

STATE OF NEW YORK

9849

IN ASSEMBLY

April 12, 2024

Introduced by M. of A. BENEDETTO -- read once and referred to the
Committee on Education

AN ACT to amend the education law, in relation to annual professional
performance reviews of teachers and principals; and to repeal section
3020-b of the education law relating to streamlined removal procedures
for teachers rated ineffective

The People of the State of New York, represented in Senate and Assem-
bly, do enact as follows:

1 Section 1. Paragraphs a and b of subdivision 1 of section 2-d of the
2 education law, as added by section 1 of subpart L of part AA of chapter
3 56 of the laws of 2014, are amended to read as follows:
4 a. "Building principal" means a building principal subject to annual
5 performance evaluation review under the provisions of section three
6 thousand twelve-c, section three thousand twelve-d, or section three
7 thousand twelve-e of this chapter.
8 b. "Classroom teacher" means a teacher subject to annual performance
9 evaluation review under the provisions of section three thousand
10 twelve-c, section three thousand twelve-d, or section three thousand
11 twelve-e of this chapter.
12 § 2. Subparagraph ii of paragraph (a) of subdivision 1 and paragraph b
13 of subdivision 2 of section 2509 of the education law, as amended by
14 chapter 201 of the laws of 2022, are amended to read as follows:
15 ii. Notwithstanding any other provision of law or regulation to the
16 contrary, teachers and all other members of the teaching staff appointed
17 on or after July first, two thousand fifteen and authorized by section
18 twenty-five hundred three of this article, shall be appointed by the
19 board of education, upon the recommendation of the superintendent of
20 schools, for a probationary period of four years, except that in the
21 case of a teacher who has rendered satisfactory service as a regular
22 substitute for a period of up to two years [~~and, if a classroom teacher,~~
23 ~~has received composite annual professional performance review ratings in~~
24 ~~each of those years~~], or such teacher has rendered satisfactory service
25 as a seasonally licensed per session teacher of swimming in day schools
26 who has served in that capacity for a period of up to two years and has

EXPLANATION--Matter in italics (underscored) is new; matter in brackets
[-] is old law to be omitted.

LBD15037-04-4

1 been appointed to teach the same subject in day schools on an annual
2 salary, the teacher shall be appointed for a probationary period of a
3 minimum of two years, depending upon the length of the regular substi-
4 tute service that shall shorten the length of the probationary period;
5 provided, however, that in the case of a teacher who has been appointed
6 on tenure in another school district within the state, the school
7 district where currently employed, or a board of cooperative educational
8 services, and who was not dismissed from such district or board as a
9 result of charges brought pursuant to subdivision one of section three
10 thousand twenty-a [~~or section three thousand twenty-b~~] of this chapter,
11 the teacher shall be appointed for a probationary period of three
12 years[~~, provided that the teacher demonstrates that he or she received~~
13 ~~an annual professional performance review rating pursuant to section~~
14 ~~three thousand twelve-c or section three thousand twelve-d of this chap-~~
15 ~~ter in his or her final year of service in such other school district or~~
16 ~~board of cooperative educational services. Provided further, however,~~
17 ~~that in the case of a teacher who has been appointed for a probationary~~
18 ~~period during the two thousand twenty-two thousand twenty-one, the two~~
19 ~~thousand twenty-one--two thousand twenty-two or the two thousand twen-~~
20 ~~ty-two--two thousand twenty-three school year and who has been appointed~~
21 ~~on tenure in another school district within the state, the school~~
22 ~~district where currently employed, board of cooperative educational~~
23 ~~services or state school for the blind or deaf and who was not dismissed~~
24 ~~from such district, board or state school for the blind or deaf as a~~
25 ~~result of charges brought pursuant to subdivision one of section three~~
26 ~~thousand twenty a or section three thousand twenty b of this chapter,~~
27 ~~such teacher shall be appointed for a probationary period of three~~
28 ~~years; provided that, in the case of a classroom teacher, such teacher~~
29 ~~demonstrates that he or she received an annual professional performance~~
30 ~~review rating pursuant to section three thousand twelve-c or section~~
31 ~~three thousand twelve-d of this chapter in the two thousand seventeen--~~
32 ~~two thousand eighteen or two thousand eighteen two thousand nineteen~~
33 ~~school year in such other school district, board of cooperative educa-~~
34 ~~tional services or state school for the blind or deaf]. The service of a~~
35 person appointed to any of such positions may be discontinued at any
36 time during such probationary period, on the recommendation of the
37 superintendent of schools, by a majority vote of the board of education.
38 Each person who is not to be recommended for appointment on tenure shall
39 be so notified by the superintendent of schools in writing not later
40 than sixty days immediately preceding the expiration of [~~his/her~~] such
41 person's probationary period.

42 b. For persons appointed on or after July first, two thousand fifteen,
43 at the expiration of the probationary term of any persons appointed for
44 such term, or within six months prior thereto, the superintendent of
45 schools shall make a written report to the board of education recommend-
46 ing for appointment on tenure those persons who have been found compe-
47 tent, efficient and satisfactory [~~and in the case of a classroom teacher~~
48 ~~or building principal, who have received annual professional performance~~
49 ~~review ratings pursuant to section three thousand twelve-c or section~~
50 ~~three thousand twelve-d of this chapter, of either effective or highly~~
51 ~~effective in at least three of the four preceding years, exclusive of~~
52 ~~any breaks in service; provided that, in the case of a classroom teacher~~
53 ~~or building principal appointed during the two thousand seventeen two~~
54 ~~thousand eighteen or the two thousand twenty-two thousand twenty-one~~
55 ~~school year, who have received composite annual professional performance~~
56 ~~review ratings pursuant to section three thousand twelve-c or section~~

~~three thousand twelve d of this chapter, of either effective or highly effective in at least one of the four preceding years, exclusive of any breaks in service, and did not receive an ineffective rating in the final year of his or her probationary period, or during the most recent school year where a rating was received, and would have been in the superintendent of schools' discretion qualified for appointment on tenure based upon performance, notwithstanding that his or her annual professional performance review had not been completed and he or she had not received an annual professional performance rating for the two thousand nineteen--two thousand twenty, two thousand twenty--two thousand twenty one or the two thousand twenty one--two thousand twenty two school year; provided that, in the case of a classroom teacher or building principal appointed during the two thousand eighteen--two thousand nineteen or two thousand nineteen--two thousand twenty school year, who has not received composite annual professional performance review ratings pursuant to section three thousand twelve c or section three thousand twelve d of this chapter, for three consecutive years, no ratings shall be required for the superintendent of schools to recommend for appointment on tenure such teacher or building principal if the teacher or principal would have been, in the superintendent of schools' discretion, qualified for appointment on tenure based upon performance, notwithstanding that his or her annual professional performance review had not been completed and he or she had not received an annual professional performance review rating for the two thousand nineteen--two thousand twenty, two thousand twenty--two thousand twenty one and two thousand twenty one--two thousand twenty two school years; provided that in the case of a classroom teacher or building principal appointed during the two thousand twenty one--two thousand twenty two school year who have received composite annual professional performance review ratings pursuant to section three thousand twelve c or section three thousand twelve d of this chapter of either effective or highly effective in at least two of the four preceding years, exclusive of any breaks in service, and did not receive an ineffective rating in the final year of his or her probationary period, or during the most recent school year where a rating was received, and would have been in the superintendent of schools' discretion qualified for appointment on tenure based upon performance, notwithstanding that his or her annual professional performance review had not been completed and he or she had not received an annual professional performance rating for the two thousand twenty--two thousand twenty one or two thousand twenty one--two thousand twenty two school year; provided further that, notwithstanding any other provision of this section to the contrary, when a teacher or principal receives an effective or highly effective rating in each year of his or her probationary service except he or she receives an ineffective rating in the final year of his or her probationary period, such teacher or principal shall not be eligible for tenure but the board of education in its discretion, may extend the teacher's probationary period for an additional year; provided, however, that if such teacher or principal successfully appealed such ineffective rating, such teacher or principal shall immediately be eligible for tenure if the rating resulting from the appeal established that such individual has been effective or highly effective in at least three of the preceding four years and was not ineffective in the final year]. By a majority vote, the board of education may then appoint on tenure any or all of the persons recommended by the superintendent of schools. [At the expiration of the probationary period, the classroom teacher or building principal shall~~

1 ~~remain in probationary status until the end of the school year in which~~
2 ~~such teacher or principal has received such ratings of effective or~~
3 ~~highly effective for at least three of the four preceding school years~~
4 ~~exclusive of any breaks in service and subject to the terms hereof,~~
5 ~~during which time a board of education shall consider whether to grant~~
6 ~~tenure for those classroom teachers or building principals who otherwise~~
7 ~~have been found competent, efficient and satisfactory. Provided, howev-~~
8 ~~er, that the board of education may grant tenure contingent upon a~~
9 ~~classroom teacher's or building principal's receipt of a minimum rating~~
10 ~~in the final year of the probationary period, pursuant to the require-~~
11 ~~ments of this section, and if such contingency is not met after all~~
12 ~~appeals have been exhausted, the grant of tenure shall be void and unen-~~
13 ~~forceable and the teacher's or principal's probationary period may be~~
14 ~~extended in accordance with this subdivision. Such persons who have been~~
15 ~~recommended for tenure and all others employed in the teaching service~~
16 ~~of the schools of such school district who have served the full proba-~~
17 ~~tionary period as extended pursuant to this subdivision] Any person who
18 has acquired tenure shall, upon such person's effective tenure date,
19 hold their [~~respective positions~~] position during good behavior and
20 efficient and competent service, and shall not be removable except for
21 cause after a hearing as provided by section three thousand twenty and
22 section three thousand twenty-a [~~or section three thousand twenty-b~~] of
23 this chapter. Failure to maintain certification as required by this
24 chapter and the regulations of the commissioner shall constitute cause
25 for removal.~~

