

STATE OF NEW YORK

7221

2019-2020 Regular Sessions

IN ASSEMBLY

April 12, 2019

Introduced by M. of A. BARNWELL -- read once and referred to the Committee on Housing

AN ACT to amend the public housing law, the emergency tenant protection act of nineteen seventy-four and the administrative code of the city of New York, in relation to penalties for owners of property who fail to file a proper or timely rent registration statement

The People of the State of New York, represented in Senate and Assembly, do enact as follows:

1 Section 1. The commissioner of housing and community renewal shall
2 distribute to each unit rent controlled or rent stabilized at any point
3 since 1971 a copy of such unit's rent history, regardless of the current
4 rent regulation status of the unit, as well as literature describing how
5 a tenant can identify a possible rent overcharge.

6 § 2. Section 14 of the public housing law is amended by adding a new
7 subdivision 8 to read as follows:

8 8. The commissioner shall generate and distribute literature explain-
9 ing how to identify a possible rent overcharge. The commissioner shall
10 conduct geographic language studies to ensure that such literature is
11 available to all residents, not just those who speak and read English.

12 § 3. Paragraph 1 of subdivision a of section 12 of section 4 of chap-
13 ter 576 of the laws of 1974, constituting the emergency tenant
14 protection act of nineteen seventy-four, as amended by chapter 403 of
15 the laws of 1983, the opening paragraph and clause (i) of subparagraph
16 (b) as amended by chapter 116 of the laws of 1997, is amended and a new
17 paragraph 9 is added to read as follows:

18 (1) Subject to the conditions and limitations of this paragraph, any
19 owner of housing accommodations in a city having a population of less
20 than one million or a town or village as to which an emergency has been
21 declared pursuant to section three, who, upon complaint of a tenant or
22 of the state division of housing and community renewal, is found by the
23 state division of housing and community renewal, after a reasonable

EXPLANATION--Matter in italics (underscored) is new; matter in brackets
[-] is old law to be omitted.

LBD10737-04-9

1 opportunity to be heard, to have collected an overcharge above the rent
2 authorized for a housing accommodation subject to this act shall be
3 liable to the tenant for a penalty equal to three times the amount of
4 such overcharge. [~~In no event shall such treble damage penalty be~~
5 ~~assessed against an owner based solely on said owner's failure to file a~~
6 ~~proper or timely initial or annual rent registration statement.~~] If the
7 owner establishes by a preponderance of the evidence that the overcharge
8 was neither willful nor attributable to his negligence, the state divi-
9 sion of housing and community renewal shall establish the penalty as the
10 amount of the overcharge plus interest at the rate of interest payable
11 on a judgment pursuant to section five thousand four of the civil prac-
12 tice law and rules. (i) Except as to complaints filed pursuant to clause
13 (ii) of this paragraph, the legal regulated rent for purposes of deter-
14 mining an overcharge, shall be deemed to be the rent indicated in [~~the~~
15 prior annual registration [~~statement filed four years prior to the most~~
16 ~~recent registration statement, (or, if more recently filed, the initial~~
17 ~~registration statement).~~] statements plus in each case any subsequent
18 lawful increases and adjustments, less any appropriate penalties. [~~Where~~
19 ~~the amount of rent set forth in the annual rent registration statement~~
20 ~~filed four years prior to the most recent registration statement is not~~
21 ~~challenged within four years of its filing, neither such rent nor~~
22 ~~service of any registration shall be subject to challenge at any time~~
23 ~~thereafter.~~] The division of housing and community renewal, in investi-
24 gating complaints of overcharge and in determining legal regulated rent,
25 shall consider all available rent history which is reasonably necessary
26 to make such determinations. (ii) As to complaints filed within ninety
27 days of the initial registration of a housing accommodation, the legal
28 regulated rent for purposes of determining an overcharge shall be deemed
29 to be the rent charged [~~on the date four years prior to~~] as of the date
30 of the initial registration of the housing accommodation (or, if the
31 housing accommodation was not previously subject to this act [~~for less~~
32 ~~than four years~~], the initial legal regulated rent) plus in each case,
33 any lawful increases and adjustments, less any appropriate penalties.
34 Where the rent charged [~~on the date four years~~] prior to the date of the
35 initial registration of the accommodation cannot be established, such
36 rent shall be established by the division. [~~Where the amount of rent set~~
37 ~~forth in the annual rent registration statement filed four years prior~~
38 ~~to the most recent registration statement is not challenged within four~~
39 ~~years of its filing, neither such rent nor service of any registration~~
40 ~~shall be subject to challenge at any time thereafter.~~]

