NEW YORK STATE SENATE

THE STENOGRAPHIC RECORD

ALBANY, NEW YORK

March 17, 2026

3:19 p.m.

REGULAR SESSION

SENATOR ROXANNE J. PERSAUD, Acting President

ALEJANDRA N. PAULINO, ESQ., Secretary

P R O C E E D I N G S

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The Senate will come to order.

I ask everyone to please rise and recite the Pledge of Allegiance.

(Whereupon, the assemblage recited the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Reverend Father Dan Quinn, of Blessed Sacrament Church in Albany, will deliver today's invocation.

FATHER QUINN: Hello. Thank you for having me.

I'm Father Quinn, from Blessed Sacrament, up the street here in Albany. I've got a couple of other parishes with their schools as well.

You know, today is St. Patrick's Day, so I know I'm dressed a little bit traditional Irish with a kilt. But I know, of course, the Irish are just one of many cultures that have come together to form, you know, what we have here as a state in New York.

And today, on the feast of one of their great saints, one of their great leaders, who himself was first a foreigner, sort of, as

the story goes, captured and sort of enslaved by those people and escaped, but then went back again as an immigrant and lived there as a man with some new and different ideas that he had. And eventually, as they caught on, he became the bishop there, the man chiefly in charge of praying for them, you know.

So we take a moment to pray, certainly for the people of Ireland today on their feast of their great saint. We take the time to pray for our community here in New York, and also for our leaders and for our legislators.

So let us pray.

In the name of the Father and of the Son and the Holy Spirit, amen.

Lord God, we know that in Your perfect fatherly love, You have given us laws to guide all of our decisions, our growth to guide our consciences. Through Moses, through the prophets, and above all through Jesus, we have received Your ways, which are so far above our ways.

And yet they are written on each of our hearts as the goal and the guide for our own lives, most supremely expressed in Your command

to love -- to love You and to love our neighbor.

So we ask You to help us to honor Your laws while we are engaged in composing ours, in composing our laws, that our ways may be a true reflection of Your perfect way. And that, in the craft of lawmaking, You may protect us from distortions, not allowing us to be satisfied with easy solutions to complex problems.

So guide us to being true agents of truth and of love, avoiding all that is really, truly in our power to hate and to live according to convenient falsehoods, or what is in our power to cause destruction, to cause division, to cause death.

Instead, help us to be people who foster and protect life: The lives of all of our citizens, our neighbors, the guests in our state -- all life, young and old.

And so, in quoting St. Patrick, help us, Lord, in all of this to arise, to rise to the challenge, through -- quoting St. Patrick -- God's strength to pilot me, God's might to uphold me, God's wisdom to guide me, God's eye to look before me, God's ear to hear me, God's word to speak for me, God's hand to guard me, God's

shield to protect me.

Christ with me, before me, behind me, in me, beneath me, above me, on my right and on my left.

May God's host save us and protect us and give us the strength we need through Christ our Lord. Amen.

(Response of "Amen.")

FATHER QUINN: Thank you for having me. You'll be in my prayers.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Reading of the Journal.

THE SECRETARY: In Senate, Monday, March 16, 2026, the Senate met pursuant to adjournment. The Journal of Friday, March 13, 2026, was read and approved. On motion, the Senate adjourned.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Without objection, the Journal stands approved as read.

Presentation of petitions.

Messages from the Assembly.

Messages from the Governor.

Reports of standing committees.

Reports of select committees.

Communications and reports from

state officers.

Motions and resolutions.

Senator Gianaris.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Good afternoon, Madam President.

On behalf of Senator Myrie, on page 15 I offer the following amendments to Calendar Number 412, Senate 2539A, and ask that said bill retain its place on the Third Reading Calendar.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The amendments are received, and the bill will retain its place on the Third Reading Calendar.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator Gianaris.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Please recognize Senator Hinchey for an introduction.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator Hinchey for an introduction.

SENATOR HINCHEY: Thank you, Madam President.

It's my honor to welcome some very special guests to the chamber today, students from my district who are part of student government at Millbrook Middle School.

We are so happy that you're here today.

These students made the trip from Dutchess County to learn about New York State history and the legislative process. And there's no better way to do that than right here in this chamber.

