

# STATE OF NEW YORK

---

7971--A

## IN SENATE

March 15, 2018

---

Introduced by Sens. HOYLMAN, ADDABBO, AVELLA, BAILEY, BRESLIN, BROOKS, COMRIE, GIANARIS, HAMILTON, KAMINSKY, KAVANAGH, KENNEDY, KRUEGER, PARKER, SANDERS, SERRANO -- read twice and ordered printed, and when printed to be committed to the Committee on Environmental Conservation -- committee discharged, bill amended, ordered reprinted as amended and recommitted to said committee

AN ACT to amend the environmental conservation law, the public service law, the public authorities law, the labor law and the community risk and resiliency act, in relation to establishing the New York state climate and community protection act

The People of the State of New York, represented in Senate and Assembly, do enact as follows:

1 Section 1. Legislative findings and declaration. The legislature here-  
2 by enacts the "New York state climate and community protection act" and  
3 finds and declares that:

4 1. Climate change is adversely affecting economic well-being, public  
5 health, natural resources, and the environment of New York. The adverse  
6 impacts of climate change include:

7 a. an increase in the severity and frequency of extreme weather  
8 events, such as storms, flooding, and heat waves, which can cause direct  
9 injury or death, property damage, and ecological damage (e.g., through  
10 the release of hazardous substances into the environment);

11 b. rising sea levels, which exacerbate damage from storm surges and  
12 flooding, contribute to coastal erosion and saltwater intrusion, and  
13 inundate low-lying areas, leading to the displacement of or damage to  
14 coastal habitat, property, and infrastructure;

15 c. a decline in freshwater and saltwater fish populations;

16 d. increased average temperatures, which increase the demand for air  
17 conditioning and refrigeration among residents and businesses;

18 e. exacerbation of air pollution; and

19 f. an increase in the incidences of infectious diseases, asthma  
20 attacks, heart attacks, and other negative health outcomes. These  
21 impacts are having a detrimental effect on some of New York's largest  
22 industries, including agriculture, commercial shipping, forestry, tour-

EXPLANATION--Matter in italics (underscored) is new; matter in brackets  
[-] is old law to be omitted.

LBD14899-03-8

1 ism, and recreational and commercial fishing. These impacts also place  
2 additional strain on the physical infrastructure that delivers critical  
3 services to the citizens of New York, including the state's energy,  
4 transportation, stormwater, and wastewater infrastructure.

5 2. a. The severity of current climate change and the threat of addi-  
6 tional and more severe change will be affected by the actions undertaken  
7 by New York and other jurisdictions to reduce greenhouse gas emissions.  
8 According to the U.S. Global Change Research Program (USGCRP) and the  
9 Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC), substantial reductions  
10 in greenhouse gas emissions will be required by mid-century in order to  
11 limit global warming to no more than 2°C and ideally 1.5°C, and thus  
12 minimize the risk of severe impacts from climate change. Specifically,  
13 industrialized countries must reduce their greenhouse gas emissions by  
14 at least 80% below 1990 levels by 2050 in order to stabilize carbon  
15 dioxide equivalent concentrations at 450 parts per million--the level  
16 required to stay within the 2°C target.

17 b. On December 12, 2015, one hundred ninety-five countries at the 21st  
18 Conference of the parties of the United Nations Framework Convention on  
19 Climate Change adopted an agreement addressing greenhouse gas emissions  
20 mitigation, adaptation, and finance starting in the year 2020, known as  
21 the Paris Agreement. The Paris Agreement was adopted on November 4,  
22 2016, and is the largest concerted global effort to combat climate  
23 change to date.

24 3. Action undertaken by New York to reduce greenhouse emissions will  
25 have an impact on global greenhouse gas emissions and the rate of  
26 climate change. In addition, such action will encourage other jurisdic-  
27 tions to implement complementary greenhouse gas reduction strategies and  
28 provide an example of how such strategies can be implemented. It will  
29 also advance the development of green technologies and sustainable prac-  
30 tices within the private sector, which can have far-reaching impacts  
31 such as a reduction in the cost of renewable energy components, and the  
32 creation of jobs and tax revenues in New York.

33 4. It shall therefore be a goal of the state of New York to reduce  
34 greenhouse gas emissions from all anthropogenic sources 100% over 1990  
35 levels by the year 2050, with an incremental target of at least a 50  
36 percent reduction in climate pollution by the year 2030, in line with  
37 USGCRP and IPCC projections of what is necessary to avoid the most  
38 severe impacts of climate change.

39 5. Although substantial emissions reductions are necessary to avoid  
40 the most severe impacts of climate change, complementary adaptation  
41 measures will also be needed to address those risks that cannot be  
42 avoided. Some of the impacts of climate change are already observable in  
43 New York state and the northeastern United States. Annual average  
44 temperatures are on the rise, winter snow cover is decreasing, heat  
45 waves and precipitation are intensifying, and sea levels along New  
46 York's coastline are approximately one foot higher than they were in  
47 1900. New York has also experienced an increasing number of extreme and  
48 unusual weather events, like Hurricanes Irene and Lee and the  
49 unprecedented Superstorm Sandy in 2012, which caused at least 53 deaths  
50 and \$32 billion in damage in New York state.

51 6. New York should therefore minimize the risks associated with  
52 climate change through a combination of measures to reduce statewide  
53 greenhouse gas emissions and improve the resiliency of the state with  
54 respect to the impacts and risks of climate change that cannot be  
55 avoided.

7. Climate change especially heightens the vulnerability of disadvantaged communities, which bear environmental and socioeconomic burdens as well as legacies of racial and ethnic discrimination. Actions undertaken by New York state to mitigate greenhouse gas emissions should prioritize the safety and health of disadvantaged communities, control potential regressive impacts of future climate change mitigation and adaptation policies on these communities, and prioritize the allocation of public investments in these areas.

8. Creating good jobs and a thriving economy is a core concern of New York state. Shaping the ongoing transition in our energy sector to ensure that it creates good jobs and protects workers and communities that may lose employment in the current transition must be key concerns of our climate policy. Setting clear standards for job quality and training standards encourages not only high-quality work but positive economic impacts.

