

# STATE OF NEW YORK

S. 2992

A. 3876

2019-2020 Regular Sessions

## SENATE - ASSEMBLY

January 31, 2019

IN SENATE -- Introduced by Sens. KAMINSKY, HOYLMAN -- read twice and ordered printed, and when printed to be committed to the Committee on Environmental Conservation

IN ASSEMBLY -- Introduced by M. of A. ENGLEBRIGHT, LIFTON, FAHY, ORTIZ, CAHILL, WALKER, CARROLL, L. ROSENTHAL, THIELE, JAFFEE, SIMON, OTIS, DINOWITZ, WILLIAMS, ROZIC, ABINANTI, MOSLEY, BARRETT, STECK, GALEF, GOTTFRIED, LUPARDO, PHEFFER AMATO, DE LA ROSA, JEAN-PIERRE, COLTON, CUSICK, PEOPLES-STOKES, SEAWRIGHT, PICHARDO, WEPRIN, SIMOTAS, GLICK, FERNANDEZ -- Multi-Sponsored by -- M. of A. LENTOL -- read once and referred to the Committee on Environmental Conservation

AN ACT to amend the environmental conservation law, the public service law, the public authorities law, the labor law and the community risk and resiliency act, in relation to establishing the New York state climate and community protection act

The People of the State of New York, represented in Senate and Assembly, do enact as follows:

- 1 Section 1. Legislative findings and declaration. The legislature here-
- 2 by enacts the "New York state climate and community protection act" and
- 3 finds and declares that:
- 4 1. Climate change is adversely affecting economic well-being, public
- 5 health, natural resources, and the environment of New York. The adverse
- 6 impacts of climate change include:
- 7 a. an increase in the severity and frequency of extreme weather
- 8 events, such as storms, flooding, and heat waves, which can cause direct
- 9 injury or death, property damage, and ecological damage (e.g., through
- 10 the release of hazardous substances into the environment);
- 11 b. rising sea levels, which exacerbate damage from storm surges and
- 12 flooding, contribute to coastal erosion and saltwater intrusion, and
- 13 inundate low-lying areas, leading to the displacement of or damage to
- 14 coastal habitat, property, and infrastructure;

EXPLANATION--Matter in italics (underscored) is new; matter in brackets [-] is old law to be omitted.

LBD05372-03-9

1 c. a decline in freshwater and saltwater fish populations;  
2 d. increased average temperatures, which increase the demand for air  
3 conditioning and refrigeration among residents and businesses;  
4 e. exacerbation of air pollution; and  
5 f. an increase in the incidences of infectious diseases, asthma  
6 attacks, heart attacks, and other negative health outcomes. These  
7 impacts are having a detrimental effect on some of New York's largest  
8 industries, including agriculture, commercial shipping, forestry, tour-  
9 ism, and recreational and commercial fishing. These impacts also place  
10 additional strain on the physical infrastructure that delivers critical  
11 services to the citizens of New York, including the state's energy,  
12 transportation, stormwater, and wastewater infrastructure.

13 2. a. The severity of current climate change and the threat of addi-  
14 tional and more severe change will be affected by the actions undertaken  
15 by New York and other jurisdictions to reduce greenhouse gas emissions.  
16 According to the U.S. Global Change Research Program (USGCRP) and the  
17 Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC), substantial reductions  
18 in greenhouse gas emissions will be required by mid-century in order to  
19 limit global warming to no more than 2°C and ideally 1.5°C, and thus  
20 minimize the risk of severe impacts from climate change. Specifically,  
21 industrialized countries must reduce their greenhouse gas emissions by  
22 at least 80% below 1990 levels by 2050 in order to stabilize carbon  
23 dioxide equivalent concentrations at 450 parts per million--the level  
24 required to stay within the 2°C target.

25 b. On December 12, 2015, one hundred ninety-five countries at the 21st  
26 Conference of the parties of the United Nations Framework Convention on  
27 Climate Change adopted an agreement addressing greenhouse gas emissions  
28 mitigation, adaptation, and finance starting in the year 2020, known as  
29 the Paris Agreement. The Paris Agreement was adopted on November 4,  
30 2016, and is the largest concerted global effort to combat climate  
31 change to date.

32 3. Action undertaken by New York to reduce greenhouse emissions will  
33 have an impact on global greenhouse gas emissions and the rate of  
34 climate change. In addition, such action will encourage other jurisdic-  
35 tions to implement complementary greenhouse gas reduction strategies and  
36 provide an example of how such strategies can be implemented. It will  
37 also advance the development of green technologies and sustainable prac-  
38 tices within the private sector, which can have far-reaching impacts  
39 such as a reduction in the cost of renewable energy components, and the  
40 creation of jobs and tax revenues in New York.

41 4. It shall therefore be a goal of the state of New York to reduce  
42 greenhouse gas emissions from all anthropogenic sources 100% over 1990  
43 levels by the year 2050, with an incremental target of at least a 50  
44 percent reduction in climate pollution by the year 2030, in line with  
45 USGCRP and IPCC projections of what is necessary to avoid the most  
46 severe impacts of climate change.

47 5. Although substantial emissions reductions are necessary to avoid  
48 the most severe impacts of climate change, complementary adaptation  
49 measures will also be needed to address those risks that cannot be  
50 avoided. Some of the impacts of climate change are already observable in  
51 New York state and the northeastern United States. Annual average  
52 temperatures are on the rise, winter snow cover is decreasing, heat  
53 waves and precipitation are intensifying, and sea levels along New  
54 York's coastline are approximately one foot higher than they were in  
55 1900. New York has also experienced an increasing number of extreme and  
56 unusual weather events, like Hurricanes Irene and Lee and the

1 unprecedented Superstorm Sandy in 2012, which caused at least 53 deaths  
2 and \$32 billion in damage in New York state.

3 6. New York should therefore minimize the risks associated with  
4 climate change through a combination of measures to reduce statewide  
5 greenhouse gas emissions and improve the resiliency of the state with  
6 respect to the impacts and risks of climate change that cannot be  
7 avoided.

