

# STATE OF NEW YORK

---

1332

2017-2018 Regular Sessions

## IN SENATE

January 9, 2017

---

Introduced by Sen. VALESKY -- read twice and ordered printed, and when printed to be committed to the Committee on Transportation

AN ACT to amend the vehicle and traffic law, in relation to establishing the behavioral-based driver retraining programs; to amend the state finance law, in relation to establishing the behavioral-based driver retraining pilot program fund; and providing for the repeal of such provisions upon expiration thereof

The People of the State of New York, represented in Senate and Assembly, do enact as follows:

1 Section 1. Legislative intent. The legislature hereby declares that  
2 drivers in the state who have reached the point of revocation for traf-  
3 fic violations have proven themselves to be problem drivers. In order to  
4 provide meaningful safeguards for the general public who are users of  
5 the highways, it is determined that additional training is needed for  
6 these problem drivers. For this reason, the legislature directs the  
7 department of motor vehicles to implement a five-year driver retraining  
8 pilot program, requiring those drivers who have reached the point of  
9 revocation, in relevant instances, to complete a behavioral-based  
10 retraining course to force a change in the attitude and driving habits  
11 of problem drivers in order to have their license reinstated.

12 § 2. Subdivision 5 of section 510 of the vehicle and traffic law, as  
13 amended by chapter 183 of the laws of 1988, is amended as follows:

14 5. Restoration. A [~~license or~~] registration may be restored by direc-  
15 tion of the commissioner but not otherwise. A license may be restored  
16 by direction of the commissioner but not otherwise; in addition, the  
17 completion of a driver retraining program as described in article  
18 twelve-D of this chapter in accordance with subdivision five-a of this  
19 section shall be required for the restoration of a license from revoca-  
20 tion in accordance with paragraphs a and c of subdivision two, subdivi-  
21 sion two-a, and subdivision three of this section, with the exception of  
22 subparagraphs (ii) and (iii) of paragraph a of subdivision two of this

EXPLANATION--Matter in italics (underscored) is new; matter in brackets  
[-] is old law to be omitted.

LBD06982-01-7

1 section. Reversal on appeal, of any conviction because of which any  
2 license or registration has been revoked or suspended, shall entitle the  
3 holder to restoration thereof forthwith. The privileges of a non-resi-  
4 dent may be restored by direction of the commissioner in his discretion  
5 but not otherwise.

6 § 3. Section 510 of the vehicle and traffic law is amended by adding a  
7 new subdivision 5-a to read as follows:

8 5-a. Driver retraining required. A license revoked in accordance with  
9 paragraphs a and c of subdivision two, subdivision two-a, and subdivi-  
10 sion three of this section, with the exception of subparagraphs (ii) and  
11 (iii) of paragraph a of subdivision two of this section, may be rein-  
12 stated, restored, or reissued only upon completion of a driver retrain-  
13 ing course as described in article twelve-D of this chapter in addition  
14 to the requirements of this section. Upon completion of the driver  
15 retraining course, the vendor of the course shall notify the department  
16 of such completion.

17 § 4. The vehicle and traffic law is amended by adding a new article  
18 12-D to read as follows:

#### 19 ARTICLE 12-D

##### 20 BEHAVIORAL-BASED DRIVER RETRAINING PROGRAM

21 Section 399-p. Statement of purpose.

22 399-q. Definitions.

23 399-r. Course approval by the commissioner.

24 399-s. Application for course approval.

25 399-t. Standards for course approval.

26 399-u. Monitoring retrained drivers and proof of effectiveness.

27 399-v. Deployment of program.

28 399-w. Information to the vendor.

29 399-x. Notifications of drivers.

30 399-y. Fee.

31 399-z. Regulations.

32 399-aa. Report.

33 399-bb. Reapproval of driver retraining courses.

34 § 399-p. Statement of purpose. The purposes of this article are to  
35 further highway safety by establishing a program of high quality and  
36 effective behavioral-based driver retraining to rehabilitate problem  
37 drivers, as defined in this article, through the use of education and  
38 explanation. A behavioral-based driver retraining program must influence  
39 and challenge participants to change their behind-the-wheel behaviors  
40 and attitudes so they will choose to drive safely, responsibly, respect-  
41 fully, and lawfully and provide participants with the knowledge, skills,  
42 and techniques to improve their driving-related choices, and thereby  
43 avoid collisions and decrease future violations. These purposes will be  
44 accomplished by establishing strict criteria for initial and continual  
45 course sponsorship approval.

