

STATE OF NEW YORK

8926

IN SENATE

April 29, 2022

Introduced by Sen. SKOUFIS -- read twice and ordered printed, and when printed to be committed to the Committee on Investigations and Government Operations

AN ACT to amend the public officers law, in relation to making certain public records available on the internet

The People of the State of New York, represented in Senate and Assembly, do enact as follows:

1 Section 1. Section 84 of the public officers law, as added by chapter
2 933 of the laws of 1977, is amended to read as follows:

3 § 84. Legislative declaration. The legislature hereby finds that a
4 free society is maintained when government is responsive and responsible
5 to the public, and when the public is aware of governmental actions. The
6 more open a government is with its citizenry, the greater the under-
7 standing and participation of the public in government. People have a
8 right to know how government operates and spends money.

9 As state and local government services increase and public problems
10 become more sophisticated and complex and therefore harder to solve, and
11 with the resultant increase in revenues and expenditures, it is incum-
12 bent upon the state and its localities to extend public accountability
13 wherever and whenever feasible.

14 The people's right to know the process of governmental decision-making
15 and to review the documents and statistics leading to determinations is
16 basic to our society. Access to such information should not be thwarted
17 by shrouding it with the cloak of secrecy or confidentiality.

18 Since the Freedom of Information Law was first adopted, advances in
19 technology have enhanced the ability to gain access to and widely
20 disseminate public information. Accordingly, the legislature finds that
21 government agencies, when agencies have the ability to do so, should
22 publish public records proactively on the internet that are of public
23 interest and available under this article.

24 The legislature therefore declares that government is the public's
25 business and that the public, individually and collectively and repres-
26 ented by a free press, should have access to the records of government
27 in accordance with the provisions of this article.

EXPLANATION--Matter in italics (underscored) is new; matter in brackets
[-] is old law to be omitted.

LBD15399-02-2

1 § 2. Subdivisions 3 and 4 of section 86 of the public officers law, as
2 added by chapter 933 of the laws of 1977, are amended and two new subdivi-
3 sions 10 and 11 are added to read as follows:

4 3. "Agency" excludes the judiciary and state legislature, and means
5 any state or municipal department, school district, board, bureau, divi-
6 sion, commission, committee, public authority, public corporation, coun-
7 cil, office or other governmental entity performing a governmental or
8 proprietary function for the state or any one or more municipalities
9 thereof, [~~except the judiciary or the state legislature~~] or any other
10 body, by whatever name, acting on behalf of government which, considered
11 in its totality, is functionally equivalent to an agency as defined in
12 this subdivision because it substantially possesses any of the following
13 features and functions:

14 (a) The body performs a governmental or proprietary function for the
15 state or municipality;

16 (b) The body's members have authority to make decisions or recommenda-
17 tions on policy and administration affecting the conduct of the business
18 of the people in the governmental sector;

19 (c) The body was created by a governmental or governmental-affiliated
20 entity or the body's origin and authority may be traced to governmental
21 action;

22 (d) The body is controlled by, overseen or operationally managed by a
23 governmental or governmental-affiliated entity;

24 (e) The body receives substantial government financial or nonfinancial
25 support;

26 (f) The body's officers and employees are public employees or are
27 nominated or appointed by public employees; or

28 (g) The body was previously determined to be open to public access.

29 4. "Record" means any [~~information kept, held, filed, produced or~~
30 ~~reproduced by, with or for an agency or the state legislature, in any~~
31 ~~physical form whatsoever including, but not limited to, reports, state-~~
32 ~~ments, examinations, memoranda, opinions, folders, files, books, manu-~~
33 ~~als, pamphlets, forms, papers, designs, drawings, maps, photos, letters,~~
34 ~~microfilms, computer tapes or discs, rules, regulations or codes~~] docu-
35 ments or electronically stored information, including but not limited to
36 any writing, drawing, graph, chart, photograph, sound recording, video
37 recording, image, and other data or data compilation, stored in any
38 medium from which information can be obtained either directly or, if
39 necessary, after translation by the agency into a reasonably usable
40 form.

