

1 NEW YORK STATE SENATE

2
3
4 THE STENOGRAPHIC RECORD

5
6
7
8
9 ALBANY, NEW YORK

10 June 4, 2026

11 1:51 p.m.

12
13
14 REGULAR SESSION

15
16
17
18 SENATOR JAMAAL T. BAILEY, Acting President

19 ALEJANDRA N. PAULINO, ESQ., Secretary

P R O C E E D I N G S

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
Senate will come to order.

I ask everyone present to please
rise and recite the Pledge of Allegiance.

(Whereupon, the assemblage recited
the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.)

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: In the
absence of clergy, let us bow our heads in a
moment of silent reflection or prayer.

(Whereupon, the assemblage respected
a moment of silence.)

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Reading
of the Journal.

THE SECRETARY: In Senate,
Wednesday, June 3, 2026, the Senate met pursuant
to adjournment. The Journal of Tuesday, June 2,
2026, was read and approved. On motion, the
Senate adjourned.

ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Without
objection, the Journal stands approved as read.

Presentation of petitions.

Messages from the Assembly.

The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Senator Hinchey

1 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
2 Assembly Bill Number 7594C and substitute it for
3 the identical Senate Bill Number 3852C, Third
4 Reading Calendar 102.

5 Senator Martinez moves to discharge,
6 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
7 Number 5079E and substitute it for the identical
8 Senate Bill 194D, Third Reading Calendar 181.

9 Senator Gounardes moves to
10 discharge, from the Committee on Internet and
11 Technology, Assembly Bill Number 6578B and
12 substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
13 6955A, Third Reading Calendar 433.

14 Senator Ramos moves to discharge,
15 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
16 Number 6950 and substitute it for the identical
17 Senate Bill Number 9843, Third Reading Calendar
18 731.

19 Senator Webb moves to discharge,
20 from the Committee on Local Government,
21 Assembly Bill Number 7620 and substitute it for
22 the identical Senate Bill 7072, Third Reading
23 Calendar 761.

24 Senator Fahy moves to discharge,
25 from the Committee on Disabilities, Assembly Bill

1 Number 1130A and substitute it for the identical
2 Senate Bill 7794, Third Reading Calendar 1001.

3 Senator Fernandez moves to
4 discharge, from the Committee on Finance,
5 Assembly Bill Number 9113B and substitute it for
6 the identical Senate Bill 8636B, Third Reading
7 Calendar 1056.

8 Senator Bailey moves to discharge,
9 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
10 Number 11412 and substitute it for the identical
11 Senate Bill 9833, Third Reading Calendar 1082.

12 Senator Comrie moves to discharge,
13 from the Committee on Consumer Protection,
14 Assembly Bill Number 3058C and substitute it for
15 the identical Senate Bill 6438C, Third Reading
16 Calendar 1105.

17 Senator Skoufis moves to discharge,
18 from the Committee on Consumer Protection,
19 Assembly Bill Number 10411A and substitute it for
20 the identical Senate Bill 9348A, Third Reading
21 Calendar 1107.

22 Senator Skoufis moves to discharge,
23 from the Committee on Energy and
24 Telecommunications, Assembly Bill Number 4713A
25 and substitute it for the identical Senate Bill

1 6200A, Third Reading Calendar 1118.

2 Senator Stewart-Cousins moves to
3 discharge, from the Committee on Codes,
4 Assembly Bill Number 3987A and substitute it for
5 the identical Senate Bill Number 8274,
6 Third Reading Calendar 1141.

7 Senator Stewart-Cousins moves to
8 discharge, from the Committee on Codes,
9 Assembly Bill Number 3988A and substitute it for
10 the identical Senate Bill 8324, Third Reading
11 Calendar 1142.

12 Senator Ramos moves to discharge,
13 from the Committee on Civil Service and Pensions,
14 Assembly Bill Number 10835A and substitute it for
15 the identical Senate Bill 9577A, Third Reading
16 Calendar 1151.

17 Senator Comrie moves to discharge,
18 from the Committee on Energy and
19 Telecommunications, Assembly Bill Number 10135
20 and substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
21 Number 9122, Third Reading Calendar 1213.

22 Senator Ryan moves to discharge,
23 from the Committee on Transportation,
24 Assembly Bill Number 11233A and substitute it for
25 the identical Senate Bill Number 9806A, Third

1 Reading Calendar 1281.

2 Senator Addabbo moves to discharge,
3 from the Committee on Veterans, Homeland Security
4 and Military Affairs, Assembly Bill Number 3397A
5 and substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
6 1242A, Third Reading Calendar 1343.

7 Senator Harckham moves to discharge,
8 from the Committee on Health, Assembly Bill
9 Number 329C and substitute it for the identical
10 Senate Bill 3051B, Third Reading Calendar 1350.

11 Senator Comrie moves to discharge,
12 from the Committee on Energy and
13 Telecommunications, Assembly Bill Number 6285 and
14 substitute it for the identical Senate Bill 4430,
15 Third Reading Calendar 1353.

16 Senator Hinchey moves to discharge,
17 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
18 Number 9581B and substitute it for the identical
19 Senate Bill 8706B, Third Reading Calendar 1386.

20 Senator Bailey moves to discharge,
21 from the Committee on Insurance, Assembly Bill
22 Number 10030B and substitute it for the identical
23 Senate Bill 8969B, Third Reading Calendar 1389.

24 Senator Weber moves to discharge,
25 from the Committee on Local Government, Assembly

1 Bill Number 10184 and substitute it for the
2 identical Senate Bill 9059, Third Reading
3 Calendar 1394.

4 Senator Weber moves to discharge,
5 from the Committee on Local Government,
6 Assembly Bill Number 10158 and substitute it for
7 the identical Senate Bill 9060, Third Reading
8 Calendar 1395.

9 Senator Addabbo moves to discharge,
10 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
11 Number 9600A and substitute it for the identical
12 Senate Bill 9063A, Third Reading Calendar 1396.

13 Senator May moves to discharge, from
14 the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
15 Number 10415 and substitute it for the identical
16 Senate Bill 9305A, Third Reading Calendar 1401.

17 Senator Mayer moves to discharge,
18 from the Committee on Finance, Assembly Bill
19 Number 65B and substitute it for the identical
20 Senate Bill 9498, Third Reading Calendar 1407.

21 Senator Skoufis moves to discharge,
22 from the Committee on Health, Assembly Bill
23 Number 10312A and substitute it for the identical
24 Senate Bill 9555A, Third Reading Calendar 1409.

25 Senator Hinchey moves to discharge,

1 from the Committee on Health, Assembly Bill
2 Number 9140 and substitute it for the identical
3 Senate Bill 9604, Third Reading Calendar 1410.

4 Senator Martinez moves to discharge,
5 from the Committee on Local Government,
6 Assembly Bill Number 10419 and substitute it for
7 the identical Senate Bill 9900, Third Reading
8 Calendar 1423.

9 Senator Ryan moves to discharge,
10 from the Committee on Local Government,
11 Assembly Bill Number 11004 and substitute it for
12 the identical Senate Bill 9901, Third Reading
13 Calendar 1424.

14 Senator Ryan moves to discharge,
15 from the Committee on Local Government,
16 Assembly Bill Number 11006 and substitute it for
17 the identical Senate Bill 9902, Third Reading
18 Calendar 1425.

19 Senator Martinez moves to discharge,
20 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
21 Number 11376 and substitute it for the identical
22 Senate Bill 9903, Third Reading Calendar 1426.

23 Senator Stavisky moves to discharge,
24 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
25 Number 11368 and substitute it for the identical

1 Senate Bill 10066, Third Reading Calendar 1429.

2 Senator Cooney moves to discharge,
3 from the Committee on Consumer Protection,
4 Assembly Bill Number 563A and substitute it for
5 the identical Senate Bill 10227, Third Reading
6 Calendar 1432.

7 Senator Gounardes moves to
8 discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
9 Assembly Bill Number 11234 and substitute it for
10 the identical Senate Bill 10273, Third Reading
11 Calendar 1433.

12 Senator Harckham moves to discharge,
13 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
14 Number 11392 and substitute it for the identical
15 Senate Bill 10411, Third Reading Calendar 1434.

16 Senator Bottcher moves to discharge,
17 from the Committee on Cities 1, Assembly Bill
18 Number 10922 and substitute it for the identical
19 Senate Bill 10431, Third Reading Calendar 1435.

20 Senator Martinez moves to discharge,
21 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
22 Number 11358 and substitute it for the identical
23 Senate Bill Number 10432, Third Reading Calendar
24 1436.

25 Senator Ryan moves to discharge,

1 from the Committee on Codes, Assembly Bill
2 Number 3191A and substitute it for the identical
3 Senate Bill 10438, Third Reading Calendar 1437.

4 Senator Serrano moves to discharge,
5 from the Committee on Cultural Affairs,
6 Assembly Bill Number 9693 and substitute it for
7 the identical Senate Bill 10525, Third Reading
8 Calendar 1440.

9 Senator Skoufis moves to discharge,
10 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
11 Number 11372 and substitute it for the identical
12 Senate Bill 10531, Third Reading Calendar 1441.

13 Senator Fahy moves to discharge,
14 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
15 Number 11464 and substitute it for the identical
16 Senate Bill Number 10542, Third Reading Calendar
17 1442.

18 Senator Martinez moves to discharge,
19 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
20 Number 11377 and substitute it for the identical
21 Senate Bill Number 10566, Third Reading Calendar
22 1443.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
24 you, Gerald. And so ordered.

25 Messages from the Governor.

1 Reports of standing committees.
2 Reports of select committees.
3 Communications and reports from
4 state officers.

5 Motions and resolutions.

6 Senator Gianaris.

7 SENATOR GIANARIS: Good afternoon,
8 Mr. President.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Good
10 afternoon.

11 SENATOR GIANARIS: I move to adopt
12 the Resolution Calendar.

13 Forget what I just said,
14 Mr. President.

15 Let's take up previously adopted
16 Resolution 2314, by Senator Ramos, read that
17 resolution's title and call on Senator Ramos.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
19 Secretary will read.

20 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 2314, by
21 Senator Ramos, recognizing the New York Chapter
22 of the National Domestic Workers Alliance.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
24 Ramos on the resolution.

25 SENATOR RAMOS: Yes, thank you,

1 Mr. President.

2 Today we recognize the New York
3 State Chapter of the National Domestic Workers
4 Alliance and the extraordinary workers that they
5 represent.

6 When we talk about what makes
7 New York work, we often talk about industries and
8 businesses and institutions. But behind all of
9 those things are people who make it possible for
10 everyone else to show up: The nanny who cares
11 for a child before going to school, the home care
12 worker helping a senior age with dignity, the
13 house cleaner whose labor gives a family time and
14 stability. Domestic workers are the workers who
15 make all other work possible.

16 And yet for generations they were
17 excluded from basic labor protections that many
18 other workers have taken for granted. And that
19 exclusion wasn't accidental. Much of this work
20 has historically been performed by women, by
21 immigrants, Black women and women of color. And
22 for too long society depended on their labor
23 while denying them the dignity, recognition, pay
24 and protections they deserve.

25 But domestic workers are organized.

1 They refuse to remain invisible. And so today we
2 honor that legacy of pioneers like Dorothy
3 Bolden, who understood that dignity is not
4 something workers should have to ask for; it's
5 something that they are owed.

6 The National Domestic Workers
7 Alliance has carried that legacy, organizing
8 workers, developing leaders, recovering stolen
9 wages, and fighting for policies that recognize
10 the value of care work. Because care work --
11 because care is work, and care workers deserve
12 rights.

13 Their advocacy has helped secure
14 paid sick leave, paid family leave, workplace
15 protections, and greater recognition of the
16 essential role domestic workers play in our
17 economy and in our communities.

18 As chair of the Senate Labor
19 Committee, I believe protecting workers means
20 protecting all workers -- not just the workers
21 whose jobs are highly visible, not just the
22 workers with the loudest voices, all workers.

23 And few workers embody the values of
24 service, sacrifice and care more than domestic
25 workers. They care for our children, our

1 parents, and our homes. And in doing so, they
2 hold our communities together.

3 Today we proudly recognize the
4 New York Chapter of the National Domestic Workers
5 Alliance for their leadership, their advocacy,
6 and their unwavering commitment to dignity,
7 fairness and justice for working people.

8 Mr. President, one of the most
9 incredible labor organizers from my community,
10 Avi Gayil {ph}, is here with all of the domestic
11 workers from across New York State who are making
12 change happen. Please extend all of the
13 courtesies of the house to them.

14 Thank you.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
16 you, Senator Ramos.

17 Senator Hinchey on the resolution.

18 SENATOR HINCHEY: Thank you,
19 Mr. President.

20 I rise today with profound gratitude
21 to honor an extraordinary movement and the
22 remarkable women who have built it. And I want
23 to thank the sponsor for this resolution.

24 For the past decade, the We Dream in
25 Black New York Chapter has been rewriting the

1 story of what's possible when people refuse to
2 accept injustice. Today, as we celebrate their
3 10-year anniversary, I want the Senate record to
4 reflect something our nation needs to hear. The
5 domestic workers of this country are among the
6 most powerful leaders and change-makers that we
7 have.

8 I was meeting with my sisters from
9 the Red Carpet for Social Justice Coalition, many
10 of whom are members of We Dream in Black. After
11 they told me about this incredible milestone, I
12 knew that when the day came for us to welcome
13 them here to the Capitol, I had to take a moment
14 to say thank you, because across our communities
15 they are the unsung heroes whose leadership
16 deserves to be enshrined in the Senate record.

17 Labor is the backbone of every
18 community, and domestic workers do some of the
19 most important, sacred, difficult and deeply
20 personal work there is. They are the people
21 nurturing our children with patience and
22 tenderness. They are the people caring for our
23 aging loved ones with dignity and gentleness.
24 And they often become trusted members of our
25 families.

1 They deserve to be seen and
2 celebrated. Their work requires tremendous skill
3 and emotional intelligence. And without their
4 caring hands and generous hearts, so much would
5 fall away.

6 For far too long, their labor has
7 been overlooked and underprotected, from the
8 exclusion of domestic workers from Social
9 Security in 1935 to the challenges and inequities
10 still today.

11 But We Dream in Black has been
12 changing that reality. In just 10 years they
13 have built a home for Black, Afro-Latina and
14 Afro-descendant domestic workers to unite,
15 amplify their voices and illuminate their
16 collective power.

17 They've recovered more than half a
18 million dollars in stolen wages, helped workers
19 understand their rights, and as the sponsor said,
20 they've won landmark victories for paid family
21 leave and paid sick and safe leave.

22 This is what the labor movement
23 looks like. It's ordinary people standing
24 together, lifting each other up, and moving
25 mountains that once seemed unmovable. It's women

1 refusing to accept anything less than the rights
2 and fairness that they so fundamentally deserve.

3 What We Dream in Black has achieved
4 over the last 10 years is nothing short of
5 remarkable. They have built a movement with a
6 capital "M." And they have inspired so many to
7 lead with courage, compassion, and belief in
8 themselves.

9 To the phenomenal members of
10 We Dream in Black here in the chamber today, we
11 see you, we celebrate you, we thank you for being
12 innovators, problem solvers, and for raising your
13 voices to raise labor standards for domestic
14 workers. Your fight is our fight. Happy 10-year
15 anniversary.

16 Thank you, Mr. President. I proudly
17 vote aye.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
19 you, Senator Hinchey.

20 Senator Sanders on the resolution.

21 SENATOR SANDERS: Thank you,
22 Mr. President.

23 I too want to commend the sponsor
24 for this move. I would be -- it wouldn't be
25 right if I didn't stand up for this moment.

1 I am the son of a domestic worker,
2 and my mother actually had the ability to go out
3 and work and help raise other families and then
4 come back and raise her own family. She had that
5 much love.

6 So I commend all of the people who
7 are able to get out there and share love in this
8 day and age, a love that this society desperately
9 needs. So I continue to urge you to be the best
10 you and then to come home and to make sure that
11 your children have everything that they need.

12 I commend the struggle that you're
13 having or that you're doing and stand shoulder to
14 shoulder with you to make sure that you are
15 treated with the dignity that you deserve.

16 I proudly vote aye.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
18 you, Senator Sanders.

19 To the unsung heroes, to our
20 sheroes, the fabric of society, the domestic
21 workers, we celebrate you and we thank you for
22 coming to the Capitol.

23 We recognize you, and on behalf of
24 the Senate we extend to you all of the privileges
25 and cordialities of the house.

1 Please rise and be recognized.

2 (Standing ovation.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
4 resolution was adopted on June 2nd.

5 Senator Gianaris.

6 SENATOR GIANARIS: Okay,
7 Mr. President, we have several members of the
8 Judiciary here as well as other appointees who we
9 are here to confirm. So I just want to give the
10 members a sense of the cadence here.

11 We're going to first take up the
12 judicial nominations, and we have agreed with the
13 Minority that only one member from each side will
14 speak on these nominations, in the interests of
15 time. There are so many of you up there, and we
16 love you all, but we also have to get through our
17 session today. It's our last day of scheduled
18 session.

19 From there, we will take up the
20 MTA nominees, and after that the remaining
21 nominees. And we are simultaneously going to
22 have a meeting of the Rules Committee in
23 Room 332.

24 So for us it will be
25 Senator Sepúlveda; I believe it will be

1 Senator Palumbo for the Minority on the judicial
2 nominations. So call a meeting of the
3 Rules Committee and recognize Senator Sepúlveda,
4 please.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: There
6 will be an immediate meeting of the
7 Rules Committee in Room 332.

8 And Senator Sepúlveda on the
9 nominations.

10 Excuse me. Hold on a sec.

11 The Secretary will read the
12 nominations, I apologize.

13 THE SECRETARY: Senator Sepúlveda,
14 from the Committee on Judiciary, reports the
15 following nominations.

16 As Interim Justices of the
17 Supreme Court:

18 Debra Givens, of Erie County;

19 Joseph Risi, of Queens County;

20 Tandra Dawson, of New York County;

21 Louis Gigliotti, of Oneida County.

22 And as Judges of the Court of

23 Claims:

24 Adam Silverman, of Albany County;

25 R. Nadine Fontaine, of

1 Albany County;
2 Ramon Rivera, of Madison County;
3 Chris Anne Kelley, of
4 Suffolk County;
5 Anna Grimaldi, of Nassau County;
6 Ellen Tobin, of Nassau County;
7 Richard Horowitz, of Suffolk County;
8 Alicia Gerez, of Nassau County;
9 Raymond Fernandez, of
10 Westchester County;
11 Damaris Torrent, of
12 Westchester County;
13 Charles Troia, of Richmond County;
14 Jeannette Rodriguez-Morick, of
15 New York County;
16 Daniel Conviser, of New York County;
17 Alexander Jeong, of Richmond County;
18 Michele Rodney, of New York County;
19 Sarika Kapoor, of Nassau County;
20 Carmen Victoria St. George, of
21 Suffolk County;
22 Fiordaliza Rodriguez, of
23 Bronx County;
24 Andrew Amer, of New York County;
25 Danielle Eaddy, of Kings County;

1 Troy Smith, of Westchester County;
2 Jennifer Naiburg, of Nassau County;
3 Jordan Katz, of Suffolk County; and
4 Mara McCabe, of Erie County.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
6 Serrano.

7 SENATOR SERRANO: Mr. President, I
8 know we got a little bit ahead of ourselves.

9 But is there a report of the
10 Judiciary Committee at the desk?

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Yes. And
12 the Secretary read, and we are --

13 SENATOR SERRANO: We're good.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: No, we
15 need to --

16 SENATOR SERRANO: Then I move to
17 accept the report of the Judiciary Committee, and
18 I ask that you then recognize Senator Sepúlveda.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: All those
20 in favor of accepting the report of the Judiciary
21 Committee please signify by saying aye.

22 (Response of "Aye.")

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Opposed,
24 nay.

25 (No response.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
2 report of the Judiciary Committee is accepted.

3 Senator Sepúlveda on the
4 nominations.

5 SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA: Thank you,
6 Mr. President, for allowing me to speak on this
7 nomination.

8 But before I do, I just want to take
9 a personal point of privilege and thank retiring
10 Justice Richard Sise, who has been just an
11 incredible leader of the Court of Claims for
12 several years, and he's going to be sorely
13 missed.

14 After much deliberation and
15 commitment and all of the work by all of the
16 nominees, I am proud to announce that today we
17 will bring to the floor the nomination of four
18 interim Supreme Court justices, seven new Court
19 of Claims justices, and 21 who are reappointed or
20 extended.

21 Each and every person who appeared
22 before our Judiciary Committee, every candidate,
23 has an incredible story and an incredible resume.
24 And I am so proud that this is my first nominees
25 as the new chair of the Judiciary Committee, and

1 I am so proud that each and every one of them
2 were here and that I'm able to see some friends
3 and some judges who I've either appeared before,
4 who are excellent justices, and I'm happy to be
5 here to announce their nomination or
6 renomination, and the renomination of the interim
7 justices.

8 Thank you all for being here. Thank
9 you to all my colleagues in the committee who
10 worked so hard and sat with us throughout the
11 process. They did a great job.

12 And now I hereby move the
13 nominations to the floor.

14 Thank you, Mr. President.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
16 you, Senator Sepúlveda.

17 Before we move the nominations,
18 Senator Palumbo on the nominations.

19 SENATOR PALUMBO: Thank you,
20 Mr. President.

21 And I second this batch of nominees
22 and associate myself with the comments of
23 Chairman Sepúlveda.

24 And Judge Sise, thank you for your
25 service to this great state and to the judiciary

1 as a whole. Yesterday during the nominating
2 process, to the person, the nominees described
3 and discussed how grateful they were to the
4 administrative judge. You will be missed.

5 And congratulations to all of those
6 nominees. We all throughout the day had -- we
7 all have different relationships with many of
8 these judges, so I won't single anyone in
9 particular out. But they all have phenomenal
10 resumes. They will continue to do great work
11 and, for some of them, new work.

12 Particularly, while I have to do --
13 maybe I will mention one, Jennifer Naiburg. Her
14 father was a very well respected attorney in
15 Suffolk County and was a family friend as well.
16 So congratulations to you and Ira, also a -- her
17 husband is a very good friend.

18 So congratulations to all of you.

19 Thank you, Mr. President. And I
20 proudly will be voting aye on this resolution.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
22 you, Senator Palumbo.

23 The question for the house is on the
24 nominations.

25 Call the roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
3 the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: In relation to the
5 nominations, voting in the negative are
6 Senators Ashby, Lanza, Mattera, Murray, Myrie,
7 O'Mara, Ortt, Rivera, Stec, Walczyk and Weik.
8 Also Senator Oberacker.

9 Ayes, 44. Nays, 12.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
11 nominees are confirmed.

12 Please rise and be recognized,
13 nominees.

14 (Standing ovation.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:
16 Congratulations, and thank you for your service.
17 Senator Serrano.

18 SENATOR SERRANO: Mr. President,
19 there's a report of the Finance Committee at the
20 desk. Please take that up.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
22 Secretary will read.

23 THE SECRETARY: Senator Krueger,
24 from the Committee on Finance, reports the
25 following nominations.

1 As members of the Metropolitan
2 Transportation Authority Board:

3 Melanie Hartzog, Janette Sadik-Khan,
4 Matthew W. Rand, James O'Donnell.

5 As members of the Advisory Council
6 on Agriculture: Kimberly Ann Wagner,
7 Olivia Fuller, Samuel J. Casella.

8 As members of the Convention Center
9 Operating Corporation: Mark J.F. Schroeder,
10 David Rappaport.

11 As members of the Dormitory
12 Authority: Walter Oden, Elizabeth Velez, and
13 Thehbia Hiwot.

14 As a member of the Port of Oswego
15 Authority: William Crist.

16 As a member of the State Commission
17 of Correction: Alexander Dockery.

18 As a member of the Palisades
19 Interstate Park Commission: Steven Noble.

20 As a member of the Saratoga-Capital
21 District State Park, Recreation and Historic
22 Preservation Commission: Brian Stratton.

23 As a member of the Board of Visitors
24 of the Central New York Developmental
25 Disabilities Services Office: Beverly Gibbs.

1 As a member of the Power Authority
2 of the State of New York: Michael Cusick.

3 As a member of the New York State
4 Energy Research and Development Authority Board:
5 Audrey Zibelman.

6 As a member of the New York
7 Financial Control Board: Kathryn Wylde.

8 As members of the Public Health and
9 Health Planning Council: Christina Gerdes, MD;
10 Kathryn D. Haslanger; and Jon Van Valkenburg.

11 As a trustee of the Board of
12 Trustees of Cornell University: Eric Gonzalez.

13 As members of the State University
14 of New York College of Environmental Science and
15 Forestry: Jessica Ottney Mahar, Peter Smith, and
16 Steven Noble.

17 As members of the Industrial Board
18 of Appeals: Richard Baum, Haeya Yim, and
19 Robert McCreanor.

20 As a member of the State Insurance
21 Fund: Richard Dollinger.

22 As members of the Behavioral Health
23 Services Advisory Council: Alyssa Monfuletho;
24 Christina Gerdes, MD; and Suzanne Lavigne.

25 As members of the New York State

1 Gaming Commission: Martin Mack and
2 Brian O'Dwyer.

3 As a member of the Buffalo and
4 Fort Erie Public Bridge Authority (Peace Bridge):
5 Mark J.F. Schroeder.

6 And as a member of the New York
7 State Thruway Authority: Linda Brown-Robinson.

8 SENATOR SERRANO: I move to accept
9 the report of the Finance Committee, and I ask
10 that you then recognize Senator Liu.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
12 Serrano, I think we're going to temporarily stand
13 at ease.

14 (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease
15 at 2:17 p.m.)

16 (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at
17 2:18 p.m.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
19 Senate will come to order.

20 Senator Serrano.

21 SENATOR SERRANO: Okay.
22 Mr. President, as I was mentioning, I move to
23 accept the report of the Finance Committee, and I
24 ask that you recognize Senator Liu.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: All those

1 in favor of accepting the report of the
2 Finance Committee, please signify by saying aye.

3 (Response of "Aye.")

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Opposed,
5 nay.

6 (No response.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
8 report of the Finance Committee is accepted.

9 Senator Liu on the nominations.

10 SENATOR LIU: Mr. President, the
11 Finance Committee held meetings for the purpose
12 of considering these nominations, and the
13 nominations were forwarded to the Senate floor
14 for passage.

15 Thank you.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
17 you, Senator Liu.

18 Senator Comrie on the nominations.

19 SENATOR COMRIE: Mr. President, the
20 Corporations, Authorities and Commissions
21 Committee also met simultaneously with Finance,
22 and we support and submit the following
23 nominations to the Metropolitan Transit
24 Authority: Melanie Hartzog, Janette Sadik-Khan,
25 Matthew W. Rand, and James O'Donnell, to be

1 members of the Metropolitan Transportation
2 Authority.

3 We also had members for the other
4 groups: Kimberly Ann Wagner, Olivia Fuller and
5 Samuel J. Casella, for the Advisory Council on
6 Agriculture; Mark J.F. Schroeder, for member of
7 the Convention Center Operating Corporation;
8 David Rappaport, for member of the Convention
9 Center Operating Corporation; Walter Oden,
10 Elizabeth Velez and Thehbia Hiwot, for the
11 Dormitory Authority; William Crist, Port of
12 Oswego Authority; Alexander Dockery,
13 State Commission of Correction; Steven Noble,
14 Palisades Interstate Park Commission;
15 Brian Stratton, Saratoga-Capital District State
16 Park, Recreation and Historic Preservation
17 Commission; Beverly Gibbs, Board of Visitors of
18 the Central New York DDSO; Michael Cusick,
19 Power Authority; Audrey Zibelman, NYSERDA Board;
20 Kathryn Wylde, New York Financial Control Board;
21 Christina Gerdes, Kathryn Haslanger and Jon Van
22 Valkenburg, Public Health and Health Planning
23 Council; Eric Gonzalez, Board of Trustees of
24 Cornell University; Jessica Ottney Mahar, Peter
25 Smith and Steven Noble, SUNY College of

1 Environmental Science and Forestry; Richard Baum,
2 Haeya Yim and Robert McCreanor, Industrial Board
3 of Appeals; Richard Dollinger, State Insurance
4 Fund; Alyssa Monfuletho, Christina Gerdes, and
5 Suzanne Lavigne, Behavioral Health Services
6 Advisory Council; Martin Mack, New York State
7 Gaming Commission; Brian O'Dwyer, New York State
8 Gaming Commission; Mark J.F. Schroeder, also who
9 will be a member of the Buffalo and Fort Erie
10 Public Bridge Authority; and Linda
11 Brown-Robinson, New York State Thruway Authority.

12 We submit these names to be accepted
13 in their positions.

14 Thank you, Mr. President.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
16 you, Senator Comrie.

17 The Secretary will read.

18 THE SECRETARY: As members of the
19 Metropolitan Transportation Authority Board:

20 Melanie Hartzog, Janette Sadik-Khan,
21 Matthew W. Rand, and James O'Donnell.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
23 question is on the nominations.

24 Call the roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
2 the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: In relation to the
4 nominations, voting in the negative are
5 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
6 Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martinez,
7 Martins, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara,
8 Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stavisky, Stec,
9 Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

10 Ayes, 36. Nays, 24.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
12 nominees are confirmed.

13 Congratulations to the nominees.
14 Please rise and be recognized.

15 (Standing ovation.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
17 Secretary will read.

18 THE SECRETARY: As members of the
19 Advisory Council on Agriculture: Kimberly Ann
20 Wagner, Olivia Fuller, Samuel J. Casella.

21 As members of the Convention Center
22 Operating Corporation: Mark J.F. Schroeder,
23 David Rappaport.

24 As members of the Dormitory
25 Authority: Walter Oden, Elizabeth Velez, and

1 Thehbia Hiwot.

2 As a member of the Port of Oswego

3 Authority: William Crist.

4 As a member of the State Commission
5 of Correction: Alexander Dockery.

6 As a member of the Palisades
7 Interstate Park Commission: Steven Noble.

8 As a member of the Saratoga-Capital
9 District State Park, Recreation and Historic
10 Preservation Commission: Brian Stratton.

11 As a member of the Board of Visitors
12 of the Central New York Development Disabilities
13 Services Office: Beverly Gibbs.

14 As a member of the Power Authority
15 of the State of New York: Michael Cusick.

16 As a member of the New York State
17 Energy Research and Development Authority Board:
18 Audrey Zibelman.

19 As a member of the New York
20 Financial Control Board: Kathryn Wylde.

21 As members of the Public Health and
22 Health Planning Council: Christina Gerdes, MD;
23 Kathryn D. Haslanger; and Jon Van Valkenburg.

24 As a trustee of the Board of
25 Trustees of Cornell University: Eric Gonzalez.

1 As members of the SUNY College of
2 Environmental Science and Forestry Board of
3 Trustees: Jessica Ottney Mahar, Peter Smith, and
4 Steven Noble.

5 As members of the Industrial Board
6 of Appeals: Richard Baum, Haeya Yim, and
7 Robert McCreanor.

8 As a member of the State Insurance
9 Fund: Richard Dollinger.

10 As members of the Behavioral Health
11 Services Advisory Council: Alyssa Monfuletho;
12 Christina Gerdes, MD; and Suzanne Lavigne.

13 As members of the New York State
14 Gaming Commission: Martin Mack and
15 Brian O'Dwyer.

16 As a member of the Buffalo and
17 Fort Erie Public Bridge Authority (Peace Bridge):
18 Mark J.F. Schroeder.

19 And as a member of the New York
20 State Thruway Authority: Linda Brown-Robinson.

21 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
23 Gianaris.

24 SENATOR GIANARIS: We neglected, on
25 the last batch of nominations, to call on

1 Senator Murray to speak on behalf of the
2 minority.

3 So if we can do that now, and then
4 we'll proceed with the nominees we just heard
5 about.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:
7 Certainly. My apologies.

8 Senator Murray on the nominations.

9 SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you,
10 Mr. President.

11 So we listened to all the names, we
12 listened to all of the different positions,
13 whether it's Agriculture, the Dormitory
14 Authority, the State Commission of Corrections,
15 the Gaming Commission -- all of these different
16 people. And some of the people I know. Some of
17 the people I think are wonderful. But it's many
18 different people, many different positions.

19 Now, I'm holding a calendar here;
20 this is just the first of a few I imagine we're
21 going to see today, with hundreds of bills.
22 Should we just take every bill that deals with
23 healthcare and put it in one pile, every bill
24 that deals with New York City, put it in a pile,
25 and we'll just vote up or down on all of those?

1 That would be ridiculous.

2 This is just as ridiculous. These
3 are important positions, important people with
4 good -- great backgrounds, some outstanding
5 backgrounds. But we should be taking these up
6 individually and show just how important these
7 positions are, how important they are to all of
8 New York's residents.

9 Instead, we're doing one block, up
10 and down. It's absurd. And that's why I've been
11 voting no and will continue to vote no.

12 Thank you, Mr. President.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
14 you, Senator Murray.

15 Senator Gianaris.

16 SENATOR GIANARIS: So it seems like
17 Senator Murray was speaking about all of them
18 generally, which is terrific.

19 Can you please recognize
20 Senator Salazar, for the Majority, on these
21 nominees.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
23 Salazar on the nominations.

24 SENATOR SALAZAR: Thank you,
25 Mr. President.

1 Today is the first time in New York
2 State history that we are voting to confirm a
3 formerly incarcerated individual to become a
4 commissioner on the State Commission of
5 Correction.

6 The State Commission of Correction,
7 the SCOC, was created more 130 years ago. Its
8 original purpose was to have nine commissioners
9 providing rigorous oversight of New York's
10 prisons and jails. Over time, the SCOC's ability
11 to adequately perform that function suffered as
12 the commission was reduced in size and in
13 resources.

14 But last year this Legislature
15 passed and the Governor signed legislation which,
16 among other changes, seeks to expand the
17 State Commission of Correction's size and its
18 diversity.

19 The intent is to ensure the
20 commission has both the capacity and expertise to
21 objectively and effectively oversee New York's
22 correctional facilities. This includes having at
23 least one commissioner who has experienced
24 incarceration firsthand.

25 Alexander Dockery has the

1 experience, the perspective, and the aptitude
2 needed to work with fellow commissioners and
3 staff to provide proper oversight of New York's
4 prisons and jails.

5 Despite having an eighth-grade
6 education upon entering prison at age 15,
7 Mr. Dockery used his time while incarcerated to
8 earn his high school equivalency diploma, his
9 associate's degree, his bachelors degree, and his
10 master's degree while incarcerated.

11 In 2023, in recognition of his clear
12 and remarkable transformation while incarcerated,
13 he was granted Executive clemency by Governor
14 Hochul.

15 Since his commutation, Mr. Dockery
16 has dedicated his life to mentoring young people,
17 volunteering at food pantries, and helping
18 formerly incarcerated New Yorkers transition back
19 into society.

20 Mr. Dockery, I thank you for your
21 dedication, and I look forward to your work as
22 the newest commissioner on the State Commission
23 of Correction.

24 I vote aye.

25 (Applause from the gallery.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
2 question is on the nominations.

3 Call the roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
6 the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: In relation to the
8 nominations, voting in the negative are
9 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
10 Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins,
11 Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt,
12 Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk,
13 Weber and Weik.

14 Ayes, 38. Nays, 22.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
16 nominees are confirmed.

17 And now you may applaud for
18 Mr. Dockery. Congratulations.

19 (Standing ovation.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
21 Gianaris.

22 SENATOR GIANARIS: Let's move on to
23 previously adopted Resolution 2298, by
24 Senator Hinchey. Please read its title and call
25 on Senator Hinchey.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
2 Secretary will read.

3 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 2298, by
4 Senator Hinchey, mourning the death of
5 Minerva Solla, distinguished citizen and devoted
6 advocate for workers' rights and social justice.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
8 Hinchey on the resolution.

9 SENATOR HINCHEY: Thank you,
10 Mr. President.

11 I rise today to commemorate the life
12 of Minerva Solla, a legendary labor leader, a
13 fierce champion for working people, and an
14 unstoppable force for justice, who was taken from
15 us this past April after a long and courageous
16 battle with ovarian cancer.

17 Minerva's life and career were
18 defined by her voice. She was most often seen
19 standing at the picket line, bullhorn in hand,
20 chanting one of her famous rallying calls.

21 She was a pioneering member and
22 community organizer of the Young Lords Party and
23 among the first women to serve in its defense
24 ministry, shaping the movement during its
25 formative years in the late 1960s in New York

1 City.

2 Minerva was fearless in speaking
3 truth to power. But her true gift, the one that
4 made her a legendary leader and mentor to so
5 many, was helping others discover their own power
6 in the struggle for justice and equality.

7 Her passion for organizing was
8 ignited at just 15 years old when CWA called a
9 strike just weeks into her part-time job at
10 Bell Telephone. Despite threats of losing her
11 job, Minerva organized many of her coworkers to
12 join strikers on the line, a bold and fitting
13 beginning to what would become a lifetime of
14 union advocacy.

15 Minerva brought the same fire to
16 Roosevelt Hospital in 1972, where she helped lead
17 a historic 47-day strike that won union
18 representation through 1199SEIU. This victory
19 marked the beginning of a decades' long
20 commitment to 1119, during which Minerva would
21 help shape the union into the powerhouse that it
22 is today, organizing workers from New York City
23 to the Hudson Valley.

24 One of Minerva's proudest victories
25 with 1199 came in the late 1980s at Our Lady of

1 Mercy Hospital in the Bronx, where she helped
2 500 workers secure representation.

3 At the time, Minerva was a single
4 mom raising three kids, ages 2, 8, and 15. She
5 wanted them to see why standing up for what you
6 believe in matters and how being part of a union
7 can change the course of a person's life and
8 future.

9 So she brought her kids into her
10 work and let them see their mother fight for
11 working people. That was Minerva. She lived her
12 values proudly, courageously, and in front of
13 everyone, especially those she loved most.

14 That conviction drove everything she
15 did, and it was always for the betterment of
16 others. It moved her to fight at the picket line
17 and in the halls of government, championing
18 landmark legislation like Paid Family Leave and
19 the Safe Staffing for Quality Care Act.

20 It drove her to found the 1199
21 Latinas Unidas Committee to uplift Latina voices
22 and culture.

23 And when Hurricane Maria devastated
24 Puerto Rico, that same conviction sent her to
25 coordinate humanitarian relief missions to help

1 bring healing to the island.

2 Minerva never slowed down and never
3 stopped fighting. So it came as no surprise when
4 her retirement was a brief 30 days before she
5 rejoined her brothers and sisters in labor, this
6 time working with the New York State Nurses
7 Association as the upstate organizing director
8 for special campaigns.

9 In that role, Minerva built a
10 coalition from the ground up that helped bring 20
11 mental health and detox beds back to Kingston
12 Health Alliance Hospital, a coalition that I was
13 proud to be a part of.

14 That same organizing spirit led her
15 to cofound the Red Carpet for Social Justice, a
16 coalition full of strong, dynamic and determined
17 women working toward a better future for women
18 and girls everywhere.

19 I had the honor of joining one of
20 their celebrations in the city to commemorate
21 legislation that we championed together, and it
22 was unlike any event I've ever been to. It was
23 electric seeing women so proudly representing
24 their cultures, their womanhood, and
25 unapologetically being who they are. The energy,

1 music, speeches and sense of purpose in that room
2 was unforgettable, and I can't wait to go back.

3 Minerva and the sisters, as she
4 lovingly called them, created the idea for
5 New York to commemorate International Women's Day
6 every March 8th. They brought that vision to
7 many of us here in this chamber, and I was proud
8 to sponsor it. And this year marked our third
9 annual observance. And one of the last things we
10 worked on together before Minerva's passing was
11 strategizing how to make this an official state
12 and federal holiday.

13 I can't tell you how proud I was to
14 select Minerva as one of my first Women of
15 Distinction honorees -- one of the easiest
16 decisions I've made. I will cherish our
17 friendship forever, and I will hold even closer
18 the incredible coalition she helped build and the
19 work we will continue to do together in her
20 honor.

21 Minerva was a leader in every sense
22 of the word -- a fighter for working people and
23 the unions that represent them. It has been my
24 privilege to watch this trailblazing woman in her
25 element, to watch her organizing people toward a

1 single mission and, of course, electrifying
2 crowds with the power of her voice.

3 One of my favorite memories with
4 Minerva, of which there are countless -- but it
5 was doing the Electric Slide on Election Day.
6 This is something -- it was a tradition that just
7 happened. It just happened in 2020. I went to
8 meet her, and of course with all of her energy
9 and her fire, she is rallying the people, she's
10 waving at the cars, she's making sure that people
11 know to do their civic duty and to cast their
12 vote, and what power that means.

13 And when I joined her on the
14 sidewalk, we broke into the Electric Slide.

15 (Laughter.)

16 SENATOR HINCHEY: And it was so
17 much fun, something that we talk about all the
18 time, because everything that Minerva did was
19 fun. She brought joy to everything that she did.
20 She brought that power to everything that she
21 did.

22 Every time I saw her, she talked
23 about Puerto Rico. She talked about the
24 importance it was for standing up for people.
25 When we celebrated her life, a moment that I will

1 cherish that I got to be a part of, she joined us
2 through Zoom with her family next to her.

3 She was still teaching us in her
4 final days. She was still teaching to us
5 advocate for housing for everyone, teaching us to
6 treat people with dignity, inspiring us to push
7 for better because the work is never done. And
8 everything that we do in this chamber and that we
9 do outside these halls in our communities will
10 have a flavor of Minerva to it, because she was
11 that big of a presence, that big of an
12 inspiration, and that important of a person.

13 I truly -- I feel her with us all
14 the time, and I truly feel so blessed to have
15 called her a friend.

16 We are joined today in the chamber
17 by Minerva's family -- her loving husband,
18 Bruce Richard; her sister, Gloria Solla, and her
19 sister-in-law, Belinda Matos; and her children:
20 Stepdaughter Gabriela Richard and her partner
21 Alejandro Quiñones; Taina Martinez;
22 Liana Berrios; Jose Gabriel Berrios.

23 We are joined also by many members
24 of the Red Carpet for Social Justice, her sisters
25 in power, her sisters in action.

1 Please, Mr. President, please
2 welcome our guests to the chamber and help us
3 remember Minerva for all the incredible things
4 that she's done. Thank you.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
6 you, Senator Hinchey.

7 Are there any other Senators wishing
8 to be heard on the resolution?

9 Seeing and hearing none,
10 Senator Ramos to close.

11 SENATOR RAMOS: Thank you,
12 Mr. President.

13 This past March I had the honor of
14 being the keynote speaker at the Social Justice
15 Women's Red Carpet event. I had the honor of
16 standing right beside Minerva Solla. I felt her
17 strength, I felt her determination despite her
18 ailment.

19 And for the past 20 years that I
20 personally got to know Minerva, she was always
21 and will always continue to be a source of
22 strength and of daring us to imagine the
23 impossible.

24 Minerva was unapologetic in her
25 pursuit of liberation for the people of

1 Puerto Rico and people all over the world. Yes,
2 she was a nurse, she worked at both NYSNA and
3 1199. But boy, would I -- would I have loved the
4 ability to see her in her younger years as one of
5 the Young Lords on the streets of New York,
6 organizing Latinos in the Bronx and uptown
7 Manhattan, organizing them for dignity, and
8 making sure that the services that our people
9 have paid for for so long were actually delivered
10 with the dignity that we deserve.

11 I will miss Minerva. I already do.
12 I will miss her every day. And I'm very thankful
13 for the honor and the privilege to have known
14 her, to have worked with her, and to have stood
15 shoulder to shoulder with her just a few days
16 before she passed.

17 Thank you, Mr. President.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
19 you, Senator Ramos.

20 To the Solla family, first and
21 foremost, que viva Puerto Rico!

22 We welcome you on behalf of the
23 New York State Senate, and we commemorate her
24 legacy.

25 And to her family and friends in

1 labor, and blood family, we recognize her and we
2 welcome you on behalf of the Senate. We extend
3 to you all the privileges and courtesies of this
4 house.

5 Please rise and be recognized.

6 (Extended standing ovation.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
8 resolution was adopted on June 2nd.

9 Senator Serrano.

10 SENATOR SERRANO: Mr. President,
11 let's take up previously adopted Resolution 2272,
12 by Senator Skoufis. Let's read that resolution
13 title only and call on Senator Skoufis.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
15 Secretary will read.

16 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 2272, by
17 Senator Skoufis, congratulating Daniel Casper of
18 Briarcliff, New York, upon the occasion of
19 representing the United States as an
20 Olympic curler in the Milano Cortina 2026
21 Winter Olympic Games in February 2026.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
23 Skoufis on the resolution.

24 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Thank you very
25 much, Mr. President.

1 Proud to rise today to welcome our
2 honored guests who have joined us on the
3 Senate floor this afternoon. You know, the first
4 evidence of a curling stone was found in
5 Scotland, inscribed with the year 1511.

6 Today we're here to honor an
7 Olympian and New York native, Daniel Casper, who
8 represented us on the USA Men's Curling Team in
9 the 2026 Olympics in Italy, now over 500 years
10 after history's first recorded stone slid across
11 the ice.

12 A winter sport requiring incredible
13 precision, curling has a long and storied
14 history, and so does Danny Casper. It was
15 Danny's father, Jeff Casper, who got him started
16 at Westchester's Ardsley Curling Club, where I
17 myself curled for many years beginning about a
18 couple of decades ago.

19 But Danny comes from a long and
20 successful family history in the sport. His
21 great-aunt, Carla Casper, competed at the 1988
22 Calgary Olympics. And Carla Casper's husband,
23 Tom Casper, coached Team USA at the 1998 Nagano
24 Olympics.

25 Danny Casper is a skip -- or, for

1 everyone else who doesn't curl, captain of his
2 team, the position who leads on overall strategy.

3 He competed with the US team at the
4 2023 FISU World University Games in Lake Placid,
5 where his team won silver.

6 Danny's team went on to compete and
7 medal at the national championships in 2023 and
8 2025, then on to the professional circuit.

9 Danny was diagnosed with an
10 autoimmune disease, Guillain-Barre Syndrome,
11 which causes the body's immune system to attack
12 the nerves, causing weakness, numbness or
13 paralysis. The onset caused him to miss part of
14 the 2024-2025 curling season and to even struggle
15 to walk or use his hands. And yet despite these
16 challenges, Danny qualified and competed as skip
17 on the USA Men's Curling Team in the 2026 Winter
18 Olympics, an incredible story of perseverance
19 overcoming enormous adversity to represent our
20 country on the world's stage of the greatest
21 athletes.

22 Congratulations to Daniel Casper for
23 these incredible achievements. New York and the
24 nation are deeply proud of your achievements as
25 the United States representative in the recent

1 Olympics. I vote yes on this resolution.

2 And, Mr. President, if you could
3 please afford a warm welcome to Danny and his
4 father this afternoon.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
6 you, Senator Skoufis.

7 To New York's own Olympian in
8 curling, Mr. Daniel Casper, and his father, we
9 welcome you on behalf of the Senate and thank you
10 for all of your contributions to our great
11 country.

12 We extend to you all the privileges
13 and courtesies of this house. Please rise and be
14 recognized.

15 (Standing ovation.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
17 resolution was adopted on June 2nd.

18 Senator Serrano.

19 SENATOR SERRANO: Mr. President,
20 there's a report of the Rules Committee at the
21 desk.

22 Please take that up.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
24 Secretary will read.

25 THE SECRETARY: Senator

1 Stewart-Cousins, from the Committee on Rules,
2 reports the following bills:

3 Senate Print 82B, by Senator Liu, an
4 act to amend the Education Law;

5 Senate Print 118A, by
6 Senator Cleare, an act to amend the Elder Law;

7 Senate Print 845A, by
8 Senator Salazar, an act to amend the
9 Public Health Law;

10 Senate Print 1004B, by
11 Senator Brouk, an act to amend the
12 Criminal Procedure Law;

13 Senate Print 1086D, by
14 Senator Rivera, an act to amend the
15 Civil Rights Law;

16 Senate Print 1335C, by
17 Senator Parker, an act to amend the
18 General Municipal Law;

19 Senate Print 1455B, by
20 Senator Kavanagh, an act to amend the
21 Executive Law;

22 Senate Print 1511A, by Senator Liu,
23 an act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law;

24 Senate Print 3622, by Senator Ortt,
25 an act to amend the Highway Law;

1 Senate Print 4230, by
2 Senator Comrie, an act to amend the Vehicle and
3 Traffic Law;

4 Senate Print 4527B, by
5 Senator Comrie, an act to amend the Tax law;

6 Senate Print 4593, by Senator Fahy,
7 an act in relation to directing the New York
8 State Department of Labor to establish a
9 voluntary training and certification program;

10 Senate Print 4894, by
11 Senator Jackson, an act to repeal paragraph (g)
12 of subdivision 4 of Section 209 of the
13 Civil Service Law;

14 Senate Print 5711C, by
15 Senator Skoufis, Concurrent Resolution of the
16 Senate and Assembly proposing amendments to
17 Section 21 of Article 6, of Article 13, and
18 Section 6 of Article 4 of the Constitution;

19 Senate Print 5754B, by
20 Senator Martinez, an act to amend the Retirement
21 and Social Security Law;

22 Senate Print 6008B, by
23 Senator Baskin, an act to amend the Highway Law;

24 Senate Print 6043, by
25 Senator Cleare, an act to amend the Elder Law;

1 Senate Print 6376A, by
2 Senator Scarcella-Spanton, an act to amend the
3 Workers' Compensation Law;

4 Senate Print 6736A, by Senator Fahy,
5 an act to amend the Social Services Law;

6 Senate Print 6983A, by
7 Senator Brisport, an act to amend the
8 Public Health Law;

9 Senate Print 7585A, by
10 Senator Cleare, an act to amend the
11 General Business Law;

12 Senate Print 7635B, by Senator Ryan,
13 an act to amend the Retirement and Social
14 Security Law;

15 Senate Print 7802A, by
16 Senator Harckham, an act to amend the Vehicle and
17 Traffic Law;

18 Senate Print 7819, by
19 Senator Cleare, an act to amend the
20 Mental Hygiene Law;

21 Senate Print 7867A, by
22 Senator Walczyk, an act to amend the Tax Law;

23 Senate Print 8015B, by
24 Senator Comrie, an act to amend the
25 General Business Law;

1 Senate Print 8205A, by
2 Senator Brisport, an act to amend the
3 Social Services Law;

4 Senate Print 8217B, by
5 Senator Hinchey, an act to amend the
6 Criminal Procedure Law;

7 Senate Print 8237, by
8 Senator Parker, an act to amend the
9 Public Authorities Law;

10 Senate Print 8239, by Senator Ramos,
11 an act to amend the Labor Law;

12 Senate Print 8240, by Senator Ramos,
13 an act to amend the Workers' Compensation Law;

14 Senate Print 8246, by Senator Myrie,
15 an act to amend the State Finance Law;

16 Senate Print 8253, by
17 Senator Brisport, an act to amend the
18 Abandoned Property Law;

19 Senate Print 8302D, by
20 Senator Comrie, an act to amend the Penal Law;

21 Senate Print 8364, by Senator Webb,
22 an act to amend the Education Law;

23 Senate Print 8385, Senator Comrie,
24 an act to amend the State Finance Law;

25 Senate Print 8407, by Senator Fahy,

1 an act to amend the Social Services Law;

2 Senate Print 8410, by

3 Senator Comrie, an act to amend the

4 Vehicle and Traffic Law;

5 Senate Print 8472A, by

6 Senator Cleare, an act to amend the

7 Administrative Code of the City of New York;

8 Senate Print 8838A, by

9 Senator Rivera, an act to amend the

10 Social Services Law;

11 Senate Print 8852C, by

12 Senator Harckham, an act in relation to

13 authorizing the County of Putnam to lease

14 certain lands used as parklands;

15 Senate Print 8865A, by

16 Senator Harckham, an act to amend the

17 Public Service Law;

18 Senate Print 8926, by Senator Ryan,

19 an act to amend the Public Authorities Law;

20 Senate Print 8965, by

21 Senator Hinchey, an act to amend the

22 Public Health Law;

23 Senate Print 9068A, by

24 Senator Griffo, an act to amend the

25 Retirement and Social Security Law;

1 Senate Print 9138, by
2 Senator Palumbo, an act relating to a
3 death benefit option for the beneficiary of
4 Justice Jerry Garguilo;

5 Senate Print 9221, by Senator Ryan,
6 an act to amend the Mental Hygiene Law;

7 Senate Print 9287A, by
8 Senator Hinchey, an act to amend the
9 Real Property Tax Law;

10 Senate Print 9363, by
11 Senator Palumbo, an act in relation to increasing
12 the term of office from two years to four years
13 for the Trustees of the Freeholders and
14 Commonalty of the Town of Southampton;

15 Senate Print 9441, by Senator Chan,
16 an act to amend the Multiple Dwelling Law;

17 Senate Print 9453, by
18 Senator Rolison, an act to amend the
19 Vehicle and Traffic Law;

20 Senate Print 9508, by
21 Senator Gounardes, an act to amend the
22 General Business Law;

23 Senate Print 9509, by Senator Ortt,
24 an act to amend the Highway Law;

25 Senate Print 9606, by Senator Ortt,

1 an act to amend subpart H of Part C of Chapter 20
2 of the Laws of 2015;

3 Senate Print 9654, by
4 Senator Murray, an act to amend the Highway Law;

5 Senate Print 9682, by Senator Liu,
6 an act to amend the Education Law;

7 Senate Print 9723A, by
8 Senator Cleare, an act to amend the
9 Public Housing Law;

10 Senate Print 9725B, by
11 Senator Harckham, an act to amend the
12 Highway Law;

13 Senate Print 9736, by
14 Senator Kavanagh, an act to amend the Penal Law;

15 Senate Print 9904, by Senator Ramos,
16 an act to amend the Labor Law;

17 Senate Print 9905, by
18 Senator Jackson, an act to amend the
19 Retirement and Social Security Law;

20 Senate Print 9906, by Senator Myrie,
21 an act to amend the Criminal Procedure Law;

22 Senate Print 9940, by
23 Senator Scarcella-Spanton, an act to amend the
24 Veterans' Services Law;

25 Senate Print 9982A, by

1 Senator Tedisco, an act in relation to
2 authorizing Kurt Nolan to receive certain credit
3 under Section 384-d and 384-e of the
4 Retirement and Social Security Law;

5 Senate Print 10058C, by
6 Senator Harckham, an act to amend the
7 Vehicle and Traffic Law;

8 Senate Print 10079, by
9 Senator Gianaris, an act to amend the
10 Executive Law;

11 Senate Print 10095B, by
12 Senator Rhoads, an act authorizing the
13 Hicksville Water District to receive
14 retroactive real property tax-exempt status;

15 Senate Print 10156B, by
16 Senator Fernandez, an act to amend the
17 Vehicle and Traffic Law;

18 Senate Print 10172, by
19 Senator Skoufis, an act to amend the
20 Alcoholic Beverage Control Law;

21 Senate Print 10196A, by
22 Senator Fahy, an act to amend the
23 Vehicle and Traffic Law;

24 Senate Print 10223A, by
25 Senator Fahy, an act to authorize the South End

1 Children's Cafe to file an application for a
2 retroactive real property tax exemption;

3 Senate Print 10443, by
4 Senator Myrie, an act to amend the
5 Criminal Procedure Law;

6 Senate Print 10446, by
7 Senator Kavanagh, an act to amend Chapter 514
8 of the Laws of 1983;

9 Senate Print 10489, by
10 Senator Bynoe, an act to amend the
11 Local Finance Law;

12 Senate Print 10528, by
13 Senator Oberacker, an act to amend the
14 Alcoholic Beverage Control Law;

15 Senate Print 10563, by
16 Senator Skoufis, an act to amend the
17 Election Law;

18 Senate Print 10603, by
19 Senator Weber, an act authorizing the
20 Kong Kehal Square of Roman to receive
21 retroactive real property tax-exempt status;

22 Senate Print 10611, by
23 Senator Stewart-Cousins, an act authorizing the
24 Town of Greenburgh, County of Westchester, to
25 alienate and discontinue the use of certain

1 parkland;

2 Senate Print 10614, by
3 Senator Palumbo, an act to amend Chapter 704 of
4 the Laws of 2023;

5 Senate Print 10616, by
6 Senator Gonzalez, an act to amend the
7 Alcoholic Beverage Control Law;

8 Senate Print 10624, by
9 Senator Bynoe, an act to authorize the
10 Freeport Bible Center to file an application for
11 a retroactive real property tax exemption;

12 Senate Print 10626, by
13 Senator Gianaris, an act to amend the
14 Judiciary Law;

15 Senate Print 10627, by
16 Senator Mayer, an act to amend the
17 General Business Law;

18 Senate Print 10628, by
19 Senator Baskin, an act to amend the
20 State Finance Law;

21 Senate Print 10629, by
22 Senator Jackson, an act to amend the
23 Civil Service Law;

24 Senate Print 10632, by
25 Senator Fernandez, an act to amend the Penal Law;

1 Senate Print 10635, by
2 Senator Kavanagh, an act to amend the
3 Multiple Dwelling Law;

4 Senate Print 10636, by
5 Senator Gounardes, an act to amend the
6 General Municipal Law;

7 Senate Print 10639, by
8 Senator Gianaris, an act to amend the
9 Election Law;

10 Senate Print 10640, by
11 Senator Gianaris, an act to amend Chapter 704 of
12 the Laws of 1991;

13 Senate Print 10641, by
14 Senator Comrie, an act to amend the New York
15 State Medical Care Facilities Finance Agency Act;

16 Senate Print 10642, by
17 Senator Gonzalez, an act to amend the
18 Environmental Conservation Law;

19 Senate Print 10644, by
20 Senator Stewart-Cousins, an act to amend the
21 Chapter 747 of the Laws of 2023;

22 Senate Print 10648, by
23 Senator Stavisky, an act implementing an
24 agreement between the state and an employee
25 organization.

