

# STATE OF NEW YORK

---

6976

2021-2022 Regular Sessions

## IN SENATE

May 20, 2021

---

Introduced by Sen. GOUNARDES -- read twice and ordered printed, and when printed to be committed to the Committee on Civil Service and Pensions

AN ACT to amend the retirement and social security law, in relation to modifying the retirement program for Triborough bridge and tunnel members

The People of the State of New York, represented in Senate and Assembly, do enact as follows:

1 Section 1. Section 604-c of the retirement and social security law, as  
2 added by chapter 472 of the laws of 1995, paragraph 2 of subdivision c  
3 and paragraph 7-a of subdivision e as amended by chapter 693 of the laws  
4 of 2003, paragraph 1 and subparagraph (ii) of paragraph 2 of subdivision  
5 d as amended by chapter 18 of the laws of 2012, paragraph 1 of subdivi-  
6 sion e as amended by chapter 661 of the laws of 2002, subparagraph (iv)  
7 of paragraph 3 of subdivision e as added by chapter 365 of the laws of  
8 1999, subparagraph (i) of paragraph 8 of subdivision e as amended by  
9 chapter 448 of the laws of 2018 and paragraph 9 of subdivision e as  
10 amended by chapter 664 of the laws of 1996, is amended to read as  
11 follows:

12 § 604-c. [~~Twenty-year/age-fifty~~] Twenty-year retirement program for  
13 Triborough bridge and tunnel members. a. Definitions. The following  
14 words and phrases as used in this section shall have the following mean-  
15 ings unless a different meaning is plainly required by the context.

16 1. "Triborough bridge and tunnel member" shall mean a member (as  
17 defined in subdivision e of section six hundred one of this article) who  
18 is employed by the Triborough bridge and tunnel authority as a bridge  
19 and tunnel officer, sergeant, or lieutenant in a non-managerial posi-  
20 tion.

21 2. [~~"Twenty-year/age-fifty~~] "Twenty-year retirement program" shall  
22 mean all the terms and conditions of this section.

23 3. "Starting date of the [~~twenty-year/age-fifty~~] twenty-year retire-  
24 ment program" shall mean the date of enactment of the act which added

EXPLANATION--Matter in italics (underscored) is new; matter in brackets  
[-] is old law to be omitted.

LBD11119-02-1

1 this section, as such date is certified pursuant to section forty-one of  
2 the legislative law.

3 4. "Participant in the [~~twenty-year/age-fifty~~] twenty-year retirement  
4 program" shall mean any Triborough bridge and tunnel member who, under  
5 the applicable provisions of subdivision b of this section, is entitled  
6 to the rights, benefits and privileges and is subject to the obligations  
7 of the [~~twenty-year/age-fifty~~] twenty-year retirement program, as appli-  
8 cable to him or her.

9 5. "Discontinued member" shall mean a participant in the [~~twenty-  
10 year/age-fifty~~] twenty-year retirement program who, while he or she was  
11 a Triborough bridge and tunnel member, discontinued service as such a  
12 member and has a right to a deferred vested benefit under subdivision d  
13 of this section.

14 6. "Administrative code" shall mean the administrative code of the  
15 city of New York.

16 b. Participation in [~~twenty-year/age-fifty~~] twenty-year retirement  
17 program. 1. Subject to the provisions of paragraph six of this subdivi-  
18 sion, any person who is a Triborough bridge and tunnel member on the  
19 starting date of the [~~twenty-year/age-fifty~~] twenty-year retirement  
20 program and who, as such a bridge and tunnel member or otherwise, last  
21 became subject to the provisions of this article prior to such starting  
22 date, may elect to become a participant in the [~~twenty-year/age-fifty~~]  
23 twenty-year retirement program by filing, within one hundred eighty days  
24 after the starting date of the [~~twenty-year/age-fifty~~] twenty-year  
25 retirement program, a duly executed application for such participation  
26 with the retirement system of which such person is a member, provided he  
27 or she is such a bridge and tunnel member on the date such application  
28 is filed.

29 2. Subject to the provisions of paragraph six of this subdivision, any  
30 person who becomes a Triborough bridge and tunnel member after the  
31 starting date of the [~~twenty-year/age-fifty~~] twenty-year retirement  
32 program and who, as such a bridge and tunnel member or otherwise, last  
33 became subject to the provisions of this article prior to such starting  
34 date, may elect to become a participant in the [~~twenty-year/age-fifty~~]  
35 twenty-year retirement program by filing, within one hundred eighty days  
36 after becoming such a bridge and tunnel member, a duly executed applica-  
37 tion for such participation with the retirement system of which such  
38 person is a member, provided he or she is such a bridge and tunnel  
39 member on the date such application is filed.