46 § 399-q. Definitions. For the purposes of this article, the following  
47 terms shall have the following definitions:

48 1. "Problem driver" shall mean a driver that has reached the point of  
49 revocation of license, due to traffic infractions, demonstrating he or  
50 she is an unusual or immediate risk upon the highways, pursuant to  
51 subdivision five-a of section five hundred ten of this chapter.

52 2. "Vendor" shall mean a not-for-profit organization which implements  
53 the program and designs, provides, conducts, and audits a behavioral-  
54 based driver retraining program approved by the commissioner.

55 3. "Instructor" shall mean an individual employed by a vendor to teach  
56 an approved driver retraining course.

1 4. "Driver retraining course" or "course" shall mean the classroom-  
2 based behavioral-based driver retraining course curriculum which has  
3 been approved by the commissioner.

4 5. "Completion certificate" shall mean a document which cannot be  
5 altered and which is provided to the student who successfully completes  
6 the driver retraining course.

7 § 399-r. Course approval by the commissioner. The commissioner shall  
8 approve a driver retraining course before any person attending and  
9 successfully completing such course may qualify to receive mandatory  
10 reinstatement, restoration, or reissuance of a license in accordance  
11 with this article and section five hundred ten of this chapter. The  
12 commissioner shall base the decision to approve a course upon the  
13 requirements set forth in this article and any additional requirements  
14 as the commissioner deems necessary.

15 § 399-s. Application for course approval. 1. A vendor seeking approval  
16 as a behavioral-based driver retraining course shall apply to the  
17 commissioner for approval. Such applications shall be made in writing  
18 and on forms prescribed by the commissioner. The application shall  
19 include at a minimum:

20 (a) the title or name of the course;

21 (b) the name of the vendor submitting the application;

22 (c) a profile of the vendor's operations, qualifications, and organ-  
23 izational capabilities including:

24 (i) a detailed description of its resources and experience relevant to  
25 the requirements to deliver this program.

26 (ii) a narrative on how and why its organization is capable of meeting  
27 the needs relevant to the delivery of this program.

28 (iii) at least three client references, including name, address,  
29 contact person, telephone number, months and years of service, and a  
30 description of the services that the vendor provided to the client;

31 (d) evidence of financial stability in the form of audited financial  
32 statements for the most recent financial year of the vendor for which  
33 statements are available including:

34 (i) statements which demonstrate that the vendor's organization is in  
35 sound financial condition, or that appropriate corrective action is  
36 being taken to resolve all identified financial problems.

37 (ii) if statements are not available for the last fiscal year, then  
38 the vendor may provide a pro forma statement of their most recent  
39 filings. If the vendor is a privately held entity that does not wish to  
40 submit its balance sheets and revenue statements, it shall demonstrate  
41 to the satisfaction of the commissioner that it is a financially stable  
42 organization.

43 (iii) alternative information which may be submitted includes, but is  
44 not limited to: number of employees, size of customer base, name of  
45 bank, name of law firm, name of accounting firm, rate of growth, approx-  
46 imate assets and liabilities.

47 (iv) additional information as the commissioner deems necessary;

48 (e) proof of curriculum ownership;

49 (f) a sample program curriculum;

50 (g) proof of course effectiveness as required in subdivision two of  
51 section three hundred ninety-nine-u of this article;

52 (h) proof of experience electronically registering, scheduling and  
53 maintaining records for all participants in a multi-site training  
54 program;

55 (i) the names and addresses of all owners, officers, and directors of  
56 the agency or organization;

1 (j) statement certifying that the vendor can provide the personnel  
2 sufficient to delivery of the program statewide through the term of the  
3 contract and how this commitment will be met; and

4 (k) such other information or material as the commissioner may  
5 prescribe. An application shall not be considered to be complete until  
6 all information and material required by this chapter and by regulation  
7 of the commissioner has been submitted.

8 2. The commissioner shall either approve or deny an application for  
9 course approval no later than ninety days following submission of a  
10 completed application.