41 (a) The order of the state division of housing and community renewal
42 shall apportion the owner's liability between or among two or more
43 tenants found to have been overcharged by such owner during their
44 particular tenancy of a unit.

45 (b) (i) Except as provided under clauses (ii) and (iii) of this
46 subparagraph, a complaint under this subdivision [~~shall~~] may be filed
47 with the state division of housing and community renewal [~~within four~~
48 ~~years of the first overcharge alleged and no determination of an over-~~
49 ~~charge and no award or calculation of an award of the amount of an over-~~
50 ~~charge may be based upon an overcharge having occurred more than four~~
51 ~~years before the complaint is filed. This paragraph shall preclude exam-~~
52 ~~ination of the rental history of the housing accommodation prior to the~~
53 ~~four-year period preceding the filing of a complaint pursuant to this~~
54 ~~subdivision~~] at any time.

55 (ii) [~~No~~] A penalty of three times the overcharge may be based upon an
56 overcharge having occurred [~~more than two years~~] at any time before the

1 complaint is filed [~~or upon an overcharge which occurred prior to April~~
2 ~~first, nineteen hundred eighty four.~~

3 ~~(iii) Any complaint based upon overcharges occurring prior to the date~~
4 ~~of filing of the initial rent registration as provided in subdivision b~~
5 ~~of section twelve a of this act shall be filed within ninety days of the~~
6 ~~mailing of notice to the tenant of such registration].~~

7 (c) Any affected tenant shall be notified of and given an opportunity
8 to join in any complaint filed by an officer or employee of the state
9 division of housing and community renewal.

10 (d) An owner found to have overcharged shall, in all cases, be
11 assessed the reasonable costs and attorney's fees of the proceeding, and
12 interest from the date of the overcharge at the rate of interest payable
13 on a judgment pursuant to section five thousand four of the civil prac-
14 tice law and rules.

15 (e) The order of the state division of housing and community renewal
16 awarding penalties may, upon the expiration of the period in which the
17 owner may institute a proceeding pursuant to article seventy-eight of
18 the civil practice law and rules, be filed and enforced by a tenant in
19 the same manner as a judgment or, in the alternative, not in excess of
20 twenty percent thereof per month may be offset against any rent there-
21 after due the owner.

22 (f) Unless a tenant shall have filed a complaint of overcharge with
23 the division which complaint has not been withdrawn, nothing contained
24 in this section shall be deemed to prevent a tenant or tenants, claiming
25 to have been overcharged, from commencing an action or interposing a
26 counterclaim in a court of competent jurisdiction for damages equal to
27 the overcharge and the penalty provided for in this section, including
28 interest from the date of the overcharge at the rate of interest payable
29 on a judgment pursuant to section five thousand four of the civil prac-
30 tice law and rules, plus the statutory costs and allowable disbursements
31 in connection with the proceeding. [~~Such action must be commenced or~~
32 ~~counterclaim interposed within four years of the date of the alleged~~
33 ~~overcharge but no recovery of three times the amount of the overcharge~~
34 ~~may be awarded with respect to any overcharge which had occurred more~~
35 ~~than two years before the action is commenced or counterclaim is inter-~~
36 ~~posed.~~]

37 (9) A penalty shall be assessed against an owner who fails to file a
38 timely or proper initial, annual or supplemental rent registration
39 statement or fails to supply the unit's rent history with a lease under
40 section 12-a of this act of two thousand dollars per unit for buildings
41 with less than fifteen units and of five thousand dollars per unit for
42 buildings with fifteen units or more. Such penalty shall be paid to the
43 tenant of the unit, either as cash, check or a credit toward their
44 monthly rent. Should the tenant's lease expire before the credit toward
45 their monthly rent is paid, then the remainder of the credit will be
46 paid out as a cash award. The choice of cash, check, or rent credit
47 shall be determined by the tenant.

