and who was not dismissed from such district or board as a result of charges brought pursuant to subdivision one of section three thousand twenty-a [or section three thousand twenty-b] of this chapter, the teacher shall be appointed for a probationary period of three years[+ provided that, in the case of a classroom teacher, the teacher demonstrates that he or she received an annual professional performance review rating pursuant to section three thousand twelve-c or section three thousand twelve-d of this chapter in his or her final year of service in such other school district or board of cooperative educational services; provided, however, that, in the case of a classroom teacher who has been appointed for a probationary period during the two thousand twenty--two thousand twenty-one, the two thousand twenty-one-two thousand twenty-two or the two thousand twenty-two--two thousand twenty-three school year and who has been appointed on tenure in another school district within the state, the school district where currently employed, board of cooperative educational services or state school for the blind or deaf, and who was not dismissed from such district, board or state school for the blind or deaf as a result of charges brought pursuant to section three thousand twenty-a or section three thousand twenty-b of this chapter, such teacher shall be appointed for a probationary period of three years; provided

28

29 30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

39

40

41 42

43

44

45 46

47

48

49

50

51 52

53

that, in the case of a classroom teacher, such teacher demonstrates that he or she received an annual professional performance review rating pursuant to section three thousand twelve-c or section three thousand 3 twelve-d of this chapter in the two thousand seventeen--two thousand 4 5 eighteen or two thousand eighteen -- two thousand nineteen school year in such other school district, board of cooperative educational services or 7 state school for the blind or deaf]; provided further, however, that in cities with a population of one million or more, a teacher appointed 8 9 under a newly created license, for teachers of reading and of the 10 emotionally handicapped, to a position which the teacher has held for at 11 least two years prior to such appointment while serving on tenure in 12 another license area who was not dismissed as a result of charges brought pursuant to subdivision one of section three thousand twenty-a 13 14 [or section three thousand twenty-b] of this chapter, the teacher shall 15 be appointed for a probationary period of two years. The service of a person appointed to any of such positions may be discontinued at any 16 time during such probationary period, on the recommendation of the 17 superintendent of schools, by a majority vote of the board of education. 18 Each person who is not to be recommended for appointment on tenure shall 19 be so notified by the superintendent of schools in writing not later 20 21 than sixty days immediately preceding the expiration of [his or her] 22 such person's probationary period. In all city school districts subject 23 to the provisions of this article, failure to maintain certification as 24 required by this article and by the regulations of the commissioner 25 shall be cause for removal within the meaning of subdivision five of 26 this section. 27

- Subdivisions 5 and 6 of section 2573 of the education law, as amended by section 3 of subpart D of part EE of chapter 56 of the laws of 2015, paragraph (b) of subdivision 5 and paragraph (b) of subdivision 6 as amended by chapter 201 of the laws of 2022, are amended to read as follows:
- 5. (a) At the expiration of the probationary term of any persons appointed for such term prior to July first, two thousand fifteen, the superintendent of schools shall make a written report to the board of education recommending for permanent appointment those persons who have been found competent, efficient and satisfactory. Such persons and all others employed in the teaching, service of the schools of a city, who have served the full probationary period, shall hold their respective positions during good behavior and efficient and competent service, and shall not be removable except for cause after a hearing as provided by section three thousand twenty-a [or section three thousand twenty-b] of this chapter.
- (b) At the expiration of the probationary term of any persons appointed for such term on or after July first, two thousand fifteen, the superintendent of schools shall make a written report to the board education recommending for permanent appointment those persons who have been found competent, efficient and satisfactory [and, in the case of a classroom teacher or building principal, who have received composite annual professional performance review ratings pursuant to section three thousand twelve-d or section three thousand twelve-d of this chapter, of either effective or highly effective in at least three of the four preceding years, exclusive of any breaks in service; provided that, in the case of a classroom teacher or building principal appointed 54 during the two thousand seventeen -- two thousand eighteen or two thousand 55 twenty--two thousand twenty-one school year, who have received composite 56 annual professional performance review ratings pursuant to section three

thousand twelve-c or section three thousand twelve-d of this chapter of 1 either effective or highly effective in at least one of the four preced-2 3 ing years, exclusive of any breaks in service, and did not receive an 4 ineffective rating in the final year of his or her probationary period 5 or during the most recent school year where a rating was received, and 6 would have been in the superintendent of schools' discretion qualified 7 for appointment on tenure based upon performance, notwithstanding that 8 his or her annual professional performance review had not been completed 9 and he or she had not received an annual professional performance rating 10 for the two thousand nineteen -- two thousand twenty, two thousand twen-11 ty two thousand twenty one or the two thousand twenty one two thousand twenty-two school year; provided that, in the case of a classroom teach-12 er or building principal appointed during the two thousand eighteen - two 13 thousand nineteen or two thousand nineteen -- two thousand twenty school 14 15 year, who has not received composite annual professional performance review ratings pursuant to section three thousand twelve-c or section 16 17 three thousand twelve-d of this chapter for three consecutive years, no ratings shall be required for the superintendent of schools to recommend 18 for appointment on tenure such teacher or building principal if the 19 teacher or principal would have been, in the superintendent of schools! 20 discretion, qualified for appointment on tenure based upon performance, 21 notwithstanding that his or her annual professional performance review 22 had not been completed and he or she had not received an annual profes-23 sional performance review rating for the two thousand nineteen -- two 24 thousand twenty, two thousand twenty--two thousand twenty-one and two 25 thousand twenty-one--two thousand twenty-two school years; provided that 26 27 in the case of a classroom teacher or building principal appointed during the two thousand twenty-one-two thousand twenty-two school year 28 who have received composite annual professional performance review 29 ratings pursuant to section three thousand twelve-c or section three 30 thousand twelve-d of this chapter of either effective or highly effec-31 32 tive in at least two of the four preceding years, exclusive of any 33 breaks in service, and did not receive an ineffective rating in the final year of his or her probationary period or during the most recent 34 school year where a rating was received, and would have been in the 35 superintendent of schools' discretion qualified for appointment on 36 tenure based upon performance, notwithstanding that his or her annual 37 professional performance review had not been completed and he or she had 38 not received an annual professional performance rating for the two thou-39 sand twenty--two thousand twenty-one or two thousand twenty-one--two 40 thousand twenty-two school year; provided further that, notwithstanding 41 any other provision of this section to the contrary, when a teacher or 42 43 principal receives an effective and/or highly effective rating in each 44 year of his or her probationary service except he or she receives an 45 ineffective rating in the final year of his or her probationary period, such teacher or principal shall not be eligible for tenure but the board 46 47 of education in its discretion, may extend the teacher's probationary period for an additional year; provided, however, that if such teacher 48 or principal successfully appealed such ineffective rating, such teacher 49 or principal shall immediately be eligible for tenure if the rating 50 resulting from the appeal established that such individual has been 51 52 effective or highly effective in at least three of the preceding four years. At the expiration of the probationary period, the classroom 53 teacher or building principal shall remain in probationary status until the end of the school year in which such teacher or principal has 55 56 received such ratings of effective or highly effective for at least