26 § 3. Subparagraphs i and ii of paragraph (a) of subdivision 1 of
27 section 2573 of the education law, subparagraph i as amended by section
28 3 of subpart D of part EE of chapter 56 of the laws of 2015, and subpar-
29 agraph ii as amended by chapter 201 of the laws of 2022, are amended to
30 read as follows:

31 i. Teachers and all other members of the teaching staff, appointed
32 prior to July first, two thousand fifteen and authorized by section
33 twenty-five hundred fifty-four of this article, shall be appointed by
34 the board of education, upon the recommendation of the superintendent of
35 schools, for a probationary period of three years, except that in the
36 case of a teacher who has rendered satisfactory service as a regular
37 substitute for a period of two years or as a seasonally licensed per-
38 session teacher of swimming in day schools who has served in that capac-
39 ity for a period of two years and has been appointed to teach the same
40 subject in day schools on an annual salary, the probationary period
41 shall be limited to one year; provided, however, that in the case of a
42 teacher who has been appointed on tenure in another school district
43 within the state, the school district where currently employed, or a
44 board of cooperative educational services, and who was not dismissed
45 from such district or board as a result of charges brought pursuant to
46 subdivision one of section three thousand twenty-a [~~or section three~~
47 ~~thousand twenty-b~~] of this chapter, the probationary period shall not
48 exceed two years; provided, however, that in cities with a population of
49 one million or more, a teacher appointed under a newly created license,
50 for teachers of reading and of the emotionally handicapped, to a posi-
51 tion which the teacher has held for at least two years prior to such
52 appointment while serving on tenure in another license area who was not
53 dismissed as a result of charges brought pursuant to subdivision one of
54 section three thousand twenty-a [~~or section three thousand twenty-b~~] of
55 this chapter, the probationary period shall be one year. The service of
56 a person appointed to any of such positions may be discontinued at any

1 time during such probationary period, on the recommendation of the
2 superintendent of schools, by a majority vote of the board of education.
3 Each person who is not to be recommended for appointment on tenure shall
4 be so notified by the superintendent of schools in writing not later
5 than sixty days immediately preceding the expiration of ~~[his or her]~~
6 such person's probationary period. In city school districts having a
7 population of four hundred thousand or more, persons with licenses
8 obtained as a result of examinations announced subsequent to the twenty-
9 second day of May, nineteen hundred sixty-nine appointed upon condi-
10 tions that all announced requirements for the position be fulfilled
11 within a specified period of time, shall not acquire tenure unless and
12 until such requirements have been completed within the time specified
13 for the fulfillment of such requirements, notwithstanding the expiration
14 of any probationary period. In all other city school districts subject
15 to the provisions of this article, failure to maintain certification as
16 required by this article and by the regulations of the commissioner
17 shall be cause for removal within the meaning of subdivision five of
18 this section.

19 ii. Teachers and all other members of the teaching staff appointed on
20 or after July first, two thousand fifteen and authorized by section
21 twenty-five hundred fifty-four of this article, shall be appointed by
22 the board of education, upon the recommendation of the superintendent of
23 schools, for a probationary period of four years, except that in the
24 case of a teacher who has rendered satisfactory service as a regular
25 substitute for a period of up to two years ~~[and, if a classroom teacher,~~
26 ~~has received annual professional performance review ratings in each of~~
27 ~~those years]~~, or such teacher has rendered satisfactory service as a
28 seasonally licensed per session teacher of swimming in day schools who
29 has served in that capacity for a period of up to two years and has been
30 appointed to teach the same subject in day schools on an annual salary,
31 the teacher shall be appointed for a probationary period of a minimum of
32 two years, depending upon the length of the regular substitute service
33 that shall shorten the length of the probationary period; provided,
34 however, that in the case of a teacher who has been appointed on tenure
35 in another school district within the state, the school district where
36 currently employed, or a board of cooperative educational services, and
37 who was not dismissed from such district or board as a result of charges
38 brought pursuant to subdivision one of section three thousand twenty-a
39 ~~[or section three thousand twenty-b]~~ of this chapter, the teacher shall
40 be appointed for a probationary period of three years~~;~~ ~~provided that,~~
41 ~~in the case of a classroom teacher, the teacher demonstrates that he or~~
42 ~~she received an annual professional performance review rating pursuant~~
43 ~~to section three thousand twelve c or section three thousand twelve d of~~
44 ~~this chapter in his or her final year of service in such other school~~
45 ~~district or board of cooperative educational services; provided, howev-~~
46 ~~er, that, in the case of a classroom teacher who has been appointed for~~
47 ~~a probationary period during the two thousand twenty two thousand twen-~~
48 ~~ty one, the two thousand twenty one two thousand twenty two or the two~~
49 ~~thousand twenty two two thousand twenty three school year and who has~~
50 ~~been appointed on tenure in another school district within the state,~~
51 ~~the school district where currently employed, board of cooperative~~
52 ~~educational services or state school for the blind or deaf, and who was~~
53 ~~not dismissed from such district, board or state school for the blind or~~
54 ~~deaf as a result of charges brought pursuant to section three thousand~~
55 ~~twenty-a or section three thousand twenty-b of this chapter, such teach-~~
56 ~~er shall be appointed for a probationary period of three years, provided~~

1 ~~that, in the case of a classroom teacher, such teacher demonstrates that~~
2 ~~he or she received an annual professional performance review rating~~
3 ~~pursuant to section three thousand twelve-c or section three thousand~~
4 ~~twelve-d of this chapter in the two thousand seventeen--two thousand~~
5 ~~eighteen or two thousand eighteen--two thousand nineteen school year in~~
6 ~~such other school district, board of cooperative educational services or~~
7 ~~state school for the blind or deaf];~~ provided further, however, that in
8 cities with a population of one million or more, a teacher appointed
9 under a newly created license, for teachers of reading and of the
10 emotionally handicapped, to a position which the teacher has held for at
11 least two years prior to such appointment while serving on tenure in
12 another license area who was not dismissed as a result of charges
13 brought pursuant to subdivision one of section three thousand twenty-a
14 [~~or section three thousand twenty-b~~] of this chapter, the teacher shall
15 be appointed for a probationary period of two years. The service of a
16 person appointed to any of such positions may be discontinued at any
17 time during such probationary period, on the recommendation of the
18 superintendent of schools, by a majority vote of the board of education.
19 Each person who is not to be recommended for appointment on tenure shall
20 be so notified by the superintendent of schools in writing not later
21 than sixty days immediately preceding the expiration of [~~his or her~~]
22 such person's probationary period. In all city school districts subject
23 to the provisions of this article, failure to maintain certification as
24 required by this article and by the regulations of the commissioner
25 shall be cause for removal within the meaning of subdivision five of
26 this section.

27 § 4. Subdivisions 5 and 6 of section 2573 of the education law, as
28 amended by section 3 of subpart D of part EE of chapter 56 of the laws
29 of 2015, paragraph (b) of subdivision 5 and paragraph (b) of subdivision
30 6 as amended by chapter 201 of the laws of 2022, are amended to read as
31 follows:

32 5. (a) At the expiration of the probationary term of any persons
33 appointed for such term prior to July first, two thousand fifteen, the
34 superintendent of schools shall make a written report to the board of
35 education recommending for permanent appointment those persons who have
36 been found competent, efficient and satisfactory. Such persons and all
37 others employed in the teaching, service of the schools of a city, who
38 have served the full probationary period, shall hold their respective
39 positions during good behavior and efficient and competent service, and
40 shall not be removable except for cause after a hearing as provided by
41 section three thousand twenty-a [~~or section three thousand twenty-b~~] of
42 this chapter.

43 (b) At the expiration of the probationary term of any persons
44 appointed for such term on or after July first, two thousand fifteen,
45 the superintendent of schools shall make a written report to the board
46 of education recommending for permanent appointment those persons who
47 have been found competent, efficient and satisfactory [~~and, in the case~~
48 ~~of a classroom teacher or building principal, who have received compos-~~
49 ~~ite annual professional performance review ratings pursuant to section~~
50 ~~three thousand twelve-c or section three thousand twelve-d of this chap-~~
51 ~~ter, of either effective or highly effective in at least three of the~~
52 ~~four preceding years, exclusive of any breaks in service; provided that,~~
53 ~~in the case of a classroom teacher or building principal appointed~~
54 ~~during the two thousand seventeen--two thousand eighteen or two thousand~~
55 ~~twenty--two thousand twenty-one school year, who have received composite~~
56 ~~annual professional performance review ratings pursuant to section three~~

