

1 NEW YORK STATE SENATE

2
3
4 THE STENOGRAPHIC RECORD

5
6
7
8
9 ALBANY, NEW YORK

10 May 28, 2026

11 1:01 p.m.

12
13
14 REGULAR SESSION

15
16
17
18 SENATOR ROXANNE J. PERSAUD, Acting President

19 ALEJANDRA N. PAULINO, ESQ., Secretary

P R O C E E D I N G S

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
Senate will come to order.

I ask everyone to please rise and
recite the Pledge of Allegiance.

(Whereupon, the assemblage recited
the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: In the
absence of clergy, let us bow our heads in a
moment of silent reflection or prayer.

(Whereupon, the assemblage respected
a moment of silence.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Reading
of the Journal.

THE SECRETARY: In Senate,
Wednesday, May 27, 2026, the Senate met pursuant
to adjournment. The Journal of Tuesday, May 26,
2025, was read and approved.

On motion, the Senate adjourned.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Without
objection, the Journal stands approved as read.

Presentation of petitions.

Messages from the Assembly.

The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Senator Cleare

1 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Aging,
2 Assembly Bill Number 8447A and substitute it for
3 the identical Senate Bill 8072B, Third Reading
4 Calendar 229.

5 Senator Harckham moves to discharge,
6 from the Committee on Crime Victims, Crime and
7 Corrections, Assembly Bill Number 6666A and
8 substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
9 6390A, Third Reading Calendar 425.

10 Senator Sanders moves to discharge,
11 from the Committee on Aging, Assembly Bill
12 Number 582A and substitute it for the identical
13 Senate Bill 3180A, Third Reading Calendar 490.

14 Senator Kavanagh moves to discharge,
15 from the Committee on Housing, Assembly Bill
16 Number 3029A and substitute it for the identical
17 Senate Bill 2091A, Third Reading Calendar 573.

18 Senator Parker moves to discharge,
19 from the Committee on Energy, Assembly Bill
20 Number 5592A and substitute it for the identical
21 Senate Bill 2011A, Third Reading Calendar 687.

22 Senator Hinchey moves to discharge,
23 from the Committee on Investigations and
24 Government Operations, Assembly Bill Number 10405
25 and substitute it for the identical Senate Bill

1 9387, Third Reading Calendar 720.

2 Senator Krueger moves to discharge,
3 from the Committee on Housing, Assembly Bill
4 Number 659 and substitute it for the identical
5 Senate Bill 9650, Third Reading Calendar 723.

6 Senator Sepúlveda moves to
7 discharge, from the Committee on Judiciary,
8 Assembly Bill Number 8047B and substitute it for
9 the identical Senate Bill 9792, Third Reading
10 Calendar 754.

11 Senator Scarcella-Spanton moves to
12 discharge, from the Committee on
13 Higher Education, Assembly Bill Number 6001A and
14 substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
15 Number 7784A, Third Reading Calendar 769.

16 Senator Ramos moves to discharge,
17 from the Committee on Labor, Assembly Bill
18 Number 8480 and substitute it for the identical
19 Senate Bill 8131, Third Reading Calendar 870.

20 Senator Hinchey moves to discharge,
21 from the Committee on Health, Assembly Bill
22 Number 7840A and substitute it for the identical
23 Senate Bill 6578A, Third Reading Calendar 977.

24 Senator Skoufis moves to discharge,
25 from the Committee on Investigations and

1 Government Operations, Assembly Bill Number 10032
2 and substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
3 Number 9107, Third Reading Calendar 1069.

4 Senator Hinchey moves to discharge,
5 from the Committee on Investigations and
6 Government Operations, Assembly Bill Number 10522
7 and substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
8 Number 9374, Third Reading Calendar 1075.

9 Senator Hinchey moves to discharge,
10 from the Committee on Investigations and
11 Government Operations, Assembly Bill
12 Number 10737A and substitute it for the identical
13 Senate Bill Number 9551A, Third Reading Calendar
14 1080.

15 Senator Zellner moves to discharge,
16 from the Committee on Investigations and
17 Government Operations, Assembly Bill
18 Number 10932A and substitute it for the identical
19 Senate Bill 9850A, Third Reading Calendar 1083.

20 Senator Stewart-Cousins moves to
21 discharge, from the Committee on Cities 2,
22 Assembly Bill Number 9520 and substitute it for
23 the identical Senate Bill 8859, Third Reading
24 Calendar 1131.

25 Senator Addabbo moves to discharge,

1 from the Committee on Veterans, Homeland Security
2 and Military Affairs, Assembly Bill Number 7627B
3 and substitute it for the identical Senate Bill
4 Number 7786B, Third Reading Calendar 1162.

5 Senator Palumbo moves to discharge,
6 from the Committee on Local Government,
7 Assembly Bill Number 10325 and substitute it for
8 the identical Senate Bill 10012, Third Reading
9 Calendar 1252.

10 Senator Ryan moves to discharge,
11 from the Committee on Transportation,
12 Assembly Bill Number 9351A and substitute it for
13 the identical Senate Bill 8571A, Third Reading
14 Calendar 1271.

15 Senator Fernandez moves to
16 discharge, from the Committee on Transportation,
17 Assembly Bill Number 10722 and substitute it for
18 the identical Senate Bill 9639, Third Reading
19 Calendar 1277.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: So
21 ordered.

22 Messages from the Governor.

23 Reports of standing committees.

24 Reports of select committees.

25 Communications and reports from

1 state officers.

2 Motions and resolutions.

3 Senator Gianaris.

4 SENATOR GIANARIS: Good afternoon,
5 Madam President.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Good
7 afternoon.

8 SENATOR GIANARIS: There will be an
9 immediate meeting of the Rules Committee in
10 Room 332.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: There
12 will be an immediate meeting of the
13 Rules Committee in Room 332.

14 SENATOR GIANARIS: We may reconvene
15 to simultaneously take up some resolutions, but
16 for now we will stand at ease.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
18 Senate will stand at ease.

19 (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease
20 at 1:06 p.m.)

21 (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at
22 1:08 p.m.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
24 Senate will return to order.

25 Personal point of privilege: Happy

1 Birthday, Dorothy!

2 (Applause.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
4 Serrano.

5 SENATOR SERRANO: Thank you,
6 Mr. President.

7 Let's now take up previously adopted
8 Resolution 2113, by Senator Hinchey. Let's read
9 that resolution title only, and call on
10 Senator Hinchey.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
12 Secretary will read.

13 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 2113, by
14 Senator Hinchey, mourning the death of Ronald F.
15 Lipton, distinguished citizen, devoted public
16 servant, and cherished member of his community.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
18 Hinchey on the resolution.

19 SENATOR HINCHEY: Thank you,
20 Mr. President.

21 I rise today to honor the
22 extraordinary legacy of a beloved Greene County
23 community member and friend, Ron Lipton, who
24 passed away on January 22nd this year at the age
25 of 85.

1 Ron believed that each of us must
2 actively work to change the world for the better,
3 starting right in our own communities, and he
4 lived that belief to its fullest. He lived
5 through and witnessed some of the most tumultuous
6 times of social and political upheaval of the
7 past century. Instead of turning to apathy and
8 cynicism, he looked to the strongest force for
9 good that he knew, people.

10 In each community that was lucky
11 enough to count Ron as a resident, he learned the
12 local issues, brought people together, and
13 advocated for real commonsense solutions that
14 would actually make a difference in people's
15 lives.

16 As a young man, he committed himself
17 to global humanitarian service, through the
18 international aid organization Care, in the early
19 1970s. When he returned to the U.S., Ron
20 ventured to California, serving as an advisor to
21 then Governor Jerry Brown, during a pivotal
22 moment in environmental and economic reform.

23 In 2006, Ron relocated to Lexington,
24 in Greene County, for his retirement. And it
25 should be said that it says a lot about a person

1 who chooses to move to a beautiful-but-can-be-
2 fairly-challenging area like the Mountain Top
3 upon retirement.

4 But oh, how lucky we were. What
5 might have been a period of rest and tranquility
6 instead became a vibrant new chapter of active
7 community involvement on the mountain. He served
8 with distinction as the cochair of the Lexington
9 Town Democratic Committee and was an active
10 member of the Mountain Top Progressives, an
11 organization he helped found and lead as a forum
12 for connection and activism across the rural
13 community that shared Mountain Top towns.

14 Ron had an insatiable drive to right
15 wrongs and better the lives of those around him.
16 Over the years, my team and I worked with Ron on
17 a number of occasions. Always fighting for the
18 well-being of his neighbors, Ron never just
19 brought us grievances, he worked with us on
20 solutions. In fact, one of my favorite topics to
21 discuss with Ron was energy policy, an area he
22 focused on during his tenure with Governor Jerry
23 Brown.

24 He was advocating to me for
25 PSC reform and utility oversight well before it

1 was in our everyday lexicon. And our bill to
2 change the makeup of the PSC and require
3 affordability in all proceedings -- which has
4 already passed this chamber -- was written in
5 partnership with Ron and his wisdom.

6 We all know that in this job one of
7 the best parts is meeting the people that would
8 otherwise probably never cross our path. For me,
9 one of those incredibly special people was
10 Ron Lipton.

11 I'll spare the whole story, but my
12 first meeting with Ron almost never happened.
13 You see, we were scheduled to meet at Maggie's
14 Crooked Cafe in Tannersville. However, that part
15 of town had exactly zero cell service. Both Ron
16 and I waited for over an hour for the other to
17 show up, not knowing that the other was just
18 sitting just a few feet away, one inside and one
19 outside.

20 It was a quick lesson for me on the
21 lack of critical infrastructure across our rural
22 communities.

23 At the last moment, Ron and I did
24 find each other, and thank God we did. That
25 meeting started a wonderful friendship filled

1 with life lessons to me from Ron. I was in awe
2 of his travels, his stories, his energy and his
3 moral clarity that never wavered.

4 Those of us lucky enough to have
5 known Ron Lipton will forever miss the example he
6 set in his community-minded leadership. And of
7 course, his persistence. My one regret is that I
8 never made it with him to the Bronx Zoo, but I
9 promise that I will get there in his honor.

10 Joining us in the gallery today are
11 friends of Ron who have become family. We
12 remember Ron today in this chamber but will carry
13 his lessons, his humor, his passion and his
14 memory with us forever.

15 I proudly vote aye on this
16 resolution and look forward to honoring Ron and
17 his memory in the years to come.

18 Thank you.

19 (Applause from the gallery.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
21 you, Senator Hinchey.

22 To the friends who have become
23 family of Mr. Lipton, we will assure you that
24 Senator Hinchey will make her way to the
25 Bronx Zoo.

1 We thank you for carrying his legacy
2 on. And I welcome you on behalf of the Senate
3 and extend to you all the privileges and
4 courtesies of this house.

5 Please rise and be recognized.

6 (Standing ovation.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
8 resolution was adopted on May 19th.

9 Senator Serrano.

10 SENATOR SERRANO: Thank you,
11 Mr. President.

12 Let's now take up previously adopted
13 Resolution 2060, by Senator Fahy. Let's read
14 that title only and call on Senator Fahy.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
16 Secretary will read.

17 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 2060, by
18 Senator Fahy, memorializing Governor Kathy Hochul
19 to proclaim May 2026 as Cystic Fibrosis Awareness
20 Month in the State of New York.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
22 Fahy on the resolution.

23 SENATOR FAHY: Thank you,
24 Mr. President.

25 Today this resolution recognizes

1 that May of this year is Cystic Fibrosis
2 Awareness Month.

3 Cystic fibrosis is a rather
4 devastating genetic disease that affects the
5 lungs, digestive system and other vital organs.
6 It affects 1600 New Yorkers and of course tens of
7 thousands of families across the country.

8 Today we are joined by one of those
9 individuals, Kellen McHale, who is here in --
10 stand up, please, Kellen, if you would. He
11 attends Lynnwood Academy in Guilderland, and he
12 is one of those who knows what it's like to daily
13 live and go through hours of treatment,
14 medications and therapies simply to breathe, eat
15 and stay healthy.

16 However, he has shown, as well as so
17 many others with this disease, extraordinary
18 resilience, courage, and hope.

19 And because of decades of research
20 and advocacy, as well as innovation, today those
21 with CF, or cystic fibrosis, live longer, fuller
22 lives than ever before. And treatments that were
23 unimaginable just a generation ago are really
24 allowing patients to attend school, play
25 baseball, as Kellen does, build careers, raise

1 families, and pursue multiple dreams.

2 That's why awareness is so essential
3 for this disease, as is early diagnosis with
4 newborn screening, continued investments in
5 research. And all, combined, can make a
6 life-changing difference here for these families
7 and individuals.

8 It is important that here in
9 New York we continue to support world-class
10 treatment centers and support our dedicated
11 health professionals as well as the parents, the
12 caregivers and all the loved ones who shoulder
13 the burden behind the scenes and help young
14 people like Kellen navigate the healthcare system
15 through their unwavering support, as his mom and
16 granddad and more are here to support him.

17 As lawmakers we do have that
18 responsibility to make sure that we continue to
19 provide quality access to affordable care, to
20 strengthen biomedical research, and ensure that
21 New Yorkers living with CF have the opportunity
22 to live these longer, healthier lives through
23 this advancement of medical progress.

24 So today, on behalf of myself as
25 well as Senator Ashby, who is a friend of the

1 family, I would appreciate, Mr. President, if you
2 would join me in welcoming Kellen and his entire
3 family. Thank you.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
5 you, Senator Fahy.

6 Senator Ashby on the resolution.

7 SENATOR ASHBY: Thank you,
8 Mr. President.

9 And thank you, Senator Fahy, for
10 bringing this important resolution to the Senate
11 floor and for your continued advocacy for cystic
12 fibrosis.

13 I know many of today's guests will
14 also be at this Saturday's Great Strides event in
15 Albany, at UAlbany's purple path 5K, which is a
16 fun day and fundraising event.

17 Our guests today are unique and
18 special in their advocacy. Emilie McHale is the
19 2025 Outstanding Advocate award winner, and she
20 is joined by her 9-year-old son and mighty
21 warrior who we just met, Kellen McHale; as well
22 as Kellen's number-one fan and Grampion,
23 Tim McHale of Brunswick, in my district;
24 Francie Gransbury, a cystic fibrosis coordinator
25 and RN at Albany Medical Center; as well as

1 Grampion Janet Schuster.

2 Mr. President, I'd ask that you
3 recognize them and offer them all the privileges
4 of the house.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Thank
6 you, Senator Ashby.

7 To the McHale family, and especially
8 Kellen, Lynnwood's finest, we thank you for your
9 strength, your resilience, your resolve, and
10 being here today. It's really important that
11 you're here.

12 I welcome you on behalf of the
13 Senate and extend to you all of the privileges
14 and courtesies of this house.

15 Please rise and be recognized.

16 (Standing ovation.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
18 resolution was adopted on May 12th.

19 Senator Serrano.

20 SENATOR SERRANO: Mr. President, at
21 this time we'll stand at ease.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
23 Senate will stand at ease.

24 (Whereupon, the Senate stood at ease
25 at 1:19 p.m.)

1 (Whereupon, the Senate reconvened at
2 1:24 p.m.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
4 Senate will return to order.

5 Senator Gianaris.

6 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President, I
7 have a motion here.

8 On behalf of Senator May, I wish to
9 call up Senate Print 2708A, recalled from the
10 Assembly, which is now at the desk.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
12 Secretary will read.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 454, Senate Print 2708A, by Senator May, an act
15 to amend the Public Service Law.

16 SENATOR GIANARIS: Move to
17 reconsider the vote by which the bill was passed.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
19 roll on reconsideration.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
23 is restored to its place on the Third Reading
24 Calendar.

25 SENATOR GIANARIS: I offer the

1 following amendments.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
3 amendments are received.

4 SENATOR GIANARIS: Please call on
5 Senator Lanza for a motion.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
7 Lanza.

8 SENATOR LANZA: Mr. President, I
9 wish to call up Senator Stec's bill, 8454,
10 recalled from the Assembly, which is now at the
11 desk.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
13 Secretary will read.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 1066, Senate Print 8454, by Senator Stec, an act
16 to amend the Public Officers Law.

17 SENATOR LANZA: Move to reconsider
18 the vote by which the bill was passed.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
20 roll on reconsideration.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
24 is restored to its place on the Third Reading
25 Calendar.

1 SENATOR LANZA: I now offer the
2 following amendments.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
4 amendments are received.

5 Senator Gianaris.

6 SENATOR GIANARIS: There's a report
7 of the Rules Committee at the desk.

8 Let's take that up.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The
10 Secretary will read.

11 THE SECRETARY: Senator
12 Stewart-Cousins, from the Committee on Rules,
13 reports the following bills:

14 Senate Print 247, by
15 Senator Persaud, an act to amend the
16 Education Law;

17 Senate Print 519, by
18 Senator Persaud, an act to amend the
19 Education Law;

20 Senate Print 687, by
21 Senator Martinez, an act to amend the
22 Education Law;

23 Senate Print 704A, by
24 Senator Krueger, an act to amend the
25 General Business Law;

1 Senate Print 1063, by
2 Senator Serrano, an act to amend the
3 Education Law;

4 Senate Print 1072A, by
5 Senator Serrano, an act to amend the
6 Education Law;

7 Senate Print 1157, by
8 Senator Cooney, an act to amend the
9 Private Housing Finance Law;

10 Senate Print 1162A, by
11 Senator Krueger, an act to amend the
12 General Business Law;

13 Senate Print 1242A, by
14 Senator Addabbo, an act to amend the
15 Veterans' Services Law;

16 Senate Print 1366, by
17 Senator Serrano, an act to amend the
18 Mental Hygiene Law;

19 Senate Print 1378A, by
20 Senator Serrano, an act to amend the
21 Arts and Cultural Affairs Law;

22 Senate Print 1476B, by
23 Senator Krueger, an act to amend the
24 Public Health Law;

25 Senate Print 1578B, by

1 Senator Sanders, an act to amend the
2 Public Health Law;
3 Senate Print 1809, by
4 Senator Fernandez, an act to amend the
5 Election Law;
6 Senate Print 2046, by Senator Webb,
7 an act to amend the Education Law;
8 Senate Print 3051B, by
9 Senator Harckham, an act to amend the
10 Mental Hygiene Law;
11 Senate Print 3334, by Senator Liu,
12 an act to amend the Education Law;
13 Senate Print 3340, by
14 Senator Gianaris, an act to amend the Tax Law;
15 Senate Print 4430, by
16 Senator Comrie, an act to amend the
17 Public Service Law;
18 Senate Print 4462B, by
19 Senator Mayer, an act to amend the
20 Social Services Law;
21 Senate Print 4707B, by
22 Senator Stavisky, an act to amend the
23 Education Law;
24 Senate Print 4917B, by
25 Senator Scarcella-Spanton, an act to amend the

1 Insurance Law;
2 Senate Print 5189, by
3 Senator Comrie, an act to amend the
4 Public Authorities Law;
5 Senate Print 5228A, by
6 Senator Bailey, an act to amend the
7 Executive Law;
8 Senate Print 5494A, by
9 Senator Bynoe, an act to amend the Education Law;
10 Senate Print 6017, by
11 Senator Baskin, an act to amend the New York
12 State Urban Development Corporation Act;
13 Senate Print 6019, by
14 Senator Baskin, an act to repeal paragraph 2 of
15 subsection (e-1) of Section 606 of the Tax Law;
16 Senate Print 6551A, by
17 Senator Bailey, an act to amend the
18 Insurance Law;
19 Senate Print 6832, by Senator Webb,
20 an act to amend the Military Law;
21 Senate Print 6976B, by
22 Senator Harckham, an act to amend the
23 Transportation Law;
24 Senate Print 7032, by
25 Senator Sepúlveda, an act to amend the

1 Vehicle and Traffic Law;

2 Senate Print 7280, by
3 Senator Martinez, an act to amend the
4 Insurance Law;

5 Senate Print 7494A, by
6 Senator Gianaris, an act to amend the
7 General Business Law;

8 Senate Print 7605A, by
9 Senator Mattera, an act to amend Chapter 19 of
10 the Laws of 1964;

11 Senate Print 7701, by
12 Senator Stavisky, an act to amend the Tax Law;

13 Senate Print 7717A, by
14 Senator Cooney, an act to amend the
15 General Business Law;

16 Senate Print 7720, by
17 Senator Gallivan, an act to amend the Vehicle and
18 Traffic Law;

19 Senate Print 7951B, by
20 Senator Mayer, an act to amend the
21 State Finance Law;

22 Senate Print 7984A, by
23 Senator Fernandez, an act to amend the
24 Social Services Law;

25 Senate Print 8201A, by

1 Senator Martins, an act to amend Chapter 280 of
2 the Laws of 2016;

3 Senate Print 8252C, by
4 Senator Gianaris, an act to amend the
5 General Business Law;

6 Senate Print 8353, by
7 Senator Salazar, an act to amend the
8 Correction Law;

9 Senate Print 8363A, by
10 Senator Fernandez, an act to amend the
11 Mental Hygiene Law;

12 Senate Print 8457, by
13 Senator Cooney, an act to amend the
14 Insurance Law;

15 Senate Print 8541, by Senator Webb,
16 an act to amend the Social Services Law;

17 Senate Print 8580A, by
18 Senator Skoufis, an act to amend the
19 General Business Law;

20 Senate Print 8587A, by
21 Senator Gounardes, an act to amend the
22 Public Health Law;

23 Senate Print 8592A, by
24 Senator Sutton, an act to amend the
25 Insurance Law;

1 Senate Print 8598A, by
2 Senator Ramos, an act to amend the
3 General Business Law;

4 Senate Print 8637, by
5 Senator Fernandez, an act to amend the
6 State Finance Law;

7 Senate Print 8701A, by
8 Senator Hinchey, an act to amend the
9 Agriculture and Markets Law;

10 Senate Print 8706B, by
11 Senator Hinchey, an act to amend the Labor Law;

12 Senate Print 8837, by
13 Senator Hinchey, an act to amend the
14 General Municipal Law;

15 Senate Print 8850A, by
16 Senator Gounardes, an act to amend the
17 General Business Law;

18 Senate Print 8969B, by
19 Senator Bailey, an act to amend the
20 Insurance Law;

21 Senate Print 9021, by
22 Senator Harckham, an act to amend the
23 Civil Rights Law;

24 Senate Print 9024, by
25 Senator Gianaris, an act to amend the

1 Election Law;

2 Senate Print 9041, by
3 Senator Hinchey, an act to amend Chapter 443
4 of the Laws of 2006;

5 Senate Print 9058, by Senator Weber,
6 an act to amend the Real Property Tax Law;

7 Senate Print 9059, by Senator Weber,
8 an act to amend the Real Property Tax Law;

9 Senate Print 9060, by Senator Weber,
10 an act to amend the Real Property Tax Law;

11 Senate Print 9063A, by
12 Senator Addabbo, an act to amend the
13 Mental Hygiene Law;

14 Senate Print 9115A, by
15 Senator Harckham, an act to amend the
16 Environmental Conservation Law;

17 Senate Print 9199, by Senator
18 Scarcella-Spanton, an act to amend the
19 Public Service Law;

20 Senate Print 9276, by
21 Senator Sepúlveda, an act to amend the
22 Retirement and Social Security Law;

23 Senate Print 9278A, by
24 Senator Fernandez, an act to amend the
25 State Finance Law;

1 Senate Print 9305, by Senator May,
2 an act to amend Chapter 62 of the Laws of 2003;

3 Senate Print 9310, by
4 Senator Brisport, an act to amend the
5 Limited Liability Company Law;

6 Senate Print 9330, by Senator Ramos,
7 an act to amend the Labor Law;

8 Senate Print 9349, by
9 Senator Zellner, an act to amend the
10 Insurance Law;

11 Senate Print 9370, by
12 Senator Comrie, an act to amend the
13 State Finance Law;

14 Senate Print 9419, by
15 Senator Addabbo, an act to amend the
16 Vehicle and Traffic Law;

17 Senate Print 9498, by Senator Mayer,
18 an act to amend the Social Services Law;

19 Senate Print 9541, by
20 Senator Skoufis, an act to amend the
21 Real Property Tax Law;

22 Senate Print 9555A, by
23 Senator Skoufis, an act to amend the
24 Public Health Law;

25 Senate Print 9604, by

1 Senator Hinchey, an act to amend the
2 Public Health Law;
3 Senate Print 9629, by
4 Senator Bottcher, an act to amend the Penal Law;
5 Senate Print 9643, by Senator Liu,
6 an act to amend the State Technology Law;
7 Senate Print 9657, by Senator Bynoe,
8 an act to amend the Criminal Procedure Law;
9 Senate Print 9679, by
10 Senator Baskin, an act to amend the
11 Private Housing Finance Law;
12 Senate Print 9728, by Senator Brouk,
13 an act to amend the Social Services Law;
14 Senate Print 9815, by
15 Senator Krueger, an act to amend the
16 Insurance Law;
17 Senate Print 9820A, by
18 Senator Borrello, an act in relation to
19 authorizing the City of Olean assessor to accept
20 an application for a real property tax exemption;
21 Senate Print 9858A, by
22 Senator Hinchey, an act to amend the Penal Law;
23 Senate Print 9880, by
24 Senator Cleare, an act to amend the
25 Social Services Law;

1 Senate Print 9887, by Senator Webb,
2 an act to amend the Executive Law;

3 Senate Print 9889, by
4 Senator Zellner, an act to amend the
5 Private Housing Finance Law;

6 Senate Print 9897, by
7 Senator Zellner, an act to amend the
8 Public Health Law;

9 Senate Print 9900, by
10 Senator Martinez, an act to amend Chapter 581 of
11 the Laws of 2005;

12 Senate Print 9901, by Senator Ryan,
13 an act to amend Chapter 492 of the Laws of 1993;

14 Senate Print 9902, by Senator Ryan,
15 an act to amend Chapter 629 of the Laws of 2005;

16 Senate Print 9903, by
17 Senator Martinez, an act to amend Chapter 307 of
18 the Laws of 2005;

19 Senate Print 9919, by
20 Senator Borrello, an act to amend the Town Law;

21 Senate Print 9989, by
22 Senator Weber, an act authorizing Toivas Dovid
23 Community Kollel, Inc., to receive retroactive
24 real property tax-exempt status;

25 Senate Print 10066, by

1 Senator Stavisky, an act to amend Chapter 534 of
2 the Laws of 1993;

3 Senate Print 10118, by
4 Senator Murray, an act to amend the Town Law;

5 Senate Print 10134, by
6 Senator Weber, an act authorizing the
7 Congregation Divrei Chaim to receive retroactive
8 real property tax-exempt status;

9 Senate Print 10227, by
10 Senator Cooney, an act to amend the
11 Executive Law;

12 Senate Print 10273, by
13 Senator Gounardes, an act to amend the
14 Real Property Tax Law;

15 Senate Print 10411, by
16 Senator Harckham, an act to amend Chapter 550 of
17 the Laws of 2013;

18 Senate Print 10431, by
19 Senator Bottcher, an act to amend the
20 Local Finance Law;

21 Senate Print 10432, by
22 Senator Martinez, an act to amend Chapter 130 of
23 the Laws of 1998;

24 Senate Print 10438, by Senator Ryan,
25 an act to amend the Penal Law;

1 Senate Print 10445, by
2 Senator Gianaris, an act to amend the
3 Education Law;

4 Senate Print 10467, by
5 Senator Bottcher, an act to amend the
6 Education Law;

7 Senate Print 10525, by
8 Senator Serrano, an act to amend Chapter 138 of
9 the Laws of 1998;

10 Senate Print 10531, by
11 Senator Skoufis, an act to amend Chapter 435 of
12 the Laws of 2014;

13 Senate Print 10542, by Senator Fahy,
14 an act to amend Chapter 141 of the Laws of 2014;

15 Senate Print 10566, by
16 Senator Martinez, an act to amend the
17 Environmental Conservation Law.

18 All bills reported direct to third
19 reading.

20 SENATOR GIANARIS: Move to accept
21 the report of the Rules Committee.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: All
23 those in favor of accepting the report of the
24 Rules Committee please signify by saying aye.