48 § 4. Section 12-a of section 4 of chapter 576 of the laws of 1974,
49 constituting the emergency tenant protection act of nineteen seventy-
50 four, is amended by adding two new subdivisions i and j to read as
51 follows:

52 i. A supplemental statement shall be filed containing the current rent
53 for each unit and such other information contained in subdivision a of
54 this section as shall be required by the division of housing and commu-
55 nity renewal within ninety days of the rent on a unit being raised. The

1 owner shall provide each tenant then in occupancy with a copy of that
2 portion of such statement as pertains to the tenant's unit.

3 j. The owner shall supply with each lease (1) literature on rent
4 history produced by the division of housing and community renewal and
5 (2) a copy of such unit's entire rent history.

6 § 5. Subdivision a of section 26-516 of the administrative code of
7 the city of New York, as amended by chapter 116 of the laws of 1997, is
8 amended and a new subdivision i is added to read as follows:

9 a. Subject to the conditions and limitations of this subdivision, any
10 owner of housing accommodations who, upon complaint of a tenant, or of
11 the state division of housing and community renewal, is found by the
12 state division of housing and community renewal, after a reasonable
13 opportunity to be heard, to have collected an overcharge above the rent
14 authorized for a housing accommodation subject to this chapter shall be
15 liable to the tenant for a penalty equal to three times the amount of
16 such overcharge. ~~[In no event shall such treble damage penalty be~~
17 ~~assessed against an owner based solely on said owner's failure to file a~~
18 ~~timely or proper initial or annual rent registration statement.]~~ If the
19 owner establishes by a preponderance of the evidence that the overcharge
20 was not willful, the state division of housing and community renewal
21 shall establish the penalty as the amount of the overcharge plus inter-
22 est. (i) Except as to complaints filed pursuant to clause (ii) of this
23 paragraph, the legal regulated rent for purposes of determining an over-
24 charge, shall be the amount of rent indicated in ~~[the]~~ prior annual
25 registration ~~[statement filed four years prior to the most recent regis-~~
26 ~~tration statement, (or, if more recently filed, the initial registration~~
27 ~~statement)]~~ statements plus in each case any subsequent lawful increases
28 and adjustments, less any appropriate penalties. ~~[Where the amount of~~
29 ~~rent set forth in the annual rent registration statement filed four~~
30 ~~years prior to the most recent registration statement is not challenged~~
31 ~~within four years of its filing, neither such rent nor service of any~~
32 ~~registration shall be subject to challenge at any time thereafter.]~~ The
33 division of housing and community renewal, in investigating complaints
34 of overcharge and in determining legal regulated rent, shall consider
35 all available rent history which is reasonably necessary to make such
36 determinations. (ii) As to complaints filed within ninety days of the
37 initial registration of a housing accommodation, the legal regulated
38 rent shall be deemed to be the rent charged ~~[on the date four years~~
39 ~~prior to]~~ as of the date of the initial registration of the housing
40 accommodation (or, if the housing accommodation was not previously
41 subject to this chapter ~~[for less than four years]~~, the initial legal
42 regulated rent) plus in each case, any lawful increases and adjustments,
43 less any appropriate penalties. Where the rent charged ~~[on the date four~~
44 ~~years prior to]~~ as of the date of the initial registration of the accom-
45 modation cannot be established, such rent shall be established by the
46 division.

