7639

2011-2012 Regular Sessions

IN ASSEMBLY

May 11, 2011

- Introduced by M. of A. WEINSTEIN -- (at request of the Office of Court Administration) -- read once and referred to the Committee on Judiciary
- AN ACT to amend the family court act, in relation to adjournments in contemplation of dismissal and suspended judgments in child protective proceedings in the family court

THE PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK, REPRESENTED IN SENATE AND ASSEMBLY, DO ENACT AS FOLLOWS:

1 Section 1. Section 1039 of the family court act, as amended by chapter 2 707 of the laws of 1975, subdivisions (a), (b), (c), (d) and (e) as 3 amended by chapter 41 of the laws of 2010 and subdivision (f) as amended 4 by chapter 601 of the laws of 1985, is amended to read as follows:

5 S 1039. Adjournment in contemplation of dismissal. (a) (I) Prior to 6 upon] THE ENTRY OF a fact-finding [hearing] ORDER, the court may, [or 7 upon a motion by [the petitioner with the consent of the respondent and] ANY PARTY OR the child's attorney WITH THE CONSENT OF ALL PARTIES 8 AND CHILD'S ATTORNEY, or upon its own motion with the consent of [the 9 THE 10 petitioner, the respondent] ALL PARTIES and the child's attorney, order the proceeding be ["]adjourned in contemplation of dismissal[". 11 that Under no circumstances shall the court order any party to consent to an 12 13 order under this section].

(II) AFTER ENTRY OF A FACT-FINDING ORDER BUT PRIOR TO THE ENTRY OF A 14 15 DISPOSITIONAL ORDER, THE COURT MAY, WITH CONSENT OF THE RESPONDENT AND UPON MOTION OF ANY PARTY OR THE CHILD'S ATTORNEY OR UPON ITS OWN MOTION 16 17 WITHOUT REQUIRING THE CONSENT OF THE PETITIONER OR ATTORNEY FOR THE ΒE 18 CHILD, ORDER THAT THE PROCEEDING ADJOURNED IN CONTEMPLATION OF DISMISSAL. THE PETITIONER, RESPONDENT AND ATTORNEY FOR THE CHILD HAVE 19 Α RIGHT TO BE HEARD WITH RESPECT TO THE MOTION. 20

(III) The court may make [such] AN order UNDER THIS SECTION only after has apprised the respondent of the provisions of this section and it satisfied that the respondent understands the effect of such

EXPLANATION--Matter in ITALICS (underscored) is new; matter in brackets
[] is old law to be omitted.

LBD11106-01-1

1 provisions. UNDER NO CIRCUMSTANCES SHALL THE COURT ORDER ANY PARTY TO 2 CONSENT TO AN ORDER UNDER THIS SECTION. THE COURT SHALL STATE ITS 3 REASONS ON THE RECORD FOR ORDERING AN ADJOURNMENT IN CONTEMPLATION OF 4 DISMISSAL UNDER THIS SECTION.

5 (b) An adjournment in contemplation of dismissal is an adjournment of 6 the proceeding for a period not to exceed one year with a view to ulti-7 mate dismissal of the petition in furtherance of justice. IN THE CASE OF AN ADJOURNMENT IN CONTEMPLATION OF DISMISSAL AFTER THE 8 ENTRY OF Α FACT-FINDING ORDER, SUCH DISMISSAL INCLUDES VACATUR OF THE FACT-FINDING 9 10 ORDER.