25 (Response of "Aye.")

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Opposed,
2 nay.

3 (No response.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
5 report of the Rules Committee is accepted.

6 Senator Gianaris.

7 SENATOR GIANARIS: Let's take up
8 the calendar, Madam President.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
10 Secretary will read.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 214, Senate Print 1783C, by Senator Hinchey, an
13 act to amend the Agriculture and Markets Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
17 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it
18 shall have become a law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
25 Calendar 214, voting in the negative are

1 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
2 Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Martins, Ortt,
3 Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk,
4 Weber and Weik.

5 Ayes, 41. Nays, 17.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 225, Senate Print Number 8968A, by
10 Senator Scarcella-Spanton, an act to amend
11 the Mental Hygiene Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
15 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
16 shall have become a law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
21 Scarcella-Spanton to explain her vote.

22 SENATOR SCARCELLA-SPANTON: Thank
23 you, Madam President.

24 My legislation establishes a
25 veterans' suicide mortality review board.

1 New York should treat veteran suicide as a public
2 health emergency and create permanent,
3 data-driven review boards to identify preventable
4 failures, improve coordination and save lives.

5 We've all heard the rallying cry
6 that 22 veterans a day are dying of suicide. We
7 see that these rates are extremely younger
8 veterans, whether it be PTSD, CTE. This is not
9 about assigning blame, but this bill will allow
10 us to address this through policy that actually
11 helps our veterans.

12 With that, I proudly vote aye.

13 Thank you.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
15 Scarcella-Spanton to be recorded in the
16 affirmative.

17 Announce the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 229, Assembly Bill Number 8447A, by
23 Assemblymember Seawright, an act to amend the
24 Elder Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 238, Senate Print 7131B, by Senator May, an act
14 to amend the Executive Law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
18 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
19 shall have become a law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: In relation to

1 Calendar 238, voting in the negative are
2 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
3 Chan, Helming, Martins, Mattera, Murray, Ortt,
4 Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk and Weber.

5 Ayes, 44. Nays, 14.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 249, Senate Print 5003B, by Senator Hinchey, an
10 act to amend the Public Authorities Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
14 act shall take effect immediately.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
19 the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
22 is passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 259, Senate Print 1723, by Senator Harckham, an
25 act to amend the Executive Law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
2 last section.

3 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
4 act shall take effect immediately.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
9 the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 299, Senate Print 5049A, by Senator Bailey, an
15 act to amend the Insurance Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
19 act shall take effect immediately.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
2 is passed.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 305, Senate Print 5939C, by Senator Skoufis, an
5 act to amend the Public Health Law.

6 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Lay it
8 aside.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 349, Senate Print 8555, by Senator Palumbo, an
11 act to amend Chapter 282 of the Laws of 2003.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
15 act shall take effect immediately.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
22 Calendar 349, voting in the negative are
23 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Harckham, Lanza,
24 Martinez, Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton and Skoufis.

25 Ayes, 51. Nays, 7.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
2 is passed.

3 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
4 392, Senate Print 3207B, by Senator Kavanagh, an
5 act to amend the Public Health Law.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
7 last section.

8 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
9 act shall take effect one year after it shall
10 have become a law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
15 the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 404, Senate Print 4099, by Senator Parker, an act
21 to amend the Administrative Code of the City of
22 New York.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This

1 act shall take effect on the 120th day after it
2 shall have become a law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
9 Calendar 404, voting in the negative are
10 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
11 Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins,
12 Mattera, Murray, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison,
13 Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

14 Ayes, 39. Nays, 19.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 414, Senate Print 5257C, by Senator Hinchey, an
19 act to amend the General Business Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
23 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
24 shall have become a law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 425, Assembly Bill Number 6666A, by
10 Assemblymember Kelles, an act to amend the
11 Correction Law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
15 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
16 shall have become a law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
21 Stec to explain his vote.

22 SENATOR STEC: Thank you,
23 Mr. President.

24 This bill would require DOCCS to
25 make facility water-testing results accessible to

1 the public, to our staff, and to the
2 incarcerated. It's transparency, and that's a
3 good thing, and I'll be voting in favor.

4 However, it strikes me that what
5 we're doing here, we're doing nothing to prevent
6 fentanyl and other drugs and contraband from
7 coming into our facilities. It seems that we're
8 more concerned about water quality for rapists
9 and child molesters and murderers than we are
10 about preventing deadly drugs and contraband from
11 coming into our facilities.

12 I just thought I'd highlight that as
13 we continue to do nothing in our correctional
14 facilities for our employees that worked there
15 and are risking their lives for us.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
17 Stec to be recorded in the affirmative.

18 Announce the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
21 is passed.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 465, Senate Print 4152A, by Senator Sanders, an
24 act to amend the Executive Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 490, Assembly Bill Number 582A, by
14 Assemblymember Steck, an act to amend the
15 Elder Law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
19 act shall take effect one year after it shall
20 have become a law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
25 the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 514, Senate Print 1784A, by Senator Hinchey, an
6 act to amend the Real Property Actions and
7 Proceedings Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 538, Senate Print 5067B, by Senator Sepúlveda, an
22 act to amend the Education Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 33. This

1 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
2 shall have become a law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
9 Calendar 538, voting in the negative:
10 Senators Skoufis and Walczyk.

11 Ayes, 56. Nays, 2.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
13 is passed.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 553, Senate Print 1009, by Senator Brouk, an act
16 to amend the Veterans' Services Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
20 act shall take effect immediately.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
25 the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 573, Assembly Bill Number 3029A, by
6 Assemblymember Kelles, an act to amend the
7 Executive Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 584, Senate Print 4945, by Senator Comrie, an act
22 to amend the Public Authorities Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This

1 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
2 shall have become a law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 590, Senate Print 614B, by Senator Rivera, an act
13 to amend the Correction Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
17 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
18 shall have become a law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
25 Calendar 590, voting in the negative are

1 Senators Borrello, Chan, Gallivan, Griffo,
2 Helming, Lanza, Mattera, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,
3 Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

4 Ayes, 43. Nays, 15.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
6 is passed.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 597, Senate Print 2666B, by Senator Salazar, an
9 act to amend the Correction Law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
11 last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
13 act shall take effect immediately.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
18 the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
20 Calendar 597, voting in the negative are
21 Senators Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Ortt, Stec,
22 Tedisco, Walczyk and Weik.

23 Ayes, 50. Nays, 8.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
25 is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 670, Senate Print 9409A, by Senator Martinez, an
3 act authorizing the Commissioner of
4 Transportation to extend the lease of certain
5 state lands located in the hamlet of Farmingdale.

6 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Lay it
8 aside.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 687, Assembly Bill Number 5592A, by
11 Assemblymember Lucas, an act to direct the
12 Department of State and Public Service Commission
13 to jointly study and report upon the provision to
14 consumer reporting agencies.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
18 act shall take effect immediately.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
25 Calendar Number 687, voting in the negative are

1 Senators Gallivan, Martins and Ortt.

2 Ayes, 55. Nays, 3.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 698, Senate Print 8512C, by Senator Krueger, an
7 act to amend the Public Service Law.

8 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Lay it
10 aside.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 716, Senate Print 8732, by Senator Fahy, an act
13 to amend the Public Officers Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
24 Calendar 716, voting in the negative:
25 Senator Brisport.

1 Ayes, 57. Nays, 1.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 720, Assembly Bill Number 10405, by
6 Assemblymember Jacobson, an act to amend the
7 Public Officers Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
18 Calendar 720, voting in the negative:
19 Senator Brisport.

20 Ayes, 57. Nays, 1.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
22 is passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 723, Assembly Bill Number 659, by
25 Assemblymember Rosenthal, an act to amend the

1 Real Property Tax Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
5 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it
6 shall have become a law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
13 Calendar 723, voting in the negative are
14 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
15 Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins,
16 Mattera, Murray, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison,
17 Skoufis, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

18 Ayes, 37. Nays, 21.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 754, Assembly Bill Number 8047B, by
23 Assemblymember Rajkumar, an act to amend the
24 Court of Claims Act.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
3 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
4 shall have become a law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
9 the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 764, Senate Print 8962, by Senator Rhoads, an act
15 in relation to authorizing the Telugu Literary
16 and Cultural Association to receive retroactive
17 real property tax-exempt status.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
3 Calendar 764, voting in the negative:
4 Senator Skoufis.

5 Ayes, 57. Nays, 1.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 769, Assembly Bill Number 6001A, by
10 Assemblymember Schiavoni, an act in relation to
11 the issuance of pool and health memberships to
12 disabled veterans.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
16 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it
17 shall have become a law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
22 Palumbo to explain his vote.

23 SENATOR PALUMBO: Thank you,
24 Mr. President.

25 I just wanted to commend the chair

1 of the Veterans Committee for bringing this bill
2 to the floor and making it statewide. We
3 discussed this bill. They do it in
4 Suffolk County for our disabled veterans.

5 Commander Bill Hughes in the
6 Westhampton Beach VFW Post brought this to our
7 attention, that this should be something we
8 should definitely do statewide to assist our
9 disabled veterans to use the facilities, use the
10 pools, use the gym, to assist in their recovery
11 and overall health.

12 So thank you to the chairwoman for
13 bringing me on as a coprime sponsor as well, and
14 I proudly vote aye.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
16 Palumbo to be recorded in the affirmative.

17 Announce the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 781, Senate Print 7779, by Senator Fernandez, an
23 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
25 last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
2 act shall take effect immediately.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
7 Fernandez to explain her vote.

8 SENATOR FERNANDEZ: Thank you,
9 Mr. President.

10 New York State has a proud tradition
11 of using distinct license plates to commemorate
12 the service of our veterans. We have license
13 plates for recognizing military branches,
14 Catholic war veterans, the Gold Star Mothers, and
15 many others who have served our nation with
16 honor.

17 This bill carries that tradition
18 forward by honoring the 65th Infantry Regiment,
19 the Borinqueneers, whose legacy was forged by
20 fire during the Korean War. Many of the brave
21 soldiers of this storied military unit settled
22 here in New York, building lives, raising
23 families, and continuing their service to our
24 communities.

25 As we continue the evergreen mission

1 of honoring our veterans, this legislation
2 provides a meaningful token of appreciation to
3 the Borinqueneers and their families. We have
4 seen similar legislation passed in other states,
5 and it is time for New York to do so as well, to
6 give the Borinqueneers license plate a home.

7 Thank you, and I proudly vote aye.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
9 Fernandez to be recorded in the affirmative.

10 Announce the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
13 is passed.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 792, Senate Print 5452, by Senator Comrie, an act
16 to amend the Election Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
18 last section.

19 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
20 act shall take effect immediately.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
22 roll.

23 (The Secretary called the roll.)

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
25 the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
2 Calendar 792, voting in the negative are
3 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
4 Gallivan, Griffio, Helming, Lanza, Martins,
5 Mattera, Murray, Ortt, Rhoads, Rolison,
6 Scarcella-Spanton, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber
7 and Weik.

8 Ayes, 39. Nays, 19.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 858, Senate Print 680, by Senator Martinez, an
13 act to amend the Executive Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
25 is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 866, Senate Print 6882, by Senator Harckham, an
3 act to amend the General Municipal Law.

4 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Lay it
6 aside.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 870, Assembly Bill Number 8480, by
9 Assemblymember Bronson, an act to amend the
10 Workers' Compensation Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
14 act shall take effect immediately.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
19 the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
21 Calendar 870, voting in the negative:
22 Senator Borrello.

23 Ayes, 57. Nays, 1.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
25 is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 874, Senate Print 1280B, by Senator Krueger, an
3 act to amend the General Business Law.

4 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Lay it
6 aside.

7 There is a home-rule message at the
8 desk.

9 The Secretary will read.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 891, Senate Print 8956, by Senator Stec, an act
12 to amend the Public Housing Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
19 Calendar 891, voting in the negative:
20 Senator Ryan.

21 Ayes, 57. Nays, 1.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 902, Senate Print 9961, by Senator Martinez, an

1 act to amend the Real Property Tax Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
5 act shall take effect on the first of January.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
10 the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
12 Calendar 902, voting in the negative:
13 Senator Brisport.

14 Ayes, 57. Nays, 1.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 904, Senate Print 10023, by Senator Martinez, an
19 act to amend the Real Property Tax Law.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
21 last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
3 the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
5 Calendar 904, voting in the negative:
6 Senator Skoufis.

7 Ayes, 57. Nays, 1.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 906, Senate Print 8288A, by Senator Persaud, an
12 act to amend the Education Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
16 act shall take effect immediately.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
21 the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 911, Senate Print 10049, by Senator Jackson, an
2 act to amend the Education Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 916, Senate Print 9789, by Senator Sepúlveda, an
17 act to amend the Uniform City Court Act.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
21 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
22 shall have become a law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
2 the results.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: In
4 relation to Calendar 916, voting in the negative
5 are Senators Ashby, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
6 Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins,
7 Mattera, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco,
8 Walczyk, Weber and Weik. Also Senator Borrello.

9 Ayes, 40. Nays, 18.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 927, Senate Print 5134, by Senator Harckham, an
14 act to amend the Correction Law.

15 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Lay it
17 aside.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 951, Senate Print 10039, by Senator Martinez, an
20 act to amend the Environmental Conservation Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 966, Senate Print 6020A, by Senator Baskin, an
10 act to amend the Executive Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
14 act shall take effect immediately.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
19 the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
22 is passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 968, Senate Print 1634A, by Senator Rivera, an
25 act to amend the Insurance Law.

1 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Lay it
3 aside.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 977, Assembly Bill Number 7840A, by
6 Assemblymember Weprin, an act to amend the
7 Public Health Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
11 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it
12 shall have become a law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
14 roll.

15 (The Secretary called the roll.)

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
17 the results.

18 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1000, Senate Print 7484A, by Senator Mayer, an
23 act to amend the Mental Hygiene Law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
25 last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
2 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it
3 shall have become a law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 1021, Senate Print 9793, by Senator Sepúlveda, an
14 act to repeal Section 470 of the Judiciary Law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
16 last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
18 act shall take effect immediately.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
25 Calendar 1021, voting in the negative are

1 Senators Lanza and Skoufis.

2 Ayes, 56. Nays, 2.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 1023, Senate Print 2516A, by Senator Gounardes,
7 an act to amend the Social Services Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
19 is passed.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 1030, Senate Print 6150, by Senator Parker, an
22 act to amend the Banking Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This

1 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
2 shall have become a law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 1054, Senate Print 6225, by Senator Rivera, an
13 act to amend the Social Services Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
17 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
18 shall have become a law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
23 Rivera to explain his vote.

24 SENATOR RIVERA: Thank you,
25 Mr. President.

1 I'm very glad that we're voting on
2 this bill today. We've passed it the last couple
3 of years, and I'm hoping that we can get it over
4 the finish line.

5 A few years ago I'm sure we've all
6 heard about the tragedy of Nicholas Dominici, a
7 young boy who was at a daycare center and
8 unfortunately found some heroin that was being
9 stashed away by the folks who were running the
10 daycare center.

11 These folks -- he passed away that
12 day. Some of his classmates were hurt but gladly
13 did not pass away.

14 Those folks were found, they were
15 held responsible, they were convicted, and I'm
16 very glad that they were.

17 But this bill, Mr. President, is to
18 make sure that parents can feel safe when they
19 leave their children in a daycare center. It
20 would create standards so that they would be able
21 to inspect the childcare center to be able to
22 make certain that it is safe for their children,
23 as well as to provide both training for the folks
24 who run the daycare centers, and set standards as
25 to what they have to make sure that they

1 recognize as it relates to drug paraphernalia,
2 et cetera, to make sure that they can keep the
3 children that they are responsible for taking
4 care of safe.

5 So I am glad that we're passing this
6 today. And I should mention that I am
7 particularly proud of this piece of legislation
8 since it came to me directly from the parents
9 themselves of Nicholas Dominici, who came to my
10 staff and myself and wanted to make sure it did
11 not happen to another kid.

12 So I'm glad that we're passing it
13 today. I'm hoping that we can get it signed into
14 law. I vote in the affirmative, Mr. President.

15 Thank you.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
17 Rivera to be recorded in the affirmative.

18 Announce the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
20 Calendar 1054, voting in the negative:
21 Senator Walczyk.

22 Ayes, 57. Nays, 1.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1058, Senate Print 4887B, by Senator Walczyk, an
2 act to amend the Tax Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
4 last section.

5 SENATOR GIANARIS: Lay it aside.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Lay it
7 aside.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 1060, Senate Print 6047A, by Senator Skoufis, an
10 act to amend the Tax Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
14 act shall take effect immediately.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
19 the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
21 Calendar 1060, voting in the negative are
22 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Harckham,
23 Helming, Hinchey, Lanza, Martinez, Ortt, Palumbo,
24 Rhoads, Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton and Weik. Also
25 Senator Tedisco.

1 Ayes, 45. Nays, 13.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 1061, Senate Print 6834A, by Senator Oberacker,
6 an act to amend the Tax Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
15 the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
17 Calendar 1061, voting in the negative are
18 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Harckham,
19 Helming, Lanza, Martinez, Ortt, Rhoads, Ryan,
20 Scarcella-Spanton, Skoufis and Weik.

21 Ayes, 47. Nays, 11.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 1063, Senate Print 7820B, by Senator Oberacker,

1 an act to amend the Tax Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
5 act shall take effect immediately.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
10 the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
12 Calendar 1063, voting in the negative are
13 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Harckham,
14 Helming, Lanza, Martinez, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,
15 Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton, Skoufis and Weik.

16 Ayes, 46. Nays, 12.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 1064, Senate Print 7966A, by Senator
21 Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, an act to amend the
22 Tax Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This

1 act shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
6 the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
8 Calendar 1064, voting in the negative are
9 Senators Harckham, Helming, Lanza, Martinez,
10 Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton,
11 Skoufis and Weik.

12 Ayes, 47. Nays, 11.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 1065, Senate Print 8188A, by Senator Hinchey, an
17 act to amend the Tax Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
3 Calendar 1065, voting in the negative are
4 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Harckham,
5 Helming, Lanza, Martinez, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,
6 Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton, Skoufis and Weik.

7 Ayes 46. Nays, 12.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1067, Senate Print 8482A, by Senator Stec, an act
12 to amend the Tax Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
16 act shall take effect immediately.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
21 the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
23 Calendar 1067, voting in the negative are
24 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Lanza, Ryan and
25 Scarcella-Spanton. Also Senator Skoufis as well.

1 Ayes, 53. Nays, 5.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 1068, Senate Print 9027, by Senator Borrello, an
6 act to amend the Tax Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
15 the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
17 Calendar 1068, voting in the negative are
18 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Harckham,
19 Helming, Lanza, Martinez, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,
20 Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton, Skoufis, Tedisco and
21 Weik.

22 Ayes, 45. Nays, 13.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1069, Assembly Bill Number 10032, by
2 Assemblymember Eachus, an act to amend
3 Chapter 283 of the Laws of 2023.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
7 act shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
14 Calendar 1069, voting in the negative are
15 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Harckham,
16 Hinchey, Lanza, Martinez, Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton
17 and Stec.

18 Ayes, 50. Nays, 8.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1070, Senate Print 9157A, by Senator Borrello, an
23 act to amend the Tax Law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
25 last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
2 act shall take effect immediately.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
9 Calendar 1070, voting in the negative are
10 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Harckham,
11 Helming, Lanza, Martinez, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,
12 Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton, Skoufis, Tedisco and
13 Weik.

14 Ayes, 45. Nays, 13.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 1071, Senate Print 9264A, by Senator Rolison, an
19 act to amend Chapter 295 of the Laws of 2023.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: There is
21 a home-rule message at the desk.

22 Read the last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
6 Calendar 1071, voting in the negative are
7 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Harckham, Lanza,
8 Martinez, Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton and Skoufis.

9 Ayes, 51. Nays, 7.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
11 is passed.

12 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
13 1072, Senate Print 9273, by Senator Krueger, an
14 act to amend the Alcoholic Beverage Control Law.

15 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Lay it
17 aside.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 1073, Senate Print 9314, by Senator Gallivan, an
20 act to amend the Tax Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
24 act shall take effect immediately.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
6 Calendar 1073, voting in the negative are
7 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Harckham,
8 Helming, Lanza, Martinez, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,
9 Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton, Skoufis, Tedisco and
10 Weik.

11 Ayes, 45. Nays, 13.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
13 is passed.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 1075, Assembly Bill Number 10522, by
16 Assemblymember Barrett, an act to amend the
17 Tax Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
3 Calendar 1075, voting in the negative are
4 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Harckham,
5 Helming, Lanza, Martinez, Ortt, Palumbo, Ryan,
6 Scarcella-Spanton, Skoufis, Tedisco and Weik.

7 Ayes, 46. Nays, 12.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1076, Senate Print 9376A, by Senator Gallivan, an
12 act to amend the Tax Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
16 act shall take effect immediately.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
18 roll.

19 (The Secretary called the roll.)

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
21 the results.

22 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
23 Calendar 1076, voting in the negative are
24 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Harckham,
25 Helming, Lanza, Martinez, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,

1 Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton, Skoufis, Tedisco and
2 Weik.

3 Ayes, 45. Nays, 13.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 1077, Senate Print 9504A, by Senator Rolison, an
8 act to amend Chapter 294 of the Laws of 2023.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: There is
10 a home-rule message at the desk.

11 Read the last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
13 act shall take effect immediately.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
18 the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
20 Calendar 1077, voting in the negative are
21 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Harckham, Lanza,
22 Martinez, Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton and Skoufis.

23 Ayes, 51. Nays, 7.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
25 is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 1080, Assembly Bill Number 10737A, by
3 Assemblymember Shrestha, an act to amend the
4 Tax Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
8 act shall take effect immediately.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
13 the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
15 Calendar 1080, voting in the negative are
16 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Harckham,
17 Helming, Lanza, Martinez, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,
18 Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton, Skoufis, Tedisco and
19 Weik.

20 Ayes, 45. Nays, 13.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
22 is passed.

23 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
24 1083, Assembly Bill Number 10932A, by
25 Assemblymember McMahon, an act to amend the

1 Tax Law.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
5 act shall take effect immediately.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
10 the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
12 Calendar 1083, voting in the negative are
13 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Helming, Lanza,
14 Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Ryan, Tedisco and Weik.

15 Ayes, 49. Nays, 9.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 1084, Senate Print 9862A, by Senator Skoufis, an
20 act to amend the Tax Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: There's a
22 home-rule message at the desk.

23 Read the last section.

24 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
25 act shall take effect immediately.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
5 the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
7 Calendar 1084, voting in the negative are
8 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Harckham,
9 Helming, Hinchey, Lanza, Martinez, Ortt, Palumbo,
10 Rhoads, Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton, Stec, Tedisco
11 and Weik.

12 Ayes, 44. Nays, 14.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 1087, Senate Print 10029, by Senator Stec, an act
17 to amend the Tax Law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
3 Calendar 1087, voting in the negative are
4 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Harckham,
5 Helming, Lanza, Martinez, Rhoads, Ryan,
6 Scarcella-Spanton, Skoufis, Tedisco and Weik.

7 Ayes, 47. Nays, 11.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1090, Senate Print Number 10188, by
12 Senator Skoufis, an act to repeal Section 2 of
13 Chapter 316 of the Laws of 2025.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
24 Calendar 1090, voting in the negative are
25 Senators Lanza, Martinez and Ryan.

1 Ayes, 55. Nays, 3.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
3 is passed.

4 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
5 1114, Senate Print 8690, by Senator Cleare, an
6 act to amend the Alcoholic Beverage Control Law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
8 last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
10 act shall take effect immediately.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
12 roll.

13 (The Secretary called the roll.)

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
15 the results.

16 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
17 Calendar 1114, voting in the negative are
18 Senators Lanza and Martinez.

19 Ayes, 56. Nays, 2.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
21 is passed.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 1115, Senate Print 10001, by Senator Skoufis, an
24 act to amend the Alcoholic Beverage Control Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
3 act shall take effect immediately.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
5 roll.

6 (The Secretary called the roll.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
8 the results.

9 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
10 Calendar 1115, voting in the negative:
11 Senator Martinez.

12 Ayes, 57. Nays, 1.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
14 is passed.

15 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
16 1131, Assembly Bill Number 9520, by
17 Assemblymember Pretlow, an act to amend the
18 Local Finance Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: There is
20 a home-rule message at the desk.

21 Read the last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
23 act shall take effect immediately.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
3 the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
5 Calendar 1131, voting in the negative:
6 Senators Skoufis and Walczyk.

7 Ayes, 56. Nays, 2.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1132, Senate Print 9839, by Senator Baskin, an
12 act to amend the Local Finance Law.

13 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Lay it
15 aside.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 1137, Senate Print 10266, by Senator Webb, an act
18 to amend the Tax Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
22 act shall take effect immediately.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
24 roll.

25 (The Secretary called the roll.)

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
2 the results.

3 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
4 Calendar 1137, voting in the negative are
5 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Helming, Lanza,
6 Palumbo, Ryan, Tedisco and Weik.

7 Ayes, 51. Nays, 7.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1153, Senate Print 267, by Senator Sanders, an
12 act to amend the Executive Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
14 last section.

15 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
16 act shall take effect on the 270th day after it
17 shall have become a law.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
25 is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 1158, Senate Print Number 2073, by
3 Senator Scarcella-Spanton, an act to amend
4 the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
8 act shall take effect immediately.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
10 roll.

11 (The Secretary called the roll.)

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
13 the results.

14 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
16 is passed.

17 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
18 1162, Assembly Bill Number 7627B, by
19 Assemblymember Kay, an act to amend the Veterans'
20 Services Law.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
22 last section.

23 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
24 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
25 shall have become a law.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
2 roll.

3 (The Secretary called the roll.)

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
5 the results.

6 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
8 is passed.

9 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
10 1163, Senate Print 8233, by Senator Sanders, an
11 act to amend the New York City Charter.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
13 last section.

14 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
15 act shall take effect immediately.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
23 is passed.

24 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
25 1167, Senate Print 10000, by Senator Brisport, an

1 act to amend the Family Court Act.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
3 last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
5 act shall take effect on the 60th day after it
6 shall have become a law.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
13 Calendar 1167, voting in the negative are
14 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Griffo,
15 Helming, Martins, Mattera, Murray, Palumbo,
16 Rhoads, Stec, Walczyk and Weik. Also
17 Senator Tedisco.