8 7. Climate change especially heightens the vulnerability of disadvan-  
9 tagged communities, which bear environmental and socioeconomic burdens as  
10 well as legacies of racial and ethnic discrimination. Actions undertaken  
11 by New York state to mitigate greenhouse gas emissions should prioritize  
12 the safety and health of disadvantaged communities, control potential  
13 regressive impacts of future climate change mitigation and adaptation  
14 policies on these communities, and prioritize the allocation of public  
15 investments in these areas.

16 8. Creating good jobs and a thriving economy is a core concern of New  
17 York state. Shaping the ongoing transition in our energy sector to  
18 ensure that it creates good jobs and protects workers and communities  
19 that may lose employment in the current transition must be key concerns  
20 of our climate policy. Setting clear standards for job quality and  
21 training standards encourages not only high-quality work but positive  
22 economic impacts.

23 9. Workers are at the front lines of climate change. Construction  
24 workers and building service workers were some of the first workers  
25 dedicated to cleaning up damage inflicted by recent storms. These work-  
26 ers were often operating in unsafe and toxic environments, cleaning up  
27 mold, and working in unstable buildings. In order to protect the health  
28 and welfare of these workers, it is in the interest of the state of New  
29 York to establish safe and healthy working conditions and proper train-  
30 ing for workers involved in climate change related activities. In addi-  
31 tion, much of the infrastructure work preparing our state for additional  
32 climate change events must happen quickly and efficiently. It is in the  
33 interest of the state to ensure labor harmony and promote efficient  
34 performance of work on climate change related work sites by requiring  
35 workers to be well-trained and adequately compensated.

36 10. Ensuring career opportunities are created and shared geograph-  
37 ically and demographically is necessary to ensure increased access to  
38 good jobs for marginalized communities while making the same neighbor-  
39 hoods more resilient. Climate change has a disproportionate impact on  
40 low-income people, women, and workers. It is in the interest of the  
41 state of New York to protect and promote the interests of these groups  
42 against the impacts of climate change and severe weather events and to  
43 advance our equity goals by ensuring quality employment opportunities in  
44 safe working environments.

45 11. The complexity of the ongoing energy transition, the uneven  
46 distribution of economic opportunity, and the disproportionate cumula-  
47 tive economic and environmental burdens on communities mean that there  
48 is a strong state interest in setting a floor statewide for labor stand-  
49 ards, but allowing and encouraging individual agencies and local govern-  
50 ments to raise standards.

51 12. By exercising a global leadership role on greenhouse gas miti-  
52 gation and climate change adaptation, New York will position its econo-  
53 my, technology centers, financial institutions, and businesses to bene-  
54 fit from national and international efforts to address climate change.  
55 New York state has already demonstrated leadership in this area by  
56 undertaking efforts such as:

a. executive order no. 24 (2009), establishing a goal to reduce greenhouse gas emissions 80% by the year 2050, creating a climate action council, and calling for preparation of a climate action plan;

b. chapter 433 of the laws of 2009, establishing a state energy planning board and requiring the board to adopt a state energy plan;

c. chapter 388 of the laws of 2011, directing the department of environmental conservation to promulgate rules and regulations limiting emissions of carbon dioxide by newly constructed major generating facilities;

d. the adoption of a state energy plan establishing clean energy goals for the year 2030 aimed at reducing greenhouse gas emission levels by 40% from 1990 levels, producing 50% of electricity from renewable sources, increasing energy efficiency from 2012 levels by 23% and the additional expressed goal of reducing 100% of the electricity sector's greenhouse gas emissions by 2040;

e. collaboration with other states on the Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative, and the development of a regional low carbon fuel standard;

f. creation of new offices and task forces to address climate change, including the New York state office of climate change, the renewable energy task force, and the sea level rise task force; and

g. the enactment of the Community Risk and Resiliency Act (CRRA), which requires agencies to consider sea level rise and other climate-related events when implementing certain state programs.

This legislation will build upon these past developments by creating a comprehensive regulatory program to reduce greenhouse gas emissions that corresponds with the targets established in executive order no. 24, the state energy plan, and USGCRP and IPCC projections.

§ 2. The environmental conservation law is amended by adding a new article 75 to read as follows:

#### ARTICLE 75

#### CLIMATE CHANGE

#### Section 75-0101. Definitions.

75-0103. New York state climate action council.

75-0105. Statewide greenhouse gas emissions report.

75-0107. Statewide greenhouse gas emissions limits.

75-0109. Scoping plan for statewide greenhouse gas emissions reductions.

75-0111. Promulgation of regulations to achieve statewide greenhouse gas emissions reductions.

75-0113. Climate justice working group.

75-0115. Implementation reporting.

#### § 75-0101. Definitions.

For the purposes of this article the following terms shall have the following meanings:

1. "Allowance" means an authorization to emit, during a specified year, up to one ton of carbon dioxide equivalent.

2. "Carbon dioxide equivalent" means the amount of carbon dioxide by mass that would produce the same global warming impact as a given mass of another greenhouse gas over an integrated twenty-year time frame after emission, based on the best available science.

3. "Co-pollutants" means hazardous air pollutants produced by greenhouse gas emissions sources.

4. "Council" means the New York state climate action council established pursuant to section 75-0103 of this article.

5. "Disadvantaged communities" means communities that bear burdens of negative public health effects, environmental pollution, impacts of

1 climate change, and possess certain socioeconomic criteria, as identi-  
2 fied pursuant to section 75-0113 of this article.

3 6. "Emissions reduction measures" means programs, measures and stand-  
4 ards, authorized pursuant to this chapter, applicable to sources or  
5 categories of sources, that are designed to reduce emissions of green-  
6 house gases.

7 7. "Greenhouse gas" means carbon dioxide, methane, nitrous oxide,  
8 hydrofluorocarbons, perfluorocarbons, sulfur hexafluoride, and any other  
9 substance emitted into the air that may be reasonably anticipated to  
10 cause or contribute to anthropogenic climate change.

11 8. "Greenhouse gas emission limit" means an authorization, during a  
12 specified year, to emit up to a level of greenhouse gases specified by  
13 the department, expressed in tons of carbon dioxide equivalent.

14 9. "Greenhouse gas emission source" or "source" means any anthropogen-  
15 ic source or category of anthropogenic sources of greenhouse gas emis-  
16 sions, with the exception of agricultural emissions from livestock,  
17 determined by the department:

18 a. that its participation in the program will enable the department to  
19 effectively reduce greenhouse gas emissions; and,

20 b. to be capable of being monitored for compliance.

