

# STATE OF NEW YORK

6180

2017-2018 Regular Sessions

## IN SENATE

May 11, 2017

Introduced by Sen. BONACIC -- read twice and ordered printed, and when printed to be committed to the Committee on Judiciary

AN ACT to amend the debtor and creditor law, the civil practice law and rules, the estates, powers and trusts law and the workers' compensation law, in relation to enacting the "uniform voidable transactions act"; and to repeal certain provisions of the debtor and creditor law relating to fraudulent conveyances

The People of the State of New York, represented in Senate and Assembly, do enact as follows:

1 Section 1. Short title. This act shall be known and may be cited as  
2 the "uniform voidable transactions act".

3 § 2. Article 10 of the debtor and creditor law is REPEALED and a new  
4 article 10 is added to read as follows:

### ARTICLE 10

#### UNIFORM VOIDABLE TRANSACTIONS ACT

##### Section 270. Definitions.

8 271. Insolvency.

9 272. Value.

10 273. Transfer or obligation voidable as to present or future  
11 creditor.

12 274. Transfer or obligation voidable as to present creditor.

13 275. When transfer is made or obligation is incurred.

14 276. Remedies of creditor.

15 277. Defenses, liability, and protection of transferee or  
16 obligee.

17 278. Extinguishment of claim for relief.

18 279. Governing law.

19 280. Supplementary provisions.

20 281. Uniformity of application and construction.

21 281-a. Relation to electronic signatures in global and national  
22 commerce act.

EXPLANATION--Matter in italics (underscored) is new; matter in brackets  
[-] is old law to be omitted.

LBD06162-01-7

§ 270. Definitions. As used in this article:

(a) "Affiliate" means:

(1) a person that directly or indirectly owns, controls or holds with power to vote, twenty percent or more of the outstanding voting securities of the debtor, other than a person that holds the securities:

(i) as a fiduciary or agent without sole discretionary power to vote the securities; or

(ii) solely to secure a debt, if the person has not in fact exercised the power to vote;

(2) a corporation twenty percent or more of whose outstanding voting securities are directly or indirectly owned, controlled or held with power to vote, by the debtor or a person that directly or indirectly owns, controls or holds, with power to vote, twenty percent or more of the outstanding voting securities of the debtor, other than a person that holds the securities:

(i) as a fiduciary or agent without sole discretionary power to vote the securities; or

(ii) solely to secure a debt, if the person has not in fact exercised the power to vote;

(3) a person whose business is operated by the debtor under a lease or other agreement, or a person substantially all of whose assets are controlled by the debtor; or

(4) a person that operates the debtor's business under a lease or other agreement or controls substantially all of the debtor's assets.

(b) "Asset" means property of a debtor, but the term does not include:

(1) property to the extent it is encumbered by a valid lien;

(2) property to the extent it is generally exempt under non-bankruptcy law; or

(3) an interest in property held in tenancy by the entirety to the extent it is not subject to process by a creditor holding a claim against only one tenant.

(c) "Claim", except as used in "claim for relief", means a right to payment, whether or not the right is reduced to judgment, liquidated, unliquidated, fixed, contingent, matured, unmatured, disputed, undisputed, legal, equitable, secured or unsecured.

(d) "Creditor" means a person that has a claim.

(e) "Debt" means liability on a claim.

(f) "Debtor" means a person that is liable on a claim.

(g) "Electronic" means relating to technology having electrical, digital, magnetic, wireless, optical, electromagnetic or similar capabilities.

