

4307

2015-2016 Regular Sessions

I N S E N A T E

March 12, 2015

Introduced by Sen. KRUEGER -- read twice and ordered printed, and when printed to be committed to the Committee on Investigations and Government Operations

AN ACT to amend the public officers law, the arts and cultural affairs law, the executive law and the legislative law, in relation to the retention of state electronic records; and to repeal subdivision 1 of section 88 of the public officers law, relating to rules and regulations governing access to state legislative records; to repeal section 5 of the executive law, relating to executive records; and to repeal section 70-0113 of the environmental conservation law, relating to information confidentially disclosed by applicants

THE PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK, REPRESENTED IN SENATE AND ASSEMBLY, DO ENACT AS FOLLOWS:

1 Section 1. Legislative intent. The legislature finds that procedures  
2 and practice that promote transparency and accountability in the execu-  
3 tive and legislative branches serve the public interest and encourage  
4 public faith in government. Current policies which allow for the  
5 destruction of emails and other electronic governmental records and  
6 exempt the legislature from the Freedom of Information Law (FOIL) run  
7 counter to these principles of transparency and accountability.  
8 Computers and other electronic devices create many of the new records  
9 we use today, most commonly via emails. These records, although elec-  
10 tronic in format, are the same as records in other formats. Electronic  
11 records show how you conduct business, make decisions, and carry out  
12 your work. They are evidence of decisions and actions. Fundamental  
13 records management principles should apply to electronic records, as  
14 they apply to other record formats.  
15 The executive branch has adopted a policy allowing automatic deletion  
16 of emails after 90 days, which has the potential to severely limit the  
17 public availability of vital information regarding the operations of  
18 agencies. The consequences of such a policy are illustrated in a 2015

EXPLANATION--Matter in *ITALICS* (underscored) is new; matter in brackets [ ] is old law to be omitted.

LBD09918-01-5

1 court case where the former Deputy Secretary for Gaming and Racing indi-  
2 cated he was "aghast" to find that emails dating from 2013 relevant to  
3 the case had been deleted. The deletion of these emails undermines the  
4 ability of the plaintiff in the case to seek redress. An administration  
5 spokesman defended deletion of the emails on the grounds they had not  
6 been the subject of a FOIL request.

7 This legislation would ensure that under the guidance of the State  
8 Archivist, agencies and legislative bodies would need to take a proac-  
9 tive approach to the preservation of electronic records. It would estab-  
10 lish strict standards for permanent preservation of the records of poli-  
11 cymakers, and prohibit deletion of emails from other government  
12 officials for at least seven years. It is modeled on federal policies  
13 adopted after extensive study of appropriate practices for handling  
14 electronic records. The state already uses email management software  
15 that would enable implementation of such a policy at minimal cost.

16 The exemption of the legislature from the Freedom of Information Law  
17 also undermines transparency and accountability. The public should have  
18 access to the same types of information from the legislature that it can  
19 already access from the Executive Branch through the FOIL process.  
20 Recent scandals involving individual legislators only highlight the need  
21 for increasing the availability of information regarding legislative  
22 records. This bill would establish the same standards for treating the  
23 Executive and Legislative branches under FOIL. The bill would also  
24 extend to the legislature the various exemptions from disclosure in the  
25 FOIL law, including records that would compromise personal privacy  
26 rights or that are related to internal deliberations of the body or  
27 agency.

28 S 2. Subdivision 3 of section 86 of the public officers law, as added  
29 by chapter 933 of the laws of 1977, is amended and a new subdivision 6  
30 is added to read as follows:

31 3. "Agency" means any state or municipal department, board, bureau,  
32 division, commission, committee, public authority, public corporation,  
33 council, office or other governmental entity performing a governmental  
34 or proprietary function for the state or any one or more municipalities  
35 thereof, except the judiciary [or the state legislature].

36 6. "ARCHIVES" MEANS ANY INSTITUTION THAT ARCHIVES RECORDS FOR THE  
37 STATE, AND PROVIDES A MEANS FOR PUBLIC ACCESS AND REVIEW OF SUCH  
38 RECORDS, INCLUDING A RESEARCH UNIVERSITY, THAT IS SELECTED BY THE GOVER-  
39 NOR FOR RECORD RETENTION.

40 S 3. Subdivision 1 of section 88 of the public officers law is  
41 REPEALED.

42 S 4. The public officers law is amended by adding a new section 88-a  
43 to read as follows:

44 S 88-A. ELECTRONIC RECORDS RETENTION. 1. EACH AGENCY, IN CONJUNCTION  
45 WITH THE STATE ARCHIVES, SHALL PRESERVE ELECTRONIC RECORDS IN ACCORDANCE  
46 WITH THE PROVISIONS OF THIS SECTION.