11 § 399-t. Standards for course approval. 1. Course approval. To be  
12 approved, a vendor must:

13 (a) provide a curriculum in accordance with the requirements of this  
14 section that includes at least four hundred thirty minutes of instruc-  
15 tion with a certified instructor present presented in a single day or a  
16 two day session. Nothing in this section shall prevent the use of  
17 audio/visual aids as part of the course presentation prescribed by the  
18 commissioner.

19 (b) have provided the course for at least ten years prior to the  
20 submission of an application.

21 (c) have administered driver retraining on a large volume basis in a  
22 class room environment to a minimum of at least fifty thousand persons  
23 in a calendar year.

24 (d) provide a description of the minimum qualifications of all manag-  
25 ers and instructors who will be hired by the applicant.

26 (e) provide each instructor with an instructor's manual and provide  
27 student workbooks and/or manuals for each course participant.

28 (f) provide proof of effectiveness pursuant to section three hundred  
29 ninety-nine-u of this article.

30 2. Curriculum. To be approved, the curriculum of the driver retraining  
31 course provided for in this article shall include at least the follow-  
32 ing:

33 (a) proven educational or psychological principals/methodologies such  
34 as Dr. William Glasser's "Choice Theory" as it relates to behind-the-  
35 wheel driving behavior;

36 (b) why drivers do or do not choose to obey traffic laws with the  
37 primary focus on behaviors rather than excuses;

38 (c) four components of human behavior - doing, thinking, feeling and  
39 physiology and the connection between the concepts of needs and wants to  
40 behaviors and the human ability to choose behaviors.

41 (d) additional problem driver behaviors including, but not limited to:  
42 hazards associated with prescriptive and over-the-counter drugs, includ-  
43 ing synergism; impacts of driving with excessive speed; impacts of  
44 right-of-way violations; dangers of distracted driving; proper passing  
45 and following distances; aggressive driving behaviors; and how fatigue  
46 can affect driving behavior.

47 3. Schedules and facilities. (a) Vendor shall set and adhere to  
48 published schedules of training classes at designated places, dates and  
49 times. Vendor shall submit training class schedule and locations to the  
50 commissioner quarterly.

51 (b) Vendor shall offer classes at locations throughout the state.

52 (c) Vendor shall offer a variety of night and weekend courses.

53 (d) Vendor shall be responsible for securing, and/or obtaining permis-  
54 sion for the use of appropriate classroom teaching facilities used for  
55 re-training programs.

1 (e) Vendor shall be responsible for any costs associated with the use  
2 of such facilities, including, but not limited to, rent, lights, heat  
3 and insurance, and no reimbursement or indemnification for such costs  
4 will be provided by the commissioner.

5 (f) Vendor shall assure that the facilities and program elements for  
6 retraining problem drivers are accessible to drivers with physical disa-  
7 bilities and in compliance with the requirements of the Americans with  
8 Disabilities Act of 1990.

9 (g) Vendor shall agree that the commissioner reserves the right to  
10 reject, at any time, the use of any facility he or she deems unfit for  
11 classroom instruction or geographically inconvenient for the regis-  
12 trants.

13 4. Business office and telephone. (a) Vendor shall maintain a business  
14 office in the state which shall be staffed Monday through Friday,  
15 between the hours of 9:00 am and 5:00 pm, to provide the administrative  
16 support necessary for successfully maintaining the program.

17 (b) Vendor shall agree to provide a toll-free telephone exchange  
18 service number for program registration use.

19 (c) Vendor shall agree to provide a website for program information  
20 and registration use.

21 5. Method of instruction. (a) Vendor shall agree to design a curric-  
22 ulum based upon the theory that inducing positive changes in attitude  
23 and driving behavior of a person who has been identified as a problem  
24 driver, as defined in this article, is a proven method of successful  
25 driver retraining.

26 (b) Vendor shall have experience in designing and implementing a  
27 curriculum based upon proven educational or psychological principles,  
28 which may include, but not be limited to, methodologies such as Dr.  
29 William Glasser's "Choice Theory." While the commissioner may consider  
30 different educational approaches based upon the objective merits of  
31 each, it is essential that any proposed curriculum be guided by a clear  
32 and consistent educational philosophy. The effectiveness of that philos-  
33 ophy in modifying the types of behavior that may lead to the need for  
34 driver retraining shall be clearly demonstrated.

35 (c) The curriculum shall include different forms of media to address a  
36 diverse community. The training shall include videos of different styles  
37 of driving aggressions and ways to defuse these aggressions.