1 All bills reported direct to third
2 reading.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: All those
4 in favor of accepting the report of the
5 Rules Committee please signify by saying aye.

6 (Response of "Aye.")

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Opposed,
8 nay.

9 (No response.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
11 report of the Rules Committee is accepted.

12 Senator Serrano.

13 (Pause.)

14 SENATOR SERRANO: Thank you,
15 Mr. President. I move to accept the report of
16 the Rules Committee.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: All those
18 in favor of accepting the report of the
19 Rules Committee please signify by saying aye.

20 (Response of "Aye.")

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Opposed,
22 nay?

23 (No response.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
25 report of the Rules Committee is accepted.

1 Senator Serrano.

2 SENATOR SERRANO: Thank you,
3 Mr. President.

4 At this time let's take up the
5 reading of the calendar.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
7 Secretary will read.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 102, Assembly Bill Number 7594C, by
10 Assemblymember Lunsford, an act to amend the
11 Environmental Conservation Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
15 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
16 shall have become a law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
21 the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 141, Assembly Bill Number 2400A, by
2 Assemblymember Eichenstein, an act to amend the
3 Public Service Law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
7 act shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 181, Assembly Bill Number 5079E, by
18 Assemblymember O'Pharrow, an act to amend the
19 General Business Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
23 act shall take effect August 1, 2027.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
3 the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
5 Calendar 181, voting in the negative are
6 Senators Borrello, Griffo, Oberacker, O'Mara,
7 Ortt, Walczyk and Weik. Also Senator Stec.

8 Ayes, 52. Nays, 8.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 205, Senate Print 8609A, by Senator Myrie, an act
13 to amend the Penal Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 7. This
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
25 is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 231, Senate Print 8742, by Senator Cleare, an act
3 to amend the Elder Law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
7 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
8 shall have become a law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
13 the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 319, Senate Print 6655, by Senator Griffo, an act
19 to amend the Education Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)
2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
3 the results.
4 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.
5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
6 is passed.
7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 362, Senate Print 9057A, by Senator Baskin, an
9 act to amend the Highway Law.
10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
11 last section.
12 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
13 act shall take effect immediately.
14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
15 roll.
16 (The Secretary called the roll.)
17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
18 the results.
19 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.
20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
21 is passed.
22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 395, Senate Print 8949, by Senator Harckham, an
24 act to amend the Public Health Law.
25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 401, Senate Print 1615A, by Senator Brisport, an
14 act to amend the Real Property Actions and
15 Proceedings Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
19 act shall take effect immediately.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: In relation to

1 Calendar 401, voting in the negative are
2 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
3 Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins,
4 Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt,
5 Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk,
6 Weber and Weik.

7 Ayes, 38. Nays, 22.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 433, Assembly Bill Number 6578B, by
12 Assemblymember Bores, an act to amend the
13 General Business Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
24 Calendar 433, voting in the negative are
25 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Helming, Martins,

1 O'Mara, Rhoads, Stec and Walczyk.

2 Ayes, 53. Nays, 7.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 435, Senate Print 4037C, by Senator Skoufis, an
7 act to amend the Education Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 11. This
11 act shall take effect on the first of July.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
18 Calendar 435, voting in the negative are
19 Senators Borrello, Chan, Gallivan, Helming,
20 Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Murray, O'Mara, Ortt,
21 Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

22 Ayes, 44. Nays, 16.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 644, Senate Print 1463B, by Senator Kavanagh, an
2 act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

3 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Lay it
5 aside.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 731, Assembly Bill Number 6950, by
8 Assemblymember Cruz, an act to amend the
9 Labor Law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
11 last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
13 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
14 shall have become a law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
19 Ramos to explain her vote.

20 SENATOR RAMOS: Yeah, thank you,
21 Mr. President.

22 You know, there's an old adage in
23 the building trades that goes that if you're
24 early, you're on time. And if you're on time,
25 you're late.

1 Construction workers understand that
2 showing up matters, and they know that if they're
3 late by even just a few minutes, their pay is
4 most likely going to be docked for at least an
5 hour.

6 But too often the opposite isn't
7 true. A worker gets up before dawn, gets
8 dressed, travels to the job site, arranges
9 childcare, shows up ready to work only to be told
10 the job has been canceled because of the weather
11 or some other reason beyond their control -- and
12 suddenly, that day's pay is gone. The worker
13 kept their commitment, and the employer faced no
14 consequence.

15 Well, that's not fair. And this
16 bill establishes that when workers show up ready
17 to work, their time is valued. If a construction
18 worker reports to a job site and is sent home
19 without cause, they should be compensated at
20 least for some of their time. And if a shift is
21 canceled with little notice, workers should not
22 bear the full cost of that decision.

23 The people who build New York
24 deserve more than our gratitude, they deserve
25 predictability and respect. Their time is

1 valuable too, and nothing gets build without
2 their hands.

3 I vote aye. Thank you.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
5 Ramos to be recorded in the affirmative.

6 Announce the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
8 Calendar 731, voting in the negative are
9 Senators Ashby, Gallivan, Helming, Murray,
10 O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk and Weik.

11 Ayes, 50. Nays, 10.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
13 is passed.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 759, Senate Print 6439, by Senator Fahy, an act
16 in relation to issuing the Village of Nelliston
17 incorporation documents.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: There is
19 a home-rule message at the desk.

20 Read the last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
22 act shall take effect immediately.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
2 the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 761, Assembly Bill Number 7620, by
8 Assemblymember Kelles, an act to amend the
9 General Municipal Law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
11 last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
13 act shall take effect immediately.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
18 the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
21 is passed.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 817, Senate Print 9301, by Senator Martinez, an
24 act to amend the Parks, Recreation and
25 Historic Preservation Law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
2 last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
4 act shall take effect immediately.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
9 the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 854, Senate Print 9051B, by Senator Gonzalez,
15 an act to amend the General Business Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
19 act shall take effect January 1, 2027.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
2 is passed.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 872, Senate Print 5900A, by Senator Lanza, an act
5 to amend the Mental Hygiene Law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
9 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it
10 shall have become a law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
15 the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 920, Senate Print 3822, by Senator Rivera, an act
21 to amend the Public Health Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 13. This
25 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it

1 shall have become a law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
6 the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
8 Calendar 920, voting in the negative:
9 Senator Ortt.

10 Ayes, 59. Nays 1.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 928, Senate Print 9126B, by Senator Baskin, an
15 act to amend the Correction Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This
19 act shall take effect immediately.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
24 Baskin to explain her vote.

25 SENATOR BASKIN: Thank you,

1 Mr. President.

2 2026 marks 10 years since
3 India Cummings died while in custody at the
4 Erie County sheriff's office.

5 India was born and raised in
6 Rochester. Later in life, she and her mother
7 moved to my district, where she lived in the City
8 of Lackawanna.

9 I started my legislative career
10 about two years after India's death. But the
11 aftermath of the situation engulfed my early
12 years as an elected official. Six months
13 after I took my oath of office as a county
14 legislator, the State Commission on Corrections
15 determined India's death was a homicide due to
16 neglect.

17 She was not eating, she was not
18 drinking, she was living in extremely unsanitary
19 conditions, and she had an untreated broken arm.
20 Her mental health severely deteriorated in jail.
21 And despite two different judges ordering her to
22 undergo a psychiatric evaluation, she did not
23 receive one before her untimely death.

24 This bill before us seeks to remedy
25 two points that I believe could have saved

1 India's life. One, timely transfer to a mental
2 health facility. And two, early intervention for
3 a family member.

4 This bill requires the process for a
5 mental health evaluation to start within 48 hours
6 of a mental health crisis. India sat in the
7 Erie County holding center for two weeks without
8 any mental health intervention.

9 I have spoken with India's mother a
10 number of times over the years, and she truly
11 believed that if she, as a mother, was allowed to
12 speak or knew what was happening with her
13 daughter, she could have helped prevent her
14 baby's death.

15 India's death was a primary
16 motivator for this legislative action as I took
17 my seat as a county legislator. It led to many
18 things in county government in Erie County. It
19 led to me bringing body cameras and a blind-spot
20 camera into Erie County jails. It led to the
21 creation of the Erie County Corrections
22 Specialist Advisory Board. And it led to the
23 creation of a medically assisted treatment
24 program in Erie County jails.

25 But these improvements did not

1 directly address the causes of India's death. I
2 was determined to pass a bill before, as a county
3 local law, but was told it had to be done as a
4 state bill.

5 So here I am today, Mr. President,
6 determined not to let India Cummings' death to be
7 in vain -- and to say her name just like we say
8 the name of Robert Brooks, just like we must say
9 the name of Messiah Nantwi and many others who
10 have died in our incarceration system.

11 I want to especially shout out and
12 thank our colleague Senator Julia Salazar for her
13 intentional and steadfast leadership on
14 correctional reform our state. Her push for many
15 reforms that have been signed into law earlier
16 this year will definitely save lives. And I am
17 hopeful that this bill will too become a law that
18 saves lives.

19 India Cummings, I say your name. I
20 vote aye on this bill, and I thank you and
21 encourage my colleagues to do the same.

22 Thank you, Mr. President.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
24 Baskin to be recorded in the affirmative.

25 Announce the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
2 Calendar 928, voting in the negative:
3 Senator Walczyk.

4 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
6 is passed.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 1001, Assembly Bill Number 1130A, by
9 Assemblymember Santabarbara, an act to amend the
10 Mental Hygiene Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
14 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it
15 shall have become a law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 1009, Senate Print 8616B, by Senator Gianaris, an

1 act to amend the General Business Law.

2 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Lay it
4 aside.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 1034, Senate Print 172B, by Senator Ramos, an act
7 to amend the Workers' Compensation Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 18. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
16 Ramos to explain her vote.

17 SENATOR RAMOS: Yes, thank you,
18 Mr. President.

19 Today we are once again doing our
20 part to bring New York's temporary disability
21 insurance system into the 21st century.

22 For far too long, workers facing
23 illness, injury or pregnancy-related medical
24 conditions have been forced to survive on a
25 benefit that has barely changed since 1989.

1 Think about how much housing costs have gone up
2 since then -- food, healthcare, gas. But the
3 maximum disability benefit has remained stuck at
4 just \$170 per week. No one can live on \$170 a
5 week nowadays.

6 And when a worker gets sick, the
7 last thing they should have to worry about is
8 whether they can keep a roof over their head or
9 food on the table.

10 This bill recognizes that when life
11 happens, workers deserve stability. By gradually
12 increasing disability benefits and bringing them
13 into alignment with paid family leave, we are
14 modernizing a system that working people have
15 been waiting decades to fix.

16 We are also providing greater
17 flexibility for workers managing chronic
18 illnesses and medical appointments and extending
19 support to experiencing the heartbreak of
20 pregnancy loss.

21 At its core, this bill is about
22 dignity and economic security. And it is about
23 making sure that a temporary health crisis
24 doesn't become a permanent financial crisis.

25 I proudly vote aye.

1 Thank you.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
3 Ramos to be recorded in the affirmative.

4 Announce the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
6 Calendar 1034, voting in the negative are
7 Senators Borrello, Lanza, Murray, O'Mara, Ortt,
8 Stec, Walczyk and Weik. Also Senator Oberacker.

9 Ayes, 51. Nays, 9.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
11 is passed.

12 Senator Serrano.

13 SENATOR SERRANO: Thank you,
14 Mr. President.

15 At this moment I'd like to just
16 welcome Senator Toby Stavisky back to the floor.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Toby!
18 (Standing ovation.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Toby!
20 The Secretary will read.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1056, Assembly Bill Number 9113B, by
23 Assemblymember Woerner, an act to amend the
24 Racing, Pari-Mutuel Wagering and Breeding Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 1066, Senate Print 8454A, by Senator Stec, an act
14 to amend the Public Officers Law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
18 act shall take effect immediately.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
25 Calendar 1066, voting in the negative:

1 Senator Ryan.

2 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 1082, Assembly Bill Number 11412, by
7 Assemblymember Bronson, an act to amend the
8 Tax Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
12 act shall take effect immediately.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
15 the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
17 Calendar Number 1082, voting in the negative:
18 Senator Walczyk.

19 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
21 is passed.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 1086, Senate Print 9990A, by Senator Skoufis, an
24 act to amend the Alcoholic Beverage Control Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 1094, Senate Print 6230C, by Senator Webb, an act
14 to amend the Public Health Law.

15 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Lay it
17 aside.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 1105, Assembly Bill Number 3058C, by
20 Assemblymember Carroll, an act to amend the
21 General Business Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
25 act shall take effect one year after it shall

1 have become a law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
6 the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
8 Calendar 1105, voting in the negative are
9 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
10 Chan, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming, Lanza, Mattera,
11 Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,
12 Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

13 Ayes, 39. Nays, 21.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 1107, Assembly Bill Number 10411A, by
18 Assemblymember Magnarelli, an act to amend the
19 General Business Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
23 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
24 shall have become a law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
6 Calendar 1107, voting in the negative are
7 Senators Borrello, Gallivan and Walczyk.

8 Ayes, 57. Nays, 3.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 1118, Assembly Bill Number 4713A, by
13 Assemblymember Sayegh, an act to amend the
14 Public Service Law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
18 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
19 shall have become a law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: In relation to

1 Calendar 1118, voting in the negative are
2 Senators Gallivan, Griffo, Stec and Walczyk.

3 Ayes, 56. Nays, 4.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 1126, Senate Print 8426A, by Senator Brouk, an
8 act to amend the Insurance Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
12 act shall take effect immediately.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
19 Calendar Number 1126, voting in the negative are
20 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
21 Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Mattera,
22 Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,
23 Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

24 Ayes, 40. Nays, 20.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill

1 is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 1141, Assembly Bill Number 3987A, by
4 Assemblymember Shimsky, an act to amend the
5 Criminal Procedure Law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
14 the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
16 Calendar 1141, voting in the negative are
17 Senators Brisport and Krueger.

18 Ayes, 58. Nays, 2.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1142, Assembly Bill Number 3988A, by
23 Assemblymember Shimsky, an act to amend the
24 Criminal Procedure Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
10 Calendar 1142, voting in the negative are
11 Senators Brisport and Krueger.

12 Ayes, 58. Nays, 2.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 1145, Senate Print 9040, by Senator Hinchey, an
17 act to amend the Penal Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
3 Calendar 1145, voting in the negative are
4 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
5 Chan, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming, Lanza, Martins,
6 Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt,
7 Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk,
8 Weber and Weik.

9 Ayes, 38. Nays, 22.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 1148, Senate Print 10106, by
14 Senator Stewart-Cousins, an act to amend the
15 Criminal Procedure Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
19 act shall take effect immediately.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: In relation to

1 Calendar 1148, voting in the negative are
2 Senators Brisport and Krueger.

3 Ayes, 58. Nays, 2.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 1151, Assembly Bill Number 10835A, by
8 Assemblymember Griffin, an act to amend the
9 Civil Service Law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
11 last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
13 act shall take effect immediately.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll).

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
18 the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
21 is passed.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 1181, Senate Print 5998C, by Senator Skoufis, an
24 act to amend the Domestic Relations Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 7. This
3 act shall take effect on the 270th day after it
4 shall have become a law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
9 Skoufis to explain his vote.

10 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Thank you very
11 much, Mr. President.

12 Briefly, I want to express my
13 gratitude to colleagues on both sides of the
14 aisle who have long supported this bill.

15 I was honored to carry the torch
16 after former Senator Anna Kaplan did not return
17 to the chamber. Jacqueline Franchetti, the
18 mother of Kyra, reached out to me asking if I
19 would continue sponsoring this bill in this
20 chamber, and of course I said yes.

21 We worked very hard, including with
22 Assemblyman Andy Hevesi, over the course of many
23 years. We've passed this bill before. And we
24 believe now OCA is in a good place, and many
25 other stakeholders are in a good place, and we're

1 hopeful that this will be the first time that the
2 bill passes both houses.

3 This is a really critical piece of
4 legislation. In too many Family Courts around
5 New York State we have instances -- we have some
6 judges who, yes, they may prioritize the health
7 and wellness of a child, but some do not make it
8 the top, the number-one priority of custody
9 cases. And of course I think everyone here in
10 this chamber would agree that that ought to be
11 the number one, the top priority.

12 That's what this bill does. It
13 makes sure that dealing with allegations that may
14 impact a child's safety aren't deferred, aren't
15 dealt with sometime down the road in some
16 subsequent hearing -- they're dealt with
17 immediately. Because unfortunately, in
18 Jacqueline's case, not dealing with those
19 red flags cost her daughter her life.

20 There are too many other children
21 who are dying at the hands of violent domestic
22 partners or spouses, and this bill will help save
23 lives and put an end to that.

24 So I thank my colleagues again.

25 I vote yes.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
2 Skoufis to be recorded in the affirmative.

3 Announce the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
6 is passed.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 1183, Senate Print 8118C, by Senator Kavanaugh, an
9 act to amend the Real Property Law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
11 last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
13 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
14 shall have become a law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
19 the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
21 Calendar 1183, voting in the negative are
22 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
23 Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins,
24 Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Palumbo,
25 Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber

1 and Weik.

2 Ayes, 39. Nays, 21.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 1188, Senate Print 9773, by Senator Sepúlveda, an
7 act to amend the Judiciary Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
11 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it
12 shall have become a law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
19 Calendar 1188, voting in the negative are
20 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
21 Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza,
22 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Stec,
23 Tedisco, Weber. Also Senator Martins.

24 Ayes, 43. Nays, 17.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill

1 is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 1205, Senate Print 4757, by Senator Bailey, an
4 act to amend the Executive Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
8 act shall take effect on the first of April.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
13 the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
15 Calendar 1205, voting in the negative:
16 Senator Walczyk.

17 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 1213, Assembly Bill Number 10135, by
22 Assemblymember Barrett, an act to amend the
23 Public Service Law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
25 last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
2 act shall take effect immediately.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 1222, Senate Print 2377, by Senator Mattera, an
13 act to amend the Public Authorities Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
25 is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 1231, Senate Print 1965, by Senator Rivera, an
3 act to amend the Public Health Law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
7 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
8 shall have become a law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
13 the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
15 Calendar 1231, voting in the negative are
16 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
17 Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martinez,
18 Martins, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara,
19 Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco,
20 Walczyk, Weber and Weik. Also Senator Skoufis.

21 Ayes, 36. Nays, 24.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
23 is passed.

24 Senator Serrano.

25 SENATOR SERRANO: Mr. President,

1 Senator Ramos wanted to explain her vote on
2 Calendar 1151.

3 Upon consent, we've agreed to allow
4 her to speak on that now.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
6 Ramos to explain her vote.

7 SENATOR RAMOS: Yeah, thank you,
8 Mr. President.

9 This is an important bill to state
10 on the record that workers deserve to know who is
11 actually communicating with them. Across the
12 country we have seen outside organizations send
13 deceptive mailers, emails and communications
14 designed to look like they come from a workers'
15 union when they did not.

16 The goal is often confusion, to
17 mislead workers and interfere with the
18 relationship between workers and the
19 organizations they have chosen to represent them.

20 This legislation prohibits the false
21 impersonation of employee organizations and their
22 representatives and gives the Attorney General
23 the authority to take action against those who
24 intentionally engage in these deceptive
25 practices.

1 And I want to take a moment to
2 address concerns that have been raised by some
3 rank-and-file union members and reform advocates.
4 I want to be very clear about legislative intent
5 on the record.

6 This bill is about fraud and
7 deception. It is not about silencing criticism.
8 It's not about limiting union democracy. It is
9 not about preventing members from organizing,
10 advocating for reform, running for office,
11 criticizing leadership, distributing literature,
12 participating in caucuses, or engaging in
13 vigorous debate about the future of their unions.

14 A healthy labor movement depends on
15 active, engaged members who are willing to ask
16 questions, challenge leadership, and advocate for
17 change. Nothing in this legislation shall be
18 construed as restricting those rights.

19 The target of this bill is much
20 narrower. If you want to criticize a union, you
21 have that right. If you want to disagree with a
22 union, you have that right. But you do not have
23 the right to pretend to be the union in order to
24 mislead workers.

25 Workers deserve honest information,

1 transparency, and they deserve the freedom to
2 make informed decisions without being subjected
3 to fraud.

4 I vote aye. Thank you.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
6 Ramos to be recorded in the affirmative.

7 The Secretary will read.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 1243, Senate Print 2317A, by Senator Skoufis, an
10 act to amend the General Municipal Law.

11 (Pause.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
13 Secretary will read.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 1243, Senate Print 2317A, by Senator Skoufis, an
16 act to amend the General Municipal Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
20 act shall take effect immediately.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
25 the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
2 Calendar 1243, voting in the negative are
3 Senators Baskin, Borrello, Bynoe,
4 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffio,
5 Martinez, Martins, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt,
6 Rhoads, Tedisco, Walczyk and Zellner.

7 Ayes, 45. Nays, 15.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1266, Senate Print 5713, by Senator Skoufis, an
12 act to amend the Railroad Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
16 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it
17 shall have become a law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
24 Calendar 1266, voting in the negative:
25 Senator Walczyk.

1 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 1281, Assembly Bill Number 11233A, by
6 Assemblymember Magnarelli, an act to amend the
7 Vehicle and Traffic Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11 act shall take effect March 1, 2028.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
16 Ryan to explain his vote.

17 SENATOR RYAN: Thank you. Thank
18 you, Mr. President. I quickly rise on this bill.

19 I think -- you know, I think one of
20 the greatest and best duties that we -- one of
21 the greatest duties that we have is to protect
22 and make laws that are beneficial to those in our
23 armed forces.

24 Under current law as it is,
25 generally only a driver's license can be renewed,

1 vehicle registrations can be renewed within
2 60 days. If you are a veteran and you have
3 orders to deploy, that isn't working out for you.

4 So what this bill does is it gives
5 them the ability to pre-renew, I guess, their
6 registrations.

7 You know, it may seem like a small
8 thing, but often it's the small, practical
9 changes that have the greatest impacts on some of
10 our New Yorkers' lives, especially those that
11 have stepped up to serve our country.

12 And I truly believe that our
13 servicemembers should not have to worry about a
14 vehicle registration while they are fulfilling
15 their obligations to serve our great nation
16 either out of state or overseas.

17 So a small procedural change, but
18 again, anything that we can do to help our
19 veterans, those heroes that put our country
20 before themselves. I proudly vote in the aye,
21 and I urge my colleagues to do the same.

22 Thank you.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
24 Ryan to be recorded in the affirmative.

25 Announce the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 1307, Senate Print 7421B, by Senator Martinez, an
6 act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
10 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it
11 shall have become a law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
18 Calendar 1307, voting in the negative are
19 Senators Griffo, Martins, Oberacker, O'Mara and
20 Walczyk.

21 Ayes, 55. Nays, 5.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 1337, Senate Print 687, by Senator Martinez, an

1 act to amend the Education Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
5 act shall take effect on the first of July.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
10 the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
12 Calendar 1337, voting in the negative:
13 Senator Walczyk.

14 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 1343, Assembly Bill Number 3397A, by
19 Assemblymember Raga, an act to amend the
20 Veterans' Services Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 1350, Assembly Bill Number 329C, by
10 Assemblymember Jackson, an act to amend the
11 Mental Hygiene Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 8. This
15 act shall take effect on the same date and in the
16 same manner as a chapter of the Laws of 2022.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
21 the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1353, Assembly Bill Number 6285, by
2 Assemblymember Otis, an act to amend the
3 Public Service Law.

4 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Lay it
6 aside.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 1354, Senate Print 4462B, by Senator Mayer, an
9 act to amend the Social Services Law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
11 last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
13 act shall take effect immediately.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
18 Mayer to explain her vote.

19 SENATOR MAYER: Thank you,
20 Mr. President.

21 And I couldn't be more pleased that
22 we are going to pass this bill today to help the
23 parents, if it passes in the Assembly, and
24 primarily the mothers of medically fragile
25 children.

1 These are children who basically
2 require 24-hour care as a result of medical
3 issues that they have. And they are approved,
4 under the state's Medicaid program, for
5 private-duty nursing, but there's not enough
6 private-duty nurses.

7 And what happens as a practical
8 matter is the mothers basically have to give up
9 their jobs in order to provide 24-hour care or to
10 supplement the private-duty nurses they can have.
11 And we have not found a way to reimburse these
12 mothers for the equivalent of private-duty
13 nursing for which they must be certified and
14 trained and supervised.

15 I've had the honor -- and truly the
16 honor -- of meeting not only the children but the
17 parents of these children. They face an
18 extraordinary challenge. And they have devoted
19 their lives to the care and well-being of their
20 children, as any mother or father would do, but
21 the state simply has not kept up its part of the
22 bargain.

23 And so this bill, which was really
24 pushed by a group, the Voices of the Medically
25 Fragile, these parents that got together and

1 said, We need to have a voice. And today we are
2 giving them a voice by saying the state must find
3 a way, through the Medicaid program, to reimburse
4 these parents as they provide this essential
5 care.

6 I'm proud to vote yes. I thank them
7 for their advocacy. We're not finished; the
8 bill -- we would love it to pass in the Assembly.
9 But this is a change that is long overdue. I
10 proudly vote aye.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
12 Mayer to be recorded in the affirmative.

13 Announce the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 1355, Senate Print 4707B, by Senator Stavisky, an
19 act to amend the Education Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 8. This
23 act shall take effect on the first of January.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)
2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
3 the results.
4 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.
5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
6 is passed.
7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 1356, Senate Print Number 4917B, by
9 Senator Scarcella-Spanton, an act to amend the
10 Insurance Law.
11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
12 last section.
13 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
14 act shall take effect on the first of January.
15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
16 roll.
17 (The Secretary called the roll.)
18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
19 the results.
20 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.
21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
22 is passed.
23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 1386, Assembly Bill Number 9581B, by
25 Assemblymember Bronson, an act to amend the

1 Labor Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
5 act shall take effect immediately.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
10 Hinchey to explain -- Senator Borrello to explain
11 his vote first.

12 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you, but I
13 appreciate the ladies-first thing. But I'll
14 speak first.

15 So this bill -- I'm opposed to this
16 bill. This bill would require any company of
17 50 or more employees to have to submit a report
18 on how AI has impacted jobs.

19 Now, I know we are all concerned
20 about the impact of AI on employment in New York
21 State, but this is a very onerous bill with a
22 \$500 per day fine, I believe, for those that
23 don't comply.

24 And the real question is, how do we
25 really know how AI is impacting it? I mean, if I

1 hire someone to, you know, to do an ad for me and
2 instead of hiring that person to run ads and do
3 marketing, I use ChatGPT or whatever, I'm not
4 sure if that counts exactly.

5 And look, if the Department of Labor
6 wants to know the impact of AI on jobs, they can
7 find out. They can do surveys, they can contact
8 employers, and they probably should. They
9 probably should because we are driving enough
10 business out of this state without trying to
11 figure out how AI is doing it even better than
12 New York State government is. And I guarantee
13 you it's not.

14 So I'll be voting no. Thank you.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
16 Borrello to be recorded in the negative.

17 Senator Hinchey to explain her
18 vote -- Senator Hinchey to close, excuse me.

19 SENATOR HINCHEY: Thank you,
20 Mr. President.

21 I rise to proudly vote aye for this
22 bill, and I want to thank the leader for bringing
23 it to the floor.

24 AI is here. No one is disputing
25 that. And there are a lot of really great ways

1 that we can use that in our lives that are
2 already happening. However, it is having a major
3 impact on our workforce. In fact, we have seen
4 numerous companies laying off not five, 10,
5 15 people -- thousands of people at a clip. That
6 is thousands of people who are unemployed
7 overnight.

8 We don't know what the scale of this
9 will be. We don't know what the impact to our
10 workforce will be. We don't know what the need
11 for our unemployment systems will be because of
12 the rise in AI in our workforce.

13 What our bill is doing is collecting
14 the data to make sure that we know what is needed
15 to not just retrain employees and workers for the
16 future, but to know what kinds of jobs we should
17 be retraining for, and to also make sure that we
18 are helping people stay in the roles that they
19 should be in today so that we don't have a
20 whiplash effect, as we have seen with some
21 companies where they have laid off thousands of
22 people, realize that they've overcorrected, and
23 tried to then rehire a few back.

24 Our bill is incredibly important to
25 understand the landscape, to actually bring in

1 the Department of Labor to really track what's
2 happening. And we've modeled our bill off of the
3 existing systems that already exist, like the
4 WARN Act. So this is not deeply onerous for
5 companies because they are used to these systems.

6 I am really proud that we will be
7 the first state in the country, although there is
8 a federal bill very similar to ours -- a
9 bipartisan bill, I should say, very similar to
10 ours that is being prioritized at the federal
11 level. But we will be the first state in the
12 country to actually start to track this data.

13 And that's incredibly important, and
14 for that I vote aye.

15 Thank you, Mr. President.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
17 Hinchey to be recorded in the affirmative.

18 Announce the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
20 Calendar 1386, voting in the negative are
21 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
22 Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins,
23 Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt,
24 Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk,
25 Weber and Weik.

1 Ayes, 38. Nays, 22.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 1387, Senate Print 8837, by Senator Hinchey, an
6 act to amend the General Municipal Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
15 the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 1388, Senate Print 8850A, by Senator Gounardes,
21 an act to amend the General Business Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
25 act shall take effect July 1, 2027.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
5 the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
8 is passed.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 1389, Assembly Bill Number 10030B, by
11 Assemblymember Weprin, an act to amend the
12 Insurance Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
16 act shall take effect January 1, 2028.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
21 the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
23 Calendar 1389, voting in the negative are
24 Senators Walczyk and Rhoads.

25 Ayes, 58. Nays, 2.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
2 is passed.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 1390, Senate Print 9021, by Senator Harckham, an
5 act to amend the Civil Rights Law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
14 the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 1394, Assembly Bill Number 10184, by
20 Assemblymember Carroll, an act to amend the
21 Real Property Tax Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
5 the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
7 Calendar 1394, voting in the negative are
8 Senators Fahy and Skoufis.

9 Ayes, 58. Nays, 2.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 1395, Assembly Bill Number 10158, by
14 Assemblymember Carroll, an act to amend the
15 Real Property Tax Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
19 act shall take effect immediately.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: In relation to

1 Calendar 1395, voting in the negative:

2 Senator Skoufis.

3 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 1396, Assembly Bill Number 9600A, by
8 Assemblymember Rajkumar, an act to amend the
9 Mental Hygiene Law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
11 last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
13 act shall take effect immediately.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
18 the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
21 is passed.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 1397, Senate Print 9115A, by Senator Harckham, an
24 act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
10 Calendar 1397, voting in the negative are
11 Senators Borrello, Chan, Martins, Oberacker,
12 Rhoads, Ryan, Stec and Walczyk.

13 Ayes, 52. Nays, 8.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 1398, Senate Print Number 9199, by
18 Senator Scarcella-Spanton, an act to amend
19 the Public Service Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
23 act shall take effect on the first of April.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
3 the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
5 Calendar 1398, voting in the negative:
6 Senator Walczyk.

7 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1400, Senate Print 9278A, by Senator Fernandez,
12 an act to amend the State Finance Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
16 act shall take effect immediately.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
21 the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1401, Assembly Bill Number 10415A, by
2 Assemblymember Magnarelli, an act to amend the
3 Public Service Law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
7 act shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 1402, Senate Print 9310, Senator Brisport, an act
18 to amend the Limited Liability Company Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
22 act shall take effect on the 365th day after it
23 shall have become a law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
3 the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
5 Calendar 1402, voting in the negative are
6 Senators Martins, Helming, Walczyk and Weber.

7 Ayes, 56. Nays, 4.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1404, Senate Print 9349, by Senator Zellner, an
12 act to amend the Insurance Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
16 act shall take effect immediately.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
21 Zellner to explain his vote.

22 SENATOR ZELLNER: Thank you,
23 Mr. President.

24 Across New York, volunteer
25 firefighters and EMS personnel play a critical

1 role in keeping our communities safe. They're
2 the people who show up when an emergency happens,
3 and many of them do it while balancing jobs,
4 families, and countless other responsibilities.

5 Part of that commitment is training.
6 The Emergency Vehicle Operator Course helps first
7 responders safely operate emergency vehicles in
8 difficult situations and prepares them for the
9 realities of the job.

10 This bill is simple. It recognizes
11 that training and creates an opportunity for
12 insurance companies to provide a premium
13 reduction for volunteers who complete it.

14 At a time when many volunteer
15 departments are facing recruitment and retention
16 challenges, we are looking for practical ways to
17 support the people who continue to answer the
18 call.

19 This won't solve every challenge
20 facing volunteer fire and EMS services, but it's
21 a commonsense step that recognizes the value of
22 their training and helps support the volunteers
23 our communities depend on every day.

24 For those reasons, I vote in the
25 affirmative.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
2 Zellner to be recorded in the affirmative.
3 Announce the results.
4 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.
5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
6 is passed.
7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 1405, Senate Print 9370, by Senator Comrie, an
9 act to amend the State Finance Law.
10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
11 last section.
12 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
13 act shall take effect immediately.
14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
15 roll.
16 (The Secretary called the roll.)
17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
18 the results.
19 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.
20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
21 is passed.
22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 1406, Senate Print 9419, by Senator Addabbo, an
24 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.
25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
3 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it
4 shall have become a law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
9 the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 1407, Assembly Bill Number 65B, by
15 Assemblymember Hevesi, an act to amend the
16 Social Services Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
20 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
21 shall have become a law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator

1 Mayer to explain her vote.

2 SENATOR MAYER: Thank you,
3 Mr. President.

4 And I could not be more pleased
5 today to vote on a bill that establishes a
6 statewide supervised visitation initiative to
7 support safe and structured parenting time for
8 children and families across New York.

9 I have to give tremendous credit to
10 the Women's Bar Association of the State of
11 New York and multiple judges of the Office of
12 Court Administration who recognized that more
13 than half of New York's counties lack any
14 supervised visitation program -- and, where it is
15 offered, the need far exceeds capacity.

16 In fact, judges are unable to make
17 thoughtful decisions about custodial and
18 visitation arrangements because they do not have
19 access to supervised visitation, which allows
20 them to have evaluators determine what's in the
21 best interests of the children.

22 This bill, which was carried by our
23 colleague before he left, Senator Hoylman-Sigal,
24 is extremely important to the future of reuniting
25 families and, given the best interests of the

1 children, decision-making based on real evidence
2 of supervised visitation.

3 I'm so grateful for the advocacy of
4 judges who, on their own, reached out about their
5 frustration with the lack of programs. As I
6 said, the Women's Bar and also the parents and
7 children, particularly those without additional
8 resources who are stuck on the bottom of the
9 waiting list waiting to have supervised
10 visitation and evaluation, so they can visit with
11 their kids in safety and comfort, knowing it is
12 in the best interests of their children.

13 I could not be more pleased that
14 this bill has finally made it to the floor.
15 Thank you to the Majority Leader for
16 understanding the priority of this issue.

17 I proudly vote aye.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
19 Mayer to be recorded in the affirmative.

20 Announce the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 1409, Assembly Bill Number 10312A, by

1 Assemblymember Paulin, an act to amend the
2 Public Health Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
13 Calendar 1409, voting in the negative are
14 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
15 Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins,
16 Mattera, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo,
17 Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber
18 and Weik.

19 Ayes, 39. Nays, 21.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
21 is passed.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 1410, Assembly Bill Number 9140, by
24 Assemblymember Rosenthal, an act to amend the
25 Public Health Law.

1 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
3 is laid aside.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 1414, Senate Print 9679, by Senator Baskin, an
6 act to amend the Private Housing Finance Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
15 Baskin to explain her vote.

16 SENATOR BASKIN: Thank you,
17 Madam President.

18 This bill seeks to codify our
19 universal and successful Block-by-Block
20 Home Ownership Program, which provides funding to
21 create new affordable homes on vacant lots.

22 I want to recognize the creator of
23 this program, our former colleague and current
24 City of Buffalo mayor, Sean Ryan, for his
25 forward-thinking approach on how to address urban

1 vacant residential land.

2 There's a housing advocate in my
3 district who creatively calls this bill the
4 fill-in-your-smile program. We are proud of our
5 neighborhoods, but we know that when those
6 neighborhoods smile, there are gaps in the smile
7 because of vacant lots that surround our
8 beautiful homes. So we've got to take our
9 neighborhoods to the dentist and fill in our
10 smiles.

11 I'm grateful to our Majority Leader,
12 Andrea Stewart-Cousins, for putting over a
13 hundred million dollars into this budget program
14 over the last three years. This investment has
15 the potential to create over 250 new homes across
16 Buffalo, Rochester, Syracuse, Binghamton and
17 Albany -- new homes that will be affordable. New
18 homes that will be accessible. New homes that
19 will help families seeking the American dream of
20 home ownership.

21 But we know that these 250 homes are
22 just a drop in the bucket when we consider the
23 needs of our constituents. The Block-by-Block
24 program is how we rebuild neighborhoods and
25 strengthen financial security and independence of

1 families.

2 These are the two goals that are
3 core to our efforts to serve our constituents,
4 regardless of whether you are in the Majority or
5 the Minority. So let's codify this program so we
6 can bring this program across the entire state to
7 every neighborhood struggling with vacant lots,
8 and fill in those gaps of our community. Let's
9 help our communities' smiles become beautiful,
10 shiny homes.

11 I vote in the affirmative, and I ask
12 my colleagues to do the same.

13 Thank you, Madam President.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
15 Baskin to be recorded in the affirmative.

16 Announce the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
18 Calendar 1414, voting in the negative are
19 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Martins, Mattera,
20 Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

21 Ayes, 54. Nays, 6.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 1415, Senate Print 9728, by Senator Brouk, an act

1 to amend the Social Services Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
5 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
6 shall have become a law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 1416, Senate Print 9815, by Senator Krueger, an
17 act to amend the Insurance Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This
21 act shall take effect January 1, 2027.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
3 Calendar 1416, voting in the negative are
4 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
5 Chan, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming, Lanza, Martins,
6 Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt,
7 Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk,
8 Weber and Weik.

9 Ayes, 38. Nays, 22.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 1418, Senate Print 9858A, by Senator Hinchey,
14 an act to amend the Penal Law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
18 act shall take effect immediately.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill

1 is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 1419, Senate Print 9880, by Senator Cleare, an
4 act to amend the Social Services Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
8 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
9 shall have become a law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
14 the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 1420, Senate Print 9887, by Senator Webb, an act
20 to amend the Executive Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
24 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
25 shall have become a law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
5 the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
8 is passed.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 1421, Senate Print 9889, by Senator Zellner, an
11 act to amend the Private Housing Finance Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
15 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it
16 shall have become a law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
21 the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
23 Calendar 1421, voting in the negative:
24 Senator Walczyk.

25 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Can you
2 hold on.

3 Senator Zellner, you wanted to
4 explain your vote on Calendar 1421?

5 SENATOR ZELLNER: Yes.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
7 Zellner to explain his vote.

8 SENATOR ZELLNER: Thank you,
9 Madam President.

10 I rise today in support of the
11 Vacant Rental Improvement Program.

12 And before I begin, I want to join
13 my colleague April Baskin in thanking and
14 recognizing your former colleague, Mayor Sean
15 Ryan, who introduced this bill during his time in
16 the Senate. Sean's been a long-time champion for
17 housing, and I'm proud to carry this bill
18 forward.

19 The reality is that New York doesn't
20 just have a housing shortage, we have housing
21 sitting vacant while families struggle to find a
22 place they can afford. In Buffalo, in Tonawanda,
23 in Amherst, and in communities across upstate,
24 people are searching for affordable housing.

25 At the same time, apartments that

1 could be housing working families remain empty
2 because the costs and barriers to bring them back
3 online are simply too high.

4 If we're serious about addressing
5 affordability, we have to be serious about
6 increasing supply. And one of the fastest ways
7 to do that is by making it easier to put existing
8 housing back into use. An empty apartment
9 doesn't help anyone. It doesn't help a family
10 looking for a home, a neighborhood trying to
11 grow, or a community working to address
12 affordability.

13 This isn't a silver bullet; no bill
14 is. But it's a practical step and cuts through
15 red tape, creates opportunities, and gets more
16 housing into our communities.

17 I vote aye.

18 Thank you, Madam President.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
20 Zellner to be recorded in the affirmative.

21 Announce the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1422, Senate Print 9897, by Senator Zellner, an
2 act to amend the Public Health Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
6 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it
7 shall have become a law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
14 Calendar 1422, voting in the negative are
15 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
16 Chan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Mattera, Murray,
17 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco,
18 Walczyk, Weber and Weik. Also Senator Palumbo.

19 Ayes, 41. Nays, 19.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
21 is passed.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 1423, Assembly Bill Number 10419, by
24 Assemblymember Solages, an act to amend
25 Chapter 581 of the Laws of 2005.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
2 last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
4 act shall take effect immediately.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
9 the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 1421, Assembly Bill Number 11004, by
15 Assemblymember Solages, an act to amend
16 Chapter 492 of the Laws of 1993.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
20 act shall take effect immediately.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
25 the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 1425, Assembly Bill Number 11006, by
6 Assemblymember O'Pharrow, an act to amend
7 Chapter 629 of the Laws of 2005.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 1426, Assembly Bill Number 11376, by
22 Assemblymember Septimo, an act to amend
23 Chapter 307 of the Laws of 2005.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
25 last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
2 act shall take effect immediately.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 1428, Senate Print 9989, by Senator Weber, an act
13 authorizing the Toivas Dovid Community Kollel,
14 Inc., to receive retroactive real property
15 tax-exempt status.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
19 act shall take effect immediately.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: In relation to

1 Calendar 1428, voting in the negative are
2 Senators O'Mara and Skoufis.

3 Ayes, 58. Nays, 2.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 1429, Assembly Bill Number 11368, by
8 Assemblymember Cook, an act to amend the
9 Chapter 534 of the Laws of 1993.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
11 last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
13 act shall take effect immediately.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
18 the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
21 is passed.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 1432, Assembly Bill Number 563A, by
24 Assemblymember Paulin, an act to amend the
25 Executive Law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
2 last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
4 act shall take effect one year after it shall
5 have become a law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
10 the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
13 is passed.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 1433, Assembly Bill Number 11234, by
16 Assemblymember Weprin, an act to amend the
17 Real Property Tax Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 1434, Assembly Bill Number 11392, by
7 Assemblymember Bichotte Hermelyn, an act to amend
8 Chapter 550 of the Laws of 2013.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
12 act shall take effect immediately.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1435, Assembly Bill Number 10922, by
23 Assemblymember Burke, an act to amend the
24 Local Finance Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
10 Calendar 1435, voting in the negative are
11 Senators Walczyk and Weik.

12 Ayes, 58. Nays, 2.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Also Senator
16 Palumbo, pardon me.

17 Ayes, 57. Nays, 3.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 1436, Assembly Bill Number 11358, by
22 Assemblymember Ramos, an act to amend Chapter 130
23 of the Laws of 1998.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
25 last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
2 act shall take effect immediately.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 1437, Assembly Bill Number 3191A, by
13 Assemblymember Lunsford, an act to amend the
14 Penal Law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
18 act shall take effect immediately.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
25 Calendar 1437, voting in the negative:

1 Senator Salazar.

2 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 1438, Senate Print 10445, by Senator Gianaris, an
7 act to amend the Education Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 1439, Senate Print 10467, by Senator Bottcher, an
22 act to amend the Education Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This

1 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
2 shall have become a law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 1440, Assembly Bill Number 9693, by
13 Assemblymember Cashman, an act to amend
14 Chapter 138 of the Laws of 1998.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
18 act shall take effect immediately.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill

1 is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 1441, Assembly Bill Number 11372, by
4 Assemblymember Schiavoni, an act to amend
5 Chapter 435 of the Laws of 2014.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
14 the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
16 Calendar 1441, voting in the negative:
17 Senator Martinez.

18 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1442, Assembly Bill Number 11464, by
23 Assemblymember Romero, an act to amend
24 Chapter 141 of the Laws of 2014.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
10 Calendar 1442, voting in the negative are
11 Senators Brisport and Martinez.

12 Ayes, 58. Nays, 2.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 1443, Assembly Bill Number 11377, by
17 Assemblymember Griffin, an act to amend the
18 Environmental Conservation Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
22 act shall take effect immediately.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
2 the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
4 Calendar 1443, voting in the negative:
5 Senator Skoufis.

6 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
8 is passed.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 1510, Senate Print 10200A, by Senator Kavanagh,
11 an act to amend the Multiple Dwelling Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 20. This
15 act shall take effect immediately.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
22 Calendar 1510, voting in the negative:
23 Senator Walczyk.

24 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill

1 is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 1581, Senate Print 10321, by Senator Bynoe, an
4 act authorizing the assessor of the County of
5 Nassau to accept from the Town of Hempstead an
6 application for exemption from real property
7 taxes.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
18 Calendar 1581, voting in the negative are
19 Senators Skoufis and O'Mara.

20 Ayes, 58. Nays, 2.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
22 is passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 1613, Senate Print 4602B, by Senator Gounardes,
25 an act to amend the Election Law.

1 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
3 is laid aside.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 1635, Senate Print 8451B, by Senator Fahy, an act
6 to amend the General Business Law.

7 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
9 is laid aside.

10 Senator Gianaris.

11 SENATOR GIANARIS: Are we through
12 the calendar, Madam President?

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: That
14 completes the reading of today's calendar.

15 SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you.

16 I believe Senator Gonzalez was out
17 of the room when Calendar 854 came up, and she
18 would like the opportunity to explain her vote on
19 that, if we can recognize her, please.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
21 Gonzalez to explain her vote on Calendar 854.

22 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Thank you,
23 Madam President.

24 I rise today to explain my vote on
25 my bill, S9051B.

1 A few weeks ago we were joined in
2 this chamber by Maria Raine, the mother of
3 Adam Raine, who committed suicide with the help
4 of ChatGPT. She came to shine light on an issue
5 that is pervasive across the country.

6 According to the Center for
7 Countering Digital Hate research, their Killer
8 Apps report found that eight in 10 AI chatbots
9 were regularly willing to assist young users in
10 planning violent attacks, including school
11 shootings, religious bombings, and high-profile
12 assassinations.

13 Perplexity and Meta AI were willing
14 to assist would-be attackers in 100 percent and
15 97 percent of responses, respectively.
16 Character.AI actively encouraged violence in
17 multiple scenarios. DeepSeek went as far as
18 wishing the would-be attacker a happy and safe
19 shooting.

20 Over the last year we have seen an
21 increase in the number of minors who have
22 self-harmed or committed suicide with the help of
23 these chatbots. We have seen school shootings.
24 We have seen the result of nonregulation.

25 And I am so proud to pass this bill

1 through this chamber. I want to thank our
2 colleagues for voting in support of this bill. I
3 want to thank the Attorney General's office for
4 being a close sponsor and partner in this
5 process.

6 I want to thank Commonsense Media,
7 which has represented thousands of parents across
8 this country.

9 I want to thank of course my staff,
10 Elon Silver, for the dedication on this bill.

11 And I truly am looking forward to
12 building on this progress to say that Big Tech
13 and chatbots should be regulated and certainly
14 that our children should be protected.

15 So thank you again, Madam -- now
16 Mr. President, for the time to explain my vote.

17 I proudly voted aye. Thank you.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
19 Gonzalez was recorded in the affirmative on the
20 aforementioned bill.

21 Senator Gianaris.

22 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
23 we're now going to pull a bill off of the
24 controversial calendar to take up our first
25 debate of the day: Calendar 1009, please.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
2 Secretary will ring the bell.

3 The Secretary will read.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 1009, Senate Print 8616B, by Senator Gianaris, an
6 act to amend the General Business Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
8 Walczyk, why do you rise?

9 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
10 Mr. President, I wonder if the sponsor would
11 yield.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
13 sponsor yield?

14 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes, I do.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
16 sponsor yields.

17 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
18 Mr. President.

19 In your legislative findings you
20 identified dynamic pricing and surveillance
21 pricing -- you identified dynamic and
22 surveillance pricing as a problem for consumers,
23 as well as identifying this pricing scheme as a
24 threat to jobs in the State of New York.

25 This bill would prohibit

1 grocery stores and pharmacies from using
2 electronic shelving labels. Does it also ban
3 those for gas stations?

4 SENATOR GIANARIS: No.

5 SENATOR WALCZYK: And through you,
6 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
7 yield.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
9 sponsor yield?

10 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
12 sponsor yields.

13 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
14 Mr. President. Would it also prohibit them in
15 department stores?

16 SENATOR GIANARIS: In -- I couldn't
17 hear you.

18 SENATOR WALCZYK: Department
19 stores?

20 SENATOR GIANARIS: No.

21 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
22 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
23 yield?

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
25 sponsor yield?

1 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
3 sponsor yields.

4 SENATOR WALCZYK: Would the
5 electronic shelving labels also -- through you,
6 Mr. President -- also be banned in home
7 improvement stores?

8 SENATOR GIANARIS: Well, it covers
9 a store over 10,000 square feet in size that
10 sells primarily household foodstuff for outside
11 consumption and/or prepared foods or 10 percent
12 of the floor area dedicated to the sale of
13 nontaxable merchandise including the sale of
14 fresh produce, fish, poultry, deli products,
15 dairy products, canned foods, dried foods,
16 beverages, baked foods and/or prepared foods.

17 Also drug retail establishments,
18 which means a retail store that sells a variety
19 of prescription and nonprescription medicines and
20 miscellaneous items such as drugs,
21 pharmaceuticals, sundries, fresh produce, meats,
22 poultry, fish, et cetera.

23 So I guess it depends, because a lot
24 of these stores do many different things these
25 days.

1 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
2 Mr. President, will the sponsor continue to
3 yield?

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
5 sponsor yield?

6 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
8 sponsor yields.

9 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
10 Mr. President.

11 So that would be the food retail
12 establishment as well as the drug retail
13 establishment definitions that you just read.
14 Why just grocery stores and pharmacies in the
15 State of New York?

16 SENATOR GIANARIS: Well, I think
17 one thing we've heard from the public is that in
18 their great concerns about affordability that
19 we're dealing with, that grocery stores tend to
20 be at the top of the list.

21 In addition, when we're talking
22 about the kind of very large stores, right --
23 because you're talking about 10,000 square feet
24 or more, not your corner grocery store -- those
25 are the large entities that are most

1 experimenting with the technology we're dealing
2 with in the bill.

3 SENATOR WALCZYK: And through you,
4 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
5 yield?

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
7 sponsor yield?

8 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
10 sponsor yields.

11 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
12 Mr. President.

13 Did you know that the average
14 grocery store is about 40,000 square feet? So it
15 would, actually, be the average grocery store --

16 SENATOR GIANARIS: Would you repeat
17 that?

18 SENATOR WALCZYK: Did you know the
19 average grocery store is about 40,000 square
20 feet?

21 SENATOR GIANARIS: I do not know
22 that. And I don't take your word for it,
23 Senator Walczyk.

24 SENATOR WALCZYK: And through you,
25 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to

1 yield?

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
3 sponsor yield?

4 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
6 sponsor yields.

7 SENATOR WALCZYK: If enacted, all
8 the grocery stores and pharmacies would have to
9 go back to paper tags if they did currently have
10 the digital tags for pricing. Within six months,
11 if this is enacted, is that correct?

12 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yeah, and let me
13 just go back to the previous question. I also
14 suppose it depends where you are. Because in
15 New York City, 40,000 square feet for a grocery
16 store is a very large grocery store.

17 But yes, you are correct in your
18 question.

19 SENATOR WALCZYK: And through you,
20 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
21 yield?

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
23 sponsor yield?

24 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The

1 sponsor yields.

2 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
3 Mr. President.

4 I also share concerns, as I know
5 much of this body does, about the pricing and
6 affordability in grocery stores. If we're
7 expecting them to change out all of their tags
8 and do pricing in a new way, what do you
9 anticipate that will cost grocery stores and
10 pharmacies across the State of New York if this
11 is implemented?

12 SENATOR GIANARIS: Walk to a shelf,
13 remove a device, and put a piece of paper in its
14 place? I can't imagine that it would be terribly
15 expensive for these very large stores we're
16 talking about.

17 SENATOR WALCZYK: And through you,
18 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
19 yield?

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
21 sponsor yield?

22 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
24 sponsor yields.

25 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,

1 Mr. President.

2 I know much of your concern in
3 consumer protection was about dynamic pricing,
4 surge pricing, and individual sort of privacy in
5 pricing.

6 What if the displays are electronic
7 but just static and there's no application of
8 that actual surge pricing or any of those
9 concerns? Would a grocery store or a pharmacy be
10 able to continue to have an electric tag that
11 just displays that price statically?

12 SENATOR GIANARIS: You mean like
13 the one you're wearing on your lapel?

14 SENATOR WALCZYK: Like that.

15 SENATOR GIANARIS: Like that? No,
16 they would not. And I'll tell you why.

17 Because the concern is once
18 technology like that is in place, it's very
19 difficult to know whether it is in fact static or
20 not. And the best way to ensure that we're not
21 getting to the point that the technology is being
22 used for surveillance pricing -- which we
23 certainly want to not allow -- is to not allow
24 that technology in place at all.

25 Like I don't know right now if that

1 thing's capable of scanning the back of
2 Senator Borrello's head and telling you all sorts
3 of his private information that could be
4 downloaded publicly.

5 SENATOR WALCZYK: And through you,
6 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
7 yield?

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
9 sponsor yield?

10 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
12 sponsor yields.

13 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
14 Mr. President. I certainly hope not.

15 But as you mention, you know, and
16 this has come up in the online sphere, we've
17 taken up legislation in this chamber addressing
18 some of that dynamic or surveillance pricing in
19 the online sphere.

20 Are there any examples in the State
21 of New York in grocery stores or pharmacies where
22 brick-and-mortar stores have been found to be
23 using dynamic surge or surveillance pricing?

24 SENATOR GIANARIS: Well, I mean,
25 what we do know is that Walmart is rolling out

1 the digital shelf labels in over 2,000 locations.

2 And they have also applied for two
3 patents related to machine learning that
4 certainly would raise a flag for me that they may
5 be interested in going down this road and using
6 these devices for the kind of things we're not
7 trying to allow. In fact, the promotional
8 materials for the entities and the companies that
9 make the electronic shelf labels specifically
10 promote the fact that they can be used for the
11 types of things we're trying to prohibit.

12 And so I think getting at the
13 device, the makers of which are explicitly saying
14 can be used for surveillance pricing, is the
15 easiest way to ensure proper enforcement.

16 SENATOR WALCZYK: And through you,
17 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
18 yield?

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
20 sponsor yield?

21 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
23 sponsor yields.

24 SENATOR WALCZYK: And through you,
25 Mr. President. In Nevada and Colorado where they

1 both have seated Attorney Generals that happen to
2 be Democrats, they've used electronic pricing in
3 stores to actually use that data to go after
4 price gouging and price surging.

5 Are we taking that tool away from
6 the Attorney General's office when we take
7 electronic price tags out of the stores and
8 making it more onerous for them to investigate if
9 this bill goes through?

10 SENATOR GIANARIS: Not according to
11 our Attorney General, who has made this bill and
12 one other her top legislative priorities as we
13 conclude the session.

14 SENATOR WALCZYK: Thank you,
15 Mr. President.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
17 you, Senator Walczyk.

18 Are there any other Senators wishing
19 to be heard?

20 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
21 closed.

22 Senator Gianaris.

23 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
24 we've agreed to restore this to the
25 noncontroversial calendar.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: On
2 consent, the bill is restored to the
3 noncontroversial calendar.

4 Read the last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 7. This
6 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
7 shall have become a law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
12 Borrello to explain his vote.

13 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you,
14 Mr. President.

15 I wanted to just take a moment to
16 say that, you know, I understand the, you know,
17 kind of the Big Brother aspect of this. But the
18 reality is it is becoming more and more difficult
19 to run a brick-and-mortar business in New York
20 State. And that's who this is going to impact
21 most.

22 The whole idea of being able to, on
23 the fly, be able to change the price
24 electronically, versus having to -- doing it
25 manually, has actually turned out to be better

1 for consumers. Studies have shown, extensive
2 studies, that this has actually provided more
3 discounts to consumers, and the nimbleness of
4 being able to change that.

5 So I understand the fear, but the
6 reality just doesn't match the fear. And
7 ultimately we are watching our communities, our
8 downtowns, lose more and more brick-and-mortar
9 businesses. They employ people. They pay
10 property taxes. They are members of our
11 community that contribute.

