

# STATE OF NEW YORK

266--A

2021-2022 Regular Sessions

## IN SENATE

(Prefiled)

January 6, 2021

Introduced by Sens. MYRIE, BAILEY, BIAGGI, BRISPORT, BROUK, CLEARE, COMRIE, COONEY, GIANARIS, HOYLMAN, JACKSON, KAVANAGH, KRUEGER, LIU, MAY, RAMOS, REICHLIN-MELNICK, RIVERA, SALAZAR, SAVINO, SEPULVEDA -- read twice and ordered printed, and when printed to be committed to the Committee on Codes -- recommitted to the Committee on Codes in accordance with Senate Rule 6, sec. 8 -- committee discharged, bill amended, ordered reprinted as amended and recommitted to said committee

AN ACT to amend the criminal procedure law, in relation to motions to vacate judgment; and to repeal certain provisions of such law relating thereto

The People of the State of New York, represented in Senate and Assembly, do enact as follows:

1 Section 1. The criminal procedure law is amended by adding two new  
2 sections 440.00 and 440.11 to read as follows:

3 § 440.00 Definition.

4 As used in this article, the term "applicant" means a person previously convicted of a crime who is applying for relief under this article.

5 § 440.11 Motion to vacate judgment; change in the law.

6 1. At any time after the entry of a judgment obtained at trial or by  
7 plea, the court in which it was entered may, upon motion of the appli-  
8 cant, vacate such judgment upon the ground that:

9 (a) The applicant was convicted of any offense in the state of New  
10 York which has been subsequently decriminalized and is thus a legal  
11 nullity.

12 (b) There has been a change, whether substantive or procedural, in the  
13 law or laws applied in the process leading to the applicant's conviction  
14 where sufficient reason exists to allow retroactive application of the  
15 changed legal standard.

16 EXPLANATION--Matter in italics (underscored) is new; matter in brackets  
[-] is old law to be omitted.

LBD01711-03-2

1 2. If the court grants a motion under this section, it must vacate the  
2 judgment on the merits, dismiss the accusatory instrument, seal the  
3 judgment, and may take such additional action as is appropriate in the  
4 circumstances.

5 § 2. Section 440.10 of the criminal procedure law, paragraph (g-1) of  
6 subdivision 1 as added by chapter 19 of the laws of 2012, paragraph (h)  
7 of subdivision 1, paragraph (a) of subdivision 3 and subdivision 4 as  
8 amended and subdivisions 7 and 8 as renumbered by chapter 332 of the  
9 laws of 2010, paragraph (i) of subdivision 1 and subdivision 6 as  
10 amended by chapter 629 of the laws of 2021, paragraph (j) of subdivision  
11 1 as amended by chapter 131 of the laws of 2019, paragraph (k) of subdi-  
12 vision 1 as amended by chapter 92 of the laws of 2021, paragraphs (b)  
13 and (c) of subdivision 2 as amended by chapter 501 of the laws of 2021,  
14 and subdivision 9 as added by section 4 of part 00 of chapter 55 of the  
15 laws of 2019, is amended to read as follows:

16 § 440.10 Motion to vacate judgment.

17 1. At any time after the entry of a judgment obtained at trial or by  
18 plea, the court in which it was entered may, upon motion of the [~~defend-~~  
19 ~~ant~~] applicant, vacate such judgment upon the ground that:

20 (a) The court did not have jurisdiction of the action or of the person  
21 of the [~~defendant~~] applicant; or

22 (b) The judgment was procured by duress, misrepresentation or fraud on  
23 the part of the court or a prosecutor or a person acting for or in  
24 behalf of a court or a prosecutor; or

25 (c) [~~Material evidence~~] Evidence adduced at a trial resulting in the  
26 judgment or that was relied upon by any party as a basis for a plea  
27 agreement was false [~~and was, prior to the entry of the judgment, known~~  
28 ~~by the prosecutor or by the court to be false~~]; or

29 (d) [~~Material evidence~~] Evidence adduced by the people at a trial  
30 resulting in the judgment or that was relied upon by any party as a  
31 basis for a plea agreement was procured in violation of the [~~defend-~~  
32 ~~ant's~~] applicant's rights under the constitution of this state or of the  
33 United States; or

34 (e) During the proceedings resulting in the judgment, the [~~defendant~~]  
35 applicant, by reason of mental disease or defect, was incapable of  
36 understanding or participating in such proceedings; or

37 (f) Improper [~~and prejudicial~~] conduct not appearing in the record  
38 occurred during a trial resulting in the judgment which conduct, if it  
39 had appeared in the record, would have [~~required~~] made possible a  
40 reversal of the judgment upon an appeal therefrom; or