9. Workers are at the front lines of climate change. Construction workers and building service workers were some of the first workers dedicated to cleaning up damage inflicted by recent storms. These workers were often operating in unsafe and toxic environments, cleaning up mold, and working in unstable buildings. In order to protect the health and welfare of these workers, it is in the interest of the state of New York to establish safe and healthy working conditions and proper training for workers involved in climate change related activities. In addition, much of the infrastructure work preparing our state for additional climate change events must happen quickly and efficiently. It is in the interest of the state to ensure labor harmony and promote efficient performance of work on climate change related work sites by requiring workers to be well-trained and adequately compensated.

10. Ensuring career opportunities are created and shared geographically and demographically is necessary to ensure increased access to good jobs for marginalized communities while making the same neighborhoods more resilient. Climate change has a disproportionate impact on low-income people, women, and workers. It is in the interest of the state of New York to protect and promote the interests of these groups against the impacts of climate change and severe weather events and to advance our equity goals by ensuring quality employment opportunities in safe working environments.

11. The complexity of the ongoing energy transition, the uneven distribution of economic opportunity, and the disproportionate cumulative economic and environmental burdens on communities mean that there is a strong state interest in setting a floor statewide for labor standards, but allowing and encouraging individual agencies and local governments to raise standards.

12. By exercising a global leadership role on greenhouse gas mitigation and climate change adaptation, New York will position its economy, technology centers, financial institutions, and businesses to benefit from national and international efforts to address climate change. New York state has already demonstrated leadership in this area by undertaking efforts such as:

a. executive order no. 24 (2009), establishing a goal to reduce greenhouse gas emissions 80% by the year 2050, creating a climate action council, and calling for preparation of a climate action plan;

b. chapter 433 of the laws of 2009, establishing a state energy planning board and requiring the board to adopt a state energy plan;

c. chapter 388 of the laws of 2011, directing the department of environmental conservation to promulgate rules and regulations limiting

emissions of carbon dioxide by newly constructed major generating facilities;

d. the adoption of a state energy plan establishing clean energy goals for the year 2030 aimed at reducing greenhouse gas emission levels by 40% from 1990 levels, producing 50% of electricity from renewable sources, and increasing energy efficiency from 2012 levels by 23%;

e. collaboration with other states on the Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative, and the development of a regional low carbon fuel standard;

f. creation of new offices and task forces to address climate change, including the New York state office of climate change, the renewable energy task force, and the sea level rise task force; and

g. the enactment of the Community Risk and Resiliency Act (CRRRA), which requires agencies to consider sea level rise and other climate-related events when implementing certain state programs.

This legislation will build upon these past developments by creating a comprehensive regulatory program to reduce greenhouse gas emissions that corresponds with the targets established in executive order no. 24, the state energy plan, and USGCRP and IPCC projections.

§ 2. The environmental conservation law is amended by adding a new article 75 to read as follows:

#### ARTICLE 75

##### CLIMATE CHANGE

##### Section 75-0101. Definitions.

75-0103. New York state climate action council.

75-0105. Statewide greenhouse gas emissions report.

75-0107. Statewide greenhouse gas emissions limits.

75-0109. Scoping plan for statewide greenhouse gas emissions reductions.

75-0111. Promulgation of regulations to achieve statewide greenhouse gas emissions reductions.

75-0113. Climate justice working group.

75-0115. Implementation reporting.

##### § 75-0101. Definitions.

For the purposes of this article the following terms shall have the following meanings:

1. "Allowance" means an authorization to emit, during a specified year, up to one ton of carbon dioxide equivalent.

2. "Carbon dioxide equivalent" means the amount of carbon dioxide by mass that would produce the same global warming impact as a given mass of another greenhouse gas over an integrated twenty-year time frame after emission, based on the best available science.

3. "Co-pollutants" means hazardous air pollutants produced by greenhouse gas emissions sources.

4. "Council" means the New York state climate action council established pursuant to section 75-0103 of this article.

5. "Disadvantaged communities" means communities that bear burdens of negative public health effects, environmental pollution, impacts of climate change, and possess certain socioeconomic criteria, as identified pursuant to section 75-0113 of this article.

6. "Emissions reduction measures" means programs, measures and standards, authorized pursuant to this chapter, applicable to sources or categories of sources, that are designed to reduce emissions of greenhouse gases.

7. "Greenhouse gas" means carbon dioxide, methane, nitrous oxide, hydrofluorocarbons, perfluorocarbons, sulfur hexafluoride, and any other

1 substance emitted into the air that may be reasonably anticipated to  
2 cause or contribute to anthropogenic climate change.

3 8. "Greenhouse gas emission limit" means an authorization, during a  
4 specified year, to emit up to a level of greenhouse gases specified by  
5 the department, expressed in tons of carbon dioxide equivalent.

6 9. "Greenhouse gas emission source" or "source" means any anthropogen-  
7 ic source or category of anthropogenic sources of greenhouse gas emis-  
8 sions, with the exception of agricultural emissions from livestock,  
9 determined by the department:

10 a. that its participation in the program will enable the department to  
11 effectively reduce greenhouse gas emissions; and,

12 b. to be capable of being monitored for compliance.

13 10. "Leakage" means a reduction in emissions of greenhouse gases with-  
14 in the state that is offset by an increase in emissions of greenhouse  
15 gases outside of the state.

16 11. "Market-based compliance mechanism" means any of the following:

17 a. A price on greenhouse gas emissions from regulated sources,  
18 expressed as a fee per ton of carbon dioxide equivalent released in a  
19 given year.

20 b. A system of market-based declining annual aggregate emissions limi-  
21 tations for sources or categories of sources that emit greenhouse gases.

22 12. "Statewide greenhouse gas emissions" means the total annual emis-  
23 sions of greenhouse gases produced within the state from anthropogenic  
24 sources and greenhouse gases produced outside of the state that are  
25 associated with the generation of electricity imported into the state  
26 and the extraction and transmission of fossil fuels imported into the  
27 state. Statewide emissions shall be expressed in tons of carbon dioxide  
28 equivalents.

29 13. "Statewide greenhouse gas emissions limit" or "statewide emissions  
30 limit" means the maximum allowable level of statewide greenhouse gas  
31 emissions in a specified year, as determined by the department pursuant  
32 to this article.