11 (I) Upon the consent of the petitioner, the respondent and the child's 12 attorney, the court may issue an order extending [such] THE period OF AN ADJOURNMENT IN CONTEMPLATION OF DISMISSAL ISSUED PURSUANT TO PARAGRAPH 13 14 OF SUBDIVISION (A) OF THIS SECTION PRIOR TO THE ENTRY OF A (I)15 FACT-FINDING ORDER for such time and upon such conditions as may be agreeable to the parties. 16

17 (II) FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN AND WITH THE CONSENT OF THE RESPONDENT, THE COURT MAY, ON ITS OWN MOTION OR ON MOTION OF ANY PARTY OR 18 THEATTORNEY 19 THE CHILD AND AFTER PROVIDING NOTICE AND AN OPPORTUNITY TO BE HEARD FOR TO ALL PARTIES AND THE ATTORNEY FOR THE CHILD, ISSUE AN ORDER EXTENDING 20 21 ADJOURNMENT IN CONTEMPLATION OF DISMISSAL ISSUED PURSUANT TO PARA-AN 22 GRAPH (II) OF SUBDIVISION (A) OF THIS SECTION AFTER ENTRY OF А ORDER FOR SUCH TIME AND UPON SUCH CONDITIONS AS MAY BE IN 23 FACT-FINDING THE BEST INTERESTS OF THE CHILD OR CHILDREN WHO ARE THE SUBJECTS OF THE 24 25 PROCEEDING.

(III) THE COURT SHALL STATE ITS REASONS ON THE RECORD FOR EXTENDING AN
 ADJOURNMENT IN CONTEMPLATION OF DISMISSAL UNDER THIS SUBDIVISION,
 INCLUDING ITS REASONS FOR CHANGES IN THE TERMS AND CONDITIONS, IF ANY.

29 (c) [Such] THE order [may] SHALL include terms and conditions [agreeable to the parties and to the court, provided that such terms and 30 conditions] IN FURTHERANCE OF THE BEST INTERESTS OF THE CHILD OR CHIL-31 WHO ARE THE SUBJECTS OF THE PROCEEDING AND shall include, BUT NOT 32 DREN 33 BE LIMITED TO, a requirement that the child and the respondent be under 34 the supervision of a child protective agency during the adjournment period. EXCEPT AS PROVIDED IN SUBDIVISION (G) OF THIS SECTION, AN ORDER 35 PURSUANT TO SECTION ONE THOUSAND SEVENTEEN, OR SECTION ONE 36 THOUSAND FIFTY-FIVE OF THIS ARTICLE SHALL NOT BE MADE IN ANY CASE ADJOURNED UNDER 37 38 SECTION; NOR SHALL AN ORDER UNDER THIS SECTION CONTAIN A CONDITION THIS 39 REQUIRING THE CHILD OR CHILDREN TO BE PLACED VOLUNTARILY PURSUANT TO 40 HUNDRED FIFTY-EIGHT AND THREE HUNDRED EIGHTY-FOUR-A OF SECTIONS THREE THE SOCIAL SERVICES LAW. In any order issued pursuant to this section, 41 [such agency] THE PETITIONER shall be directed to make a progress report 42 43 to the court, the parties and the child's attorney on the implementation 44 such order, no later than ninety days after the issuance of such of 45 order[, unless the court determines that the facts and circumstances of 46 case do not require such reports to be made] AND SHALL SUBMIT A the 47 REPORT PURSUANT TO SECTION ONE THOUSAND FIFTY-EIGHT OF THIS ARTICLE NO 48 LATER THAN SIXTY DAYS PRIOR TO THE EXPIRATION OF THE ORDER. The [child 49 protective agency] PETITIONER shall make further reports to the court, 50 the parties and the child's attorney in such manner and at such times as 51 the court may direct.

52 (d) Upon application of the respondent, the petitioner[,] OR the 53 child's attorney or upon the court's own motion, made at any time during 54 the duration of the order, if the child protective agency has failed 55 substantially to provide the respondent with adequate supervision or to 56 observe the terms and conditions of the order, the court may direct the 1 child protective agency to observe such terms and conditions and provide 2 adequate supervision or may make any order authorized pursuant to 3 section two hundred fifty-five OR ONE THOUSAND FIFTEEN-A of this act.