23

24

25

26 27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35 36

three of the four preceding school years, exclusive of any breaks in 2 service and subject to the terms hereof, during which time a board of education shall consider whether to grant tenure for those classroom 3 teachers or building principals who otherwise have been found competent, 4 5 efficient and satisfactory. Provided, however, that the board of educa-6 tion may grant tenure contingent upon a classroom teacher's or building 7 principal's receipt of a minimum rating in the final year of the proba-8 tionary period, pursuant to the requirements of this section, and if 9 such contingency is not met after all appeals have been exhausted, the 10 grant of tenure shall be void and unenforceable and the teacher's or principal's probationary period may be extended in accordance with this 11 12 subdivision. Such persons who have been recommended for tenure and all others employed in the teaching service of the schools of such school 13 14 district who have served the full probationary period as extended pursu-15 ant to this subdivision]. Any person who has acquired tenure shall, upon such person's effective tenure date, hold their [respective positions] 16 17 position during good behavior and efficient and competent service, and shall not be removable except for cause after a hearing as provided by 18 19 section three thousand twenty and section three thousand twenty-a [ex section three thousand twenty-b] of this chapter. Failure to maintain 20 21 certification as required by this chapter and the regulations of the 22 commissioner shall constitute cause for removal.

- 6. (a) In a city having a population of four hundred thousand or more, at the expiration of the probationary term of any persons appointed for such term prior to July first, two thousand fifteen, the superintendent of schools shall make a written report to the board of education recommending for permanent appointment those persons who have been found satisfactory, and such board of education shall immediately thereafter issue to such persons permanent certificates of appointment. Such persons and all others employed in the teaching service of the schools of such city, who have served the full probationary period shall receive permanent certificates to teach issued to them by the certificating authority, except as otherwise provided in subdivision ten-a of this section, and shall hold their respective positions during good behavior and satisfactory teaching service, and shall not be removable except for cause after a hearing as provided by section three thousand twenty-a [exsection three thousand twenty-b] of this chapter.
- 37 38 (b) At the expiration of the probationary term of any persons appointed for such term on or after July first, two thousand fifteen, 39 the superintendent of schools shall make a written report to the board 40 education recommending for permanent appointment those persons who 41 42 have been found competent, efficient and satisfactory [and, in the case 43 of a classroom teacher or building principal, who have received compos-44 ite annual professional performance review ratings pursuant to section 45 three thousand twelve-d or section three thousand twelve-d of this chap-46 ter, of either effective or highly effective in at least three of the 47 four preceding years, exclusive of any breaks in service; provided that, in the case of a classroom teacher or building principal appointed 48 during the two thousand seventeen -- two thousand eighteen or two thousand 49 twenty--two thousand twenty-one school year, who have received composite 50 51 annual professional performance review ratings pursuant to section three 52 thousand twelve-c or section three thousand twelve-d of this chapter of either effective or highly effective in at least one of the four preced-53 54 ing years, exclusive of any breaks in service, and did not receive an 55 ineffective rating in the final year of his or her probationary period 56 or during the most recent school year where a rating was received, and

would have been in the superintendent of schools' discretion qualified for appointment on tenure based upon performance, notwithstanding that 2 3 his or her annual professional performance review had not been completed 4 and he or she had not received an annual professional performance rating 5 for the two thousand nineteen -- two thousand twenty, two thousand twen-6 ty two thousand twenty one or the two thousand twenty one two thousand 7 twenty-two school year; provided that, in the case of a classroom teach-8 er or building principal appointed during the two thousand eighteen - two 9 thousand nineteen or two thousand nineteen -- two thousand twenty school 10 year, who has not received composite annual professional performance 11 review ratings pursuant to section three thousand twelve-e or section three thousand twelve-d of this chapter for three consecutive years, no 12 ratings shall be required for the superintendent of schools to recommend 13 for appointment on tenure such teacher or building principal if the 14 15 teacher or principal would have been, in the superintendent of schools! 16 discretion, qualified for appointment on tenure based upon performance, 17 notwithstanding that his or her annual professional performance review had not been completed and he or she had not received a composite annual 18 professional performance review rating for the two thousand nineteen --19 two thousand twenty, two thousand twenty--two thousand twenty-one and 20 two thousand twenty-one--two thousand twenty-two school years; provided 21 that in the case of a classroom teacher or building principal appointed 22 during the two thousand twenty-one--two thousand twenty-two school year 23 who have received composite annual professional performance review 24 ratings pursuant to section three thousand twelve-c or section three 25 thousand twelve-d of this chapter of either effective or highly effec-26 27 tive in at least two of the four preceding years, exclusive of any breaks in service, and did not receive an ineffective rating in the 28 final year of his or her probationary period or during the most recent 29 30 school year where a rating was received, and would have been in the superintendent of schools' discretion qualified for appointment on 31 32 tenure based upon performance, notwithstanding that his or her annual professional performance review had not been completed and he or she had 33 not received an annual professional performance rating for the two thou-34 sand twenty--two thousand twenty-one or two thousand twenty-one--two 35 thousand twenty two school year; provided further that, notwithstanding 36 any other provision of this section to the contrary, when a teacher 37 receives an effective and/or highly effective rating in each year of his 38 or her probationary service except he or she receives an ineffective 39 rating in the final year of his or her probationary period, such teacher 40 or principal shall not be eligible for tenure but the board of education 41 42 in its discretion, may extend the teacher's probationary period for an 43 additional year; provided, however, that if such teacher or principal 44 successfully appealed such ineffective rating, such teacher or principal 45 shall immediately be eligible for tenure if the rating resulting from the appeal established that such individual has been effective or highly 46 47 effective in at least three of the preceding four years and was not ineffective in the final year. At the expiration of the probationary 48 period, the classroom teacher or building principal shall remain in 49 probationary status until the end of the school year in which such 50 teacher or principal has received such ratings of effective or highly 51 52 effective for at least three of the four preceding school years, exclugive of any breaks in service and subject to the terms hereof, during 53 54 which time a board of education shall consider whether to grant tenure for those classroom teachers or building principals who otherwise have 55 56 been found competent, efficient and satisfactory. Provided, however,

18

19

20 21

22

23

24 25

26

27

28

29

30

31

35

36

37

39

40

41 42

43

45 46

47

48

49

50 51

52

53

55

that the board of education may grant tenure contingent upon a classroom teacher's or building principal's receipt of a minimum rating in the final year of the probationary period, pursuant to the requirements of 3 this section, and if such contingency is not met after all appeals have 5 been exhausted, the grant of tenure shall be void and unenforceable and the teacher's or principal's probationary period may be extended in accordance with this subdivision. Such persons who have been recommended 7 for tenure and all others employed in the teaching service of the 8 schools of such school district who have served the full probationary 9 period as extended pursuant to this subdivision]. Any person who has 10 acquired tenure shall, upon such person's effective tenure date, hold 11 12 their [respective positions] position during good behavior and efficient and competent service, and shall not be removable except for cause after 13 14 a hearing as provided by section three thousand twenty and section three thousand twenty-a [or section three thousand twenty-b] of this chapter. 15 Failure to maintain certification as required by this chapter and the 16 17 regulations of the commissioner shall constitute cause for removal.