41 (g) New evidence has been discovered [~~since the entry of a judgment~~  
42 ~~based upon a verdict of guilty after trial, which could not have been~~  
43 ~~produced by the defendant at the trial even with due diligence on his~~  
44 ~~part and which~~] or become available that, when viewed alone or with  
45 other evidence, is of such character as to create a reasonable probabil-  
46 ity that had such evidence been received at the trial or discovered  
47 prior to trial or plea agreement that the verdict or plea would have  
48 been more favorable to the [~~defendant, provided that a motion based upon~~  
49 ~~such ground must be made with due diligence after the discovery of such~~  
50 ~~alleged new evidence~~] applicant. Types of new evidence shall include,  
51 but not be limited to newly available forensic evidence or evidence that  
52 has either been repudiated by the expert who originally provided the  
53 opinion at a hearing or trial or that has been undermined by later  
54 scientific research or technological advances; or

55 (g-1) [~~Forensic DNA~~] In cases involving the forensic testing of  
56 evidence performed since the entry of a judgment, [~~(1) in the case of a~~

~~1 defendant convicted after a guilty plea, the court has determined that~~  
~~2 the defendant has demonstrated a substantial probability that the~~  
~~3 defendant was actually innocent of the offense of which he or she was~~  
~~4 convicted, or (2) in the case of a defendant convicted after a trial,~~  
5 the court has determined that there exists a reasonable probability that  
6 the verdict or plea offer would have been more favorable to the [~~defend-~~  
7 ~~ant~~] applicant, or the applicant would have rejected the plea offer.

8 (h) The judgment was obtained in violation of a right of the [~~defend-~~  
9 ~~ant~~] applicant under the constitution of this state or of the United  
10 States, including, but not limited to, a judgment entered, whether upon  
11 trial or guilty plea, against an applicant who is actually innocent. An  
12 applicant is actually innocent where the applicant proves by a prepon-  
13 derance of the evidence that no reasonable jury of the applicant's peers  
14 would have found the applicant guilty beyond a reasonable doubt; or

15 (i) The judgment is a conviction where the [~~defendant's~~] applicant's  
16 participation in the offense was a result of having been a victim of sex  
17 trafficking under section 230.34 of the penal law, sex trafficking of a  
18 child under section 230.34-a of the penal law, labor trafficking under  
19 section 135.35 of the penal law, aggravated labor trafficking under  
20 section 135.37 of the penal law, compelling prostitution under section  
21 230.33 of the penal law, or trafficking in persons under the Trafficking  
22 Victims Protection Act (United States Code, title 22, chapter 78);  
23 provided that

24 (i) official documentation of the [~~defendant's~~] applicant's status as  
25 a victim of sex trafficking, labor trafficking, aggravated labor traf-  
26 ficking, compelling prostitution, or trafficking in persons at the time  
27 of the offense from a federal, state or local government agency shall  
28 create a presumption that the [~~defendant's~~] applicant's participation in  
29 the offense was a result of having been a victim of sex trafficking,  
30 labor trafficking, aggravated labor trafficking, compelling prostitution  
31 or trafficking in persons, but shall not be required for granting a  
32 motion under this paragraph;

33 (ii) a motion under this paragraph, and all pertinent papers and docu-  
34 ments, shall be confidential and may not be made available to any person  
35 or public or private [~~entity~~] agency except [~~where~~] when specifically  
36 authorized by the court; and

37 (iii) when a motion is filed under this paragraph, the court may, upon  
38 the consent of the petitioner and all of the involved state [~~and~~] or  
39 local prosecutorial agencies [~~that prosecuted each matter~~], consolidate  
40 into one proceeding a motion to vacate judgments imposed by distinct or  
41 multiple criminal courts; or

42 (j) The judgment is a conviction for [~~a class A or unclassified~~] any  
43 misdemeanor entered prior to the effective date of this paragraph [~~and~~  
44 ~~satisfies the ground prescribed in paragraph (h) of this subdivision~~]  
45 that resulted in ongoing collateral consequences, including potential or  
46 actual immigration consequences. There shall be a rebuttable presump-  
47 tion that a conviction by plea to such an offense was not knowing,  
48 voluntary and intelligent, [~~based on ongoing collateral consequences,~~  
49 ~~including potential or actual immigration consequences, and there~~] and  
50 thus rendered the plea constitutionally defective pursuant to paragraph  
51 (h) of this subdivision. There shall be a rebuttable presumption that a  
52 conviction by verdict to such an offense constitutes cruel and unusual  
53 punishment under section five of article one of the state constitution  
54 based on such consequences and thus rendered the verdict constitu-  
55 tionally defective pursuant to paragraph (h) of this subdivision; or

1 (j-1) The judgment is a conviction for a class D or E felony entered  
2 prior to the effective date of this paragraph for which the sentence  
3 imposed was one year, and such sentence resulted in ongoing collateral  
4 consequences, including potential or actual immigration consequences.  
5 There shall be a rebuttable presumption that a conviction by plea to  
6 such an offense was not knowing, voluntary and intelligent, and thus  
7 rendered the plea constitutionally defective pursuant to paragraph (h)  
8 of this subdivision. There shall be a rebuttable presumption that a  
9 conviction by verdict to such an offense constitutes cruel and unusual  
10 punishment under section five of article one of the state constitution  
11 based on such consequences, and thus rendered the verdict constitu-  
12 tionally defective pursuant to paragraph (h) of this subdivision; or