40 3. Any election to be a participant in the [~~twenty-year/age-fifty~~]  
41 twenty-year retirement program shall be irrevocable.

42 4. Each Triborough bridge and tunnel member who becomes subject to the  
43 provisions of this article on or after the starting date of the [~~twenty-  
44 year/age-fifty~~] twenty-year retirement program shall become a partic-  
45 ipant in the [~~twenty-year/age-fifty~~] twenty-year retirement program on  
46 the date he or she becomes such a bridge and tunnel member.

47 5. Where any participant in the [~~twenty-year/age-fifty~~] twenty-year  
48 retirement program shall cease to be employed by the Triborough bridge  
49 and tunnel authority as a bridge and tunnel member, he or she shall  
50 cease to be such a participant and, during any period in which such  
51 person is not so employed, he or she shall not be a participant in the  
52 [~~twenty-year/age-fifty~~] twenty-year retirement program and shall not be  
53 eligible for the benefits of subdivision c of this section.

54 6. Where any participant in the [~~twenty-year/age-fifty~~] twenty-year  
55 retirement program terminates service as a Triborough bridge and tunnel  
56 member and returns to such service as a Triborough bridge and tunnel

1 member at a later date, he or she shall again become such a participant  
2 on that date.

3 c. Service retirement benefits. 1. A participant in the [~~twenty-~~  
4 ~~year/age fifty~~] twenty-year retirement program:

5 (i) who has completed twenty or more years of credited service; and

6 (ii) [~~who has attained age fifty, and~~

7 ~~(iii)~~] who has paid, before the effective date of retirement, all  
8 additional member contributions and interest (if any) required by subdivi-  
9 sion e of this section; and

10 [~~(iv)~~] (iii) who files with the retirement system of which he or she  
11 is a member an application for service retirement setting forth at what  
12 time he or she desires to be retired; and

13 [~~(v)~~] (iv) who shall be a participant in the [~~twenty-year/age fifty~~]  
14 twenty-year retirement program at the time so specified for his or her  
15 retirement; shall be retired pursuant to the provisions of this section  
16 affording early service retirement.

17 2. (i) Notwithstanding any other provision of law to the contrary, the  
18 early service retirement benefit for participants in the [~~twenty-~~  
19 ~~year/age fifty~~] twenty-year retirement program who retire pursuant to  
20 paragraph one of this subdivision shall be a pension consisting of:

21 (A) an amount, on account of the required minimum period of service,  
22 equal to one-half of his or her final average salary; plus

23 (B) an amount of credited service, or fraction thereof, beyond such  
24 required minimum period of service equal to one and one-half percent of  
25 his or her final average salary.

26 (ii) The maximum pension computed without optional modification paya-  
27 ble pursuant to subparagraph (i) of this paragraph shall equal that  
28 payable upon completion of thirty years of service.

29 d. Vesting. 1. A participant in the [~~twenty-year/age fifty~~] twenty-  
30 year retirement program [~~who~~] shall be entitled to receive a deferred  
31 vested benefit as provided in this subdivision if such participant:

32 (i) discontinues service as a Triborough bridge and tunnel member,  
33 other than by death or retirement; and

34 (ii) in the case of a participant who is not a New York city revised  
35 plan member, prior to such discontinuance, completed five but less than  
36 twenty years of credited service or, in the case of a participant who is  
37 a New York city revised plan member, has completed ten but less than  
38 twenty years of credited service; and

39 (iii) has paid, prior to such discontinuance, all additional member  
40 contributions and interest (if any) required by subdivision e of this  
41 section; and

42 (iv) does not withdraw in whole or in part his or her accumulated  
43 member contributions pursuant to section six hundred thirteen of this  
44 article unless such participant thereafter returns to public service and  
45 repays the amounts so withdrawn, together with interest, pursuant to  
46 such section six hundred thirteen[~~, shall be entitled to receive a~~  
47 ~~deferred vested benefit as provided in this subdivision~~].

48 2. (i) Upon such discontinuance under the conditions and in compliance  
49 with the provisions of paragraph one of this subdivision, such deferred  
50 vested benefit shall vest automatically.

51 (ii) In the case of a participant who is not a New York city revised  
52 plan member, such vested benefit shall become payable on the earliest  
53 date on which such discontinued member could have retired for service if  
54 such discontinuance had not occurred or, in the case of a participant  
55 who is a New York city revised plan member, such vested benefit shall  
56 become payable at age sixty-three.