38 (d) The proposed curriculum shall encourage the problem driver to  
39 explore and understand his or her own attitudes in various driving situ-  
40 ations and to also understand the behavioral driving characteristics  
41 that have resulted in the driver's poor driving record. The proposed  
42 program shall teach the problem driver that poor behavioral choices made  
43 behind the wheel often result in unintended consequences, including  
44 motor vehicle violations, or accidents, and that the driver shall appre-  
45 ciate the responsibility placed upon each driver to conform his or her  
46 driving conduct for the benefit of other motorists, pedestrians, and  
47 themselves. Training shall be highly interactive, engaging and take  
48 advantage of various forms of media. Classes shall maintain an appropri-  
49 ate student to instructor ratio.

50 6. Out-of-state drivers and out-of-state programs. (a) When the  
51 commissioner identifies an out-of-state driver as a problem driver, as  
52 defined in this article, the vendor shall notify the driver of the  
53 availability of the course in New York state using the same means of  
54 notification for in-state problem drivers. Vendor shall also notify the  
55 out-of-state driver of the name and location of similar programs in the



1 driver's home state, which may qualify for recognition by the commis-  
2 sioner.

3 (b) Vendor shall assist the commissioner in determining which out-of-  
4 state programs meet the criteria established in the state for a driver  
5 retraining program.

6 (c) Vendor shall coordinate with qualified programs to receive and  
7 disseminate information and referrals about problem drivers and about  
8 the retraining programs.

9 (d) If a qualified out-of-state program notifies the vendor of the  
10 successful completion of the program by an individual problem driver  
11 referred from the commissioner, the vendor shall electronically notify  
12 the commissioner of such completion.

13 7. Electronic communication. (a) Vendor shall agree that it possesses  
14 or will obtain computer hardware/software that is compatible with the  
15 hardware/software of the department to allow the vendor and the depart-  
16 ment to exchange information directly into each other's computer systems  
17 as required.

18 (b) Vendor shall agree that the department will electronically notify  
19 the vendor of the names and addresses of the problem drivers requiring  
20 retraining.

21 (c) Vendor shall agree that it shall then notify, by letter approved  
22 by the commissioner, each identified problem driver of the availability  
23 of the course and the required fee.

24 (d) Vendor shall agree that, within one business day of the successful  
25 completion of the course by a driver, it will electronically notify the  
26 department through an established computer link.

27 8. Costs, fees and transfers. (a) Vendor shall assume all costs of the  
28 driver retraining program.

29 (b) Vendor shall agree that each driver required to enroll in the  
30 driver retraining program will be assessed a reasonable and uniform fee  
31 for the course. Such fee shall not be in excess of the quote of the  
32 vendor.

33 (c) Vendor shall arrange for and collect payment of the fee from the  
34 registrant.

35 (d) Vendor shall deposit to a designated account of the department by  
36 way of electronic funds transfer as instructed by the commissioner, the  
37 agreed upon fee collected from the registrant as reimbursement of  
38 department program costs.

39 (e) Vendor shall be responsible for any costs associated with the  
40 collection of checks drawn on insufficient funds, or on unpaid registra-  
41 tion fees. The department will not refund its fee if the vendor fails to  
42 recover from the student.

43 9. Personnel. The vendor shall provide a team of personnel consisting  
44 of one account manager and personnel sufficient for the delivery of the  
45 program statewide.

46 (a) Vendor shall agree to immediately remove any person performing  
47 services under a resulting contract who is, in the judgment of the  
48 department, disqualified by reason of ethics, competence, criminal  
49 behavior, or motor vehicle violations, or any cause whatsoever, from  
50 doing commerce with, or providing services for the state. Such person  
51 may be reinstated by the vendor only upon clear written notice of the  
52 approval of the commissioner.

53 (b) Vendor shall agree that it accepts full responsibility for the  
54 performance of any sub-contractors, if used. The vendor may sub-contract  
55 the services required to deliver this program, but the department shall  
56 require a single point of responsibility for this contract. As prime

1 contractor, the vendor shall identify any and all sub-contractors and  
2 shall describe the type of contractual arrangement that will exist  
3 between the vendor and the sub-contractors. Vendor shall agree that it  
4 shall be responsible for meeting all of the terms and conditions of any  
5 contract resulting, including the performance of any sub-contractors.  
6 The department shall not be responsible for payments due a sub-contrac-  
7 tor from the primary contractor.