13 (k) The judgment occurred prior to the effective date of the laws of  
14 two thousand [~~twenty-one~~] twenty-two that amended this paragraph and is  
15 a conviction for an offense as defined in [~~subparagraphs~~] subparagraph  
16 (i), (ii), (iii) or (iv) of paragraph (k) of subdivision three of  
17 section 160.50 of this part, or a misdemeanor under the former article  
18 two hundred twenty-one of the penal law, in which case the court shall  
19 presume that a conviction by plea for the aforementioned offenses was  
20 not knowing, voluntary and intelligent if it has severe or ongoing  
21 consequences, including but not limited to potential or actual immi-  
22 gration consequences, and shall presume that a conviction by verdict for  
23 the aforementioned offenses constitutes cruel and unusual punishment  
24 under section five of article one of the state constitution, based on  
25 those consequences. The people may rebut these presumptions[]; or

26 (l) Any offense in the state of New York that an intermediate appel-  
27 late court, court of appeals, or United States federal court has deemed  
28 in violation of the constitution of this state or of the United States,  
29 or any other right under state or federal law.

30 2. Notwithstanding the provisions of subdivision one, the court [~~must~~]  
31 may deny a motion to vacate a judgment when:

32 (a) The ground or issue raised upon the motion was previously deter-  
33 mined on the merits upon an appeal from the judgment, unless since the  
34 time of such appellate determination there has been a retroactively  
35 effective change in the law controlling such issue. However, if all of  
36 the evidence currently before the court was not duly considered previ-  
37 ously by the court, the court shall grant the motion or order the hear-  
38 ing; or

39 (b) The judgment is, at the time of the motion, appealable or pending  
40 on appeal, and sufficient facts appear on the record with respect to the  
41 ground or issue raised upon the motion to permit adequate review thereof  
42 upon such an appeal unless the issue raised upon such motion is ineffec-  
43 tive assistance of counsel. This paragraph shall not apply to a motion  
44 under paragraph (i), (j), (k) or (l) of subdivision one of this section;  
45 or

46 (c) [~~Although sufficient facts appear on the record of the proceedings~~  
47 ~~underlying the judgment to have permitted, upon appeal from such judg-~~  
48 ~~ment, adequate review of the ground or issue raised upon the motion, no~~  
49 ~~such appellate review or determination occurred owing to the defendant's~~  
50 ~~unjustifiable failure to take or perfect an appeal during the prescribed~~  
51 ~~period or to his or her unjustifiable failure to raise such ground or~~  
52 ~~issue upon an appeal actually perfected by him or her unless the issue~~  
53 ~~raised upon such motion is ineffective assistance of counsel; or~~

54 (d)] The ground or issue raised relates solely to the validity of the  
55 sentence and not to the validity of the conviction. In such case, the

1 court shall deem the motion to have been made pursuant to section 440.20  
2 of this article.

3 ~~[3. Notwithstanding the provisions of subdivision one, the court may~~  
4 ~~deny a motion to vacate a judgment when:~~

5 ~~(a) Although facts in support of the ground or issue raised upon the~~  
6 ~~motion could with due diligence by the defendant have readily been made~~  
7 ~~to appear on the record in a manner providing adequate basis for review~~  
8 ~~of such ground or issue upon an appeal from the judgment, the defendant~~  
9 ~~unjustifiably failed to adduce such matter prior to sentence and the~~  
10 ~~ground or issue in question was not subsequently determined upon appeal.~~  
11 ~~This paragraph does not apply to a motion based upon deprivation of the~~  
12 ~~right to counsel at the trial or upon failure of the trial court to~~  
13 ~~advise the defendant of such right, or to a motion under paragraph (i)~~  
14 ~~of subdivision one of this section; or~~

15 ~~(b) The ground or issue raised upon the motion was previously deter-~~  
16 ~~mined on the merits upon a prior motion or proceeding in a court of this~~  
17 ~~state, other than an appeal from the judgment, or upon a motion or~~  
18 ~~proceeding in a federal court, unless since the time of such determi-~~  
19 ~~nation there has been a retroactively effective change in the law~~  
20 ~~controlling such issue; or~~

21 ~~(c) Upon a previous motion made pursuant to this section, the defend-~~  
22 ~~ant was in a position adequately to raise the ground or issue underlying~~  
23 ~~the present motion but did not do so.]~~

24 (d) Although the court may deny the motion under any of the circum-  
25 stances specified in this subdivision, in the interest of justice and  
26 for good cause shown it may in its discretion grant the motion if it is  
27 otherwise meritorious and vacate the judgment.

28 ~~[4.]~~ 3. If the court grants the motion, it must, except as provided in  
29 subdivision ~~[five]~~ four or ~~[six]~~ five of this section, vacate the judg-  
30 ment, and must either:

31 (a) dismiss and seal the accusatory instrument, or

32 (b) order a new trial, or

33 (c) take such other action as is appropriate in the circumstances.