21 10. "Leakage" means a reduction in emissions of greenhouse gases with-  
22 in the state that is offset by an increase in emissions of greenhouse  
23 gases outside of the state.

24 11. "Market-based compliance mechanism" means any of the following:

25 a. A price on greenhouse gas emissions from regulated sources,  
26 expressed as a fee per ton of carbon dioxide equivalent released in a  
27 given year.

28 b. A system of market-based declining annual aggregate emissions limi-  
29 tations for sources or categories of sources that emit greenhouse gases.

30 12. "Statewide greenhouse gas emissions" means the total annual emis-  
31 sions of greenhouse gases produced within the state from anthropogenic  
32 sources and greenhouse gases produced outside of the state that are  
33 associated with the generation of electricity imported into the state  
34 and the extraction and transmission of fossil fuels imported into the  
35 state. Statewide emissions shall be expressed in tons of carbon dioxide  
36 equivalents.

37 13. "Statewide greenhouse gas emissions limit" or "statewide emissions  
38 limit" means the maximum allowable level of statewide greenhouse gas  
39 emissions in a specified year, as determined by the department pursuant  
40 to this article.

41 14. "Environmental justice advisory group" shall mean the permanent  
42 environmental justice advisory group established by a chapter of the  
43 laws of two thousand nineteen amending the environmental conservation  
44 law relating to establishing a permanent environmental justice advisory  
45 group and an environmental justice interagency coordinating council, as  
46 proposed in legislative bill number A. 1564.

47 § 75-0103. New York state climate action council.

48 1. There is hereby established, within the department, the New York  
49 state climate action council ("council") which shall consist of the  
50 following twenty-five members:

51 a. the commissioners of transportation, health, economic development,  
52 agriculture and markets, housing and community renewal, general  
53 services, labor, environmental conservation, homeland security and emer-  
54 gency services, the chairperson of the public service commission, the  
55 superintendent of financial services, the presidents of the New York  
56 state energy research and development; New York power authority; Long

1 Island power authority; secretary of state, the chairman of the metro-  
2 politan transportation authority and dormitory of the state of New York,  
3 or their designee.

4 b. two members appointed by the governor;

5 c. two members to be appointed by the temporary president of the  
6 senate;

7 d. two members to be appointed by the speaker of the assembly;

8 e. one member to be appointed by the minority leader of the senate;  
9 and

10 f. one member to be appointed by the minority leader of the assembly.

11 2. The at large members shall include at all times individuals with  
12 expertise in issues relating to climate change mitigation and/or adapta-  
13 tion, such as environmental justice, labor, public health and regulated  
14 industries.

15 3. Council members shall receive no compensation for their services  
16 but shall be reimbursed for actual and necessary expenses incurred in  
17 the performance of their duties.

18 4. The chairperson of the council shall be the commissioner of envi-  
19 ronmental conservation or his or her designee.

20 5. A majority of the members of the council shall constitute a quorum.

21 6. Any vacancies on the council shall be filled in the manner provided  
22 for in the initial appointment.

23 7. The council shall be authorized to convene advisory panels to  
24 assist or advise it in areas requiring special expertise or knowledge.

25 8. The department shall provide the council with such facilities,  
26 assistance and data as will enable the council to carry out its powers  
27 and duties. Additionally, all other agencies of the state or subdivi-  
28 sions thereof may, at the request of the chairperson, provide the coun-  
29 cil with such facilities, assistance, and data as will enable the coun-  
30 cil to carry out its powers and duties.

31 9. The council shall consult with the climate justice working group  
32 established in section 75-0113 of this article, the department of state  
33 utility intervention unit, and the federally designated electric bulk  
34 system operator.

35 10. The council shall advise the department on:

36 a. The development of statewide greenhouse gas emissions limits rules  
37 and regulations, pursuant to section 75-0107 of this article, and regu-  
38 lations to achieve statewide greenhouse gas emissions reductions, pursu-  
39 ant to section 75-0111 of this article.

40 b. The preparation of a scoping plan for reducing greenhouse gas emis-  
41 sions, pursuant to the procedures set forth in section 75-0109 of this  
42 article.

43 11. The council shall identify existing climate change mitigation and  
44 adaptation efforts at the federal, state, and local levels and may make  
45 recommendations regarding how such policies may improve the state's  
46 efforts.

47 12. The council shall maintain a website that includes public access  
48 to the scoping plan and greenhouse gas limit information.

49 § 75-0105. Statewide greenhouse gas emissions report.

50 1. No later than one year after the effective date of this article,  
51 and each year thereafter, the department shall issue a report on state-  
52 wide greenhouse gas emissions, expressed in tons of carbon dioxide  
53 equivalents, from all greenhouse gas emission sources in the state,  
54 including the relative contribution of each type of greenhouse gas and  
55 each type of source to the statewide total.

2. The statewide greenhouse gas emissions report shall be a comprehensive evaluation, informed by a variety of data, including but not limited to:

a. information relating to the use of fossil fuels by sector, including for electricity generation, transportation, heating, and other combustion purposes;

b. information relating to fugitive and vented emissions from systems associated with the production, processing, transport, distribution, storage, and consumption of fossil fuels, including natural gas;

c. information relating to emissions from non-fossil fuel sources, including, but not limited to, garbage incinerators, biomass combustion, landfills and landfill gas generators, and anaerobic digesters;

d. information relating to emissions associated with manufacturing, chemical production, cement plants, and other processes that produce non-combustion emissions; and

e. information from sources that may be required to participate in the registration and reporting system pursuant to subdivision four of this section.

3. The statewide greenhouse gas emissions report shall also include an estimate of greenhouse gas emissions associated with the generation of imported electricity and with the extraction and transmission of fossil fuels imported into the state which shall be counted as part of the statewide total.

4. Within one year after the effective date of this article, the department shall consider establishing a mandatory registry and reporting system from individual sources to obtain data on greenhouse gas emissions exceeding a particular threshold. If established, such registry and reporting system shall apply a consistent reporting threshold to ensure the unbiased collection of data.

5. The statewide greenhouse gas emissions report shall also include an estimate of what the statewide greenhouse gas emissions level was in 1990.