12 And things like this that can make
13 it a little bit easier to do business in New York
14 State are usually, and in my opinion always, a
15 good thing. And they should have the freedom to
16 do that and not continue to make it more and more
17 difficult to not only do business here, but to be
18 able to provide affordable items to people.

19 So I'll be voting no on this, and I
20 would encourage my colleagues to do the same.

21 Thank you, Mr. President.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
23 Borrello to be recorded in the negative.

24 Senator Walczyk to explain his vote.

25 SENATOR WALCZYK: Thank you,

1 Mr. President.

2 Yeah, I share some of the concerns
3 of the sponsor when it comes to price gouging,
4 price surging. Obviously we want to manage
5 New York State in a fair way and protect our
6 consumers because we are concerned about high
7 prices in groceries.

8 And I'm concerned that this bill,
9 the way that it's written right now, will really
10 just raise prices and create one more hurdle for
11 New York State's businesses when it comes to your
12 average grocery store, your average pharmacy,
13 your community pharmacy, who have instituted
14 these tools to save costs for their business and
15 now we're going to tear them away and in six
16 months time frame expect them to do their
17 business the old way and an entirely new way
18 after they've invested in some of the technology.

19 So I think there's some changes that
20 should be considered if we bring this bill back
21 forward. But I'll be a no.

22 Thank you, Mr. President.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
24 Walczyk to be recorded in the negative.

25 Announce the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
2 Calendar 1009, voting in the negative are --

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Wait, I'm
4 sorry. I'm sorry, I apologize.

5 Senator Gianaris to explain his
6 vote.

7 SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you. I
8 just wanted to -- I heard my colleagues'
9 arguments, and I wanted to respond for a moment.

10 The notion that getting rid of the
11 device who's designed to allow increasing in
12 prices would somehow result in an increase in
13 prices is an oxymoron. I mean, the -- if you
14 look at Toshiba, IBM, Vusion and SOLUM, who
15 market these products to retail stores, what they
16 specifically tell them is that the popularity of
17 these ESLs, or electronic shelf labels, is from
18 retailers who are looking for ways to improve
19 their profitability and have prices that
20 dynamically change any time you want. That's a
21 quote from Toshiba, which makes these things.

22 IBM, electronic shelf labels. If
23 need be, you can drive prices up in order to
24 maximize margins. That's in their marketing
25 materials to retail establishments.

1 So we can talk about the technology
2 and whether it does the facial scans, which is a
3 completely creepy and scary thing. But let's be
4 clear, even the simple -- the digital price tags
5 themselves are specifically designed to allow a
6 retailer to increase prices and maximize their
7 profit on the back of consumers.

8 That's why this is so important.

9 I vote yes, Mr. President.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
11 Gianaris to be recorded in the affirmative.

12 Announce the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
14 Calendar 1009, voting in the negative are
15 Senators Gallivan, Helming, O'Mara, Ortt, Stec,
16 Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik. Also
17 Senator Borrello.

18 Ayes, 50. Nays, 10.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
20 is passed.

21 Senator Gianaris.

22 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
23 we have another member who missed the chance to
24 explain their vote. So please call on
25 Senator Fernandez to explain her vote on

1 Calendar 1400.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
3 Fernandez to explain her vote on Calendar 1400.

4 SENATOR FERNANDEZ: Thank you so
5 much. And apologies for my absence before. But
6 I wanted to speak to explain my vote on S9278A,
7 which makes a simple but critical, important
8 clarification.

9 Any interest earned on opioid -- on
10 money deposited into the Opioid Settlement Fund
11 must remain in that fund and be used for the same
12 lifesaving purposes for which the settlement
13 dollars were intended.

14 New York and local governments
15 secured opioid settlement agreements from the
16 manufacturers, distributors and retailers that
17 helped fuel this epidemic because communities
18 suffered profound harm. Families lost loved
19 ones, children lost parents, entire neighborhoods
20 were devastated by addiction, overdose and the
21 lasting consequences of this public health
22 crisis.

23 The purpose of these funds is to
24 help right that wrong through prevention,
25 treatment, recovery, harm reduction and support

1 for those impacted by the opioid epidemic.

2 The bill recognizes a basic idea:
3 If the principal belongs to the Opioid Settlement
4 Fund, the interest generated by that principal
5 should belong there as well.

6 Some may ask why we need this
7 clarification. Unfortunately, recent events in
8 Nassau County, where more than 13 million in
9 interest on opioid settlement funds were
10 transferred to the General Fund, have shown us
11 exactly why this bill is so important.
12 Regardless of one's views on whoever is involved,
13 the situation exposed a loophole. While many
14 people assumed that interest earnings would
15 automatically remain dedicated to the opioid
16 abatement, there was no clear statutory
17 requirement ensuring that outcome.

18 As a result, millions of dollars
19 that originated from the settlement funds
20 intended to address addiction became subject to
21 competing budget priorities. This is exactly the
22 kind of ambiguity that this legislation resolves.

23 At a time when communities across
24 New York continue to confront addiction,
25 fentanyl-related deaths, and the ongoing need for

1 treatment and recovery, services should be
2 maximizing every available resource, not creating
3 opportunities for those resources to be
4 diminished.

5 I urge my colleagues -- thank you
6 for voting yes, because I assume it passed. But
7 let's ensure that every dollar intended to combat
8 the opioid epidemic, including every dollar in
9 interest earned, remains dedicated to that
10 mission.

11 Thank you so much for this
12 opportunity, and I vote aye.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
14 Fernandez to be recorded in the affirmative on
15 the aforementioned bill.

16 Senator Gianaris.

17 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
18 let's take up the supplemental calendar at this
19 time.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: There are
21 substitutions at the desk.

22 The Secretary will read.

23 THE SECRETARY: Senator Cleare
24 moves to discharge, from the Committee on
25 Finance, Assembly Bill Number 4195A and

1 substitute it for the identical Senate Bill 118A,
2 Third Reading Calendar 1697.

3 Senator Parker moves to discharge,
4 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
5 Number 5404C and substitute it for the identical
6 Senate Bill 1335C, Third Reading Calendar 1701.

7 Senator Kavanagh moves to discharge,
8 from the Committee on Finance, Assembly Bill
9 Number 1191B and substitute it for the identical
10 Senate Bill 1455B, Third Reading Calendar 1702.

11 Senator Comrie moves to discharge,
12 from the Committee on Transportation,
13 Assembly Bill Number 1673 and substitute it for
14 the identical Senate Bill 4230, Third Reading
15 Calendar 1705.

16 Senator Fahy moves to discharge,
17 from the Committee on Finance, Assembly Bill
18 Number 38 and substitute it for the identical
19 Senate Bill 4593, Third Reading Calendar 1707.

20 Senator Jackson moves to discharge,
21 from the Committee on Finance, Assembly Bill
22 Number 9665 and substitute it for the identical
23 Senate Bill 4894, Third Reading Calendar 1708.

24 Senator Cleare moves to discharge,
25 from the Committee on Aging, Assembly Bill

1 Number 3602 and substitute it for the identical
2 Senate Bill 6043, Third Reading Calendar 1712.

3 Senator Scarcella-Spanton moves to
4 discharge, from the Committee on Finance,
5 Assembly Bill Number 8482A and substitute it for
6 the identical Senate Bill 6376A, Third Reading
7 Calendar 1713.

8 Senator Cleare moves to discharge,
9 from the Committee on Consumer Protection,
10 Assembly Bill Number 10137 and substitute it for
11 the identical Senate Bill 7585A, Third Reading
12 Calendar 1716.

13 Senator Ryan moves to discharge,
14 from the Committee on Finance, Assembly Bill
15 Number 9162A and substitute it for the identical
16 Senate Bill 7633B, Third Reading Calendar 1717.

17 Senator Cleare moves to discharge,
18 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
19 Number 3598 and substitute it for the identical
20 Senate Bill 7819, Third Reading Calendar 1719.

21 Senator Walczyk moves to discharge,
22 from the Committee on Investigations and
23 Government Operations, Assembly Bill Number 8143A
24 and substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
25 7867A, Third Reading Calendar 1720.

1 Senator Comrie moves to discharge,
2 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
3 Number 8638B and substitute it for the identical
4 Senate Bill 8015B, Third Reading Calendar 1721.

5 Senator Brisport moves to discharge,
6 from the Committee on Children and Families,
7 Assembly Bill Number 8248A and substitute it for
8 the identical Senate Bill 8205A, Third Reading
9 Calendar 1722.

10 Senator Hinchey moves to discharge,
11 from the Committee on Codes, Assembly Bill
12 Number 8022A and substitute it for the identical
13 Senate Bill 8217B, Third Reading Calendar 1723.

14 Senator Comrie moves to discharge,
15 from the Committee on Codes, Assembly Bill
16 Number 8675C and substitute it for the identical
17 Senate Bill 8302D, Third Reading Calendar 1729.

18 Senator Cleare moves to discharge,
19 from the Committee on Finance, Assembly Bill
20 Number 9058A and substitute it for the identical
21 Senate Bill 8472A, Third Reading Calendar 1734.

22 Senator Rivera moves to discharge,
23 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
24 Number 10576 and substitute it for the identical
25 Senate Bill 8838A, Third Reading Calendar 1735.

1 Senator Harckham moves to discharge,
2 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
3 Number 11030A and substitute it for the identical
4 Senate Bill 8865A, Third Reading Calendar 1737.

5 Senator Griffo moves to discharge,
6 from the Committee on Finance, Assembly Bill
7 Number 10263A and substitute it for the identical
8 Senate Bill 9068A, Third Reading Calendar 1740.

9 Senator Ryan moves to discharge,
10 from the Committee on Finance, Assembly Bill
11 Number 9001 and substitute it for the identical
12 Senate Bill 9221, Third Reading Calendar 1742.

13 Senator Palumbo moves to discharge,
14 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
15 Number 10478 and substitute it for the identical
16 Senate Bill 9363, Third Reading Calendar 1744.

17 Senator Rolison moves to discharge,
18 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
19 Number 10391 and substitute it for the identical
20 Senate Bill 9453, Third Reading Calendar 1746.

21 Senator Gounardes moves to
22 discharge, from the Committee on Internet and
23 Technology, Assembly Bill Number 5175A and
24 substitute it for the identical Senate Bill 9508,
25 Third Reading Calendar 1747.

1 Senator Cleare moves to discharge,
2 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
3 Number 8313B and substitute it for the identical
4 Senate Bill 9723A, Third Reading Calendar 1752.

5 Senator Scarcella-Spanton moves to
6 discharge, from the Committee on Finance,
7 Assembly Bill Number 8061 and substitute it for
8 the identical Senate Bill 9940, Third Reading
9 Calendar 1758.

10 Senator Gianaris moves to discharge,
11 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
12 Number 11199A and substitute it for the identical
13 Senate Bill 10079, Third Reading Calendar 1761.

14 Senator Fernandez moves to
15 discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
16 Assembly Bill Number 11180B and substitute it for
17 the identical Senate Bill 10156B, Third Reading
18 Calendar 1763.

19 Senator Skoufis moves to discharge,
20 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
21 Number 11437 and substitute it for the identical
22 Senate Bill 10172, Third Reading Calendar 1764.

23 Senator Palumbo moves to discharge,
24 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
25 Number 11532 and substitute it for the identical

1 Senate Bill Number 10614, Third Reading Calendar
2 1774.

3 Senator Gonzalez moves to discharge,
4 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
5 Number 11540 and substitute it for the identical
6 Senate Bill 10616, Third Reading Calendar 1775.

7 Senator Baskin moves to discharge,
8 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
9 Number 11547 and substitute it for the identical
10 Senate Bill 10628, Third Reading Calendar 1779.

11 Senator Jackson moves to discharge,
12 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
13 Number 11534 and substitute it for the identical
14 Senate Bill 10629, Third Reading Calendar 1780.

15 Senator Gounardes moves to
16 discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
17 Assembly Bill Number 11555 and substitute it for
18 the identical Senate Bill Number 10636,
19 Third Reading Calendar 1783.

20 Senator Gianaris moves to discharge,
21 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
22 Number 11558 and substitute it for the identical
23 Senate Bill 10640, Third Reading Calendar 1785.

24 Senator Comrie moves to discharge,
25 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill

1 Number 11559 and substitute it for the identical
2 Senate Bill 10641, Third Reading Calendar 1786.

3 Senator Gonzalez moves to discharge,
4 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
5 Number 11560 and substitute it for the identical
6 Senate Bill 10642, Third Reading Calendar 1787.

7 Senator Stewart-Cousins moves to
8 discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
9 Assembly Bill Number 11561 and substitute it for
10 the identical Senate Bill 10644, Third Reading
11 Calendar Bill Number 1788.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:

13 Substitutions so ordered.

14 The Secretary will read Senate
15 Supplemental Calendar 63A.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 1696, Senate Print 82B, by Senator Liu, an act to
18 amend the Education Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
22 act shall take effect on the first of July.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
2 the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 1697, Assembly Bill Number 4195A, by
8 Assemblymember Hyndman, an act to amend the
9 Elder Law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
11 last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
13 act shall take effect one day after it shall have
14 become a law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
19 the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
22 is passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 1698, Senate Print 845A, by Senator Salazar, an
25 act to amend the Public Health Law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
2 last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
4 act shall take effect immediately.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
9 the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
11 Calendar 1698, voting in the negative are
12 Senators Ashby, Baskin, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
13 Chan, Gallivan, Griffio, Lanza, Martins,
14 Mattera -- pardon me, Senator Bynoe.

15 In relation to Calendar 1698, voting
16 in the negative are Senators Ashby, Baskin,
17 Bynoe, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Gallivan,
18 Griffio, Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Borrello,
19 Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,
20 Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

21 Ayes, 40. Nays, 20.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 1699, Senate Print 1004B, by Senator Brouk, an

1 act to amend the Criminal Procedure Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 14. This
5 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
6 shall have become a law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
13 Calendar 1699, voting in the negative are
14 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
15 Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, O'Mara, Ortt,
16 Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Tedisco and Weik.

17 Ayes, 46. Nays, 14.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 1700, Senate Print 1086D, by Senator Rivera, an
22 act to amend the Civil Rights Law.

23 SENATOR GIANARIS: Lay it aside for
24 the day.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill

1 will be laid aside for the day.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 1701, Assembly Bill Number 5404C, by
4 Assemblymember Stern, an act to amend the
5 General Municipal Law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
14 the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
16 Calendar 1701, voting in the negative are
17 Senators Borrello, Chan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza,
18 Mattera, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco,
19 Walczyk and Weik.

20 Ayes, 57. Nays, 13.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
22 is passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 1702, Assembly Bill Number 1191B, by
25 Assemblymember Bores, an act to amend the

1 Executive Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
5 act shall take effect immediately.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
10 the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
12 Calendar 1702, voting in the negative are
13 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
14 Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Mattera,
15 Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,
16 Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

17 Ayes, 40. Nays, 20.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 1703, Senate Print 1511A, by Senator Liu, an act
22 to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This

1 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
2 shall have become a law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: In relation
9 Calendar 1703, voting in the negative:
10 Senator Walczyk.

11 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
13 is passed.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 1704, Senate Print 3622, by Senator Ortt, an act
16 to amend the Highway Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
20 act shall take effect immediately.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
25 the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 1705, Assembly Bill Number 1673, by
6 Assemblymember Weprin, an act to amend the
7 Vehicle and Traffic Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11 act shall take effect immediately on the first of
12 November.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
19 Calendar 1705, voting in the negative are
20 Senators Gallivan, Helming and Walczyk.

21 Ayes, 57. Nays, 3.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
23 is passed.

24 There's a substitution at the desk.

25 The Secretary will read.

1 THE SECRETARY: Senator Comrie
2 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
3 Assembly Bill Number 4619B and substitute it for
4 the identical Senate Bill 4527B, Third Reading
5 Calendar 1706.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
7 substitution is so ordered.

8 The Secretary will read.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 1706, Assembly Bill Number 4619B, by
11 Assemblymember Solages, an act to amend the
12 Tax Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
16 act shall take effect immediately.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
21 the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
23 Calendar 1706, voting in the negative are
24 Senators Griffo, Krueger and May.

25 Ayes, 57. Nays, 3.

1 Oh, excuse me, also Senator Hinchey.

2 Ayes, 56 -- also Senator Fahy.

3 Ayes, 55. Nays, 5.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Also Senator
7 Mattera.

8 Ayes, 54. Nays, 6.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Also Senator
12 Murray.

13 Ayes, 53. Nays, 7.

14 (Laughter.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
16 remains passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 1707, Assembly Bill Number 38, by
19 Assemblymember Burdick, an act in relation to
20 directing the New York State Department of Labor
21 to establish a voluntary training and
22 certification program.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This

1 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
2 shall have become a law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 1708, Assembly Bill Number 9665, by
13 Assemblymember Cashman, an act to repeal
14 paragraph (g) of Subdivision 4 of Section 209 of
15 the Civil Service Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
19 act shall take effect immediately.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
2 is passed.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 1709, Senate Print 5711C, by Senator Skoufis,
5 Concurrent Resolution of the Senate and Assembly
6 proposing amendments to Section 21 of Article 6,
7 Article 13, and Section 6 of Article 4 of the
8 Constitution.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
10 roll on the resolution.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
13 Skoufis to explain his vote on the resolution.

14 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Thank you very
15 much, Mr. President.

16 I want to thank my colleagues for
17 their support, if they're supporting this. And I
18 appreciate the vigorous debate that we've had on
19 generally this issue over the last several years.

20 This constitutional amendment is
21 important because it finishes the job, or seeks
22 to finish the job that we started several years
23 ago. We were constitutionally constrained from
24 moving a number of offices statutorily, and those
25 include, for example, county clerk, sheriff, DAs,

1 judicial offices, cities, among a couple of
2 others. We moved everything that we could
3 statutorily, but those were some that we could
4 not.

5 And so this constitutional amendment
6 seeks to transition the balance of those offices
7 and ensure that outside of New York City we do
8 have a full transition from odd- to even-year
9 election cycles when far, far more voters are
10 engaged and cast a ballot and will have a say in
11 who their local town supervisors are, county
12 executives are, county legislators are, town
13 councilmembers are, and a host of other very
14 important local officeholders.

15 And importantly, I want to thank the
16 Majority Leader as well as a number of others who
17 helped put together and advance this bill,
18 including the Board of Elections, the
19 Attorney General, the Assembly Speaker and
20 Assemblyman Jonathan Jacobson, who have been very
21 engaged on this issue. And I hope that they move
22 forward with this bill over the next however
23 many, 24 hours or so.

24 But this is good for democracy. And
25 importantly, we don't materialize the savings

1 that we talked about three years ago without
2 doing this. And this was raised three years ago
3 in our debate, that we would have these
4 outstanding offices still on the ballot without
5 or absent a constitutional amendment. Odd-year
6 elections would still have to be administered
7 without this constitutional amendment.

8 This amendment will save hundreds of
9 millions of dollars every couple of years on
10 odd-year cycles throughout the state.

11 For that and many other reasons, I
12 vote yes. Thank you.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
14 Skoufis to be recorded in the affirmative.

15 Senator Martins to explain his vote.

16 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,
17 Mr. President.

18 You know, it should not come as a
19 surprise to anyone in the chamber once again that
20 the legislation excludes almost half the State of
21 New York, by population, by excluding the largest
22 city in the State of New York, the nearly
23 9 million people who live in the great City of
24 New York.

25 Now, if you look at the statistics,

1 Mr. President, you'll see -- and I'm sure
2 everyone here recognizes it. If we have an area
3 of this state where the population has
4 consistently not come out to vote, where there is
5 a need for engagement and to encourage people to
6 vote, it's precisely in the City of New York, and
7 they've been excluded.

8 What it does is it does provide all
9 of our local communities, villages and towns and
10 counties, with influences far beyond the local
11 issues that have historically been those that
12 drive local elections. And I think,
13 Mr. President, obviously that was done with a
14 purpose in order to undermine those local
15 communities. And that should also be clear.

16 Regardless of what the rhetoric is
17 here, it's a bad bill. It continues to be a bad
18 bill. And I'll continue to be voting no.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
20 Martins to be recorded in the negative.

21 Senator Rhoads to explain his vote.

22 SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you,
23 Mr. President.

24 And to follow Senator Martins'
25 eloquent points, I do recall, as being one of the

1 Senators who debated that original bill three
2 years ago, that one point that was raised was the
3 fact that the City of New York was excluded. And
4 the explanation that we were given from the other
5 side of the chamber was that we needed a
6 constitutional amendment in order to be able to
7 include the City of New York.

8 Well, here today we have that
9 constitutional amendment. We're going through
10 the process. We're inconveniencing the rest of
11 the entire state. Yet somehow the City of
12 New York is still not included in the
13 constitutional amendment.

14 Mr. President, this is a sham. It's
15 been a sham since the beginning. I am voting no.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
17 Rhoads to be recorded in the negative.

18 Senator Murray to explain his vote.

19 SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you,
20 Mr. President.

21 As my colleagues have pointed out
22 the obvious, this is nothing but political. I
23 mean, when we hear that it's going to save money,
24 well, that's wonderful. Because all of a sudden
25 money is important.

1 It wasn't important when we wanted
2 to have pop-up election sites which would
3 increase costs, printing of all the ballots and
4 things like this. There's even a bill that would
5 now make all election commissioners full-time,
6 even in counties where they're really not
7 necessary. Which would, again, increase costs.

8 But all of a sudden, this will save
9 money.

10 As has been pointed out, it was
11 interesting that New York City was excluded. And
12 the excuse was, well, it's constitutional. Well,
13 we're certainly changing the Constitution now.
14 So it actually did go before the voters in
15 New York City, who said no, overwhelmingly. No,
16 we don't want it. But yet we're still going to
17 ram it down the throat of the rest of the state.
18 And it's completely political.

19 Here's the thing. Voters have the
20 choice. There's nothing different in the process
21 of voting in an odd year as opposed to an even
22 year. It is the exact same process. The voters
23 can go to the polls if they want. Nothing is
24 keeping them from going to the polls in an odd
25 year or an even year.

1 So the thought that we're doing it
2 to increase participation -- look, it's up to the
3 voters. If they want to participate, nothing's
4 holding them back now.

5 This is nothing but politics at its
6 worst, just like the redistricting we've talked
7 about and everything else. More and more of just
8 bad politics.

9 So I'll be voting no, Mr. President.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
11 Murray to be recorded in the negative.

12 Senator Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick to
13 explain her vote.

14 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK:
15 Thank you, Mr. President.

16 You've heard from my other
17 colleagues about the fact that this bill is not a
18 good thing for voters. Certainly in my area,
19 where the ballot will now be even longer, there
20 will be so many open positions on one ballot that
21 our voters will never make it to the end of the
22 ballot because there's just too many.

23 And those are things that I think
24 will discourage people from coming out and
25 voting -- the exact opposite intent of what we

1 want to do. We want people to come out and vote.

2 So I'll be also voting in the
3 negative. Thank you, Mr. President.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
5 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick to be recorded in the
6 negative.

7 Announce the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
9 Calendar --

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Excuse
11 me, I'm sorry. Senator Ryan to explain his vote.

12 SENATOR RYAN: Yes, I just want to
13 say -- I just want to comment on it.

14 One thing that was said is that it
15 will save hundreds of millions of dollars. We
16 hear a lot about unfunded mandates and unfunded
17 mandates and unfunded mandates. So as somebody
18 who came from town government and county
19 government, this is what I would like to refer
20 to, sometimes we do, as a reverse unfunded
21 mandate.

22 So I'll be in the affirmative.

23 Thank you.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
25 Ryan to be recorded in the affirmative.

1 Senator Weik to explain her vote.

2 SENATOR WEIK: Thank you,
3 Mr. President.

4 I'm kind of confused by this bill
5 because we spent so much time passing bills and
6 spending money to make voting easier at every
7 expense, and yet this bill will create a ballot
8 that is pages long that is bound to deter people
9 from going out to vote.

10 It's just a terrible idea, and it's
11 counterproductive to everything that this
12 Majority has done, and so I'm a no.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
14 Weik to be recorded in the negative.

15 Announce the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
17 Calendar 1709, voting in the negative are
18 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
19 Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins,
20 Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt,
21 Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk,
22 Weber and Weik.

23 Ayes, 38. Nays, 22.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
25 is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 1710, Senate Print 5754B, by Senator Martinez, an
3 act to amend the Retirement and Social Security
4 Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This
8 act shall take effect immediately.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 1711, Senate Print 6008B, by Senator Baskin, an
17 act to amend the Highway Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 1712, Assembly Bill Number 3602, by
7 Assemblymember Seawright, an act to amend the
8 Elder Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
12 act shall take effect immediately.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1713, Assembly Bill Number 8482A, by
23 Assemblymember Cruz, an act to amend the Workers'
24 Compensation Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
11 is passed.

12 Senator Gianaris.

13 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President, I
14 just want to clarify on 1710 that we did have a
15 home-rule message on that bill, from what I
16 understand.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: There is
18 a home-rule message at the desk in relation to
19 Calendar 1710.

20 Do we need me to reread that last
21 section?

22 SENATOR GIANARIS: No.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Okay,
24 just to clarify. Excellent.

25 The Secretary will read.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 1714, Senate Print 6736A, by Senator Fahy, an act
3 to amend the Social Services Law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
7 act shall take effect on the first of April.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
12 Fahy to explain her vote.

13 SENATOR FAHY: Thank you,
14 Mr. President. I rise to vote aye on this bill.

15 Glioblastoma, many of us are
16 familiar with it, is a highly aggressive brain
17 cancer with very limited treatment options and
18 very low survival rates.

19 This technology or this treatment,
20 TTFields, is a wearable device, and it is the
21 first therapy in over 10 years proven to increase
22 survivability of newly diagnosed glioblastoma
23 patients.

24 This bill will ensure that Medicaid
25 patients have access to this FDA-approved,

1 National Comprehensive Cancer Network-preferred
2 treatment, which closes a gap -- closes a
3 healthcare gap for some of the sickest, most
4 vulnerable New Yorkers.

5 TTFields, again, this treatment
6 again is -- represents the most significant
7 advancement in over a decade. It corrects a
8 critical inequity in healthcare by ensuring
9 Medicaid fee-for-service beneficiaries have equal
10 access to this life-extending treatment.

11 It's endorsed by major cancer
12 centers, medical societies, patient advocacy
13 groups, and more.

14 I have to say, as somebody who has
15 been all too familiar with cancer as -- in
16 patients, we sought every treatment for my son to
17 try to extend his life. And I'm just deeply
18 honored to be able to sponsor a treatment like
19 this, a bill like this that may help extend other
20 lives and address this glaring inequity in cancer
21 care and Medicaid treatment for this, again,
22 safe, effective and life-extending treatment.

23 And with that, Mr. President, I'm
24 very honored to vote aye.

25 Thank you.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
2 Fahy to be recorded in the affirmative.

3 Announce the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
6 is passed.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 1715, Senate Print 6983A, by Senator Brisport, an
9 act to amend the Public Health Law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
11 last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
13 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
14 shall have become a law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
19 the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
21 Calendar 1715, voting in the negative are
22 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Gallivan, Griffo,
23 Rhoads, Stec, Walczyk and Weik.

24 Ayes, 52. Nays, 8.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill

1 is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 1716, Assembly Bill Number 10137, by
4 Assemblymember Wright, an act to amend the
5 General Business Law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
14 the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 1717, Assembly Bill Number 9162A, by
20 Assemblymember Pheffer Amato, an act to amend
21 the Retirement and Social Security Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
5 Ryan to explain his vote.

6 SENATOR RYAN: Thank you,
7 Mr. President.

8 So I'm going to rise in support of
9 this bill establishing a 25-year retirement for
10 our 911 emergency communication personnel.

11 You know, when somebody calls 911,
12 it's usually at the worst moments of their life.
13 These professionals are the first point of
14 contact. Before a police officer arrives on the
15 scene, before a firefighter reaches the scene,
16 before an ambulance pulls up, a dispatcher is
17 already hard at work. They assess the
18 emergencies, they gather critical information,
19 direct resources, provide instructions.

20 That can't go unnoticed, and it's a
21 terribly, terribly difficult job. And all too
22 often they are the true unsung heroes of all the
23 emergencies. So we rely on these operators to
24 handle life-or-death situations 24 hours a day,
25 seven days a week.

1 So by creating an optional 25-year
2 retirement plan, we acknowledge that their career
3 and their hard work responding to emergencies
4 behind the headset -- it's an excruciatingly
5 difficult and demanding job, and we actually just
6 need to help them help recruit and retain
7 employees.

8 So I'm proudly going to vote in
9 favor of this, and I'll definitely want to give
10 some acknowledgement to my partners who helped
11 get this over the finish line -- obviously, the
12 hardworking men and women of CSEA, DC 37, and
13 AFSCME Council 66 and 82.

14 On behalf of these heroes that do
15 this behind the scenes every day, I vote in the
16 affirmative.

17 Thank you, Mr. President.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
19 Ryan to be recorded in the affirmative.

20 Senator Rolison to explain his vote.

21 SENATOR ROLISON: Thank you,
22 Mr. President.

23 I want to thank Senator Ryan for
24 moving this bill forward.

25 And as I've said many times here on

1 the floor, as a former cop, and starting in the
2 1980s, before there were 911 centers, we had to
3 rotate through what we called the front desk as
4 police officers when the police assistant was
5 off. No one wanted to do that job because the
6 pressure was tremendous, with the amount of phone
7 calls, answering the radio, working on the
8 computer and doing all those other things.

9 It has evolved tremendously over the
10 years. So last year, in the City of
11 Poughkeepsie, they had 130,000 phone calls into
12 their 911 center, 33,000 were for the police,
13 6,000 were for fire, 9100 for EMS, and everything
14 else was just people calling 911 who wanted to
15 talk to the water department.

16 You know, the pressure that goes
17 inside that job and that headset, as Senator Ryan
18 said, is tremendous. We owe this to them.

19 And, also too, Mr. President,
20 everything in the public safety world generally
21 starts with a phone call, and it starts with
22 them.

23 I proudly vote aye.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
25 Rolison to be recorded in the affirmative.

1 Announce the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 1718, Senate Print 7802A, by Senator Harckham, an
7 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: There is
9 a home-rule message at the desk.

10 Read the last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
12 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
13 shall have become a law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
18 Harckham to explain his vote.

19 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Thank you very
20 much, Mr. President.

21 I rise in support of Jake's Law. I
22 want to thank our Majority Leader for bringing
23 this to the floor today.

24 You know, Jake Arcara was just an
25 everyday guy. Brought a smile to everybody's

1 face, everybody loved him. Grew up in the Town
2 of Yorktown, was engaged to be married to his
3 fiancée, Katie. They were going to get married
4 in 2023.

5 He was a four-year employee of the
6 Yorktown Highway Department, where his colleagues
7 described him as loyal, warmhearted, funny,
8 hardworking, and a genuine guy.

9 Tragically, Jake was killed on the
10 job on September 14th, in 2022. He was working a
11 construction site when an out-of-control resident
12 drove their vehicle through the warning flags and
13 into Jake, killing him at the scene.

14 This crash highlights the dangers
15 faced by our local highway construction workers.
16 And we've taken action in New York State, where
17 we now have cameras along worksites, DOT, and the
18 New York State Thruway.

19 This legislation will create a
20 first-of-its-kind program in New York State to
21 allow the Town of Yorktown to work with DOT to
22 establish a work-zone camera program at the local
23 level in the Town of Yorktown, hopefully keeping
24 other highway workers safe and holding drivers
25 accountable who drive recklessly in work zones.

1 I want to thank Jake's mother,
2 Kelly Arcara, who's turned pain to purpose, who's
3 worked for a couple of years with us on this
4 bill. She's come up to Albany to speak on this
5 bill.

6 I want to thank Jake's colleagues at
7 the highway department, the Town of Yorktown, and
8 of course my friend over in the Assembly,
9 Assemblymember Matt Slater.

10 I think this is a bill that has
11 potential to really impact not just the safety in
12 the Town of Yorktown, but depending on how this
13 project goes, in many more municipalities
14 throughout the state.

15 For those reasons, I vote aye,
16 Mr. President.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
18 Harckham to be recorded in the affirmative.

19 Announce the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
21 Calendar 1718, voting in the negative:
22 Senator Lanza.

23 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
25 is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 1719, Assembly Bill Number 3598, by
3 Assemblymember Schiavoni, an act to amend the
4 Mental Hygiene Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
8 act shall take effect immediately.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
13 Palumbo to explain his vote.

14 SENATOR PALUMBO: Thank you,
15 Mr. President.

16 I wanted to first thank
17 Senator Cleare for bringing this to the floor.
18 This is a bill that I had a couple of years ago,
19 and Senator Cleare expressed an interest in
20 fixing issues with the guardianship process,
21 which she does in so many different bills.

22 So thank you for getting this to the
23 finish line. As you can hear from the
24 substitution, it did pass the Assembly as well.

25 What this bill does is it enacts

1 Karilyn's Law, which fixes a very meaningful gap
2 in the guardianship law. As people know, as you
3 all know, when someone's appointed by the court,
4 a guardian is appointed because of someone's age
5 or illness or disability, they take control of
6 all their financial and personal needs. And
7 there are times -- most of the time, or
8 oftentimes, it's a complete stranger, or
9 sometimes it's a family member.

10 And with the family dynamics being
11 what they are, individuals have no opportunity or
12 they need to go through a very lengthy court
13 process just to visit with their loved one. And
14 we know many, many stories. When I drafted this
15 bill initially, our office was inundated by
16 people around the country who suffered from this.

17 We know there are issues with access
18 to Wendy Williams. We remember -- everyone
19 remembers the radio host Casey Kasem, who didn't
20 see his family for the last year and a half of
21 his life. There was no allegations of abuse of
22 any kind, there was just a difference of
23 personality.

24 What this does is allows a motion to
25 be filed by order to show cause and a hearing

1 within 10 days. And it is presumed that you can
2 simply visit with your loved one. Believe it or
3 not, that is a huge problem and issue in the
4 guardianship process. And it can be supervised
5 or otherwise, just as if you would visit a child.
6 You want to visit your sick or ailing mother or
7 grandparent, you can see them. That's what this
8 does.

9 And it's named after
10 Karilyn Montanti, where this issue arose and was
11 brought to my attention by her daughter
12 Christine.

13 So thank you so much for bringing
14 this to the floor, Senator Cleare. I greatly
15 appreciate you moving this to the finish line and
16 playing quarterback.

17 I proudly vote aye, and I urge my
18 colleagues to do the same.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
20 Palumbo to be recorded in the affirmative.

21 Announce the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1720, Assembly Bill Number 8143A, by
2 Assemblymember Barclay, an act to amend the
3 Tax Law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
7 act shall take effect on the first of January.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
14 Calendar 1720, voting in the negative:
15 Senator Skoufis. Also Senator Martinez. Also
16 Senator Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick.

17 (Pause.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
19 the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
21 Calendar 1720, voting in the negative are
22 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Lanza, Martinez,
23 Scarcella-Spanton and Skoufis.

24 Ayes, 55. Nays, 5.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill

1 is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 1721, Assembly Bill Number 8638B, by
4 Assemblymember Kim, an act to amend the
5 General Business Law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
14 the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
16 Calendar 1721, voting in the negative:
17 Senator Skoufis.

18 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1722, Assembly Bill Number 8248A, by
23 Assemblymember Hevesi, an act to amend the
24 Social Services Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This
3 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it
4 shall have become a law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
9 the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Oh, excuse me. In
14 relation to Calendar 1722, voting in the
15 negative: Senator Walczyk.

16 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 1723, Assembly Bill Number 8022A, by
21 Assemblymember Steck, an act to amend the
22 Criminal Procedure Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This

1 act shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
6 the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1724, Senate Print 8237, by Senator Parker, an
12 act to amend the Public Authorities Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
16 act shall take effect immediately.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
21 the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
23 Calendar 1724, voting in the negative are
24 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
25 Helming, Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Murray, O'Mara,

1 Ortt, Tedisco, Walczyk and Weik.

2 Ayes, 47. Nays, 13.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 1725, Senate Print 8239, by Senator Ramos, an act
7 to amend the Labor Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
19 is passed.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Calendar
21 Number 1726, Senate Print 8240, by Senator Ramos,
22 an act to amend the Workers' Compensation Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 16. This

1 act shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
6 the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
8 Calendar 1726, voting in the negative are
9 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Palumbo, Rhoads
10 and Walczyk.

11 Ayes, 56. Nays, 4.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
13 is passed.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 1727, Senate Print 8246, by Senator Myrie, an act
16 to amend the State Finance Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
20 act shall take effect immediately.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
25 the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
2 Calendar 1727, voting in the negative:
3 Senator Walczyk.

4 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
6 is passed.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 1728, Senate Print 8253, by Senator Brisport, an
9 act to amend the Abandoned Property Law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
11 last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
13 act shall take effect immediately.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
18 the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
21 is passed.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 1729, Assembly Bill Number 8675C, by
24 Assemblymember Braunstein, an act to amend the
25 Penal Law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
2 last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 11. This
4 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
5 shall have become a law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
10 the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
12 Calendar 1729, voting in the negative are
13 Senators Brisport and Gonzalez.

14 Ayes, 58. Nays, 2.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 1730, Senate Print 8364, by Senator Webb, an act
19 to amend the Education Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
23 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
24 shall have become a law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
6 Calendar 1730, voting in the negative are
7 Senators Martinez and Skoufis.

8 Ayes, 58. Nays -- pardon me.

9 In relation to Calendar 1730, voting
10 in the negative are Senators Martinez and
11 Walczyk.

12 Ayes, 58. Nays, 2.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 1731, Senate Print 8385, by Senator Comrie, an
17 act to amend the State Finance Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
21 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it
22 shall have become a law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
2 the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 1732, Senate Print 8407, by Senator Fahy, an act
8 to amend the Social Services Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
12 act shall take effect immediately.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1733, Senate Print 8410, by Senator Comrie, an
23 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
25 last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
2 act shall take effect immediately.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 1734, Assembly Bill Number 9058A, by
13 Assemblymember Wright, an act to amend the
14 Administrative Code of the City of New York.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
18 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
19 shall have become a law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: In relation to

1 Calendar 1734, voting in the negative are
2 Senators O'Mara, Ortt, Rhoads and Weik.

3 Ayes, 56. Nays, 4.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 1735, Assembly Bill Number 10576, by
8 Assemblymember Lucas, an act to amend the
9 Social Services Law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
11 last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
13 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
14 shall have become a law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
19 the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
22 is passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 1736, Senate Print 8852C, by Senator Harckham, an
25 act in relation to authorizing the County of

1 Putnam to lease certain lands used as parklands.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: There's a
3 home-rule message at the desk.

4 Read the last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 1737, Assembly Bill Number 11030A, by
17 Assemblymember Levenberg, an act to amend the
18 Public Health Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
22 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
23 shall have become a law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
3 the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
5 Calendar 1737, voting in the negative:
6 Senator Walczyk.

7 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1738, Senate Print 8926, by Senator Ryan, an act
12 to amend the Public Authorities Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
16 act shall take effect on the 120th day after it
17 shall have become a law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
24 Calendar 1738, voting in the negative are
25 Senators Helming, Krueger, Rhoads, Walczyk and

1 Weik.

2 Ayes, 55. Nays, 5.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 1739, Senate Print 8965, by Senator Hinchey, an
7 act to amend the Public Health Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 9. This
11 act shall take effect 18 months after it shall
12 have become a law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
19 Calendar 1739, voting in the negative are
20 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
21 Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins,
22 Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt,
23 Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk,
24 Weber and Weik.

25 Ayes, 38. Nays, 22.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
2 is passed.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 1740, Assembly Bill Number 10263A, by
5 Assemblymember Buttenschon, an act to amend the
6 Retirement and Social Security Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
15 the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 1741, Senate Print 9138, by Senator Palumbo, an
21 act relating to a death benefit option for the
22 beneficiary of Justice Jerry Garguilo.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This

1 act shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
6 Palumbo to explain his vote.

7 SENATOR PALUMBO: Thank you,
8 Madam President.

9 I just rise briefly to explain the
10 life of Judge Garguilo, who was beloved by
11 everyone.

12 He was a lawyer's lawyer when he
13 practiced. And Judge Garguilo became a
14 Supreme Court judge and, because of his skill as
15 a lawyer, presided over the most complex cases --
16 brain-damaged baby cases, asbestos cases.

17 And then he presided over the opioid
18 litigation. He was the coordinating judge. For
19 those of you who don't know, you have a
20 coordinated practice or coordinated judge so that
21 all venues don't have inconsistent decisions and
22 they all go to one judge.

23 So as a reminder, the opioid
24 litigation in the State of New York, which
25 resulted in billions of dollars recovered in the

1 settlements, it involved 62 counties; 10 cities,
2 including New York City; 67 smaller municipal
3 corporations, townships, villages, judges,
4 eventually the State of New York.

5 The named defendants were
6 manufacturers, distributors, large retail
7 pharmacies. Forty defendants were named. At
8 times there were participating lawyers exceeding
9 100.

10 They converted Touro Law School to a
11 courtroom. There were over 350 written decisions
12 and directives, and it involved 357 motion
13 sequences.

14 So Judge Garguilo was this
15 coordinating judge, and as the litigation was
16 winding down, he did not want to dump this on his
17 colleagues. So as a result of his dedication to
18 the State of New York, to the practice of law,
19 and his colleagues on the judiciary, he hung
20 around and was certificated twice, and was
21 retiring this past December.

22 Very sadly, Judge Garguilo
23 unexpectedly, in September of 2025, passed away.

24 So we've had many of these, as we
25 call, death gamble bills that have come through

1 this house. But the only reason why Judge
2 Garguilo was not with his feet up by the pool was
3 as a result of that opioid litigation, and he
4 wanted to see it through to the end, which
5 thankfully he did.

6 So I proudly vote aye,
7 Madam President, and I urge my colleagues to do
8 the same.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
10 Palumbo to be recorded in the affirmative.

11 Senator Mattera to explain his vote.

12 SENATOR MATTERA: Thank you,
13 Madam President.

14 I just want to thank my colleague
15 Senator Palumbo for this very, very special bill
16 for a very, very special person, a special judge.
17 He was the People's Judge, and he passed away
18 sitting on the bench. He passed away.

19 His family, everybody misses him.
20 He's the type of salt-of-the-earth type of man.
21 He was somebody that, in other words, you were in
22 your town in St. James and you'd see him at your
23 regular local stores, the restaurants, 7-11, and
24 he would sit there and he was just a word of
25 wisdom.

1 And he was definitely a mentor to
2 me, someone that swore me in in my office, and it
3 just meant so, so much to me. And when he -- the
4 passing of him -- and we were all shocked and
5 we're still grieving over this, Madam President,
6 because he's the type of person that would have
7 been on TV, like a Judge Judy, that type of
8 person, that he's a caring type of person that
9 gives people breaks. That's what Judge Garguilo
10 is all about.

11 And what a family man, with him
12 being with his wife and his daughters. And
13 Nicole Garguilo is very, very special to me and
14 the Town of Smithtown in what she does.

15 But he's just a fixture, and his
16 name will always be there. It will be etched in
17 stone in the great Town of Smithtown.

18 Thank you so much, and I proudly
19 vote yes.

20 Thank you, Madam President.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
22 Mattera to be recorded in the affirmative.

23 Announce the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill

1 is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 1742, Assembly Bill Number 9001, by
4 Assemblymember Steck, an act to amend the
5 Mental Hygiene Law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
9 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
10 shall have become a law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
15 the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 1743, Senate Print 9287A, by Senator Hinchey, an
21 act to amend the Real Property Tax Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
5 the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
7 Calendar 1743, voting in the negative are
8 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
9 Gallivan, Griffio, Lanza, Martins, Oberacker,
10 O'Mara, Tedisco and Weik.

11 Ayes, 49. Nays, 11.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
13 is passed.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 1744, Assembly Bill Number 10478, by
16 Assemblymember Schiavoni, an act in relation to
17 increasing the term of office from two years to
18 four years for the Trustees of the Freeholders
19 and Commonalty of the Town of Southampton.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
3 the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
5 Calendar 1744, voting in the negative are
6 Senators Ryan and Skoufis.

7 Ayes, 58. Nays, 2.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1745, Senate Print 9441, by Senator Chan, an act
12 to amend the Multiple Dwelling Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
16 act shall take effect on the first of January.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
21 Chan to explain his vote.

22 SENATOR CHAN: Thank you,
23 Madam President.

24 So this bill was actually born from
25 the great fire of the Chan household on

1 Thanksgiving of 2025, as my colleagues have heard
2 this story many times and saw video clips of.

3 So there I was, me and my daughter
4 were toasting some marshmallows by the oven, and
5 the torch that I was using caught fire and my
6 hand was engulfed in this fire.

7 And I could have dropped the can of
8 gas on the floor, but my police experience tells
9 me that that can could have burst into flames.
10 And my daughter was standing right there. So I
11 made a choice of holding onto that can with all
12 my might and running it 6 seconds out my front
13 door and dropped it on my front stoop.

14 Now, every -- I do have fire
15 extinguishers on every floor in my house. I
16 didn't have time to grab it. So eventually I did
17 go in there and grab the fire extinguisher and
18 put out that fire.

19 Now, my hand still bears the scars
20 from seven months ago. And I thought, you know,
21 in case that can of gas would have dropped on my
22 floor, that would have been the first time I
23 needed that fire extinguisher.

24 Why doesn't every small apartment,
25 small dwelling, one-, two-, three-family units

1 have this fire extinguisher in there? And I
2 realized that in the news every day I read about
3 small fires that -- where tenants ran out and
4 call 911 and it turned into a big fire. I've
5 seen it as a cop as well.

6 So I thought it might be a great
7 idea if we recruit and mobilize every tenant in
8 these apartments, small dwellings, as a
9 first-line firefighter. One little fire
10 extinguisher that costs \$20 can save many, many
11 lives down the road as well as property damage.

12 So that gave me a great idea. I
13 want to thank my colleagues for supporting this
14 bill, and I urge everyone to vote up on it.

15 That's why I vote yes. Thank you.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
17 Chan to be recorded in the affirmative.

18 Announce the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
21 is passed.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 1746, Assembly Bill Number 10391, by
24 Assemblymember Jacobson, an act to amend the
25 Vehicle and Traffic Law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
2 last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
4 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it
5 shall have become a law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
10 the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
13 is passed.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 1747, Assembly Bill Number 5175A, by
16 Assemblymember Solages, an act to amend the
17 General Business Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
21 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
22 shall have become a law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
2 the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 1748, Senate Print 9509, by Senator Ortt, an act
8 to amend the Highway Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
12 act shall take effect immediately.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1749, Senate Print 9606, by Senator Ortt, an act
23 to amend subpart H of Part C of Chapter 20 of the
24 Laws of 2015.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 1750, Senate Print 9654, by Senator Murray, an
14 act to amend the Highway Law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
18 act shall take effect immediately.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 1751, Senate Print 9682, by Senator Liu, an act

1 to amend the Education Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
5 act shall take effect immediately.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
10 the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
13 is passed.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 1752, Assembly Bill Number 8313B, by
16 Assemblymember Anderson, an act to amend the
17 Public Housing Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
21 act shall take effect on the 120th day after it
22 shall have become a law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
2 the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
4 Calendar 1752, voting in the negative:
5 Senator Walczyk.

6 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
8 is passed.

9 We're skipping; Bill Number S9725B
10 was not reported from Rules and therefore should
11 not appear on the calendar.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 1754, Senate Print 9736, by Senator Kavanaugh, an
14 act to amend the Penal Law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
18 act shall take effect immediately.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
23 Murray to explain his vote.

24 SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you,
25 Madam President.

1 This one baffles me. Look, I know,
2 I get it, you don't like guns, you don't like the
3 NRA. But what we're saying with this bill is
4 that training by the United States Army, training
5 by the United States Navy, training by the
6 U.S. Marine Corps or the Adjutant General of this
7 state or by the NRA is not good enough. No, we
8 didn't train them, they're not good enough to
9 train people with the use of guns.

10 You've got to be kidding me. Can we
11 at least live in the real world? This is
12 ridiculous.

13 I vote no.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
15 Murray to be recorded in the negative.

16 Announce the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
18 Calendar 1754, voting in the negative are
19 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
20 Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins,
21 Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Rhoads,
22 Rolison, Palumbo, Tedisco, Stec, Walczyk, Weber
23 and Weik.

24 Ayes, 38. Nays, 22.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill

1 is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 1755, Senate Print 9904, by Senator Ramos, an act
4 to amend the Labor Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
8 act shall take effect immediately.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
13 the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 1756, Senate Print 9905, by Senator Jackson, an
19 act to amend the Retirement and Social Security
20 Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 12. This
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 1757, Senate Print 9906, by Senator Myrie, an act
10 to amend the Criminal Procedure Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
14 act shall take effect immediately.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
19 the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
22 is passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 1758, Assembly Bill Number 8061, by
25 Assemblymember Bronson, an act to amend the

1 Veterans' Services Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
5 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
6 shall have become a law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 1759, Senate Print 9982A, by Senator Tedisco, an
17 act in relation to authorizing Kurt Nolan to
18 receive certain credit under Sections 384-d and
19 384-e of the Retirement and Social Security Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)
2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
3 the results.
4 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.
5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
6 is passed.
7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 1760, Senate Print 10058C, by Senator Harckham,
9 an act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.
10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
11 last section.
12 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
13 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it
14 shall have become a law.
15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
16 roll.
17 (The Secretary called the roll.)
18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
19 the results.
20 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.
21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
22 is passed.
23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 1761, Assembly Bill Number 11199A, by
25 Assemblymember Reyes, an act to amend the

1 Executive Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
5 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
6 shall have become a law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
11 Chan to explain his vote.

12 SENATOR CHAN: Thank you,
13 Madam President.

14 So I rise once again, and once again
15 I call upon my own experience as an NYPD police
16 officer and police supervisor of 27 years.

17 Let's go back about 30 years. And
18 when I first became a police officer, I carried
19 what is known as a Motorola Saber radio. It was
20 this big, heavy prehistoric radio, and it wasn't
21 encrypted.

22 So now, once again, we're talking
23 about having no encryption on our police radios.
24 I'll tell you what happened when we didn't have
25 these encrypted radios. There was reporters and

1 members of the media and press just following the
2 cops around in the Lower East Side where I
3 worked.

4 And some of the problems that we
5 came across were they would get in the way when
6 our investigation wasn't over. They would get in
7 the way and identify victims when they were not
8 supposed to identify. They would broadcast a
9 news article before the investigation was
10 complete, in essence tipping off the criminals of
11 an ongoing investigation.

12 The reasons why we shouldn't have
13 the media monitor the radios, it was just
14 endless -- there's a lot of sensitive information
15 over the radio, a lot of things that are not
16 ready to be made public.

17 Recently my office -- a constituent
18 came into my office. He was a victim of a TikTok
19 scam, \$400,000. So using my connections in the
20 police department, we didn't just file a police
21 report for him, I contacted the Financial Crimes
22 Task Force. They set up a sting. They collared
23 three Thai nationals, part of an international
24 organized crime ring that's scamming my
25 constituents out of tens, hundreds of thousands

1 of dollars.

2 And -- but the problem is people are
3 monitoring the police radio, and it was made
4 public, but the Department of Homeland Security
5 took over that investigation. So now that
6 investigation itself is jeopardized.

7 So for many reasons like that, you
8 know, I'm going to have to vote down on this
9 bill. It's not a good idea.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
11 Chan to be recorded in the negative.

12 Announce the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
14 Calendar 1761, voting in the negative are
15 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
16 Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins,
17 Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt,
18 Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Ryan, Stec, Tedisco,
19 Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

20 Ayes, 37. Nays, 23.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
22 is passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 1762, Senate Print 10095B, by Senator Rhoads, an
25 act authorizing the Hicksville Water District to

1 receive retroactive real property tax-exempt
2 status.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
13 Calendar 1762, voting in the negative are
14 Senators O'Mara and Skoufis.

15 Ayes, 58. Nays, 2.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 1763, Assembly Bill Number 11180B, by
20 Assemblymember Paulin, an act to amend the
21 Vehicle and Traffic Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
25 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it

1 shall have become a law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
6 the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Excuse me.

11 In relation to Calendar 1763, voting
12 in the negative: Senator Lanza.

13 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 1764, Assembly Bill Number 11437, by
18 Assemblymember Stirpe, an act to amend the
19 Alcoholic Beverage Control Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
3 the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
5 Calendar 1764, voting in the negative are
6 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
7 Gallivan, Griffio, Lanza, O'Mara, Ortt, Stec,
8 Tedisco and Weber. Also Senators Palumbo and
9 Helming.

10 Ayes, 47. Nays, 13.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 1765, Senate Print 10196A, by Senator Fahy, an
15 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
19 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it
20 shall have become a law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
25 the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
2 Calendar 1765, voting in the negative are
3 Senators Lanza and Chan.

4 Ayes, 58. Nays, 2.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
6 is passed.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 1766, Senate Print 10223A, by Senator Fahy, an
9 act to authorize the South End Children's Cafe to
10 file an application for a retroactive real
11 property tax exemption.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
15 act shall take effect immediately.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
22 Calendar 1766, voting in the negative:
23 Senator Skoufis.

24 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill

1 is passed.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 1767, Senate Print 10443, by Senator Myrie, an
4 act to amend the Criminal Procedure Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
8 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it
9 shall have become a law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
14 the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
16 Calendar Number 1767, voting in the negative:
17 Senator Walczyk.

18 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1768, Senate Print 10446, by Senator Kavanagh, an
23 act to amend Chapter 514 of the Laws of 1983.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
25 last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 9. This
2 act shall take effect immediately.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
9 Calendar 1768, voting in the negative are
10 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
11 Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins,
12 Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Palumbo,
13 Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber
14 and Weik.

15 Ayes, 40. Nays, 20.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 1769, Senate Print 10489, by Senator Bynoe, an
20 act to amend the Local Finance Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: There's a
22 home-rule message at the desk.

23 Read the last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
5 the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
7 Calendar 1769, voting in the negative:
8 Senator Skoufis.

9 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 1770, Senate Print 10528, by Senator Oberacker,
14 an act to amend the Alcoholic Beverage Control
15 Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
19 act shall take effect immediately.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: In relation to

1 Calendar 1770, voting in the negative:

2 Senator Martinez.

3 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 1771, Senate Print 10563, by Senator Skoufis, an
8 act to amend the Election Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
12 act shall take effect immediately.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
19 Calendar 1771, voting in the negative:
20 Senator Walczyk.

21 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 1772, Senate Print 10603, by Senator Weber, an

1 act authorizing the Cong Kehal Square of Roman to
2 receive retroactive real property tax-exempt
3 status.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
7 act shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
14 Calendar 1772, voting in the negative are
15 Senators O'Mara and Skoufis.

16 Ayes, 58. Nays, 2.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 1773, Senate Print Number 10611, by
21 Senator Stewart-Cousins, an act authorizing the
22 Town of Greenburgh, County of Westchester, to
23 alienate and discontinue the use of certain
24 parkland.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: There's a

1 home-rule message at the desk.

2 Read the last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This
4 act shall take effect immediately.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
9 the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 1774, Assembly Bill Number 11532, by
15 Assemblymember Schiavoni, an act to amend
16 Chapter 704 of the Laws of 2023.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
20 act shall take effect immediately.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
25 the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
2 Calendar 1774, voting in the negative:
3 Senator Martinez.

4 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
6 is passed.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 1775, Assembly Bill Number 11540, by
9 Assemblymember Powers, an act to amend the
10 Alcoholic Beverage Control Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
14 act shall take effect immediately.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
19 the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
21 Calendar 1775, voting in the negative are
22 Senators Chan, Lanza and Martinez.

23 Ayes, 57. Nays, 3.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
25 is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 1776, Senate Print 10624, by Senator Bynoe, an
3 act to authorize the Freeport Bible Center to
4 file an application for a retroactive real
5 property tax exemption.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
14 the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
16 Calendar 1776, voting in the negative are
17 Senators O'Mara and Skoufis.

18 Ayes, 58. Nays, 2.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1777, Senate Print 10626, by Senator Gianaris, an
23 act to amend the Judiciary Law.

24 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill

1 is laid aside.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 1778, Senate Print 10627, by Senator Mayer, an
4 act to amend the General Business Law.

5 (Off the record.)

6 SENATOR GIANARIS: Lay it aside
7 temporarily, please.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
9 is laid aside temporarily.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1779, Assembly Bill Number 11547, by
12 Assemblymember Peoples-Stokes, an act to
13 amend the State Finance Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
17 act shall take effect upon the completion of all
18 grants having been transferred from Health
19 Research, Inc.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
2 is passed.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 1780, Assembly Bill Number 11534, by
5 Assemblymember Pheffer Amato, an act to amend the
6 Civil Service Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
15 the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
17 Calendar 1780, voting in the negative:
18 Senator Walczyk.

19 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
21 is passed.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 1781, Senate Print 10632, by Senator Fernandez,
24 an act to amend the Penal Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 1782, Senate Print 10635, by Senator Kavanaugh, an
14 act to amend the Multiple Dwelling Law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
18 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
19 shall have become a law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
24 Calendar 1782, voting in the negative are
25 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,

1 Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martinez,
2 Martins, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara,
3 Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Skoufis, Stec,
4 Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

5 Ayes, 36. Nays, 24.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 1783, Assembly Bill Number 11555, by
10 Assemblymember Pheffer Amato, an act to amend the
11 General Municipal Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
15 act shall take effect July 1, 2026.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 1784, Senate Print 10639, by Senator Gianaris, an

1 act to amend the Election Law.