~~1 thousand twelve c or section three thousand twelve d of this chapter of
2 either effective or highly effective in at least one of the four preced-
3 ing years, exclusive of any breaks in service, and did not receive an
4 ineffective rating in the final year of his or her probationary period
5 or during the most recent school year where a rating was received, and
6 would have been in the superintendent of schools' discretion qualified
7 for appointment on tenure based upon performance, notwithstanding that
8 his or her annual professional performance review had not been completed
9 and he or she had not received an annual professional performance rating
10 for the two thousand nineteen--two thousand twenty, two thousand twenty
11 two thousand twenty one or the two thousand twenty one--two thousand
12 twenty two school year, provided that, in the case of a classroom teach-
13 er or building principal appointed during the two thousand eighteen--two
14 thousand nineteen or two thousand nineteen--two thousand twenty school
15 year, who has not received composite annual professional performance
16 review ratings pursuant to section three thousand twelve c or section
17 three thousand twelve d of this chapter for three consecutive years, no
18 ratings shall be required for the superintendent of schools to recommend
19 for appointment on tenure such teacher or building principal if the
20 teacher or principal would have been, in the superintendent of schools'
21 discretion, qualified for appointment on tenure based upon performance,
22 notwithstanding that his or her annual professional performance review
23 had not been completed and he or she had not received an annual profes-
24 sional performance review rating for the two thousand nineteen--two
25 thousand twenty, two thousand twenty--two thousand twenty one and two
26 thousand twenty one--two thousand twenty two school years; provided that
27 in the case of a classroom teacher or building principal appointed
28 during the two thousand twenty one--two thousand twenty two school year
29 who have received composite annual professional performance review
30 ratings pursuant to section three thousand twelve c or section three
31 thousand twelve d of this chapter of either effective or highly effec-
32 tive in at least two of the four preceding years, exclusive of any
33 breaks in service, and did not receive an ineffective rating in the
34 final year of his or her probationary period or during the most recent
35 school year where a rating was received, and would have been in the
36 superintendent of schools' discretion qualified for appointment on
37 tenure based upon performance, notwithstanding that his or her annual
38 professional performance review had not been completed and he or she had
39 not received an annual professional performance rating for the two thou-
40 sand twenty--two thousand twenty one or two thousand twenty one--two
41 thousand twenty two school year, provided further that, notwithstanding
42 any other provision of this section to the contrary, when a teacher or
43 principal receives an effective and/or highly effective rating in each
44 year of his or her probationary service except he or she receives an
45 ineffective rating in the final year of his or her probationary period,
46 such teacher or principal shall not be eligible for tenure but the board
47 of education in its discretion, may extend the teacher's probationary
48 period for an additional year; provided, however, that if such teacher
49 or principal successfully appealed such ineffective rating, such teacher
50 or principal shall immediately be eligible for tenure if the rating
51 resulting from the appeal established that such individual has been
52 effective or highly effective in at least three of the preceding four
53 years. At the expiration of the probationary period, the classroom
54 teacher or building principal shall remain in probationary status until
55 the end of the school year in which such teacher or principal has
56 received such ratings of effective or highly effective for at least~~

1 ~~three of the four preceding school years, exclusive of any breaks in~~
2 ~~service and subject to the terms hereof, during which time a board of~~
3 ~~education shall consider whether to grant tenure for those classroom~~
4 ~~teachers or building principals who otherwise have been found competent,~~
5 ~~efficient and satisfactory. Provided, however, that the board of educa-~~
6 ~~tion may grant tenure contingent upon a classroom teacher's or building~~
7 ~~principal's receipt of a minimum rating in the final year of the proba-~~
8 ~~tionary period, pursuant to the requirements of this section, and if~~
9 ~~such contingency is not met after all appeals have been exhausted, the~~
10 ~~grant of tenure shall be void and unenforceable and the teacher's or~~
11 ~~principal's probationary period may be extended in accordance with this~~
12 ~~subdivision. Such persons who have been recommended for tenure and all~~
13 ~~others employed in the teaching service of the schools of such school~~
14 ~~district who have served the full probationary period as extended pursu-~~
15 ~~ant to this subdivision]. Any person who has acquired tenure shall, upon~~
16 ~~such person's effective tenure date, hold their [respective positions]~~
17 ~~position during good behavior and efficient and competent service, and~~
18 ~~shall not be removable except for cause after a hearing as provided by~~
19 ~~section three thousand twenty and section three thousand twenty-a [or~~
20 ~~section three thousand twenty-b] of this chapter. Failure to maintain~~
21 ~~certification as required by this chapter and the regulations of the~~
22 ~~commissioner shall constitute cause for removal.~~

23 6. (a) In a city having a population of four hundred thousand or more,
24 at the expiration of the probationary term of any persons appointed for
25 such term prior to July first, two thousand fifteen, the superintendent
26 of schools shall make a written report to the board of education recom-
27 mending for permanent appointment those persons who have been found
28 satisfactory, and such board of education shall immediately thereafter
29 issue to such persons permanent certificates of appointment. Such
30 persons and all others employed in the teaching service of the schools
31 of such city, who have served the full probationary period shall receive
32 permanent certificates to teach issued to them by the certificating
33 authority, except as otherwise provided in subdivision ten-a of this
34 section, and shall hold their respective positions during good behavior
35 and satisfactory teaching service, and shall not be removable except for
36 cause after a hearing as provided by section three thousand twenty-a [~~or~~
37 ~~section three thousand twenty-b]~~ of this chapter.

38 (b) At the expiration of the probationary term of any persons
39 appointed for such term on or after July first, two thousand fifteen,
40 the superintendent of schools shall make a written report to the board
41 of education recommending for permanent appointment those persons who
42 have been found competent, efficient and satisfactory [~~and, in the case~~
43 ~~of a classroom teacher or building principal, who have received compos-~~
44 ~~ite annual professional performance review ratings pursuant to section~~
45 ~~three thousand twelve-c or section three thousand twelve-d of this chap-~~
46 ~~ter, of either effective or highly effective in at least three of the~~
47 ~~four preceding years, exclusive of any breaks in service; provided that,~~
48 ~~in the case of a classroom teacher or building principal appointed~~
49 ~~during the two thousand seventeen--two thousand eighteen or two thousand~~
50 ~~twenty--two thousand twenty-one school year, who have received composite~~
51 ~~annual professional performance review ratings pursuant to section three~~
52 ~~thousand twelve-c or section three thousand twelve-d of this chapter of~~
53 ~~either effective or highly effective in at least one of the four preced-~~
54 ~~ing years, exclusive of any breaks in service, and did not receive an~~
55 ~~ineffective rating in the final year of his or her probationary period~~
56 ~~or during the most recent school year where a rating was received, and~~

1 ~~would have been in the superintendent of schools' discretion qualified~~
2 ~~for appointment on tenure based upon performance, notwithstanding that~~
3 ~~his or her annual professional performance review had not been completed~~
4 ~~and he or she had not received an annual professional performance rating~~
5 ~~for the two thousand nineteen--two thousand twenty, two thousand twen-~~
6 ~~ty--two thousand twenty one or the two thousand twenty one--two thousand~~
7 ~~twenty two school year, provided that, in the case of a classroom teach-~~
8 ~~er or building principal appointed during the two thousand eighteen--two~~
9 ~~thousand nineteen or two thousand nineteen--two thousand twenty school~~
10 ~~year, who has not received composite annual professional performance~~
11 ~~review ratings pursuant to section three thousand twelve c or section~~
12 ~~three thousand twelve d of this chapter for three consecutive years, no~~
13 ~~ratings shall be required for the superintendent of schools to recommend~~
14 ~~for appointment on tenure such teacher or building principal if the~~
15 ~~teacher or principal would have been, in the superintendent of schools'~~
16 ~~discretion, qualified for appointment on tenure based upon performance,~~
17 ~~notwithstanding that his or her annual professional performance review~~
18 ~~had not been completed and he or she had not received a composite annual~~
19 ~~professional performance review rating for the two thousand nineteen--~~
20 ~~two thousand twenty, two thousand twenty--two thousand twenty one and~~
21 ~~two thousand twenty one--two thousand twenty two school years, provided~~
22 ~~that in the case of a classroom teacher or building principal appointed~~
23 ~~during the two thousand twenty one--two thousand twenty two school year~~
24 ~~who have received composite annual professional performance review~~
25 ~~ratings pursuant to section three thousand twelve c or section three~~
26 ~~thousand twelve d of this chapter of either effective or highly effec-~~
27 ~~tive in at least two of the four preceding years, exclusive of any~~
28 ~~breaks in service, and did not receive an ineffective rating in the~~
29 ~~final year of his or her probationary period or during the most recent~~
30 ~~school year where a rating was received, and would have been in the~~
31 ~~superintendent of schools' discretion qualified for appointment on~~
32 ~~tenure based upon performance, notwithstanding that his or her annual~~
33 ~~professional performance review had not been completed and he or she had~~
34 ~~not received an annual professional performance rating for the two thou-~~
35 ~~sand twenty--two thousand twenty one or two thousand twenty one--two~~
36 ~~thousand twenty two school year, provided further that, notwithstanding~~
37 ~~any other provision of this section to the contrary, when a teacher~~
38 ~~receives an effective and/or highly effective rating in each year of his~~
39 ~~or her probationary service except he or she receives an ineffective~~
40 ~~rating in the final year of his or her probationary period, such teacher~~
41 ~~or principal shall not be eligible for tenure but the board of education~~
42 ~~in its discretion, may extend the teacher's probationary period for an~~
43 ~~additional year, provided, however, that if such teacher or principal~~
44 ~~successfully appealed such ineffective rating, such teacher or principal~~
45 ~~shall immediately be eligible for tenure if the rating resulting from~~
46 ~~the appeal established that such individual has been effective or highly~~
47 ~~effective in at least three of the preceding four years and was not~~
48 ~~ineffective in the final year. At the expiration of the probationary~~
49 ~~period, the classroom teacher or building principal shall remain in~~
50 ~~probationary status until the end of the school year in which such~~
51 ~~teacher or principal has received such ratings of effective or highly~~
52 ~~effective for at least three of the four preceding school years, exclu-~~
53 ~~sive of any breaks in service and subject to the terms hereof, during~~
54 ~~which time a board of education shall consider whether to grant tenure~~
55 ~~for those classroom teachers or building principals who otherwise have~~
56 ~~been found competent, efficient and satisfactory. Provided, however,~~