33 14. "Environmental justice advisory group" shall mean the permanent  
34 environmental justice advisory group established by a chapter of the  
35 laws of two thousand eighteen amending the environmental conservation  
36 law relating to establishing a permanent environmental justice advisory  
37 group and an environmental justice interagency coordinating council, as  
38 proposed in legislative bills numbers S.3110 and A.2234.

39 § 75-0103. New York state climate action council.

40 1. There is hereby established, within the department, the New York  
41 state climate action council ("council") which shall consist of the  
42 following twenty-five members:

43 a. the commissioners of transportation, health, economic development,  
44 agriculture and markets, housing and community renewal, general  
45 services, labor, environmental conservation, homeland security and emer-  
46 gency services, the chairperson of the public service commission, the  
47 superintendent of financial services, the presidents of the New York  
48 state energy research and development; New York power authority; Long  
49 Island power authority; secretary of state, the chairman of the metro-  
50 politan transportation authority and dormitory of the state of New York,  
51 or their designee.

52 b. two members appointed by the governor;

53 c. two members to be appointed by the temporary president of the  
54 senate;

55 d. two members to be appointed by the speaker of the assembly;

1 e. one member to be appointed by the minority leader of the senate;  
2 and

3 f. one member to be appointed by the minority leader of the assembly.

4 2. The at large members shall include at all times individuals with  
5 expertise in issues relating to climate change mitigation and/or adapta-  
6 tion, such as environmental justice, labor, public health and regulated  
7 industries.

8 3. Council members shall receive no compensation for their services  
9 but shall be reimbursed for actual and necessary expenses incurred in  
10 the performance of their duties.

11 4. The chairperson of the council shall be the commissioner of envi-  
12 ronmental conservation or his or her designee.

13 5. A majority of the members of the council shall constitute a quorum.

14 6. Any vacancies on the council shall be filled in the manner provided  
15 for in the initial appointment.

16 7. The council shall be authorized to convene advisory panels to  
17 assist or advise it in areas requiring special expertise or knowledge.

18 8. The department shall provide the council with such facilities,  
19 assistance and data as will enable the council to carry out its powers  
20 and duties. Additionally, all other agencies of the state or subdivi-  
21 sions thereof may, at the request of the chairperson, provide the coun-  
22 cil with such facilities, assistance, and data as will enable the coun-  
23 cil to carry out its powers and duties.

24 9. The council shall consult with the climate justice working group  
25 established in section 75-0113 of this article, the department of state  
26 utility intervention unit, and the federally designated electric bulk  
27 system operator.

28 10. The council shall advise the department on:

29 a. The development of statewide greenhouse gas emissions limits rules  
30 and regulations, pursuant to section 75-0107 of this article, and regu-  
31 lations to achieve statewide greenhouse gas emissions reductions, pursu-  
32 ant to section 75-0111 of this article.

33 b. The preparation of a scoping plan for reducing greenhouse gas emis-  
34 sions, pursuant to the procedures set forth in section 75-0109 of this  
35 article.

36 11. The council shall identify existing climate change mitigation and  
37 adaptation efforts at the federal, state, and local levels and may make  
38 recommendations regarding how such policies may improve the state's  
39 efforts.

40 12. The council shall maintain a website that includes public access  
41 to the scoping plan and greenhouse gas limit information.

42 § 75-0105. Statewide greenhouse gas emissions report.

43 1. No later than one year after the effective date of this article,  
44 and each year thereafter, the department shall issue a report on state-  
45 wide greenhouse gas emissions, expressed in tons of carbon dioxide  
46 equivalents, from all greenhouse gas emission sources in the state,  
47 including the relative contribution of each type of greenhouse gas and  
48 each type of source to the statewide total.

49 2. The statewide greenhouse gas emissions report shall be a comprehen-  
50 sive evaluation, informed by a variety of data, including but not limit-  
51 ed to:

52 a. information relating to the use of fossil fuels by sector, includ-  
53 ing for electricity generation, transportation, heating, and other  
54 combustion purposes;

1 b. information relating to fugitive and vented emissions from systems  
2 associated with the production, processing, transport, distribution,  
3 storage, and consumption of fossil fuels, including natural gas;

4 c. information relating to emissions from non-fossil fuel sources,  
5 including, but not limited to, garbage incinerators, biomass combustion,  
6 landfills and landfill gas generators, and anaerobic digesters;

7 d. information relating to emissions associated with manufacturing,  
8 chemical production, cement plants, and other processes that produce  
9 non-combustion emissions; and

10 e. information from sources that may be required to participate in the  
11 registration and reporting system pursuant to subdivision four of this  
12 section.

13 3. The statewide greenhouse gas emissions report shall also include an  
14 estimate of greenhouse gas emissions associated with the generation of  
15 imported electricity and with the extraction and transmission of fossil  
16 fuels imported into the state which shall be counted as part of the  
17 statewide total.

18 4. Within one year after the effective date of this article, the  
19 department shall consider establishing a mandatory registry and report-  
20 ing system from individual sources to obtain data on greenhouse gas  
21 emissions exceeding a particular threshold. If established, such regis-  
22 try and reporting system shall apply a consistent reporting threshold to  
23 ensure the unbiased collection of data.

24 5. The statewide greenhouse gas emissions report shall also include an  
25 estimate of what the statewide greenhouse gas emissions level was in  
26 1990.

27 6. The statewide greenhouse gas emissions report shall utilize best  
28 available science and methods of analysis, including the comparison and  
29 reconciliation of emission estimates from all sources, fuel consumption,  
30 field data, and peer-reviewed research.

31 7. The statewide greenhouse gas emissions report shall clearly explain  
32 the methodology and analysis used in the department's determination of  
33 greenhouse gas emissions and shall include a detailed explanation of any  
34 changes in methodology or analysis, adjustments made to prior estimates,  
35 as needed, and any other information necessary to establish a scientif-  
36 ically credible account of change.

37 8. The department shall hold at least two public hearings to seek  
38 public input regarding the methodology and analysis used in the determi-  
39 nation of statewide greenhouse gas emissions, and periodically thereaft-  
40 er.

41 § 75-0107. Statewide greenhouse gas emissions limits.

42 1. No later than one year after the effective date of this article,  
43 the department shall, pursuant to rules and regulations promulgated  
44 after at least one public hearing, establish a statewide greenhouse gas  
45 emissions limit as a percentage of 1990 emissions, as estimated pursuant  
46 to section 75-0105 of this article, as follows:

47 a. 2020: 85% of 1990 emissions.