Student government is one of the most important clubs that a student can join. It proves that you don't have to wait until you're adult to identify what matters to you, to organize around it, and to work hard to make school and your community a better place for everyone.

And this group has already put that mission into action. They ran a successful holiday food drive for a local pantry, making sure neighbors in need had food on their tables.

They organized a Valentine's Day dance to raise funds so students have the chance to go on meaningful field trips like this one.

And they've been advocating directly for student-led improvements within their school.

Seeing our next generation engaged in showing up like this is incredibly important,

and it gives me so much hope for our future. You all are setting an example not only for your peers but for all of us here today.

So thank you for being here. Thank you for taking on leadership roles. Thank you for being engaged and for caring about your fellow students and your community at large.

And I want to shout out your teachers, who helped make it all possible to be able to be here today and to instill the incredible work that something like student government can give.

And so, Madam President, I would ask you to welcome our guests to the chamber and to give them all of the privileges.

Thank you very much.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank you.

To our guests from Millbrook Middle School student government, congratulations on all the things that you have done. I welcome you on behalf of the Senate. We extend to you the privileges and courtesies of this house.

Please remain standing and be recognized.

(Standing ovation.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator Gianaris.

SENATOR GIANARIS: At this time, Madam President, I move to adopt the Resolution Calendar, with the exception of Resolution 1739.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: All those in favor of adopting the Resolution Calendar, with the exception of Resolution 1739, please signify by saying aye.

(Response of "Aye.")

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Opposed, nay.

(No response.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The Resolution Calendar is adopted.

Senator Gianaris.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Now let's take up Resolution 1739, by Senator Serrano, read its title, and call on Senator Serrano.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Resolution 1739, by Senator Serrano, memorializing Governor Kathy

Hochul to proclaim March 2026 as Youth Art Month in the State of New York.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator Serrano on the resolution.

SENATOR SERRANO: Thank you very much, Madam President.

Youth Arts Month is really a very special time here in the State of New York. It gives us the opportunity to really talk about how important the arts and culture are to students across our state.

Plenty of studies show that exposure to the arts, culture, music, dance, any of the arts has a profound impact on students across our state, allowing them to do better in all other subjects. It really does create better, well-rounded individuals and students. It makes them more excited about school itself. And it does have tremendously important outcomes.

But unfortunately, throughout the State of New York we are not always hitting our mark in ensuring that we have viable and robust arts and music instruction across our state.

So it's important that we use Youth Arts Month as a great opportunity to push

for more arts programming in schools, to support our teachers so that they can do all the things that we need to do, and also to think more about how the arts and culture in our schools do so much more than provide a moment that is aesthetically pleasing, but actually has a profound impact on test scores and ensuring that students can do well.

I will also mention that the arts are uniquely positioned to be a tremendous vehicle for discussions on social justice. And that artists across time, across history, sometimes at their own detriment, have put forth a lot of important messages that needed to be heard, in ways that all of us can really do things in very unstratified ways and come together and build coalitions around important things.

So the arts are so many things. And really, we should ensure that our students have that ability to partake in it. And that's why I'm so grateful to my colleagues for supporting Youth Arts Month for March in the State of New York.

Thank you.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank you.

Senator Bailey on the resolution.

SENATOR BAILEY: Thank you, Madam President.

Thank you, Senator Serrano, for this really important resolution.

I know we fund schools and we fund programs in schools, and we should continue to do so. But when it's at home, you see it differently.

My oldest, Giada, has taken up the violin, and she's become quite good at it, Madam President. And you ultimately see a confidence boost in her. There's a higher level of her abilities to feel like she's doing something positive because she's taken up that violin.

My youngest, Carina -- youngest daughter, Carina, has taken up the drums, and she's very talented, way better -- both of them way better than I ever was in music. But this also has -- you see a growth in her academic performance.

Julian is almost two, he's not

really playing anything officially yet unless you count banging on pots and pans, at which he is an Olympic gold medalist.

But still, it's very crucial that we fund music and arts. Because I always believe that the creative fuels the critical. You can't be a critical thinker without being a bit creative. You can't be a good lawyer or debater without thinking about a creative path towards that debate.