1 ~~that the board of education may grant tenure contingent upon a classroom~~
2 ~~teacher's or building principal's receipt of a minimum rating in the~~
3 ~~final year of the probationary period, pursuant to the requirements of~~
4 ~~this section, and if such contingency is not met after all appeals have~~
5 ~~been exhausted, the grant of tenure shall be void and unenforceable and~~
6 ~~the teacher's or principal's probationary period may be extended in~~
7 ~~accordance with this subdivision. Such persons who have been recommended~~
8 ~~for tenure and all others employed in the teaching service of the~~
9 ~~schools of such school district who have served the full probationary~~
10 ~~period as extended pursuant to this subdivision]. Any person who has~~
11 acquired tenure shall, upon such person's effective tenure date, hold
12 their [~~respective positions~~] position during good behavior and efficient
13 and competent service, and shall not be removable except for cause after
14 a hearing as provided by section three thousand twenty and section three
15 thousand twenty-a [~~or section three thousand twenty-b~~] of this chapter.
16 Failure to maintain certification as required by this chapter and the
17 regulations of the commissioner shall constitute cause for removal.

18 § 5. Section 3012 of the education law, as amended by section 4 of
19 subpart D of part EE of chapter 56 of the laws of 2015, subparagraph ii
20 of paragraph (a) of subdivision 1 and paragraph (b) of subdivision 2 as
21 amended by chapter 201 of the laws of 2022, and subparagraph ii of para-
22 graph (b) of subdivision 1 as amended by chapter 345 of the laws of
23 2019, is amended to read as follows:

24 § 3012. Tenure: certain school districts. 1. (a) i. Teachers and all
25 other members of the teaching staff of school districts, including
26 common school districts and/or school districts employing fewer than
27 eight teachers, other than city school districts, who are appointed
28 prior to July first, two thousand fifteen, shall be appointed by the
29 board of education, or the trustees of common school districts, upon the
30 recommendation of the superintendent of schools, for a probationary
31 period of three years, except that in the case of a teacher who has
32 rendered satisfactory service as a regular substitute for a period of
33 two years or as a seasonally licensed per session teacher of swimming in
34 day schools who has served in that capacity for a period of two years
35 and has been appointed to teach the same subject in day schools, on an
36 annual salary, the probationary period shall be limited to one year;
37 provided, however, that in the case of a teacher who has been appointed
38 on tenure in another school district within the state, the school
39 district where currently employed, or a board of cooperative educational
40 services, and who was not dismissed from such district or board as a
41 result of charges brought pursuant to subdivision one of section three
42 thousand twenty-a [~~or section three thousand twenty-b~~] of this article,
43 the probationary period shall not exceed two years. The service of a
44 person appointed to any of such positions may be discontinued at any
45 time during such probationary period, on the recommendation of the
46 superintendent of schools, by a majority vote of the board of education
47 or the trustees of a common school district.

48 ii. Teachers and all other members of the teaching staff of school
49 districts, including common school districts and/or school districts
50 employing fewer than eight teachers, other than city school districts,
51 who are appointed on or after July first, two thousand fifteen, shall be
52 appointed by the board of education, or the trustees of common school
53 districts, upon the recommendation of the superintendent of schools, for
54 a probationary period of four years, except that in the case of a teach-
55 er who has rendered satisfactory service as a regular substitute for a
56 period of up to two years [~~and, if a classroom teacher, has received~~

1 ~~annual professional performance review ratings in each of those years,~~
2 or such teacher has rendered satisfactory service as a seasonally
3 licensed per session teacher of swimming in day schools who has served
4 in that capacity for a period of up to two years and has been appointed
5 to teach the same subject in day schools, on an annual salary, the
6 teacher shall be appointed for a probationary period of a minimum of
7 years, depending upon the length of the regular substitute service that
8 shall shorten the length of the probationary period; provided, however,
9 that in the case of a teacher who has been appointed on tenure in another
10 school district within the state, the school district where currently
11 employed, or a board of cooperative educational services, and who was
12 not dismissed from such district or board as a result of charges brought
13 pursuant to subdivision one of section three thousand twenty-a [~~or~~
14 ~~section three thousand twenty-b~~] of this article, the teacher shall be
15 appointed for a probationary period of three years[, ~~provided that, in~~
16 ~~the case of a classroom teacher, the teacher demonstrates that he or she~~
17 ~~received an annual professional performance review rating pursuant to~~
18 ~~section three thousand twelve-c or section three thousand twelve-d of~~
19 ~~this chapter in his or her final year of service in such other school~~
20 ~~district or board of cooperative educational services. Provided further,~~
21 ~~however, that in the case of a teacher who has been appointed for a~~
22 ~~probationary period during the two thousand twenty-two thousand twenty-~~
23 ~~one, the two thousand twenty one two thousand twenty two or the two~~
24 ~~thousand twenty-two two thousand twenty-three school year and who has~~
25 ~~been appointed on tenure in another school district within the state,~~
26 ~~the school district where currently employed, board of cooperative~~
27 ~~educational services or state school for the blind or deaf and who was~~
28 ~~not dismissed from such district, board or state school for the blind or~~
29 ~~deaf as a result of charges brought pursuant to subdivision one of~~
30 ~~section three thousand twenty-a or section three thousand twenty-b of~~
31 ~~this article, such teacher shall be appointed for a probationary period~~
32 ~~of three years; provided that, in the case of a classroom teacher, such~~
33 ~~teacher demonstrates that he or she received an annual professional~~
34 ~~performance review rating pursuant to section three thousand twelve-c or~~
35 ~~section three thousand twelve-d of this article in the two thousand~~
36 ~~seventeen two thousand eighteen or two thousand eighteen two thousand~~
37 ~~nineteen school year in such other school district, board of cooperative~~
38 ~~educational services or state school for the blind or deaf]. The service
39 of a person appointed to any of such positions may be discontinued at
40 any time during such probationary period, on the recommendation of the
41 superintendent of schools, by a majority vote of the board of education
42 or the trustees of a common school district.~~

43 (b) i. Principals, administrators, supervisors and all other members
44 of the supervising staff of school districts, including common school
45 districts and/or school districts employing fewer than eight teachers,
46 other than city school districts, who are appointed prior to July first,
47 two thousand fifteen, shall be appointed by the board of education, or
48 the trustees of a common school district, upon the recommendation of the
49 superintendent of schools for a probationary period of three years. The
50 service of a person appointed to any of such positions may be discontin-
51 ued at any time during the probationary period on the recommendation of
52 the superintendent of schools, by a majority vote of the board of educa-
53 tion or the trustees of a common school district.

54 ii. Principals, administrators, supervisors and all other members of
55 the supervising staff of school districts, including common school
56 districts and/or school districts employing fewer than eight teachers,

1 other than city school districts, who are appointed on or after July
2 first, two thousand fifteen, shall be appointed by the board of educa-
3 tion, or the trustees of a common school district, upon the recommenda-
4 tion of the superintendent of schools for a probationary period of four
5 years; provided, however, that in the case of a principal, administra-
6 tor, supervisor, or other member of the supervising staff who has been
7 appointed on tenure pursuant to this chapter as an administrator within
8 an authorized administrative tenure area in another school district
9 within the state, the school district where currently employed, or a
10 board of cooperative educational services, and who was not dismissed
11 from such district or board as a result of charges brought pursuant to
12 subdivision one of section three thousand twenty-a [~~or section three~~
13 ~~thousand twenty-b~~] of this article, the principal, administrator, super-
14 visor or other member of the supervising staff shall be appointed for a
15 probationary period of three years. The service of a person appointed to
16 any of such positions may be discontinued at any time during the proba-
17 tionary period on the recommendation of the superintendent of schools,
18 by a majority vote of the board of education or the trustees of a common
19 school district.

20 (c) Any person previously appointed to tenure or a probationary period
21 pursuant to the provisions of former section three thousand thirteen of
22 this article shall continue to hold such position and be governed by the
23 provisions of this section notwithstanding any contrary provision of
24 law.

25 2. (a) At the expiration of the probationary term of a person
26 appointed for such term prior to July first, two thousand fifteen,
27 subject to the conditions of this section, the superintendent of schools
28 shall make a written report to the board of education or the trustees of
29 a common school district recommending for appointment on tenure those
30 persons who have been found competent, efficient and satisfactory. Such
31 persons, and all others employed in the teaching service of the schools
32 of such union free school district, common school district and/or school
33 district employing fewer than eight teachers, who have served the proba-
34 tionary period as provided in this section, shall hold their respective
35 positions during good behavior and efficient and competent service, and
36 shall not be removed except for any of the following causes, after a
37 hearing, as provided by section three thousand twenty-a [~~or section~~
38 ~~three thousand twenty-b~~] of this article: [~~(a)~~] (i) insubordination,
39 immoral character or conduct unbecoming a teacher; [~~(b)~~] (ii) ineffi-
40 ciency, incompetency, physical or mental disability, or neglect of duty;
41 [~~(c)~~] (iii) failure to maintain certification as required by this chap-
42 ter and by the regulations of the commissioner. Each person who is not
43 to be recommended for appointment on tenure, shall be so notified by the
44 superintendent of schools in writing not later than sixty days imme-
45 diately preceding the expiration of [~~his~~] such person's probationary
46 period.