48 b. 2025: 65% of 1990 emissions.

49 c. 2030: 50% of 1990 emissions.

50 d. 2035: 35% of 1990 emissions.

51 e. 2040: 20% of 1990 emissions.

52 f. 2045: 10% of 1990 emissions.

53 g. 2050: 0% of 1990 emissions.

54 2. Greenhouse gas emission limits shall be measured in units of carbon  
55 dioxide equivalents and identified for each individual type of green-  
56 house gas.



1     3. In order to ensure the most accurate determination feasible, the  
2 department shall utilize the best available scientific, technological,  
3 and economic information on greenhouse gas emissions and consult with  
4 the council, stakeholders, and the public in order to ensure that all  
5 emissions are accurately reflected in its determination of 1990 emis-  
6 sions levels.

7     § 75-0109. Scoping plan for statewide greenhouse gas emissions  
8 reductions.

9     1. On or before two years of the effective date of this article, the  
10 department shall prepare and approve a scoping plan outlining the  
11 department's recommendations for attaining the statewide greenhouse gas  
12 emissions limits in accordance with the schedule established in section  
13 75-0107 of this article.

14     2. The draft scoping plan shall be developed in consultation with the  
15 council, environmental justice advisory group, and the climate justice  
16 working group established pursuant to section 75-0113 of this article  
17 and other stakeholders.

18     a. The department and the council shall hold at least six regional  
19 public comment hearings on the draft scoping plan, including three meet-  
20 ings in the upstate region and three meetings in the downstate region,  
21 and shall allow at least one hundred twenty days for the submission of  
22 public comment.

23     b. The department shall provide meaningful opportunities for public  
24 comment from all persons who will be impacted by the plan, including  
25 persons living in disadvantaged communities as identified pursuant to  
26 section 75-0113 of this article.

27     c. On or before thirty months of the effective date of this article,  
28 the department shall submit the final scoping plan to the governor, the  
29 speaker of the assembly and the temporary president of the senate and  
30 post such plan on its website.

31     3. The scoping plan shall identify and make recommendations on regula-  
32 tory measures and other state actions that will ensure the attainment of  
33 the statewide greenhouse gas emissions limits established pursuant to  
34 section 75-0107 of this article. The measures and actions considered in  
35 such scoping plan shall at a minimum include:

36     a. Performance-based standards for sources of greenhouse gas emis-  
37 sions, including but not limited to sources in the transportation,  
38 building, industrial, commercial, and agricultural sectors.

39     b. Market-based mechanisms to reduce statewide greenhouse gas emis-  
40 sions or emissions from a particular source category, including an exam-  
41 ination of: the imposition of fees per unit of carbon dioxide equivalent  
42 emitted and the imposition of emissions caps accompanied by a system of  
43 tradable emission allowances.

44     c. Measures to reduce emissions from the electricity sector by  
45 displacing fossil-fuel fired electricity with renewable electricity or  
46 energy efficiency.

47     d. Land-use and transportation planning measures aimed at reducing  
48 greenhouse gas emissions from motor vehicles.

49     e. Measures to achieve long-term carbon sequestration and/or promote  
50 best management practices in land use, agriculture and forestry.

51     f. Verifiable, enforceable and voluntary emissions reduction measures.

52     4. In developing such plan the department shall:

53     a. Consider all relevant information pertaining to greenhouse gas  
54 emissions reduction programs in other states, regions, localities, and  
55 nations.



1 b. Evaluate, using the best available economic models, emission esti-  
2 mation techniques and other scientific methods, the total potential  
3 costs and potential economic and non-economic benefits of the plan for  
4 reducing greenhouse gases, and make such evaluation publicly available.  
5 In conducting this evaluation, the department shall quantify:

6 i. The economic and social benefits of greenhouse gas emissions  
7 reductions, taking into account the federal social cost of carbon, any  
8 other tools that the department deems useful and pertinent for this  
9 analysis, and any environmental, economic and public health co-benefits  
10 (such as the reduction of co-pollutants and the diversification of ener-  
11 gy sources); and

12 ii. The costs of implementing proposed emissions reduction measures,  
13 and the emissions reductions that the department anticipates achieving  
14 through these measures.

15 c. Take into account the relative contribution of each source or  
16 source category to statewide greenhouse gas emissions, and the potential  
17 for adverse effects on small businesses, and recommend a de minimis  
18 threshold of greenhouse gas emissions below which emission reduction  
19 requirements will not apply.

20 d. Identify measures to maximize reductions of both greenhouse gas  
21 emissions and co-pollutants in disadvantaged communities as identified  
22 pursuant to section 75-0113 of this article.

23 5. The department shall update its plan for achieving the statewide  
24 greenhouse gas emissions limits at least once every five years and shall  
25 make such updates available to the governor, the speaker of the assembly  
26 and the temporary president of the senate and post such updates on its  
27 website.

28 § 75-0111. Promulgation of regulations to achieve statewide greenhouse  
29 gas emissions reductions.

30 1. No later than three years after the effective date of this article,  
31 the department, after public workshops and consultation with the coun-  
32 cil, the environmental justice advisory group, and the climate justice  
33 working group established pursuant to section 75-0113 of this article,  
34 representatives of regulated entities, community organizations, environ-  
35 mental groups, health professionals, labor unions, municipal corpo-  
36 rations, trade associations and other stakeholders, shall, after no less  
37 than two public hearings, promulgate rules and regulations to ensure  
38 compliance with the statewide emissions reduction limits.

39 2. The regulations promulgated by the department pursuant to this  
40 section shall:

41 a. Ensure that the aggregate emissions of greenhouse gases from green-  
42 house gas emission sources will not exceed the statewide greenhouse gas  
43 emissions limits established in section 75-0107 of this article.

44 b. Include legally enforceable emissions limits, performance stand-  
45 ards, or measures or other requirements to control emissions from green-  
46 house gas emission sources.

47 c. Include measures to reduce emissions from greenhouse gas emission  
48 sources that have a cumulatively significant impact on statewide green-  
49 house gas emissions, such as internal combustion vehicles that burn  
50 gasoline or diesel fuel and boilers or furnaces that burn oil or natural  
51 gas.