§ 5. Section 3012 of the education law, as amended by section 4 of subpart D of part EE of chapter 56 of the laws of 2015, subparagraph ii of paragraph (a) of subdivision 1 and paragraph (b) of subdivision 2 as amended by chapter 201 of the laws of 2022, and subparagraph ii of paragraph (b) of subdivision 1 as amended by chapter 345 of the laws of 2019, is amended to read as follows:

§ 3012. Tenure: certain school districts. 1. (a) i. Teachers and all other members of the teaching staff of school districts, including common school districts and/or school districts employing fewer than eight teachers, other than city school districts, who are appointed prior to July first, two thousand fifteen, shall be appointed by the board of education, or the trustees of common school districts, upon the recommendation of the superintendent of schools, for a probationary period of three years, except that in the case of a teacher who has 32 rendered satisfactory service as a regular substitute for a period of 33 two years or as a seasonally licensed per session teacher of swimming in 34 day schools who has served in that capacity for a period of two years and has been appointed to teach the same subject in day schools, on an annual salary, the probationary period shall be limited to one year; provided, however, that in the case of a teacher who has been appointed on tenure in another school district within the state, the school district where currently employed, or a board of cooperative educational services, and who was not dismissed from such district or board as a result of charges brought pursuant to subdivision one of section three thousand twenty-a [or section three thousand twenty-b] of this article, the probationary period shall not exceed two years. The service of a person appointed to any of such positions may be discontinued at any time during such probationary period, on the recommendation of the superintendent of schools, by a majority vote of the board of education or the trustees of a common school district.

ii. Teachers and all other members of the teaching staff of school districts, including common school districts and/or school districts employing fewer than eight teachers, other than city school districts, who are appointed on or after July first, two thousand fifteen, shall be appointed by the board of education, or the trustees of common school districts, upon the recommendation of the superintendent of schools, for a probationary period of four years, except that in the case of a teacher who has rendered satisfactory service as a regular substitute for a 56 period of up to two years [and, if a classroom teacher, has received

44

45

46 47

48

49

50

51

52

53

54

55

annual professional performance review ratings in each of those or **such teacher** has rendered satisfactory service as a seasonally licensed per session teacher of swimming in day schools who has served 4 in that capacity for a period of up to two years and has been appointed 5 to teach the same subject in day schools, on an annual salary, the teacher shall be appointed for a probationary period of a minimum of two 7 years, depending upon the length of the regular substitute service that 8 shall shorten the length of the probationary period; provided, however, 9 that in the case of a teacher who has been appointed on tenure in anoth-10 er school district within the state, the school district where currently 11 employed, or a board of cooperative educational services, and who was 12 not dismissed from such district or board as a result of charges brought pursuant to subdivision one of section three thousand twenty-a [ex-13 14 section three thousand twenty-b] of this article, the teacher shall be 15 appointed for a probationary period of three years[+ provided that, in 16 the case of a classroom teacher, the teacher demonstrates that he or she 17 received an annual professional performance review rating pursuant to section three thousand twelve-d or section three thousand twelve-d of 18 this chapter in his or her final year of service in such other school 19 district or board of cooperative educational services. Provided further, 20 21 however, that in the case of a teacher who has been appointed for a 22 probationary period during the two thousand twenty-two thousand twenty-one, the two thousand twenty one-two thousand twenty-two or the two 23 thousand twenty-two--two thousand twenty-three school year and who has 24 25 been appointed on tenure in another school district within the state, the school district where currently employed, board of cooperative 26 27 educational services or state school for the blind or deaf and who was 28 not dismissed from such district, board or state school for the blind or deaf as a result of charges brought pursuant to subdivision one of 29 30 section three thousand twenty-a or section three thousand twenty-b of 31 this article, such teacher shall be appointed for a probationary period 32 of three years; provided that, in the case of a classroom teacher, such 33 teacher demonstrates that he or she received an annual professional 34 performance review rating pursuant to section three thousand twelve-c or section three thousand twelve-d of this article in the two thousand 35 36 seventeen -- two thousand eighteen or two thousand eighteen -- two thousand 37 nineteen school year in such other school district, board of cooperative educational services or state school for the blind or deaf]. The service 38 39 of a person appointed to any of such positions may be discontinued at 40 any time during such probationary period, on the recommendation of the 41 superintendent of schools, by a majority vote of the board of education 42 or the trustees of a common school district. 43

(b) i. Principals, administrators, supervisors and all other members of the supervising staff of school districts, including common school districts and/or school districts employing fewer than eight teachers, other than city school districts, who are appointed prior to July first, two thousand fifteen, shall be appointed by the board of education, or the trustees of a common school district, upon the recommendation of the superintendent of schools for a probationary period of three years. The service of a person appointed to any of such positions may be discontinued at any time during the probationary period on the recommendation of the superintendent of schools, by a majority vote of the board of education or the trustees of a common school district.

ii. Principals, administrators, supervisors and all other members of the supervising staff of school districts, including common school districts and/or school districts employing fewer than eight teachers,

21

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

36

37

38

39

40

41 42

43

45 46

47

48

49

50 51

52

53

other than city school districts, who are appointed on or after July first, two thousand fifteen, shall be appointed by the board of education, or the trustees of a common school district, upon the recommendation of the superintendent of schools for a probationary period of four 5 years; provided, however, that in the case of a principal, administrator, supervisor, or other member of the supervising staff who has been 7 appointed on tenure pursuant to this chapter as an administrator within an authorized administrative tenure area in another school district within the state, the school district where currently employed, or a 9 10 board of cooperative educational services, and who was not dismissed 11 from such district or board as a result of charges brought pursuant to 12 subdivision one of section three thousand twenty-a [er section three thousand twenty-b] of this article, the principal, administrator, super-13 14 visor or other member of the supervising staff shall be appointed for a 15 probationary period of three years. The service of a person appointed to 16 any of such positions may be discontinued at any time during the proba-17 tionary period on the recommendation of the superintendent of schools, 18 by a majority vote of the board of education or the trustees of a common 19 school district. 20