(h) "Insider" includes:

(1) if the debtor is an individual:

(i) a relative of the debtor or of a general partner of the debtor;

(ii) a partnership in which the debtor is a general partner;

(iii) a general partner in a partnership described in subparagraph (ii) of this paragraph; or

(iv) a corporation of which the debtor is a director, officer, or person in control;

(2) if the debtor is a corporation:

(i) a director of the debtor;

(ii) an officer of the debtor;

(iii) a person in control of the debtor;

(iv) a partnership in which the debtor is a general partner;

(v) a general partner in a partnership described in subparagraph (iv) of this paragraph; or

1 (vi) a relative of a general partner, director, officer or person in  
2 control of the debtor;

3 (3) if the debtor is a partnership:

4 (i) a general partner in the debtor;

5 (ii) a relative of a general partner in, a general partner of or a  
6 person in control of the debtor;

7 (iii) another partnership in which the debtor is a general partner;

8 (iv) a general partner in a partnership described in subparagraph  
9 (iii) of this paragraph; or

10 (v) a person in control of the debtor;

11 (4) an affiliate, or an insider of an affiliate as if the affiliate  
12 were the debtor; and

13 (5) a managing agent of the debtor.

14 (i) "Lien" means a charge against or an interest in property to secure  
15 payment of a debt or performance of an obligation, and includes a secu-  
16 rity interest created by agreement, a judicial lien obtained by legal or  
17 equitable process or proceedings, a common-law lien, or a statutory  
18 lien.

19 (j) "Organization" means a person other than an individual.

20 (k) "Person" means an individual, estate, partnership, association,  
21 trust, business or nonprofit entity, public corporation, government or  
22 governmental subdivision, agency or instrumentality, or other legal or  
23 commercial entity.

24 (l) "Property" means anything that may be the subject of ownership.

25 (m) "Record" means information that is inscribed on a tangible medium  
26 or that is stored in an electronic or other medium and is retrievable in  
27 perceivable form.

28 (n) "Relative" means an individual related by consanguinity within the  
29 third degree as determined by the common law, a spouse or an individual  
30 related to a spouse within the third degree as so determined, and  
31 includes an individual in an adoptive relationship within the third  
32 degree.

33 (o) "Sign" means, with present intent to authenticate or adopt a  
34 record:

35 (i) to execute or adopt a tangible symbol; or

36 (ii) to attach to or logically associate with the record an electronic  
37 symbol, sound, or process.

38 (p) "Transfer" means every mode, direct or indirect, absolute or  
39 conditional, voluntary or involuntary, of disposing of or parting with  
40 an asset or an interest in an asset, and includes payment of money,  
41 release, lease, license, and creation of a lien or other encumbrance.

42 (q) "Valid lien" means a lien that is effective against the holder of  
43 a judicial lien subsequently obtained by legal or equitable process or  
44 proceedings.

45 § 271. Insolvency. (a) A debtor is insolvent if, at a fair valuation,  
46 the sum of the debtor's debts is greater than the sum of the debtor's  
47 assets.

48 (b) A debtor that is generally not paying the debtor's debts as they  
49 become due other than as a result of a bona fide dispute is presumed to  
50 be insolvent. The presumption imposes on the party against which the  
51 presumption is directed the burden of proving that the nonexistence of  
52 insolvency is more probable than its existence.

53 (c) Assets under this section do not include property that has been  
54 transferred, concealed or removed with intent to hinder, delay or  
55 defraud creditors, or that has been transferred in a manner making the  
56 transfer voidable under this article.

1 (d) Debts under this section do not include an obligation to the  
2 extent it is secured by a valid lien on property of the debtor not  
3 included as an asset.

4 § 272. Value. (a) Value is given for a transfer or an obligation if,  
5 in exchange for the transfer or obligation, property is transferred or  
6 an antecedent debt is secured or satisfied, but value does not include  
7 an unperformed promise made otherwise than in the ordinary course of the  
8 promisor's business to furnish support to the debtor or another person.

9 (b) For the purposes of paragraph two of subdivision (a) of section  
10 two hundred seventy-three and section two hundred seventy-four of this  
11 article, a person gives a reasonably equivalent value if the person  
12 acquires an interest of the debtor in an asset pursuant to a regularly  
13 conducted, noncollusive foreclosure sale or execution of a power of sale  
14 for the acquisition or disposition of the interest of the debtor upon  
15 default under a mortgage, deed of trust, or security agreement.

16 (c) A transfer is made for present value if the exchange between the  
17 debtor and the transferee is intended by them to be contemporaneous and  
18 is in fact substantially contemporaneous.