47 2. EACH AGENCY SHALL IDENTIFY THE ACCOUNTS OF PUBLIC OFFICERS, STATE  
48 OFFICIALS AND POLICY MAKERS WHO, BY VIRTUE OF THEIR WORK, OFFICE, OR  
49 POSITION, ARE LIKELY TO CREATE OR RECEIVE PERMANENTLY VALUABLE RECORDS.  
50 FOR THE PURPOSE OF THIS SECTION, "POLICY MAKER" MEANS ANY INDIVIDUAL  
51 SUBJECT TO SECTION SEVENTY-THREE-A OF THE PUBLIC OFFICERS LAW.

52 3. (A) THE PROVISIONS OF THIS SECTION AND OF ARTICLE SIX OF THIS CHAP-  
53 TER SHALL APPLY TO ALL AGENCY-ADMINISTERED EMAIL ACCOUNTS OF ANY PUBLIC  
54 OFFICER, STATE OFFICIAL OR POLICY MAKER, INCLUDING ACCOUNTS MANAGED BY  
55 OTHER STAFF, INCLUDING, BUT NOT LIMITED TO PERSONAL ASSISTANTS, CONFI-  
56 DENTIAL ASSISTANTS, OR ADMINISTRATIVE ASSISTANTS.

1 (B) THE PROVISIONS OF THIS SECTION AND OF ARTICLE SIX OF THIS CHAPTER  
2 SHALL APPLY TO ALL AGENCY-ADMINISTERED EMAIL ACCOUNTS OF ANY PUBLIC  
3 OFFICER, STATE OFFICIAL OR POLICY MAKER, REGARDLESS OF THE ADDRESS NAMES  
4 USED BY THE PUBLIC OFFICIAL FOR AGENCY BUSINESS.

5 4. ELECTRONIC RECORDS SHALL BE MAINTAINED IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE  
6 FOLLOWING GENERAL RECORDS RETENTION SCHEDULE:

7 (A) EMAIL OF POLICY MAKERS. AGENCIES SHALL TRANSFER DOCUMENTATION  
8 ADEQUATE TO IDENTIFY, SERVICE, AND INTERPRET THE PERMANENT ELECTRONIC  
9 RECORDS, WHICH INCLUDES THE POSITION TITLE AND BEGIN AND END DATES FOR  
10 EACH EMAIL ACCOUNT CAPTURED IN THIS SUBDIVISION. THE DISPOSITION OF  
11 EMAIL DESCRIBED IN THIS PARAGRAPH IS PERMANENT. SUCH EMAIL SHALL BE  
12 TRANSFERRED TO THE STATE ARCHIVES NO SOONER THAN FIFTEEN YEARS AFTER THE  
13 DATE OF THE EMAIL AND NO LATER THAN TWENTY-FIVE YEARS AFTER THE AGENCY  
14 DETERMINED CUT-OFF DATE.

15 (B) EMAIL OF OTHER OFFICIALS. AGENCIES SHALL TRANSFER DOCUMENTATION  
16 ADEQUATE TO IDENTIFY, SERVICE, AND INTERPRET THE PERMANENT ELECTRONIC  
17 RECORDS, WHICH INCLUDES THE POSITION TITLE AND BEGIN AND END DATES FOR  
18 EACH EMAIL ACCOUNT CAPTURED IN THIS SUBDIVISION. THE DISPOSITION OF  
19 EMAIL DESCRIBED IN THIS PARAGRAPH IS TEMPORARY. SUCH EMAIL SHALL BE  
20 TRANSFERRED TO THE STATE ARCHIVES NO SOONER THAN SEVEN YEARS AFTER THE  
21 DATE OF THE EMAIL, PROVIDED, HOWEVER, THAT LONGER RETENTION IS AUTHOR-  
22 IZED IF REQUIRED FOR BUSINESS USE BY THE AGENCY.

23 5. PRODUCTION OF ELECTRONIC RECORDS BY AGENCIES SHALL COMPLY WITH THE  
24 FOLLOWING PROVISIONS:

25 (A) AGENCIES SHALL TRANSFER TO THE STATE ARCHIVES DOCUMENTATION  
26 ADEQUATE TO IDENTIFY, SERVICE, AND INTERPRET THE PERMANENT ELECTRONIC  
27 RECORDS.

28 (B) DOCUMENTATION FOR DATA FILES AND DATA BASES MUST INCLUDE RECORD  
29 LAYOUTS, DATA ELEMENT DEFINITIONS, AND CODE TRANSLATION TABLES (CODE-  
30 BOOKS) FOR CODED DATA. DATA ELEMENT DEFINITIONS, CODES USED TO REPRESENT  
31 DATA VALUES, AND INTERPRETATIONS OF THESE CODES MUST MATCH THE ACTUAL  
32 FORMAT AND CODES AS TRANSFERRED.