- (c) Any person previously appointed to tenure or a probationary period pursuant to the provisions of former section three thousand thirteen of this article shall continue to hold such position and be governed by the provisions of this section notwithstanding any contrary provision of law.
- (a) At the expiration of the probationary term of a person appointed for such term prior to July first, two thousand fifteen, subject to the conditions of this section, the superintendent of schools shall make a written report to the board of education or the trustees of common school district recommending for appointment on tenure those persons who have been found competent, efficient and satisfactory. persons, and all others employed in the teaching service of the schools of such union free school district, common school district and/or school district employing fewer than eight teachers, who have served the probationary period as provided in this section, shall hold their respective 35 positions during good behavior and efficient and competent service, and shall not be removed except for any of the following causes, after a hearing, as provided by section three thousand twenty-a [or section three thousand twenty b of this article: [(a)] (i) insubordination, immoral character or conduct unbecoming a teacher; [(b)] (ii) inefficiency, incompetency, physical or mental disability, or neglect of duty; [(c)] (iii) failure to maintain certification as required by this chapter and by the regulations of the commissioner. Each person who is not to be recommended for appointment on tenure, shall be so notified by the superintendent of schools in writing not later than sixty days immediately preceding the expiration of [his] such person's probationary period.
- (b) At the expiration of the probationary term of a person appointed for such term on or after July first, two thousand fifteen, subject to the conditions of this section, the superintendent of schools shall make a written report to the board of education or the trustees of a common school district recommending for appointment on tenure those persons who have been found competent, efficient and satisfactory [and, in the case of a classroom teacher or building principal, who have received composite annual professional performance review ratings pursuant to section 55 three thousand twelve-c or section three thousand twelve-d of this arti-56 cle, of either effective or highly effective in at least three of the

four preceding years, exclusive of any breaks in service; provided that 1 2 in the case of a classroom teacher or building principal appointed 3 during the two thousand seventeen - two thousand eighteen or two thousand 4 twenty--two thousand twenty-one school year, who have received composite 5 annual professional performance review ratings pursuant to section three 6 thousand twelve-c or section three thousand twelve-d of this article, of 7 either effective or highly effective in at least one of the four preceding years, exclusive of any breaks in service, and did not receive an 8 9 ineffective rating in the final year of his or her probationary period, 10 or during the most recent school year where a rating was received, and 11 would have been in the superintendent of schools! discretion qualified for appointment on tenure based upon performance, notwithstanding that 12 his or her annual professional performance review had not been completed 13 and he or she had not received an annual professional performance rating 14 15 for the two thousand nineteen -- two thousand twenty, two thousand twenty two thousand twenty one or the two thousand twenty one two thousand 16 17 twenty-two school year; provided that, in the case of a classroom teacher or building principal appointed during the two thousand eighteen-two 18 thousand nineteen or two thousand nineteen--two thousand twenty school 19 year, who has not received composite annual professional performance 20 review ratings pursuant to section three thousand twelve-c or section 21 three thousand twelve-d of this article for three consecutive years, no 22 ratings shall be required for the superintendent of schools to recommend 23 for appointment on tenure such teacher or building principal if the 24 teacher or principal would have been, in the superintendent of schools! 25 discretion, qualified for appointment on tenure based upon performance, 26 27 notwithstanding that his or her annual professional performance review had not been completed and he or she had not received an annual profes-28 sional performance review rating for the two thousand nineteen -- two 29 thousand twenty, two thousand twenty--two thousand twenty-one and two 30 thousand twenty-one--two thousand twenty-two school years; provided that 31 32 in the case of a classroom teacher or building principal appointed 33 during the two thousand twenty-one-two thousand twenty-two school year who have received composite annual professional performance review 34 ratings pursuant to section three thousand twelve-c or section three 35 36 thousand twelve-d of this article of either effective or highly effective in at least two of the four preceding years, exclusive of any 37 breaks in service, and did not receive an ineffective rating in the 38 final year of his or her probationary period, or during the most recent 39 school year where a rating was received, and would have been in the 40 superintendent of schools' discretion qualified for appointment on 41 tenure based upon performance, notwithstanding that his or her annual 42 43 professional performance review had not been completed and he or she had 44 not received an annual professional performance rating for the two thou-45 sand twenty--two thousand twenty-one or two thousand twenty-one--two thousand twenty-two school year; provided further that, notwithstanding 46 47 any other provision of this section to the contrary, when a teacher or principal receives an effective or highly effective rating in each year 48 of his or her probationary service except he or she receives an ineffec-49 tive rating in the final year of his or her probationary period, such 50 51 teacher shall not be eligible for tenure but the board of education, in 52 its discretion, may extend the teacher's probationary period for an additional year; provided, however, that if such teacher or principal 53 54 successfully appealed such ineffective rating, such teacher or principal 55 shall immediately be eligible for tenure if the rating resulting from 56 the appeal established that such individual has been effective or highly

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

effective in at least three of the preceding four years and was 1 ineffective in the final year. At the expiration of the probationary 2 period, the classroom teacher or building principal shall remain in 3 probationary status until the end of the school year in which such 4 5 teacher or principal has received such ratings of effective or highly 6 effective for at least three of the four preceding school years, exclu-7 sive of any breaks in service, and subject to the terms hereof, during 8 which time the trustees or board of education shall consider whether to 9 grant tenure for those classroom teachers or building principals who otherwise have been found competent, efficient and satisfactory. 10 Provided, however, that the trustees or board of education may grant 11 12 tenure contingent upon a classroom teacher's or building principal's receipt of a minimum rating in the final year of the probationary peri-13 14 od, pursuant to the requirements of this section, and if such contingen-15 cy is not met after all appeals have been exhausted, the grant of tenure shall be void and unenforceable and the teacher's or principal's proba-16 17 tionary period may be extended in accordance with this subdivision. Such persons who have been recommended for tenure and all others employed in 18 the teaching service of the schools of such school district who have 19 served the full probationary period as extended pursuant to this subdi-20 21 vision]. Any person who has acquired tenure shall, upon such person's 22 effective tenure date, hold their [respective positions] position during good behavior and efficient and competent service, and shall not be 23 24 removable except for cause after a hearing as provided by section three thousand twenty and section three thousand twenty-a [or section three 25 26 thousand twenty b] of this article. Failure to maintain certification as 27 required by this chapter and the regulations of the commissioner shall 28 constitute cause for removal. 29

- 3. Notwithstanding any other provision of this section no period in any school year for which there is no required service and/or for which no compensation is provided shall in any event constitute a break or suspension of probationary period or continuity of tenure rights of any of the persons hereinabove described.
- § 6. Subdivisions 1, 11, and 17 of section 3012-d of the education law, subdivisions 1 and 11 as added by section 2 of subpart E of part EE of chapter 56 of the laws of 2015, and subdivision 17 as amended by chapter 201 of the laws of 2022, are amended to read as follows:
- 38 1. General provisions. Notwithstanding any other provision of law, 39 rule or regulation to the contrary, the annual teacher and principal evaluations (hereinafter, evaluations) implemented by districts shall be 40 conducted in accordance with the provisions of this section. Such annual 41 42 evaluations shall be a significant factor for employment decisions 43 including but not limited to, promotion, retention, tenure determi-44 nation, termination, and supplemental compensation. Such evaluations 45 shall also be a significant factor in teacher and principal development 46 including but not limited to coaching, induction support, and differen-47 tiated professional development. Provided, however, that for the two 48 thousand twenty-four--two thousand twenty-five school year and thereaft-49 er, school districts and boards of cooperative educational services may conduct annual professional performance reviews pursuant to section 50 three thousand twelve-e of this article. In such case, the provisions of 51 52 this section shall not be applicable. Provided, however, annual teacher 53 and principal evaluation plans adopted pursuant to this section shall 54 not be applicable after the two thousand thirty-one--two thousand thir-55 ty-two school year.