41 10. "Publishable state data" means data collected by a state agency
42 that the agency is permitted, required or able to make available to the
43 public, consistent with any and all applicable laws, rules, regulations,
44 ordinances, resolutions, policies or other restrictions, requirements or
45 rights associated with the state data, including but not limited to
46 contractual or other legal orders, restrictions or requirements. Data
47 shall not be publishable state data if making such data available on a
48 website would violate statute or regulation, including disclosure that
49 would constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy, endanger
50 the public health, safety or welfare, hinder the operation of govern-
51 ment, including criminal and civil investigations, or impose an undue
52 financial, operational or administrative burden on the state agency or
53 state.

54 11. "Business days" and "days" shall be calculated from date of
55 submission, if electronic, or else post mark date.

1 § 3. Paragraphs (a) and (b) of subdivision 1, paragraphs (c), (d), (e)
2 and (g) of subdivision 2, paragraph (c) of subdivision 3 and paragraphs
3 (b) and (c) of subdivision 4 of section 87 of the public officers law,
4 paragraph (a) and the opening paragraph of paragraph (b) of subdivision
5 1 as amended by chapter 80 of the laws of 1983, paragraph (b) of subdivi-
6 sion 1 and paragraph (c) of subdivision 2 as added by chapter 933 of
7 the laws of 1977, subparagraph iii of paragraph (b) of subdivision 1 as
8 amended by chapter 223 of the laws of 2008, paragraph (d) of subdivision
9 2 as amended by chapter 289 of the laws of 1990, paragraph (e) of subdivi-
10 sion 2 as amended by chapter 155 of the laws of 2022, paragraph (g) of
11 subdivision 2 as amended by chapter 510 of the laws of 1999, paragraph
12 (c) of subdivision 3 as amended by chapter 499 of the laws of 2008,
13 paragraph (b) of subdivision 4 as added by chapter 890 of the laws of
14 1981 and paragraph (c) of subdivision 4 as added by chapter 102 of the
15 laws of 2007, are amended and a new subdivision 6 is added to read as
16 follows:

17 (a) [~~Within sixty days after the effective date of this article, the~~
18 ~~governing body of each public corporation shall promulgate uniform rules~~
19 ~~and regulations for all agencies in such public corporation pursuant to~~
20 ~~such general rules and regulations as may be promulgated by the]~~ The
21 committee on open government shall promulgate general rules and regu-
22 lations in conformity with the provisions of this article, pertaining to
23 the administration of this article.

24 (b) Each agency shall [~~promulgate rules and regulations, in conformity~~
25 ~~with this article and applicable rules and regulations promulgated~~
26 ~~pursuant to]~~ adopt the provisions of paragraph (a) of this subdivision,
27 and pursuant to such general rules and regulations as [~~may be~~] are
28 promulgated by the committee on open government in [~~conformity with the~~
29 ~~provisions of this article, pertaining to the availability of records~~
30 ~~and procedures to be followed]~~ accordance with the provisions of para-
31 graph (a) of this subdivision, shall promulgate agency-specific rules
32 and regulations in conformity with the provisions of this article,
33 including, but not limited to:

34 i. the times and places [~~such~~] agency records are available;
35 ii. the persons from whom such records may be obtained, and
36 iii. the fees for copies of records which shall not exceed twenty-five
37 cents per photocopy not in excess of nine inches by fourteen inches, or
38 the actual cost of reproducing any other record in accordance with the
39 provisions of paragraph (c) of this subdivision, except when a different
40 fee is otherwise prescribed by statute.