18 Ayes, 45. Nays, 13.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1168, Senate Print 79, by Senator Liu, an act to
23 amend the Education Law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
25 last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
2 act shall take effect immediately.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 1195, Senate Print 1140A, by Senator Gonzalez, an
13 act to amend the Tax Law.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
15 last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
17 act shall take effect immediately.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
24 Calendar 1195, voting in the negative are
25 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,

1 Chan, Cooney, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza,
2 Martinez, Martins, Mattera, Murray, Ortt, Rhoads,
3 Scarcella-Spanton, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber
4 and Weik.

5 Ayes, 37. Nays, 21.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
7 is passed.

8 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
9 1197, Senate Print 1192, by Senator Addabbo, an
10 act to amend the Criminal Procedure Law.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
12 last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
14 act shall take effect immediately.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
19 the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
21 Calendar 1197, voting in the negative:
22 Senator Brisport.

23 Ayes, 57. Nays, 1.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
25 is passed.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 1203, Senate Print 3243A, by Senator Cooney, an
3 act to amend the Social Services Law.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
5 last section.

6 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
7 act shall take effect immediately.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
9 roll.

10 (The Secretary called the roll.)

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
12 the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 1207, Senate Print 6025, by Senator Brouk, an act
18 to amend the Social Services Law.

19 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Lay it
21 aside.

22 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
23 1210, Senate Print 7611B, by Senator Bynoe, an
24 act to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the

1 last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
3 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
4 shall have become a law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
9 the results.

10 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
12 is passed.

13 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
14 1237, Senate Print 6980, by Senator Persaud, an
15 act to create a temporary state commission to
16 study and make recommendations concerning the
17 incidence of asthma in the Borough of Brooklyn.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
19 last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce

1 the results.

2 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
4 is passed.

5 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
6 1242, Senate Print 1695, by Senator Skoufis, an
7 act to amend the Real Property Tax Law.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
9 last section.

10 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
11 act shall take effect immediately.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
18 Calendar 1242, voting in the negative are
19 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Griffo,
20 Lanza, Martinez, Martins, Mattera, Rhoads,
21 Tedisco, Weber and Weik.

22 Ayes, 47. Nays, 11.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1245, Senate Print 5168A, by Senator Rolison, an
2 act to amend the Real Property Tax Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
13 Calendar 1245, voting in the negative are
14 Senators Griffo, Lanza, Martinez, Rhoads,
15 Scarcella-Spanton, Weber and Weik.

16 Ayes, 51. Nays, 7.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
18 is passed.

19 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
20 1251, Senate Print 9968, by Senator Gallivan, an
21 act in relation to establishing the Harris Hill
22 Volunteer Fire Company Benevolent Association.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
24 last section.

25 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This

1 act shall take effect immediately.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
3 roll.

4 (The Secretary called the roll.)

5 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
6 the results.

7 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
9 is passed.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1252, Assembly Bill Number 10325, by
12 Assemblymember Kassay, an act in relation to
13 authorizing the assessor of the Town of
14 Brookhaven to accept an application for a real
15 property tax exemption.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
17 last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
19 act shall take effect immediately.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: In relation to

1 Calendar 1252, voting in the negative:

2 Senator Skoufis.

3 Ayes, 57. Nays, 1.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 1271, Assembly Bill Number 9351A, by
8 Assemblymember Magnarelli, an act to amend the
9 Vehicle and Traffic Law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
11 last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
13 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
14 shall have become a law.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
19 Ryan to explain his vote.

20 SENATOR RYAN: Thank you. Thank
21 you, Mr. President.

22 So I rise in support of this bill.
23 This is legislation that I wrote to address an
24 issue directly brought to my attention by a
25 constituent -- not just any constituent, but a

1 disabled veteran who had experienced firsthand
2 the frustrating and unnecessary barriers this
3 bill seeks to eliminate.

4 At its core, what this legislation
5 is about, it's about respect and it's also about
6 common sense. Currently, today, veterans who
7 have already been determined by the United States
8 Department of Veterans Affairs to be 100 percent
9 service-connected disabled are still forced to
10 navigate an additional duplicative process in
11 order to obtain a license plate bearing the
12 universal symbol of access.

13 For veterans living with
14 life-altering injuries and chronic health
15 challenges, these hurdles -- they're more than
16 just frustrating, they're burdensome and they're
17 truly unnecessary.

18 This bill simply aligns state
19 practice with federal determinations by
20 recognizing a veteran's 100 percent VA disability
21 rating as sufficient proof of eligibility for
22 accessibility of accommodations.

23 Our veterans answered the call to
24 serve this country. Too many return home
25 carrying permanent wounds as a result of that

1 noble service. The least that we can do is
2 ensure that they are not forced to fight through
3 unnecessary red tape just to access the
4 accommodations that they have already earned.

5 I certainly want to thank my
6 constituent who brought this issue to my
7 attention, and I urge my colleagues to support
8 this great bill.

9 Thank you. I vote aye.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Senator
11 Ryan to be recorded in the affirmative.

12 Announce the results.

13 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 58.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 1275, Senate Print 9238, by Senator Mayer, an act
18 to amend the Vehicle and Traffic Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: There is
20 a home-rule message at the desk.

21 Read the last section.

22 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
23 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it
24 shall have become a law.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the

1 roll.

2 (The Secretary called the roll.)

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
4 the results.

5 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
6 Calendar 1275, voting in the negative are
7 Senators Bynoe, Lanza and Martinez.

8 Ayes, 55. Nays, 3.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
10 is passed.

11 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
12 1277, Assembly Bill Number 10722, by
13 Assemblymember Paulin, an act to amend
14 Chapter 460 of the Laws of 2021.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: There is
16 a home-rule message at the desk.

17 Read the last section.

18 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
19 act shall take effect immediately.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
21 roll.

22 (The Secretary called the roll.)

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
24 the results.

25 THE SECRETARY: In relation to

1 Calendar 1277, voting in the negative are
2 Senators Bynoe, Martinez and Murray.

3 Ayes, 55. Nays, 3.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
5 is passed.

6 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
7 1306, Senate Print 7100, by Senator Lanza, an act
8 to rename the Oakwood Beach wetland the Oakwood
9 Beach-Detective Russel Timoshenko Preserve.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
11 last section.

12 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
13 act shall take effect immediately.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
15 roll.

16 (The Secretary called the roll.)

17 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
18 the results.

19 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
20 Calendar 1306, voting in the negative:
21 Senator Brisport.

22 Ayes, 57. Nays, 1.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
24 is passed.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 1309, Senate Print 9202, by Senator Ortt, an act
2 to amend Chapter 389 of the Laws of 2024.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Read the
4 last section.

5 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
6 act shall take effect immediately.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Call the
8 roll.

9 (The Secretary called the roll.)

10 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Announce
11 the results.

12 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
13 Calendar 1309, voting in the negative are
14 Senators Brisport and Martinez.

15 Ayes, 56. Nays, 2.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
17 is passed.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 1312, Senate Print 3233A, by Senator Kavanagh, an
20 act to amend the Elections Law.

21 SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Lay it
23 aside.

24 Senator Gianaris, that completes the
25 reading of today's calendar.

1 SENATOR GIANARIS: Mr. President,
2 going back to motions and resolutions, on behalf
3 of Senator Salazar I offer the following
4 amendments to Calendar Number 1376, Senate Print
5 8353, and ask that said bill retain its place on
6 the Third Reading Calendar.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: The bill
8 is restored to its place on the Third Reading
9 Calendar.

10 Senator Gianaris.

11 SENATOR GIANARIS: I'd also like to
12 lay aside for the day Calendar 670, which was
13 previously laid aside.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT BAILEY: Calendar
15 Number 670 is laid aside for the day.

16 Senator Gianaris.

17 SENATOR GIANARIS: All right,
18 Mr. President. Cha-cha-cha. Let's take up
19 previously adopted Resolution 2214, by
20 Senator Webb, read its title and call on
21 Senator Webb.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
23 Secretary will read.

24 THE SECRETARY: Resolution 2214, by
25 Senator Webb, memorializing Governor Kathy Hochul

1 to proclaim June 2026 as Black Music Month in the
2 State of New York.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
4 Webb on the resolution.

5 SENATOR WEBB: Thank you,
6 Madam President.

7 I rise very proudly and excited
8 today to commemorate Black Music Month here in
9 our chamber here in our great State of New York.

10 Every June, Black Music Month is
11 celebrated not only in our state, but nationally.
12 It was first established in 1979, when Dyana
13 Williams, Ed Wright, and Kenny Gamble approached
14 then-President Jimmy Carter to establish this
15 commemoration.

16 He hosted the first inaugural
17 celebration on June 7, 1979, and years later,
18 once Bill Clinton taken office, Dyana Williams
19 wanted the White House to resume this celebration
20 but was shocked to find out that President Carter
21 had never actually officially signed the official
22 presidential proclamation.

23 So she wrote House Concurrent
24 Bill 509, got it passed in Congress, and brought
25 it to President Clinton, who then finally signed

1 an official proclamation to officially recognize
2 June as Black Music Month.

3 Now, every June, we recognize the
4 accomplishments and the enduring legacy of Black
5 artists, writers, performers, producers,
6 countless others -- and the impact that their
7 music has had on our culture, the culture of our
8 state, country, and the world.

9 Throughout our nation's history
10 Black music has been and is and always will be
11 the very heartbeat of American culture, whether
12 it is the powerful spirituals sung in the face of
13 slavery, to the jazz clubs of Harlem, the hip-hop
14 beats of the Bronx -- and we won't go into the
15 contestment around them -- just kidding -- Black
16 music has told the story of our struggle, our
17 resilience, our joy, our determination for
18 justice, and quite frankly for our shared
19 absolute human right for dignity and respect.

20 It has always been about more than
21 entertainment. We know that music is a form of
22 protest. It calls attention to not only the
23 trials and tribulations of the world, but it also
24 is what brings us together and helps to create
25 innovation, joy, and so much more.

1 It also helps our communities to
2 heal. It brings people from all walks of life
3 together for one collective moment that most
4 certainly makes us even stronger.

5 I think of a quote by one of the
6 founders of Black Music Month, Kenny Gamble --
7 and folks are familiar with Kenny Gamble, pioneer
8 of the "Philadelphia Sound," one of the founders.
9 He said that "Black is more than just a color, it
10 is a frame of mind. All genres of music created
11 by Black folks in America are our heart and
12 soul's gifts as well as a universal language
13 widely felt and embraced worldwide."

14 Madam President, New York is deeply
15 connected to this movement. Dyana Williams, the
16 mother of Black Music Month, is from Harlem --
17 shout out to Senator Cordell Cleare, her
18 district. We are the home of countless
19 genre-defining artists whose voices have shaped
20 the very sound of music and continue to inspire
21 today.

22 As we continue to journey forward
23 into the month of June to celebrate Black Music
24 Month, my colleagues and I held a reception
25 yesterday evening where we honored such

1 incredible artists who are both living and have
2 gone on to be with our ancestors. Many of them
3 are here with us today in the chamber, and it is
4 truly my deep and profound honor and pleasure to
5 name and recognize them not only by name, but
6 also to further lift up the fact that the work
7 that they do, and our taking this time to pause
8 to recognize them, that we are not only
9 recognizing their incredible gifts and talents,
10 but as a legislative body we are inscribing their
11 names forever into the annals of history here in
12 our great State of New York.

13 And so I would like to lift up the
14 names of all of our honorees with us today in the
15 chamber:

16 The incredible and incomparable
17 MC Lyte, also a Rock & Roll Hall of Fame
18 inductee.

19 DJ Beverly Bond, who has shown all
20 of us Black girls how to rock.

21 The incredible lyricist and
22 conscious rapper and entrepreneur, Mr. Talib
23 Kweli.

24 Posthumously, I want to recognize
25 Mr. Bob Law, who is here represented by his

1 beautiful daughter, Ms. Aisha Patrice Law.

2 And no one can ever underestimate
3 the influence of jazz and most certainly one of
4 jazz's sons, and that is none other than Mr. John
5 Coltrane, who this year it is his 100th birthday.
6 And we are joined today by his daughter,
7 Michelle Coltrane.

8 We also understand the power and
9 influence of Black radio, and we are joined today
10 by incredible entrepreneur, CEOs and pioneers in
11 that space. Coming from Buffalo, Ms. Sheila
12 Brown, CEO and owner of WUFO Radio.

13 And of course last but most
14 certainly not least, Mr. Andre Langston, CEO and
15 owner of WDKX Radio out of Rochester, whose
16 actual radio station is named in honor of such
17 important and great leaders like Frederick
18 Douglass, Malcolm X, and Dr. Martin Luther King.

19 Madam President. Let us continue to
20 make space for the creativity, protect cultural
21 institutions, do not allow policy to erase the
22 contributions of not just simply Black artists,
23 but Black people and our shared experiences.
24 That we commit in this chamber to commemorating
25 Black Music Month and all the work that we do in

1 this chamber to uplift the next generation of
2 Black artists and creatives whose voices will
3 define not only our future, but most certainly
4 shape and influence our present.

5 I want to thank our Senate Majority
6 Leader for supporting this resolution; all of my
7 colleagues for the work that you've done over the
8 last two days. It is my sincere hope and prayer
9 that all of our honorees feel loved, appreciated,
10 seen, celebrated.

11 And with that, I proudly vote aye,
12 and Happy Black Music Month.

13 Thank you, Madam President.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
15 Senator Webb.

16 Senator Baskin on the resolution.

17 SENATOR BASKIN: Thank you,
18 Madam President. I stand here today to recognize
19 Black Music Month as the celebration of legacy
20 that has shaped the culture and the soul of our
21 nation.

22 I want to lift up our leader, Andrea
23 Stewart-Cousins, for bringing this resolution
24 forward. To our colleagues, who are part of the
25 Black Task Force; to Elm Core for sponsoring this

1 beautiful two-day experience of celebratory
2 celebrations of Black music here in the State
3 Legislature; and to my colleague Senator Lea
4 Webb, for leading the way on this wonderful,
5 wonderful tribute.

6 Now that it is my second year in the
7 State Senate, it is just such a beautiful,
8 beautiful experience to take part in.

9 Black music has long been the
10 soundtrack of the African-American experience in
11 this country. It has told the story of struggle,
12 resilience, resistance, freedom, joy and triumph.

13 It is more than just entertainment.
14 It is protest. Black music is education. Black
15 music is identity.

16 As we honor our distinguished guests
17 who are here with us today -- who traveled so
18 far, and I'm so happy to welcome them -- at this
19 Black Music Month, I also want to recognize the
20 leadership of so many others in our country who
21 have contributed to this form of music.

22 As we celebrate here today, we must
23 also remember Black music's painful history in
24 this country. Our African ancestors brought here
25 in chains, against their will, carried with them

1 traditions and cultural expressions that even the
2 most inhumane forms of oppression could not
3 erase.

4 Through spirituals, rhythm, dance
5 and songs born from both suffering and hope, they
6 created music that would lay the foundations for
7 generations to come.

8 From gospel to jazz to blues to R&B
9 to hip-hop, Black music has continuously evolved
10 over the decades, shaping the music that we know
11 and love today.

12 When I was growing up,
13 Madam President, I was surrounded by generations
14 of Black music. My grandparents would listen to
15 Black artists of the 1950s and '60s: Little
16 Richard, Ray Charles, James Brown, Ella
17 Fitzgerald and Nat King Cole. My parents would
18 always be seen blasting Earth, Wind and Fire,
19 Stevie Wonder, Prince, and Michael Jackson around
20 the house.

21 Those sounds became a part of my
22 childhood. And as I got older, I adopted and was
23 attracted to genres of my own. My favorite as an
24 '80s baby and '90s kid was New Jack Swing. When
25 I think of Teddy Riley, Jimmy Jam, Terry Lewis,

1 Janet Jackson, Babyface, that genre that defined
2 the era of my childhood, it means so very much to
3 me. That was the music that motivated me. I
4 learned my first choreographed dance to New Jack
5 Swing, New Edition.

6 When I hear these songs today, that
7 brings me right back to my childhood, to feelings
8 of joy and nostalgia.

9 So today as we celebrate Black Music
10 Month, let us honor generations of Black
11 musicians, creators, performers and pioneers who
12 have transformed their pain into the soundtrack
13 that continues to inspire us all. Let us lift up
14 Sheila Brown, who I was able to speak on today at
15 our press conference as the first Black woman to
16 own a radio station here in the great State of
17 New York, and all that she has contributed to
18 Black music in uplifting Black voices across this
19 country.

20 And a special shout out to MC Lyte.
21 I was privileged to be able to shake her hand
22 today and tell her that I don't think I would
23 have the guts to be a Senator had it not been for
24 her music. Paper Thin was an album that I
25 listened to over and over and over again.

1 And I really, really appreciate her
2 contributions to me in paving the way for me to
3 be the first Black woman from my City of Buffalo
4 to ever ascend to the State Senate.

5 So may God continue to bless the
6 gifts, the creativity, and the artistry of Black
7 musicians for generations and generations to
8 come.

9 Madam President, I proudly vote aye.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
11 Senator Baskin.

12 Senator Zellner on the resolution.

13 SENATOR ZELLNER: Thank you,
14 Madam President.

15 I rise today in support of this
16 resolution recognizing Black Music Month, and I
17 want to thank Senator Webb and Senator Baskin for
18 her comments, and Senator Webb for bringing it
19 before the Senate here.

20 Black music and jazz are woven into
21 the fabric of Buffalo. For generations the
22 Colored Musicians Club has been the center of
23 that history. Legendary artists like
24 Duke Ellington, Billie Holiday, Ella Fitzgerald
25 came through those doors while traveling across

1 the country. It became a place where Black
2 artists could gather, create and build community
3 during a time when many spaces were closed off to
4 them.

5 And more than a century later, the
6 Colored Musicians Club is still standing. It
7 remains the only continuously operated
8 Black-owned music venue in the United States, and
9 that is something Buffalo and all of Western
10 New York and all of New York should be very proud
11 of.

12 And that legacy continues today
13 through Sheila Brown, who's with us here in
14 chambers. Sheila started at WUFO, woof-o, at
15 just 21 years old and worked her way up from a
16 salesperson to owner, becoming the first
17 African-American woman to own a radio station in
18 Buffalo and Western New York.

19 Sheila didn't just make history in
20 Buffalo; she helped preserve a piece of Buffalo
21 history that could have been easily lost.
22 Through WUFO she has spent decades uplifting
23 Black voices, supporting local artists,
24 preserving Buffalo's cultural history, and
25 creating a platform that generations of people in

1 Buffalo have turned to for music, conversation,
2 and connection.

3 But WUFO is more than just a radio
4 station. It has become a voice for our
5 community. And it has become the town hall for
6 our community.

7 I want to recognize Sheila Brown for
8 her leadership and everything she has done for
9 Buffalo and Western New York and the importance
10 of Black Music Month.

11 Thank you, Madam President. I vote
12 aye.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
14 Senator.

15 Senator Bailey on the resolution.

16 SENATOR BAILEY: Thank you,
17 Madam President.

18 This is one of those days here. To
19 quote Common in "I Used to Love H.E.R.," "Now,
20 Black music is Black music, and it's all good."
21 I'm not going to go with the rest of the verse;
22 it's not really chamber-appropriate.

23 But what Common was saying in "I
24 Used to Love H.E.R.," was how the feeling that he
25 had about hip-hop -- he met this girl when he was

1 nine years old, but what he loved so much had so
2 much soul.

3 And that's Black music in general,
4 Madam President. It's not just hip-hop, which is
5 one of the greatest American art forms, along
6 with jazz. It's gospel, it's R&B, it's reggae,
7 it's calypso and soca.

8 It's Sunday morning listening to
9 Hal Jackson and BLS, cleaning your house when
10 your mom's making you clean your house, to that
11 cleaning music. It is those driving songs that
12 you had on your way to North Carolina in the
13 summer for the family reunions.

14 We can talk about "Country Cousins,"
15 Kweli, for a little bit. That's one of those
16 songs that those of us from New York, we relate
17 to that with that family down South.

18 But I'm just in awe of these legends
19 in Black music, Madam President. Bob Law, with
20 being a Black talk show radio host. We didn't
21 have a lot of those. And Mr. Langston and
22 Ms. Brown, they are Black folks north of
23 Mount Vernon, right? It is really important to
24 show that there's diversity in that the music
25 experience and you're cultivating those

1 experiences north.

2 And DJ Beverly Bond, just thank you
3 for letting the world know that Black Girls Rock!
4 It's really important to not just speak about it,
5 but to say it.

6 And to the family of John Coltrane,
7 I know Ms. Michelle Coltrane had to go, but we
8 had a resolution and we spoke about his legendary
9 impact.

10 But you know I'm hip-hop 366 days a
11 year.

12 (Laughter.)

13 SENATOR BAILEY: And just to be in
14 the presence of MC Lyte and Talib Kweli, I don't
15 think you realize how big of a deal this is.

16 We know about her storied career,
17 but MC Lyte, my favorite verse from you ever was
18 self-destruction. That was my favorite verse.
19 Because like I remember it, it's one of these
20 core memories. I'm in my grandparents' basement,
21 and I told Uncle Ralph this the first time I met
22 him. I watched that video, and I saw the
23 scrolling thing on the bottom. "MC Lyte's on the
24 microphone/Leave the knives and the guns at
25 home."

1 And that stuck with me. Not only
2 were you one of the first female MCs to really do
3 it in a major way, you were on that track
4 spreading positivity. And it was something that
5 me as a young man, like learning what hip-hop
6 was, it stuck with me.

7 And look, there's so many great
8 songs. "Poor Georgie," like give your flowers to
9 those before -- you know, you never know when
10 you're going to lose somebody. My mom didn't let
11 me listen to "Ruffneck" because, I'm gonna tell
12 you the story, she thought that when the song
13 "gotta get a whatcho," she thought it was saying
14 "got to get arrested." So my mom was like, nah,
15 you're not listening to that in this house.

16 (Laughter.)

17 SENATOR BAILEY: And then I told
18 her what it was, she said, "Okay, you're still
19 not listening to that."

20 (Laughter.)

21 SENATOR BAILEY: But we talk a lot
22 about great diss songs. Ten Percent, diss songs,
23 sometimes forgets -- sometimes people forget
24 about it. You know, there was a song that was in
25 Quiet Storm that she got that from MC Lyte.

1 Right? Hit 'Em Up, they got that from MC Lyte.
2 Like that was one of the classic -- again, we're
3 not going to go into those lyrics here today, but
4 you should listen to that song.

5 Brother Kweli, in this chamber we go
6 through episodes too, like Attack of the Clones.
7 Thank you for shaping what conscious hip-hop was,
8 along with Rawkus Records and independent labels
9 and showing that we as Black people, Black men,
10 cannot just be constrained by labels, but go out
11 on our own and make independent labels hot.

12 And "Country Cousins," I talked
13 about that song that you did with UGK. It was
14 one of the songs that -- it was kind of before
15 its time where people really weren't doing
16 New York and down South tracks like that -- "Rest
17 in Peace," KMC.

18 And it was really like you were
19 talking about you're from Brooklyn and going down
20 South and having that same vibe. And the flow
21 that you started out with at the top of the song
22 was really important because it was sort of like
23 when Biggie did it on "Notorious Thugs," to show
24 that we can rap in different ways in New York.
25 We're versatile.

1 Like I am really like a student of
2 this, and it's just -- it makes me feel so proud
3 that ambassadors of a culture that was born under
4 such conditions at 1520 Sedgwick Avenue on
5 August 11, 1973, in the Bronx -- there's no
6 dispute, Lea.

7 And I just want to make sure, before
8 I forget, I want to make sure I shout out Lea. I
9 mentioned at the press conference thank you for
10 doing so much to uplift and extend what
11 Black Music Month is in this chamber.

12 And Reflection Eternal, "Never Been
13 in Love," one of the greatest hip-hop love songs
14 of all time, people don't give you enough credit
15 for that.

16 But as I close, I just want to leave
17 you with this. Black Music Month is officially
18 in June, but it's 365. The music takes you to a
19 certain place. Any time I listen to a song in a
20 shuffle, it takes me to a certain place where I
21 remember that. The mental download, the download
22 of the music on Napster -- I'm sorry, I didn't
23 have any money back then, I wasn't paying for the
24 records.

25 (Laughter.)

1 SENATOR BAILEY: But Black music is
2 so critically important to my development as not
3 just a legislator, as a man, as a husband, as a
4 father. And I have you all to thank for the
5 impact that you have made on my life.

6 I'm glad I was able to get through
7 that because, again, this is a big deal. I
8 proudly vote aye on this resolution, and
9 Black music forever!

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
11 Senator Bailey.

12 Senator Comrie on the resolution.

13 SENATOR COMRIE: Thank you,
14 Madam President. After all that history from
15 Brother Bailey, I should just sit down.

16 (Laughter.)

17 SENATOR COMRIE: But I do need to
18 stand up and thank Leader Cousins for allowing
19 this to happen, this resolution.

20 And to Lea Webb for making sure that
21 Black Music Month is truly a real celebration
22 here in Albany, where we have an opportunity to
23 celebrate artists and people and
24 industry-makers -- not just artists, but
25 entrepreneurs, businesspeople, songwriters and

1 musicians.

2 She's truly made this a memorable
3 event, and I want to thank her for all of her
4 efforts and the hundreds of hours that she put
5 into making this happen. So thank you,
6 Sister Webb.

7 I really want to thank the honorees.
8 You know, I represent Queens. I don't want to be
9 in Brooklyn.

10 (Laughter.)

11 SENATOR COMRIE: But Queens,
12 Southeast Queens has been a home to Black artists
13 for centuries, going back to when James Brown
14 lived in Addisleigh Park, Ella Fitzgerald, a lot
15 of other artists.

16 But we have people here today that
17 have truly impacted music -- Sheila Brown, as you
18 heard from Senator Baskin, and Andre Langston,
19 who I'm just meeting for the first time today --
20 but truly pioneers that have created
21 opportunities for many people to listen and
22 appreciate and enjoy Black music.

23 Bob Law, who I had the honor of
24 meeting, was truly a renaissance man, truly
25 someone that we all depended on to keep it real

1 and to keep the truth.

2 John Coltrane, truly, thank you to
3 his family for coming today. There was so much
4 that he did to help us in music. Brother Bailey
5 broke down Brother Kveli so deeply, I won't even
6 touch all of that. But, you know, I don't have
7 that music history engrained in my soul as
8 Brother Bailey.

9 But I do know it's music that moves
10 us. It's music that inspires us. It's music
11 that keeps us going in difficult times, and the
12 Black musicians that are here as well.

13 Beverly Bond, I always say
14 DJ Beverly Bond -- Black Girls Rock! -- thank you
15 for your vision. Thank you for your focus.
16 Thank you for creating a national environment to
17 empower all Black women.

18 And to MC Lyte, I had the honor of
19 having a sitdown with you last year, just to find
20 out that you're a deep sister. You care about
21 the world. You care about issues. You've
22 utilized your music to empower women. You're
23 truly a special person.