11. [Notwithstanding any inconsistent provision of law, no school district shall be eligible for an apportionment of general support for public schools from the funds appropriated for the 2015-2016 school year and any year thereafter in excess of the amount apportioned to such school district in the respective base year unless such school district has submitted documentation that has been approved by the commissioner by November fifteenth, two thousand fifteen, or by September first of each subsequent year, demonstrating that it has fully implemented the standards and procedures for conducting annual teacher and principal evaluations of teachers and principals in accordance with the requirements of this section and the regulations issued by the commissioner. Provided further that any apportionment withheld pursuant to this section shall not occur prior to April first of the current year and shall not have any effect on the base year calculation for use in the subsequent school year. For purposes of this section, "base year" shall mean the base year as defined in paragraph b of subdivision one of section thirty-six hundred two of this chapter, and "current year" shall mean the current year as defined in paragraph a of subdivision one of section thirty-six hundred two of this chapter] Each school district or board of cooperative educational services, as applicable, shall certify by September first of each year that their school district or board of cooperative educational services has a teacher and principal evaluation plan that is in compliance with the requirements of this section or a performance review plan that is in compliance with the requirements of section three thousand twelve-e of this article, as applicable, and that the district or board of cooperative educational services conducted evaluations in accordance with their most recently approved plan during the preceding school year. Provided, however, that a school district or board of cooperative educational services may only have an approved teacher and principal evaluation plan pursuant to this section until June thirtieth, two thousand thirty-two.

17. Notwithstanding any other provision of this section, for the two thousand twenty--two thousand twenty-one and the two thousand twenty-one--two thousand twenty-two school years, no school district or board of cooperative educational services shall be required to complete an annual teacher and principal evaluation required by this section for any classroom teacher or building principal [and state funding shall not be withheld from any school district for not complying with the requirements of this section].

 \S 7. The education law is amended by adding a new section 3012-e to 41 read as follows:

§ 3012-e. Teacher and principal performance review plans. 1. Notwithstanding any other provision of law, rule, or regulation to the contrary, for the annual professional performance reviews related to the two thousand twenty-four--two thousand twenty-five school year and thereafter, a school district or board of cooperative educational services shall conduct performance reviews of classroom teachers and building principals in accordance with the provisions of this section or section three thousand twelve-d of this article, as applicable. Provided that all school districts and boards of cooperative educational services shall adopt a performance review plan pursuant to this section no later than June thirtieth, two thousand thirty-two and such plan shall be used to complete performance reviews of classroom teachers and building principals no later than the two thousand thirty-two--two thousand thirty-three school year. Performance review plans developed pursuant to this section shall be the result of reaching a collectively bargained agree-

ment negotiated pursuant to article fourteen of the civil service law where a recognized employee organization exists.

- 2. Nothing herein shall require modification of an existing teacher and principal evaluation plan approved by the commissioner pursuant to section three thousand twelve-d of this article and all teacher and principal evaluation plans approved by the commissioner pursuant to the provisions of section three thousand twelve-d of this article shall not be affected by the provisions of this section on or before June thirti-eth, two thousand thirty-two; provided, however, that when a school district or board of cooperative educational services adopts a perform-ance review plan pursuant to this section, the school district or board of cooperative educational services shall notify the department and submit the new plan to the department for review on a form and in a manner prescribed by the commissioner. Provided further that, prior to June thirtieth, two thousand thirty-two, a teacher and principal evaluation plan may still be adopted or modified pursuant to section three thousand twelve-d of this article consistent with the provisions of such section.
 - 3. The performance reviews conducted pursuant to this section shall be a significant factor in teacher and principal development, including but not limited to coaching, induction support, and differentiated professional development for all teachers and principals.
 - 4. (a) A school board or board of cooperative educational services shall make its most recently adopted and reviewed plan pursuant to this section available on the school district or board of cooperative educational services' website.
 - (b) On an annual basis, each school district and board of cooperative educational services shall submit to the commissioner the ratings for each classroom teacher and building principal on each applicable teaching or leadership standard, as well as the overall rating for each teacher and principal, where available, on a form and in a manner prescribed by the commissioner. Such data shall be collected and used to the extent necessary to comply with any applicable state and federal statutory requirements.
 - (c) The commissioner and each school district and board of cooperative educational services shall ensure that any release to the public of data collected pursuant to this section, or any other data that is used as a component of performance reviews, does not include personally identifying information for any classroom teacher or building principal; provided, however, that each school district or board of cooperative educational services shall fully disclose and release to the parents or legal quardians of a student the most recent performance review rating received for each of the teachers and for the principal of the school building to which the student is assigned for the current school year consistent with paragraph b of subdivision ten of section three thousand twelve-c of this article.
- 47 (d) Performance reviews of individual classroom teachers and building 48 principals shall not be subject to disclosure pursuant to article six of 49 the public officers law.
- 50 <u>5. (a) Performance review plans developed pursuant to this section</u> 51 <u>shall:</u>
- 52 <u>(i) include the criteria by which all classroom teachers and building</u>
 53 <u>principals shall be reviewed and a description of the review procedures;</u>
- 54 <u>(ii) address each state teaching and educational leadership standard,</u>
 55 <u>as developed or adopted by the commissioner;</u>

(iii) consist of multiple measures; provided, however, that one measure shall be classroom observations of classroom teachers and school visits of building principals. The plan shall describe the number and frequency of observations; provided that nothing herein shall be construed to require that all classroom teachers or building principals have the same number or frequency of observations.

- (iv) provide the classroom teacher or building principal with timely, actionable feedback on their practice based on the information collected as part of the performance review;
- 10 <u>(v) assign ratings on each applicable teaching or educational leader-</u>
 11 <u>ship standard and an overall rating of Level 4, Level 3, Level 2, or</u>
 12 <u>Level 1 consistent with the following requirements:</u>
 - (1) Level 1 shall indicate performance significantly below a school district's or board of cooperative educational services' expectations aligned to teaching or educational leadership standards;
 - (2) Level 2 shall indicate performance that partially meets a school district's or board of cooperative educational services' expectations aligned to teaching or educational leadership standards;
 - (3) Level 3 shall indicate performance that meets a school district's or board of cooperative educational services' expectations aligned to teaching or educational leadership standards; and
 - (4) Level 4 shall indicate performance that exceeds a school district's or board of cooperative educational services' expectations aligned to teaching or educational leadership standards;
 - (vi) ensure that it is possible for a classroom teacher or building principal to obtain each rating on each teaching or educational leadership standard and as an overall rating. The process by which ratings are assigned shall be transparent and available to those being rated prior to the start of the school year, to the extent practicable; and
 - (vii) include a process for each classroom teacher and building principal to receive formal support for professional growth each year, provided that teachers and principals who receive an overall rating of Level 1 or 2 shall have a personalized professional development plan, developed by the school district or board of cooperative educational services, consistent with a locally determined growth goal setting process.
- 37 <u>(b) One measure may be used to address more than one teaching or</u>
 38 <u>educational leadership standard provided that the performance review</u>
 39 <u>includes multiple measures.</u>
 - (c) Performance reviews conducted pursuant to this section may assess a subset of the teaching and educational leadership standards in a given year; provided, however, that probationary classroom teachers and building principals shall be rated on each teaching or educational leadership standard annually.
 - (d) Nothing in this section shall be construed to require all classroom teachers or building principals to be evaluated based on the same
 measures or to receive an overall rating annually; provided, however,
 that at a minimum, probationary teachers and principals shall receive a
 rating on each teaching or educational leadership standard and an overall rating annually, while other teachers and principals may have a
 differentiated performance review process that does not culminate in an
 overall rating annually. Provided, further, that nothing herein shall be
 construed to prohibit or prevent any other teachers and principals from
 receiving an overall rating annually.
- 55 <u>6. The school district or board of cooperative educational services,</u> 56 <u>as applicable, shall ensure that all classroom teachers and building</u>

principals as well as any individual who conducts all or part of a performance review receive appropriate training consistent with the regulations of the commissioner and shall ensure that each teacher and principal who is reviewed in accordance with this section has the opportunity to provide written comment on their performance review in addition to any collectively bargained teacher and principal performance review grievance or appeal procedures.