2 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
4 is laid aside.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 1785, Assembly Bill Number 11558, by
7 Assemblymember Kim, an act to amend Chapter 704
8 of the Laws of 1991.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
12 act shall take effect immediately.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
19 Calendar 1785, voting in the negative:
20 Senator Skoufis.

21 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 1786, Assembly Bill Number 11559, by

1 Assemblymember Pretlow, an act to amend the
2 New York State Medical Care Facilities Finance
3 Agency Act.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
7 act shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 1787, Assembly Bill Number 11560, by
18 Assemblymember Barrett, an act to amend the
19 Environmental Conservation Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
21 last section.

22 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
24 is laid aside.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1788, Assembly Bill Number 11561, by
2 Assemblymember Heastie, an act to amend
3 Chapter 747 of the Laws of 2023.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
7 act shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
14 Calendar 1788, voting in the negative are
15 Senators Ortt and Walczyk.

16 Ayes, 58. Nays, 2.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 1779, Senate Print 10648, by Senator Stavisky, an
21 act implementing an agreement between the state
22 and an employee organization.

23 SENATOR GIANARIS: Is there a
24 message of necessity at the desk?

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: There is a

1 message of necessity at the desk.

2 SENATOR GIANARIS: Move to accept
3 the message.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: All those
5 in favor of accepting the message please signify
6 by saying aye.

7 (Response of "Aye.")

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Opposed,
9 nay.

10 (Response of "Nay.")

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
12 message is accepted.

13 The bill is before the house.

14 Read the last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 20. This
16 act shall take effect immediately.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
21 the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
24 is passed.

25 Senator Gianaris, that completes the

1 reading of the supplemental calendar.

2 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,
3 it's my understanding that the sponsor of
4 Calendar 1778 -- which happens to be you -- would
5 like to lay that bill aside for the day.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
7 is laid aside for the day.

8 SENATOR GIANARIS: Let's now move
9 to the controversial calendar.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
11 Secretary will ring the bell.

12 The Secretary will read.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 644, Senate Print 1463B, by Senator Kavanaugh, an
15 act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
17 Borrello, why do you rise?

18 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
19 would the sponsor yield for a question?

20 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Yes. Through
21 you, Madam President, yes.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
23 Kavanaugh, do you yield?

24 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Yes.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The

1 Senator yields.

2 SENATOR BORRELLO: Through you,
3 Madam President.

4 So obviously, you know, we have gone
5 back and forth on this before. But it sounds
6 like there has been some changes made to this, I
7 guess most importantly the idea of actually
8 assessing a fee.

9 Can you just explain the parameters
10 of that, the fee?

11 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Yeah, we
12 actually -- we're actually -- this is the fifth
13 time that this chamber has considered this bill,
14 and we're actually running this as an experiment
15 because previously many of my colleagues stood up
16 and said that, you know, there are many wonderful
17 programs that are wonderful partly because they
18 have their fee. So we've added the fee to see
19 if, you know, the wonderfulness is still
20 perceived by everyone in the chamber.

21 But yes, we have amended this
22 program so that there will be a fee at the point
23 of purchase when someone purchases a mattress,
24 and that fee will be collected, it will be --
25 there will be an audit to ensure that that covers

1 the cost of the collection program and the
2 extended producer responsibility program, and no
3 more than that cost, and that will go to either
4 the representative organization that represents
5 the manufacturers or the individual manufacturers
6 if they're complying with EPR separately.

7 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you.

8 Madam President, will the sponsor
9 continue to yield?

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
11 continue to yield?

12 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Yes,
13 Madam President.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
15 sponsor yields.

16 SENATOR BORRELLO: So you mentioned
17 that this is going to be a very -- very tight
18 assessment. In other words, you're going to try
19 to figure out a way how it's going to be a fee
20 assessed for only the cost of the program.

21 I agree that that should be the
22 case. This should not be a profit -- you know, a
23 profit center for anyone. But that seems like a
24 pretty complex thing to be able to calculate.
25 How is that -- who is going to do that, and how's

1 it going to happen?

2 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Through you,
3 Madam President, it will be done in a manner
4 that's similar to the four other states that have
5 this program that have such a fee. The bill
6 specifies that it needs to cover the cost over
7 multiple years.

8 So again, you're collecting --
9 you're getting the fee from the consumer at the
10 point that they purchase the mattress. It's
11 going to this organization. And then the
12 organization will, over time, have to, you know,
13 spend that fee to cover the costs. The costs of
14 the program change over time because they have
15 increasing responsibility to collect mattresses.

16 But it will be the producer
17 responsibility organization. When they submit
18 their plan to the DEC, they will submit a plan to
19 collect the fee and the amount of the fee and
20 some evidence that that fee has been audited
21 presumably by somebody independent, selected by
22 the manufacturers to ensure that it is the right
23 amount and no more.

24 But it's not going to be -- the fee
25 is not going to be set directly by -- you know,

1 DEC will have to approve the plan -- the fee as
2 part of the larger provision of the bill that has
3 them approving the overall plan. But the fee
4 will be set by the collective wisdom of the
5 manufacturers who are participating in the
6 producer responsibility organization.

7 And I would note that the
8 International Sleep Products Association is now
9 in support of this bill, as are NYCOM and the
10 many environmental groups that have been
11 supporting it from the beginning.

12 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
13 will the sponsor continue to yield?

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
15 continue to yield?

16 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Yes,
17 Madam President.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
19 sponsor yields.

20 SENATOR BORRELLO: Yes, I know that
21 your changes have -- you know, have garnered the
22 support of the International Sleep Association.
23 So congratulations on that, and sincerely, that
24 that was able to happen.

25 But, you know, you mentioned other

1 places where we use -- we've always referenced
2 the tires and paint as examples of how this could
3 happen. But, you know, how is this -- from a
4 logistical standpoint, like when you go -- when
5 you get rid of an old tire, you're taken
6 someplace to have the new tires put on, and they
7 take the old tire and charge you a fee. You take
8 your paint to a store, they charge you the fee.

9 How -- what's going to happen with a
10 mattress? Now when someone decides they don't
11 need their mattress anymore, what's the process
12 going to be to dispose of that mattress?

13 SENATOR KAVANAGH: The -- or the
14 industry, the producers -- producers
15 theoretically can comply with this program by
16 themselves, if they were like a particular brand
17 or a particular company and they wanted to just
18 collect their own mattresses and proceed.

19 But the way this has happened in
20 every other state, and the way we expect it would
21 happen here, is that the industry as a whole
22 would create a producer responsibility
23 organization that would collectively set up sites
24 that meet a convenience standard.

25 So there have to be sites in every

1 part of the state, there have to be additional
2 sites for every 30,000 people. So there are
3 criteria in the bill that make the -- that are
4 intended to make the collection and the drop-off
5 of mattresses convenient for consumers.

6 We know, of course, a lot of
7 mattresses are delivered directly to consumers.
8 In some cases they're still delivered in a truck
9 and a producer might be wise to arrange for the
10 truck to take the old mattress and bring it back.

11 But they're -- the program is not --
12 it's not that prescriptive as to how they do it,
13 other than they have to meet -- they have to
14 present a plan that meets a convenience standard,
15 DEC has to approve that plan, and then presumably
16 from that point forward it will be convenient to
17 the consumer.

18 The plan also is supposed to
19 indicate the manner in which they will, you know,
20 publicize the plan, any incentives they'll give
21 to retailers to participate in the plan. So
22 there's a variety of things that are intended.

23 And has been noted on this floor
24 before, these programs have worked very well in
25 other places and collected a great many

1 mattresses that otherwise go to landfill, and
2 that's of course a tremendous loss of resources,
3 about 23 cubic feet of valuable materials in
4 every mattress that gets disposed of.

5 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
6 will the sponsor continue to yield?

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
8 yield?

9 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Yes,
10 Madam President.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
12 sponsor yields.

13 SENATOR BORRELLO: I think we've
14 all seen, you know, commercials on TV, you can
15 buy a mattress online, you can buy it on Amazon,
16 and it's becoming more and more popular to do it
17 that way.

18 So if someone sells a mattress into
19 New York State, they ship it in New York State,
20 but not a brick-and-mortar mattress store, will
21 they be required to collect and redeem this fee?

22 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Through you,
23 Madam President, yes. The fee will be collected
24 at the point of sale.

25 So if you're selling a mattress to a

1 New Yorker and not collecting that fee, they will
2 be violating that law. But more importantly,
3 the -- so the DEC or perhaps the Attorney
4 General, others, could go after that participant
5 in the marketplace for violating the law.

6 But the more likely way that that is
7 discovered is the industry itself, recognizing
8 that the industry as a whole has an obligation to
9 meet increasingly ambitious standards for
10 collecting and recycling mattresses, and knowing
11 that that program is going to be funded by fees
12 collected from retail sales, will certainly be --
13 you know, people are usually aware in the market
14 if somebody's competing with them. And if
15 somebody is selling mattresses without collecting
16 a fee, and more specifically without remitting
17 that fee to the PRO, the PRO itself presumably
18 would have a great interest in ensuring that that
19 fee is properly collected.

20 And again, there's nothing -- we've
21 talked about this a little bit on this floor
22 before, but there's nothing in this bill that
23 distinguishes out-of-state or out-of-country
24 producers from in-state.

25 If you are selling mattresses in

1 New York, if you're selling a mattress to New
2 Yorkers to be used in New York, you must
3 participate both in the -- you know, in a PRO and
4 collecting the fee, and also in ensuring that
5 your mattress is properly recycled.

6 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
7 will the sponsor continue to yield?

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
9 continue to yield?

10 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Yes,
11 Madam President.

12 SENATOR BORRELLO: So I know the
13 goal of this is ultimately to have these
14 mattresses recycled. Mattresses are made up of
15 several different materials. You know, you
16 can -- there's a wide variety of ways to now --
17 to make a mattress. And the recycling of it I
18 think is going to be a challenging part.

19 But one promising thing that I've
20 been recently made aware of is something called
21 pyrolysis. I don't know if you're familiar with
22 that. It's essentially a high heat.

23 Is that going to be incorporated
24 into the definition of recycling for the purposes
25 of this bill and this program that we're going to

1 create in New York State?

2 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Through you,
3 Madam President. The pyrolysis and some other
4 chemical processes that are sometimes referred to
5 as advanced recycling by the industry are not
6 included in this bill as a form of recycling.

7 So we are not -- sometimes people
8 say we're banning advanced recycling, we're
9 banning pyrolysis. We are not doing any such
10 thing. To the extent those processes are
11 economically sensible, they will continue.
12 They'll probably become more economically
13 sensible if everybody has to collect mattresses
14 and there are materials in those mattresses that
15 would be useful inputs for that kind of process.

16 But for now, the perception that
17 motivates this bill is that those processes are
18 not advanced enough in terms of their
19 environmental sustainability to warrant allowing
20 mattress producers -- again, who have the
21 obligations here -- to use those processes and
22 count them toward the recycling goal.

23 And there are a lot of recyclable
24 materials in mattresses that are far easier to
25 recycle and, in the view that motivates this

1 bill, more beneficial to recycle in more
2 conventional ways. But again, that technology
3 could evolve over time.

4 And again, if I were in that
5 business and somebody had -- and I thought there
6 was some useful material in mattresses that I
7 could put through that process, it would probably
8 be beneficial for me to have a program like this
9 where all the mattresses are getting collected
10 and I can certainly buy the materials I want to
11 process.

12 But again, the industry itself that
13 would be responsible for recycling has not
14 objected. I know the Chemistry Council, which I
15 think has a larger fight over the role of
16 pyrolysis in the world, has -- you know, is
17 critical of that aspect of this bill.

18 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
19 will the sponsor continue to yield?

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the
21 sponsor yield?

22 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Yes,
23 Madam President.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
25 sponsor yields.

1 SENATOR BORRELLO: So I think we're
2 all trying to head towards advanced recycling
3 technology. It's really going to be the only way
4 we're going to be able to address all the concerns
5 that we hear here about things like single-use
6 plastics and, you know, big-ticket items like
7 this that are made up of a lot of material.

8 So are we restricting the use of
9 pyrolysis as part of this recycling? Or are we
10 simply saying, you know, it could be an option
11 but just not the -- not -- technology is not
12 quite ready yet? I just want to make sure
13 we're -- what the guardrails are.

14 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Through you,
15 Madam President. There's nothing in this bill
16 that would prevent somebody from using pyrolysis
17 or any other chemical treatment of materials that
18 are extracted from used mattresses.

19 But mattresses are made up of, you
20 know, metal, wood, cloth, a whole bunch of
21 materials, most of which would not be subject to
22 pyrolysis one way or the other.

23 The bill mere -- the purpose of
24 having a recycling definition in this is to give
25 specificity to the recycling targets that have to

1 be met. So there's no point, now or in the
2 future, where 100 percent of mattresses would
3 have to be recycled. But there's a target for
4 the number that have to be recycled. And we want
5 to make sure that that target is being met by
6 processes that we are confident are
7 environmentally sustainable and responsible.

8 But again, there's nothing in this
9 bill that suggests people shouldn't try to -- you
10 know, Eastman or other companies that are
11 involved in setting up facilities to reprocess
12 chemicals and other things would still be
13 entirely free to do. There's no restriction on
14 that activity in this bill.

15 SENATOR BORRELLO: Great.

16 Madam President, on the bill.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
18 Borrello on the bill.

19 SENATOR BORRELLO: Again, this may
20 be our last debate, Senator Kavanagh. And this
21 one has been a real doozy -- I think our fifth
22 time now that we've debated this.

23 But thank you again. Once again,
24 you know, you are very knowledgeable on the bills
25 that you support, so -- and I also want to

1 compliment you on listening to the industry and
2 making those adjustments that they have asked
3 for.

4 Nothing is perfect. And I think
5 that the responses, the reactions that I've
6 gotten are that this is better. In the end, it's
7 still a producer responsibility bill which still
8 has some concerns for me. However, it's much
9 better than it was before.

10 And I really think we need to look
11 down the road that if we are going to truly
12 address this issue of the disposable society that
13 we now live in, that we really need to embrace
14 advanced manufacturing technology. And my
15 understanding is pyrolysis has been around for
16 centuries, if not thousands of years, in one form
17 or another.

18 So it certainly should be something
19 that we look toward the future as an option so we
20 can do things like this. And again, you know,
21 taking plastic and making sure that we can
22 actually reuse it as many times as possible.

23 So a lot of consternation originally
24 on this bill, but it seems to be much better,
25 Madam President. So we'll see how that goes.

1 Thanks.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Are
3 there any other Senators wishing to be heard?

4 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
5 closed.

6 The Secretary will ring the bell.

7 Read the last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
14 Walczyk to explain his vote.

15 SENATOR WALCZYK: Thank you,
16 Madam President.

17 And I know that the sponsor of this
18 bill will be moving on to greener pastures. But
19 I will say, about the sponsor, he's been a
20 thoughtful legislator, intelligent and
21 hardworking. We don't always agree on policies,
22 and certainly we've had spirited debates on this
23 bill in particular in the past, some of them
24 memorable.

25 But he's always been open to

1 conversation and listening, whether it be to the
2 industry or the constituency or even legislators
3 on the other side of the aisle with ideas. I
4 think there's a lot of lessons to be learned from
5 your leadership from that perspective.

6 Unfortunately, I vote no,
7 Madam President.

8 (Laughter.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
10 Walczyk to be recorded in the negative.

11 Announce the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
13 Calendar 644, voting in the negative are
14 Senators Bynoe, Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Martinez,
15 Martins, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, Ortt,
16 Rhoads, Ryan, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and
17 Weik. Also Senator Lanza.

18 Ayes, 42. Nays, 18.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1094, Senate Print 6230C, by Senator Webb, an act
23 to amend the Public Health Law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
25 Weik, why do you rise?

1 SENATOR WEIK: Madam President, I'm
2 wondering if the sponsor would yield. I have but
3 one question.

4 SENATOR WEBB: Yes. Through you,
5 Madam President, I will yield.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
7 sponsor yields.

8 SENATOR WEIK: Thank you.

9 This bill authorizes camp operators
10 and employees who are 18 years of age or older to
11 administer medications and treatment to children
12 in certain circumstances. Those medications
13 include pain relief, motion sickness, drugs to
14 treat asthma, epilepsy, anaphylaxis.

15 I'm curious, with employees who are
16 18, 19, 20, they may not be familiar with how to
17 dispense nasal spray, an inhaler, or an EpiPen.
18 Does this bill provide training to administer
19 those medications properly?

20 SENATOR WEBB: Through you,
21 Madam President. They do, and it's under the
22 direction of the nurse and the individual's
23 primary care physician.

24 SENATOR WEIK: Thank you,
25 Madam President. I actually -- if I may, I have

1 one more question.

2 (Laughter.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the
4 sponsor yield?

5 SENATOR WEIK: Could you just tell
6 me where in the bill --

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the
8 sponsor yield?

9 SENATOR WEIK: Do you yield? I'm
10 sorry.

11 SENATOR WEBB: I'm a little 50/50
12 on it, honestly --

13 (Laughter.)

14 SENATOR WEBB: No, I will yield,
15 Madam President.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
17 sponsor yields.

18 SENATOR WEIK: Thank you,
19 Senator Webb.

20 Can you just tell me where in the
21 bill it says that they're going to receive that
22 training?

23 SENATOR WEBB: Through you,
24 Madam President, although training isn't
25 specifically spelled out in the bill, but most

1 certainly the oversight with respect to doctor's
2 orders, also the nurse, is most certainly spelled
3 out.

4 I will also say, Madam President,
5 that for any administering of services that camp
6 counselors provide -- I know some folks in the
7 chamber have maybe served as camp counselors, or
8 most certainly attended camp -- that there's
9 always training, even for things like CPR and
10 other things of that nature.

11 SENATOR WEIK: Thank you,
12 Madam President. Thank you, Senator.

13 SENATOR WEBB: No problem.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Are
15 there any other Senators wishing to be heard?

16 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
17 closed.

18 Senator Gianaris.

19 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,
20 we've agreed to restore this bill to the
21 noncontroversial calendar.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
23 will be restored to the noncontroversial
24 calendar.

25 Read the last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
2 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
3 shall have become a law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Excuse
11 me. Senator Webb to explain her vote.

12 SENATOR WEBB: Thank you,
13 Madam President.

14 And thank you, Senator Weik, for
15 your questions. Always good to clarify things.
16 And I know this is your last session, so thank
17 you for most certainly being our ranker an
18 Women's Issues.

19 But to the bill, Madam President, as
20 I mentioned, we know that going to camp is a
21 great experience for a number of children across
22 our state, especially, you know, when you think
23 about summer break. And for those who actually
24 get the opportunity to go to summer camp, it's an
25 opportunity to connect with new friends, also to

1 step outside of your comfort zone, learn new
2 skills. And your parents aren't with you at that
3 time.

4 But this means that many of our
5 children who are going to camp who may have
6 health issues are often not given the same
7 opportunities. And so what this bill intends to
8 do is that currently our law prohibits camp staff
9 who are not licensed nurses from administering
10 any medication, even simple ones such as Tylenol
11 or Benadryl or even topical creams for poison
12 ivy. This is medication that any parent would
13 provide without a second thought at home.

14 In 2003 we saw this gap when we
15 passed similar legislation that allowed licensed
16 daycare employees to administer medications,
17 emphasis on when it's approved by a parent or a
18 guardian. And camp counselors deserve that same
19 trust, and this bill would most certainly give
20 them that.

21 Camp counselors are trained
22 professionals. They're required to complete
23 first aid training that includes lessons on how
24 to administer epinephrine and CPR. And if we
25 trust them most certainly to respond to

1 life-threatening emergencies, we can most
2 certainly trust them to give a child ointment for
3 poison ivy -- again, given guidance by medical
4 practitioners.

5 So again, this is commonsense
6 legislation. I want to thank the Assembly
7 sponsor on this bill, Assemblymember Paulin, and
8 also the Camp Counselor Association of New York,
9 who also pushed for this bill, along with
10 Epilepsy Coalition of New York State and other
11 advocates.

12 I vote aye, and I encourage my
13 colleagues to do the same.

14 Thank you, Madam President.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
16 Webb to be recorded in the affirmative.

17 Announce the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1353, Assembly Bill Number 6285, by
23 Assemblymember Otis, an act to amend the
24 Public Service Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator

1 Rhoads, why do you rise?

2 SENATOR RHOADS: Hello,
3 Madam President. I was hoping that
4 Senator Comrie might be willing to yield to a few
5 questions.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
7 Comrie, do you yield?

8 SENATOR COMRIE: Yes.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
10 Senator yields.

11 SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you,
12 Senator, I appreciate it.

13 (Off-mic exchange; laughter.)

14 SENATOR RHOADS: Senator, my
15 understanding is that this bill actually amends
16 the Public Service Law to add a requirement that
17 the electric corporations and utilities submit an
18 emergency response plan that includes time-based
19 restoration schedules.

20 Can you explain why this bill is
21 necessary?

22 SENATOR COMRIE: Through you,
23 Madam President. After the last storms, outage
24 periods have grown as utility companies have
25 become more dependent on mutual aid from other

1 parts of the country.

2 This bill would only work to address
3 those issues upfront, try to pre-predict the
4 issues so that they could reduce the cost of
5 reaching out to these emergency services, as
6 opposed to waiting until after a disaster to
7 reach out to other states for help.

8 Unfortunately, storms are getting
9 worse and the possibility for major outages are
10 continuing to get worse year after year. We're
11 entering into a hurricane season this year that
12 expects to be -- fortunately -- I'm told not as
13 bad, but we want to make sure that when a utility
14 company does make a plan, that they incorporate
15 emergency services from other states in their
16 plan, hopefully to save money overall.

17 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor
18 continue to yield?

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
20 continue to yield?

21 SENATOR COMRIE: Yes.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The sponsor
23 yields.

24 SENATOR RHOADS: Through you,
25 Madam President.

1 It's my understanding that based on
2 the law as it exists without this amendment,
3 utilities are already required to submit an
4 emergency response plan. Is that not correct?

5 SENATOR COMRIE: Yes. They're
6 already -- I'm sorry, through you,
7 Madam President, they're already required to
8 submit a plan. This would just require them to
9 include more detail to make sure that if there's
10 a major emergency, that they have a built-in plan
11 to get help from other entities.

12 SENATOR RHOADS: And will the
13 sponsor continue to yield?

14 SENATOR COMRIE: Yes.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
16 sponsor yields.

17 SENATOR RHOADS: Looking at the
18 bill specifically with respect to page 1 of the
19 legislation, line 16, it talks about emergency
20 response plans should include details of
21 staffing, equipment, and a performance schedule
22 with the goal of achieving restoration of service
23 based on a time-based restoration schedule.

24 What do you mean by a time-based
25 restoration schedule?

1 SENATOR COMRIE: Through you,
2 Madam President -- one moment.

3 (Pause.)

4 SENATOR COMRIE: Right now the
5 Public Service Commission has been working to try
6 to create a timeline for outages to make sure
7 that service is restored as soon as possible to
8 customers, that customers are not going 72 hours
9 or more without service.

10 And this is an attempt to try to
11 pre-predict these things according to a schedule
12 or algorithm that they're coming up with.

13 SENATOR RHOADS: And will the
14 sponsor continue to yield?

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
16 continue to yield?

17 SENATOR COMRIE: Yes.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
19 sponsor yields.

20 SENATOR RHOADS: And so is the
21 time-based restoration goal or schedule, am I
22 correct in my understanding that it would sort of
23 be a concept of first person out of power is the
24 first person restored? Is that essentially what
25 that means?

1 SENATOR COMRIE: Essentially, yes.
2 Through you, Madam President.

3 SENATOR RHOADS: And will the
4 sponsor continue to yield?

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
6 continue to yield?

7 SENATOR COMRIE: Yes.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
9 sponsor yields.

10 SENATOR RHOADS: There are other
11 factors, though, that are considered in the
12 existing law that utilities are supposed to
13 include when submitting to the commission their
14 emergency response plan, such as individuals with
15 critical medical equipment, hospitals, facilities
16 that have essential electricity needs like
17 telecommunication companies, critical
18 transportation needs, distribution companies.

19 They're supposed to also consider
20 employee safety. They're supposed to prioritize,
21 for example, when there are areas with downed
22 wires, because that obviously is a safety
23 concern.

24 How do -- how do those -- what if
25 those instances, if they're supposed to consider

1 that in their response plan as well, don't
2 necessarily mesh with the time-based restoration
3 plan?

4 SENATOR COMRIE: Through you,
5 Madam President, I would defer to actually -- I
6 would take -- I don't agree, Senator.

7 I think that as they are putting
8 together their plan they have to put those items
9 in place and have to make an assessment of those
10 items. They have to continually check with the
11 hospitals and with folks with specialized medical
12 equipment at their home every year.

13 This is trying to just put --
14 categorize all of that and document all of that
15 so that they can be better prepared ahead of time
16 when there's an emergency.

17 This does not negate any of those
18 issues, it only enhances the ability, which is
19 what they're trying to do, for the Public Service
20 Commission to understand how effective the
21 utility could be at making total repairs,
22 understanding that every storm has different
23 variables, as you said, but to do their best to
24 make a complete restoration as soon as possible.

25 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor

1 continue to yield?

2 SENATOR COMRIE: Yes.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
4 sponsor yields.

5 SENATOR RHOADS: Based upon those
6 variables, though -- for example, if roads are
7 blocked by downed trees, if it does become a
8 safety hazard for workers because of flooding,
9 for example, do you think it's feasible to create
10 a time-based restoration schedule for utilities
11 to follow when there are so many variables that
12 they would have to consider?

13 (Pause.)

14 SENATOR COMRIE: Sorry, I was just
15 checking on a reference. Can you say the last
16 part of that question again?

17 SENATOR RHOADS: Sure. Sure.

18 Obviously we're in agreement that
19 there are -- every storm is different, there are
20 different variables, there are different
21 circumstances that are beyond the control of a
22 utility. For example, if there is flooding in a
23 particular area, or if there are downed trees, if
24 there's a public safety reason why it's unsafe
25 for utility workers to be able to go into an

1 area, those factors would be inconsistent with a
2 time-based restoration system.

3 Is it really feasible to create a
4 time-based restoration system when you have a
5 wide variety of factors that may come into play
6 that have to account in any emergency response
7 plan?

8 SENATOR COMRIE: Through you,
9 Madam President. This is aspirational. This is
10 an opportunity for the utilities to do a detailed
11 study, and also to inform the Public Service
12 Commission of worst-case scenarios so that they
13 can pre-plan to go to other states to be able to
14 get the supplemental help, so that the
15 supplemental help can be built into the plan.

16 But as you -- storms are
17 unpredictable. Utilities and light poles are
18 unpredictable. So you can never have a
19 100 percent plan. This is aspirational and is
20 asking the utilities to do more in their
21 assessment while they're planning for a disaster
22 from a breakdown of services.

23 SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you,
24 Senator Comrie.

25 On the bill, Madam President.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
2 Rhoads on the bill.

3 SENATOR RHOADS: Yeah, I certainly
4 understand the motivation behind the bill. We've
5 all had the experience where the power has gone
6 out at our homes. If you don't have a backup
7 generator, it's always frustrating when your
8 lights go out at 9 o'clock at night and you wake
9 up the following morning and see that your lights
10 are still out. We all want to get our service
11 restored as quickly as possible. We all feel the
12 same way.

13 From the perspective of a utility
14 company, however, the way they generally operate
15 is not based on first person out, first person
16 restored. It's about trying to do the most good
17 for the largest number of people that you can.

18 Which is why the law as it exists
19 today calls on them to consider individuals that
20 have -- and individual homes that have
21 life-threatening conditions that need restoration
22 of power in an expedient fashion.

23 It's why they have to consider major
24 hospitals. It's why they have to consider
25 telecommunications. It's why they have to

1 consider things that provide vital services in an
2 emergency and address those situations first
3 before they can move on.

4 It's also why, if they have the
5 ability to -- if you have 50,000 customers that
6 are out and 40,000 of those customers are out
7 because of a large-scale situation that they're
8 dealing with in a particular part of their
9 district, they want to focus their resources
10 first not necessarily on the first person that
11 lost power, they want to focus their resources on
12 how quickly can they restore power to the 40,000
13 and then worry about the 10,000 individual cases
14 where it may be one pole down or a wire down on
15 someone's house.

16 They try and account for the scale
17 and how quickly they can restore power by
18 addressing the most critical needs first that
19 will restore power to the largest number of
20 people.

21 By requiring these emergency plans
22 to actually focus on a first-in, first-fixed
23 basis, a time -- a time basis, we're kind of
24 doing the exact opposite and asking them to do
25 two completely contrary things.

1 In a perfect world, yes, it would be
2 wonderful if your power goes out first, you're
3 the first one that gets restored. But that's
4 just not the way the system was designed to work
5 and really is counter to the way the system is
6 designed to work. Because, again, you want to
7 maintain critical services, you want to provide
8 to the people that are in the greatest needs.
9 That's where the attention should be focused
10 first.

11 It also doesn't account for the fact
12 that you are putting the worker's safety, in
13 certain circumstances, in jeopardy.

14 I think by switching to -- by
15 switching to and requiring utilities to switch to
16 a time-based accounting, service-time-based
17 accounting in their emergency plan, you're doing
18 a -- you're in many instances doing a disservice
19 to not only the utilities, but to worker safety
20 and to the consumer who ultimately wants to have
21 their power restored as quickly as possible.

22 So thank you, Madam President. I'll
23 be voting no. I would encourage my colleagues to
24 do the same.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,

1 Senator Rhoads.

2 Are there any other Senators wishing
3 to be heard?

4 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
5 closed.

6 Senator Gianaris.

7 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,
8 we've agreed to restore this bill to the
9 noncontroversial calendar.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
11 has been restored to the noncontroversial
12 calendar.

13 Read the last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
15 act shall take effect immediately.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
20 Comrie to explain his vote.

21 SENATOR COMRIE: Yes, thank you,
22 Madam President.

23 I do believe that as technology has
24 become more sophisticated in the ability to do
25 prediction services, it's more sophisticated,

1 it's important that the utilities try to use
2 every means necessary to preplan.

3 I don't disagree with Senator Rhoads
4 that we need to make sure that the utilities have
5 the latitude. I just want to remind folks that
6 this is not -- there's no penalties associated
7 with this. This is aspirational. We're asking
8 the utilities to be predictive so that when they
9 do need to reach out to other entities, that they
10 can preplan that during that the year, as opposed
11 to doing it on an emergency basis, which would
12 cost more money.

13 I do agree with Senator Rhoads that
14 we need to make sure that these utilities are
15 taking care of the most egregious areas first,
16 and hopefully the Public Service Commission and
17 the utilities can make sure that those plans are
18 in the works.

19 But I just want to assure folks that
20 we're not asking for penalties for this. We're
21 not looking to put any undue burden on the
22 utilities. We would just ask them to come up
23 with better predictive models.

24 Thank you, Madam President.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator

1 Comrie to be recorded in the affirmative.

2 Announce the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
4 Calendar 1353, voting in the negative are
5 Senators Borrello, Helming, Murray, O'Mara, Ortt,
6 Rhoads and Walczyk.

7 Ayes, 53. Nays, 7.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
9 is passed.

10 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
12 Gianaris.

13 SENATOR GIANARIS: The Minority has
14 agreed to remove the lay-aside on Calendar 1410.
15 Let's restore that to the noncontroversial
16 calendar and take that up, please.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
18 is restored to the noncontroversial calendar.

19 The Secretary will read.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 1410, Assembly Bill Number 9140, by
22 Assemblymember Rosenthal, an act to amend the
23 Public Health Law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
25 last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
2 act shall take effect immediately.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
9 Calendar Number 1410, voting in the negative are
10 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
11 Helming, Lanza, Martins, Oberacker, Ortt, Rhoads,
12 Rolison and Weber.

13 Ayes, 50. Nays, 10.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
15 is passed.

16 Senator Gianaris.

17 THE SECRETARY: Oh, sorry. Also
18 Senator Mattera.

19 Ayes, 49. Nays, 11.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
21 remains passed.

22 Senator Gianaris.

23 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
24 let's move on to Calendar 1613, please.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Calendar

1 Number 1613.

2 The Secretary will read.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 1613, Senate Print 4602B, by Senator Gounardes,
5 an act to amend the Election Law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
7 Stec, why do you rise?

8 SENATOR STEC: I just walked in the
9 chamber, Mr. President. I don't have anything
10 for you. Have a good evening.

11 (Laughter.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
13 you, sir.

14 (Pause; laughter.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: I knew
16 somebody had it. I'm not doing this for my
17 health either.

18 (Laughter.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:
20 Senator Walczyk, why do you rise?

21 SENATOR WALCZYK: Mr. President,
22 would the sponsor yield.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
24 sponsor yield?

25 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Certainly.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
2 sponsor yields.

3 SENATOR WALCZYK: I appreciate my
4 neighbor being a stand-in for a moment.

5 Through you, Mr. President. This
6 bill is pretty technical in its nature. We've
7 dealt with a lot of different elections bills
8 here. But this would change Election Law to
9 address some rare scenarios. And thank goodness
10 that they're rare.

11 Currently if there's a delay or a
12 disruption at the polling site for voting,
13 bipartisan elections commissioners can appeal to
14 a local judge who is on call on Election Day, get
15 an extension or a remedy for whatever disruption
16 there was. It could be additional voting time
17 that day or, in the case of early voting, on
18 another day.

19 Or if this is a massive thing -- and
20 New York State has experienced some of these on
21 the primary in 2001 -- a massive thing, the
22 Governor could declare a state of emergency and
23 then that would allow us to have a different
24 scenario for voting.

25 What will this bill change when it

1 comes to handling disruptions to our elections?

2 (Pause.)

3 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Through you,
4 Mr. President, I appreciate my colleague's
5 indulgence.

6 What this bill does is it errs on
7 the side of presumption, allowing for -- in the
8 case that any voter is not able, because of a
9 disruption at a poll site that is greater than
10 one hour, the presumption would automatically be
11 that the time for voting on that day or if -- to
12 the extent practicable, would be extended by that
13 same period of time that the disruption prevented
14 someone from voting.

15 And that would be an automatic
16 presumption that would then not require anyone to
17 have to document the disruption, go get a lawyer,
18 go to court, try to get before a judge to get an
19 emergency order.

20 And it would provide a uniform
21 standard across the state erring on the
22 presumption that if there is a disruption that's
23 greater than one hour, the presumption would be
24 that that time would automatically be extended.

25 SENATOR WALCZYK: And through you,

1 Mr. President, will the sponsor continue to
2 yield?

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
4 sponsor yield?

5 SENATOR GOUNARDES: I do.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
7 sponsor yields.

8 SENATOR WALCZYK: Was this at the
9 request of the elections commissioners? I know
10 they put out a policy agenda -- the Democrat
11 commissioners and Republican commissioners get
12 together and they put together a priority list of
13 things that they agree on. Was this a part of
14 that list?

15 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Through you,
16 Mr. President. Not to my knowledge.

17 Though I will say we have the public
18 support of a number of election commissioners
19 throughout the state, as well as a number of good
20 government and election reform organizations as
21 well.

22 SENATOR WALCZYK: And through you,
23 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
24 yield?

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the

1 sponsor yield?

2 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Gladly.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
4 sponsor yields.

5 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,
6 Mr. President.

7 In your sponsor's memo you
8 enumerated a handful of times where elections
9 have been disrupted in New York. One of them you
10 named -- in my district, actually, in 2022, there
11 was a fire at a fire hall -- don't worry,
12 everybody is okay -- an electrical fire that
13 forced the Board of Elections to move that
14 polling site temporarily. They said there was
15 one voter at the fire hall at the time.

16 Would this have triggered that?
17 Because what they had to do is they let that
18 voter actually -- they moved the machines
19 outside, let that voter vote, and then announced
20 that they would be moving to the DPW, to the
21 highway department's location not far away.
22 Alerted the public, put up good signage.

23 Both the Republican and Democrat
24 elections commissioners came up with this
25 secondary plan. Voting wasn't really disturbed.

1 Nobody was inconvenienced. They saw it as a way
2 to handle it flexibly on Election Day without
3 having a provision like this.

4 Would this force them to have an
5 hour of additional voting that day?

6 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Through you,
7 Mr. President.

8 While I'm glad to hear that there
9 was a minimal disruption in the circumstance, the
10 election disruption that occurred in the
11 Senator's district, if the fire caused a
12 disruption where a vote could not be cast for a
13 period of greater than one hour, it would
14 automatically extend the time by one additional
15 hour or whatever time the delay caused by the
16 disruption was.

17 SENATOR WALCZYK: And through you,
18 Mr. President, would the sponsor yield?

19 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Sure.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
21 sponsor yield?

22 SENATOR GOUNARDES: I do.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
24 sponsor yields.

25 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,

1 Mr. President.

2 So it's just the -- because
3 currently two commissioners, the Republican and
4 Democrat commissioner, can go to a judge, and
5 there are judges on standby. It's really that
6 friction that you're looking to alleviate.

7 Is that the goal of this bill?

8 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Through you,
9 Mr. President, just to clarify, the friction my
10 colleague is talking about between the
11 commissioners and the judge or the -- I just want
12 to clarify what point in the process you're
13 alluding to.

14 SENATOR WALCZYK: Yeah, just
15 that -- through you, Mr. President, I'll clarify.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: By all
17 means.

18 SENATOR WALCZYK: Just the current
19 situation where there has to be a bipartisan
20 agreement, they go to a judge and they say, Okay,
21 this is our plan to ensure that there's no
22 disruption, or here's how we would like to remedy
23 any disruption.

24 Is it the fact that they have to
25 agree or the fact that they have to go to a

1 judge? Why are we making it automatic in --
2 yeah, I guess that's the question. Why are we
3 making this automatic and eliminating that?

4 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Through you,
5 Mr. President.

6 We believe that people should be
7 able to vote and that there should be no
8 circumstances that prevent them or limit their
9 ability to vote. And that when there are
10 circumstances, whether it be a fire, whether it
11 be a -- there's an example of a car crashing
12 through a polling location, whether it be
13 machines that are not working for several hours,
14 as occurred in Senator Skoufis's district, or a
15 bomb threat that happened in East Harlem during
16 the gubernatorial race several years ago. Last
17 year in New Jersey several poll sites were
18 swatted, fake bomb threats called in.

19 That impacts the ability of people
20 to cast a meaningful vote in that given election.
21 And so what we are trying to do here -- and I'm
22 glad that the circumstance worked out in the
23 example that you cited. It seemed to be, by your
24 telling, relatively frictionless.

25 There are other examples where the

1 disruption caused or prevented anyone from
2 casting a vote for several hours, there was no
3 extension of time in that circumstance. And, you
4 know, in that case if a voter had wanted to cast
5 a vote or if an aggrieved party had wanted to
6 cast a vote but was unable to, they would then be
7 forced to have to go to court themselves to say
8 that they were prevented from the ability of
9 voting.

10 And so we're trying to remove all of
11 that process by creating the presumption of an
12 extension, as long as it's greater than one hour.
13 And that's really what we're trying to do here.

14 You know, like I said, because there
15 have been a number of cases where voting time was
16 not extended, we think that and we believe that
17 the voting times that we have set out in statute
18 between the early voting that we've created,
19 Election Day voting, that that time is really
20 important. And so we want to make sure that no
21 one is denied the opportunity to be able to cast
22 their vote within the prescribed time periods.

23 SENATOR WALCZYK: Thank you,
24 Mr. President. On the bill.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator

1 Walczyk on the bill.

2 SENATOR WALCZYK: And appreciate my
3 colleague looking to attempt {sic} a problem on
4 our elections. I don't really see it the same
5 way. In talking to elections commissioners, I
6 haven't really -- this hasn't come up as an issue
7 that they've seen.

8 We currently have a system where
9 there needs to be bipartisan agreement rather
10 than automatic changes in these very rare
11 scenarios. It doesn't really make sense to me to
12 impose this automatically.

13 And it also doesn't make sense to
14 involve the Attorney General in the process. It
15 doesn't make sense to impose a number of new
16 requirements on Board of Elections to meet when
17 we already have a system where Republican and
18 Democrat commissioners have to agree in such rare
19 scenarios.

20 And I think if I'm going to voice a
21 chief concern before you cast your votes, it's
22 that the impact here, as well as these scenarios,
23 are very rare. If you make this automatic, you
24 could run into more incidents where nefarious
25 characters try to game the system for some kind

1 of political advantage, actually creating some
2 kind of disruption at a polling site in order to
3 change the time lines.

4 And without having the Republican
5 and Democrat commissioners have any control over
6 that scenario to make the decision for that
7 voting district and continue voting the way that
8 they agree to see fit, the way that it currently
9 sits in our law, I have those concerns.

10 So I'll be a no today and encourage
11 my colleagues to consider that.

12 Thank you, Mr. President.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
14 you, Senator Walczyk.

15 Any other Senators wishing to be
16 heard?

17 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
18 closed.

19 Senator Liu.

20 SENATOR LIU: Mr. President, upon
21 consent, we have agreed to restore this bill to
22 the noncontroversial calendar.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Upon
24 consent, the bill is restored to the
25 noncontroversial calendar.

1 Read the last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
8 Gounardes to explain his vote.

9 SENATOR GOUNARDES: Thank you,
10 Mr. President.

11 I appreciate my colleague's
12 questions and his viewpoint. And I just want to
13 respond to the concern that he laid out.

14 I would argue that the current
15 system right now in fact incentivizes the kind of
16 behavior he's concerned that our change will
17 bring about. Because right now someone could,
18 with nefarious intent, try to cause a disruption
19 at a polling location, relying on the necessity
20 of having a majority of the bipartisan board then
21 proactively take the position that says, yes this
22 delay needs to now go to a court in order to
23 extend the time period, thereby creating more of
24 an opportunity to cause mischief and mayhem in a
25 polling location that might favor a candidate's

1 opponent, with the hope of creating delay.

2 What we are trying to do here is by
3 standardizing it and by creating the presumption
4 of an automatic extension, you eliminate the
5 incentive to have to rely on the Board of
6 Elections, then go into the court process that is
7 currently baked in law.

8 I hope to God that we never have to
9 use this procedure and that this never comes to
10 be, but we're trying to take a proactive stance
11 here in the interest of making sure that no one,
12 whether it's a thousand people or just one
13 individual, loses their opportunity to cast a
14 vote should a disruption like that we are
15 contemplating occur.

16 And it's for those reasons,
17 Mr. President, that I'm voting aye and that I
18 would hope my colleagues would do the same.

19 Thank you.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
21 Gounardes to be recorded in the affirmative.

22 Announce the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
24 Calendar Number 1613, voting in the negative are
25 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,

1 Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins,
2 Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt,
3 Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk,
4 Weber and Weik.

5 Ayes, 38. Nays, 22.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 1635, Senate Print 8451B, by Senator Fahy, an act
10 to amend the General Business Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
12 Borrello, why do you rise?

13 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
14 would the sponsor yield for some questions.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
16 sponsor yield?

17 SENATOR FAHY: Certainly.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
19 sponsor yields.

20 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you.
21 Through you, Mr. President.

22 So obviously trying to ensure people
23 understand that something is generated through AI
24 when they see it. But my first question is, this
25 is -- it is related strictly to news content,

1 even sports and entertainment news would be
2 subject to this?

3 SENATOR FAHY: Where it's news and
4 media content, yes.

5 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
6 will the sponsor continue to yield?

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
8 sponsor yield?

9 SENATOR FAHY: Sure.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
11 sponsor yields.

12 SENATOR BORRELLO: So, you know,
13 look, news isn't what it was, you know, 30 years
14 ago. News comes, you know, from TikTok and other
15 social media outlets. It comes, you know, from a
16 variety of sources from an old-fashioned printed
17 newspaper to, you know, a short video on YouTube.

18 Would all of that be subject to
19 this?

20 SENATOR FAHY: It's quite narrow,
21 actually. And this is just about disclosure.
22 But where the content is generated or generative
23 AI use, then it would be applicable. Unless of
24 course the content was eligible for copyright
25 registration, and then the disclosure is not

1 needed.

2 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
3 will the sponsor continue to yield?

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
5 sponsor yield?

6 SENATOR FAHY: Certainly.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
8 sponsor yields.

9 SENATOR BORRELLO: So, you know, as
10 someone who has in my lifetime had patents,
11 copyrights, something can be considered
12 copyright-eligible, copyright pending, rights
13 reserved -- there's different legal terms.

14 So what legal standard are you using
15 to determine that is actually copyright-eligible?

16 SENATOR FAHY: It's -- there's
17 substantial case law on this where, if the
18 content is eligible, such as news articles that
19 are not AI-generated, other -- they're -- it's
20 not applicable. I'm not -- I'm not sure if
21 you're -- I'm following your question.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
23 Borrello, if you don't mind clarifying, yes.

24 SENATOR BORRELLO: Yeah, let me
25 clarify that.

1 So you've said if it's eligible for
2 copyright, it will be exempt. That doesn't mean
3 it's actually copyrighted, right? You're saying
4 that it could be eligible for copyrighting, and
5 therefore it would be exempt. I mean --
6 honestly, I mean, people could claim that what
7 they're doing is copyright-eligible.

8 You know, things have, you know,
9 typical rights reserved, which is kind of like
10 pre-copyright. You've got things that are called
11 patent pending, which actually means that there's
12 a patent application applied for. It doesn't
13 mean they're actually going to get a patent.

14 So that's a rather broad description
15 for an exemption, don't you think?

16 SENATOR FAHY: Through you,
17 Mr. President. The standard is set by the
18 U.S. Copyright Office.

19 But just to be clear, again, this is
20 about generative AI. And the bill is targeting
21 content that is substantially composed or
22 authored by generative AI, not ordinary
23 technology assistance such as when we're using
24 our phones and it automatically spell-checks and
25 corrects -- you know, does the autocorrects.

1 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President
2 {sic}, does the sponsor continue to yield?

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
4 sponsor yield?

5 SENATOR FAHY: Certainly.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
7 sponsor yields.

8 SENATOR BORRELLO: So you're saying
9 that the terms in the bill are "substantially
10 composed, authored, or otherwise created." But
11 that is not defined in the legislation.

12 Who's going to determine what
13 "substantially" means?

14 SENATOR FAHY: "Substantially"
15 is -- there's lots of case law on
16 "substantially," including in the copyright law.
17 And it's generally, again, where -- usually where
18 it's most. There's lots of case law on this, but
19 again, substantially composed, authored,
20 otherwise created. This has -- you know, the
21 legislation here is narrowly tailored to just
22 require disclosure that it is.

23 So again, it's going -- the idea is
24 the goal is to disclose this and make sure we
25 have accountability.

1 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
2 will the sponsor continue to yield?

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
4 sponsor yield?

5 SENATOR FAHY: Certainly.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
7 sponsor yields.

8 SENATOR BORRELLO: Okay. So this
9 is obviously going to have to be something that's
10 going to have to be enforced. And I'm assuming
11 it's the Attorney General's office, I think
12 that's what the bill calls for.

13 So is the Attorney General going to
14 have the authority to essentially examine all
15 news content on any news media entity in New York
16 State to see if the news was substantially made
17 with AI?

18 SENATOR FAHY: No, I'm sure it's --
19 through you, Mr. President, it's only where it
20 would be challenged.

21 And let me just quickly add we are
22 seeing daily examples of AI-generated
23 misinformation, fabricated reporting, we're
24 seeing many accusations of plagiarism. I mean,
25 we are rather inundated in the -- AI just in the

1 last few years has really shaken up our economy,
2 let alone our workforce, probably the biggest
3 shakeup since -- in many ways, since the
4 Industrial Revolution.

5 But we have also seen that
6 AI-generated content is now estimated to be about
7 a 50-50 split between that that is generated by
8 humans -- in other words, human reporters --
9 versus AI. It's grown that exponentially. And
10 we have hundreds if not over a thousand sites
11 that have already been cited as unreliable --
12 news sites, I should say.

13 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President
14 {sic}, will the sponsor continue to yield?

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
16 sponsor yield?

17 SENATOR FAHY: Sure.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
19 sponsor yields.

20 SENATOR BORRELLO: So you used the
21 term "unreliable news sites." I mean, obviously
22 anybody can say that they're a news organization,
23 I get that.

24 But is this about informing people,
25 or is this about, you know, maybe, in my opinion,

1 going after free speech because you don't like a
2 particular news outlet?

3 SENATOR FAHY: Through you,
4 Mr. President, this is absolutely not about going
5 after free speech.

6 This is definitely about trying to
7 protect it as well as try to restore or maintain
8 some type of public confidence in what they are
9 reading.

10 And as I mentioned, we have had a
11 complete upheaval just in the last few years,
12 given the shakeup in the economy over the
13 explosive growth of the use of AI and
14 AI-generated material. For example, when I
15 introduced this bill much earlier this year, or
16 maybe last year -- when I introduced this bill I
17 was immediately sent an alert that night saying
18 the bill had passed and it was on a website --
19 instead of USA Today, it was National USA, a
20 website coming across as a news site with no
21 board of directors, no source, very clearly
22 AI-generated and very clearly misrepresenting the
23 fact that -- misrepresenting the matter by saying
24 the bill had passed as opposed to just being
25 introduced.

1 So every day I think we are
2 inundated with content that does not have a human
3 element or human oversight or is not
4 human-generated. And it's rather disturbing and
5 undermining trust in our media, which undermines
6 trust in our governing institutions as well.

7 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
8 will the sponsor continue to yield.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
10 sponsor yield?

11 SENATOR FAHY: Certainly, yes.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
13 sponsor yields.

14 SENATOR BORRELLO: I mean, if
15 someone wanted to print or put out a news story
16 that you consider to be fake news, why would they
17 need AI? I mean, I don't understand how this is
18 AI-related.

19 If someone's going to say something
20 libelous, if they're going to plagiarize someone
21 else, they don't need to use AI. In fact, you
22 know, that seems irrelevant to it.

23 What you're saying is is that there
24 are news organizations or people that you don't
25 feel are legitimate news organizations that are

1 somehow going to be targeted, and the excuse will
2 be they used AI. Isn't that kind of what you're
3 saying?

4 SENATOR FAHY: Through you,
5 Mr. President. Yes, there is fake news. We hear
6 a lot about that in the media these last couple
7 of years. And it's anybody's -- you know,
8 there's many definitions of what that means.

9 What this bill is trying to get at
10 is the explosive growth of AI-generated news that
11 has -- does not have human oversight, human
12 input, human creativity generating that. And it
13 is undermining a trust because so much of that is
14 misinformation or often has lacked credibility
15 with sources.

16 And Casey Seiler, the editor of the
17 Times Union, has repeatedly written about how the
18 Albany Times Union has paid reporters writing
19 stories that end up being picked up in local
20 outlets through AI generation that they are not
21 credited for, nor are they compensated for.

22 So that is what we are trying to get
23 at here, is this need for disclosure. This is
24 really about disclosure and transparency. It's
25 pretty fundamental. And that's the first step to

1 really trying to get at what has been an
2 explosive growth. And the responsibilities of
3 journalism cannot be replaced by algorithms that
4 cannot be fully trusted, and it's undermining
5 journalism.

6 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
7 will the sponsor continue to yield?

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
9 sponsor yield?

10 SENATOR FAHY: Certainly.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
12 sponsor yields.

13 SENATOR BORRELLO: So I guess I'm
14 trying to understand here. You're saying that --
15 there's already laws in place to cover if someone
16 violates a copyright. I mean, every time you
17 read a news article, you know, it says right at
18 the bottom, "This cannot be used without
19 permission."

20 So you're going to -- it's got
21 nothing to do with AI, by the way. Plagiarism
22 has occurred for thousands of years, long before
23 AI existed. So I'm not sure how AI plays into
24 this. I understand it makes it easier, perhaps,
25 to assist.

1 But what you're saying is that you
2 don't believe that a news organization that might
3 just be a single-person shop or a small group of
4 people should have the ability put out a news
5 story using AI, but you want to kind of go after
6 them by saying you've got to tell people it's AI.

7 To me, I think we're just setting up
8 the possibility for the Attorney General to
9 target certain news sources that she doesn't
10 like, and we're giving her the power to do that,
11 really with kind of a technicality, wouldn't you
12 say?

13 SENATOR FAHY: Through you,
14 Mr. President. Yes, there's lots of case law
15 with regard to copyright, and often what we have
16 seen, for instance, is decades of litigation on
17 who is the song author, whether it was Writer B
18 or Writer A.

19 This is not about Writer B or
20 Writer A. This is about whether it was an
21 individual or not and whether the individual who
22 wrote the original content, the author, is
23 machine-generated through AI or whether it is the
24 journalists themselves and where that original
25 author, whether their material is being

1 manipulated or used without their -- without
2 their approval or without -- used and abused, I
3 guess is where it becomes misinformation and
4 lacks credibility.

5 And again, undermining journalism.

6 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
7 will the sponsor continue to yield?

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
9 sponsor yield?

10 SENATOR FAHY: Yes.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
12 sponsor yields.

13 SENATOR BORRELLO: Okay, so with
14 that being said -- thank you, Mr. President.

15 With that being said, how much human
16 involvement is needed to avoid, you know, placing
17 a label on the news content and qualify for the
18 exemption?

19 So you're saying that -- you're
20 basically saying plagiarism, which is a problem,
21 which is certainly, you know, illegal if you're
22 violating someone's copyright. That's already a
23 law. So at what point does this become an
24 exemption because it was a human that
25 plagiarized, versus a, you know, chatbot or

1 ChatGPT?

2 SENATOR FAHY: Through you,
3 Mr. President. This is, again, fundamentally
4 about disclosure. This is -- it doesn't say who
5 can author or what can author. It's just saying
6 if you choose to manipulate or use AI in your
7 newsroom or on your broadcasts, and it is
8 substantially generated via AI, you simply need
9 to disclose that.

10 Because of all the problems we are
11 seeing in the last few years and this lack of --
12 or this eroding trust in news sources, we are
13 seeking disclosure here so that the public
14 knows -- we are not saying you can't use AI. No
15 one is saying that here, or that you can't use
16 generative AI. We are saying you simply must
17 inform the public.

18 And we are trying to bring
19 transparency to this process and therefore giving
20 some -- trying to restore or provide some trust
21 in the media sources we use each day.

22 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
23 one last question, if the sponsor will yield.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
25 Borrello, don't lock yourself in.

1 (Laughter.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
3 sponsor yield?

4 SENATOR FAHY: Certainly.

5 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
7 sponsor yields.

8 SENATOR BORRELLO: What happens if
9 it's a news source -- and this is probably going
10 to be the case in a lot of cases -- that's not in
11 New York? How are we going to enforce this?

12 Are we -- I mean, there are news
13 sources all over the world, and quite frankly the
14 ones that you would consider to be maybe a little
15 bit shady probably aren't even, let alone based
16 in New York, based in the United States to begin
17 with.

18 How are we going to manage that?

19 SENATOR FAHY: Through you,
20 Mr. President. There is copyright law, actually,
21 which has some international implications.

22 And again, I would -- in terms of
23 enforcement, we have left that to the
24 Attorney General. And certainly the
25 Attorney General we have seen -- the Attorney

1 General time after time, especially in the last
2 couple of years, has certainly gone beyond
3 New York State's borders to enforce New York
4 State law. And -- or to enforce the law whether
5 she's working with counterparts in other states
6 or what have you.

7 But the idea is, again, this is
8 about disclosure and this is about bringing
9 transparency to journalism such that we can
10 restore at least some level of public confidence
11 in our news sources.

12 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
13 I'm going to keep my word. On the bill.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
15 Borrello, a man of his word, on the bill.

16 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you,
17 Mr. President.

18 Thank you, Senator Fahy.

19 You know, I think everybody has
20 concerns about AI content. And right now I would
21 say it's hard to tell the difference but you can
22 tell the difference. That's not going to be the
23 case fairly soon. Fairly soon it's going to be
24 impossible to tell what is AI and what is not.

25 When we start talking about news

1 organizations and entertainment news and sports
2 news and you start talking about, as Senator Fahy
3 said, you know, essentially fake news, you know,
4 things that people don't like, then we're really
5 starting to creep into the First Amendment.

6 That we're going to use this as an
7 excuse, essentially. We're going to open the
8 door to go after someone and have to defend
9 themselves against the Attorney General of New
10 York State, which has all our money to work
11 with -- we see how devastating that can be --
12 because they don't like that particular news
13 source.

14 There's also the issue of content
15 that wasn't originated by the person that's
16 broadcasting it. So you might have something
17 that was produced using AI, from another state,
18 another country, wherever it might be, that was
19 rebroadcast. We see this all the time on news
20 programs. They pick up content from around the
21 world, there's news services that may have been
22 from a -- what they would call another source, a
23 stringer source.