34 ~~[5.]~~ 4. Upon granting the motion upon the ground, as prescribed in  
35 paragraph (g) of subdivision one, that newly discovered evidence creates  
36 a probability that had such evidence been received at the trial the  
37 verdict would have been more favorable to the ~~[defendant]~~ applicant in  
38 that the conviction would have been for a lesser offense than the one  
39 contained in the verdict, the court may either:

40 (a) Vacate the judgment and order a new trial; or

41 (b) With the consent of the people, modify the judgment by reducing it  
42 to one of conviction for such lesser offense. In such case, the court  
43 must re-sentence the ~~[defendant]~~ applicant accordingly.

44 ~~[6.]~~ 5. If the court grants a motion under ~~[paragraph (i) or]~~ para-  
45 graph ~~[(k)]~~ (h), (i), (j), (k) or (l) of subdivision one of this  
46 section, it must vacate the judgment ~~[and]~~ on the merits, dismiss the  
47 accusatory instrument, seal the judgment, and may take such additional  
48 action as is appropriate in the circumstances. ~~[In the case of a motion~~  
49 ~~granted under paragraph (i) of subdivision one of this section, the~~  
50 ~~court must vacate the judgment on the merits because the defendant's~~  
51 ~~participation in the offense was a result of having been a victim of~~  
52 ~~trafficking.~~

53 ~~7.]~~ 6. Upon a new trial resulting from an order vacating a judgment  
54 pursuant to this section, the indictment is deemed to contain all the  
55 counts and to charge all the offenses which it contained and charged at  
56 the time the previous trial was commenced, regardless of whether any



1 count was dismissed by the court in the course of such trial, except (a)  
2 those upon or of which the [~~defendant~~] applicant was acquitted or deemed  
3 to have been acquitted, and (b) those dismissed by the order vacating  
4 the judgment, and (c) those previously dismissed by an appellate court  
5 upon an appeal from the judgment, or by any court upon a previous post-  
6 judgment motion.

7 [~~8-~~] 7. Upon an order which vacates a judgment based upon a plea of  
8 guilty to an accusatory instrument or a part thereof, but which does not  
9 dismiss the entire accusatory instrument, the criminal action is, in the  
10 absence of an express direction to the contrary, restored to its  
11 [~~prepleading~~] pre-pleading status and the accusatory instrument is  
12 deemed to contain all the counts and to charge all the offenses which it  
13 contained and charged at the time of the entry of the plea, except those  
14 subsequently dismissed under circumstances specified in paragraphs (b)  
15 and (c) of subdivision six. Where the plea of guilty was entered and  
16 accepted, pursuant to subdivision three of section 220.30, upon the  
17 condition that it constituted a complete disposition not only of the  
18 accusatory instrument underlying the judgment vacated but also of one or  
19 more other accusatory instruments against the [~~defendant~~] applicant then  
20 pending in the same court, the order of vacation completely restores  
21 such other accusatory instruments; and such is the case even though such  
22 order dismisses the main accusatory instrument underlying the judgment.

23 [~~9-~~] 8. Upon granting of a motion pursuant to paragraph (j) of subdivi-  
24 sion one of this section, the court [~~may~~] must vacate the judgment and  
25 may, in addition to the remedies in subdivision three of this section,  
26 either:

27 (a) With the consent of the people, [~~vacate the judgment or~~] modify  
28 the judgment by reducing it to one of conviction for a lesser offense or  
29 allow the applicant to plead to a disposition agreed upon by the  
30 parties; or

31 (b) [~~Vacate the judgment and order a new trial wherein the defendant~~  
32 ~~enters~~] Permit the applicant to enter a plea to the same offense [~~in~~  
33 ~~order to permit the court to~~] and resentence the [~~defendant~~] applicant  
34 in accordance with the amendatory provisions of subdivision one-a of  
35 section 70.15 of the penal law.

36 9. Upon granting of a motion pursuant to paragraph j-1 of subdivision  
37 one of this section, the court must vacate the judgment and permit the  
38 applicant to enter a plea to the same offense in order to permit the  
39 court to resentence the applicant to three hundred sixty-four days.

40 10. Notwithstanding any other provision of this section, the court  
41 must order a hearing and address the merits of any claim for relief when  
42 the applicant asserts that, in light of all available evidence, there  
43 exists a colorable claim that he or she is actually innocent. When the  
44 applicant raises an actual innocence claim based on, in whole or part,  
45 new evidence of actual innocence, the court may not summarily deny the  
46 motion on the ground that the applicant previously moved for relief  
47 under this article.

48 § 3. Section 440.20 of the criminal procedure law, subdivision 1 as  
49 amended by chapter 1 of the laws of 1995, is amended to read as follows:  
50 § 440.20 Motion to set aside sentence; by [~~defendant~~] applicant.