4 (e) [Upon application of] IF, PRIOR TO THE EXPIRATION OF THE PERIOD OF 5 ADJOURNMENT IN CONTEMPLATION OF DISMISSAL, A MOTION OR ORDER TO SHOW AN 6 CAUSE IS FILED BY the petitioner or the child's attorney or upon the 7 court's own motion, made at any time during the duration of the order, 8 [the] THAT ALLEGES A VIOLATION OF THE TERMS AND CONDITIONS OF THE 9 ADJOURNMENT, THE PERIOD OF THE ADJOURNMENT IN CONTEMPLATION OF DISMISSAL 10 TOLLED AS OF THE DATE OF SUCH FILING UNTIL THE ENTRY OF AN ORDER IS 11 DISPOSING OF THE MOTION OR ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE. THE court may REVOKE 12 ADJOURNMENT IN CONTEMPLATION OF DISMISSAL AND restore the matter to THE 13 the calendar OR THE COURT MAY EXTEND THE PERIOD OF THE ADJOURNMENT IN 14 CONTEMPLATION OF DISMISSAL PURSUANT TO SUBDIVISION (B) OF THIS SECTION, 15 if the court finds after a hearing ON THE ALLEGED VIOLATION that the 16 respondent has failed substantially to observe the terms and conditions 17 of the order or to cooperate with the supervising child protective agen-18 cy. [In such event] WHERE THE COURT HAS REVOKED THE ADJOURNMENT IN19 CONTEMPLATION OF DISMISSAL AND RESTORED THE MATTER TO THE CALENDAR:

20 (I) IN THE CASE OF AN ADJOURNMENT IN CONTEMPLATION OF DISMISSAL ISSUED 21 PRIOR TO THE ENTRY OF A FACT-FINDING ORDER, unless the parties consent 22 to an order pursuant to section one thousand fifty-one of this [act] 23 ARTICLE or unless the petition is dismissed upon the consent of the 24 petitioner, the court shall thereupon proceed to a fact-finding hearing 25 under this article no later than sixty days after [such] THE application 26 TO RESTORE THE MATTER TO THE CALENDAR, unless such period is extended by 27 the court for good cause shown; OR

(II) IN THE CASE OF AN ADJOURNMENT IN CONTEMPLATION OF DISMISSAL
ISSUED AFTER THE ENTRY OF A FACT-FINDING ORDER, THE COURT SHALL THEREUPON PROCEED TO A DISPOSITIONAL HEARING UNDER THIS ARTICLE NO LATER THAN
THIRTY DAYS AFTER THE APPLICATION TO RESTORE THE MATTER TO THE CALENDAR,
UNLESS SUCH PERIOD IS EXTENDED BY THE COURT FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN.

33 (III) THE COURT SHALL STATE ITS REASONS ON THE RECORD FOR REVOKING AN 34 ADJOURNMENT IN CONTEMPLATION OF DISMISSAL AND RESTORING THE MATTER TO 35 THE CALENDAR UNDER THIS SUBDIVISION.

(f) If the proceeding is not [so] restored to the calendar AS A RESULT 36 37 OF A FINDING OF AN ALLEGED VIOLATION PURSUANT TO SUBDIVISION (E) OF THIS 38 SECTION AND THE ADJOURNMENT IN CONTEMPLATION OF DISMISSAL IS NOT ΙF 39 EXTENDED PURSUANT TO SUBDIVISION (B) OF THIS SECTION, the petition is, 40 at the expiration of the adjournment IN CONTEMPLATION OF DISMISSAL period, deemed to have been dismissed by the court in furtherance of justice 41 [unless an application is pending pursuant to subdivision (e) of this 42 43 section]. If [such application is granted] THE COURT FINDS A VIOLATION PURSUANT TO SUBDIVISION (E) OF THIS SECTION, the petition shall not be 44 45 dismissed and shall proceed in accordance with the provisions of such 46 subdivision (e).