24 And ultimately who's going to end up
25 being liable here in New York State? You know,

1 the local news source, potentially. I get that
2 there are people out there that say things that
3 aren't true and that plagiarize and all that.
4 And nobody likes that. I don't like that. We
5 see it all the time on social media.

6 But to empower the Attorney General
7 of New York State to go after someone for
8 something that, in the end, could just be like
9 the content she doesn't particularly like or
10 someone else -- a rival, a competitor, a
11 political rival -- she doesn't like, and to
12 empower the government to go after someone is
13 really I think a free speech and a
14 First Amendment right.

15 So I think this is well-intentioned
16 in some ways but has the ability to quickly go
17 off the rails and be in violation of the
18 First Amendment. So I'll be voting no.

19 Thank you.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
21 you, Senator Borrello.

22 Are there any other Senators wishing
23 to be heard?

24 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
25 closed.

1 The Secretary will ring the bell.

2 Senator Gianaris.

3 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
4 we've agreed to restore this bill to the
5 noncontroversial calendar.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: On
7 consent, the bill is restored to the
8 noncontroversial calendar.

9 Read the last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
11 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it
12 shall have become a law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
17 Fahy to explain her vote.

18 SENATOR FAHY: Thank you,
19 Mr. President. I rise to explain my yes vote
20 here.

21 Between local news, radio and more,
22 journalists do play a critical role and hold all
23 of our institutions accountable. They strengthen
24 our democracy. We are facing what may be the
25 largest shakeup to our economy and our workforce

1 since the Industrial Revolution.

2 We are witnessing a rapid and
3 exponential growth in the use of artificial
4 intelligence types of technologies. While they
5 provide -- AI provides tremendous opportunities
6 and we want to lead on much of that innovation
7 and technological advancement, but that
8 innovation must be accompanied by transparency
9 and accountability.

10 This legislation, the Fair News Act,
11 which is the fundamental AI requirements,
12 fundamental artificial intelligence requirements,
13 is all common sense. When news content is
14 substantially generated by AI, the public
15 deserves to know. There is nothing partisan
16 about that.

17 This is about a consumer's right to
18 know. We need to be able to distinguish between
19 news produced by journalists or news produced by
20 machines -- or, in other words, generative AI.
21 This does not prohibit the use of AI. It does
22 not prohibit innovation. It is simply a
23 requirement of disclosure so that readers,
24 viewers, listeners can make informed decisions
25 about what they are consuming in the media.

1 The line between human-created
2 content and generated content is getting harder
3 to identify. We have seen example after example
4 of misinformation, fabricated reporting,
5 credibility questions, plagiarism accusations and
6 more. And at a time when trust in media is
7 already under strain, this form of transparency
8 in this bill is more important than ever.

9 We recognize the value and needed
10 trust in professional journalism and in a skilled
11 workforce. These responsibilities cannot be
12 replaced by algorithms.

13 In the interest of transparency and
14 protecting the future of quality journalism,
15 which is on the line here, I vote in the
16 affirmative.

17 And thank you, Mr. President.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
19 you, Senator Fahy.

20 Senator Fahy to be recorded in the
21 affirmative.

22 Announce the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
24 Calendar Number 1635, voting in the negative are
25 Senators Borrello, Mattera, Murray, Stec,

1 Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

2 Ayes, 53. Nays, 7.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
4 is passed.

5 The Secretary will read.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 1777, Senate Print 10626, by Senator Gianaris, an
8 act to amend the Judiciary Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
10 Palumbo, why do you rise?

11 SENATOR PALUMBO: Thank you,
12 Mr. President. I wonder if the sponsor would
13 yield for a few questions, please.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
15 sponsor yield?

16 SENATOR GIANARIS: It will be my
17 pleasure.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
19 sponsor yields.

20 SENATOR PALUMBO: Thank you,
21 Senator Gianaris.

22 And through you, just a few fairly
23 brief questions, I hope.

24 My understanding is this bill is a
25 little bit modified from last year's bill

1 redistricting judicial districts. But it creates
2 three new judicial districts in Western New York,
3 is that accurate?

4 SENATOR GIANARIS: It's
5 substantially modified from that version. But
6 yes, that's correct.

7 SENATOR PALUMBO: Yes. Will the
8 sponsor continue to yield?

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
10 sponsor yield?

11 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
13 sponsor yields.

14 SENATOR PALUMBO: Yes. And is it
15 also accurate that it also just moves around some
16 judges and isolates in the three new judicial
17 districts, respectively -- the 14th Judicial
18 District will be Onondaga; 15th, Monroe; and the
19 16th Judicial District will encompass Erie only.
20 So each of those three counties get their own
21 judicial districts.

22 And three others -- Five, Seven and
23 Eight -- will be moved around a little bit so
24 that they encompass I guess the surrounding area.
25 And please correct me if that's not accurate.

1 SENATOR GIANARIS: No need for me
2 to correct you, Senator Palumbo. You are
3 correct.

4 SENATOR PALUMBO: Thank you. Will
5 the sponsor continue to yield?

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
7 sponsor yield?

8 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
10 sponsor yields.

11 SENATOR PALUMBO: Were there any
12 public hearings with respect to this new
13 redistricting of the courts over there in
14 Western New York -- the ultimate resolution being
15 this bill?

16 SENATOR GIANARIS: No.

17 However, as you pointed out, we
18 passed a bill last year and received substantial
19 input as a result of that piece of legislation,
20 which was incorporated into the modified bill.

21 SENATOR PALUMBO: Will the sponsor
22 continue to yield?

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
24 sponsor yield?

25 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
2 sponsor yields.

3 SENATOR PALUMBO: Thank you,
4 Senator.

5 And also -- I think I might have
6 asked this question last year as well -- this
7 would now include, because our Regents are based
8 upon judicial districts, this gives us three more
9 Regents, increasing the number I guess it would
10 be -- what do we have, 17? So it would go to
11 20 Regents statewide. Is that accurate?

12 SENATOR GIANARIS: Increased
13 representation for upstate in the Regents,
14 correct.

15 SENATOR PALUMBO: Thank you.
16 And will the sponsor continue to
17 yield?

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
19 sponsor yield?

20 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
22 sponsor yields.

23 SENATOR PALUMBO: Just one last
24 subject area, regarding the costs. I know that
25 OCA has chimed in on this that they like the

1 newer version of the bill. And they did say that
2 it would be several million dollars, is my
3 understanding.

4 Do you have an estimate of costs?
5 Because some of these outlying districts, it's my
6 understanding, do not actually have full-time
7 courtrooms, they don't have staff. In fact,
8 their caseload is somewhat of a much smaller
9 fraction than some of these larger counties in
10 Western New York.

11 SENATOR GIANARIS: That is correct,
12 there would be some costs associated with the new
13 districts.

14 SENATOR PALUMBO: Will the sponsor
15 continue to yield?

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
17 sponsor yield?

18 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
20 sponsor yields.

21 SENATOR PALUMBO: Do you know what
22 those amounts are, Senator?

23 SENATOR GIANARIS: I think an
24 estimate I just heard was \$14 million.

25 SENATOR PALUMBO: Fourteen million.

1 Very good. Thank you, Senator Gianaris.

2 On the bill, please, Mr. President.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
4 Palumbo on the bill.

5 SENATOR PALUMBO: Thank you.

6 And Senator Gianaris, I appreciate
7 us continuing this discussion this year.

8 But when I look at this bill and I
9 look at -- I've had some conversations with
10 judges who actually sit out in Western New York.
11 And we've had some fun times this session
12 creating certain monikers for some of our
13 colleagues. My good buddy whose name begins with
14 a W, it's good alliteration of what we're doing
15 on Wednesdays.

16 But this is gerrymandering week.
17 That's what this is. This is purely political.
18 When you look at the caseloads and you look at
19 the actual intended result here, where -- let's
20 keep in mind that we have anywhere in that
21 Fourth Department, anywhere in Western New York,
22 if you have a challenge in an election case, you
23 need to go only to one county: Erie County.
24 Erie County is about 75 percent of the new
25 filings in the Eighth Judicial District, and

1 25 percent are all the rest.

2 And what this restructuring does is
3 it now takes from those three districts -- Five,
4 Seven and Eight -- moved into the newer district,
5 it takes the judge count from 67 to 26. So
6 notwithstanding that huge reduction in judges, a
7 handful of them are -- I believe seven of them
8 are Appellate Division judges who can't handle
9 caseloads.

10 So Erie would get 18 Supreme Court
11 judges, seven of which are in the
12 Appellate Division. So there will be a bunch of
13 new appointments. And we know where those
14 appointments will come from, and we know the
15 politics of Erie County.

16 And I know we've had discussions
17 before when we did this several years ago that
18 was done really out of necessity, when one of my
19 colleagues created -- sponsored a bill to create
20 the 13th Judicial District. Staten Island was a
21 part of Brooklyn Judicial District. Staten
22 Island politics are very different than Brooklyn
23 politics. And back then, Staten Island had
24 essentially zero judges, because you had to go to
25 Brooklyn and pay the toll to try and get on the

1 bench, which is what actually happened at certain
2 points to the party bosses.

3 So they split out Staten Island, and
4 now Staten Island actually has Staten Islanders
5 sitting on the bench and presiding over their
6 cases.

7 So that was a need. That was a real
8 significant and important need as far as those
9 communities are concerned.

10 So now we're splitting out three
11 large counties, giving them their own judicial
12 districts and plenty of judges, and we've got the
13 more rural areas now are still three judicial
14 districts -- with only 26 judges instead of it
15 looks like about 42 in the three bigger
16 counties -- who don't have anywhere near the
17 caseload.

18 And those outlying courts don't have
19 staff, they don't even have full-time courts. So
20 this is going to come at a significant cost. And
21 as much as I love my friends in the Office of
22 Court Administration, I have great respect for
23 them, I have to disagree with them on this bill,
24 Mr. President.

25 And for those reasons I will be

1 voting no, and I urge my colleagues to do the
2 same.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
4 you, Senator Palumbo.

5 Are there any other Senators wishing
6 to be heard?

7 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
8 closed.

9 The Secretary will ring the bell.
10 Senator Gianaris.

11 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
12 we've agreed to restore this bill to the
13 noncontroversial calendar.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: On
15 consent, the bill is restored to the
16 noncontroversial calendar.

17 Read the last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
19 act shall take effect immediately.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Are there
24 any Senators wishing to explain their vote?

25 Seeing and hearing none,

1 Senator Gianaris will close.

2 SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you,
3 Mr. President.

4 This bill actually will help a lot
5 of the residents of upstate New York who are
6 currently in the Fourth Department.

7 I heard Senator Palumbo's comments
8 about Staten Island and Brooklyn, and there are a
9 lot of parallels actually to that situation. I
10 don't know if he's aware, but currently the
11 Fourth Department residents are -- 57 percent of
12 them live in Erie, Onondaga or Monroe counties,
13 and yet 80 percent of the justices in the
14 Fourth Department are from those three counties.

15 And so by creating these three new
16 districts that are predominantly rural, I think
17 you can expect to see, much like Staten Island
18 did, the representation on the bench for those
19 rural counties increase. And so I do think there
20 are some parallels there.

21 So for example, just so everyone
22 gets a sense of it, the counties that would be in
23 the new districts -- well, in the rural
24 districts, let's call them, are Allegany,
25 Cattaraugus, Chautauqua, Genesee, Niagara,

1 Orleans and Wyoming. And one of them, they would
2 have nine justices. Cayuga, Livingston, Ontario,
3 Seneca, Steuben, Wayne and Yates would have
4 seven. And then in the new Fifth District,
5 Herkimer -- which, by the way, was the county
6 that Senator Walczyk was successful in raising
7 taxes for earlier in the week -- Herkimer,
8 Jefferson, Lewis, Oneida and Oswego would also
9 get nine justices. And so I do think -- I do
10 think there are some parallels there with what
11 Senator Palumbo was talking about.

12 And I urge all my colleagues to join
13 me in supporting this legislation.

14 Thank you.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
16 Gianaris to be recorded in the affirmative.

17 Announce the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
19 Calendar 1777, voting in the negative are
20 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
21 Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins,
22 Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt,
23 Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Ryan, Stec, Tedisco,
24 Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

25 Ayes, 37. Nays, 23.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
2 is passed.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 1784, Senate Print 10639, by Senator Gianaris, an
5 act to amend the Election Law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
7 Martins, why do you rise?

8 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,
9 Mr. President. If the sponsor would yield for a
10 few questions.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
12 sponsor yield?

13 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
15 sponsor yields.

16 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you.

17 So this is Part 2 to our discussion
18 yesterday, and here we are today. And I think it
19 may have been Senator Borrello that foreshadowed
20 this discussion by referencing this bill
21 yesterday.

22 But I believe that this is an
23 amendment -- or I know this is an amendment to
24 Section 4-108 of the Election Law by adding a new
25 Section 8, isn't that right?

1 SENATOR GIANARIS: Are you asking
2 if it adds a new section? I'm sorry, I didn't
3 hear the question.

4 SENATOR MARTINS: No, no, Senator.
5 All I'm asking is whether or not this just adds a
6 new Section 8 to Section 4-108 of the
7 Election Law.

8 SENATOR GIANARIS: That is correct.

9 SENATOR MARTINS: And so through
10 you, Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue
11 to yield.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
13 sponsor yield?

14 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
16 sponsor yields.

17 SENATOR MARTINS: Section 4-108 of
18 the Election Law details the process whereby if
19 we have an amendment to the Constitution or
20 proposed amendment to the Constitution, the
21 process that is to be followed.

22 Do you see it the same way, Senator?

23 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes, I do.

24 SENATOR MARTINS: So through you,
25 Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to

1 yield.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
3 sponsor yield?

4 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes, I do.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
6 sponsor yields.

7 SENATOR MARTINS: Currently the
8 process has the Board of Elections preparing
9 language -- that is, the Republicans and
10 Democrats on the Board of Elections working
11 collaboratively in a bipartisan or nonpartisan
12 fashion depending on your perspective, to come up
13 with language. Right?

14 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

15 SENATOR MARTINS: Through you,
16 Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
17 yield.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
19 sponsor yield?

20 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
22 sponsor yields.

23 SENATOR MARTINS: And in addition,
24 it also requires, under Section 3 of 4-108, that
25 the Attorney General is to advise in the

1 preparation of that language, ensuring that there
2 is, you know, the state's highest I guess law
3 enforcement officer, attorney, providing language
4 or helping with the language between the
5 commissioners on the Board of Elections. Right?

6 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

7 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you.

8 Through you, Mr. President, if the
9 sponsor would continue to yield.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
11 sponsor yield?

12 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
14 sponsor yields.

15 SENATOR MARTINS: And it requires
16 that the Board of Elections provide notice to
17 each county board 90 days before the general
18 election in which the matter or measure is to
19 appear on the ballot. Right?

20 SENATOR GIANARIS: That sounds
21 right.

22 SENATOR MARTINS: Then it goes on
23 to say that --

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
25 Martins --

1 SENATOR MARTINS: Through you,
2 Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
3 yield.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
5 sponsor yield?

6 SENATOR GIANARIS: I do.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
8 sponsor yields.

9 SENATOR MARTINS: Then it goes on
10 to say 120 days prior to the election date, that
11 the Board of Elections shall post the language on
12 its website -- it actually says "shall
13 prominently publish on its website at least four
14 months prior to the general election at which a
15 ballot proposal shall appear," the language that
16 will appear on the ballot.

17 So four months beforehand, they put
18 it on their website. Is that right?

19 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

20 SENATOR MARTINS: Great.

21 And it allows -- Mr. President,
22 through you, if the sponsor would continue to
23 yield.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
25 sponsor yield?

1 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
3 sponsor yields.

4 SENATOR MARTINS: And it allows for
5 a 15-day public comment period as well.

6 So not only do they put it on the
7 website four months beforehand, but they allow
8 for a 15-day right for public comment with regard
9 to the language that's being proposed. Right?

10 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

11 SENATOR MARTINS: And it goes on --
12 Mr. President, through you, if the sponsor will
13 continue to yield.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
15 sponsor yield?

16 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
18 sponsor yields.

19 SENATOR MARTINS: And does it say
20 anything about the type of language that's to be
21 used -- you know, simplicity of the language? To
22 your knowledge, Senator, is there anything there
23 that references, for example, at what grade level
24 this language should be so it's understandable?

25 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes, there are

1 some guidelines as to how to do that, yes.

2 SENATOR MARTINS: Through you,
3 Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
4 yield.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
6 sponsor yield?

7 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
9 sponsor yields.

10 SENATOR MARTINS: What are those
11 guidelines, if you know, Senator?

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
13 Martins, if you don't mind clarifying.

14 SENATOR GIANARIS: I'm sorry, I
15 didn't hear the question.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: He didn't
17 hear the question.

18 SENATOR MARTINS: What are those
19 guidelines in terms of --

20 SENATOR GIANARIS: What are the
21 guidelines?

22 SENATOR MARTINS: -- of the type of
23 language?

24 SENATOR GIANARIS: Well,
25 interestingly, the guidelines that the Board of

1 Elections follows are replicated in this bill so
2 the Legislature would do its best to follow them
3 as well.

4 But it's Section 2 -- or
5 subdivision 2 of Section 4-108. You want me to
6 read it for you?

7 SENATOR MARTINS: No, I -- through
8 you, no, I don't need you to read it. I just
9 figured if you -- for the benefit of everyone
10 else who may be interested. If not, we can move
11 on.

12 SENATOR GIANARIS: I'll do some
13 reading aloud.

14 It says: "The form in which the
15 proposed amendment, proposition or question is
16 to be submitted shall consist only of the
17 following: (a) A descriptive title of up to
18 15 words, which describes the topic, goal, or
19 outcome of the ballot question in plain language;
20 (b) A summary of the text ballot proposal of up
21 to 30 words, written in plain language, that
22 describes the change in policy to be adopted and
23 not the legal mechanism; and (c) A statement of
24 what a YES or NO vote means in up to 30 words
25 written in plain language that identifies the

1 practical outcome of each election result and not
2 the legal mechanism. If more than one such
3 amendment, proposition or question is to be voted
4 upon at such election, each such amendment,
5 proposition or question respectively shall be
6 separately and consecutively numbered."

7 Then further down at subdivision 5
8 it goes into describing what they mean by plain
9 language, and it says (reading): Plain language
10 shall mean the form of the ballot proposal and
11 abstract: Shall be written in easily
12 comprehended, concise language; shall not contain
13 more than one pass -- oh, I think there's a typo.
14 It says "shall not contain more the one passive
15 sentence"; shall not use semicolons, using
16 multiple sentences as necessary; and shall not
17 contain double negatives.

18 Then it goes on to tell you how you
19 evaluate whether the plain language is really
20 plain. And it says (reading): To evaluate
21 compliance with the plain language requirements,
22 the state board calculates an Automated
23 Readability Index score, separately, for each
24 statewide form of ballot proposal and abstract.

25 That index score shall be calculated

1 according to the following formula: Divide the
2 number of characters, excluding spaces, by the
3 number of words and multiply that number by 4.71.
4 Divide the number of words by the number of
5 sentences and multiply that number by 0.5. Add
6 the results of paragraphs a and b of this
7 subdivision, subtract 21.43 from the result of
8 paragraph (c) of this paragraph and round to the
9 nearest whole number.

10 It's rather involved just to write a
11 simple sentence. But there you have it, since
12 you asked. It's like doing your taxes.

13 (Laughter.)

14 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,
15 Mr. President. And I do appreciate the Senator
16 indulging me on that.

17 I was asking if you could provide it
18 in a -- I guess a briefer form, but reading is
19 probably the best way to actually do it, so I
20 want to thank Senator Gianaris for that.

21 SENATOR GIANARIS: It seems that
22 the law itself is not in plain language,
23 unfortunately.

24 SENATOR MARTINS: No,
25 unfortunately. I agree with you.

1 Through you, Mr. President, if the
2 Senator would continue to yield.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
4 sponsor yield?

5 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
7 sponsor yields.

8 SENATOR MARTINS: So
9 notwithstanding the fact that we have clear
10 language in law, albeit some of it confusing,
11 Senator, as to who prepares the ballot initiative
12 and the language for it when there's a
13 constitutional amendment, we now have before us
14 this bill that would substitute the majorities in
15 the Legislature in drafting that language.

16 That's what this amendment does,
17 isn't it?

18 SENATOR GIANARIS: Correct.

19 SENATOR MARTINS: And also through
20 you, Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue
21 to yield.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
23 sponsor yield?

24 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The

1 sponsor yields.

2 SENATOR MARTINS: And also this
3 proposal -- or this bill also removes the
4 opportunity for any public comment period that
5 was incorporated in the statute, thereby
6 eliminating the opportunity for the public to
7 have comment on the quality of the language or
8 the sufficiency of the language.

9 That's been removed in this bill as
10 well, right?

11 SENATOR GIANARIS: Ah. There
12 you're mistaken, Senator Martins. Because the
13 proposal would have to go through the legislative
14 process. And what we do here is public, and the
15 public can comment on it, it appears on the
16 Senate and Assembly websites. And so there would
17 be the opportunity for the public to see what is
18 being proposed.

19 SENATOR MARTINS: Through you,
20 Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
21 yield.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
23 sponsor yield?

24 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The

1 sponsor yields.

2 SENATOR MARTINS: But the process,
3 Senator, that allowed for the Board of Elections
4 to post it and for the Board of Elections to
5 receive comments, irrespective of whatever
6 comments may be received here, has been
7 eliminated with respect to the amendment that's
8 being proposed today, right?

9 SENATOR GIANARIS: Well, yes,
10 because the board would not be writing the
11 language in that circumstance, so why would they
12 be receiving public comment?

13 We would receive public comment
14 through the legislative process.

15 SENATOR MARTINS: Mr. President, on
16 the bill.

17 Thank you, Senator Gianaris.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
19 Martins on the bill.

20 SENATOR MARTINS: And so as I
21 mentioned earlier, here we are with Chapter 2.
22 You know, yesterday we talked about gutting, we
23 discussed how it was a decision of this body and
24 I'm sure the one -- I'm positive the one on the
25 other side of the building to gut the Independent

1 Redistricting Commission and again to insert
2 partisan politics into redrawing districts.

3 But this one -- this one's
4 actually -- Mr. President, this one's special.
5 This one's special because not only did we go so
6 far as to remove any independent redistricting
7 commission oversight with regard to
8 redistricting, removed the court oversight,
9 bringing everything back to this body when it
10 came to redistricting so that, again, as was done
11 in the past, majorities in this chamber would get
12 to draw their own lines and choose their own
13 voters, as opposed to the voters choosing their
14 elected officials.

15 This is -- this is special. Because
16 now what we've decided is when we do want to
17 change the Constitution of this state, the
18 process that we had that actually sent the issue
19 to the Board of Elections and allowed the Board
20 of Elections to make that decision -- a Board of
21 Elections that is composed equally of Republicans
22 and Democrats, where they would have to agree on
23 language removing partisanship, and with the help
24 of the Attorney General -- again, a level of
25 oversight, and I think important impartiality, I

1 would suggest, offering support to the Board of
2 Elections in terms of something as important as a
3 constitutional amendment. An amendment to the
4 Constitution of our state.

5 What the Majority is suggesting, or
6 what the sponsor is suggesting, is that, well,
7 let's just throw all of that out. We'll make
8 that decision ourselves here, and we're going to
9 come up with language and we're going to describe
10 that language and that effort in the way that we
11 choose to. Which is inherently a partisan
12 effort. And I think, Mr. President,
13 unfortunately it cheapens the process.

14 Through you, Mr. President, if the
15 sponsor would yield for a few more questions.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
17 sponsor yield?

18 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
20 sponsor yields.

21 SENATOR MARTINS: So is there a
22 requirement in this bill that the language that
23 is proposed truthfully and accurately reflects
24 what is being placed on the ballot?

25 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes. The

1 language mimics what is in the current rules for
2 the Board of Elections.

3 SENATOR MARTINS: Through you,
4 Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
5 yield.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
7 sponsor yield?

8 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
10 sponsor yields.

11 SENATOR MARTINS: Not with regard
12 to the simplicity of the language, Senator, with
13 regard to the truthfulness and accurateness of
14 the language in depicting what it is that's going
15 to be changed in the State Constitution.

16 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yeah, listen,
17 we -- we mimic the language that's currently
18 required for the board to follow.

19 So I suppose what you're asking
20 about is not in the current law except to the
21 extent it says the -- yes. I mean, there's
22 nowhere in the current law that gets that
23 specific as to what's required, Senator Martins.

24 SENATOR MARTINS: Through you,
25 Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to

1 yield.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
3 sponsor yield?

4 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
6 sponsor yields.

7 SENATOR MARTINS: The current law
8 has to be concurred to between the two parties,
9 their representatives on the Board of Elections,
10 with the assistance of the Attorney General.
11 What's being proposed here is a partisan effort
12 to change that so there isn't that level of
13 oversight.

14 In addition, what exists allows for
15 public comment through the Board of Elections
16 with regard to the language that they
17 independently choose, which has been eliminated
18 in this.

19 And so I'm asking you -- and I think
20 we both understand what I'm asking, Senator -- is
21 there anything here that requires that the
22 State Legislature, when it does come up with
23 language, has to accurately reflect the nature of
24 the amendment to the Constitution that's being
25 proposed?

1 SENATOR GIANARIS: I'll say a
2 couple of things about that.

3 Number one, you continue to profess
4 somehow the fact that there are political
5 appointees of both -- literally of the chairs of
6 both parties. So party officials appoint
7 commissioners, and those people are currently
8 responsible for putting the words together. They
9 don't have any such requirement as what you're
10 talking about.

11 You're suggesting that the balance
12 between the two will somehow create some
13 regulation de facto as to the veracity of what
14 ends up on the ballot.

15 We talked about this yesterday.
16 There is a very -- you talk about it as if
17 there's never an instance of the leadership of
18 the two parties collaborating -- the
19 incumbency-ship, I called it yesterday -- as if
20 it's never been the case that Republican
21 leadership and Democratic leadership would
22 collaborate to keep outsiders out.

23 And so that is a real threat, under
24 your analysis, in the current system. I mean, we
25 lived in this chamber for many years with

1 Democratic leadership and Republican leadership
2 collaborating to keep all of us out of power. We
3 overcame that, of course. But that happens.

4 And so whatever safeguards are there
5 currently to keep the Board of Elections
6 commissioners from doing exactly what you're
7 worried about are the same. We literally
8 referenced the same sections that require -- that
9 present the requirements to the board in this
10 proposal.

11 SENATOR MARTINS: Through you,
12 Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
13 yield.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
15 sponsor yield?

16 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
18 sponsor yields.

19 SENATOR MARTINS: Can we agree,
20 then, that there's a requirement in this document
21 that the -- whatever is sent to the Board of
22 Elections by the Legislature has to accurately
23 reflect what's on the ballot for a change to the
24 constitutional amendment?

25 SENATOR GIANARIS: Well, it says it

1 shall use best efforts to comply with the plain
2 language requirements of subdivisions 2 and 5,
3 which are the subdivisions we referenced earlier.

4 SENATOR MARTINS: Through you,
5 Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
6 yield.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
8 sponsor yield?

9 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
11 sponsor yields.

12 SENATOR MARTINS: Senator, I'm not
13 talking about the reading level for the language
14 that's being proposed. All I'm asking is, Can we
15 agree that it has to accurately reflect what the
16 constitutional amendment actually is?

17 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes, I would
18 think so.

19 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you.

20 Through you, Mr. President, just a
21 few more questions, if the Senator would indulge
22 me.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
24 sponsor yield?

25 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
2 sponsor yields.

3 SENATOR MARTINS: Have we heard
4 from any of the good government groups here in
5 Albany? You know, and I can list them, but I
6 think, you know, we're all too familiar with
7 them: Reinvent Albany, NYPIRG, Common Cause,
8 Brennan Center, League of Women Voters -- great
9 groups, all deeply concerned about protecting our
10 democracy.

11 Have they opined on this, or did you
12 talk to them about this particular bill and have
13 they shared with you, any of them, an opinion as
14 to whether or not this is a good idea?

15 SENATOR GIANARIS: I'm not aware of
16 them rendering an opinion on this.

17 SENATOR MARTINS: Through you,
18 Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
19 yield.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
21 sponsor yield?

22 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
24 sponsor yields.

25 SENATOR MARTINS: Did you happen to

1 reach out to any of them? You know, they are
2 often very willing to offer their opinion on
3 things such as this. Did you seek out their
4 opinion with regard to, you know, this, changing
5 how items appear on a ballot when it comes to
6 changing the Constitution? By any chance did you
7 happen to reach out to them?

8 SENATOR GIANARIS: Informally, yes.

9 SENATOR MARTINS: Through you,
10 Mr. President, if the sponsor would continue to
11 yield.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
13 sponsor yield?

14 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
16 sponsor yields.

17 SENATOR MARTINS: I'll bite. Which
18 one of them told you this was a good idea?

19 SENATOR GIANARIS: Well, I'm not
20 going to divulge my private conversations with
21 them, Senator Martins. If they wished to opine
22 publicly, they would have. But that has not
23 happened.

24 SENATOR MARTINS: I appreciate
25 that, Senator. Thank you.

1 Through you, Mr. President, if the
2 sponsor would yield.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
4 sponsor yield?

5 SENATOR GIANARIS: Yes.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
7 sponsor yields.

8 SENATOR MARTINS: So if someone
9 believes that the version that is advanced by the
10 legislative majorities does not accurately
11 reflect what's actually being proposed, that
12 change to the State Constitution -- a member of
13 the public, would they have the ability to go to
14 court to have the court oversee the language and
15 ask for the court to intervene?

16 SENATOR GIANARIS: As with any law,
17 if a member of the public believes it's being
18 broken, they can go to court and seek relief.

19 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you. Thank
20 you, Senator Gianaris, very much. Appreciate it.

21 Mr. President, on the bill.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
23 Martins on the bill.

24 SENATOR MARTINS: So again, it just
25 begs the question -- and I'll end it with this.

1 We have a system that's in place. It has been in
2 place, it has worked, it adds a level of
3 bipartisanship in coming up with language. In
4 doing so, it doesn't allow an advantage to one
5 side or the other.

6 And to make things right, it also
7 requires that the Board of Elections work with
8 the Attorney General in coming up with that
9 language. It's a good way to do it. It's not
10 perfect, but it's a good way to do it. And it
11 allows for -- especially when we're dealing with
12 an amendment to our State Constitution, that
13 there is a level of respect with respect to that,
14 and we're eliminating partisanship.

15 And so I share the same concerns I
16 shared yesterday. I think any time we include
17 partisanship in anything that involves amending
18 our State Constitution, we're doing ourselves a
19 disservice. It really is not where we should be
20 going with this.

21 Look, we all understand what's
22 happening here. We all understand. This is not
23 a secret. The real shame of it is these good
24 government groups that I listed, that they're not
25 sitting here screaming at the top of their lungs

1 and instead chose to have private conversations
2 with regard to something as serious as this.
3 That goes to the heart of the integrity of our
4 State Constitution.

5 So again, why? How does this
6 advance our state? How does this work for our
7 individual residents? How does this make things
8 better? And the short answer is it doesn't. It
9 does advance politics, partisanship and division
10 in this state.

11 Mr. President, that's why I'll be
12 voting no. Thank you.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
14 you, Senator Martins.

15 Are there any other Senators wishing
16 to be heard?

17 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
18 now closed. The Secretary will ring the bell.

19 Senator Gianaris.

20 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
21 we've agreed to restore this bill to the
22 noncontroversial calendar.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Upon
24 consent, the bill is restored to the
25 noncontroversial calendar.

1 Read the last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Are there
8 any Senators wishing to explain their vote?

9 Seeing and hearing none, Senator
10 Gianaris will explain and close.

11 SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you,
12 Mr. President.

13 Of course my colleagues want to
14 maintain the current system. Let's talk about
15 math for a moment. Currently you have political
16 appointees -- and again, I want to stress this,
17 literally appointees of the chair of the
18 political parties of the state, both Democrat and
19 Republican, making this decision for the state
20 board.

21 And for some reason, and I think I
22 can speculate about it, which I will as part of
23 my explanation, the breakdown of that
24 decision-making process is 50-50. Equal number
25 of Democrats, equal number of Republicans. So

1 the Republican Party has 50 percent of the
2 influence over how a ballot question will appear.

3 Now, if we look at the elected
4 governmental bodies of this state, both the
5 Assembly and the Senate, it's about two-thirds
6 Democrat to one-third Republican. So lo and
7 behold, Senator Martins and my colleagues across
8 the aisle say, Wait a minute. We like the
9 current system. We have half the say. If we
10 come in here, which is an actual governmental
11 body elected by the people, we only have a third
12 of a say.

13 And my question is, why should you
14 have half the say over what goes on the ballot?
15 That's not what the people wanted. That's not
16 the way the voters have acted to elect their
17 representatives in the Legislature. It's
18 arbitrary. It came about in the 1970s when the
19 Senate was Republican and the Assembly was
20 Democrat and they effectively had 50-50 influence
21 over what happened in the Legislature. It made
22 sense then on some level. It doesn't anymore.

23 I mean, I would say let's let the
24 Conservative Party then have a say. Why not?
25 Why don't they get to say something? They're a

1 party. Let's let the Working Families Party have
2 a say. Why are they cut out of the decision
3 process if we're letting political parties make
4 this decision, which is how it's currently
5 constructed.

6 I made this point yesterday. I'm
7 going to make it again. We are here because the
8 people of our districts elect us to serve. We
9 are their mouthpiece. We are their
10 representatives. And so when we take action, we
11 are speaking for them. If you don't like it that
12 two-thirds of the state wants to lean Democratic,
13 that's your problem. It's not their problem.

14 But I don't see why you should have
15 half the say over how a ballot question looks,
16 because that corrupts the ballot question. Don't
17 pretend like these political appointees somehow
18 come out with some pure product. There's been
19 plenty of criticism of the ballot language that
20 has emerged from the Board of Elections.

21 And so this brings the question back
22 to the people through their representatives in
23 this house and in the Assembly.

24 I vote yes, Mr. President.

25 Thank you.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
2 the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
4 Calendar 1784, voting in the negative are
5 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
6 Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins,
7 Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt,
8 Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk,
9 Weber and Weik.

10 Ayes, 38. Nays, 22.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 1787, Assembly Bill Number 11560, by
15 Assemblymember Barrett, an act to amend the
16 Environmental Conservation Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
18 Weber, why do you rise?

19 SENATOR WEBER: Thank you,
20 Mr. President. Through you, will the sponsor
21 yield for some questions?

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
23 sponsor yield?

24 SENATOR GONZALEZ: I do.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The

1 sponsor yields.

2 SENATOR WEBER: Thank you. And
3 through you, Mr. President.

4 So Senator Gonzalez, can you kind of
5 go through the exact purpose of the moratorium?
6 I guess it's a little unclear in the bill where
7 it talks about the environmental impact report
8 and it's not required to be completed until the
9 expiration of the moratorium.

10 So I just want to get a whole
11 timeline in terms of, you know, what the -- why
12 you came to this decision and where we are at the
13 end of that one-year moratorium.

14 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Through you,
15 Mr. President.

16 Right now hyperscale data centers
17 are being built at a rate we haven't seen before,
18 and of course on a scale we haven't seen before.
19 A lot of these large energy facilities are
20 20 megawatts and above, and they pose an
21 existential threat to our energy grid which, we
22 have discussed a lot in this chamber, is an
23 energy crisis.

24 And so the point of this bill is to
25 better understand the impacts of these biggest of

1 the big data centers, not only in our energy grid
2 but also on our environmental resources. We know
3 they take a significant amount of water, in
4 addition to our local communities, pollution,
5 et cetera.

6 SENATOR WEBER: Through you,
7 Mr. President, will sponsor yield?

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
9 sponsor yield?

10 SENATOR GONZALEZ: I do.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
12 sponsor yields.

13 SENATOR WEBER: So I guess after
14 the 12-month moratorium, what can we as a body
15 expect to see in terms of data related to the
16 moratorium?

17 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Through you,
18 Mr. President. After the one-year moratorium,
19 which again is on the permits through DEC for
20 hyperscale data centers, we would expect to see
21 an environmental impact report.

22 Under this bill, the report would
23 include an analysis of current data centers in
24 the state and their land, water and electricity
25 use and generation source, projected growth of

1 data centers in the state and their land, water
2 and electricity use, current and expected
3 pollution, impacts on DACs and recognized
4 Indigenous Nations, review of public money
5 received by data centers -- so any tax breaks --
6 and five public comment periods, so the results
7 and feedback from those comment periods in
8 different regions across New York State.

9 SENATOR WEBER: Okay, thank you.
10 And through you, Mr. President, will the sponsor
11 continue to yield?

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
13 sponsor yield?

14 SENATOR GONZALEZ: I do.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
16 sponsor yields.

17 SENATOR WEBER: You know, I think
18 we all -- we've talked about it in this body
19 where, you know, everything's going to AI, right?
20 And we've seen so much cloud-based uses
21 throughout the country, and we see it around the
22 world, essentially.

23 And we know that in order for the
24 U.S. to keep up and be a leading edge in terms of
25 AI and the related fields, we're going to need to

1 have data centers being built in this country.

2 So I guess the question I have is --
3 and I understand the concern from many residents,
4 including residents throughout the state, in
5 terms of the power needed to run these data
6 centers.

7 But, you know, do you think or do
8 you have an idea of, you know, this push towards
9 electrification in the state, has that
10 contributed a lot to the power needs in this area
11 as well?

12 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Through you,
13 Mr. President.

14 I appreciate my colleague calling
15 out that there has been a lot of support for this
16 bill across the state. We've actually seen, in
17 the absence of state regulation and federal
18 legislation, local governments, like in the
19 Town of Dryden, ban data centers.

20 Data centers and specifically
21 hyperscale data centers, as pointed out, are for
22 generative AI. And the big -- these large, large
23 energy facilities right now are running primarily
24 in other states on fossil fuel.

25 So what we are trying to do in this

1 bill is say that if we are going to make any
2 approvals of additional hyperscale data
3 centers -- which in the moment there's a queue of
4 28, with over 9,000 megawatts -- that we
5 shouldn't just rely on fossil fuels, but we
6 should have energy efficiency standards, we
7 should also have renewable energy standards that
8 work in tandem with the CLCPA as we've amended it
9 this year.

10 SENATOR WEBER: And through you,
11 Mr. President, will the sponsor continue to
12 yield?

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
14 sponsor yield?

15 SENATOR GONZALEZ: I do.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
17 sponsor yields.

18 SENATOR WEBER: You know, it says
19 the bill requires any data center with a peak
20 load of 5 megawatts or larger to procure
21 one-third of its electricity consumption from
22 renewable energy systems by 2030, with the
23 mandate rising to 90 percent by 2040. And then
24 it also requires that the data centers derive as
25 much energy -- or, quote as much of its energy

1 needs as is technologically, environmentally and
2 practically feasible, from on-site generation
3 from renewable energy systems.

4 So I guess we see some potential
5 inconsistencies with the CLCPA's mandate that by
6 2040 the state electrical grid be zero emissions,
7 not all renewables. So I guess the question is:
8 Why preclude data center use of other sources of
9 clean energy including nuclear, biogenic fuels,
10 or other yet to be identified dispatchable,
11 emissions-free resources?

12 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Through you,
13 Mr. President. To be clear, in this bill we set
14 targets. And the initial target between 2030 and
15 2034 is one-third electricity consumption derived
16 from renewables. There is nothing in this bill
17 barring the other two-thirds coming from any
18 other source, including fossil fuels.

19 And now we do want to make sure
20 that, understanding we have a climate crisis,
21 these large-scale energy facilities are running
22 on majority-renewables. And so, again, we set
23 targets but at no point -- and this was
24 intentional -- did we put 100 percent renewables,
25 because we understand that some of these centers

1 after 2040 may need to get their energy
2 elsewhere.

3 SENATOR WEBER: Thank you.

4 And through you, Mr. President, will
5 the sponsor continue to yield?

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
7 sponsor yield?

8 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Yes.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
10 sponsor yields.

11 SENATOR WEBER: So I'd like to talk
12 to you about data centers that are -- whether in
13 the construction process or in the permitting
14 process or maybe even at the infantile stage
15 process right now. What happens in all of those
16 scenarios right now under this legislation?

17 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Through you,
18 Mr. President, that is a good question.

19 If a data center -- again,
20 specifically a hyperscaler that's over
21 20 megawatts has received their permit from DEC,
22 this bill has no impact on them.

23 If they have not yet received a
24 permit from DEC, then this one-year moratorium
25 would apply.

1 But to be clear, that does not
2 preclude the other processes that they're already
3 a part of. So if after this bill is signed into
4 law a hyperscale center hasn't received their
5 permit from DEC, they would likely still be in
6 the NYISO queue. And the NYISO queue takes two
7 to five years.

8 So this would not be a significant
9 setback, under our eyes, which is why we felt one
10 year was a reasonable compromise.

11 SENATOR WEBER: Okay. All right.
12 Thank you, Mr. President.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
14 you, Senator Weber.

15 Senator Mattera, why do you rise?

16 SENATOR MATTERA: Thank you,
17 Mr. President. Would the sponsor yield for some
18 questions, please?

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
20 sponsor yield?

21 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Yes.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
23 sponsor yields.

24 SENATOR MATTERA: And I thank you,
25 Senator.

1 What is one year going to do with a
2 moratorium? You just had some -- you know,
3 explained some questions from my colleague.
4 Again, you pretty much said -- what is a year
5 going to do?

6 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Through you,
7 Mr. President. One year is going to allow us to
8 do our jobs as legislators. And that means
9 having a real, substantive and holistic plan for
10 what our energy future can look like, and how
11 we're going to protect ratepayers from the
12 potential costs that hyperscalers pose.

13 So it will give us the environmental
14 impact report to give us the information to do
15 exactly that.

16 SENATOR MATTERA: Through you,
17 Mr. President, would sponsor continue to yield?

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
19 sponsor yield?

20 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Yes.

21 SENATOR MATTERA: So in other
22 words --

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
24 sponsor --

25 SENATOR MATTERA: So if you didn't

1 get any --

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
3 sponsor yields.

4 SENATOR MATTERA: Oh, I'm sorry.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: That's
6 all right. I'm sorry. The sponsor yields. I'm
7 just letting you know, Senator Mattera.

8 SENATOR MATTERA: So after a year
9 goes by -- and pretty much that goes by very,
10 very fast -- are you going to go and propose and
11 put another bill forward, the same thing, to do
12 another moratorium for two years, three years,
13 four years, five years?

14 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Through you,
15 Mr. President. I certainly do not have the
16 results of the environmental impact report, and
17 therefore I don't know what will be needed at the
18 other end of this one-year moratorium.

19 But what we do know is that by
20 passing this bill we're not just instating the
21 one year to allow us to create new processes,
22 we're also doing some other important things.
23 Notably, creating a separate rate class for
24 hyperscalers and large energy facilities, and a
25 separate not only energy rate class, but water

1 usage class.

2 So what we're doing in the next year
3 and certainly what we'll see by the end of that
4 is companies actually shouldering the costs of
5 buildout and everyday New Yorkers not seeing
6 their energy bills continue to skyrocket because
7 of it.

8 SENATOR MATTERA: Will the sponsor
9 continue to yield, please?

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Does the
11 sponsor yield?

12 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Yes.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
14 sponsor yields.

15 SENATOR MATTERA: Do you feel,
16 Senator, that -- oh, I'm sorry {inaudible}. Do
17 you feel that you should have maybe looked into
18 doing a study on something like this before to go
19 put a moratorium? A study bill?

20 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Through you,
21 Mr. President. I put forward this bill because I
22 believe this is the best solution and that
23 hyperscale data centers pose an energy threat we
24 haven't seen before.

25 If there are additional studies that

1 are needed, certainly my colleague is welcome to
2 introduce those bills.

3 SENATOR MATTERA: Through you,
4 Mr. President, will the sponsor continue to
5 yield?

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Does the
7 sponsor yield?

8 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Yes.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
10 sponsor yields.

11 SENATOR MATTERA: Do you feel that
12 your bill is going to be turning away business?
13 Because, you know, we have not just with the --
14 which we're going to get into, the trades, but
15 we're going to get into the Business Council.

16 Do you feel that, in other words,
17 this is something that we care about New York
18 State so much to bring business in? So guess
19 what, so we could have, you know, great jobs for
20 our future. We talk about it all the time to
21 bring business in. And this is just going to
22 hurt people that want to come to this state, to
23 say what's next.

24 Do you feel, in other words, that
25 this is going to hurt business coming into our

1 state?

2 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Through you,
3 Mr. President. Economic development and business
4 is important to us. That's why this bill is
5 narrow in scope. That is why we are only
6 including DEC permits for large energy facilities
7 20 megawatts and above, as I've stated several
8 times.

9 Now, this means that every other
10 data center is not going to be a part of this
11 moratorium. It also means that we will have the
12 ability to implement things like a project labor
13 agreement to have labor standards so that when
14 these larger energy facilities are built, we're
15 not only benefiting from the business here in
16 New York State, we're actually creating union
17 jobs and good-paying jobs at that.

18 So this bill was intentionally
19 written to balance our energy needs and our need
20 to plan as a state, but also to have a shorter
21 pause in order to not completely disincentivize
22 these centers moving forward.

23 SENATOR MATTERA: Through you,
24 Mr. President, will the sponsor still continue to
25 yield?

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Does the
2 sponsor yield?

3 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Yes.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
5 sponsor yields.

6 SENATOR MATTERA: You know,
7 Senator, I've been having discussions with all
8 the trades and they are very, very upset about
9 this bill, very much so.

10 Did you ever have any conversations
11 with the union trades like myself, being a union
12 brother and sister of the trades, and the
13 Business Council at all to talk about your bill?

14 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Through you,
15 Mr. President, yes, the building trades were
16 engaged. That is why we see labor language in
17 this bill.

18 And the alternative, I would remind
19 the chamber, is do to nothing in this space.
20 That would mean approvals would go forward
21 without any of these labor standards.

22 So the labor standards are
23 representative of what they've asked for, it's
24 representative certainly of our constituents, and
25 it's representative of the need to make sure that

1 the trades have more jobs in the future.

2 SENATOR MATTERA: Through you,
3 Mr. President, would the Senator continue to
4 yield.

5 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Yes, I do.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Does the
7 sponsor yield? The sponsor yields.

8 SENATOR MATTERA: Senator, if you
9 don't mind, can you tell me what trades that you
10 had conversations with, please?

11 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Through you,
12 Mr. President, I've spoken to the pipe trades,
13 I've spoken to the building trades, and think
14 they understand that New York, as much as we want
15 to continue building, we also are in an energy
16 crisis.

17 While they oppose this bill, as they
18 would any construction moratorium, I think it's
19 also important to note that the idea that these
20 jobs will not exist in a year or that businesses
21 will go somewhere is a misunderstanding of the
22 technology itself. It is true that developers
23 can go wherever they want to go. Right now these
24 hyperscalers are used for generative AI, they're
25 used for large language models. And when you use

1 ChatGPT, for the most part your response is
2 coming from a data center in Virginia.

3 But in order to have the fastest
4 products, in order to be the most competitive in
5 the market, companies -- and again, these big
6 tech companies are really who we're talking
7 about -- want to have their data centers as close
8 as possible because that improves latency.

9 And so in a year, that desire and
10 economic incentive for them won't change, but it
11 will actually probably increase given how many
12 more consumers are adopting generative AI in
13 their worklife and in their personal lives.

14 SENATOR MATTERA: Through you, will
15 the Senator continue to yield?

16 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Yes.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Does the
18 sponsor yield? The sponsor yields.

19 SENATOR MATTERA: I'm going to ask
20 you again because, Senator, I've had conversation
21 with the trades. You still didn't mention, was
22 it Gary LaBarbera, the building trades president?
23 Was it anybody in the building -- you know, with
24 the building -- the councils? I really would
25 like to know. Matty Arasich?

1 Was it the, you know, trades --
2 because they're the ones that called me up to say
3 to, Please have this discussion where you just
4 say, Please, this is going to be hurting tens of
5 thousands of good union jobs, the hardworking men
6 and women of labor. That's what this is going to
7 do.

8 They're frightened because, you know
9 what, you're going to continue -- you sit there
10 and say a year. A year is going to go by like
11 this, and then they're frightened that you're
12 going to be doing this again with another
13 moratorium. So please, I'm asking you, who did
14 you speak to?

15 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Through you,
16 Mr. President. I know that leadership was in
17 contact with Gary LaBarbera.

18 But it is not custom in this chamber
19 to give a list of names of contacts. I know we
20 have our own individual relationships. Although
21 I'm happy to talk more to my colleague offline.

22 I would also note that as state
23 legislators, we have to balance interests.
24 That's why we went down from a three-year
25 moratorium to a one-year moratorium. That was

1 responsive to the pushback that we were hearing
2 and the opposition that I mentioned.

3 But the other piece that we have to
4 balance is that in addition to the short-term
5 jobs that could potentially be made in the next
6 year just by starting right away, we need to
7 balance our constituents' needs to have
8 affordable energy bills. And that's what we're
9 doing here.

10 If we do nothing, we may get some
11 short-term jobs in the next year, but that will
12 still be there at the end of this year, to be
13 clear, but we would also be risking all of us as
14 everyday ratepayers having those costs socialized
15 and reflected, in the next rate case, in our
16 energy bills.

17 And so this bill really is a balance
18 of interests.

19 SENATOR MATTERA: Through you,
20 Mr. President, would the Senator continue to
21 yield?

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Does the
23 sponsor yield?

24 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Yes.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The

1 sponsor yields.

2 SENATOR MATTERA: Senator, I
3 disagree with you with a one-year moratorium.
4 It's going to then turn into next year more and
5 more.

6 You and I are colleagues on the
7 Energy Committee. I want to ask you a quick
8 question. Wind, solar and battery storage. You
9 are somebody that talks about that. You want to
10 get rid of the peaker plants; it causes asthma,
11 all this.

12 First of all, I am very, very proud
13 that the NESE pipeline came in, right, into our
14 area on Long Island, 2.3 million homes and
15 businesses, because it is a necessity with the
16 PSC. What is your answer to making sure that we
17 have energy sources for any data centers? And a
18 year is going to do this?

19 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Through you,
20 Mr. President. That's exactly why we're passing
21 this bill. It is not for me to have that plan.

22 This plan -- a plan like that needs
23 to be informed by the environmental impact
24 review. There's a lot of information we do not
25 have, including a list of where all the data

1 centers are, or what their expected demand will
2 be and how much we'll need to build out renewable
3 energy or fossil fuel infrastructure in order to
4 support them -- and hopefully not the latter, the
5 former.

6 But I would add that the PSC is
7 currently having its own process. So this is
8 working in tandem with the questions the PSC are
9 asking. This would give information to the DEC,
10 and this would certainly give information to our
11 Legislature in the next legislative session to
12 see if there are any bills that need to be passed
13 to properly plan and support buildout of energy
14 to meet current and future demand.

15 SENATOR MATTERA: Through you,
16 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
17 yield, please.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
19 sponsor yield?

20 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Yes.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
22 sponsor yields.

23 SENATOR MATTERA: You know, you
24 mentioned about the water supply and everything
25 like that. Do you realize that these data

1 centers, we have a closed-loop system? You know,
2 we have cooling towers. Do you realize that?

3 In other words, I know you were
4 concerned about the water supply. Do you
5 realize, in other words, they're talking about
6 thermal energy being also to create energy at
7 these facilities?

8 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Through you,
9 Mr. President. Closed-loop systems aren't the
10 only way that data centers support cooling.

11 And I would say that when we talk
12 about water usage, it's often in terms of
13 individual queries. But training these models,
14 which happens on an ongoing basis, actually is
15 incredibly water and energy intensive.

16 And so we don't have an accurate
17 idea outside of even these cooling systems how
18 much more demand there will be on our water
19 supply and where those water supplies will be,
20 whether they are lakes, potable water, or fresh
21 drinking water moving forward.

22 SENATOR MATTERA: Through you,
23 Mr. President, just a couple more questions.
24 Would the Senator continue to yield?

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Does the

1 sponsor yield?

2 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Yes.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
4 sponsor yields.

5 SENATOR MATTERA: Senator, what
6 does this do about local control? What does this
7 do to hurt local control?

8 We talk about that a lot, that, you
9 know, we do not -- we have people that do a great
10 job with the counties and the towns and the
11 villages, with them with local control. Have you
12 talked to -- because I'm telling you, I haven't
13 heard that. Have you talked to 62 counties in
14 our State of New York at all to ask how they feel
15 about a moratorium?

16 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Through you,
17 Mr. President. I think it is notable that there
18 are over 69 memos of support that represent
19 organizations and a significant number of
20 New Yorkers.

21 While we haven't received feedback
22 from every town board, I would say that it's
23 important to note that the Town of Dryden did I
24 believe a moratorium in Monroe County {sic}. I
25 believe Brookdale is coming forward.

1 In the absence of state legislation,
2 as I've mentioned, local governments have been
3 implementing bans. And nationwide, that's
4 happened more than the opposite.

5 I would also add that it is unfair
6 to expect local governments to have to engage
7 with the wealthiest companies in the world --
8 Google, Amazon, Meta, Microsoft. Because when
9 you put those tech goliaths in a room with a
10 local government, I would bet a lot of the times
11 they have the resources to win whatever they
12 want.

13 What this bill does is allow us as
14 state legislators to take on the responsibility
15 of saying that there should be clear standards of
16 community benefits that wouldn't otherwise be
17 negotiated, community engagement, which isn't
18 otherwise mandated, to actually happen and
19 empower those local governments, empower those
20 local boards and local constituents to get the
21 most out of each of these potential deals.

22 And the last thing I'd mention on
23 permitting, this does nothing -- because it is
24 just a DEC permit, it does nothing to change the
25 power of local governments to issue local permits

1 in the process, as well as IDAs to continue to
2 negotiate.

3 SENATOR MATTERA: Through you,
4 Madam President, just one more question. Would
5 the sponsor yield, please?

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the
7 sponsor yield?

8 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Yes.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
10 sponsor yields.

11 SENATOR MATTERA: So you just said
12 that, in other words, that New York State with
13 this bill will supersede local control, because
14 you want to take the burden off of them because
15 they do not know how to handle big business.

16 Which on Long Island, we have over
17 3 million people, we know how to handle our
18 business, our county executives, our town
19 supervisors, our village supervisors do a great,
20 great job. And I'm very proud that I personally
21 vote for them.

22 So again, to go sit there and say --
23 you just said it -- to take away pretty much
24 local control is, I'm telling you, very
25 insulting.

1 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Through you,
2 Madam President. I would like to be clear.

3 What this bill is doing is evening
4 the playing field by requiring public engagement
5 before a permit is released, requiring community
6 benefits and making sure that these tech goliaths
7 are brought to the table and held accountable and
8 are shouldering the costs.

9 I would say that, again, adds to
10 empowering local governments that will continue
11 to be the ones in the room having those
12 engagement sessions, having the negotiations, and
13 approving or choosing not to approve local
14 permits.

15 And the other piece I mentioned for
16 New Yorkers is we're legislators. That is what
17 we do, we legislate for the whole state. So it
18 is not uncommon to pass statewide regulations in
19 this chamber, and I think it's actually part of
20 our responsibility in this chamber to pass
21 statewide standards.

22 SENATOR MATTERA: On the bill.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
24 Mattera on the bill.

25 SENATOR MATTERA: You know, all

1 New Yorkers need to understand something, that a
2 bill like this supersedes all local laws.

3 You know, as somebody that was in
4 the trades, this is hurting all the hardworking
5 men in the union trades -- that in other words,
6 there's a PLA on this project, all these
7 projects, and we're very proud of that. The
8 leaders called me up from the unions to say,
9 Please, we're nervous, we feel that, in other
10 words, down the line this is going to continue,
11 and it's going to hurt progress.

12 Right now we have other states and
13 other countries that are going to surpass us
14 because of bills just like this that are hurting
15 businesses that are coming here in this state.
16 We say we want to attract businesses. We say
17 that this state is affordable, which it's not.
18 There's a reason why we have everybody exiting
19 out of this state -- 2.5 million exited out of
20 this state since 2020. We'll have another
21 6 million in five more years with the study, from
22 the Marist study saying that we're going to have
23 more people leaving.

24 Businesses don't want to come here.
25 They don't. They say: Why, with all this?

1 They're nervous. And you know who's nervous?
2 The hardworking men and women of labor, because
3 they're the backbone of the economy. Without
4 construction and construction workers that brings
5 in revenue -- and, you know what, apprenticeship
6 programs. We know what AI is going to be doing.
7 The trades are going to be healthier because of
8 projects like this because AI is scary. It's
9 going to be taking away a lot of jobs from a lot
10 of people.

11 I have the job fairs and go to the
12 schools with the job fairs. I talk to the kids.
13 And they say to them, Watch what you're going to
14 college for. Make sure there's going to be a job
15 for you.

16 Am I nervous about AI? Yes, I am.
17 But you know what? The construction workers need
18 to go to work. And you know what, the
19 apprenticeship programs are getting larger and
20 larger and larger for a lot of reasons. But to
21 go and to put a moratorium on, and everybody
22 looks -- and it's going to happen again and again
23 and again. Because one year is going to do
24 absolutely nothing. It's going to be doing
25 nothing.