51 1. At any time after the entry of a judgment, the court in which the  
52 judgment was entered may, upon motion of the [~~defendant~~] applicant, set  
53 aside the sentence upon the ground that it was unauthorized, illegally  
54 imposed, exceeded the maximum allowed by law, obtained or imposed in  
55 violation of the defendant's constitutional rights, or was otherwise  
56 invalid as a matter of law. Where the judgment includes a sentence of

1 death, the court may also set aside the sentence upon any of the grounds  
2 set forth in paragraph (b), (c), (f), (g) or (h) of subdivision one of  
3 section 440.10 as applied to a separate sentencing proceeding under  
4 section 400.27, provided, however, that to the extent the ground or  
5 grounds asserted include one or more of the aforesaid paragraphs of  
6 subdivision one of section 440.10, the court must also apply [~~subdivi-~~  
7 ~~sions~~] subdivision two [~~and three~~] of section 440.10, other than para-  
8 graph [~~(d)~~] (c) of [~~subdivision two of~~] such [~~section~~] subdivision, in  
9 determining the motion. In the event the court enters an order granting  
10 a motion to set aside a sentence of death under this section, the court  
11 must either direct a new sentencing proceeding in accordance with  
12 section 400.27 or, to the extent that the defendant cannot be resen-  
13 tenced to death consistent with the laws of this state or the constitu-  
14 tion of this state or of the United States, resentence the defendant to  
15 life imprisonment without parole or to a sentence of imprisonment for  
16 the class A-I felony of murder in the first degree other than a sentence  
17 of life imprisonment without parole. Upon granting the motion upon any  
18 of the grounds set forth in the aforesaid paragraphs of subdivision one  
19 of section 440.10 and setting aside the sentence, the court must afford  
20 the people a reasonable period of time, which shall not be less than ten  
21 days, to determine whether to take an appeal from the order setting  
22 aside the sentence of death. The taking of an appeal by the people stays  
23 the effectiveness of that portion of the court's order that directs a  
24 new sentencing proceeding.

25 2. Notwithstanding the provisions of subdivision one, the court  
26 [~~must~~] may deny such a motion when the ground or issue raised thereupon  
27 was previously determined on the merits upon an appeal from the judgment  
28 or sentence, unless since the time of such appellate determination there  
29 has been a retroactively effective change in the law controlling such  
30 issue. However, if all of the evidence currently before the court was  
31 not duly considered previously by the court, the court shall not deny  
32 the motion to vacate and instead shall order a hearing or grant the  
33 motion. Even if the court has already considered all of the evidence  
34 currently before the court, the court in the interest of justice and for  
35 good cause shown may grant the motion if it is otherwise meritorious.

36 3. [~~Notwithstanding the provisions of subdivision one, the court may~~  
37 ~~deny such a motion when the ground or issue raised thereupon was previ-~~  
38 ~~ously determined on the merits upon a prior motion or proceeding in a~~  
39 ~~court of this state, other than an appeal from the judgment, or upon a~~  
40 ~~prior motion or proceeding in a federal court, unless since the time of~~  
41 ~~such determination there has been a retroactively effective change in~~  
42 ~~the law controlling such issue. Despite such determination, however,~~  
43 ~~the court in the interest of justice and for good cause shown, may in~~  
44 ~~its discretion grant the motion if it is otherwise meritorious.~~

45 4.] An order setting aside a sentence pursuant to this section does  
46 not affect the validity or status of the underlying conviction, and  
47 after entering such an order the court must resentence the [~~defendant~~]  
48 applicant in accordance with the law.

49 § 4. Section 440.30 of the criminal procedure law, subdivisions 1 and  
50 1-a as amended by chapter 19 of the laws of 2012 and the opening para-  
51 graph of paragraph (b) of subdivision 1 as amended by section 10 of part  
52 LLL of chapter 59 of the laws of 2019, is amended to read as follows:

53 § 440.30 Motion to vacate judgment and to set aside sentence; procedure.

54 1. (a) [~~A~~] An application for a motion to vacate a judgment pursuant  
55 to section 440.10 or 440.11 of this article and a motion to set aside a  
56 sentence pursuant to section 440.20 of this article must be made in

1 writing by the applicant or their counsel to the judge or justice who  
2 imposed the original sentence and upon reasonable notice to the people.  
3 ~~[Upon the motion, a defendant]~~ If, at the time of such person's request  
4 to apply for relief pursuant to this article, the original sentencing  
5 judge or justice no longer works in the court in which the original  
6 sentence was imposed, then the request shall be randomly assigned to  
7 another judge or justice of the court in which the original sentence was  
8 imposed.

9 (b) Upon the submission of an application for relief under this arti-  
10 cle, unless the applicant is represented by counsel or affirmatively  
11 states an intention to represent themselves pro se, the court shall  
12 assign defense counsel if the applicant is indigent or otherwise quali-  
13 fies for free representation in accordance with the provisions of subdi-  
14 vision one of section seven hundred seventeen and subdivision four of  
15 section seven hundred twenty-two of the county law and the related  
16 provisions of article eighteen-A of such law.