So it is really important to make sure that we continue to have arts and music in schools, because it is a vital part of who we should be as a society.

And I'm grateful to Senator Serrano for this resolution and his leadership in his committee, and to all our colleagues for continuing -- no matter what place you live in this great state, that you're supporting your students and children, because it does matter. It makes a difference.

Thank you, Madam President. I vote aye.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank you, Senator.

The question is on the resolution. All those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Response of "Aye.")

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Opposed, nay.

(No response.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The resolution is adopted.

Senator Gianaris.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Let's take up the calendar, please, Madam President.

(Pause.) I neglected to open that resolution for cosponsorship, Madam President. Let's do that first and then take up the calendar.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: At the request of the sponsor, the resolution is open for cosponsorship. Should you decide not to be a cosponsor, please notify the desk.

Senator Gianaris.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Calendar, please.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Calendar, please. The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

237, Senate Print 6600B, by Senator Jackson, an act to amend the Multiple Dwelling Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 237, voting in the negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

Ayes, 38. Nays, 22.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 325, Senate Print 228A, by Senator Skoufis, an act to amend the Real Property Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the

last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 325, voting in the negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Martins, Mattera, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk and Weik.

Ayes, 41. Nays, 19.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 328, Senate Print 3819A, by Senator Rivera, an act to amend the Executive Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the

roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 328, voting in the negative are Senators Ashby, Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Helming, Martins, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Palumbo, Rhoads, Rolison, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

Ayes, 39. Nays, 21.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 354, Senate Print 4514A, by Senator Ramos, an act to amend the Labor Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator

Ramos to explain her vote.

SENATOR RAMOS: Yeah, thank you, Madam President.

You know, today we're taking a step towards something fundamental, making sure that in New York, hard work is not synonymous with hardship.

Too many families in our state are doing everything right and still falling behind. They're working full-time, they're raising children, contributing to their communities, and yet struggling to afford rent, childcare and basic necessities.

Poverty in New York is not just about income, it's about instability. It's about whether a family can plan for the future or is constantly forced to react to crisis. And what we know and what has been widely reported is that when government makes intentional investments in working families, poverty goes down. Not abstractly, in real terms for real people. That is what good governance looks like.

This bill is about making sure our policies actually reflect that understanding, that we are not just measuring poverty but

actively reducing it, that we are aligning our systems to support stability, not perpetuate struggle.

The goal is not to simply manage poverty, but to reduce it, to give families the ability to stay in their homes, to raise their children with dignity, and to build a future in this state.

When working people have stability, New York is stronger, our economy is stronger, our communities are stronger. That's the work before us, and that's what this bill moves us closer to achieving.

Thank you.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator Ramos to be recorded in the affirmative.

Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 354, voting in the negative are Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Griffo, Helming, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Rhoads, Stec, Walczyk, Weber and Weik.

Ayes, 46. Nays, 14.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 418, Senate Print 879A, by Senator May, an act to amend the Agriculture and Markets Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 6. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator May to explain her vote.

SENATOR MAY: Thank you, Madam President.

Since I don't get to debate this bill today, I would like to at least take a moment to make a few comments about why I'm proud to put forward this legislation that allows New Yorkers to manage their lawns for food production and habitat for beneficial species.

The American lawn is the largest irrigated crop on this continent, covering about forty to 50 million acres. It takes up a third of all the water that's used for residential uses, and uses about four times as much water as

most other crops do.

In addition to that, we use pesticides, we use gas-powered equipment to mow the lawns, and all of that contributes to water pollution, air pollution, and noise pollution.

At the same time, the species that we grow in our lawns are non-native and typically invasive species from Northern Europe and Russia that are not habitat for any native species here in North America.

So I am pleased that with this bill we are saying that we want people to be able to make their yards into something that is part of a flourishing habitat for the State of New York, and I vote aye.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator May to be recorded in the affirmative.

Senator Martins to explain his vote.

SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you, Madam President.

Maybe we should have debated this bill this year. But for the sake of everyone else in the room, we'll just explain our vote, Madam President.

We had this discussion last year.

You know, the difference between someone perceives as being a garden in their front lawn and what they will allow to grow or overgrow or interfere with their neighbor's property is a real concern.