- 7. Nothing in this section shall be construed to affect the unfettered statutory right of a school district or board of cooperative educational services, as applicable, to terminate a probationary classroom teacher or principal for any statutorily and constitutionally permissible reasons.
- 8. Performance review plans developed pursuant to this section shall be submitted to the commissioner on a form and in a manner prescribed by the commissioner. The commissioner shall review such plan to determine compliance with the requirements of this section. If the commissioner determines that the submitted plan is not in compliance with this section, the plan shall be returned to the school district or board of cooperative educational services for revision. Such revisions shall be resolved through collective bargaining, to the extent required under article fourteen of the civil service law. The plan most recently accepted by the commissioner pursuant to this section shall remain in effect until a subsequent plan is agreed to by the parties and reviewed by the commissioner to determine compliance with the requirements of this section. Each school district and board of cooperative educational services shall certify annually to the commissioner that they have fully implemented the plan most recently accepted by the commissioner.
- § 8. Section 3014 of the education law, as amended by section 5 of subpart D of part EE of chapter 56 of the laws of 2015, paragraph (b) of subdivision 1 and paragraph (b) of subdivision 2 as amended by chapter 201 of the laws of 2022, is amended to read as follows:
- § 3014. Tenure: boards of cooperative educational services. 1. (a) Administrative assistants, supervisors, teachers and all other members of the teaching and supervising staff of the board of cooperative educational services appointed prior to July first, two thousand fifteen, shall be appointed by a majority vote of the board of cooperative educational services upon the recommendation of the district superintendent schools for a probationary period of not to exceed three years; provided, however, that in the case of a teacher who has been appointed on tenure in a school district within the state, the board of cooperative educational services where currently employed, or another board of cooperative educational services, and who was not dismissed from such district or board as a result of charges brought pursuant to subdivision one of section three thousand twenty-a [or section three thousand twenty-a ty-b] of this article, the probationary period shall not exceed two years. Services of a person so appointed to any such positions may be discontinued at any time during such probationary period, upon the recommendation of the district superintendent, by a majority vote of the board of cooperative educational services.
- (b) Administrative assistants, supervisors, teachers and all other members of the teaching and supervising staff of the board of cooperative educational services appointed on or after July first, two thousand fifteen, shall be appointed by a majority vote of the board of cooperative educational services upon the recommendation of the district superintendent of schools for a probationary period of not to exceed four years; provided, however, that in the case of a teacher who has

48

49

50 51

52 53

been appointed on tenure in a school district within the state, the board of cooperative educational services where currently employed, or another board of cooperative educational services, and who was not dismissed from such district or board as a result of charges brought 5 pursuant to section three thousand twenty-a [or section three thousand twenty b] of this article, the teacher shall be appointed for a proba-7 tionary period of three years; [provided that, in the case of a classroom teacher, the teacher demonstrates that he or she received a compos-8 ite annual professional performance review rating pursuant to section 9 three thousand twelve-d or three thousand twelve-d of this article of 10 either effective or highly effective in his or her final year of service 11 in such other school district or board of cooperative educational 12 **services**; and provided further that in the case of a principal, admin-13 istrator, supervisor, or other member of the supervising staff who has 14 15 been appointed on tenure pursuant to this chapter as an administrator within an authorized administrative tenure area in another school 16 17 district within the state, the school district where currently employed, or a board of cooperative educational services, and who was not dismissed from such district or board as a result of charges brought pursuant to subdivision one of section three thousand twenty-a [\bullet 18 19 20 21 section three thousand twenty b of this article, the principal, admin-22 istrator, supervisor, or other member of the supervising staff shall be appointed for a probationary period of three years. [Provided further, 23 however, that in the case of a classroom teacher who has been appointed 24 25 for a probationary period during the two thousand twenty--two thousand twenty-one, the two thousand twenty-one--two thousand twenty-two or the 26 27 two thousand twenty-two-two thousand twenty-three school year and who 28 has been appointed on tenure in a school district within the state, 29 state school for the blind or deaf, the board of cooperative educational services where currently employed, or another board of cooperative 30 educational services, and who was not dismissed from such district, 31 board or state school for the blind or deaf as a result of charges 32 brought pursuant to section three thousand twenty-a or section three 33 34 thousand twenty-b of this article, such teacher shall be appointed for a probationary period of three years; provided that, in the case of a 35 36 classroom teacher, such teacher demonstrates that he or she received an 37 annual professional performance review rating pursuant to section three 38 thousand twelve-c or section three thousand twelve-d of this article of 39 either effective or highly effective in the two thousand seventeen -- two thousand eighteen or two thousand eighteen -- two thousand nineteen school 40 year in such other school district, state school for the blind or deaf 41 42 or board of cooperative educational pervices.] Services of a person so 43 appointed to any such positions to which this paragraph applies may be 44 discontinued at any time during the probationary period, upon the recom-45 mendation of the district superintendent, by a majority vote of the 46 board of cooperative educational services. 47

2. (a) On or before the expiration of the probationary term of a person appointed for such term prior to July first, two thousand fifteen, the district superintendent of schools shall make a written report to the board of cooperative educational services recommending for appointment on tenure persons who have been found competent, efficient and satisfactory. Such persons shall hold their respective positions during good behavior and competent and efficient service and shall not be removed except for any of the following causes, after a hearing, as 55 provided by section three thousand twenty-a [or section three thousand 56 twenty-b] of this article: (i) Insubordination, immoral character or

4

5

conduct unbecoming a teacher; (ii) Inefficiency, incompetency, or neglect of duty; (iii) Failure to maintain certification as required by this chapter and by the regulations of the commissioner. Each person who is not to be so recommended for appointment on tenure shall be so notified in writing by the district superintendent not later than sixty days immediately preceding the expiration of [his or her] such person's probationary period.