47 Notwithstanding the provisions of this section, IF A MOTION OR (q) 48 ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE IS FILED ALLEGING A VIOLATION PURSUANT TO SUBDIVI-49 SION (E) OF THIS SECTION AND THE COURT FINDS THAT REMOVAL OF THE CHILD 50 FROM THE HOME IS NECESSARY PURSUANT TO SECTION ONE THOUSAND TWENTY-SEVEN OF THIS ARTICLE DURING THE PENDENCY OF THE VIOLATION MOTION OR ORDER 51 ΤO CAUSE, the court[,] may, at any time prior to dismissal of the 52 SHOW petition pursuant to subdivision (f) OF THIS SECTION, issue 53 an order 54 authorized pursuant to section one thousand twenty-seven OF THIS ARTI-55 CLE. NOTHING IN THIS SECTION SHALL PRECLUDE THE CHILD PROTECTIVE AGENCY 56 TAKING EMERGENCY ACTION PURSUANT TO SECTION ONE FROM THOUSAND

TWENTY-FOUR OF THIS ARTICLE WHERE COMPELLED BY THE 1 TERMS OF THAT 2 THE VIOLATION IS FOUND AND THE MATTER IS RESTORED TO THE SECTION. IF 3 CALENDAR, THE COURT MAY MAKE FURTHER ORDERS IN ACCORDANCE WITH SUBDIVI-4 SION (E) OF THIS SECTION.

5 S 2. Section 1053 of the family court act, as added by chapter 962 of 6 the laws of 1970 and subdivision (c) as amended by chapter 41 of the 7 laws of 2010, is amended to read as follows:

8 S 1053. Suspended judgment. (a) Rules of court shall define permissi-9 ble terms and conditions of a suspended judgment. These terms and condi-10 tions shall relate to the acts or omissions of the parent or other 11 person legally responsible for the care of the child.

12 (b) The maximum duration of any term or condition of a suspended judgment is one year, unless the court finds at the conclusion of that peri-13 14 od, upon a hearing, that exceptional circumstances require an extension 15 thereof for A PERIOD OF UP TO an additional year. THE COURT SHALL STATE 16 REASONS ON THE RECORD FOR EXTENDING A PERIOD OF SUSPENDED JUDGMENT ITS 17 UNDER THIS SUBDIVISION, INCLUDING ITS REASONS FOR CHANGES IN THE TERMS 18 AND CONDITIONS, IF ANY.

(c) Except as provided for herein, in any order issued pursuant to 19 20 this section, the court may require the child protective agency to make 21 progress reports to the court, the parties, and the child's attorney on 22 the implementation of such order. Where the order of disposition is 23 issued upon the consent of the parties and the child's attorney, such 24 agency shall report to the court, the parties and the child's attorney 25 than ninety days after the issuance of the order, unless the no later 26 court determines that the facts and circumstances of the case do not 27 require such report to be made.

28 (D) THE ORDER OF SUSPENDED JUDGMENT MUST SET FORTH THE DURATION, TERMS 29 CONDITIONS OF THE SUSPENDED JUDGMENT, AND MUST CONTAIN A DATE AND CERTAIN FOR A COURT REVIEW NOT LATER THAN THIRTY DAYS PRIOR TO THE EXPI-30 RATION OF THE PERIOD OF SUSPENDED JUDGMENT. THE ORDER OF SUSPENDED JUDG-31 32 MENT ALSO MUST STATE IN CONSPICUOUS PRINT THAT A FAILURE TO OBEY THE 33 ORDER MAY LEAD TO ITS REVOCATION AND TO THE ISSUANCE OF ANY ORDER THAT MIGHT HAVE BEEN MADE AT THE TIME JUDGMENT WAS SUSPENDED. A COPY OF 34 THE ORDER OF SUSPENDED JUDGMENT MUST BE FURNISHED TO THE RESPONDENT. 35