1 3. Such deferred vested benefit shall be a pension consisting of an  
2 amount equal to two and one-half percent of such discontinued member's  
3 final average salary, multiplied by the number of years of credited  
4 service.

5 e. Additional member contributions. 1. In addition to the member  
6 contributions required by section six hundred thirteen of this article,  
7 each participant in the [~~twenty-year/age-fifty~~] twenty-year retirement  
8 program in the rank of bridge and tunnel officer shall contribute to the  
9 retirement system of which he or she is a member (subject to the appli-  
10 cable provisions of subdivision d of section six hundred thirteen of  
11 this article) an additional five and fifty one-hundredths percent of his  
12 or her compensation and each participant in the [~~twenty-year/age-fifty~~]  
13 twenty-year retirement program in the rank of sergeant or lieutenant  
14 shall contribute to the retirement system an additional six percent of  
15 his or her compensation earned from all allowable service as a Tribor-  
16 ough bridge and tunnel member rendered on and after the date which is  
17 one hundred eighty days prior to the starting date of the [~~twenty-~~  
18 ~~year/age-fifty~~] twenty-year retirement program. A participant in the  
19 [~~twenty-year/age-fifty~~] twenty-year retirement program shall contribute  
20 additional member contributions until the later of (i) the date as of  
21 which he or she has twenty years of credited service as a bridge and  
22 tunnel officer, or (ii) the third anniversary of the date that he or she  
23 last became a participant in the [~~twenty-year/age-fifty~~] twenty-year  
24 retirement program.

25 2. Commencing with the first full payroll period after each person  
26 becomes a participant in the [~~twenty-year/age-fifty~~] twenty-year retire-  
27 ment program, additional member contributions at the rate specified in  
28 paragraph one of this subdivision shall be deducted (subject to the  
29 applicable provisions of subdivision d of section six hundred thirteen  
30 of this article) from the compensation of such participant on each and  
31 every payroll of such participant for each and every payroll period.

32 3. (i) Subject to the provisions of subparagraph (ii) of this para-  
33 graph, where any additional member contributions required by paragraph  
34 one of this subdivision are not paid by deductions from a participant's  
35 compensation pursuant to paragraph two of this subdivision:

36 (A) that participant shall be charged with a contribution deficiency  
37 consisting of such unpaid amounts, together with interest thereon at the  
38 rate of five percent per annum, compounded annually; and

39 (B) such interest on each amount of undeducted contributions shall  
40 accrue from the end of the payroll period for which such amount would  
41 have been deducted from compensation if he or she had been a participant  
42 at the beginning of that payroll period, until such amount is paid to  
43 the retirement system.

44 (ii) Except as provided in subparagraph (iii) of this paragraph, no  
45 interest shall be due on any such unpaid additional contributions which  
46 are not attributable to the period prior to the first full payroll peri-  
47 od referred to in paragraph two of this subdivision.

48 (iii) Should any person who, pursuant to paragraph eight of this  
49 subdivision, has withdrawn any additional member contributions (and any  
50 interest paid thereon) again become a participant in the [~~twenty-~~  
51 ~~year/age-fifty~~] twenty-year retirement program pursuant to paragraph six  
52 of subdivision b of this section, an appropriate amount shall be  
53 included in such participant's contribution deficiency (including inter-  
54 est thereon as calculated pursuant to subparagraph (i) of this para-  
55 graph) as if such additional contributions had never been made.

1 (iv) Notwithstanding any other provisions of this paragraph, no  
2 participant shall be charged interest for any period prior to March  
3 twenty-fifth, nineteen hundred ninety-eight with respect to any contrib-  
4 utions owed with respect to any payroll period beginning prior to such  
5 date.

6 4. The head of a retirement system which includes participants in the  
7 [~~twenty-year/age-fifty~~] twenty-year retirement program in its membership  
8 may, consistent with the provisions of this subdivision, promulgate  
9 regulations for the payment of such additional member contributions, and  
10 any interest thereon, by such participants (including the deduction of  
11 such contributions, and any interest thereon, from the participant's  
12 compensation).

13 5. Where a contribution deficiency chargeable to a participant pursu-  
14 ant to paragraph three of this subdivision has not been paid in full  
15 before the effective date of retirement, that participant shall not be  
16 eligible to retire pursuant to subdivision c of this section.

17 6. Where a contribution deficiency chargeable to a participant pursu-  
18 ant to paragraph three of this subdivision has not been paid in full  
19 before the date of discontinuance of service, that participant shall not  
20 be entitled to a deferred vested benefit pursuant to subdivision d of  
21 this section.