8 (c) Vendor shall agree in its response that each person performing  
9 services under this contract shall meet the following requirements:

10 (i) Vendor shall agree to employ only those individuals as instructors  
11 who would be reasonably considered qualified instructors for such course  
12 by reason of their educational attainments, teaching experience and  
13 familiarity with the subject matter and methods used to successfully  
14 retrain problem drivers as defined in this article.

15 (ii) An otherwise qualified instructor shall not be used in any of the  
16 driver re-training program if the person is ineligible to obtain or  
17 retain driving privileges in any jurisdiction. The department may also  
18 reject the use of any particular instructor if the department has reason  
19 to believe that the instructor is not properly qualified as a retraining  
20 instructor.

21 10. The commissioner is authorized to suspend or revoke approval of a  
22 vendor should the commissioner find that the vendor or its instructors  
23 have been found to be in violation of any applicable laws or regu-  
24 lations.

25 § 399-u. Monitoring retrained drivers and proof of effectiveness. 1.  
26 Monitoring retrained drivers. (a) Vendor shall agree that the department  
27 may monitor driving records of persons who have taken and passed the  
28 vendor's driver retraining program.

29 (b) Vendor shall agree that the department may require the vendor to  
30 periodically provide the department with information it reasonably  
31 believes necessary to monitor the performance of the vendor, including  
32 but not limited to, information on numbers of students, number of class-  
33 es held, class size, location and frequency of classes, and pass/fail  
34 rate.

35 (c) Vendor shall agree to submit on a monthly basis a reconciliation  
36 report detailing the number of drivers that have been retrained and the  
37 amount of funds transferred to the department.

38 (d) Vendor shall agree to collaborate with the department to create a  
39 survey at the end of the class to capture student feedback on their  
40 experience.

41 2. Proof of effectiveness. (a) Proof of effectiveness submitted by the  
42 vendor for sponsorship shall be verifiable research documentation show-  
43 ing evidence of effectiveness as determined by the commissioner in terms  
44 of reduced convictions or accidents or both. This research documentation  
45 shall employ accepted research principles. In order to establish veri-  
46 fiability effectiveness, the sample group shall be comprised of a minimum  
47 of three thousand drivers. The documentation shall include conviction  
48 or accident data for each motorist for a period of at least eighteen  
49 months prior to the revocation date and at least eighteen months subse-  
50 quent to reissuance of license. The documentation shall also include a  
51 description of the sampling and analytic procedures used, and the motor-  
52 ist identification number and course completion date for all course  
53 attendees. The vendor for sponsorship shall provide, at the request of  
54 the commissioner and at the applicant's expense, all driving record data  
55 and analysis used in the development of the submitted research documen-  
56 tation. Submission of any fraudulent or intentionally misleading data

1 will disqualify that organization and all owners and principals from  
2 participating or approval in the driver retraining course for a period  
3 of ten years from submission date. The commissioner may, by regulation,  
4 provide for a smaller sample group for specialized courses.

5 (b) Prior to the end of the pilot program, the vendor shall conduct a  
6 study of the effectiveness of the driver retraining program conducted in  
7 the state. This proof of effectiveness shall be verifiable research  
8 documentation showing evidence of effectiveness as determined by the  
9 commissioner in terms of reduced convictions or accidents or both. This  
10 research documentation shall employ accepted research principles and  
11 include treatment and non-treatment control groups comprised of samples  
12 of the representative driver base. In order to establish verifiable  
13 effectiveness, each sample group shall be comprised of a minimum of  
14 three thousand drivers selected randomly. The documentation shall  
15 include conviction or accident data for each motorist for a period of at  
16 least eighteen months prior to the revocation date and at least eighteen  
17 months subsequent to reissuance of license. The documentation shall also  
18 include a description of the sampling and analytic procedures used, and  
19 the motorist identification number and course completion date for all  
20 course attendees. The vendor shall provide, at the request of the  
21 commissioner and at the applicant's expense, all driving record data and  
22 analysis used in the development of the submitted research documenta-  
23 tion.