1 Our energy source, we put all our
2 eggs in one basket. Wind, solar, and battery
3 storage. That's the reason why again I'm going
4 to say, guess what, natural gas. We had to bring
5 it in. Guess what? It was a necessity again.

6 I know my colleagues were not happy
7 on the Energy Committee this year. They
8 definitely weren't. Do we know the Constitution
9 Pipeline needs to come in also too? It's a
10 necessity. It has to happen.

11 And you know what, to retool our
12 existing power plants. Yes, carbon capture.
13 That's what needs to be done. And you know,
14 again, this bill does absolutely nothing but
15 stall progress.

16 For that, Madam President, I vote
17 no.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
19 Helming, why do you rise?

20 SENATOR HELMING: Thank you,
21 Madam President. If the sponsor will yield for a
22 couple of questions.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Sure.

24 Will the sponsor yield?

25 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Yes.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
2 sponsor yields.

3 SENATOR HELMING: Thank you,
4 Senator. I'm just looking for some clarification
5 on a couple of the responses that I heard during
6 the previous debate. I thought I heard you say
7 that this legislation will have no impact on
8 existing data centers. Is that accurate?

9 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Through you,
10 Madam President. The question was on permitting
11 and the ability to build. So the -- as I
12 explained earlier, if an existing data center has
13 received all of their permits, then this
14 moratorium piece would not impact them.

15 If the clarification -- and I don't
16 want to speak for my colleague, so feel free to
17 ask follow-up questions -- is on other data
18 centers that may be impacted by parts of this
19 bill, some parts that I'm really excited about
20 include, for data centers 1 megawatt and above,
21 renewable energy or efficiency standards.

22 SENATOR HELMING: Through you,
23 Madam President, if the sponsor will continue to
24 yield.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the

1 sponsor yield?

2 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Yes.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
4 sponsor yields.

5 SENATOR HELMING: So, Senator, I
6 was looking at the section that talks about
7 someone who is currently operating a data center
8 is going to have to come into compliance with all
9 of the various energy consumption efficiency
10 goals that are developed after they've already
11 been in business for a number of years.

12 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Through you,
13 Madam President. An operational data center at
14 over 1 megawatt, which is enough to power a
15 thousand homes, I want to be clear, a data center
16 that's -- and many that exist that fall under the
17 1 megawatt threshold continue to operate, they
18 would not have the same energy efficiency goals.

19 SENATOR HELMING: Through you,
20 Madam President, if the sponsor would continue to
21 yield.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the
23 sponsor yield?

24 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Yes.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The

1 sponsor yields.

2 SENATOR HELMING: So also during
3 the previous exchange, questions and answers, it
4 sounds like there's a lot of work to be done over
5 the 12 months of the moratorium. Senator, I
6 think you referred to it's an exciting time
7 because at the end of the 12 months, this body,
8 this legislative body, will have clear standards
9 we could use to base legislation on.

10 SENATOR GONZALEZ: That's not what
11 I said. I said at the end of the 12 months --
12 but actually, to be clear, I was specific to the
13 end of the environmental impact review, we will
14 have more information as a body in addition to
15 the entire state. Because the results of the
16 review will be publicly available to all local
17 governments, New Yorkers, anyone who is
18 interested in understanding the full impacts of
19 hyperscale data centers in New York State.

20 SENATOR HELMING: Through you,
21 Madam President, if the sponsor will continue to
22 yield.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the
24 sponsor yield?

25 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Yes.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
2 sponsor yields.

3 SENATOR HELMING: Senator, who will
4 be involved with creating the energy consumption
5 efficiency goals? Which stakeholders will be
6 engaged?

7 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Through you,
8 Madam President. I know the NYSERDA, in
9 conjunction with the NYISO, in conjunction with
10 the Public Service Commission, as I mentioned,
11 and the New York State Climate Action Council.

12 SENATOR HELMING: Through you,
13 Madam President, if the sponsor will continue to
14 yield.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the
16 sponsor yield?

17 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Yes.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
19 sponsor yields.

20 SENATOR HELMING: What about the
21 federally designated bulk system operators?

22 SENATOR GONZALEZ: That's NYISO.

23 SENATOR HELMING: Okay. Through
24 you, Madam President, if the sponsor will
25 continue to yield.

1 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Yes.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
3 sponsor yields.

4 SENATOR HELMING: So we have one,
5 two, three, four -- at least four agencies. And
6 how -- I'm just trying to understand how
7 realistic it is that these agencies are going to
8 be able to collect and analyze data, assess the
9 impacts on the grid, develop efficiency metrics,
10 determine compliance standards, coordinate with
11 utilities and stakeholders, produce findings and
12 recommendations, and I think the sponsor said
13 hold five public hearings around the state and
14 publish the results in 12 months time.

15 How realistic is that?

16 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Through you,
17 Madam President, in 18 months is when the
18 environmental impact report is due.

19 And I think that's realistic because
20 a lot of the organizations on that list do
21 variations of that every day.

22 I also think for a state as big as
23 New York, five is a reasonable number because we
24 know that the needs of downstate aren't just all
25 New York City, we know we have to think about

1 Long Island, we know we have to think about
2 Western New York, we know we have to think about
3 the North Country. I've already mentioned four
4 different areas. And the Hudson Valley, that
5 makes five.

6 Now, I'm not saying those are where
7 they're going to be, but what I imagine is five
8 actually allowing us to get a better sense of
9 what our own constituents and the state broadly
10 thinks about hyperscale data centers.

11 SENATOR HELMING: Through you,
12 Madam President, if the sponsor will continue to
13 yield.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the
15 sponsor yield?

16 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Yes.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
18 sponsor yields.

19 SENATOR HELMING: Whether it's
20 12 months or 18 months, it still seems like a
21 very aggressive schedule. And my question is,
22 what happens if this work isn't completed in that
23 time frame?

24 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Through you,
25 Madam President. I agree, that is an aggressive

1 time frame.

2 We actually wanted initially a
3 three-year moratorium to give us as much time as
4 possible. But for the reasons we've mentioned in
5 this debate already, to balance our need for
6 economic development and a desire to continue
7 moving forward in innovation and generative AI,
8 we've shortened both the timeline for the
9 moratorium and the environmental impact report.

10 Now, I hope as my colleague
11 understands with any reporting in this state,
12 we -- it is incumbent on us as a chamber and as
13 members to follow up to make sure that they are
14 on schedule and that we receive that report
15 within the timeline.

16 SENATOR HELMING: Thank you,
17 Madam President. I thank my colleague for the
18 responses.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
20 Borrello.

21 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you,
22 Madam President. On the bill.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
24 Borrello on the bill.

25 SENATOR BORRELLO: So this is a

1 controversial topic. And we have data centers
2 being proposed in different parts of our state,
3 one of them in my district.

4 But you know what? I have never
5 seen Albany study something and make it better,
6 quite honestly. I've never seen Albany send a
7 directive and make it better. And what this bill
8 will do is it's taking away local decision-making
9 and local control.

10 You know, I've been asked by my
11 constituents where I stand. I stand with local
12 governments making this decision. Why? Because
13 I spent 10 years in county government. And every
14 time the state government came down on us, it was
15 never good. It was just a one-size-fits-all,
16 politically driven agenda. Most of the time to
17 burden us with the expense and cover for their
18 mistakes.

19 And that's what this is about. This
20 moratorium is not about responsible -- which
21 isn't a word, responsible development. It's
22 about covering up for New York State's failed
23 energy policies. It wasn't that long ago the
24 Governor was talking about making New York State
25 the world center for AI. And we're going to

1 develop all this stuff and we're going to be the
2 hub for AI.

3 Well, how the hell are you going to
4 do that with no energy? She had the opportunity
5 to do what she's doing now -- desperately trying
6 to bring more energy online, desperately trying
7 to get you folks on the other side of the aisle
8 to agree to repower traditional baseload power.
9 And we're not doing it.

10 So really what this is about is
11 admitting that you have failed in having
12 responsible energy policy here in New York State.
13 That you shut down power plants, that you've
14 wasted time and billions of dollar with these
15 boondoggle green energy projects.

16 You know what I'd like to see? I
17 would love to see a responsible re-energy act
18 that pauses all of these ridiculous solar sprawl
19 and wind that's going off across New York State,
20 that's gobbling up tens of thousands of acres of
21 good farmland across New York State.

22 I'd like to see a responsible act to
23 pause that, and let's come up with some better
24 ideas, some more responsible ways of handling it.
25 Because right now you've created very little

1 energy and you've blanketed the beautiful parts
2 of our state with these ridiculous wind and solar
3 projects. They pop up overnight. Where is the
4 responsibility there?

5 I was told, I heard in the debate
6 that these big companies -- that local
7 governments just can't deal with these big tech
8 companies. And yet we have all of these foreign
9 companies coming in and negotiating with all of
10 these local governments. And what do we do? We
11 actually tell them, Don't worry about the legal
12 stuff, the solar company, the wind company, their
13 attorney that they're paying is going to
14 negotiate for both sides.

15 That's worked out really, really
16 well, hasn't it? You've allowed them to come in
17 and scam our local governments. You think that's
18 okay, because it fits your political agenda.

19 So don't tell me this is about
20 trying to protect local governments. It's not.
21 It's about trying to override them. There are
22 projects in the works that are going to provide
23 good-paying jobs and transformational funding for
24 needed infrastructure. And those are going to
25 come to an end after local governments and local

1 economic development corporations have done
2 everything they can to negotiate the best deal
3 that they can.

4 And by the way, wind and solar
5 provides almost nothing except pain and
6 destroying our quality of life. That's what it's
7 provided to local governments. Not a single job.
8 All these wind projects, all these solar
9 projects, zero jobs. Zero.

10 I've heard this is going to raise
11 our energy prices. Well, here in New York State
12 we have approximately 120 to 140 data centers.
13 Not a lot. Now, compare that to the State of
14 Virginia. Just Northern Virginia has 550 data
15 centers -- 550 versus us at about 120, 130, call
16 it what you want. Their cost per kilowatt hour
17 for electricity is half of New York State's,
18 half.

19 So it's not data centers that's
20 going to raise our electricity prices. It's
21 irresponsible policies out of this body that have
22 raised our electricity prices. It's the
23 boondoggle green energy projects that are -- the
24 cost of infrastructure is built into -- hidden,
25 excuse me, inside of those delivery charges.

1 It's the fact that we told energy companies,
2 don't invest in here, don't invest in
3 infrastructure, don't build new power plants.
4 Because we're going to put you out of business.
5 And you think you're going to -- in a year you're
6 going to pause this for a year and you're going
7 to figure out a way to power data centers with
8 windmills and solar panels? No, you're not.
9 Absolutely not.

10 So you're doing this and you're
11 actually saying we're going to pause it for a
12 year but we're not going to get the data in,
13 we're not going to get the answers for 18 months.
14 How's that going to work? How are you going to
15 pause something for a year and not get your
16 answers to your questions for a year and a half?
17 That's not going to work either.

18 I'm not saying that I want data
19 centers. What I am saying is that if we are
20 going to be the leader in AI, whether it's New
21 York State or the United States, data centers are
22 part of that.

23 If we're going to actually try to be
24 the leader, the world leader in artificial
25 intelligence so we can do it better and more

1 responsibly than anywhere else in the world,
2 we're going to need power to do that. And
3 enemies of the United States know that this is a
4 problem here. The enemies of the United States
5 are investing in propaganda against these
6 data centers so as to beat the United States at
7 this game. That's why they are spreading the
8 propaganda. They're organized. Look at some of
9 the money that's flowing into these anti-data
10 centers organizations. It's not organic, it's
11 calculated. And it's calculated by the enemies
12 of the United States.

13 When we take away that local
14 control, what we are saying is we are better than
15 you, smarter than you, know more than you. I
16 know people on our local economic development
17 organizations, our IDAs, local economic
18 development corporations. These are business
19 owners, smart people that have built corporations
20 and built businesses that employed people from
21 nothing. I can't say that for most of the people
22 in this room or the room next door. Most of you
23 have never employed a single person in your life
24 except for the government employees that you
25 have.

1 So you're going to tell me that
2 you're smarter than someone that has built a
3 successful business from nothing? Or has been a
4 farmer, a local farmer with generations, that you
5 guys know better than they do? I don't think you
6 do. It's this arrogance that we know better.

7 So whatever we decide to do here
8 today is going to determine whether or not AI is
9 going to be a New York thing or a somewhere else
10 thing, whether it's Pennsylvania or China.
11 That's what you're going to determine today. And
12 I want the communities that want this in their
13 community to have the opportunity to do it. And
14 the ones that don't do not have to.

15 But to sit here and say that we are
16 going to do this ban while ignoring the fact that
17 we don't have the power and we don't have the
18 infrastructure to deliver that power is foolish.
19 To sit here and say that we are going to wait for
20 enough wind and solar projects -- which if they
21 blanketed all of New York State, if you took up
22 every square inch of this state, it still won't
23 be enough to power the needs that we have here
24 right now -- is also irresponsible.

25 So I'm going to vote no on this

1 because I want to keep local control. I'm going
2 to vote no because I know that this is just a
3 ruse, a red herring to cover for the disastrous
4 energy policies that you have visited upon the
5 people of New York State. I'm going to vote no
6 because I don't think, at the end of the day,
7 anybody in this room is quite frankly responsible
8 enough to determine the outcome for any local
9 organization, any local government, anyone's
10 local quality of life.

11 That's why I'm voting no. Thank
12 you, Madam President.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
14 you, Senator.

15 Are there any other Senators wishing
16 to be heard?

17 Senator Walczyk, why do you rise?

18 SENATOR WALCZYK: Madam President,
19 would the sponsor yield?

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the
21 sponsor yield?

22 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Yes.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
24 sponsor yields.

25 SENATOR WALCZYK: Through you,

1 Madam President.

2 So the Governor created the
3 Empire AI Consortium. The Governor, with your
4 support, budgeted \$90 million in tax money to
5 create data centers in New York. The Governor
6 created the AI and Future of the Workforce
7 Advisory Panel. You've obviously -- and I sit on
8 Internet and Tech, and you've legislated a number
9 of different regulatory things with the sort of
10 perspective that New York is going lead on the AI
11 and data center industry, and that's why we need
12 to put all of these rules and regs in place,
13 because we're going to be leaders.

14 And the Governor has recently said
15 if AI is destined to reconfigure the global
16 economy, New York must be on the front line. She
17 also said whoever is at the forefront of
18 artificial intelligence will dominate the next
19 chapter of human history.

20 Was this negotiated with the
21 Governor?

22 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Through you,
23 Mr. President, that is a misunderstanding of how
24 our legislative process tends to work here. We
25 introduce bills in the Assembly and the Senate,

1 and we negotiate them usually through -- between
2 the two chambers. And when hopefully they're
3 passed through both chambers and hopefully sent
4 to the Governor's desk, there is a chapter
5 amendment process where the Governor is able to
6 negotiate.

7 So therefore, Madam --
8 Mr. President, hi -- I would say that is not
9 where we are in the current process.

10 SENATOR WALCZYK: Mr. President,
11 would the sponsor continue to yield?

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
13 sponsor yield?

14 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Yes.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
16 sponsor yields.

17 SENATOR WALCZYK: Without talking
18 down to me about the legislative process, the
19 question was pretty simple. Was this bill
20 negotiated with the Governor's office or not?

21 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Through you,
22 Mr. President, I think I was pretty clear that I
23 negotiated this bill with my colleagues, with
24 leadership and our friends in the Assembly.

25 SENATOR WALCZYK: And through you,

1 Mr. President, would the sponsor continue to
2 yield?

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
4 sponsor yield?

5 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Yes.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
7 sponsor yields.

8 SENATOR WALCZYK: Is the Governor
9 going to veto this bill?

10 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Through you,
11 Mr. President, that is a question for the
12 Governor.

13 SENATOR WALCZYK: Thank you,
14 Mr. President.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
16 Stec, why do you rise?

17 SENATOR STEC: If the sponsor would
18 yield for a quick question.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
20 sponsor yield?

21 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Yes.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
23 sponsor yields.

24 SENATOR STEC: Thank you,
25 Mr. President, through you.

1 I'm not sure I heard an answer to
2 this question. I just want to make sure we are
3 crystal-clear. If this moratorium goes into
4 effect, what happens to a data center that's
5 already been approved, it's under construction,
6 but it's not yet operational? Is that affected
7 or caught up in this moratorium, or will it be
8 allowed to proceed and go online?

9 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Through you,
10 Mr. President. If they've already received their
11 permits from the DEC, they will proceed and
12 continue to build and not be impacted by this
13 moratorium.

14 SENATOR STEC: Thank you,
15 Mr. President.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Are there
17 any other Senators wishing to be heard?

18 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
19 closed.

20 The Secretary will ring the bell.
21 Senator Gianaris.

22 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
23 we've agreed to restore this bill to the
24 noncontroversial calendar.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Upon

1 consent, the bill will be restored to the
2 noncontroversial calendar.

3 Read the last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
5 act shall take effect immediately.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
10 Zellner to explain his vote.

11 SENATOR ZELLNER: Thank you,
12 Mr. President.

13 And thank you, Senator Gonzalez, for
14 your courageous, great work on this bill.

15 I disagree with Senator Borrello.
16 This isn't about local control, this about the
17 people. And the people are crying out for
18 leadership from this body to do something about
19 this issue.

20 Yesterday hundreds of residents
21 packed a meeting in the Town of Tonawanda
22 regarding the proposed data center at the former
23 Tonawanda Coke site. They came from different
24 backgrounds, different neighborhoods, and
25 different perspectives, but they were all there

1 for the same reason. They have questions, and
2 they do not believe those questions have been
3 answered.

4 For weeks my staff and I have been
5 hearing from residents who are trying to
6 understand what these projects could mean for
7 their communities. They're asking about energy
8 demand, water usages, infrastructure and utility
9 bills. And they deserve answers.

10 The proposed Tonawanda data center
11 may be on hold today, but this conversation is
12 far from over. Just outside my district a major
13 project continues moving forward in Niagara.
14 Another is being discussed in Genesee County.
15 And we know across the state more proposals are
16 being considered.

17 And before we hand over permits,
18 infrastructure, tax incentives and access to our
19 power grid, we have an obligation to make sure
20 New Yorkers are getting a fair deal. Because if
21 these companies are going to profit from our
22 communities, then our communities should benefit
23 from their investment.

24 We cannot allow working families to
25 subsidize billion-dollar companies through higher

1 utility bills, strained infrastructure, or
2 decisions that are leaving communities with all
3 the consequences and none of the say.

4 As a father, I take that seriously.
5 I do not want my children growing up in a
6 community that looks back years from now and
7 says, Why didn't anyone slow this thing down
8 enough to ask some questions?

9 Western New York has learned these
10 tough lessons before --

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
12 Zellner, how do you vote?

13 SENATOR ZELLNER: The people I
14 represent have every right to be skeptical.

15 I vote yes.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
17 Zellner to be recorded in the affirmative.

18 Senator May to explain her vote.

19 SENATOR MAY: Thank you,
20 Mr. President.

21 I represent the Town of Lysander,
22 which is west of Syracuse. It has 23,000 people
23 in it. And a developer has proposed a
24 300-megawatt data center in the Town of Lysander.

25 The people of the town organized,

1 they got their town board to vote for a six-month
2 moratorium so they could just review their zoning
3 laws. But if you look at the Facebook page for
4 this group that organized, they are desperately
5 calling for the state to step in and help them.
6 They're saying, where is DEC? They're saying,
7 can we have a statewide moratorium so that we can
8 really figure this out? Because 300 megawatts is
9 enough power to power 15 towns the size of
10 Lysander. The water usage is estimated to be
11 twice the total water usage of the town
12 currently.

13 So these are decisions that they're
14 having to make on a scale way beyond what a town
15 board normally would be making. And truly it's
16 not reasonable to expect them to be able to
17 figure out where 300 megawatts of energy is going
18 to come from, where that double the amount of
19 water is going to come from.

20 All of these kinds of decisions
21 require a regional approach. And this is why it
22 makes perfect sense for us to take, as a state,
23 action to help these local governments buy a
24 little bit of time so they can figure out what
25 the parameters are and what they need for their

1 districts.

2 So I am happy to vote aye on this
3 bill. Thank you.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
5 May to be recorded in the affirmative.

6 Senator Borrello to explain his
7 vote.

8 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you,
9 Mr. President.

10 You know, I think that if you asked
11 the people of New York State if they thought
12 New York State was helping when they created
13 ORES -- which has allowed these foreign
14 companies, these wind and solar companies to come
15 in and roll over local regulations, to wipe out
16 endangered species, to essentially override every
17 environmental and local zoning law -- I'd say no,
18 they would not think that's a good idea.

19 And yet we're going to sit here and
20 tell people that New York's coming to the rescue
21 right now with data centers. No, we're not.
22 This is just not fitting your political
23 narrative. It's not fitting your agenda.

24 Because everything you say you were
25 worried about you're actually doing right now

1 with these wind and solar projects that are
2 destroying our beautiful landscape, that have
3 raised our energy prices, that have impacted our
4 quality of life, that are endangering our water
5 supplies, our wetlands. So you really don't care
6 about that stuff. It's just a good excuse to
7 cover for the bad work that you've done up until
8 now.

9 I'm voting no.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
11 Borrello to be recorded in the negative.

12 Senator Webb to explain her vote.

13 SENATOR WEBB: Thank you,
14 Mr. President.

15 Georgia, Virginia, Tennessee --
16 these are states that have very large data
17 centers, and in fact they have taken efforts to
18 try to repeal those decisions because of the very
19 toxic drinking water and health challenges that
20 pursue. We don't have to look any further than
21 that.

22 I represent the Southern Tier, and
23 we have very large manufacturing entities over
24 the years that created significant health and
25 environmental hazards.

1 So all we are simply doing as a body
2 is saying pause. That is what our responsibility
3 is as legislators. We have to take facts, not
4 opinion, and figure out what are the best
5 solutions for our communities.

6 I want to thank Senator Gonzalez and
7 everyone that's been working on this. We know
8 that one of the many things we are often trying
9 to address is striking a balance between the need
10 for job creation -- but at the end of the day, if
11 we have no place where we can live, the jobs go
12 out the window.

13 And so I think it's important, as we
14 look into this very important issue, that we take
15 the time that is needed to figure out what are
16 going to be the long-term effects, not just
17 simply the costs financially, but the health,
18 environmental and other costs that we know to be
19 true.

20 I vote aye, Mr. President.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
22 Webb to be recorded in the affirmative.

23 Senator Fahy to explain her vote.

24 SENATOR FAHY: Thank you,
25 Mr. President.

1 I too stand to vote aye on this
2 bill. AI, as mentioned earlier, represents the
3 largest shift in our economy since the Industrial
4 revolution. It includes the shift we have seen,
5 an explosive growth in data centers. While we
6 all rely on AI, what we are looking for here is a
7 moratorium. We must ensure that ratepayers, who
8 we talk a lot about, are not left footing the
9 bill for this unchecked growth.

10 Large-scale data centers consume
11 enormous amounts of energy and water, placing an
12 additional strain on the grid which can drive up
13 costs for residential customers. Before we move
14 with these, we need to understand the impacts of
15 energy demand, the utility rates, land use, water
16 resources, and more.

17 A moratorium is not a ban, not a
18 ban. It's a pause. It's a pause that allows
19 New York to proceed with thoughtful standards.
20 One year so that communities can have more of a
21 voice as these projects move forward.

22 Right here in the Capital Region,
23 the community has felt a bit caught off-guard, to
24 put it as mildly as possible, with one right here
25 in our backyard being proposed, a 180-megawatt

1 one. The residents are rightfully asking
2 difficult questions: Who benefits, who bears the
3 costs, how do we protect the ratepayers, how do
4 we protect our natural resources and our water?

5 We need these questions answered
6 before, not after. I commend the sponsor. I
7 commend the leader. And I vote aye.

8 Thank you, Mr. President.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
10 Fahy to be recorded in the affirmative.

11 Senator Rivera to explain his vote.

12 SENATOR RIVERA: Thank you,
13 Mr. President.

14 First of all, I'd just like to take
15 a second to say, great job, Kristen. We have an
16 amazing colleague who obviously did her homework
17 here.

18 And then I want to speak to our
19 colleagues who are voting nay on this. And I'd
20 like for you to reconsider. Because I think that
21 some of you all are confused. When these data
22 centers come, they're not going to come to the
23 Bronx. They're not going to come to Queens.
24 They're going to come to your districts. You're
25 the folks that have these large, enormous spaces

1 that have no population in them, and that's where
2 these things are going to go.

3 And these are going to be right next
4 to small towns that are going to get less water,
5 that are going to have all sorts of power issues.
6 Everything that we've laid out here has already
7 happened in other states.

8 All that we're saying with this is
9 we're going to stop for a second, and we're going
10 to make sure that we set it up so that there can
11 be local decision-making so that this can
12 actually be done in a way that benefits the State
13 of New York.

14 Y'all, by voting no, remember, it's
15 going to go to y'all. So I would really
16 appreciate if you'd just think about it for a
17 second. It is a wise thing to press the pause
18 button and to get it right.

19 So Mr. President, I vote in the
20 affirmative.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
22 Rivera to be recorded in the affirmative.

23 Are there any other Senators wishing
24 to be explain their vote?

25 Seeing and hearing none,

1 Senator Gonzalez to close.

2 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Thank you,
3 Mr. President.

4 This is a significant moment for
5 New York State. We will be one of the first
6 states to pass a moratorium on the building of
7 large data centers. And the reason that's
8 important is because we're acknowledging we're
9 not only in a climate crisis, not only in an
10 energy crisis, but we're in an affordability
11 crisis.

12 And while my colleague across the
13 aisle and Big Tech would like us to do nothing,
14 doing nothing means that we would let these costs
15 be passed down to our constituents.

16 This bill is more than a moratorium.
17 This bill creates a separate energy class for the
18 largest data centers. It creates a separate rate
19 class for water usage for them. It creates
20 community benefits, community engagement, and it
21 gives the state an actual environmental impact
22 report to be informed in our policies moving
23 forward.

24 And that's important because for the
25 first time, we're putting New Yorkers in the

1 driver's seat over Big Tech. Because for too
2 long they have enjoyed either having no
3 regulations or writing their own rules. Doing
4 this not only means that our energy bills are
5 protected and that affordability is at the
6 forefront, but it also means that real
7 New Yorkers have a voice in this process.

8 And this isn't a normal threat. I
9 want to be clear because there's been a lot of
10 misinformation about this bill and who it applies
11 to and what it does. Hyperscale centers are on a
12 scale we have literally never seen before. And
13 it is not existential to say that the energy
14 demand that is increasing is because of these
15 data centers. The New York State Independent
16 Systems Operator says that with the approximately
17 28 large data centers in their queue, they would
18 add an additional 9,682 megawatts of energy to
19 our currently constrained and aging grid.

20 This is an 11-times increase in
21 energy demand from data centers and, by 2030,
22 increases the gap by which our current demand and
23 our energy generation will see. And that's
24 without those centers coming online.

25 So we know this isn't fear-based,

1 this is fact-based. We know it's our
2 responsibility to have a plan and do something.
3 And I am so proud to be in a chamber that has
4 stood up and done exactly that.

5 I want to say thank you to
6 Senator Krueger because without her leadership,
7 we certainly would not have made it to this
8 point.

9 And I really want to thank all of
10 the staff that have put in their time and heart
11 and soul -- because this isn't a new bill, this
12 is a bill that is an omnibus encompassing of many
13 bills they've worked on.

14 And so I not only want to thank my
15 own team, Katie, Elan and Hannah, but I want to
16 thank our Senate central staff: Mike, of course;
17 Dan, Grant, Sean, Carissa, Nicole, Malik, Lakeya,
18 Karen, Amanda, and Alex. Thank you for standing
19 up for what is moral and what is right.

20 With that, I enthusiastically vote
21 aye. Thank you.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
23 Gonzalez to be recorded in the affirmative.

24 Announce the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: In relation to

1 Calendar 1787, voting in the negative are
2 Senators Borrello, Chan, Gallivan, Griffo,
3 Helming, Lanza -- excuse me, Senator Helming in
4 the affirmative -- Lanza, Martins, Mattera,
5 Oberacker, Ortt, Rhoads, Ryan, Stec, Tedisco,
6 Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

7 Ayes, 44. Nays, 16.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
9 is passed.

10 Senator Gianaris, that completes the
11 reading of today's controversial calendar.

12 SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you,
13 Mr. President.

14 Just to give my colleagues a sense
15 of the remainder of the evening, we are at the
16 point where we are going to hear some comments
17 from our departing colleagues -- other than
18 myself. And we are waiting for the two leaders
19 to come out for that process.

20 After that, there will be respective
21 party conferences. And after that, we will
22 return to take up the final calendar of the
23 session.

24 So if we can just stand at ease for
25 a couple of minutes while the leaders get out

1 here, and we'll pick it up in a moment.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: We will
3 stand at ease temporarily.

4 (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease
5 at 8:20 p.m.)

6 (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at
7 8:21 p.m.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
9 Senate will return to order.

10 Senator Gianaris.

11 SENATOR GIANARIS: We are ready.
12 We're going to hear from the following members --

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Some
14 order, please. Excuse me, some order, please.
15 Thank you.

16 Senator Gianaris.

17 SENATOR GIANARIS: And just to be
18 clear, for this part of the evening we are only
19 going to hear from the members who are leaving
20 the Senate. This is not the time for tributes to
21 them from the other members; we can do that in
22 conference or in private.

23 But we're going to hear first from
24 Senator Oberacker, then Senator Weik and
25 Senator Martins, and concluding with

1 Senator Kavanagh.

2 So please call on Senator Oberacker.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
4 Oberacker for departing remarks.

5 SENATOR OBERACKER: Thank you,
6 Mr. President.

7 At the Gettysburg ceremony, the
8 Gettysburg ceremony, the featured speaker of that
9 event was a gentleman by the name of Edward
10 Everett. Edward Everett spoke for over two
11 hours. Now, if I asked any of you here in this
12 chamber if you knew who Edward Everett was, I'm
13 sure I'd get the look that I'm seeing now. No.

14 After which our president,
15 Abraham Lincoln, got up and made his iconic
16 speech, which is about three minutes, depending
17 on the cadence.

18 Every one of you in here knows about
19 his speech. Not one of you knows about
20 Edward Everett. So if I'm to be a student of
21 history, I too will keep my remarks short.

22 First and foremost, it's thank you.
23 I've got to say thank you to my wife, Shannon. I
24 may have, you know, brought the ends together,
25 but she tied everything together to make it work.

1 I've got to say thank you to the
2 greatest staff here in Albany, my staff. Lynn,
3 my chief of staff; Mira, my legislative director.
4 I have Julie, Camille, Victoria and Sean. And
5 I'm telling you, once I leave here, folks, you
6 ought to be grabbing these folks, because they
7 are just absolutely amazing, amazing staff.

8 Leader Ortt, I want to say thank
9 you. I want to say thank you for leadership,
10 thank you for taking me into your office and
11 feeling sometimes I was coming into the
12 principal's office at times. But your
13 leadership, your guidance, I truly appreciate it.
14 Thank you. I will carry that with me always.

15 My Republican Conference and my
16 staff. You guys are amazing, absolutely amazing.
17 I'm taking a piece of each and every one of you
18 with me when I leave here. And to that end, I
19 also want to congratulate those that are leaving
20 with me as well, Senator Martins and of course
21 Senator Weik, who I came in with in my initial
22 entry here into Albany.

23 Leader Stewart-Cousins, thank you.
24 Thank you for the cordialities you've shown me,
25 and your guidance. I appreciate that as well. I

1 will take that with me.

2 My Majority members, thank you. You
3 know, you had an effect. You actually softened
4 me, which I didn't think was possible. So for
5 that I'm thankful. For that I'm thankful.

6 I had a much longer speech set, and
7 I was going to have Gerald actually read it --

8 (Laughter.)

9 SENATOR OBERACKER: Because if
10 there's anybody that can take a two-hour speech
11 and do it in two minutes, it would be Gerald.

12 (Laughter.)

13 SENATOR OBERACKER: But I'm going
14 to let him off the hook, I'm going to let him off
15 the hook tonight.

16 Every one of you will have a place
17 at my table. Every one of you will have a dish
18 that I -- hopefully I could prepare with love.
19 Maybe we'll have an adult beverage. Maybe we'll
20 talk -- hopefully not about politics, but maybe,
21 you know, mix a little bit in there to keep me in
22 on things. But you will all be invited, every
23 single one of you.

24 If I was to find one word and really
25 mean this to kind of encompass what I'm trying to

1 say, it's a Hawaiian word. And it's "mahalo."
2 And it means thanks, gratitude, admiration,
3 praise, esteem, regards and respect. Mahalo.
4 Mahalo. Mahalo, Mr. President.

5 Thank you all. God bless you.
6 Cheers. Thank you.

7 (Standing ovation.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
9 you, Senator Oberacker.

10 Senator Weik for departing remarks.

11 SENATOR WEIK: Thank you,
12 Mr. President. Unlike me, I'll try to keep my
13 comments short and sweet. (Pause.)

14 (Laughter.)

15 SENATOR WEIK: Delayed reaction.

16 (Laughter.)

17 SENATOR WEIK: To know me is to
18 know that.

19 So first I'd just like to say thank
20 you. This has been the honor of a lifetime to be
21 able to serve here in this chamber.

22 I thank my constituents for
23 believing in me and sending me here. This has
24 been the best six years of my life. And to
25 experience this is like nothing else in this

1 world.

2 And I know all of you know what I'm
3 talking about, because it's almost like traveling
4 around the world. We're traveling around the
5 state every day that we come here. We hear the
6 common things, we hear the differences. We see
7 and understand the different perspectives and
8 points of view. And to me, that's invaluable.

9 And so I thank you all for sharing
10 your hometowns and your districts with me. It
11 has truly been interesting and eye-opening to see
12 how this state really functions together.

13 So to my colleagues across the
14 aisle, I want to say thank you very much. I've
15 gotten to know some of you, Senator Persaud
16 especially, very well. And I thank you so much
17 for your friendship. Senator Webb, I've gotten
18 to know you too. So I thank you so much for that
19 relationship.

20 I want to thank the Secretary of the
21 Senate, who I've had a nice relationship with as
22 well. She has been there through a lot of my
23 different times.

24 I want to thank our central staff
25 who work so hard to make sure that we're prepared

1 and we know what we need every single day. So
2 thanks, guys, I really appreciate it. I know you
3 sit behind me, so I couldn't tell you a face to a
4 name, because for six years I've only heard your
5 voice -- and I could pick you out anywhere just
6 by your voice.

7 To the Sergeants-at-Arms, all of
8 you, including Ben -- Ben has always been that
9 pillar. When we see him, it brings us comfort,
10 it brings us love, it brings us joy.

11 And to all of the Sergeant-at-Arms,
12 I so enjoy seeing you here and hearing your
13 stories and meeting you and getting to know you.
14 So I thank you so much for watching over us and
15 protecting us.

16 I want to thank my staff. Although
17 they have changed often, I would like to say
18 thank you so very much. Presently I have Matt
19 here -- he's laughing. Sue is my chief of staff.
20 I've got Will, I've got Anastasia and I've got
21 Bella. And they are my favorite team, and they
22 put up with me every day. So I thank them so
23 much for that.

24 I really want to thank my husband
25 and my family. When I ran for Senate, my husband

1 was not exactly supportive. Leaving him and my
2 high school son at home -- the other two had
3 gone. And I told him this is something that I
4 felt in my heart and in my soul. And I actually
5 said to him, "Get on board or get out of the
6 way."

7 (Laughter.)

8 SENATOR WEIK: And so he got on
9 board.

10 (Laughter.)

11 SENATOR WEIK: And I love him
12 dearly. Our 31st anniversary is coming up just
13 next week. And so I love you, I thank you, Jim.
14 So thanks always for being there and putting up
15 with me.

16 I want to thank my children, too,
17 who you've seen on my palm cards and in my
18 brochures. They are my whole life: My son Jimmy
19 and my daughter Callie and my youngest son Tom.
20 And of course my grandchildren, Adley and Chase.
21 Chase is the new guy. And I just -- I love them
22 all so very much.

23 I want to thank my family here. And
24 they really are; you know that as well. When we
25 come here, we're here for a good solid week. We

1 spend all of our time together.

2 And to my colleagues here, we came
3 in six years ago during the pandemic, and it was
4 a weird, wild time. And we formed this very
5 tight bond and friendship. And I just -- I'm
6 going to miss you all. I don't like to cry. But
7 I am going to miss all of you very, very much.

8 To the Majority Leader, I'd like to
9 thank you very much for all of your support and
10 your kind words over the years. It's been great
11 to get to know you as well.

12 And I'd really like to
13 congratulate -- I feel better knowing I'm not the
14 only one leaving. So to Senator Oberacker,
15 Senator Martins, and to my colleagues who are
16 also leaving on the -- I'm not sure how many.
17 It's just the two of you, right? I just want to
18 say congratulations to you as well, and I wish
19 you all the very best in your future endeavors.

20 And last, but not least whatsoever,
21 is the leader. And he and I have a very special
22 bond because when I started to run for office and
23 everyone kind of fled and left, he called up and
24 he said, "Please don't fear. Some of us are
25 staying and working." And that meant the world

1 to me.

2 And I'm so glad that you have always
3 been there for us. You have been a phenomenal
4 leader. We couldn't have asked for more.

5 And so I thank you so much for your
6 dedication to us, your loyalty, your kindness,
7 your friendship, your support, your guidance. I
8 thank you so very, very much.

9 Thank you.

10 (Standing ovation.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
12 you, Senator Weik.

13 Senator Martins for departing
14 remarks.

15 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,
16 Mr. President.

17 My trajectory's been a little
18 different than most, so I'll start where I should
19 start, Mr. President, by thanking my wife and my
20 family for the opportunities and the support that
21 they've given me over the years.

22 I come from an immigrant family. I
23 think most people know that. And so the idea
24 that a kid born to immigrant parents -- poverty,
25 very small farming village in northern

1 Portugal -- can be raised here in New York, grow
2 up to be the mayor of his village, serve several
3 terms and then get elected to the State Senate,
4 and leave, pursue his -- and then decide to come
5 back, it's truly a blessing.

6 This is a very special place. You
7 know, many people consider other places to be the
8 center of democracy. The center of democracy, my
9 friends, is right here in this chamber, in this
10 state. The diversity that this state provides,
11 the opportunities it provides and has provided
12 over the years, is something that we should all
13 be very much aware of the legacy that we have and
14 the responsibility we have as members of the
15 New York State Senate.

16 There are only 63 of us. Once upon
17 a time there were only 62 of us. And so that
18 idea and the camaraderie that that brings is
19 something pretty special.

20 And I had the opportunity to join
21 the chamber and sat on that side of the chamber
22 for years. And those were different times. And
23 then I chose to come back, something I wanted to
24 do, for different reasons.

25 But as I said before, very important

1 that we respect this place. When we're in the
2 Majority, to respect the place. When we're in
3 the Minority, to respect the chamber as well.

4 It is the Majority's responsibility
5 to advance policy, clearly. That's what we did,
6 that's what you do. But it is the Minority's
7 responsibility to advocate aggressively. That's
8 what we're supposed to do. That's our job. And
9 sometimes that puts us in conflict because we are
10 passionate about what we do.

11 But I will tell you this. It's
12 always from a good place. And I know it's always
13 from a good place from you as well. That's how
14 policy is set.

15 We each represent 330,000,
16 340,000 people, whether we sit on that side of
17 the room or sit on this side of the room. And so
18 the ability for us to talk to each other and to
19 respect each other's opinions -- and to
20 understand that we're not just setting policy for
21 people who sit in the Majority, but for the
22 entire state.

23 And if there's one thing that I hope
24 I learned when I was in the Majority, and
25 something I know I know very well being in the

1 Minority, it's that's important, that process.

2 Take care of each other. Take care
3 of each other. Look out for each other.

4 Regardless of where you sit in the room, where
5 you come from. It's our responsibility to make
6 sure that those who come after us understand what
7 it is to be a Senator in the State of New York.

8 It's not an easy thing. It's not something
9 you're born with. And when you walk in the door,
10 I can tell you, you don't know what that means,
11 and it takes you a little bit of time to
12 understand what does it mean to be a New York
13 State Senator.

14 I had the good fortune of having
15 people teach me that when I got here in 2010.
16 Perhaps I had to relearn it when I got here in
17 2022.

18 I want to thank the Majority Leader.
19 We've known each other a long time. The Majority
20 Leader was here when I got here in 2010. She was
21 here when I left in 2016. And you're still here.

22 I want to thank Leader Ortt for your
23 friendship, for your leadership. Again, we've
24 known each other a long time, both before and
25 after.

1 But for everyone in the room,
2 everyone in the chamber, thank you. Thank you
3 for the opportunity to serve with you. Thank you
4 for the opportunity to work with you on such
5 important issues that truly make a difference in
6 the lives of people across New York State.

7 I too have a wonderful staff.
8 Obviously I want to thank them. Great people who
9 have stayed with me, many of them since 2010.
10 And when I left, they found other work, but when
11 I came back, they came back as well. Which was
12 great to be able to reassemble the team and to
13 work again. I will miss them. And I'm sure we
14 will stay in touch, but it's different.

15 The one thing I will leave you with,
16 as a person who has served, who has left and who
17 has come back, cherish your time here.
18 Appreciate it. When you leave, you're the same
19 person, obviously, but it's different.
20 Appreciate what opportunities are here and what a
21 privilege it is to serve as a New York Senator
22 and how important that is.

23 Mr. President, it has been a
24 privilege to serve with all of my colleagues. To
25 share a phrase from my dear friend Senator

1 Oberacker, mahalo to everyone. Thank you for
2 that.

3 I love the idea that everyone has a
4 plate at the table and everyone is free to come
5 and go. And I hope we will have the opportunity
6 over time, and that our lives will intersect in
7 the future, and I am pretty sure they will.

8 But if there's anything at all in
9 our lives where I can be of any help to any of
10 you -- to you, to your families -- please do not
11 hesitate.

12 God bless you all. And thank you
13 for the opportunity to have served with you.

14 Thank you.

15 (Standing ovation.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
17 you, Senator Martins.

18 Last but certainly not least,
19 Senator Kavanagh for departing remarks.

20 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Thank you,
21 Mr. President.

22 Most of you, my colleagues in this
23 chamber, know that I've never been much of a
24 speech maker in here. To the extent I speak on
25 the floor it's usually fielding, you know,

1 interesting and sometimes obscure questions about
2 obscure legislation or talking about investments
3 we're making on housing in the budget.

4 And I'm sure when St. Patrick's Day
5 rolls around, when I come and speak as the head
6 Irishman, the head of the American-Irish
7 Legislators Society, you all miss Tim Kennedy and
8 his long, eloquent, silver-tongued speeches he
9 makes here.

10 But I am really grateful for this
11 opportunity to speak briefly tonight in what's
12 likely to be my last evening in this chamber as a
13 Senator.

14 Mostly I do want to express
15 gratitude. I want to begin, as others have, by
16 expressing gratitude to those closest to me. I
17 have a representative sample of the very large
18 and supportive Kavanagh family, my brothers
19 Timothy Kavanagh and Sean Kavanagh are here with
20 us in the chamber. And my family has been -- my
21 extended family has been so supportive of me of
22 politically, professionally, personally over so
23 many years and really has shaped my perspectives
24 on the world, my commitment to serve.

25 So thank you for being here and

1 thank you to all the Kavanaghs everywhere, and
2 there's quite a lot of them.

3 Everyone in this chamber -- this has
4 also been gone into, but everyone in this chamber
5 knows how challenging it can be to be in a
6 relationship with an elected official. And so I
7 want to thank Eden Forsythe, who's also here, for
8 putting up with the ridiculous schedule and the
9 demands on our time and obscure calls about, you
10 know, the budget or legislation at odd hours.
11 And of course for your love and support over a
12 lot of years now, so -- and thank you for being
13 here also.

14 To all of my colleagues, this really
15 has in so many ways been a tremendously
16 productive collaboration. And I've been here for
17 20 years, nine years in this chamber and 11 years
18 in the Assembly.

19 Of course as others have outlined, I
20 begin with Senate Majority Leader Andrea
21 Stewart-Cousins, for your strength as a leader,
22 for your grace, and for really always making the
23 difficult judgments we have to make about what's
24 important and what's right and how to get the
25 things done that we've gotten done over so many

1 years.

2 And for entrusting me with the role
3 of chairing the Housing Committee and leading on
4 those issues in particular. Thank you.

5 I also -- I did spend a lot of years
6 in the Assembly, and several of my colleagues
7 from the Assembly have migrated over here to the
8 Senate with me.

9 I do want to thank, you know,
10 Carl Heastie and all of the Assembly colleagues
11 who are here and on the other side of the
12 building. Those were also really wonderful,
13 challenging and productive years.

14 I -- let me also -- I'm going to
15 just end, but also just to thank my present and
16 my former staffers. Much of my current office
17 staff are here today. We all will have a lot
18 more opportunities to say goodbye. We're all in
19 our work for the next seven months or so, and
20 I'll be in office.

21 But I do want to -- like knows that
22 our staffers really are the people that make us
23 what we are as public officials, as public
24 servants, you know, as -- when we're successful
25 for our communities, our constituents, it's

1 because of all of you. So thank you all for
2 sticking with me over so many years and such
3 wonderful work.

4 And to the central staff. We know,
5 we do all of this work late into the night, early
6 in the morning. Often they are working later
7 than us, working harder than us. And, you know,
8 so many smart, wonderful people, some of them --
9 I'm not going to name names of the Housing staff
10 and the others I've worked with over so many
11 years. But it has been just a tremendous honor
12 and a privilege and a pleasure to work with all
13 of you now over -- over many, many years.

14 And I'm proud of the work we've
15 accomplished. You know, on housing we really
16 have, over the last eight years, I think
17 transformed the way the State of New York thinks
18 about housing. It used to, I think, be a
19 secondary issue. We thought the federal
20 government would spend money, localities would
21 implement it.

22 But, you know, from my time leading
23 with all of you the negotiations on the Housing
24 Stability and Tenant Protection Act during COVID,
25 those dark, dark years when this chamber was

1 mostly empty and there would be like three or
2 four of us here at a time, you know, figuring out
3 how to prevent evictions with a 22-month
4 moratorium and a \$4 billion program to make sure
5 that people's rent was paid.

6 For working with Senator Salazar on
7 good-cause eviction and the Housing Access
8 Voucher Program and our new, excitingly named
9 Shelter Arrears Eviction Forestallment Program --
10 because the word "forestallment" has been
11 neglected far too long in our parlance.

12 And, you know, for the programs that
13 I've been working with you've heard
14 Cordell Cleare and I speak obsessively about
15 recently freezing people's rents, reducing
16 people's property taxes through the SCRIE, DRIE,
17 SCHE, and DHE programs which we had a marvelous
18 success with this year.

19 We've also just massively increased
20 the amount of support that the state provides for
21 housing. We've -- the capital budgets go up and
22 down, but we've essentially doubled our
23 commitment to building and maintaining the
24 housing we've got in the last few years. And we
25 should be very proud of that.

1 And I'm also just -- I'm very proud
2 of the environmental work. You know,
3 Senator Harckham and others really have led on
4 that. The All Electric Building Act, which is
5 still being litigated but I think will come out
6 unscathed and will be implemented soon in
7 New York, and so much other work.

8 We know we differ, especially across
9 the aisle we differ on how to address those
10 challenges. But I think it is really the
11 challenge of our time that we make things more
12 sustainable, that we make it cleaner, that we
13 make it more affordable, and that we diminish
14 exposure of people to toxins.

15 I've been very -- I've been proud of
16 the work we've done on extended producer
17 responsibility, debating not once, twice, but
18 five times the mattress EPR bill with
19 Senators Borrello and Walczyk. I think maybe
20 this is five times is the charm.

21 (Laughter.)

22 SENATOR KAVANAGH: But really
23 getting in and trying to figure out what -- like
24 what it is that we can do to really make the
25 economy more circular and sustainable and

1 affordable for folks.

2 I -- when I got to the Legislature,
3 the gun laws of New York were depressingly weak.
4 You could still walk into a parking lot with a
5 very dangerous weapon and sell it to somebody for
6 cash with no questions asked and walk away and
7 not be committing a crime.

8 So the SAFE Act, which we did, you
9 know, before I was in the Senate, and the
10 continued work of this body on making our gun
11 laws keep people safe, keep guns out of the wrong
12 hands, has been an ongoing and very important
13 thing. And we're passing more bills today to
14 make sure that we live up to that commitment.

15 One of the things that a lot of you
16 have said here in this room today, and at other
17 points, people have commented on my well-deserved
18 reputation for wonkery. For, you know, delving
19 into the most obscure details, knowing the facts,
20 sometimes maybe, you know, blinding you with the
21 facts during debate.

22 But I do want to say that, you know,
23 a lot of what -- why this has been so productive
24 is that each of us brings so many gifts and
25 skills and perspectives to this work. And yes,

1 I'm very proud that I can recite obscure details
2 of various legislation and pieces of the budget
3 that are critical to me, and we all do that and
4 we all know how to do that.

5 But it really is the wide range of
6 skills and talents that makes us so productive.
7 People's -- the rhetoric on this floor that is
8 sometimes so moving and so inspiring, not just
9 for us here in this room, but we know for people
10 across the state. The ability to figure out how
11 to make -- how to take the many different
12 perspectives -- and this is something we talk
13 about across the aisle, but within our own
14 conference, to get together and make the
15 compromises and do the work that is necessary for
16 people.

17 One of the things I'm most proud of
18 about this body is that we are never
19 self-satisfied. I mentioned a few
20 accomplishments that I'm proud of. We all do
21 that. But we also understand that we continue to
22 face enormous challenges across this state --
23 that people struggle to afford to live where they
24 live, that we are not building enough housing.
25 In some cases, we've got government preventing us

1 from building enough housing in some places.

2 With that, we have far too many of
3 our families still facing homelessness and
4 eviction. Personally my sense is that we haven't
5 done enough on preventing especially children
6 from being exposed to toxins.

7 We know that we have these
8 challenges, and it is one of the great hallmarks
9 of this body that we never give up. I know
10 sometimes some people across the aisle would like
11 us to give up on certain directions that we want
12 to go. But I know everyone in this room really
13 takes this work as an opportunity to serve, to
14 meet people's needs large and small.

15 And for all of that, it's been just
16 such a privilege -- people have said it, but the
17 privilege of a lifetime to spend 20 years doing
18 this work representing hundreds of thousands of
19 New Yorkers. And this is not retirement for me.
20 I look for other ways to serve and hope to serve
21 with many of you in various capacities over the
22 long run. But in the meantime, I know all of you
23 and this institution will continue to do the
24 wonderful work we've done for so long.

25 So thank you.

1 (Standing ovation.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
3 you, Senator Kavanagh.

4 Senator Gianaris.

5 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
6 there will be an immediate meeting of the
7 Democratic Conference in Room 332.

8 And please call on Senator Lanza for
9 an announcement.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: There
11 will be an immediate meeting of the
12 Democratic Conference in Room 332.

13 Senator Lanza.

14 SENATOR LANZA: Mr. President, the
15 Republican Conference will meet in Room 315
16 immediately.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
18 Republican Conference will also meet immediately,
19 in Room 315.

20 Senator Gianaris.

21 SENATOR GIANARIS: One moment,
22 Mr. President.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Okay,
24 let's call a return to session at -- we'll aim
25 for 9:30 and hope for the best.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
2 Senate will return to order at 9:30.

3 The Senate will stand at ease
4 temporarily.

5 (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease
6 at 8:52 p.m.)

7 (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at
8 10:46 p.m.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
10 Senate will return to order.

11 Senator Gianaris.

12 SENATOR GIANARIS: Good evening,
13 Mr. President.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Good
15 evening.

16 SENATOR GIANARIS: We are going to
17 at this time call an immediate meeting of the
18 Rules Committee simultaneous with taking up some
19 of the remaining resolutions, beginning with
20 previously adopted Resolution 2317, by
21 Senator Webb.

22 Can we have that resolution's title
23 read, recognize Senator Webb, and call an
24 immediate meeting of the Rules Committee, please.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Okay.

1 There will be an immediate meeting of the
2 Rules Committee in Room 332, simultaneously with
3 the resolution.

4 The Secretary will read.

5 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 2317, by
6 Senator Webb, commemorating the 80th Anniversary
7 of Binghamton University in 2026.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
9 Webb on the resolution.

10 SENATOR WEBB: Thank you,
11 Mr. President.

12 I rise today on the 80th anniversary
13 of my alma mater --

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
15 Webb -- Senator Webb, excuse me.

16 Can we have some order in the house,
17 please. There is an immediate meeting of the
18 Rules Committee, but we're calling a resolution
19 simultaneously.

20 Senator Webb, please continue with
21 your resolution. Thank you.

22 SENATOR WEBB: Thank you,
23 Mr. President.

24 I rise to lift up the
25 80th anniversary of not only my alma mater, but

1 also of several Senators in the chamber:
2 Senator Monica Martinez, also Senator John Liu.
3 And that esteemed university is Binghamton
4 University.

5 I want to thank our Senate Majority
6 Leader for her supporting of this resolution.
7 Our SUNY system, as we all know, is a
8 world-renowned institution that brings in
9 students from across the globe. And
10 Binghamton University stands as a pillar of the
11 SUNY system. It is consistently ranked as a top
12 public school and has been identified as a
13 dignified Public Ivy by Forbes Magazine.

14 Binghamton University has countless
15 notable alums from entertainment, politics,
16 sports, media, business and research.

17 Some alums to note -- and again,
18 these aren't all: Ruben Santiago Hudson, Sunny
19 Hostin, Paul Reiser, Billy T. Jones. We also
20 have Nobel Prize winners as well.

21 Binghamton University, or BU, was
22 founded in 1946 as Triple Cities College and
23 intended to serve the needs of local veterans
24 returning from service in World War II. It was
25 originally located in Endicott, five miles west

1 of its current campus, and was a branch of
2 Syracuse University.

3 In 1950, BU left Syracuse and was
4 incorporated into our SUNY system, also then
5 renamed as Harper College, in honor of
6 Robert Harper, who helped settle the area west of
7 Binghamton. Over the course of the 1960s, the
8 campus moved across the Susquehanna River to its
9 current location in Vestal, and was formally
10 designated the State University of New York at
11 Binghamton.

12 BU is a leading research institution
13 dedicated to higher education and committed to
14 collaborative interdisciplinary research,
15 inspirational artistic endeavors, and high-impact
16 educational experiences. Throughout its 80-year
17 history, Binghamton University has graduated more
18 than 160,000 students from over 100 countries.

19 BU has remained steadfast in its
20 mission to work in partnership with the community
21 to ensure that all students develop and
22 demonstrate the knowledge, skills, abilities and
23 character to live a productive and rewarding
24 life.

25 I am very proud to be an alum of

1 this great institution, as many folks in my
2 office are also proud alumni as well. We
3 consistently receive interns from this great
4 institution who are talented, they are eager to
5 get to work, and they go on to do amazing things.

6 I personally want to thank
7 Binghamton University on reaching such an
8 important milestone of its 80th anniversary. I
9 also want to thank Assemblymember Donna Lupardo,
10 who is also a proud alum of Binghamton
11 University, who also presented this resolution in
12 the Assembly.

13 I very proudly vote aye on this
14 resolution. And go, Bearcats!

15 Thank you, Mr. President.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
17 you, Senator Webb.

18 Senator Martins on the resolution.

19 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,
20 Mr. President.

21 I rise to thank the sponsor for the
22 resolution. She forgot to mention
23 Kaitlin Martins Solomon as a graduate of
24 Binghamton University.

25 As you can imagine, Mr. President,

1 Kaitlin is our oldest daughter, just graduated
2 from Downstate Medical College a month ago, and a
3 proud alumnae of Binghamton University. As the
4 Senator said, as the sponsor said, the finest
5 university, public university we have in our SUNY
6 system, bar none. I don't want to hear the rest
7 of you.

8 (Laughter.)

9 SENATOR MARTINS: It's a wonderful
10 school, and it's doing a wonderful job. Really,
11 you just have to look at the sponsor and the
12 others who have graduated from there, including
13 our other colleagues here, Senator Martinez.

14 But what a wonderful experience I
15 can tell you, Mr. President, that my family has
16 had and my daughter has had in Binghamton,
17 graduating from the university that really has
18 set her up for success in life, and that is all
19 that we can ask.

20 We should be very proud in New York
21 of our entire SUNY system, but in particular SUNY
22 Binghamton. Go, Bearcats!

23 Thank you, Mr. President.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
25 you, Senator Martins.

1 SUNY schools are a bonanza of
2 educational wealth, and we thank the sponsor for
3 all that they do. But UA, you know.

4 (Laughter.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
6 resolution was previously adopted on June 2nd.

7 Senator Liu, another SUNY Binghamton
8 alumni.

9 SENATOR LIU: That's right,
10 Mr. President. You let Jack Martins know that as
11 well.

12 (Laughter.)