47 Where the prior rent charged ~~[on the date four years prior to the date~~
48 ~~of initial registration of]~~ for the housing accommodation cannot be
49 established, such rent shall be established by the division provided
50 that where a rent is established based on rentals determined under the
51 provisions of the local emergency housing rent control act such rent
52 must be adjusted to account for no less than the minimum increases which
53 would be permitted if the housing accommodation were covered under the
54 provisions of this chapter, less any appropriate penalties. ~~[Where the~~
55 ~~amount of rent set forth in the annual rent registration statement filed~~
56 ~~four years prior to the most recent registration statement is not chal-~~

~~lenged within four years of its filing, neither such rent nor service of any registration shall be subject to challenge at any time thereafter.]~~

(1) The order of the state division of housing and community renewal shall apportion the owner's liability between or among two or more tenants found to have been overcharged by such owner during their particular tenancy of a unit.

(2) Except as provided under clauses (i) and (ii) of this paragraph, a complaint under this subdivision ~~[shall]~~ may be filed with the state division of housing and community renewal ~~[within four years of the first overcharge alleged and no determination of an overcharge and no award or calculation of an award of the amount of an overcharge may be based upon an overcharge having occurred more than four years before the complaint is filed]~~ at any time. (i) ~~[No]~~ A penalty of three times the overcharge may be based upon an overcharge having occurred ~~[more than two years]~~ at any time before the complaint is filed ~~[or upon an overcharge which occurred prior to April first, nineteen hundred eighty-four. (ii) Any complaint based upon overcharges occurring prior to the date of filing of the initial rent registration as provided in section 26-517 of this chapter shall be filed within ninety days of the mailing of notice to the tenant of such registration. This paragraph shall preclude examination of the rental history of the housing accommodation prior to the four year period preceding the filing of a complaint pursuant to this subdivision]~~.

(3) Any affected tenant shall be notified of and given an opportunity to join in any complaint filed by an officer or employee of the state division of housing and community renewal.

(4) An owner found to have overcharged may be assessed the reasonable costs and attorney's fees of the proceeding and interest from the date of the overcharge at the rate of interest payable on a judgment pursuant to section five thousand four of the civil practice law and rules.

(5) The order of the state division of housing and community renewal awarding penalties may, upon the expiration of the period in which the owner may institute a proceeding pursuant to article seventy-eight of the civil practice law and rules, be filed and enforced by a tenant in the same manner as a judgment or not in excess of twenty percent thereof per month may be offset against any rent thereafter due the owner.

i. A penalty shall be assessed against an owner who fails to file a timely or proper initial, annual or supplemental rent registration statement or fails to supply the unit's rent history with a lease under section 26-517 of this chapter of two thousand dollars per unit for buildings with less than fifteen units and of five thousand dollars per unit for buildings with fifteen units or more. Such penalty shall be paid to the tenant of the unit, either as cash, check or a credit toward their monthly rent. Should the tenant's lease expire before the credit toward their monthly rent is paid, then the remainder of the credit will be paid out as a cash award. The choice of cash, check, or rent credit shall be determined by the tenant.

§ 6. Section 26-517 of the administrative code of the city of New York is amended by adding two new subdivisions h and i to read as follows:

h. A supplemental statement shall be filed containing the current rent for each unit and such other information contained in subdivision a of this section as shall be required by the division of housing and community renewal within ninety days of the rent on a unit being raised. The owner shall provide each tenant then in occupancy with a copy of that portion of such statement as pertains to the tenant's unit.

1 i. The owner shall supply with each lease (1) literature on rent
2 history produced by the state division of housing and community renewal
3 and (2) a copy of such unit's entire rent history.

4 § 7. This act shall take effect immediately; provided that:

5 a. the amendments to section 12 and section 12-a of the emergency
6 tenant protection act of nineteen seventy-four made by sections three
7 and four of this act shall expire on the same date as such act expires
8 and shall not affect the expiration of such act as provided in section
9 17 of chapter 567 of the laws of 1974; and

10 b. the amendments to sections 26-516 and 26-517 of chapter 4 of title
11 26 of the administrative code of the city of New York made by sections
12 five and six of this act shall expire on the same date as such law
13 expires and shall not affect the expiration of such law as provided
14 under section 26-520 of such law.