6. The statewide greenhouse gas emissions report shall utilize best available science and methods of analysis, including the comparison and reconciliation of emission estimates from all sources, fuel consumption, field data, and peer-reviewed research.

7. The statewide greenhouse gas emissions report shall clearly explain the methodology and analysis used in the department's determination of greenhouse gas emissions and shall include a detailed explanation of any changes in methodology or analysis, adjustments made to prior estimates, as needed, and any other information necessary to establish a scientifically credible account of change.

8. The department shall hold at least two public hearings to seek public input regarding the methodology and analysis used in the determination of statewide greenhouse gas emissions, and periodically thereafter.

#### § 75-0107. Statewide greenhouse gas emissions limits.

1. No later than one year after the effective date of this article, the department shall, pursuant to rules and regulations promulgated after at least one public hearing, establish a statewide greenhouse gas emissions limit as a percentage of 1990 emissions, as estimated pursuant to section 75-0105 of this article, as follows:

a. 2020: 85% of 1990 emissions.

b. 2025: 65% of 1990 emissions.

c. 2030: 50% of 1990 emissions.

d. 2035: 35% of 1990 emissions.

1 e. 2040: 20% of 1990 emissions.

2 f. 2045: 10% of 1990 emissions.

3 g. 2050: 0% of 1990 emissions.

4 2. Greenhouse gas emission limits shall be measured in units of carbon  
5 dioxide equivalents and identified for each individual type of green-  
6 house gas.

7 3. In order to ensure the most accurate determination feasible, the  
8 department shall utilize the best available scientific, technological,  
9 and economic information on greenhouse gas emissions and consult with  
10 the council, stakeholders, and the public in order to ensure that all  
11 emissions are accurately reflected in its determination of 1990 emis-  
12 sions levels.

13 § 75-0109. Scoping plan for statewide greenhouse gas emissions  
14 reductions.

15 1. On or before two years of the effective date of this article, the  
16 department shall prepare and approve a scoping plan outlining the  
17 department's recommendations for attaining the statewide greenhouse gas  
18 emissions limits in accordance with the schedule established in section  
19 75-0107 of this article.

20 2. The draft scoping plan shall be developed in consultation with the  
21 council, environmental justice advisory group, and the climate justice  
22 working group established pursuant to section 75-0113 of this article  
23 and other stakeholders.

24 a. The department and the council shall hold at least six regional  
25 public comment hearings on the draft scoping plan, including three meet-  
26 ings in the upstate region and three meetings in the downstate region,  
27 and shall allow at least one hundred twenty days for the submission of  
28 public comment.

29 b. The department shall provide meaningful opportunities for public  
30 comment from all persons who will be impacted by the plan, including  
31 persons living in disadvantaged communities as identified pursuant to  
32 section 75-0113 of this article.

33 c. On or before thirty months of the effective date of this article,  
34 the department shall submit the final scoping plan to the governor, the  
35 speaker of the assembly and the temporary president of the senate and  
36 post such plan on its website.

37 3. The scoping plan shall identify and make recommendations on regula-  
38 tory measures and other state actions that will ensure the attainment of  
39 the statewide greenhouse gas emissions limits established pursuant to  
40 section 75-0107 of this article. The measures and actions considered in  
41 such scoping plan shall at a minimum include:

42 a. Performance-based standards for sources of greenhouse gas emis-  
43 sions, including but not limited to sources in the transportation,  
44 building, industrial, commercial, and agricultural sectors.

45 b. Market-based mechanisms to reduce statewide greenhouse gas emis-  
46 sions or emissions from a particular source category, including an exam-  
47 ination of: the imposition of fees per unit of carbon dioxide equivalent  
48 emitted and the imposition of emissions caps accompanied by a system of  
49 tradable emission allowances.

50 c. Measures to reduce emissions from the electricity sector by  
51 displacing fossil-fuel fired electricity with renewable electricity or  
52 energy efficiency.

53 d. Land-use and transportation planning measures aimed at reducing  
54 greenhouse gas emissions from motor vehicles.

55 e. Measures to achieve long-term carbon sequestration and/or promote  
56 best management practices in land use, agriculture and forestry.

f. Verifiable, enforceable and voluntary emissions reduction measures.  
4. In developing such plan the department shall:

a. Consider all relevant information pertaining to greenhouse gas emissions reduction programs in other states, regions, localities, and nations.

b. Evaluate, using the best available economic models, emission estimation techniques and other scientific methods, the total potential costs and potential economic and non-economic benefits of the plan for reducing greenhouse gases, and make such evaluation publicly available. In conducting this evaluation, the department shall quantify:

i. The economic and social benefits of greenhouse gas emissions reductions, taking into account the federal social cost of carbon, any other tools that the department deems useful and pertinent for this analysis, and any environmental, economic and public health co-benefits (such as the reduction of co-pollutants and the diversification of energy sources); and

ii. The costs of implementing proposed emissions reduction measures, and the emissions reductions that the department anticipates achieving through these measures.

c. Take into account the relative contribution of each source or source category to statewide greenhouse gas emissions, and the potential for adverse effects on small businesses, and recommend a de minimis threshold of greenhouse gas emissions below which emission reduction requirements will not apply.

d. Identify measures to maximize reductions of both greenhouse gas emissions and co-pollutants in disadvantaged communities as identified pursuant to section 75-0113 of this article.

5. The department shall update its plan for achieving the statewide greenhouse gas emissions limits at least once every five years and shall make such updates available to the governor, the speaker of the assembly and the temporary president of the senate and post such updates on its website.

§ 75-0111. Promulgation of regulations to achieve statewide greenhouse gas emissions reductions.

1. No later than three years after the effective date of this article, the department, after public workshops and consultation with the council, the environmental justice advisory group, and the climate justice working group established pursuant to section 75-0113 of this article, representatives of regulated entities, community organizations, environmental groups, health professionals, labor unions, municipal corporations, trade associations and other stakeholders, shall, after no less than two public hearings, promulgate rules and regulations to ensure compliance with the statewide emissions reduction limits.

2. The regulations promulgated by the department pursuant to this section shall:

a. Ensure that the aggregate emissions of greenhouse gases from greenhouse gas emission sources will not exceed the statewide greenhouse gas emissions limits established in section 75-0107 of this article.

b. Include legally enforceable emissions limits, performance standards, or measures or other requirements to control emissions from greenhouse gas emission sources.

c. Include measures to reduce emissions from greenhouse gas emission sources that have a cumulatively significant impact on statewide greenhouse gas emissions, such as internal combustion vehicles that burn gasoline or diesel fuel and boilers or furnaces that burn oil or natural gas.