41 (c) if disclosed would impair present or imminent contract awards [~~or~~]
42 excluding collective bargaining negotiations;

43 (d) are trade secrets or are submitted to an agency by a commercial
44 enterprise or derived from information obtained from a commercial enter-
45 prise under compulsion of law or regulation and which if disclosed would
46 cause substantial injury to the competitive position of the subject
47 enterprise;

48 (e) are compiled for such agency's law enforcement purposes only to
49 the extent that disclosure would:

50 i. interfere with such agency's law enforcement investigations or
51 judicial proceedings, provided however, that any agency, which is not
52 conducting the investigation that the requested records relate to, that
53 is considering denying access pursuant to this subparagraph shall
54 receive confirmation from the law enforcement or investigating agency
55 conducting the investigation that disclosure of such records will inter-
56 fere with an ongoing investigation;

1 ii. deprive a person of a right to a fair trial or impartial adjudi-
2 cation;

3 iii. identify a confidential source or disclose confidential informa-
4 tion relating to a criminal investigation; or

5 iv. reveal criminal investigative techniques or procedures, except
6 routine techniques and procedures;

7 (g) are inter-agency or intra-agency deliberative materials, including
8 recommendations, proposals, suggestions, and other subjective documents
9 reflecting the personal opinions of the writer or writers rather than
10 the policy of the agency, which are not:

11 i. statistical or factual tabulations or data;

12 ii. instructions to staff that affect the public;

13 iii. final agency policy or determinations;

14 iv. external audits, including but not limited to audits performed by
15 the comptroller and the federal government; or

16 (c) a reasonably detailed current list by subject matter of all
17 records in the possession of the agency, whether or not available under
18 this article. Each agency shall update its subject matter list annually,
19 and the date of the most recent update shall be conspicuously indicated
20 on the list. Each state agency as defined in subdivision four of this
21 section [~~that maintains a website~~] shall post its current list on its
22 website and such posting shall be linked to the website of the committee
23 on open government. [~~Any such agency that does not maintain a website~~
24 ~~shall arrange to have its list posted on the website of the committee on~~
25 ~~open government.~~]

26 (b) As used in this subdivision the term "agency" or "state agency"
27 means [~~only a state department, board, bureau, division, council or~~
28 ~~office and any public corporation the majority of whose members are~~
29 ~~appointed by the governor~~] a board, bureau, division, commission,
30 committee, public authority, public corporation, council, office or
31 other governmental entity performing a governmental or proprietary func-
32 tion for the state, except the judiciary or the state legislature.

33 (c) Each state agency [~~that maintains~~] shall maintain a website
34 [~~shall~~] and post information related to this article and article six-A
35 of this chapter on its website. Such information shall include, at a
36 minimum, contact information for the persons from whom records of the
37 agency may be obtained, the times and places such records are available
38 for inspection and copying, and information on how to request records in
39 person, by mail, and[, ~~if the agency accepts requests for records elec-~~
40 ~~tronically,~~] by e-mail. This posting shall be linked to the website of
41 the committee on open government.

42 (d) Every state agency shall make its publishable state data available
43 on the agency's website or to the office of information technology
44 services to be available on the state's open data website.

45 (e) Every agency shall make available on its website's homepage a link
46 to that agency's current fiscal year budget.

47 (f) Every agency shall make available copies of all current and
48 proposed collective bargaining agreements and related documents, includ-
49 ing, but not limited to, all addenda, schedules, memoranda, and other
50 attachments.

51 6. Whenever there is a question as to whether or not a record should
52 be disclosed, it shall be presumed that the requestor is entitled to the
53 record.

54 § 4. Subdivision 1, paragraphs (a) and (b) of subdivision 2, subdivi-
55 sions 3 and 4 and paragraph (h) of subdivision 5 of section 89 of the
56 public officers law, subdivision 1 as added by chapter 933 of the laws

1 of 1977, paragraph (a) of subdivision 1 as amended by chapter 33 of the
2 laws of 1984, paragraph (b) of subdivision 1 as amended by chapter 182
3 of the laws of 2006, paragraph (a) of subdivision 2 as amended by
4 section 11 of part U of chapter 61 of the laws of 2011, paragraph (b) of
5 subdivision 2 as amended by section 2 of part GGG of chapter 59 of the
6 laws of 2019, subdivision 3 as amended by chapter 223 of the laws of
7 2008, paragraph (c) of subdivision 3 as added by chapter 47 of the laws
8 of 2018, subdivision 4 as amended by chapter 22 of the laws of 2005,
9 paragraph (c) of subdivision 4 as amended by chapter 453 of the laws of
10 2017, paragraph (d) of subdivision 4 as added by chapter 487 of the laws
11 of 2016 and paragraph (h) of subdivision 5 as added by chapter 890 of
12 the laws of 1981, are amended to read as follows:

13 1. (a) (i) The committee on open government is continued and shall
14 consist of [~~the lieutenant governor or the delegate of such officer, the~~
15 ~~secretary of state or the delegate of such officer, whose office shall~~
16 ~~act as secretariat for the committee, the commissioner of the office of~~
17 ~~general services or the delegate of such officer, the director of the~~
18 ~~budget or the delegate of such officer, and~~] seven [other] persons, none
19 of whom shall hold any other state or local public office except the
20 representative of local governments as set forth herein, to be appointed
21 as follows: [~~five by the governor, at least two of whom are or have been~~
22 ~~representatives of the news media, one of whom shall be a representative~~
23 ~~of local government who, at the time of appointment, is serving as a~~
24 ~~duly elected officer of a local government, one by the temporary presi-~~
25 ~~dent of the senate, and one by the speaker of the assembly. The persons~~
26 ~~appointed by the temporary president of the senate and the speaker of~~
27 ~~the assembly shall be appointed to serve, respectively, until the expi-~~
28 ~~ration of the terms of office of the temporary president and the speaker~~
29 ~~to which the temporary president and speaker were elected. The four~~
30 ~~persons presently serving by appointment of the governor for fixed terms~~
31 ~~shall continue to serve until the expiration of their respective terms.~~
32 ~~Thereafter, their respective successors shall be appointed for terms of~~
33 ~~four years. The member representing local government shall be appointed~~
34 ~~for a term of four years, so long as such member shall remain a duly~~
35 ~~elected officer of a local government.] two representatives, each of
36 whom is from the news media or a nongovernmental nonprofit group that
37 works on issues related to transparency or open government, two repre-
38 sentatives of local government who, at the time of appointment, are
39 serving as duly elected officers of a local government, and three
40 private citizens of the state, none of whom may be custodians of public
41 records, members of the news media or a nonprofit group that works on
42 issues related to transparency or open government, or a staff member or
43 spokesperson for an organization that represents custodians or reque-
44 sters of public records. Of the seven members, at least two shall be
45 attorneys admitted to practice in New York and at least two shall
46 possess expertise concerning electronic records, including electronic
47 storage, retrieval, review, and reproduction technologies.~~

48 (ii) Members of the committee shall be appointed from a pool of appli-
49 cants identified by the governor and the governor shall publish on the
50 governor's website notice of the governor's intent to consider appli-
51 cants for positions on the committee on open government and the notice
52 shall include the application procedures, criteria for evaluating appli-
53 cants' qualifications, and procedures for resolving any conflicts of
54 interest; and solicit recommendations for committee members from agen-
55 cies, news media, and nongovernmental nonprofit groups that work on
56 issues related to transparency or open government; and post names and

1 qualifications of applicants on the governor's website; and when evalu-
2 ating an applicant, consider the need for geographic, political, racial,
3 ethnic, cultural, and gender diversity on the committee and ensure the
4 neutrality of the committee.

5 (iii) Subject to the advice and consent of the senate, the governor
6 shall appoint the members of the committee from the pool of applicants
7 created pursuant to this section.

8 (iv) The committee shall [~~hold no less than two meetings annually~~]
9 meet at least monthly, but may meet at any time.

10 (v) The members of the committee shall be entitled to reimbursement
11 for actual expenses incurred in the discharge of their duties.