33 (C) DIGITAL GEOSPATIAL DATA FILES MUST INCLUDE THE DOCUMENTATION SPEC-  
34 IFIED IN PARAGRAPH (B) OF THIS SUBDIVISION. IN ADDITION, DOCUMENTATION  
35 FOR DIGITAL GEOSPATIAL DATA FILES CAN INCLUDE METADATA THAT CONFORMS TO  
36 THE FEDERAL GEOGRAPHIC DATA COMMITTEE'S CONTENT STANDARDS FOR DIGITAL  
37 GEOSPATIAL METADATA, AS SPECIFIED IN EXECUTIVE ORDER 12906 OF APRIL 11,  
38 1994 (3 CFR, 1995 COMP., P. 882).

39 (D) DOCUMENTATION FOR ELECTRONIC FILES CONTAINING TEXTUAL DOCUMENTS  
40 WITH SGML TAGS MUST INCLUDE A TABLE FOR INTERPRETING THE SGML TAGS, WHEN  
41 APPROPRIATE.

42 (E) DOCUMENTATION FOR THE FOLLOWING TYPES OF ELECTRONIC RECORDS MUST  
43 CONFORM TO FORMATS SPECIFIED IN NATIONAL ARCHIVES AND RECORDS ADMINIS-  
44 TRATION BULLETIN 2014-04; APPENDIX A: REVISED FORMAT GUIDANCE FOR THE  
45 TRANSFER OF PERMANENT ELECTRONIC RECORDS. TABLES OF FILE FORMATS;  
46 PROVIDED, HOWEVER, THAT THE STATE ARCHIVE MAY APPROVE ADDITIONAL ACCEPT-  
47 ABLE FILE FORMATS:

- 48 (I) EMAIL MESSAGES WITH ATTACHMENTS;
- 49 (II) SCANNED IMAGES OF TEXTUAL RECORDS;
- 50 (III) RECORDS IN PORTABLE DOCUMENT FORMAT (PDF);
- 51 (IV) DIGITAL PHOTOGRAPHIC RECORDS; AND
- 52 (V) WEB CONTENT RECORDS.

53 6. (A) ANY AGGRIEVED PERSON SHALL HAVE STANDING TO ENFORCE THE  
54 PROVISIONS OF THIS SECTION AGAINST A PUBLIC BODY BY THE COMMENCEMENT OF  
55 A PROCEEDING PURSUANT TO ARTICLE SEVENTY-EIGHT OF THE CIVIL PRACTICE LAW  
56 AND RULES, OR AN ACTION FOR DECLARATORY JUDGMENT AND INJUNCTIVE RELIEF.

1 IN ANY SUCH ACTION OR PROCEEDING, IF A COURT DETERMINES THAT AN AGENCY  
2 FAILED TO COMPLY WITH THE PROVISIONS OF THIS SECTION, THE COURT SHALL  
3 HAVE THE POWER, IN ITS DISCRETION, UPON GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, TO DECLARE  
4 THAT THE AGENCY VIOLATED THE PROVISIONS OF THIS SECTION. IF THE COURT  
5 DETERMINES THAT AN AGENCY HAS VIOLATED THE PROVISIONS OF THIS SECTION,  
6 THE COURT MAY REQUIRE THE MEMBERS OF THE AGENCY TO PARTICIPATE IN A  
7 TRAINING SESSION CONCERNING THE OBLIGATIONS IMPOSED BY THIS SECTION  
8 CONDUCTED BY THE STAFF OF THE COMMITTEE ON OPEN GOVERNMENT.

9 (B) IN ANY PROCEEDING BROUGHT PURSUANT TO THIS SECTION, COSTS AND  
10 REASONABLE ATTORNEY'S FEES MAY BE AWARDED BY THE COURT, IN ITS  
11 DISCRETION, TO THE SUCCESSFUL PARTY. IF A COURT DETERMINES THAT AN ELEC-  
12 TRONIC RECORD WAS NOT RETAINED IN MATERIAL VIOLATION OF THIS ARTICLE,  
13 THE COURT SHALL AWARD COSTS AND REASONABLE ATTORNEY'S FEES TO THE  
14 SUCCESSFUL PETITIONER, UNLESS THERE WAS A REASONABLE BASIS FOR THE AGEN-  
15 CY TO BELIEVE THAT IT WAS IN COMPLIANCE WITH THE PROVISIONS OF THIS  
16 SECTION.

17 (C) THE STATUTE OF LIMITATIONS IN AN ARTICLE SEVENTY-EIGHT PROCEEDING  
18 WITH RESPECT TO AN ACTION TAKEN AT EXECUTIVE SESSION SHALL COMMENCE TO  
19 RUN FROM THE DATE THE ELECTRONIC RECORD AT ISSUE HAS BEEN MADE AVAILABLE  
20 TO THE PUBLIC.