24 Thank you all for coming today. I
25 really appreciate everything that's happening.

1 I'm sorry that we weren't at the reception last
2 night, but we were here passing the budget. But
3 we will be honoring you in every way possible.
4 Today is just a small token of our appreciation,
5 of our love and respect for all of you, for all
6 the things that you've done.

7 Thank you, Senator Webb, for making
8 this happen.

9 Thank you, Madam President.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
11 Senator Comrie.

12 Senator Myrie on the resolution.

13 SENATOR MYRIE: Thank you,
14 Madam President.

15 Let me first thank Senator Lea Webb
16 for all of her leadership in making this event
17 and yesterday's event really I think a historic
18 celebration of Black music during this month.
19 And of course to our leader, Andrea
20 Stewart-Cousins, for bringing this resolution.

21 We had a chance to meet a lot of the
22 honorees at the press conference earlier today,
23 so I won't go through everyone.

24 I just wanted to elevate two in
25 particular, the first being DJ Beverly Bond, who,

1 you know, I was thinking as we were going through
2 what might be the best thing to say about you
3 during this speech and at the press conference.
4 And, you know, I thought, Well, we have Senator
5 Lea Webb, a powerful and strong Black woman. We
6 have Andrea Stewart-Cousins, the first Black
7 woman, the first woman to lead the Senate
8 Majority in the history of this state. I of
9 course came from a Black woman. I am married to
10 a Black woman.

11 And what you have done with Black
12 Girls Rock -- the affirmation that it gives for
13 so many that look like you, that look like our
14 families, our community. It's bigger than the
15 music.

16 And I want to publicly thank you for
17 everything that you have done there and that you
18 will continue to do, and what it has grown to be.

19 And then of course to Talib, who as
20 we all know is from Brooklyn. But he also went
21 to the best high school in the State of New York,
22 Brooklyn Tech. I have the honor of also
23 representing Medgar Evers College, where another
24 powerful Black woman, his mom, Dr. Greene, has
25 been a professor and a scholar and someone who I

1 take great humility and joy in working with to
2 achieve things for our community.

3 Talib, what you did for young Black
4 men like me, who was listening to rap music and
5 reciting lyrics that I had no idea what -- like
6 what we -- I'm talking street stuff that I have
7 no idea what I'm talking about.

8 (Laughter.)

9 SENATOR MYRIE: I don't live that
10 life. I didn't grow up that way.

11 But then there came you, someone who
12 was rapping about things that I did relate to and
13 that I did know about, and teaching me things and
14 saying, Look, you can do this and be cool, and
15 you don't got to be all this over here.

16 That has stuck with me forever. And
17 I just wanted to say thank you for the example
18 that you have set and continue to set for many
19 Black boys and many Black men -- that you can
20 stand in both spaces and be just as cool and just
21 as powerful.

22 So as we celebrate Black Music
23 Month, I want to thank all the honorees for
24 taking the time to be with us here in the
25 chamber. Thank you for your patience as we've

1 gone through the legislative process.

2 I very, very, very proudly vote aye
3 on the resolution. Thank you.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
5 Senator Myrie.

6 Senator Fernandez on the resolution.

7 SENATOR FERNANDEZ: Thank you,
8 Madam President.

9 So I don't know if anybody or many
10 people know this, but I grew up dancing. I was
11 always in dance class, jazz, ballet, tap,
12 everything. And one of my favorite things is --
13 was learning about the music. Every time my
14 teacher put on a different song, we're going to
15 dance to this, she would give us -- he/she would
16 give us a little history about who the artist was
17 and when it was popular, when it came out.

18 And one of my most I guess favorite
19 things about music in general is that
20 Black artists originated every genre, almost.
21 For those that don't know, again, I'm a big fan
22 of Beyoncé and I do love her.

23 (Laughter.)

24 SENATOR FERNANDEZ: One of my
25 favorite things to know and to share and to talk

1 about is how she is using her position now to
2 elevate the history of Black music, from Act 1:
3 Renaissance, and giving credit to the Black LGBT
4 community and Donna Summer and DJ Frankie
5 Knuckles for how they inspired that genre of
6 music. Country music was taken from
7 Black artists, and rock music. I'm excited for
8 Act 3 coming out.

9 But I have to stand up to thank the
10 sponsor, Lea Webb, for bringing this resolution,
11 because it is a moment that we should appreciate.
12 It's a contribution to this country that we
13 should appreciate and recognize every day.

14 And I'm truly grateful to all our
15 guests here for sharing your -- my God, your
16 spirit, your stardom, your influence, and for
17 everything you've contributed to music in our
18 country and society, and the love that we have
19 celebrating as humans.

20 So thank you. I proudly vote aye
21 too.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
23 Senator Fernandez.

24 Senator Hinchey on the resolution.

25 SENATOR HINCHEY: Thank you,

1 Madam President.

2 I rise, first and foremost, to thank
3 my seatmate, Senator Lea Webb, who has put so
4 much energy into this over the last few years.
5 Your passion and excitement is palpable, and it
6 just makes me so excited.

7 But even larger, I rise to celebrate
8 Black music. I represent and grew up in a
9 predominantly, almost exclusively white
10 community, but Black music helped shape my way of
11 thinking. Listening to Black music as a kid
12 opened my eyes to different cultures, opened my
13 eyes to different ways of life. Opened my eyes
14 to some very good music.

15 And it's something that we would
16 talk about with my friends all the time. It was
17 accessible. We listened to it, we loved it. And
18 it was just a huge part of growing up.

19 I too grew up dancing, and it's some
20 of the best music to dance to. But being able to
21 listen to some of the lyrics, you know, to
22 understand where people are coming from, it
23 shaped my life today.

24 Talib Kweli, listening to you
25 growing up in upstate New York, in the Catskills

1 and the Hudson Valley -- thank you.

2 Listening to Missy Elliott, blasting
3 her from my car down our rural roads, while
4 people are listening to God knows what, was so
5 much fun and important for people to be able to
6 hear and learn from.

7 Listening to Eve is just so -- was
8 so much fun and so, again, important for our
9 learning and way of life.

10 And so I want to say thank you for
11 everything that all of you have done. Thank you
12 to the families, but thank you, more broadly, to
13 the way that Black music has shaped our culture
14 and really spoken to people in the more rural
15 area and white communities, bringing us all
16 together.

17 Thank you so much.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
19 Senator Hinchey.

20 Senator Sepúlveda on the resolution.

21 SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA: Thank you,
22 Madam President, for allowing me to speak on this
23 resolution now.

24 My colleague Jamaal Bailey speaks
25 about hip-hop and the newer generation of music,

1 but I grew up in Brooklyn, New York, with my
2 grandfather, and I grew up listening to Latin
3 music, salsa music, which has a large African
4 influence. But also my grandfather was a revered
5 and loved jazz musician. So while I listened to
6 all kinds of music, every -- almost every day I
7 had to listen to one of the probably greatest
8 jazz saxophonists ever, John Coltrane.

9 We listened to Charlie Parker, Sonny
10 Rollins, who passed away a couple of days ago,
11 Miles Davis, Duke Ellington, Billie Holiday,
12 Dizzy Gillespie, Charlie Parker -- Bill Evans was
13 one of the greatest composers and jazz pianists
14 to exist.

15 And of course the man who probably
16 deserves the most credit for creating one of the
17 only two American forms of music -- one is salsa
18 music, which was formed in Harlem -- and jazz.
19 These are the only two true forms of pure
20 American music.

21 And the person who changed American
22 music, the history of American music was none
23 other than a man named Louie Armstrong. Louie
24 Armstrong changed music completely in this
25 country and throughout the world. The concept of

1 syncopation he brought to music, where prior to
2 Louie Armstrong music was like a marching band.
3 You know, you'd listen to the marching band
4 music, and he brought in syncopation and changed
5 it completely.

6 So to all the artists today, Black,
7 white, no matter where you're from, you all owe a
8 debt of gratitude to Louie Armstrong, because he
9 changed our music, he created everything today
10 that's been used in creating hip-hop and other
11 forms of music -- country music, rock and roll,
12 all of that -- all of them owe a debt of
13 gratitude to a Black man named Louie Armstrong.

14 I vote aye. Thank you.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
16 Senator Sepúlveda.

17 Senator Cleare to close.

18 SENATOR CLEARE: Thank you,
19 Madam President.

20 I rise to speak in support of the
21 Black Music Month resolution, and I want to offer
22 special thanks to our incredible collaborators on
23 the Black Music Month program. But the grandest
24 shout-out of all to Senator Lea Webb, for her
25 incredible vision and commitment.

1 I represent Harlem, the epicenter of
2 Black history, culture, thought, art,
3 scholarship, and music. A significant part of
4 the history of Black music is rooted in my
5 district, including the quintessential venues of
6 the Harlem Renaissance, such as the Alhambra
7 Ballroom, the Cotton Club, Count Basie's Lounge,
8 the Lenox Lounge, the Renaissance Ballroom, the
9 Savoy, Monette's Supper Club, Bill's Place,
10 Minton's Playhouse, the Apollo Theater, the
11 original Red Rooster.

12 Moreover, many of the finest
13 Black musicians lived in, played in, and
14 frequented Harlem, including Louie Armstrong,
15 Duke Ellington, Earl "Fatha" Hines, Cab Calloway,
16 Thelonious Monk, Dizzy Gillespie, Count Basie,
17 Jelly Roll Morton, Charlie Parker, Fats Waller,
18 Ella Fitzgerald, Bessie Smith, Paul Robeson,
19 Ethel Waters, Bill "Bojangles" Robinson,
20 Lena Horne, Billie Holiday, and Josephine Baker,
21 just to name a few.

22 Black music has played a significant
23 role in all areas of life globally. Black
24 musicians have historically been dispatched as
25 cultural ambassadors to foster goodwill, bring

1 people together, and represent American values,
2 using music to connect with global audiences in
3 ways that politics and traditional diplomacy
4 could not.

5 Beginning in the 1950s and '60s, the
6 U.S. government, through the Department of State,
7 dispatched Black jazz icons such as Louie
8 Armstrong, Duke Ellington, Dizzy Gillespie and
9 others, to tour the world.

10 Blues, gospel, R&B evolved out of
11 the African-American experience in the American
12 South. And as these genres migrated north, many
13 were popularized and perfected in some ways
14 during the Harlem Renaissance. Ultimately these
15 genres have become the pillars of rock and the
16 pop industry.

17 Black music dominates the global
18 cultural economy and is one of the largest
19 exports of the United States of America.
20 Streaming data places rap and hip-hop on one of
21 the most consumed genres globally. Black music
22 influences design, fashion, and various youth
23 subcultures around the world.

24 This year's ceremony honors
25 Ms. Sheila Brown, of WUFO Radio in Buffalo. And

1 we have to thank each and every one of these
2 individuals. Ms. Brown, we thank you for keeping
3 the music alive. And not just the music -- the
4 history, the legacy, the opportunity. Andre
5 Langston of WDKX Radio in Rochester, we thank you
6 too for elevating and continuing the legacy.

7 The family of Bob Law, Aisha
8 Patrice, thank you so much -- unknowingly -- for
9 sharing your family with all of us. I feel like
10 he was a part of my own family. We waited to
11 hear him come on. That was our voice, and we
12 felt like we knew him.

13 The family of John Coltrane and
14 Alice Coltrane -- Michelle, who was here
15 earlier -- thank you so much for John's
16 contributions. John would have been 100 this
17 year. We're so excited about all the events.

18 And I have to lift up the names of
19 so many others who would be 100 this year. Very
20 interestingly, Jimmy Heath, Randy Weston,
21 Miles Davis, all would be 100 years old this
22 year. Makes you wonder what was going on in the
23 20s, huh?

24 Talib, we share a high school; your
25 mother tells me all the time. And, you know,

1 what else should we expect, the son of
2 Dr. Greene, for you to touch a whole 'nother
3 generation with the same legacy and the same
4 originality.

5 Ms. Beverly Bond, you're a writer, a
6 businesswoman, a philanthropist. Thank you for
7 the give-back. Thank you for showing us the way
8 to do it.

9 And MC Lyte -- oof. You showed us
10 our place in hip-hop, in a powerful and dignified
11 way. I thank you for that.

12 Today is a great day as we honor
13 those who are here. And I can't leave, I can't
14 take my seat without of course lifting up the
15 great, Harlem's own, cultural icon Rob Base, who
16 we just lost this week. It takes two to make a
17 thing go right.

18 And also, as was mentioned before,
19 the jazz great -- are you signing, John Liu?

20 (Laughter.)

21 UNIDENTIFIED SENATOR:

22 Internationally known.

23 SENATOR CLEARE: Internationally
24 known.

25 (Laughter.)

1 SENATOR CLEARE: -- the jazz great
2 Sonny Rollins, who resided in Senator Hinchey's
3 district but also had a great relationship with
4 Harlem.

5 You know, for hundreds of years
6 Black music has been the drumbeat and the
7 lifeblood of existence, of resistance, of
8 freedom, of storytelling, creativity and history.
9 Before we were allowed to read, before we were
10 allowed to go to schools, before we were
11 integrated, we brought music with us. And music
12 was how we communicated with each other. And it
13 is how we communicate with the world.

14 I am so proud to celebrate our music
15 in Black Music Month. Thank you, Leader
16 Stewart-Cousins, for allowing this resolution to
17 be brought to the floor. It is so important.

18 Black music, long may it live.

19 Thank you.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
21 Senator Cleare.

22 To our incredibly distinguished
23 honorees who are here for Black Music Month, who
24 have been named and celebrated on this floor here
25 today, we welcome you on behalf of the Senate.

1 We extend to you the privileges and cordialities
2 of the house. We honor all you have contributed,
3 and in those whose memory we speak as well.

4 Congratulations. Please rise and be
5 honored on the floor.

6 (Enthusiastic standing ovation.)

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
8 resolution was previously adopted on May 27th.

9 Senator Gianaris.

10 SENATOR GIANARIS: Please call on
11 Senator Gonzalez for an introduction.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
13 Gonzalez for an introduction.

14 SENATOR GONZALEZ: Thank you,
15 Madam President.

16 Today it is my honor to rise and
17 welcome Ambassador Satoshi Katahira, of the
18 Consulate General of Japan in New York, and the
19 distinguished Japanese delegation alongside
20 Senator Liu, to the New York State Senate.

21 Ambassador Katahira has a long
22 history in international and economic affairs
23 that has taken him across the world to places
24 like Brazil and the United Kingdom. He began his
25 post here in October 2025, and is continuing to

1 build on the deep and broad friendship between
2 Japan and the United States through cultural and
3 economic exchange, reinforcing the bond between
4 our two countries.

5 As we celebrate Asian American and
6 Pacific Islander Heritage Month, we recognize his
7 leadership and the generations of AAPI
8 communities whose culture, advocacy, and public
9 service have shaped New York.

10 The Consulate General of Japan
11 serves millions of people across our state, which
12 is currently home to 61,000 Japanese residents.
13 Myself and Senator Liu have the privilege of
14 joining many of our Japanese neighbors at the
15 Japan Day Parade, where Ambassador Katahira
16 rolled out their new Mascot, Happi, a squirrel
17 that represents the relationship between New York
18 City and Japan. And for those who may have
19 missed it, he even dressed up as Happi the
20 Squirrel.

21 I have also had the privilege of
22 partnering with the Consulate General on a number
23 of initiatives. Every year we bring together a
24 delegation of Japanese high school students to
25 meet with students in my own district and

1 understand their experiences.

2 Watching younger people connect
3 across languages, cultures, and experiences is a
4 powerful reminder that diplomacy is not only
5 conducted between governments, it is built every
6 day through human connection, curiosity, and
7 shared learning.

8 As many of you know, I have also had
9 a chance to do some of that learning. I am
10 marrying into a Japanese family and have yearly
11 been able to visit my soon-to-be
12 grandmother-in-law in Hyuga, a small surf town.
13 And while Hyuga looks very different from Queens,
14 where I grew up, I can say what feels so familiar
15 are the shared values of family, of food, of art
16 at the center of community.

17 At a time when division and
18 isolation can feel all too common, these
19 exchanges matter deeply. They help foster a
20 generation that understands the value of cultural
21 appreciation and solidarity despite different
22 backgrounds.

23 Learning from Japanese-American
24 political history, organizing, and activism in
25 the United States is so instructive to how we

1 should view the world today.

2 And we are also proudly joined today
3 by a World War II veteran. Thank you so much for
4 your service.

5 With Ambassador Katahira there is
6 also a delegation of Japanese business leaders.
7 Japanese businesses make over \$800 billion in
8 investments into the American economy. These
9 companies range from the financial and
10 real estate sectors to manufacturing and
11 entrepreneurs leading innovation and industries.

12 So to Ambassador Katahira and the
13 broader delegation, I want to say {in Japanese},
14 and I want to welcome you and thank you for your
15 continued friendship with the people of New York.

16 Madam President, please join me in
17 extending all the privileges of this chamber to
18 our distinguished guests.

19 Thank you.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
21 Senator Gonzalez.

22 To Ambassador Katahira, to our
23 distinguished delegation representing the
24 business community of Japan, we welcome you to
25 the Senate. On behalf of our members, we extend

1 to you the privileges and courtesies of the
2 house.

3 Please rise, if you are able, and we
4 look to recognize you.

5 (Standing ovation.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
7 Gianaris.

8 SENATOR GIANARIS: All right,
9 Madam President, let's now begin the
10 controversial calendar with Calendar 927, please.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
12 Secretary will ring the bell.

13 The secretary will read.

14 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
15 927, Senate Print 5134, by Senator Harckham, an
16 act to amend the Correction Law.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
18 Rhoads, why do you rise?

19 SENATOR RHOADS: I was hoping that
20 Senator Harckham might yield to a few questions.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
22 Harckham, do you yield?

23 SENATOR HARCKHAM: I do.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
25 Harckham yields.

1 SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you,
2 Senator Harckham.

3 Through you, Madam President, of
4 course. Am I correct in my understanding that
5 the purpose of this bill is to create a standard
6 electronic medical records database for
7 correctional centers?

8 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Through you,
9 Madam President, that is correct.

10 SENATOR RHOADS: And will the
11 sponsor continue to yield?

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
13 continue to yield?

14 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Yes.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
16 sponsor yields.

17 SENATOR RHOADS: And am I also
18 correct in my understanding that this piece of
19 legislation was actually introduced and passed
20 back in the '23-'24 session as well, correct?

21 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Through you,
22 Madam President, that is correct.

23 SENATOR RHOADS: And will the
24 sponsor continue to yield?

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you

1 continue to yield?

2 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Yes.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
4 sponsor yields.

5 SENATOR RHOADS: Were there any
6 revisions or modifications to the bill that
7 appears before us today in comparison to the bill
8 that was actually introduced and passed by this
9 body -- and by the Assembly, incidentally -- back
10 in 2024?

11 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Through you,
12 Madam President, no, there have not been.

13 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor
14 continue to yield?

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
16 continue to yield?

17 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Yes.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
19 sponsor yields.

20 SENATOR RHOADS: Am I also correct
21 in my understanding that after being passed in
22 2023, in the '23-'24 session, by the Senate and
23 the Assembly, the Governor actually vetoed this
24 piece of legislation?

25 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Through you,

1 Madam President, that is correct.

2 SENATOR RHOADS: Why is it being --
3 will the sponsor continue to yield?

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
5 continue to yield? Senator Harckham, do you
6 continue to yield?

7 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Yes.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
9 sponsor yields.

10 SENATOR RHOADS: Why is the bill
11 being reintroduced?

12 SENATOR HARCKHAM: I'm sorry, could
13 you repeat that, please?

14 SENATOR RHOADS: Sure.

15 Why is the bill being reintroduced?

16 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Through you,
17 Madam President. The bill is being reintroduced,
18 one, because the need is still there.

19 And I would just share a brief aside
20 on the way this legislation came about. I have
21 three correctional facilities in my district
22 which I visit annually, and I was meeting with
23 PEF and CSEA members who are on the medical staff
24 through OMH. And they were telling me of the
25 problems of having paper files -- our entire

1 medical system and medical economy decades ago
2 transferred to an electronic system -- and this
3 was an impediment both to care and efficient
4 staff work.

5 You know, often in here we hear that
6 we're not being responsive to the needs of folks
7 working in correctional facilities. Well, this
8 bill came as a suggestion from folks working in
9 correctional facilities.

10 So the need is still there. The
11 difference is in the budget yesterday, in fact,
12 we passed \$35.8 million for this purpose; there
13 was just no Article VII language accompanying it.
14 So this is just a two-sentence bill that directs
15 the commissioner to do it, in consultation with
16 DOH and OMH, and to promulgate rules.

17 SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you,
18 Senator.

19 Will the sponsor continue to yield?

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
21 continue to yield?

22 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Yes.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
24 Senator yields.

25 SENATOR RHOADS: Well, I certainly

1 understand the motivation behind the bill, no
2 question about that.

3 The Governor's veto message spelled
4 out the reason why, however, the bill was vetoed
5 in the initial instance, in that DOCCS as well as
6 the Office of Mental Health is already putting
7 together an electronic medical records system for
8 use in correctional centers.

9 And her concern was that since this
10 process is up to the RFP stage already, through
11 your legislation having to restart the process,
12 would require significant reengineering, would
13 render the already-completed work obsolete, and
14 would undo the substantial time and cost to the
15 state that they've already invested to get it to
16 the RFP stage.

17 With that being the case, why are we
18 reintroducing the legislation if it's something
19 that's already being created by the state and
20 funded through our budget yesterday?

21 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Through you,
22 Madam President, I reject, respectfully, that
23 that is the case, that they do have to go back
24 and undo everything.

25 This codifies it. I believe we in

1 the Legislature have responsibility to proscribe
2 what our agencies do. We have seen time and
3 again agencies go down a path only to walk away
4 from a project.

5 They started this eight years ago.
6 In 2018 is when they started this, eight years
7 ago. And so there was a feeling among us on the
8 Majority side that it was time to step in and
9 codify this legislatively so this gets done once
10 and for all.

11 SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you,
12 Senator Harckham.

13 On the bill.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
15 Rhoads on the bill.

16 SENATOR RHOADS: The Governor's
17 veto message was very clear. It's not something
18 I made up. The veto message, No. 73, issued in
19 2024 on November 22nd, indicated: "While I
20 recognize the need to align medical records
21 across state agencies, this bill would be
22 duplicative of an existing effort from the Office
23 of Information Technology, which is working on
24 separate electronic health record projects with
25 DOCCS and the Office of Mental Health, exactly

1 that this bill prescribes.

2 "This bill would render the work
3 already completed obsolete, require significant
4 reengineering, and delay implementation of this
5 important work, all at a substantial and
6 unnecessary cost to the state, which is the
7 reason I therefore am constrained to veto this
8 bill."

9 It's an interesting dynamic. What
10 apparently is happening between the majorities in
11 the Assembly and the Senate and the Governor's
12 office is that they seem incapable of getting on
13 the same page.

14 Yesterday we just approved 36 --
15 \$35.8 million for the very project that the
16 Governor was talking about, a project that is at
17 the RFP stage. Which means all the preliminary
18 work behind putting together a plan in order to
19 issue the RFP and actually have companies bid on
20 the right to perform the work, has already been
21 performed.

22 And so now the concern from the
23 Governor -- and it's odd that I ever, on this
24 side of the aisle, align myself with anything
25 that the Governor says or does -- that the

1 Governor has indicated is already far enough
2 along that the passage of this bill would
3 actually cost the state additional resources and
4 would require them to backtrack.

5 And I know that my colleague
6 Senator Harckham mentioned that this has already
7 taken eight years to come to fruition. We
8 certainly can't start back at square one by
9 passing this legislation today and delaying this
10 project even further.

11 So I will be voting no,
12 Madam President, and I would encourage my
13 colleagues to do the same.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
15 Senator Rhoads.

16 Senator Martins, why do you rise?

17 SENATOR MARTINS: Just wondering if
18 the sponsor would yield for a few questions.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Will the
20 Senator yield?

21 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Absolutely.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
23 Senator yields.

24 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,
25 Madam President. Through you.

1 Senator Harckham, can you tell us,
2 if you know, how much money has already been
3 spent on this effort to create electronic medical
4 records for incarcerated persons?

5 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Through you,
6 Madam President, we do not have that information.

7 SENATOR MARTINS: Through you,
8 Madam President, if the sponsor would continue to
9 yield.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Will you
11 continue to yield?

12 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Yes.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
14 Senator yields.

15 SENATOR MARTINS: And, Senator, do
16 you know whether that will include all persons
17 who are incarcerated in New York State or whether
18 there will be an option for persons to opt out
19 and to continue to use paper records?

20 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Through you,
21 Madam President. We are unaware of what DOCCS
22 has been working on for the last eight years
23 other than the report that they are working on
24 it.

25 But a uniform medical system for

1 everyone in the system does not contemplate
2 opting out. It's a uniform system so that when
3 someone goes from provider to provider to
4 provider, just the way we do through NYSHIP,
5 those medical records are there for that
6 provider.

7 SENATOR MARTINS: Through you,
8 Madam President, if the sponsor would continue to
9 yield.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
11 continue to yield?

12 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Yes.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
14 Senator yields.

15 SENATOR MARTINS: And with regard
16 to certain medical data and information in a
17 person's file, would that incarcerated person be
18 able to unilaterally decide that they wanted to
19 exclude information from their electronic record
20 and not make it uniformly available so that
21 future providers would have the benefit of being
22 able to access that information?

23 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Through you,
24 Madam President, this bill is neutral on that
25 subject.

1 This bill simply directs DOCCS, DOH,
2 and OMH to develop a system and promulgate rules.
3 So this bill is silent on that question.

4 SENATOR MARTINS: Last question,
5 Madam President, if the sponsor would yield for
6 one more.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
8 continue to yield?

9 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Yes.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
11 Senator yields.

12 SENATOR MARTINS: Senator, do you
13 believe that the system is better if everyone
14 participates in the electronic system without
15 carveouts and removing information from their
16 medical records?

17 SENATOR HARCKHAM: Through you,
18 Madam President. As I mentioned to the Senator
19 before, this bill is neutral on that. It simply
20 tells the commissioner of OMH and DOH to develop
21 a system and promulgate rules.

22 So as the sponsor of this, I am not
23 asserting one way or the other whether folks
24 should opt in, should opt out, whether the system
25 is better with that. We'll leave that to the

1 medical record professionals to develop.

2 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,
3 Madam President. On the bill.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
5 Martins on the bill.

6 SENATOR MARTINS: And I thank
7 Senator Harckham. Because, you know, we had this
8 debate just a week ago, maybe two weeks ago here
9 on the floor dealing with the integrity of
10 medical records, electronic medical records, and
11 the transition from paper to medical records and
12 the ability of people to carve out different
13 elements of those records unilaterally.

14 And I think we had a disagreement,
15 obviously, across the aisle between the Majority
16 and those of us who felt that the integrity of
17 the system and the protections that the integrity
18 of the system would provide for the patient
19 themselves in the event that there were a need
20 for intervention in the future, should supercede.

21 And here we are again, spending -- I
22 heard a figure of \$38 million had been allocated
23 in yesterday's budget for an effort. And
24 obviously spending that money without preserving
25 the integrity of the system seems rather futile

1 if people can just circumvent and decide not to
2 participate in the process.