12 (b) The committee shall:

13 i. [~~furnish to any agency advisory guidelines, opinions or other~~
14 ~~appropriate information regarding this article~~] issue advisory opinions
15 to any agency or person which shall be made available on the committee's
16 website;

17 ii. [~~furnish to any person advisory opinions or other appropriate~~
18 ~~information regarding this article~~] provide annual training to agencies,
19 public officials and public employees on articles six and seven of this
20 chapter;

21 iii. promulgate rules and regulations [~~with respect to the implementa-~~
22 ~~tion of subdivision one and paragraph (c) of subdivision three of~~
23 ~~section eighty seven~~] to carry out the provisions of this article which
24 shall be made available on the committee's website;

25 iv. [~~request from any agency such assistance, services and information~~
26 ~~as will enable the committee to effectively carry out its powers and~~
27 ~~duties~~] assign appeals officers to review appeals of decisions by agen-
28 cies and issue orders and opinions. The committee shall employ or
29 contract with attorneys to serve as appeals officers to review appeals
30 and, if necessary, to hold hearings on a regional basis under this arti-
31 cle. Each appeals officer must comply with all of the following: (A)
32 complete a training course provided by the committee prior to acting as
33 an appeals officer; (B) if a hearing is necessary, hold hearings
34 regionally as necessary to ensure access to the remedies provided by
35 this article and article seven of this chapter; and (C) comply with the
36 procedures under this article and article seven of this chapter and any
37 rules or regulations promulgated by the committee;

38 v. [~~develop a form, which shall be made available on the internet,~~
39 ~~that may be used by the public to request a record~~] establish an
40 informal mediation program to resolve disputes under this article and
41 article seven of this chapter; and

42 vi. report on its activities [~~and findings~~], including the number and
43 nature of complaints filed with the committee, its decisions, and any
44 recommended changes to the law regarding this article and article seven
45 of this chapter, [~~including recommendations for changes in the law,~~]
46 to the governor and the legislature annually, on or before [~~December~~
47 fifteenth] October thirty-first.

48 (c) The committee shall appoint an executive director who shall not be
49 an existing state employee and who shall serve for a term of five years,
50 unless removed by a majority vote of the committee. The executive direc-
51 tor shall receive a salary in the same amount as set forth for state
52 officers in subdivision two of section one hundred sixty-nine of the
53 executive law. The executive director may serve no more than two terms.

54 (d) The executive director shall not seek election nor accept appoint-
55 ment to any political office during his or her tenure as executive
56 director and for one year thereafter.

1 (e) The executive director shall ensure that the duties of the commit-
2 tee on open government are carried out and shall monitor appeals and
3 complaints submitted to the committee.

4 (a) The committee on [~~public access to records may~~] open government
5 shall promulgate guidelines regarding deletion of identifying details or
6 withholding of records otherwise available under this article to prevent
7 unwarranted invasions of personal privacy. [~~In the absence of such~~
8 ~~guidelines, an agency may delete identifying details when it makes~~
9 ~~records available.~~]

10 (b) An unwarranted invasion of personal privacy includes, but shall
11 not be limited to:

12 i. disclosure of employment, medical or credit histories or personal
13 references of applicants for employment;

14 ii. disclosure of items involving the medical or personal records of a
15 client or patient in a medical facility;

16 iii. sale or release of lists of names of natural persons and residen-
17 tial addresses if such lists would be used for solicitation or fund-
18 raising purposes;

19 iv. disclosure of information of a personal nature when disclosure
20 would result in economic or personal hardship to the subject party and
21 such information is not relevant to the work of the agency requesting or
22 maintaining it;

23 v. disclosure of information of a personal nature reported in confi-
24 dence to an agency and not relevant to the ordinary work of such agency;

25 vi. information of a personal nature contained in a workers' compen-
26 sation record, except as provided by section one hundred ten-a of the
27 workers' compensation law;

28 vii. disclosure of electronic contact information, such as an e-mail
29 address or a social network username, that has been collected from a
30 taxpayer under section one hundred four of the real property tax law; or

31 viii. disclosure of law enforcement arrest or booking photographs of
32 an individual, unless public release of such photographs will serve a
33 specific law enforcement purpose and disclosure is not precluded by any
34 state or federal laws.