22 7. Where a participant has not paid in full any contribution deficien-  
23 cy chargeable to him or her pursuant to paragraph three of this subdivi-  
24 sion, and a benefit, other than a refund of member contributions pursu-  
25 ant to section six hundred thirteen of this article or a refund of  
26 additional member contributions pursuant to paragraph eight of this  
27 subdivision, becomes payable under this article to the participant or to  
28 his or her designated beneficiary or estate, the actuarial equivalent of  
29 any such unpaid amount shall be deducted from the benefit otherwise  
30 payable.

31 7-a. Notwithstanding paragraph six or seven of this subdivision, where  
32 a deficiency chargeable to a participant pursuant to paragraph three of  
33 this subdivision has not been paid in full while the participant is a  
34 Triborough bridge and tunnel member and such participant retires prior  
35 to July first, two thousand eleven, such participant may elect to be  
36 covered by this paragraph. Such participant shall be entitled to the  
37 benefits provided in subdivision c of this section provided that partic-  
38 ipant authorizes the retirement system to deduct from such benefits an  
39 amount which will result in the deficiency, plus associated interest to  
40 date of final payment, being paid in full no later than July first, two  
41 thousand eleven or such earlier date as agreed to by the participant.  
42 Such amount will be deducted in equal installments on a monthly basis.  
43 Nothing in this paragraph shall prevent the participant from making a  
44 partial payment of the amount of the deficiency at the time of retire-  
45 ment so as to reduce the monthly payment nor to make a lump sum payment  
46 equal to the amount of the total unpaid balance at any time during the  
47 period of repayment.

48 8. (i) Such additional member contributions (and any interest thereon)  
49 shall be paid into the contingent reserve fund of the retirement system  
50 of which the participant is a member and shall not for any purpose be  
51 deemed to be member contributions or accumulated contributions of a  
52 member under section six hundred thirteen of this article or otherwise  
53 while he or she is a participant in the [~~twenty-year/age-fifty~~] twenty-  
54 year retirement program or otherwise, except that, a surplus of such  
55 additional member contributions that are paid into the retirement



1 system's contingent reserve fund may be used for the sole purpose of  
2 offsetting a deficit of basic member contributions.

3 (ii) Should a participant in the [~~twenty-year/age-fifty~~] twenty-year  
4 retirement program who has rendered less than fifteen years of allowable  
5 service as a Triborough bridge and tunnel member cease to hold a posi-  
6 tion as a Triborough bridge and tunnel member for any reason whatsoever,  
7 his or her accumulated additional member contributions made pursuant to  
8 this subdivision (together with any interest thereon paid to the retire-  
9 ment system) may be withdrawn by him or her pursuant to procedures  
10 promulgated in regulations of the board of trustees of the retirement  
11 system, together with interest thereon at the rate of five percent per  
12 annum, compounded annually.

13 (iii) Except as provided in subparagraph (ii) of this paragraph, no  
14 member, while he or she is a participant or otherwise, shall have a  
15 right to withdraw such additional member contributions or any interest  
16 thereon from the retirement system.

17 9. A member who has made the additional contributions specified by  
18 this subdivision may borrow a portion of such contributions, pursuant to  
19 the provisions of section six hundred thirteen-b of this article.

20 § 2. This act shall take effect immediately.

FISCAL NOTE.--Pursuant to Legislative Law, Section 50:

SUMMARY OF BILL: This proposed legislation would amend Section 604-c  
of the Retirement and Social Security Law (RSSL) to remove age 50 as an  
eligibility requirement for retirement for Tier 4 and Tier 6 members of  
the New York City Employees' Retirement System (NYCERS) who are members  
of the respective TBTA 20/50 Plans.

Effective Date: Upon enactment.

IMPACT ON BENEFITS: Currently, members of the Tier 4 and 6 TBTA 20/50  
Plans are eligible to receive a service retirement benefit upon attain-  
ing 20 or more years of credited service and age 50. Tier 4 members who  
leave employment with at least five, but less than 20 years of service,  
are eligible to receive a vested retirement benefit payable on the date  
they would have attained 20 or more years of credited service and age  
50. Tier 6 members who leave employment with at least 10, but less than  
20 years of credited service are eligible to receive a vested retirement  
benefit payable at age 63.

Under the proposed legislation, if enacted, affected members of the  
TBTA 20/50 Plans would be eligible to receive a service retirement bene-  
fit upon attaining 20 years of credited service, without regard to age.  
Tier 4 members who leave employment with at least five, but less than 20  
years of credited service, would be eligible to receive a vested retire-  
ment benefit payable on the date the member would have completed 20  
years of credited service, without regard to age. Tier 6 members who  
leave employment with at least 10, but less than 20 years of credited  
service would continue to be eligible to receive a vested retirement  
benefit payable at age 63.