We've seen it in real time, maybe many of us have seen it in our communities, where someone decides that they're going to keep their house in a certain condition and allow their overgrowth in their property -- maybe it's a small lot, but it brings different creatures to the community and different impacts on the neighbors.

And as much as that person may love the look of their house and want to avail themselves of that, we do live in communities, Madam President, where we have to live together. And oftentimes what that person may want for themselves will automatically translate into an impact to their neighbors.

So why don't we allow things to be as they are when we only allow local communities to make those decisions for themselves. Why don't we allow the kind of civility that we have seen historically, as opposed to allowing the

outlier to actually control the narrative.

It would be great if the sponsor's vision was actually true. It would be great if the person actually maintained a property properly. But that rarely happens, Madam President.

Therefore, I'll vote no.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator Martins to be recorded in the negative.

Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 418, voting in the negative are Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Gallivan, Griffo, Lanza, Martins, O'Mara, Ortt, Rhoads, Ryan, Walczyk and Weik. Also Senator Weber.

Ayes, 48. Nays, 12.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 423, Senate Print 5265, by Senator Bailey, an act to amend the Correction Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator Bailey to explain his vote.

SENATOR BAILEY: Thank you, Madam President.

In a day and time when people are able to feed themselves less and less, I see more and more folks voting against this bill. When people are not able to sustain themselves, this is not the time for us to think about taking food out of people's mouths, literally.

Some of us live to eat, but you must eat in order to live. And there's no exemption for that for individuals that are coming home from incarceration. They should eat. They need to eat, Madam President. We should screen them for SNAP eligibility. This is all this does, is to screen. This is not granting anybody anything. This is merely a screen.

Because when you're coming home from incarceration there's so many reasons, there's so many things that you're facing. Senseless violence. Really, so many reasons. Mental

health reasons. Financial reasons.

You know, people sometimes don't love the city. But I love the city. Madam President, I think we should be supporting this bill so people can eat.

I vote aye.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator Bailey to be recorded in the affirmative.

Senator Hinchey to explain her vote.

SENATOR HINCHEY: Thank you, Madam President.

I rise to thank the sponsor for introducing this bill and the leader for bringing it to the floor today.

Access to food should be a right. You cannot live in our society if you are hungry and seeking food. You cannot live your fullest life or be acclimated back into your community if you're wondering where your next meal is going to come from.

And too often we do not have enough services for people who are coming back to better their lives in our communities. We don't set them up for success. We say: Good luck out there, figure it out.

Having access to food is a basic necessity. That if we are not helping people figure out how they're going to find their next meal or take that worry off the table, quite literally, then we are not actually looking out for our constituents and the rest of our community members who are all just going about our daily lives.

And so when someone needs food, we should be, in this body, doing everything we can to make sure that that is not a question. And SNAP is a big part of that.

And so I thank you, Senator Bailey, for bringing this bill forward. I encourage all of my colleagues in every community that we represent to vote in favor. And I proudly vote in favor of this bill.

Thank you.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator Hinchey to be recorded in the affirmative.

Senator Martins to explain his vote.

SENATOR MARTINS: Thank you, Madam President.

I also want to thank Senator Bailey for introducing this bill. I think it's

important. At a time when we are dealing with, you know, so much concern across the state with regard to affordability, people's access to basic necessities should be something that should concern all of us.

I would just remind my colleagues that in this context, this state has increased spending in its budget by over $80 billion in the last six or seven years alone. Eighty billion dollars.

There is no reason why there should be anybody in this state that is hungry when you're spending $80 billion more year over seven years ago.

And so as we debate these issues and discuss these issues, I do want to thank the sponsor for bringing this to the floor, and we can address this small piece of this equation. But I would remind everyone, as we discuss the budget this year, remember, that $80 billion is gone. Go figure out why we can't feed people.

Madam President, I vote yes.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator Martins to be recorded in the affirmative.

Senator Murray to explain his vote.

SENATOR MURRAY: Thank you, Madam President.

I too would like to praise the sponsor for bringing this to the floor.