52 3. In promulgating these regulations, the department shall:

53 a. Design and implement all regulations in a manner that seeks to be  
54 equitable, to minimize costs and to maximize the total benefits to New  
55 York, and encourages early action to reduce greenhouse gas emissions.

1 b. Ensure that greenhouse gas emissions reductions achieved are real,  
2 permanent, quantifiable, verifiable, and enforceable by the department.

3 c. Ensure that activities undertaken to comply with the regulations do  
4 not result in a net increase in co-pollutant emissions or otherwise  
5 disproportionately burden disadvantaged communities as identified pursu-  
6 ant to section 75-0113 of this article.

7 d. Prioritize measures to maximize net reductions of greenhouse gas  
8 emissions and co-pollutants in disadvantaged communities as identified  
9 pursuant to section 75-0113 of this article and encourage early action  
10 to reduce greenhouse gas emissions and co-pollutants.

11 e. Minimize leakage.

12 4. Market-based compliance mechanisms.

13 a. The department may consider provisions for the use of market-based  
14 compliance mechanisms to comply with the regulations.

15 b. Prior to the inclusion of any market-based compliance mechanism in  
16 the regulations, to the extent feasible and in the furtherance of  
17 achieving the statewide greenhouse gas emissions limit, the department  
18 shall do all of the following:

19 i. Consider the potential for direct, indirect, and cumulative emis-  
20 sion impacts from these mechanisms, including localized impacts in  
21 disadvantaged communities as identified pursuant to section 75-0113 of  
22 this article;

23 ii. Design any market-based compliance mechanism to prevent any  
24 increase in the emissions of co-pollutants; and

25 iii. Maximize additional environmental, public health, and economic  
26 benefits for the state of New York and for disadvantaged communities  
27 identified pursuant to section 75-0113 of this article, as appropriate.

28 c. Such regulations shall include provisions governing how market-  
29 based compliance mechanisms may be used by regulated entities subject to  
30 greenhouse gas emissions limits and mandatory emission reporting  
31 requirements to achieve compliance with their greenhouse gas emissions  
32 limits.

33 d. The department shall ensure that, at a minimum, forty percent of  
34 any funds collected pursuant to any market-based compliance regulations  
35 promulgated under this section as a result of legislative authorization,  
36 funds authorized by the public service commission to be collected solely  
37 for and directed to the New York state energy research and development  
38 authority and proceeds collected by the New York state energy research  
39 and development authority from the auction or sale of carbon dioxide  
40 emission allowances allocated by the department are invested in a manner  
41 which will benefit disadvantaged communities, identified pursuant to  
42 section 75-0113 of this article, consistent with the purposes of this  
43 article, including, but not limited to, increased access to renewable  
44 energy, energy efficiency, weatherization, zero- and low-emission trans-  
45 portation, and adaptation opportunities. The department shall consult  
46 with the climate justice working group in developing and carrying out  
47 such investments.

48 § 75-0113. Climate justice working group.

49 1. There is hereby created within the department, no later than six  
50 months after the effective date of this article, a "climate justice  
51 working group". Such working group will be comprised of representatives  
52 from: environmental justice communities, the department, the department  
53 of health, the New York state energy and research development authority,  
54 and the department of labor.

55 a. Environmental justice community representatives shall be members of  
56 communities of color, low-income communities, and communities bearing

1 disproportionate pollution and climate change burdens, or shall be  
2 representatives of community-based organizations with experience and a  
3 history of advocacy on environmental justice issues, and shall include  
4 at least three representatives from New York city communities, three  
5 representatives from rural communities, and three representatives from  
6 upstate urban communities.

7 b. The working group, in consultation with the department, the depart-  
8 ments of health and labor, the New York state energy and research devel-  
9 opment authority, and the environmental justice advisory group, will  
10 establish criteria to identify disadvantaged communities for the  
11 purposes of co-pollutant reductions, greenhouse gas emissions  
12 reductions, regulatory impact statements, and the allocation of invest-  
13 ments related to this article.

14 c. Disadvantaged communities shall be identified based on geographic,  
15 public health, environmental hazard, and socioeconomic criteria, which  
16 shall include but are not limited to:

17 (i) areas burdened by cumulative environmental pollution and other  
18 hazards that can lead to negative public health effects;

19 (ii) areas with concentrations of people that are of low income, high  
20 unemployment, high rent burden, low levels of home ownership, low levels  
21 of educational attainment, or members of groups that have historically  
22 experienced discrimination on the basis of race or ethnicity; and

23 (iii) areas vulnerable to the impacts of climate change such as flood-  
24 ing, storm surges, and urban heat island effects.

25 2. Before finalizing the criteria for identifying disadvantaged commu-  
26 nities and identifying disadvantaged communities pursuant to subdivision  
27 one of this section, the department shall publish draft criteria and a  
28 draft list of disadvantaged communities and make such information avail-  
29 able on its website.

30 a. The department shall hold at least six regional public hearings on  
31 the draft criteria and the draft list of disadvantaged communities,  
32 including three meetings in the upstate region and three meetings in the  
33 downstate region, and shall allow at least one hundred twenty days for  
34 the submission of public comment.

35 b. The department shall also ensure that there are meaningful opportu-  
36 nities for public comment for all persons who will be impacted by the  
37 criteria, including persons living in areas that may be identified as  
38 disadvantaged communities under the proposed criteria.

39 3. The group will meet no less than annually to review the criteria  
40 and methods used to identify disadvantaged communities and may modify  
41 such methods to incorporate new data and scientific findings. The  
42 climate justice working group shall review identities of disadvantaged  
43 communities and modify such identities as needed.

44 § 75-0115. Implementation reporting.

45 1. The department shall, not less than every four years, publish a  
46 report which shall include recommendations regarding the implementation  
47 of greenhouse gas reduction measures.

48 2. The report shall, at minimum, include:

49 a. Whether the state is on track to meet the statewide greenhouse gas  
50 emissions limits established in section 75-0107 of this article.

51 b. An assessment of existing regulations and whether modifications are  
52 needed to ensure fulfillment of the statewide greenhouse gas emissions  
53 limits.