7 (b) On or before the expiration of the probationary term of a person 8 appointed for such term on or after July first, two thousand fifteen, 9 10 the district superintendent of schools shall make a written report to 11 the board of cooperative educational services recommending for appoint-12 ment on tenure persons who have been found competent, efficient and satisfactory [and, in the case of a classroom teacher or building prin-13 14 cipal, who have received composite annual professional performance 15 review ratings pursuant to section three thousand twelve-c or section three thousand twelve-d of this article, of either effective or highly 16 17 effective in at least three of the four preceding years, exclusive of any breaks in service; provided that, in the case of a classroom teacher 18 or building principal appointed during the two thousand seventeen--two 19 20 thousand eighteen or two thousand twenty--two thousand twenty-one school 21 year who have received composite annual professional performance review ratings pursuant to section three thousand twelve-c or section three 22 thousand twelve-d of this article of either effective or highly effec-23 tive in at least one of the four preceding years, exclusive of any 24 breaks in service, and did not receive an ineffective rating in the 25 final year of his or her probationary period or in the most recent 26 27 school year where a rating was received, and would have been in the district superintendent of schools' discretion qualified for appointment 28 on tenure based upon performance, notwithstanding that his or her annual 29 30 professional performance review had not been completed and he or she had 31 not received an annual professional performance rating for the two thou-32 sand nineteen two thousand twenty, two thousand twenty-two thousand 33 twenty-one or the two thousand twenty-one-two thousand twenty-two 34 school year; provided that, in the case of a classroom teacher or build-35 ing principal appointed during the two thousand eighteen--two thousand 36 nineteen or two thousand nineteen - two thousand twenty school year, who 37 has not received composite annual professional performance review ratings pursuant to section three thousand twelve-c or section three 38 39 thousand twelve-d of this article for three consecutive years, no ratings shall be required for the district superintendent of schools to 40 41 recommend for appointment on tenure such teacher or building principal 42 if the teacher or principal would have been, in the district superinten-43 dent of schools' discretion, qualified for appointment on tenure based 44 upon performance, notwithstanding that his or her annual professional performance review had not been completed and he or she had not received 45 an annual professional performance review rating for the two thousand 46 47 nineteen-two thousand twenty, two thousand twenty-two thousand twenty-one and two thousand twenty-one--two thousand twenty-two school 48 years; provided that in the case of a classroom teacher or building 49 principal appointed during the two thousand twenty-one--two thousand 50 51 twenty-two school year who have received composite annual professional 52 performance review ratings pursuant to section three thousand twelve-c 53 or section three thousand twelve-d of this article of either effective 54 or highly effective in at least two of the four preceding years, exclu-55 sive of any breaks in service, and did not receive an ineffective rating 56 in the final year of his or her probationary period, or during the most

47

48

49 50

51

52

53

54

55

recent school year where a rating was received, and would have been in the district superintendent of schools' discretion qualified for 2 appointment on tenure based upon performance, notwithstanding that his 3 4 or her annual professional performance review had not been completed and 5 he or she had not received an annual professional performance rating for the two thousand twenty--two thousand twenty-one or two thousand twen-6 7 ty-one--two thousand twenty-two school year; provided further that, notwithstanding any other provision of this section to the contrary, 8 9 when a teacher or principal receives an effective or highly effective 10 rating in each year of his or her probationary service except he or she receives an ineffective rating in the final year of his or her proba-11 tionary period, such teacher shall not be eligible for tenure but the 12 board of education in its discretion, may extend the teacher's proba-13 14 tionary period for an additional year; provided, however that if such 15 teacher or principal successfully appealed such ineffective rating, such teacher or principal shall immediately be eligible for tenure if the 16 rating resulting from the appeal established that such individual has 17 been effective or highly effective in at least three of the preceding four years and was not ineffective in the final year. At the expiration 18 19 20 of the probationary period, the classroom teacher or building principal 21 shall remain in probationary status until the end of the school year in 22 which such teacher or principal has received such ratings of effective 23 or highly effective for at least three of the four preceding school years, exclusive of any breaks in service, during which time a board of 24 cooperative educational services shall consider whether to grant tenure 25 for those classroom teachers or building principals who otherwise have 26 27 been found competent, efficient and satisfactory. Provided, however, 28 that the board of cooperative educational services may grant tenure contingent upon a classroom teacher's or building principal's receipt of 29 a minimum rating in the final year of the probationary period, pursuant 30 31 to the requirements of this section, and if such contingency is not met 32 after all appeals have been exhausted, the grant of tenure shall be void 33 and unenforceable and the teacher's or principal's probationary period 34 may be extended in accordance with this subdivision]. Such persons shall 35 hold their respective positions during good behavior and competent and 36 efficient service and shall not be removed except for any of the follow-37 ing causes, after a hearing, as provided by section three thousand twenty-a [or section three thousand twenty-b] of this article: (i) Insubor-38 39 dination, immoral character or conduct unbecoming a teacher; Inefficiency, incompetency, or neglect of duty; (iii) Failure to main-40 tain certification as required by this chapter and by the regulations of 41 42 the commissioner. Each person who is not to be so recommended for 43 appointment on tenure shall be so notified in writing by the district superintendent not later than sixty days immediately preceding the expi-44 45 ration of [his or her] such person's probationary period. 46

§ 9. Section 3020 of the education law, as amended by chapter 691 of the laws of 1994, subdivision 1 as amended by chapter 103 of the laws of 2010, subdivision 3 and paragraph a of subdivision 4 as amended by section 2 of subpart G of part EE of chapter 56 of the laws of 2015, and subdivision 4 as added by section 1 of part J of chapter 93 of the laws of 2002, is amended to read as follows:

§ 3020. Discipline of teachers. 1. No person enjoying the benefits of tenure shall be disciplined or removed during a term of employment except for just cause and in accordance with the procedures specified in section three thousand twenty-a of this article or in accordance with 56 alternate disciplinary procedures contained in a collective bargaining

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41 42

43

44

45

46

47 48

49

50 51

53

agreement covering [his or her] such person's terms and conditions of employment that was effective on or before September first, nineteen hundred ninety-four and has been unaltered by renegotiation, or in accordance with alternative disciplinary procedures contained in a 5 collective bargaining agreement covering [his or her] such person's terms and conditions of employment that becomes effective on or after 7 September first, nineteen hundred ninety-four; provided, however, that any such alternate disciplinary procedures contained in a collective 8 9 bargaining agreement that becomes effective on or after September first, 10 nineteen hundred ninety-four, must provide for the written election by 11 the employee of either the procedures specified in such section three 12 thousand twenty-a or the alternative disciplinary procedures contained 13 in the collective bargaining agreement and must result in a disposition 14 of the disciplinary charge within the amount of time allowed therefor 15 under such section three thousand twenty-a[+ and provided further that 16 any alternate disciplinary procedures contained in a collective bargain-17 ing agreement that becomes effective on or after July first, two thousand ten shall provide for an expedited hearing process before a single 18 hearing officer in accordance with subparagraph (i-a) of paragraph c of 19 subdivision three of section three thousand twenty-a of this article in 20 21 cases in which charges of incompetence are brought based solely upon an 22 allegation of a pattern of ineffective teaching or performance as 23 defined in section three thousand twelve-c of this article and shall provide that such a pattern of ineffective teaching or performance shall 24 25 constitute very significant evidence of incompetence which may form the 26 basis for just cause removal]. 27