47 (b) At the expiration of the probationary term of a person appointed
48 for such term on or after July first, two thousand fifteen, subject to
49 the conditions of this section, the superintendent of schools shall make
50 a written report to the board of education or the trustees of a common
51 school district recommending for appointment on tenure those persons who
52 have been found competent, efficient and satisfactory [~~and, in the case~~
53 ~~of a classroom teacher or building principal, who have received compos-~~
54 ~~ite annual professional performance review ratings pursuant to section~~
55 ~~three thousand twelve-c or section three thousand twelve-d of this arti-~~
56 ~~cle, of either effective or highly effective in at least three of the~~

~~four preceding years, exclusive of any breaks in service, provided that in the case of a classroom teacher or building principal appointed during the two thousand seventeen two thousand eighteen or two thousand twenty two thousand twenty one school year, who have received composite annual professional performance review ratings pursuant to section three thousand twelve c or section three thousand twelve d of this article, of either effective or highly effective in at least one of the four preceding years, exclusive of any breaks in service, and did not receive an ineffective rating in the final year of his or her probationary period, or during the most recent school year where a rating was received, and would have been in the superintendent of schools' discretion qualified for appointment on tenure based upon performance, notwithstanding that his or her annual professional performance review had not been completed and he or she had not received an annual professional performance rating for the two thousand nineteen two thousand twenty, two thousand twenty two thousand twenty one or the two thousand twenty one two thousand twenty two school year, provided that, in the case of a classroom teacher or building principal appointed during the two thousand eighteen two thousand nineteen or two thousand nineteen two thousand twenty school year, who has not received composite annual professional performance review ratings pursuant to section three thousand twelve c or section three thousand twelve d of this article for three consecutive years, no ratings shall be required for the superintendent of schools to recommend for appointment on tenure such teacher or building principal if the teacher or principal would have been, in the superintendent of schools' discretion, qualified for appointment on tenure based upon performance, notwithstanding that his or her annual professional performance review had not been completed and he or she had not received an annual professional performance review rating for the two thousand nineteen two thousand twenty, two thousand twenty two thousand twenty one and two thousand twenty one two thousand twenty two school years, provided that in the case of a classroom teacher or building principal appointed during the two thousand twenty one two thousand twenty two school year who have received composite annual professional performance review ratings pursuant to section three thousand twelve c or section three thousand twelve d of this article of either effective or highly effective in at least two of the four preceding years, exclusive of any breaks in service, and did not receive an ineffective rating in the final year of his or her probationary period, or during the most recent school year where a rating was received, and would have been in the superintendent of schools' discretion qualified for appointment on tenure based upon performance, notwithstanding that his or her annual professional performance review had not been completed and he or she had not received an annual professional performance rating for the two thousand twenty two thousand twenty one or two thousand twenty one two thousand twenty two school year, provided further that, notwithstanding any other provision of this section to the contrary, when a teacher or principal receives an effective or highly effective rating in each year of his or her probationary service except he or she receives an ineffective rating in the final year of his or her probationary period, such teacher shall not be eligible for tenure but the board of education, in its discretion, may extend the teacher's probationary period for an additional year, provided, however, that if such teacher or principal successfully appealed such ineffective rating, such teacher or principal shall immediately be eligible for tenure if the rating resulting from the appeal established that such individual has been effective or highly~~

1 ~~effective in at least three of the preceding four years and was not~~
2 ~~ineffective in the final year. At the expiration of the probationary~~
3 ~~period, the classroom teacher or building principal shall remain in~~
4 ~~probationary status until the end of the school year in which such~~
5 ~~teacher or principal has received such ratings of effective or highly~~
6 ~~effective for at least three of the four preceding school years, exclu-~~
7 ~~sive of any breaks in service, and subject to the terms hereof, during~~
8 ~~which time the trustees or board of education shall consider whether to~~
9 ~~grant tenure for those classroom teachers or building principals who~~
10 ~~otherwise have been found competent, efficient and satisfactory.~~
11 ~~Provided, however, that the trustees or board of education may grant~~
12 ~~tenure contingent upon a classroom teacher's or building principal's~~
13 ~~receipt of a minimum rating in the final year of the probationary peri-~~
14 ~~od, pursuant to the requirements of this section, and if such contingen-~~
15 ~~cy is not met after all appeals have been exhausted, the grant of tenure~~
16 ~~shall be void and unenforceable and the teacher's or principal's proba-~~
17 ~~tionary period may be extended in accordance with this subdivision. Such~~
18 ~~persons who have been recommended for tenure and all others employed in~~
19 ~~the teaching service of the schools of such school district who have~~
20 ~~served the full probationary period as extended pursuant to this subdivi-~~
21 ~~vision].~~ Any person who has acquired tenure shall, upon such person's
22 effective tenure date, hold their [respective positions] position during
23 good behavior and efficient and competent service, and shall not be
24 removable except for cause after a hearing as provided by section three
25 thousand twenty and section three thousand twenty-a ~~[or section three~~
26 ~~thousand twenty-b]~~ of this article. Failure to maintain certification as
27 required by this chapter and the regulations of the commissioner shall
28 constitute cause for removal.

29 3. Notwithstanding any other provision of this section no period in
30 any school year for which there is no required service and/or for which
31 no compensation is provided shall in any event constitute a break or
32 suspension of probationary period or continuity of tenure rights of any
33 of the persons hereinabove described.

34 § 6. Subdivisions 1, 11, and 17 of section 3012-d of the education
35 law, subdivisions 1 and 11 as added by section 2 of subpart E of part EE
36 of chapter 56 of the laws of 2015, and subdivision 17 as amended by
37 chapter 201 of the laws of 2022, are amended to read as follows:

38 1. General provisions. Notwithstanding any other provision of law,
39 rule or regulation to the contrary, the annual teacher and principal
40 evaluations (hereinafter, evaluations) implemented by districts shall be
41 conducted in accordance with the provisions of this section. Such annual
42 evaluations shall be a significant factor for employment decisions
43 including but not limited to, promotion, retention, tenure determi-
44 nation, termination, and supplemental compensation. Such evaluations
45 shall also be a significant factor in teacher and principal development
46 including but not limited to coaching, induction support, and differen-
47 tiated professional development. Provided, however, that for the two
48 thousand twenty-four--two thousand twenty-five school year and thereaft-
49 er, school districts and boards of cooperative educational services may
50 conduct annual professional performance reviews pursuant to section
51 three thousand twelve-e of this article. In such case, the provisions of
52 this section shall not be applicable. Provided, however, annual teacher
53 and principal evaluation plans adopted pursuant to this section shall
54 not be applicable after the two thousand thirty-one--two thousand thir-
55 ty-two school year.

11. [~~Notwithstanding any inconsistent provision of law, no school district shall be eligible for an apportionment of general support for public schools from the funds appropriated for the 2015-2016 school year and any year thereafter in excess of the amount apportioned to such school district in the respective base year unless such school district has submitted documentation that has been approved by the commissioner by November fifteenth, two thousand fifteen, or by September first of each subsequent year, demonstrating that it has fully implemented the standards and procedures for conducting annual teacher and principal evaluations of teachers and principals in accordance with the requirements of this section and the regulations issued by the commissioner. Provided further that any apportionment withheld pursuant to this section shall not occur prior to April first of the current year and shall not have any effect on the base year calculation for use in the subsequent school year. For purposes of this section, "base year" shall mean the base year as defined in paragraph b of subdivision one of section thirty-six hundred two of this chapter, and "current year" shall mean the current year as defined in paragraph a of subdivision one of section thirty-six hundred two of this chapter~~] Each school district or board of cooperative educational services, as applicable, shall certify by September first of each year that their school district or board of cooperative educational services has a teacher and principal evaluation plan that is in compliance with the requirements of this section or a performance review plan that is in compliance with the requirements of section three thousand twelve-e of this article, as applicable, and that the district or board of cooperative educational services conducted evaluations in accordance with their most recently approved plan during the preceding school year. Provided, however, that a school district or board of cooperative educational services may only have an approved teacher and principal evaluation plan pursuant to this section until June thirtieth, two thousand thirty-two.

17. Notwithstanding any other provision of this section, for the two thousand twenty-two thousand twenty-one and the two thousand twenty-one--two thousand twenty-two school years, no school district or board of cooperative educational services shall be required to complete an annual teacher and principal evaluation required by this section for any classroom teacher or building principal [~~and state funding shall not be withheld from any school district for not complying with the requirements of this section~~].

§ 7. The education law is amended by adding a new section 3012-e to read as follows:

§ 3012-e. Teacher and principal performance review plans. 1. Notwithstanding any other provision of law, rule, or regulation to the contrary, for the annual professional performance reviews related to the two thousand twenty-four--two thousand twenty-five school year and thereafter, a school district or board of cooperative educational services shall conduct performance reviews of classroom teachers and building principals in accordance with the provisions of this section or section three thousand twelve-d of this article, as applicable. Provided that all school districts and boards of cooperative educational services shall adopt a performance review plan pursuant to this section no later than June thirtieth, two thousand thirty-two and such plan shall be used to complete performance reviews of classroom teachers and building principals no later than the two thousand thirty-two--two thousand thirty-three school year. Performance review plans developed pursuant to this section shall be the result of reaching a collectively bargained agree-

1 ment negotiated pursuant to article fourteen of the civil service law
2 where a recognized employee organization exists.