3 There either is a purpose to doing
4 this or there is not a purpose to doing this.
5 Either those persons that Senator Harckham
6 referred to who suggested the benefits in doing
7 this and moving away from paper -- either they
8 are right or they are not.

9 And so either from a policy
10 standpoint we should go dive into the integrity
11 of a process that actually provides a system that
12 protects people and allows for those medical
13 records to be readily accessible by healthcare
14 professionals, or we don't.

15 And so in light of debates we've had
16 on the floor here where that has been eroded, I
17 hope that this effort doesn't lead us down that
18 same road, Madam President.

19 I am supporting this bill because I
20 do believe in the integrity of electronic medical
21 records and I believe that we have committed to
22 that. I hope we don't take further steps to
23 erode that effort, because I do think we're doing
24 New Yorkers and our residents a disservice when
25 we do that.

1 Madam President, I vote aye.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
3 Senator.

4 Are there any other Senators wishing
5 to be heard?

6 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
7 closed. The Secretary will ring the bell.

8 Read the last section.

9 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
10 act shall take effect on the 180th day after it
11 shall have become a law.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
13 roll.

14 (The Secretary called the roll.)

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
16 the results.

17 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
18 Calendar 927, voting in the negative are
19 Senators Borrello, Ortt, Rhoads, Tedisco and
20 Walczyk.

21 Ayes, 54. Nays, 5.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
23 is passed.

24 Senator Gianaris.

25 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,

1 before we continue on with the controversial
2 calendar, please recognize Senator Skoufis.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
4 Skoufis.

5 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Thank you,
6 Madam President.

7 I'd like to formally request that
8 Calendar Number 1286, Senate Bill 2294, be
9 starred until formal further notice.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Calendar
11 Number 1286, S2294, is starred.

12 Senator Gianaris.

13 SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you,
14 Madam President.

15 Congratulations to Senator Skoufis
16 for starring a bill.

17 Let's move on to Calendar 874,
18 please.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
20 Secretary will read.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 874, Senate Print 1280B, by Senator Krueger, an
23 act to amend the General Business Law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
25 Borrello, why do you rise?

1 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
2 I know that the sponsor is not here, but can
3 someone answer questions on this bill?

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
5 Rivera, do you yield?

6 SENATOR RIVERA: As long as my
7 colleague is sure about it, that he wants to do
8 it, then yes, I'll -- yes, I yield.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
10 Senator yields.

11 SENATOR BORRELLO: I've never been
12 so sure about anything in my life, so --

13 SENATOR RIVERA: Go ahead, buddy.

14 SENATOR BORRELLO: So first of all,
15 I guess the first question is -- I know a lot of
16 you folks down in the city don't have natural
17 gas -- do you have a gas stove?

18 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,
19 Madam President, I certainly do.

20 SENATOR BORRELLO: All right.
21 Madam President, will the sponsor continue to
22 yield?

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
24 continue to yield?

25 SENATOR RIVERA: Yes.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
2 Senator yields.

3 SENATOR BORRELLO: I do as well,
4 and I love my gas stove. There's really no way
5 to finish a steak any better than a gas stove.
6 Certainly not an electric stove. So maybe we can
7 agree on that, at least.

8 But my concern is -- is that this is
9 a label requirement for a gas stove, a warning
10 label. I know. Be still your beating heart.

11 There's actually a Biden-appointed
12 federal judge that has issued an injunction
13 against a similar law in Colorado, basically
14 saying it's a violation of the 1st Amendment.

15 So why would we move this forward?
16 Why would we not wait to see how that's been
17 adjudicated first?

18 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,
19 Madam President, a couple of things.

20 First, I did gasp over here,
21 Madam President. I did. I stopped myself.
22 Because yes, all this bill does is add a warning,
23 either in a sticker that can be removed or on a
24 box -- actually, on both. The bill requires it
25 on both, Madam President. A warning, a simple

1 warning. That's what it does.

2 Now, as it relates to my colleague's
3 question, we know that there has been -- that
4 there was a legal action that was brought against
5 the State of Colorado, I believe, that was --
6 they have their version of the bill. We feel
7 pretty confident that this, since it's only a
8 label, Madam President, we feel pretty confident
9 it's okay.

10 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
11 will the sponsor continue to yield?

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
13 continue to yield?

14 SENATOR RIVERA: Sure will.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
16 Senator yields.

17 SENATOR BORRELLO: I see the
18 facetiousness with which you see this.

19 But I can tell you as a small
20 business owner that the burdens that happen on
21 businesses large and small, in this chamber and
22 in this state, in this city, have driven out a
23 lot of businesses, raised the price of a lot of
24 things.

25 So if anything requires a warning

1 label, it should be the budget we just passed.

2 With that being said, let me ask
3 this question, then. Who's supposed to pay this
4 fine? It's really not clear. Is it the
5 manufacturer, is it the wholesaler, is it the
6 retailer? Who is supposed to attach this label?
7 And if it's not there, who's responsible for
8 paying the fine?

9 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,
10 Madam President, the manufacturer.

11 And certainly, while I'm very --
12 certainly as concerned as my colleague is with
13 impositions on small business, I don't think that
14 a small business that I know of makes gas stoves.
15 It probably is made by big companies that can
16 probably afford to put a warning label --

17 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
18 will the --

19 SENATOR RIVERA: Unless it's a
20 golden one, Madam President, in which case -- and
21 I don't think the bill includes that.

22 Sorry, go ahead.

23 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
24 will the sponsor continue to yield?

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you

1 continue to yield?

2 SENATOR RIVERA: Yup.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
4 Senator yields.

5 SENATOR BORRELLO: So it's the
6 manufacturer that's required to put this on. It
7 doesn't seem clear in the language that it's the
8 sole responsibility of the manufacturer.

9 Because at the end of the day, if we
10 want the consumer, the person that's buying the
11 stove that's going to install it, to understand
12 the danger of buying a gas stove, then shouldn't
13 that -- we have to make sure that the wholesaler
14 keeps that label on, doesn't take it off, that
15 the retailer keeps that label on, doesn't take it
16 off.

17 Wouldn't that be a liability for all
18 of them, and a potential fine? How is the
19 manufacturer going to know if the label ends up
20 at the final destination of the retail floor?

21 (Pause.)

22 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,
23 Mr. President. There were a few -- there were a
24 few parts to that question. Let's break it down.
25 If my colleague could give me the first part of

1 the question, I wanted to make sure that I could
2 answer the correct one.

3 If I'm not mistaken, the first part
4 of the question had to do with the -- with who
5 was supposed to put the warning label on the
6 thing?

7 SENATOR BORRELLO: Who is
8 responsible -- Madam President, through you, a
9 clarification. Who is responsible for that
10 warning label to make sure that it is affixed to
11 the end -- when it ends up in the hands of the
12 consumer? In other words, who will pay the fine?

13 (Pause.)

14 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,
15 Madam President. It will be the responsibility
16 of the manufacturer.

17 And certainly much like those pesky
18 stickers on mattresses -- remember those? -- the
19 manufacturer makes sure that they are -- in the
20 factory, that they are affixed to it. And then
21 the person who sells it does not yank it off.

22 The consumer can do whatever they
23 want with it. But the responsibility to affix it
24 and to make sure that it's on both the product
25 itself and the box or, you know, whatever it

1 comes in, is the manufacturer.

2 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
3 will the sponsor continue to yield?

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
5 continue to yield?

6 SENATOR RIVERA: Yes.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
8 sponsor yields.

9 SENATOR BORRELLO: Okay. So it's
10 the manufacturer's responsibility. So is it --
11 but at the end of the day, it's -- the goal is to
12 warn of the hazards of a natural gas stove to the
13 final consumer.

14 What happens if that label somehow
15 disappears, accidentally or on purpose? Because
16 it goes from the manufacturer to a distribution
17 warehouse to a wholesaler to a retailer and then
18 finally to the consumer. Somewhere along the way
19 in that supply chain, and in the transition, the
20 transportation, that label could come off.

21 At the end of the day I don't think
22 we're sending, you know, our version of the
23 mattress police, the gas stove police, to the
24 manufacturing facility, you know, in China or
25 wherever it might be.

1 They're going to find out whether or
2 not this label is affixed at the store.

3 So how are we going to make the
4 manufacturer responsible for the label that our
5 mattress police, slash, gas stove police are
6 going to -- they obviously have to find it in the
7 retail location, right? So how are they going to
8 be responsible for that?

9 SENATOR RIVERA: Madam President,
10 through you. Most products -- I'm not sure what
11 my colleague purchases, but most products that I
12 purchase come enclosed somewhere. They come in
13 boxes which are sealed from the factory.

14 And so, since the bill requires that
15 the manufacturers are the ones who actually put
16 the thing in the box, put it in the box all the
17 way over wherever they produce it. It is
18 unlikely in most cases, now, Madam President --
19 it may be different in other places, but I know
20 that when I go to a store, certainly when I'm
21 looking, let's say, at a refrigerator, and I'm
22 looking at a refrigerator, they're not going to
23 sell me -- unless in very specific circumstances
24 they might sell me the one that's right there.

25 But more than likely they're going

1 to sell me something that's in a box, that's
2 self-contained. So the thing is sealed in there.

3 Since this -- and as far as the box
4 is concerned, well, the box doesn't even have to
5 have a sticker. It could have words that can be
6 printed right onto the box; therefore, it's much
7 less likely that they'll fall off.

8 It seems that my colleague is
9 looking for some obscure thing -- again, that
10 we're trying to do something which is more than
11 what the bill intends to do. Which is, again, to
12 inform people about the potential dangers.
13 Because it is true, it is not non-factual, it is
14 factual that studies have for decades documented
15 the health hazards that are involved,
16 potentially, in a gas stove.

17 Which by the way, Madam President,
18 as I said, I have one, and I have no intention of
19 changing it. I like to cook on my gas stove.
20 And guess what? If this bill passes and is
21 signed into law, it will do absolutely nothing to
22 change that.

23 And when that gas stove -- which is
24 a newer one, so hopefully it will last for a long
25 time. But when it goes away, I probably will get

1 another gas stove. And this one, egads,
2 hopefully will have a little sticker on it that
3 I'll remove as soon as I begin -- before I begin
4 cooking, that will document for anybody who
5 purchases it, that there is a potential danger,
6 that there's health-harming pollutants like
7 carbon monoxide, nitrogen dioxide, formaldehyde,
8 and benzene that could come from me cooking on
9 that.

10 Now that I know that,
11 Madam President, I will take the thing off and
12 will make some fresh carbonara for you, for my
13 colleague, and for anybody else that wants it.

14 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
15 will the sponsor continue to yield?

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
17 continue to yield?

18 SENATOR RIVERA: I certainly will.

19 SENATOR BORRELLO: I am certain
20 your carbonara will be fantastic.

21 But that being said, we still
22 haven't really addressed how this is actually
23 going to work.

24 You just got done saying you could
25 print it on the box. But then again, you know,

1 if an appliance is delivered and installed by a
2 professional -- you know, my father did that as a
3 plumber, he installed appliances as well -- what
4 happens if the sticker's not there? How are
5 we -- we're not going to be able to warn these
6 people of the dangers of a gas stove if it was
7 taken out of the box that had the warning printed
8 on it, outside the sight of the consumer, and
9 installed.

10 So now how is that installer
11 responsible for warning them of the dangers of
12 gas stoves?

13 (Pause.)

14 SENATOR RIVERA: So,
15 Madam President, again, in the very unlikely
16 situation that there is -- the words that are
17 printed on the box are not there, or the thing
18 that is affixed, the sticker that is affixed to
19 the actual stove, if it should come off, there
20 is -- there is no -- there wasn't any funding
21 yesterday in the budget, nor will there ever be a
22 gas stove police function here in the State of
23 New York.

24 The bill allows for, in a situation
25 where somebody is alleging that there's a

1 violation, whomever they -- the -- for example,
2 the distribution, the distributor or the person
3 who sells it could be -- could have the
4 opportunity to be heard to be able to make the
5 case that they were not responsible for its
6 removal.

7 It just seems to me to be like an
8 overly complicated thing. It's a sticker. I'm
9 not done. It's a sticker, Madam President.
10 Or -- or words on the box, the both of those
11 things. It's a sticker.

12 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
13 will the sponsor continue to yield?

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
15 continue to yield?

16 SENATOR RIVERA: Yup.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
18 Senator yields.

19 SENATOR BORRELLO: But are we sure
20 it's a sticker? I mean, we don't really have
21 anything -- how is this going to work? Is it a
22 sticker, is it a label, is it something that's
23 going to hang off of one of the knobs that the
24 consumer should take off?

25 And then who's going to be enforcing

1 this rule? Who's going to be the ones going out
2 there, policing this and assessing fines and
3 going after the manufacturer?

4 So you've described a lot of
5 potential scenarios. What's the bill actually
6 say has to be done in order for this to be
7 compliant?

8 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,
9 Madam President. This bill is not -- not that my
10 colleague is suggesting this, but this bill is
11 not a way to just catch people in the act of
12 removing these labels or stickers or what have
13 you and then charging them a whole bunch of
14 money.

15 We're instead saying that if you're
16 a manufacturer, that you're making these
17 things -- which, again, scientific evidence
18 exists that you potentially could be harmed by
19 something that happens to it, like -- I also make
20 a mean pizza, Madam President, from scratch. I
21 do. And put it right in my oven over there.
22 Which is also a gas oven, Madam President.

23 So if we do that, if we have a
24 manufacturer who makes it and there is -- at some
25 point between it being manufactured and being

1 delivered to the consumer, the thing is off, it
2 is not like somebody is going to go, Aha, we
3 gotcha, there it is, now you owe us five grand or
4 whatever it is that the fine is. The warning,
5 I'm sorry. Warning, and then the fine. So
6 there's a warning first, Madam President.

7 There is no obscure situation here
8 that we're looking for. Ultimately what this
9 bill aims to do is to just provide information to
10 the consumer. That's it. There is no conspiracy
11 here. There's nothing that we're trying to see
12 if we can catch somebody in the act of doing
13 something inappropriate.

14 We're simply saying you as a
15 manufacturer, you're making a product which is a
16 good product, which makes some good steaks, but
17 you should just let folks know perhaps you should
18 open the window. You should just know that there
19 are side effects that might come from what you
20 cook here. There might be some health-harming
21 pollutants that are possible with you continuing
22 to cook on this.

23 So we just want you to be informed
24 of it. But after you're informed, purchase that,
25 purchase that bad boy, hook it up, make steaks

1 for everybody, and God bless America.

2 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
3 will the sponsor continue to yield?

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
5 continue to yield?

6 SENATOR RIVERA: Yup.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
8 Senator yields.

9 SENATOR BORRELLO: I guess I'm
10 still not understanding who is responsible within
11 New York State government for compliance. How
12 will they be doing this? Because at the end of
13 the day, most of these appliances are not
14 manufactured here anymore in the United States,
15 sadly.

16 And by the way, we have online
17 retailers that could deliver a stove to your
18 house in a box, and that wholesaler, that online
19 retailer, could be in another state, another
20 country.

21 Who is going to be responsible for
22 enforcing this, and how?

23 (Pause.)

24 SENATOR RIVERA: So,
25 Madam President, through you. So if we're going

1 to get to technicalities, it would be either the
2 Department of State or the Attorney General who
3 would be -- who would have potentially the
4 responsibility to do this.

5 But let's just be clear; we are not
6 asking for some sort of dragnet from either one
7 of those agencies to go and look to make sure
8 that if this becomes law that every single one of
9 them has it.

10 We're just saying to manufacturers,
11 consumers should be informed about the choices
12 that they're making. They can continue to make
13 the choice. Nobody's banning nothin'. We're
14 just saying you should know what you're putting
15 into your home, that simple.

16 There's sometimes, for example,
17 in -- and we know this in poor neighborhoods like
18 the ones that I live in, sometimes when the
19 heat's not working, people will open up their
20 ovens and they would leave them open, without
21 anything in it, just to warm the house. And we
22 warn people not to do that because of the CO2
23 that they're putting into their apartment
24 building. And by locking the doors and
25 everything to try to make it hot, it could

1 actually make them poisoned -- it might poison
2 them because of what they're doing to keep their
3 house warm.

4 So this is the type of thing that
5 can happen with any type of appliance. And all
6 that we're saying is that people should be
7 informed about it, that people should have the
8 information. They're still going to make the
9 choice. They will. I know I will.

10 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
11 will the sponsor continue to yield?

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
13 continue to yield?

14 SENATOR RIVERA: Yup.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
16 Senator yields.

17 SENATOR BORRELLO: So I guess the
18 answer you gave to my original question was it's
19 going to be either the Department of State or the
20 Attorney General's office.

21 So they are going to have to create
22 like a gas stove division? Otherwise, how is
23 this going to be enforced? I don't understand
24 it.

25 SENATOR RIVERA: Madam President,

1 through you, no.

2 If somebody says to the Department
3 of State or to the Attorney General, Hey, we
4 believe that there is this vast conspiracy to
5 remove these stickers from these foreign hordes
6 of appliances that are coming into our country,
7 then I guess they'll investigate and they'll
8 be -- they'll do what they need to do in that
9 regard.

10 Ultimately this is not -- these are
11 the agencies that will be responsible for
12 potentially enforcing this. But this is not
13 something that we're looking to create some sort
14 of gotcha situation. It is simply, once again --
15 through you, Madam President -- just to provide
16 information to the consumer about what they're
17 putting into their homes. Which they can still
18 continue to choose to do.

19 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
20 will the sponsor continue to yield?

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
22 continue to yield?

23 SENATOR RIVERA: Yeah.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
25 Senator yields.

1 SENATOR BORRELLO: Okay, so I think
2 you mentioned "vast conspiracy," but I don't
3 think that's going to be the case. I think
4 someone's going to buy a gas stove, maybe
5 somebody goes to a store who doesn't like gas
6 stoves, and checking all the stoves to see if
7 there's a sticker on it, and then they're going
8 to call the Attorney General's office, allegedly,
9 or the Department of State, and say, I saw a gas
10 stove or I bought a gas stove without the warning
11 label, what are you going to do about it?

12 What happens when that gets
13 triggered? What going to happen next?

14 SENATOR RIVERA: Well, through you,
15 Madam President, first of all, whomever's on the
16 other side of the phone will probably roll their
17 eyes a little bit. And after they get through
18 that, they'll say, All right, tell me about the
19 situation that you're trying to describe.

20 And then they might investigate it,
21 and they find that there's evidence of it, then
22 they'll go to the law and the law would say that
23 they would potentially receive a warning and that
24 eventually, if that warning is not heeded -- in
25 other words, if there's other instances of the

1 same thing being found -- then the manufacturer
2 would be held responsible for just -- for not
3 having -- for not having them.

4 Oh, \$250, I'm sorry. Two hundred
5 and fifty bucks. I'm not sure if Whirlpool can
6 actually manage the \$250, Madam President,
7 but that's how it potentially would happen.

8 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
9 will the sponsor continue to yield?

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
11 continue to yield?

12 SENATOR RIVERA: Yup.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
14 Senator yields.

15 SENATOR BORRELLO: So what if it's
16 a used stove that you bought, the stove had the
17 label, and now you're turning around and you're
18 selling the stove without the label. Is that
19 person selling the stove now responsible for that
20 \$250 fine without a label on it?

21 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,
22 Madam President, the shortest answer I will give
23 today. No.

24 SENATOR BORRELLO: Glad to hear it.
25 All right. Madam President, on the

1 bill.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
3 Borrello on the bill.

4 SENATOR BORRELLO: And I know we
5 have others that want to ask questions here.

6 Look, folks, this is silly. We all
7 know this is silly. And the true evidence is
8 that there's no infrastructure here. There's no
9 plan. I couldn't get answers to something as
10 simple as who's really responsible for this.

11 The manufacturer, okay, great. So
12 Whirlpool, whoever it might be -- you know, some
13 Italian or Japanese or Chinese or Korean, we're
14 going to go after them, we're going to send, you
15 know, a group to go exact a \$250 fine from
16 somebody in another country?

17 I don't understand how this is going
18 to work, because I don't think it's actually
19 going to work. And we've passed this bill
20 before. It's just ridiculous to think that this
21 is actually going to do anything other than make
22 some people feel good that we're allegedly
23 warning people about a device that has been
24 around for, I don't know, 70 years now, that now
25 we're going to let them know that maybe you

1 shouldn't buy one because it might cause a
2 problem.

3 So this is just a feel-good,
4 do-nothing bill that in the end isn't going to
5 warn anybody about anything they probably don't
6 already know. But most importantly, it's going
7 to create, I think, a potential for this to go to
8 the next level, where they're going to start
9 fining people -- you know, retail stores.

10 It's very easy to buy something
11 online and have it delivered to your house, have
12 it installed. But you know what? Our
13 brick-and-mortar retailers, they're the ones that
14 are paying property taxes and employing people.
15 They're the ones that keep our small communities
16 alive and actually having, you know, economic
17 activity, and this problem is going to be a
18 burden on them at some point. Because I don't
19 think we really know who it's going to.

20 We even read through this bill, and
21 it appears that we don't know who's actually
22 supposed to pay this fine. It makes the most
23 sense that at the final point of sale, the retail
24 location, they're the ones who are going to be
25 held responsible for this. That's really what's

1 going to happen.

2 Because if I was the manufacturer, I
3 would just simply say, Hey, that sticker was on
4 there when it left our facility. I don't know
5 why it's not on at the retail level. Because
6 that's the only place you're going to be able to
7 go and see whether or not there's a sticker on
8 there.

9 And we don't know if it's a sticker.
10 We don't know if it's printing on a box. We
11 don't know if it's some kind of like, you know,
12 whatever, hermetically sealed -- if you broke
13 this seal, don't buy this stove, because it might
14 not have the warning label on it.

15 It's just absolutely ridiculous.
16 But unfortunately, all too often, all too common,
17 the things that come out of Albany are pretty
18 ridiculous to the average commonsense person.

19 So I'll be voting no, like we did
20 last time on this. But I would certainly love to
21 see some real, genuine answers to this. I don't
22 know, it's just a sticker -- if you knew the
23 amount of burdens that we put on businesses in
24 this state that pile up one after another after
25 another, it's death by a thousand cuts. And this

1 is another one.

2 So I'll be voting no. Thank you.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
4 Murray, why do you rise?

5 SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you,
6 Madam President. Would the sponsor yield for a
7 few questions?

8 SENATOR RIVERA: Sure.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
10 Rivera yields.

11 SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you,
12 Madam President. Through you.

13 So a similar bill was put in place,
14 I believe -- or passed by the legislature out in
15 California. But the governor, Gavin Newsom,
16 vetoed that legislation. Are you familiar with
17 that? Do you know why he vetoed it?

18 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,
19 Madam President. This was in California? I'm
20 not Newsom, so no.

21 SENATOR MURRAY: Through you,
22 Madam President, will the sponsor continue to
23 yield?

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
25 continue to yield?

1 SENATOR RIVERA: Yup.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
3 Senator yields.

4 SENATOR MURRAY: So let me move on
5 to the reason for targeting gas stoves. So the
6 World Health Organization funded a 2024 study
7 that found that compared with electric stoves,
8 using electricity as opposed to using gas for
9 cooking or heating, it did not result in any
10 higher risk estimate for asthma in children or in
11 adults. So --

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Can I just
13 clarify? Are you asking a question?

14 SENATOR MURRAY: No, I'm asking a
15 question.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Yes, a
17 question is being asked. Thank you.

18 SENATOR MURRAY: Based on that, why
19 are we not requiring all stoves, not just gas but
20 electric as well, to have this warning label if,
21 according to the World Health Organization, it's
22 equally at risk?

23 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,
24 Madam President. First of all, that study did
25 identify -- although I'm not familiar with it,

1 this is why you surround yourself with smarter
2 people than yourself. And in this case some of
3 these smart folks here have -- are familiar with
4 that study. And in it, it does identify a lower
5 risk for electrical stoves.

6 But I certainly welcome my
7 colleague's introduction of a bill to do just
8 that for electric stoves as well.

9 SENATOR MURRAY: Madam President,
10 would the sponsor continue to yield.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
12 continue to yield?

13 SENATOR RIVERA: Yup.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
15 Senator yields.

16 SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you.
17 Through you, Madam President.

18 Well, the Lawrence Berkeley National
19 Laboratory found that to eliminate risk, whether
20 it be an electric or gas stove, the best way to
21 do that would be through ventilation, just using
22 the fan, the vent to do it, to remove basically
23 all of the risk.

24 So why wouldn't we just educate the
25 public on ventilating?

1 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,
2 Madam President. Funny that my colleague should
3 ask, because -- since, as the bill is written,
4 the actual wording on it, part of it is certainly
5 in the bill, but there could actually be a
6 determination made by the Department of State
7 when the actual label requirements are being
8 created that could add that language as well.

9 So we could actually say to people,
10 Hey, if you're going to, as I said earlier,
11 continue to cook on a gas stove, then you should
12 make sure that you open up that window, if you
13 can, because that will make it a little bit less
14 likely that you will have some of the concerns
15 that exist with this type of stove.

16 SENATOR MURRAY: Madam President,
17 will the sponsor continue to yield?

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
19 continue to yield?

20 SENATOR RIVERA: Yup.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
22 sponsor yields.

23 SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you.

24 Through you, Madam President. So
25 I'm glad we agree on the ventilation aspect.

1 So it goes back to begging the
2 question, then, why are we not requiring it for
3 all stoves? The risk is virtually the same,
4 according to most of the studies. So why aren't
5 we requiring it on every stove?

6 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,
7 Madam President. Well, the bill is not mine. It
8 is through our great and phenomenal colleague who
9 I hope is watching. I'm not sure if it's this
10 one or that one. Liz, wherever you at, love ya!

11 So our colleague chose to introduce
12 the bill related to gas stoves, but we certainly
13 could in the future look at expanding it also to
14 electrical stoves. Because ultimately,
15 Madam President, as I made clear earlier, this is
16 not about stopping anybody from doing anything.
17 This is just about making sure that people have
18 information, that as consumers they're better
19 educated. And certainly ventilation is one of
20 them.

21 But even when that is not the case,
22 even when there is ventilation, there is still a
23 risk, so people should just know it. And, like
24 myself, keep on cooking that steak on that gas
25 stove.

1 SENATOR MURRAY: Madam President,
2 will the sponsor continue to yield?

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
4 continue to yield?

5 SENATOR RIVERA: Yup.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
7 Senator yields.

8 SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you.
9 Through you, Madam President.

10 So why not gas dryers? There are
11 many, many gas dryers where we dry our clothing.
12 And usually they're in an enclosed laundry room
13 or something that doesn't really have great
14 ventilation. So are we requiring labels on those
15 as well?

16 (Pause.)

17 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,
18 Madam President, a couple of things.

19 Number one, it is not open
20 combustion, so it is a different type of thing.

21 But second, I believe -- he's not in
22 the room, but Senator Kavanaugh has a bill related
23 to those types of dryers, so you should ask --
24 our colleague should ask Senator Kavanaugh.

25 SENATOR MURRAY: Madam President,

1 would the sponsor continue to yield.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
3 continue to yield?