21 7. NOTHING IN THIS SECTION SHALL BAR AN EMPLOYEE OF AN AGENCY FROM  
22 MAINTAINING A RECORD SLATED FOR DESTRUCTION UNDER THE RETENTION SCHED-  
23 ULES DEVELOPED PURSUANT TO SECTION 57.06 OF THE ARTS AND CULTURAL  
24 AFFAIRS LAW, IF SUCH RECORD IS RELEVANT TO AN ONGOING MATTER AND SUCH  
25 DISCLOSURE WOULD NOT VIOLATE ANY PRIVILEGE OR CONFIDENTIALITY INTEREST.

26 S 5. Subparagraphs vi and vii of paragraph (b) of subdivision 2 of  
27 section 89 of the public officers law, as amended by section 11 of part  
28 U of chapter 61 of the laws of 2011, are amended and a new subparagraph  
29 viii is added to read as follows:

30 vi. information of a personal nature contained in a workers' compen-  
31 sation record, except as provided by section one hundred ten-a of the  
32 workers' compensation law; [or]

33 vii. disclosure of electronic contact information, such as an e-mail  
34 address or a social network username, that has been collected from a  
35 taxpayer under section one hundred four of the real property tax law[.];  
36 AND

37 VIII. COMMUNICATIONS OF A PERSONAL NATURE BETWEEN STATE LEGISLATORS  
38 AND THEIR CONSTITUENTS.

39 S 6. The arts and cultural affairs law is amended by adding a new  
40 section 57.06 to read as follows:

41 S 57.06. ELECTRONIC RECORDS RETENTION. 1. THE STATE ARCHIVES SHALL  
42 DEVELOP AND IMPLEMENT A PROTOCOL FOR THE PRESERVATION OF ELECTRONIC  
43 RECORDS OF THE STATE IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE PROVISIONS OF THIS ARTICLE.  
44 SUCH PROTOCOL SHALL INCLUDE:

45 (A) A PROCESS BY WHICH SENDERS AND RECIPIENTS OF ELECTRONIC MAIL CAN  
46 CATEGORIZE SUCH MAIL INTO RECORDS THAT WILL BE RETAINED, AND THOSE THAT  
47 WILL BE SUBJECT TO PROCEDURES FOR REGULAR DISPOSITION OF SUCH RECORDS IN  
48 THE ORDINARY COURSE OF BUSINESS;

49 (B) THE DELINEATION OF SUCH OTHER STANDARDS OR PROCEDURES WHICH WILL  
50 ASSIST IN THE IDENTIFICATION AND PRESERVATION OF ELECTRONIC RECORDS;

51 (C) THE IDENTIFICATION OF SOFTWARE AND OTHER TECHNOLOGICAL AIDS THAT  
52 WOULD FACILITATE RECORDS PRESERVATION AND REVIEW, AND WHICH MAY BE  
53 PURCHASED WITHIN AVAILABLE RESOURCES; AND

54 (D) A SCHEDULE FOR RECORDS RETENTION FOR SPECIFIC TYPES OF RECORDS AND  
55 IDENTIFICATION OF HISTORICALLY IMPORTANT RECORDS DEVELOPED IN CONCERT  
56 WITH THE AGENCIES PROVIDING THE ELECTRONIC RECORDS.

1 2. NOTHING IN THIS SECTION SHALL BAR AN EMPLOYEE OF THE STATE ARCHIVES  
2 FROM MAINTAINING A RECORD SLATED FOR DESTRUCTION UNDER THE RETENTION  
3 SCHEDULE, OR FROM PROVIDING SUCH RECORD TO AN AGENCY, IF SUCH RECORD IS  
4 RELEVANT TO AN ONGOING MATTER, AND SUCH DISCLOSURE WOULD NOT VIOLATE ANY  
5 PRIVILEGE OR CONFIDENTIALITY INTEREST.

6 S 7. Section 5 of the executive law is REPEALED.

7 S 8. Subdivision 3 of section 713 of the executive law, as amended by  
8 section 16 of part B of chapter 56 of the laws of 2010, is amended to  
9 read as follows:

10 3. Any reports prepared pursuant to this article shall not be subject  
11 to disclosure pursuant to [section eighty-eight] ARTICLE SIX of the  
12 public officers law.

13 S 9. The legislative law is amended by adding a new section 33-a to  
14 read as follows:

15 S 33-A. DISCLOSURE. ALL MEMBERS, OFFICERS AND EMPLOYEES OF THE SENATE  
16 AND THE ASSEMBLY SHALL BE SUBJECT TO THE PROVISIONS OF ARTICLE SIX OF  
17 THE PUBLIC OFFICERS LAW.

18 S 10. Section 70-0113 of the environmental conservation law is  
19 REPEALED.

20 S 11. This act shall take effect on the one hundred twentieth day  
21 after it shall have become a law.