1733

2009-2010 Regular Sessions

IN SENATE

February 5, 2009

Introduced by Sens. KRUEGER, DUANE, C. JOHNSON, SCHNEIDERMAN -- read twice and ordered printed, and when printed to be committed to the Committee on Civil Service and Pensions

AN ACT to amend the retirement and social security law, in relation to forfeiture of pension rights or retirement benefits upon conviction of a felony related to public employment

THE PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK, REPRESENTED IN SENATE AND ASSEMBLY, DO ENACT AS FOLLOWS:

Section 1. The retirement and social security law is amended by adding a new article 3-B to read as follows:

ARTICLE 3-B

PENSION FORFEITURE FOR PUBLIC CORRUPTION ACT SECTION 156. SHORT TITLE.

6 157. DEFINITIONS.

3

4

5

7

8

158. PENSION FORFEITURE.

159. MISCELLANEOUS.

9 S 156. SHORT TITLE. THIS ARTICLE SHALL BE KNOWN AND MAY BE CITED AS 10 THE "PENSION FORFEITURE FOR PUBLIC CORRUPTION ACT".

11 S 157. DEFINITIONS. THE FOLLOWING WORDS AND PHRASES, AS USED IN THIS 12 ARTICLE, SHALL HAVE THE FOLLOWING MEANINGS, UNLESS A DIFFERENT MEANING 13 IS PLAINLY REQUIRED BY THE CONTEXT:

14 1. "DEFENDANT" SHALL MEAN A PERSON AGAINST WHOM A FORFEITURE ACTION IS 15 COMMENCED.

2. "DESIGNATED FELONY OFFENSE" SHALL MEAN: (A) ANY FELONY OFFENSE SET
FORTH IN THE PENAL LAW; (B) A CONSPIRACY TO COMMIT ANY FELONY OFFENSE
SET FORTH IN THE PENAL LAW; OR (C) ANY CRIMINAL OFFENSE COMMITTED IN ANY
OTHER STATE, DISTRICT, OR TERRITORY OF THE UNITED STATES AND CLASSIFIED
AS A FELONY THEREIN, WHICH IF COMMITTED WITHIN THIS STATE, WOULD CONSTITUTE AN OFFENSE DESIGNATED IN PARAGRAPH (A) OR (B) OF THIS SUBDIVISION.

EXPLANATION--Matter in ITALICS (underscored) is new; matter in brackets
[] is old law to be omitted.

LBD01147-03-9

1 3. "COMPTROLLER" SHALL MEAN THE COMPTROLLER OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK 2 IN HIS OR HER CAPACITY AS ADMINISTRATIVE HEAD OF THE NEW YORK STATE AND 3 LOCAL EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM AND THE NEW YORK STATE AND LOCAL 4 POLICE AND FIRE RETIREMENT SYSTEM.

5 4. "MEMBER" SHALL MEAN A MEMBER OF THE NEW YORK STATE AND LOCAL 6 EMPLOYEES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM OR THE NEW YORK STATE AND LOCAL POLICE AND 7 FIRE RETIREMENT SYSTEM WHO JOINED SUCH SYSTEM ON OR AFTER THE EFFECTIVE 8 DATE OF THIS ARTICLE.

9 5. "RETIRED MEMBER" SHALL MEAN A PERSON WHO IS RETIRED FROM AND WHO IS 10 RECEIVING A RETIREMENT ALLOWANCE FROM A RETIREMENT SYSTEM AND WHO HAD 11 JOINED SUCH SYSTEM ON OR AFTER THE EFFECTIVE DATE OF THIS ARTICLE.

12 6. "RETIREMENT SYSTEM" SHALL MEAN THE NEW YORK STATE AND LOCAL EMPLOY-13 EES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM OR THE NEW YORK STATE AND LOCAL POLICE AND FIRE 14 RETIREMENT SYSTEM.