4 SENATOR RIVERA: Yup.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
6 Senator yields.

7 SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you.

8 Through you, Madam President. How
9 about vacuum cleaners? We're worried about
10 breathing and asthma and problems like that. A
11 little known fact, I used to sell vacuum
12 cleaners, believe it or not, going door to door.

13 I went to sell the vacuum cleaners
14 and during my demonstration, I used to show every
15 time you turn on that vacuum cleaner, the dust
16 and everything that emits out of those bags, it
17 would make you gag.

18 I will guarantee you, it's a lot
19 more than anything emitting from a gas stove or
20 dryer or electric -- why not warning labels on
21 vacuum cleaners?

22 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,
23 Mr. President. My colleague is going to continue
24 going down the list of things --

25 SENATOR MURRAY: Mm-hmm.

1 SENATOR RIVERA: -- that we might
2 need to put a warning on. And I would say very
3 likely, if there is a danger in those things,
4 then we should put a warning on them.

5 Because again, a warning label,
6 which is a piece of plastic or a piece of --
7 even, in some cases, not even a piece of plastic,
8 because as I stated earlier, it could be written
9 on the box. In this case it has to be on the box
10 and in an actual sticker.

11 But say that my colleague introduces
12 something related to safety -- you know,
13 precautions that are to be not on a sticker
14 but -- not even on a sticker, but on the box.
15 Great, they're on the box. So they're in the
16 instruction booklet or whatever.

17 It is not meant to do anything but
18 inform the consumer about what they're getting
19 themselves into. And it is in the interest of
20 the consumer to have -- it should be in the
21 interest of us, who care about our constituents,
22 to have them have the most information possible.

23 It doesn't stop them from doing
24 anything. This will not stop anybody from buying
25 a gas stove. I don't know what my colleagues are

1 having a conniption fit about. I really don't.

2 So, again, they can be a warning
3 label just to inform consumers about whether
4 there's a danger to this, a danger -- I don't
5 know that much about, you know, vacuum cleaners
6 myself, but if my colleague, as a former purveyor
7 of such accoutrement, knows about the dangers of
8 them, then they should put a bill together to put
9 a warning on them so that folks have the
10 information increase to make better choices about
11 what they purchase.

12 SENATOR MURRAY: Madam President,
13 would the sponsor continue to yield.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
15 continue to yield?

16 SENATOR RIVERA: Yup.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
18 Senator yields.

19 SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you.

20 Through you, Madam President. Are
21 you familiar with the process for manufacturing a
22 gas stove?

23 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,
24 Madam President, I am not.

25 SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you.

1 Madam President, on the bill.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
3 Murray on the bill.

4 SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you.

5 And thank you, Senator Rivera.

6 So through this conversation with
7 myself and Senator Borrello, we've heard the
8 sponsor say how simple it is, it's so -- it's
9 just a sticker. Yet he doesn't know the process
10 for manufacturing stoves. I'm guessing he
11 doesn't know the process for distributing large
12 appliances as well.

13 See, we live in a tri-state area, so
14 when we do things like this and we require a
15 specific thing for a product, whereas other
16 states in the tri-state do not, it makes
17 distribution extremely difficult.

18 So it's not simple. It's not just a
19 label. The label doesn't magically jump onto the
20 product or onto the box either. There is cost
21 involved in putting it together and in getting
22 into the assembly line and putting a process in
23 place, usually with machinery. So again, not as
24 simple as it seems.

25 I always find that the people that

1 don't know are the ones that tell everyone else
2 how simple it is. So it isn't simple. But the
3 problem is this. And the reason I was going down
4 the line of different products is because we can
5 do this all day, and unfortunately New York does.
6 There's a reason we have the nickname of the
7 nanny state. It's because this is what we do.

8 You know, 62 percent of the
9 households in New York have gas stoves. They've
10 been around for years and years and years and
11 years. If we're really worried about the health,
12 then let's target some of the things, like the
13 vacuum cleaners, like electric stoves, gas
14 dryers. I could go on and on and on.

15 I could, but I'm afraid because, if
16 I do, we'll have a litany of bills that again
17 will, as my colleague put it, basically make
18 these small businesses or the big businesses die
19 a death of a thousand cuts, because there will be
20 bill after bill requiring all of these
21 nanny-state things.

22 You know, it's funny, we talk about
23 when we pick up a product -- you know, you'll
24 pick up a hemorrhoid product and it has a warning
25 that it's not to be taken orally. And people

1 laugh and say, Why would you even think that?
2 Well, because somebody made a bill requiring them
3 to do it.

4 Now, you keep saying it's real
5 simple and everything, and yet there's a warning
6 the first time, then a civil penalty of \$250 and
7 subject to a penalty of up to a thousand dollars.
8 We'll have the Department of State involved,
9 we'll have the Attorney General involved -- I'm
10 telling you, it doesn't sound simple to me. It
11 sounds like quite a process.

12 So for that reason, Madam President,
13 I think we need to just take a step back and --
14 you know, we're all adults. We understand, when
15 we're buying something, maybe do a little
16 research -- is it dangerous, is it not.

17 But for the 62 percent of households
18 in New York that have gas stoves, I haven't
19 quaked in my boots. I have one, so I feel pretty
20 safe.

21 So I'll be voting no. Thank you.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Are there
23 any other Senators wishing to be heard?

24 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
25 closed. The Secretary will ring the bell.

1 Read the last section.

2 THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This
3 act shall take effect one year after it shall
4 have become a law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
6 roll.

7 (The Secretary called the roll.)

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
9 Rivera to explain his vote.

10 SENATOR RIVERA: Thank you,
11 Madam President.

12 So it is true, Madam President, and
13 for my colleagues, it is true that maybe I was a
14 little flippant as it relates to the simplicity
15 of this.

16 But I would think that the idea that
17 basically every product that you get already has
18 things that are attached to it, already has words
19 that are printed on it, already has stickers that
20 we require on there because of all sorts of
21 issues that have occurred in the past where
22 private companies, for the sake of pursuing their
23 own benefit and their own -- as they do, to
24 pursue their own benefit and to pursue the most,
25 you know, bang for their buck, they would cut

1 corners if it wasn't for the fact that
2 government, whether it's the State of New York or
3 the federal government, actually curtails some of
4 the worst actions of the private sector and the
5 worst actions of private companies that just want
6 to make a buck.

7 It means that there's a whole slew
8 of safety standards that would not exist -- that
9 is a fact. That is a reality. So it is true, it
10 would add a step or two.

11 Now, I would say to a company that
12 is selling, you know, Whirlpool or whatever other
13 company is selling, they're probably selling
14 certainly all over the world and all over the
15 country. New York is probably a big market. So
16 there probably would be a way for them to say
17 like if we're going to sell a hell of a lot of,
18 you know, stoves or what have you, that we could
19 probably, as they already probably do, have a
20 process that's strictly for those so that they
21 can add something that might not be necessary in
22 other states or might not be necessary in other
23 countries.

24 These are things that I think can
25 certainly be achieved. And ultimately, this is

1 the thing. This is -- as we have said in the
2 past, there's scientific studies that for decades
3 have established that there's health hazards in
4 gas stoves that can release harming pollutants
5 like carbon monoxide, nitrogen dioxide,
6 formaldehyde, benzene, et cetera. And still it
7 makes a hell of a steak.

8 And still, and saying it as somebody
9 who has a gas stove at home -- and I will not get
10 an induction one, even if that one breaks,
11 because it's a better cook for me. So I'm going
12 to continue to do that, whether this is the law
13 or not.

14 And I would urge my colleagues to do
15 the same thing, to keep getting it. No problem
16 whatsoever. But ultimately this, as in many
17 other pieces of legislation that we have approved
18 in the State of New York and we will consider in
19 the future, have to do with informing people so
20 that just a consumer is prepared, they know what
21 is good, what is bad, and they make the best
22 choice possible for themselves and their
23 families.

24 So yes, I will cook up some steak, I
25 will cook up some carbonara, and I will continue

1 to do it in a gas stove and hopefully, if mine
2 ever breaks, one that will have a sticker on it
3 that says, Hey, just so you know the risks
4 involved. And I'll say I know the risks
5 involved, rip, let's cook up some carbonara, why
6 don't we.

7 I will vote in the affirmative.

8 Thank you, Madam President.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
10 Rivera to be recorded in the affirmative.

11 Senator May to explain her vote.

12 SENATOR MAY: Thank you,
13 Madam President.

14 I want to say, as Consumer
15 Protection chair, I want to reassure my
16 colleagues on the other side of the aisle, we
17 know how to do labels in New York State.

18 If you buy packaged food that you
19 want to cook on your gas stove, that package has
20 to be labeled with the ingredients and the
21 sell-by date of that food. If you buy a vacuum
22 cleaner that claims to meet the HEPA standards,
23 which stands for high efficiency particulate air
24 standards, it has to be labeled that it does
25 that.

1 So we know how to do this. It's not
2 that hard. You generally only buy one stove
3 in -- for your home at, you know, over many, many
4 years. So one label isn't a huge deal.

5 I do want to say, though, we are
6 joined here by firefighter and actor and
7 all-round Renaissance man Tim Guinee. Tim came
8 to my home last winter and he measured the
9 nitrogen dioxide emissions from my stove. After
10 10 minutes of the stove being on in my kitchen,
11 the emissions had gone up by 13 times the
12 baseline. And they reached two and-a-half times
13 the -- what was the safe limit set by the EPA for
14 short-term exposure.

15 Nitrogen dioxide is associated with
16 13 percent of all childhood asthma cases in this
17 country, as well as cardiovascular problems in
18 adults, older people, and increased mortality
19 from diabetes.

20 Tim did not measure benzene, carbon
21 monoxide, formaldehyde or particulate matter. If
22 he had, I might have been alarmed even more.

23 But I will say that electric stoves
24 do not emit benzene, carbon monoxide, nitrogen
25 dioxide or formaldehyde. And so labeling them

1 for these things wouldn't make any sense at all.

2 Many people enjoy cooking with
3 gas --

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator,
5 how do you vote?

6 SENATOR MAY: I was trying to speak
7 on the bill before, and Senator Gianaris said I
8 could have a little bit of extra time.

9 Sorry. I'm almost done.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Okay.

11 SENATOR MAY: Many people,
12 including me, enjoy cooking with gas, but we
13 should have full disclosure of the risks,
14 especially with the health of children in the
15 household or elderly folks.

16 This is a minor requirement, and I
17 want to thank Senator Rivera for his spirited
18 defense of just putting stickers on a gas stove.
19 It makes eminent sense. It could save lives.

20 I vote aye.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
22 May to be recorded in the affirmative.

23 Announce the results. No, hold on
24 one sec.

25 Senator Weik to explain her vote.

1 SENATOR WEIK: Thank you,
2 Madam President.

3 I recently bought a thing of
4 beauty -- it's an eight-burner, two-oven gas
5 unit. And I'm a terrible cook, so of course it's
6 got the vent above it because I set everything on
7 fire.

8 So when I bought this thing, of
9 course it's difficult to use, it comes with an
10 instruction booklet. So in the instruction
11 booklet the warning you're talking about is
12 already in that instruction booklet.

13 I also have the misfortune of having
14 another place that I visit where I cook. It's
15 got an electric stove that I had to replace.
16 Brand new electric stove, the only good part of
17 it is it also acts as an air fryer.

18 Again, in that booklet it tells you
19 all of the warnings of using an electric unit,
20 just like when you buy a hair dryer or a curling
21 iron. It basically says don't stand in a full
22 bathtub when you operate this item. Not a joke,
23 it's serious.

24 But yes, we have to put these
25 things -- it's already in the instruction

1 booklet. I hope you take a look at the
2 instruction booklet, because this is a
3 duplicative requirement. It's kind of an
4 anti-business thing that we're asking of --
5 again, these warnings are already in the
6 instruction booklet for these units.

7 And for that reason I'll be voting
8 no.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
10 Weik to be recorded in the negative.

11 Senator Murray to explain his vote.

12 SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you,
13 Madam President.

14 First, let me say thank God
15 Senator Rivera is okay. You've cooked a lot of
16 steaks on that dangerous, dangerous gas stove
17 without any warning, but you managed to survive.
18 So thank God you're with us.

19 With that said, I'll also say this.
20 Listen, we sit here and we hear how simple
21 everything is, and then the suggestions by the
22 Senator on how to distribute these products. It
23 isn't that simple.

24 When you're distributing, especially
25 to a large market like New York, it's not just

1 the New York market, it is the tri-state market.
2 When they bring these things in, they usually go
3 to a distribution center, which now the liability
4 is out of the hands of the manufacturer, it's now
5 to the distribution center.

6 If they happen to bring a stove --
7 that was supposed to go to Jersey -- by mistake
8 on their route to New York, they're now -- the
9 manufacturer is now going to be subjected to
10 possible fines.

11 What I'm saying here is it's not as
12 simple as everyone likes to make it sound. It is
13 a process, and once again a process we're
14 imposing on businesses over and over and over
15 again. And we wonder why these businesses are
16 leaving the state. This is why. This is why.
17 Because we are such a nanny state.

18 With that said, I know my time is
19 almost up. I'll also say Tim is a great guy. I
20 know he means well, and I appreciate all of his
21 hard work.

22 With that said, I'm still a no.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
24 Murray to be recorded in the negative.

25 Announce the results.

1 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
2 Calendar 874, voting in the negative are
3 Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan,
4 Gallivan, Griffio, Helming, Lanza, Martins,
5 Mattera, Murray, Ortt, Rhoads, Rolison, Ryan,
6 Scarcella-Spanton, Skoufis, Stec, Tedisco,
7 Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

8 Ayes, 38. Nays, 21.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
10 is passed.

11 Senator Gianaris.

12 SENATOR GIANARIS: Okay, let's move
13 on to Calendar 1072, please.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
15 Secretary will read.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 1072, Senate Print 9273, by Senator Krueger, an
18 act to amend the Alcoholic Beverage Control Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
20 Martins, why do you rise?

21 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,
22 Madam President. I was hoping that the sponsor
23 would yield for a few questions.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the
25 sponsor yield?

1 SENATOR SKOUFIS: I'm not the
2 sponsor, but on behalf of the sponsor, I'm
3 delighted to yield.

4 SENATOR MARTINS: Filling in
5 today --

6 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
8 surrogate yields.

9 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you.

10 Madam President, through you.
11 Senator, are you familiar with the "tied-house"
12 laws in New York State?

13 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
14 Madam President, yes.

15 SENATOR MARTINS: Madam President,
16 through you, if the sponsor would continue to
17 yield.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the
19 Senator yield?

20 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
22 Senator yields.

23 SENATOR MARTINS: So as I
24 understand it, it's to prevent different layers
25 or tiers from having undue influence with each

1 other -- in this case, manufacturers, wholesalers
2 and retailers, to keep them separate.

3 In this particular case we're being
4 asked to pass a law specific to a location, and
5 there isn't the necessary detail in the bill or
6 in the memo to express why we should be doing
7 that.

8 And I was hoping you'd be able to
9 give us some details with regard to this
10 location, the level of interaction between these
11 tiers, so that we could have an informed vote.

12 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
13 Madam President, I appreciate the question and
14 I'll do my best to provide those details you're
15 looking for.

16 Basically, the specific property and
17 company that we are looking to provide an
18 exemption to here in this bill is Christie's
19 Auction House at 20 Rockefeller Plaza, which I
20 assume is in Senator Krueger's district.

21 They actually have a tied-house
22 exemption that as part of this bill we are
23 repealing and replacing with a different
24 tied-house exemption. And the purpose of this
25 exemption is to allow for this auction house to

1 sell wines.

2 And the reason why this is needed is
3 because some of the ownership of Christie's
4 Auction House has partial ownership in vineyards
5 I believe overseas.

6 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,
7 Madam President. Thank you, Senator. I
8 appreciate it.

9 On the bill.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
11 Martins on the bill.

12 SENATOR MARTINS: So I -- again,
13 I'm not opposed to this. I just find it
14 important that when we do receive a bill and we
15 are making an exception -- and for those who
16 aren't aware, in state law there is no
17 discretion. The SLA can't grant exemptions. The
18 only way that they can get it is to come here.

19 So it's important that we ask the
20 questions. What is the level of interference,
21 what is the level of I guess co-mixing between
22 the different tiers to make sure that there isn't
23 going to be undue influence and we're not just
24 agreeing to something without, quite frankly,
25 understanding what it is we're being asked to do.

1 In this case, as I understand it,
2 there is a large international entity. Part of
3 its ownership may own some portions of a vineyard
4 overseas, and as a result that would trigger the
5 tied laws here in New York State, not allowing
6 them to have an interest in a retail sales of
7 alcohol, wine, and the like.

8 So understanding this more
9 completely, Madam President, I'll be voting aye.

10 Thank you, Senator Skoufis.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank
12 you, Senator.

13 Are there any other Senators wishing
14 to be heard?

15 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
16 closed. Read the last section.

17 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
18 act shall take effect immediately.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the
20 roll.

21 (The Secretary called the roll.)

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce
23 the results.

24 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
25 Calendar Number 1072, voting in the negative:

1 Senator Martinez.

2 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill
4 is passed.

5 Senator Gianaris.

6 SENATOR GIANARIS: Next up,
7 Calendar 1132, please.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
9 Secretary will read.

10 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
11 1132, Senate Print 9839, by Senator Baskin, an
12 act to amend the Local Finance Law.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
14 Martins, why do you rise?

15 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,
16 Madam President. If the sponsor would yield for
17 a few questions.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the
19 sponsor yield?

20 SENATOR BASKIN: Yes,
21 Madam President, I yield.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
23 sponsor yields.

24 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,
25 Senator.

1 In the budget that was voted on
2 yesterday, there was an amount that was included
3 in appropriations, that was included specifically
4 for the City of Buffalo. Do you recall how much
5 that was?

6 SENATOR BASKIN: I believe it was
7 25 million.

8 (Pause.)

9 SENATOR BASKIN: But 55 million in
10 additional funding. Through you,
11 Madam President, 55 million in additional
12 funding.

13 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you.

14 Madam President, through you, if the
15 sponsor would continue to yield.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the
17 sponsor yield?

18 SENATOR BASKIN: Yes, I yield.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
20 sponsor yields.

21 SENATOR MARTINS: And, Senator, are
22 you familiar with the Buffalo Fiscal Stability
23 Authority?

24 SENATOR BASKIN: Through you,
25 Madam President, yes, I am.

1 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you.

2 Through you, Madam President, if the
3 sponsor would continue to yield.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the
5 sponsor yield?

6 SENATOR BASKIN: Yes.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
8 sponsor yields.

9 SENATOR MARTINS: So can you tell
10 us, what's the makeup of the fiscal authority?
11 How long has it been in place? How are those
12 appointments made, if you know? Just some
13 background on this particular fiscal authority.

14 SENATOR BASKIN: Through you,
15 Madam President. The Buffalo Fiscal Stability
16 Board has been enacted for decades. It's made up
17 of a variety of members that are appointed
18 through recommendations to the Governor's office
19 in the City of Buffalo. And their primary
20 purpose is to have oversight of the city's
21 finances, mostly in the event of a fiscal crisis.

22 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you.

23 Madam President, if the sponsor
24 would continue to yield.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the

1 sponsor yield?

2 SENATOR BASKIN: Yes, I yield,
3 Madam President.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
5 sponsor yields.

6 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you.

7 In dealing with the Buffalo Fiscal
8 Stability Authority, there are times when it is
9 under a control period, and there are times when
10 it is dormant. Right now, can you tell us
11 whether the authority is under a control period
12 or whether it is in fact dormant?

13 SENATOR BASKIN: Through you,
14 Madam President. Currently the Buffalo Fiscal
15 Stability Board members are not a -- what we call
16 a hard board, where they are making complete
17 decisions about the city's finances at this time.

18 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you.

19 Madam President, through you, if the
20 sponsor would continue to yield.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
22 sponsor yield?

23 SENATOR BASKIN: Yes,
24 Madam President.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The

1 sponsor yields.

2 SENATOR MARTINS: So as I
3 understand it, there are a couple of instances in
4 which the board would go into a control period
5 and become active and take over the finances of
6 the city, I guess when they are in financial
7 distress or something of the like.

8 Are you familiar with what the
9 triggers are that would require the control board
10 to take control of the city's finances?

11 (Pause.)

12 SENATOR BASKIN: Through you,
13 Madam President. In order for the Fiscal
14 Stability Board to be completely in control, the
15 city has to carry and be in a deficit.

16 At this time, the city may have a
17 projected deficit, but they do not have a current
18 deficit. The City of Buffalo's budget is
19 balanced at the moment, which would explain why
20 the Fiscal Stability Board is not currently
21 enacted.

22 SENATOR MARTINS: Through you,
23 Madam President, if the sponsor would continue to
24 yield.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the

1 sponsor yield?

2 SENATOR BASKIN: Yes,
3 Madam President.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
5 sponsor yields.

6 SENATOR MARTINS: So as I
7 understand it, the control period can be declared
8 if the city is projected, projected, to incur a
9 substantial operating funds deficit and other
10 things as well.

11 Given the fact that yesterday the
12 budget included, you know, 50 million-plus for
13 the City of Buffalo for just that reason, do
14 you -- are you saying that the control board has
15 not declared a control period for the City of
16 Buffalo?

17 SENATOR BASKIN: Currently the --
18 through you, Madam President, currently the
19 City of Buffalo's budget is balanced.

20 SENATOR MARTINS: Okay.
21 Madam President, through you, if the sponsor
22 would continue to yield.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
24 sponsor yield?

25 SENATOR BASKIN: Yes.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
2 sponsor yields.

3 SENATOR MARTINS: So the city's
4 budget is balanced, but we just shelled out
5 \$50 million to help them.

6 How about -- how many people sit on
7 the Buffalo Fiscal Stability Authority?

8 SENATOR BASKIN: Through you,
9 Madam President, the board is made up of nine
10 members.

11 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you.

12 Madam President, through you, if the
13 sponsor would continue to yield.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
15 sponsor yield?

16 SENATOR BASKIN: Yes,
17 Madam President, I yield.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
19 sponsor yields.

20 SENATOR MARTINS: So the board has
21 seven voting members, two ex officio members,
22 which includes the mayor of the city and the
23 county executive of the County of Erie.

24 The seven actual voting members are
25 appointed by the Governor, three of them upon the

1 recommendation each of the Senate Majority
2 Leader, the Speaker of the Assembly, and the
3 Comptroller, four being appointed by the
4 Governor, including the chair and the vice chair.

5 Can you tell me, of the seven
6 members who are appointed, how many of them --
7 how many of those appointments are vacant right
8 now?

9 SENATOR BASKIN: Through you,
10 Madam President. I don't have the number of
11 vacancies currently on the Buffalo Fiscal
12 Stability Board with me at the moment.

13 SENATOR MARTINS: Through you,
14 Madam President, if the sponsor would continue to
15 yield.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
17 sponsor yield?

18 SENATOR BASKIN: Yes,
19 Madam President, I yield.

20 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
21 sponsor yields.

22 SENATOR MARTINS: Senator, are you
23 aware that the chair of the fiscal authority
24 is -- that spot is vacant and has been vacant now
25 for months, if not over a year?

1 SENATOR BASKIN: Through you,
2 Madam President. There may be an official
3 vacancy, but there has been an acting chair who
4 has been presiding over the Fiscal Stability
5 Board to date.

6 SENATOR MARTINS: Madam President,
7 through you, if the sponsor would continue to
8 yield.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
10 sponsor yield?

11 SENATOR BASKIN: Yes,
12 Madam President.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
14 sponsor yields.

15 SENATOR MARTINS: Are you familiar
16 or aware that the vice chair of the authority is
17 also vacant at this point? Not only the chair
18 but the vice chair as well, that spot is vacant
19 and has not been appointed.

20 SENATOR BASKIN: Through you,
21 Madam President. It is not uncommon for
22 government oversight boards that are voluntary to
23 have vacancies. Just because there is a vacancy
24 in a particular seat, it does not mean that the
25 board does not have leadership.

1 SENATOR MARTINS: Through you,
2 Madam President, if the sponsor would continue to
3 yield.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
5 sponsor yield?

6 SENATOR BASKIN: Yes, Madam
7 President, I yield.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
9 sponsor yields.

10 SENATOR MARTINS: To your
11 knowledge, has the board or the authority met to
12 address the request for the \$50 million that was
13 provided, as well as for this piece of
14 legislation that we're being asked to vote on
15 today, has -- have you received or has the Senate
16 received any request on behalf of the Buffalo
17 Fiscal Stability Authority for the authority that
18 we're being asked to provide them, which is to
19 borrow money?

20 (Pause.)

21 SENATOR BASKIN: Through you,
22 Madam President. The bill before us is focused
23 on a period of extension for the board to be able
24 to do borrowing. So a lot of my colleague's
25 questions are really not focused on the bill that

1 are before us.

2 I will, through you, answer that the
3 Fiscal Stability Board did have a public meeting.
4 I believe that meeting was between 30 and 60 days
5 ago. And in order for there to be business
6 before the board where they have to actually take
7 control of the city's finances or vote, the city
8 has to be in an official deficit. And the city
9 currently has a balanced budget.

10 SENATOR MARTINS: We heard that.

11 Madam President, through you, if the
12 sponsor would continue to yield.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Will the
14 sponsor yield?

15 SENATOR BASKIN: Yes,
16 Madam President, I yield.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
18 sponsor yields.

19 SENATOR MARTINS: So, Senator, who
20 asked for this bill? Who requested the bill?

21 SENATOR BASKIN: This bill came to
22 be through conversations with the current mayor
23 of the City of Buffalo.

24 SENATOR MARTINS: Through you,
25 Madam President, if the sponsor would continue to

1 yield.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
3 sponsor yield?

4 SENATOR BASKIN: Yes,
5 Madam President, I yield.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
7 sponsor yields.

8 SENATOR MARTINS: Aside from a
9 discussion with Mayor Ryan, were there any
10 discussions with anyone on the Buffalo Fiscal
11 Stability Authority with regard to what we're
12 being asked to vote on here today?

13 Which is, by the way, to authorize
14 the Buffalo Fiscal Stability Authority to
15 borrow -- to not only extend their term, but to
16 borrow up to \$150 million.

17 SENATOR BASKIN: Through you,
18 Madam President. Just again for a point of
19 clarity, the bill before us is a bill that
20 extends the City of Buffalo's authority to bond
21 for more than one year. And this agreement has
22 been in place for 40 years.

23 Could my colleague repeat his
24 question?

25 SENATOR MARTINS: I will.

1 Madam President, through you, if the
2 sponsor would continue to yield.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
4 sponsor yield?

5 SENATOR BASKIN: Yes, I yield.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
7 sponsor yields.

8 SENATOR MARTINS: So if I do
9 understand correctly, and I may be wrong, but
10 this bill authorizes the authority -- that is,
11 the Buffalo Fiscal Stability Authority -- to
12 borrow money, not the City of Buffalo itself,
13 correct?

14 SENATOR BASKIN: No. Through you,
15 Madam President, my colleague is incorrect.

16 (Pause.)