19 § 273. Transfer or obligation voidable as to present or future credi-  
20 tor. (a) A transfer made or obligation incurred by a debtor is voidable  
21 as to a creditor, whether the creditor's claim arose before or after the  
22 transfer was made or the obligation was incurred, if the debtor made the  
23 transfer or incurred the obligation:

24 (1) with actual intent to hinder, delay or defraud any creditor of the  
25 debtor; or

26 (2) without receiving a reasonably equivalent value in exchange for  
27 the transfer or obligation, and the debtor:

28 (i) was engaged or was about to engage in a business or a transaction  
29 for which the remaining assets of the debtor were unreasonably small in  
30 relation to the business or transaction; or

31 (ii) intended to incur, or believed or reasonably should have believed  
32 that the debtor would incur, debts beyond the debtor's ability to pay as  
33 they became due.

34 (b) In determining actual intent under paragraph one of subdivision  
35 (a) of this section, consideration may be given, among other factors, to  
36 whether:

37 (1) the transfer or obligation was to an insider;

38 (2) the debtor retained possession or control of the property trans-  
39 ferred after the transfer;

40 (3) the transfer or obligation was disclosed or concealed;

41 (4) before the transfer was made or obligation was incurred, the  
42 debtor had been sued or threatened with suit;

43 (5) the transfer was of substantially all the debtor's assets;

44 (6) the debtor absconded;

45 (7) the debtor removed or concealed assets;

46 (8) the value of the consideration received by the debtor was reason-  
47 ably equivalent to the value of the asset transferred or the amount of  
48 the obligation incurred;

49 (9) the debtor was insolvent or became insolvent shortly after the  
50 transfer was made or the obligation was incurred;

51 (10) the transfer occurred shortly before or shortly after a substan-  
52 tial debt was incurred; and

53 (11) the debtor transferred the essential assets of the business to a  
54 lienor that transferred the assets to an insider of the debtor.

1 (c) A creditor making a claim for relief under subdivision (a) of this  
2 section has the burden of proving the elements of the claim for relief  
3 by a preponderance of the evidence.

4 § 274. Transfer or obligation voidable as to present creditor. (a) A  
5 transfer made or obligation incurred by a debtor is voidable as to a  
6 creditor whose claim arose before the transfer was made or the obli-  
7 gation was incurred if the debtor made the transfer or incurred the  
8 obligation without receiving a reasonably equivalent value in exchange  
9 for the transfer or obligation and the debtor was insolvent at that time  
10 or the debtor became insolvent as a result of the transfer or obli-  
11 gation.

12 (b) A transfer made by a debtor is voidable as to a creditor whose  
13 claim arose before the transfer was made if the transfer was made to an  
14 insider for an antecedent debt, the debtor was insolvent at that time,  
15 and the insider had reasonable cause to believe that the debtor was  
16 insolvent.

17 (c) Subject to subdivision (b) of section two hundred seventy-one of  
18 this article, a creditor making a claim for relief under subdivision (a)  
19 or (b) of this section has the burden of proving the elements of the  
20 claim for relief by a preponderance of the evidence.

21 § 275. When transfer is made or obligation is incurred. For the  
22 purposes of this article:

23 (a) a transfer is made:

24 (1) with respect to an asset that is real property other than a  
25 fixture, but including the interest of a seller or purchaser under a  
26 contract for the sale of the asset, when the transfer is so far  
27 perfected that a good-faith purchaser of the asset from the debtor  
28 against which applicable law permits the transfer to be perfected cannot  
29 acquire an interest in the asset that is superior to the interest of the  
30 transferee; and

31 (2) with respect to an asset that is not real property or that is a  
32 fixture, when the transfer is so far perfected that a creditor on a  
33 simple contract cannot acquire a judicial lien otherwise than under this  
34 article that is superior to the interest of the transferee;

35 (b) if applicable law permits the transfer to be perfected as provided  
36 in subdivision (a) of this section and the transfer is not so perfected  
37 before the commencement of an action for relief under this article, the  
38 transfer is deemed made immediately before the commencement of the  
39 action;

40 (c) if applicable law does not permit the transfer to be perfected as  
41 provided in subdivision (a) of this section, the transfer is made when  
42 it becomes effective between the debtor and the transferee;

43 (d) a transfer is not made until the debtor has acquired rights in the  
44 asset transferred; and

45 (e) an obligation is incurred:

46 (1) if oral, when it becomes effective between the parties; or

47 (2) if evidenced by a record, when the record signed by the obligor is  
48 delivered to or for the benefit of the obligee.