15 S 158. PENSION FORFEITURE. NOTWITHSTANDING ANY OTHER PROVISION OF 16 GENERAL, SPECIAL OR LOCAL LAW, RULE OR REGULATION TO THE CONTRARY:

17 1. IN THE CASE OF A MEMBER OR RETIRED MEMBER WHO IS CONVICTED OF ANY DESIGNATED FELONY OFFENSE SET FORTH IN PARAGRAPH (A) OR (B) OF SUBDIVI-18 19 SION TWO OF SECTION ONE HUNDRED FIFTY-SEVEN OF THIS ARTICLE, THE COMMIS-20 SION OF WHICH IS RELATED TO THE PERFORMANCE OR FAILURE TO PERFORM SUCH 21 MEMBER OR RETIRED MEMBER'S OFFICIAL DUTIES AND RESPONSIBILITIES, AN ACTION MAY BE COMMENCED IN SUPREME COURT BY THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY HAVING 22 JURISDICTION OVER THE OFFENSE FOR THE FORFEITURE OF ALL OR A PORTION OF 23 THOSE RIGHTS AND BENEFITS TO WHICH SUCH PERSON IS OR WILL BE ENTITLED AS 24 25 A MEMBER OR RETIRED MEMBER PROVIDED THAT ANY CONTRIBUTIONS MADE BY THE 26 OFFICIAL TO HIS OR HER RETIREMENT SYSTEM SHALL NOT BE SUBJECT TO FORFEI-27 TURE, BUT SHALL BE RETURNED TO SUCH OFFICIAL. SUCH ACTION SHALL BE COMMENCED WITHIN SIX MONTHS OF SUCH CONVICTION. FOR PURPOSES OF 28 THIS 29 ARTICLE, A DESIGNATED FELONY OFFENSE IS RELATED TO THE PERFORMANCE OR FAILURE TO PERFORM SUCH MEMBER OR RETIRED MEMBER'S OFFICIAL DUTIES AND 30 RESPONSIBILITIES IF IT: (A) CONSTITUTED A MATERIAL VIOLATION OF SUCH 31 32 MEMBER OR RETIRED MEMBER'S DUTIES AND RESPONSIBILITIES AS A PUBLIC SERV-ANT; OR (B) EVEN THOUGH COMMITTED OUTSIDE THE SCOPE OF SUCH MEMBER'S 33 34 OFFICIAL DUTIES OR RESPONSIBILITIES, INVOLVED ACTIONS OR CONDUCT BY 35 WHICH SUCH MEMBER OR RETIRED MEMBER INDICATED OR CONVEYED THAT HE OR SHE WAS ACTING WITH THE AUTHORITY OF, OR UNDER COLOR OF THE AUTHORITY OF, 36 37 ANY GOVERNMENTAL ENTITY.

38 2. WHERE THE ATTORNEY GENERAL FINDS THAT A MEMBER OR A RETIRED MEMBER 39 HAS BEEN CONVICTED OF A DESIGNATED FELONY OFFENSE AS DEFINED IN PARA-40 GRAPH (C) OF SUBDIVISION TWO OF SECTION ONE HUNDRED FIFTY-SEVEN OF THIS ARTICLE, THE COMMISSION OF WHICH IS RELATED TO THE PERFORMANCE OR FAIL-41 URE TO PERFORM SUCH MEMBER OR RETIRED MEMBER'S OFFICIAL DUTIES AND 42 43 RESPONSIBILITIES, AN ACTION MAY BE COMMENCED IN SUPREME COURT BY THE ATTORNEY GENERAL FOR THE FORFEITURE OF ALL OR A PORTION OF THOSE RIGHTS 44 45 AND BENEFITS TO WHICH SUCH PERSON IS OR WILL BE ENTITLED AS A MEMBER OR RETIRED MEMBER. SUCH ACTION SHALL BE COMMENCED WITHIN ONE YEAR OF SUCH 46 47 CONVICTION.