It's -- you've got someone who's served their time. They did something wrong, went to prison, they served their time. They're done. They're about to come out into society, they're about to hopefully become a very successful member of society and acclimate back in.

We need to do all we can to help them do that, to make that transition as smooth as possible so that they can do that and they will have that advantage. They're going to be hungry when they get out, whether they qualify or not. So why not help them on the way out and give them that extra help as they finish serving their time and they're going back into society.

I proudly vote aye for this bill.

Thank you.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator Murray to be recorded in the affirmative.

Senator Gianaris to explain his vote.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you, Madam President.

I'm compelled to stand up and point out to my colleagues that it's -- well, I was going to say it's unfortunate, but it's really not -- that my colleagues across the aisle are in the Minority.

So it's easy to stand up and cast aspersions without remembering the fact that some of these good colleagues served in the Majority. And in that time, under Governor Pataki's leadership when Senator Bruno was majority leader, spending, believe it or not, in this state went up by $60 billion. Doubled, doubled in that time.

And so like I said, it's an easy job to do when you just sit there and throw out wild claims to try and make your point. But the fact is when you actually have to govern, you spend to support the people of this state. The Republicans did it when they were in charge, and we're certainly doing it.

We're doing it better and in ways that are supporting working people, as opposed to just the wealthy.

Thank you, Madam President.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator Gianaris to be recorded in the affirmative.

Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 423, voting in the negative are Senators Borrello, Chan, Gallivan, Griffo, Oberacker, O'Mara, Ortt, Rhoads, Stec, Walczyk and Weik. Also Senator Tedisco.

Ayes, 48. Nays, 12.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 442, Senate Print 4482, by Senator Mayer, an act to amend the Election Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect on the 90th day after it shall have become a law.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 442, voting in the negative:
Senator Lanza.
Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.
ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill is passed.
THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 458, Senate Print 1368, by Senator Serrano, an act to create a temporary state commission to study and make recommendations concerning the application of pesticides.
ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the last section.
THE SECRETARY: Section 5. This act shall take effect immediately.
ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the roll.
(The Secretary called the roll.)
ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce the results.
THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.
ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill is passed.
THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 476, Senate Print 887A, by Senator Sepúlveda, an

act to amend the Surrogate's Court Procedure Act.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 482, Senate Print 5288, by Senator Sepúlveda, an act to amend the Civil Practice Law and Rules.

SENATOR LANZA: Lay it aside.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Lay it aside.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 501, Senate Print 7663A, by Senator Bynoe, an act in relation to authorizing the County of Nassau assessor to accept an application for a real property tax exemption.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the

last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 501, voting in the negative:

Senator O'Mara.

Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 516, Senate Print 553, by Senator Liu, an act to amend the Education Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 3. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce

the results.

THE SECRETARY: Ayes, 60.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 518, Senate Print 6334, by Senator Fahy, an act to amend the Education Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect 18 months after it shall have become a law.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 518, voting in the negative are Senators Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Martins, Walczyk and Weik.

Ayes, 56. Nays, 4.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number

520, Senate Print 6759, by Senator Fernandez, an act to amend the Education Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 520, voting in the negative:

Senator Weik.

Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill is passed.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 521, Senate Print 6929A, by Senator Webb, an act to amend the Education Law.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 4. This act shall take effect one year after it shall have become a law.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator Webb to explain her vote.

SENATOR WEBB: Thank you, Madam President.

This legislation aims to strengthen transparency and accountability with the dental laboratory industry. This is an industry that quietly plays a vital role in the health and well-being of thousands of New Yorkers every single year.

Dental laboratories manufacture dentures, crowns, bridges, orthodontic appliances that are placed in patients' mouths. When a dentist places a crown or a denture, patients naturally assume that the products that they are receiving were made safely and with quality materials, and dentists assume the same thing.

This assumption, however, is not always backed by transparency or accountability. Madam President, currently there's no requirement that a dental laboratory inform the dentist of the materials used in the restoration, or the

point of origin of manufacture. This lack of transparency matters.

Also, poorly manufactured restorations can lead to infections, allergic reactions, structural failures, and the need for costly corrective procedures.

Recent surveys have shown that nationwide, approximately 25 percent of domestic dental laboratory sales and 38 percent of dental restorations are manufactured overseas.