49 § 276. Remedies of creditor. (a) In an action for relief against a  
50 transfer or obligation under this article, a creditor, subject to the  
51 limitations in section two hundred seventy-seven of this article, may  
52 obtain:

53 (1) avoidance of the transfer or obligation to the extent necessary to  
54 satisfy the creditor's claim;

1 (2) an attachment or other provisional remedy against the asset trans-  
2 ferred or other property of the transferee if available under applicable  
3 law; and

4 (3) subject to applicable principles of equity and in accordance with  
5 applicable rules of civil procedure:

6 (i) an injunction against further disposition by the debtor or a  
7 transferee, or both, of the asset transferred or of other property;

8 (ii) appointment of a receiver to take charge of the asset transferred  
9 or of other property of the transferee; or

10 (iii) any other relief the circumstances may require.

11 (b) If a creditor has obtained a judgment on a claim against the  
12 debtor, the creditor, if the court so orders, may levy execution on the  
13 asset transferred or its proceeds.

14 § 277. Defenses, liability, and protection of transferee or obligee.

15 (a) A transfer or obligation is not voidable under paragraph one of  
16 subdivision (a) of section two hundred seventy-three of this article  
17 against a person that took in good faith and for a reasonably equivalent  
18 value given the debtor or against any subsequent transferee or obligee.

19 (b) To the extent a transfer is avoidable in an action by a creditor  
20 under paragraph one of subdivision (a) of section two hundred seventy-  
21 six of this article the following rules apply:

22 (1) Except as otherwise provided in this section, the creditor may  
23 recover judgment for the value of the asset transferred, as adjusted  
24 under subdivision (c) of this section, or the amount necessary to satis-  
25 fy the creditor's claim, whichever is less. The judgment may be entered  
26 against:

27 (i) the first transferee of the asset or the person for whose benefit  
28 the transfer was made; or

29 (ii) an immediate or mediate transferee of the first transferee, other  
30 than:

31 (A) a good-faith transferee that took for value; or

32 (B) an immediate or mediate good-faith transferee of a person  
33 described in clause (A) of this subparagraph.

34 (2) Recovery pursuant to paragraph one of subdivision (a) or subdivi-  
35 sion (b) of section two hundred seventy-six of this article of or from  
36 the asset transferred or its proceeds, by levy or otherwise, is avail-  
37 able only against a person described in subparagraph (i) or (ii) of  
38 paragraph one of this subdivision.

39 (c) If the judgment under subdivision (b) of this section is based  
40 upon the value of the asset transferred, the judgment must be for an  
41 amount equal to the value of the asset at the time of the transfer,  
42 subject to adjustment as the equities may require.

43 (d) Notwithstanding voidability of a transfer or an obligation under  
44 this article, a good-faith transferee or obligee is entitled, to the  
45 extent of the value given the debtor for the transfer or obligation, to:

46 (1) a lien on or a right to retain an interest in the asset trans-  
47 ferred;

48 (2) enforcement of an obligation incurred; or

49 (3) a reduction in the amount of the liability on the judgment.

50 (e) A transfer is not voidable under paragraph two of subdivision (a)  
51 of section two hundred seventy-three or section two hundred seventy-four  
52 of this article if the transfer results from:

53 (1) termination of a lease upon default by the debtor when the termi-  
54 nation is pursuant to the lease and applicable law; or



(2) enforcement of a security interest in compliance with article nine of the uniform commercial code, other than acceptance of collateral in full or partial satisfaction of the obligation it secures.