48 3. PRIOR TO COMMENCEMENT OF SUCH ACTION DESCRIBED IN SUBDIVISION ONE OR TWO OF THIS SECTION, THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY OR THE ATTORNEY GENERAL, 49 50 AS THE CASE MAY BE, SHALL PROVIDE NOTICE TO THE COMPTROLLER STATING THAT HE OR SHE HAS REASON TO BELIEVE THAT THE PERSON CONVICTED COMMITTED THE 51 FELONY RELATED TO HIS OR HER OFFICIAL DUTIES AND RESPONSIBILITIES. 52 WITHIN TWENTY DAYS OF RECEIPT OF SUCH NOTICE, THE COMPTROLLER SHALL 53 54 SUBMIT A NOTICE OF APPLICABILITY TO THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY OR THE ATTOR-55 NEY GENERAL AS THE CASE MAY BE. THE NOTICE OF APPLICABILITY SHALL CONTAIN A STATEMENT SPECIFYING WHETHER THE PERSON CONVICTED IS OR HAS 56

1 BEEN A MEMBER OR RETIRED MEMBER OF THE NEW YORK STATE AND LOCAL EMPLOY-2 EES' RETIREMENT SYSTEM OR THE NEW YORK STATE AND LOCAL POLICE AND FIRE 3 RETIREMENT SYSTEM AND SHALL DESCRIBE THE RIGHTS AND BENEFITS TO WHICH 4 SUCH PERSON IS OR WILL BE ENTITLED FROM SUCH PUBLIC RETIREMENT SYSTEM.

5 4. NO FORFEITURE ACTION MAY BE COMMENCED BY THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY OR 6 THE ATTORNEY GENERAL UNTIL RECEIPT OF THE NOTICE OF APPLICABILITY AS SET 7 FORTH IN SUBDIVISION THREE OF THIS SECTION. IN DETERMINING WHETHER ΤO 8 SEEK FORFEITURE OF A PORTION, RATHER THAN ALL, OF SUCH RETIREMENT BENE-FITS, THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY OR THE ATTORNEY GENERAL MAY CONSIDER MITI-9 10 GATING FACTORS INCLUDING, BUT NOT LIMITED TO: THE NATURE AND SERIOUSNESS THE OFFENSE COMMITTED IN RELATION TO THE AMOUNT OF THE FORFEITURE 11 OF PENALTY; WHETHER THE DEFENDANT'S CONDUCT IN COMMITTING THE OFFENSE WAS 12 WILLFUL OR MALICIOUS; WHETHER THE DEFENDANT MADE ANY SUBSTANTIAL GOOD 13 14 FAITH EFFORTS TO PREVENT OR MITIGATE THE HARM CAUSED BY THE OFFENSE; 15 WHETHER THE DEFENDANT'S PARTICIPATION IN THE CRIME WAS UNDER DURESS, 16 COERCION OR INDUCED BY OTHERS; THE IMPACT OF THE CRIME ON THE STATE OR 17 LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND THE NUMBER OF YEARS OF THE DEFENDANT'S PUBLIC SERVICE PERFORMED WITHOUT CRIMINAL CONDUCT; THE PECUNIARY BENEFIT TO THE 18 19 DEFENDANT FROM THE CRIME; AND WHETHER AND TO WHAT EXTENT THE DEFENDANT'S 20 FAMILY IS DEPENDENT UPON THE DEFENDANT'S PRESENT AND FUTURE RETIREMENT 21 BENEFITS.