17 (c) Upon making a determination as to assignment of counsel, the court  
18 shall also promptly order the disclosure of discovery to the person  
19 applying for relief and his or her counsel. The order of disclosure of  
20 discovery shall include that:

21 (i) The people produce all items and information that relate to the  
22 subject matter of the case and are in the possession, custody and  
23 control of the prosecution or persons under their direction or control  
24 and make available for inspection any physical evidence secured in  
25 connection with the investigation or prosecution of the applicant,  
26 including all evidence that would be discoverable pursuant to section  
27 245.20 of this part; and

28 (ii) The applicant's prior trial and appellate counsel shall make  
29 available to the applicant or his or her counsel their complete files  
30 relating to the case; and

31 (iii) Court clerks and probation departments shall make available to  
32 the applicant or his or her counsel the court files or probation records  
33 pertaining to the case; and

34 (iv) Nothing in this section shall preclude the court from conducting  
35 an in camera inspection of evidence and issuing a protective order  
36 pursuant to section 245.70 of this part at the request of the prose-  
37 cution or defense.

38 (v) The discovery order will require that the people and prior defense  
39 counsel turn over all relevant discovery to the person applying for  
40 relief or their counsel no later than thirty days from the issuance of  
41 the court's discovery order.

42 (d) (i) An applicant who is in a position adequately to raise more  
43 than one ground should raise every such ground upon which he or she  
44 intends to challenge the judgment or sentence. If the motion is based  
45 upon the existence or occurrence of facts, the motion papers ~~[must]~~ may  
46 contain sworn allegations thereof, whether by the ~~[defendant]~~ applicant  
47 or by another person or persons. Such sworn allegations may be based  
48 upon personal knowledge of the affiant or upon information and belief,  
49 provided that in the latter event the affiant must state the sources of  
50 such information and the grounds of such belief. The ~~[defendant]~~ appli-  
51 cant may further submit documentary evidence or information supporting  
52 or tending to support the allegations of the moving papers.

53 (ii) The people may file with the court, and in such case must serve a  
54 copy thereof upon the ~~[defendant]~~ applicant or his or her counsel, if  
55 any, an answer denying or admitting any or all of the allegations of the



1 motion papers, and may further submit documentary evidence or informa-  
2 tion refuting or tending to refute such allegations.

3 (iii) After all papers of both parties have been filed, and after all  
4 documentary evidence or information, if any, has been submitted, the  
5 court must consider the same for the purpose of ascertaining whether the  
6 motion is determinable without a hearing to resolve questions of fact.

7 ~~[(b) In conjunction with the filing or consideration of a motion to  
8 vacate a judgment pursuant to section 440.10 of this article by a  
9 defendant convicted after a trial, in cases where the court has ordered  
10 an evidentiary hearing upon such motion, the court may order that the  
11 people produce or make available for inspection property in its  
12 possession, custody, or control that was secured in connection with the  
13 investigation or prosecution of the defendant upon credible allegations  
14 by the defendant and a finding by the court that such property, if  
15 obtained, would be probative to the determination of defendant's actual  
16 innocence, and that the request is reasonable. The court shall deny or  
17 limit such a request upon a finding that such a request, if granted,  
18 would threaten the integrity or chain of custody of property or the  
19 integrity of the processes or functions of a laboratory conducting DNA  
20 testing, pose a risk of harm, intimidation, embarrassment, reprisal, or  
21 other substantially negative consequences to any person, undermine the  
22 proper functions of law enforcement including the confidentiality of  
23 informants, or on the basis of any other factor identified by the court  
24 in the interests of justice or public safety. The court shall further  
25 ensure that any property produced pursuant to this paragraph is subject  
26 to a protective order, where appropriate. The court shall deny any  
27 request made pursuant to this paragraph where:~~

28 ~~(i) (1) the defendant's motion pursuant to section 440.10 of this  
29 article does not seek to demonstrate his or her actual innocence of the  
30 offense or offenses of which he or she was convicted that are the  
31 subject of the motion, or (2) the defendant has not presented credible  
32 allegations and the court has not found that such property, if obtained,  
33 would be probative to the determination of the defendant's actual inno-  
34 cence and that the request is reasonable;~~

35 ~~(ii) the defendant has made his or her motion after five years from  
36 the date of the judgment of conviction, provided, however, that this  
37 limitation period shall be tolled for five years if the defendant is in  
38 custody in connection with the conviction that is the subject of his or  
39 her motion, and provided further that, notwithstanding such limitation  
40 periods, the court may consider the motion if the defendant has shown:  
41 (A) that he or she has been pursuing his or her rights diligently and  
42 that some extraordinary circumstance prevented the timely filing of the  
43 motion; (B) that the facts upon which the motion is predicated were  
44 unknown to the defendant or his or her attorney and could not have been  
45 ascertained by the exercise of due diligence prior to the expiration of  
46 the statute of limitations; or (C) considering all circumstances of the  
47 case including but not limited to evidence of the defendant's guilt, the  
48 impact of granting or denying such motion upon public confidence in the  
49 criminal justice system, or upon the safety or welfare of the community,  
50 and the defendant's diligence in seeking to obtain the requested proper-  
51 ty or related relief, the interests of justice would be served by  
52 considering the motion;~~