The goal of this legislation is not to burden businesses with unnecessary regulation but to, rather, establish accountability and oversight in an area directly tied to patient health. Dental appliances and prosthetics are medical devices that must meet certain standards of safety, quality and traceability.

I vote aye and encourage my colleagues to do the same.

Thank you, Madam President.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator Webb to be recorded in the affirmative.

Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 521, voting in the negative:

Senator Walczyk.

Ayes, 59. Nays, 1.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill is passed.

Senator Gianaris, that completes the reading of the noncontroversial calendar.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Thank you, Madam President.

Please call on Senator Comrie for an introduction.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator Comrie for an introduction.

SENATOR COMRIE: Thank you, Madam President.

I rise today to acknowledge that we have a group of people that are here from Queens today that were brought by our borough president, Donovan Richards. They're in the gallery now. Some of them, it's their first time in Albany.

And I just wanted to thank them for coming. They're here to work to make sure that Queens gets the money.

(Laughter.)

SENATOR COMRIE: They're here to make sure that Queens doesn't get hit with

property taxes, which we don't do in this state. And we were able to convince them today to go back downstate and let the mayor know that that will not happen and we're not going to do anything with property taxes. That's something that has to be done on the city level.

But they're also here today to help argue the fight for some of the shifts that were burdened on the city during the de Blasio administration when the previous Governor, who shall not be named --

(Laughter.)

SENATOR COMRIE: -- shifted a lot of money from the state to the city to burden. Which is one reason why the city's in a financial struggle right now.

So I just wanted to thank them for coming. Our borough president is probably meeting with the Speaker right now, Donovan Richards. He's not here. But I just wanted to thank you all for coming.

We had a great day. A lot of legislators got to meet you. You've learned a lot. I hope you can come back on a regular basis to join the throngs of people that are up here to

make sure that Queens gets the money.

Thank you.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank you.

To the delegation from Queens civic organizations, I welcome you on behalf of the Senate. We extend to you the privileges and courtesies of this house. Please rise and be recognized.

(Standing ovation.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator Gianaris.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Let's take up the controversial calendar, please.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The Secretary will ring the bell.

The Secretary will read.

THE SECRETARY: Calendar Number 482, Senate Print 5288, by Senator Sepúlveda, an act to amend the Civil Practice Law and Rules.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator Rhoads, why do you rise?

SENATOR RHOADS: Madam President, I was hoping that Senator Sepúlveda, as the sponsor, might yield to a few questions.

SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA: Through you, Madam President, I yield for those questions.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The Senator yields.

SENATOR RHOADS: Thank you, Madam President. Through you, Madam President.

Senator, I understand the -- I think I understand the purpose of the bill, but I do have a couple of questions with regard to its scope.

My understanding is that this legislation is intended to address a specific circumstance with regard to pendente lite child and spousal support applications, presumably to the Family Court.

However, the legislation itself amends CPLR 2101 to add a subdivision H, which would apply to every court in the State of New York.

What's the reason for such a broad application when it's designed to address, according to your justification memo, a specific circumstance in only the Family Court?

SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA: Through you, Madam President.

My colleague, I'm not sure if we're reading the same bill. This bill is a simple bill about tabs and exhibits when you file any kind of pleading in the courts.

My experience as an attorney for 34 years, dealing with myself and colleagues that have filed things like motions or orders to show cause, where on the cusp, on the verge of statute of limitations expiring, a judge will reject a pleading because a person didn't put a tab on an exhibit, that the case will be -- that the filing will be denied, the statute of limitations expires, and a person loses the ability to have his day in court for a simple tab. It has nothing to do with what you indicated.

SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor continue to yield?

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator, if you can just hold a minute, please. Thank you.

(Pause.)

SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA: I know it mentions Family Court --

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: One

moment, please.

SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA: Oh, sorry.

(Pause.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Okay, Senator.

SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA: Okay. The case that's in the memo is one particular case in a bucket of cases. But that's where the most egregious situations have occurred, in Family Court cases.

So you stand corrected about the actual type of case, but this is to fix a problem that's beyond just those pleadings in Family Court.