17 SENATOR BASKIN: The bill before
18 us -- through you, Madam President, the bill
19 before us allows for the City of Buffalo to
20 extend their ability to bond in private sales for
21 an additional year. That is the bill before us.

22 There is a separate bill about
23 deficit borrowing that has been introduced, but
24 that is not the bill before us. And my
25 colleague's line of questioning is not germane to

1 the topic of the bill before us.

2 SENATOR MARTINS: So
3 Madam President, through you, if the sponsor
4 would continue to yield.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Does the
6 sponsor yield?

7 SENATOR BASKIN: Yes,
8 Madam President.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The
10 sponsor yields.

11 SENATOR MARTINS: So if a city has
12 distress and requested \$50 million in a grant
13 from the State of New York and is now
14 requiring -- or requesting the ability to borrow,
15 while they have a fiscal control board, are you
16 suggesting that we should ignore the
17 fiscal control board and allow the city to
18 continue to borrow without having a plan or
19 oversight?

20 (Pause.)

21 SENATOR BASKIN: Through you,
22 Madam President. The bill before us is subject
23 to oversight by the State Comptroller.

24 SENATOR MARTINS: Madam President,
25 on the bill.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator
2 Martins on the bill.

3 SENATOR MARTINS: You know,
4 Madam President, I'm sitting here reading the
5 bill. I have it right here. So I'm going to
6 take the opportunity to read the bill number,
7 Section 9839, which is the calendar number we
8 have here tonight, or this afternoon, 9839, which
9 is Calendar Number 1132, which is the bill we are
10 debating here today.

11 And it's an act to amend the
12 Local Finance Law in relation to facilitating the
13 marketing of any issue of serial bonds or notes
14 of the City of Buffalo issued on or before a
15 certain date, with the purpose being to authorize
16 the Buffalo Fiscal Stability Authority to issue
17 bonds between July 1, 2025, and June 30, 2029.

18 Right from the memo that's
19 associated with the bill.

20 So I would hope that I'd be able to
21 get some answers to some questions about the
22 Fiscal Stability Authority, because it is that
23 which we are being asked to vote on today by the
24 bill and the memo itself. Not the City of
25 Buffalo, but the Stability Authority.

1 And just think about what we're
2 going through here and the exercise we're going
3 through. I have no issue whatsoever with
4 assisting a city in this state that is going
5 through a fiscal crisis and allowing the city the
6 opportunity to get its act together and to pay
7 its bills and to continue to provide services for
8 its residents, to continue to pay its public
9 employees, to continue to honor its contracts.
10 None. And I'm happy to support your efforts when
11 that is in fact the case.

12 But as I mentioned yesterday, if
13 we're going to hand \$50 million to a city and
14 then we're going to say here on the floor of the
15 Senate that they are -- they have a balanced
16 budget and that they're not going through fiscal
17 distress and somehow their fiscal board, which is
18 a seven-member voting board where three of the
19 members aren't there and haven't been reappointed
20 by the Governor -- so you only have four people
21 there -- they're asking for \$50 million. They're
22 asking for the ability to borrow \$150 million.
23 The memo itself should serve as proof to this
24 body that they are in fiscal distress, because it
25 speaks to the need to get their fiscal house in

1 order and be able to borrow so that they can put
2 a plan in place and to be able to phase in that
3 plan over several years.

4 So as we've done in the past, it
5 requires a plan. If the state is going to come
6 in and provide money, going to come in and
7 provide the authority to borrow, it requires a
8 plan. There has to be a restructuring plan.

9 The idea that we have a request that
10 comes before us and says, No, we're fine, we have
11 a balanced budget, we're okay. No, no, no,
12 nobody can claim that we're in deficit or that
13 we're in distress, just give us the \$50 million.
14 We're going to ignore -- we're going to ignore
15 this fiscal stability board that was created by
16 this body, and we're just going to allow that
17 board, even though they haven't asked us for it,
18 to borrow \$150 million, is just odd.

19 The request came from the mayor of
20 the city, a former colleague of ours, and I wish
21 him well. But that's not how this works. You
22 want to come in, declare the fact that you have
23 an emergency, declare the fact that you need
24 help, declare the fact that you're asking the
25 rest of the state, the taxpayers of the rest of

1 the estate to come up with the revenue to get you
2 over this hurdle. That's fine.

3 But show us what that plan looks
4 like. Show us that you're serious about actually
5 refinancing or reworking your finances so that
6 you're able to make ends meet.

7 So what do we have? We have a
8 \$50 million ask. You voted for that yesterday.
9 It's done. The City of Buffalo will be getting
10 their money. Gap filled.

11 But now we're being asked to let the
12 city borrow up to \$150 million, and not include
13 the very board that this body, the Assembly and
14 the Governor, this state placed on Buffalo to
15 make sure that they had those safeguards in
16 place.

17 So as the city has been going
18 through periods of distress over the course of we
19 know years -- and again, I wish the mayor all the
20 luck in the world, and we're here to support his
21 efforts and the fiscal board's efforts in helping
22 Buffalo meet their obligations.

23 But to come in here and to tell us
24 the budget is balanced, they're not disastrous
25 distressed, and there hasn't been a trigger for

1 the Buffalo Fiscal Stability Authority to enter a
2 control period is a joke.

3 Madam President, we have other
4 control boards in this state, other control
5 boards that are in place, other control boards
6 that are active and are doing their job. Before
7 we are asked to vote on whether or not to
8 authorize \$150 million, we should have an idea of
9 what that plan looks like, what the
10 responsibility is of that board, and help.

11 We should at least know that the
12 board is fully constituted and meeting and
13 engaged and actually working with the City of
14 Buffalo, its mayor, its comptroller, in terms of
15 coming up with solutions and alternatives to make
16 sure that they get through this fiscal crisis.

17 Madam President, if the sponsor
18 would yield for a question.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Does the
20 sponsor yield?

21 SENATOR BASKIN: Yes,
22 Madam President, I yield.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
24 sponsor yields.

25 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you.

1 Do you know how much debt the City
2 of Buffalo has currently?

3 SENATOR BASKIN: As of a week ago,
4 the city comptroller has a projected deficit of
5 \$103 million.

6 SENATOR MARTINS: Deficit of
7 103 million --

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Are you
9 asking if the Senator will yield?

10 SENATOR MARTINS: I'm just
11 repeating the words, Madam President.

12 If the Senator will yield for
13 further questions?

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Will you
15 yield for a further question?

16 SENATOR BASKIN: Yes, I yield.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
18 Senator yields.

19 SENATOR BASKIN: Yes, I yield.

20 SENATOR MARTINS: So the projected
21 deficit is \$103 million. Do you know how much
22 outstanding debt the city has currently for which
23 it has outstanding bond obligations --

24 SENATOR BASKIN: Through you --

25 SENATOR MARTINS: Excuse me. I'll

1 leave it at that.

2 SENATOR BASKIN: Through you,
3 Madam President. The bill before us is about
4 capital borrowing. And this chamber allows for
5 extensions on -- for authorities to be able to do
6 bonding and be able to have the powers to be able
7 to bond when the city will be in need, all the
8 time.

9 And my colleague's line of
10 questioning just does not align with what it is
11 that we are actually voting on today, which is
12 allowing the City of Buffalo to just extend for
13 one year their ability to be able to go to the
14 bond market should they so choose to do so.

15 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,
16 Madam President.

17 And thank you, Senator Baskin.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
19 Martins, are you on the bill?

20 SENATOR MARTINS: I am on the bill.

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
22 Martins on the bill.

23 SENATOR MARTINS: So we're being
24 asked to allow the city, I guess, under these
25 circumstances -- there's a 100-plus-million

1 dollar-projected deficit, Madam President. There
2 is a request that the city be able to borrow
3 money directly. The Fiscal Stability Authority
4 has not been engaged even though they have the
5 ability and, frankly, I would say the obligation
6 to engage when they find that there's a
7 substantial operating funds deficit or one that
8 exists or one that is projected.

9 This body has already provided the
10 City of Buffalo with \$50 million through its
11 budget voted on just yesterday. And yet rather
12 than go through the fiscal stability board that
13 exists and that exists for the purpose of
14 extending oversight over the city specifically
15 for instances such as this, we're now giving
16 the -- we're ignoring the fiscal stability board,
17 which, by the way, is still there, and through
18 legislative act giving the city the opportunity
19 to go out and borrow that money themselves.

20 Madam President, thank you for your
21 time. Senator Baskin, thank you for yours.

22 I wish, Madam President, that the
23 memo reflected the bill itself. Thank you.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Are there
25 any other Senators wishing to be heard?

1 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
2 closed. The Secretary will ring the bell.

3 Read the last section.

4 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
5 act shall take effect immediately.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
7 roll.

8 (The Secretary called the roll.)

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
10 the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 59.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
13 is passed.

14 Senator Gianaris.

15 SENATOR GIANARIS: Next up is
16 Calendar 305.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
18 Secretary will ring the bell.

19 The Secretary will read.

20 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
21 305, Senate Print 5939C, by Senator Skoufis, an
22 act to amend the Public Health Law.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER:
24 Senator Ashby, why do you rise?

25 SENATOR ASHBY: Madam President,

1 would the sponsor yield?

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
3 Skoufis, do you yield?

4 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
6 Senator yields.

7 SENATOR ASHBY: Through you,
8 Madam President. Can you tell me how this bill
9 will impact the Essential Plan?

10 (Pause.)

11 SENATOR SKOUFIS: While staff looks
12 over their notes, I understand you have another
13 question. Would you like to go to that one?

14 SENATOR ASHBY: Through you,
15 Madam President. Can you tell me how this bill
16 would impact Child Health Plus?

17 SENATOR SKOUFIS: So let me answer
18 both of those questions this way. The bill
19 before us is focused on commercial health plans.
20 And we look to provide for the same floor as
21 exists for Medicaid reimbursement.

22 Typically providers want way more
23 than a Medicaid level of reimbursement. If you
24 go ask any hospital, any FQHC, any solo
25 practitioner, the gold standard is commercial

1 reimbursement amongst the payer mix, with
2 Medicare usually being second and Medicaid being
3 well below cost.

4 In this case, what we've seen is
5 PBMs actually reimbursing pharmacies, and
6 especially those pharmacies that they do not have
7 vertical integration with -- because I remind my
8 colleagues that there are some PBMs that also own
9 pharmacies. And what this bill looks to do is to
10 simply set a floor at the Medicaid level of
11 reimbursement, because many of these PBMs to many
12 of these pharmacies are actually reimbursing
13 below Medicaid and below the at-cost value of
14 dispensing certain drugs, including lifesaving
15 drugs like children's inhalers for asthma.

16 And so to the extent that
17 Child Health Plus or the Essential Plan is
18 captured by what I just described, which again
19 affects commercial plans, then that same impact
20 would extend to those programs.

21 SENATOR ASHBY: Will the sponsor
22 continue to yield?

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
24 Skoufis, do you continue to yield?

25 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Yes.

1 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
2 Senator yields.

3 SENATOR ASHBY: Through you,
4 Madam President. So what impact and cost would
5 it have on those two programs?

6 SENATOR SKOUFIS: Through you,
7 Madam President. In other states that have
8 advanced a proposal identical if not similar to
9 what we are debating right now, we have not seen
10 premiums increase. We have not seen an impact on
11 costs in programs like the ones that we are
12 talking about.

13 And I think that could be for a
14 variety of reasons. First, PBMs make their money
15 predominantly in the reimbursements sort of side
16 of their ledger, not through undercutting
17 reimbursements below Medicaid levels to
18 independent pharmacies.

19 And furthermore, plans can tell
20 PBMs -- if a PBM, after we pass this, comes to a
21 health plan and says, Well, we want to charge
22 this now to you, the health plan can simply say
23 no. And I suspect that health plans will have
24 very little if any interest in making upwards
25 adjustments so that PBMs can accommodate their

1 profits despite only offering Medicaid-level
2 reimbursements.

3 SENATOR ASHBY: Thank you,
4 Senator Skoufis.

5 Thank you, Madam President.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you,
7 Senator.

8 Are there any other Senators wishing
9 to be heard?

10 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
11 closed. The Secretary will ring the bell.

12 Read the last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
14 act shall take effect January 1, 2027.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
16 roll.

17 (The Secretary called the roll.)

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
19 the results.

20 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
21 Calendar 305, voting in the negative are
22 Senators Ashby and Walczyk.

23 Ayes, 57. Nays, 2.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
25 is passed.

1 Senator Gianaris.

2 SENATOR GIANARIS: Next up,
3 Madam President, is Calendar 1312, once
4 Senator Kavanagh walks through that door.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
6 Secretary will read.

7 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
8 1312, Senate Print 3233A, by Senator Kavanagh, an
9 act to amend the Election Law.

10 SENATOR GIANARIS: There he is.

11 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
12 Borrello, why do you rise?

13 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
14 would the sponsor yield for some questions?

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
16 Kavanagh, do you yield?

17 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Through you,
18 Madam President, yes.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
20 Senator yields.

21 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you.

22 Through you, Madam President. You
23 know, as I read through this -- the modifications
24 to this, it appears that this is going to
25 severely limit who can challenge, you know, an

1 absentee ballot or an affidavit ballot.

2 So my concern is -- my first
3 question is, you know, if a candidate wants to
4 challenge the validity of an absentee ballot in
5 their race -- which is a standard practice, we
6 all know that -- how will this bill impact that?

7 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Through you,
8 Madam President. This bill will not meaningfully
9 restrict the ability of people to challenge.

10 It has several different provisions.
11 It mostly addresses the circumstances in which
12 people are doing challenges on the spot where the
13 voters are present. And it amends a portion of
14 the law that lays out a very detailed process
15 when somebody is asserting that someone is
16 ineligible to vote and they're issuing a
17 challenge.

18 And it first of all adds a very --
19 there's a thing called the preliminary -- there's
20 a thing called the preliminary -- there's a
21 preliminary portion of that process that adds a
22 specific question about citizenship if that is
23 the basis for the challenge. And it allows then
24 a series of questions to go through.

25 It does create a much more formal

1 process for a specific kind of challenge, which
2 is when people use -- there's a practice
3 sometimes people do where they send a large
4 volume of mail to people and then they get the
5 mail that's returned. And then they say, well,
6 given that this piece of mail is returned, we're
7 going to challenge whether you live at that
8 address. So it's a formal structure for that
9 process.

10 But it does not change the fact that
11 at a poll site, at any poll site, under current
12 law unchanged by this, there is an inspector from
13 each party, there's -- there are up to three
14 poll watchers for any candidate. And all those
15 people will still be available and they'll still
16 be able to issue challenges to voters that they
17 have reason to believe are ineligible to vote.

18 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
19 will the sponsor continue to yield?

20 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
21 continue to yield?

22 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Yes,
23 Madam President.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
25 Senator yields.

1 SENATOR BORRELLO: Section 8 here
2 reads: "Information concerning the citizenship
3 status of individuals, when collected and
4 transmitted pursuant to this section, shall not
5 be retained, used or shared for any other purpose
6 except as may be required by law."

7 So -- and it also essentially says
8 that if someone fails to certify that they're an
9 actual citizen, which is what the qualification
10 is to vote in New York State, that that shall be
11 considered an innocent error. And "Such person
12 failing to certify United States citizenship
13 shall not be considered as attempting to register
14 to vote."

15 So how can you -- how is this law
16 assuming that someone who is not being truthful
17 about their citizenship did so in error?

18 SENATOR KAVANAGH: First of all,
19 just for those -- I'm sure there are many people
20 following along at home, we're talking about
21 Section 5 of the bill, which adds a new
22 subdivision 8 to Section 8.504 --

23 SENATOR BORRELLO: Sorry, yes.

24 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Just to clarify.

25 SENATOR BORRELLO: I stand

1 corrected.

2 SENATOR KAVANAGH: No, just
3 clarifying where we are.

4 So yeah, there are a couple of very
5 distinct provisions here. Actually, yes, this
6 bill provides -- in the first sentence of that
7 provision provides the information about
8 citizenship shouldn't be shared with other
9 authorities. It doesn't mean the Board of
10 Elections cannot use that information for the
11 purpose for which it's collected, which is to
12 determine the citizenship status of folks.

13 And there have been -- you know,
14 we've had a number of initiatives recently that
15 are intended not to make particular -- to make
16 information about citizenship or suspicions of
17 citizenship something that is broadly shared for
18 purposes other than the reason it's collected.

19 Just to be clear, information
20 concerning citizenship status of individuals,
21 when collected and transmitted pursuant to this
22 section, this section is the section about
23 developing challenges to voters. There's nothing
24 in this law that changes the fact that it
25 continues to be a crime to -- attempt to -- to

1 vote if you're not eligible to vote because of
2 citizenship.

3 This is about the information that's
4 concerning citizenship collected pursuant to
5 8-504. And it says to the extent that it's
6 collected by boards, they can retain it for their
7 -- they can use it for the purpose of verifying
8 eligibility to vote, but not for other purposes.
9 And not share it with other agencies, for
10 example.

11 The innocent-error thing -- again,
12 there are three sentences. The second sentence
13 is about a poll worker or an inspector -- who,
14 again, might be an inspector of either party, who
15 generally do them as joint -- this process
16 jointly. But it's the failure to certify that an
17 individual is a citizen of the United States
18 shall be considered an innocent error.

19 And again, this is embedded in
20 Section 8-504, which lists a series of
21 specifically phrased -- there's actually
22 statutory language that lists all the things that
23 you're supposed to say to a voter before they
24 certify they're eligible to vote. And what we're
25 saying is if the election worker doesn't say this

1 out loud, that shall be considered an innocent
2 error.

3 It does not, again, suggest that if
4 somebody willfully or intentionally permits
5 somebody to vote who's not eligible to vote --
6 but this is like -- sort of like a sin of
7 omission. If you fail to read those exact words,
8 from the perspective of the election worker,
9 that's an innocent mistake that isn't going to
10 get the election worker in trouble.

11 The third sentence there is about
12 the person failing to certify their citizenship.
13 And again, that shall not be considered an
14 attempt to register to vote.

15 And that is a reference to the fact
16 that if I -- if I show up at a poll site and I
17 believe I'm eligible to vote and I am challenged
18 and they say "You're not on the voting rolls," I
19 am sometimes given an affidavit ballot.

20 And we changed the law, an
21 enterprising young Assemblymember named Kavanagh
22 many years ago changed the law such that when
23 you're given an affidavit ballot -- envelope, you
24 can say "If I'm not on the list, I will use this
25 affidavit envelope to register."

1 So what this is saying is if you
2 fail to certify that you're a citizen, then you
3 are ineligible -- then this -- that shall not be
4 construed as an attempt to vote if you say -- you
5 say you're not a citizen. You don't say that
6 you're a citizen.

7 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
8 will the sponsor continue to yield?

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
10 continue to yield?

11 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Yes.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
13 Senator yields.

14 SENATOR BORRELLO: Okay, I want to
15 go back to what you said like 10 minutes ago --

16 (Laughter.)

17 SENATOR BORRELLO: -- that -- that
18 the information concerning citizenship, that they
19 can retain that for the purposes of verifying
20 citizenship.

21 But the -- specifically that
22 subsection 8 says that if they -- once that
23 information is collected, it cannot be retained.
24 The word "retained" is right in line 12.

25 Isn't that a conflict with what you

1 said?

2 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Not be retained
3 for any other purpose --

4 SENATOR BORRELLO: No, no, no. No,
5 cannot be retained --

6 SENATOR KAVANAGH: -- except as
7 required by law.

8 SENATOR BORRELLO: It says "shall
9 not be retained, used or shared," but it starts
10 with "retained."

11 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Right, it can't
12 be --

13 SENATOR BORRELLO: So how do you --

14 SENATOR KAVANAGH: If it's
15 collected -- sorry. Through you,
16 Madam President. If it's collected for the
17 purpose of complying with this law, which is all
18 about determining whether people are eligible to
19 vote, it can't be retained or transmitted -- it
20 cannot be retained, used or shared for any other
21 purpose.

22 But it's collected -- the "other"
23 refers to not this section, which is the section
24 of Election Law that's about determining whether
25 you're eligible to vote.

1 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you.

2 Madam President, will the sponsor
3 continue to yield?

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
5 continue to yield?

6 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Yes,
7 Madam President.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
9 Senator yields.

10 SENATOR BORRELLO: So last
11 question, based on your previous answer. So if
12 someone -- if an election worker fails to ask the
13 necessary questions to verify the citizenship of
14 a voter, this will automatically be considered an
15 innocent error.

16 How are we knowing the intent is an
17 innocent error? How -- how is that assumption
18 made for the purpose of this change to the law?
19 Why are we making that assumption? Shouldn't
20 there be a level of fear of consequence if
21 someone does have nefarious intentions?

22 SENATOR KAVANAGH: And we -- this
23 is -- this provision deals with the situation at
24 a poll site where the election officials who have
25 to administer a lengthy oath that is in statute

1 fail to affirmatively say the words about
2 citizenship.

3 And we're saying that is an innocent
4 error. Because we don't want our harried
5 election workers, who have to read the words that
6 are in this statute, to get in trouble if they
7 fail to certify that.

8 If they -- if there was some
9 evidence that they intentionally invited people
10 to vote or they snuck the person in,
11 notwithstanding the fact that there are both
12 parties represented, that would be a different
13 matter.

14 This is just saying -- again, in a
15 provision of law, Section 8-504, that has
16 multiple oaths that you might have to administer
17 in different circumstances, we're actually adding
18 an extra oath about citizenship to that law right
19 now in this bill.

20 So we're not trying to skirt the
21 need to confirm citizenship. We're in fact
22 enhancing that. But if they fail to
23 affirmatively certify that, they are not presumed
24 to have made an error merely by failing to
25 certify that. Not to make a pernicious error,

1 it's an -- it's considered an innocent mistake.

2 SENATOR BORRELLO: Madam President,
3 on the bill.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
5 Borrello on the bill.

6 SENATOR BORRELLO: Thank you,
7 Senator Kavanaugh. I'm always impressed with the
8 level of knowledge you have on all of these
9 things.

10 And so that being said, this was
11 brought to the attention -- to us by some
12 elections professionals that have concerns about
13 this. So I bring it up to say that the
14 perception is this is going to loosen and not
15 tighten the process here to ensure integrity in
16 that election.

17 So if that's the case, then I really
18 think this should be looked at again. Because it
19 sounds like my impression and Senator Kavanaugh's
20 impression were diametrically opposed.

21 Therefore, I think that this --
22 whether it was intentional or not needs to be
23 tightened up and strengthened so people have that
24 confidence that this is indeed going to
25 strengthen and not weaken our election integrity.

1 So with that, I will be voting no.

2 Thank you, Madam President.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
4 Martins, why do you rise?

5 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,
6 Madam President. If the sponsor would yield for
7 a few questions.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
9 Kavanagh, do you yield?

10 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Yes, succinctly,
11 Madam Speaker -- or Madam President, I will
12 yield.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
14 Senator yields.

15 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you,
16 Senator.

17 You know, I feel pretty strongly --
18 extremely strongly that for every person who
19 votes who shouldn't vote, they are diluting a
20 vote from someone who had a right to vote, and
21 therefore stealing that person's voice.

22 I know oftentimes in this house
23 the -- the -- that it's expressed frankly the
24 same sentiment, but in an opposite view. But I
25 believe that we need to protect the ability of

1 people who shouldn't vote not to vote. That is,
2 prevent them from voting and -- in order not to
3 dilute the rights of people who have a right to
4 vote.

5 And my concern with this -- well,
6 first of all, do you agree?

7 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Through you,
8 Madam President, I agree.

9 SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you.

10 Madam President, through you, if the
11 sponsor would continue to yield.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
13 continue to yield?

14 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Yes,
15 Madam President.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
17 Kavanagh yields.

18 SENATOR MARTINS: And so, you know,
19 we've all been to polling places in the past.
20 It's part of, I guess, an occupational hazard for
21 all of us that we spend a bit of time there.

22 And I find that oftentimes it's
23 those very people that are there in the polling
24 place that have a sense of their community and
25 know if so-and-so shows up to vote and says that

1 they live at 123 Main Street and you live a
2 couple of houses away and you know that that
3 person isn't familiar to you, you have an
4 obligation, I would think, to challenge that
5 person as to whether or not they actually in fact
6 live in that location.

7 Don't you agree?

8 SENATOR KAVANAGH: I generally
9 agree that that is an appropriate thing for
10 somebody with information that they think -- I'm
11 not sure I'd call it an obligation, but I think
12 that is a part of the process. And this bill
13 doesn't change that. And I think that's a fine
14 part of the process.

15 SENATOR MARTINS: Through you,
16 Madam President, if the sponsor would continue to
17 yield.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
19 continue to yield?

20 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Yes,
21 Madam President.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
23 sponsor yields.

24 SENATOR MARTINS: And yet if this
25 bill is to proceed, it would limit the types of

1 questions that can be asked, the form that it can
2 be asked, and limit the ability of that person to
3 intervene in order to prevent someone who they
4 believe should not be voting from voting.

5 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Through you,
6 Madam President, there we disagree.

7 This bill limits a particular manner
8 of challenging people's address, which is sending
9 a large volume of mail out into the world and
10 then sort of brandishing a returned piece of
11 mail. It is not about having personal knowledge,
12 because you live on the street, that that person
13 doesn't live there.

14 And it creates a structure so that
15 that information can be properly reviewed and
16 used. Just as, for example, we don't allow
17 people to challenge people's petition signatures
18 on the spot, there's a process.

19 And I think this is similar to that,
20 but it does not limit the ability for somebody to
21 point out evidence that somebody doesn't live on
22 the street or to ask that question, or the
23 current process where people have oaths
24 administered and if there's a doubt, they can be
25 given an absentee ballot -- an affidavit ballot

1 so it can be decided later.

2 SENATOR MARTINS: Madam President,
3 through you, if the sponsor would continue to
4 yield.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
6 continue to yield?

7 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Yes,
8 Madam President.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
10 Senator yields.

11 SENATOR MARTINS: So if a mailing
12 goes out, a political mailing is sent out and a
13 piece of mail is returned as undeliverable or
14 that the person no longer lives at that address,
15 would that trigger a requirement under this
16 statute -- under this bill?

17 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Through you,
18 Madam President. This bill deals with
19 circumstances where somebody sends a mailing with
20 the intent of using it for challenges or with a
21 reasonable expectation that that's the purpose of
22 the mailing.

23 So if you -- if someone comes into
24 possession of information that demonstrates that
25 that somebody doesn't live at a particular

1 address -- not through this particular practice,
2 which has become something that, you know, people
3 have used in recent years -- then that
4 information can still be presented.

5 SENATOR MARTINS: I'm sorry,
6 that --

7 SENATOR KAVANAGH: The
8 information -- if you have information that
9 indicates I live on Main Street and they say they
10 live on Main Street but I know they don't live on
11 Main Street because Mrs. Jones moved into that
12 house last week, that information can be still
13 presented.

14 If I have a piece of mail that's
15 been returned, this bill does not necessarily
16 deal with an individual piece of mail. But
17 there's a presumption that if you're sending
18 large volumes of mail for the purpose of
19 generating challenges, then you notify -- you
20 provide a copy of the mail and you provide the
21 list of people you send it to in advance so all
22 parties can review that and determine how it's
23 being used.