54 c. An overview of social benefits from the regulations or other meas-  
55 ures, including reductions in greenhouse gas emissions and copollutants,

diversification of energy sources, and other benefits to the economy, environment, and public health, including women's health.

d. An overview of compliance costs for regulated entities and for the department and other state agencies.

e. Whether regulations or other greenhouse gas reduction measures undertaken are equitable, minimize costs and maximize the total benefits to the state, and encourage early action.

f. Whether activities undertaken to comply with state regulations disproportionately burden disadvantaged communities as identified pursuant to section 75-0113 of this article.

g. An assessment of local benefits and impacts of any reductions in co-pollutants related to reductions in statewide and local greenhouse gas emissions.

h. An assessment of disadvantaged communities' access to or community ownership of the services and commodities identified in section eight of the chapter of the laws of two thousand eighteen which added this article.

i. Whether entities that have voluntarily reduced their greenhouse gas emissions prior to the implementation of this article receive appropriate credit for early voluntary reductions.

j. Recommendations for future regulatory and policy action.

3. In preparing this report, the department shall, at a minimum, consult with the council, and the climate justice working group established in section 75-0113 of this article.

4. The report shall be published and posted on the department's website.

§ 3. Subdivision 1 of section 54-1523 of the environmental conservation law is amended by adding a new paragraph h to read as follows:

h. to establish and implement easily-replicated renewable energy projects, including solar arrays, heat pumps and wind turbines in public low-income housing in suburban, urban and rural areas.

§ 4. The public service law is amended by adding a new section 66-p to read as follows:

§ 66-p. Establishment of a renewable energy program. 1. As used in this section:

(a) "load serving entity" means any entity that secures energy to serve the electrical energy requirements of end-use customers in New York state;

(b) "prevailing rate of wages" shall have the same meaning as such term is defined in paragraph a of subdivision five of section two hundred twenty of the labor law; and

(c) "renewable energy systems" means systems that generate electricity or thermal energy through use of the following technologies: solar thermal, photovoltaics, wind, hydroelectric, geothermal electric, geothermal ground source heat, tidal energy, wave energy, ocean thermal, offshore wind and fuel cells which do not utilize a fossil fuel resource in the process of generating electricity.

2. No later than January first, two thousand nineteen, the commission shall establish a program to require that a minimum of fifty percent of the statewide electric generation secured by load serving entities to meet the electrical energy requirements of all end-use customers in New York state in two thousand thirty shall be generated by renewable energy systems.

The commission shall set annual minimum percentage levels of electricity generated by renewable energy systems and delivered to end-use customers in New York state for each year of the program.

3. No later than July first, two thousand twenty and every two years thereafter, the commission shall, after notice and provision for the opportunity to comment, issue a comprehensive review of the program established pursuant to this section. The commission shall determine, among other matters: (a) progress in meeting the overall annual targets for deployment of renewable energy systems; (b) distribution of systems by size and load zone; and (c) annual funding commitments and expenditures. The commission shall evaluate the annual targets established pursuant to subdivision two of this section and determine whether the annual targets should be accelerated, increased or extended, taking into consideration load modifications associated with, but not limited to, energy efficiency measures and the electrification of transportation, heating systems and industrial processes.

4. The commission may temporarily suspend or modify the obligations under such program provided that the commission, after conducting a hearing as provided in section twenty of this chapter, makes a finding that the program impedes the provision of safe and adequate electric service or that there is a significant increase in arrears or service disconnections that the commission determines is related to the program.

5. Every contractor employed pursuant to this section, not otherwise required to pay laborers, workers or mechanics the prevailing rate of wages pursuant to article eight of the labor law, shall pay employees under contract for the development of renewable energy systems rated at two hundred fifty kilowatts or more, a wage of not less than the prevailing rate of wages for such work in the locality where such installation occurs. This requirement shall be in effect for the duration of the receipt by the contractor of the incentives established pursuant to this section and in no event shall such requirement extend beyond the availability of such incentives. Every contractor subject to the provisions of this subdivision shall maintain payroll records in accordance with section two hundred twenty of the labor law.

§ 5. Section 1005 of the public authorities law is amended by adding a new subdivision 26 to read as follows:

26. Renewable energy program. As deemed feasible and advisable by the trustees, no later than January first, two thousand nineteen, the authority shall secure energy to serve the electrical energy requirements of its end-use customers in accordance with the renewable energy program as set forth and defined in section sixty-six-p of the public service law.

§ 6. Sections 1020-jj, 1020-kk and 1020-ll of the public authorities law, as renumbered by chapter 415 of the laws of 2017, are renumbered sections 1020-kk, 1020-ll and 1020-mm and a new section 1020-jj is added to read as follows:

§ 1020-jj. Renewable energy program. The authority and all load serving entities that secure energy to serve the electrical energy requirements of end-use customers in its service territory shall comply with the renewable energy program as set forth and defined in section sixty-six-p of the public service law.

§ 6-a. Subdivision 1 of section 1020-s of the public authorities law, as amended by chapter 415 of the laws of 2017, is amended to read as follows:

1. The rates, services and practices relating to the electricity generated by facilities owned or operated by the authority shall not be subject to the provisions of the public service law or to regulation by, or the jurisdiction of, the public service commission, except to the extent (a) article seven of the public service law applies to the siting



1 and operation of a major utility transmission facility as defined there-  
2 in, (b) article ten of such law applies to the siting of a generating  
3 facility as defined therein, (c) section eighteen-a of such law provides  
4 for assessment for certain costs, property or operations, (d) to the  
5 extent that the department of public service reviews and makes recommen-  
6 dations with respect to the operations and provision of services of, and  
7 rates and budgets established by, the authority pursuant to section  
8 three-b of such law, [and] (e) that section seventy-four of the public  
9 service law applies to qualified energy storage systems within the  
10 authority's jurisdiction and (f) that section sixty-six-p of the public  
11 service law applies to the authority and load serving entities that  
12 secure energy to serve the electrical energy requirements of end-use  
13 customers within the authority's jurisdiction.

14 § 7. The labor law is amended by adding a new article 8-B to read as  
15 follows:

#### 16 ARTICLE 8-B

##### 17 LABOR AND JOB STANDARDS AND WORKER PROTECTION

##### 18 Section 228. Labor and job standards and worker protection.

19 § 228. Labor and job standards and worker protection. 1. All state  
20 agencies involved in implementing the New York state climate and commu-  
21 nity protection act shall assess and implement strategies to increase  
22 employment opportunities and improve job quality. Within one hundred  
23 twenty days of the effective date of this section, all state agencies,  
24 offices, authorities, and divisions shall report to the legislature on:

25 a. steps they will take to ensure compliance with this section; and  
26 b. regulations necessary to ensure that they prioritize the statewide  
27 goal of creating good jobs and increasing employment opportunities.