3. In promulgating these regulations, the department shall:

a. Design and implement all regulations in a manner that seeks to be equitable, to minimize costs and to maximize the total benefits to New York, and encourages early action to reduce greenhouse gas emissions.

b. Ensure that greenhouse gas emissions reductions achieved are real, permanent, quantifiable, verifiable, and enforceable by the department.

c. Ensure that activities undertaken to comply with the regulations do not result in a net increase in co-pollutant emissions or otherwise disproportionately burden disadvantaged communities as identified pursuant to section 75-0113 of this article.

d. Prioritize measures to maximize net reductions of greenhouse gas emissions and co-pollutants in disadvantaged communities as identified pursuant to section 75-0113 of this article and encourage early action to reduce greenhouse gas emissions and co-pollutants.

e. Minimize leakage.

4. Market-based compliance mechanisms.

a. The department may consider provisions for the use of market-based compliance mechanisms to comply with the regulations.

b. Prior to the inclusion of any market-based compliance mechanism in the regulations, to the extent feasible and in the furtherance of achieving the statewide greenhouse gas emissions limit, the department shall do all of the following:

i. Consider the potential for direct, indirect, and cumulative emission impacts from these mechanisms, including localized impacts in disadvantaged communities as identified pursuant to section 75-0113 of this article;

ii. Design any market-based compliance mechanism to prevent any increase in the emissions of co-pollutants; and

iii. Maximize additional environmental, public health, and economic benefits for the state of New York and for disadvantaged communities identified pursuant to section 75-0113 of this article, as appropriate.

c. Such regulations shall include provisions governing how market-based compliance mechanisms may be used by regulated entities subject to greenhouse gas emissions limits and mandatory emission reporting requirements to achieve compliance with their greenhouse gas emissions limits.

d. The department shall ensure that, at a minimum, forty percent of any funds collected pursuant to any market-based compliance regulations promulgated under this section as a result of legislative authorization, funds authorized by the public service commission to be collected solely for and directed to the New York state energy research and development authority and proceeds collected by the New York state energy research and development authority from the auction or sale of carbon dioxide emission allowances allocated by the department are invested in a manner which will benefit disadvantaged communities, identified pursuant to section 75-0113 of this article, consistent with the purposes of this article, including, but not limited to, increased access to renewable energy, energy efficiency, weatherization, zero- and low-emission transportation, and adaptation opportunities. The department shall consult with the climate justice working group in developing and carrying out such investments.

§ 75-0113. Climate justice working group.

1. There is hereby created within the department, no later than six months after the effective date of this article, a "climate justice working group". Such working group will be comprised of representatives from: environmental justice communities, the department, the department

1 of health, the New York state energy and research development authority,  
2 and the department of labor.

3 a. Environmental justice community representatives shall be members of  
4 communities of color, low-income communities, and communities bearing  
5 disproportionate pollution and climate change burdens, or shall be  
6 representatives of community-based organizations with experience and a  
7 history of advocacy on environmental justice issues, and shall include  
8 at least three representatives from New York city communities, three  
9 representatives from rural communities, and three representatives from  
10 upstate urban communities.

11 b. The working group, in consultation with the department, the depart-  
12 ments of health and labor, the New York state energy and research devel-  
13 opment authority, and the environmental justice advisory group, will  
14 establish criteria to identify disadvantaged communities for the  
15 purposes of co-pollutant reductions, greenhouse gas emissions  
16 reductions, regulatory impact statements, and the allocation of invest-  
17 ments related to this article.

18 c. Disadvantaged communities shall be identified based on geographic,  
19 public health, environmental hazard, and socioeconomic criteria, which  
20 shall include but are not limited to:

21 (i) areas burdened by cumulative environmental pollution and other  
22 hazards that can lead to negative public health effects;

23 (ii) areas with concentrations of people that are of low income, high  
24 unemployment, high rent burden, low levels of home ownership, low levels  
25 of educational attainment, or members of groups that have historically  
26 experienced discrimination on the basis of race or ethnicity; and

27 (iii) areas vulnerable to the impacts of climate change such as flood-  
28 ing, storm surges, and urban heat island effects.

29 2. Before finalizing the criteria for identifying disadvantaged commu-  
30 nities and identifying disadvantaged communities pursuant to subdivision  
31 one of this section, the department shall publish draft criteria and a  
32 draft list of disadvantaged communities and make such information avail-  
33 able on its website.

34 a. The department shall hold at least six regional public hearings on  
35 the draft criteria and the draft list of disadvantaged communities,  
36 including three meetings in the upstate region and three meetings in the  
37 downstate region, and shall allow at least one hundred twenty days for  
38 the submission of public comment.

39 b. The department shall also ensure that there are meaningful opportu-  
40 nities for public comment for all persons who will be impacted by the  
41 criteria, including persons living in areas that may be identified as  
42 disadvantaged communities under the proposed criteria.

43 3. The group will meet no less than annually to review the criteria  
44 and methods used to identify disadvantaged communities and may modify  
45 such methods to incorporate new data and scientific findings. The  
46 climate justice working group shall review identities of disadvantaged  
47 communities and modify such identities as needed.

48 § 75-0115. Implementation reporting.

49 1. The department shall, not less than every four years, publish a  
50 report which shall include recommendations regarding the implementation  
51 of greenhouse gas reduction measures.

52 2. The report shall, at minimum, include:

53 a. Whether the state is on track to meet the statewide greenhouse gas  
54 emissions limits established in section 75-0107 of this article.

1 b. An assessment of existing regulations and whether modifications are  
2 needed to ensure fulfillment of the statewide greenhouse gas emissions  
3 limits.

4 c. An overview of social benefits from the regulations or other meas-  
5 ures, including reductions in greenhouse gas emissions and copollutants,  
6 diversification of energy sources, and other benefits to the economy,  
7 environment, and public health, including women's health.

8 d. An overview of compliance costs for regulated entities and for the  
9 department and other state agencies.