13 SENATOR LIU: And I'm so old, they
14 were the Colonials when I went there, before they
15 became Bearcats.

16 Mr. President, please take up
17 previously adopted Resolution 1708, by
18 Senator Fernandez, read the resolution title
19 only, and recognize Senator Fernandez.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
21 Secretary will read.

22 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1708, by
23 Senator Fernandez, memorializing Governor Kathy
24 Hochul to proclaim July 20, 2026, as Colombian
25 Independence Day in the State of New York, on the

1 216th Anniversary of Colombian Independence.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
3 Fernandez on the resolution.

4 SENATOR FERNANDEZ: Thank you so
5 much, Mr. President.

6 I proudly rise as a Colombian and in
7 fact the first Colombian American to serve in the
8 State Legislature -- just for a short time,
9 because soon after, we were -- I was joined by
10 many Colombian women leaders here in the
11 Legislature.

12 But it is really something I'm proud
13 of, to be able to introduce this resolution. I
14 am half-Colombian. My mother, born in Plato,
15 Colombia, from my grandparents, Fernando and
16 Valdina. And this resolution is so impactful and
17 important because we have seen, through music,
18 through food, through culture, through flowers,
19 through everything how much the Colombian
20 community and culture has impacted things that we
21 love every day.

22 We have artists that have shaped the
23 world when it comes to pop culture, from Shakira
24 to Carlos Vives, actresses like Sofía Vergara,
25 and now more modern artists like Karol G, who was

1 the first Latina to headline Coachella.

2 But it is such a pride that I can
3 say I am Colombian, one of the most beautiful
4 countries in South America, namely the most
5 beautiful country I think on the Forbes list this
6 year and last year.

7 I highly recommend people to visit,
8 because the history is rich, over 200 years ago
9 relieving themselves from the Spanish regime to
10 show true independence, leadership, and to this
11 day leading in this world when it comes to
12 dignity for its people and equal rights and
13 really bringing a conversation forward about how
14 to speak for your people and to protect your
15 country.

16 So I am very honored and proud to be
17 Colombian. I thank you for this opportunity to
18 make it official in New York that we are going to
19 celebrate Colombian Independence Day on July
20 20th. And I welcome and invite everybody to not
21 just the Bronx, where we do have some great
22 restaurants, like La Masa, but to my colleagues'
23 districts in Queens, where we do have
24 Little Colombia there.

25 But thank you for this opportunity.

1 I proudly vote aye on this resolution. And
2 please make sure you celebrate in July all of
3 your Colombian pride.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
5 you, Senator Fernandez.

6 Senator Ramos on the resolution.

7 SENATOR RAMOS: {In Spanish.} I
8 feel so grateful for the privilege of celebrating
9 Colombia's independence here in the New York
10 State Senate.

11 My parents came to this country with
12 little more than hope, determination, and the
13 belief that their children would have the
14 opportunities they never had. And because of
15 them, I have the extraordinary privilege of
16 representing one of the largest Colombian
17 communities anywhere in the United States.

18 I was born in Little Colombia, and
19 I'm so proud to have grown up to be the first
20 Colombian American to represent it here in the
21 Senate. I represent the bakeries, the
22 restaurants, the small businesses and the
23 thousands of families who helped build Queens.

24 Every summer those streets come
25 alive during the Calle Columbia Festival -- this

1 year on Saturday, June 20th, at 12 noon, on
2 37th Avenue and 82nd Street in Jackson Heights.

3 And then on Sunday, July 26th,
4 everyone's invited to the Colombian Independence
5 Pride Festival in Flushing Meadows, Corona Park,
6 at 2 p.m.

7 And what we celebrate is more than a
8 nationality. We celebrate resilience. Because
9 Colombians unfortunately know a lot about that.
10 Many of us grew up experiencing tremendous
11 violence, conflict and hardship between the
12 guerillas, cartels, the paramilitary, and even
13 the military. Millions of Colombians have been
14 displaced, kidnapped, murdered and disappeared.

15 And yet despite all of that,
16 Colombians remain known around the world for our
17 optimism, our warmth, and our joy. I think
18 that's because we understand something important,
19 and that's that happiness is not ignoring pain,
20 happiness is deciding that pain will not have the
21 final word.

22 That's who we Colombians are. A
23 people who have endured so much become experts in
24 hope. And perhaps that spirit comes from the
25 country itself, a nation of the Andes, where my

1 family is from, and the Amazon, of the Caribbean
2 and the Pacific, home to extraordinary
3 biodiversity, extraordinary beauty and, yes, the
4 best coffee in the world.

5 But Colombia's greatest treasure is
6 its people. We're Indigenous, we're African,
7 we're European, we're Arab. We are a beautiful
8 mixture of cultures and histories that taught us
9 long ago that diversity is strength.

10 And as we celebrate independence, we
11 also remember the responsibility that comes with
12 it: The responsibility to protect the democracy,
13 sovereignty and extraordinary land that
14 Simón Bolívar and generations of Colombians
15 fought to preserve.

16 So I urge every Colombian who is
17 watching who can vote in the upcoming
18 presidential runoff on Sunday, June 21st, to do
19 so, because we are ready to write a new chapter.

20 {In Spanish.} Gracias.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
22 you, Senator Ramos.

23 Senator Chan on the resolution.

24 SENATOR CHAN: I rise to support
25 Senator Fernandez's resolution.

1 And here's a little-known fact about
2 the Chan family. We came through Columbia. My
3 uncle lived in Colombia from 1953 to 1968 until
4 he was hired by Singer Sewing Machine, then at
5 Binghamton, New York, and that's how we emigrated
6 here. From there he petitioned for my family to
7 arrive from Hong Kong.

8 So with that said, I want to give a
9 shout out to my cousin Isabella Cheng, who was
10 born in Colombia, my cousin Jaime Cheng, who was
11 born in Colombia, and my cousin Blanca Cheng, who
12 was born in Columbia.

13 And I proudly support this
14 resolution. My favorite part of Columbia? The
15 big Colombian breakfasts.

16 Thank you.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
18 you, Senator Chan.

19 The resolution was adopted on
20 March 10th.

21 Senator Gianaris.

22 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
23 next up is previously adopted Resolution 1700, by
24 Senator Webb. Read its title and call on
25 Senator Webb, please.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
2 Secretary will read.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 1700, by Senator Webb, commemorating the
5 10th Annual Sock Out Cancer Day on June 7, 2026,
6 in conjunction with the observance of
7 National Cancer Survivors Day.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
9 Webb on the resolution.

10 SENATOR WEBB: Thank you,
11 Mr. President.

12 You know, we do a lot of work in
13 this chamber to not only ensure that we have more
14 resources to fight back against very deadly
15 diseases, but we also do things in this chamber
16 to lift up opportunities for the community to
17 build awareness and to most certainly connect
18 those who are impacted by these issues to those
19 respective resources.

20 And that, at its core, is the
21 essence of the Annual Sock Out Cancer Day.

22 I want to thank the Majority Leader
23 for supporting this resolution. This is a day
24 that's recognized with the observance of the
25 National Cancer Survivors Day, which was

1 established in 2017 by Security Mutual Life
2 Insurance Company, in my district, in order to
3 help provide support for cancer patients in need
4 of financial assistance with non-medical expenses
5 such as food, transportation and housing.

6 For the last 10 years, Sock Out
7 Cancer has raised public awareness with its
8 signature multicolored socks that are made right
9 here in New York by individuals of all abilities
10 at Finger Lakes Textiles. From concerts and
11 hockey games to 5K runs, this initiative has
12 raised millions of dollars for patients and
13 families in need.

14 A cancer diagnosis is one of the
15 worst possible things that we know that can
16 happen to someone. It is confusing. It's
17 anxiety-inducing on so many levels. Worrying
18 about your health, your family's health, your
19 financial situation with time off work, and
20 paying for treatments, and most certainly the
21 impacts to your life overall.

22 Cancer patients already have too
23 much stress in their daily lives, which is why
24 Sock Out Cancer works with hospitals and other
25 organizations to provide financial assistance so

1 patients can focus on their battle with cancer.

2 This is a day for all of us across
3 New York State to pause and stand in solidarity
4 with residents who are fighting cancer along with
5 their families. We all have a role to play,
6 whether we choose to wear the signature socks, as
7 I described a moment ago, donate to the cause, or
8 simply stand beside our loved ones in this fight.

9 We honor the strength of cancer
10 survivors and reaffirm our steadfast support for
11 those in this fight. We lift up their strength
12 by honoring their resilience and reminding them
13 that they are not alone. Every step we take and
14 every event that we support helps to bring hope
15 to those facing this disease.

16 So to Security Mutual Life Insurance
17 and all the partners that make this day possible,
18 your leadership is a beacon of hope for many
19 families across our state. Let's continue to
20 Sock Out Cancer together.

21 Thank you, Mr. President. I proudly
22 vote aye.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
24 Webb to be recorded in the affirmative.

25 The resolution was adopted on

1 March 10th.

2 Senator Gianaris.

3 SENATOR GIANARIS: Okay, at this
4 time let's take up previously adopted
5 Resolution 2262, by Senator Martins, read its
6 title and call on Senator Martins, please.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
8 Secretary will read.

9 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 2262, by
10 Senator Martins, mourning the death of Carl L.
11 Marcellino, former New York State Senator and
12 distinguished citizen of his community.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
14 Martins on the resolution.

15 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,
16 Mr. President. I rise to celebrate the life of
17 Carl Louis Marcellino, Senator Carl Marcellino.

18 Many of us remember Carl from having
19 served with him. Carl served for 22 years,
20 through 2018. Some of us have been here a long
21 time. Yet some of us who have been here a long
22 time at this point probably didn't have the
23 opportunity or the privilege to serve with
24 Carl Marcellino, which is I guess a message to
25 all of us here just how quick things move as you

1 go through this process and service in this
2 chamber.

3 Carl Marcellino served for 22 years
4 as a New York City schoolteacher. After his
5 service as a schoolteacher, he served as the
6 clerk for the Town of Oyster Bay on Long Island,
7 before going on to serve for 23 years as a member
8 of this chamber.

9 He was very integral to a lot of us
10 in terms of how he carried himself in this
11 chamber. Those of us who remember Carl remember
12 him to be a person of integrity, sometimes a
13 little gruff, but always ready to help in any way
14 that he could.

15 A lot of the things that he
16 concentrated on while he was a State Senator are
17 things that survive today and part of the fabric
18 of what we do here, especially when it comes to
19 the environment, as he served for decades as the
20 chair of the Environmental Committee.

21 Carl is survived by his wife, Pat;
22 by his son, Carl; and by his daughter, Jean. He
23 made a difference. It's not something you can
24 really say about everyone. But Carl Marcellino,
25 through his service as a schoolteacher, as a

1 government official, and all those years here in
2 the State Senate, he made a difference. New York
3 State is better today because of the service that
4 Carl provided, because of the leadership he
5 provided not only here in New York but in so many
6 organizations focused on the environment.

7 Carl was a friend. And so I
8 appreciate and I'm thankful for the opportunity
9 to recognize his service, his legacy, and to
10 thank all of us here for just taking a brief
11 moment in honor of one of our own who passed
12 earlier this year.

13 So, Mr. President, thank you for
14 this opportunity. Today, as we go about our
15 lives and we finish off the session -- it is the
16 last day -- take a moment along the way to just
17 say a silent prayer, keep Carl in your thoughts.
18 He was one of us.

19 God bless you. Thank you all very
20 much. Thank you, Mr. President.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
22 you, Senator Martins.

23 God bless one of the members of our
24 Senate family.

25 The resolution was previously

1 adopted on June 2nd.

2 Senator Gianaris.

3 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
4 at this time I move to adopt the
5 Resolution Calendar.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: All those
7 in favor of adopting the Resolution Calendar
8 please signify by saying aye.

9 (Response of "Aye.")

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Opposed,
11 nay.

12 (No response.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
14 Resolution Calendar -- excuse me. The Resolution
15 Calendar? The Rules agenda is accepted.

16 SENATOR GIANARIS: No, you were
17 right, it's the Resolution Calendar.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
19 Resolution Calendar, excuse me. It's late.

20 SENATOR GIANARIS: Now I believe
21 there's a Rules report at the desk. Let's take
22 that up, please.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
24 Secretary will read.

25 THE SECRETARY: Senator

1 Stewart-Cousins, from the Committee on Rules,
2 reports the following bills:

3 Senate Print 1232A, by Senator May,
4 an act in relation to authorizing
5 Christopher Walser and Matthew Patire to each
6 take the competitive civil service examination;

7 Senate Print 1763A, by
8 Senator Fernandez, an act to amend the
9 Insurance Law;

10 Senate Print 1819A, by
11 Senator Fernandez, an act to amend the
12 Criminal Procedure Law;

13 Senate Print 2001A, by
14 Senator Brisport, an act to amend the
15 Social Services Law;

16 Senate Print 4490A, by
17 Senator Helming, an act in relation to
18 authorizing Christine Hasseler to apply for a
19 recalculation of her retirement benefits;

20 Senate Print 6987A, by
21 Senator Harckham, an act to amend the
22 Social Services Law;

23 Senate Print 7712, by Senator Ortt,
24 an act to amend the Criminal Procedure Law;

25 Senate Print 7978A, by

1 Senator Brouk, an act to amend the
2 Social Services Law;

3 Senate Print 9113A, by
4 Senator Bailey, an act to amend the
5 Insurance Law;

6 Senate Print 9255, by
7 Senator Jackson, an act to amend the
8 Retirement and Social Security Law;

9 Senate Print 9407, by
10 Senator Gonzalez, an act to amend the Tax Law;

11 Senate Print 9432A, by
12 Senator Lanza, an act to amend the
13 Civil Practice Law and Rules;

14 Senate Print 9454, by
15 Senator Rolison, an act to amend the
16 Vehicle and Traffic Law;

17 Senate Print 9458, by
18 Senator Hinchey, an act to allow Steven Kobie
19 Jackson to be eligible to take the civil service
20 examination;

21 Senate Print 9528A, by Senator Webb,
22 an act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law;

23 Senate Print 9566, by
24 Senator Jackson, an act to amend the
25 Retirement and Social Security Law;

1 Senate Print 9586A, by
2 Senator Parker, an act to amend the
3 Public Authorities Law;

4 Senate Print 10084, by
5 Senator Gallivan, an act to authorize the
6 Town of Hamburg to extend the Big Tree Fire
7 Protection District;

8 Senate Print 10189, by
9 Senator Gounardes, an act to amend the
10 Retirement and Social Security Law;

11 Senate Print 10256, by
12 Senator Bynoe, an act to amend the Education Law;

13 Senate Print 10398A, by
14 Senator Martinez, an act to amend the
15 General Municipal Law;

16 Senate Print 10593, by
17 Senator Skoufis, an act to amend the
18 Public Officers Law;

19 Senate Print 10608, by
20 Senator Bynoe, an act in relation to authorizing
21 the County of Nassau to accept an application for
22 a real property tax exemption;

23 Senate Print 10615, by Senator Liu,
24 an act to amend the Education Law;

25 Senate Print 10619, by

1 Senator Sutton, an act to amend the
2 Public Authorities Law;

3 Senate Print 10623, by
4 Senator Bynoe, an act to amend the
5 Vehicle and Traffic Law;

6 Senate Print 10633, by
7 Senator Martinez, an act to amend the Tax Law;

8 Senate Print 10643, by
9 Senator Ramos, an act to amend the Cannabis Law;

10 Senate Print 10650, by
11 Senator Kavanagh, an act to amend the
12 Military Law;

13 Senate Print 9444A, by
14 Senator Bynoe, an act to amend the Highway Law;

15 Senate Print 10187, by
16 Senator Rhoads, an act to amend the
17 Nassau County Civil Divisions Act;

18 Senate Print 10655, by
19 Senator Jackson, an act to amend the
20 Civil Service Law.

21 All bills report direct to third
22 reading.

23 SENATOR GIANARIS: Move to accept
24 the report of the Rules Committee.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: All those

1 in favor of accepting the report of the
2 Rules Committee, please signify by saying aye.

3 (Response of "Aye.")

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Opposed,
5 nay.

6 (No response.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
8 report of the Rules Committee is accepted.

9 Senator Gianaris.

10 SENATOR GIANARIS: Let's take up
11 the supplemental active list at this time,
12 please.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
14 Secretary will read.

15 There are substitutions at the desk.

16 The Secretary will read.

17 THE SECRETARY: Senator Gounardes
18 moves to discharge, from the Committee on
19 Corporations, Authorities and Commissions,
20 Assembly Bill Number 9590A and substitute it for
21 the identical Senate Bill 8839A, Third Reading
22 Calendar 324.

23 Senator Bailey moves to discharge,
24 from the Committee on Insurance, Assembly Bill
25 Number 6652B and substitute it for the identical

1 Senate Bill 6122A, Third Reading Calendar 582.

2 Senator Bailey moves to discharge,
3 from the Committee on Insurance, Assembly Bill
4 Number 3687B and substitute it for the identical
5 Senate Bill 5313A, Third Reading Calendar 885.

6 Senator Jackson moves to discharge,
7 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
8 Number 9528 and substitute it for the identical
9 Senate Bill 8847, Third Reading Calendar 1238.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
11 substitutions are so ordered.

12 The Secretary will read.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 324, Assembly Bill Number 9590A, by
15 Assemblymember Fall, an act to amend the
16 Public Authorities Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
20 act shall take effect immediately.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
25 the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 582, Assembly Bill Number 6652B, by
6 Assemblymember Weprin, an act to amend the
7 Insurance Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
16 Fernandez to explain her vote.

17 SENATOR FERNANDEZ: Thank you,
18 Mr. President.

19 I thank the body for bringing this
20 bill to the floor. This was a bill that we tried
21 to get -- actually, we did get it in the
22 one-house, because this bill addresses
23 affordability. This has been the theme for us
24 this year, trying to make life easier, more
25 accessible, more affordable for all New Yorkers.

1 And when New Yorkers are going
2 through substance use treatments, mental health
3 counseling treatments, sometimes there are
4 copays. And sometimes those copays are very
5 expensive. And when they are that expensive, it
6 does lead people to make the hard decision of
7 going to continue their care or possibly paying a
8 bill they need to pay.

9 So this bill caps copays at 250 to
10 give that opportunity, that ability to go get
11 your care and continue your work in taking care
12 of yourself.

13 So thank you for bringing this bill
14 to the floor. I proudly vote aye.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
16 Fernandez to be recorded in the affirmative.

17 Announce the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 595, Senate Print 1913, by Senator Rivera, an act
23 to amend the Public Health Law.

24 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Lay it

1 aside.

2 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
3 835, Senate Print 8623B, by Senator May, an act
4 to amend the General Business Law.

5 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Lay it
7 aside.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 885, Assembly Bill Number 3687B, by
10 Assemblymember Weprin, an act to amend the
11 Insurance Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
15 act shall take effect January 1, 2027.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 1031, Senate Print 8279, by Senator Sepúlveda, an

1 act directing the Superintendent of Financial
2 Services to conduct an analysis of the financial
3 stability of the check-cashing industry.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
7 act shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 1238, Assembly Number 9528, by
18 Assemblymember Pheffer Amato, an act to amend the
19 Public Health Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
3 the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
5 Calendar 1238, voting in the negative are
6 Senators Ortt and Walczyk.

7 Ayes, 58. Nays, 2.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1301, Senate Print 5317A, by Senator Bailey, an
12 act to amend the Correction Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
16 act shall take effect immediately.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
21 the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1374, Senate Print 8201A, by Senator Martins, an
2 act to amend Chapter 280 of the Laws of 2016.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: There's a
4 home-rule message at the desk.

5 Read the last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
7 act shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
15 is passed.

16 Senator Gianaris, that completes the
17 reading of today's supplemental active list.

18 SENATOR GIANARIS: Let's move on to
19 the supplemental calendar, please.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: There are
21 substitutions at the desk.

22 The Secretary will read.

23 THE SECRETARY: Senator May moves
24 to discharge, from the Committee on Civil Service
25 and Pensions, Assembly Bill Number 6148A and

1 substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
2 1232A, Third Reading Calendar 1790.

3 Senator Harckham moves to discharge,
4 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
5 Number 7833A and substitute it for the identical
6 Senate Bill 6987A, Third Reading Calendar 1795.

7 Senator Ortt moves to discharge,
8 from the Committee on Codes, Assembly Bill
9 Number 8235 and substitute it for the identical
10 Senate Bill 7712, Third Reading Calendar 1796.

11 Senator Brouk moves to discharge,
12 from the Committee on Children and Families,
13 Assembly Bill Number 7603B and substitute it for
14 the identical Senate Bill 7978A, Third Reading
15 Calendar 1797.

16 Senator Jackson moves to discharge,
17 from the Committee on Finance, Assembly Bill
18 Number 10250 and substitute it for the identical
19 Senate Bill 9255, Third Reading Calendar 1799.

20 Senator Gonzalez moves to discharge,
21 from the Committee on Budget and Revenue,
22 Assembly Bill Number 10429 and substitute it for
23 the identical Senate Bill 9407, Third Reading
24 Calendar 1800.

25 Senator Rolison moves to discharge,

1 from the Committee on Transportation,
2 Assembly Bill Number 10390A and substitute it for
3 the identical Senate Bill 9454, Third Reading
4 Calendar 1802.

5 Senator Jackson moves to discharge,
6 from the Committee on Finance, Assembly Bill
7 Number 10833 and substitute it for the identical
8 Senate Bill Number 9566, Third Reading Calendar
9 1805.

10 Senator Gounardes moves to
11 discharge, from the Committee on Civil Service
12 and Pensions, Assembly Bill Number 11154 and
13 substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
14 10189, Third Reading Calendar 1808.

15 Senator Bynoe moves to discharge,
16 from the Committee on Education, Assembly Bill
17 Number 11057 and substitute it for the identical
18 Senate Bill 10256, Third Reading Calendar 1809.

19 Senator Martinez moves to discharge,
20 from the Committee on Local Government,
21 Assembly Bill Number 10921A and substitute it for
22 the identical Senate Bill 10398A, Third Reading
23 Calendar 1810.

24 Senator Liu moves to discharge, from
25 the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill

1 Number 11539 and substitute it for the identical
2 Senate Bill 10615, Third Reading Calendar 1813.

3 Senator Martinez moves to discharge,
4 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
5 Number 11552 and substitute it for the identical
6 Senate Bill 10633, Third Reading Calendar 1816.

7 Senator Kavanagh moves to discharge,
8 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
9 Number 11538 and substitute it for the identical
10 Senate Bill 10650, Third Reading Calendar 1818.

11 Senator Bynoe moves to discharge,
12 from the Committee on Rules, Assembly Bill
13 Number 11077A and substitute it for the identical
14 Senate Bill 9444A, Third Reading Calendar 1819.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:
16 Substitutions so ordered.

17 The Secretary will read.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 1790, Assembly Bill Number 6148A, by
20 Assemblymember Lemondes, an act in relation to
21 authorizing Christopher Walser and Matthew Patire
22 to each take the competitive civil service
23 examination.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: There's a
25 home-rule message at the desk.

1 Read the last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
10 Calendar 1790, voting in the negative:
11 Senator Brisport.

12 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 1791, Senate Print 1763A, by Senator Fernandez,
17 an act to amend the Insurance Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
21 act shall take effect on the first of January.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
3 Calendar 1791, voting in the negative:
4 Senator Ortt.

5 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
7 is passed.

8 The Secretary will read.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 1792, Senate Print 1819A, by Senator Fernandez,
11 an act to amend the Criminal Procedure Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
15 act shall take effect immediately.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
22 Calendar 1792, voting in the negative are
23 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
24 Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins,
25 Martinez, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara,

1 Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Skoufis, Stec,
2 Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

3 Ayes, 36. Nays, 24.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 1793, Senate Print 2001A, by Senator Brisport, an
8 act to amend the Social Services Law.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
10 last section.

11 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
12 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it
13 shall have become a law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
18 the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
20 Calendar 1793, voting in the negative are
21 Senators Gallivan, Griffo, Martins, Oberacker and
22 Walczyk.

23 Ayes, 55. Nays, 5.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
25 is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 1794, Senate Print 4490A, by Senator Helming, an
3 act in relation to authorizing Christine Hasseler
4 to apply for a recalculation of her retirement
5 benefits.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
9 act shall take effect immediately.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
14 the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 1795, Assembly Bill Number 7833A, by
20 Assemblymember Levenberg, an act to amend the
21 Social Services Law.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
23 last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
25 act shall take effect one year after it shall

1 have become a law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
6 Harckham to explain his vote.

7 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Thank you very
8 much, Mr. President.

9 On May 14th in 2024, Maria Coto, who
10 was a senior child protective services worker for
11 Westchester County Department of Social Services,
12 was making a call in a apartment building two
13 blocks from my district office. She accidentally
14 rang the wrong doorbell. A man under the
15 influence of PCP and alcohol came out and
16 savagely beat her, and she never recovered from
17 her injuries.

18 Her colleagues in Westchester County
19 CSEA vowed to see that her death would not be in
20 vain, and so they set about creating a mechanism
21 whereby no one would ever be in danger like that
22 again.

23 And so that's what this bill is. It
24 requires that social service districts equip all
25 of the forward-facing caseworkers with panic

1 buttons that they can wear on their clothing so
2 that they don't have to grapple for a telephone
3 or a laptop in a time of emergency. This has
4 been a priority of CSEA statewide, but especially
5 those of us who work with them in Westchester.

6 So I want to thank my colleague
7 Dana Levenberg over in the Assembly and thank all
8 my colleagues from Westchester. I know
9 Senator Mayer, Senator -- our Majority Leader, I
10 thank her for putting this on the agenda this
11 evening. I know she's been very supportive of
12 this initiative.

13 Proud to vote aye. Thank you.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
15 Harckham to be recorded in the affirmative.

16 Announce the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
18 Calendar 1795, voting in the negative:
19 Senator Walczyk.

20 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
22 is passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 1796, Assembly Bill Number 8235, by
25 Assemblymember Hawley, an act to amend the

1 Criminal Procedure Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
5 act shall take effect immediately.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
10 the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
12 Calendar 1796, voting in the negative are
13 Senators Bailey, Brisport, Gonzalez, Hinchey,
14 Krueger, Liu, Mayer, Myrie, Rivera and Salazar.
15 Also Senator Skoufis. Also Senator Ramos.

16 Ayes, 48. Nays, 12.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 1797, Assembly Bill Number 7603B, by
21 Assemblymember Hevesi, an act to amend the
22 Social Services Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This

1 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
2 shall have become a law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 1798, Senate Print 9113A, by Senator Bailey, an
13 act to amend the Insurance Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
24 Calendar 1798, voting in the negative:
25 Senator Walczyk.

1 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 1799, Assembly Bill Number 10250, by
6 Assemblymember Pheffer Amato, an act to amend the
7 Retirement and Social Security Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 1800, Assembly Bill Number 10429, by
22 Assemblymember Powers, an act to amend the
23 Tax Law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
25 last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
2 act shall take effect on the first day of a
3 sales tax quarterly period.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 1801, Senate Print 9432A, by Senator Lanza, an
14 act to amend the Civil Practice Law and Rules.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
18 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
19 shall have become a law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
2 is passed.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 1802, Assembly Bill Number 10390A, by
5 Assemblymember Jacobson, an act to amend the
6 Vehicle and Traffic Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
10 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it
11 shall have become a law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
18 Calendar 1802, voting in the negative:
19 Senator Lanza.

20 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
22 is passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 1803, Senate Print 9458, by Senator Hinchey, an
25 act to allow Steven Kobie Jackson to be eligible

1 to take the civil service examination.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: There is
3 a home-rule message at the desk.

4 Read the last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Excuse me. In
16 relation to Calendar 1803, voting in the
17 negative: Senator Brisport.

18 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1804, Senate Print 9528A, by Senator Webb, an act
23 to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: There is
25 a home-rule message at the desk.

1 Read the last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
3 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it
4 shall have become a law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
9 the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
11 Calendar 1804, voting in the negative:
12 Senator Lanza.

13 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 1805, Assembly Bill Number 10833, by
18 Assemblymember Pheffer Amato, an act to amend the
19 Retirement and Social Security Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)
2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
3 the results.
4 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.
5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
6 is passed.
7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 1806, Senate Print 9586A, by Senator Parker, an
9 act to amend the Public Authorities Law.
10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
11 last section.
12 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
13 act shall take effect immediately.
14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
15 roll.
16 (The Secretary called the roll.)
17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
18 the results.
19 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
20 Calendar 1806, voting in the negative:
21 Senator Walczyk.
22 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.
23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
24 is passed.
25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1807, Senate Print 10084, by Senator Gallivan, an
2 act to authorize the Town of Hamburg to extend
3 the Big Tree Fire Protection District.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: There is
5 a home-rule message at the desk.

6 Read the last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
8 act shall take effect immediately.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
13 the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 1808, Assembly Bill Number 11154, by
19 Assemblymember Pheffer Amato, an act to amend the
20 Retirement and Social Security Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 1809, Assembly Bill Number 11057, by
10 Assemblymember Benedetto, an act to amend the
11 Education Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
15 act shall take effect immediately.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 1810, Assembly Bill Number 10921A, by

1 Assemblymember Stern, an act to amend the
2 General Municipal Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
6 act shall take effect on the first of December.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 1811, Senate Print 10593, by Senator Skoufis, an
17 act to amend the Public Officers Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 10. This
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
3 Calendar 1811, voting in the negative are
4 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
5 Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins,
6 Mattera, Mayer, Murray, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo,
7 Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber
8 and Weik.

9 Ayes, 38. Nays, 22.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 1812, Senate Print 10608, by Senator Bynoe, an
14 act in relation to authorizing the County of
15 Nassau to accept an application for a real
16 property tax exemption.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
20 act shall take effect immediately.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
25 the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
2 Calendar 1812, voting in the negative are
3 Senators O'Mara and Skoufis.

4 Ayes, 58. Nays, 2.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
6 is passed.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 1813, Assembly Bill Number 11539, by
9 Assemblymember Alvarez, an act to amend the
10 Education Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
14 act shall take effect July 1, 2026.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
19 the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
22 is passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 1814, Senate Print 10619, by Senator Sutton, an
25 act to amend the Public Authorities Law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
2 last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
4 act shall take effect immediately.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
9 the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 1815, Senate Print 10623, by Senator Bynoe, an
15 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
19 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
20 shall have become a law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
25 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick to explain her vote.

1 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK:

2 Thank you, Mr. President.

3 I want to thank the sponsor.

4 Southern State Parkway is right by
5 my home. And just within the last few weeks, we
6 had a horrific accident where a drunk driver
7 crossed over the divider, hit another car
8 head-on, killing the two occupants, who were in
9 their eighties. And then also careened with four
10 or five other cars. It was a disaster.

11 Just recently I wrote to the
12 Governor asking her to reopen the State Trooper
13 facility in this area in Valley Stream, which
14 covers my district, on the Southern State Parkway
15 because of the issues that we're seeing.

16 So I thank the sponsor for bringing
17 this up. I proudly vote aye.

18 Thank you, Mr. President.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
20 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick to be recorded in the
21 affirmative.

22 Senator Martins to explain his vote.

23 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,
24 Mr. President.

25 The stretch between Exit 17 and

1 Exit 32 on the Southern State Parkway on
2 Long Island is known as Blood Alley. It's known
3 as Blood Alley because of the number of accidents
4 that have happened there over the years.

5 The highway, Mr. President, was
6 constructed at a time when they didn't expect
7 vehicles to travel quite as fast as they do right
8 now, the lanes are a little narrower.

9 And unfortunately, with the number
10 of cars that travel on the Southern State
11 Parkway, invariably there have been accidents
12 and, as has been described, some really bad
13 accidents over the years.

14 I want to thank the sponsor for this
15 initiative. Anything we can do to get cars to
16 slow down, to pay attention. And yes, as
17 Senator Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick just said, add
18 enforcement. And increased enforcement in the
19 area will save lives, will protect residents.

20 And therefore, again, thank you to
21 the sponsor.

22 Mr. President, I vote aye.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
24 Martins to be recorded in the affirmative.

25 Senator Rhoads to explain his vote.

1 SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you,
2 Mr. President.

3 Exits 23 through 29 actually run
4 through my district as well. And I'm greatly
5 appreciative to Senator Bynoe for carrying this
6 piece of legislation.

7 I certainly associate myself with
8 the comments of my colleagues Senator Martins and
9 Senator Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick. This is a
10 dangerous stretch of roadway, and anything we can
11 do to make it a little bit safer is certainly
12 well worth doing. So again, thank you to the
13 sponsor.

14 I proudly vote aye.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
16 Rhoads to be recorded in the affirmative.

17 Announce the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1816, Assembly Bill Number 11552, by
23 Assemblymember Stern, an act to amend the
24 Tax Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
10 Calendar 1816, voting in the negative:
11 Senator Skoufis.

12 Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 1817, Senate Print 10643, by Senator Ramos, an
17 act to amend the Cannabis Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 9. This
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
3 Calendar 1817, voting in the negative are
4 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
5 Chan, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming, Hinchey,
6 Krueger, Lanza, Martins, May, O'Mara, Ortt,
7 Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber
8 and Weik. Also Senator Rivera.

9 (Pause.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
13 Calendar 1817, voting in the negative are
14 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
15 Chan, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming, Hinchey,
16 Krueger, Lanza, Martins, May, O'Mara, Ortt,
17 Palumbo, Rhoads, Rivera, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco,
18 Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

19 Ayes, 37. Nays, 23.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
21 is passed.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 1818, Assembly Bill Number 11538, by
24 Assemblymember Lee, an act to amend the
25 Military Law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
2 last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
4 act shall take effect immediately.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
9 the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 1819, Assembly Bill Number 11077A, by
15 Assemblymember Burroughs, an act to amend the
16 Highway Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
20 act shall take effect immediately.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
25 the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 1820, Senate Print 10187, by Senator Rhoads, an
6 act to amend the Nassau County Civil Divisions
7 Act.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 1821, Senate Print 10655, by Senator Jackson, an
22 act to amend the Civil Service Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
24 Gianaris.

25 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,

1 is there a message of necessity at the desk?

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: There is
3 a message of necessity at the desk.

4 SENATOR GIANARIS: Move to accept
5 the message of necessity.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: All those
7 in favor of accepting the message, please signify
8 by saying aye.

9 (Response of "Aye.")

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Opposed,
11 nay.

12 (No response.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
14 message is accepted, and the bill is before the
15 house.

16 Read the last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 24. This
18 act shall take effect immediately.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill

1 is passed.

2 Senator Gianaris, that completes the
3 reading of today's supplemental calendar.

4 SENATOR GIANARIS: Let's move on to
5 the controversial calendar, please.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
7 Secretary will ring the bell.

8 The Secretary will read.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 595, Senate Print 1913, by Senator Rivera, an act
11 to amend the Public Health Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
13 Gallivan, why do you rise?

14 SENATOR GALLIVAN: Would the
15 sponsor answer some questions, or yield for some
16 questions?

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
18 sponsor yield?

19 SENATOR RIVERA: Yes.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
21 sponsor yields.

22 SENATOR GALLIVAN: So this bill has
23 to do with the 340B program. How does this bill,
24 Senator Rivera, ensure that the intent of the
25 program is properly realized?

1 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,
2 Mr. President. For those folks who might not be
3 familiar, the 340B program is a federal program
4 that provides benefits to institutions, health
5 institutions across the country.

6 What it does is -- it's a critical
7 financial lifeline for so many institutions
8 because what it does is it provides discounted
9 drugs to facilities all across the nation.

10 But this is the thing that we have
11 to focus on, Mr. President. The fact is that the
12 program was designed specifically to aid
13 organizations like FQHCs, safety net hospitals,
14 et cetera, that then use the savings that they
15 accrue from getting discounted drugs to be able
16 to do all sorts of things for folks in different
17 communities all across the state and all across
18 our country.

19 Whether it is providing
20 uncompensated care, which includes folks who are
21 either uninsured or underinsured, whether it's
22 dealing with behavioral health crises, whether
23 it's vaccination programs, public health fairs,
24 et cetera, et cetera, the savings that
25 organizations, FQHCs across the state accrue, and

1 hospitals as well, accrue from these savings
2 allow them to provide all these services to the
3 most vulnerable in our state.

4 SENATOR GALLIVAN: Will the sponsor
5 yield?

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
7 sponsor yield?

8 SENATOR RIVERA: Yes.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
10 sponsor yields.

11 SENATOR GALLIVAN: I understand the
12 program, and it's a very good program if
13 properly -- properly implemented. But how does
14 this bill ensure that it is properly implemented
15 and properly administered?

16 SENATOR RIVERA: Well, through you,
17 Mr. President, what this bill does is it actually
18 makes certain that -- there are some actions that
19 pharmaceutical companies are taking right now
20 which are actually making it harder for the
21 program to be administered correctly, and I thank
22 my colleague for bringing that up.

23 The fact is what this bill would do
24 is it prohibits a pharmaceutical manufacturer, a
25 PBM or pharmacy benefit manager, an outsourcing

1 facility or a third-party logistic provider from
2 directly or indirectly denying, prohibiting,
3 conditioning, or otherwise limiting dispensing of
4 drugs from a covered entity or contract pharmacy,
5 denying access to drugs manufactured by a
6 pharmaceutical manufacturer to a covered entity
7 or contracted pharmacy, but most importantly,
8 imposing requirements, exclusions, reimbursement
9 terms, fees and audits, et cetera, that are not
10 required by the federal program.

11 So it's actually making the --
12 putting this bill -- making this a bill a reality
13 and making sure that it is signed into law would
14 make sure that the program actually continues to
15 do the thing that it's supposed to be doing; in
16 other words, helping institutions that serve the
17 most vulnerable in every corner of our state, in
18 every Senate district in the state.

19 SENATOR GALLIVAN: Will the sponsor
20 continue to yield?

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
22 sponsor yield?

23 SENATOR RIVERA: Yes.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
25 sponsor yields.

1 SENATOR GALLIVAN: Are there any
2 transparency measures in the bill to ensure that
3 the money is spent consistent with the intent of
4 the program?

5 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,
6 Mr. President. It's funny that my colleague
7 mentions this. There is -- in this particular
8 bill there is no language necessarily for
9 transparency.

10 I should mention that every single
11 entity -- for example, every hospital in the
12 State of New York is a nonprofit entity. Every
13 FQHC, or Federally Qualified Health Center, all
14 of these institutions have a requirement to say
15 the type of care or the type of charity care,
16 et cetera, that they provide to their
17 constituents -- to our constituents, I should
18 say, and to the patients that they serve.

19 So although there's nothing in this
20 bill specifically that deals with transparency as
21 it is -- as it keeps being brought up, the notion
22 that there are large institutions that are taking
23 advantage of the program, the fact is that the
24 institutions that I'm looking to protect here are
25 institutions that we should all seek to protect:

1 Federally Qualified Health Centers, safety-net
2 institutions across the state, et cetera, that
3 serve the most vulnerable.

4 SENATOR GALLIVAN: Will the sponsor
5 continue to yield?

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
7 sponsor yield?

8 SENATOR RIVERA: Yes.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
10 sponsor yields.

11 SENATOR GALLIVAN: If I could ask
12 the sponsor just to clarify your last answer when
13 you talked about large institutions taking
14 advantage of the program.

15 Did that mean that they're utilizing
16 the program the way it's intended, or they're
17 doing something wrong?

18 (Pause.)

19 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,
20 Mr. President.

21 What I am saying is that there is a
22 claim, there's a consistent claim that folks who
23 are availing themselves of this program are
24 taking, quote, unquote, advantage of it. And
25 this is a talking point that is used over and

1 over again.

2 It is a complicated program at
3 the -- and it is a federal program, and certainly
4 larger institutions probably have more ease in --
5 they have the capacity to be able to avail
6 themselves of it by having more resources to be
7 able to use it correctly.

8 But the reality is that ultimately
9 whether it is HRSA, whether it's the IRS, whether
10 it's the New York State Attorney General, all of
11 these entities have authority to look into
12 whether there is -- whether there is any
13 impropriety.

14 So certainly while I use the word,
15 it is really a talking point that really obscures
16 the fact that ultimately these impositions from
17 pharmaceutical companies are about them
18 maintaining their profit margin. And it
19 certainly -- I don't blame them. This is what
20 they do. They have to maximize profit for their
21 stockholders.

22 But for us, the job of us in this
23 chamber and certainly in this building should be
24 to protect the most vulnerable. And again this
25 program, which was created specifically for the

1 purpose of having institutions like FQHCs and
2 safety-net institutions avail themselves of
3 savings to use to provide all sorts of services
4 to the most vulnerable, that is what this bill is
5 intending to do: Make sure that the program
6 continues to exist in that capacity.

7 SENATOR GALLIVAN: Will the sponsor
8 continue to yield?

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
10 sponsor yield?

11 SENATOR RIVERA: Yes.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
13 sponsor yields.

14 SENATOR GALLIVAN: So we know that
15 the beneficiaries should be the underserved, or
16 underserved populations.

17 But does this bill do anything to
18 ensure that we -- the collective we, or those
19 administering the program in the state -- will
20 know that the benefits are getting to the right
21 place?

22 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,
23 Mr. President. What I would suggest is that --
24 well, the bill specifically does not do -- does
25 not do any of that.

1 What I would say is, number one, as
2 I mentioned already, there are more than a few --
3 there's responsibilities that these entities have
4 because they are nonprofit institutions, because
5 they have -- they are using public dollars and
6 they're availing themselves of a public program,
7 in this case a federal one, they have certain
8 responsibilities to be able to maintain all these
9 records and to provide them to these entities.
10 That's number one.

11 And number two, what I would suggest
12 to anyone, not just my colleague who's asking the
13 questions -- through you, Mr. President -- but to
14 any single person in this State Senate or in the
15 State Assembly, to reach out to the FQHC or
16 Federally Qualified Health Center that serves
17 them or their community. And they will be told
18 by those folks, it will just take them a few
19 minutes, probably, to be able to say what they
20 use this money for.

21 So there are, again,
22 responsibilities that each one of these entities
23 has to report the charity care that they provide.
24 So it's not like they're hiding anything. They
25 have to provide this information to the IRS, to

1 HRSA, to the New York Attorney General if
2 requested.

3 And ultimately, if you just ask any
4 of these safety-net institutions or
5 Federally Qualified Health Centers, I'm sure they
6 will be able to tell you all the things that they
7 do with these savings.

8 SENATOR GALLIVAN: Thank you,
9 Senator.

10 Will the sponsor continue to yield?

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
12 sponsor yield?

13 SENATOR RIVERA: Yes.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
15 sponsor yields.

16 SENATOR GALLIVAN: So the sponsor,
17 in describing what the bill -- what the program
18 was and then what the bill did, essentially
19 restricts the pharmaceutical manufacturer,
20 third-party logistics provider, whomever is
21 selling the pharmaceuticals, it restricts them
22 from doing certain things.

23 Would that be accurate?

24 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,
25 Mr. President, yes.

1 SENATOR GALLIVAN: Will the sponsor
2 continue to yield?

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Does the
4 sponsor yield?

5 SENATOR RIVERA: Yes.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
7 sponsor yields.

8 SENATOR GALLIVAN: And if I
9 understand it correctly, then these manufacturers
10 enter into some sort of contract with the
11 hospitals, the FQHCs or whoever is on the
12 receiving end. Is that accurate?

13 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,
14 Mr. President, it is not a direct contract, so to
15 speak, exactly.

16 But there is a requirement that
17 these -- that the pharmaceuticals would be under
18 the obligations of the federal program to provide
19 drugs at a discounted price to these health
20 institutions.

21 SENATOR GALLIVAN: Will the sponsor
22 continue to yield?

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
24 sponsor yield?

25 SENATOR RIVERA: Yes.

1 SENATOR GALLIVAN: And thank you
2 for that. I'll move on.

3 They're of course like many bills,
4 but this one is so significant, and the
5 340B program is so significant. Like many bills,
6 we have tremendous support for the bill and I
7 would suggest tremendous opposition.

8 Among those opposing it are the
9 State Laborers, NAACP for the state, the State
10 Building and Construction Trades Council,
11 Partnership for New York City, the Teamsters
12 Local 237, the Hispanic Health Network, and the
13 Latino Commission on AIDS, among others.

14 Why would they be opposing this
15 bill?

16 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,
17 Mr. President. Certainly each one of these
18 folks, some of them have provided memos, some of
19 them have not. So the reasoning you can find in
20 their memos.

21 But the reality is that we've
22 actually had -- I've actually had conversations
23 with some folks who after they say, for example,
24 this will raise our costs, then my next question,
25 my follow-up, is how will it do that? They can't

1 actually tell us. Which is what's -- which is a
2 little weird here.

3 I certainly understand the
4 opposition from pharmaceutical companies. And I
5 respect it. They are doing what they need to do
6 to make sure that they can keep making money and
7 making profit.

8 In the case of many of these
9 institutions, you would have to ask them why
10 they're opposed. But I certainly think that
11 the -- when we're talking about who is supportive
12 of it and you're talking about every Federally
13 Qualified Health Center -- and I do have a list
14 if my colleague -- if my colleague wants, I can
15 provide him a list -- he probably knows it.
16 Every single person in here probably knows every
17 safety-net institution and every Federally
18 Qualified Health Center in their district.

19 As a matter of fact, more than a few
20 times, Mr. President, in the last few years there
21 have been some of my colleagues on this side of
22 the aisle and on that side of the aisle that have
23 reached out to me and my staff saying, This is an
24 issue that we have with an institution in our
25 backyard that is about to go bust, that is just a

1 couple of months away from completely losing
2 money, or not being able to operate, because they
3 don't -- they can't cover payroll.

4 And this is something that happens
5 all over the place. These are the same
6 institutions, Mr. President, that use this
7 program to be able to get some savings and to be
8 able to provide some of the services that they
9 have, some of the services that they provide, to
10 our most vulnerable across the state.

11 So certainly the opposition, while I
12 respect it, I don't understand it. And I'm not
13 saying as in I read the memos and outside of
14 saying we want to make sure that we keep most of
15 our money -- which is what pharma says, and
16 God bless them for it -- a lot of other folks I
17 don't necessarily understand their opposition.

18 SENATOR GALLIVAN: Would the
19 sponsor continue to yield?

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
21 sponsor yield?

22 SENATOR RIVERA: Yes.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
24 sponsor yields.

25 SENATOR GALLIVAN: The sponsor

1 earlier -- properly, of course -- described this
2 as a federal program.

3 My question is, wouldn't it be
4 better for this to be addressed at the federal
5 level, as opposed to the state trying to regulate
6 a federal program?

7 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,
8 Mr. President. The reason this bill is necessary
9 is as a response to actions that the
10 pharmaceutical companies have taken.

11 And I should tell you, by the way,
12 that this is not the only time that they've tried
13 it. This is not the only place that they've
14 tried it, Mr. President. And there's been
15 lawsuits that have been brought by the
16 pharmaceutical companies against states that have
17 actually acted against them, and they have not
18 been successful.

19 So as opposed to fidgeting with the
20 federal program, which certainly is something
21 that could happen, we are not the federal
22 government here, and we do not -- thank the good
23 Lord -- and we do not have -- and with this bill,
24 we don't change anything in the federal program.

25 What we do is we actually say to the

1 pharmaceutical companies is like, Hey, you're
2 messing with it, you are using -- you are doing
3 things that actually make it harder for
4 institutions to avail themselves of this program.
5 And by doing that, you're making it harder for
6 these institutions to have the only lifeline that
7 many of them have to be able to continue to
8 operate.

9 And so you shouldn't do that
10 anymore. And what this bill would do is it would
11 ban you from doing those things.

12 Which again, Mr. President, is to do
13 something that the federal government does not
14 require and that when they have challenged other
15 states' actions in curtailing theirs, when pharma
16 in other states, when pharmaceutical companies,
17 period, have challenged the actions of other
18 states in their curtailment of the actions that
19 they have taken, they have been found to not --
20 they haven't been successful in getting the
21 courts to back them up.

22 SENATOR GALLIVAN: Would the
23 sponsor continue to yield?

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
25 sponsor yield?

1 SENATOR RIVERA: Yes.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
3 sponsor yields.

4 SENATOR GALLIVAN: I'm not sure if
5 you're aware, Senator Rivera, that within the
6 past week that the Health Resources and Services
7 Administration submitted a proposed rulemaking on
8 the federal 340B program to OMB for review and
9 approval.

10 And the first question: Are you
11 aware of it? And whether you are or whether
12 you're not, my question is, wouldn't it be better
13 to wait to see what happens with these proposed
14 changes before the state tries to make -- tries
15 to further regulate it?

16 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,
17 Mr. President. We're -- there might be some
18 changes -- I was not aware that in the last
19 week -- we've been kind of busy the last week, as
20 you probably -- as you probably know.

21 So I was not aware of that
22 particular potential rulemaking, or at least this
23 process of public comment. And so there might be
24 some changes to the program, but again, this does
25 not change what the federal program does.

1 What we're seeing here is that the
2 actions of the pharmaceuticals companies are the
3 inappropriate ones, that they're the ones -- (to
4 staffers with documents) You can go ahead and
5 pick it up. That's fine, you can pick it up. Go
6 ahead. It happens. It's a lot of information
7 there.

8 Anyway, what we're saying is that
9 the actions of the pharmaceutical companies are
10 the inappropriate ones. They are going beyond
11 the scope of what the program allows because what
12 they're doing is they're making it harder for
13 institutions to avail themselves of it.

14 And the program was designed
15 specifically -- it's funny, some of the staffers,
16 the same ones that dropped some papers, the
17 reason they dropped the papers, Mr. President, is
18 because there's a lot of research that has been
19 on this, and there's some of that research that
20 tells us that when this was actually put into
21 effect, there's actually, on the Congressional
22 Record, there is a description of what the
23 program is meant to do.

24 And what the pharmaceutical
25 companies are doing are actually making it harder

1 for that to actually function.

2 So as opposed to not following the
3 federal guidelines, what we're saying is like
4 please just leave it alone, let's make sure -- if
5 there's federal guidelines that changed,
6 Mr. President, then we'll have to avail -- we'll
7 have to abide by those changes.

8 But for the moment we're just
9 saying: Pharmaceutical companies, do not do what
10 you're doing because you're making it harder for
11 these institutions to continue to survive.

12 SENATOR GALLIVAN: Would the
13 sponsor continue to yield?

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
15 sponsor yield?

16 SENATOR RIVERA: Yes.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
18 sponsor yields.

19 SENATOR GALLIVAN: Through you,
20 Mr. President, is Senator Rivera satisfied with
21 the level of oversight of this current program?
22 And does this bill do anything to make the
23 oversight better? If you're dissatisfied with
24 it.

25 (Pause.)

1 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,
2 Mr. President. The bill does have language that
3 just insists that every hospital and every
4 financial -- every health institution in the
5 state has to follow federal law.

6 And certainly if there's some more
7 oversight that needs to be done there, as I
8 mentioned earlier, we have -- whether it is HRSA,
9 which you mentioned earlier, whether -- and that,
10 by the way, is the Health Resources and Services
11 Administration, which is a state -- which is a
12 federal entity that is responsible for oversight
13 of all sorts of health programs. This is one of
14 them.

15 So whether they change the rules --
16 whether it's the IRS, which they have to file
17 their taxes with as nonprofit organizations, or
18 whether it is through the New York Attorney
19 General, which can investigate them. So I think
20 that that's plenty of places where oversight can
21 occur.

22 Ultimately my concern,
23 Mr. President, is for the fact that there
24 institutions that serve vulnerable people in
25 every corner of our state -- not just in the

1 Bronx, not just in Queens, not just in Buffalo,
2 not just in upstate New York, but in every part
3 of our state. And that the actions that the
4 pharmaceutical companies have taken have actually
5 made it harder for them to avail themselves of
6 that program.

7 So that is what I'm ultimately
8 focused on and what the bill seeks to do.

9 SENATOR GALLIVAN: On the bill,
10 Mr. President.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:
12 Senator Gallivan on the bill.

13 SENATOR GALLIVAN: I would like to
14 thank Senator Rivera for taking the time to
15 answer the questions.

16 And I very much appreciate his
17 concern to ensure that the benefits of this very
18 worthwhile program reach all the vulnerable
19 people across the state. We all should be
20 concerned about that. And so I very much
21 appreciate that.

22 I also, though, appreciate our
23 responsibility to ensure tax dollars are spent
24 properly, that we ensure proper oversight, to the
25 extent that we can. While this is a federal

1 program, of course, you've got some
2 administration responsibility by the state.

3 And I think the oversight of the
4 program is woefully inadequate. It is not
5 transparent at all. And I think working on a
6 bill to provide that better oversight, to provide
7 more transparency to ensure the proper use of the
8 program, proper implementation of the program,
9 will go much further in helping those that
10 actually need it.

11 Thank you, Mr. President.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
13 you, Senator Gallivan.

14 Senator Borrello, why do you rise?

15 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
16 on the bill.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
18 Borrello on the bill.

19 SENATOR BORRELLO: You know, I
20 understand that this is a program that has
21 provided needed funding to our hospitals.

22 But I also understand the reason
23 that these hospitals need that funding is because
24 of how our Medicaid program is so broken here in
25 New York State. Billions upon billions in

1 unchecked fraud, waste and abuse that no one
2 apparently wants to address. Medicaid
3 reimbursement rates that are well below the cost
4 of care. A Medicaid program that allows
5 recipients to use the emergency room like it's
6 their primary care physician.

7 And nothing in New York State has
8 been made better -- in fact, it's made worse.
9 With the exception of a handful of hospitals in
10 New York City, every other hospital in New York
11 State is not bleeding money, it's hemorrhaging
12 money. And that's because of a broken system
13 that has been abused, unfortunately, and not
14 fixed.

15 So we've got an easy -- we've got an
16 easy mark here, right? Pharmaceutical companies.
17 They can pay.

18 But there's no accountability.
19 There's no transparency. We really don't know
20 where the money is going. And truth be told, as
21 much as even the poor rural hospitals that I
22 represent utilize this program, it is being
23 abused by big hospitals in big areas that are
24 making a ton of money.

25 And meanwhile, we actually have

1 people that could be using discounted
2 pharmaceuticals. I know everyone wants to say,
3 No, no, no, don't worry about those folks that
4 are on Medicaid -- that's just not true. I've
5 heard from so many facilities, people that
6 provide lifesaving transfusions, that these drugs
7 are needed at that discount to save people's
8 lives. And there are people out there that don't
9 have insurance, that aren't on Medicaid, that are
10 given lifesaving treatments thanks to these
11 discounts.

12 So don't tell me this isn't for
13 people who need the discounted drugs. It is.
14 It's been perverted and abused over the course of
15 a couple of decades now. And I understand,
16 again, the need. But let's fix the broken
17 system. Let's root out the billions of dollars
18 in fraud, waste and abuse. And let's clean up
19 our Medicaid program here and provide proper
20 funding to our hospitals so that these programs
21 can move forward and benefit the people they're
22 supposed to benefit.

23 And that's why I'm voting no.

24 Thank you.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank

1 you, Senator Borrello.

2 Senator Gianaris.

3 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
4 pursuant to Rule 5, without objection, I move
5 that we stay in session past the hour of
6 midnight.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Without
8 objection, so ordered.

9 Are there any other Senators wishing
10 to be heard?

11 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
12 closed.

13 The Secretary will ring the bell.

14 Senator Gianaris.

15 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
16 we have agreed to restore this bill to the
17 noncontroversial calendar.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: On
19 consent, the bill is restored to the
20 noncontroversial calendar.

21 Read the last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
23 act shall take immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
3 Rivera to explain his vote.

4 SENATOR RIVERA: Thank you,
5 Mr. President. And I thank my colleague for the
6 conversation.

7 I am still very confused about you
8 all voting no. I am very confused, for example,
9 by my colleague that just explained his vote at
10 the end, because I agree with him. We seem to
11 agree with each other, Mr. President. It is
12 true.

13 And I have been, for my entire
14 tenure here -- certainly in my tenure as the
15 chair of the Health Committee, I've consistently
16 talked about the fact that we do not have a
17 long-term plan as far as Medicaid, as far as
18 strengthening the system that serves our most
19 vulnerable. That in every corner of our state,
20 in Senator Borrello's district, whether it's
21 Finger Lakes Community Center, whether it's
22 Chautauqua Health Center, Universal Primary Care,
23 Oak Orchard Community Health Center -- each one
24 of these is a Federally Qualified Health Center
25 that serves poor working-class folks in his

1 district.

2 And there's a list like this in
3 every single one of our districts, Mr. President.

4 And yet we're saying that the
5 actions that are being taken by multinational
6 billionaire, you know, make a profit-making
7 machines of the pharmaceutical companies are
8 doing things with this program that actually
9 restricts the ability of these institutions to be
10 able to take -- to be able to get the savings as
11 the program was designed, to provide
12 uncompensated care to those underinsured or
13 uninsured people in our state, to provide support
14 for behavioral health crises, to provide for
15 vaccination programs. Yes, to provide discounted
16 drugs for people. This is what the program is
17 for.

18 So the idea that you're voting no
19 when this is to protect that program is very
20 perplexing to me. But, you know, it is what it
21 is. Folks can vote what they wish.