28 2. In considering and issuing permits, licenses, regulations,  
29 contracts, and other administrative approvals and decisions pursuant to  
30 the New York state climate and community protection act, all state agen-  
31 cies, offices, authorities, and divisions shall apply the following  
32 labor, training, and job quality standards to the following project  
33 types: public work; projects in receipt of more than one hundred thou-  
34 sand dollars in total financial assistance; or to projects with a total  
35 value of more than ten million dollars; and privately-financed projects  
36 on public property.

37 a. the payment of no less than prevailing wages for all employees in  
38 construction and building, consistent with article eight of the this  
39 chapter, and building services, consistent with article nine of this  
40 chapter;

41 b. the inclusion of contract language requiring contractors to estab-  
42 lish labor harmony policies; dispute resolution mechanisms; prevailing  
43 wage compliance; safety policies; workers compensation insurance  
44 (including review of contractor experience rating and other factors);  
45 and apprenticeship program appropriate for crafts employed. Procurement  
46 rules should encourage bundling of small contracts and projects to  
47 improve the efficiency of compliance;

48 c. apprenticeship utilization:

49 i. that all contractors and subcontractors, including those that  
50 participate in power purchase agreements, energy performance contracts,  
51 or other similar programs, participate in apprenticeship programs in the  
52 trades in which they are performing work;

53 ii. maximum use of apprentices as per department of labor approved  
54 ratios;

55 iii. encouragement of affiliated pre-apprentice direct entry programs,  
56 including but not limited to EJM Construction Skills; NYC Helmets to



1 Hardhats, and Nontraditional Employment for Women (NEW) for the recruit-  
2 ment of local and/or disadvantaged workers;

3 iv. existing workforce development programs, including those at the  
4 New York state energy research and development authority, should be made  
5 to conform to these standards.

6 3. The commissioner, the fiscal officer and other relevant agencies  
7 shall promulgate such regulations as are necessary to implement and  
8 administer compliance with the provisions of this section. The depart-  
9 ment and the fiscal officer shall coordinate with organized labor and  
10 local and county level governments to implement a system to track  
11 compliance, accept reports of non-compliance for enforcement action, and  
12 report annually on the adoption of these standards to the legislature  
13 starting one year from the effective date of this section.

14 a. For the purposes of this section, "fiscal officer" shall mean the  
15 industrial commissioner, except for construction and building service  
16 work performed by or on behalf of a city, in which case "fiscal officer"  
17 shall mean the comptroller or other analogous officer of such city.

18 b. The provisions of the contract by the recipient of financial  
19 assistance pertaining to prevailing wages are to be considered a  
20 contract for the benefit of construction and building service workers,  
21 upon which such workers shall have the right to maintain action for the  
22 difference between the prevailing wage rate of pay, benefits, and paid  
23 leave and the rates of pay, benefits, and paid leave actually received  
24 by them, and including attorney's fees.

25 c. i. Where a recipient of financial assistance contracts building  
26 service work to a building service contractor, the contractor is held to  
27 the same obligations with respect to prevailing wages as the recipient.  
28 The recipient must include terms establishing this obligation within any  
29 contract signed with a contractor.

30 ii. Where a recipient of financial assistance contracts for  
31 construction, excavation, demolition, rehabilitation, repair, reno-  
32 vation, alteration or improvement to a subcontractor, the subcontractor  
33 is held to the same obligations with respect to prevailing wages as the  
34 recipient. The recipient must include terms establishing this obligation  
35 within any contract signed with a subcontractor.

36 4. For the purposes of this section "financial assistance" means any  
37 provision of public funds to any person, individual, proprietorship,  
38 partnership, joint venture, corporation, limited liability company,  
39 trust, association, organization, or other entity that receives finan-  
40 cial assistance, or any assignee or successor in interest of real prop-  
41 erty improved or developed with financial assistance, for economic  
42 development within the state, including but not limited to cash payments  
43 or grants, bond financing, tax abatements or exemptions, including but  
44 not limited to abatements or exemptions from real property, mortgage  
45 recording, sales, and use taxes, or the difference between any payments  
46 in lieu of taxes and the amount of real property or other taxes that  
47 would have been due if the property were not exempted from such taxes,  
48 tax increment financing, filing fee waivers, energy cost reductions,  
49 environmental remediation costs, write-downs in the market value of  
50 buildings or land, or the cost of capital improvements related to real  
51 property for which the state would not pay absent the development  
52 project, and includes both discretionary and as of right assistance. The  
53 provisions of this section shall only apply to projects receiving more  
54 than one hundred thousand dollars in total financial assistance, or to  
55 projects with a total project value of more than ten million dollars.

1 5. The commissioner shall evaluate whether there are additional stand-  
2 ards that could be applied to increase wage and benefit standards or to  
3 encourage a safe, well-trained, and adequately compensated workforce.

4 6. Nothing set forth in this section shall be construed to impede,  
5 infringe, or diminish the rights and benefits which accrue to employees  
6 through bona fide collective bargaining agreements, or otherwise dimin-  
7 ish the integrity of the existing collective bargaining relationship.

8 7. Nothing set forth in this section shall preclude a local government  
9 from setting additional standards that expand on these state-wide stand-  
10 ards.

11 § 8. Report on barriers to, and opportunities for, community ownership  
12 of services and commodities in disadvantaged communities. 1. On or  
13 before two years of the effective date of this act, the department of  
14 environmental conservation, with input from relevant state agencies, the  
15 environmental justice advisory group as defined in section 75-0101 of  
16 the environmental conservation law, the climate justice working group as  
17 defined in section 75-0113 of the environmental conservation law and  
18 Climate Action Council established in article 75 of the environmental  
19 conservation law, and following at least two public hearings, shall  
20 prepare a report on barriers to, and opportunities for, access to or  
21 community ownership of the following services and commodities in disad-  
22 vantaged communities as identified in article 75 of the environmental  
23 conservation law:

- 24 a. Distributed renewable energy generation.
- 25 b. Energy efficiency and weatherization investments.
- 26 c. Zero-emission and low-emission transportation options.
- 27 d. Adaptation measures to improve the resilience of homes and local  
28 infrastructure to the impacts of climate change including but not limit-  
29 ed to microgrids.
- 30 e. Other services and infrastructure that can reduce the risks associ-  
31 ated with climate-related hazards, including but not limited to:
  - 32 i. Shelters and cool rooms during extreme heat events;
  - 33 ii. Shelters during flooding events; and
  - 34 iii. Medical treatment for asthma and other conditions that could be  
35 exacerbated by climate-related events.