35 3. (a) Each entity subject to the provisions of this article, within
36 [~~five~~ ten] business days of the receipt of a [~~written request for a~~
37 ~~record reasonably described~~] record or records request, shall make such
38 record or records available to the [~~person requesting it, deny such~~
39 ~~request in writing~~] requestor or furnish a written acknowledgement of
40 the receipt of such request [~~and a statement of the approximate date,~~
41 ~~which shall be reasonable under the circumstances of the request, when~~
42 ~~such request will be granted or denied,~~] including, where appropriate, a
43 statement that access to the record or records will be determined in
44 accordance with subdivision five of this section. Such acknowledgement
45 shall include:

46 i. a statement of the approximate date, which shall be reasonable
47 under the circumstances of the request not to exceed twenty business
48 days from receipt of the original request, and advising if exceptions
49 will apply, when such request will be granted or denied, including,
50 where appropriate, a statement that access to the record will be deter-
51 mined in accordance with subdivision five of this section; or

52 ii. if an agency determines to grant a request in whole or in part,
53 and if circumstances prevent disclosure to the person requesting the
54 record or records within twenty business days from the date of the
55 acknowledgement of the receipt of the request, the agency shall state,
56 in writing, both the reason for the inability to grant the request with-

1 in twenty business days and a date certain within a reasonable period,
2 depending on the circumstances, when the request will be granted in
3 whole or in part, and advise if exceptions will apply.

4 iii. In the event that the agency determines it cannot grant access to
5 any of the requested record or records: (A) a statement of determination
6 that access to the requested record or records cannot be granted because
7 the request was made to the wrong agency; (B) a statement of determi-
8 nation that access to the requested record or records cannot be granted
9 because the request is too vague; or (C) a statement of determination
10 that access to the requested record or records cannot be granted because
11 the records do not exist.

12 (b) Where appropriate, an agency shall make a determination under this
13 subdivision for each category of record in a records request containing
14 more than one records request.

15 (c) An agency shall not deny a request on the basis that the request
16 is voluminous or that locating, generating, or reviewing the requested
17 records or providing the requested copies is burdensome because the
18 agency lacks sufficient staffing or on any other basis if the agency may
19 engage an outside professional service to provide copying, programming
20 or other services required to provide the copy, the costs of which the
21 agency may recover pursuant to paragraph (c) of subdivision one of
22 section eighty-seven of this article.

23 (d) An agency may require a person requesting lists of names of
24 natural persons and residential addresses to provide a written certif-
25 ication that such person will not use such lists of names and addresses
26 for solicitation or fund-raising purposes and will not sell, give or
27 otherwise make available such lists of names and addresses to any other
28 person for the purpose of allowing that person to use such lists of
29 names and addresses for solicitation or fund-raising purposes. [~~If an~~
30 ~~agency determines to grant a request in whole or in part, and if circum-~~
31 ~~stances prevent disclosure to the person requesting the record or~~
32 ~~records within twenty business days from the date of the acknowledgement~~
33 ~~of the receipt of the request, the agency shall state, in writing, both~~
34 ~~the reason for the inability to grant the request within twenty business~~
35 ~~days and a date certain within a reasonable period, depending on the~~
36 ~~circumstances, when the request will be granted in whole or in part.]~~

37 (e) Upon payment of, or offer to pay, the fee prescribed therefor, the
38 entity shall provide a copy of such record and certify to the correct-
39 ness of such copy if so requested, or as the case may be, shall certify
40 that it does not have possession of such record or that such record
41 cannot be found after diligent search. Nothing in this article shall be
42 construed to require any entity to prepare any record not possessed or
43 maintained by such entity except the records specified in subdivision
44 three of section eighty-seven and subdivision three of section eighty-
45 eight of this article. When an agency has the ability to retrieve or
46 extract a record or data maintained in a computer storage system with
47 reasonable effort, it shall be required to do so. When doing so requires
48 less employee time than engaging in manual retrieval or redactions from
49 non-electronic records, the agency shall be required to retrieve or
50 extract such record or data electronically. Any programming necessary to
51 retrieve a record maintained in a computer storage system and to trans-
52 fer that record to the medium requested by a person or to allow the
53 transferred record to be read or printed shall not be deemed to be the
54 preparation or creation of a new record.