10 e. Whether regulations or other greenhouse gas reduction measures  
11 undertaken are equitable, minimize costs and maximize the total benefits  
12 to the state, and encourage early action.

13 f. Whether activities undertaken to comply with state regulations  
14 disproportionately burden disadvantaged communities as identified pursu-  
15 ant to section 75-0113 of this article.

16 g. An assessment of local benefits and impacts of any reductions in  
17 co-pollutants related to reductions in statewide and local greenhouse  
18 gas emissions.

19 h. An assessment of disadvantaged communities' access to or community  
20 ownership of the services and commodities identified in section eight of  
21 the chapter of the laws of two thousand nineteen which added this arti-  
22 cle.

23 i. Whether entities that have voluntarily reduced their greenhouse gas  
24 emissions prior to the implementation of this article receive appropri-  
25 ate credit for early voluntary reductions.

26 j. Recommendations for future regulatory and policy action.

27 3. In preparing this report, the department shall, at a minimum,  
28 consult with the council, and the climate justice working group estab-  
29 lished in section 75-0113 of this article.

30 4. The report shall be published and posted on the department's  
31 website.

32 § 3. Subdivision 1 of section 54-1523 of the environmental conserva-  
33 tion law is amended by adding a new paragraph h to read as follows:

34 h. to establish and implement easily-replicated renewable energy  
35 projects, including solar arrays, heat pumps and wind turbines in public  
36 low-income housing in suburban, urban and rural areas.

37 § 4. The public service law is amended by adding a new section 66-p to  
38 read as follows:

39 § 66-p. Establishment of a renewable energy program. 1. As used in  
40 this section:

41 (a) "load serving entity" means any entity that secures energy to  
42 serve the electrical energy requirements of end-use customers in New  
43 York state;

44 (b) "prevailing rate of wages" shall have the same meaning as such  
45 term is defined in paragraph a of subdivision five of section two  
46 hundred twenty of the labor law; and

47 (c) "renewable energy systems" means systems that generate electricity  
48 or thermal energy through use of the following technologies: solar ther-  
49 mal, photovoltaics, wind, hydroelectric, geothermal electric, geothermal  
50 ground source heat, tidal energy, wave energy, ocean thermal, offshore  
51 wind and fuel cells which do not utilize a fossil fuel resource in the  
52 process of generating electricity.

53 2. No later than January first, two thousand twenty, the commission  
54 shall establish a program to require that a minimum of fifty percent of  
55 the statewide electric generation secured by load serving entities to  
56 meet the electrical energy requirements of all end-use customers in New

1 York state in two thousand thirty shall be generated by renewable energy  
2 systems.

3 The commission shall set annual minimum percentage levels of electric-  
4 ity generated by renewable energy systems and delivered to end-use  
5 customers in New York state for each year of the program.

6 3. No later than July first, two thousand twenty-one and every two  
7 years thereafter, the commission shall, after notice and provision for  
8 the opportunity to comment, issue a comprehensive review of the program  
9 established pursuant to this section. The commission shall determine,  
10 among other matters: (a) progress in meeting the overall annual targets  
11 for deployment of renewable energy systems; (b) distribution of systems  
12 by size and load zone; and (c) annual funding commitments and expendi-  
13 tures. The commission shall evaluate the annual targets established  
14 pursuant to subdivision two of this section and determine whether the  
15 annual targets should be accelerated, increased or extended, taking into  
16 consideration load modifications associated with, but not limited to,  
17 energy efficiency measures and the electrification of transportation,  
18 heating systems and industrial processes.

19 4. The commission may temporarily suspend or modify the obligations  
20 under such program provided that the commission, after conducting a  
21 hearing as provided in section twenty of this chapter, makes a finding  
22 that the program impedes the provision of safe and adequate electric  
23 service or that there is a significant increase in arrears or service  
24 disconnections that the commission determines is related to the program.

25 5. Every contractor employed pursuant to this section, not otherwise  
26 required to pay laborers, workers or mechanics the prevailing rate of  
27 wages pursuant to article eight of the labor law, shall pay employees  
28 under contract for the development of renewable energy systems rated at  
29 two hundred fifty kilowatts or more, a wage of not less than the  
30 prevailing rate of wages for such work in the locality where such  
31 installation occurs. This requirement shall be in effect for the dura-  
32 tion of the receipt by the contractor of the incentives established  
33 pursuant to this section and in no event shall such requirement extend  
34 beyond the availability of such incentives. Every contractor subject to  
35 the provisions of this subdivision shall maintain payroll records in  
36 accordance with section two hundred twenty of the labor law.

37 § 5. Section 1005 of the public authorities law is amended by adding a  
38 new subdivision 26 to read as follows:

39 26. Renewable energy program. As deemed feasible and advisable by the  
40 trustees, no later than January first, two thousand twenty, the authori-  
41 ty shall secure energy to serve the electrical energy requirements of  
42 its end-use customers in accordance with the renewable energy program as  
43 set forth and defined in section sixty-six-p of the public service law.

44 § 6. Sections 1020-kk, 1020-ll and 1020-ll of the public authorities  
45 law, 1020-kk and 1020-ll as renumbered by chapter 520 of the laws of  
46 2018, and 1020-ll as renumbered by chapter 415 of the laws of 2017, are  
47 renumbered sections 1020-xx, 1020-yy and 1020-zz and a new section  
48 1020-kk is added to read as follows:

49 § 1020-kk. Renewable energy program. The authority and all load serv-  
50 ing entities that secure energy to serve the electrical energy require-  
51 ments of end-use customers in its service territory shall comply with  
52 the renewable energy program as set forth and defined in section sixty-  
53 six-p of the public service law.

54 § 6-a. Subdivision 1 of section 1020-s of the public authorities law,  
55 as amended by chapter 415 of the laws of 2017, is amended to read as  
56 follows:

1 1. The rates, services and practices relating to the electricity  
2 generated by facilities owned or operated by the authority shall not be  
3 subject to the provisions of the public service law or to regulation by,  
4 or the jurisdiction of, the public service commission, except to the  
5 extent (a) article seven of the public service law applies to the siting  
6 and operation of a major utility transmission facility as defined there-  
7 in, (b) article ten of such law applies to the siting of a generating  
8 facility as defined therein, (c) section eighteen-a of such law provides  
9 for assessment for certain costs, property or operations, (d) to the  
10 extent that the department of public service reviews and makes recommen-  
11 dations with respect to the operations and provision of services of, and  
12 rates and budgets established by, the authority pursuant to section  
13 three-b of such law, ~~and~~ (e) that section seventy-four of the public  
14 service law applies to qualified energy storage systems within the  
15 authority's jurisdiction and (f) that section sixty-six-p of the public  
16 service law applies to the authority and load serving entities that  
17 secure energy to serve the electrical energy requirements of end-use  
18 customers within the authority's jurisdiction.