24 SENATOR MARTINS: Through you,
25 Madam President, if the sponsor would continue to

1 yield.

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
3 continue to yield?

4 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Yes,
5 Madam President.

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
7 sponsor yields.

8 SENATOR MARTINS: But just to be
9 clear, if you do send out mail, political mail,
10 and it is returned and you collect those returned
11 pieces, then with the intent of pursuing it, but
12 it wasn't your intent when you sent out the mail,
13 but it is your intent once you get those pieces
14 back, you would not have to comply with the
15 requirements of this bill, right?

16 SENATOR KAVANAGH: You would --
17 there might be a question of fact whether you
18 knew or whether you intended that or reasonably
19 knew that that mail would be used. Somebody
20 might be skeptical if your campaign is using
21 returns, you presumably knew you'd get returns
22 and now you're using them to challenge.

23 But the bill deals with the
24 situation where you either expressly intended the
25 mail to be used in that way or reasonably

1 anticipated that it would be used in that way.

2 I would suggest that if I'm a
3 campaign that intends to use that mail, it would
4 be logical to -- and this statute passes, it
5 would be logical to comply with this statute and
6 say, Here's a copy of a piece of mail and here's
7 who we sent it to, and we intend to use it as
8 challenges. And then the process would proceed.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Through
10 you, Madam President, if the sponsor would
11 continue to yield. Do you continue to yield?

12 SENATOR KAVANAGH: Yes,
13 Madam President.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
15 sponsor yields.

16 SENATOR MARTINS: So just -- so
17 every campaign in New York State for every level
18 of state government, local government, or federal
19 government that sends out a piece of mail and --
20 and -- for campaign purposes, and then expects
21 there may be, because there invariably is, as we
22 all know, pieces of mail that come back, in order
23 to be safe, are you suggesting that every
24 campaign send every campaign piece to the Board
25 of Elections with a list of who they sent it to,

1 in the off chance that some of those pieces may
2 come back and they may want to challenge whether
3 or not something actually lives where they say
4 they live?

5 SENATOR KAVANAGH: They may. And
6 if they want to be challenging that voter's right
7 to vote on Election Day at the poll site by
8 telling a voter who is presenting themselves as
9 eligible to vote, that they're not going to be
10 allowed to vote today -- if they want to use the
11 mail for that purpose, then yes, a good practice
12 would be for them to indicate that they intend
13 to -- they intend to do that.

14 SENATOR MARTINS: Madam President,
15 through you -- you know what? I appreciate it.
16 Thank you very much to the sponsor.

17 Thank you, Madam President. On the
18 bill.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
20 Martins on the bill.

21 SENATOR MARTINS: So we started out
22 our discussion with a very simple premise. By
23 allowing somebody who shouldn't have a right to
24 vote, whether because they don't live there or
25 because of citizenship they don't have a right to

1 vote -- those are the primary characteristics
2 eliminating a person's ability to vote currently.
3 There are others; we'll focus on those.

4 If we can identify that someone
5 should not be voting, what this bill does is it
6 handcuffs us and it handcuffs the local community
7 members, boards of elections, parties,
8 candidates, from being able to say, Stop, you
9 can't vote. You don't have a right to vote.

10 Requiring the off-chance erring on
11 the side of providing layers of bureaucracy,
12 providing details to the Board of Elections for a
13 condition of being able to safeguard what
14 everyone in this body has always regarded as
15 being a sacrosanct right, the right to vote, also
16 means making sure that those who shouldn't be
17 voting don't.

18 So I question why it is that we
19 would put those obligations on this process.
20 Because it should be everyone's responsibility --
21 all of us, certainly everyone back home, and
22 those who care -- to ensure that only people who
23 are entitled to vote actually do vote. Whoever
24 they happen to be.

25 So the idea that we're going to

1 require, frankly, all of us and everyone else out
2 there who's engaged in this process to go through
3 this process of sending mailings to the Board of
4 Elections, along with lists of people they mailed
5 to, along with lists of returned mail in the
6 off chance that that person who happens to not
7 have received a mail because they have moved, if
8 they happen to show up on Election Day at the
9 polls asking to vote and you received that piece
10 of mail back and you didn't send it to the
11 Board of Elections, somehow you did something
12 wrong.

13 Why does it default against those
14 who are trying to ensure the integrity of the
15 system? Madam President, I'm at a loss as to why
16 we would possibly support a bill like this and
17 create these kinds of hurdles in order to do what
18 each and every one of us should do as a matter of
19 course.

20 I will tell you this. If that piece
21 of mail is returned, my expectation, and everyone
22 in this room's expectation, is that person isn't
23 showing up at the polling place. But if they do,
24 I'll be holding that piece of mail -- hopefully
25 someone will -- in order to challenge that person

1 and why they took the opportunity to vote.

2 And it may be innocent. It may be.

3 But they have every right to question that
4 person's vote on that day and ask that person for
5 clarification. This bill would prevent that, and
6 that's why I'm voting no.

7 Thank you, Madam President.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Are there
9 any other Senators wishing to be heard?

10 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
11 closed. The Secretary will ring the bell.

12 Read the last section.

13 THE SECRETARY: Section 9. This
14 act shall take effect on the 30th day after it
15 shall have become a law.

16 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
17 roll.

18 (The Secretary called the roll.)

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
20 the results.

21 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
22 Calendar 1312, voting in the negative are
23 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
24 Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins,
25 Mattera, Murray, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison,

1 Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

2 Ayes, 39. Nays, 20.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
4 is passed.

5 Senator Gianaris.

6 SENATOR GIANARIS: Next up,
7 Madam President, is Calendar 968.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
9 Rhoads, why do you rise?

10 SENATOR RHOADS: I was hoping that
11 the sponsor would yield to a couple of questions.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
13 Rivera --

14 SENATOR RIVERA: Yes.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator --
16 I'm sorry. Oh, the Secretary will read. I
17 jumped over, I apologize.

18 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
19 968, Senate Print 1634A, by Senator Rivera, an
20 act to amend the Insurance Law.

21 SENATOR RHOADS: Now I'm hoping
22 that the Senator will yield to a few questions.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Now. That
24 was my mistake. Thank you, Senator Rhoads.

25 SENATOR RIVERA: Yes.

1 SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you,
2 Madam President. And thank you, Senator Rivera.

3 Madam President, through you. The
4 bill focuses on creating a healthcare -- health
5 plan allocation of 12.5 percent of spending for
6 primary care, is that correct?

7 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,
8 Madam President. With the recognition that
9 primary care being the first point of contact
10 with individuals -- should be the first point of
11 contact with individuals, the place where people
12 can get their routine medical care, this bill --
13 what this bill would do is over a period of years
14 it would establish a 1 percent per year increase
15 up to 12.5 percent of the Medicaid spend so that
16 it goes to primary care.

17 But it would not be an immediate
18 thing. That would be the ultimate goal. But it
19 would not be an immediate thing.

20 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor
21 continue to yield?

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
23 continue to yield?

24 SENATOR RIVERA: Yes.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The

1 Senator yields.

2 SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you.

3 Through you, Madam President.

4 My understanding is that the
5 immediate threshold is 12.5 percent. That is
6 intended to be the max. If they are under
7 12.5 percent, then there's a 1 percent per year
8 plan -- they have to develop a plan for a
9 1 percent increase until they get to
10 12.5 percent. Is that not correct?

11 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,
12 Madam President, the ultimate goal would be to
13 get to 12.5 percent. It would be -- I am -- we
14 are not -- we don't have -- that is not being met
15 now. We don't know exactly where the percentage
16 is, but it is below 12.5 percent.

17 The goal ultimately,
18 Madam President, is to make sure that we have
19 more folks in the Medicaid program who have
20 access to primary care -- therefore, being able
21 to identify chronic conditions earlier, being
22 able to take care of -- to focus on wellness as
23 opposed to sick care.

24 And it is -- I believe it is a good
25 way not only to spend money more wisely, but to

1 make sure that people have better and healthier
2 lives.

3 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor
4 continue to yield?

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
6 continue to yield?

7 SENATOR RIVERA: Yes.

8 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
9 Senator yields.

10 SENATOR RHOADS: Through you,
11 Madam President. I know you said you don't know
12 what the percentage is now, but you think it's
13 less than 12.5 percent.

14 Milbank Memorial Fund's Primary Care
15 Scorecard says that spending on primary care as a
16 total share of healthcare spending in New York is
17 actually 13.3 percent in the commercial market
18 and 10.1 percent for Medicaid.

19 So if the commercial market is
20 already meeting its threshold but the state is
21 not, in terms of Medicaid spending, why aren't we
22 focusing just on the state's portion of Medicaid?

23 (Pause.)

24 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,
25 Madam President. So the -- the national average

1 as far as -- is about 5 percent, is what we know.

2 But if the bill were to become law,
3 then we would actually get reports from both
4 Medicaid spending as well as private plans and
5 would then -- we would make -- we would make a
6 plan to hit the 12.5 eventually.

7 If there is -- if that number is
8 exceeded already, then God bless America -- we're
9 done. But if it's not, which is what we believe,
10 then it would be -- the goal would be to go
11 1 percent a year until we get to 12.5.

12 SENATOR RHOADS: And will the
13 sponsor continue to yield?

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
15 continue to yield?

16 SENATOR RIVERA: Yes.

17 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
18 Senator yields.

19 SENATOR RHOADS: So with the
20 understanding that if in fact healthcare spending
21 in the commercial market, competitive
22 marketplace, is 13.3 percent, they would have
23 already met the goals, the legislation authorizes
24 the commissioner to promulgate rules and
25 regulations. Do these rules and regulations

1 include penalties at some point if in fact
2 private health plans -- if in fact health plans
3 do not meet these goals?

4 (Pause.)

5 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,
6 Madam President. First of all, the -- we would
7 have to see plan by plan what percentage we're
8 talking about. There might be some plans that
9 actually exceeded; there might be some that don't
10 meet it. And so we would look towards -- to get
11 there.

12 And if there is -- and if it's -- if
13 the -- if it's not met, then the fines would
14 correspond to Public Health Law that already
15 exists that would be up to -- the fines would be
16 up to \$2,000.

17 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor
18 continue to yield?

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
20 continue to yield?

21 SENATOR RIVERA: Yes.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
23 sponsor yields.

24 SENATOR RHOADS: So there is no
25 provision for -- through you, Madam President,

1 there is no provision for fines in the
2 legislation itself other than the reference to
3 the Public Health Law, which lays out the fine
4 schedule?

5 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,
6 Madam President, that is correct.

7 SENATOR RHOADS: Okay. And will
8 the sponsor continue to yield.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
10 continue to yield?

11 SENATOR RIVERA: Yes.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
13 Senator yields.

14 SENATOR RHOADS: The bill focuses
15 on health plans meeting these targets. Oh,
16 actually I'll withdraw that question for a moment
17 and I'll switch to another question, the state
18 and its administration of Medicaid.

19 Are there sanctions against the
20 state if it fails to meet these primary care
21 goals?

22 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,
23 Madam President. The majority of Medicare --
24 Medicaid, pardon me, in the State of New York
25 is -- currently operates through managed care

1 organizations. Therefore, there are middlemen
2 and so therefore the fine, if it were to be
3 assessed, probably would be assessed on those
4 plans, not on the state itself.

5 SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you.

6 Will the sponsor continue to yield?

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Will you
8 continue to yield?

9 SENATOR RIVERA: Yes.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
11 Senator yields.

12 SENATOR RHOADS: The focus is on
13 health plans meeting these targets. But why
14 weren't provider systems factored into this
15 equation?

16 Because my understanding of the way
17 that this works -- obviously I'm a consumer, I
18 decide that I'm going to go to my primary care
19 physician for whatever preventative care that I
20 need. I make the choice to go to a specific
21 physician. The services that are provided to me
22 are services that are provided by the physician.
23 The health plan only gets involved in the
24 equation when they receive the bill.

25 Do we have an issue where they're

1 denying primary care services? Are people not
2 being provided primary care services because the
3 health plans themselves aren't providing it? How
4 does this help encourage people to seek primary
5 care, if that's the ultimate goal?

6 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,
7 Madam President. The reality is that we find
8 that most folks do not avail themselves of
9 primary care if it is available to them. And
10 this would be a way to kind of encourage the
11 spend so that it goes in that direction, with the
12 understanding that providing -- that spending
13 more money in routine medicine, in the first
14 point of contact, it would actually be -- it
15 would be better for the system.

16 As I said, as I stated earlier,
17 having folks be able to identify chronic
18 conditions earlier means that folks who have
19 asthma, diabetes, or any other chronic condition
20 could focus on making sure that that condition
21 gets better, as opposed to just focusing on
22 episodes where they have either had an asthma
23 attack or have to be hospitalized for low blood
24 sugar, et cetera, et cetera.

25 So ultimately this is about trying

1 to switch up the total spend. It's about
2 encouraging more -- have it be available more.
3 It is not about -- you know, it's not about
4 finding more places to fine people. Instead, it
5 is about trying to focus our total healthcare
6 expenditures in places where it would cause
7 people to be healthier and to lead better lives.

8 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor
9 continue to yield?

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
11 continue to yield?

12 SENATOR RIVERA: Yes.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
14 sponsor yields.

15 SENATOR RHOADS: Through you,
16 Madam President, I get all that. I mean, I get
17 what the goal of the legislation is.

18 But by putting the burden on the
19 health plan, I'm trying to understand what it is
20 that that the health plan is supposed to do to
21 actually encourage people to seek primary care
22 more frequently.

23 How does this actually -- you're
24 focusing on the percentage of spend, but the
25 health plan is actually paying the bills that

1 come to them. Right? It's not -- it's
2 apparently not the case that you have health
3 plans that are denying coverage for primary care;
4 people aren't seeking primary care.

5 So how does this actually encourage
6 people to seek primary care, which is the
7 ultimate goal?

8 (Pause.)

9 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,
10 Madam President. First of all, it is
11 certainly -- as we've said many times, insurance
12 companies kind of live for the instances in which
13 they can deny care.

14 So I can't tell in every single
15 instance, but certainly there are many instances,
16 as many as they can muster, where they will deny
17 care to an individual, whether it be primary or
18 otherwise.

19 But, second, the bill actually
20 speaks to creating a set of incentives that
21 actually would work to increase the amount of
22 spending, particularly since we have -- there are
23 definitely visits to primary care providers, but
24 it doesn't necessarily show in the spend.

25 Now, it is true that we would have

1 to get -- if the bill were to pass and be made
2 into law, we would get more exact percentages.
3 At this point we're operating with analysis that
4 doesn't have all the information. There would
5 have to be a study done to determine how close or
6 how far away we are from the 12.5.

7 But also in Section (2) and
8 Section (2)(d) and throughout all of it, there
9 are a set of different actions that would be --
10 that are suggested for the Department of Health
11 and the commissioner to encourage the -- the --
12 more folks utilizing primary care.

13 So it's all in the bill already, all
14 the different methods that can be utilized to get
15 more folks to be -- to avail themselves of
16 primary care.

17 SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor
18 continue to yield?

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
20 continue to yield?

21 SENATOR RIVERA: Yes.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
23 sponsor yields.

24 SENATOR RHOADS: You brought up the
25 issue of a study, and I just want to briefly

1 touch on that. This version of the bill has
2 passed in prior years. And the version in prior
3 years that was vetoed by the Governor included a
4 commission for DOH and DFS to study the delivery
5 of primary care. So it's exactly the study that
6 you were talking about, but in this particular
7 version it's removed.

8 Wouldn't the study portion of it, to
9 study how we can encourage more people to make
10 use of primary care, be the important precursor
11 to putting policy in place, law in place, where
12 there are actual penalties?

13 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,
14 Madam President, not to bring up bad memories,
15 but that was known kindly among some of us as the
16 Thanksgiving Day massacre, in which a whole host
17 of bills, every study bill under the sun, was
18 vetoed at the same time by the Governor, whether
19 it had to do with healthcare, whether it had to
20 do with transportation, whether it had to do with
21 anything under the sun.

22 So that bill was actually a more
23 curtailed version of this one. This one would
24 actually require -- if it were to be signed into
25 law, would require a study to make the

1 determination as far as where we are as far as
2 percentages, and then it would create -- and
3 there would be set, as we've discussed before,
4 the goals on a yearly basis to go up to 12.5.

5 SENATOR RHOADS: Would the sponsor
6 yield for one final question?

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Do you
8 continue to yield?

9 SENATOR RIVERA: Yes.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
11 Senator yields.

12 SENATOR RHOADS: That massacre was
13 because there was a budgetary impact to these --
14 to those studies that were to be conducted. So
15 perhaps this bill should have been included as
16 part of the budget, along with the study.

17 But the last point is I notice that
18 urgent cares are exempted from this particular
19 legislation, which in many portions of the state
20 you may not have an abundance of primary care
21 providers, so primary care is provided by urgent
22 cares or by hospitals.

23 Why would we remove that? And then
24 doesn't that impact the overall number? If
25 people are seeking primary care from their

1 urgent-care provider but we're not counting those
2 numbers in our statistics to determine whether a
3 health plan has met that 12.5 percent, isn't that
4 artificially making it more difficult for health
5 plans to meet the goals that are set forth in the
6 legislation?

7 (Pause.)

8 SENATOR RIVERA: Through you,
9 Madam President. Recognizing certainly that
10 there are limits -- and we've talked about
11 workforce, healthcare workforce shortages. This
12 is certainly an issue that I care deeply about
13 and we have spoken about in the past.

14 This is in recognition, this
15 exclusion is in recognition, Madam President, of
16 the fact that urgent cares are for -- are more,
17 at least in their design, although they're not
18 totally defined in state law in the State of
19 New York, it does actually -- is therefore other
20 types of episodes that are not necessarily having
21 to do with routine medicine and first point of
22 contact, which is ultimately what we want to
23 focus on.

24 But it's certainly something worth
25 looking at in the future.

1 SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you,
2 Senator Rivera.

3 Briefly on the bill.

4 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
5 Rhoads on the bill.

6 SENATOR RHOADS: I understand the
7 motivations and I agree with the motivations. We
8 should be increasing primary care usage if we
9 can.

10 I just think we're putting the cart
11 before the horse. Let's get the data and come up
12 with a constructive solution on how to do that
13 before we actually put policy in place.

14 I'll be voting no, Madam President.

15 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Are there
16 any other Senators wishing to be heard?

17 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
18 closed. The Secretary will ring the bell.

19 Read the last section.

20 THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This
21 act shall take effect immediately.

22 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
23 roll.

24 (The Secretary called the roll.)

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator

1 Rivera to explain his vote.

2 SENATOR RIVERA: Thank you,
3 Madam President.

4 And I thank my colleague for some of
5 the questions here.

6 Ultimately, there is -- it is
7 clear -- not only is it common sense, but there's
8 data that demonstrates that having primary care
9 more accessible, spending more on that means that
10 people will avail themselves of it, which means
11 that they'll be able to identify chronic
12 conditions earlier, they would lead better lives,
13 and it would make the system as a whole less
14 expensive.

15 So ultimately what this bill means
16 to do -- and by the way, Madam President,
17 20 other states have enacted similar laws and
18 regulations to report on an increase in
19 primary-care spending, anything from
20 West Virginia to Colorado to Connecticut to
21 Maine, et cetera, et cetera, et cetera.

22 So it is -- we believe that this is
23 an important measure that, if it becomes a law,
24 would actually move us towards the place where we
25 could have people avail themselves of primary

1 care earlier in their lives, be able to have
2 better lives for themselves and their family, to
3 have the system as a whole be cheaper.

4 So I certainly hope that we can get
5 it passed this year, and I'll be voting in the
6 affirmative.

7 Thank you, Madam President.

8 PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator Rivera to
9 be recorded in the affirmative.

10 Announce the results.

11 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
12 Calendar 968, voting in the negative are
13 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,
14 Chan, Gallivan, Griffio, Lanza, Martins, Mattera,
15 Murray, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco,
16 Walczyk and Weik.

17 Ayes, 42. Nays, 17.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
19 is passed.

20 Senator Gianaris.

21 SENATOR GIANARIS: Calendar 866 up
22 next, please.

23 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
24 Secretary will read.

25 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

1 866, Senate Print 6882, by Senator Harckham, an
2 act to amend the General Municipal Law.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
4 Martins, why do you rise?

5 SENATOR MARTINS: Madam President,
6 on the bill.

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Senator
8 Martins on the bill.

9 SENATOR MARTINS: So this bill
10 would allow a preemption of local zoning across
11 New York State for solar panels on carports.
12 Sounds like a straightforward bill.

13 Obviously there are a lot of
14 concerns in our chamber historically amongst many
15 of us about preempting local control, especially
16 when it comes to zoning. And so the idea of a
17 carport -- when I think of a carport I think of a
18 house and I think of, you know, that piece next
19 to the house, maybe, you know, sort of a
20 shed-like enclosure where you park your car,
21 Madam President.

22 And, you know, if that's the case,
23 if you're looking at it, probably 10 feet by
24 20 feet or so, that itself would probably take
25 about 10 to 12 panels and would produce about 5

1 kilowatts of electricity. Something as small as
2 that, about that, a small shed over a car.

3 But that's not we're talking about,
4 Madam President. We're talking about preempting
5 local zoning to allow for 5 megawatts. And so to
6 talk about 5 megawatts, five megawatts is defined
7 or at least described as a small-to-medium
8 utility-scale installation which covers about
9 20 acres or so.

10 In order for solar panels to produce
11 about 5 megawatts of electricity, you're talking
12 about a small-to-medium-scale utility-type
13 installation. In order to create 5 megawatts of
14 electricity, you'd have to provide coverage for
15 literally 20, 25 acres.

16 And so in the context of preempting
17 local zoning for our villages, our towns and our
18 cities, the idea of someone just being able to
19 put that much or that kind of structure up for
20 20 acres or more, to reach that 5 megahertz --
21 megawatts, excuse me -- threshold,
22 Madam President, is a real concern.

23 Now, obviously I would be concerned
24 if it were just a carport on the side of a house.
25 I would be. Because local communities should be

1 able to make those decisions for themselves, and
2 we should be loath to preempt local communities
3 and their home rule.

4 But when it's 5 megawatts, what
5 we're talking about here is on a scale that if it
6 were to be imposed on our local communities,
7 every supermarket parking lot, every school
8 parking lot, can go out and just put these
9 carports. And frankly, some people may like it.
10 Some people may not. But that's a local zoning
11 decision that each local community should be able
12 to make for themselves without preempting zoning
13 on that scale.

14 And so although I appreciate the
15 intent and the effort behind the bill and the
16 idea to promote solar and renewable energy as an
17 alternative, I would certainly prefer to see it
18 more as a collaborative effort allowing our local
19 communities to opt in and not preempting their
20 local zoning prerogative.

21 Because obviously depending on where
22 it is, depending on its proximity to homes,
23 depending on its proximity to parks and to other
24 decisions that are typically made by our local
25 communities because they're there, something on

1 this size and this scale frankly is just too
2 much.

3 And so, Madam President, I can't
4 support this bill. I'll be voting no. Although
5 I again want to thank Senator Harckham because I
6 do understand it's coming from a good place.

7 I just can't get there on this bill,
8 so I'll be voting no. And I thank you for your
9 time.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Thank you.
11 Are there any other Senators wishing
12 to be heard?

13 Seeing and hearing none, debate is
14 closed. The Secretary will ring the bell.

15 Read the last section.

16 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
17 act shall take effect on the first of January.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
19 roll.

20 (The Secretary called the roll.)

21 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
22 the results.

23 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
24 Calendar 866, voting in the negative are
25 Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick,

1 Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martinez,
2 Martins, Mattera, Murray, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,
3 Rolison, Ryan, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk and Weber.

4 Ayes, 38. Nays, 21.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
6 is passed.

7 Senator Gianaris.

8 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,
9 by consent with the Minority, we are removing the
10 lay-asides on Calendars 1207, 698, and 1058.

11 Can we please take those up on the
12 noncontroversial calendar.

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Pursuant
14 to agreement, on Calendars 1207, 698 and 1058 the
15 lay-asides are removed and the bills will retain
16 their place on the noncontroversial calendar.

17 There is a substitution at the desk.

18 The Secretary will read.

19 THE SECRETARY: Senator Krueger
20 moves to discharge, from the Committee on Rules,
21 Assembly Bill Number 9111C and substitute it for
22 the identical Senate Bill 8512C, Third Reading
23 Calendar 698.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
25 Secretary will read.

1 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
2 698, Assembly Bill Number 9111C, by
3 Assemblymember Gallagher, an act to amend the
4 Public Service Law.

5 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
6 last section.

7 THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This
8 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
9 shall have become a law.

10 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
11 roll.

12 (The Secretary called the roll.)

13 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
14 the results.

15 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
16 Calendar 698, voting in the negative:
17 Senator Walczyk.

18 Ayes, 58. Nays, 1.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
20 is passed.

21 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
22 1058, Senate Print 4887B, by Senator Walczyk, an
23 act to amend the Tax Law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
25 last section.

1 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
2 act shall take effect immediately.

3 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
4 roll.

5 (The Secretary called the roll.)

6 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
7 the results.

8 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
9 Calendar 1058, voting in the negative are
10 Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Harckham,
11 Helming, Lanza, Martinez, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads,
12 Ryan, Scarcella-Spanton, Skoufis and Webb.

13 Ayes, 47. Nays, 12.

14 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
15 is passed.

16 THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number
17 1207, Senate Print 6025, by Senator Brouk, an act
18 to amend the Social Services Law.

19 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Read the
20 last section.

21 THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This
22 act shall take effect on the 90th day after it
23 shall have become a law.

24 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Call the
25 roll.

1 (The Secretary called the roll.)

2 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: Announce
3 the results.

4 THE SECRETARY: In relation to
5 Calendar 1207, voting in the negative are
6 Senators Borrello, Lanza, Murray, Ortt, Rhoads
7 and Walczyk.

8 Ayes, 53. Nays, 6.

9 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The bill
10 is passed.

11 Senator Gianaris.

12 SENATOR GIANARIS: Madam President,
13 returning to motions for a second, on behalf of
14 Senator Fahy, on page 61 I offer the following
15 amendments to Calendar Number 1294, Senate Print
16 4500A, and ask that said bill retain its place on
17 Third Reading Calendar.

18 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The
19 amendments are received, and the bill will retain
20 its place on the Third Reading Calendar.

21 Senator Gianaris.

22 SENATOR GIANARIS: The sponsors of
23 the resolutions we took up earlier today would
24 like to open them for cosponsorship.

25 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: The

1 resolutions we took up today are open for
2 cosponsorship. Should you choose not to be a
3 cosponsor, please notify the desk.

4 Senator Gianaris.

5 SENATOR GIANARIS: Is there any
6 further business at the desk?

7 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: There is
8 no further business at the desk.

9 SENATOR GIANARIS: I move to
10 adjourn until tomorrow, Friday, May 29th, at
11 11:00 a.m.

12 ACTING PRESIDENT MAYER: On motion,
13 the Senate stands adjourned until Friday,
14 May 29th, at 11:00 a.m.

15 (Whereupon, at 5:35 p.m., the Senate
16 adjourned.)

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25