3 2. Nothing herein shall require modification of an existing teacher
4 and principal evaluation plan approved by the commissioner pursuant to
5 section three thousand twelve-d of this article and all teacher and
6 principal evaluation plans approved by the commissioner pursuant to the
7 provisions of section three thousand twelve-d of this article shall not
8 be affected by the provisions of this section on or before June thirti-
9 eth, two thousand thirty-two; provided, however, that when a school
10 district or board of cooperative educational services adopts a perform-
11 ance review plan pursuant to this section, the school district or board
12 of cooperative educational services shall notify the department and
13 submit the new plan to the department for review on a form and in a
14 manner prescribed by the commissioner. Provided further that, prior to
15 June thirtieth, two thousand thirty-two, a teacher and principal evalu-
16 ation plan may still be adopted or modified pursuant to section three
17 thousand twelve-d of this article consistent with the provisions of such
18 section.

19 3. The performance reviews conducted pursuant to this section shall be
20 a significant factor in teacher and principal development, including but
21 not limited to coaching, induction support, and differentiated profes-
22 sional development for all teachers and principals.

23 4. (a) A school board or board of cooperative educational services
24 shall make its most recently adopted and reviewed plan pursuant to this
25 section available on the school district or board of cooperative educa-
26 tional services' website.

27 (b) On an annual basis, each school district and board of cooperative
28 educational services shall submit to the commissioner the ratings for
29 each classroom teacher and building principal on each applicable teach-
30 ing or leadership standard, as well as the overall rating for each
31 teacher and principal, where available, on a form and in a manner
32 prescribed by the commissioner. Such data shall be collected and used to
33 the extent necessary to comply with any applicable state and federal
34 statutory requirements.

35 (c) The commissioner and each school district and board of cooperative
36 educational services shall ensure that any release to the public of data
37 collected pursuant to this section, or any other data that is used as a
38 component of performance reviews, does not include personally identify-
39 ing information for any classroom teacher or building principal;
40 provided, however, that each school district or board of cooperative
41 educational services shall fully disclose and release to the parents or
42 legal guardians of a student the most recent performance review rating
43 received for each of the teachers and for the principal of the school
44 building to which the student is assigned for the current school year
45 consistent with paragraph b of subdivision ten of section three thousand
46 twelve-c of this article.

47 (d) Performance reviews of individual classroom teachers and building
48 principals shall not be subject to disclosure pursuant to article six of
49 the public officers law.

50 5. (a) Performance review plans developed pursuant to this section
51 shall:

52 (i) include the criteria by which all classroom teachers and building
53 principals shall be reviewed and a description of the review procedures;
54 (ii) address each state teaching and educational leadership standard,
55 as developed or adopted by the commissioner;

1 (iii) consist of multiple measures; provided, however, that one meas-
2 ure shall be classroom observations of classroom teachers and school
3 visits of building principals. The plan shall describe the number and
4 frequency of observations; provided that nothing herein shall be
5 construed to require that all classroom teachers or building principals
6 have the same number or frequency of observations.

7 (iv) provide the classroom teacher or building principal with timely,
8 actionable feedback on their practice based on the information collected
9 as part of the performance review;

10 (v) assign ratings on each applicable teaching or educational leader-
11 ship standard and an overall rating of Level 4, Level 3, Level 2, or
12 Level 1 consistent with the following requirements:

13 (1) Level 1 shall indicate performance significantly below a school
14 district's or board of cooperative educational services' expectations
15 aligned to teaching or educational leadership standards;

16 (2) Level 2 shall indicate performance that partially meets a school
17 district's or board of cooperative educational services' expectations
18 aligned to teaching or educational leadership standards;

19 (3) Level 3 shall indicate performance that meets a school district's
20 or board of cooperative educational services' expectations aligned to
21 teaching or educational leadership standards; and

22 (4) Level 4 shall indicate performance that exceeds a school
23 district's or board of cooperative educational services' expectations
24 aligned to teaching or educational leadership standards;

25 (vi) ensure that it is possible for a classroom teacher or building
26 principal to obtain each rating on each teaching or educational leader-
27 ship standard and as an overall rating. The process by which ratings are
28 assigned shall be transparent and available to those being rated prior
29 to the start of the school year, to the extent practicable; and

30 (vii) include a process for each classroom teacher and building prin-
31 icipal to receive formal support for professional growth each year,
32 provided that teachers and principals who receive an overall rating of
33 Level 1 or 2 shall have a personalized professional development plan,
34 developed by the school district or board of cooperative educational
35 services, consistent with a locally determined growth goal setting proc-
36 ess.

37 (b) One measure may be used to address more than one teaching or
38 educational leadership standard provided that the performance review
39 includes multiple measures.

40 (c) Performance reviews conducted pursuant to this section may assess
41 a subset of the teaching and educational leadership standards in a given
42 year; provided, however, that probationary classroom teachers and build-
43 ing principals shall be rated on each teaching or educational leadership
44 standard annually.

45 (d) Nothing in this section shall be construed to require all class-
46 room teachers or building principals to be evaluated based on the same
47 measures or to receive an overall rating annually; provided, however,
48 that at a minimum, probationary teachers and principals shall receive a
49 rating on each teaching or educational leadership standard and an over-
50 all rating annually, while other teachers and principals may have a
51 differentiated performance review process that does not culminate in an
52 overall rating annually. Provided, further, that nothing herein shall be
53 construed to prohibit or prevent any other teachers and principals from
54 receiving an overall rating annually.

55 6. The school district or board of cooperative educational services,
56 as applicable, shall ensure that all classroom teachers and building

1 principals as well as any individual who conducts all or part of a
2 performance review receive appropriate training consistent with the
3 regulations of the commissioner and shall ensure that each teacher and
4 principal who is reviewed in accordance with this section has the oppor-
5 tunity to provide written comment on their performance review in addi-
6 tion to any collectively bargained teacher and principal performance
7 review grievance or appeal procedures.

8 7. Nothing in this section shall be construed to affect the unfettered
9 statutory right of a school district or board of cooperative educational
10 services, as applicable, to terminate a probationary classroom teacher
11 or principal for any statutorily and constitutionally permissible
12 reasons.

13 8. Performance review plans developed pursuant to this section shall
14 be submitted to the commissioner on a form and in a manner prescribed by
15 the commissioner. The commissioner shall review such plan to determine
16 compliance with the requirements of this section. If the commissioner
17 determines that the submitted plan is not in compliance with this
18 section, the plan shall be returned to the school district or board of
19 cooperative educational services for revision. Such revisions shall be
20 resolved through collective bargaining, to the extent required under
21 article fourteen of the civil service law. The plan most recently
22 accepted by the commissioner pursuant to this section shall remain in
23 effect until a subsequent plan is agreed to by the parties and reviewed
24 by the commissioner to determine compliance with the requirements of
25 this section. Each school district and board of cooperative educational
26 services shall certify annually to the commissioner that they have fully
27 implemented the plan most recently accepted by the commissioner.

28 § 8. Section 3014 of the education law, as amended by section 5 of
29 subpart D of part EE of chapter 56 of the laws of 2015, paragraph (b) of
30 subdivision 1 and paragraph (b) of subdivision 2 as amended by chapter
31 201 of the laws of 2022, is amended to read as follows:

32 § 3014. Tenure: boards of cooperative educational services. 1. (a)
33 Administrative assistants, supervisors, teachers and all other members
34 of the teaching and supervising staff of the board of cooperative educa-
35 tional services appointed prior to July first, two thousand fifteen,
36 shall be appointed by a majority vote of the board of cooperative educa-
37 tional services upon the recommendation of the district superintendent
38 of schools for a probationary period of not to exceed three years;
39 provided, however, that in the case of a teacher who has been appointed
40 on tenure in a school district within the state, the board of cooper-
41 ative educational services where currently employed, or another board of
42 cooperative educational services, and who was not dismissed from such
43 district or board as a result of charges brought pursuant to subdivision
44 one of section three thousand twenty-a [~~or section three thousand twen-~~
45 ~~ty-b~~] of this article, the probationary period shall not exceed two
46 years. Services of a person so appointed to any such positions may be
47 discontinued at any time during such probationary period, upon the
48 recommendation of the district superintendent, by a majority vote of the
49 board of cooperative educational services.