19 § 7. The labor law is amended by adding a new article 8-B to read as  
20 follows:

21 ARTICLE 8-B

22 LABOR AND JOB STANDARDS AND WORKER PROTECTION

23 Section 228. Labor and job standards and worker protection.

24 § 228. Labor and job standards and worker protection. 1. All state  
25 agencies involved in implementing the New York state climate and commu-  
26 nity protection act shall assess and implement strategies to increase  
27 employment opportunities and improve job quality. Within one hundred  
28 twenty days of the effective date of this section, all state agencies,  
29 offices, authorities, and divisions shall report to the legislature on:

30 a. steps they will take to ensure compliance with this section; and  
31 b. regulations necessary to ensure that they prioritize the statewide  
32 goal of creating good jobs and increasing employment opportunities.

33 2. In considering and issuing permits, licenses, regulations,  
34 contracts, and other administrative approvals and decisions pursuant to  
35 the New York state climate and community protection act, all state agen-  
36 cies, offices, authorities, and divisions shall apply the following  
37 labor, training, and job quality standards to the following project  
38 types: public work; projects in receipt of more than one hundred thou-  
39 sand dollars in total financial assistance; or to projects with a total  
40 value of more than ten million dollars; and privately-financed projects  
41 on public property.

42 a. the payment of no less than prevailing wages for all employees in  
43 construction and building, consistent with article eight of the this  
44 chapter, and building services, consistent with article nine of this  
45 chapter;

46 b. the inclusion of contract language requiring contractors to estab-  
47 lish labor harmony policies; dispute resolution mechanisms; prevailing  
48 wage compliance; safety policies; workers compensation insurance  
49 (including review of contractor experience rating and other factors);  
50 and apprenticeship program appropriate for crafts employed. Procurement  
51 rules should encourage bundling of small contracts and projects to  
52 improve the efficiency of compliance;

53 c. apprenticeship utilization:

54 i. that all contractors and subcontractors, including those that  
55 participate in power purchase agreements, energy performance contracts,

1 or other similar programs, participate in apprenticeship programs in the  
2 trades in which they are performing work;

3 ii. maximum use of apprentices as per department of labor approved  
4 ratios;

5 iii. encouragement of affiliated pre-apprentice direct entry programs,  
6 including but not limited to EJM Construction Skills; NYC Helmets to  
7 Hardhats, and Nontraditional Employment for Women (NEW) for the recruit-  
8 ment of local and/or disadvantaged workers;

9 iv. existing workforce development programs, including those at the  
10 New York state energy research and development authority, should be made  
11 to conform to these standards.

12 3. The commissioner, the fiscal officer and other relevant agencies  
13 shall promulgate such regulations as are necessary to implement and  
14 administer compliance with the provisions of this section. The depart-  
15 ment and the fiscal officer shall coordinate with organized labor and  
16 local and county level governments to implement a system to track  
17 compliance, accept reports of non-compliance for enforcement action, and  
18 report annually on the adoption of these standards to the legislature  
19 starting one year from the effective date of this section.

20 a. For the purposes of this section, "fiscal officer" shall mean the  
21 industrial commissioner, except for construction and building service  
22 work performed by or on behalf of a city, in which case "fiscal officer"  
23 shall mean the comptroller or other analogous officer of such city.

24 b. The provisions of the contract by the recipient of financial  
25 assistance pertaining to prevailing wages are to be considered a  
26 contract for the benefit of construction and building service workers,  
27 upon which such workers shall have the right to maintain action for the  
28 difference between the prevailing wage rate of pay, benefits, and paid  
29 leave and the rates of pay, benefits, and paid leave actually received  
30 by them, and including attorney's fees.

31 c. i. Where a recipient of financial assistance contracts building  
32 service work to a building service contractor, the contractor is held to  
33 the same obligations with respect to prevailing wages as the recipient.  
34 The recipient must include terms establishing this obligation within any  
35 contract signed with a contractor.

36 ii. Where a recipient of financial assistance contracts for  
37 construction, excavation, demolition, rehabilitation, repair, reno-  
38 vation, alteration or improvement to a subcontractor, the subcontractor  
39 is held to the same obligations with respect to prevailing wages as the  
40 recipient. The recipient must include terms establishing this obligation  
41 within any contract signed with a subcontractor.

42 4. For the purposes of this section "financial assistance" means any  
43 provision of public funds to any person, individual, proprietorship,  
44 partnership, joint venture, corporation, limited liability company,  
45 trust, association, organization, or other entity that receives finan-  
46 cial assistance, or any assignee or successor in interest of real prop-  
47 erty improved or developed with financial assistance, for economic  
48 development within the state, including but not limited to cash payments  
49 or grants, bond financing, tax abatements or exemptions, including but  
50 not limited to abatements or exemptions from real property, mortgage  
51 recording, sales, and use taxes, or the difference between any payments  
52 in lieu of taxes and the amount of real property or other taxes that  
53 would have been due if the property were not exempted from such taxes,  
54 tax increment financing, filing fee waivers, energy cost reductions,  
55 environmental remediation costs, write-downs in the market value of  
56 buildings or land, or the cost of capital improvements related to real

property for which the state would not pay absent the development project, and includes both discretionary and as of right assistance. The provisions of this section shall only apply to projects receiving more than one hundred thousand dollars in total financial assistance, or to projects with a total project value of more than ten million dollars.

5. The commissioner shall evaluate whether there are additional standards that could be applied to increase wage and benefit standards or to encourage a safe, well-trained, and adequately compensated workforce.

6. Nothing set forth in this section shall be construed to impede, infringe, or diminish the rights and benefits which accrue to employees through bona fide collective bargaining agreements, or otherwise diminish the integrity of the existing collective bargaining relationship.