- 2. No person enjoying the benefits of tenure shall be suspended for a fixed time without pay or dismissed due to a violation of article thirteen-E of the public health law.
- 3. Notwithstanding any inconsistent provision of law, the procedures set forth in section three thousand twenty-a of this article and subdivision seven of section twenty-five hundred ninety-j of this chapter may be modified or replaced by agreements negotiated between the city school district of the city of New York and any employee organization representing employees or titles that are or were covered by any memorandum of agreement executed by such city school district and the council of supervisors and administrators of the city of New York on or after December first, nineteen hundred ninety-nine. Where such procedures are so modified or replaced: (i) compliance with such modification or replacement procedures shall satisfy any provision in this chapter that requires compliance with section three thousand twenty-a of this article, (ii) any employee against whom charges have been preferred prior to the effective date of such modification or replacement shall continue to be subject to the provisions of such section as in effect on the date such charges were preferred, (iii) the provisions of subdivisions one and two of this section shall not apply to agreements negotiated pursuant to this subdivision, and (iv) in accordance with paragraph (e) of subdivision one of section two hundred nine-a of the civil service law, such modification or replacement procedures contained in an agreement negotiated pursuant to this subdivision shall continue as terms of such agreement after its expiration until a new agreement is 52 contained in a collective bargaining agreement that becomes effective on or after July first, two thousand ten shall provide for an expedited 55 hearing process before a single hearing officer in accordance with 56 subparagraph (i-a) of paragraph c of subdivision three of section three

37

38

39

40

41 42

43

44 45

46

47

48

49 50

51

52

53

55

thousand twenty-a of this article in cases in which charges of incompe-1 tence are brought against a building principal based solely upon an 2 allegation of a pattern of ineffective teaching or performance as 3 defined in section three thousand twelve-c of this article and shall 4 5 provide that such a pattern of ineffective teaching or performance shall 6 constitute very significant evidence of incompetence which may form the 7 basis for just cause removal of the building principal and provided further that any alternate disciplinary procedures contained in a 8 9 collective bargaining agreement that becomes effective on or after July 10 first, two thousand fifteen shall provide that all hearings pursuant to 11 sections three thousand twenty-a or three thousand twenty-b of this 12 article shall be conducted before a single hearing officer and that two consecutive ineffective ratings pursuant to annual professional perform-13 14 ance reviews conducted in accordance with the provisions of section three thousand twelve-s or three thousand twelve-d of this artisle shall 15 constitute prima facie evidence of incompetence that can only be over-16 17 come by clear and convincing evidence that the employee is not incompetent in light of all surrounding circumstances, and if not successfully 18 overcome, the finding, absent extraordinary circumstances, shall be just 19 gause for removal, and that three consecutive ineffective ratings pursu-20 21 ant to annual professional performance reviews conducted in accordance 22 with the provisions of section three thousand twelve-c or three thousand twelve-d of this article shall constitute prima facie evidence of incom-23 petence that can only be overcome by clear and convincing evidence that 24 25 the calculation of one or more of the principal's underlying components on the annual professional performance reviews pursuant to section three 26 27 thousand twelve-c or three thousand twelve-d of this article was fraudulent, and if not successfully overcome, the finding, absent extraordinary circumstances, shall be just cause for removal. For purposes of 28 29 this subdivision, fraud shall include mistaken identity]. Notwithstand-30 31 ing any inconsistent provision of law, the commissioner shall review any 32 appeals authorized by such modification or replacement procedures within 33 fifteen days from receipt by such commissioner of the record of prior 34 proceedings in the matter subject to appeal. Such review shall have 35 preference over all other appeals or proceedings pending before such 36 commissioner.

4. a. Notwithstanding any inconsistent provision of law, the procedures set forth in section three thousand twenty-a of this article and subdivision seven of section twenty-five hundred ninety-j of this chapter may be modified by agreements negotiated between the city school district of the city of New York and any employee organization representing employees or titles that are or were covered by any memorandum of agreement executed by such city school district and the united federation of teachers on or after June tenth, two thousand two. Where such procedures are so modified: (i) compliance with such modified procedures shall satisfy any provision of this chapter that requires compliance with section three thousand twenty-a of this article; (ii) any employee against whom charges have been preferred prior to the effective date of such modification shall continue to be subject to the provisions of such section as in effect on the date such charges were preferred; (iii) the provisions of subdivisions one and two of this section shall not apply to agreements negotiated pursuant to this subdivision, except that no person enjoying the benefits of tenure shall be disciplined or removed during a term of employment except for just cause; and (iv) in accordance with paragraph (e) of subdivision one of section two hundred nine-a 56 of the civil service law, such modified procedures contained in an

agreement negotiated pursuant to this subdivision shall continue as terms of such agreement after its expiration until a new agreement is 3 4 dures contained in a collective bargaining agreement that becomes effec-5 tive on or after July first, two thousand ten shall provide for an expe-6 dited hearing process before a single hearing officer in accordance with 7 subparagraph (i-a) of paragraph c of subdivision three of section three 8 thousand twenty-a of this article in cases in which charges of incompe-9 tence are brought based solely upon an allegation of a pattern of inef-10 fective teaching or performance as defined in section three thousand 11 twelve-e of this article and shall provide that such a pattern of inef-12 feetive teaching or performance shall constitute very significant evidence of incompetence which may form the basis for just cause 13 14 removal, and provided further that any alternate disciplinary procedures 15 contained in a collective bargaining agreement that becomes effective on or after July first, two thousand fifteen shall provide that all hear-16 17 ings pursuant to sections three thousand twenty-a or three thousand twenty-b of this article shall be conducted before a single hearing officer and that two consecutive ineffective ratings pursuant to annual 18 19 professional performance reviews conducted in accordance with the 20 21 provisions of section three thousand twelve-c or three thousand twelve-d 22 of this article shall constitute prima facie evidence of incompetence 23 that can only be overcome by clear and convincing evidence that the 24 employee is not incompetent in light of all surrounding circumstances, 25 and if not successfully overcome, the finding, absent extraordinary circumstances, shall be just cause for removal, and that three consec-26 27 utive ineffective ratings pursuant to annual professional performance 28 reviews conducted in accordance with the provisions of section three thousand twelve-d or three thousand twelve-d of this article shall 29 30 constitute prima facie evidence of incompetence that can only be over-31 come by clear and convincing evidence that the calculation of one or 32 more of the teacher's underlying components on the annual professional 33 performance reviews pursuant to section three thousand twelve-c or three 34 thousand twelve-d of this article was fraudulent, and if not successfully overcome, the finding, absent extraordinary circumstances, shall be 35 36 just cause for removal. For purposes of this paragraph, fraud shall 37 include mistaken identity]. 38

b. Any modifications to the procedures set forth in section three thousand twenty-a of this article and subdivision seven of section twenty-five hundred ninety-j of this chapter shall not change the manner in which the fees and expenses of such proceedings pursuant to the aforesaid sections are paid.

- § 10. Section 3020-b of the education law is REPEALED.
- 44 § 11. This act shall take effect immediately.

39

40

41 42

43