50 (b) Administrative assistants, supervisors, teachers and all other
51 members of the teaching and supervising staff of the board of cooper-
52 ative educational services appointed on or after July first, two thou-
53 sand fifteen, shall be appointed by a majority vote of the board of
54 cooperative educational services upon the recommendation of the district
55 superintendent of schools for a probationary period of not to exceed
56 four years; provided, however, that in the case of a teacher who has

1 been appointed on tenure in a school district within the state, the
2 board of cooperative educational services where currently employed, or
3 another board of cooperative educational services, and who was not
4 dismissed from such district or board as a result of charges brought
5 pursuant to section three thousand twenty-a [~~or section three thousand~~
6 ~~twenty-b~~] of this article, the teacher shall be appointed for a proba-
7 tionary period of three years; [~~provided that, in the case of a class-~~
8 ~~room teacher, the teacher demonstrates that he or she received a compos-~~
9 ~~ite annual professional performance review rating pursuant to section~~
10 ~~three thousand twelve-c or three thousand twelve-d of this article of~~
11 ~~either effective or highly effective in his or her final year of service~~
12 ~~in such other school district or board of cooperative educational~~
13 ~~services,]~~ and provided further that in the case of a principal, admin-
14 istrator, supervisor, or other member of the supervising staff who has
15 been appointed on tenure pursuant to this chapter as an administrator
16 within an authorized administrative tenure area in another school
17 district within the state, the school district where currently employed,
18 or a board of cooperative educational services, and who was not
19 dismissed from such district or board as a result of charges brought
20 pursuant to subdivision one of section three thousand twenty-a [~~or~~
21 ~~section three thousand twenty-b~~] of this article, the principal, admin-
22 istrator, supervisor, or other member of the supervising staff shall be
23 appointed for a probationary period of three years. [~~Provided further,~~
24 ~~however, that in the case of a classroom teacher who has been appointed~~
25 ~~for a probationary period during the two thousand twenty-two thousand~~
26 ~~twenty-one, the two thousand twenty-one two thousand twenty-two or the~~
27 ~~two thousand twenty-two two thousand twenty-three school year and who~~
28 ~~has been appointed on tenure in a school district within the state,~~
29 ~~state school for the blind or deaf, the board of cooperative educational~~
30 ~~services where currently employed, or another board of cooperative~~
31 ~~educational services, and who was not dismissed from such district,~~
32 ~~board or state school for the blind or deaf as a result of charges~~
33 ~~brought pursuant to section three thousand twenty-a or section three~~
34 ~~thousand twenty-b of this article, such teacher shall be appointed for a~~
35 ~~probationary period of three years; provided that, in the case of a~~
36 ~~classroom teacher, such teacher demonstrates that he or she received an~~
37 ~~annual professional performance review rating pursuant to section three~~
38 ~~thousand twelve-c or section three thousand twelve-d of this article of~~
39 ~~either effective or highly effective in the two thousand seventeen-two~~
40 ~~thousand eighteen or two thousand eighteen-two thousand nineteen school~~
41 ~~year in such other school district, state school for the blind or deaf~~
42 ~~or board of cooperative educational services.] Services of a person so
43 appointed to any such positions to which this paragraph applies may be
44 discontinued at any time during the probationary period, upon the recom-
45 mendation of the district superintendent, by a majority vote of the
46 board of cooperative educational services.~~

47 2. (a) On or before the expiration of the probationary term of a
48 person appointed for such term prior to July first, two thousand
49 fifteen, the district superintendent of schools shall make a written
50 report to the board of cooperative educational services recommending for
51 appointment on tenure persons who have been found competent, efficient
52 and satisfactory. Such persons shall hold their respective positions
53 during good behavior and competent and efficient service and shall not
54 be removed except for any of the following causes, after a hearing, as
55 provided by section three thousand twenty-a [~~or section three thousand~~
56 ~~twenty-b~~] of this article: (i) Insubordination, immoral character or

1 conduct unbecoming a teacher; (ii) Inefficiency, incompetency, or
2 neglect of duty; (iii) Failure to maintain certification as required by
3 this chapter and by the regulations of the commissioner. Each person who
4 is not to be so recommended for appointment on tenure shall be so noti-
5 fied in writing by the district superintendent not later than sixty days
6 immediately preceding the expiration of [~~his or her~~] such person's
7 probationary period.

8 (b) On or before the expiration of the probationary term of a person
9 appointed for such term on or after July first, two thousand fifteen,
10 the district superintendent of schools shall make a written report to
11 the board of cooperative educational services recommending for appoint-
12 ment on tenure persons who have been found competent, efficient and
13 satisfactory [~~and, in the case of a classroom teacher or building prin-
14 cipal, who have received composite annual professional performance
15 review ratings pursuant to section three thousand twelve c or section
16 three thousand twelve d of this article, of either effective or highly
17 effective in at least three of the four preceding years, exclusive of
18 any breaks in service, provided that, in the case of a classroom teacher
19 or building principal appointed during the two thousand seventeen--two
20 thousand eighteen or two thousand twenty--two thousand twenty-one school
21 year who have received composite annual professional performance review
22 ratings pursuant to section three thousand twelve c or section three
23 thousand twelve d of this article of either effective or highly effec-
24 tive in at least one of the four preceding years, exclusive of any
25 breaks in service, and did not receive an ineffective rating in the
26 final year of his or her probationary period or in the most recent
27 school year where a rating was received, and would have been in the
28 district superintendent of schools' discretion qualified for appointment
29 on tenure based upon performance, notwithstanding that his or her annual
30 professional performance review had not been completed and he or she had
31 not received an annual professional performance rating for the two thou-
32 sand nineteen two thousand twenty, two thousand twenty two thousand
33 twenty one or the two thousand twenty one two thousand twenty two
34 school year, provided that, in the case of a classroom teacher or build-
35 ing principal appointed during the two thousand eighteen two thousand
36 nineteen or two thousand nineteen two thousand twenty school year, who
37 has not received composite annual professional performance review
38 ratings pursuant to section three thousand twelve c or section three
39 thousand twelve d of this article for three consecutive years, no
40 ratings shall be required for the district superintendent of schools to
41 recommend for appointment on tenure such teacher or building principal
42 if the teacher or principal would have been, in the district superinten-
43 dent of schools' discretion, qualified for appointment on tenure based
44 upon performance, notwithstanding that his or her annual professional
45 performance review had not been completed and he or she had not received
46 an annual professional performance review rating for the two thousand
47 nineteen two thousand twenty, two thousand twenty two thousand twen-
48 ty one and two thousand twenty one two thousand twenty two school
49 years, provided that in the case of a classroom teacher or building
50 principal appointed during the two thousand twenty one two thousand
51 twenty two school year who have received composite annual professional
52 performance review ratings pursuant to section three thousand twelve c
53 or section three thousand twelve d of this article of either effective
54 or highly effective in at least two of the four preceding years, exclu-
55 sive of any breaks in service, and did not receive an ineffective rating
56 in the final year of his or her probationary period, or during the most~~

1 ~~recent school year where a rating was received, and would have been in~~
2 ~~the district superintendent of schools' discretion qualified for~~
3 ~~appointment on tenure based upon performance, notwithstanding that his~~
4 ~~or her annual professional performance review had not been completed and~~
5 ~~he or she had not received an annual professional performance rating for~~
6 ~~the two thousand twenty two thousand twenty one or two thousand twen-~~
7 ~~ty one two thousand twenty two school year, provided further that,~~
8 ~~notwithstanding any other provision of this section to the contrary,~~
9 ~~when a teacher or principal receives an effective or highly effective~~
10 ~~rating in each year of his or her probationary service except he or she~~
11 ~~receives an ineffective rating in the final year of his or her proba-~~
12 ~~tionary period, such teacher shall not be eligible for tenure but the~~
13 ~~board of education in its discretion, may extend the teacher's proba-~~
14 ~~tionary period for an additional year; provided, however that if such~~
15 ~~teacher or principal successfully appealed such ineffective rating, such~~
16 ~~teacher or principal shall immediately be eligible for tenure if the~~
17 ~~rating resulting from the appeal established that such individual has~~
18 ~~been effective or highly effective in at least three of the preceding~~
19 ~~four years and was not ineffective in the final year. At the expiration~~
20 ~~of the probationary period, the classroom teacher or building principal~~
21 ~~shall remain in probationary status until the end of the school year in~~
22 ~~which such teacher or principal has received such ratings of effective~~
23 ~~or highly effective for at least three of the four preceding school~~
24 ~~years, exclusive of any breaks in service, during which time a board of~~
25 ~~cooperative educational services shall consider whether to grant tenure~~
26 ~~for those classroom teachers or building principals who otherwise have~~
27 ~~been found competent, efficient and satisfactory. Provided, however,~~
28 ~~that the board of cooperative educational services may grant tenure~~
29 ~~contingent upon a classroom teacher's or building principal's receipt of~~
30 ~~a minimum rating in the final year of the probationary period, pursuant~~
31 ~~to the requirements of this section, and if such contingency is not met~~
32 ~~after all appeals have been exhausted, the grant of tenure shall be void~~
33 ~~and unenforceable and the teacher's or principal's probationary period~~
34 ~~may be extended in accordance with this subdivision]. Such persons shall~~
35 hold their respective positions during good behavior and competent and
36 efficient service and shall not be removed except for any of the follow-
37 ing causes, after a hearing, as provided by section three thousand twen-
38 ty-a [~~or section three thousand twenty b~~] of this article: (i) Insubor-
39 dination, immoral character or conduct unbecoming a teacher; (ii)
40 Inefficiency, incompetency, or neglect of duty; (iii) Failure to main-
41 tain certification as required by this chapter and by the regulations of
42 the commissioner. Each person who is not to be so recommended for
43 appointment on tenure shall be so notified in writing by the district
44 superintendent not later than sixty days immediately preceding the expi-
45 ration of [~~his or her~~] such person's probationary period.