22 The bottom line for me, this is --
23 it's an important bill. I am very glad -- I
24 should say quickly, Mr. President, that I'm
25 thankful to Leader Andrea Stewart-Cousins for

1 allowing this conversation to come to the floor.
2 Because the reality is that, again, in the time
3 that I've been in the Senate, certainly the time
4 that I've been the chair of the Health Committee,
5 every -- basically I can talk about all sorts of
6 times when colleagues of mine have come with
7 concerns about institutions in their backyard.
8 And I have tried to do what I can to be helpful
9 to them.

10 The reality is that we have to
11 definitely do a redesign on the entire system,
12 and I'm certainly committed to that. But the
13 notion that we would not try to protect what we
14 have available to us so that institutions that
15 protect the most vulnerable can continue to
16 operate, it's -- I am glad that this is coming to
17 the floor. I am hopeful that we can make it a
18 reality and turn it into a law.

19 And I will be proudly voting in the
20 affirmative. Thank you, Mr. President.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
22 Rivera to be recorded in the affirmative.

23 Announce the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
25 Calendar 595, voting in the negative are

1 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
2 Gallivan, Griffo, Lanza, O'Mara, Ortt, Rolison,
3 Tedisco, Weber and Weik.

4 Ayes, 48. Nays, 12.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
6 is passed.

7 There's a substitution at the desk.

8 The Secretary will read.

9 THE SECRETARY: Senator May moves
10 to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
11 Assembly Bill Number 9349B and substitute it for
12 the identical Senate Bill 8623B, Third Reading
13 Calendar 835.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY:
15 Substitution so ordered.

16 The Secretary will read.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 835, Assembly Bill Number 9349B, by
19 Assemblymember Torres, an act to amend the
20 General Business Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
22 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, why do you rise?

23 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK:
24 Mr. President, I'm wondering if the sponsor would
25 yield for a few questions.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
2 sponsor yield?

3 SENATOR MAY: I'd be glad to.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
5 sponsor yields.

6 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK:
7 Through you, Mr. President. Thank you,
8 Senator May, for yielding.

9 Reading Section 2 of the bill, on
10 page 4, it's sort of to me the guts of what this
11 is trying to do. And it says that no entity,
12 service provider shall set or adjust the
13 reference price or consumer price of a good or
14 service using surveillance pricing directly or
15 indirectly to a consumer.

16 Now, reading that, to me, it means
17 that you can't increase prices, you can't
18 decrease prices. Is that correct?

19 SENATOR MAY: Through you,
20 Mr. President. The bill prevents the use of
21 personal data for setting prices, individualized
22 prices for a consumer. So that would be going up
23 or going down, yes.

24 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK:
25 Through you, Mr. President, will the sponsor

1 continue to yield.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Does the
3 sponsor yield?

4 SENATOR MAY: I do.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
6 sponsor yields.

7 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK: So
8 looking also at this section that I just quoted
9 to you, if a company wants to use surveillance
10 pricing to decrease a price to someone that, say,
11 purchases an item over and over again, is that
12 permitted under this bill?

13 SENATOR MAY: Through you,
14 Mr. President. Yes, in certain cases, if -- they
15 can use purchase history as a reason for offering
16 a discount. Yeah, I'll stop there. Yes.

17 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK:
18 Through you, Mr. President, will the sponsor
19 continue to yield.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
21 sponsor yield?

22 SENATOR MAY: Yes.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
24 sponsor yields.

25 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK: So

1 I believe your first answer said that we're not
2 allowed to increase or decrease prices using
3 surveillance prices. So how is it that we could
4 possibly offer a discount using surveillance
5 pricing or my purchase history? How do you
6 reconcile those two statements that you just
7 made?

8 SENATOR MAY: Through you,
9 Mr. President. The exceptions to the rule of
10 using personal information are loyalty programs,
11 if somebody has signed up for a -- some kind of a
12 loyalty program, that those discounts can be
13 employed.

14 Group discounts, if you identify
15 yourself as a veteran or a senior or an expectant
16 parent or something like that.

17 And then purchase-history-based
18 discounts are the third exception to this. So
19 someone who has already purchased an item, a
20 retailer can offer a discount on the same item or
21 a similar item or an item that's paired with it,
22 like chips and salsa or something like that.

23 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK:
24 Mr. President, will the sponsor continue to
25 yield.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
2 sponsor yield?

3 SENATOR MAY: I will.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
5 sponsor yields.

6 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK: So
7 through you, Mr. President, I would ask if you
8 could point to where in the statute it provides
9 those exceptions that you just described to me.

10 SENATOR MAY: On page 2,
11 Sections (g) and (h) define the bona fide
12 discount and bona fide custom discount.

13 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK:
14 Mr. President, will the sponsor continue to
15 yield.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
17 sponsor yield?

18 SENATOR MAY: I will.

19 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK: So
20 my understanding is bona fide discounts can only
21 be offered if you and I as consumers get the same
22 exact discount. Is that correct?

23 SENATOR MAY: Through you,
24 Mr. President. The same exact discount for the
25 same reasons, yes.

1 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK:

2 Through you, Mr. President, will the sponsor
3 continue to yield.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
5 sponsor yield?

6 SENATOR MAY: I do.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
8 sponsor yields.

9 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK: So
10 currently when I go into CVS and I buy certain
11 brands of shampoo, my receipt will print out
12 discounts to try to entice me to use that shampoo
13 again, and it will say if you spend over \$15, you
14 get \$5 off. That's geared toward me because I
15 bought that particular item. Is that discount
16 allowed under this statute?

17 SENATOR MAY: Through you,
18 Mr. President, yes. That is because of prior
19 purchase history.

20 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK:
21 Through you, Mr. President, will the sponsor
22 continue to yield.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
24 sponsor yield?

25 SENATOR MAY: I will.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
2 sponsor yields.

3 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK: So
4 how is purchase history different than
5 surveillance pricing?

6 SENATOR MAY: Through you,
7 Mr. President. Surveillance pricing is a range
8 of things. They can mine all kinds of data from
9 your age and your zip code to the kind of
10 computer you might be using or even whether your
11 phone battery is dying -- a whole range of items
12 of data that then allow them to try to figure out
13 the maximum price they can get out of you.

14 So it's not just your -- the actions
15 that you have offered to the company by buying
16 something from them, but it's all kinds of other
17 information that they can get access to.

18 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK:
19 Through you, Mr. President, will the sponsor
20 continue to yield.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Does the
22 sponsor yield?

23 SENATOR MAY: I will.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
25 sponsor yields.

1 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK: So
2 looking at Section 2(d), where it says that no
3 entity or service provider shall offer a
4 bona fide customer discount unless such discount
5 is offered uniformly to any consumer who meets
6 the disclosed eligibility conditions or criteria.

7 When I read that, to me that
8 indicates that you are not permitted to get that
9 CVS discount based on the purchase history, as I
10 just described to you, because it states that a
11 discount has to be uniformly tailored -- I'm
12 sorry, a discount uniformly tailored to an
13 individual price history can't simultaneously
14 exist with what you just -- what I just read.

15 So I'm trying to understand, how do
16 you reconcile those two statements?

17 SENATOR MAY: Through you,
18 Mr. President. Could I ask you please to tell me
19 where you're looking? Because there is, on
20 page 3, a part about based solely on a consumer's
21 prior purchase history. That is in the language.

22 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK:
23 Through you, Mr. President, will the sponsor
24 continue to yield.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the

1 sponsor yield?

2 SENATOR MAY: I will.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
4 sponsor yields.

5 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK: So
6 I was reading on page 2, Section 2(d).

7 If you could refer me to the
8 carveout that you just mentioned, that would be
9 helpful.

10 (Pause.)

11 SENATOR MAY: I'm sorry for the
12 delay. Would -- could I -- through you,
13 Mr. President, could I ask you to repeat the
14 question just one more time.

15 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK:
16 Sure. When I read Section 2(d) it talks about
17 the fact that we can't offer a bona fide custom
18 discount unless such discount is offered
19 uniformly to any consumer who meets the disclosed
20 eligibility conditions or criteria.

21 So when I read that, to me that
22 means that you must offer a discount that is
23 uniform. Anything uniquely tailored to my
24 purchase history I believe is prohibited by that
25 section.

1 So what I'm trying to understand is
2 since you told me that the CVS discount that says
3 that I bought my shampoo and conditioner and
4 gives me a coupon, how is that permitted if under
5 this section it seems to be prohibited?

6 SENATOR MAY: Through you,
7 Mr. President. The fundamental idea here is that
8 anyone with the same profile deserves the same
9 discount. So if two people have the same
10 shopping behavior and discounts are being
11 offered, they should be offered to them
12 equivalently.

13 If they have different behavior,
14 they might qualify for a large -- one might
15 qualify for a larger discount.

16 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK:
17 Through you, Mr. President, will the sponsor
18 continue to yield.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Does the
20 sponsor yield?

21 SENATOR MAY: I do.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
23 sponsor yields.

24 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK: So
25 for subscription services, if I, say, have a

1 SiriusXM radio in my car and I don't want to pay
2 the full price and I call up and say I'm going to
3 cancel my service, and they turn around and say,
4 well, we'll give you a discount, we'll give it to
5 you for \$5 or \$6 a month.

6 Is that type of discount permitted
7 under this statute?

8 SENATOR MAY: Through you,
9 Mr. President. Yes, that is acceptable, because
10 it isn't using personal data.

11 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK:
12 Through you, Mr. President, will the sponsor
13 continue to yield.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Does the
15 sponsor yield?

16 SENATOR MAY: I do.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
18 sponsor yields.

19 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK: Are
20 you aware of the fact that there was a very
21 similar bill to this offered in Colorado that was
22 then vetoed by their governor? Are you aware of
23 that?

24 SENATOR MAY: I am aware.

25 But I also should say it's not that

1 similar, that we took carefully into account the
2 issues that came up with the Colorado bill in
3 drafting this bill.

4 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK:
5 Through you, Mr. President, will the sponsor
6 continue to yield?

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
8 sponsor yield?

9 SENATOR MAY: I will.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
11 sponsor yields.

12 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK: So
13 the Colorado veto message from the governor
14 specifically cites the fact that instead of
15 specifically defining and targeting unethical
16 conduct and practices, that their bill took a
17 very broad approach to capture any technology
18 that incidentally influences a price amount. And
19 it was the discount lost that was specifically
20 objectionable.

21 And I'm not sure if you're also
22 aware that Connecticut prohibits the algorithm
23 pricing, specifically exempting discounts. And
24 also in Maryland, that their law limits it to
25 price increases and price decreases are not

1 covered by their statute.

2 So I know that we've discussed this
3 extensively in committee, and I've always
4 appreciated our dialogue. But I'm wondering if
5 we could have done a better job on this by
6 targeting the increases and the bad actors and
7 leaving out the discounts and the price
8 reductions that we do get as benefits when a
9 consumer repeatedly buys a product.

10 SENATOR MAY: Through you,
11 Mr. President. I'm not sure if there was a
12 question there, but I do want to say, first of
13 all, I'm glad that other states are doing this.

14 Every state has a little bit of a
15 different context. And the fact is in Colorado
16 they have a comprehensive data privacy law that
17 their bill had to fit into, and it's one of the
18 reasons why they've had to struggle with the
19 implementation.

20 We have a different situation here
21 in New York State, and so this bill was
22 specifically targeted to the New York situation.

23 I'm not sure if there was another
24 question there.

25 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK:

1 Through you, Mr. President, will the sponsor
2 continue to yield?

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Will the
4 sponsor yield?

5 SENATOR MAY: I will.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
7 sponsor yields.

8 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK: So
9 I wonder if a person who buys sunscreen but
10 doesn't live near the beach, would their discount
11 that they're potentially offered, if it's
12 different than the person who does live near the
13 beach, is that permitted under this legislation?

14 SENATOR MAY: Through you,
15 Mr. President, no. That kind of geolocation data
16 is part of the problem. We find situations even
17 where -- there was a situation at Target where
18 they found that if you used the Target app from
19 the parking lot as opposed to inside the store,
20 you were being offered different prices because
21 they are -- they have an algorithm that figures
22 out where -- at which point in your journey you
23 might pay the most for the item.

24 And I do want to come back to the
25 question of discounts that you asked before,

1 because the big issue here is that -- is that if
2 you have, you know, a hundred-dollar list price
3 for something but everybody's getting a discount,
4 so that the average price is \$80, some people are
5 going to be getting more than the average and
6 some people are going to be getting less.

7 And the discount doesn't necessarily
8 mean that you're saving money, it just means you
9 might be saving more or less money than other
10 people around you. But it is -- but these
11 targeted discounts where they're doing individual
12 discounts for each person ends up driving the
13 price higher for everyone.

14 And that is the issue that we're
15 dealing with and the reason why we're doing this,
16 is because those very specifically targeted uses
17 of your personal data are being done. And the
18 reason there is so much lobbying against this
19 bill is that it makes a lot of money for the
20 companies if they can set the highest possible
21 price. They may call it a discount, but really
22 what they're trying to do is get the highest
23 possible price out of each person based on the
24 data that they have.

25 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK: On

1 the bill, Mr. President.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
3 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick on the bill.

4 SENATOR CANZONERI-FITZPATRICK:
5 Thank you, Senator May. As I stated before,
6 we've been on the Consumer Protection Committee
7 and we've discussed this bill before. I always
8 appreciate our interaction.

9 I do have a different interpretation
10 of this bill. And I have concerns. First of
11 all, Section 2(c) buried in this bill is a data
12 privacy section -- I'm sorry, 2(d). I think
13 we're trying to protect personal data, which I
14 don't disagree with, but it's buried in a
15 consumer protection bill in a way that, you know,
16 to come out at -- literally the last bill to be
17 debated, it's a little concerning that we didn't
18 have more time to discuss this.

19 The bill, in my opinion, does three
20 basic things. It does a lot of good things,
21 because it does try to make sure that our
22 personal data isn't retained and shared and used
23 for surveillance pricing. And it's trying to
24 make sure that we don't have bad actors.

25 But I do think that this bill does

1 prevent personalized discounts based on our
2 purchase history. I know there's a difference of
3 interpretation. But based on what I'm reading, I
4 think we're going to have a lot of problems.

5 I think that businesses that are
6 offering discounts to the person that comes into
7 the store often is a good thing. And it is the
8 business's decision to offer those discounts.
9 It's not like we're twisting their arm to make
10 sure that I keep going back to buy the same
11 product.

12 I think that in the time of
13 affordability that we have all talked about, that
14 putting our discount programs at risk is not a
15 good thing. It's not moving forward the ball of
16 us all talking about making sure that life is
17 more affordable for everybody.

18 I do think it's very powerful to
19 look and see what other states are doing. And,
20 you know, when I read the governor's statement
21 from Colorado, you know, that they said that, you
22 know, these discounts are really important and
23 that why can't we limit what we're doing to the
24 bad actors who are trying to, you know, price
25 gouge us. That's not what I want. Certainly

1 that's not what I think anybody would want for
2 our New Yorkers.

3 But I do think that, you know,
4 Maryland is on to something where they're saying
5 that, you know, we're going to only target those
6 who are trying to increase prices based on
7 surveillance information -- surveillance pricing,
8 and not necessarily wipe out all the discounts
9 that we can have.

10 So, Mr. President, I have a lot of
11 concerns about it. Maybe we'll see a chapter
12 amendment. Maybe Senator May and I will both be
13 back here next session and we can continue to
14 work on this bill, because I don't think it's
15 right the way it is.

16 And I will be voting in the
17 negative. Thank you.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
19 you, Senator Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick.

20 (Sternly.) Senator Borrello, why do
21 you rise?

22 (Laughter.)

23 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President --

24 (Laughter continues.)

25 SENATOR BORRELLO: I think I'm a

1 glutton for punishment, Mr. President. Will the
2 sponsor yield for a question?

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
4 May, will you yield?

5 SENATOR MAY: Gladly.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
7 sponsor yields.

8 SENATOR BORRELLO: When I think of
9 surveillance pricing, which I thought about way
10 too much in the last half hour, I don't think of
11 banks. I think of retail operations, you know,
12 drugstores, you know, grocery stores.

13 Why are banks included in
14 surveillance pricing legislation like this?

15 (Pause.)

16 SENATOR MAY: Through you,
17 Mr. President. We're in a strange moment when a
18 lot of different types of companies are also
19 financial institutions. So Target has a Target
20 card, Amazon or Apple, they have their own cards.
21 And so they count as financial institutions. But
22 they are the ones that -- really, you know, it's
23 the behavior of companies like those that it's
24 really what this bill is trying to get at.

25 So we didn't exempt financial

1 institutions, but we did say anything to do
2 with -- that involves creditworthiness is part --
3 is not subject to the -- is not considered
4 surveillance pricing. If you are -- if the bank
5 is giving you a loan or even a credit card based
6 on your credit history or other personal
7 information, that isn't proscribed here.

8 But we didn't want to just give a
9 blanket exemption to every financial institution,
10 because some of the biggest retailers are also
11 financial institutions.

12 SENATOR BORRELLO: Mr. President,
13 on the bill.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
15 Borrello on the bill.

16 SENATOR BORRELLO: I had a lot more
17 questions, but I could see nobody else wants to
18 hear them, so --

19 (Laughter.)

20 SENATOR BORRELLO: I think what we
21 have here is a bill that was just a big, you
22 know, kind of scattershot, if you will.

23 And I understand what you're trying
24 to accomplish. But when you start restricting a
25 financial institution's -- particularly a bank's

1 ability to be able to ensure that they are making
2 a good decision, they're going to choose not to
3 make the decision in favor of the consumer. So
4 what we're going to do here by not carving out
5 banks is restrict access to credit.

6 And with that, Mr. President, I'm
7 done. God bless you.

8 (Laughter.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: God bless
10 you, Senator Borrello.

11 (Laughter.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Are there
13 any other Senators wishing to be heard?

14 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
15 closed.

16 The Secretary will ring the bell.
17 Senator Gianaris.

18 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
19 we've agreed to restore this bill to the
20 noncontroversial calendar, please.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
22 will be restored to the noncontroversial calendar
23 upon consent.

24 Read the last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This

1 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
2 shall have become a law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
7 May to explain her vote and close.

8 SENATOR MAY: Thank you,
9 Mr. President.

10 If you go back about 160 years,
11 shopping was a barter operation. You would go
12 into a store and you would haggle with the
13 shopkeeper over a price. And that was a
14 situation that some people loved, but for a lot
15 of people it was really difficult. If you were
16 new in town or you didn't speak the language very
17 well or you had multiple children in tow or
18 something like that, the chances that you would
19 come out feeling that you'd gotten a fair price
20 were pretty slim.

21 And then all of a sudden there was
22 this amazing invention of the price tag, where
23 people would go in a store and they would know
24 what the price of the items was and they would
25 know that everyone was getting the same price,

1 and they felt like things were much more fair.
2 And it put some downward pressure on prices
3 because businesses had to compete with each
4 other. And that was the state of affairs for a
5 very long time.

6 But now that we have this age of
7 Big Data and so much of our activity is online
8 and so much of that activity can be harvested for
9 decision-making by companies, all of a sudden we
10 see this wild, wild West where everything has
11 different prices all the time. It's almost
12 impossible to do comparison shopping because the
13 prices are changing constantly.

14 And what we are finding is often it
15 is done in a way that is really discriminatory
16 and, once again, hardest on the people who are in
17 a hurry, who are harried, who are struggling,
18 whose phone is dying, who have some kind of thing
19 that signals that this company can charge them a
20 higher price.

21 And that is what we are trying to
22 get at to make sure that people can have some
23 sense that the prices that they are being charged
24 are fair prices and are similar to the prices
25 other people in their situation would be offered.

1 And so I am proud of all the work
2 that we've done, really grateful to the people
3 who worked so hard on this bill, and I proudly
4 vote aye.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
6 May to be recorded in the affirmative.

7 Announce the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
9 Calendar 835, voting in the negative are
10 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
11 Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins,
12 Mattera, Murray, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,
13 Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

14 Ayes, 39. Nays, 21.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
16 is passed.

17 Senator Gianaris, that completes the
18 reading of the controversial calendar.

19 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
20 please recognize Senator Lanza for a motion.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
22 Lanza.

23 SENATOR GIANARIS: For what reason,
24 I don't know.

25 SENATOR LANZA: Thank you,

1 Senator Gianaris.

2 Mr. President, I call up
3 Senator Helming's bill, Print No. 10182A,
4 recalled from the Assembly, which is now at the
5 desk.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
7 Secretary will read.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 1256, Senate Print 10182A, by Senator Helming, an
10 act to amend Chapter 117 of the Laws of 1983.

11 SENATOR LANZA: I now move to
12 reconsider the vote by which the bill was passed.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
14 roll on reconsideration.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
18 is restored to its place on the Third Reading
19 Calendar.

20 SENATOR LANZA: I now offer the
21 following amendments.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
23 amendments are received.

24 Senator Gianaris.

25 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,

1 there are several privileged resolutions at the
2 desk. Let's take those up, please.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: There are
4 privileged resolutions at the desk.

5 The Secretary will read.

6 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 2343, by
7 Senator Stewart-Cousins, amends a plan setting
8 forth an itemized list of grantees for a certain
9 appropriation for additional grants in aid for
10 certain educational and not-for-profit
11 institutions.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
13 question is on the resolution.

14 Call the roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
19 Resolution 2343, voting in the negative are
20 Senators Borrello, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming,
21 Lanza, O'Mara, Ortt, Rhoads, Stec, Walczyk and
22 Weik.

23 Ayes, 49. Nays, 11.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
25 resolution is adopted.

1 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 2344, by
2 Senator Stewart-Cousins, amends a plan setting
3 forth an itemized list of grantees for a certain
4 appropriation for the 2023-2024 fiscal year for
5 services and expenses of human services and
6 veterans community services organizations.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
8 question is on the resolution.

9 Call the roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
14 Resolution 2344, voting in the negative are
15 Senators Borrello, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
16 O'Mara, Ortt, Lanza, Stec and Walczyk.

17 Ayes, 51. Nays, 9.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
19 resolution is adopted.

20 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 2345, by
21 Senator Stewart-Cousins, amends a plan setting
22 forth an itemized list of grantees for a certain
23 appropriation for additional grants in aid for
24 certain educational and not-for-profit
25 institutions.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
2 question is on the resolution.

3 Call the roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
6 the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
8 Resolution 2345, voting in the negative are
9 Senators Borrello, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming,
10 Lanza, O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk and
11 Weik.

12 Ayes, 49. Nays, 11.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
14 resolution is adopted.

15 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 2346, by
16 Senator Stewart-Cousins, amends a plan setting
17 forth an itemized list of grantees for certain
18 appropriations for services and expenses of
19 economic development and community services
20 organizations.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
22 question is on the resolution.

23 Call the roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
3 Resolution 2346, voting in the negative are
4 Senators Borrello, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming,
5 Lanza, O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco and Walczyk.

6 Ayes, 50. Nays, 10.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
8 resolution is adopted.

9 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 2347, by
10 Senator Stewart-Cousins, amends a plan setting
11 forth an itemized list of grantees for a certain
12 appropriation for aid for services and expenses
13 of human services and veterans community services
14 organizations.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
16 question is on the resolution.

17 Call the roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
22 Resolution 2347, voting in the negative are
23 Senators Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, O'Mara, Ortt,
24 Stec, Tedisco and Walczyk.

25 Ayes, 52. Nays, 8.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
2 resolution is adopted.

3 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 2348, by
4 Senator Stewart-Cousins, amending a plan setting
5 forth an itemized list of grantees for a certain
6 appropriation for the 2025-2026 state fiscal
7 year.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
9 question is on the resolution.

10 Call the roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
13 the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
15 Resolution 2348, voting in the negative are
16 Senators Borrello, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming,
17 Lanza, O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco and Walczyk.

18 Ayes, 50. Nays, 10.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
20 resolution is adopted.

21 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 2349, by
22 Senator Stewart-Cousins, amends a plan
23 establishing an itemized list of grantees for
24 2025-2026 providing community safety and
25 restorative justice programs.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
2 question is on the resolution.

3 Call the roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
6 the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
8 Resolution 2349, voting in the negative are
9 Senators Borrello, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming,
10 O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco and Walczyk. Also
11 Senator Lanza.

12 Ayes, 50. Nays, 10.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
14 resolution is adopted.

15 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 2350, by
16 Senator Stewart-Cousins, amends a plan setting
17 forth an itemized list of grantees for a certain
18 appropriation for additional grants in aid for
19 services and expenses of Senate priorities for
20 housing initiatives.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
22 question is on the resolution.

23 Call the roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
3 Resolution 2350, voting in the negative are
4 Senators Borrello, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
5 Lanza, O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco and Walczyk.

6 Ayes, 50. Nays, 10.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
8 resolution is adopted.

9 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 2351, by
10 Senator Stewart-Cousins, amends a plan setting
11 forth an itemized list of grantees for certain
12 appropriations for services and expenses of
13 economic development and community services
14 organizations.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
16 question is on the resolution.

17 Call the roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
22 Resolution 2351, voting in the negative are
23 Senators Borrello, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
24 Lanza, O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco and Walczyk.

25 Ayes, 50. Nays, 10.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
2 resolution is adopted.

3 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 2352, by
4 Senator Stewart-Cousins, amends a plan setting
5 forth an itemized list of grantees for a certain
6 appropriation for additional grants in aid for
7 certain educational and not-for-profit
8 institutions.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
10 question is on the resolution.

11 Call the roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
14 the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
16 Resolution 2352, voting in the negative are
17 Senators Gallivan, Griffio, Helming, O'Mara, Stec,
18 Tedisco and Walczyk.

19 Ayes, 53. Nays, 7.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
21 resolution is adopted.

22 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 2353, by
23 Senator Stewart-Cousins, establishes a plan
24 setting forth an itemized list of grantees for a
25 certain appropriation for the 2025-2026 state

1 fiscal year for services and expenses of human
2 services and veterans community services
3 organizations.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
5 question is on the resolution.

6 Call the roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
9 the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
11 Resolution 2353, voting in the negative are
12 Senators Borrello, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
13 O'Mara, Ortt, Stec and Walczyk.

14 Ayes, 52. Nays, 8.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
16 resolution is adopted.

17 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 2354, by
18 Senator Stewart-Cousins, amends a plan
19 establishing an itemized list of grantees for
20 2025-2026 providing community public health
21 programs and services.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
23 question is on the resolution.

24 Call the roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
2 the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
4 Resolution 2354, voting in the negative are
5 Senators Borrello, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
6 O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco and Walczyk.

7 Ayes, 51. Nays, 9.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
9 resolution is adopted.

10 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 2355, by
11 Senator Stewart-Cousins, establishes a plan
12 setting forth an itemized list of grantees for a
13 certain appropriation for the 2026-2027 state
14 fiscal year.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
16 question is on the resolution.

17 Call the roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
22 Resolution 2355, voting in the negative are
23 Senators Borrello, Gallivan, Helming, O'Mara,
24 Stec, Tedisco and Walczyk.

25 Ayes, 53. Nays, 7.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
2 resolution is adopted.

3 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 2356, by
4 Senator Stewart-Cousins, establishes a plan
5 setting forth an itemized list of grantees for a
6 certain appropriation for the 2026-2027 state
7 fiscal year.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
9 question is on the resolution.

10 Call the roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
13 the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
15 Resolution 2356, voting in the negative are
16 Senators Borrello, Gallivan, Griffio, Helming,
17 O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco and Walczyk.

18 Ayes, 51. Nays, 9.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
20 resolution is adopted.

21 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 2357, by
22 Senator Stewart-Cousins, establishes a plan
23 setting forth an itemized list of grantees for a
24 certain appropriation for the 2026-2027 state
25 fiscal year.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
2 question is on the resolution.

3 Call the roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
6 the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
8 Resolution 2357, voting in the negative are
9 Senators Borrello, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming,
10 Lanza, O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco and Walczyk.

11 Ayes, 50. Nays, 10.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
13 resolution is adopted.

14 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 2358, by
15 Senator Stewart-Cousins, establishes a plan
16 setting forth an itemized list of grantees for
17 2026-2027 providing public protection and
18 economic development programs.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
20 question is on the resolution.

21 Call the roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: In relation to

1 Resolution 2358, voting in the negative are
2 Senators Borrello, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming,
3 Lanza, O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco and Walczyk.

4 Ayes, 50. Nays, 10.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
6 resolution is adopted.

7 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 2359, by
8 Senator Stewart-Cousins, establishes a plan
9 setting forth an itemized list of grantees for
10 2026-2027 providing public health and mental
11 health programs.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
13 question is on the resolution.

14 Call the roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
19 Resolution 2359, voting in the negative are
20 Senators Borrello, Gallivan, Griffo, Lanza,
21 O'Mara, Ortt, Stec, Tedisco and Walczyk. Also
22 Senator Helming.

23 Ayes, 50. Nays, 10.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
25 resolution is adopted.

1 Senator Gianaris.

2 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
3 the sponsors of all of today's resolutions would
4 like to open them for cosponsorship.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: All
6 resolutions are open for cosponsorship. Should
7 you choose not to be a cosponsor, please notify
8 the desk.

9 Senator Gianaris.

10 SENATOR GIANARIS: I move to
11 recommit the calendar to the Rules Committee.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: So
13 ordered.

14 SENATOR GIANARIS: At this point
15 let's stand at ease while we await the leader.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
17 Senate will stand at ease.

18 (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease
19 at 12:45 a.m.)

20 (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at
21 12:48 a.m.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
23 Senate will return to order.

24 Senator Gianaris.

25 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,

1 please recognize Minority Leader Ortt.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Minority
3 Leader Ortt.

4 SENATOR ORTT: Good morning.

5 (Laughter.)

6 (Responses: "Good morning.")

7 SENATOR ORTT: It almost seems like
8 I was just here talking. I'm sure it seems that
9 way to all of you. And this speech will be a
10 little bit shorter.

11 (Cheers; applause.)

12 SENATOR ORTT: I said a little bit.

13 (Laughter.)

14 SENATOR ORTT: Don't get too
15 excited now.

16 But yeah, it is strange to have been
17 budget remarks last week, and now deja vu, here
18 we are at the end of session.

19 But it is the end of session. Every
20 year -- you know, this is not a normal place.
21 And I think we can all agree on that. When I
22 talk to my wife or my family, even constituents
23 who, you know, they don't come here but they
24 might have a bill that they might be interested
25 in or they might be asking about, when you try to

1 explain how things happen here, or why they
2 happen, it's like describing -- what it must have
3 been like for Neil Armstrong to describe to
4 somebody what the moon was like. It just -- it's
5 just -- unless you were there, it's really hard
6 to explain to people how this place goes.

7 But we all certainly know. And so
8 we are bonded by that shared experience. This
9 year, obviously, with the budget being so late
10 and the end of session being crunched into what
11 effectively was a week.

12 But to borrow sort of a phrase from
13 the Majority Leader, it's nice to actually be at
14 the end of the end. Right?

15 So I want to thank Majority Leader
16 Stewart-Cousins. Obviously we lead two
17 conferences that don't always agree on policy or
18 the direction of the state on the big-ticket
19 items. But we do agree on the value of what each
20 and every one of us do in this chamber, and on
21 the value and the importance of public service
22 and the role of the State Senate in leading the
23 state.

24 And so I want to thank her for
25 leading her conference, for working and

1 conversing with me on sometimes thorny issues.
2 We're not always on the floor here as leaders,
3 but I appreciate her -- again, her partnership
4 and her responsiveness.

5 I do want to thank my deputy,
6 Senator Andrew Lanza.

7 (Applause.)

8 SENATOR ORTT: So he came out this
9 morning in his seersucker suit. Now, usually
10 that means we're close. But as I told him, that
11 is the last-day suit. So if tomorrow's the last
12 day, he's got to wear that suit again tomorrow.

13 (Laughter.)

14 SENATOR ORTT: And there's been
15 years where that suit has gone about 48 hours,
16 maybe longer. But luckily we're going to get out
17 of here in about 24.

18 But I want to thank Senator Lanza.
19 It is a tough role, no doubt. The leader knows
20 this for her deputy. It is a tough spot, a tough
21 spot, especially this time of year, with the
22 amount of active lists, being out here, managing
23 the floor. There was a time, I said this week, I
24 said, You know -- to my members -- you've got to
25 understand, Senator Lanza sometimes is on the

1 floor, he's got Senator Gianaris over here asking
2 him what's going on, they're going
3 back-and-forth, and he's got me on the phone over
4 here. It's almost like the angel and the devil,
5 right, on each shoulder. You can decide who's
6 who.

7 (Laughter.)

8 SENATOR ORTT: You can decide who's
9 who.

10 But it is a tough spot to be in,
11 because you're managing what -- a relationship
12 with one side, and you're managing your members.
13 And I very much appreciate his friendship. I
14 appreciate his leadership, his partnership. And
15 we would not be able to get here as smoothly
16 without him.

17 So thank you very much, my friend.
18 I appreciate it.

19 (Applause.)

20 SENATOR ORTT: A lot has been said,
21 certainly, about Senator Gianaris. I know this
22 is his last night here. So it is my goal to of
23 course add to it a little bit if I can.

24 But I want to thank him for his
25 service, and I want to tell a quick little story.

1 So when Rob Ortt was a freshman Senator and I sat
2 right where Senator Martinez {sic} sits right
3 now -- which of course is the last seat over
4 there. You're just almost out in the hallway
5 there, right? But you're in. You're in the
6 chamber.

7 And when you're a new Senator, just
8 like now, very often your first bill is sort of
9 a -- you know, it's not earth-shattering
10 legislation, but it's your first bill. A big
11 deal. And it usually sails through, fairly non
12 controversially, maybe unanimously.

13 And after it's passed, usually the
14 floor leader of whatever conference will stand up
15 say, That's Senator So-and-so's first bill. And
16 everyone applauds, right? And it's a neat
17 feeling. Which is exactly what I expected to
18 happen for my first bill. But it did not. My
19 first bill was laid aside.

20 (Laughter.)

21 SENATOR ORTT: My first bill. Maybe
22 it was a premonition. But it was laid aside by
23 none other than the -- at the time, the floor
24 leader of the Minority, Senator Gianaris. It was
25 on Flag Day. That's what the topic was. We were

1 cleaning up -- for some reason the New York State
2 law said Flag Day was June 12th, and of course
3 federal law is June 14th. I don't know, I was
4 new, I inherited the bill from somebody else. We
5 were passing it. But Senator Gianaris wanted to
6 ask me a few questions.

7 And so we danced. And like so many
8 things, I was right, and it had to be changed.
9 And we passed it the next day unanimously, but
10 after that debate. But after debate, that was my
11 first sort of interaction and real face-to-face
12 with Senator Mike Gianaris. And I can tell you,
13 from that first impression, not much has changed,
14 so ...

15 (Laughter.)

16 SENATOR ORTT: But I appreciated
17 the debate.

18 And Senator Gianaris, while I can't
19 say that I will miss you, I do wish you well, and
20 your family, and whatever your future holds.

21 (Applause.)

22 SENATOR ORTT: So to our members
23 who are leaving, I know you all had a chance to
24 speak -- and I really appreciated that, by the
25 way, Leader. I don't remember that always

1 happening, like over the years, but that was
2 great. That was a great thing.

3 To the three members who are
4 leaving, you know, every conference is, aside
5 from the number of Republicans or Democrats,
6 you're colored by the personalities of the people
7 who are here. And the different skill sets and
8 the different talents and the different
9 background and experiences. And the communities
10 you represent.

11 And to the three members,
12 Senator Oberacker, Senator Weik, Senator Martins,
13 our conference will miss you. I think your
14 districts and the state will miss you. But the
15 great thing about this chamber, while you have
16 contributed to it, as we all know, it will go on
17 stronger because of your service. And you get to
18 write a piece of history which we're all
19 fortunate to be a part of.

20 So thank you for your service to
21 your communities, to our state, and to our
22 conference.

23 (Applause.)

24 SENATOR ORTT: To my staff, my
25 great staff, I want to thank -- in particular I

1 do want to start off, Peter Drao -- where's
2 Peter? Is he out here? Maybe he's sleeping,
3 poor guy.

4 Peter Drao got thrown into the fire
5 as the Republican finance secretary, finance
6 person, because our previous finance person left,
7 you know, sort of during -- well, I guess at the
8 time I thought it was terrible timing, but he
9 actually left on April 10th, which as it turned
10 out was months before the budget was passed.

11 (Laughter.)

12 SENATOR ORTT: So it gave us plenty
13 of time. I was very concerned at the time he
14 left, but Peter got thrown in there and did a
15 great job and has worked with Chris on the
16 Majority side.

17 And again, that relationship is very
18 important certainly for the Minority Conference,
19 the Republican Conference, and Peter did a
20 fantastic job. And really I don't think we
21 missed a beat. So I want to thank Peter for his
22 efforts.

23 (Applause.)

24 SENATOR ORTT: I want to thank
25 Chandler Frontero and Ryan Mulson for being on

1 the floor for many, many hours, seated very close
2 to Senator Lanza, and dealing with all that comes
3 with that.

4 I do want to thank my chief counsel,
5 Ben Kosinski. This is his first full session as
6 chief counsel, so I do want to recognize that.

7 And I'll just close -- see, I told
8 you it would be shorter. Between the budget and
9 this last week, it is certainly the -- my belief,
10 and I know the belief of our members, that a lot
11 of these stated goals at the beginning of
12 session, from the Governor on down, about
13 affordability and energy rates and creating jobs
14 and lowering costs, there's not a ton, if
15 anything, that we -- that I saw that addresses
16 any of that.

17 I know there will be things that are
18 going to be stated that they're going to address
19 those things, but there's certainly very little
20 evidence to back that up. As a matter of fact,
21 in the last couple of days, you know, we focused
22 on our problems -- i.e., political problems.

23 People in New York State were not
24 crying out for more gerrymandering. The people
25 of New York State were not crying out for new

1 judicial districts. Those are political
2 solutions to maybe political problems, at least
3 for one party. But that's not going to make
4 people's lives better in this state. It might
5 make some people in this room's lives better, but
6 not their constituents, not the people of
7 New York State.

8 It's not going to lower anyone's
9 energy costs. It's not going to lower their
10 taxes. In fact, I would argue if they get the
11 result they want, it will increase people's
12 taxes. It will increase people's energy rates.
13 It will increase the cost to live here.

14 There are -- and there was a lot of
15 discussion about that on the floor here, and I
16 watched some of it. And, lookit, it's politics.
17 And I can appreciate on some level my colleagues
18 who didn't shy away from it's just brass-knuckle
19 politics. But that is not what is going to
20 improve the lives of people in the state.

21 We removed checks and balances. We
22 removed -- what I always look at is -- we talk so
23 much about institutions, the institution of the
24 Senate. There's a lot of institutions that have
25 been built up over a long time in our country and

1 in our state. And those institutions
2 figuratively, just like institutions or buildings
3 literally, they have lodestones, they have
4 load-bearing walls that hold those things up.
5 And if you remove them, you weaken the structural
6 integrity of that building.

7 When we remove checks and balances,
8 we are weakening the structural integrity of our
9 institutions. And that's what we did this week
10 here in New York State. Somewhere -- I don't
11 know if he's still alive or not, but somewhere
12 Harry Reid, they got rid of the 60 votes to
13 appoint a Supreme Court justice. I'm sure my
14 colleagues across the aisle would tell you it
15 didn't work out the way Harry Reid thought it
16 would.

17 Sometimes these things do not work
18 out the way we think, and sometimes, whether it
19 redounds to the benefit of one party or another,
20 I do not think it redounds to the benefit of the
21 people, whether it's of New York State or of the
22 United States. And that's what I think we did
23 tonight, we did today and yesterday. We did not
24 strengthen our democratic institutions here in
25 New York, we weakened them. And we did so for

1 politics. And that was said many, many times.

2 We decided that changing terms like
3 "mother" and "father" in the law, that was going
4 to make people's lives better here in New York.
5 It just seems like a misplaced sense of
6 priorities.

7 And when we leave here, everyone in
8 this chamber is going to talk about what happened
9 here and what didn't happen here. And we're all
10 going to spend the next six months or, for some
11 of my colleagues, the next few weeks campaigning
12 and being in our districts and talking to our
13 constituents about what happened here, whether
14 you think it's great or not so great. Whether
15 you think it's going to make people's lives
16 better or not.

17 And we're going to talk about what
18 didn't occur. The missed opportunities, the
19 things we didn't tackle and didn't address, for
20 whatever reason. And there are always things
21 that don't get done. There are always things
22 that don't get done.

23 But the people of this state are
24 counting on us to get these things done. And
25 there are many of my constituents -- over the

1 years I have seen the decline in population.
2 Many of my colleagues, and even some of my
3 colleagues across the aisle, and certainly as a
4 state we've seen the loss of people. People
5 ultimately vote with their feet, as the old
6 saying goes.

7 And I don't think we did anything, I
8 don't think we did anything, Mr. President, to
9 try and keep folks on the edge, people who are
10 deciding whether their future is in New York,
11 whether they can afford for their future to be in
12 New York.

13 Businesses, a lot of anti-business
14 bills here. Now, some people at home might
15 think, what do I care? I don't own a business.
16 No, you don't. But that business provides jobs
17 that provide income for people to provide a roof
18 over their family's head, to put food on the
19 table, to put gas in the car, to save a little
20 for college.

21 And every time we do things -- and I
22 don't know how it affects -- you know, I know the
23 City of New York is a very different place. And
24 I know certain laws of economics do not apply as
25 equally to the City of New York as they do to the

1 rest of state, certainly upstate New York. I'll
2 say Western New York.

3 And I don't see anything we did
4 that's in the benefit of certainly
5 Western New York this week, I can tell you that
6 for damn sure.

7 And so it's disappointing, but now
8 the real work begins. We're going to be back
9 home with our constituents, the people who send
10 us here, and we have to answer to them for what
11 went on here and what didn't go on here. And we
12 have to articulate why we voted the way we did.

13 And I will conclude by saying that
14 actually makes me thrilled because, you know, as
15 some of my colleagues who are leaving -- everyone
16 talked, Senator Kavanagh -- everyone talked about
17 their family -- Senator Gianaris -- talked about
18 their family. And that's interesting to me, and
19 it's not accidental and it's not just like
20 cliché.

21 We all say we're fighting for
22 New York. And for a lot of us -- I'm sure the
23 leader, myself -- I travel around the state.
24 I've been in many of -- if not all of your
25 districts (indicating Republicans), and I've been

1 in some of your districts (indicating Democrats).
2 And it's a beautiful state. I really love every
3 part of it. But I don't know every part of it.
4 I don't wake up in the morning -- you know, I
5 don't live in Manhattan, so I don't wake up every
6 morning thinking I'm going to fight for Manhattan
7 because I don't live there, I don't know anyone
8 there. Those aren't my neighbors.

9 You get up and fight for your
10 constituents, and if you drill it down, you're
11 fighting for your family and your friends and
12 your neighbors and the people that you do know,
13 and that you extrapolate out are probably not
14 dissimilar from the people that you represent.
15 And they probably have the same dreams and hopes
16 and frustrations as the people that you know.
17 And you hope to come here and bottle that and
18 channel that into positive changes -- and in our
19 case, in trying to stop things that we believe
20 are going to harm those people.

21 And after the next few months, maybe
22 the few weeks, some people will not come back
23 next year by choice. Some people will not come
24 back by the choice of the voters of New York.
25 But this body will return, slightly different,

1 but with the same task, with the same obligation
2 to make the people of this state's lives better,
3 more affordable, more free, safer, and to put
4 this state on the right track.

5 And I hope the next legislature will
6 do a better job than this one.

7 Mr. President, I thank you.

8 To my colleagues in our conference,
9 thank you for allowing me to lead you through
10 another session.

11 To my colleagues across the aisle,
12 thank you for giving me the chance to be the
13 loyal opposition to you for another session.

14 And I wish all of you have a great
15 summer, a great fall, and I hope to see many of
16 you, most of you, back here come January.

17 Thank you very much, Mr. President.
18 God bless.

19 (Standing ovation from Republicans.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
21 Gianaris.

22 SENATOR GIANARIS: At this time
23 please recognize Majority Leader Andrea
24 Stewart-Cousins.

25 (Cheers; sustained applause.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Majority
2 Leader Andrea Stewart-Cousins.

3 (Standing ovation.)

4 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: So I'm
5 done now, right?

6 (Laughter.)

7 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: I think
8 that's what -- I think that's what that's all
9 about. Because you know, when I tell you to
10 trust the shaded boxes, you trust the shaded
11 boxes.

12 And I really, you know, just want to
13 do what Leader Ortt just did and begin by
14 thanking all the amazing people who make sure
15 that we do serve the people of New York State
16 with our very best.

17 I certainly want to congratulate my
18 colleagues in the Majority. Relentless,
19 tireless. It was a tough, tough call, and nobody
20 missed a beat. And nobody took their eye off the
21 ball. You focused, and focused under
22 extraordinary circumstances. Liz, who certainly
23 brought us through year after year of budget, was
24 not here. And everybody stood up and did what we
25 had to do.

1 She is fine. She has been
2 participating virtually. And we expect to see
3 Liz right back in her chair when we come back
4 next year.

5 (Sustained applause.)

6 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: So I want
7 to start by thanking people who I don't usually
8 thank, my presiding officers. Yup.

9 (Applause.)

10 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: So we
11 have Senator Bailey, Senator Mayer,
12 Senator Persaud, and Senator Cooney, who is
13 celebrating the birth of his newborn son, Aidan.

14 (Applause.)

15 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: And
16 again, thank you to the Minority Leader.

17 You know, we manage to always
18 communicate back and forth because I think we all
19 know that communication is the key. And when we
20 communicate and when you can, you know, take each
21 other's word and know what you're dealing with,
22 it's just a lot easier. So thank you for your
23 leadership.

24 And of course to Senator Lanza,
25 thank you for being the intrepid floor leader.

1 And I know you're going to miss your buddy.

2 SENATOR LANZA: I will.

3 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: But
4 again, I'm sure whoever's sitting in this seat
5 will benefit from your knowledge and experience.

6 I want to thank my senior staff, my
7 team. Where's J. Lang, Jonathan Lang?

8 (Applause.)

9 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: And
10 where's Dorothy Powell? There's Dorothy.

11 (Applause.)

12 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: And, you
13 know, you talked about your brand-new finance
14 secretary. I had a brand-new -- they both left
15 at the same time, right?

16 But so my brand-new finance
17 secretary, Chris Friend, did amazing work. Oh,
18 there you are.

19 (Applause.)

20 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: And a man
21 whose birthday was yesterday, my comms director,
22 Mike Murphy.

23 (Applause.)

24 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: And I
25 want to shout out to Leah Goldman, our director

1 of intergovernmental affairs.

2 (Applause.)

3 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: And she
4 just came back after giving birth to a beautiful
5 baby girl, Sharlyn {ph}.

6 I say that I am the Majority Leader
7 that has seen more births than anyone before me,
8 I'm telling you. It's wonderful because, you
9 know, it's always a source of delight to know
10 that there's a new generation coming and, you
11 know, if we do it right, they will continue in a
12 way of some kind of service, and certainly public
13 service is very, very noble.

14 I also want to be able to thank my
15 own staff, led by Jonathan Alvarenga.

16 (Applause.)

17 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: Thank
18 you. Jonathan and my team, thank you.

19 They manage my life in ways that
20 really, you know, all I have to do when I come
21 here is worry about all of you. So I do -- which
22 I do. So I appreciate, appreciate my staff
23 incredibly.

24 And I do want to give a special
25 thank you to the Secretary of the Senate,

1 Alejandra Paulino --

2 (Applause.)

3 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: -- and
4 her team.

5 Thank you, Alejandra, for making
6 sure the chamber and all the other things that we
7 have to do really run so very smoothly.

8 And let's give it up for Big Ben.

9 (Applause; cheers.)

10 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: And
11 really all the Sergeants. I think, you know,
12 again, we feel safe, we feel looked after. Our
13 guests do too. So thank you, Ben, all the
14 Sergeants, for all that you do.

15 (To Senator Gianaris) And of
16 course, you know, we said goodbye to you already,
17 but of course I will say it again.

18 It has been, you know, an honor of
19 my lifetime to serve with you, to be a partner
20 for so many years -- 13, to be exact.

21 And again, as I said, not only have
22 you been a trusted advisor, and a steady hand,
23 and just, you know, somebody who you could depend
24 on wherever you were to do whatever needed to be
25 done. I really, really thank you.

1 I know you are going to have a great
2 next chapter. But I thank you for all that
3 you've contributed to us every single day. Thank
4 you so much.

5 (Applause.)

6 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: I always
7 tell him that he really is the best Senate Deputy
8 Majority Leader ever. So, you know, I again
9 thank you for all your partnership.

10 And then you, Brian.

11 (Laughter.)

12 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: You know,
13 I'm saying how do I get to sit between two
14 departing members?

15 But again, Brian, thank you.

16 I think we had a chance, as you all
17 probably did, to spend time telling Brian the
18 impacts that he's made in our lives through his
19 example, through the way he has been able to
20 explain the minutest details with the utmost
21 amount of patience and intellect. And he'll
22 break it down for you, he'll meet you wherever
23 you are.

24 And the passion that he has around
25 the things that he cares about -- which is just

1 about everything. So it is. You know, he's one
2 of those incredible human beings.

3 And so again, we wish you well. We
4 will miss you. But each of us are better because
5 of the service that you've given us -- exactly,
6 both of you. So thank you so very much, Brian.

7 (Enthusiastic applause.)

8 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: And I
9 also want to wish my friends departing on that
10 side of the aisle -- Jack, you and I were here --
11 I called you a repeater because you came back,
12 right?

13 But I remember those early days in
14 Local Government, and it's a good -- I wish you
15 well. I'm sure if -- and you could come back
16 again if you want, but --

17 (Laughter.)

18 SENATOR GIANARIS: No.

19 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: A
20 three-peater.

21 (Laughter.)

22 SENATOR GIANARIS: No.

23 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: Don't say
24 no. You're not going to be here.

25 SENATOR GIANARIS: I want a

1 Democrat.

2 (Laughter.)

3 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: That's so
4 funny. Well, not right now, you know.

5 (Laughter.)

6 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: But to
7 you and to Senator Weik, thank you so much. It
8 feels like you've been here longer than six
9 years. When you said only six years, I was quite
10 surprised.

11 But again, I know that your family
12 will welcome you back because back we heard the
13 options. And the fact that you had the support
14 so that you could come and be -- and really, you
15 know, work for your constituents and the state,
16 is to our benefit. So I wish you very, very good
17 luck.

18 And same thing -- did I leave out
19 Senator Oberacker?

20 (Inaudible interjection; laughter.)

21 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: Okay. I
22 was going to thank him for the steak sauce, but
23 okay.

24 (Laughter.)

25 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: Jeez, he

1 didn't even wait.

2 (Laughter.)

3 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: Started
4 his new life already.

5 (Laughter.)

6 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: But
7 anyway, I wish him well also.

8 So on to the remarks.

9 Public service is not always easy.
10 The issues before us are rarely simple, and the
11 responsibility of finding solutions that improve
12 the lives of New Yorkers is one we don't take
13 lightly.

14 But throughout the session our
15 conference remained focused on addressing the
16 concerns we hear from our constituents and
17 delivering for the people of New York.

18 So when we began the session in
19 January, we knew the challenges ahead would be
20 significant. New Yorkers are struggling with
21 rising costs. Families are facing higher utility
22 bills, higher healthcare costs, growing economic
23 uncertainty. At the same time, we're confronted
24 with an increasingly unpredictable federal
25 government that has repeatedly threatened

1 programs and protections that millions of
2 New Yorkers depend on.

3 Faced with those realities, we
4 chose, and we choose to move New York forward.
5 So this session we confronted the growing burden
6 of utility costs, we advanced packages aimed at
7 holding utility companies accountable,
8 strengthening oversight, ensuring that ratepayers
9 are protected from unnecessary costs. We made
10 clear that utility providers should serve
11 New Yorkers, not profit at their expense.

12 On the first day of session I said
13 we would stand up for immigrant communities and
14 advance the goals of New York for All, and that's
15 exactly what we did. We fought to protect
16 immigrant families, strengthen due process, and
17 safeguard access to schools, healthcare and other
18 essential services.

19 We made clear that New York will
20 continue to be a place where families can live
21 with dignity and pursue opportunity and
22 contribute to the communities they call home.

23 At a time when reproductive rights
24 remain under attack nationwide, we enacted
25 protections for patients' privacy, expanded

1 access to fertility and IVF treatments, and
2 safeguarded the right of New Yorkers to make
3 their own healthcare decisions.

4 We also stood up for affordable
5 healthcare. As federal leaders continue to
6 threaten healthcare access and undermine critical
7 programs, we advanced legislation to lower
8 prescription drug costs, improve access to care,
9 and protect patients across the state.

10 For the first time we took major
11 steps toward truly universal childcare by
12 expanding UPK and investing in childcare programs
13 statewide.

14 We fully funded our schools again,
15 and made it clear that every student deserves a
16 quality education.

17 We fought to lower costs, protect
18 consumers. We took on junk fees, deceptive
19 pricing practices, subscription traps, corporate
20 abuses that make it harder for working families
21 to make ends meet.

22 We defended science and public
23 health, advancing legislation that supports
24 vaccine access, empowers healthcare providers,
25 and reinforces evidence-based public health

1 practices that keep our communities safe.

2 We continue to lead on environmental
3 protection and climate action, advancing
4 legislation to protect our natural resources,
5 reduce pollution, invest in clean energy
6 infrastructure, expand electrification and solar
7 opportunities.

8 We advanced legislation to
9 strengthen our democracy and protect the right to
10 vote. We worked to safeguard election workers,
11 modernize our election systems, ensure
12 New Yorkers can participate in our democracy free
13 from intimidation and interference.

14 We strengthened protections for
15 survivors of domestic violence and sexual
16 violence, continuing our work to ensure survivors
17 have access to the resources, support and legal
18 protections they need while strengthening
19 accountability for those who seek to harm or
20 intimidate them.

21 Finally, we continued to support
22 New York's agricultural industry and delivered
23 critical investments to both New York City and
24 local municipalities across our state, helping
25 communities strengthen infrastructure, improve

1 critical services and support long-term economic
2 growth.

3 We continued to invest in creating
4 more affordable housing across the state, and at
5 the same time stand up for homeowners and
6 renters, because we all know that affordable
7 housing is crucial for strong communities.

8 At a time when so many New Yorkers
9 are looking for stability and leadership, we
10 remain focused on delivering results, protecting
11 fundamental rights, and strengthening the
12 communities we represent.

13 Those accomplishments did not happen
14 overnight. They're the result of months of hard
15 work, difficult conversations, and shared
16 commitment to serving the people of New York.

17 And while we can be proud of what
18 we've achieved, we all recognize that there is
19 more to be done and that challenges remain, that
20 our work is not finished.

21 So as we close this session, I'm
22 reminded that progress is measured not only by
23 what we accomplish in this chamber, but by the
24 difference it makes in the lives of New Yorkers.
25 There's always going to be more work to do, but

1 this session demonstrated what is possible when
2 we remain focused on the people who elected us to
3 serve.

4 So to every member of this chamber,
5 I do thank you for your service. To the staff
6 and to all those who work so hard, we thank you.
7 And you've earned a few days off. Not many.
8 Well, you all, maybe.

9 But those of us here we know are
10 going to return to our districts, to hopefully
11 our families again, to those people who love and
12 care about us. Many of us are going to be in
13 races. We wish you luck.

14 I certainly -- again, as Leader Ortt
15 said, we know we will see most of you back here.

16 But remember that what you do is
17 important. What you do matters. The fact that
18 you do it creates opportunities that many of us
19 would never have believed we would ever have. We
20 don't take it lightly. But we do know that
21 New York needs us to be focused on New Yorkers.
22 There's no better people to do it.

23 So God bless. Enjoy the summer.
24 Win your races. You all, please.

25 (Laughter.)

1 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: You too.

2 You too.

3 (Laughter.)

4 SENATOR STEWART-COUSINS: But, you
5 know, enjoy, and we'll see you back here next
6 year. Thank you.

7 (Extended standing ovation.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
9 you, Madam Leader.

10 Senator Gianaris.

11 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
12 it has been an honor.

13 One final time: Is there any
14 further business at the desk?

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Sadly for
16 the great State of New York and the New York
17 State Senate, this is the last time I get to say,
18 Senator Gianaris, that there is no further
19 business for you at the desk.

20 It has been an honor and a pleasure
21 for all of us.

22 (Noisy, extended applause.)

23 SENATOR GIANARIS: Okay, I move to
24 adjourn until the call of the temporary
25 president, with the intervening days being

1 legislative days.

2 And, Mr. President, let's go, Mets!

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Let's go,
4 Mets!

5 On motion, the Senate stands
6 adjourned until the call of the
7 Temporary President, with the intervening days
8 being legislative.

9 And hopefully we will come back with
10 the 2026 NBA champions, the New York Knicks!

11 (Explosive cheers.)

12 (Whereupon, at 1:29 a.m., the Senate
13 adjourned.)

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25