24 § 399-v. Deployment of program. Vendor shall propose and provide a  
25 start-up deployment plan. The proposed start-up deployment plan timeta-  
26 ble shall include realistic milestone dates to indicate when the vendor  
27 will meet certain targets. The vendor's start-up deployment plan shall  
28 include:

29 1. the number of class locations the vendor intends to have opera-  
30 tional by specific dates;

31 2. the number of instructors the vendor plans to hire by specific  
32 dates;

33 3. plans to test its computer compatibility with the department data  
34 center; and

35 4. a realistic start-up date for full operations of the proposed driv-  
36 er retraining program.

37 § 399-w. Information to the vendor. 1. The department will provide the  
38 vendor with the names, addresses, and license numbers of those individ-  
39 uals who are required to successfully complete a course of driver  
40 retraining by electronic media.

41 2. All data provided to the vendor shall be kept in accordance with  
42 the requirements of the Driver Privacy Protection Act and any related  
43 state requirements.

44 3. The selected vendor will be required to enter into a data privacy  
45 agreement with the department once a contract has been awarded.

46 4. The department will update the driver's record upon notification by  
47 the vendor of the driver's successful completion of the re-training  
48 program.

49 5. The department shall provide the vendor with relevant data neces-  
50 sary for the completion of the required effectiveness study.

51 § 399-x. Notifications of drivers. The department shall notify those  
52 individual drivers that are required to successfully complete the driver  
53 retraining program of this requirement.

54 § 399-y. Fee. The vendor is authorized to impose a fee for partic-  
55 ipation in the behavioral-based driver retraining program. The depart-  
56 ment shall receive a portion of the fee not to exceed two-fifths.



1     § 399-z. Regulations. The commissioner shall promulgate such rules and  
2 regulations as are necessary to effectuate the provisions of this arti-  
3 cle. In addition to any requirements expressly authorized by this arti-  
4 cle, such regulations may include, but not be limited to, requirements  
5 and standards with respect to: vendors and instructors; classroom facil-  
6 ities; suspension or revocation of approval; appeal of revocation;  
7 course administration and advertising; monitoring of courses and  
8 instructors; and reevaluation of course effectiveness pursuant to  
9 section three hundred ninety-nine-u of this article.

10    § 399-aa. Report. Within five years of the establishment and implemen-  
11 tation of this article, the commissioner shall report to the governor,  
12 the temporary president of the senate and the speaker of the assembly on  
13 the driver retraining program and its results. Such report shall include  
14 recommendations as to the future of the program.

15    § 399-bb. Reapproval of driver retraining courses. Nothing in this  
16 article shall be deemed to require the commissioner to reapprove motor  
17 vehicle driver retraining courses approved by the commissioner pursuant  
18 to rules and regulations prior to the effective date of this article.

19    § 5. The state finance law is amended by adding a new section 99-aa to  
20 read as follows:

21    § 99-aa. Behavioral-based driver retraining pilot program fund. 1.  
22 There is hereby established in the joint custody of the state comp-  
23 troller and the commissioner of taxation and finance a special fund to  
24 be known as the "driver retraining pilot program fund".

25    2. Such fund shall consist of all fees received by the department of  
26 motor vehicles pursuant to the provisions of article twelve-D of the  
27 vehicle and traffic law, and all other moneys appropriated, credited or  
28 transferred thereto from any other fund or source pursuant to law.

29    3. The moneys in such fund shall be expended only for the purposes of  
30 administering and implementing the provisions of article twelve-D of the  
31 vehicle and traffic law by the department of motor vehicles.

32    § 6. This act shall take effect one year after it shall have become a  
33 law and shall expire and be deemed repealed 5 years after the date the  
34 behavioral-based driver retraining pilot program is established and  
35 implemented by the commissioner of motor vehicles pursuant to article  
36 12-D of the vehicle and traffic law as added by section four of this  
37 act; provided however, that effective immediately, the addition, amend-  
38 ment, or repeal of any rule or regulation necessary for the implementa-  
39 tion of this act shall be made and completed on or before such effective  
40 date; and provided further, however, that the commissioner of motor  
41 vehicles shall notify the legislative bill drafting commission upon the  
42 date the behavioral-based driver retraining pilot program is established  
43 and implemented in order that the commission may maintain an accurate  
44 and timely effective data base of the official text of the laws of the  
45 state of New York in furtherance of effectuating the provisions of  
46 section 44 of the legislative law and section 70-b of the public offi-  
47 cers law.