46 § 9. Section 3020 of the education law, as amended by chapter 691 of
47 the laws of 1994, subdivision 1 as amended by chapter 103 of the laws of
48 2010, subdivision 3 and paragraph a of subdivision 4 as amended by
49 section 2 of subpart G of part EE of chapter 56 of the laws of 2015, and
50 subdivision 4 as added by section 1 of part J of chapter 93 of the laws
51 of 2002, is amended to read as follows:

52 § 3020. Discipline of teachers. 1. No person enjoying the benefits of
53 tenure shall be disciplined or removed during a term of employment
54 except for just cause and in accordance with the procedures specified in
55 section three thousand twenty-a of this article or in accordance with
56 alternate disciplinary procedures contained in a collective bargaining

1 agreement covering [~~his or her~~] such person's terms and conditions of
2 employment that was effective on or before September first, nineteen
3 hundred ninety-four and has been unaltered by renegotiation, or in
4 accordance with alternative disciplinary procedures contained in a
5 collective bargaining agreement covering [~~his or her~~] such person's
6 terms and conditions of employment that becomes effective on or after
7 September first, nineteen hundred ninety-four; provided, however, that
8 any such alternate disciplinary procedures contained in a collective
9 bargaining agreement that becomes effective on or after September first,
10 nineteen hundred ninety-four, must provide for the written election by
11 the employee of either the procedures specified in such section three
12 thousand twenty-a or the alternative disciplinary procedures contained
13 in the collective bargaining agreement and must result in a disposition
14 of the disciplinary charge within the amount of time allowed therefor
15 under such section three thousand twenty-a [~~, and provided further that~~
16 ~~any alternate disciplinary procedures contained in a collective bargain-~~
17 ~~ing agreement that becomes effective on or after July first, two thou-~~
18 ~~sand ten shall provide for an expedited hearing process before a single~~
19 ~~hearing officer in accordance with subparagraph (i-a) of paragraph c of~~
20 ~~subdivision three of section three thousand twenty-a of this article in~~
21 ~~cases in which charges of incompetence are brought based solely upon an~~
22 ~~allegation of a pattern of ineffective teaching or performance as~~
23 ~~defined in section three thousand twelve c of this article and shall~~
24 ~~provide that such a pattern of ineffective teaching or performance shall~~
25 ~~constitute very significant evidence of incompetence which may form the~~
26 ~~basis for just cause removal].~~

27 2. No person enjoying the benefits of tenure shall be suspended for a
28 fixed time without pay or dismissed due to a violation of article thir-
29 teen-E of the public health law.

30 3. Notwithstanding any inconsistent provision of law, the procedures
31 set forth in section three thousand twenty-a of this article and subdivi-
32 sion seven of section twenty-five hundred ninety-j of this chapter may
33 be modified or replaced by agreements negotiated between the city school
34 district of the city of New York and any employee organization repres-
35 enting employees or titles that are or were covered by any memorandum of
36 agreement executed by such city school district and the council of
37 supervisors and administrators of the city of New York on or after
38 December first, nineteen hundred ninety-nine. Where such procedures are
39 so modified or replaced: (i) compliance with such modification or
40 replacement procedures shall satisfy any provision in this chapter that
41 requires compliance with section three thousand twenty-a of this
42 article, (ii) any employee against whom charges have been preferred
43 prior to the effective date of such modification or replacement shall
44 continue to be subject to the provisions of such section as in effect on
45 the date such charges were preferred, (iii) the provisions of subdivi-
46 sions one and two of this section shall not apply to agreements negoti-
47 ated pursuant to this subdivision, and (iv) in accordance with paragraph
48 (e) of subdivision one of section two hundred nine-a of the civil
49 service law, such modification or replacement procedures contained in an
50 agreement negotiated pursuant to this subdivision shall continue as
51 terms of such agreement after its expiration until a new agreement is
52 negotiated [~~, provided that any alternate disciplinary procedures~~
53 ~~contained in a collective bargaining agreement that becomes effective on~~
54 ~~or after July first, two thousand ten shall provide for an expedited~~
55 ~~hearing process before a single hearing officer in accordance with~~
56 ~~subparagraph (i-a) of paragraph c of subdivision three of section three~~

~~1 thousand twenty a of this article in cases in which charges of incompe-~~
~~2 tence are brought against a building principal based solely upon an~~
~~3 allegation of a pattern of ineffective teaching or performance as~~
~~4 defined in section three thousand twelve-c of this article and shall~~
~~5 provide that such a pattern of ineffective teaching or performance shall~~
~~6 constitute very significant evidence of incompetence which may form the~~
~~7 basis for just cause removal of the building principal and provided~~
~~8 further that any alternate disciplinary procedures contained in a~~
~~9 collective bargaining agreement that becomes effective on or after July~~
~~10 first, two thousand fifteen shall provide that all hearings pursuant to~~
~~11 sections three thousand twenty a or three thousand twenty b of this~~
~~12 article shall be conducted before a single hearing officer and that two~~
~~13 consecutive ineffective ratings pursuant to annual professional perform-~~
~~14 ance reviews conducted in accordance with the provisions of section~~
~~15 three thousand twelve-c or three thousand twelve-d of this article shall~~
~~16 constitute prima facie evidence of incompetence that can only be over-~~
~~17 come by clear and convincing evidence that the employee is not incompe-~~
~~18 tent in light of all surrounding circumstances, and if not successfully~~
~~19 overcome, the finding, absent extraordinary circumstances, shall be just~~
~~20 cause for removal, and that three consecutive ineffective ratings pursu-~~
~~21 ant to annual professional performance reviews conducted in accordance~~
~~22 with the provisions of section three thousand twelve c or three thousand~~
~~23 twelve d of this article shall constitute prima facie evidence of incom-~~
~~24 petence that can only be overcome by clear and convincing evidence that~~
~~25 the calculation of one or more of the principal's underlying components~~
~~26 on the annual professional performance reviews pursuant to section three~~
~~27 thousand twelve c or three thousand twelve d of this article was fraudu-~~
~~28 lent, and if not successfully overcome, the finding, absent extraor-~~
~~29 dinary circumstances, shall be just cause for removal. For purposes of~~
~~30 this subdivision, fraud shall include mistaken identity]. Notwithstand-~~
31 ing any inconsistent provision of law, the commissioner shall review any
32 appeals authorized by such modification or replacement procedures within
33 fifteen days from receipt by such commissioner of the record of prior
34 proceedings in the matter subject to appeal. Such review shall have
35 preference over all other appeals or proceedings pending before such
36 commissioner.

37 4. a. Notwithstanding any inconsistent provision of law, the proce-
38 dures set forth in section three thousand twenty-a of this article and
39 subdivision seven of section twenty-five hundred ninety-j of this chap-
40 ter may be modified by agreements negotiated between the city school
41 district of the city of New York and any employee organization repres-
42 enting employees or titles that are or were covered by any memorandum of
43 agreement executed by such city school district and the united feder-
44 ation of teachers on or after June tenth, two thousand two. Where such
45 procedures are so modified: (i) compliance with such modified procedures
46 shall satisfy any provision of this chapter that requires compliance
47 with section three thousand twenty-a of this article; (ii) any employee
48 against whom charges have been preferred prior to the effective date of
49 such modification shall continue to be subject to the provisions of such
50 section as in effect on the date such charges were preferred; (iii) the
51 provisions of subdivisions one and two of this section shall not apply
52 to agreements negotiated pursuant to this subdivision, except that no
53 person enjoying the benefits of tenure shall be disciplined or removed
54 during a term of employment except for just cause; and (iv) in accord-
55 ance with paragraph (e) of subdivision one of section two hundred nine-a
56 of the civil service law, such modified procedures contained in an

1 agreement negotiated pursuant to this subdivision shall continue as
2 terms of such agreement after its expiration until a new agreement is
3 negotiated[, and provided further that any alternate disciplinary proce-
4 dures contained in a collective bargaining agreement that becomes effec-
5 tive on or after July first, two thousand ten shall provide for an expe-
6 dited hearing process before a single hearing officer in accordance with
7 subparagraph (i a) of paragraph c of subdivision three of section three
8 thousand twenty a of this article in cases in which charges of incompe-
9 tence are brought based solely upon an allegation of a pattern of inef-
10 fective teaching or performance as defined in section three thousand
11 twelve c of this article and shall provide that such a pattern of inef-
12 fective teaching or performance shall constitute very significant
13 evidence of incompetence which may form the basis for just cause
14 removal, and provided further that any alternate disciplinary procedures
15 contained in a collective bargaining agreement that becomes effective on
16 or after July first, two thousand fifteen shall provide that all hear-
17 ings pursuant to sections three thousand twenty a or three thousand
18 twenty b of this article shall be conducted before a single hearing
19 officer and that two consecutive ineffective ratings pursuant to annual
20 professional performance reviews conducted in accordance with the
21 provisions of section three thousand twelve c or three thousand twelve d
22 of this article shall constitute prima facie evidence of incompetence
23 that can only be overcome by clear and convincing evidence that the
24 employee is not incompetent in light of all surrounding circumstances,
25 and if not successfully overcome, the finding, absent extraordinary
26 circumstances, shall be just cause for removal, and that three conse-
27 cutive ineffective ratings pursuant to annual professional performance
28 reviews conducted in accordance with the provisions of section three
29 thousand twelve c or three thousand twelve d of this article shall
30 constitute prima facie evidence of incompetence that can only be over-
31 come by clear and convincing evidence that the calculation of one or
32 more of the teacher's underlying components on the annual professional
33 performance reviews pursuant to section three thousand twelve c or three
34 thousand twelve d of this article was fraudulent, and if not successful-
35 ly overcome, the finding, absent extraordinary circumstances, shall be
36 just cause for removal. For purposes of this paragraph, fraud shall
37 include mistaken identity].

38 b. Any modifications to the procedures set forth in section three
39 thousand twenty-a of this article and subdivision seven of section twen-
40 ty-five hundred ninety-j of this chapter shall not change the manner in
41 which the fees and expenses of such proceedings pursuant to the afore-
42 said sections are paid.

43 § 10. Section 3020-b of the education law is REPEALED.

44 § 11. This act shall take effect immediately.