NOT LATER THAN SIXTY DAYS BEFORE THE EXPIRATION OF THE PERIOD OF 36 (E) 37 SUSPENDED JUDGMENT, THE PETITIONER SHALL FILE A REPORT, PURSUANT TO SECTION ONE THOUSAND FIFTY-EIGHT OF THIS ARTICLE, WITH THE FAMILY COURT 38 39 AND ALL PARTIES, INCLUDING THE RESPONDENT AND HIS OR HER ATTORNEY, THE 40 THE CHILD AND INTERVENORS, IF ANY, REGARDING THE RESPOND-ATTORNEY FOR ENT'S COMPLIANCE WITH THE TERMS OF THE SUSPENDED JUDGMENT. 41 THE REPORT REVIEWED BY THE COURT ON THE SCHEDULED COURT DATE. 42 SHALL BE UNLESS A 43 MOTION OR ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE HAS BEEN FILED PRIOR TO THE EXPIRATION OF 44 THE PERIOD OF SUSPENDED JUDGMENT ALLEGING A VIOLATION OR SEEKING AN 45 EXTENSION OF THE PERIOD OF THE SUSPENDED JUDGMENT, THE TERMS OF THE SUSPENDED JUDGMENT SHALL BE DEEMED SATISFIED. IN SUCH 46 DISPOSITION OF 47 EVENT, THE COURT'S JURISDICTION OVER THE PROCEEDING SHALL BE TERMINATED. 48 HOWEVER, THE ORDER OF FACT-FINDING AND THE PRESUMPTIVE EFFECT OF SUCH 49 FINDING UPON RETENTION OF THE REPORT OF SUSPECTED ABUSE AND NEGLECT ON 50 THE STATE CENTRAL REGISTER IN ACCORDANCE WITH PARAGRAPH (B) OF SUBDIVI-51 SION EIGHT OF SECTION FOUR HUNDRED TWENTY-TWO OF THE SOCIAL SERVICES LAW SHALL REMAIN IN EFFECT UNLESS THE COURT GRANTS A MOTION BY THE RESPOND-52 ENT TO VACATE THE ORDER OF FACT-FINDING PURSUANT TO SECTION ONE THOUSAND 53 54 SIXTY-ONE OF THIS ARTICLE.

55 S 3. Section 1071 of the family court act, as amended by chapter 437 56 of the laws of 2006, is amended to read as follows:

S 1071. Failure to comply with terms and conditions of suspended judg-1 2 ment. If, prior to the expiration of the period of the suspended judg-3 ment, a motion or order to show cause is filed that alleges that a 4 parent or other person legally responsible for a child's care violated 5 the terms and conditions of a suspended judgment issued under section one thousand fifty-three of this article, the period of the suspended 6 judgment shall be tolled AS OF THE DATE OF SUCH FILING pending disposi-7 8 tion of the motion or order to show cause. IF A MOTION OR ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE ALLEGING A VIOLATION HAS BEEN FILED AND THE COURT FINDS 9 THAT 10 REMOVAL OF THE CHILD FROM THE HOME PENDING DISPOSITION OF THE MOTION OR ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE IS NECESSARY PURSUANT TO SECTION ONE THOUSAND 11 TWEN-TY-SEVEN OF THIS ARTICLE, THE COURT MAY ISSUE AN ORDER PURSUANT TO SUCH 12 SECTION ONE THOUSAND TWENTY-SEVEN. 13 NOTHING IN THIS SECTION SHALL 14 PRECLUDE THE CHILD PROTECTIVE AGENCY FROM TAKING EMERGENCY ACTION PURSU-15 ANT TO SECTION ONE THOUSAND TWENTY-FOUR OF THIS ARTICLE WHERE COMPELLED BY THE TERMS OF THAT SECTION. If, after A hearing ON THE ALLEGED 16 the court is satisfied by competent proof that the parent or 17 VIOLATION, other person violated the order of suspended judgment, the court may 18 19 revoke the suspension of judgment and enter any order that might have 20 been made at the time judgment was suspended OR MAY EXTEND THE PERIOD OF 21 SUSPENDED JUDGMENT PURSUANT TO SUBDIVISION (B) OF SECTION ONE THOUSAND 22 THIS ARTICLE. COURT SHALL STATE ITS REASONS FOR FIFTY-THREE OF THEREVOKING OR EXTENDING A PERIOD OF SUSPENDED JUDGMENT UNDER THIS SECTION. 23 S 4. This act shall take effect on the ninetieth day after it shall 24 25 have become a law.