55 [~~(b)~~] (f) All entities shall[~~, provided such entity has reasonable~~
56 ~~means available,~~] accept requests for records submitted in the form of

1 electronic mail and shall respond to such requests by electronic mail,
2 using forms, to the extent practicable, consistent with the form or
3 forms developed by the committee on open government pursuant to subdivi-
4 sion one of this section and provided that the written requests do not
5 seek a response in some other form. Agencies shall not require requests
6 to be made in any specific format and may not ignore or deny requests
7 not made in the agency's preferred format.

8 [~~e~~] (g) Each state agency, as defined in subdivision five of this
9 section, that maintains a website shall ensure its website provides for
10 the online submission of a request for records pursuant to this article.

11 (h) All responses to requests shall be attributed to a natural person
12 who is an employee of the responding entity. Responses containing denial
13 of requests, asserting exceptions to disclosure, or asserting that
14 records do not exist, shall be sworn under the penalty of perjury.

15 4. (a) Except as provided in subdivision five of this section, any
16 person denied access to a record may within [~~thirty~~] ninety days appeal
17 in writing such denial to the [~~head, chief executive or governing body~~
18 ~~of the entity, or the person therefor designated by such head, chief~~
19 ~~executive, or governing body, who shall within ten business days of the~~
20 ~~receipt of such appeal fully explain in writing to the person requesting~~
21 ~~the record the reasons for further denial, or provide access to the~~
22 ~~record sought. In addition, each agency shall immediately forward to the~~
23 ~~committee on open government a copy of such appeal when received by the~~
24 ~~agency and the ensuing determination thereon] committee on open govern-
25 ment. Failure by an agency to conform to the provisions of subdivision
26 three of this section shall constitute a denial. A written appeal shall
27 include, if available, a copy of the original request for public record
28 or records, and the agency's response, if any.~~

29 i. Upon receipt of an appeal under this subdivision, the committee on
30 open government shall assign an appeals officer to determine whether the
31 appeal is within the committee's jurisdiction, frivolous or without
32 factual basis, reduce that conclusion to writing and transmit a copy to
33 the requestor and to the responsible records access officer and request
34 a written response from the agency. Upon receipt of a request from the
35 committee on open government an agency shall provide a written response
36 to the appeal within fifteen days after receiving the request for a
37 response; and if the appeal alleges the agency failed to respond to a
38 request within the statutory time, provide a response to the record
39 request; and if the appeal alleges the agency denied a request in
40 violation of this article, provide a copy of the record, a descriptive
41 index of the record, or a written reason why the record is being with-
42 held, as appropriate.

43 ii. The agency or requestor shall provide an affidavit or statement of
44 facts at issue in the appeal within the time provided in a request that
45 the committee on open government may make.

46 iii. The committee on open government shall maintain the confidential-
47 ity of any record provided under this subdivision.

48 iv. A person or agency may not be civilly or criminally liable for
49 providing a record to the committee on open government under this subdivi-
50 vision.

51 v. The provision of a record or a description of a record to the
52 committee on open government under this subdivision may not be construed
53 as a waiver of any applicable privilege.

54 vi. Upon receipt of the agency response and any additional information
55 requested under this subdivision, the committee on open government shall
56 invite the requestor to participate in an informal mediation; and issue

1 a written decision within fifteen days of the date the requestor
2 declines informal mediation or declares the informal mediation termi-
3 nated; or if unable to reach a decision based on the written
4 submissions, schedule an informal conference with the requestor and the
5 agency that may be conducted by teleconference or written testimony
6 submitted by electronic mail, and issue a written decision within
7 fifteen days of the informal conference; or if unable to issue a deci-
8 sion within the times specified in this paragraph and paragraph (b) of
9 this subdivision, state in writing the reason for its inability to issue
10 a decision and issue a decision as soon as possible but not later than
11 sixty days after the filing of the appeal.

12 vii. The committee on open government shall send a copy of the written
13 decision to the requestor and the responding agency.

14 (b) An agency may, within the statutory time for acknowledging a
15 records request under this section, submit a written complaint to the
16 committee on open government alleging that a requestor's records request
17 or pattern of records requests is frivolous, vexatious, or made in bad
18 faith.