36 2. The report, which shall be submitted to the governor, the speaker  
37 of the assembly and the temporary president of the senate and posted on  
38 the department of environmental conservation website, shall include  
39 recommendations on how to increase access to the services and commod-  
40 ities.

41 3. The department of environmental conservation shall amend the scop-  
42 ing plan for statewide greenhouse gas emissions reductions in accordance  
43 with the recommendations included in the report.

44 § 9. Climate change actions by state agencies. 1. All state agencies  
45 shall assess and implement strategies to reduce their greenhouse gas  
46 emissions.

47 2. In considering and issuing permits, licenses, and other administra-  
48 tive approvals and decisions, including but not limited to the execution  
49 of grants, loans, and contracts, all state agencies, offices, authori-  
50 ties, and divisions shall consider whether such decisions are inconsis-  
51 tent with or will interfere with the attainment of the statewide green-  
52 house gas emissions limits established in article 75 of the  
53 environmental conservation law. Where such decisions are deemed to be  
54 inconsistent with or will interfere with the attainment of the statewide  
55 greenhouse gas emissions limits, each agency, office, authority, or  
56 division shall provide a detailed statement of justification as to why

1 such limits/criteria may not be met, and identify alternatives or green-  
2 house gas mitigation measures to be required where such project is  
3 located.

4 3. In considering and issuing permits, licenses, and other administra-  
5 tive approvals and decisions, including but not limited to the execution  
6 of grants, loans, and contracts, pursuant to article 75 of the environ-  
7 mental conservation law, all state agencies, offices, authorities, and  
8 divisions shall not disproportionately burden disadvantaged communities  
9 as identified pursuant to subdivision 5 of section 75-0101 of the envi-  
10 ronmental conservation law. All state agencies, offices, authorities,  
11 and divisions shall also prioritize reductions of greenhouse gas emis-  
12 sions and co-pollutants in disadvantaged communities as identified  
13 pursuant to such subdivision 5 of section 75-0101 of the environmental  
14 conservation law.

15 § 10. Authorization for other state agencies to promulgate greenhouse  
16 gas emissions regulations. 1. The public service commission, the New  
17 York state energy research and development authority, the department of  
18 health, the department of transportation, the department of state, the  
19 department of economic development, the department of agriculture and  
20 markets, the department of financial services, the office of general  
21 services, the division of housing and community renewal, the public  
22 utility authorities established pursuant to titles 1, 1-A, 1-B, 11,  
23 11-A, 11-B, 11-C and 11-D of article 5 of the public authorities law and  
24 any other state agency may promulgate regulations to contribute to  
25 achieving the statewide greenhouse gas emissions limits established in  
26 article 75 of the environmental conservation law. Provided, however, any  
27 such regulations shall not limit the department of environmental conser-  
28 vation's authority to regulate and control greenhouse gas emissions  
29 pursuant to article 75 of the environmental conservation law.

30 § 11. Chapter 355 of the laws of 2014, constituting the "community  
31 risk and resiliency act", is amended by adding two new sections 17-a and  
32 17-b to read as follows:

33 § 17-a. The department of environmental conservation shall take  
34 actions to promote adaptation and resilience, including:

35 (a) actions to help state agencies and other entities assess the  
36 reasonably foreseeable risks of climate change on any proposed projects,  
37 taking into account issues such as: sea level rise, tropical and extra-  
38 tropical cyclones, storm surges, flooding, wind, changes in average and  
39 peak temperatures, changes in average and peak precipitation, public  
40 health impacts, and impacts on species and other natural resources.

41 (b) identifying the most significant climate-related risks, taking  
42 into account the probability of occurrence, the magnitude of the poten-  
43 tial harm, and the uncertainty of the risk.

44 (c) measures that could mitigate significant climate-related risks, as  
45 well as a cost-benefit analysis and implementation of such measures.

46 § 17-b. Major permits for the regulatory programs of subdivision three  
47 of section 70-0107 of the environmental conservation law shall require  
48 applicants to demonstrate that future physical climate risk has been  
49 considered. In reviewing such information the department may require the  
50 applicant to mitigate significant risks to public infrastructure and/or  
51 services, private property not owned by the applicant, adverse impacts  
52 on disadvantaged communities, and/or natural resources in the vicinity  
53 of the project.

54 § 12. Nothing in this act shall limit the existing authority of a  
55 state entity to adopt and implement greenhouse gas emissions reduction  
56 measures.

1     § 13. Nothing in this act shall relieve any person, entity, or public  
2 agency of compliance with other applicable federal, state, or local laws  
3 or regulations, including state air and water quality requirements, and  
4 other requirements for protecting public health or the environment.

5     § 14. Review under this act may be had in a proceeding under article  
6 78 of the civil practice law and rules at the instance of any person  
7 aggrieved.

8     § 15. Severability. If any word, phrase, clause, sentence, paragraph,  
9 section, or part of this act shall be adjudged by any court of competent  
10 jurisdiction to be invalid, such judgement shall not affect, impair, or  
11 invalidate the remainder thereof, but shall be confined in its operation  
12 to the word, phrase, clause, sentence, paragraph, section, or part ther-  
13 eof directly involved in the controversy in which such judgement shall  
14 have been rendered.

15     § 16. This act shall take effect on the same date and in the same  
16 manner as a chapter of the laws of 2018, amending the environmental  
17 conservation law, relating to establishing a permanent environmental  
18 justice advisory group and an environmental justice interagency coordi-  
19 nating council, as proposed in legislative bills numbers A.2234 and  
20 S.3110, takes effect; provided further, the provisions of section seven  
21 of this act shall take effect on the one hundred eightieth day after it  
22 shall have become a law and shall apply to any grants, loans, and  
23 contracts and financial assistance awarded or renewed on or after such  
24 effective date.