SENATOR RHOADS: Will the sponsor continue to yield?

SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA: Through you, Madam President, yes, I do.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The Senator yields.

SENATOR RHOADS: Through you, Madam President. Is this a situation where it's pro se applications that are a problem, or are these applications that are actually filed by attorneys?

SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA: Both.
SENATOR RHOADS: Both?
SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA: Yes.
SENATOR RHOADS: Okay.
Thank you, Senator --
SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA: Both, sorry.
SENATOR RHOADS: I'm going to speak on the bill.
Thank you, Senator. I appreciate it.
ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Senator Rhoads on the bill.
SENATOR RHOADS: I promised my colleagues that I would only ask two questions. I asked two questions, just for the record.
(Laughter.)
SENATOR RHOADS: I was -- I'm concerned -- I certainly understand the intent of the legislation. I feel as though attorneys-at-law should be qualified. Certainly most are and, certainly most paralegals are, to be able to put exhibit tabs on exhibits.
I'm concerned that this may apply to any filing -- like, for example, when I have to submit premarked exhibits for trial, where we're

sort of using a specific example and instead of using a scalpel to fix that specific example, we're kind of using a meat cleaver and putting in a piece of legislation that would apply to a broad number of cases.

I could understand if these were pro se applications that were being made where you don't have trained attorneys that are actually filing these applications. That certainly would make sense to me.

But when the purpose of exhibit tabs are so that everyone can agree on -- the court and the parties to litigation can agree on what we're speaking about when we're referring to particularly cases with multiple exhibits, I think we -- we should have been a little more specific in this legislation.

And I don't know that the Office of Court Administration, the State Bar Association, or any of the organizations were consulted, much less asked for or support this particular legislation.

And so while I understand the purpose, I unfortunately will vote no, and I would encourage my colleagues to do the same. If

this bill were a little tighter, it might be a different result.

Thank you, Madam President.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank you, Senator.

Are there any other Senators wishing to be heard?

Senator Sepúlveda on the bill.

SENATOR SEPÚLVEDA: Thank you, Madam President. I just want to be able to clarify something.

Exhibits on pleadings can be handled several ways. When you have multiple judges throughout the court system with different part rules, that is where the problem is created.

You can start -- you can label an exhibit page with an 8.5-by-11 and you can type in, in larger font, "Exhibit A." Where the problem has existed is that unless you have what's called a little tab to notate that exhibit, some judges throughout the system will reject that pleading.

What this says is either you put a page where you type in, literally, "Exhibit A," in black print at the bottom before you put the

exhibit, or you use a tab. Either one is acceptable.

The problem occurs when judges say you have to use a specific tab, and that is highly unfair. And especially in cases where either statute of limitations are expiring or you need particular relief immediately -- for a judge to reject it because that's the way you want to notify about a particular exhibit in a pleading, is inherently unfair and confusing because there are so many judges with different rules in different parts.

Thank you. And I vote aye.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Thank you.

Are there any other Senators wishing to be heard?

Seeing and hearing none, the debate is closed.

Senator Gianaris.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Let's restore this to the noncontroversial calendar, by consent, please.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: By consent, the bill will be restored to the

noncontroversial calendar.

Read the last section.

THE SECRETARY: Section 2. This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Call the roll.

(The Secretary called the roll.)

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: Announce the results.

THE SECRETARY: In relation to Calendar 482, voting in the negative are Senators Borrello, Canzoneri-Fitzpatrick, Chan, Griffo, Helming, Lanza, Mattera, Murray, Oberacker, O'Mara, Rhoads, Stec, Tedisco, Walczyk and Weik.

Ayes, 45. Nays, 15.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: The bill is passed.

Senator Gianaris, that completes the reading of today's calendar.

SENATOR GIANARIS: Is there any further business at the desk?

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: There is no further business at the desk.

SENATOR GIANARIS: I move to

adjourn until tomorrow, Wednesday, March 18th, at 3:00 p.m.

ACTING PRESIDENT PERSAUD: On motion, the Senate stands adjourned until Wednesday, March 18th, at 3:00 p.m.

Enjoy your St. Patrick's Day!

(Whereupon, at 4:03 p.m., the Senate adjourned.)