22 UPON MOTION BY THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY OR THE ATTORNEY GENERAL, AS 5. 23 THE CASE MAY BE, MADE UPON COMMENCEMENT OF OR AT ANY TIME DURING THE PENDENCY OF A FORFEITURE ACTION, PURSUANT TO THE PROCEDURE SET FORTH IN 24 25 SUBDIVISION ONE OF SECTION SIXTY-THREE HUNDRED ELEVEN OR SECTION SIXTY-26 THREE HUNDRED THIRTEEN OF THE CIVIL PRACTICE LAW AND RULES, THE COURT MAY ISSUE A TEMPORARY RESTRAINING ORDER OR A PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION 27 28 PROHIBITING THE DEFENDANT FROM RECEIVING ANY RIGHTS OR BENEFITS FROM THE 29 APPROPRIATE RETIREMENT SYSTEM. A PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION MAY BE GRANTED WHERE THE COURT FINDS THAT THERE IS A SUBSTANTIAL PROBABILITY THAT THE 30 DISTRICT ATTORNEY OR ATTORNEY GENERAL WILL PREVAIL ON THE ISSUE OF 31 32 FORFEITURE. NO SHOWING OF IRREPARABLE HARM SHALL BE REQUIRED. THE COURT NOT CONSIDER ON SUCH MOTION ANY ISSUES PRESENTED TO THE COURT WHICH 33 MAY HEARD THE CRIMINAL ACTION IN WHICH THE DEFENDANT WAS CONVICTED OR 34 WHICH 35 ARISE OUT OF SUCH CRIMINAL ACTION AND MAY BE PRESENTED ON APPEAL.

36 6. ALL DEFENDANTS IN A FORFEITURE ACTION BROUGHT PURSUANT TO THIS37 ARTICLE SHALL HAVE THE RIGHT TO TRIAL BY JURY ON ANY ISSUE OF FACT.

7. THE BURDEN OF PROOF SHALL BE UPON THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY OR THE
ATTORNEY GENERAL, AS THE CASE MAY BE, TO PROVE BY CLEAR AND CONVINCING
EVIDENCE THE FACTS NECESSARY TO ESTABLISH A CLAIM OF PENSION FORFEITURE.

8. AT ANY TIME DURING THE PENDENCY OF A FORFEITURE ACTION, THE COURT 41 MAY DISMISS THE ACTION IF IT FINDS THAT SUCH RELIEF IS WARRANTED BY THE 42 43 EXISTENCE OF SOME COMPELLING FACTOR, CONSIDERATION OR CIRCUMSTANCE 44 INCLUDING, BUT NOT LIMITED TO, ONE OR MORE OF THE MITIGATING FACTORS SET 45 FORTH IN SUBDIVISION FOUR OF THIS SECTION, OR OTHER INFORMATION OR EVIDENCE WHICH DEMONSTRATES THAT SUCH FORFEITURE WOULD NOT SERVE THE 46 47 ENDS OF JUSTICE. THE COURT SHALL ISSUE A WRITTEN DECISION STATING THE 48 BASIS FOR AN ORDER ISSUED PURSUANT TO THIS SUBDIVISION.

9. (A) UPON A FINDING BY THE COURT THAT THE DEFENDANT HAS COMMITTED A 49 50 FELONY IN CONNECTION WITH HIS OR HER OFFICIAL DUTIES AND RESPONSIBIL-51 ITIES IN THIS STATE, THE COURT SHALL ISSUE AN ORDER TO THE APPROPRIATE SYSTEM FOR: (I) THE FORFEITURE OR RECOUPMENT OF ALL OR A 52 RETIREMENT PORTION OF THE DEFENDANT'S RIGHTS AND BENEFITS AS A MEMBER OR RETIRED 53 54 MEMBER OF SUCH SYSTEM; (II) THE RECOUPMENT OF ALL OR A PORTION OF THE 55 RETIREMENT BENEFITS PAID TO THE DEFENDANT; AND (III) THE REFUND TO THE 56 DEFENDANT OF ANY CONTRIBUTIONS MADE BY THE DEFENDANT TO THE RETIREMENT

35

SYSTEM FOR ANY PERIOD FOR WHICH THE DEFENDANT'S RIGHTS AND BENEFITS AS A MEMBER OR RETIRED MEMBER OF SUCH RETIREMENT SYSTEM HAVE BEEN ORDERED FORFEIT.

4 (B) IN DETERMINING THE EXTENT OF THE FORFEITURE OR RECOUPMENT THAT IS
5 WARRANTED, THE COURT MAY CONSIDER ONE OR MORE OF THE MITIGATING FACTORS
6 SET FORTH IN SUBDIVISION FOUR OF THIS SECTION. ALL ORDERS AND FINDINGS
7 MADE BY THE COURT PURSUANT TO THIS SECTION SHALL BE SERVED UPON THE
8 COMPTROLLER.