53 ~~(iii) the defendant is challenging a judgment convicting him or her of  
54 an offense that is not a felony defined in section 10.00 of the penal  
55 law; or~~

~~(iv) upon a finding by the court that the property requested in this motion would be available through other means through reasonable efforts by the defendant to obtain such property.~~

~~1-a.] 2. (a) [(1)] (i) Where the [defendant's] applicant's motion requests the performance of a forensic DNA test on specified evidence, and upon the court's determination that any evidence containing deoxyribonucleic acid ("DNA") was secured in connection with the trial or the plea resulting in the judgment, the court shall grant the application for forensic DNA testing of such evidence [upon its determination that if a DNA test had been conducted on such evidence, and if the results had been admitted in the trial resulting in the judgment, there exists a reasonable probability that the verdict would have been more favorable to the defendant.~~

~~(2) Where the defendant's motion for forensic DNA testing of specified evidence is made following a plea of guilty and entry of judgment thereon convicting him or her of: (A) a homicide offense defined in article one hundred twenty five of the penal law, any felony sex offense defined in article one hundred thirty of the penal law, a violent felony offense as defined in paragraph (a) of subdivision one of section 70.02 of the penal law, or (B) any other felony offense to which he or she pled guilty after being charged in an indictment or information in superior court with one or more of the offenses listed in clause (A) of this subparagraph, then the court shall grant such a motion upon its determination that evidence containing DNA was secured in connection with the investigation or prosecution of the defendant, and if a DNA test had been conducted on such evidence and the results had been known to the parties prior to the entry of the defendant's plea and judgment thereon, there exists a substantial probability that the evidence would have established the defendant's actual innocence of the offense or offenses that are the subject of the defendant's motion, provided, however, that:~~

~~(i) the court shall consider whether the defendant had the opportunity to request such testing prior to entering a guilty plea, and, where it finds that the defendant had such opportunity and unjustifiably failed to do so, the court may deny such motion; and~~

~~(ii) a court shall deny the defendant's motion for forensic DNA testing where the defendant has made his or her motion more than five years after entry of the judgment of conviction, except that the limitation period may be tolled if the defendant has shown: (A) that he or she has been pursuing his or her rights diligently and that some extraordinary circumstance prevented the timely filing of the motion for forensic DNA testing; (B) that the facts upon which the motion is predicated were unknown to the defendant or his or her attorney and could not have been ascertained by the exercise of due diligence prior to the expiration of this statute of limitations; or (C) considering all circumstances of the case including but not limited to evidence of the defendant's guilt, the impact of granting or denying such motion upon public confidence in the criminal justice system, or upon the safety or welfare of the community, and the defendant's diligence in seeking to obtain the requested property or related relief, the interests of justice would be served by tolling such limitation period].~~

(ii) Where the applicant's motion for relief requests the performance of any other testing of forensic evidence or any physical evidence secured in the case, the judge shall grant the application for testing of such evidence, unless there is no reasonable probability that the testing of this evidence could result in a different or improved outcome for the person applying for relief.

1 (b) (i) In conjunction with the filing of a motion under this subdivi-  
2 sion, the court may direct the people to provide the [~~defendant~~] appli-  
3 cant and his or her counsel with information in the possession of the  
4 people concerning the current physical location of the specified  
5 evidence and if the specified evidence no longer exists or the physical  
6 location of the specified evidence is unknown, a representation to that  
7 effect and information and documentary evidence in the possession of the  
8 people concerning the last known physical location of such specified  
9 evidence.

10 (ii) If there is a finding by the court that the specified evidence no  
11 longer exists or the physical location of such specified evidence is  
12 unknown, [~~such information in and of itself shall not be a factor from~~  
13 ~~which any inference unfavorable to the people may be drawn by the court~~  
14 ~~in deciding a motion under this section~~] the court shall grant the  
15 applicant's motion and vacate the judgment.

16 (iii) The court, on motion of the [~~defendant~~] applicant, may also  
17 issue a subpoena duces tecum directing a public or private hospital,  
18 laboratory or other entity to produce such specified evidence in its  
19 possession and/or information and documentary evidence in its possession  
20 concerning the location and status of such specified evidence.