19 i. Upon receipt of a complaint under this subdivision, the committee
20 on open government shall send a copy of the complaint to the requestor
21 and request a written response that shall be provided within thirty
22 days.

23 ii. The agency or requestor shall provide an affidavit or statement of
24 facts at issue in the complaint within the time provided in a request
25 that the committee on open government may make.

26 iii. Upon receipt of the requestor's response and any additional
27 information requested under this subdivision, the committee on open
28 government shall issue a written decision within thirty days determining
29 whether the requestor's request or patterns of requests is frivolous,
30 vexatious, or made in bad faith.

31 iv. If the committee on open government finds that the requestor's
32 record request is frivolous, vexatious, or made in bad faith based on
33 the totality of the circumstances, including the number and scope of the
34 requestor's past records requests and the agency's responses to those
35 requests and efforts to cooperate with the requestor, it shall issue an
36 order authorizing the agency to ignore the records request; or respond
37 to a less burdensome version of the request within a reasonable time as
38 determined by the committee on open government.

39 vii. The committee on open government shall send a copy of the written
40 decision to the requestor and the complaining agency.

41 (c) Except as provided in subdivision five of this section, a person
42 denied access to a record in [~~an appeal determination~~] a decision under
43 the provisions of [~~paragraph~~] paragraphs (a) and (b) of this subdivision
44 may bring a proceeding for review of such denial pursuant to article
45 seventy-eight of the civil practice law and rules. In the event that
46 access to any record is denied pursuant to the provisions of subdivision
47 two of section eighty-seven of this article, the agency involved shall
48 have the burden of proving that such record falls within the provisions
49 of such subdivision two. [~~Failure by an agency to conform to the~~
50 ~~provisions of paragraph (a) of this subdivision shall constitute a~~
51 ~~denial.~~

52 (e)] (d) The court in such a proceeding: (i) [~~may~~] shall assess,
53 against such agency involved, reasonable attorney's fees and other liti-
54 gation costs reasonably incurred by such person in any case under the
55 provisions of this section [~~in which such person has substantially~~
56 ~~prevailed, and~~] when the agency failed to respond to a request or appeal

1 within the statutory time; ~~and~~ (ii) shall assess, against such agency
2 involved, reasonable attorney's fees and other litigation costs reason-
3 ably incurred by such person in any case under the provisions of this
4 section in which such person has substantially prevailed and the court
5 finds that the agency had no reasonable basis for denying access; and
6 (iii) shall assess, against such requestor involved, reasonable attor-
7 ney's fees and other litigation costs reasonably incurred by an agency
8 in any case under the provisions of this section in which the court
9 finds that the requestor's records request or pattern of records
10 requests is frivolous, vexatious, or made in bad faith.

11 ~~(d)~~ (e) (i) Appeal to the appellate division of the supreme court
12 must be made in accordance with subdivision (a) of section fifty-five
13 hundred thirteen of the civil practice law and rules.

14 (ii) An appeal from an agency taken from an order of the court requir-
15 ing disclosure of any or all records sought:

16 (A) shall be given preference;

17 (B) shall be brought on for argument on such terms and conditions as
18 the presiding justice may direct, upon application of any party to the
19 proceeding; and

20 (C) shall be deemed abandoned if the agency fails to serve and file a
21 record and brief within sixty days after the date of service upon the
22 petitioner of the notice of appeal, unless consent to further extension
23 is given by all parties, or unless further extension is granted by the
24 court upon such terms as may be just and upon good cause shown.

25 (h) As used in this subdivision the term [~~"agency" or~~] "state agency"
26 means [~~only a state department, board, bureau, division, council or~~
27 ~~office and any public corporation the majority of whose members are~~
28 ~~appointed by the governor~~] a board, bureau, division, commission,
29 committee, public authority, public corporation, council, office or
30 other governmental entity performing a governmental or proprietary func-
31 tion for the state, except the judiciary or the state legislature.

32 § 5. This act shall take effect immediately.