9 10. UPON A FINAL DETERMINATION THAT REVERSES OR VACATES THE CONVICTION 10 CONVICTIONS OF A DESIGNATED OFFENSE OR OFFENSES, THE MEMBER OR OR RETIRED MEMBER WHO HAS FORFEITED RETIREMENT RIGHTS AND BENEFITS PURSUANT 11 12 TO THIS SECTION SHALL HAVE SUCH RIGHTS AND BENEFITS RETROACTIVELY RESTORED UPON APPLICATION TO THE COURT WITH JURISDICTION OVER THE 13 14 FORFEITURE ACTION, REGARDLESS OF ANY TEMPORARY RESTRAINING ORDER OR 15 PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION WHICH MAY BE OUTSTANDING OR ORDER WHICH MAY HAVE 16 BEEN ISSUED. SUCH COURT, UPON FINDING THAT SUCH A FINAL DETERMINATION 17 OCCURRED, SHALL ISSUE AN ORDER RETROACTIVELY RESTORING SUCH RIGHTS HAS 18 AND BENEFITS, TOGETHER WITH SUCH OTHER RELIEF DEEMED APPROPRIATE. AS A 19 CONDITION TO FULL RESTORATION OF RIGHTS AND BENEFITS AS PROVIDED IN THIS 20 SUBDIVISION, THE MEMBER OR RETIRED MEMBER SHALL REIMBURSE THE RETIREMENT 21 SYSTEM FOR ANY CONTRIBUTIONS THAT WERE REFUNDED TO THE MEMBER OR RETIRED 22 MEMBER PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF PARAGRAPH (A) OF SUBDIVISION NINE 23 OF THIS SECTION.

24 11. EXCEPT AS OTHERWISE PROVIDED BY THIS ARTICLE, THE CIVIL PRACTICE 25 LAW AND RULES SHALL GOVERN THE PROCEDURE IN ACTIONS COMMENCED UNDER THIS 26 ARTICLE, EXCEPT WHERE THE ACTION IS REGULATED BY ANY INCONSISTENT 27 PROVISIONS HEREIN. IN SUCH ACTIONS, THE COURT MAY NOT CONSIDER ANY 28 PRESENTED TO THE COURT WHICH HEARD THE CRIMINAL ACTION IN WHICH ISSUES 29 THE DEFENDANT WAS CONVICTED OR WHICH ARISE OUT OF SUCH CRIMINAL ACTION 30 AND MAY BE PRESENTED ON APPEAL.

31 S 159. MISCELLANEOUS. THE REMEDIES PROVIDED FOR IN THIS ARTICLE ARE 32 NOT INTENDED TO SUBSTITUTE FOR, LIMIT OR SUPERSEDE THE LAWFUL AUTHORITY 33 OF ANY PUBLIC OFFICER, AGENCY OR OTHER PERSON TO ENFORCE ANY OTHER RIGHT 34 OR REMEDY PROVIDED FOR BY LAW.

S 2. This act shall take effect immediately.

FISCAL NOTE. -- Pursuant to Legislative Law, Section 50:

This bill would amend the Retirement and Social Security Law with regard to the forfeiture of the retirement system rights and benefits of certain future members or retirees of the New York State and Local Employees' Retirement System or the New York State and Local Police and Fire Retirement system.

If this bill is enacted, it would provide that if a future member or retiree was convicted of any one of certain felony offenses relating to his (or her) performance or failure to perform official duties and responsibilities, such member or retiree would forfeit all or a portion of his (or her) rights and benefits as a member or retiree of such System and all or a portion of retirement benefits already received. There could be a resulting decrease in the fiscal obligations of the Systems. The amount of the decrease would be the present value of all such forfeited benefit payments.

This estimate, dated January 20, 2009 and intended for use only during the 2009 Legislative Session, is Fiscal Note No. 2009-100, prepared by the Actuary for the New York State and Local Employees' Retirement System and the New York State and Local Police and Fire Retirement System.