21 (c) In response to a motion under this paragraph, upon notice to the  
22 parties and to the entity required to perform the search the court may  
23 order an entity that has access to the combined DNA index system  
24 ("CODIS") or its successor system to compare a DNA profile obtained from  
25 probative biological material gathered in connection with the investi-  
26 gation or prosecution of the [~~defendant~~] applicant against DNA databanks  
27 by keyboard searches, or a similar method that does not involve upload-  
28 ing, upon a court's determination that (1) such profile complies with  
29 federal bureau of investigation or state requirements, whichever are  
30 applicable and as such requirements are applied to law enforcement agen-  
31 cies seeking such a comparison, and that the data meet state DNA index  
32 system and/or national DNA index system criteria as such criteria are  
33 applied to law enforcement agencies seeking such a comparison and (2) if  
34 such comparison had been conducted, [~~and if the results had been admit-~~  
35 ~~ted in the trial resulting in the judgment,~~] a reasonable probability  
36 exists that the verdict would have been more favorable to the [~~defend-~~  
37 ~~ant, or in a case involving a plea of guilty, if the results had been~~  
38 ~~available to the defendant prior to the plea, a reasonable probability~~  
39 ~~exists that the conviction would not have resulted~~] applicant. For  
40 purposes of this subdivision, a "keyboard search" shall mean a search of  
41 a DNA profile against the databank in which the profile that is searched  
42 is not uploaded to or maintained in the databank.

43 [~~2. If it appears by conceded or uncontradicted allegations of the~~  
44 ~~moving papers or of the answer, or by unquestionable documentary proof,~~  
45 ~~that there are circumstances which require denial thereof pursuant to~~  
46 ~~subdivision two of section 440.10 or subdivision two of section 440.20,~~  
47 ~~the court must summarily deny the motion. If it appears that there are~~  
48 ~~circumstances authorizing, though not requiring, denial thereof pursuant~~  
49 ~~to subdivision three of section 440.10 or subdivision three of section~~  
50 ~~440.20, the court may in its discretion either (a) summarily deny the~~  
51 ~~motion, or (b) proceed to consider the merits thereof.]~~

52 3. Upon considering the merits of the motion, the court must grant it  
53 without conducting a hearing and vacate the judgment or set aside the  
54 sentence, as the case may be, if:

55 (a) The moving papers allege a ground constituting legal basis for the  
56 motion; and

1 (b) Such ground, if based upon the existence or occurrence of facts,  
2 is supported by sworn allegations thereof; and

3 (c) The sworn allegations of fact essential to support the motion are  
4 either conceded by the people to be true or are conclusively substanti-  
5 ated by unquestionable documentary proof.

6 4. Upon considering the merits of the motion, the court may deny it  
7 without conducting a hearing if:

8 (a) The moving papers do not allege any ground constituting legal  
9 basis for the motion; or

10 (b) [~~The motion is based upon the existence or occurrence of facts and~~  
11 ~~the moving papers do not contain sworn allegations substantiating or~~  
12 ~~tending to substantiate all the essential facts, as required by subdivi-~~  
13 ~~sion one, or~~

14 ~~(e)]~~ An allegation of fact essential to support the motion is conclu-  
15 sively refuted by unquestionable documentary proof; or

16 [~~(d)~~ (c)] An allegation of fact essential to support the motion (i) is  
17 contradicted by a court record or other official document[~~, or is made~~  
18 ~~solely by the defendant and is unsupported by any other affidavit or~~  
19 ~~evidence,]~~ and (ii) under these and all the other circumstances attend-  
20 ing the case, there is no reasonable possibility that such allegation is  
21 true.

22 5. If the court does not determine the motion pursuant to subdivisions  
23 two, three or four, it must conduct a hearing and make findings of fact  
24 essential to the determination thereof. The [~~defendant~~] applicant has a  
25 right to be present at such hearing but may waive such right in writing.  
26 If he or she does not so waive it and if he or she is confined in a  
27 prison or other institution of this state, the court must cause him or  
28 her to be produced at such hearing.

29 6. At such a hearing, the [~~defendant~~] applicant has the burden of  
30 proving by a preponderance of the evidence every fact essential to  
31 support the motion. At the hearing, defense counsel shall receive a  
32 daily copy of the hearing minutes.

33 7. Regardless of whether a hearing was conducted, the court, upon  
34 determining the motion, must set forth on the record its findings of  
35 fact, its conclusions of law and the reasons for its determination.

36 § 5. Subdivision 4 of section 450.10 of the criminal procedure law, as  
37 amended by chapter 671 of the laws of 1971 and as renumbered by chapter  
38 516 of the laws of 1986, is amended to read as follows:

39 4. An order, entered pursuant to [~~section 440.40, setting aside a~~  
40 ~~sentence other than one of death, upon motion of the People]~~ article  
41 four hundred forty of this title, shall be authorized to an intermediate  
42 appellate court as a matter of right.

43 § 6. Subdivision 5 of section 450.10 of the criminal procedure law is  
44 REPEALED.

45 § 7. Severability. If any provision of this act, or any application of  
46 any provision of this act, is held to be invalid, that shall not affect  
47 the validity or effectiveness of any other provision of this act, or of  
48 any other application of any provision of this act, which can be given  
49 effect without that provision or application; and to that end, the  
50 provisions and applications of this act are severable.

51 § 8. This act shall take effect on the sixtieth day after it shall  
52 have become a law; provided, however, that paragraphs (b) and (c) of  
53 subdivision 1 of section 440.30 of the criminal procedure law as added  
54 by section four of this act shall take effect one year after it shall  
55 have become a law.