(f) A transfer is not voidable under subdivision (b) of section two hundred seventy-four of this article:

(1) to the extent the insider gave new value to or for the benefit of the debtor after the transfer was made, except to the extent the new value was secured by a valid lien;

(2) if made in the ordinary course of business or financial affairs of the debtor and the insider; or

(3) if made pursuant to a good-faith effort to rehabilitate the debtor and the transfer secured present value given for that purpose as well as an antecedent debt of the debtor.

(g) The following rules determine the burden of proving matters referred to in this section:

(1) A party that seeks to invoke subdivision (a), (d), (e) or (f) of this section has the burden of proving the applicability of that subdivision.

(2) Except as otherwise provided in paragraphs three and four of this subdivision, the creditor has the burden of proving each applicable element of subdivision (b) or (c) of this section.

(3) The transferee has the burden of proving the applicability to the transferee of clause (A) or (B) of subparagraph (ii) of paragraph one of subdivision (b) of this section.

(4) A party that seeks adjustment under subdivision (c) of this section has the burden of proving the adjustment.

(h) The standard of proof required to establish matters referred to in this section is preponderance of the evidence.

§ 278. Extinguishment of claim for relief. A claim for relief with respect to a transfer or obligation under this article is extinguished unless action is brought:

(a) under paragraph one of subdivision (a) of section two hundred seventy-three of this article, not later than four years after the transfer was made or the obligation was incurred or, if later, not later than one year after the transfer or obligation was or could reasonably have been discovered by the claimant;

(b) under paragraph two of subdivision (a) of section two hundred seventy-three or subdivision (a) of section two hundred seventy-four of this article, not later than four years after the transfer was made or the obligation was incurred; or

(c) under subdivision (b) of section two hundred seventy-four of this article, not later than one year after the transfer was made.

§ 279. Governing law. (a) In this section, the following rules determine a debtor's location:

(1) A debtor who is an individual is located at the individual's principal residence.

(2) A debtor that is an organization and has only one place of business is located at its place of business.

(3) A debtor that is an organization and has more than one place of business is located at its chief executive office.

(b) A claim for relief in the nature of a claim for relief under this article is governed by the local law of the jurisdiction in which the debtor is located when the transfer is made or the obligation is incurred.

§ 280. Supplementary provisions. Unless displaced by the provisions of this article, the principles of law and equity, including the law

1 merchant and the law relating to principal and agent, estoppel, laches,  
2 fraud, misrepresentation, duress, coercion, mistake, insolvency, or  
3 other validating or invalidating cause, supplement its provisions.

4 § 281. Uniformity of application and construction. This article shall  
5 be applied and construed to effectuate its general purpose to make  
6 uniform the law with respect to the subject of this article among states  
7 enacting it.

8 § 281-a. Relation to electronic signatures in global and national  
9 commerce act. This article modifies, limits, or supersedes the Electron-  
10 ic Signatures in Global and National Commerce Act, 15 U.S.C. Section  
11 7001 et seq., but does not modify, limit, or supersede Section 101(c) of  
12 that act, 15 U.S.C. Section 7001(c), or authorize electronic delivery of  
13 any of the notices described in Section 103(b) of that act, 15 U.S.C.  
14 Section 7003(b).

15 § 3. Paragraph 5 of subdivision (c) of section 5205 of the civil prac-  
16 tice law and rules, as amended by chapter 93 of the laws of 1995, is  
17 amended to read as follows:

18 5. Additions to an asset described in paragraph two of this subdivi-  
19 sion shall not be exempt from application to the satisfaction of a money  
20 judgment if (i) made after the date that is ninety days before the  
21 interposition of the claim on which such judgment was entered, or (ii)  
22 deemed to be [~~fraudulent conveyances~~] voidable transactions under arti-  
23 cle ten of the debtor and creditor law.