FINANCIAL IMPACT - PRESENT VALUES: Based on the anticipated group of  
members benefiting from the change in the eligibility requirement and  
the actuarial assumptions and methods described herein, the enactment of  
this proposed legislation would increase the Present Value of Future  
Benefits (PVFB) by approximately \$6.1 million.

Under the Entry Age Normal cost method used to determine the employer  
contributions to NYCERS, there would be an increase in the Unfunded  
Accrued Liability (UAL) of approximately \$7.0 million offset by a  
decrease in the Present Value of future employer Normal Cost of \$0.9  
million.

**FINANCIAL IMPACT - ANNUAL EMPLOYER CONTRIBUTIONS:** In accordance with Section 13-638.2(k-2) of the Administrative Code of the City of New York (ACCNYS), new UAL attributable to benefit changes are to be amortized as determined by the Actuary but are generally amortized over the remaining working lifetime of those impacted by the benefit changes. As of June 30, 2020, the remaining working lifetime of the members who could potentially benefit from the change in the eligibility requirement for retirement is approximately eight years.

For the purposes of this Fiscal Note, the increase in UAL was amortized over an eight-year period (seven payments under the One-Year Lag Methodology (OYLM)) using level dollar payments. This payment plus the increase in the Normal Cost results in an increase in annual employer contributions of approximately \$1.6 million each year.

**CONTRIBUTION TIMING:** For the purposes of this Fiscal Note, it is assumed that the changes in the PVFB and annual employer contributions would be reflected for the first time in the June 30, 2020 actuarial valuation of NYCERS. In accordance with the OYLM used to determine employer contributions, the increase in employer contributions would first be reflected in Fiscal Year 2022.

**CENSUS DATA:** The estimates presented herein are based on the census data used in the June 30, 2020 (Lag) actuarial valuation of NYCERS to determine the Preliminary Fiscal Year 2022 employer contributions.

The 116 NYCERS Tier 4 TBTA 20/50 Plan members as of June 30, 2020 who could potentially benefit from the change in the eligibility requirement for retirement had an average age of approximately 41.8 years, average service of approximately 15.7 years, and an average salary of approximately \$112,300. As of June 30, 2020, there are no members in the Tier 6 TBTA 20/50 Plan.

**ACTUARIAL ASSUMPTIONS AND METHODS:** The changes in the PVFB and annual employer contributions presented herein have been calculated based on the actuarial assumptions and methods in effect for the June 30, 2019 (Lag) actuarial valuations used to determine the Preliminary Fiscal Year 2021 employer contributions of NYCERS.

The Actuary is proposing a set of changes for use beginning with the June 30, 2019 (Lag) actuarial valuations of NYCERS to determine the Final Fiscal Year 2021 Employer Contributions (2021 A&M). If the 2021 A&M is enacted, it is estimated that it would produce increases in the PVFB and annual employer contributions that are approximately 1% larger than the results shown above.

**RISK AND UNCERTAINTY:** The costs presented in this Fiscal Note depend highly on the realization of the actuarial assumptions used, as well as certain demographic characteristics of NYCERS and other exogenous factors such as investment, contribution, and other risks. If actual experience deviates from actuarial assumptions, the actual costs could differ from those presented herein. Costs are also dependent on the actuarial methods used, and therefore different actuarial methods could produce different results. Quantifying these risks is beyond the scope of this Fiscal Note.

Not measured in this Fiscal Note are the following:

- \* The initial, additional administrative costs of NYCERS and other New York City agencies to implement the proposed legislation.
- \* The impact of this proposed legislation on Other Postemployment Benefit (OPEB) costs.

**STATEMENT OF ACTUARIAL OPINION:** I, Sherry S. Chan, am the Chief Actuary for, and independent of, the New York City Retirement Systems and Pension Funds. I am a Fellow of the Society of Actuaries, an Enrolled

Actuary under the Employee Retirement Income and Security Act of 1974, a Member of the American Academy of Actuaries, and a Fellow of the Conference of Consulting Actuaries. I meet the Qualification Standards of the American Academy of Actuaries to render the actuarial opinion contained herein. To the best of my knowledge, the results contained herein have been prepared in accordance with generally accepted actuarial principles and procedures and with the Actuarial Standards of Practice issued by the Actuarial Standards Board.

FISCAL NOTE IDENTIFICATION: This Fiscal Note 2021-29 dated May 19, 2021 was prepared by the Chief Actuary for the New York City Employees' Retirement System. This estimate is intended for use only during the 2021 Legislative Session.