7. Nothing set forth in this section shall preclude a local government from setting additional standards that expand on these state-wide standards.

§ 8. Report on barriers to, and opportunities for, community ownership of services and commodities in disadvantaged communities. 1. On or before two years of the effective date of this act, the department of environmental conservation, with input from relevant state agencies, the environmental justice advisory group as defined in section 75-0101 of the environmental conservation law, the climate justice working group as defined in section 75-0113 of the environmental conservation law and Climate Action Council established in article 75 of the environmental conservation law, and following at least two public hearings, shall prepare a report on barriers to, and opportunities for, access to or community ownership of the following services and commodities in disadvantaged communities as identified in article 75 of the environmental conservation law:

- a. Distributed renewable energy generation.
- b. Energy efficiency and weatherization investments.
- c. Zero-emission and low-emission transportation options.
- d. Adaptation measures to improve the resilience of homes and local infrastructure to the impacts of climate change including but not limited to microgrids.
- e. Other services and infrastructure that can reduce the risks associated with climate-related hazards, including but not limited to:
  - i. Shelters and cool rooms during extreme heat events;
  - ii. Shelters during flooding events; and
  - iii. Medical treatment for asthma and other conditions that could be exacerbated by climate-related events.

2. The report, which shall be submitted to the governor, the speaker of the assembly and the temporary president of the senate and posted on the department of environmental conservation website, shall include recommendations on how to increase access to the services and commodities.

3. The department of environmental conservation shall amend the scoping plan for statewide greenhouse gas emissions reductions in accordance with the recommendations included in the report.

§ 9. Climate change actions by state agencies. 1. All state agencies shall assess and implement strategies to reduce their greenhouse gas emissions.

2. In considering and issuing permits, licenses, and other administrative approvals and decisions, including but not limited to the execution of grants, loans, and contracts, all state agencies, offices, authorities, and divisions shall consider whether such decisions are inconsistent with or will interfere with the attainment of the statewide green-

house gas emissions limits established in article 75 of the environmental conservation law. Where such decisions are deemed to be inconsistent with or will interfere with the attainment of the statewide greenhouse gas emissions limits, each agency, office, authority, or division shall provide a detailed statement of justification as to why such limits/criteria may not be met, and identify alternatives or greenhouse gas mitigation measures to be required where such project is located.

3. In considering and issuing permits, licenses, and other administrative approvals and decisions, including but not limited to the execution of grants, loans, and contracts, pursuant to article 75 of the environmental conservation law, all state agencies, offices, authorities, and divisions shall not disproportionately burden disadvantaged communities as identified pursuant to subdivision 5 of section 75-0101 of the environmental conservation law. All state agencies, offices, authorities, and divisions shall also prioritize reductions of greenhouse gas emissions and co-pollutants in disadvantaged communities as identified pursuant to such subdivision 5 of section 75-0101 of the environmental conservation law.

§ 10. Authorization for other state agencies to promulgate greenhouse gas emissions regulations. 1. The public service commission, the New York state energy research and development authority, the department of health, the department of transportation, the department of state, the department of economic development, the department of agriculture and markets, the department of financial services, the office of general services, the division of housing and community renewal, the public utility authorities established pursuant to titles 1, 1-A, 1-B, 11, 11-A, 11-B, 11-C and 11-D of article 5 of the public authorities law and any other state agency may promulgate regulations to contribute to achieving the statewide greenhouse gas emissions limits established in article 75 of the environmental conservation law. Provided, however, any such regulations shall not limit the department of environmental conservation's authority to regulate and control greenhouse gas emissions pursuant to article 75 of the environmental conservation law.

§ 11. Chapter 355 of the laws of 2014, constituting the community risk and resiliency act, is amended by adding two new sections 17-a and 17-b to read as follows:

§ 17-a. The department of environmental conservation shall take actions to promote adaptation and resilience, including:

(a) actions to help state agencies and other entities assess the reasonably foreseeable risks of climate change on any proposed projects, taking into account issues such as: sea level rise, tropical and extra-tropical cyclones, storm surges, flooding, wind, changes in average and peak temperatures, changes in average and peak precipitation, public health impacts, and impacts on species and other natural resources.

(b) identifying the most significant climate-related risks, taking into account the probability of occurrence, the magnitude of the potential harm, and the uncertainty of the risk.

(c) measures that could mitigate significant climate-related risks, as well as a cost-benefit analysis and implementation of such measures.

§ 17-b. Major permits for the regulatory programs of subdivision three of section 70-0107 of the environmental conservation law shall require applicants to demonstrate that future physical climate risk has been considered. In reviewing such information the department may require the applicant to mitigate significant risks to public infrastructure and/or services, private property not owned by the applicant, adverse impacts

1 on disadvantaged communities, and/or natural resources in the vicinity  
2 of the project.

3 § 12. Nothing in this act shall limit the existing authority of a  
4 state entity to adopt and implement greenhouse gas emissions reduction  
5 measures.

6 § 13. Nothing in this act shall relieve any person, entity, or public  
7 agency of compliance with other applicable federal, state, or local laws  
8 or regulations, including state air and water quality requirements, and  
9 other requirements for protecting public health or the environment.

10 § 14. Review under this act may be had in a proceeding under article  
11 78 of the civil practice law and rules at the instance of any person  
12 aggrieved.

13 § 15. Severability. If any word, phrase, clause, sentence, paragraph,  
14 section, or part of this act shall be adjudged by any court of competent  
15 jurisdiction to be invalid, such judgement shall not affect, impair, or  
16 invalidate the remainder thereof, but shall be confined in its operation  
17 to the word, phrase, clause, sentence, paragraph, section, or part ther-  
18 eof directly involved in the controversy in which such judgement shall  
19 have been rendered.

20 § 16. This act shall take effect on the same date and in the same  
21 manner as a chapter of the laws of 2019, amending the environmental  
22 conservation law, relating to establishing a permanent environmental  
23 justice advisory group and an environmental justice interagency coordi-  
24 nating council, as proposed in legislative bill number A. 1564, takes  
25 effect; provided further, the provisions of section seven of this act  
26 shall take effect on the one hundred eightieth day after it shall have  
27 become a law and shall apply to any grants, loans, and contracts and  
28 financial assistance awarded or renewed on or after such effective date.