24 § 4. Subdivision (g) of section 5519 of the civil practice law and  
25 rules, as added by chapter 184 of the laws of 1988, is amended to read  
26 as follows:

27 (g) Appeals in medical, dental or podiatric malpractice judgments. In  
28 an action for medical, dental or podiatric malpractice, if an appeal is  
29 taken from a judgment in excess of one million dollars and an undertak-  
30 ing in the amount of one million dollars or the limit of insurance  
31 coverage available to the appellant for the occurrence, whichever is  
32 greater, is given together with a joint undertaking by the appellant and  
33 any insurer of the appellant's professional liability that, during the  
34 period of such stay, the appellant will make no [~~fraudulent conveyance~~  
35 ~~without fair consideration~~] voidable transaction as described in  
36 [~~section two hundred seventy-three-a~~] article ten of the debtor and  
37 creditor law, the court to which such an appeal is taken shall stay all  
38 proceedings to enforce the judgment pending such appeal if it finds that  
39 there is a reasonable probability that the judgment may be reversed or  
40 determined excessive. In making a determination under this subdivision,  
41 the court shall not consider the availability of a stay pursuant to  
42 subdivision (a) or (b) of this section. Liability under such joint  
43 undertaking shall be limited to [~~fraudulent conveyances~~] voidable trans-  
44 actions made by the appellant subsequent to the execution of such under-  
45 taking and during the period of such stay, but nothing herein shall  
46 limit the liability of the appellant for [~~fraudulent conveyances~~] voida-  
47 ble transactions pursuant to article ten of the debtor and creditor law  
48 or any other law. An insurer that pays money to a beneficiary of such a  
49 joint undertaking shall thereupon be subrogated, to the extent of the  
50 amount to be paid, to the rights and interests of such beneficiary, as a  
51 judgment creditor, against the appellant on whose behalf the joint  
52 undertaking was executed.

53 § 5. Subparagraph 4 of paragraph (b) of section 7-3.1 of the estates,  
54 powers and trusts law, as amended by chapter 206 of the laws of 1998, is  
55 amended to read as follows:



(4) Additions to an asset described in subparagraph one of this paragraph shall not be exempt from application to the satisfaction of a money judgment if (i) made after the date that is ninety days before the interposition of the claim on which such judgment was entered, or (ii) deemed to be [~~fraudulent conveyances~~] voidable transactions under article ten of the debtor and creditor law.

§ 6. Paragraph 3 of subdivision 3-a of section 50 of the workers' compensation law, as amended by chapter 139 of the laws of 2008, is amended to read as follows:

(3) A member's participation in a group self-insurer shall not relieve it of its liability for compensation prescribed by this chapter except by the payment thereof by the group self-insurer or by itself. Each member shall be responsible, jointly and severally, for all liabilities of the group self-insurer provided for by this chapter occurring during its respective period of membership, and such liability shall attach to any recipient of a conveyance of assets made in violation of subdivision (a) of section two hundred [~~seventy-three~~] seventy-four of the debtor and creditor law. As between the employee and the group self-insurer, notice to or knowledge of the occurrence of the injury on the part of the member shall be deemed notice or knowledge, as the case may be, on the part of the group self-insurer; jurisdiction of the member shall, for the purpose of this chapter, be jurisdiction of the group self-insurer and such group self-insurer shall in all things be bound by and subject to the orders, findings, decisions or awards rendered against the participating member for the payment of compensation under the provisions of this chapter. The insolvency or bankruptcy of a participating member shall not relieve the group self-insurer from the payment of compensation for injuries or death sustained by an employee during the time the member was a participant in such group self-insurer. Notice of termination of a participating member shall not be effective until at least ten days after notice of such termination, on a prescribed form, has been either filed in the office of the chair or sent by certified or registered letter, return receipt requested, and also served in like manner upon the member. In the event such termination is due to a member's failure to pay required contributions, such member's termination shall not be rescinded more than three times.

§ 7. This act shall take effect one hundred twenty days after it shall have become law, and shall apply to a transfer made or obligation incurred on or after such effective date, but shall not apply to a transfer made or obligation incurred before such effective date, nor shall it apply to a right of action that has accrued before such effective date. For the purposes of this act, a transfer is made and an obligation is incurred at the time provided in section 275 of the debtor and creditor law, as added by section two of this act.